

APPENDIX

The Executive Trump Card: Government-Initiated Votes of Confidence in Parliamentary Democracies

Francesco Bromo  

Parliamentary Affairs

<https://doi.org/10.1093/pa/gsaf036>

Vote of Confidence Procedure - Legal Provisions

Bulgaria

- Constitution (1991, rev. 2015): Article 112. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Bulgaria_2015. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (20 December 2024): Article 106. Bulgarian National Assembly:

<https://www.parliament.bg/en/podns>. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Czechia

- Constitution (1993, rev. 2013): Article 44 (Chapter II), Article 71. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Czech_Republic_2013. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (19 April 1995, rev. 2014): Article 83, Article 85, Article 96. Czech Chamber of Deputies: <https://www.psp.cz/en/docs/laws/1995/90.html>. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

France

- Constitution (1958, rev. 2008): Article 49. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/France_2008. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (February 2010): Article 152, Article 155. French National Assembly:

<https://www2.assemblee-nationale.fr/langues/welcome-to-the-english-website-of-the-french-national-assembly#chap3-10>. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Germany

Constitution (1949, rev. 2014): Article 68. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/German_Federal_Republic_2014. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (2022): Article 98. German Bundestag:

<https://www.btg-bestellservice.de/pdf/80060000.pdf>. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Ireland

- Standing orders (2020): Article 68, Article 80, Article 83. Irish Dáil Éireann:

https://data.oireachtas.ie/ie/oireachtas/parliamentaryBusiness/standingOrders/dail/2021/2021-01-27_consolidated-dail-eireann-standing-orders-january-2021_en.pdf. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Italy

- Standing orders (15 December 2001, rev. 25 September 2012): Article 39, Article 54, Article 87, Article 115, Article 116, Article 154. Italian Chamber of Deputies:

https://en.camera.it/application/xmanager/projects/camera_eng/file/RULES_OF_PROCEDURE_CHAMBRE_OF_DEPUTIES.pdf.

Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Primary legislation: No. 400 (23 August 1988).

<https://www.gazzettaufficiale.it/eli/gu/1988/09/12/214/so/86/sg/pdf> [Italian]. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Japan

- Constitution (1946): Article 69. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Japan_1946. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (28 June 1947, rev. 21 June 2024): Article 28, Article 47. Japanese House of Representatives:

https://www.shugiin.go.jp/internet/itdb_annai.nsf/html/statics/shiryo/dl-rules.htm [Japanese]. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Poland

- Constitution (1997, rev. 2009): Article 160. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Poland_2009. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (2022, rev. 26 July 2024): Article 112, Article 117, Article 169. Polish Sejm:

https://oide.sejm.gov.pl/oide/en/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=14798:the-standing-orders-of-the-sejm-of-the-republic-of-poland&catid=7&Itemid=361.

Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Portugal

- Constitution (1976, rev. 2005): Article 192, Article 193. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Portugal_2005. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (20 August 2007, rev. 21 April 2017): Article 19, Article 62, Article 87, Articles 217-220. Portuguese Assembly of the Republic:

https://www.parlamento.pt/sites/EN/Parliament/Documents/Rules_of_Procedure.pdf. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Slovenia

Constitution (1991, rev. 2016): Article 117. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Slovenia_2016. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders (19 April 2002, rev. 26 May 2023): Article 21, Article 64, Articles 257-260. Slovenian National Assembly:

<https://imss.dz-rs.si/IMiS/ImisAdmin.nsf/IMiSNetAgent?OpenAgent&2&DZ-MSS-01/ecba208564d333f66a6eabfb7c5e9d06ed97e54277741a40748a99c7efa33072>. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Spain

- Constitution (1978, rev. 2012): Article 112. Constitute Project:

https://www.constituteproject.org/constitution/Spain_2011. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

- Standing orders: Article 85, Article 173, Article 174. Spanish Congress of Deputies: https://www.congreso.es/webpublica/ficherosportal/standing_orders_02.pdf. Last accessed: 12 February 2025.

Table A1: Government-Initiated Votes of Confidence by Regime Type and Geographic Area, 1945-2021

	Conjunct	Simple	Total	Failed
Parliamentary	345	69	414	8
Semi-Presidential	91	88	179	6
Western Europe	435	137	572	11
Central and Eastern Europe	1	16	17	3
Pacific	0	4	4	0

Note: “Parliamentary” includes Australia, Czechia, Germany, Italy, Japan, Norway, Spain, and the United Kingdom. “Semi-Presidential” includes Bulgaria, France, Ireland, Poland, Portugal, and Slovenia (classification based on Elgie 2011). “Western Europe” includes France, Germany, Ireland, Italy, Norway, Portugal, Spain, and the United Kingdom. “Central and Eastern Europe” includes Bulgaria, Czechia, Poland, and Slovenia. “Pacific” includes Australia and Japan.

Table A2: Failed Government-Initiated Votes of Confidence, 1945-2021

Country	Prime minister	Date of vote	Division	Type of vote
Bulgaria	Philip Dimitrov	28-Oct-1992	111 (Y) 120 (N)	Simple
Germany	Willy Brandt	20-Sep-1972	233 (Y) 248 (N)*	Simple
Germany	Helmut Kohl	17-Dec-1982	8 (Y) 218 (N)*	Simple
Germany	Gerhard Schröder	1-Jul-2005	151 (Y) 296 (N)*	Simple
Ireland	Charles Haughey	4-Nov-1982	80 (Y) 82 (N)	Simple
Ireland	Albert Reynolds	5-Nov-1992	77 (Y) 88 (N)	Simple
Italy	Romano Prodi	9-Oct-1998	312 (Y) 313 (N)	Simple
Italy	Romano Prodi	24-Jan-2008	156 (Y) 161 (N)**	Simple
Norway	John Lyng	20-Sep-1963	74 (Y) 76 (N)	Simple
Norway	Kåre Willoch	29-Apr-1986	78 (Y) 79 (N)	Conjunct
Norway	Kjell Bondevik	9-Mar-2000	71 (Y) 81 (N)	Conjunct
Portugal	Mário Soares	9-Dec-1977	100 (Y) 159 (N)	Simple
Slovenia	Janez Drnovšek	8-Apr-2000	31 (Y) 55 (N)	Conjunct
Slovenia	Borut Pahor	20-Sep-2011	36 (Y) 51 (N)	Conjunct

*See Döring and Hönnige (2006).

**In the upper chamber.

Note: After 2021, and as of this writing, we have observed two more instances of failed government-initiated votes of confidence in the countries included in my analysis. One (also mentioned in the article) is Michel Barnier in France, 4-Dec-2024, 244 (Y) 331 (N), conjunct. The other is Olaf Scholz in Germany, 16-Dec-2024, 207 (Y) 394 (N), simple.

References

Döring, Herbert and Christoph Hönnige. 2006. "Vote of Confidence Procedure and *Gesetzgebungsnotstand*: Two Toothless Tigers of Governmental Agenda Control." *German Politics* 15(1):1–26.

Elgie, Robert. 2011. *Semi-Presidentialism: Sub-Types And Democratic Performance*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.