JIABS

Journal of the International
Association of Buddhist Studies

Volume 36/37 2013/2014 (2015)

The *Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies* (ISSN 0193-600XX) is the organ of the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Inc. As a peer-reviewed journal, it welcomes scholarly contributions pertaining to all facets of Buddhist Studies. JIABS is published yearly.

The JIABS is now available online in open access at http://journals.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/index.php/jiabs. Articles become available online for free 24 months after their appearance in print. Current articles are not accessible on-line. Subscribers can choose between receiving new issues in print or as PDF.

Manuscripts should preferably be submitted as e-mail attachments to: *editors@iabsinfo.net* as one single file, complete with footnotes and references, in two different formats: in PDF-format, and in Rich-Text-Format (RTF) or Open-Document-Format (created e.g. by Open Office).

Address subscription orders and dues, changes of address, and business correspondence (including advertising orders) to:

Dr. Danielle Feller,
IABS Assistant-Treasurer, IABS
Department of Slavic and South Asian Studies (SLAS)
Anthropole
University of Lausanne
CH-1015 Lausanne, Switzerland
E-mail: *iabs.treasurer@unil.ch*
Web: http://www.iabsinfo.net

Subscriptions to JIABS are USD 65 per year for individuals and USD 105 per year for libraries and other institutions. For informations on membership in IABS, see back cover.

EDITORIAL BOARD

KELLNER Birgit
STRAUCH Ingo
Joint Editors

BUSWELL Robert
CHEN Jinhua
COLLINS Steven
COX Collett
GÓMEZ Luis O.
HARRISON Paul
VON HINÜBER Oskar
JACKSON Roger
JAINI Padmanabh S.
KATSURA Shōryū
KUO Li-ying
LOPEZ, Jr. Donald S.
MACDONALD Alexander
SCHERRER-SCHAUB Cristina
SEYFORT RUEGG David
SHARF Robert
STEINKELLNER Ernst
TILLEMANS Tom

Cover: Cristina Scherrer-Schaub

Font: "Gandhari Unicode" designed by Andrew Glass (http://andrewglass.org/fonts.php)

© Copyright 2015 by the International Association of Buddhist Studies, Inc.

Print: Ferdinand Berger & Söhne GesmbH, A-3580 Horn

JIABS

Journal of the International
Association of Buddhist Studies

Volume 36/37 2013/2014 (2015)

Brandon Dotson

The Remains of the Dharma: Editing, Rejecting, and Replacing the Buddha's Words in Officially Commissioned Sūtras from Dunhuang, 820s to 840s 5

Seong-Uk Kim

The Zen Theory of Language: Linji Yixuan's Teaching of "Three Statements, Three Mysteries, and Three Essentials" (sanju sanxuan sanyao 三句三玄三要) 69

New Approaches to Studying the Materiality of Buddhist Manuscripts

---

Orna Almogi, Emanuel Kindzorra, Oliver Hahn, Ira Rabin

Inks, Pigments, Paper: In Quest of Unveiling the History of the Production of a Tibetan Buddhist Manuscript Collection from the Tibetan-Nepalese Borderlands 93

Martin Delhey, Emanuel Kindzorra, Oliver Hahn, Ira Rabin

Material Analysis of Sanskrit Palm-Leaf Manuscripts Preserved in Nepal 119

Orna Almogi, Martin Delhey, Claire MacDonald, Boryana Pouvkova

Recovering Lost Writing and Beyond: Multispectral Imaging for Text-related and Codicological Studies of Tibetan Paper and Sanskrit Palm-Leaf Manuscripts 153

Conference

Authors and Editors in the Literary Traditions of Asian Buddhism

Guest editors
Cathy Cantwell, Jowita Kramer, Robert Mayer,
and Stefano Zacchetti

Cathy Cantwell and Robert Mayer
Authors and Editors in the Literary Traditions of Asian Buddhism 195

Jonathan A. Silk
Establishing/Interpreting/Translating: Is It Just That Easy? . . . 205

Robert Mayer
gTer ston and Tradent: Innovation and Conservation in Tibetan Treasure Literature 227

Cathy Cantwell
Different Kinds of Composition/Compilation Within the Dudjom Revelatory Tradition 243

Jowita Kramer
Innovation and the Role of Intertextuality in the Pañca-skandhaka and Related Yogācāra Works. 281

Oskar von Hinüber
Building the Theravāda Commentaries: Buddhaghosa and Dhammapāla as Authors, Compilers, Redactors, Editors and Critics 353

L. S. Cousins †
The Case of the Abhidhamma Commentary 389

Sarah Shaw
In What Way is There a Saṅghavacana? Finding the Narrator, Author and Editor in Pāli Texts 423

Marta Sernesi
The Collected Sayings of the Master: On Authorship, Author-function, and Authority 459

MARTIN SEEGER
'The (Dis)appearance of an Author:' Some Observations and Reflections on Authorship in Modern Thai Buddhism 499

PÉTER-DÁNIEL SZÁNTÓ
Early Works and Persons Related to the So-called Jñānapāda School 537

ULRICH PAGEL (GENERAL SECRETARY, IABS)
Report of the XVIth Congress of the International Association of Buddhist Studies. 563

Notes on the contributors 571

Different Kinds of Composition/Compilation Within the Dudjom Revelatory Tradition[1]

Cathy Cantwell

Robert Mayer (this volume) has introduced the research project which we have been conducting since 2010, and commented on the main theoretical issues we have been considering. The project focuses on the works on the tantric deity, Vajrakīlaya, of the twentieth century prolific scholar and visionary revealer, Dudjom Jigdral Yeshe Dorje (*bdud 'joms 'jigs bral ye śes rdo rje*, 1904–1987), henceforth, simply Dudjom Rinpoche. I have been working through the textual materials in collaboration with our Tibetan lama consultant, Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin, and in this paper, I review some of the key findings from the first three years of the project. The issues to be considered here are what we can tell from an analysis of the textual content of a Revelation production; how exactly a revelatory cycle may develop and expand over the following generations; and what we can conclude from the specific types of textual production and re-workings which are witnessed in this case study.

At the outset, we must bear in mind the indigenously significant distinction between the lama as a visionary revealer of sacred text received directly from the tantric buddha, Guru Rinpoche, and the lama as a scholar/editor, editing, compiling, and composing practices and commentaries on the basis of established textual traditions. Both processes are considered to be necessary in the

[1] I would like to acknowledge the support of the Arts and Humanities Research Council of the UK, who funded the research project on which this paper is based at the University of Oxford. I would also like to thank Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin Rinpoche, who has acted as the research project's lama consultant, and with whom I have discussed the Tibetan texts discussed in this paper at length. Thanks are also due to Holly Gayley, who made detailed comments on an earlier version. Any errors remain my own responsibility.

Journal of the International Association of Buddhist Studies
Volume 36/37 • 2013/2014 (2015) pp. 243–280

revelatory tradition: generally, 'raw' revelation text is unsuitable for recitation and ritual practice in an unmodified form. In practice, as we shall see, these two categories may not be quite so distinct when we actually analyse the content of the textual productions of visionary lamas, especially since a visionary lama may himself edit and expand some of his own revelatory output, but we need to be aware of these different classifications, and consider how they might have influenced the content in any given case. Some visionary lamas may only leave their revelatory productions, without any attempt to edit or order the materials; some scholar lamas who are not themselves revealers may produce edited compilations of revelation texts produced by a visionary lama of their spiritual lineage. But most visionary lamas will write as editors/compilers on at least some occasions, and this is likely to impact on the style of these different types of textual productions – different, at least, from the traditional perspective of a contrast between the inspired revelation, and the creation of structured ritual practices based on it.

A further possible distinction might be made on the basis of the writers' different levels of integration into the wider Tibetan monastic and scholarly communities. On the one hand, we have the productions – whether Revelations or learned compilations – of a towering erudite figure such as Dudjom Rinpoche himself, central in the transmission of many of the tantric lineages, including those classed as non-revelatory scriptural collections. On the other hand, a visionary lama from a relatively narrow lineage affiliation and/or one specific geographical area might not be seeking to integrate their visionary writings to the broader tradition, and might therefore be a little more willing to allow greater variation on the usual themes of tantric production. I am currently uncertain about the extent of any contrast, because the specific focus on Dudjom Rinpoche's writings has meant that I have not been able to analyse to the same extent the precedents for the ostensibly idiosyncratic or less obviously conventional writings amongst the works of some of his predecessors. In any case, many visionary lamas may fall somewhere in the middle of what might be better seen as a spectrum of levels of integration rather than the stark opposition which this hypothetical example suggests. But it seems important to note

that Dudjom Rinpoche may primarily represent a particular *type* of visionary revealer, a kind of high status learnèd visionary, rather than being typical of *all* Tibetan revealers. Even if this is the case, the impact on the whole tradition of a small number of preeminent lamas – also such as Terdak Lingpa (*gter bdag gliṅ pa*) in the seventeenth century or Jamgon Kongtrul (*'jam mgon koṅ sprul*) in the nineteenth – mean that the Dudjom case study is likely to reveal patterns important to the wider system of Treasure Revelation. Besides their importance to the transmissional lineages, the writings of these lamas included numerous compilations and compositions on the Revelations of earlier generations, which became established as the standard works on these textual traditions, so their influence can hardly be underestimated.

Robert Mayer (this volume) has pointed out the modular nature of much of this revelatory literature: thus, the research has involved the identification of new materials or approaches, as well as the tracing the patterns of reproduction and re-working of previous text passages, and the creation of new wholes. It is worth noting that reproduction of long passages within a new Revelation or even within a non-revelatory composition need not always involve the copying of written text. Tibetan religious training involves internalisation of long textual liturgies. They are generally written in verse form and regularly recited or chanted, and in some cases, deliberately memorised. The verses are associated with specific tantric imagery, which is visualised as the verses are outwardly intoned, so that the meditative experience comes to incorporate the associated words (and vice versa), and is thoroughly internalised by the practitioner. Thus, a new Revelation may flow naturally from the visionary, it may have its own distinctive qualities, and presumably may be experienced as a direct transmission from Guru Rinpoche, but features of the traditions in which the lama is trained will often leave their mark on the new production.

Dudjom Rinpoche as a revealer of visionary tantric materials

First, to consider Dudjom Rinpoche as a visionary tantric revealer, I would like to focus on the example of his Vajrakīlaya cycle, the *Razor*

Disintegration-on-Touch Vajrakīlaya (*phur pa spu gri reg phuṅ*), with some reference to his principal Lama Heart Accomplishment practice, the *Embodiment of Seven Revelation Treasuries* (*bla sgrub gter kha bdun 'dus*). This is essentially a compilation, but it is a slightly unusual case, combining the categories of revelation and compilation.

Dudjom Rinpoche's identification as an emanation of Drokben Khye'u-chung lotsawa (*'brog ban khye'u chuṅ lo tsā ba*), famed as a direct student of Guru Rinpoche,[2] and as a rebirth of the seventeenth century Dudul Dorje (*bdud 'dul rdo rje*, 1615–1672), as well as Dudjom Lingpa and other lamas considered to form part of a series of rebirths, was a significant aspect of his own self-identity from an early age. This identification implies that he too, as a rebirth of Drokben Khye'u-chung lotsawa, would have the capacity and perhaps the duty to reveal further Treasures from those teachings. It seems that Dudjom Rinpoche began to discover Treasure caskets considered to be destined for him from when he was young,[3] yet there is a clear contrast between Dudjom Rinpoche and his predecessors. Whereas the preserved *Collected Works* of Dudul Dorje and Dudjom Lingpa consist almost entirely of their own Treasure Revelations (and a few later commentarial works on those Revelations), around only two and a half volumes of Dudjom Rinpoche's twenty-five volume *Collected Works* consist of his own Revelations. The rest are mostly compilations and commentarial writings relating to the Revelations of previous lamas, along with scholarly works on other topics. It appears that Dudjom Rinpoche made a very deliberate choice to focus on previous Revelations,

---

[2] In the Nyingma (*rñiṅ ma*) tradition, Guru Rinpoche or Padmasambhava is considered to be the Second Buddha, who manifested in the eighth century and was responsible, along with his team (summarised in the formula of "Enlightened Scholar, Enlightened Master, Dharma King," *mkhan slob chos gsum*, indicating the bodhisattva scholar, Śāntarakṣita, Guru Rinpoche himself, and King Khri sroṅ blde'u btsan), for establishing the Dharma in Tibet, and becoming the fount of the later Nyingma tantric lineages.

[3] See Tsewang Dongyal 2003: 167, who cites Dudjom Rinpoche's own words (*gźon nu'i dus nas raṅ skal gyi gter sgrom maṅ po rñed ciṅ*); the equivalent passage is in Tsewang Dongyal 2008: 179.

to renew interest in them, and to create more accessible or better ordered practice texts.

This clear decision did not, however, imply that he would shut off his Revelations entirely. In fact, he still revealed a number of important cycles, including cycles relating to all three Vajrayāna Roots (*bla ma*, *yi dam*, *mkha' 'gro*). But there are two interesting features to these Revelations. First, his primary focus on earlier texts, which encompassed both older Revelations, as well as the Transmitted teachings (*bka' ma*), including the scriptural tantras and the corpus of preserved teachings and practices springing from them, appears to be reflected in the character of his Revelations. Even Dudjom Rinpoche's Revelation activity thus contributed to his ambition to preserve and reinvigorate earlier texts. Secondly, the Revelations he did reveal are short, well-structured and pithy, and this appears to be related to his decision to restrict his Revelation production, as we shall see below. His added instructions often follow the same principle of his work on previous Revelations, integrating material from the traditional heritage.

Both these two features are clear in the case of Dudjom Rinpoche's Vajrakīlaya Revelation, the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch*. The title, *Razor*, picks up on some of the key Vajrakīlaya Revelations of the past, for which Dudjom Rinpoche also held the lineages, especially the thirteenth century Guru Chöwang's (*chos kyi dbaṅ phyug*) *Ultra Secret Blazing Razor* (*yaṅ gsaṅ spu gri 'bar ba*), and the fifteenth to sixteenth century Pema Lingpa's (*padma gliṅ pa*) *Ultra Secret Razor Lifeforce* (*yaṅ gsaṅ srog gi spu gri*),[4]

---

[4] Dudjom Rinpoche drew on Guru Chöwang's heritage and the Mindroling traditions of its practice in composing his first Vajrakīlaya text in his late teens, which was a Ritual Practice Framework text (*sgrub khog*) for the Vajrakīlaya who overwhelms Māra's Troops with his splendour (*Phur bu bdud dpung zil gnon*) of the Revealer, Drakngak Lingpa (*drag sṅags gliṅ pa*, see below pp. 256–260). He had received the lineage for Guru Chöwang's *Ultra Secret Blazing Razor Vajrakīlaya* from Orgyan Namdrol Gyamtso (*o rgyan rnam grol rgya mtsho*) of Mindroling. In his List of Transmissions (*thob yig*), Dudjom Rinpoche lists the three lineages, two of which separately descended to the Mindroling founder, Terdak Lingpa (one of them transmitted via Pema Lingpa), and then continued in one stream down to Orgyan

as well as the principal previous Dudjom tradition Vajrakīlaya Revelations. These are Dudul Dorje's and Dudjom Lingpa's, about which I will say more below, and Dudjom Rinpoche's work on Dudjom Lingpa's Revelation is called *The Meteoric Iron Razor Vajrakīlaya which Vanquishes Māra* (*rdo rje phur bu bdud 'joms gnam lcags spu gri*).[5]

Namdrol Gyamtso. Dudjom Rinpoche notes further that Terdak Lingpa also received transmission from Guru Chöwang's primordial wisdom body, so that a third direct lineage also stems from Terdak Lingpa (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Dza Oṃ: 547–551). The colophons of two of Dudjom Rinpoche's own compositions on Guru Chöwang's *Ultra Secret Blazing Razor Vajrakīlaya* (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Za: 240; 262–263) also make it clear that he was following the Mindroling traditions for its performance. Unfortunately, I have been unable to identify any edition of Guru Chöwang's Revelation, nor any compilation predating Terdak Lingpa's. However, given Dudjom Rinpoche's reliance on the Mindroling lineage of practice, for the purposes of this work, we can probably reasonably safely assume that Dudjom Rinpoche was primarily using Terdak Lingpa's version (this is also included in the *Rin chen gter mdzod*, Kongtrul 1976–1980 Volume 49: 75–116, as is the commentary by Lochen Dharmaśrī, Kongtrul 1976–1980, Volume 49: 213–240). Not long after writing up his *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* Revelation, Dudjom Rinpoche worked extensively (particularly during the water dragon year of 1952) on Pema Lingpa's *Ultra Secret Razor Lifeforce Vajrakīlaya* (*Yaṅ gsaṅ srog gi spu gri*). He had received the lineage for this, along with other lineages from the Pad gliṅ corpus, from the renunciant lama, Genden Gyamtso (*dge 'dun rgya mtsho*), see Dudjom Rinpoche's List of Transmissions (1979–1985, Volume Wa Āḥ: 129–173, and especially pp. 161–164 on the *Ultra Secret Razor Lifeforce*); see also Dudjom Rinpoche's supplication to him (1979–1985. Volume A: 19, translated in Ron Garry 2005: 181–182; and see Tsewang Dongyal 2008: 90). At the request of the tenth *gsuṅ sprul* (speech rebirth of Pema Lingpa), Pema Ngawang Chökyi Gyaltsan (*padma ṅag dbaṅ chos kyi rgyal mtshan*), Dudjom Rinpoche edited the texts and produced a number of new compilations (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Cha: 405–749; see, for instance, the colophon to the Ritual Manual, p. 456, and see also Tsewang Dongyal 2008: 200–201).

[5] The name also occurs in a prophesy relating to Dudjom Lingpa's *Sealed Secret Heart Practice*, although it seems to represent a description of *The Sealed Secret Heart Practice* rather than its name (*thugs sgrub yaṅ sñiṅ gsaṅ ba'i rgya can ni: bdud 'joms gnam lcags rdo rje'i spu gri 'di: Dudjom Rinpoche* 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 576); I have not, however, located this prediction within Dudjom Lingpa's writings.

The Razor Disintegration-on-Touch Vajrakīlaya can be seen as in continuity not only with the previous Revelations but also with the Transmitted literature (*bka' ma*). It is described as embodying the three forms of transmission, of Treasure Revelation, the Transmitted literature, and Pure Vision (*dag snaṅ*).[6]

Secondly, Dudjom Rinpoche makes it clear that his *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* is a particularly deep, concise and essentialised presentation, but also that it came out of a vast repertoire. He recounts that following his Pure Vision dream, he awoke with perfect recollection, and if he had, "translated all the symbolic language which erupted from the expanse of [my] awareness, the Dharma cycle would have … been unprecedented."[7] Thus, the framing for the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* emphasises that Dudjom Rinpoche had exercised a degree of choice in identifying the crucial elements to be transcribed. It is also worth noting that Dudjom Rinpoche only transcribed the Revelation a little over a decade later. In this instance, it seems that he had been reluctant to add to the Vajrakīlaya textual corpus by transcribing his own Revelation at all, only much later deciding to do so. But in fact, it is quite usual for the transcription of a Revelation cycle to take place after some years, and this also implies that the context in which the texts are established may *in practice* resemble other forms of religious writing, the lama settled in a suitable dwelling and perhaps supported and encouraged to write by his students and sponsors.

Now, a Treasure cycle often contains a "root" text (*rtsa gźuṅ*), which represents key points of the original flow of the Revelation as it was first transcribed by the Revealer, and then a number of other texts, which may be built up from the root verses, or may be

---

[6] Personal communication, Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin. I have not seen a written source explicitly specifying that the Revelation combined all three, but it is clear that all three played a part, and the Empowerment Ritual text does mention all three.

[7] *rig pa'i kloṅ nas gang brdol brda thad kar bsgyur na gter ston goṅ ma gñis kyi chos skor las kyaṅ rgyas śiṅ man ṅag phrin las las tshogs gyi rim pa sṅar ma grags pa'aṅ ji sñed cig snaṅ mod kyi/'on kyaṅ deṅ dus 'di rigs gsar du 'bebs pa ṅal ba don med du mthoṅ nas btaṅ sñoms su bźag*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ba: 476–477.

supplementary to them. Dudjom Rinpoche's *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* has a short, well organised root text, in three sections. The first of these gives an outline of the sections needed for the empowerment rite, while the second consists of a pithy summarised version of instructions on four ritual meditations well-established in the Vajrakīlaya literature, and especially drawing on the interpretations of a famous early commentary from the transmitted tradition, the *'Bum nag*. The third section concerns the main practice texts, and the seven syllable verses given in this section form the core of the Ritual Manual (*phrin las*) which Dudjom Rinpoche compiled shortly afterwards. They are structured around key lines from a famous short Vajrakīlaya tantra, lines which are frequently repeated in Vajrakīlaya texts of all types, and the principal visualisation sequences have distinctive elements, but conform to a number of well-established variants on the deity meditations. Most of these, as well as the specific phrasings found in the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch*, differ from the Vajrakīlaya Revelations of Dudul Dorje and Dudjom Lingpa, and this distinction holds true also for the expansions of the root verses given in the Ritual Manual. Here, we find instead that passages from Guru Chöwang's *Ultra Secret Razor*, in some cases repeated also in Pema Lingpa's *Ultra Secret Razor Lifeforce*, have re-appeared in this new Revelation. Some of these parallel passages, such as a very distinctive Invocation of the Vidyādharas (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ba: 500–501), are not found widely, and thus would seem to indicate a family resemblance within this branch of the transmission. Others, such as a Golden Libation (*gser skyems*) to be performed as an auspicious offering to the *maṇḍala* and local area deities (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ba: 502–503), are witnessed in many tantric sources and are not even confined to the Vajrakīlaya ritual texts. Another interesting point is that although the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* distinguishes itself from the earlier Dudjom tradition Vajrakīlaya Revelations in its main practice sequences, it draws extensively on these texts for its auxilliary rites. Thus, the key revelation verses indicate their own distinctive identity, drawing on a broad heritage of the Nyingma tradition, while nestling within a wider ritual context in which its Dudjom tradition affiliation is signalled.

As an essentialised practice with few elaborations, the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* gives some terse instructions which have been interpreted quite differently by different groups of followers. The descriptions of the *maṇḍala* are short, and say very little about the deity's Celestial Palace. Depictions of the *maṇḍala* are rather rare; sometimes a print of the *maṇḍala* for the *Meteoric Iron Razor* is used in its place, even though the layout of the *maṇḍala* of deities is not the same. There are significant variations in the *maṇḍala*s which are made. For example, the wheel for the ten Wrathful Deities may be depicted with ten or with eight spokes.[8] While one *maṇḍala* has the central triangle, and successive rings from inside to outside, to represent all the deities, another *maṇḍala* (Duddul Rabtenling 2012: Plate 36) has simplified the arrangement to such an extent that only a central circle with the deity's seed-syllable, along an eight-spoked wheel, is shown. A central triangle is so ubiquitous

[8] For the purpose of this discussion, I am contrasting two depictions of the *maṇḍala*, one from Lama Tenzin Samphel, for which the ultimate provenance is unknown – although this is clearly an authentic Dudjom tradition source – and the other from a collection of *maṇḍala*s published by the Duddul Rabtenling (*bdud 'dul rab brtan gliṅ*, 2012) Dudjom tradition monastery in Odisha. It is worth saying that variations in depictions of *maṇḍala*s are rarely cause for concern in Tibetan contexts: the main issue is whether or not the *maṇḍala* derives from an authentic source, is properly blessed, and whether or not it is beautifully painted, thus serving to engender a grand and inspiring atmosphere for the practice. Often, the main work in painting *maṇḍala*s or constructing coloured sand *maṇḍala*s is left to professional artists trained in the artistic traditions, who may not in any case be closely familiar with the ritual practice texts, and who may follow established conventions for the layout of *maṇḍala* features without reference to the specific practice manuals. Nonetheless, striking variations in *maṇḍala* depictions of the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* can demonstrate the limited extent of the guidance in the practice texts when the artistic conventions were being established in this case. It is also possible that features of the Odisha *maṇḍala* may have been modified by the new Dudjom *sprul sku*, Dudjom Sangye Pema (*saṅs rgyas padma*, b. 1990), who apparently kept the *maṇḍala* set for more than ten days while staying in Kathmandu, checked through all the *maṇḍala*s and suggested various amendments, including a change to the side of the *mkha' 'gro thugs thig maṇḍala* (Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin personal communication, 9th January and 14th February 2013, reporting the spoken clarifications of the Odisha lama, Sonam Tashi).

in Vajrakīlaya rituals that is could be assumed to be present even if unmentioned, but in this case, the simplified *maṇḍala* could be seen as reflecting the simple description of the visualisation in the Ritual Manual and root text.[9]

The continuity between the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* and Guru Chöwang's thirteenth century *Ultra Secret Razor* Vajrakīlaya Revelation is not explicitly recognised nor commented on in the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* texts, and I have the impression that few Dudjom tradition lamas are clearly aware of it. However, when we turn to Dudjom Rinpoche's principal *Lama Accomplishment* production, the *Embodiment of Seven Treasuries* (*bla sgrub gter kha bdun 'dus*), an identification with previous Revelations is proclaimed even in its title. A Revelation prophesy presented in the opening pages of the Ritual Manual indicates the centrality of Guru Chöwang's formative *Secret Embodiment of the Lama*.[10] Detailed examination shows that the identifed Revelations of different periods share extensive passages of text, and virtually all Dudjom Rinpoche's key verses for recitation within his main Ritual Manual are almost word-for-word identical to those in Guru Chöwang's *Secret Embodiment of the Lama*. As mentioned above, Dudjom Rinpoche's *Embodiment of Seven Treasuries* appears to be slightly ambivalent in its status, in one sense a compilation, yet also a Revelation. It has even been classified by one lama of the tradition as a Revelation which Dudjom Rinpoche received directly from Guru Rinpoche's principal disciple, Yeshe Tsogyal. Yet generally, it is considered a compilation of the six previous Revelations, while classified as 'Revelation' since it wholly consists of Revelation text, and has been blessed anew by Dudjom Rinpoche's work. Nonetheless, it also seems that it incorporates Dudjom Rinpoche's

---

[9] Nonetheless, the central triangle is referred to later in the root text, in the Subsidiary Ritual section (*mthiṅ nag gru gsum dkyil 'khor*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ba: 473).

[10] "In general, each will have its own approach; But especially, the *Eight Chapter Ritual Manual* is auspicious" (*spyir ni raṅ raṅ lugs bzhin la: khyad par las byaṅ le brgyad śis:*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ca: 3). The *Eight Chapter Ritual Manual* is a pith instruction on the practice which is part of Guru Chöwang's *Secret Embodiment of the Lama* cycle.

own Revelation entitled the *Complete Embodiment of the Sugatas* (*bde gśegs yoṅs 'dus*), a Revelation which has not been separately transcribed by Dudjom Rinpoche.[11] A comparison of the Dudjom *Lama Accomplishment* Ritual Manual with that of Terdak Lingpa's compilation of the *Secret Embodiment of the Lama* demonstates close textual parallelling. The main difference is the order of sections: Dudjom Rinpoche significantly re-orders the material to fit the standard sections for *sādhana* practice. There *are* variations in

[11] Both Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin Lama and Lama Kunzang Dorjee saw the *sādhana* as a compilation. However, Lama Tharchin's introduction to the practice (Lama Tharchin 2006: 1–2) speaks of it as, "a text that was passed to Dudjom Rinpoche directly by Khandro Yeshe Tsogyal," and he writes further that Dudjom Rinpoche had a vision of Yeshe Tsogyal, in which she told him to compose the text, bringing together the six previous treasures with his own revelation, so that, "thanks to the kindness of Yeshe Tsogyal… all the blessing and the power of all seven lineages have been gathered within this single practice." Dudjom Rinpoche says nothing of this vision within his empowerment text, but there is some indication of ambivalence in relation to his own status. He writes of blending together the *six* Revelations (*gter byon bla ma'i thugs sgrub gdams srol rim pa drug gi chu bo gcig tu 'dres pa'i chos sde*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ca: 66), but within the colophon, he revises the previous mention only of six Revelations to speak of, "blending six or seven lineages" (*gter kha drug gam bdun gyi brgyud pa'i chu bo gcig tu 'dres pa*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ca: 76). Moreover, the opening folios of the main Ritual Manual (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ca: 2–3) more clearly specify *seven*, and give his own a separate Revelation title (the *Complete Embodiment of the Sugatas*, *bde gśegs yoṅs 'dus*), using language of the seventh suggestive of a full revelatory status. He speaks of this Dharma cycle as his "own portion" (*raṅ skal*, Volume Ca: 2), or "destined for me," the same wording he uses of his *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch*, when he concluded that, "my own portion of the territory should be held and not given up" (*raṅ skal yal bar mi dor ba'i sa khoṅs 'dzin*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ba: 477); and see also his words relating to his early discoveries ("from the time of my youth, [I] have discovered many revelation caskets which represent my own portion," or, "which were destined for me," note 3 above). It thus seems that the *Embodiment of Seven Treasuries* has a rather unusual intermediate status, at once fully endowed with the consecrations of a direct revelation, while also compiled in accordance with both the ultimate intentions and the actual words of all the previous revelations. In short, if Dudjom Rinpoche is in this instance more of a compiler than a mystical revealer, the impression is that he is acting more as a visionary compiler, rather than a scholarly editor.

a few sections and Dudjom Rinpoche supplies additional material in parts, although even some of this may possibly derive from some other section of Guru Chöwang's corpus which was not included in Terdak Lingpa's compilation. The dominant influence of Guru Chöwang's Revelation is witnessed also in the way that the meditation instructions are explained in the commentary to the Dudjom practice, written by the lineage holder, Chatral Sangye Dorje Rinpoche (*bya bral saṅs rgyas rdo rje*, b. 1913). There, he gives four citations from the *Secret Embodiment of the Lama*, although only the first is explicitly identified.[12] All four relate to the meditation instructions connected with the mantra recitation practice, and three are extensive passages.[13]

The clearest distinction between the two manuals in the main ritual medititative sequence is that Dudjom Rinpoche includes two alternative sequences for the figure of the main Guru Rinpoche, Pema Tö-treng-tsal figure, and only the second is found in Terdak Lingpa's Manual. The first is identified by Dudjom Rinpoche as the "Nirmāṇakāya Zahor style" (*sprul sku za hor ma ltar*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ca: 47) and is replete with the sets of garments characteristic of Guru Rinpoche. The second, which clearly derives from the *Secret Embodiment of the Lama*, and is found word-for-word identically in Terdak Lingpa's Manual, is explicitly identified as the "*Secret Embodiment Sambhogakāya Lama*" form (*bla ma loṅs sku gsaṅ 'dus ltar*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ca: 8). This form appears as a dark blue Vajrasattva in union with the consort.

---

[12] The second is identified as deriving from Dudul Dorje's (*bdud 'dul rdo rje*, 1615–1672) *Complete Embodiment of Enlightened Intention* (*dgoṅs pa yoṅs 'dus*). No doubt it occurs there, but its source would seem to be from the *Secret Embodiment of the Lama*. The four citations occur in Chatral Rinpoche n.d.: p. 9 (corresponding to Chöwang 1979: 16–17); pp. 9–10 (corresponding to Chöwang 1979: 18); p. 11 (corresponding to Chöwang 1979: 22–23); pp. 11–12 (corresponding to Chöwang 1979: 27–28).

[13] The first relates to the instruction for receiving empowerment; the second to the ultimate empowerment; the third to focusing on a *tsakli* (initiation card) image; and the fourth to the final "protection of the enlightened intention" (*dgoṅs pa bskyaṅ ba*). Here, this section is elaborated on by glossing the inner significances of the features of the *maṇḍala* and its deities.

Now, although Dudjom Rinpoche preserves this second form of Guru Rinpoche within his text, and gives the option for practitioners to use it, in practice in the Dudjom tradition, it appears that the more typical Guru Rinpoche visualisation is almost exclusively preferred.[14] However, although I have not identified an exact parallel for the precise lines within the wider *Secret Embodiment of the Lama* texts, this form is not altogether absent. In fact, in a Guru Chöwang manuscript collection, the main practice text at the beginning gives the blue Vajrasattva type form (Chöwang 1979: 20–21), just as we find in the Terdak Lingpa compilation, but two shorter texts also in the collection give similar visualisations to this form. One is a brief text specifically on absorbing the accomplishment of the *nirmāṇakāya* lama,[15] and gives several of the main elements. The other short text apparently compiled by an early lineage master, gives a visualisation (Chöwang 1979: 485) which is similar to the Dudjom text. Instead of two alternative visualisations, it gives first the standard Guru Rinpoche form, and then practitioners should visualise that this transforms, and the lama as dark blue cross-legged Vajradhara or vajra holder (*rdo rje 'dzin*) arises, holding vajra and bell, and adorned with jewels and bone ornaments. A further variation is found on this theme in Pema Lingpa's (*padma gliṅ pa*, 1450–1521) *Jewel Ocean* Lama Heart Accomplishment practice. There, a similar meditation on a Guru Rinpoche form is followed by a form similar to Dudjom Rinpoche's sambhogakāya lama (Padma Gliṅ pa 1975–1976, Ka: 768–769; Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Cha: 10–11). This time, the two forms arise together, the dark-blue cross-legged form with vajra and bell in union with the consort, appearing on the top of the crown of Guru Rinpoche's head.

---

[14] Certainly, the verses for this visualisation and praise were always recited on each tenth day practice at the Rewalsar monastery during my fieldwork in 1981–1983, and *Secret Embodiment of the Lama* visualisation was always omitted. Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin commented that this preference for the typical Guru Rinpoche form is general in the practice of Dudjom Rinpoche's text throughout the tradition.

[15] The text is entitled: *bla ma sprul sku'i sgrub pa phyi ltar ñaṃsu blaṅ ba* (Chöwang 1979: 241–249).

To sum up on the two different deity cycles in Dudjom Rinpoche's corpus considered here, it is clear that both draw heavily on the heritage of earlier Revelations, and especially those of Guru Chöwang. While Revelation cycles on the same deity revealed by different lamas at different historical moments may have their own distinctive features, continuities are extensive in these cases, even – and perhaps especially – at the constituent level of specific passages of sacred text re-appearing anew within different frameworks.[16]

Dudjom Rinpoche as a scholarly editor, compiler, and commentator

For the second part of the paper, I focus on Dudjom Rinpoche's work as an editor, scholarly compiler, and commentator. The first case is that of the earliest Vajrakīlaya commentary he appears to have written, when he was still a teenager. This was a sixty-four page Ritual Practice Framework text (*sgrub khog*) for the *Vajrakīlaya who overwhelms Māra's Troops with his splendour* revealed by Drakngak Lingpa (*drag sṅags gliṅ pa*). Drakngak Lingpa was a charismatic lama from Eastern Tibet who had acquired a formidable reputation by the early twentieth century as an extraordinary spiritual master and a rebirth of Ātsara Sa le, renowned from the Guru Rinpoche hagiographies. He had established his seat in the Himalayan border region of Pemako, where he invited the young Dudjom Rinpoche to visit and bestow a lengthy series of tantric empowerments. While these ceremonies were taking place, the visionary lama was establishing the texts for the Vajrakīlaya Revelation he had received a few years before, and Dudjom Rinpoche received the transmissions from him, and even acted as the scribe in transcribing some of the master's words. Pressed by the older lama, Dudjom Rinpoche agreed to compose a Ritual Practice Framework text for the cycle, even though the revelatory texts already included one, and his colophon seems to hint that he had found the task somewhat daunting (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 454–455; Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume 'A: 488–

[16] See the discussion of the modular nature of Tibetan tantric literature in the article by Robert Mayer above.

489; see also Padma Rig ’dzin n.d.: 49–51). The case is interesting, since a number of features of Dudjom Rinpoche’s later contributions to various other Revelation cycles are already in evidence. Here, he spells out clearly that he “filled out” (*bsab*) the revelation text with material from Guru Chöwang’s *Ultra Secret Razor*, as well as from general Ritual Practice Framework texts, giving a presentation in accordance with the Mindroling (*smin grol gliṅ*) monastery styles of practice. We have already noted how Dudjom Rinpoche’s own Revelation practice manuals reproduce material from Guru Chöwang’s. Here, he informs us that he has drawn on Guru Chöwang’s Vajrakīlaya Revelation while compiling a suitable series of rituals for the practice of a Revelation cycle of a quite different lineage. Furthermore, the reference to the styles of the major Nyingmapa centre of the Mindroling monastery in Central Tibet indicates Dudjom Rinpoche’s interest in universalising a single specific Revelation, by integrating its practice with the more widely familiar Mindroling ritual conventions. This would become a hallmark of his later work on previous Revelations. But there is more to it than simply a matter of ritual conventions. Dudjom Rinpoche received the teachings of many different Nyingmapa lineages, but several of his principal lamas were Mindroling trained, and he himself spent time there, a period described by Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin as equivalent to his college education. Dudjom Rinpoche not only established Mindroling ritual protocols in the institutions under his guidance; it seems that he became perhaps as deeply immersed in some of the spiritual traditions which were specialisms at Mindroling, as he was in the Dudjom traditions which were his own specific heritage. The Guru Chöwang Revelations were one such Mindroling specialism. As noted above (see note 4), the seventeenth century founder of Mindroling, Terdak Lingpa (*gter bdag gliṅ pa*), had received the lineage from three sources. Terdak Lingpa’s father, Trinlé Lhundrup (*phrin las lhun grub*, 1611–1632) had become the lineage holder of the two previously separate lines of the transmission, which he passed to Terdak Lingpa, who then further received a direct (visionary) transmission from Guru Chöwang’s primordial wisdom body. Thus, the Mindroling lamas became central to the lineage transmission, and Dudjom Rinpoche himself received the lineage from one of his

Mindroling lamas, Orgyan Namdrol Gyamtso (*o rgyan rnam grol rgya mtsho*). Moreover, the main Ritual Manuals still in use today for Guru Chöwang's *Ultra Secret Razor Vajrakīlaya* and his *Secret Embodiment of the Lama* were both compiled by Terdak Lingpa, while Terdak Lingpa's scholarly brother, Lochen Dharmaśrī (1654–1717), had composed a commentarial text to accompany the *Ultra Secret Razor*, as well as a text on the ritual dances associated with the *Secret Embodiment of the Lama* performance. In short, Dudjom Rinpoche's interest in connecting his revelatory and scholarly textual productions with Mindroling traditions highlights his deep involvement with spiritual practices such as Guru Chöwang's Revelations, which were of importance to the Nyingmapa as a whole, and had been central to the Mindroling heritage.

When one analyses the content of Dudjom Rinpoche's text for Drakngak Lingpa's Vajrakīlaya cycle, we find that in contrast to the Ritual Practice Framework text included in the Revelation, Dudjom Rinpoche provides a detailed and explicit framework of sections and sub-sections, making it easy to navigate the material. He changes the order of some of the sections of the text, and his text is twice the length of that in the original Revelation. Dudjom Rinpoche includes most of Drakngak Lingpa's Ritual Practice Framework root verses, also indicating root verses to recite from the Revelation's Ritual Manual and other texts. Many of the further recitations added by Dudjom Rinpoche are recognisable as from Terdak Lingpa's Ritual Practice Framework text or his other compilations of Guru Chöwang's *Ultra Secret Razor*. Dudjom Rinpoche also integrates further generic material which is used widely in Major Practice Sessions (*sgrub chen*) of different tantric deities.

Perhaps what is most surprising about Dudjom Rinpoche's Ritual Practice Framework text is that he does not throughout integrate Drakngak Lingpa's Treasure text in an unmodified form. In fact, although most are used, some appropriate recitations given in the Revealer's text have been dropped altogether. They have been replaced by differently worded recitations without the Treasure punctuation (*gter śad*), some from Terdak Lingpa's Ritual Practice Framework text and some from other sources. Moreover, while many of the Revelation lines are reproduced unchanged, not all

are exact citations of root words. For example, there are four separate verses to be recited in offering to the Four Great Kings when the ritual boundaries are opened up at the end of the session, one for each of the deities. The original Revelation gave a single verse covering all (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 388), so Dudjom Rinpoche has expanded it to create four verses (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 447), an improvement which fits well with the standard practice. This involves a procession to each side of the temple in turn, where an appropriate verse for the particular King will be recited while offerings are made. Dudjom Rinpoche makes a more radical intervention in his reproduction of verses of Aspirations (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 450). Taking ten verse lines from the original Revelation (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 387–388), Dudjom Rinpoche has broken them into two verses, changed the order, and added an extra line. Since these Aspiration verses express common Mahāyāna Buddhist sentiments, it is conceivable that Dudjom Rinpoche's version might have picked up a different version of these Aspirations. However, it would seem more likely in this case that he is following the Revealer, but simply modifying the recitation to give it an improved structure, so that the first verse deals with the path (adding one line to make the amendment coherent), while the second deals with the fruit of the path. The interesting feature of these kinds of amendment is that they show that Dudjom Rinpoche, even at this early period, was prepared to intervene and amend the sacred root text itself, if by doing so, it would help to make the practice smoother. Perhaps most unexpectedly, if one assumes that a Revelation tradition will carefully preserve all its sacred words and manner of perfoming the rituals, a few instructions in the root Revelation appear to be directly contradicted. Thus, Dudjom Rinpoche changes some of the *maṇḍala* colours, and not only in the outer areas of the *maṇḍala*, but in particular, with the central triangle on which the deity arises, and also in the order of the primordial wisdom lights which constitute the Celestial Palace walls.[17] Thus, we can see that

[17] Dudjom Rinpoche (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 420) gives the central "dharma source" symbol, which is depicted as a triangle, as black (*dbus su chos 'byuṅ nag po*), while the original *gter ma* (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 372) gives dark blue (*dbus su chos 'byuṅ ni/ mthiṅ nag*). Generally, the central

despite the ideology of the sacredness of the Revelation words, a lama of Dudjom Rinpoche's stature can, and may even be *expected* to introduce slight modifications.

Finally, I would like to consider the case of Dudjom Rinpoche's two and a half volume work on *The Meteoric Iron Razor* (*gnam lcags spu gri*) and the earlier texts it is based on. Its extensive

---

triangle in Vajrakīlaya *maṇḍala*s is dark blue (and this is also given in Terdak Lingpa's *sgrub khog*: *dbus kyi gru gsum mthiṅ nag*, in Terdak Lingpa 1998, Volume 9: 322r). Had Dudjom Rinpoche's text read simply *nag*, then we might have suspected a scribal error (the omission of *mthiṅ*), but the word *nag po* is clear. I am uncertain, but the most likely reason for the non-standard colouring in this case, is most probably related to practical artistic considerations. Dudjom Rinpoche advises that the central deity should be represented by a dark blue syllable, *hūṃ*. Since a dark blue letter would not show up on a dark blue background, this may have been the reason for changing the colour. However, one *maṇḍala* representation (Duddul Rabtenling 2012: Plate 41) gives the black colouring for the triangle, which is outlined in blue, yet the seed syllable is not depicted. The order of the colours for the primordial wisdom walls specified in Dudjom Rinpoche's text (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 420) is, from the inside: blue, yellow, red, green, white (this sequence is given in the Duddul Rabtenling 2012: Plate 41). The root *gter ma* in contrast (Drakngak Lingpa 2005: 372) gives, white, yellow, red, green, blue. Terdak Lingpa's Ritual Practice Framework text here (Terdak Lingpa 1998, Volume 9: 322r) is different from both, giving, blue, white, yellow, red, green. It would make sense that Dudjom Rinpoche would change the order to give blue first: generally, the innermost wall is coloured in accordance with the *maṇḍala*'s principal deity, which in the case of Vajrakīlaya, is blue. Terdak Lingpa's colour schema is the most usual for Vajrakīlaya, and reflects the order of the direction colours, proceeding from the centre, to the east, south, west and north. In his modifications of the colour schema, Dudjom Rinpoche does not appear simply to have followed the scholarly principle of bringing the text into line with conventional depictions: a black triangle is not usual, and his order for the walls is closer to the norm than Drakngak Lingpa's, but still gives the white in a less usual place. It is possible that already Drakngak Lingpa's community might have introduced some practice conventions for the performance which Dudjom Rinpoche was reflecting in his text. Our more recent work on the Padma gliṅ pa cycle which Dudjom Rinpoche contributed to (Cantwell forthcoming) has focused our attention on this further aspect of the communal or collaborative nature of revelatory text production. Already established ritual conventions and the particular ritual practice needs of the community for whom the lama is compiling the text may play some part in the lama's choices of what to include and exclude in his work.

rites and commentarial manuals have helped to establish it as the primary Dudjom Vajrakīlaya practice, especially in the context of monastic practice, where long elaborate rituals are preferred. It represents Dudjom Rinpoche's compilations, ritual and commentarial texts on Dudjom Lingpa's cycle of *The Sealed Secret Heart Practice* (*thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can*). The discussion here is based primarily on the main Ritual Manuals. Now, there is considerable continuity between Dudul Dorje's Vajrakīlaya texts from his cycle of *The Heart Essence of Three* (*Deities*), *Amitāyus*, *Viśuddhaheruka*, *Vajrakīlaya* (*sñiṅ thig tshe yaṅ phur gsum*) and Dudjom Lingpa's *Sealed Secret Heart Practice*. Dudjom Lingpa's primary training was in Dudul Dorje's tradition, and frequent reference is made in Dudjom Lingpa's autobiography (Dudjom Lingpa 2011) to his performance of rituals and retreats focused on Dudul Dorje's works. Moreover, Dudjom Lingpa clearly identified himself with Dudul Dorje. There are many references within his autobiography both of his own self-recognition as Dudul Dorje's rebirth, and to confirmations of this status which he received in his visions. Many of Dudjom Lingpa's sections for recitation incorporate entire verses or passages word-for-word the same as in Dudul Dorje's Revelation, or with slight re-wordings. Most strikingly, Dudul Dorje's very distinctive expansion of a famous series of verses which always take centre-place in Vajrakīlaya texts,[18] is reproduced unchanged in Dudjom Lingpa's Revelation, and continues in Dudjom Rinpoche's *Meteoric Iron Razor*.[19] I have not found

---

[18] These verses open the famous short *rDo rje phur pa rtsa ba'i rgyud kyi dum bu*, which was translated and edited by the Sa skya Paṇḍita (1182–1251). Thus, alone of all the Phurpa tantras, it was included in the main tantra sections in the editions of both the Tshal pa and Them spaṅ ma *bKa' 'gyur*s (see the Bibliography for its location in several sources), and neither relegated to a separate *rñiṅ rgyud* section nor excluded altogether, as was the case with the great majority of Nyingma tantras. These same classic verses can also be found (with various textual variants slightly amending the meaning) in all the major Phurpa tantras as well as in virtually every Phurpa *sādhana* of any length.

[19] The parallel verses are found in Dudul Dorje's *phur pa'i las byaṅ phrin las kun khyab dgra bgegs kun 'dul* (DD[1] Volume Cha: 81–82, DD[2] Volume Cha: 262–263, DD[3]: 372–373, DD[4]: 224 [incomplete]); Dudjom Lingpa's

this expanded version of the verses in any other Vajrakīlaya text. At the same time, there are significant differences between Dudul Dorje's and Dudjom Lingpa's Ritual Manual. The group of deities to be visualised are rather different, even the specific forms of the central deities. Thus, while Dudjom Lingpa's Revelation incorporates material from Dudul Dorje's and they are closely related as part of one tradition, they are far from identical.

Dudjom Rinpoche's contributions witnessed in The Meteoric Iron Razor's Ritual Manual[20]

Dudjom Rinpoche's *Meteoric Iron Razor* is ostensibly a compilation of Dudjom Lingpa's *Sealed Secret Heart Practice* and not a new Revelation or in any sense mystically inspired, yet it is no simple copy.[21] Dudjom Rinpoche has integrated material from different parts of Dudjom Lingpa's cycle, from Dudul Dorje's Revelation and also from the Transmitted literature (*bka' ma*), to create a more complete

---

thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can/ dpal chen phrin las kyi sgrub pa/ rdo rje gźon nu'i las byaṅ ye śes sgyu 'phrul gyi gsaṅ mdzod (DL[1] Volume Ca: 42 and DL[2] Volume Ca: 56–57); Dudjom Rinpoche's *dpal rdo rje phur bu thugs kyi sgrub pa gsaṅ ba'i rgya can bdud 'joms gnam lcags spu gri'i las byaṅ khrag 'thuṅ mṅon par rol pa'i dga' ston* (1979–1985, Volume Tha: 90–91). It is quite possible, even likely, that Dudul Dorje may have inherited this wording from a tradition in which he was previously trained. However, I have not so far identified the phrasing in any other source, despite searching. It is worth noting that neither Dudjom Lingpa's nor Dudjom Rinpoche's other Vajrakīlaya revelations employ this distinctive phrasing; it seems confined to this specific strand inherited from Dudul Dorje. The task of finding such parallel passages in previous sources will become very much easier when searchable computer input of a wide range of Tibetan texts has been achieved. Currently, the work has to be done purely by the browsing of texts (mainly) in pdf format, and doubtlessly some parallels are missed.

[20] *dpal rdo rje phur bu thugs kyi sgrub pa gsaṅ ba'i rgya can bdud 'joms gnam lcags spu gri'i las byaṅ khrag 'thuṅ mṅon par rol pa'i dga' ston* (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 77–153).

[21] In several of the other sections of *The Meteoric Iron Razor*'s two and a half volumes, Dudjom Rinpoche brings his extensive scholarly knowledge to bear on the tradition, and this results in further kinds of influences on the practice, but here, I concentrate purely on the evidence from the Ritual Manual.

practice manual than is found in Dudjom Lingpa's original texts, and moreover, the new text has a very clear ordered structure, with explicit section titles in some cases lacking in the earlier versions.

Unlike Dudjom Rinpoche's concise root text for his *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch*, Dudjom Lingpa does not have a single root revelation text for his *Sealed Secret Heart Practice*, but he does have a text of several hundred pages in length (DL[1] Volume Ṅa: 43–492), containing many separate sections, and including important root verses, and this becomes an important resource for Dudjom Rinpoche's compilation. Parts appear carefully constructed, but some sections finish mid-stream, marked at the end by *ḍākinī* symbolic lettering which closes off, or more precisely, re-encodes the remaining stream of revelation. It seems that this generally indicates interruptions to the flow of the revelation, and in parts, the text is rather disjointed, stopping mid-stream and re-starting, apparently beginning the same line again, as though the revealer is pausing momentarily.

The clearest aspect of Dudjom Rinpoche's work in his Ritual Manual is that he has integrated material from at least five different texts of Dudjom Lingpa's Revelation, involving some re-ordering and re-working of text. The overall structure of *The Meteoric Iron Razor* Ritual Manual is formed by combining Dudjom Lingpa's Ritual Manual for his *Sealed Secret Heart Practice* together with his text for the tantric *Tshogs* Feast (= *tshogs kyi 'khor lo*, equivalent to Sanskrit *gaṇacakra*). Yet Dudjom Lingpa's Manual lacks detail on the visualisation of the deities, and for the meditation during the mantra recitation, the two central meditative components on which the entire practice depends. Dudjom Rinpoche has thus taken his detailed deity descriptions from the various sub-texts within the long source revelation text within the previous volume, re-ordering and integrating them into a single long passage. He also includes material from the two short Manuals for the Concealed practice (*gab byaṅ*) and the Inner Accomplishment practice (*naṅ sgrub*), along with the text for the Empowerment rite (*dbaṅ chog*).

A second notable feature of Dudjom Rinpoche's work is that he has integrated material from Dudul Dorje's Treasure Revelation,

not found in Dudjom Lingpa's texts. That is, he has used additional material from the main predecessor of both the Dudjom incarnations. In *The Meteoric Iron Razor* Ritual Manual, the distinction between Revelation and non-Revelation text is indicated by the use (or absence) of the special punctuation mark (the *gter śad*) which is given at the end of each line of a Treasure Revelation. Many marked Revelation lines not found in Dudjom Lingpa's *Sealed Secret Heart Practice*, derive from the earlier Dudul Dorje Revelation.[22] Moreover, key components of Dudul Dorje's *tshogs*

[22] In particular, the identified parallel passages come from Dudul Dorje's main Vajrakīlaya Ritual Manual (*yaṅ gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ khrag las*: *sñiṅ thig tshe yaṅ phur gsum gyi*: *phur pa'i las byaṅ phrin las kun khyab dgra bgegs kun 'dul*, DD[1] Volume Cha: 73–114; DD[2] Volume Cha: 255–288, DD[3]: 445–472, DD[4]: 248–259), and from his separate *tshogs* tantric feast section (*sñiṅ thig tshe yaṅ phur gsum gyi tshogs mchod mi zad gter gyi rgyan 'khor*, DD[1] Volume Cha: 141–158; DD[2] Volume Cha: 289–302; DD[3]: 349–409, although this includes also an insert, pp. 357–369; DD[4]: 224–247, but note that this is incomplete, and includes an inappropriate insert, pp. 225–232). Parallels are found in the Confession section (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 85, DD[1] Volume Cha: 80–81); the titles for the root verses on the three meditative absorptions (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 90–91, DD[1] Volume Cha: 81–82); lines opening and closing the section on the Celestial Palace visualisation (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 92, 94, DD[1] Volume Cha: 83); lines within the section for Generating the Deity (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 94–95, DD[1] Volume Cha: 83–84); lines on the Ten Wrathful Deities in the retinue, even though the actual appearance of these emanations appears to differ (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 103, DD[1] Volume Cha: 95); lines in the visualisation of the twenty-one Supreme Son emanations (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 104, DD[1] Volume Cha: 95–96). Dudjom Rinpoche also follows Dudul Dorje in including a nine metre variation on the fifth root verse of the *rDo rje phur pa rtsa ba'i rgyud kyi dum bu* as part of the empowerment section (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 105–106, DD[1] Volume Cha: 97). It is possible that some of the additions I have *not* yet identified either in Dudjom Lingpa's or Dudul Dorje's texts may be found in Dudjom Lingpa's *Sealed Secret Heart Practice* (see note 19 above on the difficulties of exhaustive comparison). It is moreover plausible that some of the passages I have found in Dudul Dorje's Revelation might also come to light elsewhere within Dudjom Lingpa's texts. However, I have not identified them in any part of his *Sealed Secret Heart Practice*, nor within his second quite different Vajrakīlaya Revelation, the *Vajrakīlaya Sugata-essence* or *Vajrakīlaya Tathāgatagarbha* (*phur pa bde gśegs sñiṅ po*). Even if they

feast section are taken up by Dudjom Rinpoche in his separate short *tshogs* text for *The Meteoric Iron Razor* (*rdo rje phur pa'i tshogs mchod graṅs gsog ñer bsdus*, Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 177–178). This integration of Dudul Dorje's *tshogs* recitations is a clear indication of Dudjom Rinpoche's decision to incorporate Dudul Dorje's practice into *The Meteoric Iron Razor*'s everyday rites.[23]

Thirdly, Dudjom Rinpoche has added many lines which lack the special Revelation punctuation mark (*gter śad*), including recitations conveying further teachings, crucial meditation instructions, commentary and elaborations, many of which are drawn more

---

do occur somewhere in Dudjom Lingpa's corpus, they appear to have been omitted from the recitations which are most obviously central for *The Sealed Secret Heart Practice*'s principal meditative ritual, while on the contrary, they *are* found in the appropriate sections of Dudul Dorje's works. The obvious conclusion is that Dudjom Rinpoche has taken them from Dudul Dorje's and not from Dudjom Lingpa's Revelation.

[23] Dudjom Rinpoche's colophon to the text appears to acknowledge that he has drawn on Dudul Dorje's as well as Dudjom Lingpa's Revelation here: he writes that he has "extracted" the text, "from within the earlier and later main Revelation source(s)," *źes pa'aṅ gter gźuṅ goṅ 'og las btus pa ste 'jigs bral ye śes rdo rjes so/* (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 178). It is also possible that throughout *The Meteoric Iron Razor* Ritual Manual, Dudjom Rinpoche not only supplemented his presentation with passages from Dudul Dorje, but that he checked his readings of Dudjom Lingpa by consulting Dudul Dorje, and edited accordingly. On at least one occasion of a passage shared by all three lamas (in the build-up of the elements which form the basis for the Celestial Palace visualisation), where a variant reading is found in the two copies of Dudul Dorje which we have (*māṃ sa'i*, as opposed to *gser gyi*), one variant (*gser gyi*) is followed by Dudjom Lingpa, while the other – that found in the copy of Dudul Dorje's works which comes from Dudjom Rinpoche's own library – is followed by Dudjom Rinpoche (DD[1] Volume Cha: 82; DD[2] Volume Cha: 263; DL[1] Volume Ca: 43; DL[2] Volume Cha: 58; Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 92). It seems unlikely that the reading *māṃ sa'i* would have been introduced accidentally, so it is quite possible that Dudjom Rinpoche followed Dudul Dorje. We need caution here, however. Dudjom Rinpoche may simply have been using an earlier version of Dudjom Lingpa's text, while the copyist of the current edition of Dudjom Lingpa's *Collected Works* might possibly have corrupted the reading *māṃ sa'i*, into the more cliched, *gser gyi*.

widely from the Vajrakīlaya traditions. There are an additional two pages of description of the visualised celestial palace, which is summed up in a single four line verse in Dudjom Lingpa's main Ritual Manual (DL[1] Volume Ca: 43). Dudul Dorje (DD[1] Volume Cha: 83) gives just two verses. I have identified a parallel passage of eleven lines of this section, within a Ritual Manual for the *Rog lugs* Vajrakīlaya tradition (*rdo rje phur bu rog lugs kyi sgrub thabs las byaṅ dṅos grub char 'bebs*). This text, from a transmitted rather than a Revelation source, was compiled by Lochen Dharmaśrī, the great Mindroling scholar mentioned above for his work on Guru Chöwang's Revelations. Dudjom Rinpoche included this *Rogs lugs* text in his own Transmitted Teachings compilation (Dudjom Rinpoche 1982–1987, Volume Ta: 457–537) and composed a Lineage Supplication to accompany it (*rog lugs kyi phur pa'i brgyud 'debs, bdud 'joms bka' ma*, Volume Ta: 453–455). Again, we can note the influence of Dudjom Rinpoche's Mindroling training here, in this case, one of the Transmitted Vajrakīlaya traditions associated with Mindroling.

Fourthly, we find a number of sometimes small yet significant amendments to the Revelation, seemingly to bring greater consistency to the meditative visualisations, and clearing up apparent discrepancies. Just as in the case of Dudjom Rinpoche's work on Drakngak Lingpa's Vajrakīlaya, we see changes of wording, reordering and omission of words or lines, demonstrating a willingness to re-work the sacred words.[24] Sometimes, apparently small

[24] It is necessary to add the caveat that in cases of very small amendments and spelling corrections etc., we cannot always be certain that deliberate amendments have been made. We are now unfortunately in the position that we have access only to a single version of most of Dudjom Lingpa's works. The Bhutanese version of his *Collected Works* appears merely to represent a copy of the hand-written version from Dudjom Rinpoche's own library, which he had printed in Kalimpong. Where the readings of *The Meteoric Iron Razor* differ from this edition, we cannot be certain that Dudjom Rinpoche was in fact copying and emending this source. Even if Dudjom Rinpoche only succeeded in bringing this version from Tibet, he had written most of *The Meteoric Iron Razor* texts many years before while still residing in Tibet (for example, he wrote *The Meteoric Iron Razor* Ritual Manual and its commentary in 1932–1933). Dudjom Lingpa's *Collected Works* were compiled

re-wordings may bring greater consistency and clear up apparent discrepancies. A tantric deity may be depicted in various forms for different ritual purposes, so there may be good reasons for variations, but Dudjom Rinpoche has standardized or chosen a specific set of visualisations and amended or simply not used alternatives. A most striking case is that of two deities within the central *maṇḍala*, which Dudjom Lingpa's texts do not always include. One is the second consort, E-ka-dza-ṭī, the consort for violent 'releasing' into the Buddha fields, as opposed to the first consort who unites with the central deity. The other is Buddha Kīla, the first of the Kīla deities of the Buddha families who form the immediate circle around the main deity. In *The Meteoric Iron Razor* Ritual Manual's Generation section, E-ka-dza-ṭī and Buddha Kīla are described as positioned to the left and right of the central deity respectively. The other four Kīla deities then surround the central deities and are placed in the four cardinal directions. In Dudjom Lingpa's source Revelation text, no mention is made of either of these deities, and the lines for recitation speak of the four family Kīla deities (DL[1] Volume Ṅa: 68). Where *The Meteoric Iron Razor* Ritual Manual repeats these lines, the word *four* has been changed into *five* (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 97), and similar amendments are also made elsewhere in the text.[25]

---

by Sera Khandro (*se ra mkha' 'gro*, 1892–1940; see Jacoby 2007: 62–64) but we have no idea how many copyings were done before the single witness we now have available. Moreover, it is quite possible that other compilations of Dudjom Lingpa's Works may have been made by Dudjom Lingpa's family: Sera Khandro did not have a good personal relationship with many of them, and she might have been working independently. If they did make a separate *Collected Works*, it is no longer available, yet given the difficulties in Eastern Tibet during the Chinese occupation and the Cultural Revolution, this would not be altogether surprising. Furthermore, there must once have been versions of the individual texts, and it is quite likely that some of them would have remained in circulation even after the *Collected Works* had been compiled. Thus, it is possible that Dudjom Rinpoche may have had access to a copy of Dudjom Lingpa's *Sealed Secret Heart Practice* with quite different readings from those of the current edition.

[25] Moreover, the earlier four has been changed to five even in Dudjom Rinpoche's version of Dudjom Lingpa's own Fulfilment supplement (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha, 157–162), which retains the original

The two deities *are*, however, found in various other parts of Dudjom Lingpa's collection.[26] The texts mentioning Buddha Kīla sometimes describe him as white, while Vajra Kīla is blue (DL[1] Volume Ca: 60–61), but elsewhere, give Buddha Kīla as blue and Vajra Kīla as white (DL[1] Volume Ca: 84), the colour scheme of *The Meteoric Iron Razor* Ritual Manual (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Tha: 95–96). In short, Dudjom Lingpa's texts do not give these two deities at all in some sections, and where they are given, there is variation in the colour scheme for Buddha Kīla and Vajra Kīla. Dudjom Rinpoche, then, included them and settled on one version for the visualisation, bringing the families of Kīlas into line elsewhere in the texts.

Final Reflections

Summing up the clearest features of Dudjom Rinpoche's work on Drakngak Lingpa's and Dudjom Lingpa's Vajrakīlaya Revelations considered here, we see an interest in creating well-ordered and consistent practice texts, through selective integration and re-working of the source texts, together with amendments or expansions based on practice traditions from a broader heritage of Vajrakīlaya texts, and especially those connected with Mindroling. In part, the new versions of the texts, with their clear conventional structuring, sometimes augmented by familiar liturgies, may help in universalising the specific Revelations. More than this, they also help to preserve and integrate the sacred words and spiritual vision of great masters of the past. Components of Terdak Lingpa's Ritual

---

colophon identifying it as Dudjom Lingpa's. Although, as explained above, the immediate retinue in Dudul Dorje's Revelation is rather different, it is worth noting that he too has the four and not the five Kīla deities (apparently consistently in his case). The circle of eight in his *maṇḍala* include the four Kīla deities in the intermediate directions.

[26] They are found in the Concealed practice Manual (DL[1] Volume Ca: 60–61), the Empowerment rite (DL[1] Volume Ca: 6–7) and the Inner Accomplishment text (DL[1] Volume Ca: 84), while Buddha Kīla is mentioned in the Destructive Expelling ritual (*drag zlog*, DL[1] Volume Ca: 207–208). One of the Fulfilment texts (DL[1] Volume Ca: 120–121) speaks of E-ka-dza-ṭī, but omits Buddha Kīla.

Practice Framework text for Guru Chöwang's *Ultra Secret Razor*, as well as classic elements of Ritual Practice Framework texts more generally, are combined with Drakngak Lingpa's inspired words. Dudul Dorje's influence is already present within Dudjom Lingpa's Revelation, yet Dudjom Rinpoche chose to add further passages from his Revelation cycle. A vision of the Celestial Palace found in the transmitted *Rog lugs* tradition clarifies an undeveloped section of Dudjom Lingpa's corpus. Since Dudul Dorje's words are also revealed text, they are marked by the Revelation punctuation, and it would not be clear to most practitioners of Dudjom Rinpoche's *Meteoric Iron Razor* that they had not been part of Dudjom Lingpa's cycle. But even in the case of the additional lines describing the details of the Celestial Palace, where the passage lacks the Revelation punctuation, it is probably safe to assume that few practitioners wo5uld reflect on the basis for the new integral vision created by Dudjom Rinpoche's Ritual Manual.[27] Given also Dudjom Rinpoche's own status as an enlightened master and the authentic representative of the lineage, the new version has come to represent the sacred tradition as a whole.

A not dissimilar production process seems to be at work where Dudjom Rinpoche is composing texts for his own Revelation cycles. In the *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch Vajrakīlaya*, passages found in Guru Chöwang's *Ultra Secret Razor* Revelation are integrated, and it is not clear whether such expansions of the text are to be considered part of the sacred Revelation or not, but in any case, it is the Ritual Manual and the other practice texts which become synonymous with the Revelation tradition. Dudjom Rinpoche's Revelations are also remarkably well-structured. In the case of the *Embodiment*

[27] Nonetheless, some do. Since I wrote this, I discussed the Celestial Palace passage with senior lamas at the Pema Yoedling Dratsang, Gelegphu, Bhutan. They were interested in the identification of the *Rog lugs* parallel text. One commented that they had noticed the addition, and had previously wondered about it, speculating that it might perhaps have come from Dudjom Rinpoche's pure vision. Most of these lamas had themselves been direct students of Dudjom Rinpoche. Presumably, as the new texts are subsequently transmitted, it is likely that the earlier versions would become less familiar to further generations of practitioners, and Dudjom Rinpoche's versions uncritically accepted as representing the original tradition.

of Seven Treasuries, where the text as a whole appears to have a slightly unusual or ambivalent status as both Revelation and compilation, the sacred words of Guru Chöwang's *Secret Embodiment of the Lama*, along with those of five other important Revealers of the past, are combined into a new whole. Conformity with standard ordering is especially clear in the re-arrangement of sections for the Ritual Manual, in comparison with Terdak Lingpa's version of Guru Chöwang's *Secret Embodiment of the Lama*.

However, in case the impression is given that Dudjom Rinpoche's contribution is essentially merely to reproduce and tidy up the literary legacy of the past, while taming or containing new visionary formulas so that they become submerged within the straitjacket of the well trusted procedures of the traditional heritage, I want to make it clear that idiosyncratic elements are not necessarily edited out or lost. I end with one rather unusual example of Dudjom Rinpoche's work on *The Meteoric Iron Razor*. This is a section within the Secondary Ritual (*smad las*), performed in order to overcome negative forces and misfortunes, often as a public monastic ceremony at the end of the year for the benefit of the local community. In general, despite the pervasive repetition of passages from appropriate previous sources, when a revealer produces more than one textual cycle on a single tantric deity, there may be little overlap between them, especially in their main root verses. We have seen that the main Ritual Manual for Dudjom Rinpoche's *Razor Disintegration-on-Touch* has little in common with *The Meteoric Iron Razor*. Dudjom Lingpa revealed two Vajrakīlaya cycles, and also produced a pure vision Vajrakīlaya cycle, and there are very few overlaps between them. Dudjom Rinpoche's work on Dudjom Lingpa's cycles also reflects the clear distinctions between these cycles: his *Meteoric Iron Razor* is largely restricted to the *Sealed Secret Heart Practice* amongst Dudjom Lingpa's cycles, while he also wrote ritual practice texts for Dudjom Lingpa's *Sugata Essence* (*bde gśegs sñiṅ po*) Vajrakīlaya cycle (Dudjom Rinpoche 1979–1985, Volume Ta: 597–652), and these also are largely confined to the source texts of this Revelation (found within the second half of DL[1] Volume Ca). Yet within *The Meteoric Iron Razor*'s Secondary Ritual, Dudjom Rinpoche has inserted a very distinctive passage

of several pages for expelling evil forces, including it as a branch recitation, to be performed following the main recitations. It starts with a myth of origin for the sharpened barberry sticks which form a criss-crossed fence around the torma which is to be cast out at the culmination of the rite.[28] This is followed by a series of verses describing animal and spirit creatures, types of pestilences and severe climatory phenomena which gather at the points of the sticks, above and below, and at their middle. Finally, there are a number of lines which list the various evils to be expelled by this magical circle of barberry sticks. Now, this section does not even derive from Dudjom Lingpa's *Sealed Secret Heart Practice*, but is instead found as a separate section within his Pure Vision cycle, the *Primordial Wisdom Latticework* (*dag snaṅ ye śes drwa ba*). This Vajrakīlaya cycle is not generally practised and is little known in the Dudjom tradition. It appears that Dudjom Rinpoche has felt it so important to ensure that this rather singular recitation connected with the barberry sticks should be kept alive, that he has included it within his *Meteoric Iron Razor* compilation, without mentioning where it comes from.

It is hard to say how typical Dudjom Rinpoche's editorial techniques may be of scholarly lamas who take on the responsibility of compiling texts for a Revelation cycle, but certainly, it would seem that principles of a certain amount of re-ordering and re-working

---

[28] Lopon P. Ogyan Tanzin (personal communication, July 2013) confirmed my impression that this story does not seem to represent part of the broader ritual heritage: he had never heard anything like it before. He suggested that this example of a Pure Vision teaching is likely to reflect a typical process in the appearance of Mahāyoga scripture, in which a particular issue or context provides the inspiration or the underlying basis (*gleṅ gźi*), raising the theme which is then elaborated on in the tantra. He argued that if a master should look at the sky, some *rDzogs chen* teaching might arise, but for Mahāyoga, it is necessary for a topic first to be raised. Thus, in this case, he suggested that Dudjom Lingpa may have reflected on the absence of an origin story for the boundary fence of barberry sticks, and the need to understand this aspect of the ritual better, and after resting his mind, the verses may have sprung up. Of course, it may still transpire that this apparently unusual recitation has parallels within previous Vajrakīlaya traditions, although I have not yet identified any such precedents.

of a Revelation source, to create consistent and discrete texts suitable for recitation and ritual practice, are likely to be widespread.[29] Perhaps what may be less common is the synthesizing of a specific Revelation with text from previous Revelations and from the transmitted literature, and the apparent blurring of lines between one's own revelatory text, that of previous revealers, and one's own editorial interventions. Yet it is quite likely that Dudjom Rinpoche was far from unique in this respect; other towering figures who left an impressive legacy of influential work on previous Revelations, such as Terdak Lingpa and Jamgon Kongtrul, may well have worked similarly, and they too had a huge range of spiritual lineages to draw upon when making their compilations.

A rather separate issue is the question of the effect of the editorial process on the end product: Dudjom Rinpoche's work can be seen as in effect integrating the productions of visionary lamas of specific lineage affiliation into the mainstream. Again, this too seems to have been a feature of the work of some earlier high status learnèd visionaries. It is clear that Terdak Lingpa was seeking to unify and strengthen the Nyingmapa across Tibet, and one aspect of this was drawing together an extraordinarily broad heritage, combining it with a focus on the works of the ancestral forefathers, Nyang-ral (*ñaṅ ral ñi ma 'od zer*, 1124–1192) and Guru Chöwang. Kongtrul is famous for seeking to preserve minor revelation lineages, and he composed/compiled many practice texts for them. Without the detailed comparisons I have done for the Dudjom case study, I am uncertain how far these were compiled in a similar fashion to Dudjom Rinpoche's, but it would not be surprising if they were.

---

[29] More recent project work on a Ritual Manual compiled for the Padma gliṅ pa Vajrakīlaya tradition by the third *gsuṅ sprul* or Padma gliṅ pa incarnation would seem to confirm this impression. A further significant aspect of these editorial processes, present in many instances of compilations written by Dudjom Rinpoche and other lamas, but not so prominent in the examples considered in this paper (since metred verses were already present in the revelation sources), is that the compiler may re-work the revelatory words written in prose to create beautiful metrical verses for recitation. This dimension will be addressed at greater length in Cantwell, forthcoming.

As well as universalising diverse traditions, Dudjom Rinpoche's own immersion in the Mindroling heritage, and his specific choice to apply these materials to his work, means that in adding a Mindroling gloss to the Revelations of Eastern Tibetan visionary lamas, he was able to lend their works a more scholarly Central Tibetan sensibility. There is a further interesting aspect of what was clearly a *choice* on Dudjom Rinpoche's part to infuse his writings with Mindroling heritage visionary writings. Although the thrust of the ideology relating to Revelations may be rather prescriptive, inevitably linking a lama such as Dudjom Rinpoche with the teachings destined for Drokben Khye'u-chung lotsawa's rebirths, the system is flexible enough to allow for some divergence from the allotted 'destiny.' In this case, a prediction apparently relating to Dudjom Rinpoche alone amongst the series of rebirths is used to explain why Dudjom Rinpoche focused to such an extent on the broader heritage.[30]

Finally, we can conclude that the erudite scholar lama's work may seek to reproduce, creatively re-work and systematise the classic works of towering visionaries of the Nyingmapa heritage, integrating them with the productions of more recent revealers. The new versions of the Revelations then take on a sacred status themselves, and above all, become central to the actual practice tradition, while the initial decodings of the symbolic Treasure Revelation may be lost to sight. But along with the tendency to impose familiar structures, to repeat well-known liturgies, and to universalise the singular revelations of lamas of relatively narrow lineage affiliations, there remains room to preserve distinctive perspectives and developments of the ritual and symbolic repertoire, and this doubtless contributes to the overall sense of vibrancy in the tradition.

---

[30] This is an oft-cited prophesy of O rgyan bde chen gliṅ pa: "Either (he) will bring forth new Treasure Revelations, or protect the teachings of the old Treasure Revelations," *gter gsar 'byin nam gter rñiṅ bstan pa skyoṅs* (Tsewang Dongyal 2003: 25; the equivalent passage is in Tsewang Dongyal 2008: 65).

General Abbreviations

DD[1]	See Dudul Dorje 1997.
DD[2]	See Dudul Dorje 1976.
DD[3]	See Dudul Dorje 1971.
DD[4]	See Dudul Dorje 1973.
DL[1]	See Dudjom Lingpa 2004.
DL[2]	See Dudjom Lingpa 1978.
TBRC	Tibetan Buddhist Resource Center (online http://www.tbrc.org/).

Bibliography

Boord, M. J. 2002. *A Bolt of Lightning From The Blue*: *The vast commentary of Vajrakīla that clearly defines the essential points*. Annotated translations, including *Phur 'grel 'bum nag* as transmitted to Ye-shes mtsho-rgyal. Berlin: edition khordong.

'Bum nag, The: *rdo rje phur pa'i bśad 'bum slob dpon rnam gsum gyi dgoṅs pa slob dpon chen po padmas mkhar chen bza' la gdams pa / phur 'grel 'bum nag ces gźan las khyad par 'phags pa'i thugs kyi ti la ka*. Two editions: (1) Dudjom Rinpoche 1982–1987, Volume Tha, pp. 215–557. (2) *Phur pa 'bum nag* and *Phur pa'i 'grel chen bdud rtsi dri med*, *Two rare Vajrakīla teachings from the miraculous Lotus-born Gu-ru Rin-po-che Padmasambhava*, reproduced from rare mss. from the library of Lopon Sonam Sangpo. Gonpo Tseten, Gangtok 1976, pp. 1–229. An electronic version is available from the Tibetan Buddhist Resource Centre, New York (TBRC W27485).

Cantwell, Cathy (forthcoming). "Re-presenting a famous Revelation: Dudjom Rinpoche's work on the *Ultra Secret Razor Lifeforce Vajrakīlaya* (*yang gsang srog gi spu gri*) of Pema Lingpa (*padma gling pa*, 1450–1521)." Unpublished paper presented to the section on *Originality and the Role of Intertextuality in the Context of Buddhist Texts* at the International Association of Buddhist Studies conference, Vienna, August 2014, to be published in the proceedings of the section (in *Buddhist Studies Review).*

Chatral Rinpoche n.d. = Chatral Sangye Dorje Rinpoche *(bya bral saṅs rgyas rdo rje*). *thugs sgrub gter kha bdun 'dus daṅ 'brel ba'i bsñen yig sñiṅ por bsdus pa bltas gsal dri med śel gyi me loṅ*.

(This appears to be a text extracted from a block printed volume: it is labelled in the margin simply as *bsñen yig*, and has English page numbers, 1–21. I procured the text from the Dudjom tradition Rewalsar monastery in 1982.)

Chöwang. 1979 = Guru Chöwang (*gu ru chos kyi dbaṅ 'phyug*). *gsaṅ 'dus bla ma'i thugs sgrub kyi skor*: *a collection of rare teachings from the*

revelations of gu-ru chos-kyi-dban-phyug. Paro, Bhutan: Ugyen Tempai Gyaltsen. (= *Rin chen gter mdzod chen po'i rgyab chos*, Volume 10; TBRC W23455.)

Dharmaśrī, Lochen (*lo chen dharma śrī*). *rdo rje phur bu rog lugs kyi sgrub thabs las byaṅ dṅos grub char 'bebs* in Dudjom Rinpoche 1982–1987, Volume Ta: 457–537.

Dharmaśrī, Lochen (*lo chen dharma śrī*). 1975–2000. *Collected Works (gsun 'bum) of Smin-glin Lo-chen Dharma-śrī*. Dehra Dun: D. Kochhen Tulku (TBRC W9140).

Specific texts referred to:

rdo rje phur bu yaṅ gsaṅ spu gri'i bsñen yig rin chen sñe ma, Volume 15: 143r–158r.

gsaṅ 'dus bla ma'i las byaṅ daṅ 'brel ba'i tshes bcu mchod pa'i 'chams kyi brjed byaṅ bde gsal 'phrul gyi me loṅ, Volume 19: 105r–111v.

Drakngak Lingpa (*drag sṅags gliṅ pa*). 1983–1985. *bdud 'joms drag sṅags gliṅ pa'i gter chos. The Collected Revelations (gter-chos) of bDud-'joms-drag-sngags-gliṅ-pa*. Bir, District Kangra: Tulku Pema Lodoe (TBRC W21576).

Drakngak Lingpa (*drag sṅags gliṅ pa*). 2005. *sprul pa'i gter chen bdud 'joms drag sṅags gliṅ pa'i gter chos*. Volume Hūṃ. Taiwan (publication details given in Chinese).

Duddul Rabtenling (*bdud 'dul rab brtan gliṅ*). 2012. *bdud 'joms 'jigs bral ye śes rdo rje'i gter chos yoṅs kyi dkyil 'khor* (*The Comprehensive Mandala of H.H. Dudjom Rinpoche's Terchoi*). Odisha, India: Duddul Rabtenling Monastery.

Dudjom Lingpa. 1978. *gter chos/bdud 'joms gliṅ pa*; *sprul pa'i gter chen bdud 'joms gling pa'i zab gter gsang ba'i chos sde*, *The collected gter-ma rediscoveries of Gter-chen Bdud-'joms-gliṅ-pa /edited by H. H. Bdud-'joms 'Jigs-bral-ye-śes-rdo-rje*. In *dbu med* script. Kalimpong: Dupjung Lama (TBRC W21728).

Dudjom Lingpa. 2004. *gter chos/bdud 'joms gliṅ pa*; *sprul pa'i gter chen bdud 'joms gliṅ pa'i zab gter gsaṅ ba'i chos sde*. 21 volumes. Thimphu, Bhutan: Lama Kuenzang Wangdue (TBRC W28732).

(Note that a version of the *Collected Works* in *dbu med* script had been published in 1978 in Kalimpong (TBRC W21728); the relevant passages cited have also been checked in this earlier version.)

Specific texts referred to:

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can: dpal chen phriṅ las kyi sgrub pa: rdo rje gźon nu'i gsaṅ sgrub/ las bźi lhun grub:, Volume Ṅa: 43–492.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can gyi: dbaṅ chog 'khor lo'i khyab bdag:, Volume Ca: 1–22.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can: dpal chen phrin las kyi sgrub pa: rdo rje gźon nu'i las byaṅ ye śes sgyu 'phrul gyi gsaṅ mdzod:, Volume Ca: 33–56.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can gyi: gźuṅ las 'phros pa'i gab byaṅ:, Volume Ca: 57–67.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can gyi: gab byaṅ las 'phros dmar byaṅ:, Volume Ca: 69–73.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can: dpal chen phrin las kyi sgrub pa: rdo rje gźon nu'i naṅ sgrub ñi zla'i tshom bu:, Volume Ca: 79–94.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can: dpal chen phrin las kyi sgrub pa: rdo rje gźon nu'i tshogs mchod: dṅos grub baṅ mdzod kyi lde mig:, Volume Ca: 95–118.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can dpal chen phrin las kyi sgrub skor las: bskaṅ ba dṅos grub char 'bebs, Volume Ca: 119–123.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can gyi skor: dpal chen rdo rje gźon nu'i bskaṅ ba dpag bsam ljon shiṅ rgyas pa:, Volume Ca: 125–128.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro sñiṅ thig las: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can gyi: drag zlog gnam 'cags 'khor lo, Volume Ca: 203–217.

dag snaṅ ye shes drwa ba las: drag po'i rtsaṅ phur gyi bskyed chog bskul ba daṅ bcas pa, Volume Ba: 139–150.

Dudjom Lingpa. 2011. *A Clear Mirror*: *The Visionary Autobiography of a Tibetan Master*. Translated by Chönyi Dolma and Ann Holland. Hong Kong: Ranjung Yeshe. (The Tibetan version is found in Dudjom Lingpa *Collected Works* [DL[1]]: Volume Dza.)

Dudjom Rinpoche. 1979–1985. *Collected Works*: *The collected writings and revelations of H. H. bDud-'joms Rin-po-che 'Jigs bral ye shes rdo rje*. 25 volumes. Kalimpong: Dupjung Lama (TBRC W20869 0334–0358; *bDud 'joms 'jigs bral ye shes rdo rje'i gsuṅ 'bum*).

Specific texts referred to:

bla ma thugs kyi sgrub pa'i las byaṅ dṅos grub 'dod 'jo'i dga' ston, Volume Ca: 1–39.

bla ma thugs kyi sgrub pa'i byin rlabs gtor ma'i dbaṅ bskur gyi cho ga skal bzaṅ 'dod 'jo, Volume Ca: 61–76.

bla ma'i thugs sgrub nor bu rgya mtsho'i las byaṅ padma'i ljon shiṅ khrigs su bsdebs pa rig 'dzin dgoṅs rgyan, Volume Cha: 1–47.

pad gliṅ phur pa yaṅ gsaṅ srog gi spu gri, Volume Cha: 405–749.

phur bu yaṅ gsaṅ bde gśegs sñiṅ po'i skor, Volume Ta: 597–652.

phur pa bdud 'joms gnam lcags spu gri (*The Meteoric Iron Razor*), Volume Tha and Volume Da.

Specific texts cited here:

dpal rdo rje phur bu thugs kyi sgrub pa gsaṅ ba'i rgya can bdud 'joms gnam lcags spu gri'i las byaṅ khrag 'thuṅ mṅon par rol pa'i dga' ston, Volume Tha: 77–153.

zab gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ thig las: dpal chen rdo rje gźon nu'i bskaṅ ba dpag bsam ljon shiṅ rgyas pa: thugs sgrub gsaṅ ba'i rgya can gyi skor:, Volume Tha: 157–162.

rdo rje phur pa'i tshogs mchod graṅs gsog ñer bsdus, Volume Tha: 177–178.

dpal rdo rje phur bu bdud 'joms gnam lcags spu gri'i smad las dgra bgegs sgrol ba'i las rim khrag 'thuṅ khros pa'i dga' ston, Volume Tha: 419–521.

phur pa spu gri reg phuṅ gi skor (The Razor Disintegration-on-Touch texts), Volume Ba: 459–621.

Specific texts cited here:

phur pa spu gri reg phuṅ gi rtsa ba, Volume Ba: 459–477.

rdo rje phur pa spu gri reg phuṅ gi phrin las bdud sde'i g'yul 'joms, Volume Ba: 481–520.

rdo rje phur pa spu gri reg phuṅ gi dbaṅ chog phrin las bcud thig, Volume Ba: 597–622.

zab pa daṅ rgya che ba'i dam pa chos kyi thob yig rin chen sgron me'i glegs bam daṅ pa, Volume Dza Oṃ. (See especially, the section on the *gu ru chos dbaṅ* transmissions: 547–551.)

zab pa daṅ rgya che ba'i dam pa chos kyi thob yig rin chen sgron me'i glegs bam gñis pa, Volume Wa Āḥ. (See especially, the section on the *padma gliṅ pa* transmissions: 129–173.)

dpal rdo rje phur bu yaṅ gsaṅ spu gri'i sgrub chen 'dra 'bag gi las tho bklag pas don rtogs, Volume Za: 209–240.

rdo rje phur pa yaṅ gsaṅ spu gri'i dmar chen gtor zlog gi lag len las tho gnad kyi gsal sgron, Volume Za: 241–263.

dpal rdo rje phur bu bdud dpuṅ zil gnon gyi sgrub pa chen po'i khog dbub phrin las sgrub pa'i rol mo, Volume 'A: 425–489 (also found in Drag sṅags gliṅ pa 2005: 391–455).

bka' drin can gyi bla ma rnams la gsol ba 'debs pa byin rlabs myur 'dren mos gus kyi shiṅ rta, Volume A: 13–23.

Dudjom Rinpoche. 1982–1987. *Rñin ma Bka' ma rgyas pa*. Compiled by Bdud-'Joms 'Jigs-bral-ye-śes-rdo-rje. 58 volumes. Kalimpong: Dupjung Lama (TBRC W19229 0448–0505; The Expanded Version of the Nyingma Kama Collection Teachings Passed in an Unbroken Lineage).

Dudul Dorje. 1971. *bdud 'dul phur pa gnam lcags spu gri*. New Delhi: Jamyang Norbu (TBRC W30284).

Dudul Dorje. 1973. *sñiṅ thig tshe yaṅ phur gsum gyi glegs bam*. New Delhi: Sanje Dorje (TBRC W30283).

Dudul Dorje. 1976. *gter chen rig 'dzin bdud 'dul rdo rje'i gter chos*. 8 volumes. Darjeeling: Bairo Tulku Rinpoche, reproduced from the manuscript collection from the library of Dudjom Rinpoche (TBRC W22123).

Dudul Dorje. 1997. *spo bo gter ston bdud 'dul rdo rje'i zab gter gsuṅ 'bum*. 12 volumes. Darjeeling: Kargyud Sungrab Nyamso Khang (TBRC W22123).

Specific texts consulted (where available, the versions in DD[2], DD[3], and DD[4] have also been used):

yaṅ gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ khrag las: sñiṅ thig tshe yaṅ phur gsum gyi: phur pa'i las byaṅ phrin las kun khyab dgra bgegs kun 'dul, Volume Cha: 73–114.

sñiṅ thig tshe yaṅ phur gsum gyi tshogs mchod mi zad gter gyi rgyan 'khor, Volume Cha: 141–158.

yaṅ gsaṅ mkha' 'gro'i sñiṅ khrag las: sñiṅ thig tshe yaṅ phur gsum gyi: phur pa gnam lcags spu gri dbaṅ chog nor bu rgya mtsho, Volume Cha: 769–832.

Garry, Ron. 2005. *Wisdom Nectar*: *Dudjom Rinpoche's Heart Advice*. Ithaca, New York, and Boulder, Colorado: Snow Lion.

Jacoby, Sarah. 2007. *Consorts and Revelation in Eastern Tibet: The Auto/biographical Writings of the Treasure Revealer Sera Khandro (1892–1940)*, unpublished Ph.D. thesis, University of Virginia.

Kongtrul (*'jam mgon koṅ sprul blo gros mtha' yas*). 1976–1980. *Rin chen gter mdzod chen mo*. 111 volumes. Paro, Bhutan: Ngodrub and Sherab Drimay, dPal spuṅs dgon pa'i par khaṅ, Volume Ki 49: *rdo rje phur bu yang gsang spu gri'i las byang kun bzang rol mtsho* 75–116, and *rdo rje phur bu yang gsang spu gri'i bsnyen yig rin chen snye ma* 213–240 (TBRC W20578).

Padma Gliṅ pa. 1975–1976. *rig 'dzin padma glin pa yi zab gter chos mdzod rin po che*. 21 volumes. Thimphu, Bhutan: Kunsang Tobgay (TBRC W21727)

(The *bla ma nor bu rgya mtsho* is mostly found in Volumes Ka and Kha, and takes up the whole of those volumes. The text specifically consulted here: *las byaṅ padma'i ljon shiṅ* Volume Ka: 761–794. The *phur pa yaṅ gsaṅ srog gi spu gri* is mostly found in Volume Ma, 16, and takes up the whole of that volume.)

Padma Rig 'dzin, sPrul sku. n.d, *sprul pa'i gter chen bdud 'joms drag sṅags gliṅ pa'i thun moṅ phyi yi rnam thar mdor bsdus tsam brjod pa dad gsum chu skyes bźad pa'i 'dzum mdaṅs*, composed in the "Hidden Land," Padma'i tshal 'Chi med yaṅ gsaṅ (in Pemako). n.p.

rDo rje phur pa rtsa ba'i rgyud kyi dum bu [*Fragment of the Root Vajrakīlaya Tantra*], found in the main tantra sections of various editions of the *bKa' 'gyur*, for instance, the *sde-dge mtshal-par bka'-'gyur* (TBRC W22084) Volume *rgyud* Ca (81): 86–90; the *lHa sa bKa' 'gyur* (TBRC W26071) Volume *rgyud* Ṅa (82): 602–609; the *sNar thaṅ bKa' 'gyur* (TBRC W22703) Volume *rgyud* Ṅa (83): 576–582; the *Peking bKa' 'gyur* reprinted and catalogued in *The Tibetan Tripitaka*, *Peking Edition*, *kept in the library of the Otani University*, *Kyoto*, edited by D. T. Suzuki, 1955–1961, Bkaḥ-ḥgyur Volume *rgyud* Ca: 46a–48a; the *Urga bKa' 'gyur* (TBRC

W29468) Volume *rgyud* Ca (82): 86–90; the *sTog Palace bKa' 'gyur* (TBRC W22083) Volume *rgyud* Ṅa (95): 873–878. (An edition (based on Peking and sDe dge) with a translation into English is found in Boord 2002: 79–90.)

Terdak Lingpa (*gter bdag gliṅ pa*). 1998. *smin gliṅ gter chen rig 'dzin 'gyur med rdo rje'i gsuṅ 'bum*. 16 volumes. Dehra Dun: D. G. Khochhen Tulku (TBRC W22096). In particular, compilation of Guru Chöwang: the Ultra Secret Razor Vajrakīlaya, *rdo rje phur bu yaṅ gsaṅ spu gri'i las byaṅ kun bzaṅ rol mtsho*, Volume 9: 275r–301, and *dpal rdo rje phur bu'i sgrub pa chen po'i rim pa gsal bar byed pa dṅos grub kyi dga' ston*, Volume 9: 305r–332v; *dpal rdo rje phur bu'i dmar chen gtor zlog gi las rim bdud 'joms rnam rol*, Volume 9: 338r–361r; *thun gtor 'bul ba*, Volume 9: 362r–363v; *gtor bzlog bdud 'joms rnam rol gyi bskul mthar gser skyems 'bul ba*, Volume 9: 364r–372r; *dpal rdo rje phur bu'i phrin las dgra bgegs sgrol ba'i man ṅag rdo rje'i me char*, Volume 9: 373r–382v.

Tharchin, Lama. 2006. "Drubchen, a Teaching by Lama Tharchin Rinpoché" June 29, 2006 at Pema Ösel Ling, available as a pdf download from the Vajrayana Foundation website: http://www.vajrayana.org/media/files/files/963f790a/LTR_Drupchen_Teachings_2006.pdf.

Tsewang Dongyal, Khenpo. 2003. *Dus gsum rgyal ba'i spyi gzugs/ gter chen bdud 'joms 'jigs bral ye śes rdo rje 'gro 'dul gliṅ pa rtsal gyi rnam thar ye śes rdo rje'i 'od zer*. Sarnath: Pema Samye Chokhor Ling Nyingmapa Buddhist Monastery. (An English version is available, see Tsewang Dongyal 2008.)

Tsewang Dongyal, Khenpo. 2008. *Light of Fearless Indestructible Wisdom: The Life and Legacy of H.H. Dudjom Rinpoche*. Samye Translation Group. Ithaca, New York: Snow Lion Publications.