BRIGID LYNCH, *Horizontalism and Historicity in Argentina: Cultural Dialogues of the Post-Crisis Era.* Oxford: Legenda. 2021. 174 pp.

Brigid Lynch's wide-ranging new study addresses two characteristics that the author identifies as typifying post-2001, or 'post-Crisis', culture in Argentina: horizontalism and historicity. 2001 in Argentina was a year of political turmoil, economic upheaval, and social unrest. Although the roots of the catastrophe are long, through the Menem years of neoliberal 'structural adjustment' to the post-1976 civic-military dictatorship, and beyond, 2001 is for many historians, political scientists, and artists, a before-and-after moment. For Lynch, drawing on Raymond Williams's 'structures of feeling', it is when these two latent trends came to the surface.

The introduction sketches the 2001 crisis, also known as the *Argentinazo*, a difficult to translate term that conjures images of protest, patriotism, and a long line of governments overthrown. Lynch's sympathies are very much with the folk in the street – the protestors, activists, and cultural producers, rather that the politicians who have come and gone either side of the turn of the millennium. Anglophone theorists of the Marxist and post-Marxist tradition inform Lynch's analytical framework, including Mark Fisher's work on the 'normalisation of crisis', David Harvey's idea of 'creative destruction' (what Naomi Klein called the 'shock doctrine' of contemporary disaster capitalism), and Chantal Mouffe's notion of political 'agonism'.

Lynch assembles – honouring Williams – what she calls a 'catholic' collection of cultural products: novels by Tomás Eloy Martínez and Carlos Gamerro; films both fiction (Pablo Trapero's issue-tainment drama *Elefante blanco*) and documentary (Martín Oesterheld's *La multitud*); independent publications (the collective *lavaca's* monthly magazine *Mu*)*;* performances directed by Lola Arias and others; an installation depicting a dictatorship clandestine detention centre, by Marcelo Brodsky; and a state-television historical drama, *Lo que el tiempo nos dejó*. Lynch calls this the 'intermedial approach' of the book, and in its best moment there is an admirable will to comparison.

The *historicity* of the title refers to an upsurge in polemics about Argentina's history, recent and more distant. Lynch notes the political revisionism of the government of Cristina Fernández, but also a tendency to revisit and rethink the image of the armed-left or the memory of the disappeared, in Carlos Gamerro and Tomás Eloy Martínez, respectively. The *horizontality* calls to a tendency towards grassroots and popular organizing that eschews the top-down forms of party politics and certain models of populism, as in the collective journalistic efforts of *lavaca.* Lynch draws on the work of writer and activist Marina Sitrin and her promotion of an 'affective politics' of respect and cooperation (p.5).

Alongside the main analysis, there are useful mini-essays on the depiction of the *villa miseria* on screen; on architecture and utopia in the mid-century; on the role of clothes, toys and music in the creation of historical memory (an area explored by Jordana Blejmar). Lynch concludes her analysis by underscoring the 'ebb and flow' (p.151) between horizontality and historicism during this period, as encountered in her corpus of cultural works. It is less that these tendencies began with the Crisis, rather that they have spread and gained strength, and can be found across a variety of cultural forms. But there are competing ways of thinking about the culture of this period: what Cecilia Palmeiro called its 'trash' aesthetic; Josefina Ludmer's influential idea of 'post-autonomy' in literature; or Florencia Garramuño's examination of artistic non-specificity. Readers will decide on the pre-eminence of historicity and horizontality, above other trends.

Developed from a St Andrew's PhD, at times the book's genesis is a touch too apparent; indeed at least one reference to 'this thesis' has survived. The corpus is catholic, but looked at less charitably also somewhat arbitrary; one more than one occasion the author states that the horizontality or historicism of the title are less than overwhelmingly present in the chosen case studies. A number of glitches detract from the study's overall effect. Gamerro may have had five novels to his credit when the thesis was being written but a sixth, *Cardenio*, came out in 2016 and *La jaula de los onas* last year. The scant reference his *Un yuppie en la columna del Che Guevara*, which completes the action of *Los bustos de Eva*, hampers some of the arguments. Nor is Marroné the 'narrator' (p.126) of the novel. Lynch's rendering of Borges's 'El otro duelo' sees the rivals decapitated, when the bloody denouement makes clear that their heads are still, albeit loosely, attached – it matters not to them, but to readers it should. That said, this is an engaging study that offers an innovative perspective, with lively case studies, on recent Argentine cultural history.

BEN BOLLIG

St. Catherine's College, University of Oxford.