

“Multiplex est modus”: Elements of  
Accommodation in the Early Jesuit  
Missions to India, 1545-1575



Bradley Thomas Blankemeyer  
St Anne's College  
University of Oxford

A thesis submitted for the degree of  
Doctor of Philosophy in History  
Trinity 2020

## Standard Abstract

My project explores the methodologies of missionaries of the Society of Jesus in southern India between Francis Xavier's arrival in 1542 and the policy reforms under Alessandro Valignano in 1575, investigating the presence of cultural accommodation within the attitudes and decisions of various Jesuits. During the three decades between the Society's foundation and Valignano's arrival in India, Jesuits faced a number of issues both internally and externally, suggesting an organization prone to the influences of various individuals and contemporary ecclesiastical and secular politics. I argue that these factors presented limits to the development of more adaptive techniques which characterised cultural accommodation of the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century through Matteo Ricci and Roberto de Nobili, and that analysing these can help illustrate why such a policy did not manifest during earlier decades.

Nevertheless, elements of accommodation appear in the voices of some Jesuits active during this period through their opinions regarding the primary objectives of mission. Although accommodation did not exist in a complete form in this period, I shall show that the basic underpinnings did emerge through the opinions and attitudes of some individuals on multifarious particulars, such as education, language, conversion, and identity. Following an ideological commitment to simultaneous contemplation and action, members of the Society of Jesus were afforded greater flexibility and mobility than their religious contemporaries, labouring across diverse environments throughout South Asia and beyond. Analysing the questions regarding Jesuit organisational procedures and relations with convert communities, non-Christians, the Portuguese state in India, and other clergy, this thesis aims to better illuminate the multiple ways individual Jesuits interpreted their purpose as well as pinpoint instances where elements of accommodation appeared through their interpretations.

## History Faculty Abstract

Purportedly uttered by Jerónimo Nadal, the phrase ‘multiplex est modus tradendi Exercitia’—‘manifold is the way of administering the *Exercises*’—presents a rather apt distillation of the various elements ingrained in the spiritual ideology of the Society of Jesus, the religious order founded by Ignatius of Loyola and his close companions from the University of Paris in 1539. Loyola’s Spiritual *Exercises* were structured as a series of guided meditations on the life and death of Jesus Christ, involving a dialogue between a master or councillor (one who had completed the full programme) and an exercitant (the one who sought to complete it), and structured to allow for customisation at every stage to each individual’s needs, intellectual and physical abilities, and comprehension of the spiritual mysteries of Christ. As described by Loyola, the principal means for the primary objective of ‘helping souls’ was through the *Exercises*. Bringing this spiritual guide with them wherever they went, the Jesuit order itself—formulated to spread the Gospel to all people, care for the sick, administer the sacraments, and help souls—soon found its way across the globe via European ships expanding their commercial and political influence in Africa, Asia, and the Americas. Crucially were they also expected to be comfortable in any variety of these new environments. Envisioned as a living extension of the Spiritual *Exercises*, companions of the Society of Jesus were afforded the mobility to implement this dialogue within their apostolate to newly-encountered communities throughout the world. In all these places, interpretations of the *Exercises* had to adapt to many different contexts as well as individuals—not only because they ultimately had to adapt, but also because they were designed to do so.

If we expand the micro-perspective of the *Exercises* to a macro level, the missionary might address one’s whole ministry to the many peoples with whom the missionary interacts person by person. Accounting for the diversity of personalities illustrates the variation in

methodology. Any given population possessed many complex factors, such as cultural and social mores—including verbal and physical language, class, gender, sexuality—extant religious traditions, political pressures within and without, environmental concerns, et cetera; while individual missionaries faced personal obstacles through their own limitations of education or even overcoming predispositions.

By the time Matteo Ricci (fl. 1578-1610) and Roberto de Nobili (fl. 1605-1656) attempted to fashion themselves as distinct from other Europeans by donning the attire of the local intellectual elites in their respective missions of China and South India and communicating via respective language and media, such demonstrations of cultural flexibility clearly distinguished them from earlier missionaries of the Society of Jesus. Both men sought to understand the indigenous religious and philosophical systems, the codes of civility and social status, and both aimed to convert the learned classes of their respective mission fields, going to great lengths to accomplish these goals. Whilst clearly innovative, there is less scholarly agreement on how far they represent a natural evolution from the founding spirit and principles of the Jesuits, in particular the adaptability of the *Exercises* to any disposition or environment. Their approach was first labelled by modern scholars as an exercise in *accommodatio*, meaning accommodation or adaptation, though its previous definitions never included such a dramatic adjustment of one's appearance and way of life.

This principle was perhaps drawn from Cicero, bolstered by Paul the Apostle, witnessed in patristic writings, reinvigorated by humanists, and later employed to increasing degrees by members of the Society of Jesus as well as other Catholic religious orders, not to mention those outside of these circles. Accommodation as so often used by scholars today describes the procedure by which such figures as Ricci and Nobili operated, one which stretches beyond such a general definition. Accommodation is considered here as an etic term for practices not exclusively implemented by the Society of Jesus, although the Jesuit

way of proceeding and distinctiveness—both of which characterise the attempted formation of a Jesuit identity distinct from that of any temporal affinities—created optimal conditions for such a method to flourish through the emic principle of *accommodatio*.

The driver of change in this method was most certainly the Visitor to the Indies and later Asia Provincial, Alessandro Valignano (fl. 1566-1606). Prior to Valignano, distinctly Eurocentric views and cultural and linguistic ignorance regarding China prevented Jesuits and Franciscans from successfully making inroads beyond Portuguese Macao for almost twenty-five years. From the start of his visitation in 1575, Valignano had first mandated comprehensive language education for Ricci and his companions, a model which he encouraged in all mission fields albeit to varying degrees. Alongside Chinese scholars with whom Ricci conversed, Valignano encouraged his Italian colleague in 1595 to alter his attire first to Buddhist garments then to those of the Confucian literati, in order to have his message heard by the right people. From Loyola to Valignano, the Jesuits focused constantly on the question of how to present themselves in both appearance and speech.

While Francis Xavier (fl. 1542-1552), the first Jesuit to venture outside of Europe, established missions throughout Asia which would serve as the foundation for rapid growth and influence of the Jesuits from the sixteenth century onwards, his contemporaries and immediate successors experienced many difficulties interpreting their primary objectives amongst a variety of communities. During the three decades between the Society's foundation and Valignano's arrival in India, Jesuits faced a number of issues both internally and externally, suggesting an organization prone to the influences of various individuals and contemporary ecclesiastical and secular politics. I find that these factors presented limits to the development of more adaptive techniques which characterized cultural accommodation of the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century, and that analysing these can help illustrate why such a policy did not manifest during earlier decades. Nevertheless, elements

of accommodation appear in the voices of some Jesuits active during this period through their opinions regarding the primary objectives of mission. Although accommodation did not exist in a complete form in this period, I shall show that the basic underpinnings did emerge through the opinions and attitudes of some individuals on multifarious particulars, such as education, language, conversion, and identity. Following an ideological commitment to simultaneous contemplation and action, members of the Society of Jesus were afforded greater flexibility and mobility than their religious contemporaries, labouring across diverse environments throughout South Asia and beyond. Analysing the questions regarding Jesuit organisational procedures and relations with convert communities, non-Christians, the Portuguese state in India, and other clergy, this thesis aims to better illuminate the multiple ways individual Jesuits interpreted their purpose as well as pinpoint instances where elements of accommodation appeared through their interpretations.

I argue that analysing the priorities of Jesuit vocation in the India mission clarifies what is most important to each individual and whether these decisions take into account the communities to whom they catered; whether they are in fact accommodating. Incorporated into this is also the understanding of Jesuit distinctiveness—the understanding of *modus procedendi*—and identity as it compares to national or ethnic identity, particularly in the context of the objectives of the Portuguese *Estado da Índia*. In the first chapter, I analyse further the concept of distinctiveness in the Society of Jesus and how it figures into various ministries in which Jesuits were involved. Chapter Two considers the topic of education and ministry to Indian communities, discussing the opinions concerning whom and what should be taught in Jesuit colleges, how a Jesuit should conduct themselves in independent ministry—including notions of martyrdom—and how the Society deals with the complexities of global activity. The third chapter analyses the attitudes towards conversion and the procedures through which nonbelievers enter the Christian faith, accounting for the

theological and juridical decisions of this period and how Jesuits contributed to the debate, and what it means for accommodation. Chapter Four looks at accommodation through the question of *conversos*, those Iberian Christians who converted from Judaism, and the shift in attitudes towards them and the office that sought to prevent them from apostasy, the Inquisition. The role of Jesuits in the creation (and critique) of this institution in Asia, the first outside of Europe, is especially considered given the later decision to abstain from direct involvement with the Holy Office. In the fifth and final chapter, I focus primarily on the arrival of Alessandro Valignano, contemplating how significant his directive to ‘entrare con amore’ or ‘enter with love’ was in the context of India, and the legacy of his visit on the policies of various mission fields, from language learning to his opinions on Portuguese governance of various provinces from Europe to East Asia. Valignano’s status as one of the key implementers of accommodation in Japan is especially valuable in this final part, as his work in India greatly differed. In the close of this thesis, I reconsider the frequently referenced directive of the Apostle Paul in his letter to the Corinthians to ‘become all to all’, a principle which proves crucial in understanding cultural accommodation and whether to consider its presence in the first thirty years of the India missions of the Society of Jesus.

While I base my research primarily on published sources such as the 18-volume *Documenta Indica* and the second half of the collection *Documentação para a história das missões*, these volumes nevertheless contain a wealth of sources not fully realised in previous historiography, mainly due to their massive scope. My methods have been to pinpoint particular individuals and analyse their letters and reports, from the early missionaries Niccolò Lancilotto and Antonio Criminali to those closely involved with the Inquisition, which include Melchior Carneiro and Francisco Rodrigues. I used this research to locate unpublished manuscript sources related to these individuals and others in the Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, the Jesuit Archives in Rome, and the Arquivo

Nacional de Torre do Tombo, the Portuguese National Archives in Lisbon. I incorporate letters, reports, treatises, historical accounts, and Inquisitional proceedings from these archives to bolster the published sources considered. While Josef Wicki and Georg Schurhammer contributed greatly to the historiography of this period, I aim to provide a fresh look at these early years by analysing the priorities and purpose of members of the Society in India and how they relate to elements of cultural accommodation—that is, more generally, a recognition of the feelings, needs, and traditions of a diverse Indian and non-Christian audience.

## **Acknowledgments**

To my family, friends and colleagues who have played a role over the past four years, but most especially to Bethany, whose patience and support has driven me to do better and maintain commitment in the most difficult times.

## Table of Contents

Acknowledgments	9
Introduction	11
Chapter One: <i>Quidditas Jesuitica</i> : Jesuit Distinctiveness And ‘Way Of Proceeding’	59
Chapter Two: Ways Of Proceeding In India: Jesuit Attitudes Towards Mission And Ministry	90
Chapter Three: ‘Blessed Is One Who Out Of Virtue Becomes Christian’: Conversion Theology In The Jesuit Administration And Indigenous Reception Of Baptism	148
Chapter Four: ‘In The Society There Is No Distinction Between Jew Or Greek’: <i>Conversos</i> , The Goan Inquisition, And Jesuit Accommodation	183
Chapter Five: ‘Intrando Con Amore’: The Visitor As Diplomat In India	227
Conclusion: Becoming All To All	268
Bibliography	273

## Introduction

*Multiplex est modus tradendi Exercitia ac diversis hominum generibus*  
- ‘Manifold is the way of administering the *Exercises* and applying them to the various  
races of mankind’<sup>1</sup>

Purportedly uttered by Jerónimo Nadal (1507-1580), this poignant phrase presents a rather apt distillation of the various elements ingrained in the spiritual ideology of the Society of Jesus, the religious order founded by Ignatius of Loyola (ca.1491-1556) and his close companions from the University of Paris in 1539.<sup>2</sup> Nadal joined the Society years after having initially spurned the fledgling group, but quickly developed a close relationship with Loyola, who entrusted him with promulgating the drafted *Constitutiones* to professed houses across the continent in the mid-1550s. Nadal was later named as visitor to the various European provinces in 1560. Earning the epithet, ‘theologian of Ignatian spirituality’, he understood the significance of the Spiritual *Exercises*, the contemplative guide and central spiritual text required of all Jesuits, in the global propagation of the Roman Catholic faith by his fellow members.<sup>3</sup> The *Exercises* themselves were structured as a series of guided meditations on the life and death of Jesus Christ, involving a dialogue between a master or councillor (one who had completed the full programme) and an exercitant (the one who sought to complete it), and structured to allow for customisation at every stage to each individuals’ needs, intellectual and physical abilities, and comprehension of the spiritual

---

<sup>1</sup> ‘Excerpta ex instructione ignoti auctoris’, *Monumenta Ignatiana. Exercitia spirituali Sancti Ignatii de Loyola et eorum directoria* [henceforth *MI Ex*] (2 vols, Rome, 1955), ii, p. 176; John O’Malley, *The First Jesuits* (Cambridge, MA, 1993), p. 127. As the title states, the author is unknown, although the document is typically attributed to Nadal.

<sup>2</sup> A number of dates serve as pivotal moments for the foundation of the Society of Jesus: Loyola and his companions made preliminary vows at Montmartre in 1534, while the papal bull *Regimini militantis Ecclesiae* (1540) given by Paul III officially recognised the order; a second bull, *Exposcit debitum* (1550) of Julius III, further confirmed the decision.

<sup>3</sup> Miguel Nicolau, ‘Nadal (Jérôme), jésuite, 1507-1580’, *Dictionnaire de Spiritualité: ascétique et mystique, doctrine et histoire* (17 vols, Paris, 1932-95), xi, col 3; John W. O’Malley, *Saints or Devils Incarnate?: Studies in Jesuit History* (Leiden, 2013), p. 151.

mysteries of Christ.<sup>4</sup> As described by Ignatius in his final months of life, the principal means for ‘helping souls’, as he often described the primary Jesuit purpose, was through the *Exercises*.<sup>5</sup> Bringing this spiritual guide with them wherever they went, the Jesuit order itself—formulated to spread the Gospel to all people, care for the sick, administer the sacraments, and help souls—soon found its way across the globe via European ships expanding their commercial and political influence in Africa, Asia, and the Americas. Crucially were they also expected to be comfortable in any variety of these new environments, as Nadal himself put it: ‘the whole world will be our home’.<sup>6</sup> In all these places, interpretations of the *Exercises* had to adapt to many different contexts as well as individuals—not only because they ultimately had to adapt, but also because they were designed to do so.

Nadal acted as a devoted interpreter of Ignatius in the period following the founder’s death in 1556, committed to aiding the success of the Society but also contributing his own unique style in communication. As may be gleaned from his words above, Nadal delivered the message of Ignatian spirituality through the experience of his own training as both a theologian and one who valued the humanist practice of rhetoric, and much of the language he used to describe the vast domain of Jesuit ministry derived from these influences. In the ‘dialogues’ he composed between 1562 and 1565, Nadal fabricated a fictitious colloquium between three laymen: a friend of the Jesuits, a Catholic with some ill-disposition towards

---

<sup>4</sup> Ignatius of Loyola, ‘Eighteenth Annotation’, *The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, trans. Elder Mullan, S.J. (New York, 1914), p. 19. The annotation according to this translation reads, ‘The eighteenth: The Spiritual *Exercises* have to be adapted to the dispositions of the persons who wish to receive them, that is, to their age, education or ability, in order not to give to one who is uneducated or of little intelligence things he cannot easily bear and profit by’.

<sup>5</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Father Fulvio Androzzi, Rome, 18 Jul 1556, *Monumenta Ignatiana. Sancti Ignatii de Loyola Societatis Iesu fundatoris epistolae et instructiones* [henceforth *MI Epp*] (12 vols, Madrid, 1903-11), xii, p. 141.

<sup>6</sup> Jerónimo Nadal, ‘Exhortationes anni 1554 in Hispania’, *Epistolae et Monumenta P. Hieronymi Nadal V: Commentarii de Instituto Societatis Iesu*, ed. Miguel Nicolau (Rome, 1962), p. 54; the original Latin reads ‘totus mundus nostra fit habitatio’.

them, and a Lutheran. This literary device had been employed by Desiderius Erasmus and other humanists, and for Nadal it served to explicate the spiritual essence of the Society. In one of these exchanges, through the pro-Jesuit character, Nadal noted how members of his own order ‘consider that they are in their most peaceful and pleasant house when they are constantly on the move, when they travel throughout the earth, when they have no place to call their own’.<sup>7</sup>

Nadal thus further reified the Jesuit expectation of frequent movement, distinguishing them from the monastic tradition of fixed houses and obligations, imbuing missionaries and their purpose with the flexibility which the *Exercises* possessed—as ‘contemplative whilst active’.<sup>8</sup> Nadal, however, was not alone in producing such distillation of the Society’s purpose. His contemporary, long-time Jesuit secretary Juan Alfonso de Polanco (fl. 1547-1576), compiled a list of sixteen desired traits for a suitable Jesuit candidate, amongst which he explicitly noted ‘flexibility—as much in speculative as in practical judgment’—a commitment to adaptive decision-making through contemplation as well as action.<sup>9</sup> Envisioned as a living extension of the *Exercises*, *socios* (‘companions’) of

---

<sup>7</sup> Jerónimo Nadal [ca. 1565], ‘Dialogus II’, *Epistolae et Monumenta P. Hieronymi Nadal V*, p. 774; in Latin: ‘Illam reputant esse quietissimam atque amoenissimam habitationem, si perpetuo peregrinari, orbem terrarum circumire, nullibi in suo habitare’. Quoted and translated in John W. O’Malley, ‘To Travel to Any Part of the World: Jerónimo Nadal and the Jesuit Vocation’, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 16/2 (1984), p. iv.

<sup>8</sup> ‘Simul in actione contemplativus’; cf. Jerónimo Nadal, ‘P. Hieronymi Natalis in Examen Annotationes’, *Epistolae P. Hieronymi Nadal* (4 vols, Madrid, 1898-1905), iv, p. 651. Robert Bellarmine (1542-1621) described the Society in a sermon from Naples in 1596 as ‘religio mixta’—a combination of monastic and mendicant orders—in that they ‘dedicate themselves to action that requires prior contemplation’ (‘illae videlicet quae versantur in actione quae praerequirit contemplationem’); Roberto Bellarmino, ‘Exhortatio tertia de perfectione Instituti Societatis Iesu,’ *Opera oratorio postuma* (11 vols, Rome, 1942-68), ix, p. 382; quoted in Franco Motta, ‘Jesuit Theology, Politics, and Identity: The Generalate of Acquaviva and the Years of Formation’ in P.-A. Fabre and F. Rurale (eds), *The Acquaviva Project: Claudio Acquaviva’s Generalate (1581-1615) and the Emergence of Modern Catholicism* (Boston, 2017), p. 356. Cf. Coreth Emerich. “In actione contemplativus.” *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie* 76 (1954), pp. 55–82.

<sup>9</sup> Juan Alfonso de Polanco, ca. 1550, ‘Industriae’, *Polanci Complementi: Epistolae et Commentaria P. Joannis Alphonsi de Polanco* (2 vols, Madrid, 1917), ii, p. 730; ‘[Flexibilidad]—tanto en el speculativo quanto en el práctico entendimie[nto], debe ser flexible’. Stephen Schloesser, ‘Accommodation as a Rhetorical Principle: Twenty Years after John O’Malley’s *The First Jesuits* (1993)’ *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1 (2014), p. 358; cf. O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 82.

the Society of Jesus were afforded the mobility to implement this dialogue within their apostolate to newly-encountered communities throughout the world, enabling the rapid growth of Jesuit global presence through the second half of the sixteenth century.<sup>10</sup>

Seeking their most ‘pleasant house’ through movement, some Jesuits rapidly acclimated to new environments. By the time Matteo Ricci (fl. 1578-1610) and Roberto de Nobili (fl. 1605-1656) attempted to fashion themselves as distinct from other Europeans by donning the attire of the local intellectual elites in their respective missions of China and South India and communicating via respective language and media, such demonstrations of cultural flexibility clearly distinguished them from earlier missionaries of the Society of Jesus. Both men sought to understand the indigenous religious and philosophical systems, the codes of civility and social status, and both aimed to convert the learned classes of their respective mission fields, going to great lengths to accomplish these goals. Whilst clearly innovative, there is less scholarly agreement on how far they represent a natural evolution from the founding spirit and principles of the Jesuits, in particular the adaptability of the *Exercises* to any disposition or environment. Their approach was first labelled by modern scholars as an exercise in *accommodatio*, meaning accommodation or adaptation, though its previous definitions never included such a dramatic adjustment of one’s appearance and way of life. As John Correia-Afonso noted, ‘Ignatius certainly does not seem to have considered the possibilities of an adaptation on the scale later attempted by Nobili’ yet this ‘so-called Jesuit method of accommodation goes back as a matter of fact to St. Ignatius, who is its decided supporter, although in its own way’.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>10</sup> This growth was reflected in the proliferation of members as well as the Jesuits’ most renowned contribution, colleges: by 1556, the Jesuits had about 1500 members across 46 colleges; by 1579 there were 5164 members in 144 colleges; and by 1600, 8,519 Jesuits in 245 colleges. Cf. Dauril Alden, *The Making of an Enterprise: The Society of Jesus in Portugal, Its Empire, and Beyond, 1540-1750* (Stanford, 1996), p. 17; cf. R. Po-chia Hsia, *The World of Catholic Renewal, 1540-1770* (Cambridge, 2005), p. 32.

<sup>11</sup> John Correia-Afonso, *The Ignatian Vision of India: A Historical Study* (Anand, 1991), p. 55. This conclusion of Correia-Afonso is drawn considerably from Anton Huonder, *Der hl. Ignatius von Loyola und*

The driver of change in this method was most certainly the Visitor to the Indies and later Asia Provincial, Alessandro Valignano (fl. 1566-1606). Prior to Valignano, distinctly Eurocentric views and cultural and linguistic ignorance regarding China prevented Jesuits and Franciscans from successfully making inroads beyond Portuguese Macao for almost twenty-five years.<sup>12</sup> From the start of his visitation in 1575, Valignano had first mandated comprehensive language education for Ricci and his companions, a model which he encouraged in all mission fields albeit to varying degrees. Alongside Chinese scholars with whom Ricci conversed, Valignano encouraged his Italian colleague in 1595 to alter his attire first to Buddhist garments then to those of the Confucian literati, in order to have his message heard by the right people.<sup>13</sup> From Loyola to Valignano, the Jesuits focused constantly on to the question of how to present themselves in both appearance and speech.<sup>14</sup> Given the claimed theoretical roots of accommodation with Ignatius of Loyola and a more institutionalised version beginning under Valignano, one of the key questions throughout this thesis is thus: why did it not emerge earlier?

The policy we now call cultural accommodation was never truly consistent. As H el ene Vu Thanh notes, the idea of a ‘critical assessment of the limits (in the sense of both “perimeter” and “limitations”) of the policy’ forms part of more recent scholarly efforts to move beyond gauging success or failure of a methodology.<sup>15</sup> In line with this

---

*der Missionsbrief der Gesellschaft Jesu zum 300j ahrigen Ged achtis seiner Heiligsprechung* (Aachen, 1922), p. 117; but others make this connection as well, cf. John O’Malley, *First Jesuits* (Cambridge, Mass., 1993), pp. 37-39; Ananya Chakravarti, ‘The Many Faces of Balthasar da Costa: *imitatio* and *accommodatio* in the seventeenth century Madurai mission’, *Etnogr fica* 18/1 (2014), p. 147.

<sup>12</sup> George H. Dunne, S.J., *Generation of Giants: The Story of the Jesuits in China in the last Decades of the Ming Dynasty* (South Bend, 1962), p. 17.

<sup>13</sup> Jonathan D. Spence, *The Memory Palace of Matteo Ricci* (New York, 1984), pp. 114-15; Tara Alberts, *Conflict and Conversion: Catholicism in Southeast Asia, 1500-1700* (Oxford, 2013), pp. 89-90.

<sup>14</sup> Cf. Ignatius of Loyola, *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, trans. George E. Ganss (St Louis, 1970), pp. 129, 201.

<sup>15</sup> H el ene Vu Thanh, ‘The Jesuits in Asia under the Portuguese Padroado: India, China, and Japan (Sixteenth to Seventeenth Centuries)’, in Ines G.  upanov (ed), *Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits* (Oxford, 2019), p. 403; Thanh’s work follows on that of scholars such as Andr s Prieto, ‘The Perils of Accommodation: Jesuit Missionary Strategies in the Early Modern World’ *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 4 (2017).

historiographical trend, I argue that the shifting priorities of Jesuit vocation in the India mission illuminate the various limits to cultural accommodation through individual values regarding mission. The extent to which Jesuits made efforts towards accommodation derives from whether the respective decisions of various individuals take into account the unique circumstances of the communities to whom they catered. In addition, the prevailing prejudices and preconceptions crucially part of sixteenth-century Iberian national and ethnic mentalities and identity, particularly evident in the context of the objectives of the Portuguese *Estado da Índia*, presented limitations to the realisation of any policy during these early decades, while the physical perimeters of the state prevented any further development within directly-managed imperial spaces. Despite the dearth of cultural understanding or anthropologically-minded approaches amongst the Society of Jesus during the first thirty years of missions to India, we can nevertheless interrogate the writings of Jesuits over the course of this period to determine whether there exists some recognition of cultural difference in less normative terms.

During the three decades between the Society's foundation and Valignano's arrival in India, the Society faced a number of issues both internally and externally, suggesting an organization prone to the influences of various individuals and contemporary ecclesiastical and secular politics. I find that these factors presented limits to the development of more adaptive techniques which characterized cultural accommodation of the late sixteenth and early seventeenth century, and that analysing these can help illustrate why such a policy did not manifest during earlier decades. Nevertheless, elements of accommodation appear in the voices of some Jesuits active during this period through their opinions regarding the primary objectives of mission. Although accommodation did not exist in a complete form in this period, I shall show that the basic underpinnings did emerge through the opinions and attitudes of some individuals on multifarious particulars, such as education, language,

conversion, and identity. To understand the complex set of factors involved, this introduction will explicate the variety of analytical issues intrinsic to missionary accommodation which will figure into each of the subsequent chapters, followed by the objectives of this overall thesis and the questions it seeks to address.

### **Theology of Salvation in the Justification of Accommodation**

Despite much concern over defining the identity and ‘distinctiveness’ of the Society, the notion of a distinct Jesuit theology did not seem to exist at this time. Some favour extended towards Thomas Aquinas and the Dominicans, with the *Constitutions* of the Society giving preference to Thomist doctrine in theological study, and in the course of the Jesuit apostolate they drew upon the Scholastic tradition, including Nobili’s frequent references to Aquinas’ works in his *Dialogue on Eternal Life*.<sup>16</sup> Ignatius, however, did not put ‘intellectual charism’ at the forefront of their institute, and in the Ignatian spirit and the Jesuit way of proceeding, doctrinal orientation was considered contingent upon changes in the Society’s future and like so many other Jesuit proscriptions, flexible. Over three decades of discourse regarding the role of education, which Franco Motta notes ‘often appeared to be a serious battle between pragmatism and crystalline theological orthodoxy’, the Society gradually defined its *Ratio studiorum* as a foundation for schools and solidified its theological position in instruction through a preference for Thomism.<sup>17</sup> In the preceding years, and removed from the European confessional borders in which many of these debates occurred, however, latent doctrinal ambiguity—as well as resilient Portuguese ideologies—allowed for diversity of opinions on theological matters like baptism.

---

<sup>16</sup> Cessario, ‘Molina and Aquinas’, p. 298. Amaladass and Clooney, ‘Introduction’, p. 13.

<sup>17</sup> Motta, ‘Jesuit Theology, Politics, and Identity’, pp. 365-6.

In September 1541, Ignatius of Loyola penned instructions on how one was to achieve conversion, not quite in a formulaic sense but rather as a set of principled guidelines intended to draw out spiritual reflection and promote an active display of service and charity. In essence, he reinforced the primacy of internal worship ahead of the external as outlined in the *Spiritual Exercises*, as a preference of prayer and inspiration before the sacramental. It was in this same letter that Ignatius instructed his companions to, like Paul, ‘become all things to all people’, following a theme of conforming Jesuit ministry to the work of the Apostle. Ignatius did not acknowledge baptism in this context, but rather discussed the metaphor of leading one through the door into the ‘house’ in which a conversion would seemingly take place. He provided the following instructions:

‘In all conversations that we desire to win, to cast the net in greater service of God our Lord, we should possess with others the same procedure that the devil has with a good soul is to know everything toward evil, for us is everything towards good. The devil enters with the other and leaves together with him; he enters with the other, not contradicting his customs, but praising them all; he becomes familiar with the soul; then little by little he attempts to leave together with him, persuading him under the appearance of good [*sub specie boni*] to some detriment of error or illusion, always toward evil. As such toward good we can praise or make do with some particular good thing, pretending to not recognise the evil things the soul possesses, and winning his affection we make our things greater. And thus, entering with him, we leave with ourselves.’<sup>18</sup>

This point of ‘*entrar con el otro*’ provides an interesting visualisation of conversion, despite the ambiguity regarding the indiscernible location into which one must enter, and at

---

<sup>18</sup> Ignatius of Loyola, ‘*Altera ad eosdem nuntios instructio*’, Rome, September 1541, *MI Epp*, i, p. 180; ‘En todas conversaciones que queremos ganar, para meter en red en maior servicio de Dios N. S., tengamos con otros la mesma orden que el enemigo tiene con un buena ánima todo ad malum, nosotros todo ad bonum, es á saber: el enemigo entra con el otro y sale consigo; entra con el otro no le contradiziendo sus costumbres, mas alabándoselas; toma familiaridad con el ánima; despues poco á poco procura salir consigo, trayendole sub specie boni á algún inconveniente de horror ó ilusión, semper ad malum; así nosotros podemos ad bonum alabar ó conformar con uno cerca alguna cosa particular buena, disimulando en las otras cosas que malas tiene, y ganando su amor hacemos nuestras cosas mejor; y así, entrando con él, salimos con nosotros’. Many thanks to Ernesto Oyarbide-Magaña for his assistance with this translation. The translation of ‘enemigo’ as ‘the devil’ conforms to its use throughout the *Exercises*, often corresponding with the Vulgate *daemon*, cf. Ignatius of Loyola, *MI Ex*, i; cf. Barton T. Geger, ‘Ten Things that St. Ignatius Never Said or Did’ in *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 50/1 (2018), pp. 37-9.

least one scholar suggests that this statement ‘may apply as the basis of the accommodation strategy’.<sup>19</sup> In addressing the subsequently appended ‘door’ to this metaphor, Ines Županov interprets this section in light of the questions of liminality encountered through the *Exercises*.<sup>20</sup> This is illuminating and potentially evidence for cultural accommodation, though a couple of additional issues may also be noted. The frequent use within these instructions of *ad malum* and *ad bonum*—toward good or evil—is conspicuous in its Latin usage. Both serve as a possible reference to the *Summa Theologica* of Thomas Aquinas. In the section discussing habits, Aquinas referred to a teleology of virtue, in that whilst habits are always leading towards either something good or something evil, virtues in particular are habits that always lead towards good. What creates the distinction between certain habits that always lead towards evil and virtues is whether one lives righteously—a principle that itself arises when ‘God works in us without us’,<sup>21</sup> correlating again to the Ignatian view of the supremacy of internal worship.

Ignatius overlooked a similar metaphor used in a fifteenth century reading of Duns Scotus on the view of ‘constraint’ or compulsion as derived from the Gospel of Luke, to ‘constrain them to come in’ or ‘compelle eos intrare’.<sup>22</sup> Decades after Ignatius’ death, the Franciscan Gerónimo de Mendieta (1525-1604) interpreted in 1596 this parable of ‘The Slighted Feast’ in Luke through the gloss of the thirteenth century exegete Nicholas of Lyra, assigning levels of compulsion in conversion methods proportional to knowledge of

---

<sup>19</sup> Cf. Lavinia Brancaccio, *China accommodata: Chinakonstruktionen in jesuitischen Schriften der Frühen Neuzeit* (Berlin, 2007), p. 55.

<sup>20</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 68.

<sup>21</sup> Thomas Aquinas, *Summa theologica*, I.II 55.4c, ‘quam Deus in nobis sine operatur’, and for the preceding sentence: ‘virtus autem est habitus semper se habens ad bonum’; Nicholas Austin, S.J. *Aquinas on Virtue: A Causal Reading* (Georgetown, 2017), p. 154.

<sup>22</sup> Luke 14:23, ‘Then the master said to the slave, “Go out into the roads and lanes, and compel people to come in, so that my house may be filled”’; Henri Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews: Scholastic Theology and Enforced Conversion in the Thirteenth Century’, *Dutch Review of Church History* 69/2 (1989), p. 174. Cf. Adone Agnolin, ‘Violence and Adaptability of the Word: Jesuits and Natives in Portuguese America (16<sup>th</sup>-17<sup>th</sup> centuries)’ in Lavenia et al, *Compel People to Come In*, p. 69.

Scripture; this entailed a minimum amount of compulsion in the conversion of Jews, and a maximum amount for Gentiles.<sup>23</sup> Using this hierarchy, Mendieta transformed the gloss into what John Phelan views as ‘an eschatological rationale for the universal monarchy of the Spanish Habsburgs’.<sup>24</sup> In similar fashion, Franciscans and some Jesuits in India through the 1540s interpreted this providential mandate in the context of the Portuguese presence in Asia, based in part through the revitalisation of Duns Scotus by Martín de Ledesma, a prominent theologian of the Salamanca tradition active at Coimbra in the 1530s.<sup>25</sup> By the 1540s Simão Rodrigues was at Coimbra, however, and acting in line with his more lenient approach to provincial administration he ‘did not confront the dilemma of forced baptism, to which he barely referred, but rather proposed that the sovereign again tread the path of general forgiveness’.<sup>26</sup> Despite the prominent place of Thomism at Coimbra, a designated *catédra* or chair in the faculty of Theology during what was called the ‘second scholastic’ period (1537-1772) was reserved exclusively for the teachings of Scotus and almost always held by an ordained Franciscan.<sup>27</sup> Although Scotian theology had typically been rather obscure or observed primarily amongst Franciscans, this renewed interest and higher profile at Coimbra certainly affected theologians and students here, including Jesuits.

---

<sup>23</sup> Cf. Jerónimo de Mendieta, *Historia eclesiástica indiana: obra escrita á fines del siglo XVI* (4 vols, Mexico City, 1870), iii, pp. 26-8; cf. Nicholas of Lyra, *Biblia sacra cum glossis, interlineari et ordinaria* (6 vols, Venice, 1588), v, pp. 162-4.

<sup>24</sup> John Leddy Phelan, *The Millennial Kingdom of the Franciscans in the New World. A Study of the Writings of Gerónimo de Mendieta* (Berkeley, 1971), p. 16.

<sup>25</sup> Marcocci, *Consciência de um Império*, p. 380.

<sup>26</sup> Giuseppe Marcocci, “...per capillos adductos ad pillam”. Il dibattito cinquecentesco sulla validità del battesimo forzato degli ebrei in Portogallo (1496-1497) in Adriano Prosperi (ed), *Salvezza della anime, disciplina dei corpi. Un seminario sulla storia del battesimo* (Pisa, 2006), p. 342.

<sup>27</sup> José Francisco Meirinhos, ‘Escotistas portugueses dos séculos XIV e XV’, in Luís Alberto de Boni et al (eds), *João Duns Scotus (1308-2008). Homenagem dos scotistas lusófonos* (Porto Alegre, 2008), pp. 342-3.

*Conversion theology: Scotus & Aquinas*

Ecclesiastics and mendicants in South Asia dealt with different situations from the European social contexts to which they were accustomed, however Iberian edicts regarding Jewish and Muslim subjects often served as precedent in their decisions and ideologies cultivated in the metropole held a tremendous influence on the approach to conversion. During the sixteenth century the theological viewpoints regarding baptism engaged primarily with the writings of two medieval scholars, John Duns Scotus and Thomas Aquinas. Before discussing the understanding of these positions in missions and the approaches to baptism in practice in India, it is necessary to remark first on some of the key differences between these two theologians, the debate over their writings in the Iberian peninsula at this time, and the effect each had on the development of the Society of Jesus.

During the thirteenth century, a theological shift occurred in the approach towards Jews in Christendom, a movement that departed from predominant Augustinian thought regarding the place of Jews in Christian society.<sup>28</sup> Augustine had reckoned that the Jewish tradition was not in fact a living one, since the fulfilment of the prophets had already been realised through Jesus Christ, thus they preserved only an artefact of the Christian tradition. To the Jewish people he commanded, ‘not forgetting the Law of God but carrying it everywhere, be a testimony to all peoples, a disgrace to yourselves, unknowing you serve the Law to those who are called from east to west’.<sup>29</sup> Thus the Christian perspective had been that the Jewish people should be left with their ignorance, but not harmed; with the thirteenth century came a shift in this prevailing thought. Instead of considering Jews as ‘people of the Old Testament’ and treating their existence with toleration, the view changed

---

<sup>28</sup> Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews’, p. 161; cf. Jeremy Cohen, *The Friars and the Jews: The Evolution of Medieval Anti-Judaism* (Ithaca, 1982), pp. 39-40.

<sup>29</sup> Saint Augustine, *S. Aurelii Augustini Hipponensis Episcopi Tractatus adversus Iudaeos*, caput VII, 9, in Jacques-Paul Migne (ed), *Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Series Latina [Patrologia Latina]* (217 vols, Paris, 1844-1855), xlii, col. 57; cf. Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews’, p. 162.

to consider rabbinic Judaism and the Talmudic teachings as perversion of the true faith to be tolerated no more than those of heretics, pagans, and unbelievers. As Henri Krop observes, ‘toleration was replaced by an active mission and measures attacking Jewish life, such as the condemnation and burning of the Talmud, forced disputations, the forced admission of Christian preachers in the synagogues and forced conversions’.<sup>30</sup> In this shift, Jeremy Cohen argues, the influence of both Franciscans and Dominicans played a significant role. This particular persecution, however, did not depend on one theologian or the other, as ‘no difference in respect of the Jews is to be expected in the views of Thomas Aquinas, a leading Dominican, and Duns Scotus, an important Franciscan theologian’.<sup>31</sup> Where the two Church Doctors diverge, then, is the question of coercive, or enforced baptism.

At its very essence, the practice of forced baptism was denounced by Aquinas; for Scotus, it was not only accepted but even considered obligatory in certain cases. The principle behind these divergent views was not their attitude towards Jews but rather their views of power and who wielded greater authority in matters such as free will. In a *quaestio* from the fourth book of his commentary on Peter Lombard’s *Sentences*, Scotus posited a hierarchy of powers, from the cosmos with God as ruler, down to the familial level with the parents as authority figures. Regarding the baptism of children, the opening to the *quaestio* considered that the opposition to forced conversion is that it is against the will of the parents, who should be responsible for their offspring; Scotus suggested that in the hierarchy of powers, ‘a lower power cannot impose an obligation that conflicts with the wishes of a higher power’. Therefore divine authority—and thus too through a Christian leader whose authority has been ordained by God—supersedes that of the parents, especially so in a

---

<sup>30</sup> Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews’, pp. 162-3.

<sup>31</sup> Cohen, *Friars and the Jews*, p. 325.

decision of such gravity as the salvation of soul or even the uniformity of Christendom, with obvious direct implications for the expulsion of Jews in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries.

Scotus referenced a sermon by Augustine, which stated that

‘above all the prince is obliged to further the service of God. It is therefore necessary that he should withdraw minors from parental power, if the parents want to educate them otherwise than in the service of God. For God is the highest and most elevated Lord. Hence, the prince has to bring those little children to divine worship’<sup>32</sup>

Scotus, however, exceeded his initial conditions by suggesting that forced baptism of adults too is appropriate, for even if it produces weak converts it will nevertheless result in later generations of true believers. To the extent that uniformity necessitated conversion, he further disputed the Augustinian view of toleration towards Jewish people—specifically the argument drawn from Romans 9:27 that ‘the remnant of Israel shall be saved’—based on the idea that this remnant will ultimately be followers of the Antichrist and therefore should be prevented from doing so. Additionally, for Scotus religious tradition did not matter, as he thought no parents—whether Jewish or Christian—possessed inalienable rights, leaving the prince to intervene in matters of the family.<sup>33</sup>

Both Scotus and Thomas Aquinas expressed belief in a hierarchy, but their writings differed on the nature of authority (*potestas*) within that hierarchy. Aquinas focused on this essential point, believing that based on natural law certain rights had been reserved to the parents over their children, whether Jew or gentile, rather than the princely authority. This was in part due to the fact that he understood children to lack disposition of free will until they reach a certain age of maturity, and so they could not willingly consent; instead, the parents would express the will of the child. Scotus outlined a distinction between assent and

---

<sup>32</sup> John Duns Scotus, *Opera omnia*, ed. Luke Wadding (26 vols, Paris, 1891-95), xvi, p. 487; Saint Augustine, ‘Sermo 62’, caput VIII, 13, *Patrologia Latina*, xxxviii, cols. 420/1; cf. Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews’, p. 165.

<sup>33</sup> Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews’, p. 174.

willing, extrapolating from the fact that since complete assent does not occur with infants at baptism then only a modest amount of will is sufficient for any baptism. However, Aquinas had two other points besides the issue of willingness. First, inclusive to the inalienability of natural rights was the right of self-preservation and propagation, in that for example Jews possessed the right to instruct their children according to their tradition, even though they were in a position of dependence on the secular or ecclesiastical authority. Second, Aquinas argued that there was no precedent of enforced baptism of minors directly enacted by the Church.<sup>34</sup>

Regardless of these other two arguments from Aquinas, the question of will remained a very difficult one; although he objected to forced conversion of children, for adults he accepted some degree of coercion, even compulsory baptism that relied upon certain conditions (i.e. non-immediate threats of violence). So too had Augustine believed in the power of punishment as a tool for discovering truth in Christ—in other words, coercive conversion.<sup>35</sup> The distance then between absolute and conditional coercion was the degree to which the potential convert resisted.<sup>36</sup> *Qui tacet consentit*—‘one who is quiet, consents’, as goes the Latin maxim oft repeated by Church theologians. Scotus was no exception regarding the concept: ‘for the Church must regard he who is silent as having given his assent (*qui tacet praesumentis consentire*). Consequently, the Church does not compel a person who protests loudly to observe the Christian faith, but unless he protests openly and violently, he is forced to do so’.<sup>37</sup> Thus while there exists a very clear distinction between Aquinas and Scotus in the administration of baptism for infants, the break between

---

<sup>34</sup> Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews’, p. 167. *Summa Theologica* II.II 10.12.

<sup>35</sup> David M. Lantigua and David A. Clairmont, ‘Between Inculturation and Natural Law’, *Journal of Moral Theology* 2/2 (2013), pp. 63-4.

<sup>36</sup> Seth Kimmel, *Parables of Coercion: Conversion and Knowledge at the End of Islamic Spain* (Chicago, 2015), pp. 21, 24.

<sup>37</sup> Duns Scotus, *Opera omnia*, xvi, p. 419; cf. Krop, ‘Duns Scotus and the Jews’, p. 175.

them begins to narrow as the potential convert grows in age. Ultimately, as Augustine had emphasised and both theologians reiterated, once baptism had occurred, the Church then possessed jurisdiction and responsibility over the new initiate, which in the context of India had significant implications for subjecthood under the Portuguese. These initial converts may not entirely understand to what they consented, but through mentoring and obligatory reception of sacraments their descendants would most likely gain the appropriate level of comprehension—even if it required the power of the Holy Office to bring it about. This acceptance of baptism, regardless of the means through which it was administered, remained the norm even for most Jesuits, yet the means were nevertheless scrutinised by some.

While the allusion to virtue by Ignatius mentioned above indicates his recognition of Thomist theology, this is nonetheless hardly sufficient to claim an endorsement by the Jesuit founder of Aquinas' view as it concerns conversion specifically. It is only when compared with points made by Scotus on the administration of baptism that Ignatius' directions on leading the potential convert, the one who is 'to be won' to their side, clearly suggest further inspiration from Aquinas. The primary indicator is the use of persuasion rather than coercion, recognising the slow process by which a convert is led away from their error, and their love is earned. It ultimately relies on the individual's willingness to enter into the faith and the conditional conversion which Aquinas supported; in Ignatius' case, this precluded any threat of violence in favour of making the conditions much easier. As described by Ignatius, the non-Christian may preserve the good that already existed but abandon the evil. Similarly, the customs of the other must be praised and not contradicted, enabling an ease of transition for the non-Christian. Making these adjustments in a Jesuit's conversation with the 'other' signified a desire to encourage a greater willingness to convert as opposed to accepting a modest amount of will, as Scotus suggested.

### What is Accommodation?

Conceptually, accommodation appears within the early Christian texts, in which not only words but even the individual was adapted to the audience and more specifically those unfamiliar with Christ. The Apostle Paul, beloved saint of the Jesuits and to whom the first college in India was dedicated, wrote in his first letter to the Corinthians,

‘I have made myself a slave to all, so that I might win more of them. To the Jews I became as a Jew, in order to win Jews. To those under the law I became as one under the law (though I myself am not under the law) so that I might win those under the law. To those outside the law (though I am not free from God’s law but am under Christ’s law) so that I might win those outside the law. To the weak I became weak, so that I might win the weak. I have become all things to all people, that I might by all means save some (*omnia omnibus factus sum*).’<sup>38</sup>

Ignatius incorporated these words in his early instructions to Fathers Paschase Broët and Alfonso Salmeron on the method for negotiating and conversing in the Lord’s name; as he noted, ‘observe first what the condition might be and make yourself of it...take up their manner with them, because that is what pleases them; *omnia omnibus factus sum*’.<sup>39</sup> As we will see, much of this same language for winning or gaining others to the side of Christ dominated the Jesuit reports and correspondence, coupled especially with the idea of becoming or making oneself more appealing to others to achieve these gains.

The development of the Jesuit method of accommodation began through the influence of Renaissance humanist principles on the founder Ignatius. Loyola and the founding group who met whilst at the University of Paris in the 1530s focused their studies on theology yet were inevitably influenced by humanism through the study of Latin grammar and rhetoric as well as the movement’s criticism of scholastic theology.<sup>40</sup> In the

---

<sup>38</sup> 1 Cor. 9:19-22. The final verse in the Latin Vulgate reads: ‘Omnibus omnia factus sum, ut omnes facerem salvos’, in which ‘all’ is used in the accusative; however, very few English translations use this.

<sup>39</sup> Ignatius of Loyola, ‘Further instruction to the same nuncios’, Sep 1541, *MI Epp*, i, p. 179; ‘mirar primero de qué condicion sea y hazeros della...tomar el modo dellos con ellos, porque aquello es lo que les agrada; *omnia omnibus factus sum*’.

<sup>40</sup> O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 15.

rebirth of classical study, the principle of rhetoric as practised by Marcus Tullius Cicero took on broader significance in conjunction with Christian theology as first practised by early biblical exegetes such as Augustine.<sup>41</sup> One modern definition of *accommodatio* has described it as ‘the fitting or adjusting of one thing to another’, drawing from Cicero’s statements on rhetoric in *De inventione* which defined that ‘elocution is the adaptation (*accommodatio*) of words and ideas appropriate for the sake of rhetorical strategy’.<sup>42</sup> In this case, accommodation or adaptation is explicitly linked with the ability to eloquently orate and present cogent ideas and arguments applicable to that particular audience. Humanism reintroduced classical views on the principle of rhetoric. In the minds of Christian philosophers of this period, Cicero’s advice for understanding one’s audience could thus be employed in literary analysis, to explain and elucidate Scripture much as Augustine and the Church Fathers had done. Desiderius Erasmus contributed significantly through his reworking of the accommodation method via classical rhetoric to form the foundation for his own ‘Christo-centric hermeneutic’. Through his critical reading of patristic exegesis, Erasmus’ interpretive method sought to negotiate the concepts of historical change over time with immutable divine truths—in other words, words or ideas must be adapted to their respective epoch yet retain inherent dogmatic meaning.<sup>43</sup> Although the works of Erasmus were later banned from Jesuit schools, his hermeneutical contribution nevertheless had a profound effect on the early Society. Humanist-inspired educational policies attached

---

<sup>41</sup> Ines G. Županov, ‘Conversion Historiography in South Asia: Alternative Indian Christian Counter-histories in Eighteenth Century Goa’, *The Medieval History Journal* 12/2 (2009), p. 315; Ananya Chakravarti, *The Empire of Apostles: Religion, Accommodatio, and the Imagination of Empire in Early Modern Brazil and India* (Oxford, 2018), p. 9.

<sup>42</sup> Charles T. Lewis and Charles Short, ‘accommodatio’, *A Latin Dictionary* (Oxford, 1879). Cicero, *De Inventione*, 1.7.9; ‘elocutio est idoneorum verborum et sententiarum ad inventionem accommodatio’. Many thanks to Nick Davidson for drawing my attention to this entry, and to Lucy McNerney for her help with the translation.

<sup>43</sup> Robert Coogan, ‘Review of Peter Walter, “Theologie aus dem Geist der Rhetorik”’, *Bibliothèque d’humanisme et renaissance* (1992), p. 559; Ines G. Županov, ‘Accommodation’, in Régine Azria and Danièle Hervieu-Léger (eds), *Dictionnaire des faits religieux* (Paris, 2010), pp. 1-4; Chakravarti, ‘The Many Faces of Balthasar da Costa’, p. 147. Cf. Carlo Ginzburg, *Wooden Eyes* (New York, 2001), pp. 110-11.

themselves to the classics more directly, implementing a ‘Ciceronian pedagogy’ where classical literature informed the disciplines and ideas taught within the Jesuit colleges. The Society thereby also applied Cicero’s definition of *accommodatio* through its educational ministry, as the Constitutions impressed upon Jesuit educators to lecture ‘in a manner suitable for the edification of the people’.<sup>44</sup>

In seeking to better understand accommodation in a way distinct from merely model individuals, the concept requires a synthesis of constituent parts as variously described through previous scholarship. The earliest references to cultural accommodation and adaptation appeared through early and mid-20<sup>th</sup> century Catholic theologians studying the early modern missions in Asia, particularly in light of ecclesiastical shifts in ideals following the second World War and in relation to present-day missions following the Second Vatican Council.<sup>45</sup> Johannes Thaurén (1892-1954) oversaw the dissection of accommodation into a series of different forms—external, linguistic, aesthetic, socio-legal (*sozialrechtliche*), intellectual, and religious—justifying the idea through the New Testament and exegesis conducted by the Church Fathers. Thaurén viewed in particular the external, linguistic, and aesthetic as a sort of ‘accidental’ or non-essential unity, in that they collectively served as malleable forms, in contrast to the internal unity (*unitas symbolica*) of the latter three forms of legal, intellectual and religious, which were unchangeable along doctrinal lines.<sup>46</sup> This emphasis on the immutable ‘essence’ of Christianity versus would play out greatly in the missions, as explored below. Johannes Bettray (1919-80) continued the work of Thaurén through the same forms, which he used to analyse the mission of Matteo Ricci. Tying accommodation to Paul’s directive to become all to all, Bettray viewed the principle as a

---

<sup>44</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 201.

<sup>45</sup> W.S.F. Pickering, ‘Introduction: Old Positions and New Concerns’ *Journal of the Anthropological Society of Oxford* 23/2 (1992), pp. 101-2.

<sup>46</sup> Johannes Thaurén, SVD, *Die Akkommodation im Katholischen Heidenapostolat* (Münster, 1927), pp. 21, 29.

consistent part of the Church throughout its history.<sup>47</sup> Bettray's somewhat myopic (and rather uncritical) focus on one specific individual overlooked the role of humanism, nevertheless his attention to missionary praxis in China accurately depicted the absence of any set theory guiding Ricci's adaptative measures in dress, speech, and theological message. Additionally, the significance Bettray placed on both Alessandro Valignano and the *Exercises* drew out some of the factors which enabled such a method to flourish. Bettray's contemporary, the Jesuit Angel Santos Hernández (1915- ), though interpreting the principle of missionary accommodation through a similar scope, crucially noted how 'accommodation (*adaptación*) can have application in quite diverse fields of the apostolate', and how the method depended heavily on obedience to mission superiors like Valignano who favoured methods along the lines of accommodation.<sup>48</sup> One of the most significant conclusions from Santos was how 'first of all, accommodation had to be positioned through a complete understanding of the language', another key element of Valignano's mission principles.<sup>49</sup>

Though Thaurén viewed accommodation as an etic Christian methodology, from Bettray and Santos' analyses the interpretation of cultural accommodation has grown far more complex and has been critically assessed to examine the concept beyond the confines of a few Jesuits, leading to the argument that in fact 'every aspect of the first Jesuits' ministries was shaped by the rhetorical principle of accommodation to one's particular audience'.<sup>50</sup> Building from the example of John O'Malley's thesis and those who have expounded upon it, a more etiological way of conceptualising accommodation in the early

---

<sup>47</sup> Johannes Bettray SVD, *Die Akkommodationsmethode des P. Matteo Ricci S.I. in China* (Rome, 1955), p. 1.

<sup>48</sup> Angel Santos Hernández SJ, *Adaptación Misionera* (Bilbao, 1958), pp. 574-5.

<sup>49</sup> Santos Hernández, *Adaptación Misionera*, p. 575.

<sup>50</sup> Schloesser, 'Accommodation as a Rhetorical Principle', p. 348; the argument, however, comes from O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, p. 14.

Jesuit missions is through its origin as a principle of rhetoric, wherein one adapts oneself to the audience with whom one seeks to engage, imbued with Christian theological truth. As O'Malley states, the rhetorical dimension 'was a basic principle in all their ministries, even if they did not explicitly identify it as rhetorical'.<sup>51</sup> It is important to note that this was not what Ignatius impressed upon the earliest members of the Society; rather he bade them adapt the Spiritual *Exercises* to the individual who was undertaking them. Humanist influence on Ignatius, however, imbued the *Exercises* and the principles laid out for mission and for proselytism within the Society. If we expand the micro-perspective of the *Exercises* to a macro level, the missionary might address one's whole ministry to the many peoples with whom the missionary interacts person by person, a crucial step in the transformation of adaptability in contemplative dialogue to that of active. Accounting for the diversity of personalities illustrates the variation in methodology. Any given population possessed many complex factors, such as cultural and social mores—including verbal and physical language, class, gender, sexuality—extant religious traditions, political pressures within and without, environmental concerns, et cetera; while individual missionaries faced personal obstacles through their own limitations of education or even overcoming biases. As Andrés Prieto aptly notes, 'even though the rhetoric of accommodation permeated the spiritual and worldly activities of the Jesuits, not all members of the order agreed on how to translate this notion into actual practice'.<sup>52</sup>

Županov views accommodation as 'a device of humanistic rhetoric, the ability to adapt oneself and one's speech in order to be in touch with the feelings and needs of the audience this became a device of all Jesuit ministries which spanned many cultures and

---

<sup>51</sup> O'Malley, *The First Jesuits*, p. 255; cf. Schloesser, 'Accommodation as a Rhetorical Principle', p. 353.

<sup>52</sup> Prieto, 'Perils of Accommodation', p. 397.

contexts'.<sup>53</sup> This principle was perhaps drawn from Cicero, bolstered by Paul's example, witnessed in patristic writings, reinvigorated by humanists, and later employed to increasing degrees by members of the Society of Jesus as well as other Catholic religious orders, not to mention those outside of these circles.<sup>54</sup> Accommodation as so often used by scholars today describes the procedure by which such figures as Ricci and Nobili operated, a procedure which extended to a greater extreme than the general definition associated with previous iterations. Accommodation is considered here as an etic term for practices not exclusively implemented by the Society of Jesus, although the Jesuit way of proceeding and distinctiveness—both of which characterise the attempted formation of a Jesuit identity distinct from that of any temporal affinities—created optimal conditions for such a method to flourish through the emic principle of *accommodatio*. Yet the absence of an enumerated, widescale policy equated with a quite flexible and individualised understanding of *accommodatio*, revealing opportunities for both broader interpretations as well as more restrictive ones. The early foundation of 'contemplation in action' merged fortuitously with aspects of 'cosmopolitanism, youth, flexibility, and centralised organisation of the new order', as Joan-Pau Rubiés put it, but other factors such as educational initiatives and the unique context of non-European environments proved necessary to see cultural accommodation thrive.<sup>55</sup> Such factors elicited divergent views between the more open Jesuits and those who tended to hold narrower interpretations of the purpose of the Society, with both seeking to legitimise through foundational principles, a debate more properly

---

<sup>53</sup> Ines Županov, "'One Civility, but Multiple Religions': Jesuit Mission among St. Thomas Christians in India (16<sup>th</sup>-17<sup>th</sup> centuries)' *Journal of Early Modern History* 9/3-4 (2005), p. 286.

<sup>54</sup> Some Calvinist scholars have argued that models used by John Calvin were based on the rhetorical principle of accommodation; cf. Richard Osmer, 'James W. Fowler and the Reformed Tradition: An Exercise in Theological Reflection in Religious Education', *Religious Education: The official journal of the Religious Education Association* 85/1 (1990), pp. 62-63.

<sup>55</sup> Joan-Pau Rubiés, 'The Concept of Cultural Dialogue and the Jesuit Method of Accommodation', *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 147 (2005), p. 247.

explored in Chapter Two. The *Exercises*, borne out of Loyola's unique experience yet influenced by the humanist movement and specifically the rejuvenated principle of rhetoric, evinced their flexibility first through the interpretation and applications of colleagues such as Jerónimo Nadal, later through early educators and students of language like Henrique Henriques (fl. 1546-1600), and finally with the truly transformative missionary accommodation of Ricci and Nobili. This thesis aims to bridge the gap between the founder and these exemplar individuals to better illuminate the multiple ways individual Jesuits might interpret their purpose as well as pinpoint instances where elements of accommodation appear through their interpretations.

Through this analysis it proves helpful to visualise a hypothetical scenario both in the spirit of the *Exercises* as well as the rhetorical considerations employed in humanist dialogic scholarship. If we consider an abstract audience which one intends to address, in the process of this presentation a number of steps are involved. Observation and information gathering help guide the preparation for approaching the audience, requiring a concerted efforts at understanding location and environment; the language will need to be in a form and manner that has the greatest impact, ensuring both comprehension and cultural significance; and self-fashioning through presentation and performance put these preliminary considerations into practice. All these phases are furthermore contingent upon the subjective interpretation of the individual regardless of training. Reinterpreting the forms posited by Thaurén and Bettray, I will investigate what I view as the constituent elements of cultural accommodation in turn: attention to cultural differences, language, and presentation.

*Attention to Cultural Difference*

In order to adjust to one's audience, one must first observe and read the audience, noting the cultural particulars unique to them and maintaining records that serve to instruct others who may follow how to cater to this audience. The development of initial observation into a more scientific approach manifests through deliberate record-keeping and experimentation. This often leads scholars to draw a correlation between Jesuits and ethnography or even proto-anthropology, in that their missions evince to an extent a prototype of the more systematic study of human culture.<sup>56</sup> In the earliest years, a less sophisticated form of description dominated the Jesuit written record, but this grew more elaborate soon thereafter as historians of the Society drew from the existing corpus of letters which noted in great detail the variety of cultures with which they interacted, drawing greater curiosity of readers.<sup>57</sup> Copies of these letters circulated amongst the respective authors' companions in regional networks at the same time others reached the metropole, circulating knowledge about locations and peoples both familiar and unfamiliar. Their confreres' accounts of missions contributed to more scrupulous record-keeping and later a more comprehensive accounting of culture, itself contingent upon non-European sources and perspectives which had been pushed aside in the early decades.<sup>58</sup>

---

<sup>56</sup> Cf. Joan-Pau Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology in the Renaissance: South India Through European Eyes, 1250-1625* (Cambridge, 2004); Ângela Barreto Xavier and Ines Županov, *Catholic Orientalism: Portuguese Empire, Indian Knowledge* (Oxford, 2015); Paolo Aranha, '«Glocal» conflicts: missionary controversies on the Coromandel coast between the XVII and the XVIII Centuries', in Michela Catto, Guido Mongini, and Silvia Mostaccio (eds), *Evangelizzazione e Globalizzazione: Le missioni gesuitiche nell'età moderna tra storia e storiografia* (Città di Castello, 2010), pp. 79-104.

<sup>57</sup> A brief survey of histories compiled from letters by Jesuits begins with Emanuel Acosta and Gian Pietro Maffei, *Rerum a Societate Iesu in oriente gestarum* (1571); followed by Manuel Teixeira, *Vida del bienaventurado padre Francisco Javier* (1579; original Portuguese manuscript lost); Alessandro Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso de la Compañia de Jesús en las Indias orientales* (1583); Gian Pietro Maffei, *Historiarum Indicarum libri XVI* (1588); Orazio Torsellino, *De vita Francisca Xaverii. Libri* (Rome, 1596); João de Lucena, *Historia da vida do padre Francisco de Xavier* (Lisbon, 1600); Luis de Guzmán, *Historia de las Misiones de la Compañia de Jesus* (1601); Fernão Guerreiro, *Relação anual das coisas que fizeram os Padres da Companhia de Jesus nas suas Missões do Japão, China, Cataio [etc.]* (5 vols, 1603-11); and Sebastião Gonçalves, *Primeira Parte da Historia dos Religiosos da Companhia de Jesus* (1614).

<sup>58</sup> Cf. Susan Bayly, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings: Muslims and Christians in South Indian society, 1700-1900* (Cambridge, 1989), p. 397.

As noted by Županov, ‘for Ricci and Valignano accommodation was a dynamic, two-way process in which both sides added and/or exchanged cultural material following their own social strategies’.<sup>59</sup> Yet the exchange also relied in part on a kind of cultural sympathy or at least open interest on the part of European Jesuits, through which an attempt at an understanding of existing systems, rather than a wholesale imposition of new ones beyond that of the religious, took precedence.<sup>60</sup> Alessandro Valignano exhibited an understanding of the crucial differences between Europe and Asia in a way that failed to appear substantially in prior accounts from other Jesuits; as Markus Friedrich put it, ‘juxtaposing Europe and India and insisting on their partial incommensurability became a key element of his reporting’.<sup>61</sup> Even Valignano exhibited limits in this regard, as Franz Schütte pondered that if he had attempted to engage seriously with cultural and textual traditions Valignano might ‘have judged otherwise of the intellectual capabilities of its people, and his missionary methods might possibly have been radically different’.<sup>62</sup>

It is important to recognise that Jesuits were certainly not alone in the production of knowledge about India. The Franciscans were the first missionaries to arrive in India, in 1518, and a decade before Francis Xavier (fl. 1542-1552) landed as the inaugural Jesuit in Asia the Franciscans had contributed directly to the creation of the Diocese of Goa in 1533, with one of their own, Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque, named as the first bishop.<sup>63</sup> Due to their early presence, the Franciscan order counted more members born in Asia than their Jesuit counterparts, which created a generation of authors in the mid-seventeenth century

---

<sup>59</sup> Županov, “‘One Civility, but Multiple Religions’”, p. 313.

<sup>60</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision*, p. 56.

<sup>61</sup> Markus Friedrich, “‘Government in India and Japan is different from government in Europe’”: Asian Jesuits on Infrastructure, Administrative Space, and the Possibilities for a Global Management of Power’, *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 4 (2017), p. 6.

<sup>62</sup> Josef Franz Schütte, *Valignano’s Mission Principles for Japan*, trans. John J. Coyne (St. Louis, 1980), part 1, pp. 130-1.

<sup>63</sup> Liam Brockey, ‘Conquests of Memory: Franciscan Chronicles of the East Asian Church in the Early Modern Period’, *Culture & History Digital Journal* 5/2 (2006), pp. 5-6.

whose work on the missions possessed a decidedly more local perspective. However, they often sympathised with colonial elites who patronised Franciscan efforts in India and sent their children to Franciscan schools.<sup>64</sup> Consequently this local perspective was closer to the interests of the *Estado da Índia*. Whilst this relationship with ecclesiastical and political authorities initiated stronger connections with such developments as the establishment of a printing press in 1556, the Franciscans nevertheless collected more than they wrote and never truly organised reportage on their activities until the publication of the treatise *Conquista Espiritual do Oriente* in 1636 by Frei Paulo da Trindade.<sup>65</sup> Trindade himself lamented the ‘great carelessness on the part both of authors who wrote about Indian matters and of our own men of those times’.<sup>66</sup>

The Jesuits, on the whole, had taken much greater effort to avoid such pitfalls, credited to both the requirement of regular reports and centralised structure which the Franciscans lacked. Additionally, the drive to gather data about newly-encountered communities, not only in India but across the globe, grew out of a more general rejection of ‘the mendicants’ prophetic view of history’ in favour of ‘natural and moral’ narratives, itself influenced by humanism.<sup>67</sup> Still, the inherent need for missionaries to observe cultural norms towards the purpose of proselytism typically resulted in less systematic productions of knowledge.<sup>68</sup> Value judgments made by Jesuit missionaries as to rites and practices that appeared to contradict their own cultural values rendered some texts useless in understanding characteristics that might have proven advantageous to more

---

<sup>64</sup> Barreto Xavier & Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, p. 170.

<sup>65</sup> Barreto Xavier & Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, pp. 166, 175.

<sup>66</sup> Frei Paulo da Trindade, *Conquista Espiritual do Oriente*, ed. F. Felix Lopes, OFM (3 vols, Lisbon, 1962-67), i, p. 6; quoted in Brockey, ‘Conquests of Memory’, p. 5.

<sup>67</sup> Jennifer Selwyn, *A Paradise Inhabited by Devils: The Jesuits’ Civilizing Mission in Early Modern Naples* (New York, 2004), pp. 63-4. Cf. Adriano Prospero, ‘L’Europa Cristiana e il mondo. Alle origini dell’idea di missione’, *Dimensioni e problem della ricerca storica* 2 (1992), pp. 198-204.

<sup>68</sup> Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology*, p. 2.

accommodationist-inclined minds. By the early seventeenth century this had changed; Diogo Gonçalves' *Historia do Malavar* (1615) provided context on cultural and social norms for the edification of future missionaries, distinguishing 'between those [errors] which are inimical to the Christian Faith and those which make no material difference'.<sup>69</sup>

For Catholic missionaries working across the world, the prevailing belief in a universal Church led to the assumption that this universality was equated with commensurability. Few realised, however, the extent to which cultural and social traits proved incommensurable with European Christian norms, nor how little these external characteristics resembled supposedly universal Christian truths. This is not to say that there existed some kind 'insurmountable incommensurability', as Pagden argued; rather, the act of overcoming these obstacles of subjectivity to implement cultural accommodation required a number of skills developed over a period of time under circumstances quite different to an individual's developmental conditions.<sup>70</sup> The concept of *adiaphora*, a term linked to biblical exegesis, was crucial in addressing this misunderstanding, as it recognised elements which were merely external or superficial and therefore indifferent from those immutable (internal, as Thaurén suggested) teachings and practices that required correction in order to conform to orthodoxy and orthopraxy. Again, the Jesuits were remarkably well-suited to interpret issues through such distinctions, as the *Exercises* had prompted, 'all matters in which we wish to make a choice must be either indifferent or good in themselves'.<sup>71</sup> This opened the Jesuit procedure to enforcing good and discouraging evil customs while simultaneously allowing those which are morally neutral or non-religious, aiding the process of rendering many 'heathen' customs into merely social ones.<sup>72</sup> While

---

<sup>69</sup> John T. Tucker, 'Portuguese Missionary in Malabar', *International Review of Missions* 45 (1956), p. 232.

<sup>70</sup> Anthony Pagden, *European Encounters with the New World: From Renaissance to Romanticism* (New Haven, 1994), p. 179. Cf. Chakravarti, *Empire of Apostles*, pp.16-17.

<sup>71</sup> Loyola, *Spiritual Exercises*, p. 83.

<sup>72</sup> Županov, 'Conversion Historiography', pp. 313-14.

the principle of *adiaphora* influenced the development of moral casuistry, the analysis of ethics through specific cases, most missionaries gathered empirical data in reality whilst casuists explored the various examples theoretically without the added pressures of the lived environment.

As part of this observation, cultural variation across space played a significant role in how adaptation played out—physical space in terms of the natural environment of the missionary location and social space through the local population and its culture, religion, social structure, as well as the presence of European-born population. As Ananya Chakravarti observes, the application of the rhetorical *accommodatio* ‘allowed missionaries to transcend the contingencies not only of time but also of space, in spreading the Christian message’.<sup>73</sup> Županov examines this human and physical geography particularly well. While Catholic missions to India depended upon the Portuguese *Padroado*, the ecclesiastical administrative operation on the whole was inconsistent and inefficient, resulting in “a situation structurally similar to the one faced by the apostles and missionaries of the early Christian church”, in which a small band of faithful representatives sent out into non-Christian lands faced situations which relied on their ability to interpret the best course of action.<sup>74</sup> This situation, however, depended upon the degree of Portuguese presence, as difficult terrain often meant lessened administrative oversight, such as in Madurai for Nobili as well as other areas inward from the coasts, which contributed to more instances of independent Jesuit decision-making. In Portuguese centres like Goa and Malacca priests of various orders often participated in public displays of colonial power, spaces in which a more coercive and often forceful approach often resulted in more lapsed converts, thereby

---

<sup>73</sup> Chakravarti, *Empire of Apostles*, p. 9.

<sup>74</sup> Ines Županov, *Missionary Tropics: The Catholic Frontier in India (16<sup>th</sup>-17<sup>th</sup> centuries)* (Ann Arbor, 2005), p. 148.

relying more so upon the oversight of the Inquisition and limiting missionary flexibility in deference to secular rigidity.<sup>75</sup>

### *Language*

Cultural variation across space created the first obstacle for a missionary to overcome: language. In his definition of missionary accommodation, Angel Santos Hernández argued that adaptation relied directly on complete knowledge of the language pertinent to the mission.<sup>76</sup> Between the reclaiming of Ciceronian rhetoric and the effect this had on Ignatius as reflected in the foundational literature, the only way a Jesuit would have even a remote chance at moving an audience to reflect on Christian teachings was by speaking in their own language. Humanist Latin, though a significant aspect of the classical resurgence in the fifteenth century, did not fit within the refreshed missionary *accommodatio*, in that it could not significantly move all audiences of a global stage; vulgate Latin and missionary vernacular became the norm in correspondence, while indigenous languages over time came to dominate individual study during the mission. The Jesuit Constitutions had first suggested that greater edification could be achieved ‘by endeavouring to learn the [vernacular] language well’.<sup>77</sup> Based on the early correspondence discussed in Chapter Two, it is possible that this idea gained greater significance through Jesuit activity in India, albeit in a more limited fashion. Nevertheless communication was of frequent concern to religious orders whose organisation and apostolic distribution crossed linguistic space, and the Jesuits’ wide reach certainly exemplified this to a greater degree.<sup>78</sup>

---

<sup>75</sup> Alberts, *Conflict and Conversion*, p. 91.

<sup>76</sup> Hernández, *Adaptación Misionera*, p. 575.

<sup>77</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 201.

<sup>78</sup> Ronnie Po-chia Hsia, ‘Introduction: Catholic Global Missions and the Expansion of Europe’, in Ronnie Po-chia Hsia (ed), *A Companion to Early Modern Catholic Global Missions* (Leiden, 2018), p. 6.

Where *accommodatio* blossomed into the more fundamental cultural accommodation was through a more systematic approach to language learning, in which European missionaries devoted more time to linguistics than to? some public ministries and schools became centres of serious study for both European and indigenous students learning each other's language. After 1575, Valignano served as the primary motivator for both India and Japan in this regard.

The modern approach to language learning tends to emphasize the significance of immersion, as this allows one to gain conversational insight, practise amongst indigenous speakers, return negative or positive confirmation, and thereby reinforce behaviours necessary to comprehension; the whole process being empirical, based on performance and experience but contingent upon experimentation and analysis. Far from suggesting that the Jesuits prefigured the modern approach to language study, they nevertheless formulated their own approach to linguistic study initially through native speakers, from which they later developed grammars and manuals for their own edification that outpaced language learning methods in Europe.<sup>79</sup> For Nobili, linguistic comprehension meant more than Tamil conversation and textual composition, but also a grasp of deeper levels of cultural and religious meaning; when he decided to employ the word *sarvēśuran* instead of *tambiran* he drew upon prior attempts to translate not just the name and honorific but the theological significance behind it, incorporating prior observation which served to improve his own adaptation to a Tamil audience.<sup>80</sup> While Xavier had attempted similarly to adopt an esoteric

---

<sup>79</sup> Cf. Otto Zwartjes, *Portuguese Missionary Grammars in Asia, Africa and Brazil, 1550-1800* (Amsterdam, 2011), p. 7. Examples include Henrique Henriques' *Arte da Lingua Malabar* (ca. 1549) and Thomas Stephens' *Arte de Lingoa Canarim* (ca. 1600, pub. 1640). For comparison with European tradition, cf. John Gallagher, "'To Heare It by Mouth': Speech and Accent in Early Modern Language Learning", *The Huntington Library Quarterly* 82/1 (2019), pp. 63-86.

<sup>80</sup> Sangkeun Kim, *Strange Names of God: The Missionary Translation of the Divine Name and the Chinese Responses to Matteo Ricci's "Shangti" in Late Ming China, 1583-1644* (Bern, 2004), p. 108-9; cf. S. Rajamanickam, "Roberto de Nobili and Adaptation," *Indian Church History Review* 1 (1967), p. 89. The term *tambiran* had been employed by the first Jesuit Tamil scholar Henrique Henriques (discussed in

Buddhist name for God, his own misunderstanding resulted in confusion amongst the Japanese audience, mistaking him for a new Buddhist teacher.<sup>81</sup> In the half century between these two notorious figures, members of the Society of Jesus in India developed a greater capacity to appreciate the linguistic, cultural, and theological nuances in order to more successfully communicate with indigenous audiences.

One way to transcend the inherent issues of translation was by teaching and converting those who are culturally more commensurable—that is, local people—to take up the mantle of proselytism, firstly as interpreters but also as indigenous clergy. Interpreters typically served as the preferred standard of indigenous communication, mostly for the ease with which they could begin helping missionaries, but also due to the controversy over native clergy amongst both clerics and laity. Space figured crucially into these tensions; Portuguese settlers claimed they favoured the theological education and Latin proficiency of European priests, while Jesuits on the frontiers complained how they could not achieve the evangelical duties and proselytism through interpreters.<sup>82</sup> Race, however, played a role as well. In the context of Japan, the indigenous *dojuku* (‘acolytes’) had served as translators, preachers, and enablers of elite conversions prior to the arrival of Alessandro Valignano, essentially serving as native clergy without ordainment in an environment far different than the Portuguese urban centres of Goa and Cochin.<sup>83</sup> When Valignano encouraged the admission of such Japanese clergy, no such provision served the Indian sub-provinces, even

---

subsequent chapters), meaning “the Lord has no Lord”, whereas Nobili’s understanding was that *sarvēśuran*—“master of all things”—had a closer connotation to the Latin *Deus* in its indication of singularity; additionally, it was less common in southern India and yet could be understood through the Upanishads. Cf. Bror Tiliander, *Christian and Hindu Terminology: A Study in Their Mutual Relations with Special Reference to the Tamil Area* (Uppsala, 1974), p. 88.

<sup>81</sup> M. Antoni J. Üçerler, ‘The Jesuits in East Asia in the Early Modern Age: A New “Areopagus” and the “Re-invention” of Christianity’, in Thomas Banchoff and José Casanova (eds), *Jesuits and Globalization: Historical Legacies and Contemporary Challenges* (Washington, D.C., 2016), p. 28.

<sup>82</sup> Charles Borges, ‘Foreign Jesuits and Native Resistance in Goa, 1542-1759’, in Teotonio R. de Souza (ed), *Essays in Goan History* (Goa, 1989), p. 75.

<sup>83</sup> Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 62.

on the frontiers. Native clergy too served as proxy for self-fashioning, as they literally indigenised Christianity, yet instead the Jesuit emphasis in India remained on those Europeans who might accommodate themselves.

Most importantly, learning local languages in India opened up the possibility for greater cultural study. As Rubiés notes, ‘research into Hindu religion to a large extent followed from the effort to teach Christianity more effectively by using the original vernacular languages’ in that linguistic practice as well as scholarship revealed more than just oral communication but also a ‘native set of social assumptions’.<sup>84</sup> As mentioned above and will be shown in subsequent chapters, the first thirty years covered in this thesis display little evidence of the cultural relativism that developed under Valignano, yet the language study that burgeoned during this period evinced some revelation of cultural difference inherent within the practice of translation. In the process of crafting indigenous language grammars, individuals labouring in India like Henrique Henriques and Thomas Stephens (fl. 1579-1619) began with the familiar, but complex, languages of Latin and Greek as a means for systematic organization of grammar, vocabulary, and syntax.<sup>85</sup> Comparative linguistics thus served as one of the first processes for objective, and less normative, cultural comparison.

### *Presentation and performance*

Transmission of the essential parts of Christianity in a form distinct from an identifiably European aesthetic was first ‘enabled by the resourcefulness of Jesuit missionaries in learning the spoken languages of these new lands and peoples’, eventually

---

<sup>84</sup> Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology*, p. 316.

<sup>85</sup> Zwartjes, *Portuguese Missionary Grammars*, pp. 4, 30.

building towards what Simon Ditchfield calls a ‘visual language’.<sup>86</sup> The transformation of verbal communication, as well as a subsequent realisation of its limits, developed into an understanding of visual communication through self-presentation. Citing Saint Paul’s first letter to the Corinthians, Roberto de Nobili noted how ‘the evangelical preacher is to take up that manner of life which will cause his hearers to judge him worthy of being listened to’.<sup>87</sup> Physical presentation figured largely into how the audience judged the merit of the orator, serving as one of the key characteristics viewed as part of *accommodatio*, especially the clothes worn. On a decidedly comprehensive level, accommodation developed through mimesis, self-effacement, indigenization, and “taking the other”, yet rarely did missionaries achieve such complete transformation.<sup>88</sup> In the context of China, clothing served as the earliest and foremost external sign of missionary accommodation, as the impetus for changing one’s dress first appeared here in earnest.<sup>89</sup> Michele Ruggieri, companion of Matteo Ricci, made the initial decision for both of them to dress as Buddhist monks in order that they might distinguish themselves from the Portuguese merchants whose commercial zeal had not been quite welcome at the Ming court.<sup>90</sup> In a similar approach, Nobili recognised the limits of his inflexible Portuguese companion Gonçalo Fernandes in making progress in Madurai, understanding the need to define himself as something other than *parangi*, the Tamil name for all Europeans which Nobili assumed was only for Portuguese.<sup>91</sup> In the context of India, Nobili served as a more comprehensive

---

<sup>86</sup> Simon Ditchfield, ‘The Jesuits in the Making of a World Religion’, *History Today* 57/7 (2007), p. 57.

<sup>87</sup> Roberto de Nobili, *Adaptation*, ed. S. Rajamanickam (Palayamkottai, 1971), pp. 7-17. Cf. Francis X. Clooney, S.J., ‘Roberto de Nobili, Adaptation and the Reasonable Interpretation of Religion’ *Missiology: An International Review* 18/1 (1990), p. 28.

<sup>88</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 108.

<sup>89</sup> Bettray, *Akkommodationsmethode*, pp. 1-10.

<sup>90</sup> Prieto, ‘Perils of Accommodation’, p. 399.

<sup>91</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission: Jesuit Experiments and Brahmanical Knowledge in Seventeenth-century India* (Oxford, 1999), p. 5; Paolo Aranha, ‘Discrimination and Integration of the Dalits in Early Modern South Indian Missions: The Historical Origins of a Major Challenge for Today’s Christians’, *Journal of World Christianity* 6/1 (2016) p. 179. Cf. Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology*, p. 337.

example who progressed from a sort of external observant to a participatory member amongst his ‘audience’ in order to comprehend their perspective and respond accordingly to it.<sup>92</sup>

Despite such measures to alter appearance, self-fashioning may involve a more restrained approach as well, in which an individual may first perform in a manner that strives to distinguish them from the norm along similar lines to Nobili’s separation from the Portuguese identity. It may mean more simply a kind of cosmopolitanism through which an individual gains insight from other personalities, an idea often at odds with the imperial universalism and nationalistic impulses at play in the overseas missions.<sup>93</sup> Or this can even simply be through opposition to the use of state force and subjection.<sup>94</sup> As Tara Alberts proposed, Jesuits and other missionaries ‘used a variety of strategies to make their sacral role comprehensible to local peoples’ and often this more simply equated to demonstrating differences between a priestly identity and that of a Portuguese settler’s, in a process hardly different from ‘a layman’s cultivation of his image’.<sup>95</sup> For some, their respective habits conveyed Christian spiritual value, but in the case of some Jesuits in East Asia this was negotiable, much to the dismay of orders like the Dominicans who held fast to their black robes.

---

<sup>92</sup> David Mosse, *Saint in the Banyan Tree: Christianity and Caste Society in India* (Berkeley, 2012), p. 34.

<sup>93</sup> Francisco Bethencourt, ‘Early Modern Imperialism and Cosmopolitanism’ in *Cosmopolitanism in the Portuguese-speaking World* (Leiden, 2017), p. 82; Liam Brockey, ‘“A Vinha do Senhor”: The Portuguese Jesuits in China in the Seventeenth Century’ *Portuguese Studies* 16 (2000), p. 127. Beyond openness, Županov reckoned ‘love... would be transformed into *accommodatio*’, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 71.

<sup>94</sup> Anne B. McGinness, ‘Between Subjection and Accommodation: the Development of José de Anchieta’s Missionary Project in Colonial Brazil’, *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1.2 (2014), pp. 228-9.

<sup>95</sup> Alberts, *Conflict and Conversion*, p. 89.

### **Political and Intellectual Contexts**

Differences between the imperial-colonial structures and those of Christianity can be seen through the actions of missionaries; understanding accommodation as a departure from the state-driven Christianity that seeks to make Portuguese Christians out of Indians in preference of a spirituality-driven Christianity that seeks to make Indian Christians.<sup>96</sup> As W.S.F. Pickering notes, on the opposite end of the spectrum to accommodation existed ‘cultural colonisation’, ‘where the missionary either disregards totally the local culture or openly condemns it. Whichever, the missionary imposes his own culture on his converts’.<sup>97</sup> A natural cultural exchange via secular enablers is expected, as with all disruptive foreign interventions, yet this kind of cultural colonisation was diminished through accommodation to the “other” in a way that did not exist within the state agenda. This is of course complicated given that the mere existence of the Jesuits and other religious orders in India is based on the patronage privileges bestowed on the Portuguese crown by the papacy, through which all missions are enabled by the crown and its representatives globally. Nevertheless, outside of the concerted efforts of creating ‘another Portugal’ in Goa, there existed to some extent within the capital and to a greater extent outside of it missionary initiatives to avoid the Christian state violence and hegemony that dominated the decade in which Jesuits first entered the subcontinent.

On the eve of the first Jesuit arrivals in India, most missionaries and clerics had remained in Goa, the capital of the *Estado da Índia*, while some had been scattered up the coast north to Bassein and then Bombay, or south to Cochin and Cranganore, while others operated outside the Indian subcontinent in places such as Ormuz in the Persian Gulf or Malacca in present-day Malaysia. The campaigns of Francis Xavier in many ways changed

---

<sup>96</sup> Prieto, ‘Perils of Accommodation’, p. 403.

<sup>97</sup> Pickering, ‘Introduction’, p. 104.

that condition, as his penchant for peregrinations throughout the southern Malabar, Fishery, and Coromandel coasts piqued the interest of other missionaries to expand into these less-evangelised lands outside *Estado* control, while his origination of the mission to Japan greatly contributed to the momentous yet turbulent history of Christianity there. Although at times implicated with the introduction of accommodation, Xavier—as I will show in subsequent chapters—did little accommodating of language and presentation beyond opening up new mission fields and expanding the network for future Jesuits, an initiative very much motivated by a desire to express Christianity beyond the bounds of the Portuguese state despite his own support of colonial power and the Inquisition.<sup>98</sup> As mentioned above, limits to the development of accommodation included a spatial sense, a ‘perimeter’ of typically Europeanised space both imposed upon and by Jesuits operating within these socio-political spheres.<sup>99</sup>

The establishment of these new locales nevertheless developed into new opportunities for Xavier’s contemporaries and successors. Jesuits in the mid-sixteenth century operated colleges and hospitals, preached publicly on the streets of Portuguese settlements, worked with local intermediaries to transmit prayers and catechisms to potential converts, and cared for the sick and poor throughout the southern Indian littoral. Mass baptisms administered by Jesuits and other religious may not have been accompanied by the visible representation of the Portuguese viceroyalty, but it nevertheless came with the understanding of the imperial state’s power in the process; converts received Portuguese names, heard mass and received the Eucharist from Portuguese clerics, came under the legal

---

<sup>98</sup> Županov, ‘Accommodation’, p.2; and Županov, “‘One Civility, but Multiple Religions’”, p. 286 attribute the method in part to his ministries, yet other works by Županov downplay his influence somewhat. John Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India, 1542-1773* (Anand, 1997), p. 20.

<sup>99</sup> Cf. Thanh, ‘The Jesuits in Asia under the Portuguese Padroado’, p. 403; Claude B. Stuczynski, ‘Negotiated Relationships: Jesuits and Portuguese *Conversos*—A Reassessment’, in James Bernauer and Robert Maryks (eds), *“The Tragic Couple”: Encounters Between Jews and Jesuits* (Leiden, 2013), p. 48; and Friedrich, “‘Government in India and Japan is different from government in Europe’”, pp. 11-20.

jurisdiction of the *Estado*, and saw increasing crackdowns on supposed ‘idolatrous’ cultural practises that had defined their pre-Christian identities.

### *European ideas of civility and race*

Anthony Pagden argued that despite any given European’s expectations and objectives, their cultural encounters would reveal at one point or another the inescapable incommensurability that existed between interlocutors.<sup>100</sup> In so many of the early missions, this idea proved quite true. For as many instances in which we find missionary comprehension of cultural particularities in one context, in another context there are as many examples of a complete insensitivity to these differences.<sup>101</sup> Alongside the cultural exchange that occurred through the conduit of Portuguese expansion, indigenous exploitation and the enslavement of Africans and their transoceanic trafficking blossomed as well under racially-defined standards.<sup>102</sup> Many missionaries associated intellectual capacity with skin colour or ethnicity, with even the accommodationist Valignano outlining his Aristotelian-based classification of intelligent peoples based on phenotype, as explored in Chapter Five.<sup>103</sup> Civility too played out in the correspondence, in particular the judgment placed upon some Indians for their strict adherence to caste purity. Notions of civil and racial superiority certainly imposed limits upon the development of accommodation.

Besides these more general ideas, Iberian attitudes towards the presence of New Christians or *conversos* and the role of the Inquisition in ensuring their orthodoxy proved integral in the formulation of social norms, identity, and ‘national’ belonging. As we will

---

<sup>100</sup> Pagden, *European Encounters*, p. 41.

<sup>101</sup> Daniel Madigan, ‘Global Visions in Contestation: Jesuits and Muslims in the Age of Empires’, in Banchoff and Casanova, *Jesuits and Globalization*, p. 85.

<sup>102</sup> Giuseppe Marcocci, ‘Blackness and Heathenism. Color, Theology, and Race in the Portuguese World, c. 1450-1600’, *Anuario Colombiano de Historia Social y de la Cultura* 43/2 (2016), p. 36.

<sup>103</sup> Schütte, *Valignano’s Mission Principles*, pp. 131-2.

see in Chapter Three, a great deal of animosity towards Jews played out in the context of India, extending beyond Jewish and converso communities to implicate Brahmans alongside them, indicating a conscious decision to project European (and in particular, Iberian) notions of ancestral purity and racial classification. This extended to views regarding Muslims in many of the Portuguese settlements of India, from the conquest of Goa in 1510 and subsequent eradication of the local Muslim community to the frequent correspondence claiming Islam as the primary obstacle to conversion, an inheritance of a long polemical history in Iberia.<sup>104</sup>

When it came to Jesuits in particular, the policies concerning the membership of those who were of converted Jewish or Muslim ancestry contradicted much of Ignatius' thoughts on the Society's purpose to reach all people and help all souls. Antonio Possevino's comments upon the prohibition of converso Jesuits in 1593 signalled as much, stating how the very foundation of the Society 'permits no preference for lineage, or for human concerns—which are vestiges of paganism—or for its own honour, such as not allowing oneself to be touched by others or to greet them, as is the custom of some infidels'—a reference to the concept of caste, discussed in Chapter Two.<sup>105</sup> Possevino thus echoed the thoughts of the founder, who alluding to the Apostle Paul had made it clear that 'in the Society there is no distinction between Jew and Greek, etc., when they are united in the same spirit of divine service'.<sup>106</sup>

Not all Jesuits were Portuguese, and the subsequent arrivals in India were not only of varying opinion but also of national identities, resulting in a 'plurality of positions' that

---

<sup>104</sup> Madigan, 'Global Visions in Contestation', p. 69.

<sup>105</sup> Rome, Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (ARSI), *Congregationes* 20/B, fo. 206r, quoted in Thomas M. Cohen, 'Racial and Ethnic Minorities in the Society of Jesus', in Thomas Worcester (ed), *The Cambridge Companion to the Jesuits* (Cambridge, 2008), p. 204.

<sup>106</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Diego Mirón, 5 Apr 1554, *MI Epp*, vi, pp. 569-70; 'en la Compañia non est distinctio judaei et graeci etc, quando son unidos en el mesmo espíritu del diuino servicio con los otros'.

arose among the cohort in the subcontinent. Nevertheless, as Marcocci notes, ‘we often find references in the sources to conflicts between an intransigent majority, guided by fathers of Portuguese origin, and more heterogeneous minority groups’.<sup>107</sup> Additionally, we may add that those Portuguese of a more heterogeneous background—e.g. *conversos* or *cristãos novos*, or *mestiços*—often fell on the side of those non-Portuguese companions with a more pliable missiology, as will be shown. Lines within the order were not drawn on nationality, but rather through a number of factors such as familial background, socio-cultural influences, and education, all which affected formation of personal identity. The idea that perhaps those of a more volatile family history express a more nuanced view towards different religious traditions is certainly not a novel one, but in the context of the Society and its specific activities in Asia it has not received proper attention.<sup>108</sup>

### *State and Subject*

Becoming Christian under Portuguese dominion came with certain consequences such as subjecthood, and in much of the programmes of mass conversion this was a specified objective. As part of the imperial agenda, non-Christians were seen as individuals to be increasingly assimilated into the dominant colonial society in being made subjects of the

---

<sup>107</sup> Giuseppe Marcocci, ‘Jesuit Missionaries and the Portuguese Inquisition in South Asia: A Controversial History (16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Centuries)’ in Ines G. Županov and Anand Amaladass (eds), *Intercultural Encounters and the Jesuit Mission in South Asia (16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Centuries)* (Bangalore, 2014), p. 239.

<sup>108</sup> Most works on the influence of *conversos* in the area of doubt, skepticism, and tolerance have focused on the Sephardic diaspora from Iberia, mainly in the Netherlands; see Richard Popkin, *The History of Skepticism: From Savonarola to Bayle* (New York, 2003); see also Yosef Kaplan, *An Alternative Path to Modernity: The Sephardi Jews of Amsterdam in Early Modern Times* (Leiden, 2010); and Yirmiyahou Yovel, *The Other Within: The Marranos; Split Identity and Emerging Modernity* (Princeton, 2009). Stefania Pastore addresses the absence of the Spanish context in these studies, arguing that ‘despite the sudden shutdown imposed in the late fifteenth century with the expulsion of the Jews and Muslims, the creation of the Inquisition, and the choice of a single mono-confessional identity, this world of doubt persisted’; ‘Doubt in Fifteenth-Century Iberia’, in Mercedes García-Arenal (ed), *After Conversion: Iberia and the Emergence of Modernity* (Leiden, 2016), p. 285.

Crown.<sup>109</sup> Individuals whose conversion or involvement in the Christian discourse did not come with the same political status, due to their place under separate indigenous sovereignty, often experienced a far more flexible message that sought to absorb more from their existing cultural systems.<sup>110</sup> Subjects of non-Portuguese entities may also impede such conversion attempts, as was the case for Indian sovereignties in which existed a ‘sense of spiritual contractualism in the relationship between ruler and subject’ by which rulers’ decisions to convert held greater influence than their subjects.<sup>111</sup>

On the one hand, as Nobili recognised, this recognition as subject afforded neophytes protection and defence in places like Goa, but less so in places under non-Christian sovereignty. On the other, these Christians were nevertheless subject to the strict regulations against heresy and superstition, issues which by Nobili’s time remained common amongst the newly-converted yet were still horribly misunderstood and poorly accommodated by missionaries. The strict conditions imposed, particularly regarding social status as per caste customs such as the Brahman sacred thread, worked against the proselytising efforts of Jesuits outside of Goa, who often had to answer for why a conversion might result in such a harsh assimilation into Portuguese Christian civil and cultural traditions.<sup>112</sup>

Portuguese presence even possessed the basic consequence of tangible structural change against the realisation of what Thaurén and Betray termed aesthetic accommodation, a form of adaptation through which architectural, spatial, and artistic

---

<sup>109</sup> David Mosse, ‘The Politics of Religious Synthesis: Roman Catholicism and Hindu Village Society in Tamil Nadu, India’ in Charles Stewart and Rosalind Shaw (eds) *Syncretism/Anti-Syncretism: The Politics of Religious Synthesis* (London, 1994), p. 79.

<sup>110</sup> Paolo Aranha, ‘The Social and Physical Spaces of the Malabar Rites Controversy’, in Giuseppe Marcocci, Aliocha Maldavsky, Wietse de Boer, and Ilaria Pavan (eds), *Space and Conversion in Global Perspective* (Leiden, 2014), p. 215.

<sup>111</sup> Alan Strathern, ‘Transcendental Intransigence: Why Rulers Rejected Monotheism in Early Modern Southeast Asia and Beyond’, *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 49/2 (2007), p. 362.

<sup>112</sup> Roberto de Nobili, ‘Report Concerning Certain Customs of the Indian Nation’, *Preaching Wisdom to the Wise: Three Treatises by Roberto de Nobili, S.J., Missionary and Scholar in 17<sup>th</sup> Century India*, ed. and tr. Anand Amaladass and Francis X. Clooney (St. Louis, 2000), p. 220.

reflected local cultural particulars. This played out most significantly in the Jesuit construction of churches in Japan which imitated prevailing building styles and customary ritual space.<sup>113</sup> While materials and labour were certainly locally sourced, ecclesiastical structures like churches and seminaries in Goa and most other south Indian mission locales typically followed the Portuguese architectural style, with some later exceptions.<sup>114</sup>

### *Political and commercial influence*

In addition to these points, it is necessary to take into account the distinctions between colonial interests and evangelical pursuits, though the two are not mutually exclusive. Understanding the absence of a monolithic Roman Catholic ideology and methodology remains key in determining the uneven distribution and progress of religious (as in members of orders, those responsible for the propagation of faith) throughout the imperial sphere. Scholars such as Paolo Aranha have necessarily decried the ‘univoque and simplistic connection’ between colonialism and Christianisation that historians such as Charles Boxer often supported.<sup>115</sup> This is not to say that many missionaries did not attempt to realise both agendas; indeed, in multiple instances that much is certain. Some Jesuits saw their evangelical purpose as indistinguishable from the Portuguese imperial vehicle through which it was transmitted, while others saw no other recourse for maintaining Christian communities than to rely on the Portuguese political—as well as naval and military—

---

<sup>113</sup> Cf. Carla Tronu Montane, ‘Sacred Space and Ritual in Early Modern Japan: The Christian Community of Nagasaki (1569-1643)’ (PhD Thesis, SOAS, University of London, 2012), pp. 21-35.

<sup>114</sup> The most notable example is the Cathedral Bom Jesu in Goa Velha, which was constructed using local laterite yet appears in much of the style of the Alentejo region of Portugal.

<sup>115</sup> Paolo Aranha, ‘Early Modern Asian Catholicism and European Colonialism: Dominance, Hegemony and Native Agency in the Portuguese Estado da Índia’, in Klaus Koschorke and Adrian Hermann (eds), *Polycentric Structures in the History of World Christianity* (Wiesbaden, 2014), p. 292. Cf. C.R. Boxer, *The Church Militant and Iberian Expansion* (Baltimore, 1978), pp. 77-93.

might.<sup>116</sup> Yet some transcended these limits, whether willingly or not, and found greater opportunities for expression and methodological flexibility. Amongst the various markers of accommodation, one suggested that ‘the absence of Portuguese military and political presence to protect and monitor missionaries in established Asian missions encouraged the latter to utilise methods of persuasion rather than coercion’.<sup>117</sup>

This entanglement emanated from the *Padroado Real*, the patronage bestowed upon the Portuguese (as well as Castilian) crown by the pope through a series of bulls beginning in the mid-fifteenth century, which was often used opportunistically by officials to retain rights over ecclesiastical appointments and control endowments of religious institutions and activities of religious orders. In short, it effectively delegated to the monarch administration of the Church within Portuguese overseas dominions, connecting seemingly separate concerns of conversion and commerce.<sup>118</sup> The privileges of *Padroado* allowed for greater control of acquisition and management of land and properties by religious institutions throughout the villages of Goa, implicating clerical middlemen in the supplanting of existing estates and rent collection.<sup>119</sup> Controversy often followed the Jesuit attempts to finance their enterprise through commercial efforts, ranging from the local sale of pepper to occasional wider trade in enslaved persons, yet on the whole most members of the Society abstained from what were seen as more secular activities.<sup>120</sup>

We must not neglect that overwhelmingly Jesuit and other religious personnel had their origins in the metropole and the socio-cultural factors of their upbringing undoubtedly

---

<sup>116</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 69; C.R. Boxer, *The Portuguese Seaborne Empire, 1415-1825* (London, 1969).

<sup>117</sup> Županov, ‘Accommodation’, p. 2.

<sup>118</sup> Rowena Robinson, *Conversion, Continuity and Change: Lived Christianity in Southern Goa* (New Delhi, 1998), p. 44. Cf. Malyn Newitt, ‘Formal and Informal Empire in the History of Portuguese Expansion’ *Portuguese Studies* 17 (2001), p. 2.

<sup>119</sup> Borges, ‘Foreign Jesuits and Native Resistance’, p. 70.

<sup>120</sup> Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, pp. 528-51.

weighed on their actions in the periphery, most notably in the form of the vow of obedience owed to the King of Portugal.<sup>121</sup> Barring any claims of proto-nationalism, Portuguese mentalities informed identities of both lay and clerical communities in a way more unique than other European political communities at that time. For figures like Ricci and Nobili, political shifts affected the entangled interests of the Society and its Portuguese royal patrons, which loosened during the Iberian Union from 1580 to 1640, opening the door for more non-Portuguese Jesuits to enter the Asian theatre as well as diminished oversight.<sup>122</sup> As Ines Županov argued, as opposed to the support of political aggrandisement by some Spanish and Portuguese members, ‘the Italian Jesuits were not thinking along these “imperial” lines’.<sup>123</sup>

During the years prior to the union of crowns, issues within Portugal and indeed southern Europe nevertheless caused a great deal of stress and difficulty for the Jesuit order. After being named Provincial and rector of the college at Coimbra, Simão Rodrigues allowed a great deal of charismatic spirituality to flourish amongst the companions studying there, leading to public displays of evangelical zeal and mortification which despite some precedent with Ignatius exceeded the founder’s intentions of moderate discipline and obedience for the order. As will be discussed in Chapter Two, this indiscipline and fervour had significant consequences for the early missions in India, where such displays of piety proved seldom helpful amongst either indigenous non-Christians or Portuguese *casados*. Rodrigues was called to Rome in 1553 and his post replaced by the Spaniard Diego Mirón, ushering in a period of intense rigour almost to the opposite extreme. Onwards from the visitation of Alessandro Valignano to the Portuguese Province in 1574, detailed in Chapter

---

<sup>121</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 69.

<sup>122</sup> Stuczynski, ‘Negotiated Relationships’, p. 45.

<sup>123</sup> Županov, “‘One Civility, but Multiple Religions’”, p. 286.

Five, decades of disputes between a stricter Portuguese faction and the more flexible Italians (and some Spaniards) amounted to latent tensions on through the first half of the Iberian Union. Nobili's own words prove highly significant here. Writing to Superior General Claudio Acquaviva in late 1610, he expressed how non-Portuguese served as better missionaries in India, alluding to Paul's words above—'because discarding easily their national customs, *they become all to all*, which Portuguese cannot do, except with great difficulty'.<sup>124</sup>

## Method

Over the course of this thesis, I will analyse the influence of the rhetorical principle of *accommodatio* through its place within the spirituality and objectives of the Society of Jesus and the development of organizational identity and Jesuit 'distinctiveness'; through this principle appeared elements and limits of the more general cultural accommodation. Accommodation in terms of the core elements outlined above was not strictly reserved to the Society, though it was through various Jesuit missions that this strategy came to fruition, and thus their example comes under particular scrutiny here. Progressing through the stages of the rhetorical adaptation in the attempt to fashion a new identity by renouncing those aspects which defined a person prior to them becoming a Jesuit, inherent predispositions of cultural affinities, traditions, social norms inhibited this self-fashioning. In the context of Portuguese India, as subsequent chapters will show, these predispositions materialised through specific mentalities: anti-New Christian or *converso* sentiments, imperial millenarian predispositions, uniformity of Christian dominium, mechanisms for regulating moral and religious conformity (e.g. the Holy Office), and judgments regarding the 'Other'.

---

<sup>124</sup> Nobili, R. to Acquaviva, C, Madurai, 21 Oct 1610, ARSI, *Goa* 51, fos. 164-5; quoted from Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 68. Emphasis mine.

The tradition of *l'histoire des mentalités* holds significance in this approach, to investigate as Robert Darnton said ‘the way ordinary people make sense of the world’.<sup>125</sup> Given the predilection of the Society for recruits from the Portuguese nobility, the Jesuits might superficially seem uncharacteristic of this kind of cultural history of the commonfolk, yet assumptions and values inherent throughout Portuguese society along with the missions outside the elite spheres of social influence offer an intriguing sample set from which to study. One of the issues with looking at mentalities is, as Lawrence Stone put it, ‘to distinguish the normal from the eccentric’, in that particular personalities are often atypical and therefore may not be indicative of the larger social milieu.<sup>126</sup> As we will see, some individuals, especially those either outside the norm of Portuguese society (e.g. conversos) or entering from outside it altogether (e.g. Italians), illustrate these exceptions to distinctly Portuguese mentalities. By focusing on a variety of individuals across the spectrum within the Jesuit order, placing their opinions and objectives in conversation with those of society both within Portugal and in India (as well as their fellow companions), I aim to illuminate various incidents in which Jesuits were involved and what their behaviour tells us about the development of accommodation.

I have structured this thesis mainly along a thematic progression, centred around main points—Jesuit identity and distinctiveness, early mission methodologies, conversos and the Inquisition in India, administration of baptism, and policy and personnel shifts—wherein the pivotal occurrences take place in a somewhat chronological narrative. These themes thus allow for the exploration of the outlined ‘elements’ of cultural accommodation,

---

<sup>125</sup> Robert Darnton, *The Great Cat Massacre and Other Episodes in French Cultural History* (New York, 1984), p. 3.

<sup>126</sup> Lawrence Stone, ‘The Revival of Narrative: Reflections on a New Old History’, *Past and Present* 85 (1979), pp. 22-3.

as well as its limits, at play in these larger developments but also specifically the more crucial moments.

While I base my research primarily on published sources such as the 18-volume *Documenta Indica* and the collection *Documentação para a história das missões do Padroado português do Oriente*, these volumes nevertheless contain a wealth of sources still not fully utilised in previous historiography, mainly due to their massive scope. My methods have been to pinpoint particular individuals and analyse their letters and reports in terms of the core elements of accommodation, from the early missionaries Niccolò Lancilotto and Antonio Criminali to those closely involved with the Inquisition, which include Melchior Carneiro and Francisco Rodrigues. I used this research to locate unpublished manuscript sources related to these individuals and others in the Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu, the Jesuit Archives in Rome, and the Arquivo Nacional de Torre do Tombo, the Portuguese National Archives in Lisbon. I incorporate letters, reports, treatises, historical accounts, and Inquisitional proceedings from these archives to bolster the published sources considered. The two most renowned Jesuit scholars of the India missions during the twentieth century, Josef Wicki (1904-93) and Georg Schurhammer (1882-1971), produced a tremendous amount of edited and transcribed letters, but more importantly they devoted their career to analysing the sources they collated and published through prodigious scholarship on the early missions of the Society of Jesus, Jesuit controversies regarding *conversos* and indigenous clergy, the St Thomas Christians of south India, and other topics in early modern South Asian history.<sup>127</sup> While Wicki and Schurhammer contributed greatly to the historiography of this period, recent work by

---

<sup>127</sup> On Schurhammer's works, cf. Georg Schurhammer, S.J., *Gesammelte Studien* (4 vols, Rome, 1962-65). No similar collection exists for Josef Wicki's scholarly output, but a short biography and comprehensive bibliography has been produced, cf. 'Fr. Josef Wicki, S.J.' *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 54 (1985), pp. 473-96.

modern scholars on many of these same topics suggests there is much work still do.<sup>128</sup> For my contribution, I aim to provide a fresh look at these early years by analysing the priorities and purpose of members of the Society in India and how they relate to elements of cultural accommodation—that is, more generally, a recognition the feelings, needs, and traditions of a diverse Indian and non-Christian audience.

This approach entails some methodological challenges. From a source perspective, extricating mission priorities from letters, consultations, and reports can prove difficult given the frequently laudatory and optimistic tone many letters take. Despite the Jesuit affinity for humanist rhetoric, most correspondence is often fairly simple and straightforward, choosing to emphasise what might edify the Society in Europe more. In this regard, the more dissatisfied authors can provide a greater assurance of honesty and clarity; focusing on requests for guidance or assistance can illustrate priorities better, while comparing contemporaneous letters can reveal disagreements and tensions, both between members and those outside the Society. Languages create some issues as well, with the variety of Romance languages without any logic behind their specific use but also the frequent lack of orthography or poor understanding of syntax and grammar. When considering the over eighteen thousand pages of letters in the *Documenta Indica* along with other major volumes and archival sources, striving for truly comprehensive analysis is daunting—especially when it comes to locating indigenous voices, of which during this early period there are disappointingly few, creating additional issues for this study. Focusing on the missionary narratives as discourse, however, can fill out the narrative—a ‘specialised clerical discourse’, to borrow Rubiés’ phrase, in which distinct knowledge was

---

<sup>128</sup> Besides such recent monographs as Ananya Chakravarti’s *Empire of Apostles*, the most recent is Antony Mecherry, S.J., *Testing Ground for Jesuit Accommodation in Early Modern India: Francisco Ros SJ in Malabar (16<sup>th</sup>-17<sup>th</sup> Centuries)* (Rome, 2019). A number of new interpretations also appear in Ines G. Županov (ed), *The Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits* (Oxford, 2019).

exchanged.<sup>129</sup> All of these problems have plagued scholars in the past, likely serving as one of the main reasons that the existing literature has not hitherto systematically analysed the developments of missionary accommodation in this period. I sincerely hope that mine is but one contribution to a necessary historiographical question.

Much of the scholarship on accommodation, understandably so, has centred on East Asia and the missions to the Ming imperial court and the communities of Japan where the first attempts to expand accommodation beyond linguistics or comprehensive ethnographic study occurred. In addressing these particular contexts, Antoni Üçerler posed some simple yet key questions that may also be addressed to the India mission specifically, helping elucidate the variable presence of missionary accommodation. On a structural or organisational level, did a master plan exist throughout the whole of the Indian missions? Concerning more social and personal interactions, did missionaries have different opinions on how to proceed? And on more religious and cultural questions, ‘if there were disagreements, were they minor, or did they reveal fundamentally divergent or even incompatible ideas as to how Christianity was to be transmitted to a non-Christian people?’<sup>130</sup> Questions such as these have not been deeply analysed in the context of the early Jesuit mission to India and through the lens of accommodation; I aim to address these here.

As stated at the opening, the *Exercises* themselves were flexible in how they could be applied, and thus do not constitute some kind of consistent plan for how mission was to proceed. We can therefore also foresee the potential for disagreement, as the absence of any explicit directives will necessarily produce some discord as members seek to interpret the

---

<sup>129</sup> Joan-Pau Rubiés proposed that Jesuits ‘must be analyzed as participating in a specialized clerical discourse, one which to some extent they shared with other religious orders’, *Travel and Ethnology*, p. 2. Similarly, in his other work Rubiés pointed to the significance of ‘cultural dialogue’ that occurred in these intercultural encounters, cf. ‘Concept of Cultural Dialogue’, p. 242.

<sup>130</sup> Üçerler, ‘Jesuits in East Asia’, p. 28.

complex situations faced in a number of new socio-cultural environments. In truth, there were disagreements. These form the basis of this thesis, as they help illustrate how a religious order worked through the difficult issues faced in their mission fields, ranging from minor to fundamentally divergent ideas on how Christianity should be brought to the people of India. One final question Üçerler posed brings all this together—was the Christianity which Jesuits practised and preached an ‘imposition of an alien religious and cultural phenomenon’ or did it become a form rooted in Indian cultural and social traditions?<sup>131</sup> Reflecting upon this larger question throughout this thesis complements the other questions.

---

<sup>131</sup> Üçerler, ‘Jesuits in East Asia’, p. 28.

**Chapter One**  
***Quidditas Jesuitica: Jesuit Distinctiveness and ‘way of proceeding’***

Despite the fact that *accommodatio* does not unilaterally dominate the methodology of the Society of Jesus, the conditions fostered by the Jesuit order and the identity it sought to generate in its members greatly contributed to the flourishing of the practice. ‘Noster modus procedendi’, often viewed by the earliest Jesuit leaders and historians as the distinctive characteristics that Ignatius of Loyola developed and which inspired the foundational literature, was never a fixed set of procedures.<sup>1</sup> Rather, the objectives and true purpose of the Society of Jesus both in Europe and the overseas mission fields evolved.<sup>2</sup> As has been argued, what Ignatius termed as ‘way of proceeding’ has been reinterpreted as ‘ways of proceeding’ by more recent scholars.<sup>3</sup> The Latin term *multiplex* used by Nadal, as discussed in the previous chapter, and the object of its description bears this out.<sup>4</sup> The centrality of the Spiritual *Exercises* cannot be overstated here, as they above all things guided the formation of members of the Society, and as such there exist multiple ways of carrying out one’s purpose as a Jesuit over the course of one’s career. Amidst the various characteristics that comprise Jesuit distinctiveness, there is room for variation, further complicated by the diverse environments within which the Society operated.

John O’Malley argued that the rhetorical principle of *accommodatio* involved not only characteristics of speech, writing, and pedagogy, but that it in fact ‘shaped almost every

---

<sup>1</sup> John O’Malley references Jerónimo Nadal’s origination of this statement with Ignatius, more specifically as ‘nuestro modo de proceder’ in his mother tongue, in *Epistolae et Monumenta P. Hieronymi Nadal V*, pp. 304-5; O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 8. Cf. Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 146, where it is stated as ‘the Society’s manner of proceeding’.

<sup>2</sup> O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 8.

<sup>3</sup> Cf. Robert Aleksander Maryks (ed), *Exploring Jesuit Distinctiveness: Interdisciplinary Ways of Proceeding within the Society of Jesus* (Boston, 2016).

<sup>4</sup> ‘Excerpta ex instructione ignoti auctoris’, *MI Ex*, ii, p. 176; O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 127.

aspect of Jesuit thought, action, and self-identity'.<sup>5</sup> From the fundamentals of the *Spiritual Exercises* arose a number of formative texts for the order which galvanised Ignatian principles into more concrete administrative policies and ideologies, and through these the Jesuit order fostered a distinctiveness that earned them ardent supporters as much as detractors. Within this literature burgeoned the characteristics that scholars have often defined as part of the unique Jesuit identity which, I argue, helped create the optimal conditions for cultural accommodation to flourish bolstered by the underlying rhetorical principle. I outline here as crucial elements in the development of *accommodatio* for the Society of Jesus, sometimes bleeding into one another: a literary tradition manifested through letter-writing, the tension between obedience and autonomy and its effect on decision-making and discernment, an unexpected commitment to education, increased demand for and dedication to language learning, and potential for self-presentation and invention. Through all these constituent parts developed the essence of the Jesuits, or *quidditas Jesuitica*.

### **Formative literature**

The primary papal document commonly known as the 'Formula of the Institute' served to define the purpose of the Society of Jesus and how its members were to live and conduct their ministry. Included in the two papal bulls confirming the legitimacy of the new religious order—*Regimini militantis ecclesiae* (1540) and *Exposcit debitum* (1550)—the text earned its colloquial name from the 'formula for living' described in the *Prima Societatis Jesu Instituti Summa* of August 1539, and the oft-used phrase 'our Institute and

---

<sup>5</sup> Schloesser, 'Accommodation as a Rhetorical Principle', p. 350.

way of proceeding' as found in the Constitutions.<sup>6</sup> While the Formula carried the significance of a Rule to which other orders adhered, the decision to not term it as such signalled Ignatius' intent to both respect the ancient orders and distinguish his own from them. The Formula also anticipated the creation of the Constitutions, whose authorship was entrusted to Ignatius by his peers in 1541 and which was only formally confirmed by the first General Congregation in 1558 after enduring multiple corrections and translations, not to mention the death of Ignatius in 1556.<sup>7</sup> The fifteen years during which the founder revised this document witnessed dramatic shifts in the growth, influence, and purpose of the Society, as Jesuits positioned themselves amongst the Protestant communities of Germany, the prelates at the Council of Trent, and the pagans and infidels of Asia. To be sure, not all the policies outlined in his Constitutions originated in these external laboratories, but they nevertheless contributed to a number of the aspects discussed here and in the chapters that follow.

Given that two papal bulls incorporated the Formula, successive Jesuits could not alter the foundational objectives and structure provided, though the language was simple enough to allow for the Constitutions to expound on the basics in greater detail. Outside of the standard vows of poverty, chastity, and obedience, part of the fundamental Jesuit purpose was 'the progress of souls in Christian life and doctrine, by means of public preaching, lectures...and further by means of the *Spiritual Exercises*, the education of children and unlettered persons', hearing confessions and administering sacraments.<sup>8</sup> Thus in essence the Society was comparable to secular clergy as well as mendicants such as the Franciscans and Dominicans, incorporating ministry of the Word of God and sacraments

---

<sup>6</sup> George Ganss, 'Technical Introduction on the Constitutions of the Society of Jesus', *Constitutions*, pp. 36-45. Ganss notes the original phrases as written were, respectively, 'vivendi formula' and 'nuestro Instituto y modo de proceder'.

<sup>7</sup> Ganss, 'Technical Introduction', pp. 49-53.

<sup>8</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, pp. 66-67.

with public education in formal and informal settings, and service to the poor, imprisoned, and hospitalised. Importantly, the *Spiritual Exercises* figured directly into this purpose so that it not only served neophytes to the order but also became a means for propagation of the faith and spiritual consolation.<sup>9</sup>

The *Ratio Studiorum*, often considered the third and last literary piece in moulding the Jesuit identity, is a peculiar contributing factor here in the expansion of *accommodatio*. It certainly defined the means by which Jesuit schools should be run and the pedagogical mission therein, yet its drafting and composition was only completed in 1599. This is a crucial point to consider when looking at the scope of this thesis given that certainly some elements of the text's production were known before 1575, but more generally it does not seem to figure into the minds of the early Jesuits. Others have noted its role in the later missions, particularly as it pertains to missionary accommodation.<sup>10</sup> Education in general nevertheless contributed to the identity and purpose of the Society from an early point, driven by the procedure of the *Exercises* in guidance and instruction which over time grew into the more formal school environment.

### **Letter-writing and empiricism**

Alongside the *Exercises*, regular letter writing served as the primary means for maintaining unity amongst the Society, and as mentioned these were a unique part of the order from its inception. While mostly simple narrations based on medieval standards of correspondence, this clear and deliberate language correlated with the Jesuit model of 'active asceticism and obedience': to be mobile in their contemplative spirituality yet remain

---

<sup>9</sup> John O'Malley, S.J., Gauvin Alexander Bailey, Steven J. Harris, and T. Frank Kennedy, S.J. (eds), *The Jesuits II: Cultures, Sciences, and the Arts, 1540-1773* (Toronto, 2006), p. xxxv.

<sup>10</sup> Cf. Andrew Redden, 'Priestly Violence, Martyrdom, and Jesuits: The Case of Diego de Alvaro (Paraguay, 1639)' in Maryks (ed), *Exploring Jesuit Distinctiveness*, pp. 81-113.

ever cognizant of the need to render their observations to a superior in a way most conducive to the progress of the Society.<sup>11</sup> As Ignatius wrote, ‘if I notice that this is not being done for the greater union, charity, and edification of all, I shall be obliged to write you and command you under obedience to reread, correct, and rewrite every principal letter’.<sup>12</sup> No one author should self-aggrandise their individual exploits through flowery language, but rather aim to bring a positive reputation to the Society as a whole. True to the intentions of *accommodatio*, Ignatius gave directions on how different letters would appear to particular audiences; the *cartas particulares* or public letters would provide purposefully chosen details to edify the Society and its work, while the private *hijuela* was intended for only certain individuals within the order and not wider circulation.<sup>13</sup> Loyola thought that these would serve as ‘spiritual consolation’ to those who read them, whether the public or religious members.

Although outside the purview of this study, a note on the *indipetae* is illustrative here. These ‘Indies-seeking’ letters became integral to the Jesuit administration of missions over time through their formulation into comprehensive documents which aided and defended the discretionary judgment of dispatching Jesuits to particular provinces. As many studies have pointed out,<sup>14</sup> these petitions created a network of letters not unlike the humanist circles of intellectual ‘republics’, as they were heavily personal and demanded

---

<sup>11</sup> Ines Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 6.

<sup>12</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Pierre Favre, 10 Dec 1542, *MI Epp*, i, p. 237; ‘que si assi no viere que hazéis de aqui adelante, por mayor vnión, caridad y edificación de todos, no quiriendo que Dios N. S. me demande mi negligencia en tantas cosas, seré forçado escriuiros, y mandaros en obediencia, que cada carta principal que me escriuiédes, remirando, la tornéis á escribir, ó la hagáis escribir después de assi corrijida’; cf. Ignatius of Loyola, *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, tr. William J. Young (Chicago, 1959), p. 14.

<sup>13</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Pierre Favre, 10 Dec 1542, *MI Epp*, i, pp. 236-39; Ananya Chakravarti, ‘In the Language of the Land: Native Conversion in Jesuit Public Letters from Brazil and India’ *Journal of Early Modern History* 17 (2013), p. 516.

<sup>14</sup> Cf. Aliocha Maldavsky, ‘Pedir las Indias. Las cartas *indipetae* de los jesuitas europeos, siglos XVI-XVIII, ensayo historiográfico’ *Relaciones: Estudios de historia y sociedad* 33/132 (2012), pp. 147-81; Emanuele Colombo and Marco Rochini, ‘Four Hundred Years of Desire. Ongoing Research into the Nineteenth-Century Italian *Indipetae* (1829-1856)’, in Niccolò Guasti (ed), *Representations of the other and Intercultural Experiences in a Global Perspective (16<sup>th</sup>-20<sup>th</sup> Centuries)* (Milan, 2017), pp. 83-108; Liam Brockey, ‘A Passage through India: Jesuit Missionaries en Route to East Asia, 1570-1700’ *Revista de Cultura* 3 (2002), pp. 115-25; A.R. Capoccia, ‘Les destin des *indipetae* au-delà du XVI<sup>e</sup> siècle’ in P.A Fabre and B. Vincent (eds), *Missions religieuses modernes: “Notre lieu est le monde”* (Rome, 2007), pp. 71-88.

coherent defence of one's qualifications for a given mission field, not to mention that they demonstrated 'the filial relation that united each member of the order to the general based in Rome'.<sup>15</sup> Whilst *indipetae* were only systematically requested and catalogued after 1583, the basic premise for these petitions arose during the visits of Jerónimo Nadal to the provinces of Portugal, Castile, Andalucía, and Aragón in 1561-62, during which he distributed a questionnaire amongst the active members.<sup>16</sup> A desire to draw out the personal motivations of potential missionaries indicated a religious order that sought to foster a tradition of regular reflection in writing.

The value of letters to readers clerical and lay derived from the observations Jesuits provided, especially as the Society expanded into all known corners of the globe. Given that these letters had two intended audiences, extensive details abounded through their construction as well as in the desire of the superior to possess more documentation than less. This lent itself well to greater powers of observation with the purpose of gathering knowledge about the areas in which each Jesuit operated. The production of Jesuit knowledge blossomed and came to include all matters and disciplines, from science and medicine to languages and sociology and anthropology.<sup>17</sup> One of the reasons for this was the Jesuit contemplative-active model, combining concerted use of rational faculties and personal reflection with empiricism, the latter producing the mentality where 'the other, the

---

<sup>15</sup> Maldivsky, 'Pedir las Indias', p. 148.

<sup>16</sup> Colombo and Rochini, 'Four Hundred Years', pp. 83-4. The more than 14,000 *indipetae* are stored at the Jesuit Archives in Rome, ARSI, Fondo Gesuitico 732-57. More petitions are found throughout the archival collections: cf. Josef Wicki, 'Archives and Libraries in Rome', in John Correia-Afonso (ed), *Indo-Portuguese History: Sources and Problems* (Oxford, 1981), pp. 42-3.

<sup>17</sup> In the area of science, amongst the most renowned Jesuits in Europe were Christopher Clavius (1538-1612) and Athanasius Kircher (1602-1680), while in Asia missionaries like Ferdinand Verbiest (1623-1688) produced seminal works on science, cf. Ferdinand Verbiest, *Ferdinand Verbiest and Jesuit Science in 17th-Century China: An Annotated Edition and Translation of the Constantinople Manuscript (1676)*, eds. Nikolaïdes Euthymios and Noël Golvers (Athens, 2009). On Clavius as well as more general survey, cf. Agustín Udías Vallina, *Jesuit Contribution to Science: A History* (Cambridge, 2014); and for the Americas cf. Andrés Ignacio Prieto, *Missionary Scientists: Jesuit Science in Spanish South America, 1570-1810* (Nashville, 2010).

foreign, the strange, was seen as a “factum” to be surveyed, enumerated, described, explained and catalogued’.<sup>18</sup> Different to other orders, even the mendicants, the Jesuits took contemplation in action as an opportunity to gather empirical data that thus guided superiors towards reflection and decision-making; these manifested in the *experiencias* programme of experiments for companions to conduct towards understanding their vocation. It included six *experiencias*: the making of the *Exercises* in seclusion, month-long service in a hospital, pilgrimage without financial assistance, low-level employment in Jesuit houses, teaching of doctrine to less-educated, and preaching or (if ordained) hearing confessions, or both.<sup>19</sup>

Yet it also had origins in the humanist education, both experienced by early Jesuits and propagated within their colleges, through which public disputations honed the skills of judgment and observation alongside an appreciation of good literature.<sup>20</sup> While not alone amongst the orders in the promotion of humanism, the Society took to it more comprehensively, informed primarily by Ignatius’ predilection for humanist learning alongside some of the prevailing scholastic pedagogies.<sup>21</sup> From humanism early Jesuits emphasised the practise of rhetoric and active life that engaged with students as well as the public, whilst the *modus Parisiensis* inherited by the founders during their own studies in Paris imparted the scholastic rigour and educational progress through which rote learning in pursuit of proficiency determined students’ advancement through the levels of study.<sup>22</sup> Early Jesuits found enduring value in the university model of the scholastics, but nevertheless noted the humanist critique of the *scholae* and their ‘failure to relate to a life of virtue and

---

<sup>18</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 22.

<sup>19</sup> Schloesser, ‘Accommodation as Rhetorical Principle’, p. 356.

<sup>20</sup> John Correia-Afonso, *Jesuit Letters and Indian History: A Study of the Nature and Development of the Jesuit Letters from India (1542-1773) and of Their Value for Indian Historiography* (Bombay, 1955), p. 57.

<sup>21</sup> O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 3.

<sup>22</sup> Ditchfield, ‘Jesuits in the Making’, p. 55; P.R. Blum, ‘Apostolato dei collegi: On the Integration of Humanism in the Educational Programme of the Jesuits’, *Studies in Early Modern Aristotelianism* (Leiden, 2012), p. 25.

public service' essential to the driving force behind the Society.<sup>23</sup> In fact, Jesuit schools sought to educate and form young men towards not only potential membership in the order but also for a career in civil service. To an extent the Jesuits subscribed to humanist claims 'that the classical ideal of virtue depended on cultivating a certain sense of self...on not acting, or not being seen to act, out of self-interest, catering to one's own appetites, but on serving the community'.<sup>24</sup> Thus the intellectual demands combined with rhetorical study into the contemplative-active model, pushing the principle of concerted enquiry honed within schools towards mindful attention to localised differences of place in respective communities, additionally contributing to ethnographical narratives that exceeded traditional observation of the 'other'.<sup>25</sup>

The humanist emphasis on classical literature, or *litterae humaniores*, was the means by which attentiveness to cultural difference first developed. This literature proliferated within the Jesuit schools for their own members as well as young men they intended to educate for either the Society itself or even civil service, informed by the Italian schools where classics were integral to the curriculum.<sup>26</sup> More importantly, it initiated the course of education towards more advanced topics. In a letter written by Juan Polanco on behalf of Ignatius in 1547, the secretary stressed that students should 'proceed from a good foundation of humane letters to the other studies', working to train one's mind towards the more laborious tasks, 'as arts and scholastic theology are'.<sup>27</sup> Additionally, integral to this classical study was proficiency in languages, one of the crucial reasons being 'that, beyond the

---

<sup>23</sup> O'Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 208.

<sup>24</sup> James Hankins, 'Machiavelli, Civic Humanism, and the Humanist Politics of Virtue', *Italian Culture* 32/2 (2014), p. 102. Hankins' future publication might contribute further to the development of this idea, cf. *Virtue Politics: Soulcraft and Statecraft in Renaissance Italy* (Cambridge, Mass., forthcoming 2019).

<sup>25</sup> Paolo Aranha, '«Glocal» conflicts', p. 80.

<sup>26</sup> John O'Malley, *Saints or Devils Incarnate?*, p. 184; cf. Paul F. Grendler, *Schooling in Renaissance Italy: Literacy and Learning, 1300-1600* (Baltimore, 1989).

<sup>27</sup> Juan Polanco to Diego Laínez, 21 May 1547, *MI Epp*, i, p. 522.

understanding, to give light to science and all natural, acquired and infused gifts of God, languages (especially Latin) are very necessary to whomever wants to communicate with others what God gives him'.<sup>28</sup> As Paul Blum reckoned, Polanco's understanding of *litterae humaniores* and humanistic principles within Jesuit pedagogy, particularly in using classical literature as a foundation for both understanding and communication, enabled the Jesuit missions' global reach.<sup>29</sup> Beyond mere capabilities, however, this training furthermore contributed to similar study of pagan cultural traditions in the pursuit of divine universal truths and fruitful conversation.

Partially out of attention to rhetoric, the prodigious output of letters indicative of the Jesuit order arose from the transformation of the art of speech into *ars dictaminis*, or the art of letter-writing, achieved most notably by Petrarch and famed for its ability to incorporate 'private and public discourse, scholarly and philosophical enquiry, and all manner of literary enterprises'.<sup>30</sup> The entirety of this form espoused by humanists certainly did not figure into every Jesuit's prose style as more important than eloquence was information or edification, depending on the type of letter. The Constitutions impressed upon members that, in order that news from elsewhere 'may be communicated to all', periodic letters should be sent to provincials 'which contains only the edifying reports' in two copies—one in the vernacular, one in Latin—that could be disseminated throughout the province.<sup>31</sup> As has been aptly observed, correspondence arriving from Asia often 'were no elegant, humanist belles-lettres since missionaries studiously avoided refined style and rhetorical ambiguities'.<sup>32</sup> Yet the descriptions of foreign peoples and customs suited a particular audience in that it possessed

---

<sup>28</sup> Juan Polanco to Diego Laínez, 21 May 1547, *MI Epp*, i, p. 523.

<sup>29</sup> Blum, 'Apostolato dei collegi', p. 26.

<sup>30</sup> Nicholas Mann, 'Origins of Humanism', in Jill Kraye (ed), *The Cambridge Companion to Renaissance Humanism* (Cambridge, 2006), p. 5.

<sup>31</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, pp. 292-3.

<sup>32</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 6.

enough value for public consumption, and some of these letters saw wider circulation through such printed volumes as the Venetian series *Nuovi Avisi delle Indie di Portugallo* (1551-68) and Giovanni Pietro Maffei's *Historiarum Indicarum* (1588).<sup>33</sup> The extensive practise of correspondence subtly brought to regular attention the need to adapt one's written voice to suit any audience, be it their confreres or unknown fellow European Christians. Progressing from mere description of peculiar Indian traditions toward pagan doctrinal understanding and attempts at ethnology, the latter excluded from the more popular volumes like that of Maffei, the rhetorical drive for letter-writing would contribute to increased cultural relativism, even if it was not necessarily a concerted effort by Jesuit missionaries.<sup>34</sup>

A key philosophical contribution from Ignatius, however, was the practice of discernment, a call to 'find God in all things', which began as an introspective practice guided by a spiritual director during the making of the *Exercises*. Discernment influenced the decision-making process, in that it also required reflection upon the deep spiritual internal self, recognising that this comes from God. Although dependent on obedience at first, discernment culminates in self-realisation and comprehension of the divine will acting through one's mental faculties, allowing for individualisation.<sup>35</sup> It may also be condensed to the way 'by which one understands the act of distinguishing, separating, evaluating, and weighing carefully', typically good from evil.<sup>36</sup> At times, the extensive correspondence promoted by Ignatius proved logistically unreliable, especially in the case of India as explored in the next chapter, and some Jesuits experienced difficulty managing their ministry without responses while others thrived on the greater opportunity for autonomy. When combining the practical problems of communication with the more fluid Ignatian

---

<sup>33</sup> Chakravarti, 'In the Language of the Land', pp. 505-24.

<sup>34</sup> Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology*, pp. 311-13.

<sup>35</sup> Moshe Sluhovskiy, 'Loyola's Spiritual Exercises and the Modern Self', in Robert Maryks (ed), *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence* (Leiden, 2014), pp. 222-3.

<sup>36</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 46.

spirituality, involving such aspects as discernment and the adaptable *Exercises*, many developed individualised courses of ministry in line with Jesuit distinctiveness. As Ines Županov notes, the opportunity for greater individualisation and self-realisation, emanating from ‘Jesuit esteem for natural faculties, reasoning and personal experience’, were crucial in the development of empiricism in Jesuit missions.<sup>37</sup> Thus discernment encouraged members of the Society to trust their comprehension, to embrace all observation as valuable and seek as much information empirically through a practised understanding of self and one’s abilities. As has been observed, ‘the autonomy of the intellectual mission of the Society of Jesus finds its cornerstone in the stipulated obligation to discover the “truth” without feeling constrained by the requirements of the doctrinal formulations of a particular school of thought or theological tradition’.<sup>38</sup> As Ângela Barreto Xavier and Ines Županov note, the Jesuit intellectual and empirical approach evolved from a mostly soteriological purpose to a more general pursuit of knowledge.<sup>39</sup>

### **Obedience and autonomy**

Maintaining communication required management, and as Županov notes, ‘Jesuit transnational success was based on the ability of building and maintaining horizontal information networks with the support of a hierarchically organised chain of command’.<sup>40</sup> As part of their indefatigable record-keeping from the start, Ignatius’ secretary Juan Polanco was tasked with conducting a general account of the provinces, entitled the *Chronicon Societatis Iesu*, which served as a quasi-history of the Society from 1537 to 1556. The stories

---

<sup>37</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 22.

<sup>38</sup> Romanus Cessario, ‘Molina and Aquinas’, in Alexander Aichele and Mathias Kaufmann (eds), *A Companion to Luis de Molina* (Leiden, 2014), p. 303.

<sup>39</sup> Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, p. 119.

<sup>40</sup> Ines Županov, ‘Passage to India: Jesuit Spiritual Economy between Martyrdom and Profit in the Seventeenth Century’, *Journal of Early Modern History* 16/2 (2012), p. 124.

contained therein came from all across the continent of Europe, detailing more pressing issues as well as minutiae, from the founding of schools and their current enrolment as well as pranks directed towards young Jesuit students by other local ‘scamps’ and the need for appropriate punishment.<sup>41</sup> As a historical text, however, the more interesting facet is Polanco’s honest assessment of the state of affairs, presenting a religious order much removed from the stereotype of regimented and disciplined ‘Soldiers of Christ’, but rather one whose members fell along the spectrum between obedience and autonomy. On the one hand, individuals regularly reported the quotidian happenings and petitioned for guidance, but on the other they not only adapted to the needs of various environments of mid-sixteenth century Europe but also seized opportunities to make independent decisions as they arose.<sup>42</sup>

A few organisational aspects contributed to the Jesuits’ observance of obedience, beyond the assumed vow characteristic of all religious orders. Obedience formed the basis of the uniquely ‘fourth vow’ of the Jesuit to follow orders of any pontiff concerning the progress and propagation of the faith and go wherever he may direct them.<sup>43</sup> A high degree of obedience was afforded to the top of the order as well. Decisions made by the Superior General possessed, it was claimed, the inspiration of Christ and thus called for due respect.<sup>44</sup> Critics found this obedience particularly worrisome given that, unlike most orders who elected their superior through chapters, positions were appointed top-down and the highest authority—the Superior General—also held that position for life. Jesuits defended these standards of obedience on the grounds of maintaining administrative efficiency, as elections hamstrung the ‘active’ lives and missions that Jesuits conducted, or in favour of allowing greater discretion in handling local affairs. Yet the significance afforded to the General

---

<sup>41</sup> Juan Alfonso de Polanco, *Year by Year with the Early Jesuits (1537-1556): Selections from the “Chronicon” of Juan de Polanco, S.J.*, ed. and tr. John Patrick Donnelly (St Louis, 2004), p. 320.

<sup>42</sup> O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 11.

<sup>43</sup> Ignatius of Loyola, ‘The Formula of the Institute’, *Constitutions*, p. 68.

<sup>44</sup> Loyola, ‘Formula of the Institute’, *Constitutions*, p. 69.

Congregations (in which a new Superior General was elected and other major decisions made) translated to less provincial self-determination than the mendicants, whose chapters had less authority than Jesuit Congregations.<sup>45</sup> The rarity of such congregations bolstered the impact of their decisions to such a degree that the collection of *Regulae Societatis Iesu*, ‘norms of behaviour promulgated by the generals or by the general congregations’, often held greater influence than the Constitutions on the decisions of provincials. In these rules, obedience is frequently reinforced but so too is individual conscience and the open discussion of it between Jesuits and their superiors without reservation.<sup>46</sup>

The notion of a distinct Jesuit identity originated through the formative texts, yet at the same time developed through the realisation of a contemplative-active model of ministry. As Jesuits moved about the societal sphere, their ideas and actions had significant political implications, whether through recognition of papal sovereignty above regnal or state authorities or the aforementioned obedience directed towards the pope and the Jesuit hierarchy from General to incremental superiors. The former is what contributed to such the banning of Jesuits and other Catholic priests from England in 1584, while the latter resulted in occasional scandals by superiors’ decisions, such as municipal complaints in Coimbra about public mortification by Jesuits.<sup>47</sup> Much of the anti-Jesuit polemics of the 18<sup>th</sup>-19<sup>th</sup> centuries attacked their ‘hermaphroditism’ (between secular and regular clergy) and what even other clerics recognised was their existence outside the structures of society; they contravened ‘the delicate networks of codes, obligations, and jurisdictions that governed

---

<sup>45</sup> O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 53.

<sup>46</sup> Silvia Mostaccio, *Early Modern Jesuits Between Obedience and Conscience During the Generalate of Claudio Acquaviva (1581-1615)* (Farnham, 2014), p. 80. *Regulae* editions were published at various intervals, but the first one is dated to 1560, cf. Dionysius Fernández Zapico (ed), *Regulae Societatis Iesu (1540-1556)* (Rome, 1948).

<sup>47</sup> Simão Rodrigues to Ignatius of Loyola, ca. early 1547, *Epistolae PP. Paschasii Broëtii, Claudii Jaii, Joannis Cordurii et Simonis Rodericii* (Madrid, 1903), pp. 547-553.

collective life, both in ecclesiastical and civil contexts'.<sup>48</sup> Franco Motta places the origins of this ambiguous political identity within the generalate of Claudio Acquaviva (fl. 1581-1615), and to an extent this appears sound; the latter's handling of the perennial controversy of New Christians within the Society alongside appeasement of a fervent Portuguese faction, as explored in Chapter Three, evinces inherently political machinations that fly in the face of Ignatian intentions for Jesuit identity. Nevertheless, the early Society's inability to reconcile its founding principles with provincial prejudices and insubordination suggest shortcomings with this model, from multiple policy shifts regarding members of mixed ancestry to the fluctuating enforcement of obedience, both of which crossed centuries of Jesuit ministry.

These demands for organisational obedience were balanced by a general understanding of autonomy as outlined in both the *Exercises* and the *Constitutions*. Interestingly, the word 'obedience', included among the vows required of Jesuits in the Formula of the Institute as outlined in the bull *Exposcit debitum* of 1550, was not among the vows in the earlier Formula of 1540. In contrast, as Stephen Schloesser observed, the *Exercises* served as a 'devotional expression of subjective individualism', in which the individual undertaking the programme is emphasised and given the choice ('election') on how to approach a variety of different theoretical scenarios.<sup>49</sup> This also meant determining the extent to which one should obey the opinion of a superior or councillor, which could naturally lead to confusion in balancing obedience and autonomy through election. Ignatius's conception of the individual stressed that one's goals 'are to be subordinated to such overriding goals as the glory of God and the salvation of souls', which in the context

---

<sup>48</sup> Motta, 'Jesuit Theology, Politics, and Identity', p. 357; Sabina Pavone, 'Anti-Jesuitism in a Global Perspective' in Županov (ed), *The Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits*. Cf. Robert Maryks, 'The Jesuit Missionary Ethos', *Eighteenth-Century Studies* 46/3 (2013), p. 431. The polemical use of the term 'hermaphrodite' in fact arises in the anti-Jesuit *Catéchisme des Jésuites* (1602) by Etienne Pasquier.

<sup>49</sup> Schloesser, 'Accommodation as Rhetorical Principle', p. 356.

of overseas missions as much as Europe allowed for divergent and subjective interpretations.<sup>50</sup> Silvia Mostaccio identifies this, however, as a virtue of ambiguity associated with Jesuit identity, a ‘vital oscillation between “inside” and “outside”, between the authority of the self and of the external authorities’. This fluctuation thus formed the basis for a number of interpretations on theoretical and pastoral practices present within Jesuit global ministry, one of them being missionary accommodation, a secondary virtue practised alongside obedience.<sup>51</sup> Yet the ambiguity inherent in Jesuit identity meant the scale running between obedience and autonomy allowed for a multitude of expressions. In provinces like Portugal, ambiguity manifested in the conflicts between factions, one which favoured a more relaxed view of obedience and discipline and another more strict, known as ‘rigorists’, discussed further in Chapter Four. As Mostaccio argued, obedience depended upon ‘a discretionary adaptation of the law’ with the understanding that accommodation came from a decision made with respect towards those superiors who could legitimise it, yet at the same time both individuals had to navigate the ambiguity of obedience to one’s interior conscience informed by spiritual discernment versus that of the greater collective and universal Church.<sup>52</sup> Each had to make a choice. As we will see in later chapters, the superior played as significant a role in fostering *accommodatio* as the individuals who implemented it.

### **Decision-making and Jesuit subjectivity**

Autonomy and obedience were also at issue in another element in the formative literature, decision-making. The procedure for ‘making’ the *Exercises* encouraged the

---

<sup>50</sup> John Langan, ‘The Good of Obedience in a Culture of Autonomy’, *Studies in the Spirituality of the Jesuits* 32 (2000), p. 4.

<sup>51</sup> Mostaccio, *Early Modern Jesuits*, p. 4.

<sup>52</sup> Mostaccio, *Early Modern Jesuits*, p. 6.

individual to be an active participant, stressing the Master or councillor role in guiding the exercitant towards determining and discerning for themselves the direction of their spiritual journey. The key to this was decision-making based on not only reason and logic but also feelings and emotions, a point noted by Ignatius' secretary Juan Polanco. Polanco outlined different ways of making a decision as prescribed by the *Exercises*, yet privileged above all feelings and desires over weighing options rationally, due to the fact that an individual is guided by a 'better light than human reason'.<sup>53</sup> Ignatius outlined this very point in the text, encouraging the exercitant to consider that 'before I make my choice I will feel that the greater or lesser love for the thing chosen is solely for the sake of my Creator and Lord'.<sup>54</sup> Contemplation was crucial in this election, and the exercitant was expected to take considerable time to reflect on certain situations and experiences in order to devote themselves completely to that distinct objective. Thus understanding this reflection enabled Jesuits to foster conditions that allowed those to whom they ministered to better make decisions based on their own interior contemplation. In many missions, however, Jesuits lacked patience or discretion with conversion targets as well as recent converts, as we will see in Chapter Four.

The *Exercises* established the development of subjectivity in its progression from obedience to self-realisation. An exercitant's director determined much of the course of meditations during the *Exercises*, but the exercitant was encouraged to take the specific events described in the programme and make them their own through the constant introspection of spiritual discernment, as described above. As the exercitant shares some of this introspection with their director, the director is instructed to avoid imposing their own insight onto the meditative experience of the exercitant, allowing space for a subjective

---

<sup>53</sup> O'Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 42. Cf. Schloesser, 'Accommodation as Rhetorical Principle', p. 354.

<sup>54</sup> Juan Polanco, 'Directorium P. Ioannis Alfonsi de Polanco', *MI Ex*, ii, pp. 314-15.

interpretation of the divine within one's self. As Moshe Sluhovsky lucidly observes, 'what began as obedient adherence to the spiritual director's assignments and then developed into a dialogue between director and practitioner, terminates with a constant internal dialogue of the self with God who is within it'.<sup>55</sup>

As to the choice itself, the *Exercises* stated that 'all matters in which we wish to make a choice must be either indifferent or good in themselves'.<sup>56</sup> The concept of indifference held great significance for the development of *accommodatio*, as the term *adiaphora* or 'indifferent things' arose out of the Reformation debates on biblical hermeneutics as part and parcel of the adaptation of Scripture to sixteenth century audiences. This move to separate what is human from what is divine created a category of cultural aspects that could be distinguished by their moral or religious neutrality from that of the innately spiritual; thus, the 'indifferent things' could continue to exist, provided they were proven to show that they were purely social practices or customs. Maintaining the separation was a key aspect of the adaptation of Christianity to existing structures.<sup>57</sup> At the peak of Roberto de Nobili's radical accommodation methods, his primary defence of this particular approach was an argument for the separation of ritual and social rules and religion. In this Nobili incorporated *adiaphora* to defend his methods by concluding that the civil and non-religious aspects of Indian society could be distinguished from the 'idolatrous' ones.<sup>58</sup>

---

<sup>55</sup> Sluhovsky, 'Loyola's Spiritual Exercises', p. 223.

<sup>56</sup> Ignatius of Loyola, *The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius*, tr. Anthony Mottola (New York, 1989), p. 83. The original Latin: 'necessarium est omnia quorum facere volumus electionem, indifferentia esse vel bona in se'; Loyola, *MI Ex*, i, p. 480.

<sup>57</sup> Aranha, 'Social and Physical Spaces', p. 220.

<sup>58</sup> Anand Amaladass and Francis X. Clooney, 'Introduction', *Preaching Wisdom to the Wise*, p. 9; cf. I.G. Županov, 'Le repli du religieux: les missionnaires jésuites du 17<sup>e</sup> siècle entre la théologie chrétienne et une éthique païenne', *Annales: Histoire, Sciences Sociales* 51/6 (1996), pp. 1218-21.

Yet besides applying *adiaphora* into specific ‘things’, a Jesuit himself had to become indifferent. In the first week of the *Spiritual Exercises*, part of the ‘Principle and Foundation’ (*De Fundamento*) was that ‘we must make ourselves indifferent to all created things, in so far as it is left to the choice of our free will and is not forbidden’.<sup>59</sup> From the *Exercises*, Loyola incorporated the idea into the placement of members of the Society, where outside of the various classes—professed (taking the four solemn vows), coadjutors (spiritual or temporal), and scholastics—existed a fourth distinction of those received without a defined class. Given they had no predetermined status, these individuals ‘should enter as still indifferent with respect to whichever of the previously mentioned grades the superior will think best’.<sup>60</sup> In the chapter devoted to the class of indifferent members, a key caveat was included, that ‘when something occurs constantly to these candidates as being conducive to the greater glory to God our Lord, they may, after prayer, propose the matter simply to the superior and leave it entirely to his judgment’.<sup>61</sup> The expectation of personal indifference expanded throughout one’s ministry, where in the instances which a Jesuit did not make an immediate decision or preference then he must seek to remain impartial to the choices available to him until, either through spiritual discernment or the counsel of his superior, a judgment that ensured the most good was made. Later in the *Constitutions*, this was described in the context of determining movement from one place to another, where one may make a choice ‘after considering the reasons on one side and the other, while praying and keeping his will indifferent’.<sup>62</sup> Županov describes how, in order to reach a choice by discerning God, ‘one had to be empty, that is, inclined to nothing, indifferent, because the answer is not simply, if at all, a verbal sign’, with the result being both an ‘inherent

---

<sup>59</sup> Loyola, *Spiritual Exercises*, p. 47. In Latin: ‘Quocirca opus est ut simus indifferentes ad omnia create, in quantum est concessum libertati nostrae et non prohibitum’; Loyola, *MI Ex*, i, p. 461.

<sup>60</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 83.

<sup>61</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 117.

<sup>62</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 280.

indecisiveness' and in the context of mission a kind of liberty similar to what Protestant theologians found through *adiaphora*.<sup>63</sup> The emptiness of indifference certainly formulated for the Jesuits in India, as well as in other pagan societies, a mouldable vessel capable of unexpected responses to hitherto unfamiliar circumstances.

It is unclear how the concept of *adiaphora* entered into the Society of Jesus. Although discussed through Nobili's defence of Hindu social practices, Ines Županov nevertheless notes its use amongst Protestants during the sixteenth century as a means for negotiating between church and state the management of indifferent things such as laws, ethics, and customs.<sup>64</sup> Peter Canisius (1521-97), one of the founding Jesuits and missionary throughout Germany, acknowledged the concept of *adiaphora* in use amongst the Protestants, in that they reckoned Catholic teachings on traditions which uphold church authority to be 'of little or of absolutely no value.'<sup>65</sup> More than likely, the idea entered into Ignatian spirituality in much the same way as in Protestant ideology, through reinterpretations of classical literature and patristics. *Adiaphora* was first referenced within Stoic philosophy to denote neutral things between virtues and vices, but then was taken up by the Church Fathers and medieval theologians to interpret Christian morality, before becoming a central part of Christian liberty in Erasmus' *Enchiridion* and Protestant writings.<sup>66</sup> Nevertheless, in early Jesuit literature the term used more often was '*indifferentia*', and most likely the main influence arose through the Thomistic condition of

---

<sup>63</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, pp.46-7; Scott Francis, 'Marguerite de Navarre, a Nicodemite? *Adiaphora* and Intention in *Heptameron* 30, 65, and 72', *Renaissance and Reformation/Renaissance et Reforme* 39/3 (2016), p. 10.

<sup>64</sup> Županov, 'Le repli du religieux', p. 1222. Cf. B.J. Verkamp, *The Indifferent Mean: Adiaphorism in the English Reformation to 1554* (Columbus, 1971).

<sup>65</sup> Hilmar M. Pabel, 'Peter Canisius and the Protestants: A Model of Ecumenical Dialogue?' *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1/3 (2014), p. 385.

<sup>66</sup> Francis, 'Adiaphora and Intention', pp. 9-10; Županov, 'Le repli du religieux', pp. 1203-4. Cf. E.F. Meyland, 'The Stoic Doctrine of Indifferent Things and Conception of Christian Liberty in Calvin's *Institutio Religionis Christianae*', in R. Gamble (ed), *Articles on Calvin and Calvinism* (14 vols, New York, 1992), iii, pp. 105-15.

*aequilibrium indifferentiae*, where an individual maintains equidistance from all options available and seeks to be indifferent to any one choice.<sup>67</sup> As mentioned, a similar approach was stressed by Loyola in the *Exercises*. Regardless of specific term used, the principle remained the same—to strive towards indifference, even objectivity, in all decision-making or election, and to thus understand those things which are indifferent to religion.

Adapting again the personal, contemplative *Exercises* into the active ministry, Jesuits were to translate their role as councillor into how they guided their audience. As Schloesser remarked in his study of O'Malley's thesis, 'just as in the *Exercises*, preaching required accommodation to the individual so that deep feelings might be elicited and point toward a choice'.<sup>68</sup> In the context of Europe, this might be to extol virtues amongst the laity or discourage heresy, whilst Asian or American missions might require an adapted message to a potential convert about choosing to accept the truth of Christ; the needs of the individual were again the factor in rhetoric. The confidence, then, to act autonomously derived from the movement of consolation, described as 'finding within [oneself] something that neither was nor could be from [oneself] but came purely from God', much in the same way that spiritual discernment granted one the capacity to choose.<sup>69</sup> With this self-awareness, a Jesuit missionary was a vehicle for God's message and therefore able to function independently and come to decisions affecting the course of the mission without a constant need for theological bureaucracy. As one scholar recently put it, the formative literature such as the

---

<sup>67</sup> Carlos Martínez Valle, 'Jesuit psychagogies: an approach to the relations of schooling and casuistry' *Paedagogica Historica: International Journal of the History of Education* 49/4 (2013), pp. 582, 587. This concept was taken up more extensively by later Jesuit theologians such as Luis de Molina and Francisco Suarez.

<sup>68</sup> Schloesser, 'Accommodation as Rhetorical Principle', p. 361. Cf. O'Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 42.

<sup>69</sup> O'Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 20.

*Exercises* and the *Constitutions* ‘might help, but only the Holy Spirit and divine prudence can teach such tact’.<sup>70</sup>

## Education

The education of ‘unlettered persons’ in Christian catechism dominated the early Society documents, but over time the Superior General and Fathers Assistant, informed by the successes at early schools such as that in Messina (est. 1548), developed a more complete understanding of educational policy influenced by humanism. This latter culminated in the *Constitutions* and the *Ratio Studiorum*, where a defined set of regulations combined the curriculum of the medieval scholastic university with that of the humanistic schools of Renaissance Italy, blending the ‘Parisian way’ the founders experienced in their own education with the newer form of Latin schools to train well-rounded men.<sup>71</sup> Robert Maryks emphasised the humanist-inspired education of the Jesuit schools in what may be called ‘Ciceronic pedagogy’, where classical literature as mentioned above informed the disciplines and ideas taught within the colleges.<sup>72</sup> The Society thereby applied Cicero’s view of accommodation as part of the rhetorical strategy of adapting words and ideas for the purpose of elocution through its educational policies, as the *Constitutions* expressed the need for Jesuit educators at the Society’s colleges to lecture ‘in a manner suitable for the edification of the people’.<sup>73</sup>

---

<sup>70</sup> Jeffrey Muller, ‘The Jesuit Strategy of Accommodation’, in Wietse de Boer, Karl A.E. Enenkel, and Walter Melion (eds), *Jesuit Image Theory* (Leiden, 2016), p. 466.

<sup>71</sup> John O’Malley, ‘How the First Jesuits Became Involved in Education’, in Vincent J. Duminico (ed), *The Jesuit Ratio Studiorum: 400<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Perspectives* (New York, 2000), pp. 58-63.

<sup>72</sup> Maryks, ‘The Jesuit Missionary Ethos’, p. 432. A more recent study has looked beyond Cicero to earlier Greek traditions in rhetoric and their influence on Jesuit education and ideology, cf. Jaska Kainulainen, ‘Isocrates’s phronesis and the Early Jesuits’, *Journal of Early Modern History* 22/6 (2018), pp. 528-48.

<sup>73</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 201.

How this education was administered was just as significant, from curricula to pedagogy. In some European colleges, the necessary censure of certain books limited the open intellectual pursuit seemingly furthered by the Jesuits, though not without some resistance.<sup>74</sup> In India, as shown in Chapter Two, some Jesuits referenced or requested copies of texts that at the time were on the *Index Prohibitorum Librorum* without any awareness of their controversial status, sometimes due to poor communication of recent additions but also because of their own pursuit of education from a variety of sources.<sup>75</sup> Nevertheless, curriculum content in Asian schools pointed to issues with humanist pedagogy, as the inculcation of superiority of European culture in indigenous schools to an extent undermined Jesuit attempts to distinguish their identity from the ‘Western cultural aggression’ of the state and settler communities.<sup>76</sup> In the colleges of Europe as well as various global mission fields, Jesuits incorporated Christian principles into performances of classical drama, tweaking dialogue to avoid potentially heretical, pagan passages. Ignatius’ intent in promoting classical theatre was not so much for artistic but rather didactic value, as a means to develop good oratorical skills while avoiding the ‘historic immorality and pagan affinities’.<sup>77</sup> While drama would figure less into the India missions than, for example, Japan, theatrical exercise certainly had value in developing an understanding of the value of non-Christian art for rhetorical and even evangelical purposes.

---

<sup>74</sup> Cf. Ruth Atherton, ‘Peter Canisius and the Development of Catholic Education in Germany, 1549-97’, *Studies in Church History* 55 (2019), pp. 145-160.

<sup>75</sup> E.g. Francis Xavier wrote about how two Jesuits possessed copies of a book by Constantino Ponce de la Fuente, who had been accused of ‘luteranismo’ by the Inquisition in 1543, cf. Francis Xavier to Gaspar Berze, 24 Apr 1552, *Monumenta Xaveriana, ex autographis vel ex antiquioribus exemplis collecta* [henceforth *MX*] (2 vols, Madrid, 1899-1900, 1912), i, p. 756; also cf. Elisabetta Corsi, *Órdenes religiosas entre América y Asia: ideas para una historia misionera de los espacios colonials* (Mexico City, 2008), p. 49.

<sup>76</sup> Teotonio R. de Souza, ‘Asia and Christianity in History: Addressing Some Problems of Church Historiography’, *Asian Christian Review* 7/1 (2013), p. 26; Cf. K.M. Panikkar, *Asia and Western Dominance: A Survey of the Vasco da Gama Epoch of Asian History, 1498-1945* (London, 1953).

<sup>77</sup> Kevin J. Wetmore, ‘Jesuit Theater and Drama’, *Oxford Handbooks Online* (7 Jul 2016).

Studies stood separate from the contemplative prayer within the Jesuit way of proceeding, as Nadal noted in his *Regula pro scholaribus Societatis* or ‘Rules’ of 1563. In making distinctions befitting the concept of adiaphora, he saw two means for achieving the aid of souls: one was through the typically religious life most regular clergy observed, and the other was in intellectual pursuits.<sup>78</sup> Whereas some Jesuits thrived in the mission fields perhaps through charisma and vigour among other traits, others were far more suited to a life of scholarship. Through these different paths, the Society not only proficiently produced personalities like Nobili and Ricci, but also renowned theologians like Roberto Bellarmine or scientists such as Athanasius Kircher. Yet a variety of pursuits bridged the gap between the contemplative and active lives Jesuits balanced, one of which was language.

### Languages

The Constitutions suggested that greater edification could be achieved ‘by endeavouring to learn the [vernacular] language well’, but the expectation already existed amongst the early Jesuits.<sup>79</sup> Beginning with the desire for pilgrimage to Jerusalem and to preach amongst all peoples there, the founders understood the importance of language. Additionally, language was seen as essential to both the unity of the Society and the service of the greater community wheresoever a Jesuit resided, while also recognising that they may use their own native tongue if it was more profitable.<sup>80</sup> Once the purpose of the Society shifted towards being sent by the Pope to whatever area necessary, awareness of this principle grew.

---

<sup>78</sup> Jeronimo Nadal, ‘Regulae pro scholaribus Societatis’, *Monumenta Paedagogica Societatis Iesu: Novo Editio Penitus Retractata II (1557-1572)*, ed. Ladislaus Lukács (Rome, 1974), p. 116; Cf. Cessario, ‘Molina and Aquinas’, p. 303.

<sup>79</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 201.

<sup>80</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to various rectors of the Society, 1 Jan 1556, *MI Epp*, x, pp. 451-2. Cf. Correia-Afonso, *Jesuit Letters*, p. 58.

Applying the rhetorical approach to the study of languages, Loyola stressed that the guiding principle in using the vernacular was ‘careful disposition to the place and person’.<sup>81</sup> In the various cultural environments Jesuits entered, the contemplative-active life that carried through all aspects of ministry contributed to considerable linguistic success that often surpassed their clerical peers.<sup>82</sup> Returning to Juan Polanco’s letter to Diego Laínez in 1547, the secretary laid out front how he felt ‘that it should suffice to possess these humane letters, especially languages, in subjects capable by age and mental capacity’.<sup>83</sup> Aiming towards mastery of Latin, then Greek and later Hebrew, Jesuit education instilled serious efforts at linguistics from the novitiate forward.

From experiences amongst diverse communities, the limits to proselytism through interpreters led to decisions made by provincial superiors to encourage both the education of indigenous men in European languages as well as the assignment of European Jesuits to advanced study in local languages. Printing presses in Asia and the Americas were established with the enthusiastic support of the Jesuits, especially so when the press in India later developed Dravidian scripts in addition to Latin.<sup>84</sup>

Yet for language study to be successful, the student must approach the specific language with an element of cultural openness, recognising that the language has intrinsic value and can impart more than simply mimetic lessons through which to transmit a message born in the native tongue. Similarly, it can be said that the reinforcement of the colonial language evinced the perceived superiority of those who spoke it and the entity it

---

<sup>81</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to various rectors of the Society, 1 Jan 1556, *MI Epp*, x, p. 452.

<sup>82</sup> At least this was true for India, but in the Spanish Americas the Dominicans and Franciscans were the foremost linguists, yet they were also the first missionaries to arrive there; cf. Alan Strathern, ‘*Os Piedosos* and the Mission in India and Sri Lanka in the 1540s’ in Roberto Carneiro and Artur Teodoro de Matos (eds), *D. João III e o Império. Actas do Congresso Internacional* (Lisbon, 2004), p. 859.

<sup>83</sup> Juan Polanco to Diego Laínez, 21 May 1547, *MI Epp*, i, p. 521.

<sup>84</sup> M. Antoni J. Üçerler, ‘Gutenberg Comes to Japan: the Jesuits & the first IT Revolution of the Sixteenth Century’, *The Ricci Institute Public Lectures Series* (September 2005), pp. 7-8.

represented. For as prolific the Jesuits were in publishing grammars, dictionaries, and literature in non-European languages, early on few of them laboured to learn the languages themselves. In the colleges of Europe, however, even Loyola ordered daily lessons and weekly sermons in the vernacular to encourage those less-versed to fully comprehend the local language as well as prove their competency.<sup>85</sup> Without the directive of superiors, the motivation to commit oneself in a similar manner to the foreign languages of Africa, Asia, and the Americas rested with the individual. In the context of India, it would take until 1575, with the arrival the innovative Valignano, before a superior acted upon this principle.

### **Appearance, presentation, and self-fashioning**

Becoming all things to all people perhaps best applied to self-fashioning. In the realm of aesthetics, the Society of Jesus often had fluid ideas about self-presentation, in which imposed norms balanced with opportunities for self-expression according to the particulars, tied back into the principles of the *Exercises*. Throughout the programme, ‘ample interior space was provided for individual, “free” self-examination’, as Ines Županov put it.<sup>86</sup> Similar to how *accommodatio* accounted for shifts in social and intellectual norms over time in biblical exegesis, the *Exercises* asked participants to envision themselves within the mysteries of the Gospel, thereby positioning their present form and context within the time of Christ to better understand how to act in the present. Any time a Jesuit might be lost as to their purpose or how to negotiate between interior worship and external action, they were directed to complete the *Exercises* as a form of self-reflection, going through the prescribed meditations to greater understand their purpose within the universal Church.

---

<sup>85</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to various rectors of the Society, 1 Jan 1556, *MI Epp*, x, pp. 451-2.

<sup>86</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 22.

Such reinforced focus allowed for frequent reassessment of identity and how to display themselves in order to gain the most ‘fruit’.

The Constitutions described more specific characteristics that a Jesuit should seek to maintain in self-presentation, such as ‘a pleasing manner of speech,...a good appearance by which those with whom they deal are more usually edified’, and even in some cases ‘the extrinsic gifts of nobility, wealth, reputation, and the like’.<sup>87</sup> This concern for edification also defined the physical dress of Jesuits, even down to the specific garments they wore. Linda Zampol D’Ortia explored the use of garments as negotiation of identity for Jesuits active in Japan in the late sixteenth century, drawing out the significance of dress as a form of communication—it discloses information about the wearer, their purpose, and even virtues. On a more general level, during this period physical attire was ‘an integral part of the identity of the wearer’.<sup>88</sup> The black cassock often served as a source of identity for Jesuits, displaying the humility and poverty that often defined other orders through simple garments, yet distinguishing them from both their fellow mendicant Blackfriars and Greyfriars as well as the habits of the monastic clergy. The Constitutions indicated this but at the same time provided room for interpretation, stating that all clothing should possess three characteristics: ‘it should be proper;...conformed to the usage of the region where one is living’—‘*ad usum loci, in quo vivitur accommodatus*’—and not contradict the vow of poverty through expensive materials. Further details clarified that the Society did not forbid the wearing of expensive cloth either upon entering or if the need called for them, but it should not be regular attire.<sup>89</sup> Indeed, the black cassock similar to that worn by secular clergy suited the contravention of the ecclesiastical and social networks described by Motta,

---

<sup>87</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, pp. 129-30.

<sup>88</sup> Linda Zampol D’Ortia, ‘Purple Silk and Black Cotton: Francisco Cabral and the Negotiation of Jesuit Attire in Japan (1570-73)’ in Maryks (ed), *Exploring Jesuit Distinctiveness*, pp. 138-9.

<sup>89</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 258. Cf. D’Ortia, ‘Purple Silk and Black Cotton’, pp. 140-1.

affording Jesuits distinction with modesty as well as the flexibility to navigate various spheres of early modern life.<sup>90</sup> Adjustment of dress became a key aspect of *accommodatio* through the later missions as some Jesuits conformed to local norms of dress to advance their missions in a manner in line with Ignatius' views on appearance.

Limits to self-fashioning derive from limits on autonomy, and like identity itself, self-fashioning is affected both from within and without. Stephen Greenblatt's seminal work on this stated as much, in that 'the power to impose a shape upon oneself is an aspect of the more general power to control identity—that of others at least as often as one's own'.<sup>91</sup> Jesuits who took solemn vows were enjoined to leave their families and even sever ties with them, for Christ would be the only object of their affection. Since these connections could disturb their spiritual life and apostolate, candidates were advised to consider relatives as no longer living, and to say 'not that they have brothers and sisters, but that they had them, showing thus that they do not have what they gave up in order to have Christ in place of all things'.<sup>92</sup> Recent scholarship has exposed the limits of this, however, from the influence of the nobility upon whom the Society relied for patronage to intense residual bonds between family members that some could not bring themselves to completely separate.<sup>93</sup> Pater as well as patria had implications for identity, as discussed further in Chapter Three, and the bonds between countrymen often hindered the progress of Jesuit self-fashioning towards the formula of living that removed all materiality. Given the aforementioned benefits of nobility, wealth, and reputation for the Society, especially amongst the early Jesuits this often meant that men retained their status and would carry some social standing that, while

---

<sup>90</sup> Motta, 'Jesuit Theology, Politics, and Identity', p. 357.

<sup>91</sup> Stephen Greenblatt, *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to Shakespeare* (Chicago, 2005), p. 1.

<sup>92</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 95.

<sup>93</sup> A series of panels held at the Sixteenth Century Conference in November 2018 discussed cases from Spain and Italy, including a suggestion that Ignatius himself was unable to sever all family ties. One of the more notorious examples of Jesuit writings referring to family members as more or less "dead" to them came from Aloysius Gonzaga. An edited volume on the topic is forthcoming in 2022.

seen as edifying to the order, also might prevent individual members from transforming themselves in accordance with difficult new environments like Portuguese India or north-eastern China.<sup>94</sup> Harking back to the apostolic model of Paul, Loyola stressed that ‘in the Society there is no distinction between Jew and Greek, etc.’, emphasising the embrace of all nations as well as converted Jews, a controversy which he specifically addressed at the time.<sup>95</sup> Following prescriptions for proper dress may indicate their aesthetic assimilation into the Society, but latent social (and, as seen in Portugal and its empire, often political) reputation could potentially belie the unity and cosmopolitan distinctiveness the order fostered.

### **Suaviter in modo**

A final characteristic to consider is notably more difficult to define, as it holds a more subtle place in the Jesuit personality, yet nevertheless plays a greater role in distinctiveness than often recognised. In the publication *Industriae ad curandos animae morbos* (1600) by Claudio Acquaviva, the Superior General from 1581 to 1615, there appeared the phrase ‘*suaviter in modo, fortiter in re*’—more or less, gentle in method, more resolute in execution.<sup>96</sup> Many have referenced this dictum, but few have analysed its reach amongst the Society, if it had one at all. As Harro Höpfl suggests, regardless of its context in Acquaviva’s printed work, ‘the counsel it embodied is congruent with many concerns

---

<sup>94</sup> Self-assessment could also mean self-abnegation, as parts of the *Spiritual Exercises* ‘formed part of a strategy to rid a person of overpowering personal desires’; cf. Charles Borges, *The Economics of the Goa Jesuits, 1542-1759* (New Delhi, 1994), p. 18.

<sup>95</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Diego Mirón, 5 Apr 1554, *MI Epp*, vi, pp. 569-70; Cf. Robert A. Maryks, *The Jesuit Order as a synagogue of Jews: Jesuits of Jewish ancestry and purity-of-blood laws in the early Society of Jesus* (Leiden, 2010). This topic is discussed at length here in later chapters.

<sup>96</sup> Claudio Acquaviva, *Industriae ad curandos animae morbos* (Florence, 1600), unknown; this reference is difficult to track down, as it has become a highly popular motto for a number of different individuals and organisations, and the only secondary historical literature that cites the text does not provide the location of the saying in the printed original.

central to the Society of Jesus’, among which Höpfl includes appearance and reputation.<sup>97</sup> As has been shown, presenting oneself as appealing and of good repute was integral to Jesuit *accommodatio* as heavily informed by classical rhetoric. This maxim certainly encapsulated similar aspects of rhetorical art, in that it intended to persuade a particular audience by appearing more pleasing in manner while nevertheless remaining resolute in the message, and more so the truth.<sup>98</sup> The aforementioned characteristics of the Jesuit ‘way of proceeding’ indicated an objective of pleasing outward disposition, but the extent to which an individual might elaborate on those distinctive Jesuit factors remained quite subjective. Where the *suaviter* ideal aids in the analysis I take up here is as a measure of particular Jesuits’ understanding of ministry as ‘gentle’ or ‘pleasing’ to those whom they wish to absorb into the fold of Christianity.

This mode of interpretation has connections with each of the subsequent chapters, particularly in the situations through which either the administration or literature of the Society presents no clear verdict on how its members are to proceed. In discussing conversion methodology, as Ines Županov argues, ‘the method of accommodation was...based on the premise that teaching the Gospel and converting non-Christians should not be based on violence’.<sup>99</sup> Yet even amongst the degrees of coercion falling outside the realm of violence, we might consider the concept of *suaviter* to be integral to accommodation. As Roberto de Nobili remarked in his *Informatio* from 1613, ‘one cannot understand why India should be dealt with more strictly than the other countries...indeed, all the more gently should one proceed with this Indian nation’.<sup>100</sup> The famed

---

<sup>97</sup> Harro Höpfl, ‘*Suaviter in modo, fortiter in re*’: Appearance, Reality, and the Early Jesuits’ in Stephen Linstead and Heather Höpfl (eds), *The Aesthetics of Organization* (London, 2000), p. 198.

<sup>98</sup> Höpfl, ‘*Suaviter in modo*’, p. 202.

<sup>99</sup> Ines Županov, ‘South Asia’ in Ronnie Po-chia Hsia (ed), *A Companion to Early Modern Catholic Global Missions* (Leiden, 2018), p. 246.

<sup>100</sup> Nobili, ‘Report Concerning Certain Customs’, pp. 214-15.

accommodationist earned the support of General Acquaviva in his controversial efforts to proselytise in Madurai, perhaps bringing us back to this connection between the originator of the motto and one who perhaps sought to realise it best. As it applies more generally throughout this thesis, I look to examples through which Jesuits exercised a gentler approach—whether they explicitly referred to such a term as *suaviter* or not—towards non-Christian communities and individuals throughout India as a means for gauging the practice of *accommodatio*, where much as in rhetoric the message retained its significance while delivered in a manner more appealing to the audience.

## **Conclusion**

Every part of Jesuit distinctiveness blurred the lines between secular and regular clergy—they had no formal Rule, but rather a Formula; they wore no habit, as they were secular priests and thus dressed as such; they had centralised administration, rather than just local; they lived in houses as opposed to monasteries, communal but not to the extent of medieval orders; they worked amongst the people but were expected to practice contemplative study and worship. This transcendence of norms would become a regular fixture throughout the history of the Society, but in the case of the early years a great deal of adjustment was required on the part of members who struggled to understand their purpose, leading to those who rejected more accommodating methods as well as those who saw them as integral to Jesuit identity. As part of the principle and foundation in the *Exercises*, achieving indifference in decision-making was crucial in instilling objectivity within Jesuit ministry, yet human nature enabled subjectivity in judgment.

Becoming all to all could manifest in diverse ways, and not just through the Jesuit way of proceeding. Nevertheless, the spirituality with which Ignatius imbued his order created the opportunity for one to make oneself more flexible and more agreeable to those

with whom they conversed. And as Ignatius had indicated, understanding the manner in which one was to conform oneself began through observation and attentiveness to the individual with whom they conversed. Ignatius structured so much of his instructions around discourse, and thus the intimate level of this interaction required an individualised approach. Constructing an identity defined by its flexibility not only allowed for adaptation but also the capacity for rigidity. Jesuit distinctiveness figured significantly into the development of missionary accommodation, and like accommodation, possessed limits as well. As we will see in the coming chapters, these limits materialised in the priorities upon which individual Jesuits acted which drew them away from the foundational principles of the Society and its ways of proceeding.

## Chapter Two Ways of Proceeding in India: Jesuit Attitudes Towards Mission and Ministry

In early 1545, Francis Xavier (fl. 1541-1552) wrote to Ignatius of Loyola from Cochin about how ‘in these regions of the infidel the educated are not needed’ but rather those of ‘physical and spiritual force’.<sup>1</sup> His letter went on to describe a great deal of difficulties that a Jesuit might face, but none required any great amount of education; in fact, Xavier noted, ‘those without talent for confessing, preaching, or related things of the Society...will be of great service in these parts’.<sup>2</sup> Almost six years later, Xavier’s contemporary Niccolò Lancilotto (fl. 1545-1558) reported from further south in Kollam that the mission’s needs were quite the opposite. Noting the variety of customs and religious opinions the local people held, he stressed that Loyola should ‘not believe that to gain fruit in this land whatever men will suffice, rather it is necessary that men are just as learned as virtuous. The men that are to come here must be well-versed in the natural sciences, in order to be able to convince with reason the errors that these people have on these matters’.<sup>3</sup> Variation in opinion was fairly common amongst the early Jesuit letters, pointing to the subjectivity that has defined the Society of Jesus across its history yet which has been underexamined regarding the early period in India. As Antoni Üçerler noted in the context of East Asia, ‘from the outset there was no clear agreement among the Jesuits regarding the best way to preach the Gospel. In fact, it took them at least several decades to formulate and

---

<sup>1</sup> Francis Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola, 27 Jan 1545, *MX*, i, p. 362; ‘tuiuessen fuerças corporales iuntamente con las espirituales; porque pera estas partes de infieles no son neçessarias letras’.

<sup>2</sup> Francis Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola, 27 Jan 1545, *MX*, i, p. 362; ‘Las personas que no tienen talento para confessar, predicar ó fazer cosas annexas á la Companhia...farían mucho seruiço en estas partes’.

<sup>3</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Dec 1550, *Documenta Indica* [henceforth *DI*] eds. Josef Wicki and John Gomes (18 vols, Rome, 1948-88), ii, p. 127; ‘Nam crea V.R. que, pera fazer fruito nesta terra, bastão quaisquer homens, mas hé nesessario homens asi doutos como vertuosos. Hos omens que quá an-de andar, am-de ser mui eixersitados nas siencias naturais, pera poder com rezõis naturais comvmser os erros que estas gemtes neles tem’.

refine their vision'.<sup>4</sup> The same can be said of the Indian subcontinent. These individual differences are vital to understanding the development and limits of missionary accommodation, and therefore serve as the focus in this chapter.

In the context of India, the conventional wisdom has been that the missionary accommodation method did not appear until the mission of Roberto de Nobili, yet I shall show that components of the method appeared in India during the first decade of Jesuit activity. I seek to draw out these accommodationist components by analysing the various attitudes of the earliest Jesuits in India towards their mission as provided by the Society, the diverse communities of the Indian littoral, and the Portuguese state (*Estado da Índia*) and its officials and institutions. Noting the objectives and priorities inherent in their decisions, I will investigate how Xavier and his companions proceeded in regards to obedience and autonomy, education, and language; how they interpreted their role under the Portuguese patronage (*Padroado Real*) and amongst the lay settlers, especially in the context of the first martyrdom; and how they viewed the Hindus, Christians, Muslims in light of cultural and racial differences. The unique challenges of this first decade serve as a pivotal starting point for investigating the elements of missionary accommodation, partially because some of the values that became characteristically Jesuit—obedience, education, language study, cosmopolitanism, cultural openness—were not foregone conclusions by any means at this time. As mentioned, Jesuit distinctiveness did not systematically equate to accommodation, nevertheless these values helped foster its development.

In the historiography of missionary accommodation, the early period has been often neglected or overshadowed by the more outright practitioners of the methodology such as Nobili. One exception has been Francis Xavier, whom many have associated with the

---

<sup>4</sup> Üçerler, 'Jesuits in East Asia', p. 28.

development of accommodation, albeit mostly in the context of his missions to Japan.<sup>5</sup> Certainly his attempts to interpret his audience and adapt both his message and appearance to better suit them indicate a level of accommodation more than most Jesuits. However, through his attitudes towards cultural observation and the necessity of language comprehension, as well as regarding such distinctive Jesuit concepts as the value of education and balance between obedience and autonomy, Xavier did not transform himself or his mission much at all in any sense similar to the approach taken by Nobili decades later. It was only through his inaugural entry into Japan that Xavier began to understand the limits of his own methods and therefore sought to accommodate the cultural norms of speaking and dressing like those with whom he sought to gain favour.<sup>6</sup> I argue that Xavier's preference for constant traveling and preaching over fixed locations and the opportunities they provided—e.g. regular education of local children in doctrine and other subjects, committed study of language and culture, even discipline—in conjunction with his practices towards indigenous Indians served as limits to his own development of accommodation. Mission was the apostolic calling to go out, but obedience demanded that they return.

As mentioned, the Jesuit way of proceeding is an ideal perhaps best seen in its plural form, in that there exists a variety of ways in which Jesuits may go about their ministry. Although European personnel and institutions influenced the Society of Jesus, the missions *in partibus infidelium* often dealt with more complex issues than those encountered in the traditional bounds of Christendom. The unique context of the *Estado da Índia*, in contrast to the Iberian political dominions in the Americas, also created a mission experience beset by inconsistent oversight and management difficulties on the part of Portuguese

---

<sup>5</sup> Ines Županov's definition of 'accommodatio' is one example, cf. *Dictionnaire des faits religieux*, pp. 1-4; Joan-Pau Rubiés argues the first iteration of the method in India was through Nobili, cf. 'Concept of Cultural Dialogue', pp. 244-5.

<sup>6</sup> Rubiés, 'Concept of Cultural Dialogue', pp. 244-5.

administrators and officials acting within the *Padroado*. Early problems with Jesuit central organisation and transoceanic communication contributed to additional feelings of uncertainty regarding the objectives and procedures of ministry expected by the Superior General and provincial and regional superiors—and even frustration in the case of some like Lancilotto, as we will see. Consequently, early Jesuits in these locales responded in various ways to the issues arising in their appointed regional communities, the cultural and religious diversity of local populations, and the difficulties faced in navigating imperial, ecclesiastical and intra-organisational politics. These factors steered some members towards practices that later characterised the method of missionary accommodation in a way that their saintly example Francis Xavier did not realise.

### **India on the Eve of Jesuit Arrivals**

The main areas of India where a majority of Jesuit missionaries laboured, and which serve as the primary regional focus here, include the port cities of the Malabar coast such as Calicut and Cochin, the islands of Goa on the Konkan coast, and the Fishery Coast on the southern tip of the Indian subcontinent. The coast of Malabar served as the earliest site of contact between indigenous communities and the Portuguese, beginning with the arrival of Vasco da Gama at Calicut (modern Kozhikode) in 1498, where the Portuguese established their first *feitoria*, a factory or trading post. Before the Portuguese intrusion, conflicts over territorial control in the interior occurred predominantly between the principalities of Calicut and Cochin (modern Kochi), while the coastal areas contained a vibrant mercantile economy characterised by cosmopolitan culture, religious tolerance, and a relatively peaceful network of trading ports.<sup>7</sup> Similar expressions of kingship throughout southern

---

<sup>7</sup> Ananya Chakravarti, *Empire of Apostles*, p. 32.

India involved groups of ruling warriors that ‘developed more coherent and centrally organised state systems’ which included Travancore and Cochin, whose regional expansion was driven by external pressures, such as that of the Portuguese.<sup>8</sup>

Primarily, the economic enterprise was in black pepper and rice, which brought wealth to the local rulers who controlled these ports and engaged in maritime trade within the Indian Ocean as well as caste groups such as the elite martial Nayars from which some rulers ascended.<sup>9</sup> In Calicut in particular, the cosmopolitan society there consisted of a great number of Muslim merchants who dominated the pepper trade, secured through an established partnership they held with ruling Hindu *samūtiri* raja or *zamorin*. Some Muslims called *paradesi* had origins in Persia, but the other large community of Māppilas, an indigenous group of Malayalam-speaking Muslims, controlled much of the regional trade of the Malabar coast as well as the city of Colombo in Sri Lanka. Determined to break the Indian Ocean monopoly and simultaneously degrade the Muslim population of the Malabar coast, the Portuguese established additional trading posts in southwestern India. In the face of a rising economic threat, the *zamorin* sought to preserve his lucrative enterprise, and when the Māppilas searched out support for their resistance to the Portuguese, the Calicut raja offered his protection.<sup>10</sup> This arrangement was nevertheless partly forced, as the Māppilas received harassment from the Portuguese in Cochin, who had built their first fortress in the city in 1503 after securing a collaborative alliance with Raja Tirumumpara.<sup>11</sup> Any diplomacy between the Calicut *zamorin* and the Portuguese was further dissolved when the Kōlathiri raja of the port city of Cannanore saw the opportunity to leverage their own commercial interests against the Mappilas, allowing the Portuguese to establish a factory as

---

<sup>8</sup> Bayly, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings*, p. 62.

<sup>9</sup> Bayly, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings*, p. 19.

<sup>10</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 21.

<sup>11</sup> Bayly, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings*, p. 258. Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 22.

well as a fortress there. Connecting these principalities of Cochin and Cannanore—as well as a third city, Kollam (also known as Quilon or Coullão)—was the vassalage to the *zamorin* that all aimed to break through alliance with the Portuguese. The end result was the construction of factories and forts across many of the Malabar ports, from the larger ones already mentioned to lesser domains such as Chaliyam (or Chale) and Cranganore, which enabled European commercial, political, and importantly religious excursions across the western Indian littoral.<sup>12</sup>

Amongst the Malabar populations lived the unique community of Thomas Christians, whose own legend claimed that they descended from the elite Keralan Nambudiri Brahman caste who had been converted by St. Thomas in the year 50. The group established themselves in the pepper-trading entrepôts of Kerala, serving the Hindu lords of the southern Malabar, likely intermarrying with the influential Nayars in the process, and were rewarded with land and titles.<sup>13</sup> The place of the indigenous Thomas Christians within Malabar society held unique significance in respect to the Muslim and Hindu communities. Prior to Portuguese arrival, these Christians were identified as *Nasrani Mappila*, a combination of the Malayalam word for ‘Nazarene’ in use as well in Persia (from where they had emigrated to southern India) and the honorific title of *Mappila*, which although more closely meaning ‘brother-in-law’ also referred to the local Muslims.<sup>14</sup> This correlation between indigenous Christians and Muslims on the Malabar coast by Malayalam-speaking Hindus displayed local consideration of different religious customs as part of an established social structure, one which preceded the Portuguese and mendicant intrusion.

---

<sup>12</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, pp. 22-3.

<sup>13</sup> Bayly, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings*, pp. 244-47

<sup>14</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 291.

The Thomas Christians had formed an organised church via the introduction of Nestorian priests from Sasanian Persia into India, who brought their distinct (and by Western standards, heretical) theology on the nature of Christ. These Christians initially welcomed the arrival of the Portuguese, as they were able to provide support to counteract existing competition with Muslims within the lucrative black pepper trade.<sup>15</sup> Yet their theological differences had sparked some discord between their bishops—who were appointed by the patriarchate in Mesopotamia (modern Iraq)—and Portuguese officials, the Franciscans, and after 1542 the Jesuits as well.<sup>16</sup> Although Nestorian bishops of the Thomas Christians, as they came from southwest Asia, spoke Syriac, the lay clerical priests (*kattanars*) followed a hereditary appointment among the Malayalam-speaking population. Additionally, lay members appeared aesthetically and culturally similar to their diverse cohabitantes, which among other factors maintained their social connection with the greater multireligious community. Once the Portuguese arrived, they were thenceforth identified as foreign Christians, *surianos* after their Syrian connections, or ‘*cristãos de São Tomé*’. Naming conventions proved the first step of many by Portuguese ecclesiastical officials to supplant the Nestorians’ position as local, socio-culturally commensurable Christians with considerable influence in Malabar society, a Latinisation process which played out over the course of a century. Although the Thomas Christians typically experienced inconsistent liaisons with their bishops from southwest Asia since the earliest converts, the sixteenth century witnessed a remarkable rise in the visitations of Nestorian clerics, causing, as will be shown, some serious conflicts with Portuguese *Padroado* attempts to assimilate the privileged indigenous Christian communities into the Latin rite of the Roman Catholic Church. In one event of note, the fervent priest Álvaro Penteado (fl. 1510-1537) declared

---

<sup>15</sup> Hsia, *World of Catholic Renewal*, p. 201.

<sup>16</sup> Josef Wicki, ‘De Epistolarum Auctoribus’, *DI*, i, p. 43\*; Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 99

the Thomas Christians heretics almost immediately upon arrival in Cochin in 1518, yet he could not mobilise any ecclesiastical or political official to do anything, as neither the Nestorians nor the Portuguese cared for his obstinate and bad-tempered behaviour.<sup>17</sup> The mission later fell to the Franciscans, as described below.

Cochin was one of the most unique port settlements, where the population counted Portuguese merchants and settlers alongside established Jewish families, Thomas Christians, Muslims, and Hindus. Jewish communities had been established on the Malabar Coast well before the arrival of the Portuguese. In the writings of Ibn Battuta from his travels to Malabar in 1342-3, he mentioned the Jewish settlement in the then-fledgling town of Cochin which owed tribute to the larger city of Kollam.<sup>18</sup> An earthquake in the fourteenth century necessitated the demolition and rebuilding of a newer town adjacent to a more suitable harbour protected from the volatile weather patterns of the Indian Ocean, and Cochin's new location ultimately contributed to its growth in trade, which had paled in comparison to the nearby port of Cranganore and its prominence in the pepper trade. This growth also developed out of the alliance made between the raja and both viceroy Dom Francisco Almeida and Afonso de Albuquerque, the latter of which built the first European fort in India at the entry to the harbour. Portuguese control over trade in the Indian Ocean meant that Cochin prospered through the relatively mutually beneficial partnership between João III and the raja.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Sebastião Pires to Dom João III, 16 Dec 1527, *Documentação para a história das missões do Padroado português do Oriente* [henceforth *DHMPPPO*], ed. António da Silva Rêgo (12 vols, Lisbon, 1947-58), ii, p. 144; cf. Giuseppe Marcocci, *A Consciência do Império: Portugal e o seu Mundo (sécs. XV-XVII)* (Coimbra, 2012), p. 381; Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 99; Stephen Neill, *A History of Christianity in India: the Beginnings to AD 1707* (Cambridge, 1984), pp. 196-7. Županov notes that Penteado was a Franciscan, but other sources do not mention his order; besides being called a 'Padre' he is described also as 'sacerdote de missa', but not Friar.

<sup>18</sup> Mehrdad Shokoohy, 'The town of Cochin and its Muslim heritage on the Malabar coast, South India', *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* 8/3 (1998), p. 352.

<sup>19</sup> Duarte Barbosa, *O Livro em que dá relação de que viu e ouviu no Oriente Duarte Barbosa* (Lisbon, 1946), pp. 168-9.

The arrangement stipulated, however, that the area surrounding the *fortaleza* would be under distinct control of the Portuguese, including the enforcement of Christian uniformity, while the raja retained authority over distinct quarters of the city. Given historical precedent of the demographics in Cochin and the economic benefit of commerce there, subsequent rajas insisted on protecting Muslims as well as Jews as their own subjects. As noted by Mehrdad Shokoohy, this protection under the Hindu raja contributed to the situation in which, ‘unlike in Goa, the Muslim community not only continued to survive, but with the later decline of the Portuguese power regained their social position, and increased in number’.<sup>20</sup> Separation of religious communities was not restricted to Jews and Muslims, but also to all non-Christians. The reason for this has been explored most comprehensively by Ângela Barreto Xavier, explaining the two main principles of the early Portuguese *Estado* in the Indian subcontinent as ‘legal autonomy and physical separation’ in ordering the relationship with local populations.<sup>21</sup> Nevertheless, as Alan Strathern notes, the conversion of the raja’s subjects required the same protection; ‘as Christians they were subject to Portuguese law, but as residents or holders of land, they could be subject to the service and fiscal obligations owed to the native lord’.<sup>22</sup> The converse was true for any non-Christians who were able to remain in Portuguese territory. A century later, the French navigator and writer François Pyrard de Laval detailed how this legacy of separation in Cochin had survived, noting that the new town around the fort ‘is very populous as well with Portuguese as Indians, both Christians, of whom there are a large number, and infidels,

---

<sup>20</sup> Shokoohy, ‘Town of Cochin’, pp. 354-5.

<sup>21</sup> Ângela Barreto Xavier, ‘*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos: Law, Religion, and Identity in the Portuguese Kingdom and Empire*’, *Journal of Early Modern History* 15 (2011), p. 260.

<sup>22</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 89.

who, however, are not permitted to exercise their paganism in the town, but have to go outside to places depending upon the King of Cochin'.<sup>23</sup>

The conquest of Goa in 1510 saw Cochin replaced as the Portuguese administrative centre in Asia. However, the commercial relations that existed in Cochin did not translate to the context of Goa, as the subsequent defeat of the Muslim forces under Yusuf Adil Shah gave licence to Afonso de Albuquerque to summarily wipe them out. In his letter to Dom Manuel I, Albuquerque described his victory thus: 'I set fire to the city and put them all to the sword, and for four days continuously your soldiers spilled blood among them; wherever we could find them, no Moor was left alive, and the men filled the mosques with [Muslims] and set fire to them'.<sup>24</sup> Consequently, Goa served as a *tabula rasa* for the Portuguese to establish their Christian kingdom in the East, as the only religion left represented in the islands was that of the *gentios*, who although were infidels were not as heretical through Portuguese eyes as Muslims and Jews. The Jesuit Luís Fróis later used these terms when he recounted how the Muslims of southern India 'came from Mecca and Persia and many other parts to infect and corrupt the poor *gentios* that are a blank slate so to speak (*tanquam tabula rasa*), and they [Muslims] about go imposing on them [*gentios*] the sign of eternal damnation'.<sup>25</sup> Mosques were destroyed, Muslim women converted to Christianity under threat in mass ceremonies and married off to Portuguese settlers.

Much like Portuguese concerns in Cochin, the establishment of the *Estado da Índia* capital in Goa focused on their own military, commercial, and spiritual interests rather than more laborious task of upending existing environmental structures. The village organisation

---

<sup>23</sup> François Pyrard de Laval, *The Voyage of François Pyrard of Laval*, eds. A. Gray and H.C.P. Bell (London, 1888), p. 434f.

<sup>24</sup> Afonso de Albuquerque to Dom Manuel I, 22 Dec 1510, *Cartas de Affonso de Albuquerque, seguidas de documentos que as elucidam*, ed. Raymundo António de Bulhão Pato (6 vols, Lisbon, 1884-1915), i, p. 26; cf. Robinson, *Conversion, Continuity and Change*, p. 46.

<sup>25</sup> Luís Fróis to companions of the College of Sant Antão of Lisbon, 6 Dec 1560, *DMPPPO*, viii, p. 192.

which characterised the islands of Goa was primarily based on Hindu temple administration through which the rents were collected and supported the community economy. These communities were locally led by *gauncars*, who collected taxes and managed the village affairs, yet under the Adil Shah new taxes had been imposed and communal land was confiscated. As Rowena Robinson suggests, ‘perhaps because of this the Hindus, particularly the *gauncars*, welcomed the Portuguese invaders and supported them against the Muslims’.<sup>26</sup> This relationship established from the time of Albuquerque’s conquest equated to preservation of institutions like the village-temple administration and caste norms, and consequently officials such as *gauncars* and *tanadors* (land overseers) and many other land management personnel survived within the *Estado*.<sup>27</sup> The dominant caste groups who controlled much of the land included the Gaud Saraswat Brahmans and the Kshatriya caste Marathas, whose maintenance of the regional system afforded some autonomy and means for resistance.<sup>28</sup> Nevertheless, over time these positions became contested as Portuguese officials required Christians to replace Hindu administrators as a means for reasserting authority and encouraging the conversion of indigenous Goans, a topic further explored in subsequent chapters.

In the farthest reaches of the Indian subcontinent, the Fishery Coast (*Costa da Pescaria*, in Portuguese) served as one of the major battlegrounds of the early missions. The most dominant state was the Vijayanagar kingdom, which lorded over a number of semi-independent princes of the Malabar, Fishery, and Coromandel coasts, and whose territory by 1547 extended to Cape Comorin. Within the Portuguese sources detailing the coastal regions, three other kingdoms were described—Quilon, Travancore, and Cape Comorin.

---

<sup>26</sup> Robinson, *Conversion, Continuity and Change*, p. 43.

<sup>27</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India*, p. 8.

<sup>28</sup> Paul Axelrod and Michelle A. Fuerch, ‘Flight of the Deities: Hindu Resistance in Portuguese Goa’ *Modern Asian Studies* 30/2 (1996), p. 402

During the early decades of the sixteenth century, alliances shifted between the Portuguese and the various local kingdoms as well as amongst themselves and the smaller *svarūpams* (headmen), also called the Pandyas. In the process attempts to increase their domains led to conflicts, such as the war between the kings of Quilon and Travancore and the Pandyas, where besides requests to the Portuguese both sides also sought the assistance of mercenaries.<sup>29</sup> The most famous of these were the *vadugai* ('northerners', in Tamil), or Badagas as the Portuguese called them, who were Telugu-speaking Kshatriya warriors originally from the southern Deccan plateau. For the Jesuits, the *vadugai* created many problems for the missions in their hired raids on the Fishery Coast, made particularly difficult due to the Christian convert communities there—the Paravas.

In 1532, the headman of the Paravas, a pearl-fisher caste under the hegemony of the king of Travancore, positioned himself amongst the negotiations with the Portuguese, seeing an opportunity through the foreign power to secure protection from the Muslim sultanate located at nearby Korkai, as well as to gain greater autonomy.<sup>30</sup> The Paravas converted *en masse*, yet they became mostly Christians in name only, as the shortage of priests and catechists led to the entire community possessing no knowledge of their new faith.<sup>31</sup> This very issue would launch the interest of the Jesuits and specifically Francis Xavier to conduct missions along the Fishery Coast, where they viewed great opportunities for realising their 'manner of proceeding'.

---

<sup>29</sup> Georg Schurhammer, S.J., *Orientalia*, ed. László Szilas, S.J. (Rome, 1963), pp. 272-85.

<sup>30</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 90.

<sup>31</sup> Neill, *History of Christianity in India*, pp. 140-3. Sanjay Subrahmanyam, *The Portuguese Empire in Asia, 1500-1700: A Political and Economic History* (London, 1993), p. 92; cf. Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, pp. 90-1; Bayly, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings*, pp. 321-40; S. Manickam, 'The politico-economic implications of the religious conversions of the paravas in the gulf of Mannar, AD 1532-1552', *Tamil Civilization* 1 (1983), pp. 57-73; Kenneth McPherson, 'Uma história de duas conversões: deus, a cobiça e o desenvolvimento de novas comunidades na região do Oceano Índico', *Oceanos* 34 (1998), pp. 74-85.

*Understanding of Caste*

Underscoring the context of southern India, as with the whole subcontinent, was the concept of caste. One of the more well-established and accepted aspects of caste is the Portuguese origin of the term—*casta*. Besides this rather simple connection, scholarship in the past has predominantly neglected Portuguese historiography and rather centred on the British colonial perception and classification of caste as the harbinger of the complex system's reification. Not only from a Portuguese perspective but also a particularly Jesuit one, however, sixteenth and seventeenth century normative assessments of caste were accompanied by some comprehension of the processes that governed Indian society. This was especially true of the *História do Malavar* (1615) of Diogo Gonçalves, written half a century after the first Jesuits arrived in that region. Gonçalves' work proved to be the first attempt to document the history of the Society in India in the areas outside of Goa, accompanied by his meticulous description of the caste system, and the various categories particular to the Malabar coastline and the inland *Serra*, or mountains, of modern-day Kerala. A limited comprehension of the Malayalam language allowed for considerable description of each trade, occupation, and social status within this regional society, and how people conducted social activities like daily interaction and marriage according to customs and traditions. Naturally the purpose of providing such detail was the 'refutation of some errors and abuses of Malabar in government and political customs', as the title of his third book put it.<sup>32</sup>

In line with more recent scholarship on the construction of caste of India, European observations during the period of early Jesuit missions evinced an understanding of the significance and formulation of caste practices across the diverse landscape of southern

---

<sup>32</sup> Diogo Gonçalves, *História do Malavar (Hs. Goa 58 des Arch. Rom S.I.)*, ed. Josef Wicki (Münster, 1955), p. v.

India.<sup>33</sup> General perceptions of the primary caste groups—Brahman, Kshatriya, Vaishya, and Sudra—as well as the more local divisions appear within some early documentation by Jesuits, through which missionaries described concerns over restrictions on marriage, personal contact, and notions of purity, all which presented difficulties in the pursuit of conversions.<sup>34</sup> Although some clerics believed that conversion released the person from caste distinctions and the social norms which accompanied it, the majority of early converts came from the lower castes (or even untouchable status, *Dalits* as termed today) and therefore already did not participate in many ritual traditions nor access sacred sites. In fact, it seems that as conversions continued amongst the lower caste groups Roman Christianity took on the social connotations of impurity previously attributed to them as Hindus.<sup>35</sup> Thus as missionaries became more aware of extant social systems and the cultural significance of caste, they focused on the opposite end of this social hierarchy, preferring Brahmans and Kshatriyas as a means for elevating the standing of Christianity in southern Indian society.

Their preferences certainly fit the prevailing caste norms of the period where, rather than the anachronistic term of Hinduism, a prevailing Brahmanism held the greatest influence. In reality, as Susan Bayly notes, ‘caste identities were extremely malleable, and the role of the Brahman was that of catalyst rather than a representative of a dominant hierarchy’.<sup>36</sup> Jesuits did not quite comprehend the former trend, but certainly recognised quickly the power held by Brahmans. This caste group had been singled out early on as the ‘priestly’ class, and therefore viewed as arbiters of gentile knowledge in India. Nevertheless, as pagan religious experts, they were also viewed as ‘instruments of Satan’

---

<sup>33</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 91; cf. Nicholas Dirks, *Castes of Mind: Colonialism and the Making of Modern India* (Princeton, 2001); Will Sweetman, *Mapping Hinduism: ‘Hinduism’ and the Study of Indian Religion, 1600-1776* (Wiesbaden, 2003); cf. Barreto Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*.

<sup>34</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 92.

<sup>35</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, pp. 92-4.

<sup>36</sup> Bayly, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings*, p. 70.

and earned considerable derision by many missionaries not only because of this diabolical connection but also what the European clerics viewed as the disingenuous creators of a social hierarchy atop which they placed themselves.<sup>37</sup> Equally troublesome was the assignment of the Portuguese foreigners, in Tamil *parangi*, at the bottom of this classification system. Thus realising the futility in upending caste distinctions, Jesuit missionaries over time came to favour the Hindu ‘priestly’ knowledge and reinforce the pre-eminent Brahmanism in Indian society by focusing their conversion efforts on Brahmans, privileging membership in the Society to them over the lower castes.<sup>38</sup> Additionally, Brahmanical influence on the ritual practices of typically higher caste groups, such as the use of the sacred thread (or *linha* in Portuguese), led to the inclusion of Kshatriyas in some contexts, such as the conversion of the King of Tanur, discussed in the next chapter.<sup>39</sup>

### **Pre-Mission Perspectives and Personalities**

Before even the idea of India became a possibility for missions, let alone those of the Jesuits, the issues faced in Europe and specifically on the Iberian Peninsula affected the course of Christian proselytism and ministry. In Stuart Schwartz’s study of the history of toleration within the Iberian imperial administrative centres of metropole and periphery, he emphasizes how the doctrine of *extra ecclesiam nulla salus*, or ‘no salvation outside the church’, placed a burden on those who, either willingly or unwillingly, became subjects to the Christian *auctoritas* and its concern for uniformity, conformity, and salvation. As Schwartz remarks, ‘the voyages of European expansion, the great global missionary effort, and the reform of the Church were all carried out in the shadow of the underlying question

---

<sup>37</sup> Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, p. 129. Cf. Lodovico de Varthema, *The Itinerary of Ludovico di Varthema of Bologna from 1502 to 1508*, tr. John Winter Jones (London, 1863).

<sup>38</sup> Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, p. 133.

<sup>39</sup> Robinson, *Conversion, Continuity and Change*, p. 34.

of God's plan of redemption and the appropriate road to individual salvation'.<sup>40</sup> In the wake of the Protestant Reformation, missionaries and settlers stood on the frontier of a changing Europe and her overseas territories now also seeking to regain the collection of souls lost to Protestantism.

While Europe underwent intensive theological debate, political tension, and military conflict, its community of the faithful at home and abroad faced stricter regulations on the proliferation of more open thought and discourse. Groups of individuals in communion with the Church nevertheless held varied perspectives, with the non-traditionalists becoming what Schwartz distinguishes as relativists (finding some truth in multiple religions), universalists (salvation extended to all), others who disagreed with the strict exclusivity of the Tridentine reforms, as well as sceptics and atheists. Given the reinvigorated Inquisition within Spain and the recently instituted version in Portugal in 1536, charged with the goal of ensuring conformity amongst converts (particularly former Jews) and eradicating heresy and heterodoxy, this variation proves even more intriguing. Examples in Spain and elsewhere in Europe have been highly documented in more recent times, as many Inquisitional court studies have revealed the nuanced theological interpretations of some European individuals.<sup>41</sup> Most early modern Christian societies assumed that political stability was dependent on religious uniformity; heretical and heterodox thought were seen as destructive to the common good. Portugal was no exception. Yet the early sixteenth

---

<sup>40</sup> Stuart Schwartz, *All Can Be Saved: Religious Tolerance and Salvation in the Iberian Atlantic World* (New Haven, 2009), p. 3.

<sup>41</sup> Cf. Sarah Tilchman Nalle, *Mad for God: Bartolome Sanchez, the Secret Messiah of Cardenete* (Charlottesville, 2001). Nalle details the Inquisitional trial of Sanchez, whose views provide further evidence of the distinctions Schwartz mentions. Cf. Richard L. Kagan, *Lucrecia's Dreams: Politics and Prophecy in Sixteenth-Century Spain* (Berkeley, 1990). Georg Schurhammer, *Francis Xavier: His Life. His Times*, tr. M. Joseph Costelloe (4 vols, Rome, 1973-82) provides a lengthy digression from the biography of the Jesuit saint to describe a number of Jews from Portugal and Spain, the latter fleeing the Inquisition there, who had been accused of subverting authority, pp. 620-696. Of course cf. Carlo Ginzburg, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller*, tr. John and Anne Tedeschi (Baltimore, 1992); John Jeffries Martin, *Venice's Hidden Enemies: Italian Heretics in a Renaissance City* (Baltimore, 2004), among others.

century had initiated interior reflection on matters of faith that would create a novel range of responses, not least among figures such as Ignatius of Loyola.

Although Schwartz does not consider Asia in comparison, the threads of Iberian toleration, relativism, and dissidence remind us of the diversity of opinions and cultural traditions in Europe and how they influenced missionaries. Other scholars such as Wolfgang Reinhard have reflected upon the impact of shifting European ideologies on missions and lay cultural encounters, using the case of the Spanish Indies to point out the complicity of clerics in the colonial vision. Going forward, Reinhard's point proves significant here: 'we find, particularly in the sixteenth century, a complex and moreover constantly changing set of attitudes [toward the Other] into which it is often difficult to fit precisely any given individual'.<sup>42</sup> This certainly characterises the situation in India at the introduction of the Society to the *Estado*.

Ines Županov argues that the context of pre-1540s India has been 'defined as an early period of religious and social permissiveness or even tolerance', which ended with the arrival of the Jesuits.<sup>43</sup> Portuguese control in western India involved 'intense Christianisation' during what Ronnie Hsia describes as the second period of Catholic expansion in the subcontinent, starting in 1530 and ending around 1600. At this time, the 'direct colonial rule' in the islands of Goa and the adjacent region intensified the campaign of violent conversions, ecclesiastical institutionalisation, and geographical reach of missions, all which generated a naturally more hostile imposition of political and religious control.<sup>44</sup> On the heels of the surge for religious uniformity with the establishment of the Inquisition in Lisbon in 1536 and other Portuguese cities soon thereafter, as well as

---

<sup>42</sup> Wolfgang Reinhard, 'Missionaries, humanists and natives in the sixteenth-century Spanish Indies – a failed encounter of two worlds?' *Renaissance Studies* 6/3-4 (1992), p. 360.

<sup>43</sup> Županov, "'One civility, but multiple religions'", p. 289.

<sup>44</sup> Hsia, *World of Catholic Renewal*, pp. 200-1.

particularly fervent campaign to embody the spirit of Catholic or Counter Reformation, similar efforts took place in India. Collaborative efforts by the governor, archbishop, and vicar general initiated both the first *auto-da-fé* in 1539 through a makeshift tribunal and the destruction of all Hindu temples and idols throughout the islands of Goa (*ilhas da Goa*, or Tiswadi) the following year.<sup>45</sup> Supplanting the local *gauncar* estate network, recently-erected churches and religious confraternities now received the rents which were once collected for temple maintenance.<sup>46</sup>

Closely involved with this programme were the Franciscans, the first religious order to arrive in India in 1518. Prior to their arrival, however, a number of crucial developments had occurred within the Iberian Peninsula that affected the order; namely, as part of the spiritual renewal of the fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, a stricter observance of the Rule of St. Francis by followers of Juan de Guadalupe within the Franciscan provinces of San Gabriel in Spain and Piedade in Portugal birthed friars of a particular zeal who appealed to both Iberian crowns. They stuck to the traditional habit, went about barefoot, and kept a strict diet and programme of fasting. For the Spanish, these men led the first mission to New Spain in 1524, while the Portuguese friars became the *piadosos*, named for their province, who formed the earliest group patronised by Dom João III to send to India.<sup>47</sup>

In 1538, two of the most notable *piadosos*, Frei Vicente de Lagos (fl. 1538-50) and Fr. Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque, arrived in Goa following two distinct paths. Frei Vicente departed straight for Cranganore, where he founded a college for Thomas Christians in 1540 that counted one hundred indigenous pupils by 1549, an achievement which earned him praise from the Jesuit Francis Xavier upon his visitation to the area yet also came with the

---

<sup>45</sup> Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 44; for the *auto* held in Goa, cf. 'Auto contra o Padre Diogo de Moraes', 6 June 1539, *DHMPPPO*, ii, pp. 265-8.

<sup>46</sup> 'Destino a dar às rendas dos pagodes' 30 Jun 1541, *DHMPPPO*, ii, pp. 293-305; cf. Charles Borges, 'Foreign Jesuits and Native Resistance', p. 70.

<sup>47</sup> Alan Strathern, '*Os Piedosos*', pp. 856-7.

recommendation for a Jesuit to help with the affairs there.<sup>48</sup> Albuquerque on the other hand remained in the capital, as he had sailed to India for the purpose of serving as the inaugural Bishop of Goa. Thus the years during which the church in India exerted more spiritual vigour, it was these Franciscan *piedosos* at the centre of it, not only in Goa but also other Portuguese settlements and indigenous principalities as well as southwest Sri Lanka. Vicar General Miguel Vaz Coutinho (fl. 1533-47) helped to foment this movement. Though not part of the Friars Minor, had great esteem for the *piedosos*, requesting in 1545 that Franciscans specifically from the Province of Piedade be sent to India to bolster the ministry there.<sup>49</sup> Through their partnership, the *piedosos* and Coutinho promoted the forceful policies to encourage conversion amongst the *gentios* of the islands of Goa, a campaign which involved temple destruction and the prohibition of Hindu rites and ceremonies. This perhaps was not unexpected, as Alan Strathern notes that chronicles of the Franciscan movement suggested ‘a great lust for destroying heathen holy places had always been characteristic of the *piedosos*’.<sup>50</sup>

The Franciscans serve as an interesting comparison to the Jesuits highlighted here; in contrast to the Ignatian spirituality of forming an ‘indifferent’ individual and the greater organisational flexibility of the Society of Jesus, the Franciscans’ remained tied to their monastic and ascetic life, which created tensions with the *piedoso* zeal and expressions of piety in mission. More importantly for discussions here, the Franciscan dynamism relied heavily on their association with their patrons and their reciprocated support in the education and spiritual well-being of the laity, most especially the Portuguese aristocracy and elites. These connections continued in Asia, where their institutions served the families of the elite

---

<sup>48</sup> Francis Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola, 12 Jan 1549, *MX*, i, pp. 480-1; cf. Carlos Mercês de Melo, *The Recruitment and Formation of the Native Clergy in India: An Historico-canonical Study* (Lisbon, 1955); Strathern, ‘*Os Piedosos*’, p. 857.

<sup>49</sup> Strathern, ‘*Os Piedosos*’, pp. 857-8.

<sup>50</sup> Strathern, ‘*Os Piedosos*’, p. 859.

of the *Estado*, ties which Xavier and Županov name as ‘the reason why their interests were closer to those of the “colonizers”, whose spokesmen they easily became, frequently representing their anxieties and goals’.<sup>51</sup> As we will see here and in subsequent chapters, despite the differences in clerical ideology and frequent detachment from the affairs of the *casado* elite, many Jesuits nevertheless served some of those same interests.

Amongst the climate of vigorous Christianisation, Francis Xavier arrived. Despite the common association of the Jesuits with these programmes, we nevertheless find through the individuals surveyed below signs of the mentalities Schwartz describes.<sup>52</sup> There were many ways of proceeding, and as John O’Malley has rightly cautioned the Society of Jesus was not exclusively a tool of the Counter Reformation, even if Francis Xavier often exuded the resurgent Catholicism mentality. Most modern studies that have focused on Xavier have done so with little critical analysis. The most renowned scholar of Xavier, the German Jesuit Georg Schurhammer conducted a magisterial work on the saint’s life and writings yet gilded it with the hagiographical views one might expect from mid-nineteenth century Jesuit scholarship. Recent historiography of Xavier has rightly put this to task but has not thoroughly analysed his attitudes in light of the practice of missionary accommodation. In a similar sense, Xavier’s companions have often been cast aside as complements to the memory of this Apostle of the Indies, their writings serving as contrast to the extensive travels and purported successes he enjoyed. I intend here to focus on a sample of individuals in conversation with one another, as they often were, in order to better understand how general decisions of the Jesuits in India were made in favour of one opinion or another, as well as in what instances certain ideas suggestive of missionary accommodation failed to

---

<sup>51</sup> Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, p. 170.

<sup>52</sup> Cf. Županov, “One civility, but multiple religions”, p. 289.

come to fruition. Before diving into the attitudes evident within their writings, I first want to briefly look at these particular individuals.

### *Xavier and his Companions*

The first Jesuit missionary to India, Francis Xavier initially came to Portugal to serve Dom João III with his companion Simão Rodrigues, both named papal nuncios by Paul III in July 1540.<sup>53</sup> The ill Rodrigues had to remain in Portugal, but Xavier commenced the *carreira da India* in 1541 with a number of privileges granted by the pope: to appoint apostolic notaries, absolve clerics of serious crimes and excommunication as well as heretics and schismatics, and ‘authorize the foundation and endowment of monasteries, churches, hospitals for the poor, and other pious establishments’.<sup>54</sup> Xavier received his initial assignment to the subcontinent as ministry to Portuguese subjects to ensure that they were properly cared for spiritually on their journey, and in the first year in India he concerned himself greatly with the affairs of Europeans living in the Goan islands. Working at hospitals for Portuguese families, preaching, and offering mass, the initial concerns of Jesuit priests in Goa centred on European salvation. Yet once outside the centre of the *Estado*, Xavier and others that followed ministered to peoples with a much more diverse set of religions and experiences. Along with his position of Jesuit superior in India, he often assumed a position of superiority in ecclesiastical matters as he made clear his intentions to go where he thought he was most needed.

Around the time Xavier left for India, the Urbino-born Niccolò Lancilotto joined the Society of Jesus in Rome in 1541, after which he was sent to Coimbra to begin his studies in July 1542. His writing reflects the educational shortcomings of not only the early Jesuit

---

<sup>53</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision of India*, p. 10.

<sup>54</sup> Schurhammer, *Francis Xavier*, p. 715.

order but also himself, as he did not know Latin or Portuguese all that well, despite both his assignment in Goa as a teacher of Virgil and Terence and his years of advanced study in Portugal. After entering the priesthood, he departed for India in spring 1545 and arrived that September, and it was there he would live out his last twelve years. Lancilotto was more suited to the administration of colleges and schools, as he was often sick and unaccustomed to the environment of southern India, serving as rector of the Colleges at Goa (1545-48) and Kollam (1549-58).<sup>55</sup> As will be shown, some of his opinions informed the development of policy by Ignatius and codified into the Constitutions, and in particular his views on the importance of language in missions derived in part from an understanding of the inherent linguistic difficulties of southern India. His extensive praise of Henrique Henriques in this regard, discussed below, is most telling.<sup>56</sup>

The personality trait of his perhaps most recognised by scholars is his penchant for anxiety and pessimistic perspective on the overall condition of the missions, yet this is better seen as self-deprecation and illness rather than displeasure with his assignment. As Josef Wicki claims, he ‘often painted all things in a dark colour’, but much can be gleaned from the negative views, as and when they are imbued with critical suggestions and requests.<sup>57</sup> He wrote far more often than any of his contemporaries, in that while most were required to correspond on an annual basis, Lancilotto sent at least two letters per year, and even more once he transferred to the more remote (in terms of ecclesiastical support) area of Kollam. In doing so, his correspondence provides an opportunity to comprehend what major problems arose in the context of early missions, as opposed to the embellished narratives written by others to the edification of their confreres in Coimbra and Rome. In many ways

---

<sup>55</sup> Wicki, ‘De epistolarum auctoribus’, pp. 43\*-44\*; Agostino Aurati, *Nicolao Lancilotto: Un gesuita urbinato del secolo XVI in India benemerito della cultura* (Urbino, 1974), pp. 16-19.

<sup>56</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 29 Oct 1552, *DI*, ii, pp. 382-3.

<sup>57</sup> Wicki, ‘De epistolarum auctoribus’, p. 44\*.

the more honest presentation of tribulation and discontent provides a healthy corrective to the glorified depictions of life and ministry in India made by others. Despite his less scientific or ethnographic approach, Lancilotto's less polished perceptions elucidate his understanding of the more appropriate methods not only for success but also for respect amongst the local populations.

The second Italian to have an impact at this time was Antonio Crimali, who joined the Society on 9 April 1542 and departed for India the same year as his compatriot. He wrote remarkably fewer letters than Lancilotto, yet this was also influenced by his early death four years after his arrival, around 15 June 1549. Crimali served as the regional superior of the *Costa da Pescaria* missions, otherwise known as the Fishery Coast, which extended from Cape Comorin to Tuticorin along the southernmost tip of India. Killed by a group of *vadugai*, warriors from Vijayanagara who made frequent incursions into the southern coasts, his debated martyrdom had implications for the responsibilities of Portuguese officials as viewed by some Jesuits, not to mention its consequences for future missions, as will be discussed.

Henrique Henriques (fl. 1546-1600) served the longest of this early group of companions and had one of the most lasting, yet perhaps least recognised, impacts on the missions to the subcontinent. A descendent of *conversos*, his place within the Society was debated at times by others, despite the fact that his tireless efforts to master indigenous languages produced multiple texts which proved integral to successive Jesuits to develop more advanced literature. A Konkani grammar published in 1567 would aid Thomas Stephens (fl. 1579-1619) in his *Arte da Lingoa Canarim* drafted around 1600, while Henriques' dictionary, confessionary, and doctrinal in Tamil allowed for continued missions to work through the local languages. Henriques became regional superior upon the death of Crimali, a post which he held until Alessandro Valignano relieved him of this position to

allow for more concerted linguistic studies for Tamil, or the *lingua malavar* as he called it. An initial reliance on local interpreters clearly had some impact on his approach, as he later sought to establish a confraternity that would not only include women but also indigenous auxiliaries.<sup>58</sup> Although a key part of this early collection of Jesuits, his deeds often spoke louder than his words, with his letters figuring somewhat less here.

### **Jesuit Attitudes towards Mission Responsibilities**

On the eve of Francis Xavier's journey and during the first years in India, the perception of the cultural climate there played into his view of ministry and mission. In one of his final letters before departing Lisbon, Xavier wrote to his companions Rome requesting that they pray about his future cohabitation and conversation with gentiles.<sup>59</sup> Rumours amongst the court affected his preconceived notions about the people of India and the state of them and their souls. Yet Xavier also saw promise, for the Portuguese viceroy Martim Afonso de Sousa told him that 'in India, on an island of only gentiles without mixture of Moors or Jews, we were to produce great fruit, and he does not indicate difficulty in making the King of that island Christian along with his kingdom'.<sup>60</sup> Famously, Xavier foresaw his contribution to India in a dream from 1537 while in Rome, carrying 'on his shoulders a black Indian like those from Ethiopia', his body nearly crushed under the weight of the man.<sup>61</sup> The symbolism is palpable: the tremendous expectation of transporting the heathens

---

<sup>58</sup> Henrique Henriques, 'Statutes of the Confraternity of Charity', 1578, *DI*, xi, pp. 70-123.

<sup>59</sup> Francis Xavier to Fathers Ignatius of Loyola and Jean Codure, 18 Mar 1541, *MX*, i, p. 240.

<sup>60</sup> Francis Xavier to Fathers Ignatius of Loyola and Jean Codure, 18 Mar 1541, *MX*, i, p. 239.

<sup>61</sup> Sebastião Gonçalves, S.J., *Primeira Parte da História dos Religiosos da Companhia de Jesus e do que fizeram com a divina graça na conversão dos inféis a nossa sancta fee catholica nos reynos e provincias da Índia Oriental (Original, Bibli. Nacional, Fundo Geral 915)[henceforth Primeira parte]* (1614), ed. Joseph Wicki, S.J. (3 vols, Coimbra, 1957), i, p. 45. Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, pp. 35-7, notes that this particular phrasing differed from the earliest account given by Diego Laínez to Pedro de Ribadaneyra, which only described 'un indio', cf. Ignatius of Loyola, *Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola et de Societatis Iesu initiis*, eds. Dionysius Fernández Zapico, S.J., and Candidus de Dalmases, S.J. (4 vols, Rome, 1943-65), ii, pp. 381-2.

of India (furthermore the ‘Indies’, or all of Asia) toward salvation would be the greatest struggle of his life, and indeed this would bring about his death. Not only did this dream propel his tireless peregrinations across Asia to the point of great personal sacrifice, the imagined version and later representations of his vision also fashioned a picture—quite literally, in the form of prayer cards—of the great travails that awaited the Jesuits who followed his example.<sup>62</sup> Remarking on his motivations, Xavier wrote to Francisco Mansilhas that ‘to best serve in this life, we have to be pilgrims to go to all parts where we might be able to serve them more’.<sup>63</sup>

While this certainly corresponded to the model set by the early apostles like Saint Paul, wandering was not exactly the most suitable for a foundling religious order with no practical experience in any mission environment not least outside of Europe, not least especially from a superior of the missions throughout Asia. Loyola would later come to worry about this predilection of Xavier’s for constant peregrination, but the Superior General did not rein him in sooner.<sup>64</sup> Indeed the Jesuits, despite Xavier’s positive language about the prospects for propagation of the faith, struggled to determine the right ways of proceeding. Returning to Xavier’s letter prior to departing for India, he requested from his Superior General that he write ‘more at length on the concepts concerning the method that you would think we ought to have among the infidels there; because, given that experience will show us part of the method that we ought to have, we hope in God our Lord that it will please his divine Majesty to give us the rest by you knowing the manner that we must

---

<sup>62</sup> Multiple examples of these prayer cards exist, but the most accessible print is an illustration from a book edited by the Flemish chronicler Jean Bollandus, cf. Abraham van Diepenbeek, *Den droom van Xaverius van Indien te bekeeren* (1640), engraving, 10 x 13.4 cm (John Carter Brown Library Archive of Early American Images, Providence, R.I.).

<sup>63</sup> Francis Xavier to Francisco Mansilhas, 7 Apr 1545, *MX*, i, p. 381.

<sup>64</sup> Cf. Ignatius of Loyola to Francis Xavier, 28 Jun 1553, *DI*, iii, p. 3.

serve'.<sup>65</sup> On the topics of education and language in particular, Jesuits differed on the value of their own experience versus the insight of their superiors.

### *Jesuit Education in India*

Education of 'unlettered persons' in Christian catechism dominated the early Jesuit literature, such as the *Constitutions* and the *Ratio Studiorum*, where a defined set of regulations combined the curriculum of the medieval scholastic university with that of the humanistic schools of the Renaissance Italy.<sup>66</sup> Applying the rhetorical principle of *accommodatio* through its educational policies, the *Constitutions* expressed the need for Jesuit educators at the Society's colleges to lecture 'in a manner suitable for the edification of the people, which is different from the scholastic manner'.<sup>67</sup> Individual Jesuits expressed commitment to education in a variety of ways. Francis Xavier was certainly at the forefront of the Jesuit pedagogical development, advising John III to found a college for Jesuit training at Coimbra, which came to fruition the year after his departure for India. Upon arriving in Goa he and his companions were granted the responsibility of running a school founded by the *mordomos* ('stewards') of the Confraternity of the Faith, vicar general Miguel Vaz Coutinho and *mestre* Diogo de Borba, for educating native Goan boys in Christian doctrine and the humanities, though the Jesuits did not take immediate control of this instruction.<sup>68</sup> The school became the College of St Paul, and while Xavier expressed his appreciation for the Jesuit stewardship of native education, he never worked in the college, his companion and secular priest Paolo da Camerino was the only teacher there, and the

---

<sup>65</sup> Francisco Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola and Codure, 18 Mar 1541, *MX*, i, p. 239.

<sup>66</sup> O'Malley, 'How the First Jesuits Became Involved in Education', pp. 58-63.

<sup>67</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 201.

<sup>68</sup> *Exemplum Historiae fundationis Collegii Goani*, Rome, Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (ARSI), Goa 22, fos. 1-10.

school remained in the hands of the *mordomos* until 1545.<sup>69</sup> Education in particular served as one of the most significant differences between the Jesuits and other orders, as this college and many others outside Europe that followed afforded the Society the independence to pursue missionary efforts that had hamstrung other orders like the Franciscans.<sup>70</sup>

Throughout his ministry, organized education served as a less significant aspect of Xavier's ministry. By the time he preached among the Tamil-speaking communities along the southern coast, Xavier possessed no books from which to develop curriculum or learn the language, nor did any other companions travel with him on this first mission away from Goa.<sup>71</sup> Essentially, there was no infrastructure within which any Jesuit could work, compounded by the lack of members in India, and many Jesuits commented on how these missions compared with the evangelism of the early Church. This kind of directionless service was integral in the early mission of the Society, which Xavier knew all too well. Calling for additional help, as was frequently done, Xavier stated that 'persons that do not possess talent for confessing, preaching, or doing other associated works of the Society, after having completed their exercises and having served in humble offices for some months, they will provide much service in these parts, if they should possess bodily strength as well as spiritual'.<sup>72</sup> In essence, they should complete the standard novitiate, including the *Exercises* for a Jesuits seminarian, without additional education. He imparted upon Ignatius that education was not a necessary qualification, 'because for these parts of infidels great learning is not needed'.<sup>73</sup> Thus Xavier's perception of an uneducated indigenous population

---

<sup>69</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India*, p. 12

<sup>70</sup> Girolamo Imbruglia, *The Jesuit Missions of Paraguay and a Cultural History of Utopia (1568-1789)* (Leiden, 2017), p. 87.

<sup>71</sup> Neill, *History of Christianity in India*, p. 144.

<sup>72</sup> Francis Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola, 27 Jan 1545, *MX*, i, p. 362.

<sup>73</sup> Francis Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola, 27 Jan 1545, *MX*, i, p. 362.

coloured his opinion of the level of education required for the Jesuits tasked with instructing them.

In order to adjust oneself to be more edifying towards an Indian audience, however, a Jesuit must not only educate themselves but also others. Xavier's colleague Niccolò Lancilotto held some different opinions on the value of education, and his letters contain a number of key contentions in favour of increased attention to pedagogy within the Society in India, both for members and those in wider society. He felt proselytism required more training, advising that any newly-dispatched missionaries must be prepared to counter the heretical claims indigenous people held.<sup>74</sup> Whereas Xavier called for new personnel to possess corporal and spiritual strength, Lancilotto added that 'this land requires men of great strength and letters and spiritual virtue'. Invoking the example of Paul and the other blessed saints, he suggested that the tribulations faced in India were much greater than the apostles faced, and the men of the Society have much less divine blessing than the first Christians.<sup>75</sup> Education of Jesuits therefore had implications for the education of young non-Christians. As such, Lancilotto felt that the best way to spread the faith was to focus efforts on elevating the status of education in India and in this pursuit to accept more indigenous men into the colleges and train them to be at least Christians and at best Jesuits. Recalling Paul's words to the Corinthians to 'become all to all', the Italian noted, 'wherefore we might desire to be all things to others here...it might be ordered that in all things and to all we adapt ourselves, according to the wishes of the college founders'.<sup>76</sup> Included in these objectives were the admission of native students.

---

<sup>74</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Dec 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 127; cf. Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision*, p. 33.

<sup>75</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 10 Oct 1547, *DI*, i, p. 184.

<sup>76</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Nov 1546, *DI*, i, p. 142.

Whereas Xavier's purpose was less pedagogical, Lancelotto likely influenced the educational policies of the Society through his letters to Ignatius. Accepting the possibility of the college producing indigenous Jesuits in the future, he echoed the *Exercises'* expression of free will in one's decision-making, stating that

‘it is necessary to take up children, and to exercise them in letters and in holiness of life, till they arrive to the maturity of age, so that they may choose good or evil for themselves, and then to welcome and accept into our Congregation whosoever shall wish to follow Christ's path and ours’<sup>77</sup>

The implied motive for this was of course conversion, a pivotal theme explored in greater detail in the next chapter, with the intention that education would induce indigenous non-Christians towards the faith—as well as possible recruitment into the Society. Ignatius consented to this proposition, responding to Lancelotto some years later from his usual backlog of global letters, ‘I hold as very fit the means you take of training the children in Christian doctrine and life, for it is to be hoped that not only will these turn out well, but they will help many others by their example and conversation’.<sup>78</sup> Comparing this idea to what was at that time being attempted in Europe, Ignatius' secretary Juan Polanco reckoned that ‘though it is not usual in these parts [Europe] in the colleges of the Society, this work is not foreign to our Institute...and in India it is among the best things one could do’.<sup>79</sup>

Into the discussion of education entered the Portuguese António Gomes (fl. 1548-54), who upon arrival replaced Lancelotto as rector of St Paul's. Although more fervent than his predecessor and therefore a welcome injection of life into an environment affected by Lancelotto's lukewarm personality, Gomes presented a threat to policies which Lancelotto

---

<sup>77</sup> Niccolò Lancelotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Nov 1546, *DI*, i, p. 144; cf. Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision*, p. 29. Incidentally, shortly before this letter the Constitutions of the College of St Paul, Goa were drafted and sent to Rome, 27 June 1546, *DI*, i, pp. 111-29.

<sup>78</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Niccolò Lancelotto, 26 Dec 1553, *DI*, iii, p. 48. Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision*, p. 48.

<sup>79</sup> Juan de Polanco from communication of provincial Miguel de Torres, 21 Nov 1555, *DI*, iii, p. 307. Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision*, p. 51.

thought had greater potential for gaining new converts. Now in Cochin observing the college's affairs from afar, Lancilotto remarked in late 1548 that 'it is true that he has more talent in preaching and confessing than in ruling and commanding'.<sup>80</sup> To an extent, Gomes suited the ideals Xavier preferred in new arrivals. The problem with Gomes' administration of the college was that while he respected the humanistic education favoured by the founding Jesuits, he sought to reform all styles of meditation and oration in the Coimbra tradition. This amounted to more radical practises of mortification and strict authoritarian rule of the college as means of enforcing order. Gomes' objective, 'that this college will be a university for all of India', signified not the inclusion of all Indian students but rather a university intended for the edification and development of Portuguese living in India, to mould St. Paul's 'of the method and spirit that I had in the college of Coimbra'.<sup>81</sup> This concern for reform of spirit of only Christians equated to the dismissal of native students in favour of older and illiterate Portuguese boys, as Gomes placed the welfare of the *casados* ahead of all others in his ministry. As Gomes remarked in his letter from 1548, 'the people of this land are for the most part poor-spirited, and without having Portuguese we will achieve nothing, because the Portuguese from here do not want to confess to an Indian nor a *mestiço* priest, but rather one that is Portuguese'.<sup>82</sup>

The debate brought in many different voices, with Lancilotto, Francis Xavier, and Gomes at various points agreeing with and criticising the other on specific details. Xavier did not care for the type of fervent Jesuit like Gomes who came from Coimbra, although he agreed with him on the point of barring native Indians from entering the Society. Lancilotto favoured the policy of the *mordomos*, the confraternity that initially founded the college of

---

<sup>80</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 26 Dec 1548, *DI*, i, p. 439.

<sup>81</sup> António Gomes to Simão Rodrigues, 20 Dec 1548, *DI*, i, p. 412; cf. Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 124.

<sup>82</sup> António Gomes to Simão Rodrigues, 20 Dec 1548, *DI*, i, p. 416; C.R. Boxer, 'The Problems of the Native Clergy in Portuguese India, 1518-1787' *History Today* 17/11 (1967), p. 774.

Santa Fé, for they had intended it to be ‘exclusively for the education of indigenous Christian boys’.<sup>83</sup> Prior to Gomes’ term as rector, Lancilotto defended the policy of not admitting Portuguese or *mestiço* boys at all, as he opined that ‘if we receive Portuguese with these black [boys], they will always be in disputes, saying: “You are black and I am white, you are slave and I am free-born” etc. *Mestiços* of this land however carry poor repute, therefore no one here expects anything good from them.’<sup>84</sup> The Italian had nevertheless complained that the confraternity had operated the college poorly, and therefore happily welcomed a reform-minded rector like Gomes—that is, until he decided to disregard the place of *moços da terra*, native boys, who had been attending the institution. The two struck a temporary compromise, and Gomes followed Lancilotto’s suggestion, separating Indian students from Portuguese in lessons.

The debate did not end there, however, as the question of Gomes’ reputation resurfaced. Continuing his complaints about Gomes, Lancilotto simultaneously called on Xavier, the provincial superior and the appropriate authority for these local issues, to resolve the situation. He saw that Gomes had created an environment ‘with so much fervour and so much austerity, that it was necessary for Master Francis [Xavier] to remedy [the situation]’.<sup>85</sup> Xavier nevertheless failed to handle the issue, and by early 1551 Lancilotto wrote to Loyola how ‘in the College of Goa there is now not a single Indian: all of them were dismissed by Padre António Gomes, and he took Portuguese men’.<sup>86</sup> Clearly trying to suppress some of his emotion on the matter, Lancilotto reflected upon how this policy in admission could have been handled better ‘with much modesty and without any scandal...but the Padre is so fervent and so zealous for the Society, that he would not know

---

<sup>83</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 122. Details on this policy are found in *Statuta Confraternitatis Fidei*, *DI*, i, pp. 776–80.

<sup>84</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Nov 1546, *DI*, i, p. 142.

<sup>85</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 8 Jan 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 10; Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p.163.

<sup>86</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 6 Jan 1551, *DI*, ii, p. 148.

how to act if not in this manner'.<sup>87</sup> The new viceroy, Afonso de Noronha, finding the college to be less edifying due to the manner in which Gomes altered the college's student demographics, ordered the indigenous boys to return. When Xavier finally responded to the issue, he too found the details distressing and dismissed Gomes from the position of rector in 1551, sending him to Diu, where he would spend the rest of his years in relative obscurity.<sup>88</sup>

The Superior General Loyola certainly comprehended the significant needs of the Indian missions, but felt hamstrung by a host of factors, not least of which were lack of able Jesuits and Xavier's dismissal of others, including Gomes.<sup>89</sup> Responding to Lancilotto's request for literate men with more tact than fervour—six years after the initial request and one year following the reminder being further evidence of the backlog—Ignatius responded that 'on the persons that you say ought to be sent to India, if we should have the strengths equal to your wish, you will be completely satisfied; but in the end we do what we can, and God Our Lord will provide the rest'.<sup>90</sup> Loyola's words indicated the limited options available to the Jesuits in India, and ultimately the conditions created the opportunities for debates and varied responses to the issues that arose. Through Lancilotto's privileging of native youth education, a greater capacity existed for the elements of accommodation to sprout, yet Gomes' concern for the Portuguese living in Goa imposed limitations to any development of such an approach.

Through these various discussions about education, the ambiguity of the greater Jesuit understanding of responsibilities within one's mission appears. Beginning with

---

<sup>87</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 6 Jan 1551, *DI*, ii, p. 148.

<sup>88</sup> '...and because P. Antonio Gomez expelled them [that is to say, the boys] from the College, as we said, he himself was expelled from the Society', Juan Alfonso de Polanco, *Vita Ignatii Loiolae et Rerum Societatis Jesu Historia* (6 vols, Madrid, 1894-98), iv, p. 663.

<sup>89</sup> Cf. John Correia-Afonso, 'Ignatius and Indian Jesuit Vocations' in Teotonio de Souza and Charles Borges (eds), *Jesuits in India: in Historical Perspective* (Macau, 1992), pp. 79-80.

<sup>90</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Niccolò Lancilotto, 26 Dec 1553, *DI*, iii, p. 48.

Xavier's emphasis on preaching over teaching, we see how the charismatic evangelist considered the Society's priorities outside the classroom rather than inside. In part, this suits the early Jesuit ideology, which as some have pointed out did not initially consider the formal education of students as part of their primary purpose, but rather simply to help the illiterate. Yet from Lancilotto's perspective as one actively engaged in the college's operations in Goa, the Italian saw some promise in the education of young indigenous Christians as part of a potentially fruitful native clergy. Much like other aspects of the early Jesuits, dissonance in interpretation of responsibilities hindered the more accommodationist initiatives.

#### *Language learning and use*

With language a greater potential for cultural adaptation arose. Connecting the dots between Ciceronic rhetoric and its humanist resurfacing, the effect the movement had on Ignatius as reflected in the foundational literature, and cultural differences across space, the only way a Jesuit would have even a remote chance at moving an audience to reflect on Christian teachings was by speaking in their own language. Humanist Latin, though a significant aspect of the classical resurgence in the fifteenth century, did not fit within the refreshed policy of *accommodatio*, in that it could not significantly move all audiences of a global stage; Jesuits' vernaculars became the norm in correspondence, while indigenous languages over time came to dominate individual study during the mission. Loyola stressed this multiple times in his correspondence during the period in which he drafted the Constitutions, mostly seeking to avoid tensions between members of different backgrounds and nations. While the *Constitutions* had first suggested that greater edification could be achieved by fully comprehending the local language, it did not tie this principle to any

particular region.<sup>91</sup> Given the timing of correspondence described below in relation to the period of Loyola's drafting of the Constitutions, it is probable that this idea first emanated from Jesuit activity in India, despite the fact that some early documents from within the general curia mention the communication issues which arose amongst the diverse dialects of Italy as well as elsewhere in Europe.<sup>92</sup>

In many instances Xavier more or less learned Tamil for the purpose of reciting prayers and Christian sayings, but his grasp of the language never exceeded mimicry or memorisation. He summoned droves of people to his public gatherings, who then learned prayers and the Apostles' Creed by reciting words spoken in Tamil by Xavier, which he himself had learned only through repetition rather than comprehension. As he described in a 1544 letter recounting his time on the Fishery Coast, Xavier sought to preach Christian doctrine to the people, but noted that obviously no one spoke Basque. He thus 'fetched people who understood our language and theirs, and after we had met for many days, with great effort we produced the prayers...and the general confession from Latin into Tamil (*malauar*)'.<sup>93</sup> The text described was a basic catechism covering the prayers of the rosary and the Creed, which he had ordered a companion to print to carry out his public preaching in Cape Comorin. It would ultimately inform the *Doutrina Cristã* and *Confessionairo* composed in Tamil by Henrique Henriques and published thirty years later.<sup>94</sup> The catechism did not evince any linguistic comprehension, yet its production by Xavier at the very least evinced some attempt by the first Jesuit to create a linguistic bridge with the local communities.<sup>95</sup>

---

<sup>91</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 201.

<sup>92</sup> Cf. Ignatius of Loyola, *Sancti Ignatii de Loyola Constitutiones Societatis Jesu* (4 vols, Rome, 1934-48), iii, p. 131. Cf. Polanco, *Vita Ignatii Loiolae*, v, p. 49.

<sup>93</sup> Francisco Xavier to the Society in Rome, 15 Jan 1544, *MX*, i, p. 280.

<sup>94</sup> Antoni Üçerler, 'Gutenberg Comes to Japan'. Henriques' translated text of the *Doutrina Cristã* was published in 1577.

<sup>95</sup> Cf. Francisco Xavier, 'Brevis catechismus Christianae doctrinae', *MX*, i, pp. 987-90.

Aware of the difficulties in learning Tamil or Malayalam, Lancilotto recognised the success of his colleagues—not only Henriques, but also Antonio Criminali who picked up Tamil rather quickly—in terms of language while noting his own shortcomings.<sup>96</sup> As he often had to converse with indigenous people through interpreters, Lancilotto thus determined that the missionaries to India ‘should work to learn the languages, because through interpreters little or no fruit is made’.<sup>97</sup> After a few years of work in both Goa and Kollam, Lancilotto translated this into policy-making, advising that ‘the Fathers who dwell here should have fixed provinces and regions and where they should be they should endeavour to learn the languages,’ a suggestion he repeatedly made.<sup>98</sup>

His close correspondent and friend Henrique Henriques led this effort of more advanced study, becoming the first European Tamil scholar—though it was not without its own set of problems. Writing in 1548, Henriques stated that due to the complex grammar and syntax issues ‘I did not believe I could succeed and so I gave it up’, and only after the interpreter left did he resolve to learn the language.<sup>99</sup> Repeating his suggestions as he often did, Lancilotto reminded Ignatius again in 1552 how ‘much less fruit is produced’ by speaking through intermediaries, taking insight from Henriques’ work across the more remote regions of southern India.<sup>100</sup> Lancilotto praised the methods Henriques used to better converse with local populations, and how this created opportunities to retrieve greater knowledge about the Fishery coast and its people and win them over to the Christian faith. Henriques accomplished this through both a rudimentary grasp of the language—which increasingly improved—and a collective of ‘men who were well-inclined and well-

---

<sup>96</sup> Wicki, ‘De epistolarum auctoribus’, p. 43\*.

<sup>97</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 10 Oct 1547, *DI*, i, p. 184.

<sup>98</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 29 Oct 1552, *DI*, ii, p. 381. Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision*, p. 38.

<sup>99</sup> Henrique Henriques to Fathers Ignatius of Loyola, Simão Rodrigues and others, 31 Oct 1548, *DI*, i, p. 285; cf. Zwartjes, *Portuguese Missionary Grammars*, p. 30.

<sup>100</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 29 Oct 1552, *DI*, ii, p. 381.

conditioned’ to help with instructing converts, baptising the young, burying the dead and caring for the sick. After his visitation to the Cape of Comorin, Lancilotto ‘was incredibly consoled in seeing how well instructed those people are, and how well informed many of them are on the matters of our most holy faith’.<sup>101</sup> Overall, he remarked positively how Henriques ‘is not only respected among the Christians, but also the Moors and *gentios*’.<sup>102</sup> The fruits of his dedicated work were some of the earliest published works in India, a Tamil grammar, *Arte malauar* (c. 1566), followed by a doctrinal text, *Confessionairo* (1580).

For Henriques, understanding the ‘gentilic rites to which they were accustomed’ was necessary for the preservation of the new faith of converts, as well as ‘his methods of penance to punish them’.<sup>103</sup> The purpose overall was to ensure retention of Christian doctrine and rejection of superstitions, but this required at least some understanding of what constituted the rites of gentiles, something which only started to arrive once better language comprehension proliferated amongst the missionaries and their coadjutors. Henriques thus echoed the sentiments of his superior Lancilotto in a letter to Superior General Diego Laínez ten years after Lancilotto’s last plea, using practically the same phrasing, that ‘much, much more [fruit] will be made, if those who come here understand the language’.<sup>104</sup>

In essence, the question of language stemmed from education. In order to administer a successful mission amongst non-Lusophone communities, one had to either employ interpreters—which required instruction of indigenous people in Portuguese—or learn the local languages oneself. In any scenario, schools and the texts used within them were indispensable to training and initiating comprehension of the mission particulars, despite

---

<sup>101</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 29 Oct 1552, *DI*, ii, p. 382.

<sup>102</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 29 Oct 1552, *DI*, ii, p. 382-3.

<sup>103</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 29 Oct 1552, *DI*, ii, p. 382; ‘acostumão rytos gentilicos’

<sup>104</sup> Henrique Henriques to Diego Laínez, 29/30 Dec 1562, *DI*, v, p. 682; cf. V. Perniola, *The Catholic Church in Sri Lanka: the Portuguese period: original documents translated into English*, vol. 1 (Dehiwala, 1989), p. 409.

the demographics of those who enrolled and studied. Jesuit superiors at the time had failed to decide on curriculum and prescribe content, and some companions felt stranded. Lancilotto certainly aired his grievance, responding rather directly to Xavier and his prolonged absence: ‘those who say that the men of the Society who come here do not have need of being lettered are not those that stop by here’.<sup>105</sup> Nevertheless, in contrast to his foil António Gomes, Lancilotto channelled his drive for policy change through obedience to his superiors despite their occasional disregard of his proscriptions as well as their own disobedience, as with Xavier. Just as the *Exercises* instilled the principle of independent decision-making, obedience balanced the zeal contained therein, encouraging a more mindful strategy that informed cultural accommodation.

Additionally, as Lancilotto had stressed the need for languages as part of missionary appointments to fixed provinces, the placement of Jesuits in these provinces and their expected obedience to their superiors’ decisions regarding such placement greatly influenced the development of serious language study. The Constitutions reiterated this fact on multiple occasions. On the topic of missions and the distribution of individual Jesuits throughout the ‘diverse regions’ of the world, the Constitutions stated that if the pope had not sent a member to a particular location, or they themselves had not chosen a place, then ‘they may carry on their labour, not by traveling but by residing steadily and continually in certain places where much fruit of glory and service to God is expected’.<sup>106</sup> Maintaining residence in one location facilitated language comprehension, therefore prioritising fixed provincial appointments rather than encouraging more apostolic peregrinations necessarily highlighted the Jesuit responsibility towards language learning. Much like the question of education, given the lack of an established policy in the first decade, in many ways the

---

<sup>105</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 8 Jan 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 12.

<sup>106</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 268.

perspectives of individual Jesuits regarding language relied on their understanding of mission responsibilities and priorities. For most of the Jesuits, their ministry was reserved to the Portuguese settler community as well as those serving the military and the state, while the minority worked in areas outside auspices of the *Estado*, so their priorities often lied within Lusophone ministry. As missions were established in places like the Fishery Coast and Jesuits began to live in these places rather than simply travel to them, the emphasis shifted to ministry amongst the indigenous communities.

### **Jesuit attitudes towards the Estado**

The Society's status under the *Padroado Real* and their own oaths to the Holy See obliged them to adhere to both viceregal and ecclesiastical jurisdiction, yet the professed Jesuit vow of obedience to the pope at times equated to less discourse on the local level in preference to communicating through the superior general in Rome. As for imperial authority, as Ines Županov puts it, 'In Asia Portuguesa, the will of the secular arm and the will of the Jesuits did not coincide on many occasions'.<sup>107</sup> One of the key shortcomings with the prevailing scholarship of this early period pertains to the perception of Jesuit complicity with state policies of temple destruction, mass solemn baptism, and the prohibition of Hindu ceremonies in public or private. To an extent this association remains accurate—when Dom João III ordered the viceroy in 1546 to replace all idols throughout Goa with crosses, he not only named the bishop and vicar general as responsible, but also Francis Xavier.<sup>108</sup> Yet it also closes off deeper investigation into the vast stores of letters which at times evince deviation from this trajectory. Bearing in mind the later tactics of Roberto de Nobili to defy

---

<sup>107</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 49.

<sup>108</sup> 'Instruções de D. João III dirigidas ao Padre Miguel Vaz sobre a cristandade da Índia', 5 Mar 1546, *DHMPPQ*, iii, p. 261. Xavier, '*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*', p. 277.

his European-ness, we find that attempts of individuals to distinguish their ministry from the imperial agenda reveal some piece of the accommodationist method in transcending cultural incommensurability, which was only reinforced further by Portuguese attempts at conformity. Through the lens of these individuals, it is clear that Jesuits held different viewpoints and acted upon these in a way that either opened up or limited the possibility for accommodation.

Colonial policies in places like Goa and Cochin partitioned communities of gentiles from Christians, hoping to encourage more conversions. This separation, however, did not absolve indigenous Goans from catechism, as laws from the 1540s to the 1560s required Brahmans specifically but also all Indians over the age of fourteen to attend indoctrination church services for one hour every week.<sup>109</sup> Therefore Jesuits operating in the islands of Goa primarily served as auxiliaries to the actions committed by the state in the years before they arrived as well as during their first decades. Portuguese actions throughout India clearly created a precarious situation for Jesuits. That the local peoples should associate all European Jesuits with the Portuguese should not come as a surprise, as the majority of Jesuits in India at the time were Portuguese and those who were not nevertheless spoke the same language. Along the Fishery Coast they were called *parangis*, the Tamil word deriving for 'Franks' derived from Syriac, though naturally a similar sort of generalisation of all Indians emanated from Europeans as well. Most notably, the famed accommodationist of the early seventeenth century Roberto de Nobili experienced some difficulty in separating himself from the label *parangi* in the attempt to persuade Brahman converts that they were Christian but not European, as had often been the association.<sup>110</sup>

---

<sup>109</sup> Xavier, 'Conversos and Novamente Convertidos', p. 277.

<sup>110</sup> Neill, *History of Christianity in India*, pp. 287-8.

Francis Xavier held somewhat contradictory feelings towards the Portuguese officials, depending on the situation: in Goa he found their presence indispensable as Christian authorities and examples for indigenous converts, but elsewhere he loathed their imposition on the more removed communities. The experiences of Xavier both in Portugal and throughout southern coastal India affirmed his opinions on proselytism the role of the state, and these would give strength to the later development of the Inquisition in Goa, an institution he first called for in May 1546.<sup>111</sup> In the more metropolitan areas where the Portuguese imperial and commercial presence held a steady influence, he supported the arm of the Inquisition towards moral regulation and jurisdiction which emanated from the Iberian kingdoms. Outside of the more urbanised areas such as the Fishery Coast, he sought the the missionaries of the Society for handling preaching and ministry to local populations in their own location rather than introducing them to a European society. To this end, Xavier requested that vicar general Pero Fernandes Sardinha on his behalf request the transfer of civil jurisdiction over Indian converts from Portuguese captains to either a Jesuit superior or the bishop.<sup>112</sup> At one point he even sought to retire from the Parava mission in which he first established his renowned ministry, writing that he found the situation ‘complicated by the Portuguese military manoeuvres in the area’.<sup>113</sup> In some instances, Xavier tried to influence the captains of various locations along the Fishery Coast. In 1544 he asked Francis Mansilhas to write to the captain requesting that for a whole month ‘he not command nor allow harm to be done to the *gentios* from the land of the Great King [of Travancore], for they all are great friends of ours’, and that any violence would jeopardise the arrangements Xavier had made with the local raja to preach amongst his people.<sup>114</sup> His concern stemmed

---

<sup>111</sup> Francisco Xavier to João III, 16 May 1546, *MX*, i, pp. 421-2.

<sup>112</sup> Chakravarti, *Empire of Apostles*, p. 85.

<sup>113</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 56.

<sup>114</sup> Francisco Xavier to Francisco Mansilhas, 2 Sep 1544, *MX*, i, pp. 338-9.

from the impression he had of Portuguese commercial interests and the means by which they sought to gain and protect them. Writing to Rodrigues on the methods of Portuguese officials, he observed how ‘they all go the route of “I seize, you seize (*rapio, rapis*)”’. And I am frightened how those who come from there [Portugal] encounter so many moods, tenses and participles of this disgraceful verb of *rapio, rapis*’.<sup>115</sup> This rapacious attitude on the part of *Estado* officials extended to securing conversions as well. In a letter to Ignatius in 5 December 1550, Lancilotto claimed to the Superior General that the methods carried out by the Portuguese soldiers in the Christianisation drive of the 1530s had continued up to then, in that as they ‘had gone about taking lands and capturing people, the same soldiers had begun to baptise the same people they captured’.<sup>116</sup>

Lancilotto clearly also felt compelled to draw attention to what he saw as questionable actions by the Portuguese in defiance of canon law. Citing the 1536 bull *Consueverunt Romani Pontifices*, he informed Loyola how, throughout many cities and towns of the Malabar Coast in which the Portuguese held factories or fortresses, they ‘hold all their commerce with infidels not only Moorish but also gentile, and all sell arms and other items prohibited by the canon’.<sup>117</sup> Lancilotto stopped short of condemning the practice, as he noted opinions were split over the matter. Given that this narrative followed his own requests to allow greater privileges to the Jesuits for absolving heretics—a practice typically reserved to bishops—remarking on this business was likely intended to show that things in India happened differently and required more flexibility. As Lancilotto remarked, ‘we will absolve all men, however God knows by what law’.<sup>118</sup>

---

<sup>115</sup> Francisco Xavier to Simão Rodrigues, 27 Jan 1545, *DI*, i, p. 375.

<sup>116</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Dec 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 125.

<sup>117</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 8 Jan 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 2.

<sup>118</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 8 Jan 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 3.

*Martyrdom and Portuguese responsibility*

Occasionally, liberties taken in commerce had significant consequences. In mid-1549 João Fernandes Correa, the Portuguese captain of the Fishery Coast in South India, erected a toll crossing to block the flow of pilgrims to the temple of Rameswaram, the legendary peninsula of the *Ramayana* epic. The act of restricting access to such a holy site inspired a raid by *vadugai*, Telugu-speaking elite warriors of the Vijayanagara empire, who associated the Jesuit Antonio Crimalini, a young missionary ministering to the southern coast, with the destructive and imposing European authorities. After he refused to board the boat to evade the rampaging soldiers, he approached the men, who tore his cassock and shirt from his body, lanced him with spears until near death, and decapitated him. Thus became Crimalini, the ‘Parmesan protomartyr’ of the Society of Jesus.<sup>119</sup>

Accounts sent from the group of companions on the Fishery Coast shortly thereafter described a grand display of sanctity by Crimalini, ‘whose life so perfect in abnegation of himself’. According to his confreres, unnamed explicitly in the letter, Crimalini was advised to board the Portuguese ship, but he could not leave the recent converts whom he had instructed in their new faith. Upon seeing the ‘enemies of the faith’ running towards him, he kneeled and lifted his open palms to the sky. After being thrown down and pierced on the side by a turbaned *vaduga* (assumed to be a Muslim), Crimalini aided the warriors in their disrobing of him before fleeing towards the nearby church. Two more times he kneeled while he received lance strikes in the chest and the other side, before the *vadugai* cut off his head ‘and held it in the air with the shirt full of blood ripped into pieces’.<sup>120</sup> Henrique

---

<sup>119</sup> Martyrologies of the seventeenth century, such as Bernard Bauhuis’ *Epigrammata* (1631) and Mathias Tanner’s *Societas Iesu* (1675), later praised the example of Crimalini alongside the Cuncolim martyrs and other Jesuits and missionaries who hitherto had given their lives in India and East Asia

<sup>120</sup> Missionaries of the Fishery Coast to the Superior of the Society in India, 19 Jun 1549, *DI*, i, pp. 487-8. The mention of a Muslim’s role in Crimalini’s death has come interesting implications for the presentation of martyrdom; Peter Paul Rubens later depicted the death of St Thomas, the somewhat mythological disciple who traveled to India, coming from the spear of a turbaned Muslim.

Henriques, Crimali's successor as the superior of the Parava mission, responded to his martyrdom in a propaganda letter two years later, stating 'if you want to be maltreated by the infidels and suffer for Christ, it will come. The Lord having wanted to reward the good Father Antonio, the Badagas killed him'.<sup>121</sup>

Antonio Crimali's martyrdom had implications for future recruits to the south Indian missions—as depicted by martyrologies that praised Crimali willingly offering up his neck—but on the other it was precipitated by poor administrative decisions of the Portuguese and deemed unnecessary. Both Henriques and another Jesuit Alfonso Cypriano stated in their letters that it was the careless (*desaprecebido*) Portuguese captain Correa who had caused the raid through his greed in tolling the pilgrim road, offending certain Brahmans.<sup>122</sup> While other Jesuits mentioned the Portuguese role in the murder, Lancilotto again through some honest reflection went so far as to also implicate Crimali, hinting that perhaps he did not need to attempt intervention. As Lancilotto wrote to Ignatius months after Crimali's death,

'some of us of great fervour say that he is worthy of being canonized and venerated among the Saints, and so write to Portugal; I, in being his companion for a long time, give witness that he was of a most beautiful life; concerning his death let those that hold more spirit judge; he had embarked and then disembarked surely thinking that those enemies would respect him as they had on other occasions.'<sup>123</sup>

With some doubt, Lancilotto seemed to suggest that Crimali's death was a result of some naïveté in thinking that he would be greeted with respect by the oncoming raid of Hindu *vadugai*, since his mission had nothing to do with the questionable Portuguese activities. Although Crimali 'died for the love of Christians, a death to which he offered himself

---

<sup>121</sup> Henrique Henriques to Simão Rodrigues and to the Portuguese companions, 12 Jan 1551, *DI*, ii, p. 166; Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 147.

<sup>122</sup> Henrique Henriques to Ignatius of Loyola, 21 Nov, 1549, *DI*, i, p. 578; Alfonso Cypriano to Ignatius of Loyola, 3 Dec 1549, *DI*, i, p. 593; Cypriano also referred to the captain as 'descuidado'. Cf. Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, pp. 160-1.

<sup>123</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 25 Jan 1550, *DI*, ii, pp. 11-12.

almost voluntarily’, this wilful offering denied the potential for divine influence that characterised martyrdom.<sup>124</sup> Instead of staying with the indigenous converts and escorting them to safety, he put himself in a position of likely death, a manoeuvre Jesuit superiors did not wish to encourage.

In an attempt to stoke greater motivation to respond to requests from the Indies missions, it was clear that a great deal of embellishment had been employed by fervent Jesuits including Gomes. Quelling some of these fervours, the Criminali episode ultimately initiated efforts to define the Jesuit identity in opposition both to an often inept and destructive Portuguese administration and to an undisciplined and disobedient ideology formed in the Coimbra college. As Ines Županov suggests, the death of Antonio Criminali ‘might have given a decisive fillip to considering adaptationist practices that were to be implemented, not without opposition, in the next two centuries’.<sup>125</sup> Deciding how to negotiate this identity involved a great deal of attention to the local circumstances.

### **Jesuit attitudes towards Indian Communities**

Despite the distinctly more European setting Goa provided to arriving clerics, for Jesuits in particular their task was to go wherever they were sent. As Ronnie Hsia rightly notes, ‘while this European enclave mirrored Portuguese colonial societies elsewhere and provided a bulwark of Catholicism, the vast Indian hinterland beckoned adventurous Jesuits, missionaries in search of the “merchandise of souls”’.<sup>126</sup> Dominicans and Franciscans primarily administered to settlers and converts in the largely Portuguese populated cities of Goa and Cochin, tied to their chapter houses and the diocesan churches, whereas Jesuits had

---

<sup>124</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 22 Dec 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 133.

<sup>125</sup> Županov, “‘One civility, but multiple religions’”, pp. 293-4.

<sup>126</sup> Hsia, *World of Catholic Renewal*, p. 201. Cf. Joan-Pau Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology*, p. 2.

more flexibility in establishing their missions outside these limits. Upon reaching Goa in 1542, Francis Xavier was advised by the governor to travel to Cape Comorin, ‘where all say there are many Christians to be made’.<sup>127</sup> This movement towards the frontiers of Portuguese influence would set the stage for the companions that followed, and Xavier’s mentality played into the optimistic perception of the possibilities for propagation of the faith. Claiming to baptise so many that his hands underwent tremendous fatigue, he noted how the newly-initiated children in particular proved a great service to his ministry, stomping and smashing Hindu idols so that ‘the dishonours that the devil receives from the boys I bring are more than the honours that their fathers and parents give to the idols that they make and venerate’.<sup>128</sup>

Children figured greatly into Xavier’s ministry, for he found them far more mouldable than adults in this context. He attributed many of the problems to the priestly caste of Brahmans, who ‘sustain all of gentility; they have control of the houses where idols [*pagodes*] are and are the most perverse people of the world’.<sup>129</sup> Remarking on their ignorance, the Jesuit revealed his own, claiming that they possessed barely any literature and deceive the people into making offerings to idols, a viewpoint he later reversed as he learned more about them.<sup>130</sup> Instead he chose to discuss the evils of these Brahmans in claiming the commands of the gods to the devotees, especially in his claim that they ‘confessed to me in secret that they do not have any heritage but those stone idols, from which they live spreading lies’.<sup>131</sup> His impression of the local religious traditions, along with the Brahmans responsible for teaching them, demonstrated a rather superficial understanding of Hindu principles and caste distinctions, taking the variation across

---

<sup>127</sup> Francis Xavier to the Society at Rome, 18 Sep 1542, *MX*, i, p. 258.

<sup>128</sup> Francis Xavier to the Society in Rome, 15 Jan 1544, *MX*, i, p. 283.

<sup>129</sup> Francis Xavier to the Society in Rome, 15 Jan 1544, *MX*, i, p. 288.

<sup>130</sup> Cf. Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, p. 131.

<sup>131</sup> Francis Xavier to the Society in Rome, 15 Jan 1544, *MX*, i, p. 289.

different Brahmans to be evidence of deceit.<sup>132</sup> Despite the wisdom he later gathered from them, the Brahman priests seemed more a hindrance to conversions, rather than an opportunity for fruitful discussion and debate. As he remarked in the same letter, ‘if there were no Brahmans, all the gentiles would be converted to our faith’.<sup>133</sup> Royal decrees in 1546 and 1560 correlated with this very idea, ordering explicitly Brahmans to be banished from the islands of Goa.

As Ines Županov has shown in her seminal work on the concept of tropical space and imagination, the Jesuits’ unwillingness to fully transform themselves into this context was in part due to the ‘connection between tropical climate and the oversensual bodies and minds of the Indians’.<sup>134</sup> This association assumed that an embrace of the tropics would lead to a kind of carnal temptation and propensity for evil the likes of which only the gentiles possessed, and the threat was very real for many Jesuits in a land of such imposing heat. Even one of the more storied missionaries, Henrique Henriques—whose forty-year career on the Fishery Coast was unmatched by his confreres and remarkable given the illnesses that struck the others—reflected upon the lustful sentiments that often wracked his mind while catering to the needs of half-naked Paravas. Writing to Superior General Diego Laínez in 1561, Henriques requested dispensation for both him and his companions in the Gulf of Mannar to try out a local medicine, saying that ‘there are *yogis* who take home remedies with which they discipline (*mortificão*) their flesh, of a manner that no appetite comes from sensuality...will it please God that, taking these remedies with permission, they might benefit us’.<sup>135</sup> Here Henriques saw benefit in a specific local tradition used to reinforce one of the professed vows of the Society of Jesus—chastity—showing a desire to accommodate

---

<sup>132</sup> Cf. Chakravarti, *Empire of Apostles*, pp. 96-106.

<sup>133</sup> Francis Xavier to the Society in Rome, 15 Jan 1544, *MX*, i, p. 289.

<sup>134</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 1.

<sup>135</sup> Henrique Henriques to Diego Laínez, 29/30 Dec 1562, *DI*, v, p. 382.

himself to the cultural norms. A year later Laínez responded, advising Henriques to avoid any *gentio* prescription for chastity, perhaps influenced by the distrust of Brahmans and other Hindus.<sup>136</sup>

### *Race and Native clergy*

As mentioned before, concerning intercultural interaction and communication within the mission, inherent issues of translation could be transcended by teaching and converting those who were culturally more commensurable to take up the mantle of proselytism, firstly as interpreters but also as indigenous clergy. Yet as Lancilotto and Henriques expressed, less progress was made by working through interpreters, so Jesuits needed to first learn the language of the people to whom they ministered. Conversely, one logical conclusion might be to admit indigenous Christians, fluent in these languages, into the Society to serve as proxies for European Jesuit self-fashioning, as they literally embodied the indigenised Christianity which cultural accommodation sought to manifest. Logic in this regard, however, did not win out against normative racial attitudes of the early Jesuits. As the episodes described above involving Xavier portray, the view of *gentios* and their level of education played one role in the initiative for admitting native clergy, but the other role was that of racial classification. According to Xavier and Županov, the negative view of Brahmans and even *gentios* in general, later shared by Alessandro Valignano in his writings, were part of a deliberate attempt to focus energy and resources on the more desired missionary projects of China and Japan, societies which through racial classification were

---

<sup>136</sup> Cf. Diego Laínez to Henrique Henriques, 11 Dec 1563, *DI*, v, pp. 660-2.

perceived as more ‘perfect’.<sup>137</sup> The low esteem which Xavier and some others held towards indigenous Christians therefore had a direct influence on their potential as Jesuits.

Caste to an extent connects native clergy to our larger issue of accommodation. As described above, conversion to Christianity across southern India did not translate to loss of caste distinctions, and through the retention of status Jesuits came to express a preference for Brahmans for minor orders, followed by express directives to only admit those of the higher caste groups. Thus as missionaries came to comprehend the complexities of caste, more warmed to the idea of admitting *gentios*, but this required assurance of their complete rejection of prior beliefs. Distrust of Brahmans by many missionaries worked against their ordination, yet being viewed as a priestly caste had some effect on changes in policy. As Carlos Mercês de Melo pointed out, the Council of Trent preferred poorer candidates for ordination, but by the time of the Third Provincial Council in 1585 the church in India interpreted this differently, finding ‘it more prudent and necessary to temporize with the existing system so deeply rooted in the Indian soil, rather than to fight it or condemn it indiscriminately’.<sup>138</sup> The Third Provincial Council saw past the religious significance of the Brahmans and instead focused on the reputation of the indigenous candidates, that they ‘should generally be of honourable and pure castes (*castas*) and families, because by these the other Christians have more respect’.<sup>139</sup> Thus beyond the accommodationist element of presentation—in this instance the transmission of universal truths of Christianity through the vessel of a commensurable indigenous individual—reinforcing the importance of

---

<sup>137</sup> Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, pp. 127-8. Cf. Alessandro Valignano, ‘Sumario de las cosas que perteneçen a la provincial de la Yndia oriental’ (1579) *DHMPPQ*, xii, p. 475.

<sup>138</sup> Mercês de Melo, *Recruitment and Formation of the Native Clergy*, p. 140.

<sup>139</sup> Fr. Vicente da Fonseca, Decrees of the Third Provincial Council, Fourth Action, *Bullarium Patronatus Portugalliae Regum in ecclesiis Africae, Asiae atque Oceaniae*, ed. José Tavares de Macedo (5 vols, Lisbon, 1872), iv, pp. 77-8; cf. Mercês de Melo, *Recruitment and Formation of the Native Clergy*, p. 139.

reputation and effective evangelical communication equated to selective recruitment of Indian Jesuits based on their social status.

The actions of Francis Xavier perhaps provide some clarity on the topic of race and indigenous clergy within the Society. Many of the problems faced by Jesuits working under their superior Xavier were compounded by the fact that Xavier spent most of his time in distant places, concerning himself with mass baptisms and propagation of the faith rather than administration or governance of the colleges he established and the parishes he brought together. Lancilotto saw this as a serious weakness for the future of the Society, stressing that ‘the priests who come here should have fixed areas in which to work’.<sup>140</sup> Xavier’s opinion of native students perhaps correlated with his absence, as Ines Županov suggests that Xavier ‘spread news of Indian spiritual defaults and flaccidity, partly to justify his displacement toward Japan’ and avoid a number of what he deemed lesser pursuits.<sup>141</sup> On many of the issues where Xavier took a negative perspective in opposition to some of his companions, the idea of race figured greatly into his judgments. Xavier found the Indian people across the subcontinent mostly to be ignorant and uneducated, while despite the Brahmans serving as the learned elite he believed they withheld their erudition from the people in order to retain their own power in society. Once in the service of Christianity, the Brahmans became much less of a problem. After a visit by Xavier, he described one Brahman who converted as ‘a very good man’, and the first professed Indian Jesuit came from the same caste, as discussed below.<sup>142</sup> On a more general level, however, he did not approve of the inclusion of Indian professed clergy. He wrote to Ignatius that ‘by the experience that I have from these parts I see clearly, my own Father, that through those

---

<sup>140</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius Loyola, 10 Oct 1547, *DI*, vol. 1, p. 184.

<sup>141</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 57.

<sup>142</sup> Francisco Xavier to the Society in Rome, 15 Jan 1544, *MX*, i, p. 289.

native Indians the way is not open as through those our Company preserves; and that Christianity will last here in them [Indians] as much as we who are here will stay and reside, or those you will send from there [Europe]'.<sup>143</sup>

It was not for lack of trying that Loyola failed to truly resolve this issue, as his letter to Xavier in 1549 outlined the means by which his friend could endeavour to incorporate worthy indigenous converts into the Society, encouraging him 'that you should not lose spirit'. Among the many options Loyola would 'place before him', one of these included 'to make [Christians] in every part, seeking from there to extract more of them and the best that you are able to, so that they are instructed in the colleges'.<sup>144</sup> In the context of the debate and the subsequent obstacles, and even solid barriers post-1579, to admission of native students and clergy, John Correia-Afonso perhaps said it best: 'there are good reasons for saying sadly that in the matter of native vocations to the Jesuit life, the old Society does not seem to have shared the vision of the great Founder'.<sup>145</sup>

The greater discussion of native clergy spread from the debates over which students to instruct in the Jesuit college. Niccolò Lancilotto's constant pressuring of Ignatius about the instruction of native students derived not only from a concern for their own edification, but also due to the struggles he faced personally. In 1546, he remarked that the men of this country should be instructed in sciences, in houses or colleges of the Society, as 'they are more apt to endure the heat of this country, which is generally intolerable'.<sup>146</sup> Drawing on the tropical difficulties, Lancilotto instead saw acclimation as an opportunity rather than a sign of depravity. The practice of employing indigenous auxiliaries or even non-Jesuit priests had already been successfully employed by Francisco Mansilhas, companion to

---

<sup>143</sup> Francisco Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola, 12 Jan 1549, *Epistolae S. Francisci Xaverii aliaque eius scripta* [henceforth *EX*], eds. Georg Schurhammer and Josef Wicki (2 vols, Rome, 1944-45), ii, p. 8.

<sup>144</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Francisco Xavier, 11 Oct 1549, *DI*, i, pp. 513-14.

<sup>145</sup> Correia-Afonso, 'Ignatius and Indian Jesuit Vocations', p. 80.

<sup>146</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Nov 1546, *DI*, i, p. 144.

Francis Xavier on the Cape of Comorin, who as Lancilotto noted ‘has with him two young men who are of that land’. They had been trained at the seminary at St Paul’s in Goa but were not Jesuits; one was a deacon, the other of a minor order.<sup>147</sup> Building on his earlier thought, Lancilotto suggested that perhaps those already accustomed to the conditions might prove indispensable to the mission efforts: ‘to me the best method, that we could have for the conversion of these people and that we could do in colleges like the one where we are, seems for us to teach men of the same origin, those who could endure more the labours of the land.’<sup>148</sup>

Yet even if Xavier had conceded the schooling of indigenous Christians who sought to work for the Society in other capacities, he did not consider them worthy of ministry to the laity; as he remarked to Simão Rodrigues in early 1549, ‘those who enter into the Company here are not to go outside the colleges, for not having letters nor virtues nor spirit to be able to attend to the conversion of the gentiles, because for this requires many years of mortification and of experience, as you well know’.<sup>149</sup> For most of the sixteenth and seventeenth centuries, only Brahmans and occasionally some Kshatriyas were allowed to enter in the capacity of lay positions within Jesuit houses and colleges, retaining caste distinctions not only beyond conversion but also through inclusion within the Society, and limiting them to working in professed houses and caring for the sick, among other duties of the ‘unlearned’ members.<sup>150</sup> Despite this concession to indigenous Jesuit service, a step towards cultural accommodation through the element of presentation, it seems the

---

<sup>147</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Martim de Santa Cruz, Nov 1546, *DI*, i, p. 45. Their names were Gaspar and Manuel, cf. Francis Xavier to Francisco Mansilhas, 18 Dec 1544, *DHMPPO*, iii, p. 129.

<sup>148</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 10 Oct 1547, *DI*, i, p. 184; ‘Al parecer mío el mejor modo que se pudiese tener para la conversión destas gentes ee que se hiziesse en colegios como este a do nosotros estamos, para se doctrinar hombres de la misma naturaleza, los cuales podrían sufrir más los trabajos de la tierra’.

<sup>149</sup> Francis Xavier to Simão Rodrigues, 20 Jan 1549, *EX*, ii, p. 42.

<sup>150</sup> C.R. Boxer, *The Church Militant and Iberian Expansion*, p. 20.

negotiation of Jesuit identity in the *Estado* floated between the exigencies of Portuguese settler sentiments and local caste reputation, showing the limitations of accommodation through partial indigenous membership.

Lancilotto challenged the idea, held most strongly by the pro-Portuguese rector António Gomes, that native vocations would not produce viable Jesuits, and went against claims of ignorance to suggest that learned discourse was required to foster local converts. The debate over the place of native clergy within both the empire and the order had contentious periods. When Lancilotto sought to dispatch a token Indian Jesuit brother to Europe as a mission representative in 1553, ‘the plan was abandoned because the Portuguese did not favour such visits’.<sup>151</sup> Back in the *Estado*, the question of restricting admission surfaced through the Visitor to the Missions Gonçalo Álvares in 1568. In his decision, even Álvares expressed some ambivalence on the topic:

‘From experience the Fathers feel that for now it is not convenient to receive to the Society those of this country, nor even *mestiços*; and superiors of the other religious orders are much the same. However I am inclined (after I looked after whether there might be some industrious and useful who can help the Ordinary, and whether they could join us) that all doors should not be closed to any nation, for Christ Our Lord died for all’<sup>152</sup>

Similar to the debate over *conversos* (descendants of converted Iberian Jews) in the Society as discussed later, the place of gentile converts from India produced controversy, hindering dissenting voices like Lancilotto’s from having greater effect on policy. The closest the early Society came to respecting these opinions was with Fr Pedro Luís (fl. 1547-96), a Brahman convert from the area of Kollam. Born around 1532, he converted at age 15 and was sent to St Paul’s for his education, and later served extensively as interpreter and coadjutor, receiving ordainment at last in 1575.<sup>153</sup> He would be the only Indian ordained as

<sup>151</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 262.

<sup>152</sup> Gonçalo Alvares to Francisco Borgia, [Dec] 1568, *DI*, vii, p. 575.

<sup>153</sup> Cf. *DI*, vol. 2, p. 382, fn. 17; ‘Anno 1575 sacerdotio auctus’.

a priest in the Society of Jesus prior to the suppression of the Jesuits in 1759. Regardless of his tireless labours and almost half a century of service for the order in India, the General Congregation never changed their standards—in fact, superior general Everard Mercurian decided the opposite and barred admission of native clergy, Asian and Eurasian, just four years after Luís’ ordination.<sup>154</sup> Although he never convinced his European companions or superiors to admit his Indian brethren, Luís nevertheless contributed extensively to mission activity on the Fishery Coast through continued linguistic work; the Tamil catechism initiated by Xavier was further improved by the work of Luís, whose expertise contributed to its later printing.<sup>155</sup> Luís’ storied career and impact on the early Jesuit mission evince the significance that indigenous clergy held—and furthermore, the promise they could have held—for overcoming the cultural incommensurability which the Society would later visualise another way through accommodation. Given this unique position and potential, as Luís himself wrote in 1589, ‘as the only Malabar son in the Society...I do not know for what reasons it is founded’ that others like him should not be admitted.<sup>156</sup>

### *Thomas Christians*

The community of Thomas Christians serves as the final point of discussion here, due to their pivotal place in the historiography of accommodation. As Županov acknowledges, through this community of Nestorian Christians, Jesuits ‘developed the idea that Christianity could accommodate non-European “social customs” without getting intrinsically corrupt as a religion’, yet during the initial years of interaction such an

---

<sup>154</sup> Charles Boxer, ‘The problem of the native clergy’, in G.J. Cuming (ed), *The Mission of the Church and the Propagation of the Faith* (Cambridge, 1970), p. 89.

<sup>155</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India*, p. 29. The faulty original was published in 1557, with a more accurate translation done by Henrique Henriques, with the help of Pedro Luís, and published in 1578.

<sup>156</sup> Fr. Pedro Luís, Brahman, to Fr. Claudio Acquaviva, General, 2 Jan 1589, *DI*, xv, pp. 219-20.

understanding did not exist.<sup>157</sup> None of these early Jesuits could look past the heresies to understand better how an indigenous Christianity that preceded them might be so successful. Not until the arrival of Alessandro Valignano, whose diligent observations of this unique community informed his own policy-making throughout Asia, did a Jesuit achieve such a revelation. Correia-Afonso suggests that Valignano sought to establish a seminary in Malabar for the purpose of training indigenous priests from the Thomas Christian community in the Latin rite, essentially to supplant their theology yet retain their mode of civility and status in the region.<sup>158</sup> His apparent hope was that upper caste Nayars would perhaps be enticed by the prospect of converting to Christianity if their social status could be retained through a community which held such privilege in southern India.<sup>159</sup>

According to some estimates, at the time of Xavier's mission on the Malabar coast in 1549, the St Thomas Christians probably numbered less than 100,000.<sup>160</sup> Outside of distinct theological differences, relations between this community and the Portuguese soured after the 1550s over the practice of the Portuguese *Padroado*, which granted the viceregal government the authority to appoint bishops and other clerics (naturally sympathetic to the Archdiocese in Goa), and the extension of that policy towards 'Latinisation' of the Syriac church. In 1585 the Third Goan Provincial Council advised Fr Francisc Ros, Jesuit missionary amongst the community of Vaipikotta, to examine the liturgical texts of the Thomas Christians in order to eradicate their heretical beliefs, a project fully realised by the Synod of Diamper in 1599. Beyond this, however, Ros defended the dress of the *kattanar* clergy and the liturgical language, a pivotal shift in the development of accommodation in India.<sup>161</sup> It seems that such an idea never occurred to the early Jesuits,

---

<sup>157</sup> Županov, "One civility, but multiple religions", p. 324.

<sup>158</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India*, p. 76.

<sup>159</sup> Županov, "One civility, but multiple religions", p. 300.

<sup>160</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India*, p. 8.

<sup>161</sup> Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology*, p. 323; Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India*, p. 77.

yet they mulled over the intriguing indigenised Christianity of the *surianos* over the course of the first thirty years. From early 1549 until his death, Lancilotto was the regional superior of the Malabar mission and both founder and rector of Salvador College in Kollam, a boys' school intended to instruct mainly Syrian Christians. The Italian showed very little recognition of the unique place of the Thomas Christians, however his opinions on the prospect of native clergy developed over the course of his time in Malabar, suggesting at least some understanding of the potential opportunities for indigenisation of Christianity through the model of this local community.

### **Conclusion**

Despite his criticism of the vices of Goa and the Portuguese *casados*, Xavier often exuded the ideological perspectives characteristic of the *Estado* and its ecclesiastical administrators, on such points as views of the Brahman caste, Eurocentric prejudices, and his support of the Inquisition. Some of his colleagues, however, showed a more variegated approach to ministry and a recognition of additional training and methods not assumed by Xavier in his time. Although examples contained herein do not comprehensively cover the entirety of mission activity, the differences across regions—between those under direct and indirect Portuguese control—of the application of conversion practices and religious distinctions or separations remove the potential for a consistent policy within the Society of Jesus for mission and proselytism. Outside of the environmental factors, the personalities, context, and administrative instruction contributed to varied methodologies. As Joan-Pau Rubiés notes, if we look at the wide scope of the period of activity pre-suppression, Jesuits in India tended to be very shrewd and less concerned about the preservation of existing cultural systems than achieving the greatest gain through their methods, 'often using accommodation opportunistically, as a temporary measure rather than as a long-term

acceptance of cultural diversity'.<sup>162</sup> Otherwise the attempts by the Portuguese in the urbanised areas of south-western India to destroy and supplant local culture with Europeanised religious and political traditions seemingly would have drawn greater activism on their part. Nevertheless, these temporary measures did happen, and it is by looking for these particular calculated movements that elements of accommodation may arise.

Although Niccolò Lancilotto played a role in the early missions in southern India, it remains unclear to what extent he influenced the development of policy as solidified in the Constitutions and other formative administrative documents. His own complaints and shortcomings reveal the problems with his own ministry, and in the end he never truly manifested the ideals he often demanded of the rest of the Society. However, the key contribution here lies in how his concerns play into the method to be implemented later by figures like Nobili and Ricci. They certainly did not receive inspiration from Lancilotto, but the basic principles of a *suaviter* approach lay within some of the founding ideals of consolation, 'helping souls', and adjusting oneself in language and appearance so as to create a more ameliorative approach than that of mass conversion on the scale practised by the Portuguese ecclesiastical, and often political, authorities as explored in the next chapter. The intention to impart this methodology on the greater order not only points to a commitment to guiding themes found within the *Exercises*, but the prevalence of opinion on the matter across time also suggests a debate within the companions in India over the protocol necessary for a suitable and successful Jesuit mission, a debate which possessed more vigour as the years progressed.

---

<sup>162</sup> Rubiés, 'Concept of Cultural Dialogue', p. 239.

What we see here in Lancilotto's proscriptions and the remarks of others in support of his opinion is a concern to alter the face of the Society in India in order to produce more fruit. This constant concern about the progress and success of the order within their missions behoved them to conceptualise the mission in terms more gentle (*suaviter*) than the Portuguese had brought forth in the first thirty years of conquest and control. An aspiration to shed the Portuguese or *parangi* distinctions, though not explicitly understood at this time, arose at times within the letters as Jesuits experienced the trials of labouring under heated conditions of both extramural confrontation and intramural debate, seeking to mitigate the problems of European adaptation to the physical as well as cultural environment and the response best suited to Jesuit distinctiveness. The fervour with which Gomes conducted himself elicited the same response of anxiety by Lancilotto and Henriques concerning the physical heat—their discomfort contributed to the search for a cooling resolution.

As John Correia-Afonso notes, Xavier 'has also been condemned as a fanatic incapable of appreciating faiths and cultures other than his own, a supporter of the colonialists and of the Inquisition and a hard taskmaster, intolerant of the frailties of his weaker brethren'.<sup>163</sup> I agree, contending further that Xavier did not fit the mark of an accommodationist. His haughtiness and tendency to do what he pleased contradicted the necessary balance between autonomy and obedience, an ideal which he seemed to possess prior to his departure for India. Additionally, despite his occasional criticism of imperial incompetency or hindrance in the progress of Christianity, he nevertheless relied on the Portuguese state to reinforce communal faith with political authority. Outside of these characteristics detrimental to forming a more Jesuit identity through which Xavier might have fostered accommodationist strategies, his impression of the cultural inferiority of

---

<sup>163</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Jesuits in India*, p. 20.

Indian societies prevented any serious consideration of the value of indigenous communities regarding education or spirituality, leading him to neglect the language and philosophical traditions as potential tools through which he might transcend incommensurability.

The Constitutions themselves stressed how ‘it is the part of those who live under obedience to the Society not to scheme, directly or indirectly, to be sent here or there, either by his Holiness or by their own superior...in missions of this type the superior will have much greater power to direct a member to one place rather than another’.<sup>164</sup> Despite his superior position, Ignatius of Loyola often could not exercise this power over Francis Xavier, and perhaps this particular clause’s inclusion resulted from such actions. When Loyola did exercise his request for obedience, it was too late. Writing in June 1553, unaware of Xavier’s death months before, Loyola stated that ‘I determine that God Our Lord will be more served by your person if you will have remained in India, sending others and directing them to do what you had prepared to do’.<sup>165</sup> The *Imitation of Christ* by Thomas á Kempis, a text with a significant effect on Loyola and his spiritual ideology, noted that ‘qui multum peregrinantur raro sanctificantur’—‘those who often wander are rarely sanctified’.<sup>166</sup> Given that the only saint to come from this generation in Asia was the itinerant Xavier, perhaps it does not always hold true. Nevertheless in the context of accommodation these peregrinations certainly did not always help to edify his companions nor fit the founder’s expectations.

---

<sup>164</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 280.

<sup>165</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Francis Xavier, 28 Jun 1553, *DI*, iii, p. 3.

<sup>166</sup> Thomas a Kempis, *Imitatio Christi*, I, 23.

**Chapter Three**  
**‘Blessed is one who out of virtue becomes Christian’: Conversion Theology in the  
 Jesuit Administration and Indigenous Reception of Baptism**

The first ever ecclesiastical council in India and Asia, convened in 1567 in the church of St Catherine in Goa, brought together representatives from the Franciscans, Dominicans, and Jesuits, alongside secular clerics and the greater authorities of the Church in Asia. Forty-seven decrees of general concern, thirty-five in reformation of the affairs, and thirty-three in reformation of morals all arose from this earliest attempt to address the difficulties faced in the context of Goa and other territories under its jurisdiction. It opened with a rather important first decree:

‘It is not permitted to bring anyone to our faith and baptism by force through threats and intimidation, since no one comes to Christ in faith unless he be drawn by the heavenly Father in freely given love and prevenient grace. Those who desire to bring the unbelievers to the true faith must see to it that they treat them with gentleness and kindness’<sup>1</sup>

The debate over forced baptism, with or without any prior instruction in the faith, came to a head in the Iberian kingdoms on multiple occasions, as well as in the context of overseas councils from New Spain to the *Estado da Índia*. In the Spanish context, Juan de Torquemada had defended mass baptisms in the context of the Reconquista in the mid-fifteenth century, whilst invocations of Franciscan theologian John Duns Scotus informed Salamanca theologians defending forced baptism.<sup>2</sup> The first missionaries to Central America, the Franciscans employed mass conversion practises among the Mexica people, which were later criticised and reformed through the First Mexican Provincial Council of

---

<sup>1</sup> ‘Primeiro Concílio Provincial de Goa’, *DHMPPPO*, x, p. 341. Cf. Neill, *History of Christianity in India*, p. 232.

<sup>2</sup> Marcocci, *Consciência do Império*, p. 380.

1555.<sup>3</sup> This final move resulted in a mandate of religious instruction to potential converts prior to receiving the first sacrament.

In Europe, Desiderius Erasmus had reemphasised the necessity for instruction around the sacrament of baptism after the early part of the century saw almost a complete absence of catechetical teaching. Influenced by his patristic studies, he proposed reviving the ancient catechumenate in 1522 in line with the early Church, which in order to fit the prevailing tradition of infant baptism would involve instruction following reception of the sacrament, when the child came of age to understand basic principles.<sup>4</sup> For children this was seen by some European Catholics as a controversial proposition for a secondary baptism, but for adults the instruction would seemingly take place beforehand, as they were able to understand better, and should therefore not stand contrary to doctrine.

In the case of Portuguese India, it would take until 1567 for the Ecclesiastical Council to question the practice of mass baptism, but in the twenty years prior clerics debated with each other over what constituted sufficient catechism or sincere conversion. Even then, the question remained as to what genuine conversions truly were, given that the process is a highly internal one, while the negotiation of an external appearance shifted over time and space. Patristic theology took different viewpoints on conversion—from the presence of an immanent, internal divine truth which one must embrace, to a rejection of prior worship and thought in favour of one’s new faith.<sup>5</sup> This latter perspective, often the recourse of the *Padroado* missionaries of various religious orders, entailed for many

---

<sup>3</sup> Francisco Antonio Lorenzana, *Concilios provinciales primero, y Segundo, celebrados en la muy noble y muy leal ciudad de México, presidiendo el Illmo. Y Rmo. Señor D. Fr. Alonso de Muntúfar, en los años de 1555, y 1565* (Mexico City, 1769), pp. 42-3; cf. Mark Christensen, ‘Missionizing Mexico: Ecclesiastics, Natives, and the Spread of Christianity’ in Ronnie Po-chia Hsia (ed), *A Companion to Early Modern Catholic Global Missions* (Leiden, 2018), p. 24.

<sup>4</sup> Hughes Oliphant Old, *The Shaping of the Reformed Baptismal Rite in the Sixteenth Century* (Grand Rapids, 1992), p. 182.

<sup>5</sup> Sabine MacCormack, “‘The Heart has Its Reasons’”: Predicaments of Missionary Christianity in Early Colonial Peru’, *The Hispanic American Historical Review* 65/3 (1985), pp. 443-4.

indigenous Indians, as Alan Strathern notes, ‘a thoroughgoing transformation of lifestyle, and thereby impinged on the purity regulations and ritual practices which expressed and maintained status identity’.<sup>6</sup> Decades later, Roberto de Nobili defended the struggle of new converts in Madurai in his *Informatio* (1615), recognising how ‘it is very hard and extremely difficult, at least from the start, for our neophytes to leave off and reject at a moment’s notice the habit of performing absolutely all human actions to the accompaniment of special rites or prayers’.<sup>7</sup> Nobili’s view of more careful and accommodating approach to conversion, however, was not shared by most of his predecessors.

Conversion forms the central discussion of this chapter, specifically the vocalised as well as less subtle debate over the methods for and nature of conversion to Christianity, the context of conversion, and the regulation of these converts. I approach each of these lines, as in other chapters, primarily through the lens of the Society of Jesus and the underlying principles of missionary accommodation, but also drawn in comparison to other orders active in India at the time. Accommodation connects not only with the internalised nature of conversion in contrast with the negotiation of shifts in external self-presentation, but also the ability to adapt oneself to a particular audience through a transcendence of obstacles inherent in one’s identity—in this case a predominantly Portuguese Christian identity.<sup>8</sup> As discussed in the next chapter, the Jesuit superior Gonçalo da Silveira intended to make Goa into ‘another Portugal’, and as Giuseppe Marcocci has argued this ideology characterised a number of other individuals, such as his fellow Provincials António de Quadros and Francisco Rodrigues.<sup>9</sup> Similarly Josef Wicki identified these three men as proponents of more a rigorous governance style, availing themselves of the power of the state through the

---

<sup>6</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 93.

<sup>7</sup> Nobili, *Preaching Wisdom to the Wise*, p. 214.

<sup>8</sup> Prieto, ‘Perils of Accommodation’, pp. 403–4.

<sup>9</sup> Marcocci, *Consciência de um Império*, p. 380.

Inquisition and mass solemn baptisms.<sup>10</sup> Both Rodrigues and Quadros attended the Provincial Council as not only representatives of the Society but also experts of canon law. At the time of these particular superiors' tenure in India, greater association occurred between Jesuits and Franciscans in Goa, relationships which seem to have influenced prevailing sentiments of the Society in India towards conversion in the 1560s.

Contrasting the views of these superiors with their contemporary Jesuit companions and other religious elucidates the missionary methodologies in relation to priorities ranging from largely political, Portuguese imperial objectives to the soteriological emphases of the Jesuit *modus procedendi*. Marcocci and others have reflected upon the question of forced conversion across global missions, but not to the extent of analysing the different Jesuit viewpoints in light of prevailing conversion theology and specifically in regards to the method of missionary accommodation.<sup>11</sup> On the other hand, some scholars have explored Jesuit theological preferences as manifested in the schools and colleges, but have not reflected upon this influence within the theatre of India.<sup>12</sup> I aim to synthesise these two angles to understand the theological influences within the Jesuit order, the effect on these southern Indian missions, and the extent and limits of accommodation in missionary strategies regarding baptism and the longer process of conversion. As I will establish, the Jesuit order did not explicitly subscribe to any particular theologian, despite a penchant for Thomas Aquinas, and for the most part this holds true in the opinions of theologians in India; however, corresponding to the renewed vigour that characterised the period of the late 1550s

---

<sup>10</sup> Josef Wicki, 'De domibus, collegiis, sociis Provinciae Indicae', *DI*, iv, p. 4\*.

<sup>11</sup> Cf. Xavier, 'Conversos and Novamente Convertidos', pp. 255-87; cf. Vincenzo Lavenia, Stefania Pastore, Sabina Pavone, and Chiara Petrolini (eds), *Compel People to Come In: Violence and Catholic Conversions in the non-European World* (Rome, 2018).

<sup>12</sup> Cf. Motta, 'Jesuit Theology, Politics, and Identity', pp. 353-74; cf. Fernando Felix Lopes, 'O ensino das doutrinas de Escoto na Universidade de Coimbra' *Colectânea de estudos de história e literatura* (3 vols, Lisbon, 1997), ii, pp. 473-534; cf. Cristiano Casalini, *Aristotele a Coimbra: Il Cursus Conimbricensis e l'educazione nel Collegium Artum* (Rome, 2012).

and early 1560s Jesuit superiors in India defended practices of force, threats, and coercion towards the objective of converting all Hindu communities in and around Goa or, commensurate with Portuguese policies towards Jews in the late fifteenth century, exiling them by law. As Ângela Barreto Xavier astutely observed, Jesuits of this period appeared ‘to take a hard stance rather than the accommodating one that characterised their later missionary culture’.<sup>13</sup>

To what extent did Jesuits serve the interests of the indigenous peoples, whose conversion they sought to gain, versus those of the state? Upon the death of Rodriques and Quadros, the visitor and oft-cited harbinger of *accommodatio* Alessandro Valignano, himself displeased by the Portuguese monopoly over the Society within Asia, sought to dissociate the Society from some of the more significantly political and ecclesiastical interests, deciding that thereafter no Jesuit would serve the Holy Office. In the previous decades, however, the relationship between the Society of Jesus and both the state and the church was far more intimate. I thus investigate here some examples of conversion achieved by Jesuits during the early period in India, focusing on their audience and targets, particular techniques and judgments (as well as outside influences on both), and rough attempts at the theological grounding of these decisions. Connecting with the next chapter, I find that the debates between Jesuits over the conversion of *gentios* in Goa and other enclaves of Portuguese India were more contentious than over the topic of the Inquisition, yet the two issues overlapped. To an extent, drawing on Miriam Bodian’s analysis of mid-seventeenth century Inquisitional trials in Brazil, I believe that the efforts to convert *en masse* were inextricable from the agenda to install the first overseas Holy Office in order to more consistently regulate religion in the *Estado*, given that the Church made no claim of

---

<sup>13</sup> Xavier, ‘*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*’, p. 273.

jurisdiction over the unbaptised.<sup>14</sup> In the voices that questioned the attitudes towards both potential and new converts, we can observe how accommodationist notions of cultural observation and openness became more pronounced.

### Early views of conversion in India

In 1522 the Dominican Duarte Nunes, titular Bishop of Dume and clerical visitor, arrived in India to observe the ecclesiastical conditions, writing his letter thereafter to King Dom João III in Portugal about the situation in Goa. At the time, the *Estado* capital remained in Cochin, and thus the climate in Goa had typically been more lax towards the non-Christian populations following the violent conquest of 1510. In order to promote the spread of the Christian faith, Nunes called for the destruction of all Hindu temples and their replacement with Portuguese-style churches, intending to coax local *gentios* towards conversion through structural displacement but also through legislation by which ‘whoever wants to live in this island let him become a Christian and he shall possess his lands and houses as has till now done; if he does not want to do so, let him leave the island’.<sup>15</sup> Besides establishing a policy of conversion or expulsion, itself evocative of the practices directed towards Jews by Dom Manuel I, he echoed the Augustinian view, describing how newly baptised Indians might not necessarily be good Christians, but their children likely would be.<sup>16</sup> When his proscriptions finally materialised some twenty years later under the governor

---

<sup>14</sup> Miriam Bodian, ‘Baptized or Not? The Inquisitors’ Dilemma in Trials of Portuguese Jews from Dutch Brazil, 1645-1647’ in Claude Stuczynski and Bruno Feitler (eds), *Portuguese Jews, New Christians, and ‘New Jews’: A Tribute to Roberto Bachmann* (Leiden, 2018), p. 123.

<sup>15</sup> ‘Relatório do Bispo de Dume a El-Rei’, *DHMPPPO*, vol. 1, p. 452; ‘quem quer que quizesse viver na ilha fosse cristão e teria suas terras e casas como tem, e nam querendo, que so fosse da ilha’. Cf. Alexander Henn, *Hindu-Catholic Encounters in Goa: Religion, Colonialism, and Modernity* (Bloomington, 2014), p. 41. The next sentence by Nunes remarked how ‘not one creature [nenhum creatura] would remain’ in Goa who was not Christian.

<sup>16</sup> ‘Relatório do Bispo de Dume a El-Rei’, *DHMPPPO*, vol. 1, p. 453; ‘estes nam fosem bons cristãos, os filhos ho seriam’. Cf. Boxer, *Portuguese Seaborne Empire*, p. 72.

Martim Afonso de Sousa, the series of destroyed temples came with the support of the Franciscans and Dominicans present as well as the newly-arrived inaugural Jesuit missionary Francis Xavier.

In the 1540s, this programme of more fervent enforcement of Christianity at the expense of local religious traditions came on the heels of a resurgent Catholicism in Europe, with the establishment of the Portuguese Inquisition in 1536 as well as the start of the Council of Trent in 1545, and movements in the metropole affected to an extent decisions in the peripheries. Among these included the aforementioned *piadosos*, the reformed Franciscans whose patronage under the Portuguese crown enabled a more spirited campaign for conversion prior to the Jesuit arrival. For Portuguese clerics—undoubtedly the majority of them were from Portugal, except the recognisable minority of Jesuits from Spain and elsewhere—interaction with the communities of converted Iberian Jews and Muslims provided some precedent for ministry and discipline regarding neophytes, as has been discussed. However, the pluralistic communities throughout the active mission fields of southern India required a negotiation between the anxiety over apostasy and protection from local retaliation or social upheaval. The nature of the Lusitanic network in sixteenth century Asia equated to few areas under direct control, which meant that large-scale or high status conversions in existing non-Christian communities could have significant implications for the entire region, as many historical cases have shown.<sup>17</sup> Nevertheless, the ideologies cultivated in Iberia held a tremendous influence on the approach to conversion. Often in discussions of conversion ideology and narratives as well as post-conversion ministry, the theology employed in particular decisions and approaches has been overlooked. Jesuits and their fellow mendicants and representatives of the Church employed various means to

---

<sup>17</sup> Changes in authority via conversion occurred from some of the earliest cases, cf. Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 90.

educate catechumens as well as administer the sacraments, and comparing these approaches can elucidate the underlying reasons for certain decisions even in the absence of explicit theological references. More importantly, the means by which these conversions occurred illustrate some limits to missionary accommodation, as many Jesuit decisions lacked the discipline, cultural attentiveness and openness, and commitment to education that crucially inform the adaptationist methodology.

*Early Jesuit views of conversion*

In terms of the more general administration of baptism, the earliest Jesuits represented both a continuation of policies as well as a shift away from them. Seeking the conversion of non-Christians and more specifically *gentios* corresponded to one of the essential objectives engrained within the Jesuit foundational literature, 'the propagation of the faith and the progress of souls',<sup>18</sup> but the question revolved around where to start. Writing on behalf of the Superior General Loyola, Juan Polanco reminded Niccolò Lancilotto that 'Father Ignatius wishes you to understand thoroughly that he prefers that those who give themselves to our Society should obtain an extremely small fruit of their labours, but a sure one, rather than seek very plentiful fruits but with danger of spiritual offence to themselves or others'.<sup>19</sup> The small but sure conversions perhaps correlated to the Jesuit interest in elite targets, but this was not always so. The first Jesuit to India, Francis Xavier, was driven to ministry amongst the Paravas, the lower caste of pearl fishers on the far southern Coromandel Coast, by accounts of their mass baptism years before. Far from

---

<sup>18</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 66.

<sup>19</sup> Juan Polanco to Niccolò Lancilotto, 22 Nov 1547, *DI*, i, 211; 'Et prorsus hoc te intelligere cupit Pater Ignatius, malle se ut qui nostrae se dedunt Societati perexiguum aliquem laborum fructum, sed securum, capiant, quam si uberrimos sed cum discrimine offensionis sui vel aliorum, fructus prosequerentur'. Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision of India*, p. 53.

simply motivated to maintain initiates baptised under dubious pretences, Xavier himself conducted mass baptisms in his travels along the southern Indian littoral, as indicated by the legendary number of baptised he reported.<sup>20</sup>

The Italian Lancilotto decried this model for mass conversion first in his letter from October 1547, in which he noted that ‘the manner that they have of baptising them is that in whatever place or in whatever time, that someone will say that they want to be Christian, without more instruction, they make them and let them leave. Many of them return to gentility’.<sup>21</sup> Thus the threat of apostasy stood foremost in his mind, rather than the indigenous social repercussions. He reiterated the problem in December 1550, likely influenced by principles reinforced in the aforementioned instructions from Loyola. Referring back to the period of Duarte Nunes, he noted the presence of poor Christians ultimately produced by dubious practises under the Portuguese. He reminded the Superior General how some half a century prior, as they began to inhabit the Malabar Coast, Portuguese settlers, merchants, and soldiers ‘went taking lands and capturing people, the same soldiers began to baptise the same men which they captured, thus without any observance and reverence of the sacrament, and without any catechism or doctrinal’.<sup>22</sup> In his view, a ‘great abuse’ not only occurred at the start of the Portuguese presence in southern India, but had persevered throughout the increasing arrival of Dominicans, Franciscans, ‘and is used to date among us’.<sup>23</sup> Exactly who he referred to as ‘us’ remains unclear, though given the letter was primarily intended for the Superior General (and possibly other Jesuits)

---

<sup>20</sup> António da Silva Rego, ‘The Collected Writings of Georg Schurhammer (Review)’ *Catholic Historical Review* 54/1 (1968), p. 76.

<sup>21</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 10 Oct 1547, *DI*, i, p. 183.

<sup>22</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Dec 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 125; ‘andavam tomando terras e cativando gentes, comesaram eles mesmos soldados a bautizar as mesmas gentes que cativam, asi sem nenhum acatamento e reverencia ao sacramento, e sem nenhum cataquismo e doutrina’.

<sup>23</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 5 Dec 1550, *DI*, ii, p. 125; ‘grande abuzo...he se husa oje em dia entre nós’.

it likely indicated those within his own order. Some Jesuits, however, made efforts to secure more certain baptisms as Ignatius preferred rather than a multitude of them. Henrique Henriques wrote in late 1558 from the Fishery Coast that a number of *gentios* of various castes came to him and his companions and displaying a relaxed view towards conversion noted they ‘seek the baptism and, for the Father to proceed more securely, they are not yet baptized. We hope too that they might persevere in this good objective’.<sup>24</sup> In this instance Henriques emphasised gradual conversion through catechism to, as Polanco stressed, obtain small but sure ‘fruit’.

Despite these divergent views regarding mass solemn baptisms, Xavier and Lancilotto at times expressed similar displeasure with the Portuguese temporal authorities, only Xavier tempered his opinions at times. The difference was that Xavier’s disapproval was directed towards the local officials whom he felt did not exercise the same care with converts as he felt the Jesuits and ecclesiastics would. His famous calls for the Inquisition arose out of frustration with some converts’ poor knowledge of their new faith, yet also Portuguese flaws in ensuring their conformity.<sup>25</sup> Of the failure of crown representatives in Goa and Cochin to preserve the faith, Xavier instructed his superior and friend Simão Rodrigues, ‘allow not one of your friends to come to India with administrations and offices of the King, because of them it can be properly said: “Let them be wiped out of the book of the living, and not be written among the righteous”’.<sup>26</sup> Around the same time, however, Xavier lauded the positive contributions of the Estado officials towards the progress of the faith in his letter to the Society in Rome.<sup>27</sup> We often receive a more honest and forthright

---

<sup>24</sup> Henrique Henriques to the Superior General, 20 Dec 1558, *DI*, iv, p. 143.

<sup>25</sup> Francisco Xavier to Dom João III, 16 May 1546, *DHMPPO*, iii, pp. 351-2.

<sup>26</sup> Francisco Xavier to Simão Rodrigues, 27 Jan 1545, *EX*, i, p. 281; ‘Nenhum amigo voso consentais vir à India com carregos e officios d’El-Rey, porque deles propriamente se pode dizer: “Deleantur de libro viventium et cum iustis non scribantur”’.

<sup>27</sup> Francisco Xavier to members in Rome, 27 Jan 1545, *EX*, i, p. 278. Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 128.

perspective from Xavier from the personal letters, and the same can be said of his companions. Yet both viewpoints served a purpose in the eyes of Xavier, as the secular arm played a role in imposing the moral discipline he and others like vicar general Pero Fernandes Sardinha felt was necessary in Goa.

### *Baptismal self-fashioning*

Serving as superior in Xavier's absence, the rector of the Jesuit college in Goa Antonio Gomes led a mission in September 1549 to catechise the recently converted king of Tanur, christened as Dom João. Despite his Portuguese garments upon his presentation in Goa, the king wanted to preserve particular elements of his previous tradition due to the significance they afforded him as king; mostly the sacred thread, or *linha* in Portuguese, later defended by the renowned accommodationist Roberto de Nobili as a primarily social symbol bereft of religious meaning. In 1546 secular priest Diogo de Borba, the former *magister* of St Paul's College prior to Jesuit administration, claimed the King of Tanur and about a dozen of his family members would convert in secret but not change their external appearance, their habits or 'usual idolatries' so as to preserve authority. Borba felt this request went against the Church Fathers, specifically Augustine and his views on lying in *De Mendacio*, 'in which such dissimulations and lies are in no way permitted, even if the contrary is held within one's heart'.<sup>28</sup> The Bishop of Goa, the Franciscan *piadoso* Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque addressed the controversy in a lengthy letter in October 1549 to Queen Catarina of Portugal, dismissing Borba's opinion, stating 'that the King of Tanur was able to wear some exterior signs of a Brahman, his heart being firm in the faith and believing

---

<sup>28</sup> Mestre Diogo de Borba to Dom João de Castro, 27 Feb 1546, *DHMPPPO*, iii, p. 310; 'em que en nenhuma maneira permite taer desimulações e mentiras, ainda que no coração se tenha ho contrairo'. Cf. Županov, "One civility, but multiple religions", pp. 292-3; and D. Ferrolí, S.J. *The Jesuits in Malabar* (Bangalore, 1939), pp. 133-4.

in Jesus Christ'.<sup>29</sup> However, Albuquerque's expectation, much like Borba had stated, was that eventually Dom João 'would break the thread of the Brahman...and become dressed in the clothes of the Christian, which are Portuguese.'<sup>30</sup>

The correlation between Christianity and Portuguese-ness was typically strong and significant in the eyes of most who laboured under the banner of the *Estado da Índia*. The perspective of Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque regarding the conversion of Dom João of Tanur indicated at some level an understanding of the value of the king's old presentation, particularly as it pertained to the anticipated domino fall of his entire kingdom's subjects post-conversion. Thus, as Županov has argued, 'it was in addressing the issue of the King of Tanur's conversion that the concept of *accommodation*, although not mentioned *expressis verbis*, was invoked for the first time', but this bending of Christian principles was never permanent or even long-term.<sup>31</sup> The expectation of his eventual transition from Indian to Portuguese, regardless of the performative display of such on the streets of Goa, never diminished, even if it signalled a novel decision in the pursuit of conversion.<sup>32</sup> The king was always expected to become a kind of *fidalgo*.

On the decision to allow Dom João to retain his Brahman sacred thread, Bishop Albuquerque noted how 'all delighted to hear of this practice/custom, and it was agreeable to them; and some, who had opinion to the contrary, remained so'.<sup>33</sup> Diogo de Borba certainly disagreed, but so too did António Gomes along the same lines 'of the contrary

---

<sup>29</sup> Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque to the Queen of Portugal, 25 Oct 1549, *DI*, i, p. 542.

<sup>30</sup> Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque to the Queen of Portugal, 25 Oct 1549, *DI*, i, p. 542; cf. Mestre Diogo de Borba to Dom João de Castro, 27 Feb 1546, *DHMPPO*, iii, p. 309.

<sup>31</sup> Županov, "One civility, but multiple religions", p. 292.

<sup>32</sup> Županov, "One civility, but multiple religions", pp. 292-3; Cf. p. 293, 'The insistence on the split between inside (soul) and outside (society), private and public, combined with the conscious strategic maintenance of a certain illusion for the sake of later triumph, marks a new thinking, if not yet a policy, in the conversion of the "gentiles"'.  
<sup>33</sup> Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque to the Queen of Portugal, 25 Oct 1549, *DI*, i, p. 543; 'folguarão de ouvir esta pratica, e paresceo-lhes bem; e algum, que tinha oppenião ao contrayro, ficou desta'.

opinion, saying that it was necessary for him [Dom João] to present himself as Christian in removing the Brahman insignias'.<sup>34</sup> None of the religious men doubted the sincerity of the king's heart, yet Borba questioned his interior motives based on his exterior demands, while Gomes believed he 'does not aim for more than his own salvation'.<sup>35</sup> Borba and Gomes found Dom João's physical appearance to be a form of dissimulation and responded with a more strict view towards his conversion, while the accommodating figure in this instance was the Franciscan bishop. Whereas Roberto de Nobili would later argue for the strictly socio-cultural significance of the *linha* in Madurai, here another Jesuit contended that the strictly religious value warranted its removal. Neither was fully correct, yet the lengths to which the accommodationist Nobili went to better comprehend the overall significance far exceeded the limited attempt by Gomes to do the same for the King of Tanur. In truth Dom João had converted partially to serve his own political interests in the region, and retaining the sacred thread crucially ensured his success in this regard.<sup>36</sup>

### *Educational responsibilities*

Francis Xavier generally did not place education at the forefront of his ministry and instead focused on preaching the Gospel and baptising nonbelievers. He emphasised charismatic ministry and evangelical experience in ensuring salvation, rather than the humanist focus on comprehensive study and improved linguistic and rhetoric capabilities which characterised a number of his Jesuit successors.<sup>37</sup> When he developed a rudimentary

---

<sup>34</sup> Sebastião Gonçalves, *Primeira parte*, ii, p. 36; 'porque o P. Antonio Gomes era de contraria opiniam, disendo ser-lhe necessario manifestar-se per christam tirando as insignias de bramene'. Cf. *DI*, i, p. 543. Gomes' opinion was written in late October 1549, shortly after Albuquerque's.

<sup>35</sup> António Gomes to Dom João III, ca. 25 Oct 1549, *DI*, i, p. 529.

<sup>36</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 299; Gaspar Correia, *Lendas da India* (8 vols, Lisbon, 1858-66), iv, pp. 684-5.

<sup>37</sup> Ananya Chakravarti, *Empire of Apostles*, p. 118. Cf. Correia-Afonso, *Jesuit Letters*, p. 57. Cf. Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 69.

Portuguese catechism in 1542, very little instruction was offered to the initiate before receiving baptism but rather a great deal more after it.<sup>38</sup> Overall, Xavier rarely scrutinised conversion methods. However, Niccolò Lancilotto once again expressed discomfort as well as displeasure in the procedures used not only by Portuguese officials and ecclesiastics, but also fellow Jesuits, offering solutions through education.

Before discussing the issues of catechism and educational responsibilities, Lancilotto more immediately noticed a generally lax approach to the sacramental rites. In his first letter written after arriving in India in September 1545, Lancilotto described the manner in which the various clergy administered the rite of baptism:

‘The manner of baptising them is with their catechism, with holy water, without chrism or any oil, things which I neither praise nor condemn. Here among us there are men who do not wish to baptise anyone in this manner, nor is it possible to remove that scruple from their thinking’<sup>39</sup>

Lancilotto experienced mixed feelings on the practices employed here, seemingly due to the fact that the proper, canonical process was not being respected but other religious were nevertheless converting Goan Indians. Perhaps he was less scandalised by these rapid, mass baptisms because so many Christian conversions had been achieved up to that point.<sup>40</sup> Important to his account, however, is the recognition of an ongoing debate in his mention of some people—assumedly Portuguese, or only clerics—who disagree with this kind of ritually ‘incomplete’ baptism. Lancilotto goes on to describe other tactics employed in the city of Goa, such as the admittance of ‘Turks and Moors and gentiles without any respect’ when mass is said at the cathedral, seemingly to encourage conversion by allowing exposure to the holy mass. It was also possible, however, that the lack of personnel to instruct both

---

<sup>38</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision of India*, p. 48.

<sup>39</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Simão Rodrigues, 22 Oct 1545, *DI*, i, p. 32; ‘La manera de baptizarli è con suo catechismo, con aqua benedicta, sense chresma o olio nisciuno, le quale cose neque laudo neque vitupero. Qui tra noi hai gente che non vole baptizare nignuno de questa manera, nè li possa cavare el scrupulo de la fantasia’.

<sup>40</sup> Joseph Greco, S.J., *Le pouvoir du Souverain Pontife à l’égard des infidèles* (Rome, 1967), p. 49.

potential and recent converts contributed to such openness. Those with whom Lancilotto spoke defended this practice because it allowed non-Christians to witness the ceremonies and ‘sacrifices’ involved, although he noted ‘the canons are to the contrary’.<sup>41</sup> Nevertheless, he remarked ‘I who am not that scrupulous am willing to continue the [local] custom of the land’,<sup>42</sup> which is to say the practice as it existed. In essence, Lancilotto consented to this type of baptism, even if he had reservations about the elements of the process.

The Italian Jesuit did not make reference to any particular theology regarding these conversions, but his remarks two years later expressed a number of concerns about the baptisms and the care converts received after receiving the sacrament. As Aquinas stated in the *Summa Theologica*, baptism should be deferred for an adequate amount of time, not only ‘on account of caution for the Church, in order that it not be deceived in conferring baptism falsely’, but also to provide the opportunity ‘for faith and morals to be examined’ and ‘to be instructed fully in the faith’.<sup>43</sup> Lastly, this period of time was so that catechumenates would not receive baptism until the decreed holy days of Easter or Pentecost. Lancilotto’s main contentions were consistent with these Thomist and canonical opinions in that he witnessed many Indian *gentios* become Christians ‘for purely temporal interests and many of them to poor ends’ or even to avoid imprisonment, and he complained that clerics ‘baptize them in whatever place or in whatever time...without much doctrine’, and subsequently ‘many return to gentilism [heathenism] and Islam’.<sup>44</sup>

---

<sup>41</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Simão Rodrigues, 22 Oct 1545, *DI*, i, p. 32. Precisely which canons is unclear.

<sup>42</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Simão Rodrigues, 22 Oct 1545, *DI*, i, p. 32; ‘io che non so molto scrupoloso me ne vado con el costume de la terra’.

<sup>43</sup> *Summa Theologica*, III 68.3; ‘propter cautelam Ecclesiae, ne decipiatur, fite accedentibus conferens...quando per aliquod spatium eorum fides et mores examinantur...quia aliquo temporis spatio indigent ad hoc quod plene instruantur de fide, et exercitentur in his quae pertinent ad vitam Christianam’.

<sup>44</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 10 Oct 1547, *DI*, i, pp. 182-3; ‘se hazen todos por puro enterresse temporale y muchos dellos a mal fin’; ‘La manera que tienen de los bautizar es que en qualquiera logar o em qualquiera tiempo...sin más doctrina’; ‘Muchos dellos se toernan a la gentilidad y a la morama’.

Lancilotto's contemporary and compatriot Antonio Criminali explained extensively how the process of instruction should be carried out for these adult converts. After explaining in late 1545 the means by which converts were baptised in Goa—that is to say, the Indian non-Christians 'gather and say that they want to be Christians; when the sermon is over, when it is preached, they [priests] baptise them immediately'—Criminali gave his opinion on the same issues as Lancilotto, which included the absence of oil or chrism and the lack of instruction. In contrast to his companion, however, Criminali explicitly referenced the teachings of Aquinas, as well as other Dominican theologians such as Silvestro Mazzolini and Antonio Pierozzi, regarding the amount of time deemed necessary for sufficient instruction in the Christian faith; a period which he said could be forty days (as Erasmus had suggested, along the ancient practice of a Lenten-long catechumenate) or, following the theologians he cited, six months 'or according to the opinion of a prudent man'.<sup>45</sup> In his statements, he was certainly far more critical about the practice of the church in Goa than Lancilotto, often repeating how 'incomplete' each ceremony was, regardless whether it happens in the city's churches or those in the surrounding islands. Criminali declared, 'I tell them that if they baptise them, that I have scruples in this'.<sup>46</sup>

It is possible to see the procedures as described by Lancilotto as an example of adjusting the rigours of doctrine to fit the local context, but the second opinion of Criminali portrays outright concern over such laxity in administration of sacraments. Arguably, these adaptations were not done to suit the indigenous people, nor to respect and not contradict their customs according to Ignatius, but rather implemented to suit the lack of personnel, the imperial objective of Christian uniformity across Portuguese territories, and the desire

---

<sup>45</sup> Antonio Criminali to Ignatius of Loyola, 7 Oct 1545, *DI*, i, pp. 13-14; 'conveneno e dicono che voleno essere christiani; finite la predica, quando si predica, subit[o] li baptizano'; '6 mesi o secondo al parere de uno homo prudente'.

<sup>46</sup> Antonio Criminali to Ignatius of Loyola, *DI*, i, pp. 15-16; 'Io le dico che lori se li baptizano, che io tegno scrupulo in questo'.

to see the latter realised in spite of the former. As many have stated, conversion was a highly political matter, and was tied to the establishment of rule in Goa.<sup>47</sup> Based on Lancilotto's account, there were not enough clerics to instruct indigenous Goans in the faith which they purportedly willingly accepted. Francis Xavier even noted how 'the wives of settlers born here, and mestiço daughters and sons, are content in saying that they are Portuguese by family/nation and not by law: the cause of this is the lack of preachers here who teach the law of Christ'.<sup>48</sup> Instead clerics viewed it as a sign of the victory of religion and evidence that the rest of Asia would fall just as easily—the divine providence ordained to the cause of the propagation of faith.

One example provides evidence of some shift in the process of conversion realised by some Jesuits. In January of 1549, Manuel de Morães wrote to the Society at Coimbra about the positive state of missionary work in the area of Travancore in the far southern point of India, describing among many things the method in which he and his companions carried out baptisms. Although he did not indicate a long period of catechetical instruction, Morães nevertheless noted that 'first we work to guide them to an understanding of the truth, and for some days have them learning the orations and instructing them in the truth'.<sup>49</sup> While this certainly questioned some claims of prior reports on procedures carried out in the capital of the *Estado*, the location of this mission pointed to a different experience in the areas outside Portuguese jurisdiction.

The narrative proceeded to describe how with some speed the neophytes were escorted to the church, gave confession and learned the important prayers and creed, and received the sign of the cross per the baptismal rites. Even after all these steps, Morães noted

---

<sup>47</sup> Rowena Robinson, *Conversion, Continuity and Change*, p. 44; Županov, 'Conversion Historiography', p. 312.

<sup>48</sup> Francisco Xavier To Dom João III, 16 May 1546, *DHMPPQ*, iii, p. 351.

<sup>49</sup> Manuel de Morães to the Society at Coimbra, 3 Jan 1549, *DI*, i, p. 464; 'primeiro trabalhamos polo[s] trazer a conhecimento da verdade, e tê-llos alguns dias aprendendo as orações e instruindo-os na verdade'.

that they then proceeded to carry out the sacrament of marriage for some new converts.<sup>50</sup> Given that the people described by the Jesuit were *paraiyas*, a southern Indian caste group of low status, there is a further dimension of potential benefit for a group that stood outside of caste, whose movement into the Church could have afforded some social capital, at least under the auspices of the Portuguese.<sup>51</sup> Therefore, the quick pace of the sacramental process could equally have been encouraged by missionaries as *gentios*. If we look other parts of his letter, however, some aspects of ministry presented optimism about achieving Lancilotto and Crimali's intended *modus procedendi*—the instruction of local people in groups there by those who already knew the language and taught both adults and young children.<sup>52</sup>

In a way these practises corresponded to accommodation strategies. Although it is unclear as to the length of time during which this catechism took place, on display were conversions of comparably less force or imposition than that taking place in Goa, accompanied by competent interlocutors bridging the divide of language. Spatially, the absence of more imposing colonial systems created favourable conditions for such a sacramental process to take place. However, as some members passed and superiors changed, the expectation of obedience from new personnel reinforced the more strong-handed methods amongst the Jesuits, showing once again both the limits of accommodation and the voices in opposition.

---

<sup>50</sup> Manuel de Morães to the Society at Coimbra, 3 Jan 1549, *DI*, i, pp. 464-5.

<sup>51</sup> Cf. Georg Schurhammer, 'Letters of D. João da Cruz in the National Archives of Lisbon', *Kerala Society Papers* 1 (1930) pp. 304-7; *ibid.*, 'João da Cruz, a Chetti, not a Nair', *Kerala Society Papers* 2 (1932) p. 276; and *ibid.*, 'Die Bekehrung der Paraver', in *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 4 (1935) pp. 207-15. Cf. António da Silva Rego, *Historia das missões do Padroado Português do Oriente* (Lisbon, 1949), pp. 365-75; and *DHMPPQ*, i, pp. 260-75, 278; *ibid.*, ii, pp. 256-61.

<sup>52</sup> Manuel de Morães to the Society at Coimbra, 3 Jan 1549, *DI*, i, pp. 463-4.

### Forced conversions and the Estado

A spirit of rigour, similar in form to and presumably derived from what had blossomed in Portugal in the late 1550s, appeared through such figures as Gonçalo da Silveira, António de Quadros, and Francisco Rodrigues—‘all supporters of the Inquisition’.<sup>53</sup> Josef Wicki identified this current of rigour as not only commensurate with the activity of the Holy Office, but also the view of force in conversion. Between the arrival of this contingent and 1560, the number of conversions saw tremendous increases; whereas in 1556 new converts counted forty-two, subsequent years reached the thousands, culminating in over twelve thousand in 1560.<sup>54</sup> Affinities for these rigorist methods coalesced into certain factions. Cristovão da Costa wrote from Bassein in November 1560 noted that ‘with these [indigenous] people we do more with external force than humility, whereby [with humility] the internal is much more necessary’, deeming the external more effective.<sup>55</sup> This way of proceeding was undoubtedly influenced by the temptation to deploy the secular arm, often employed by Jesuits in places like Goa and Cochin as the physical force by which they could impart the sense of *potestas*, yet also given legitimacy through the emphasis on internal motivations of humility over any external machinations of ambition. Costa absolved himself of any external force, pointing to how he never lost sight of interior humility even though he relied on lay authorities to bolster his mission—for example, enquiring the help of the captain to destroy a temple in Bassein and litter the steps of a *tirtha* or ritual tank, as well as other sites, with the blood and entrails of a cow, effectively desecrating it to Hindus—an initiative also clearly reliant on sound

---

<sup>53</sup> Wicki, ‘De domibus, collegiis’, p. 4\*.

<sup>54</sup> Luís Fróis to the Society in Portugal, 13 Nov 1560, *DI*, iv, pp. 786-809.

<sup>55</sup> Cristovão da Costa to the Society in Europe, 17 Nov 1560, *DI*, iv, p. 707-8; ‘com esta gemte mais se ffaz com potencia que com humilldade exterior, pollo quall a interior nos hé muito mais necessaria’.

understanding of local forms of pollution.<sup>56</sup> Similarly António Gomes had relied on a close relationship with both Bishop of Goa Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque and the governor Jorge Cabral, a coalition which was later criticised by the successive viceroy Afonso de Noronha.<sup>57</sup>

Subsequently, in 1560 and 1563, all Brahmans were banished from the islands of Goa and Hindu ceremonies were prohibited, a policy once promulgated by the Jesuit Gonçalo da Silveira in the previous decade. Jesuit collaboration with the *Estado* continued, as the measures were executed by then viceroy Dom Constantino de Bragança, with whom Francisco Rodrigues and Melchior Carneiro liaised, as well as the provincial Antonio de Quadros. In oddly similar fashion to Lancilotto, Quadros remarked how *gentios* often become Christian, playing down the various motivations through which indigenous Goans sought baptism and claiming instead the presence of will as legitimation. He stated that

‘others come because Our Lord brings them, without anyone else persuading them...others, and these are the least numerous, come because they are constrained to do so by the laws which Your Highness has promulgated in these lands, in which Hindu temples are prohibited and Hindu ceremonies are banned...and after being imprisoned, out of fear of punishment, they ask for the holy baptism’.<sup>58</sup>

His companion Melchior Nunes Barreto, on the other hand, asked what other recourse there was ‘but to see [gentiles] moved with gifts and praise, with punishments, with favours, with disfavours, with everything that can move them to want to be catechised’.<sup>59</sup> Quadros attributed the ‘constraining’ to royal decrees, yet he seemed unfazed by the ensuing measures employed within the spirit of these laws. In fact, these laws even emboldened his efforts, allowing him greater access to a pool of Hindu prisoners with whom he could further

---

<sup>56</sup> Teotonio de Souza, ‘The Council of Trent (1545-1563): Its Reception in Portuguese India’, in Klaus Koschorke (ed), *Transcontinental Links in the History of Non-Western Christianity* (Wiesbaden, 2002), p. 192.

<sup>57</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 138.

<sup>58</sup> António de Quadros to the King of Portugal, 14 Jan 1561, *DI*, v, p. 64; cf. Boxer, *Portuguese Seaborne Empire*, p. 70.

<sup>59</sup> Melchior Nunes Barreto to Diego Laínez, 15 Jan 1562, *DI*, v, p. 485.

compel towards conversion. Those that expressed interest in becoming Christian were released from prison and brought to the Jesuit college, where they were invited to learn more about the faith and share a meal with the brothers. As he noted, even if they arrived due to fear of punishment, ‘charity is that those who come wanting to be taught cannot be denied’. Knowing full well of the custom by which Hindus who share food with outcastes such as Christians ‘lose their place of being *gentios*’, Quadros described how ‘those that have our food to eat and on our plates, they soon become incapable of being *gentios* and end up without hope of retaining caste, and unavoidably have to take another law because they lost that which they had...those who understand, do not call this making Christians by force’.<sup>60</sup>

One who apparently did not understand was Antonio de Heredia (fl. 1545-62), one time superior of the college in Cochin and missionary to Ormuz before returning to Portugal in 1561. It was there that he wrote a damning letter, possibly intended for visitor Jerónimo Nadal, in which he described the scandals he witnessed. Heredia claimed that Quadros, along with collateral provincial Francisco Rodrigues and titular Bishop of Nicaea Melchior Carneiro, had gained the favour of Dom Constantino de Bragança, giving the Jesuits license to carry out more of the viceroy’s agenda and supporting him through their theologians, not to mention Rodrigues and Quadros’ role as deputies for the newly-arrived Holy Office.<sup>61</sup> One other Jesuit, Melchior Nunes Barreto, expressed pride in this collaboration, in that ‘many gentiles became Christians these past years with great labour and cost of our Fathers and favour of the Viceroy Dom Constantino’.<sup>62</sup> Heredia implicated his Jesuit superiors in this campaign, noting that ‘the method was so excessive (*exorbitante*) that it cannot but leave the whole of India scandalized’.<sup>63</sup> Referencing the opinions of local Muslims, he

---

<sup>60</sup> António de Quadros to the King of Portugal, 14 Jan 1561, *DI*, v, p. 65.

<sup>61</sup> António de Herédia to some important father, Autumn 1561, *DI*, v, p. 194.

<sup>62</sup> Melchior Nunes Barreto to Diego Laínez, 15 Jan 1562, *DI*, v, p. 484.

<sup>63</sup> António de Herédia to some important father, Autumn 1561, *DI*, v, p. 193.

argued that Quadros' claims of not using force were disingenuous, for recent laws had indeed forced non-Christians to either leave the islands or convert, and those who stayed were subject to Christian law. Amongst other solutions, he advised that the next superiors sent to India preferably not come from Portugal.<sup>64</sup>

Melchior Carneiro attested to Heredia's claims in his letter to Cardinal Dom Henrique in 1557, defending the strong-armed practices in part 'because gentiles are not moved now with the love of the Gospel, rather Our Lord deceives them with human means as he deceives many who enter in the Religion'.<sup>65</sup> In a seemingly original argument for divine intervention even in what Lancilotto had called conversions 'for purely temporal interests and many of them to poor ends', Carneiro allowed for the acceptance of conversion through some degree of will along Scotian theological lines, despite the suggested deception.<sup>66</sup> Confirming Heredia's claims of state collaboration as well, Carneiro attributed the growth of the faith to not only 'the goodness of God...with the arrival of Dom Gonçalo [da Silveira]' but also the Governor Francisco Barreto (r. 1555-58) who 'now favours Christianity as required'.<sup>67</sup> Governor Barreto, alongside the misgivings he had towards the Inquisition as discussed in the next chapter, had earlier decreed a number of more lenient measures that favoured the indigenous population, including allowing Brahmans to celebrate certain ceremonies and paying gentile or Muslim slave owners for their slaves if they converted to Christianity and transferring them to Christians. Some Jesuits such as Balthasar Dias even complained that the Dominicans and Franciscans did not write to the king with criticisms of these decrees.<sup>68</sup> Barreto had been induced to change his mind through the pressure which arrived with the more rigorist Jesuit faction in 1556-57 who immediately

---

<sup>64</sup> António de Herédia to some important father, Autumn 1561, *DI*, v, p. 197.

<sup>65</sup> Melchior Carneiro to Cardinal Infante Henrique, 20 Dec 1557, *DI*, v, p. 9.

<sup>66</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, 10 Oct 1547, *DI*, i, pp. 182-3.

<sup>67</sup> Melchior Carneiro to Cardinal Infante Henrique, 20 Dec 1557, *DI*, iv, p. 9.

<sup>68</sup> Ana Cannas da Cunha, *A Inquisição no Estado da Índia: Origens (1539-1560)* (Lisbon, 1995), pp. 121-2.

commanded more influence in Goa. The governor acquiesced to demands for more public and extravagant mass baptismal ceremonies, heavily influenced by the moral authority of Francisco Rodrigues.<sup>69</sup>

*The Moral Theology of Francisco Rodrigues*

The other figure criticised by Heredia, Francisco Rodrigues, serves as an intriguing example in the discussion of conversion methods. Rodrigues entered the Society of Jesus in 1548 in Portugal and soon thereafter rose to the position of master of the Jesuit college in Lisbon, Saint Antony's.<sup>70</sup> He departed for India in 1556 and again became quickly instrumental in provincial administration there, this time as rector of the College of Saint Paul and associate Provincial, a position he shared with Gonçalo da Silveira. Besides this role within the order, Rodrigues was also active in the greater colonial and ecclesiastical spheres, most notably through his position as auxiliary judge for the Goan Inquisition, alongside fellow Jesuit António de Quadros, followed by appointment as one of the first deputies for the Goan tribunal of the Mesa da Consciência upon its establishment in 1570. With Quadros and a third companion Melchior Nunes Barreto, Rodrigues brought a renewed sense of purpose through preaching and exhortation to the people of Goa, but this kind of rigour was accompanied by a stronger emphasis on law and structure—Diogo do Couto had characterised Rodrigues by his expertise in '*canones*' and status as a preacher and rhetorician.<sup>71</sup> This group of three companions had ordered the first standardised confessional to be printed and sent with Xavier's early doctrinal text to all the Portuguese forts where Jesuits were stationed, whilst Quadros had been appointed to introduce the Jesuit

---

<sup>69</sup> Marcocci, *Consciência de um Império*, p. 394.

<sup>70</sup> Francisco Rodrigues to the Society in Portugal, 2 Nov 1556, *DI*, iii, p. 500.

<sup>71</sup> Diogo do Couto, *Da Asia. Decada Setima, Parte Primeira* (Lisbon, 1782), liv. II, cap. VII, p. 156.

Constitutions to India when he arrived in 1555.<sup>72</sup> It was Rodrigues' background in canon law, however, that contributed most significantly to the more rigorous measures in Goa leading up to the ecclesiastical council.

Before these larger events, Rodrigues indicated some negative opinion of the indigenous population in letters to his superiors. When Brahman convert Pedro Luís petitioned the Superior General Diego Laínez for ordainment and acceptance into the Society of Jesus in November 1559, the letter passed through the hands of the associate provincial Rodrigues en route to Portugal. In a postscript he wrote how 'we are so struck by the poor account that some have given of him which is believed here that (even though none [like him] are received in the Society) we do not have confidence in him', and instead he recommended the Portuguese-born António Belo.<sup>73</sup> Although existing policy prohibited native clergy in India at the time, Laínez ultimately admitted Luís. Rodrigues' behaviour should not surprise. As Sabina Pavone notes, the violence directed towards prospective converts and neophytes correlates with prejudice against native clergy, citing Županov and Xavier's observation of power dynamics reinforced by civil and ecclesiastical authorities—regardless of uniformity of faith, the 'coloniser' possessed higher status and power over the 'colonised'.<sup>74</sup>

Similar to Xavier, Rodrigues preferred those with virtue instead of education, having found the local population to not benefit from such intellect. He wrote to the superior in Portugal how 'all other [non-Portuguese] men understand almost nothing', and consequently 'it does one better with two degrees of virtue than with all the letters of the

---

<sup>72</sup> Luís Fróis to the Society at Coimbra, 30 Nov 1557, *DI*, iii, p. 711.

<sup>73</sup> Francisco Rodrigues to Diego Laínez, 17 Nov 1559, *DI*, iv, p. 391; 'nós amdamos tão asombrados da maa conta que de sim tem dado alguns que aqui se criarão (ainda que nenhum se recebeo na Companhia) que nos não fiamos [de]les'.

<sup>74</sup> Sabina Pavone, 'Practices of Conversion in South India in the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> Centuries: Strategies and Narratives' in Lavenia et al, *Compel People to Come In*, p. 132; Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, p. 255.

world'.<sup>75</sup> Despite these viewpoints, Rodrigues' position as a preacher and *letrado* (a 'man of letters') edified many other Jesuits, while he was recognised, ironically, for his knowledge of Hindu 'law' on which very little has been written.<sup>76</sup> It was *letrados* like Rodrigues who drew the ire of the captain of Cochin, Diogo Alvares Teles, amidst the *converso* controversy in 1557 as described in the upcoming chapter, claiming that he never accomplished anything and instead merely interfered in local matters.<sup>77</sup>

Outside of a couple reports, there are few letters or records attributed to Rodrigues, although multiple other Jesuits reference him or his deeds in India over the course of his twenty years spent in Asia.<sup>78</sup> What he did not write others did for him, as Luís Fróis—commissioned by Rodrigues himself—recounted the deeds of the provincial in a letter from November 1557.<sup>79</sup> Concerning the moral theology of conversion, Rodrigues' decisions seemed to fit within the prevailing currents of imperial Portuguese political thought. He was attributed with the 'provisions' that intended to remove *gentios* from any official administrative roles in the *Estado* and replace them with Christians, place non-Christian orphans in the care of the Jesuit college (ultimately for conversion), bequeath property of those *gentios* who died without inheritors to Christians, and grant privileges to Portuguese citizens, while prohibiting 'gentilic rites and ceremonies'. All exacted heavy penalties on offenders. Fróis boasted how not only did Rodrigues encourage the Christians of Goa to pressure the governor towards these measures, but that most importantly

'as the Christians began to feel the favour of God Our Lord and of his prince [Dom João III], they began to enliven themselves greatly...and began to persuade the gentile parents that they should want to become Christian, so they would see the

---

<sup>75</sup> Francisco Rodrigues to Leão Henriques, 5 Dec 1560, *DI*, iv, p. 763; 'toda a outra gente quasi nenhuma cousa entende...mais se faz com dous graos de virtude que com todas as letras do mundo'.

<sup>76</sup> Luís Fróis to the Society in Portugal, 13 Nov 1560, *DI*, iv, p. 801. It remains unclear what the extent of Rodrigues' knowledge of Hindu law was exactly.

<sup>77</sup> Francisco Fernandes, *Testimonium Francisci Fernandes de Altercatione Inter P. M. Carneiro S.I. et Did. Alvares Teles, Praefectum Cocin.*, 5 May 1557, *DI*, iii, p. 641.

<sup>78</sup> Cf. *DI*, iii, docs. 63 & 90; iv, docs. 45 & 99.

<sup>79</sup> Luís Fróis to Jesuits in Europe, 30 Nov 1557, *DHMPPPO*, vi, pp. 327-57.

good that comes to them; soon many gentiles and some Moors ran to this college [St Paul's] to catechize themselves in order to receive the holy baptism'<sup>80</sup>

With the arrival of Dom Constantino de Bragança as viceroy in 1559, Rodrigues was only emboldened further to see a more Christian city of Goa realized. Mass baptisms became the norm as Jesuit influence grew through administrative collaboration, and the Holy Office began its first formal proceedings at the start of the 1560s. As Marcocci aptly notes, 'the enthusiasm seemed to silence all doubts about the liturgy and religious instruction of converts'.<sup>81</sup> Together with Quadros, the provincials seemingly subscribed to a Scotian view of the Christian prince as more virtuous or having more authority than parents in baptising their child. As his companion Quadros believed, citing Aquinas of all people, 'in no way will they suffer those who are under the Christian princes'—a mentality also found with Scotus.<sup>82</sup> Seeking to dispute once again the claim of forced conversion policies, Quadros sought to legitimise through a more widely accepted church authority, rather than the more obscure one, the uniformity of faith he and his secular officials had secured

Besides the aforementioned questions about the priorities of some Jesuits and how these corresponded with those of the Portuguese state, we return to the point of theology itself and what might have justified certain affinities for forceful measures. Marcocci argues that Rodrigues and Quadros in Goa were in close contact with Franciscans and thus influenced by the Scotian theology to which the friars subscribed. It is even claimed that Quadros had been inspired to go about the city of Goa barefoot—a move which was met with some derision by at least one clerical author—taking inspiration from the disalced reformed Franciscans in the city.<sup>83</sup> The earliest Franciscan history of Indian missions

---

<sup>80</sup> Luís Fróis to Jesuits in Europe, 30 Nov 1557, *DHMPPPO*, vi, pp. 346-7.

<sup>81</sup> Marcocci, *Consciência de um Império*, p. 394.

<sup>82</sup> António de Quadros to the King of Portugal, 14 Jan 1561, *DI*, v, p. 66.

<sup>83</sup> Alberts, *Conflict and Conversion*, pp. 93-5; on the letter of the cleric cited by Alberts, cf. Rome, ARSI, Fondo Gesuitico, Tit. VIII, n. 722, fo. 56v.

produced by Frei Paolo do Trindade (fl. 1595-1651), the *Conquista Espiritual do Oriente* (1630-36) attested to the necessity of taking up orphans and children of *gentios* to instruct them in the faith, even against the will of their own family. For orphans with no family, Frei Trindade recounted how in the second half of the sixteenth century they would be taken by the friars to their college and ‘made Christians’. On the method of the Franciscans regarding an orphan whose father had died but whose mother or grandparents were living, they ‘took such orphan and removed him from home and possession of the mother, when she did not want to make him Christian, and gave him to a Christian tutor, as was ordered by Viceroy Dom Antão de Noronha [1567] and confirmed by the governor Fernão Teles [1581] from the advice of the *letrados*’.<sup>84</sup> This policy had not always been in place, as from 1559 Dom Sebastião had decreed that only those orphans without parents or grandparents could be turned over to the state body, the *juiz dos órfãos*, but notably these orphans were to be placed in the Jesuit college of St Paul’s, where they would be baptised.<sup>85</sup> In the shift towards greater authority of the state over parents, it was the *letrados* Rodrigues and Quadros who had contributed to the council through which this decree first became the law.

Against the tide of more coercive developments, the first archbishop Dom Gaspar de Leão Pereira arrived in Goa in 1561, forming an effective foil to Jesuit superiors’ dominance of the theological discourse in the *Estado* capital. Melchior Nunes Barreto recounted to the Superior General the next year how the ‘rumour’ that Christians ‘were made in Saint Paul’s by force’ persuaded Pereira ‘to disfavour the method of [forced] conversion, in such a way that it greatly hampered the affairs of Christianity...so much that the devil then prevailed with his idolatries and demolished the soul of the Christians’.

---

<sup>84</sup> Trindade, *Conquista Espiritual do Oriente*, i, pp. 370-73.

<sup>85</sup> Timothy Coates, *Convicts and Orphans: Forced and State-Sponsored Colonizers in the Portuguese Empire, 1550-1755* (Stanford, 2002), p. 166.

Beyond the dire scenes he depicted, Barreto worried how this ‘caused there to not be such close conversation and conformity between the Lord Archbishop and the Father Provincial [António de Quadros]’, given that Quadros had done nothing wrong in his eyes.<sup>86</sup> Barreto and Quadros thus blamed the lack of progress of Christendom solely on Pereira’s interventions.

The council which finally convened in 1567 was part of an attempt by the new archbishop to establish religious conformity in response to the greater ecclesiastical authority enjoyed by the Jesuit superiors and their supporters during the few years between the death of Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque in 1553 and the delayed arrival of Archbishop Pereira, as well as the new disputes that had arisen between various clerical authorities. While Pereira was successful in his campaign to prohibit forced conversion through the council, further decrees extended a number of laws intended to favour Christianity and establish uniformity of faith in the Goan islands, bolstered by the presence of the Inquisition and conforming to the canons of the Council of Trent.<sup>87</sup> Church officials and representatives of the religious orders used this first council to reinforce the position that all other religions, sects, and *luterano* beliefs were false and heretical, while affirming the banishment of Brahmans from Goa. In light of issues discussed above, however, some crucial decisions were made; ‘removing the abuses that in clerical persons is known’, and against methods employed by such Jesuits as António de Quadros they determined ‘that no one may induce these *gentios* to eat against their will’.<sup>88</sup> Although the council settled things at the moment, conversion methods remained contentious; the Third Goan Provincial Council in 1584 saw

---

<sup>86</sup> Melchior Nunes Barreto to Diego Laínez, 15 Jan 1562, *DI*, v, p. 485.

<sup>87</sup> Dom Jorge Themudo, ‘Primeiro Concílio Provincial de Goa’, 1567, *DHMPPPO*, x, p. 334.

<sup>88</sup> Dom Jorge Themudo, ‘Primeiro Concílio Provincial de Goa’, 1567, *DHMPPPO*, x, pp. 338, 342.

thirty out of the sixty-six total decrees deal with conversion policy and the handling of new converts.<sup>89</sup>

While Francisco Rodrigues' attendance at the council was certainly significant, his most important contribution in fact proved to be the extensive responses on 'cases of conscience' pertaining to moral theology and economy throughout the various environs of Portuguese imperial control in Asia, the *Comentários sobre os casos versados* (ca. 1571).<sup>90</sup> These cases, frequently discussed at St Paul's College throughout his time in Goa, essentially served as casuistry training for Jesuit novices. Out of the entire two hundred-eighty folios of the *Comentários*, only about one hundred pertain to Rodrigues. This excludes some sections one might expect he wrote, such as one penned by a different, unknown author dealing with cases of the Inquisition. At the same time, Rodrigues interceded on cases dealing with East Asia, such as the 'Response to some cases questioned by the fathers of Japan' and a treatise on the moral cases of Malacca written by Manuel de Carvalho, places which he never visited.<sup>91</sup> In terms of questions concerning his then-home

---

<sup>89</sup> Mercês de Melo, *Recruitment and Formation of the Native Clergy*, p. 133.

<sup>90</sup> 'Comentários do Padre Francisco Rodrigues da Companhia de Jesus sobre os casos versados na Índia e suas partes com muitas outras resoluções mui importantes e necessárias aos confessores, com seu index de todas as coisas que neste livro se contém' ANTT, Manuscritos da Livraria, no. 805, fos. 280. [Henceforth *Comentários*]

<sup>91</sup> Ana Fernandes Pinto and Silvana Remédio Pires, 'The "Resposta que alguns padres de Japão mandaram perguntar": a clash of strategies?' *Bulletin of Portuguese-Japanese Studies* 10-11 (2005), pp. 9-60; Manuel Lobato, 'Notas e correções para uma edição crítica do Ms. da Livraria n.º 805 (IAN/TT), a propósito da publicação de um tratado do P.e Manuel de Carvalho SJ' *Anais de Historia de Alem-Mar* 3 (2002), 389-408. Josef Wicki published an article mainly describing the organisation of the manuscript in the Torre do Tombo, cf. Josef Wicki, 'Problemas Morais no Oriente Portugues do Século XV' in *O Centro de Estudos Históricos Ultramarinos e as Comemorações Henriquinas* (Lisbon, 1961); Giuseppe Marcocci discussed a few cases pertaining to the decisions made regarding trade and the Portuguese monopoly on pepper, cf. 'Conscience and Empire: Politics and Moral Theology in the Early Modern Portuguese World' *Journal of Early Modern History* 18 (2014), pp. 473-94, and earlier work, Giuseppe Marcocci, 'Teologia e missioni in un impero commerciale: casi di coscienza e sacramenti nel mondo portoghese, ca. 1550-1600' *Cristianesimo nella Storia* 31/2 (2010), pp. 451-82. Recent discussions include Rômulo da Silva Ehalt, 'Casuística nos Trópicos: a pragmática teológico-moral de Francisco Rodrigues na Ásia portuguesa (séculos XVI e XVII), *Revista de História da Sociedade e da Cultura* 19 (2019), pp. 399-418; and Sanjay Subrahmanyam, 'Morality and Empire: Cases, Norms, and Exceptions in Sixteenth-Century Portuguese Asia', in Carlo Ginzburg and Lucio Biasiori (eds), *A Historical Approach to Casuistry: Norms and Exceptions in a Comparative Perspective* (London, 2019), pp. 219-38.

of India, the cases mostly pertain to more political affairs like royal contracts for measurements of rice to the law on prisons and their administration by viceregal authorities.<sup>92</sup> His work on moral economy afforded him greater prominence as a theologian, but it also contributed to a growing network of missionary casuistry debates on a variety of concerns of conscience and moral theology.<sup>93</sup>

The practice of casuistry provides an intriguing final point of reflection on the question of the extent of cultural accommodation present amidst the conversion debates. The contributions made by Rodrigues to casuistry have been argued as an example of missionary accommodation, based on the flexible approach he took to cases which Jesuit fathers in Japan posed to him in order to gauge the theological basis on local questions. As John O'Malley notes, casuistry itself developed out of the rhetorical tradition of *accommodatio*.<sup>94</sup> Ana Fernandes Pinto and Silvana Remédio Pires find that Rodrigues' casuistry corresponds with accommodation through the pragmatism shown by the Jesuit theologian in deciding these complex questions. Although many of his responses conformed with the decrees of the Goan Council in which he participated, there are many that answered to the contrary in the context of East Asia.<sup>95</sup> Many of these cases dealt with aberrations in the baptismal liturgy in Japan, the responses going against some of the same decisions Rodrigues handled at the council years earlier 'either because he agreed with the necessity not to scandalise the Japanese or because he felt that these changes in the method of proceeding with regard to these matters did not contradict the doctrine in any way'.<sup>96</sup>

Pragmatic judgments made by theologians like Rodrigues prove nonetheless important, as more recent scholarship has shown. As Rômulo Ehalt points out, although

---

<sup>92</sup> Wicki, 'Problemas Morais', p. 259.

<sup>93</sup> Marcocci, 'Conscience and Empire', p. 488.

<sup>94</sup> O'Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 255.

<sup>95</sup> Pinto and Pires, 'The "Resposta"' p. 19.

<sup>96</sup> Pinto and Pires, 'The "Resposta"' p. 21.

often informed by the opinions of Thomist theologians like Domingo de Soto and Martín de Azpilcueta Navarro on various cases, through their lived experience within the missions throughout Asia Jesuit *letrados* in Goa ‘reinterpreted the solutions encountered in European moral theology and constructed a genuine textual corpus of pragmatic knowledge’ pertaining both to more crucial issues of conversion as well as common concerns of social and commercial activity.<sup>97</sup> In the context of Japan, one such case that lacked precedent involved the question of baptism of foundlings, to which Rodrigues suggested that either Christians raise them or, where this is not possible, they ‘should be baptized and left to their own devices, concluding that “it is less inconvenient for the gentiles to raise some baptized ones, than to keep them from salvation”’.<sup>98</sup> In contrast to the policies within Goa regarding orphans as mentioned above, the absence of Portuguese state power in Japan necessitated such a seemingly pragmatic decision from the perspective of the theologian, yet it failed to address the question of will that has been at odds in the discussion here. In fact, as Giuseppe Marcocci argues, decisions such as this and many other responses which comprised the *Comentários* mainly ‘aimed at promoting entry among the ranks of the converted wherever possible’.<sup>99</sup>

Rodrigues’ subtle approbation of Scotian conversion theology could perhaps be expected within the realm of Jesuit flexibility, and his contribution to early missionary casuistry is certainly historically significant, nevertheless the argument is not quite strong. One could draw upon his own reference to the oft-cited ‘*omnibus omnia factus sum*’ of Saint Paul in the case of whether Jesuits could shave their heads and beards like the Buddhist *bonzes*, yet his decisions are nevertheless drawn not from personal experience but rather the

---

<sup>97</sup> Ehalt, ‘Casuística nos Trópicos’, p. 405.

<sup>98</sup> Ehalt, ‘Casuística nos Trópicos’, p. 411; Biblioteca do Palácio Nacional da Ajuda, Jesuítas na Ásia, 49-VI-6, f. 99v-100.

<sup>99</sup> Marcocci, ‘Teologia e missioni’, p. 465.

experiments of others.<sup>100</sup> Perhaps present here in the case opinions of Rodrigues was a recognition of the difficulties faced by Jesuits in Japan dissimilar from those in India, a situation not unlike that of Alessandro Valignano described in chapter five of this thesis, not to mention the fledgling condition of the Japan mission at this time. Nevertheless, we should not confuse flexibility with missionary accommodation. Rodrigues' adaptability of thought pertained to cases of conscience which he handled with perspective from a distance. In the tradition of casuistry he responded to specific cases through theological consultation and prior opinions rendered on similar matters, rather than determining the course of action based on local empiricism, instead relying on others' assessments. In observing a case to determine whether it went against canons or doctrine, there was an implicit understanding on the part of Rodrigues that adjustments to Japanese cultural norms were normal whilst Indian ones were not, presumably due to existing imperial power over the latter. Even in judgments that seemingly defended indigenous rights, self-interest likely played a greater role, whether through the aspiration for universal conversion or even their own commercial pursuits as Sanjay Subrahmanyam has shown in the case of Malacca.<sup>101</sup> Much like we will see later, this tendency to afford greater understanding of cultural difference amongst 'white' Asians compared to the diverse communities of southern India also evinces a noticeable discrepancy in judgment of culture and civility, perhaps influenced like many others by racial classifications. For Rodrigues, whilst he supported the flexibility of the missions in East Asia, he defended the rigidity of the church and clerics in the Portuguese territories of South Asia.

---

<sup>100</sup> *Comentarios*, ANTT, Manuscritos da Livraria, no. 805, fo. 131; Pinto and Pires, 'The "Resposta"' p. 55.

<sup>101</sup> Subrahmanyam, 'Morality and Empire', p. 232; the aim for 'universal conversion' is a somewhat recurring theme in the discussion of casuistry in Marcocci, 'Teologia e missioni', pp. 453, 469.

## Conclusion

With the death of Francisco Rodrigues and António de Quadros, the direct Jesuit involvement with the Inquisition and the Mesa da Consciência ended, but the Society's complicated relationship with state and ecclesiastical institutions in India continued. As the Jesuit enterprise in India developed in various communities, incoming members of the Society brought different perspectives to the questions of conversion and ministry, as they pertained to both orthodoxy and orthopraxy. The established presence enabled an easier transition for newcomers to the mission field and therefore a shorter learning curve. This foundation, though still relatively young in the 1550s, proved sufficient for a more vigorous debate to manifest intramurally over the policies towards non-Christians and newly-initiated Christians alike. The outcomes of these initiatives helped to shape the methodologies of the Society in India for the next few decades that followed, codifying the opinions of the stronger majority and pushing aside the relative diversity of perspectives that, while chaotic for a religious order in need of consistency, had the potential to depart from the paranoia of European ecclesiastical tribunals. Instead, a distinctly Portuguese and fervent contingent descended upon the extant mission fields with an agenda that prioritised the moral theology and orthopraxy around conversion, intrinsic to the 'spiritual conquest of the East' that sought to impose a uniform Christian model at the expense of extant indigenous cultural diversity.<sup>102</sup> This expectation of converts' wholesale rejection of prior social and cultural identity, I believe, stood in stark contrast to the accommodation model that would later define the Society.

The tendency to fit into the recurring model of conversion techniques in the Portuguese *Estado da Índia* somewhat undermines any sense of the distinctiveness of Jesuits

---

<sup>102</sup> Giuseppe Marcocci, 'A fé de um império: a Inquisição no mundo português de Quinhentos,' *Revista de História* 164 (2011), p. 71.

in this context. Whilst later figures like Roberto de Nobili innovated the approach to apostolate through the self-fashioning of cultural accommodation, few that preceded him reached anything close to such controversial methods. Nobili's criticism of Portuguese primacy and ecclesiastical rigidity in India, not to mention Valignano's resistance to 'Portugalisation' (to be discussed further in the final chapter), is mirrored in some of the opinions rendered during the early period of Jesuit missions, and these additional voices of dissent in the face of supposedly prevailing ideas evince some recognition of change and flexible identity as opposed to the rigid Portuguese national identity at this time. As Girolamo Imbruglia has shown, through the progress outlined in the *Spiritual Exercises*, 'lending oneself to radical change and renouncing one's own identity were the paths that led to God through life in the world'.<sup>103</sup> I find that such renunciation did not materialise amongst the Jesuit majority whose efforts to convert *en masse* signalled an agenda coterminous with the *Estado's* objective to enforce religious uniformity. As we will see in the next chapter, this agenda included the initiative of installing the first overseas Holy Office in order to embolden this collaboration.

It is difficult to place, definitively, the ideologies of particular Jesuits during this period, but given the undefined theological basis upon which the Society relied prior to the late 1580s, as well as the examples of missionaries between Xavier and the council, the notion of the Jesuit 'way of proceeding' in the plural sense suits this context. Nevertheless, Jesuits had plenty of theological precedent to draw upon without administrative guidance; when Nobili proposed a more gentle, long-term approach to conversion, he argued that anything more coercive contradicted Doctors and Fathers of the Church—Gregory,

---

<sup>103</sup> Girolamo Imbruglia, 'Ideali di civilizzazione: la Compagnia di Gesù e le missioni (1550-1600)', in Adriano Prosperi and Wolfgang Reinhard (eds), *Il Nuovo Mondo nella coscienza italiana e tedesca del Cinquecento* (Bologna, 1992), p. 301; cf. Agnolin, 'Violence and Adaptability of the Word', p. 71.

Augustine, Jerome, and others—who ‘were unanimous in deciding that great indulgence was to be shown to recent converts to Christ’.<sup>104</sup> Although lacking reference to Aquinas or Scotus, Nobili’s methodology certainly did not include forced conversion.

What we witness occurring in Goa at the time in some way fits within the Ignatian ideal of autonomy and informed decision-making, yet it crucially conflicted with the balancing side of obedience to not only the superiors but also to the Constitutions and the *Exercises* which informed Jesuit spirituality. Determining the best course of action and what was most ‘good’ and did the least ‘evil’, an approach that would develop into missionary casuistry, influenced the moral theology of Jesuit theologians at the time, but the same consideration of theology did not figure largely into the decisions regarding the treatment of conversion targets and new converts. Those in lower positions, such as Lancilotto and Crimali, had in fact considered these questions along the lines of some theological precedent, but theirs was not the rule but rather the exception.

---

<sup>104</sup> Roberto de Nobili, *Roberto de Nobili on Indian Customs*, part I, ed. S. Rajamanickam (Palayamkottai, 1972), p. 144.

**Chapter Four**  
**‘In the Society there is no distinction between Jew or Greek’: *Conversos*, the Goan Inquisition, and Jesuit Accommodation**

Martim Afonso de Sousa, Francis Xavier’s friend, correspondent, and traveling companion on the missionary’s inaugural voyage to India in 1541-42, arrived in Goa as the presumptive governor of the *Estado da Índia* with a particular fervour towards eradicating heresy and heathenism. Shortly into his tenure—and seventeen years before the establishment of the Inquisition at Goa—he oversaw the trial of a physician, Jerónimo Dias, a converted Jew (in Portuguese *converso*; or *cristão-novo*, ‘New Christian’), sentencing him to be burned at the stake for blasphemy in 1543. Dias was only the second former Jew to be executed in India.<sup>1</sup> Francis Xavier discussed the need for an Inquisition in India in 1545, stating that his intent was to write to the king, the governor, and the Inquisitor-General Dom Henrique to request that the state ‘by way of the Inquisition punish those who persecute those who are converted to our holy law and faith’.<sup>2</sup> It is not clear whether Xavier actually wrote to any of them around that time, but the next year he had shifted his focus. Addressing Dom João III in May 1546, he wrote that ‘in order for there to be good Christians in India the necessity is that Your Majesty establish the Holy Inquisition, because there are many

---

<sup>1</sup> Cunha, *Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, p. 127. Cf. Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 9. The first *crisťão-novo* was an unnamed man burned at the stake in 1539, as reported, rather confusingly, by Doutor Jerónimo Dias in a letter to the king on 3 Dec 1539, cf. Arquivo Nacional de Torre do Tombo (ANTT), *Corpo Cronológico*, p. I, m. 66, doc. 47, fos. 15-16; transcribed and published in Cunha, pp. 252-5. Županov, op. cit. p. 273, considers the writer of the letter to be the same Jerónimo Dias who was executed some four years later, yet Cunha notes that there is not enough data to conclude they are the same person but assumes they are different individuals given the opinion rendered against New Christians in the letter by Dr Dias. This is still rather inconclusive and speculative, given that New Christians were not always opposed to implicating other New Christians.

<sup>2</sup> Francis Xavier to Francisco Mansilhas, 7 Apr 1545, *MX*, i, p. 380; ‘que por via de Inquizição castigue aos que percegum aos que se convertem á nossa santa ley e fê’.

who live according to the Jewish law and the Moorish sect, without fear of God or shame of the world'.<sup>3</sup> By 1560 the first non-European Inquisition was established in Goa.

While the Inquisition in Goa initially developed from the frenzy over *conversos* as secret apostates or crypto-Jews, it would eventually consider all those living in the islands to be under its auspices, regardless of religion.<sup>4</sup> Outside of the *Estado* capital, consequences in Portuguese-held areas included restriction of movement of non-Christians as well as later persecution of 'Judaizers' suspected of practising their old faith as well as corrupting others' Christian beliefs. In sixteenth-century South Asia, Judaism posed a particularly delicate problem for the Jesuits, as places like Cochin, Cranganore, and Calicut all had significant Jewish communities living alongside Hindus of varying traditions, Muslims, and Nestorian Christians, each comprised of various ethnicities from across the Indian Ocean trading network, speaking different languages and holding varied perspectives on their respective traditions. Ines Županov notes that accommodation found its first expression in relation to the community of St Thomas Christians rather than '*gentios*' or 'infidels,' claiming that 'it is this experience of closeness, familiarity and common heritage with European Christians, combined with perplexing differences and uncertain analogies that mobilized Jesuit theological and ethnographic inquiries'.<sup>5</sup> If we look at the attitudes of Jesuits toward *converso* communities in India, however, the focus shifts to a group that, to the Portuguese, perhaps provided a better example of familiarity—a group that Ignatius of Loyola himself sought to include within his order and whose ancestral tradition he respected (and supposedly emulated), but also a group whose actions seemingly provided the final spark

---

<sup>3</sup> Francis Xavier to D. João III, 16 May 1546, *DHMPPPO*, iii, p. 351; 'a segunda nesecydade, que a Yndia tem pera serem bons christãos os que nela vivem, hé que mande Vosa Alteza a samta Ynquizição, porque há muitos que vivem a ley mozaica e a seita mourisca, sem nenhum temor de Deus nem verguonda do mundo'. Cf. Glenn Joseph Ames, *Renascent Empire?: The House of Braganza and the Quest for Stability in Portuguese Monsoon Asia, c. 1640-1683* (Amsterdam, 2000), p. 60.

<sup>4</sup> Cunha, *Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, pp. 77-114.

<sup>5</sup> Županov, "One civility, but multiple religions", p. 288.

that lit the explosion of the first Inquisition outside Europe. The same kinds of enquiries did not materialise.

In the historiography of accommodation, scholars have excluded from this ‘testing ground’ the other religious groups familiar to Portuguese and the Jesuits, namely those part of (or once part of) the Jewish tradition. Although any given missionary likely had little to no experience with indigenous cultural, societal, or religious systems, both exiled and refugee Sephardic Jews living in India prior to Portuguese expansion and *conversos* who arrived there during its course were undoubtedly familiar to the Jesuits, Dominicans and Franciscans labouring there. From their unique positions of privilege in local trade and politics, Jews and *conversos* throughout Goa and the Malabar coast might have served as valuable intermediaries in Jesuit ethnographic pursuits; instead, fear and suspicion arose about the migration and presence of *conversos* amidst their campaigns to establish uniformity across the enclaves of Portuguese India, during which the Jesuits enjoyed increasing influence. By looking specifically at Jesuit discussions of Jews who retained their religion in the diaspora as well as those Christian converts from Judaism in India, I will analyse these intramural debates to better discern the range of opinions as they relate to the elements and limits of missionary accommodation and Jesuit distinctiveness. I shall examine how the defined components of accommodation shaped their understanding of mission objectives—whether examination of any given person’s faith superseded the concern for the propagation of faith; whether legislating for heresy superseded instruction of initiates; whether the agenda of the state superseded that of the Society.

The Society of Jesus as a whole stood neither in opposition to nor in favour of the involvement of the Inquisition in either Europe or in India, much as it often lacked comprehensive groupthink across its global membership. By 1575 the Italian Visitor Alessandro Valignano (among others) saw the Jesuit purpose in Asia and the Inquisition as

incompatible, while many of the earliest Jesuits expressed support without explicitly desiring direct involvement.<sup>6</sup> As Giuseppe Marcocci has pointed out, ‘many Portuguese Jesuits in South Asia found the idea of serving the Inquisition absolutely normal’, given that many of them had experienced it first-hand in Europe and often contributed to its activity.<sup>7</sup>

By way of its origin as a principle of rhetoric, accommodation involves at its core an adjustment to the audience with which an individual wishes to converse and/or interact. Adjusting oneself to an audience implies a degree of recognition of the particularities of an environment or people through knowledge—especially pertaining to the local context—and in the case of missions involves understanding the origins of their current beliefs and leading them to a correct Christian faith, as opposed to any *post facto* imposition of punishment for them. Following the line that connects accommodation to Ignatian principles espoused in his early writings and objectives for the Society, we can also draw conclusions from the founder’s opinions on the Jewish people and those who became Christians, regardless of the integrity of their conversion. We should not forget Ignatius’ own words, that ‘in the Society there is no distinction between Jew and Greek, etc., when they are united in the same spirit of divine service’.<sup>8</sup>

I argue that what links these three points—the converso community at Cochin, the introduction of the Goan Inquisition, and Jesuit accommodation—is the preservation of Portuguese identity and a culture of suspicion and fear towards *conversos*, aspects which take centre stage amongst some members of the Society of Jesus, a religious order whose principles which foster the practice of cultural accommodation appeared to be at odds with

---

<sup>6</sup> Valignano assented to this opinion in his letter to Superior General Mercurian, 30 Dec 1575, *DI*, x, p. 376; the original opinion was discussed at the 1575 provincial consultation in Chorão, found in *DI*, x, p. 277; Schütte, *Valignano’s Mission Principles*, p. 113; Marcocci, ‘Jesuit Missionaries and the Portuguese Inquisition’, p. 235. O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, pp. 311-12.

<sup>7</sup> Marcocci, ‘Jesuit Missionaries and the Portuguese Inquisition’, p. 235.

<sup>8</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Diego Mirón, 5 Apr 1554, *MI Epp*, pp. 569-70; ‘en la Compañia non est distinctio judaei et graeci etc, quando son unidos en el mesmo espíritu del diuino servicio con los otros’.

those priorities. Although the formal Jesuit opinion of Judaism and those descended from Jewish converts was favourable, the views of many Iberian members nevertheless ranged from ambivalent to even hostile towards both Jews and *conversos*. Despite Dauril Alden's observation that 'the Society's decision to bar New Christians reflected the willingness to yield to Iberian prejudices', I also find a willingness to neglect Jesuit prescriptions for self-fashioning and a more indifferent identity.<sup>9</sup> Lacking the necessary balance between autonomy and obedience, those who promoted judicial measures to combat lapses of converts did not seemingly accommodate their audience but rather relied on intimidation. The prevailing sentiments of Jesuits at this time—that is, supporting the establishment of the Goan Inquisition—corresponded to more explicitly Portuguese negative mentalities towards *conversos* rather than the cosmopolitan Jesuit identity and cultural openness, to either Jew or *gentio*, that serves as part of missionary accommodation. As Jonathan Boyarin posits, 'the formation of Christian identity in engagement with Jewish difference was also a formative element in the colonial encounter'.<sup>10</sup> The actions of some individuals in response to the expectation of the Inquisition evince a tacit alignment with the imperial project alongside a rigid presentation of a distinctly European or Portuguese identity, as opposed to the more fluid Jesuit self.

Also at play in this context was the question of degree of compulsion within conversion and its connection with the theology of salvation as well as the *suaviter* approach which defines cultural accommodation. In the context of Hindu and Jewish traditions, there were occasional equivocations of the two, yet individuals who retained these belief systems or Christian converts who allegedly relapsed to those traditions received different treatment;

---

<sup>9</sup> Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 258.

<sup>10</sup> Jonathan Boyarin, *The Unconverted Self: Jews, Indians, and the Identity of Christian Europe* (Chicago, 2009), p. 56.

debates over how *gentios* might have been or were being compelled into the Christian faith through mass or forced baptisms did not entertain the notion of how the same methods might have been applied in the forced conversions of Jews in Portugal at the end of the fifteenth century. In the process, inquisitorial proceedings became a tool for rooting out crypto-Judaism with much greater force and violence, as *conversos* comprised over two-thirds of death sentences meted out by the Goan Inquisition in the first sixty years, whilst remnant Hindu praxis among *novamente convertidos* earned comparatively softer judgment.<sup>11</sup> This shift in approach towards targeting *judaizantes* or “Judaizers” was simultaneously reflected in the marked rise of anti-converso literature from the 1530s—coinciding with the establishment of the first tribunal of the Holy Office in Portugal in 1536—through to the end of the sixteenth century, where instead of contesting supposed heretical Judaizers towards the aim of conversion the intent focused on denigrating them.<sup>12</sup> As we shall see, whereas much of the spirit of the Society and Ignatius himself indicated a welcoming attitude towards those of Jewish descent, the Jesuit arrivals to India in the late 1550s represented the more aggressive approach of vilification towards eventual criminal prosecution, itself influenced by the ambition and commercial interests that similarly marked such manoeuvres in Portugal.

### ***Conversos*<sup>13</sup> and the Society of Jesus**

In the European theatre, Robert Maryks deals specifically with the issue concerning *conversos* in the Society and the shift in policy regarding admitting those with Jewish

---

<sup>11</sup> A.J. Saraiva, *The Marrano Factory: The Portuguese Inquisition and Its New Christians, 1536-1765*, tr. H.P. Salomon and I.S.D. Sassoon (Leiden, 2001), p. 347.

<sup>12</sup> Claude B. Stuczynski, ‘The Imaginary Synagogue: Anti-Jewish Literature in the Portuguese Early Modern World (16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Centuries), by Bruno Feitler’, *Journal of Jesuit Studies*, 6/1 (2019), p. 176.

<sup>13</sup> A note here regarding the use of the term *converso*: following the rationale given by Robert Maryks in *Jesuit Order as a Synagogue of Jews*, p. xvi, ‘for it does not carry any pejorative connotation, it is employed in contemporary historiography, and, additionally, it points out the Iberian origins of the group’, I intend to employ the term *converso* to refer to those who were descendants of Jewish converts in the Iberian peninsula. Occasionally, if used by the source, the term New Christian or *cristão novo* may be used. Of

ancestry. Between 1540 and 1593, there existed no legal impediment to vocation in the Society for an individual of Jewish background, ‘even though not every confrere would have supported it’.<sup>14</sup> During the Third General Congregation of 1573, however, measures were put in place to at least hinder the proliferation of such lineage within, at the very least, the General Curia of the Society and provincial superiors. It was the actions, allegedly, of the Italian assistant and delegate Benedetto Palmio and the Portuguese delegates (headed by the elector Leão Henriques) that torpedoed the presumptive election of Juan Alfonso de Polanco to the office of superior general, mainly due, as has been argued, to his *converso* status.<sup>15</sup> Prior to this so-called ‘intrigue’ of 1573, the first three decades of the Society presented a fairly open admission policy for *conversos* in the face of Spanish reinforcement of *estatutos de limpieza de sangre* (‘blood purity laws’) such as that imposed by the Archbishop of Toledo Juan Martinez Guijarro (or ‘Silíceo’) in 1547.<sup>16</sup> Whilst Loyola and his representatives defended the Society from accusations of ‘judaizing’, it is clear that many Portuguese were not comfortable with the presence of *conversos* in the order, even before the ‘intrigue’ of the general congregation. Strong opinions regarding the place of Jews and those descended from Jews prevailed in Portugal. As Sanjay Subrahmanyam has argued, the rulers of Castile desired to expel the Jews from Castile, while the rulers of Portugal sought to expel the Jews from Judaism.<sup>17</sup>

---

course, neither term means that the individual was a convert, but that they could have had any degree of Jewish ancestry, as this distinction was not of concern until after 1608, when an applicant to the Society of Jesus had his background reviewed to the fifth generation; Maryks, *op. cit.*, p. xv.

<sup>14</sup> Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. xv.

<sup>15</sup> Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. xxvi; Josef Wicki, ‘Die « Cristaos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz der Gesellschaft Jesu von Ignatius bis Acquaviva’ *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 46 (1977), p. 344.

<sup>16</sup> Alexander Samson, ‘The *adelantamiento* of Cazorla, *converso* Culture and Toledo Cathedral Chapter's 1547 *estatuto de limpieza de sangre*’, *Bulletin of Spanish Studies*, 84/7 (2007), pp. 819-36.

<sup>17</sup> Sanjay Subrahmanyam, ‘Jews & New Christians in Portuguese Asia 1500-1700’ (unpublished paper, delivered 5 June 2013, John W. Kluge Center, Library of Congress).

This expulsion also relates to the relationship between Portugal and its imperial environs, between the extant *conversos* in the homeland and the novel converts overseas. As Ângela Barreto Xavier has noted, the quest to reclaim the number of souls lost to Protestantism in Europe through conversions in Asia, Africa, and the Americas elicited a general apprehension amongst the Old Christians about the integrity of religious conversion, partially influenced by the overwhelming majority these new converts held amongst colonial populations.<sup>18</sup> Similarly, whereas in fifteenth- and sixteenth-century Portugal (as well as Spain) *conversos* were scrutinised for their presence in civil and ecclesiastical offices and later challenged directly by the Holy Office, decrees in the mid-sixteenth century Estado sought to remove from office most gentiles and infidels and replace them with Portuguese or converts, whilst the newly-installed Goan Inquisition increased the assessment (and suspicion) of converts' resolve. This anxiety over the rise in new (lowercase 'n') Christians within Portuguese lands was certainly informed by its precedents regarding crypto-Judaism; as Xavier points out, 'it is clear that by the mid-sixteenth century the aim of the Portuguese authorities was religious unity in Goa, achieved through the same model employed at home, in order to establish the foundations for lasting rule by the crown in those distant lands'.<sup>19</sup> Jesuit involvement—both through the Inquisition and ecclesiastical policy—in this model is undeniable.

Beyond potential associations with nationality, general educational and collegial associations prior to missions tend to correlate with approach to ministry abroad. Although the College of Coimbra was essentially the only school in which Jesuits assigned to work under the Padroado could prepare academically and spiritually, it produced its fair share of charismatic and expressive individuals ready for the challenges of heathen lands. Francis

---

<sup>18</sup> Xavier, '*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*', p. 286.

<sup>19</sup> Xavier, '*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*', p. 280.

Xavier, who once pleaded with the king of Portugal for the institution of such a Jesuit college, later came to criticize figures such as António Gomes for their ‘Coimbra fervours’, a sort of outward expression of piety, which he saw as not only unfavourable but also counterproductive to the progress of missions and retention of converts. To what extent this label holds true is debatable, especially when considering that almost every Jesuit who departed for India and East Asia had at least spent some time in Coimbra.<sup>20</sup> Nevertheless, the rumour held such prominence that Ignatius personally addressed the members of the Society at Coimbra in 1547, reminding them—among many other points—that ‘spiritual infirmities such as tepidity are caused, not only by chills but even by over-warmth, such as excessive fervour’.<sup>21</sup>

Before approaching the idea of the Inquisition, it is first necessary to determine why the debate over the place of the Holy Office existed amongst Jesuits. Given its reinvigorated presence in the Iberian peninsula, the most obvious issue to focus on is that of *limpeza de sangue* and the regulation of *conversos* in the kingdoms of early modern Spain and Portugal, noting the variety of opinions regarding the place of these converts from Judaism and how they compared with the popular perception. In particular, Marcocci stresses the importance of analysing ‘how individual New Christians and Jesuits actually interacted, which was often the result of “negotiated relationships” made up of affinities, interests and ambiguities, rather than clearly defined choices’.<sup>22</sup> Nowhere were these characteristics of negotiated relationship more relevant than with the case of Loyola.

---

<sup>20</sup> Col. Conimbricens. Adm. 1542/1553, Rome, ARSI, Lus. 43I, fos. 1-4. Catalogues such as this one show that, during the first decade at least, every Jesuit father (since there were no ordinations of either native clergy or *criollos*, Portuguese born in India, at this time) active in India passed through the College of Coimbra, whether for six months (as was the case with Henrique Henriques) or two years (as with Niccolò Lancilotto).

<sup>21</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to the Fathers and Brothers Studying at Coimbra, 7 May 1547, *MI*, i, p. 504: ‘que no solamente vienen las enfermedades spirituales de causas frias, como es la tibieza, pero aun de calientes, como es el demasiado heruor’. Loyola, *Letters of St. Ignatius*, p. 126.

<sup>22</sup> Marcocci, ‘Jesuit Missionaries and the Portuguese Inquisition’, p. 238.

Ignatius of Loyola possessed a quite noticeable sympathy towards both *conversos* and Jews, a sensibility which preceded the founding of the Society and ultimately carried on through his generalate. Some of the more famous accounts involve his association not with groups of *conversos*, but with the heterodoxical *alumbrados*, who certainly counted among themselves a number of Spaniards with varying degrees of Jewish ancestry. While the Inquisition initially thought these ‘illuminated’ to be Judaizers, they were certainly not limited to *conversos*, or even *luteranismos* as they were accused of being during the influx of Protestant thought in Castile. Nevertheless, their controversial spirituality came under close scrutiny, leading to the questioning of Ignatius himself by the Holy Office in 1525. Maryks suggests that ‘Loyola was incarcerated because the vicar general of Alcalá suspected him of crypto-Judaism, most likely due to his numerous contacts with *alumbrados*/Erasmists who often were of converso background’.<sup>23</sup> These associations form the bulk of claims regarding the origin of his sensitivity towards *conversos*, particularly as it has been argued that, given his birth around the time of the decree ordering the conversion or exile of all Jews in Castile and Aragon, he may never have interacted with any (at least openly) practicing Jews in his earlier years.<sup>24</sup> Clearly there existed an affinity towards those of the Jewish faith or descendants of practitioners, yet the only true interaction or affiliation occurred through the *conversos* with whom he surrounded himself. Among those in his inner circle believed to be *conversos* were his secretary and long-time member of the Jesuit curia Juan Alfonso de Polanco (1517-76), the second Superior General of the Society Diego Laínez (1512-65), Ignatius’ close friend and biographer Pedro de Ribadeneyra (1526-1611), and rector of the Messina college and later vicar general Jerónimo Nadal (1507-80). Polanco

---

<sup>23</sup> Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 47.

<sup>24</sup> Eusebio Rey, ‘San Ignacio de Loyola y el problema de los cristianos nuevos’, *Razón y Fe* 153 (1956), pp. 177-78. Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 48.

and Nadal have been signalled as the two foremost companions of Loyola, due to their involvement in the writing and promulgation of the *Constitutions* and their actions as faithful ambassadors for Ignatius, and as such represent within the Jesuit central administration the striking significance of a persecuted and marginalised group.<sup>25</sup>

A number of examples have been provided by Robert Maryks concerning the affinity Ignatius held towards Jewish and *converso* communities. As scholarship on the Society of Jesus has established, funding from affluent European patrons was essential to the existence and proliferation of Jesuit operations, from colleges and professed houses to missions abroad, and much of this financial support before and after the foundation of the Society came from *converso* networks in both Spain and the Spanish Netherlands. Yet beyond merely safeguarding the monetary supply, Ignatius took great strides to ensure the legal protection of his order from the anti-*converso* measures of the Spanish Inquisition. In 1547 the Archbishop Juan Martínez Silíceo of Toledo introduced his *statuto de limpieza de sangre*, which once again brought to the fore the issue of blood purity, which from a legal standpoint were somewhat regularly reinforced throughout the mid-fifteenth and sixteenth centuries on a rather localised level, mostly in Castile.<sup>26</sup> Together with his *converso* successor Diego Laínez, Loyola worked to oppose the attempts of Silíceo to prohibit *conversos* from joining the Society, writing in 1552 that the archbishop ‘should take care of his own business rather than interfering with the internal issues of the Society’.<sup>27</sup> When Jerónimo Nadal, another supposed *converso* member of Loyola’s close companions in the administration, travelled to Spain in 1554 to discuss with the archbishop the Jesuit policy of non-discrimination based on lineage, he defended his subsequent admission of *converso*

---

<sup>25</sup> O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 11.

<sup>26</sup> Samson, pp. 824-5.

<sup>27</sup> Juan Polanco to Francisco de Villanueva, 2 Jan 1552, *Cartas de San Ignacio de Loyola: fundador de la Compañía de Jesús* (6 vols, Madrid, 1874-89), iii, pp. 13-21. Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. xxi.

candidates at Alcalá de Henares by stating, ‘We take pleasure in admitting those with Jewish ancestry’.<sup>28</sup>

Ignatius’ commitment to admitting those of Jewish background into the Society seems to fit with his ideology of a slightly less than restricted order, and stands in particular contrast with the other orders who throughout the sixteenth century refused to accept *conversos*.<sup>29</sup> His defence of this blighted group corresponds with much of the biographical literature that appeared after his death, notably those penned by two close converso companions, Polanco (in his *Chronicon Societatis Iesu*, 1573-5) and Ribadeneyra (*Vida*, 1583). One of the most famous examples of Ignatius’ affinity for the Jewish tradition came from an account by Ribadeneyra in which Ignatius, attending a gathering of other Jesuits, expressed his opinion of the great blessing it would be to ‘have been born from Jewish lineage’.<sup>30</sup>

We might assume that the *Constitutions* would serve as a key text for clarifying the question of early policy on the admittance of conversos; but the truth is that the foundational document is slightly ambiguous. Per the 1970 translation by George Ganss, the question of one’s ancestry as part of the General Examen was that of whether the candidate came ‘from a family long Christian or one recently converted’.<sup>31</sup> His own editorial notes explain that this was not to exclude any New Christian from entering the Society but rather to ensure that they were well-educated in their faith according to the degree in which they entered it.<sup>32</sup>

---

<sup>28</sup> Jerónimo Nadal, ‘P. Natalis ephemerides, Pars secunda. 1553-1562’, *Epistolae P. Hieronymi Nadal*, ii, p. 21: ‘conquestus et apud me quod non reciperemus, qui ducunt a iudaeis originem; se id scire de Araozio et Mirone. Respondi ita non esse; sed habere nos delectum in illis recipiendis’. Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. xxii.

<sup>29</sup> Dominicans never adopted widespread measures, though individual convents did, such as those in Aragón in 1525; Franciscans did not admit *conversos* up to 4<sup>th</sup> generation from 1525 onwards; Jeronymites had banned them from 1486 onwards, in line with some civil statutes in Spain; Discalced Carmelites adopted anti-converso statutes in 1595; Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 28.

<sup>30</sup> Pedro de Ribadeneyra, *Patris Petri de Ribadeneyra, Societatis Jesu sacerdotis, Confessiones, epistolae aliaque scripta inedita, ex autographis* (2 vols, Madrid, 1920-23), ii, p. 375: ‘huuiera tenido por gran merced de Dios el auer nascido de judios’.

<sup>31</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 86.

<sup>32</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 86.

Pierre-Antoine Fabre notes that the original Spanish version did not entirely employ such vague terms, but instead clearly distinguished between *christianos antiguos* and *modernos*, as the 1556 Latin publication described it: ‘Num a progenitoribus iam olim christianis an a modernis descendat’.<sup>33</sup> According to Fabre, however, the first version of the Constitutions, composed in 1550, included the terms ‘*christianos viejos o nuevos*’ within the question, thereby clearly addressing the more familiar nomenclature of the time. It is unclear whether this was a conscious choice to avoid specifically addressing *christianos nuevos* given the context of such a description in sixteenth century Iberia, but nevertheless such a change in wording suggests consideration of revision to perhaps emphasise what Ganss notes as an examination of candidates to determine their background and what, if any, theological instruction might be required. Considering the edicts of conversion from the late fifteenth and early sixteenth centuries, the likelihood of encountering a candidate from such a background—especially if we are to believe all comments mentioned above—was fairly significant.

This perception was not confined to the Society members only: sympathy towards Jews influenced perceptions of Ignatius from the outside as well, as noted by multiple close associates. Polanco recounted that in 1555 there existed a rumour among the theology faculty at the University of Paris that ‘the founder of our Institute had been a certain Jew who had instituted this form of religious life in expiation for his shameful crimes’.<sup>34</sup> In Córdoba, the Jesuit college educated boys from many of the prominent families, but rarely did any of those seeking clerical vocation join the Society, as it was perceived to be the order for Jews.<sup>35</sup>

---

<sup>33</sup> P.A. Fabre, ‘La Conversion Infinie des *Conversos*. Des “nouveaux-chrétiens” dans la Compagnie de Jésus au 16e siècle’ *Annales* 54/4 (1999), p. 877.

<sup>34</sup> Polanco, *Vita Ignatii Loiolae*, v, p. 322; Polanco, *Year by Year*, p. 386.

<sup>35</sup> Rey, ‘Ignacio y el problema’, p. 191. O’Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 190. Rome, ARSI, Epist. Hisp. XVIII, fo. 314.

This is of course not to say that Ignatius and his first companions held some thread of more moderate views in the face of prevailing social norms towards conversos; yet the presence of accusations against the order and its founder suggests that many Jesuits' sensibilities were atypical. As John O'Malley put it, 'the first generation of Jesuits were by no means innocent of the prejudices of their day, although in individual instances and in the official policy of the Society they rose above some of them'.<sup>36</sup>

Although outside our purview, the response to the controversial election of Everard Mercurian in 1573 provides a poignant example of how some Jesuits rose above the prejudices of the day. Antonio Possevino (1533-1611), secretary to Mercurian from 1573 to 1576, witnessed the conspiring of Portuguese and Italian electors to prevent a converso leader, the presumptive Juan de Polanco, under the guise of criticising what might have been a fourth Spaniard as Superior General. In that election, Possevino noted the divisive elements of 'nation' playing out within a Society initially borne out of Ignatian principles of universality and divine providence in opposition to any ethnicity (albeit of a European sort) or bloodline—principles which he thought the Congregation had disregarded. Writing a memorial to Mercurian in his final year as secretary, he detailed exactly how Ignatius intended the Society to view its membership, echoing the founder's words on 'no distinction between Jew or Greek':

[Ignatius] felt that the spirit of God did not make distinctions between people, and that he believed more in Jesus Christ than in worldly caution...and this remained stamped on the souls of the Society, and he shaped the Society in such a way that nothing moved him to alter it, knowing that "What God has joined together, let no man separate"<sup>37</sup>

---

<sup>36</sup> O'Malley, *First Jesuits*, p. 192.

<sup>37</sup> Thomas Cohen, 'Nation, Lineage, and Jesuit Unity in Antonio Possevino's Memorial to Everard Mercurian (1576)' in *A Companhia de Jesus na Península Ibérica nos séculos XVI e XVII: espiritualidade e cultura: actas do Colóquio Internacional* (2 vols, Porto, 2004), ii, p. 549; original cf. Rome, ARSI, Congregationes 20/B, fos. 206-12. The quotation at the end is a reference to Matthew 19:6, 'quos Deus coniungit homo non separet'.

Moreover, he tied these principles into the very identity of Christians and the Society itself, defined by characteristics which distinguished them from those of pagans and infidels, that is to say ‘preference for lineage, or for human concerns...or for its own honour, such as not allowing oneself to be touched by others or to greet them, as is the custom of some infidels about whom Alessandro Valignano has recently written’.<sup>38</sup> Taking cues from Valignano’s letters detailing his observations of rules governing caste interactions in India, Possevino implied that *limpeza de sangue* made Jesuits no different to those they attempted to convert. From the accounts of foreign missions, he argued that this policy of discrimination towards *conversos* would ultimately affect the relations between missionaries and the indigenous peoples with whom they interacted.<sup>39</sup> Possevino had good reason to be concerned; just as the Society under Mercurian saw the movement towards anti-*converso* politics, it also included a decisive ban on admission of both natives and *mestiços* into the clergy within India.<sup>40</sup>

### **Reality of *conversos* in the Society**

Beyond Ignatius’ views towards *conversos* in the Society of Jesus, there is a clear difference between the wishes of the superior general and the prevailing attitudes of the active members. As has been shown both within the case of the Church as well as the Jesuit order in particular, there was naturally no monolithic outlook: there was reasonable diversity in opinion and method within the overarching Church, even more so within the Society. In fact, as has been pointed out through scholarship addressing the ‘Rules for Thinking with the Church’ (the final stage of the *Spiritual Exercises*), Jesuits were

---

<sup>38</sup> Cohen, ‘Nation, Lineage, and Jesuit Unity’, p. 548; Congregationes 20/B, fo. 207r.

<sup>39</sup> Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. xxix; Thomas Cohen, ‘Jesuits and New Christians: The Contested Legacy of St. Ignatius’, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 42/3 (2010), p. 36.

<sup>40</sup> Cohen, ‘Jesuits and New Christians’, p. 41.

encouraged to ‘recognize the working of the Spirit even in a different way of thinking and in a plurality of opinions’ in preference to radical, set opinions—a point reflected in the controversial Jesuit implementation of casuistry.<sup>41</sup> On the topic of Jewish ancestry, this fact is reflected in the shift towards the anti-*converso* politics of the Third General Congregation in 1573. Yet certainly opinions and measures arose in the roughly two decades between Ignatius’ death in 1556 and the election of general Everard Mercurian: how exactly did these play out in India, a much more cosmopolitan and heterogeneous environment than the Iberian Peninsula? In order to understand this, I will take into account the following: first, those Jesuits active in southern India who purportedly had Jewish ancestry and their experience with anti-*converso* measures as well as their own priorities; second, those Jesuits who wrote explicitly against New Christians, their recommendations, and how their ideas influenced policies and institutions in Goa; and third, how the debate over ancestry and *limpeza de sangue* spilled over into the mentality regarding native Indian populations of Hindu and Muslim religious traditions.

### *Simão Rodrigues*

The degree to which a member responded to another companion’s ancestry also varied. The consequences depended upon the status of the actor. For instance, in his instructions to those under his charge, Simão Rodrigues, the provincial superior of Portugal, wrote that

‘those who by divine inspiration seek to be received in the college [of Coimbra, or subsequently elsewhere]...will be examined by the following criteria; and if they are determined of any of these [criteria], they are not to be received...[item 3.] if by any means he descended from New Christians.

---

<sup>41</sup> Antonio Guillén, ‘Praise: the Fundamental Attitude in the Church’, *The Way* 52/2 (2013), p. 102; Antony Mecherry, S.J., ‘*Sentir con la iglesia*’ and Ecumenical Rapprochements of the Sixteenth Century: An Indian Reality’ in Robert J. Daly and Patrick Howell (eds), *Thinking and Feeling with the Churches* (Chestnut Hill, 2017), p. 131.

If he has held any opinion, which had been reprov'd for heresy or known publicly as such'<sup>42</sup>

Although written during the years 1546-50, Rodrigues had previously admitted a number of known *conversos* to the Jesuit college in Portugal, many of whom were then dispatched to Asian missions. These actions certainly correlate with the opinion of Loyola, as expressed to Rodrigues' successor Diego Mirón in Polanco's letter on behalf of Loyola, where in addition to reminding the superior of the province Portugal that 'being of the lineage of New Christians is not an impediment that excluded them from the Society', Polanco also advised Mirón that if any controversy over a member's ancestry arose, 'they could be directed to another area'.<sup>43</sup> At some point Rodrigues very clearly developed a standard against the wishes of his Superior General.

The subversion of Rodrigues, however, was not limited to his instructions to the Society in Portugal, as a letter from Francis Xavier in 1552 shows. Writing to Gaspar Berze, who would replace Xavier as superior of the Indian missions later that year, he advises his fellow Jesuit to 'reject absolutely those that you know belong to any of those classes which our Father Ignatius has by name excluded for ever from entrance into our Order. One of these is, as you know, to be of Jewish extraction'.<sup>44</sup> Xavier's injunction contradicted his decisions to admit and assign to prominent positions Jesuits with Jewish ancestry—Henrique Henriques being one, whom Xavier welcomed into the Society in the late 1540s

---

<sup>42</sup> Simão Rodrigues, *Modo que se ha de ter nos collegios da Companhia en o receber dos estudantes d'ella*, in *Epistolae PP. Broëti, Jaii, Cordurii, Rodericii*, p. 861; 'Os que por inspiração devina pedirem ser recebidos no collegio...serão examinados das cousas seguintes; e se em alguma d'ellas forem comprehendidos, não se receberão...3. Se por alguma via desçende de christãos nouos. Se ha tido alguma openião, polla qual aja sido reprouado por ereje ou conhecido pubricamente por tal.'

<sup>43</sup> Juan Polanco to Diego Mirón, 5 Apr 1554, *MI*, vi, p. 569: 'Y advierta VR que el ser de linaje de cristianos nuevos no es impedimento que excluya de la Compañia...Es verdad que, si por la disposición de los ánimos de una tierra no fuse cosa edificativa aceptar alguno tal, diestramente se podría enderezar a otra parte'; Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 64-5.

<sup>44</sup> Francis Xavier to Gaspar Berze, 14 Apr 1552, *MX*, i, pp. 916-17: 'Guardai-vos de nunca receber pessoas para a Companhia, que sejam de pouca hidade, nem outros que o P. Ignacio deffende que se não recebem, como são os que vem de linhagem hebraeorum'.

and named as superior of the Fishery Coast missions against the wishes of some others. Instructions from both superiors to prohibit conversos from entering the Society contradicted the orders of the general Loyola. This remains a source of confusion, as there seems to be no record of Ignatius ever advising either Rodrigues or Xavier to forbid admission to anyone of Jewish ancestry, and his other writings in favour of such a practice render the possibility of any such record highly unlikely.<sup>45</sup> Certainly in the early 1550s letters speak of frustration concerning the lack of communication, leaving room for potential judgments outside any superiors' wishes.<sup>46</sup> In any case, Xavier's admissions of Jesuits of converso background had all occurred prior to his letter to Berze in 1552.<sup>47</sup>

The controversy over insubordination and disobedience under the provincialate of Rodrigues sheds some light here. The removal of Rodrigues from his post in 1551 by Loyola caused a crisis within Portugal which challenged the authority of the superior general, only somewhat settled by the promulgation of the *Constitutions* by Nadal in 1553 and the replacement of Rodrigues with Diego Mirón—discussed further in Chapter Five—which seemingly sought to reinforce organisational obedience. The new provincial Mirón, however, promoted the ban on admission of conversos, even calling into question once again the admission of Henriques not only concerning his supposed time spent within the order of

---

<sup>45</sup> Josef Wicki draws his conclusion from Georg Schurhammer, the comprehensive biographer of Francis Xavier, that Simão Rodrigues introduced the ban in an 'unauthorised' fashion, cf. Wicki, '« Cristaos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz', p. 348. Robert Maryks too puts Rodrigues at fault, suggesting that this incoherence resulted from uncertainty about the wishes of the superior general, 'perhaps because of Rodrigues' instruction that could have been brought to [Xavier] by one of the many Jesuits who travelled from Portugal to Asia', cf. Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 74.

<sup>46</sup> See, for example, Niccolò Lancilotto's letter concerning the transmission of the Constitutions, *DI*, ii, p. 133. At this time, Polanco took charge of most of the correspondence on Loyola's behalf, as the superior general suffered from exhaustion attempting to address all the concerns of the Society while simultaneously working on completing the Constitutions, and the flow of information certainly suffered because of it—Ignatius' final letter to Xavier was sent after the missionary had already passed away on Sancian.

<sup>47</sup> Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 74. Given that Xavier died later that year, it is unclear whether he had actually changed his mind or simply been swayed by this supposed transmission.

discalced Franciscans but also how ‘above all he is New Christian’.<sup>48</sup> This continued opposition to Loyola’s authority on the matter of Jewish ancestry thus extended some level of the disobedience within the Portuguese province despite Rodrigues’ absence.

### *António Gomes*

Regardless of Xavier’s possible shift in opinion, the Society continued to admit *conversos* for at least the next two decades that followed. Among those who joined the Society in Portugal, some of the most notable included Henrique Henriques (1520-1600), as well as Afonso de Castro (1520-58) and Gaspar Rodrigues (?-1552). Additionally, there was Gomes Vaz (1542-1610), rector of the college in Malacca, whose paternal and maternal grandparents were of Jewish ancestry and were burned under the Inquisition in his hometown of Serpa.<sup>49</sup> One of the most intriguing cases is that of António Gomes (ca.1520-54). Gomes is perhaps known more for his role as rector of St Paul’s, having replaced Lancilotto there and bringing what was seen (at least by his predecessor) as a much-needed reinvigoration of the spiritual life in Goa. As has been remarked in the previous chapter, however, this too was followed by an ‘excessive’ fervour that pushed a public display of devotion and mortification indicative of many Coimbra novices that arrived in the second wave. exhibitiv aspect exceeded the personal control and regulation required of fasting and sensual rejection—in other words, it tested principles of obedience. It also earned Gomes a reprimand and ultimately a demotion; sent to Diu, later instructions from his superior and

---

<sup>48</sup> Inácio de Azevedo by commission of Diego Mirón to Ignatius of Loyola, 7 Dec 1553, *Monumenta Brasiliae*, ed. Serafim Leite (5 vols, Rome, 1956-68), v, p. 21: ‘y ultra esto es christiano nuevo’; Giuseppe Marcocci, ‘Inquisição, jesuitas e cristãos-novos em Portugal no século XVI’, *Revista de História das Ideias* 25 (2004), pp. 264-5.

<sup>49</sup> Wicki, ‘« Cristaos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz’, pp. 356, 351; Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 74. It is unclear from both sources whether the victims were the paternal or maternal side, or both.

sharpest critic Xavier suggested that any attempt to even leave the Gujarati island would result in even more severe penalties.<sup>50</sup> He was, of course, later dismissed from the Society.

António Gomes provides a peculiar case of a Jesuit with ‘dubious’ ancestry who served as one of the most vocal critics to admission of men like him. Although Maryks claims Gomes was of Jewish ancestry, the one-time rector nevertheless led the opposition to the appointment of Henriques as regional superior of the Fishery Coast (*Costa da Pescaria*) primarily because of his Jewish ancestry. How might Gomes then have reconciled this contention with his own identity? It helps to consider what John Robert Clines calls a process of ‘self-confessionalisation’ where an individual’s identity shifts according to their views towards their tradition and changes in prevailing norms. Thus we could consider the opposition of Gomes, a suspected *converso*, to other *conversos* through the framework of what Clines discusses—in which an individual’s identity oscillated in conjunction with the perceived changes in the Society.

In his study, Clines centres on the case of Giovanni Battista Eliano, a Jewish-born convert admitted to the Society by Loyola in 1552, who had shifting notions of conversion based on his experience as a Jew within a Society, moving from acceptance of those with Jewish heritage to defence of outright prohibition during his lifetime. As Clines notes, ‘Eliano’s textual artifice of conversion needed to conform to the perceived nature of conversion at the moment of writing’, meaning that his own testimonies over the years reflected differing views on the personal process. In 1562 he wrote a letter in which he ‘presented conversion as a complex process of identity construction that was riddled with temptations of apostasy’, or as a kind of ‘difficult process of leaving and belonging’. But by

---

<sup>50</sup> Francis Xavier to Gaspar Berze, 14 Apr 1552, *MX*, i, p. 744; ‘se Antonio Gomez por todo este ano em que estamos sair de Dio para yr a outra parte, por qualquer caso que seya, abrireis esa sedula e o que n’ela se contem, mandado-lhe o treslado d’ela...’. Coleridge writes that ‘this paper shows that Francis had finally determined to cut him off from the Society’, cf. *The Life and Letters of St. Francis Xavier*, ed. Henry James Coleridge (2 vols, London, 1872-76), ii, p. 477.

the time of writing his 1588 autobiography, he described ‘conversion not as a process in which converts oscillated between two faiths, but as a singular and irrevocable act through baptism’.<sup>51</sup> His views reflected not only his shifting interpretation of the process but also the general theological debate over whether conversion was gradual or a decisive moment. Initially it seems that many of his confreres were sensitive to the process of conversion, and his early letter described hardships most typically understood, especially to those in the business of propagating and aiding in conversion. Eliano confided in his superior Diego Laínez and his companions that his status as a convert would undoubtedly prove beneficial to mission, as it ‘gave him an unmatched appreciation for the religious peregrinations of young catechumens and a unique skill set in procuring converts’.<sup>52</sup> In the context of India, the only indigenous convert to take up mission in the Society, Pero Luís, felt more compelled to testify to his ‘liberation’ from the ‘gates of Hell’ by converting than whatever unique traits his prior religion might have afforded him.<sup>53</sup>

Eliano’s case raises an interesting point in the context of overseas missions about who among the Society’s ranks acknowledged the difficulty of conversion or held much sympathy to shifts in religious identity, and how those who came from old Christian families in particular viewed new convert communities. Were those who were more cognizant and understanding of the state of new initiates themselves more familiar with the process and therefore better suited? Or were other factors involved? If we look at António Gomes in light of Eliano’s identity shifts, we may find a man whose success in India—much like other Portuguese Jesuits who travelled to Asia, his reputation in the Old World owed much to his actions in the ‘New’—was highly dependent upon high-profile actions rather than a more

---

<sup>51</sup> Robert John Clines, ‘How to Become a Jesuit Crypto-Jew: The Self-Confessionalization of Giovanni Battista Eliano through the Textual Artifice of Conversion’, *Sixteenth Century Journal* 48/1 (2017) p. 4.

<sup>52</sup> Clines, ‘How to Become a Jesuit Crypto-Jew’, p. 12.

<sup>53</sup> Pedro Luís to Superior General Diego Laínez, ca. 17 Nov 1559, *DI*, iv, p. 393.

modest, productive labour over time. His role in the conversions of some indigenous noblemen serves as testament to his commitment to building a lasting legacy in a land with few opportunities for such an undertaking, but his approach portrays a man more concerned with fashioning a Portuguese Christian identity for himself and others—a model that for many like him was the ideal Christian—than an understanding of conversion as a complex transitional process. As others have argued, this kind of preference for honour and reputation befitted the model of the chivalric *fidalgos* of the Iberian Peninsula during the sixteenth century.<sup>54</sup> At odds also with the fashioning of a Jesuit identity, Gomes seemingly put the interest in his own salvation over the welfare of others, and as suggested by Luke Clossey ‘many Jesuits of this sort left the order’.<sup>55</sup>

Statistical studies on the *indipetae*, the letters sent by Jesuit novices to the Superior General, have shown that the clear preference of assignment was in the mission fields of Japan, over the first forty years where greater opportunities for sacrifice abounded, whilst administrators and provincials in India often had to surreptitiously hold missionaries in Goa to bolster their perennially-low numbers.<sup>56</sup> Similarly, Gomes had been sent to India in an attempt to temper his indiscipline, yet he ultimately fashioned the college of St. Paul’s in Goa in the mould of Coimbra, much to Xavier’s chagrin. Although this was intended to be a ‘vaguely punitive or correctional exile’, Gomes attempted to use this to his advantage, fomenting public displays of zeal within Goa as rector, releasing from prison and publicly baptising the local Brahman chief Loku, then celebrating and processing through Goa the

---

<sup>54</sup> Antony Mecherry, ‘Archbishop Aleixo de Menezes OSA, A Portuguese Fidalgo: Behind the Curtain’, *Vidyajyoti Journal of Theological Reflection* 82/1 (2018), p. 10.

<sup>55</sup> Luke Clossey, *Salvation and Globalization in the Early Jesuit Missions* (Cambridge, 2008), p. 121.

<sup>56</sup> Liam Brockey, ‘A Passage Through India’, p. 119. The statistics, admittedly, are hard to come by as it pertains to the first forty years, as the *indipetae* as a formal request did not start until 1583; prior to this year, the only methods for gauging any given individual’s personal interest in the Asia missions were through letters sent to the Jesuit Curia beginning in the 1560s, following Jeronimo Nadal’s visitations to Portugal and Spain to encourage submission of petitions for dispatch to the ‘Indies’; Colombo and Rochini, ‘Four Hundred Years of Desire’, pp. 83-84.

now-named Lucas de Sá and his family for one week.<sup>57</sup> Seemingly beneficial to the Church in India, these acts in fact only further highlighted to his superiors Gomes' unfavourable personality, suggesting a campaign of self-aggrandizement. Gomes had never argued that his own identity gave him a unique insight into conversion, but his actions suggested a transactional form of baptism. As Županov has argued, of utmost importance to Gomes was that his high profile convert in public presentation 'became a Portuguese because that was still the undisputed goal of conversion to Christianity'.<sup>58</sup>

Gomes' understanding of Christian identity correlated with the prevailing norms of Portuguese identity, for which the Coimbra model served as the archetype, and the reinforcement of *limpeza de sangue*. In Clines' view of this 'self-confessionalization', individuals participated in 'dialogic religious exchange that stimulated further confession building', reinforcing prevailing ideas. As collective definitions evolved, such as overarching policies regarding the ancestry of potential recruits into the Society, the response of individuals like Eliano became conditioned toward a different identity or representation of the self.<sup>59</sup> Zeal for personal exemplification, religious fervour, mortification, and public exhibition of these deeds all seem to be a part of the Coimbra philosophy in the mid-1540s, not to mention the growing deviation from the founder's wishes of non-discrimination towards *conversos* in Portugal. Gomes' behaviour evinced the same sort of religious dialogue with both his confreres in Coimbra and the types with whom he surrounded himself in Goa and the College of St. Paul's, reinforcing attitudes that other Jesuits such as Xavier saw as emanating from the distinctly Portuguese novitiate.

---

<sup>57</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 116.

<sup>58</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 137.

<sup>59</sup> Clines, 'How to Become a Jesuit Crypto-Jew', p. 5.

In the eyes of Xavier, there was certainly a place for Jesuits like Gomes—just not on the frontiers. Županov notes that ‘missionaries like Gomes, Xavier reckoned, could be employed to remedy these abuses among their compatriots’ in the many Portuguese fortresses in Asia, while those of a different disposition could be better suited to work in areas where the Portuguese, in both a secular and ecclesiastical capacity, were less influential.<sup>60</sup> It is telling that some of the more flexible members of the Society operating in India laboured outside the major Portuguese-populated sites of Goa and Cochin, while those who remained in these more urban sites—some detailed below—conditioned the responses of their companions towards the concerns that dominated the Portuguese psyche, reinforcing an identity of a more national sort. Gomes was one of the early figures of this developing prototypical identity at Coimbra, albeit not quite as outspoken against *conversos* as his successors.

### **The *Conversos* of Cochin**

Following the aforementioned cases of some *converso* Jesuits in India, a shift occurred in the *Estado* during the second decade of missions, with new arrivals affecting some of the methodologies and main objectives of the Society in Goa and elsewhere. Through the 1550s, as noted above, the Portuguese priorities were the establishment of religious uniformity through many of the same measures used on the Iberian Peninsula.<sup>61</sup> On the heels of the trial and execution of Jerónimo Dias in 1543, Vicar General Miguel Vaz Coutinho imposed stronger regulations, Hindu temples throughout Goa were destroyed, and the public practice of the Hindu religion prohibited; Coutinho himself petitioned the crown

---

<sup>60</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 127.

<sup>61</sup> Xavier, ‘*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*’, p. 280.

for a Goan Inquisition.<sup>62</sup> By 1560, converts' position within Indo-Portuguese society experienced further volatility, as viceregal decrees removed from office most *conversos* and *mestiços* in preference of Portuguese Old Christians—a move which in Portugal had already occurred over half a century before. Despite a royal decree on 6 March 1554 establishing a Tribunal of the Holy Office in Goa, the deaths of the Bishop of Goa Juan Alfonso de Albuquerque in 1553 and of Coutinho's successor Sebastião Pinheiro in 1555 in the time it took for the announcement to reach India stalled its formal introduction.<sup>63</sup>

Amidst all this arrived two of the more influential Jesuits, Gonçalo da Silveira and Melchior Carneiro. Although deemed primarily responsible for encouraging the final realisation of the Inquisition in Goa, they were certainly not alone in the campaign to remove 'Judaizers' from Portuguese India. Beyond António Gomes' opinions, many expressed concern over the presence of New Christians in coastal urban centres, from members of the Society to Church officials and the *casado* and merchant population. Certain controversial moments of the 1550s, such as those related below, serve as the catalyst for this shift, rather than merely the introduction of more enthusiastic Jesuits in India. The direct involvement of these individuals in these events, however, suggests that both personalities and local events or conditions drove this change. In other words, regardless of prior concerns about the converso communities in India, it is unclear whether the sequence of events would have proceeded in such a way had it not been for these two Jesuits.

The key event that triggered much of the Jesuit concern with New Christians in India took place on the feast day of Corpus Christi, 30 April 1557. In the offertory box of both the Sé church and the Dominican house in Cochim de Baixo (Santa Cruz), a *chyto* (chitty, or

---

<sup>62</sup> Cunha, *Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, p. 127.

<sup>63</sup> Cunha, *Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, pp. 129-30; José Pedro Paiva, 'The Inquisitional Tribunal in Goa: Why and for What Purpose?' *Journal of Early Modern History* 21 (2017), pp. 574-5.

scrap paper) containing various blasphemous writings was deposited, closed with the signature of ‘the tribes of Israel’.<sup>64</sup> After much commotion and discussion amongst the Franciscans, Dominicans, the vicar of Cochin Pedro Gonçalves, and the two Jesuits Silveira and Carneiro, officials arrested about twenty *conversos* in the Portuguese-controlled area of Cochin, seemingly the entire population of those claiming to be of Jewish ancestry, and accused them of apostasy. A trial was held in the city, presided by the vicar Gonçalves and later the bishop Jorge Temudo,<sup>65</sup> and soon thereafter the group was sent to Goa for further interrogation. Since no formal Inquisitional court existed in Goa at the time, the *conversos* were ultimately sent to Lisbon for their final formal trials and autos-da-fé, followed by the execution of all but one of the accused.<sup>66</sup> Historiography of the Inquisition in Goa points to this moment as the defining factor in the arrival of the Holy Office in India, but how did it get to that point? Some of the writings of individuals prior to the arrests and trials deserve analysis in light of Jesuit involvement and the controversies over *conversos*.

#### *Intervention of Dom Gonçalo da Silveira*

Dom Gonçalo da Silveira de Bragança was born in 1521 to one of the foremost noble families in Portugal as the son of Dom Luís da Silveira, first Conde de Sortelha, and Dona Beatriz de Noronha, the daughter of Fernão Coutinho, the Marechal do Reino under João III. His brother rightly became the second count of Sortelha, while two of his uncles served as captains of Diu. While Dom Gonçalo da Silveira did not blatantly avail himself of familial

---

<sup>64</sup> Melchior Carneiro to Cardinal Infante Henrique, 20 Dec 1557, *DI*, iv, pp. 5-13. Pius Malekandathil, ‘The Jews of Cochin and the Portuguese: 1493-1668’ *Proceedings of the Indian History Congress* 62 (2001), p. 246. Gonçalo da Silveira also references the note, but only recounts the signature, cf. *DI*, iii, p. 762.

<sup>65</sup> Temudo was later appointed Archbishop of Goa as part of the Ecclesiastical Council in 1567, whose decrees came down strongly on Hindus living in the Goan islands under Portuguese control, and also enacted very strict legislation on the conduct of ‘old’ Christians and converts.

<sup>66</sup> The excepted individual was Leonor Caldeira, who was excused because of her age; Malekandathil, ‘Jews of Cochin’, p. 246; Lisbon, ANTT, *Inquisição de Lisboa*, Proc. 5265, fo. 123. N.B. the first ever Portuguese auto-da-fe was held in Lisbon in 1540.

clout, he nevertheless found support along the way; in the controversies over the provincialate of Simão Rodrigues, his aunt Dona Guiomar Coutinho echoed Silveira's complaints against Rodrigues in a letter to Loyola.<sup>67</sup> He had entered the Society at Coimbra on 9 June 1543 and remained there until sent on mission to India in 1556, where he was named Provincial of the Indian missions and remained until 1559. Perhaps his most notable exploit came not in India but in East Africa. Sent to Mozambique in 1560 and made superior there, he famously briefly converted the King of Monomotapa before being killed by order of the king himself on 15 March 1561. While he was not the first Jesuit martyr of the 'Indies', he earned a special place in the literature of the period for his death at the hands of Muslims, particularly regarding the recovery of his remains.<sup>68</sup>

Silveira's time spent in India provides some significant insight into the methods he preferred and proposed to those under his guidance. Notably, Dom Gonçalo possessed a great passion for preaching the faith and delivering sermons, which on the one hand inspired companions such as António de Quadros to comment that God himself would have taken Silveira to confront the Antichrist.<sup>69</sup> On the other hand, Dom Gonçalo often appeared rather arrogant; described as insensitive or even apathetic by the eighteenth-century biographer António Franco, Silveira even clashed with his collateral provincial Francisco Rodrigues over the imposed restrictions to sermon lengths, which he viewed as impractical.<sup>70</sup>

---

<sup>67</sup> Francisco Rodrigues, *História da Companhia de Jesus na Assistência de Portugal* [henceforth *HCJAP*] (4 vols, Porto, 1931-50), i, p. 150.

<sup>68</sup> Alessandro Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso de la Compañia de Jesús en las Indias orientales*, ed. Josef Wicki, S.J. (Rome, 1944), pp. 302-3. Although Diogo Gonçalves discussed the details of Silveira's martyrdom in his *Historia do Malavar* (ca. 1615), the primary work was N. Godinho, *Patris Gonzali Sylveriae S. I. sacerdotis in urbe Monomotapa martyrium passi* (Lugduni, 1612). The Jesuit archives contain a number of writings on Silveira, though predominantly focusing on his time (and death) in Mozambique: 'Ragguaglio dell'inventione del corpo del P. Consalvo Silveria della Compagnia di Giesù, mandata al P. Franc. Govea della medesima Compagnia dal Sig.r licenziado Alfonso Barbuda', Rome, ARSI, Goa 34 I, fos. 22-31; 'Relação da morte do P. Dom Gonçalo da Comp.a [Titulus posterior:] Martyrium B. P. Consalvi Silveriae ex Lusitania missum', Rome, ARSI, Fondo Gesuitico, ms. 2, II/121.

<sup>69</sup> Berthe Leite, *D. Gonçalo da Silveira* (Lisbon, 1946), p. 19.

<sup>70</sup> António Franco, *Imagem da virtude em o noviciado da Companhia de Jesus no Real Collegio de Jesus de Coimbra* (2 vols, Coimbra, 1719), ii, p. 45; Leite, *D. Gonçalo da Silveira*, pp. 126, 133.

Nonetheless intelligent and devout, his effect on the condition of the Society in India in the late 1550s evinced an ambitious and zealous approach to religion and society in the Estado da Índia.

More outspoken than most on the members of the Society and the people in India during his provincialate, he commented on the *gentios* (specifically Brahmans), labelling them ‘malicious people with the intention of disseminating their sect and converting all; true enemies of Christ, bankers from hell, usurers and bearers of evil through diabolical dissimulation’.<sup>71</sup> His suggestion for dealing with them versus other groups differed, however. For *conversos*, ‘the solution Silveira proposed was the Inquisition, while for the Brahmans he suggested removing them from public affairs and cohabitation with the Portuguese’.<sup>72</sup> Naturally, the Inquisition held no jurisdiction over the unbaptised population, so this separation served as the legal means to deal with those neither Old or New Christian. The latter proposition of segregation between *gentios* and Portuguese, unlike the *conversos* however, could be transcended through conversion, after which Silveira believed ordination possible. While he decried the scandal of Jesuits of Jewish ancestry within the Society, the Brahman status of coadjutor Pero Luís held no impediment to entry into the order for Silveira. Writing on behalf of Luís in a letter to Superior General Diego Laínez in 1559, which followed the Jesuit hopeful’s request just days before, he gave his opinion that ‘I believe that he will become a good priest and of good knowledge for here [India]’.<sup>73</sup> Among his reasons for approbation were Luís’ prudence and quick handling of orders, but also ‘seeming to be dark-skinned, according to the climate, although not completely black’,

---

<sup>71</sup> Gonçalo da Silveira to Cardinal Infante Henrique, Grand Inquisitor, Jan 1557, *DI*, iv, p. 3: ‘maliciosissima gente...zelosissima de se plantar com sua seita e de adquirir todos a ela, inimicissimos do nome christam, e por huma dissimulaçam diabolica sam os banqueiros do inferno, das onzenas e maleficios’. Xavier, ‘*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*’, p. 256.

<sup>72</sup> Xavier, ‘*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*’, p. 256.

<sup>73</sup> Gonçalo da Silveira to Diego Laínez, 25 Nov 1559, *DI*, iv, p. 432; ‘creo saldrá hun bueno sacerdote, y para aquá de buena scientia’.

ostensibly a more qualifying characteristic.<sup>74</sup> Indeed, this slight distinction in colour had been outlined by Duarte Barbosa during the early 1510s when his *O Livro* correlated gradations between white and black skin with level of civility, ‘a hierarchy that started with “alvo” (the whitest) in the top, and “preto” (the darkest) in the bottom’.<sup>75</sup> Fitting the mark of Jesuit, whose decision-making should depend on the circumstances, Silveira seems to at least find some benefit in supporting the candidacy of Luís for full membership in the Society, even though the Brahman convert still possessed some semblance of the traits that displeased Silveira. Subtleties in racial categorisation from earlier Portuguese attempts to codify difference, such as that of Barbosa, perhaps allowed Silveira to justify Luís’ admission.

Similar to the approach of Gomes, Silveira had promoted standards inimical to cultural accommodation, in that his intention was to create a European sphere in which authorities could handle what they understand and dismiss or persecute what they did not; there was no attempt to discern what was *adiaphora*, as the clear agenda of the Portuguese (and many Jesuits like Silveira) was to create a new Christian realm in India. The similitude of Jews and Brahmans reinforced by Silveira had roots as far back as Josephus, yet he was willing to accept the model more readily through the interpretation of both as agents of resistance. Nevertheless each group presented different problems to the Portuguese Jesuits and ecclesiastics, and as such they were addressed using different means. Partially due to a greater familiarity with Judaism in its European iteration but perhaps more so due to the perceived perpetual rejection of Christ as Messiah by the Jewish people, the Inquisitorial response was required for *conversos*. Yet this reaction also seemed to arise from an

---

<sup>74</sup> Gonçalo da Silveira to Diego Laínez, 25 Nov 1559, *DI*, iv, p. 432; ‘sacando ser prieto, según el clima, aunque no de todo negro’.

<sup>75</sup> Ângela Barreto Xavier, ‘Languages of Difference in the Portuguese Empire. The Spread of “Caste” in the Indian World’, *Anuario Colombiano de Historia Social y de la Cultura* 43/2 (2016), p. 99; *Livro em que dá relação do que vio e ouvio no Oriente Duarte Barbosa* (Lisbon, 1946).

association with Judaism as a ‘false’ doctrine and interpretation of Scripture, which demanded correction of the heresies and blasphemies of Jews and especially crypto-Jews.<sup>76</sup> Brahmans and *gentios* in general had been typically more obstinate to any instruction or preaching of Scripture, yet any resistance nevertheless followed a shorter timespan when compared to the Jewish experience with Christianity. Therefore, as was the case of Goa, these Hindu groups did not experience quite the same juridical persecution yet were instead separated from distinctly Portuguese areas.

What enabled this separation and bound Jews and Brahmans together in the Portuguese administration of their area of Cochin was their relationship to Christian converts and their descendants. Per arrangements made with the Raja, the Portuguese were granted permission to build a wooden fort in 1503, around which they could settle, in the lower area of the city (‘de Baixo’), which the Portuguese called Santa Cruz after being given the designation of a city in 1527.<sup>77</sup> In the upper part (‘da Cima’) of Cochin, called locally Mattancherry, the raja retained jurisdiction. From the early part of the sixteenth century when Cochim de Baixo served as the major port and economic hub for the *Estado da Índia*, as Pius Malekandathil suggests, ‘the general policy of the Portuguese was to placate their commercial allies and thus ensure regular supply of cargo to Portugal, the Jews seem to have enjoyed a great amount of freedom’.<sup>78</sup> This more relaxed policy drew numerous waves of immigration of expelled Jews from Castile and Portugal (called *Judeus brancos* or ‘white Jews’) to not only Mattancherry but other friendly locations along the Malabar Coast that offered mercantile opportunities in the lucrative pepper trade. Corresponding with royal decrees to banish any Jews from Portuguese lands, these new immigrants, along with

---

<sup>76</sup> Cf. Henry Kamen, *The Rise of Toleration* (New York, 1967), p. 20.

<sup>77</sup> Subrahmanyam, *Portuguese Empire in Asia*, p. 60.

<sup>78</sup> Malekandathil, ‘Jews of Cochin’, p. 242.

communities of indigenous Jews (called *Judeus pretos* or ‘black Jews’) who held long-established political and commercial links with various local leaders, were prohibited from entering Cochim de Baixo although not from participating in trade.<sup>79</sup> In the wake of new measures by Dom Joao III against *conversos* in the 1530s which included the establishment of the Portuguese Inquisition, another wave of immigration occurred, this time of converted Jews and their descendants. Whilst legislation intended to prohibit any contact between Jews and *conversos* to avoid potential apostasy, the reality was that the ‘city’s economy was oriented above all to private interests, which the ambitions of a centralising state could not manage to control’, allowing a rather more open engagement between the two groups.<sup>80</sup> With the renewed vigour of the Counter Reformation and the movement towards establishing an Inquisition in Asia, some religious and political officials sought an end to such spiritually dangerous interaction, regardless of its purpose.

The extent to which there existed an aspiration to extract a distinct Jesuit identity from that of the Portuguese played out in the context of sanctity and defence of the faith against blasphemy and controversy. Therefore, while Jesuits operating in volatile areas outside Portuguese presence distanced themselves from the tactics of armed intimidation, they also questioned the Portuguese propensity to disregard the demographics of commercial relationships. Silveira expressed very strong opinions on the state of things in Cochin in January 1557, just a few months before the blasphemous writings were found within the offertory boxes. In his letter to then-Inquisitor the Cardinal Dom Infante Henrique, Silveira described the ‘pervasive Judaism’ and the ‘domestic enemies’ of Jews and Brahmans that existed within Cochin in particular. While he went into great detail about

---

<sup>79</sup> Malekandathil, ‘Jews of Cochin’, p. 243.

<sup>80</sup> José Alberto Rodrigues da Silva Tavim, ‘From Setúbal to the Sublime Porte: the Wanderings of Jácome de Olivares, New Christian and Merchant of Cochin (1540-1571)’, in Sanjay Subrahmanyam (ed), *Sinners and Saints: the Successors of Vasco da Gama* (New Delhi, 1995), p. 95.

the various sins and scandals of each of these groups, specifically ‘with regards to the Jews and bad Christians, the remedy is plain and simple, that is the Inquisition’.<sup>81</sup>

Thus, having just arrived in late 1556, Silveira wasted no time in making clear his intentions as Provincial. With knowledge of the decree for establishing the tribunal of the Holy Office in Goa and no living prelate to commence its proceedings, it appears that his actions certainly showed an intent to take the lead on Inquisitorial prosecution. As Valignano described in his *Historia*, Silveira had continuously preached to the community in Cochin, aware of the collection of *conversos* and the commerce taking place between them and the Jews of Mattancherry. However their interaction was not limited to economic activities, as he also claimed that ‘they go at night to celebrate in their synagogue their Jewish festivals, which they can then do more at their leisure, for there was not even at that time an Inquisition in India’.<sup>82</sup> These rumours drove the Jesuit to further zeal and fervour (even ‘divine fury’) in his preaching, going so far as to persecute the supposed crypto-Jews to the point at which these ‘irritants and scandalisers’ allegedly lost their sanity and consequently responded with blasphemous writings against both Silveira and Christ himself.<sup>83</sup>

In my impression, Silveira in turn prodded the *converso* community, which he believed had apostatised, until they gave in to his provocations and committed an offence deemed worthy of a formal Inquisition. Not only did Silveira arrive in India with a mind to institute the Holy Office, his objective was to see Portuguese Christianity imported as a whole. In a highly adulatory letter commissioned by Silveira, António da Costa described

---

<sup>81</sup> Gonçalo da Silveira to Cardinal Infante Henrique, Grand Inquisitor, Jan 1557, *DI*, iv, p. 2: ‘Quanto aos judaeus e maos christãos, o remedio está cham, que hé Inquisiçam’.

<sup>82</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso*, p. 342: ‘hião de noyte a celebrar em sua sinagoga suas festas judaicas, o que podião então fazer mays à sua vontade, por não aver aynda naquelle tempo na Yndia Inquisição’.

<sup>83</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso*, p. 342: ‘De maneyra que, espinhados e escandalizados, não poderão ter sua sanha’.

the great success at Goa, how ‘Our Lord by his goodness and mercy gathers those to the Society from his chosen...even though there are many infidels, there are so many Portuguese that it looks like another Portugal’.<sup>84</sup> Returning to Ângela Barreto Xavier’s point on the anxieties of demographic shifts via indigenous *novamente convertidos* and subsequent measures to reinforce peninsular and Indian-born Lusitanian primacy, this recognition of a Portuguese majority likely comforted pro-imperial sentiments. As Silveira’s biographer remarked, ‘Dom Gonçalo was the true governor of India, in his time’.<sup>85</sup> In reflecting more of the Portuguese identity of his birth, Silveira had aided the ambitions of the state which had not only sought to break private trade involving *conversos* that threatened an imperial monopoly but also fulfil the desired religious uniformity within the *Estado*.

#### *Melchior Carneiro*

We might be inclined to believe this account wholeheartedly if not for the strange circumstances and tenuous evidence for mass arrests. Complicating things further is the controversy over the facts and subsequent actions against the Cochin *conversos* by some Portuguese officials, which leads us to Silveira’s companion, Melchior Carneiro. Born in 1515, Melchior Nunes Carneiro, also known as Belchior, entered the Society at Coimbra on 25 April 1543, remaining at the Jesuit college there for some time until the plan of Cardinal Dom Infante Henrique to open a new university supervised by the Society brought him and nine other Jesuits, including Simão Rodrigues, to Évora.<sup>86</sup> In 1551 the group opened the

---

<sup>84</sup> António de Costa, general letter to the Society in Portugal, 26 Dec 1558, *DI*, iv, p. 198; ‘Nosso Senhor por sur bondade [e] misericórdia os ajunte à Companhia dos seus escolhidos...porque nós aqui, aynda que há muitos infieis, são tantos os portugueses que parece este outro Portugal’.

<sup>85</sup> Leite, *D. Gonçalo da Silveira*, p. 128.

<sup>86</sup> *Col. Conimbricensis*. Rome, ARSI, Lus. 43 I, fos. 1-4; Valignano, *Historia del principio y progresso*, p. 303. Franco, *Imagem da virtude*, i, p. 262.

Colégio do Espírito Santo with Carneiro as its first rector.<sup>87</sup> Nadal appointed him as the companion of Simão Rodrigues when Rodrigues was summoned to Rome to answer for his insubordination and lack of discipline. As Antonio Franco noted, Carneiro was himself a ‘companion prone to many of those public mortifications to which the first of our Fathers were quite inclined’, actions which were seen as scandalous.<sup>88</sup> Of noble background like his Cochin companion Silveira, Carneiro had an intensely storied global career, spanning from Portugal to China in two instances of episcopal leadership, a first for the Society of Jesus.

In 1555, Carneiro arrived in India. He was made the titular Archbishop of Nicaea (despite never even living there) in 1560, which, along with the simultaneously appointed Archbishop of Hieropolis Andres Oviedo, granted him the position of coadjutor and the right of succession to the Patriarch of Ethiopia, who at the time was João Nunes Barreto.<sup>89</sup> Given that the three men were unable to enter East Africa in 1555, Carneiro laboured along the Malabar coast for years until his appointment in 1566 to the position of Apostolic Administrator of China and Japan, and from that time lived in Macau—even after he rose to the position of Patriarch—until his death in August 1583.<sup>90</sup> Despite not receiving the title of bishop, he carried out the episcopal functions for the diocese, finally appointed absentee Patriarch of Ethiopia in 1577.<sup>91</sup>

---

<sup>87</sup> Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 33.

<sup>88</sup> Franco, *Imagem da virtude*, i, pp. 264, 262: ‘era companheiro dos mais naquellas mortificaçoens publicas a que foram tam inclinados os nossos primeiros Padres’.

<sup>89</sup> Robert Streit, *Biblioteca Missionum* (32 vols, Münster, 1916-74), iv, p. 214. Streit states that Carneiro was named Bishop of Nicaea and coadjutor of the Patriarch of Ethiopia in 1557; Wicki, on the other hand, remarks in his annotations of Valignano’s *Historia* that this appointment occurred in 1560, cf. *Historia del principio y progreso*, p. 303. To further confuse things, Carlos Sommervogel mentions that Carneiro ‘consacré évêque de Nysse en 1555’, cf. *Bibliothèque de la Compagnie de Jésus* (11 vols, Brussels, 1890-1932), ii, p. 757. Given the *Testimonium* of Francisco Fernandes in May 1557, in which Carneiro boasts about his appointment in the line of succession to Patriarch of Ethiopia, it seems most likely that the 1555 or 1557 date is most accurate.

<sup>90</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso*, p. 303.

<sup>91</sup> Angel Santos Hernández, S.J., *Jesuitas y obispadas: La Compañía de Jesús y la dignidades eclesiásticas* (Madrid, 1998), pp. 95-6.

One of the more interesting aspects of Carneiro's career is his opinion of his fellow Jesuit Henrique Henriques, on whom he wrote to superior general Laínez in 1559 as part of his general report on all Jesuit activity in the province. Among many positive characteristics, he also casually noted that Henriques 'is known as New Christian and for this reason many of the people hold him in low esteem', a point which Josef Wicki suggested referred to the disapproval of Henriques' appointment as superior of the Costa da Pescaria mission by António Gomes.<sup>92</sup> Another Jesuit, António de Herédia, wrote that through the appointment of *conversos* to positions of authority in the Society 'some people are not edified, before they are scandalised', naming Henriques as one example.<sup>93</sup> Hardly anything more can be gleaned from Carneiro's report about his opinion nor from Herédia's about his, but their comments give a sense of the view of reputation that concerned some Jesuits. On this subject, however, Herédia had more to say about Carneiro than the scandalous *converso* Henriques, implicating the noble Jesuit prelate amongst the contingent of superiors whose forceful methods for conversion in Goa Herédia believed caused great scandal for the Jesuits (see chapter 4).<sup>94</sup> Once again, the account stops short of a full description of Carneiro's personal approach, but clearly his own reputation had come into question. To get a clearer picture of Carneiro, we have to look at other documents.

First there is the altercation that took place in Cochin on 5 May 1557. Many details concerning Carneiro and his personality can be deduced from the testimony given by the clerk of the church in Cochim, Francisco Fernandes, following the discovery of the blasphemous *escrytos* in the church of Santo Sacramento and the Dominican house. The account describes the gathering of the Vicar Pero Gonçalves, Melchior (called 'Belchior')

---

<sup>92</sup> Melchior Carneiro to Diego Laínez, ca. 20 Nov 1559, *DI*, iv, p. 420; 'es conocido por christiano nuevo i por esta causa algunos del pueblo lo tienen en poco'. Wicki's editorial footnote on the same page references the letter written by Gomes to Lancilotto after Henriques was named superior.

<sup>93</sup> António de Herédia to some important father, autumn 1561, *DI*, v, p. 201.

<sup>94</sup> António de Herédia to some important father, autumn 1561, *DI*, v, pp. 194, 197.

Carneiro, and the Franciscan Francisco Lopo, in which they discussed the inquiries carried out concerning the writings ‘and so also of the New Christians [and] how they lived’.<sup>95</sup> The captain of Cochin, Diego Alvares Teles, entered the chancel, was offered a seat with the clerics, and after a while began to give his comments on the whole affair. His main contention was that the priests, in carrying out their inquiries about the blasphemies and the New Christians in particular, had done ‘more than what I said and ordered you...I did not tell you otherwise than only for you to take testimonies about the inscriptions, and they tell me here that you asked more than these questions’.<sup>96</sup> Consequently, he commands that the matter be dropped and nothing more be done, but Carneiro disputes this, saying ‘meekly’ that it was an ecclesiastical affair and that the captain could not interfere.<sup>97</sup> From that point on, the conversation essentially becomes a contentious discourse over jurisdiction and authority, with each man claiming that their service to God—whether in a clerical or political capacity—is more important.

Perhaps most telling is the instance in which Teles accuses the priests of tearing the town of Cochim de Baixo apart through their actions while investigating private lives of those living there. To this Carneiro responds that ‘it would be best that those men of poor quality that exist in this land should go away’, defending the decision to weed out the bad Christians.<sup>98</sup> Included in this philosophy is the familiar Jesuit refrain that a few good ones are better than many bad ones, although in this case it is used against a Christian society instead of referring to the ‘fruit’ of conversion.<sup>99</sup> This appears to be a further distortion of

---

<sup>95</sup> Fernandes, *Testimonium*, *DI*, iii, p. 639: ‘e asy tambem dos crystãos novos como vivyão’.

<sup>96</sup> Fernandes, *Testimonium*, *DI*, iii, p. 639: ‘fazeis mais do que vos eu dise e mamdey e do que ficastes comigo, eu não vos dise senão que somente tiraseis testemunhas sobre os escrytos e a mim diserão-me que quá que se perguntava por mais’.

<sup>97</sup> Fernandes, *Testimonium*, *DI*, iii, p. 640: ‘Padre Belchior Carneiro respondeo ao ditto capitão mãosamente: “Sennhor, Vosa Mercê não pode mamdar nisto nada porquanto hé cousa eclesiastica” e como hera cousa da Ymquisição ficava Sua Mercê escumungado’.

<sup>98</sup> Fernandes, *Testimonium*, *DI*, iii, p. 640: “Milhor serya que os roi[n]s que ouver na terra se vão embora”.

<sup>99</sup> Juan Polanco to Niccolò Lancillotto, 22 Nov 1547, *DI*, i, p. 211.

that preference of Ignatius that it is better to gain stronger but fewer converts than a great number who might risk spiritual ruin of themselves or others, a maxim that Xavier perceived as integral to decisions about the admission and dismissal of members of the Society. This ideology certainly suited the Jesuits, who sought *maiores gloriam* qualitatively over quantitatively, yet in the context of a city like Cochin the possibility of an entirely Christian community in the Portuguese settlement of Santa Cruz might have prompted an interest of rooting out *judaísmos*. That is perhaps why such intrusion drew controversy and created competing camps within the Society at large.

Nevertheless, the charge made against Carneiro and other ecclesiastical officials of dividing the Portuguese town displays Teles' concern for the political and social repercussions of the inquiries made in identifying potential crypto-Jews among the population. The subsequent trial of one of the accused, Maria Nunes, attested to the claims of the captain, as her testimony noted that a group of Cochin conversos had attempted, around Easter of 1557, to flee to Ormuz to escape Silveira's impromptu tribunal.<sup>100</sup> Such a move was of concern not only to the municipal authority, but also the governor of the *Estado da Índia*, Francisco Barreto (fl. 1555-58). Barreto, often described as one of the more moderate governors of India due to his lessening of legal restrictions against Brahmans, attempted to an extent to restrict the trials of the Cochin conversos in Goa, claiming that the Jesuits had overstepped their ecclesiastical jurisdiction. The defence lawyer for another accused, Diogo Soares, remarked as much, claiming that Gonçalo da Silveira had 'made himself an inquisitor, without having the power, authorization or seniority to act as such'.<sup>101</sup>

---

<sup>100</sup> Cunha, *Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, p. 132. Lisbon, ANTT, Inquisição de Lisboa, processo no. 6369, fo. 57v.

<sup>101</sup> Lisbon, ANTT, Inquisição de Lisboa, processo no. 185, fos. 21-21v; quoted in Paiva, 'Inquisitional Tribunal in Goa', p. 590.

These secular officials expressed a concern for the political and social repercussions of the inquiries made in outing potential crypto-Jews among the population.

Scholars have identified a greater concern, however, about the economic consequences of arresting a couple of dozen *converso* merchants and how that plays into wider imperial practices.<sup>102</sup> Among others, Pius Malekandathil notes that a ‘commercial jealousy’ on the part of the private Portuguese traders, somewhat late to the game when compared to the New Christian merchants, motivated the final realisation of an official Inquisition. Malekandathil’s reading of the testimony concludes that Teles had ‘accused the Inquisitors of trying to empty his city of inhabitants under the pretext of an inquiry against the New Christians’.<sup>103</sup> Others have suggested similar reasons, pointing to the fear of the growing influence of *conversos* in Cochin and Goa, in opposition to the interest of the Portuguese crown in promoting imperial policies of Christian expansion and consolidation.<sup>104</sup> In any case, the sides in contention were not homogenous. As José Alberto Tavim has noted, some individuals gained personally from these excessive steps by the Jesuits, while ‘the religious for their part profited from these individual quarrels to push ahead their own arguments concerning the heresy of the New Christians’.<sup>105</sup>

Whilst the issue of *conversos* in Cochin and other Portuguese Asian locales was certainly not confined to merely economic or financial concerns, as António José Saraiva and others have noted, it was part of a greater exercise in the imperial peripheries to mirror

---

<sup>102</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 10; cf. Cunha, *Inquisição no Estado da Índia*, pp. 139-45.

<sup>103</sup> Malekandathil, ‘Jews of Cochin’, p. 246.

<sup>104</sup> Paiva, ‘Inquisitional Tribunal in Goa’, p. 567; cf. António Baião, *A Inquisição de Goa, tentativa de história da sua origem, estabelecimento, evolução e extinção* (2 vols, Lisbon and Coimbra, 1930-45); Anant Priolkar, *The Goa Inquisition: Being a Quatercentenary Commemoration Study of the Inquisition in India* (Bombay, 1961); the concept of fear also plays a part in Charles Amiel and Anne Lima, ‘A narração de Charles Dellon. Estudo’ in Charles Amiel and Anne Lima (eds), *A Inquisição de Goa descrita por Charles Dellon (1687)*, tr. Bruno Feitler (São Paulo, 2014).

<sup>105</sup> Tavim, ‘From Setúbal to the Sublime Porte’, p. 104.

the policies of the Portuguese towards conversos in the metropole.<sup>106</sup> Saraiva himself described the Inquisition as a ‘monumental hoax’ intended not to create a purified Christianity but to purge the mercantile middle class, whom conservative Portuguese nobles identified as Jewish.<sup>107</sup> Based on Fernandes’ testimony and writings from figures such as Carneiro and Silveira, we must not neglect the concern for purifying Christianity in India; however, these inextricable strands of economic success, political consolidation, and religious interests, which so defined the sixteenth-century Portuguese imperial mind, ensnared the Jesuits in that same web. In the case of those involved in the events of 1557, the prosecution of the *conversos* fell into line with these imperial interests, satisfying the economic and political desire to wrestle commercial activity in Cochin from converso families to the benefit of an emerging Old Christian merchant class, as well as the religious commitment to establish Christian uniformity and allow for a more consolidated judicial power to eradicate deviations from the true faith in the future.

The early years of Portuguese presence in India were thus characterised by ‘legal autonomy and physical separation...more a suzerain than sovereign power, a kind of indirect rule’, which had derived from the legal precedent concerning Muslims and Jews in the kingdom of Portugal<sup>108</sup>—to physically separate communities and then control movement in and out of them. In light of the inaugural council of the Estado in 1567, developments to draw into the fold the existing local society of Goa arose out of an attempt to transcend the boundaries of Christian and non-Christian territories in Cochin. What had transpired there in 1557, from the perspective of the Jesuits and other ecclesiastical officials, was an intrusion into the Christian Portuguese space of Santa Cruz (Cochin de Baixo) by

---

<sup>106</sup> This is part of the main argument put forward by Xavier, ‘*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*’, p. 257.

<sup>107</sup> Saraiva, *The Marrano Factory*, pp. 148-55.

<sup>108</sup> Xavier, ‘*Conversos and Novamente Convertidos*’, p. 260.

Jews through their *converso* comrades, thereby proving the continued existence of a threat to civil Christian society that many Portuguese knew all too well. As Melchior Carneiro suggested in late 1557, Old Christians were annoyed by the audacity of these *conversos* and the freedom which they supposedly possessed:

‘the New Christians have given themselves ample occasion without the blasphemous writings, for the freedom that some of them have in conversing [with] the Jews of Cochim de Cima and in entering in their synagogue and, according to what is said publicly, in order to help with their factory; and some circumcise their sons, which is very cheeky (*atreuimento*) because commonly the boys go around nude’<sup>109</sup>

This perceived impudence, to which other Christians attested, legitimated a heightened regulation of space and those within it.

## Conclusion

In the years following the institution of the Goan Inquisition to which this incident directly contributed, the concern about *conversos* waned while trials of *gentio* converts swelled. Portuguese *conversos* formed ‘9% of the Goan Inquisition’s 3800 victims between 1561 and 1623, after 1590 they almost disappear from the lists: 321 from 1561-1590; 12 from 1591-1600; 5 from 1601-1610; 4 from 1611-1620.’<sup>110</sup> Most of the remaining percentage of defendants were Indian converts or descendants of converted *gentios* who had been accused of crypto-Hinduism. Yet through all this, the nine percent represented by Portuguese *conversos* of all those tried over the first sixty years of the Goan Inquisition ‘made up 69% of the 149 persons sentenced to death by the Goan Inquisition’.<sup>111</sup>

But an interesting deduction can also be made; both *conversos* in Cochin and *novamente convertidos* in Goa held some prominence in their respective communities,

<sup>109</sup> Melchior Carneiro to Cardinal Infante Henrique, 20 Dec 1557, *DI*, iv, p. 11.

<sup>110</sup> Saraiva, *Marrano Factory*, pp. 346-7.

<sup>111</sup> Saraiva, *Marrano Factory*, p. 347.

whether through commerce or politics or a combination of these and other aspects, and the harsh restrictions and blood purity regulations sought to re-establish a balance that favoured the Portuguese-born minority in positions of power within the Estado. The negotiated relationship between Portuguese officials and the raja of Cochin limited the capabilities of the ecclesiastical offices and the secular arm essential to the implementation of their judgments, leaving little room for a Christian moral economy to rule the whole of Cochin as the Portuguese did not have jurisdiction over most of Cochin. Goa, on the other hand, had consisted of more demarcated territories since Albuquerque's initial victories, supplemented by conquests in the 1540s, and the fall of the Vijayanagara empire in 1565 opened the door for further consolidation of power over populations in the Konkan region.

Bearing in mind Saraiva's points, it seems highly possible that in the context of Goa economic retribution played a significant role in the progressive introduction of the Inquisition in India. Yet whilst in Cochin the main threat to Portuguese monopoly was the *converso* population, in Goa it was Brahman control over temple administration and its associated land tax revenue, plus social privileges, that threatened the Portuguese elite's visions of consolidating their political and economic power. The specious—and even potentially fraudulent—claims offered by Silveira as to the blasphemous actions of crypto-Jews in Cochim de Baixo bring into question the motives to which captain Teles alluded; that is, attempts to disrupt the extant mercantile milieu.

But what about the general views of Jesuits towards *conversos*? Josef Wicki claimed that it was not race that caused Simão Rodrigues to disregard those with Jewish ancestry, but rather their lack of 'boa fama' as a collective group in Portugal which caused their exclusion.<sup>112</sup> Regarding Wicki's opinion, there certainly existed a considerable degree of

---

<sup>112</sup> Wicki, '« Cristaos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz', p. 361.

concern within the wider Society over the reputation of the order, and this could have very well played into how Rodrigues made his decision over the wishes of the founder. As we have seen, some Jesuits operating in India such as Carneiro and Herédia held reservations about the low esteem or ill repute that *conversos* brought to the Society. Yet Rodrigues' own disobedience in Coimbra, the encouragement of public self-flagellation and disturbance of lay citizens of the city, brings into question his understanding of how best to promote the good repute of the Jesuits, and so too the scandal over conversion tactics under Carneiro.

If the idea of 'good repute' plays into the admissions decisions, the histories of the aforementioned Jesuits of Portuguese noble birth certainly affirms this attempt. Certainly much of the Society, including Loyola and Xavier, came from nobility, and the Portuguese in particular contributed a large number of Jesuits from noble families as well. Antonio Possevino's 1576 memorial to General Mercurian suggested, however, that there existed a false pretence for the claims of reputation that characterised the Portuguese contingent in opposition to *conversos*. As Possevino noted, their obstinacy perhaps instead derived from 'overweening ambition (because they feel themselves to have been deprived of offices in the Society on which their honour depends)'.<sup>113</sup> We certainly see this reflected in the views of António Gomes, whose haughtiness was deemed misplaced by Xavier in the context of the Goa, where that behaviour—much as in Coimbra under Rodrigues—went against the humility and obedience the early Society attempted to instil in its members. So too with individuals like Gonçalo da Silveira, whose family honour contributed to his intense movements against the *converso* communities in India. In this sense, resembling tactics of the Portuguese lay elite to remove those officials without *limpeza de sangue*, ambition to

---

<sup>113</sup> Cohen, 'Nation, Lineage, and Jesuit Unity', p. 555.

attain the highest positions within the Jesuit order overshadowed any regard towards certain principles of its founder—in this case, to respect and accept *conversos*.

Focusing on the perception of *conversos* helps us distinguish what the Society felt its priorities were in India; given Ignatius of Loyola's lack of concern, and even wilful acceptance, of men with Jewish ancestry, why does it become a great concern to the Jesuits sent to India at their superior's behest? It is perhaps the presence of a concerted effort of Jesuits against New Christians—both within the Society and greater society—that evinces a countervailing cultural effect on members on the ground in opposition to the directives from their superiors. Ignatius certainly crafted the order with individual agency in mind, yet as the organisation grew he understood the importance of instilling obedience as a means of managing that agency and keeping check on the zeal and fervour that exceeded the Society's objective and character. Once again, the case of Simão Rodrigues holds relevance, in that his encouragement of spiritual expression, although part of what Ignatius sought to foster, did not serve the Society when done publicly in such a manner as to bring controversy. Yet on the topic of *conversos*, this obedience obviously did not continue under the later generals, as the election of Everard Mercurian shows.

What occurred in India around the mid to late 1550s saw one of the perspectives—that is, the *converso* question—come into mainstream focus where it had not been in the years before. The obsession with crypto-Jews, a veritable Iberian norm, obfuscated the view of the Society in India of Ignatian ideals and values on a par with what would become accommodation. The methodology perhaps might have been able to manifest earlier had the principles that stood above the realm of national identity taken priority. In the case of the Inquisition in Goa, it was the agenda of some of these Jesuits that triggered an irreversible and unrelenting assault that came to be focused not so much on the initial targets of *conversos*, but rather on Indian converts, rendering unsuccessful not only the supposed

pursuit of 'helping souls' but also the charge to make no distinctions between Jews and *gentios*.

**Chapter Five**  
**‘Intrando con amore’: The Visitor as Diplomat in India**

‘His Holiness (*Sua Santità*) should make some Father of ours his commissary or visitor to these Christians sending him to visit them, because in this way it would be certainly welcome, because this Bishop gives obedience to His Holiness and would not be opposed to said visitor, and in this method entering with love it would be possible to easily help these Christians’<sup>1</sup>

The concept of love within the Society of Jesus is not one that immediately strikes a reader of the letters, other than through the love of God—*amor do nosso Senhor, de Deus, do Christo*. When the Jesuit Emmanuel Fernandes employed the term, he specifically called for his Superior General to ‘take from me love and desires in order to give you everything’.<sup>2</sup> Less common was the instruction or guidance of labouring or approaching one’s ministry with love of the other. Thus when Francis Xavier wrote to Ignatius in early 1549, opining that the ‘Company of Jesus should mean Company of love and conformity of souls, and not of rigour or servile fear’, it stands out as a pivotal moment in defining what the purpose of the Society should be—even taken as an approach that would come to define *accommodatio*.<sup>3</sup> It should perhaps follow then that the name associated with the encouragement of an accommodationist methodology in Asia, the Visitor to the Indies Alessandro Valignano, would be the one to combine the convivial conversion technique that Ignatius of Loyola had once instructed—‘*entrar con el otro*’—with love.

One document dating to the time of Valignano’s visitation in 1575 told a similar story but to greater effect. Given as instructions to Jesuit superiors of the coastal fortresses

---

<sup>1</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 4 Dec 1575, *DI*, x, p. 168.

<sup>2</sup> Emmanuel Fernandes to António Correia in Coimbra, 4 Dec 1555, *DI*, iii, p. 323; ‘tome V.R. de mim o amor e desejos de lhe dar tudo’.

<sup>3</sup> Francis Xavier to Ignatius of Loyola, 12 Jan 1549, *MX*, i, p. 476; ‘y también por me parecer que Compañia de Jesús quiere dizir Compañia de amor y conformidad de ánimos, y no de rigor ni temor seruil’; cf. Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 71: ‘love...would be transformed into *accommodatio*’.

in India from the Visitor, the first mention of love is towards one's companions, to make multiple visits with them, 'enlivening and helping the fathers more with works than words, showing them much love and charity (*charidade*)...showing confidence with everything, and even if you know of some faults, remediate them with gentleness (*suavidade*)'.<sup>4</sup> Here he also incorporated another variation of *suavitas*, stressing a more gentle approach in personal relationships, as well as *caritas* in the sense of goodness and compassion. Some pages later, however, the use of love is in reference to evangelisation and ministry, toward those outside the order. Noting the patience and caution that is necessary with propagating what is to local Indian populations 'new' Christianity, superiors must strive to act 'with all things treating Christians as well as gentiles with much love and affability, especially conducting yourselves in principles and making yourselves loved, because in this manner you will help better, but with love you will also have a religious importance in the way that all have respect for you'.<sup>5</sup> More advice along these lines fills the pages that follow, echoing some of the same standards which Valignano seemed to express in his other writings and which characterised accommodation: that of a more affable and gentle approach to proselytization.

In looking more closely at the course of events in Portugal and India during the early period of Valignano's position as Visitor (1574-96), this chapter will show how his different attitudes towards the missions in India inhibited the development of cultural accommodation there as he set his gaze on East Asia. Focusing firstly on the Visitor's approach to Portuguese

---

<sup>4</sup> Rome, ARSI, Fondo Gesuitico 721 VI, 1, fo. 2v: 'Instructio data Superioribus a p. Visitatore, 1575'; 'animando he ajudando os padres mais com as obras que com palavras a mostrando lhes muito amor e charidade...mostrando muita confiança com todos, e ainda que acheis algumas faltas remedealas eis com suavidade'. The complete transcribed document is in fact published in *DI*, xi, pp. 1-32.

<sup>5</sup> Rome, ARSI, Fondo Gesuitico, 721 VI, 1, fo. 6v; 'tratando com todos assi Christãos como gentios com muito amor e affabilidade procurando maxime nos principios e fazer que vos amem porque desta maneira vos ajudareis melhor, mas com amor tereis tãobem huma gravidade religiosa de maneira que vos tenham todos respeito'.

provincial governance before looking at his consultations on the policies in India, I intend to show how the vision of Valignano towards a *suaviter* leadership prior to his departure from Europe was lost in the interim visitation of India and regained in the context of China and Japan. Despite this privileging of East over South Asia, Valignano moulded the conditions which allowed accommodation to arise, demonstrating principles of careful observation to particularity of place.<sup>6</sup> More than most of the individual Jesuits discussed thus far in previous chapters, Valignano's position and personality merged to affect missionary policy drastically. Valignano was able to realise these projects through a separation of Jesuit objectives from the Portuguese (and Iberian) ones, a concerted effort to encourage linguistic study, and as exhibited above a *suaviter* manner of proceeding. These endeavours were not however without limits, and his perception of culture very clearly fell along racial lines. Such limits varied from Valignano's belief in the Japanese and Chinese peoples as more 'civilised' than Indians, to his support of a conflicting agenda proposing the force of the Portuguese state behind the conversion efforts.<sup>7</sup> Across his career, a kind of 'missionary diplomacy' characterises his actions, seeking to resolve disputes and determine the correct course for different contexts—to an extent an attempt to 'become all to all', despite the problematic ways in which that occurred.<sup>8</sup>

Prior to his arrival in India, Valignano first encountered questions of administration within the Society, conflicting with the Portuguese superiors on the manner of governance, a topic discussed in the first section here. Included within these contentious discussions was the question of legitimacy. Amongst this new generation, the time between the foundation of the Society and the Jesuits of the 1570s triggered claims as to what legitimised

---

<sup>6</sup> Cf. Schloesser, 'Accommodation as a Rhetorical Principle', p. 352.

<sup>7</sup> Cf. Prieto, 'Perils of Accommodation', p. 399; Thanh, 'Jesuits in Asia under the Portuguese Padroado', p. 405; both reference Valignano's *Historia del principio y progreso* to support their explanations.

<sup>8</sup> Charles Ralph Boxer, *The Christian Century in Japan: 1549-1650* (Berkeley, 1951), p. 211.

individuals' actions. As we will see, both sides presented their actions as grounded in the spirit or letter of Ignatius himself, yet these were often used to support policies or principles already in action. It is possible that the reason for such variation follows much of what has already been hitherto said in this thesis, which is that the Ignatian imperative to exercise discernment in decision-making produced a considerable variation in opinion. Therefore, many Jesuits interpreted their founder's own advice within his many letters or administrative documents in whatever way suited the judgments they have reached. In the cases discussed here, this debate occurred most vividly between rigorist and moderate wings within the Society, with the degree of intensity based primarily on discipline. As a moderate, Valignano favoured a more ameliorative governance in contrast to his Portuguese confreres, and this largely figured into his judgments on mission.

Scholars have typically associated Valignano with the introduction of the practice of cultural accommodation, mainly due to his endorsement of Matteo Ricci's adoption of attire associated with the Confucian elite who attended the imperial Ming court, but also through his prescriptions for the missions in Japan. In which similar actions were taken to ensure a more 'Japanese' Christianity was fostered through education of locals in their own languages and establishment of schools. With the *dojuku*, the 'acolytes' who served as native interpreters for the Jesuit missions, Valignano arrived in Japan to find an indigenous labour force already in place and took this as an indication of the fruitful potential of education amongst the Japanese. Once schools were established, reciprocal language learning on the part of both Japanese laity and European Jesuits could occur more openly in a way that did not exist in India.

Concerning Valignano's time in India, however, scholars have not fully addressed the absence of any similar measures there. Race certainly played a factor. Franz Schütte addressed the discrepancy between the Visitor's view of the *gente bianca*, the Japanese and

Chinese people, and the darker-skinned Indians of the southern subcontinent, lamenting how Valignano never uncovered the established tradition of Indian philosophy and theology that existed in the interior and thus his judgments were primarily based on his interaction with unlearned, predominantly commercial, coastal populations.<sup>9</sup> Yet, as Ângela Barreto Xavier and Ines Županov note, Valignano legitimised his view of intellectual inferiority through racial categorisation and a privileging of East Asia, casting aside the needs of the Indian missions for his preferred project of converting Japan and China.<sup>10</sup> Amidst the arguments against focusing efforts on the progress of Christianity in India was the role of the Portuguese in the process. Partially a consequence of his views on governance against the Lusophone rigorists, but also on the commercial and imperial agenda which he saw as detrimental to the reputation of Jesuits in Japan as well as India, he represented, as Camilla Russell suggests, ‘the gradual separation of the Iberian colonial agenda from the Jesuit missionary enterprise’.<sup>11</sup>

What I add to the argument is the contention that this gradual separation brought by Valignano only exists on the part of Japan, where he and others note that the conflation of Portuguese and Jesuit representatives by Japanese (and even Chinese) authorities hold grave consequences for the progress of the Society. He certainly proposed the removal of at least one Jesuit from the Indian mission field to focus on language studies, but that seemed to be much of the extent of movements to encourage Jesuit *accommodatio*. Valignano encouraged the assumption of Thomas Christians into the fold of the Roman rite with little regard for their distinct cultural identity, noting that despite their Christianity they still lacked the reason that characterised those of a similar ethnicity. Therefore, much like Xavier, it appears

---

<sup>9</sup> Schütte, *Valignano's Mission Principles*, part 1, pp. 130-1.

<sup>10</sup> Xavier and Županov, *Catholic Orientalism*, pp. 127-8.

<sup>11</sup> Camilla Russell, ‘Imagining the ‘Indies’: Italian Jesuit Petitions for the Overseas Missions at the Turn of the Seventeenth Century’, in Massimo Donattini, Giuseppe Marcocci, Stefania Pastore (eds), *L'Europa divisa e i Nuovi Mondi. Per Adriano Prosperi, Vol. II* (Pisa, 2011), p. 186.

to be more a matter of self-preservation and self-interest, underpinned by the Asian racial hierarchy he assumed, that Valignano proposed measures of cultural accommodation for the East Asian missions. In terms of the indigenous populations of India, we may question whether Valignano governed with love.

### **To Govern with Love or Rigour**

As with love, certain other characteristics of Valignano's approach fit many of the undercurrents of personality ascribed to his predecessors, yet true to the Society, his charisma defied generalisations. Hailing from southern Italy when the Kingdom of Naples was governed by a viceroy from Spain, some have identified him with the anti-Castilian sentiment that also prevailed—politically and clerically—in Portugal; but he also exhibited some of the traits similar to his northern peninsular confreres Lancilotto and Criminali.<sup>12</sup> He was critical of the Portuguese Jesuits and their passion for the kingdom and its interests, and in fact had been appointed specifically by General Mercurian to combat these strident feelings across the Padroado mission fields. Motivations for this assignment, however, later included the need to calm the tensions between Portuguese and Castilian Jesuits in Asia during the union of crowns (1580-1640), as a kind of neutral figure less affected by the political landscape. His first task was specifically to disrupt the direct control of the province of India, overseen from Portugal under the rigorists Leão Henriques and Luis Gonçalves da Camâra.<sup>13</sup> He stressed the necessity for the admission of native clergy, but only in the context of Japan, against the more reserved perspective of the superior general. He

---

<sup>12</sup> Donald F. Lach, *Asia in the Making of Europe, Volume I: The Century of Discovery* (Chicago, 1965), book 2, p. 800.

<sup>13</sup> Andrew C. Ross, 'Alessandro Valignano: The Jesuits and Culture in the East', in John W. O'Malley, Gauvin Alexander Bailey, Steven J. Harris, T. Frank Kennedy (eds), *The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences, and the Arts, 1540-1773*, vol. 1 (Toronto, 1999), pp. 341-2.

encouraged more concerted efforts at language scholarship towards both catechetical and ethnographic purposes in the missions to India, but in his pivotal decisions to enrich the Jesuit progress throughout Asia he possessed a poor impression of the diverse communities in southern India. With this in mind, to what extent did he realistically approach the responsibilities of his distinguished position in India with some commitment to the principle of love?

Understanding Valignano's opinions regarding the Portuguese requires an understanding of some distinctions within the Society of Jesus in the metropole. Rigorism, as has been briefly discussed in previous chapters, had stirred controversy in Portugal during the early years of the Society. Ignatius had encouraged a shift in leadership in 1552 after Simão Rodrigues was accused of indiscipline and lax behaviour at the College of Coimbra, as well as 'daring to question decisions made by the superiors', and in 1553 Diego Mirón was named Provincial for the Portuguese Assistancy.<sup>14</sup> These changes resulted in an extensive purge of members in order to reinforce a stricter standard of membership, but the arrival of Mirón was accompanied by his support of the *segregacionistas*, essentially those who sought to exclude conversos from admission into the Society. Complicating things further was the growing cabal of *rigoristas*, who favoured an increasingly closer relationship of the Society in Portugal with the Inquisition and Portuguese temporal power.<sup>15</sup> Rigorism had developed at the college as part of a movement towards spiritual perfection, claimed to originate through the theology of Ignatius of Loyola, yet manifested in a strict observance of rules along the lines of such orders as the *piadosos*, seeking to suppress human nature at great self-discipline.<sup>16</sup> This ideology prevailed under the leadership of Luis Gonçalves da

---

<sup>14</sup> Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 288.

<sup>15</sup> Marcocci, 'Inquisição, jesuítas, e cristãos-novos', pp. 263-72.

<sup>16</sup> Francisco Rodrigues, *História da Companhia de Jesus na Assistência de Portugal* (4 vols, Porto, 1931-50), ii, p. 293.

Câmara (collateral provincial in 1556, assistant in 1558), the provincials Leão Henriques (1565-70) and Jorge Serrão (1570-74), and a number of other Portuguese and some Spaniards, ensuring a fairly strong trend of rigorist governance for two decades. Ensuring their consistent rule was a close alliance with then-Inquisitor General and Cardinal Dom Infante Henrique, whose political power expanded upon the death of Dom João III in 1557 on account of the young and unprepared successor Dom Sebastião, for whom the cardinal would later serve as regent in 1562. In addition to the privileged positions Jesuits came to hold at colleges from Évora to Braga, particular prominent figures gained closer connections with the ruling elite: Luís Gonçalves da Câmara served as confessor for Dom Sebastião, while Luís' brother Martim Gonçalves da Câmara acted as the young king's principal counsellor and confidential secretary (*escrivão de puridade*), and their cousin Leão Henriques served as Dom Henrique's confessor. As Giuseppe Marcocci put it, 'the brothers Câmara were among the principal protagonists of Portuguese life between the end of the 1560s and beginning of the 1570s'.<sup>17</sup>

The movement towards this preference of rigour—which relied on mortification, and regular observance and penance—in the development and regulation of Jesuit members split the Society into factions, with the opposition, called *indulgentes*, 'more inclined to broad-mindedness and preferred to rule by gentleness, love, and paternal goodness'.<sup>18</sup> Additionally, the rigorists in superior positions continually requested fewer teaching commitments, drawing them away from one of the foremost foundational responsibilities of the Society, even more confounding given their place within Portuguese colleges.<sup>19</sup>

---

<sup>17</sup> Marcocci, 'Inquisição, jesuítas, e cristãos-novos', pp. 273, 280.

<sup>18</sup> José Vaz de Carvalho, S.J., 'The Rehabilitation of Simão Rodrigues, S.J.', in Thomas M. McCoog (ed), *The Mercurian Project: Forming Jesuit Culture, 1573-1580* (St. Louis, 2004), p. 422; Marcocci, 'Inquisição, jesuítas, e cristãos-novos', p. 272.

<sup>19</sup> Cristiano Casalini, *Aristotle in Coimbra: The Cursus Conimbricensis and the Education at the College of Arts*, tr. Luana Salvarani (Abingdon, 2017), p. 43.

Although the rigorists had counted Spaniards among their ranks, it would take the election of Everard Mercurian in 1572 to divide the Society further, as the denial of the generalate to Juan Polanco created some animosity towards the Portuguese factions.<sup>20</sup> As Francisco Rodrigues noted in his history of the Portuguese Jesuits, the opposing faction in fact ‘advocated to be more accommodating to the character of the Portuguese’.<sup>21</sup>

Valignano, observing these movements at work in both Europe and Asia through letters received in his preparations for departure, acknowledged the circumstances of the election of his superior and the environment which it created in a letter from early 1574. Seeking to impress Mercurian, Valignano was firm, quoting the Psalms: ‘My father, all eyes look to you’.<sup>22</sup> He worried about the state of the Province of Portugal and pleaded with the new General to resolve the issues, stating that the men of the province ‘had possessed great hope with the election of Your Paternity, but with all this there is no lack of fear: if one of those who are so rigid is appointed provincial, it is over [*acta res est*]’.<sup>23</sup> Similarly, as he attested in the personal account of his own visitation, in which the Jesuits barely conversed with him, if the future Visitor did not express himself with authority, then the brothers of the province would not dare speak up and against this type of rigorism. Clearly an undercurrent of discontent with the extant policies carried through the lower Jesuit ranks, but they were unable to enact any real change from below.

---

<sup>20</sup> Members of this faction that developed were called *memorialistas*, named after the many (often anonymous) written *memorias* in favour of reform, which for the purpose of this chapter are less significant; nevertheless, they were comprised primarily of Spanish, pro-*converso* Jesuits in both Castile and the General Curia. Because of their stance and origin, it has been assumed that they were predominantly New Christians themselves. Cf. Cohen, ‘Jesuits and New Christians’, p. 22; and Maryks, *Jesuit Order As a Synagogue of Jews*.

<sup>21</sup> Rodrigues, *História da Companhia*, ii, p. 293.

<sup>22</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 116; ‘Padre mio, ad te sunt oculi omnium’. Cf. Psalms 118:148, 140:8.

<sup>23</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 116; ‘hanno conceputo grandissima Speranza con la eletteione di V. Paternità, ma con tutto ciò non manca timore: se si fa provinciale alcuno di questi rigidi, acta res est’.

Valignano described the province of Portugal as in such a state that it required a serious transformation, and this was likely intended to move Mercurian to act. The extent to which Valignano's letter speaks with candour on the state of things is remarkable, but it provides some indication of the style of his visitation and what it would later mean to India. Initially his critiques were more general, but then he focused on specific individuals, noting

‘almost all of these fathers who have some authority in Portugal are in my opinion truly good and of holy volition and intention; but they are all governed and the others still govern according to one command [*ad nutum unius*], that is Father Luis Gonzales [Gonçalves da Câmara], which he holds, and he has placed in the intellect of others such false principles that it is no wonder if, governing these men with good intention, they make such grave errors’<sup>24</sup>

Valignano's use of *ad nutum unius* carried some weight here, as it signified a fairly tight grip with which Câmara governed the province and expected compliance, and he clearly did not favour any other manner. In his letter Valignano noted that Câmara had insinuated that the means by which the Society in Rome was governed were not good and the ‘spirit of the Company was destroyed in Italy’.<sup>25</sup> The then Provincial Jorge Serrão, a close colleague of Câmara's, was reportedly much more direct, claiming that to govern with ‘love and pleasantness [*soavità*]' like the Italians do ‘is a proposition in direct opposition to the spirit of Father Ignatius’.<sup>26</sup> The implication of referring to Italy in the statement might not have irked Valignano, but certainly as a representative for the Jesuit General Curia this flew in the face of his authority and objective, questioning his very purpose. On the whole his more general conclusions about the Portuguese province were that it sought to do whatever it

---

<sup>24</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 110; ‘Questi Padri quasi tutti, che sono di qualche autorità in Portugallo, sono a mió giudicio veramente buoni et di santa volunta et intentione; ma si governano tutti et governano anchora gli altri ad nutum unius, che è il P. Luis Gonzales, il quale tiene egli et ha posto nell'intelletto delli altri principii tanto falsi che non è meraviglia se, governando questi con buona intentione, fanno gravissimi errori’.

<sup>25</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 111; ‘il spirit della Compagnia sia destrutto in Italia’.

<sup>26</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 12 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 86; ‘di [governare] con [amore] et soavità “questo è una propositione al diretto contraria al [spirito] del P. Ignatio”’. Brackets used here are substitutes for the encoded numbers, letters, and symbols Valignano used in this particular letter, perhaps the only example of such a practise.

wanted in opposition to any sort of standard practised in other provinces, Italy and Spain especially. Serrão's mention of *suavitas* demonstrated his understanding that there existed a trend within the Society of this softer approach, but the provincial saw no value in it nor had any desire to follow it.

Furthermore, Serrão's comments simply did not correlate with the reality of the administration and governing style of the Society. Ignatius had incorporated into the General Examen, the first part of the *Constitutions* which provided instructions for reviewing candidates and personnel within the Society, the means by which superiors should govern those working under them. As the Examen on observances within the Society described,

‘the more completely the superiors know these subjects’ interior and exterior affairs, just so much the better will they be able, with greater diligence, love, and care (*tanto maiori cum diligentia, amore, et sollicitudine*), to help the subjects and to guard their souls...thus he [the superior] may direct them better, without placing them beyond the measure of their capacity in dangers or labours greater than they could in our Lord endure with a spirit of love (*quam in Domino ferre suaviter possint*)’<sup>27</sup>

Contradicting the argument of Provincial Serrão, not only did the terms of both love and pleasantness appear within the guidance of the founder Loyola, they also corresponded specifically to the context which was contested—that of the superior's approach to governing and furthermore the Jesuit ‘manner of proceeding (*procedendi modum*)’.<sup>28</sup>

Again and again, the onus of the Portuguese province is on the practice of rigorism. In a list of seven principles Valignano identified in place within Portugal by which the authorities had governed falsely, the first two included their refusal to follow any precedent in Italy about how to live or proceed, and an insistence on corporal punishment (‘*gastigo corporale*’) to deal with any sins or imperfections—if they did not strive to remove every imperfection, they were to be dismissed from the Society. The third principle directly

---

<sup>27</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 104.

<sup>28</sup> Loyola, *Constitutions*, p. 104.

confronted Valignano's approach, and instead stated that 'one does not have to govern with love but with rigour', based on an example provided by Gonçalves da Câmara of a brother who once requested to be governed with love rather than punishment.<sup>29</sup> Câmara tied this principle directly to Ignatius of Loyola, detailing how, when he brought this case to him, the then-superior general declared this request to be 'the worst sign...that is, to want to be governed with love'.<sup>30</sup> Câmara had experienced this almost twenty years before, but used the one case to exemplify the entire Italian *modus procedendi*.<sup>31</sup> Based on the structure of Valignano's account—and the ambiguity of Câmara's—Ignatius likely intended that the problem lay with the general request to be treated in a certain way, not necessarily the specific means of dealing with them. Ignatius had intended to replace the lax discipline of Simão Rodrigues with more resolute obedience, which certainly corresponded with the directive to avoid allowing a brother or novice to determine how they should be governed.

Beyond this point, in Valignano's eyes the extent of intense mortification was questionable, as were the subsequent principles of prohibiting cohabitation of members of all ranks, vigilant rigour to remove all imperfect members, and the arrogant belief that every part of their governing procedures were in 'service to God'.<sup>32</sup> In fact, the methods had made even some other prominent figures in Portugal uneasy, in particular the cousin of Gonçalves da Câmara, the provincial Leão Henriques. Valignano noted that from his conversations with the rector of Santo Antão college, Miguel de Sousa, that all those that had held positions

---

<sup>29</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 112; 'Il 3° principio è che non si ha da governar con amore ma con rigore'.

<sup>30</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 112; 'questo era il pegior segno che havesse dato quell Fratello, cioè di voler esser governato con amore'. A similar reference occurs in a letter two weeks prior, cf. Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 12 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 86.

<sup>31</sup> Cf. Luis Gonçalves da Câmara, 'Memoriale seu diarium Patris Ludovici Gonzalez da Camara', *Fontes narrativi de Sancto Ignatio*, i, p. 612.

<sup>32</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 113; 'arbitrantur se obsequium prestare Deo', cf. John 16:2.

of authority were accustomed to ruling in a more ‘rigorous’ manner and had lost all trace of ruling in any other way. He wrote,

‘having discussed these at length with Father Leão [Henriques] and Father Miguel de Sousa, that they confessed to me that this governing with rigor had ruined this Province and they have promised me that they will make great changes on this henceforth; though with all this, they are so used to the contrary that they do not know to do it’<sup>33</sup>

From these words, it was clear that the Province needed guidance. Ultimately, Valignano closed his letter to Mercurian with cautious instruction for the future visitor to be aware of the conditions present in the province, noting that this visitor should understand the potential duplicity of the companions there, to ‘not believe them so easily, because they already proceed to say that they need to be governed with love, but we must not believe them so quickly [*sed non oportet illis tam cito credere*]’.<sup>34</sup> Here the current Visitor returned to his own philosophy on governance with love, and how through works more so than words their own actions spoke to the contrary. The shakeup was swift, with a new Provincial named that year, in the form of the more moderate Manuel Rodrigues.

Taking into account Valignano’s assessment of the province during his visitation in Lisbon, the influence of Gonçalves da Câmara and his rigorist approach to governance stood at the centre of the concerns. If we look back to the controversy surrounding Simão Rodrigues during his tenure of the same post, Ignatius understood that discipline and obedience within the order required a formidable figure at the top and felt no misgivings about removing that individual if they proved insufficient, even if that person had been a

---

<sup>33</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 116; ‘havendo di questo allungo trattato con il P. Leone et con il P. Michel di Sosa, che mi han confessato che questo governar con rigore ha ruinato questa Provincia et mi han promesso che farranno gran cose da questo innanzi, con tutto ciò sonó tanto abituati al contrario che non lo sanno fare’.

<sup>34</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 121; ‘non creda loro facilmente, perché già cominciano a dir che bisogna governor con amore, sed non oportet illis tam cito credere’. It is unclear why Valignano repeats himself more or less in Latin at the closing of this sentence, but it is likely a scholastic reference that has gone hitherto unnoticed.

close companion, friend, and even co-founder of the order. The collective Society was far more important than one person. Additionally, from the perspective of Francis Xavier, such indiscipline at the upper level of provincial administration produced a crop of poor novices. Thus it proves reasonable to reflect on the influence the Provincial had on the individual missionaries that eventually landed in India, tracing the presence of a governing philosophy and methodology back to him. Focusing on the contemporary concerns surrounding Gonçalves da Câmara and those whom he sent to India, there exists enough correlation to consider how issues at home came to affect the work abroad. The Italian method, as Câmara and the Portuguese superiors saw it, was to ‘adhere only to the “essentials” but pay no attention to the “accidentals” [i.e. details]’.<sup>35</sup> Valignano indeed pressed in his letters the importance of distinguishing between essential and trivial needs, particularly in leadership, that ‘they should be strong in their resolutions, conceding to them [Jesuits in lower positions] on the other things that are non-essential’.<sup>36</sup> Valignano followed his own advice in his resolutions; as he stated in his letter, ‘while they [Câmara and superiors] thought to catechise me and instruct me as to the method with which I ought to govern India with the same spirit that they adopt here, they discovered so many things from me that they became the catechised’.<sup>37</sup>

### **Rigour and Force in India**

Following the landmark First Provincial Council of Goa in 1567, the Tridentine spirit explicit in the measures privileging Christianity emboldened the *religiosos* of various

---

<sup>35</sup> M. Antoni J. Üçerler, ‘Alessandro Valignano: man, missionary, and writer’, *Renaissance Studies* 17/3 (2003), p. 342; Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 111.

<sup>36</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 8 Mar 1574, *DI*, ix, pp. 220-21; ‘sia forte nelle risoluzioni, condescendendo con loro nell’altre cose che non sono essenziali’.

<sup>37</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 110-11; ‘essi mentre pensorono di catechizer me et addoctrinarmi al lor modo acciò che governasse l’India con questo spirito che aqui tengono, mi scuoprirono tante cose che essi ne rimasero li catechizati’. Cf. Üçerler, ‘Alessandro Valignano’, p. 342.

orders in India post-1570, bringing about growth in both size and influence alongside the Estado's dissolution of Brahman agency and even general clearing of all non-Christian presence in the area.<sup>38</sup> As such, the confidence for the growth of Christianity in Goa and beyond swelled, but disputes continued over the responsibilities of clerics in this growth. Also significant in these intramural discussions was the extent to which individuals had autonomy in decision-making in contrast to limits in respect of obedience owed to superiors. If we look at the context of India this was certainly well-established, as has been shown in previous chapters. We may turn here, however, to one of the most illuminating texts for the understanding of purpose and priority amongst members of the Society in India during this period of 'Catholic renewal', particularly in light of the authorities overseeing activities at the time.

In the weeks preceding the inaugural Provincial Congregation of late December 1575, Valignano held a consultation on the island of Chorão north of Goa with the superiors of various mission fields across the subcontinent to discuss a number of *preguntas* ('questions') concerning general Jesuit ministry, administration, and organisation. On the first two questions—whether the Province of India ought to be divided, and whether one superior should oversee the Fishery (*Pescaria*) and Travancore coast missions—all stood in agreement on the affirmative. The third question—whether one ordained Jesuit should be the superior of another ordained companion—created a split in opinion. The first group stood in line with the wishes of Ignatius of Loyola and followed the suggestion of Francis Xavier that 'in the missions one should be superior of the other', while the second pressed that 'they should be companions'.<sup>39</sup> Group two deferred to the fact that the next level

---

<sup>38</sup> Ames, *Renascent Empire?*, p. 61.

<sup>39</sup> 'Deliberationes patrum veterum et superiorum de pluribus quaestionibus provinciae Indiae' [henceforth Chorão consultation], 6-18 Dec 1575, *DI*, x, pp. 234-5; 'porque la sancta memoria de nuestro Padre Ignatio escribió al P.e Maestro Francisco aprobando el orden que havia dado, que en las misiones el uno fuesse superior del otro...La 2.a opinión fue que ordinariamente estuviessen como compañeros'. The letter from

superior to those in question would use discretion to determine how things should proceed; in some cases, this might mean a superior some distance from the Jesuits in question. Consequently, the second opinion acquiesced to the first to an extent, that ‘in the missions and distant residences one should always be superior of the other, for the inconveniences and diversity of opinions that tend to occur, that cannot be remedied in a short time’.<sup>40</sup> Placing one as superior to another ensured that there was a more immediate hierarchical dynamic for imparting decisions as well as ensuring obedience, crucial to quelling the divisions that might occur over disagreement—an issue at the centre of the Madurai mission between Roberto de Nobili and his companion Gonçalo Fernandes.<sup>41</sup>

As detailed above, the superiors in Portugal defended their practises to Valignano in early 1574 by claiming the principles by which they governed had emanated from Ignatius himself. Much like these attempts at legitimation, the true approaches of the Society became contested by various individuals in the Indies missions. Many decades later, when the noted accommodationist Nobili was plying his own methods—notably claimed to be in the true spirit of Ignatius as well—he and then-Provincial of Malabar Alberto Laerzio, who along with Valignano had supported the Italian *sannyasin*, found themselves under scrutiny by some of their confreres, among them Diogo da Cunha. Da Cunha remarked during a consultation held in Cochin in June 1610 that their particular method ‘did not seem to conform to that of the Apostles, nor to that of our ancient Fathers, Master Francisco (Xavier), Gonçalo (da Sylveira) and others’.<sup>42</sup> The opening of this consultation, however,

---

Xavier referenced is ca. 11 Oct 1549, *DI*, i, p. 512: ‘De la orden que avéis dado que, adonde ay juntos de dos arriba de la Compañia, uno sea superior, y aunque fuessen dos solos, me ha alegrado. En el Señor nuestro me parece que siempre se deve hazer assi para adelante’.

<sup>40</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 235; ‘en las misiones y residencias distantes siempre uno sea superior del otro, por los inconvenientes y diversidad de los pareceres que suelen ocurrir, que no se pueden remediar en breve tiempo’.

<sup>41</sup> Cf. Županov, *Disputed Mission*.

<sup>42</sup> Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 60; for the consultation report cf. Rome, ARSI, Goa 51, fos. 27-8.

purposefully invoked the significance of the *Constitutions*, drafted by the founder Ignatius, and how it had placed authority in the hands of the Superior General, who at the time lent approbation to the accommodationist attempts. The use of precedent is of particular interest, as different individuals viewed these ‘ancient Fathers’ in varying light; competing views of Xavier and Loyola served different sides throughout these disputes. In this case, the inclusion of the rigorist Gonçalo da Silveira, as discussed in previous chapters, among other historic Jesuit figures indicated that for some the more rigid approach was viewed as more compatible with the spirit of the Society than the more flexible one.

The opinion among missionaries was not the same on the question of the relationship with the secular power, shown not only through such figures as Niccolò Lancilotto and Henrique Henriques but also to an extent Valignano. In his *Historia del principio y progreso*, Valignano recounted how the strength of the *Estado* contributed to prosperity in general, with the influence of the Portuguese crown in both the Indian Ocean and the subcontinent littoral such that ‘either by love, or by force, all attempt to have friendship with the Portuguese’.<sup>43</sup> Likely intended to satisfy his royal audience, Valignano exaggerated the dominance of the state both in economic and political terms, but in truth the Portuguese relied on this force to maintain order in India. The Jesuits, on the other hand, did not always do so. Perhaps prefiguring the opinion of Da Cunha some twenty years prior to the consultation on Nobili’s methods, however, Valignano indicated that force had proven integral in the success of Francis Xavier:

‘because Father [Xavier] understood through his spirit and care how incapable and primitive is the nature of these people in the affairs of God, and that with them reason does not have as much vigour as force...and with much greater difficulty will it be saved, if not under the lordship of the Portuguese, or where in some way that power could be extended, as it already is by the coastline, where, the armadas

---

<sup>43</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso*, p. 40; ‘o por amor, o por fuerza, todos procuran tener amistad con los portuguesses’.

of Your Highness coming and going, can grant favour and punishment according to what the people there deserve'<sup>44</sup>

Later questions of the Chorão Consultation exemplified some of the complex divisions within the Society in India over the Jesuit position vis-à-vis state institutions. Amongst the items discussed explicitly by the Jesuit superiors in India, one question was whether they should serve as confessors or councillors to governors, viceroys, or captains, which split the group roughly in half along the lines of what was more edifying to the local population and served the good of the *Estado*. More interesting, however, were the questions concerning two tangible offices, the Mesa da Consciência and the Holy Office of the Inquisition. As has been discussed, both tribunals counted Jesuits among their officials throughout the mid-sixteenth century, but certain figures prioritised their activities over others. After Martin Gonçalves da Câmara, brother to Luís the Provincial of Portugal and confessor to Dom Sebastião, earned the position of president of the Mesa sometime in 1565, the growing influence of their family within royal politics increased the Jesuit presence in affairs involving the imperial regulation of morality. This increased power directly contributed to the Holy Office as well, which had been entitled by the Mesa in Portugal in 1569 to prosecute Hindus and Muslims for various reasons, such as preventing conversions.<sup>45</sup> On the eve of the General Congregation, Jesuits at Chorão in late 1575 signalled a reconsideration of their purpose within both of those institutions.

The idea of serving Portuguese state officials directly elicited ambivalence among the companions, but it was clear how involvement in the Mesa and Inquisition appeared to

---

<sup>44</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso*, pp. 69-70; 'porque el Padre entendía con su espíritu y prudencia cuán incapaz y rudo es el natural desta gente en las cosas de Dios, y que no tiene con ellos tanto vigor la razón como la fuerza... y con mucho mayor dificultad se conservaría, si no fuese debaxo del señorío de los portuguesses, o donde en alguna manera se pudiesse estender su poder, como es por las costa de mar, por donde, passando y llegando las armadas de S. A., puedan dar favor y castigo conforme a lo que las gentes della merecen'

<sup>45</sup> Giuseppe Marcocci, 'Conscience and Empire', p. 486. Cf. Marcocci, *Consciência de um império*.

the laity. Regarding the first institution, unless the General Superior believed otherwise, ‘all were of the opinion that, if the King did not oblige us to it, our own should not serve as prelates’.<sup>46</sup> They left open the opportunity to handle cases of conscience, much like Francisco Rodrigues had done up until his death in 1573 but not nearly in the same capacity. In a similar departure from Rodrigues’ responsibilities, all attendants except one decided the best course of action was that ‘we should not intervene in any case in the Holy Office of the Inquisition, because it is very odious and causes great fear to the men [of this land]’.<sup>47</sup> Valignano provided his own observations on both the preceding consultation and the congregation itself when he wrote to the Superior General shortly thereafter in late December 1575, concluding that personally he too found this particular opinion better than the other.<sup>48</sup> Both verdicts acknowledged, ultimately, that the final decision lay with the Inquisitor General, at that time Cardinal Dom Henrique; as far as the Mesa da Consciência was concerned, the Jesuits in Asia had already technically received exemption from that tribunal earlier that year.<sup>49</sup>

The timing was perhaps just right. While the Holy Office had begun formal trials in 1560, the Goan office of the Mesa da Consciência was established by Archbishop Jorge Temudo only in 1570; and yet four years later its close relationship with the Jesuits fell apart. From its inauguration the Provincial António de Quadros and rector Melchior Nunes Barreto served as councillors, but their tenure was short, as Barreto died in the autumn of

---

<sup>46</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 277; ‘Quanto a la Mesa de la Consciencia fueron todos de parecer que si el Rey no nos obligaba a esso, no fuessen los nuestros de ordinario’.

<sup>47</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 277; ‘no nos entremetamos por ningún caso en el sancto officio de la Inquisition, porque es muy odioso y que causa mucho miedo a los hombres’.

<sup>48</sup> Alessandro Valignano, ‘Observationes circa Congregationem’, 30 Dec 1575, *DI*, x, p. 376. Cf. Marcocci, ‘Jesuit Missionaries and the Portuguese Inquisition’, p. 235; cf. Schütte, *Valignano’s Mission Principles*, p. 113; cf. José Eduardo Franco, ‘A Companhia de Jesus e a Inquisição: afectos e desaffectos entre duas instituições influentes (Séculos XVI-XVII)’ *Actas do Congresso Internacional Atlântico de Antigo Regime: poderes e sociedades* (Lisbon, 2005), p. 10.

<sup>49</sup> A letter from Manuel Rodrigues on 14 Mar 1575 indicated that Rodrigues received word from General Mercurian noting that Cardinal Dom Henrique had released the Society from any obligation to the Mesa, but that it did not arrive in time to go with those ships dispatched for India; cf. *DI*, ix, p. 629.

1571 and Quadros a year later.<sup>50</sup> Ignorant of the latter's demise, then vicar general Juan Polanco wrote to him one month after his death informing him that new appointments were delayed until the election of the new Superior General.<sup>51</sup> Perhaps the absence of any new Jesuit deputies on the Mesa contributed to the decision of other companions to abstain from further involvement; nevertheless the public perception proved sufficient grounds for the separation.

At the Chorão consultation, the first opinion given to the question was rendered by Francisco Dionisio, who felt that the Jesuits were best equipped to handle the cases, 'because there is a great absence of learned men in the country and of those that have discretion and heart free from passion'.<sup>52</sup> Dionisio certainly fitted the description of a learned man, having committed himself to scholastic study for three years, theology for another two years, as well as serving as moral theology professor at the college in Goa. The catalogue of members in 1566 recorded his displeasure with fellow Jesuits who failed to reach the perfection of preaching that the Society claimed to possess.<sup>53</sup> Even though he still agreed that the Jesuits should not be directly involved in the Inquisitional *processos*, the shortcomings apparently bothered him more than he let on, as it was revealed in 1578 that throughout the previous three years Dionisio had secretly sought to leave the order and join the Carthusians, a fact he divulged only after he had fled his post as rector in Cochin to seek entry into the Dominican order there.<sup>54</sup> It is not certain that the shift in purpose regarding the Inquisition was what sparked his desire to separate from the Society, though the whole episode nonetheless partially revealed the perception of other orders in contrast to the Jesuits.

---

<sup>50</sup> Županov, *Missionary Tropics*, p. 212.

<sup>51</sup> Juan de Polanco to António de Quadros, 24 Dec 1572, *DI*, viii, p. 596.

<sup>52</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 277; 'por que ay mucha falta en la tierra de hombres doctos y que tengan secreto y el coraçon libre de passión'.

<sup>53</sup> 'Cathologo dos Padres e Irmãos que residem neste collegio de São Paulo de Goa e nas igrejas que estão à obediencia delle a 2 de Dezembro de 1566', *DI*, vii, p. 75.

<sup>54</sup> Schütte, *Valignano's Mission Principles*, pp. 359-60; Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 291.

Dionisio, at least as far as we can gather, felt disillusioned with his own order's preaching abilities, driven enough by such conviction to abandon it rather than to reform the order from within.

### **Conversos, Unloved**

The debate over the place of *conversos* in the Society illustrates the complexity and variety of opinions within Jesuit factions. Dividing lines were not as simple as rigorists and Portuguese on one side and more moderate Italians on the other, as Thomas Cohen more or less suggested.<sup>55</sup> Instead, the dialectic shifted over time and depended on various factors and contexts, including, as Claude Stuczynski notes, 'individual or collective choices, geographical spaces, and, of course, historical circumstances'.<sup>56</sup> By the mid-seventeenth century António Vieira represented a Portuguese Jesuit tradition of millenarian zeal strongly in favour of enabling the Portuguese imperial project—informed by the circumstances of the Portuguese Restoration—yet which was also *pro-converso*. In our period of focus, collective choices determined by the predominantly rigorist Portuguese contingent in Asia, affected by the growing power of the Inquisition in Portugal (and her empire) and the Counter Reformation, and the majority non-Christian space of India to realise an enthusiastic campaign of conversion created a particularly zealous Jesuit province in India during the 1560s, yet the issue of *conversos* depended more so on individual choices.

During his tenure as Provincial from 1559 until his death in 1572, António de Quadros exemplified the odd connections wrought by personal and political interests. Quadros supported quite directly the Inquisition as well the practise of forced baptism (discussed in the previous chapter), not to mention his role in reinforcing rigour and

---

<sup>55</sup> Cohen, 'Jesuits and New Christians', p. 22.

<sup>56</sup> Stuczynski, 'Negotiated Relationships', p. 48.

discipline in response to such figures as António Gomes; yet in his capacity as Provincial of India he appeared to have never barred known conversos from superior positions.<sup>57</sup> The case of Simão Rodrigues serves as another example. Rodrigues certainly opposed the agenda of rigorists in the province, yet he also espoused some anti-*converso* opinions. Ignatius, on the other hand, was both in favour of a more moderate approach, coupled with discipline, and the admission of *conversos* into the Society. Prevailing moods in the province of Portugal were such that Ignatius' latter preference diminished greatly after Rodrigues was recalled to Rome in 1552, allowing the more rigorous leadership to take root over multiple decades.

Alessandro Valignano remained noticeably frustrated in dealing with the implacable Portuguese Jesuit leadership, remarking on it at length in some of his extensive letters written during his stopover in Portugal. Having addressed on multiple occasions the fact that 'the error exists in the way' these superiors carried out their duties, he was particularly disappointed at the fact that they 'do not change because they do not understand nor can they even fathom that [this way] is rigid'.<sup>58</sup> This rigidity of governance and in particular the place of New Christians undoubtedly represented a deviation from foundational instruction. Diego Mirón (or Mirão), as mentioned, had been appointed by Loyola in 1552 to take over the position of Provincial from the supposed indiscipline of Simão Rodrigues, yet Mirón himself proudly supported the *segregacionismo* faction, earlier in Spain and now in Portugal, which sought to prevent admission of conversos into the Society.<sup>59</sup> Shortly after his appointment the Spaniard was reminded by his superior general through secretary Polanco that 'to be of the lineage of the New Christians is no impediment that might exclude

---

<sup>57</sup> Wicki, '« Cristãos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz', pp. 351-52, 361.

<sup>58</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 8 Mar 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 220; 'l'errore sta nel modo, il quale pensó che non lo muteranno perché non cognoscono, né si fanno capaci che sia rígido'.

<sup>59</sup> Marccoci, 'Inquisição, jesuitas e cristãos-novos', p. 264.

one from the Society’, as there existed no distinctions among the Jesuit companions.<sup>60</sup> Over the course of the two decades that followed, these instructions clearly lost out as Portuguese provincial leadership continued to move in its own direction. Further complicating the already messy faction lines, the Portuguese superiors saw a direct correlation between laxity and Jewish ancestry, for as Valignano noted ‘they damn all rule by *conversos*, because they [*conversos*] do not punish sins, and they say that until now this has been the ruin of the Society’.<sup>61</sup> This sentiment had certainly prevailed for some time, and the province continued to be inflexible on the matter.<sup>62</sup> By the time Valignano consulted the Jesuit companions there, even Mirón had become quite unpopular ‘by those that govern and from 5 or 6 others that are united with them...but from all the others he is considered holy and very popular.’<sup>63</sup>

The situation had become so fraught that Valignano had to avoid recommending a new Provincial who might further exacerbate the Portuguese discontent with the Jesuit Curia. His primary concern had been to ‘proceed with great softness [*suavità*]’ and ‘show great respect and love to these Fathers’ so as to not upset any one group.<sup>64</sup> Valignano thus indicated a preference for either the return of Simão Rodrigues or another moderate, Manuel Rodrigues, as more acceptable replacements for leadership than someone like Mirón, whose foreign, particularly Spanish, identity displeased many.<sup>65</sup> They were not exactly his only choices, but as he remarked in his letter to Mercurian from 1574, other possible competent candidates such as Francisco Enriquez and Piero Gomez had been excluded due to the

---

<sup>60</sup> Ignatius of Loyola to Diego Mirón, 5 Apr 1554, *MI*, vi, p. 569; ‘ser de linaje de x.nos nuevos no es impedimiento que escluya de la Compañia’.

<sup>61</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 112; ‘dannano tanto il governo delli confessi, perché non castigano li peccati, et dicono che questo è stato fin hora la ruina délia Compagnia’.

<sup>62</sup> Casalini, *Aristotle in Coimbra*, p. 42.

<sup>63</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 8 Mar 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 220; ‘Il P. Mirone è poi, da questi che governano et da 5 o 6 altri che con questi sono uniti, poco amato et lo riceveranno con mala sodisfattione, ma da tutti gl'altri è tenuto per santo et grandemente desiderate’.

<sup>64</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 8 Mar 1574, *DI*, ix, pp. 219-220; ‘proceduto con grande suavità’; ‘che è necessario che per una parte monstri grande rispetto et amore a questi Padri’.

<sup>65</sup> Nuno da Silva Gonçalves, S.J., ‘Jesuits in Portugal’, in McCoog, *Mercurian Project*, p. 720.

claims that they were twenty-five percent New Christian (*'tengono un 4° di christiano novo'*, i.e. grandparent(s) of either Jewish or Muslim birth), even though no legal precedent existed in the Society at-large to prevent their appointment.<sup>66</sup> Mercurian followed the Italian's advice and named Manuel Rodrigues as Provincial that same year, a move that quelled the rigorists Jorge Serrão and Luis Gonçalves da Câmara, yet ultimately would leave intact some thread of the anti-*converso* slant that had long defined Portugal. As Robert Maryks claims, it was the same Manuel Rodrigues who was responsible years later for a letter to the General Congregation calling for exclusion of New Christians from the Jesuit order altogether.<sup>67</sup>

Crucial to handling all this was finding a middle ground; moving from one extreme to another only created a more volatile situation. At least, that is how Valignano appears to have read it. In a way, Valignano respected this more moderate tradition grounded in the Ignatian encouragement of indifference, allowing him to transcend the more delineated factions. Another phrase often used in instructions by Jesuit superiors to their companions, *'pouco a pouco'*, perhaps best suits how Valignano approached this delicate balance in his work as Visitor, and later Provincial. Little by little he had hoped to break the Portuguese Jesuits from their prejudices, perhaps even when it came to *conversos*. In a letter from Claudio Acquaviva from December 1582, the newly-elected Superior General advised that, even though *'those who in Portugal are called New Christians'* should not be given the position of superior or another prominent ministry where they might cause offense to prelates or inquisitors, they *'should be embraced in the love of Christ with all the care for*

---

<sup>66</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 8 Mar 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 220. Cf. Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. xv.

<sup>67</sup> *'Card. Henricus contra Generalatum novorum Christianorum'*, Rome, ARSI, Institutum 184 II, fo. 356r; *'confessi (id est homes, qui ex Judaeorum sanguine emanant) in societatum admitti non possint'*; cf. Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 82.

all those who for their virtue deserve it'.<sup>68</sup> Echoing the opinions that Lancilotto had once impressed upon Loyola in 1551, Valignano agreed and noted the inherent issues with the Portuguese when it came to New Christians; but departing from his principle of *amore*, he also described how even the loving embrace his General proposed was 'a hopeless cause which has no remedy...because this opinion is very ingrained in the hearts of men'.<sup>69</sup>

Hardly discussed about Valignano is his role in the managing of conversos within the Society. Antonio Possevino, secretary under General Mercurian and vocal opponent of the Portuguese 'intrigue' at the General Congregation of 1573, had lambasted Leão Henriques for his role in influencing the outcome against the favoured Juan de Polanco—a move which, as mentioned, Infante Dom Henrique directly supported.<sup>70</sup> In the same *Memorial*, Possevino added that Henriques had also prevented the dispatching of *conversos* to India but had been undermined by the courageous virtue of Valignano to bring known New Christians from Castile with him, noting how the Visitor, 'aided by nothing more than the true spirit of the Society, overcame all those vain shadows and showed...that the ruin of the Society would most certainly follow if it is allowed to live with these fears'.<sup>71</sup> According to his own letters, however, Valignano had made certain that none of his forty-one companions accompanying him on his inaugural departure to India possessed any *converso* background.<sup>72</sup>

---

<sup>68</sup> Acquaviva to the Indies Provincial [Valignano], 22 Dec 1582, *DI*, xii, p. 695; 'los que en Portugal llaman christianos nuevos, sino que sean abrazados in chántate Christi con toda caridad todos los que por su virtud lo merecen'.

<sup>69</sup> Claudio Acquaviva to the Indies Provincial [Valignano], 22 Dec 1582, *DI*, xii, p. 695; 'Esto entre los portugueses es cosa desesperada y que no tiene remedio, porque está esta opinión muy metida en los corazones de los hombres'. Giuseppe Marcocci notes in 'Jesuit Missionaries and the Portuguese Inquisition' that this quote came from Acquaviva as well, but this is in fact one of the many commentaries and annotations made by Valignano as responses to the instructions given by the Superior General, cf. *DI*, xii, p. 685.

<sup>70</sup> 'Card. Henricus contra Generalatum novorum Christianorum' Rome, ARSI *Institutum* 184 II, fos. 373-6.

<sup>71</sup> *Memorial*, ARSI Congregationes 20/B, fos. 210-211; cited in Cohen, 'Nation, Lineage, and Jesuit Unity', p. 559, and Maryks, *Jesuit Order*, p. 172.

<sup>72</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 118; Wicki, '« Cristaos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz', pp. 353-4.

A different story emerged in the overseas missions, exemplifying the factors of complex dividing lines at play between the metropole and periphery as described by Stuczynski.<sup>73</sup> Evinced a more indifferent diplomacy, Valignano attended to a de facto ban on the dispatching of known *converso* Jesuits to Asia, yet he remained less concerned with any presence of such members already deployed there. Henrique Henriques, criticised at one time by António Gomes for his *converso* ‘impediment’ to a vocation in the Society of Jesus, received special dispensation from Valignano to remove himself from the responsibilities of ministry to the people of the Fishery Coast in order to make a concerted effort at learning (and mastering) the Tamil language. On separate occasions, two other Jesuits—Melchior Carneiro and António de Herédia—worried about the implications of Henriques, a known New Christian, holding any position of authority, as the Portuguese laity either ‘held [him] in low esteem’ or ‘were scandalised’ by his presence.<sup>74</sup>

Valignano had not quite overcome the shadows as Possevino thought, but nevertheless displayed diplomatic expertise in handling the *converso* controversy in the Portuguese provinces. As he wrote to General Mercurian from Mozambique, if missionaries to India come from Spain ‘there should be no one who holds some *converso* descent, because they are indeed so abhorred by the Portuguese that, although they are not only good but holy, they are considered useless here’.<sup>75</sup> Valignano lamented the fact that this prejudice existed and asked for forgiveness for those who created it, but he especially called upon the

---

<sup>73</sup> Stuczynski, ‘Negotiated Relationships’, p. 48.

<sup>74</sup> Melchior Carneiro to Diego Lainez, ca. 20 Nov 1559, *DI*, iv, p. 420; ‘es conocido por christiano nuevo i por esta causa algunos del pueblo lo tienen en poco’; António de Herédia to some important father, autumn 1561, *DI*, iv, p. 201; ‘Não se edificão algumas pessoas diso, antes se escandalizão por correrem os tempos como correm’.

<sup>75</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, August 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 412; ‘si ha da avvertire con quelli che vengono dale Provincie di Spagna che non vi sia alcuno che tenga alcuna razza di confesso, perché invero sono tanto abhorriti da portughesi che ancorché sieno non solo buoni ma santi, sono qui inutili et subito cognosiuti con poca nostra reputatione’. Cf. Wicki, ‘« Cristaos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz’, pp. 353-54.

General to resolve the matter. From his perspective, an effective ban on sending any *converso* would be done to ‘respect those who are from outside’ this Portuguese social norm.<sup>76</sup> The Chorão consultation commented on the issue in similar fashion, deciding that

‘it seems that those who have some descent from New Christians ought not to be received, because even though they may be very virtuous, they [Portuguese?] have very little trust in them and many times it happens that their parents are sentenced by the Holy Office of the Inquisition, of which a great scandal and infamy is caused in the Society.’<sup>77</sup>

As illustrated, the rigorist and anti-*converso* sentiments did not always fall along the same lines of national or regional identity. In the same letter in which he criticised the scandal of New Christian Jesuits in India, the Portuguese-born Antonio de Heredia nevertheless claimed that it would be much better if new candidates ‘should not come from the Portuguese nation’ because of dominating rigorist sentiments, later providing details of dealings between Portuguese Jesuit superiors and *Estado* officials that he deemed scandalous.<sup>78</sup> Higher up, the first Italian superior general, Claudio Acquaviva (1581-1615), oversaw the formal agreement of legislation on Jewish ancestry as an impediment to admission into the Society at the General Congregation in 1593. Acquaviva signalled his intent to regulate the role of *conversos* in the Society in 1582, enacting an early modern ‘Don’t Ask, Don’t Tell’ prototype along ancestral lines, where he stated that ‘it seems necessary that, where they are known, they are not to be given the offices of superiors, or of some important ministry where offense may occur, especially in principal persons’.<sup>79</sup> Acquaviva certainly had some personal conviction behind these decisions, yet it almost seems that in this earlier writing he blamed Portuguese proclivities in forcing his hand and

<sup>76</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, August 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 412.

<sup>77</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 284.

<sup>78</sup> António de Herédia to some important father, Autumn 1561, *DI*, iv, pp. 197, 199; ‘e se ella não fosse da nação portugessa tanto melhor seria’.

<sup>79</sup> Claudio Acquaviva, ‘Instrucción para el nuevo Provincial de la India Oriental hecha en Roma a 22 de Xbre. 1582’, *DI*, xii, p. 695; ‘parece necessario que, adonde son conocidos, no se les den cargos de superiores, o de algún ministerio importante de donde pueda soceder ofension, especialmente en personas principals’.

attempted to carve out some of the cultural and political influence wherever possible. The General understood that Portugal was a special case as he negotiated the stubborn anti-*converso* sentiments with the need for flexibility abroad. Thus he reminded Valignano in a letter of 1582,

‘Understand that some of ours in Goa have attended to the acts of the Inquisition at some point as Inquisitor, and another time as agent or commissioner of the Holy Office, which in no way suits them, and so I seek that Your Reverence resolve this; and understand that in all of Europe, except in Portugal, we have ensured that ours should not be Consultors of the Holy Office, which although in these parts it is not advisable to refuse in these times, for that reason we ought to not develop the other extreme of making ourselves Inquisitors’<sup>80</sup>

The rise in the predominantly Portuguese rigorist faction in the province had contributed to an enhanced feeling of regional pride and opposition to foreigner involvement within provincial leadership, and this front lessened only when the rigorists declined in influence.<sup>81</sup> Even then, the start of the reign of Philip I of Portugal (Philip II of Spain) in 1580 incited further patriotic sentiment, albeit along different lines. There nevertheless exists a correlation between the presence of *segregacionistas* Jesuits in superior positions, the opposition to *conversos* in similar offices, and the preponderance of Portuguese recruits sent to India—a phenomenon that Acquaviva perhaps recognised, but one that Alessandro Valignano certainly understood when he began to formulate organisation in Asia along national lines. Breaking apart these factions, seeking to diminish the dominance of any one group, would prove crucial to the development of accommodation. Through Valignano’s diplomacy, we see once again the complexity of factions within the Iberian Jesuits, and how

---

<sup>80</sup> Lisbon, Biblioteca Nacional de Portugal, Fundo Geral 6620; cf. Josef Wicki, review of *A Inquisição de Goa*, by António Baião, *AHSI* 21 (1952), p. 189; “Entiéndese que alguno[s] de los nuestros en Goa han assistido a los actos de Inquisición alguna vez como Inquisidor, y alguna otra vez como agente o commissario del Santo Officio, lo qual en ninguna manera conviene, y así desseo que V.R. lo remedee, y entenda que en toda Europa, excepto en Portugal, hemos procurado que los nuestros no sean Consultores del Santo Officio, lo qual, aunque en essas partes no conviene negar en esos tempos, no por esso devemos dar en el otro extremo de hazernos inquisidores’.

<sup>81</sup> Silva Gonçalves, ‘Jesuits in Portugal’, p. 720.

despite his own individual choices to placate the prevailing Portuguese sentiments against *conversos* he did so as a means to protect the Society from scandal and preserve its reputation amongst the settler society of the *Estado da Índia*. Although Valignano acted against the Ignatian view of *conversos*, ultimately his *suaviter* approach to handling the Portuguese, alongside a concern for the appearance of the Society, showed one side of *accommodatio*. If, by avoiding scandal and placating the Portuguese, Valignano could fulfil the greater objective of ensuring Jesuit progress in his more preferred missions of East Asia, then this concession would be worthwhile.

### **Managing identities**

Understanding the rigorist mentality within the Portuguese ranks certainly figured heavily into the decisions made by Valignano in Asia. As Camilla Russell has argued, even the decision itself to appoint the Neapolitan as Visitor to the Indies and later superior of the Province, a distinctly Portuguese-dominated set of mission fields, portrayed an initiative to disentangle the imperial agenda from the Jesuit *modus procedendi*.<sup>82</sup> His measures helped to expand the presence of the Society in areas either under indigenous or non-Portuguese political control, which in doing so necessitated some of the methods along the lines of cultural accommodation. Given his statements about Portuguese Jesuit superiors and the overall issues with imperial politics in Asia, one might think that he purposefully sought this separation of the two institutions, but the contrast between China and India presents contrary evidence. Valignano had no problem with the force of the *Estado* in the Goan islands, as his *Historia* noted, for it exuded the military and political power necessary to keep converted populations in order and discourage them from joining with the ‘enemies’,

---

<sup>82</sup> Russell, ‘Imagining the Indies’, p. 186.

which is to say the non-Christian sovereigns such as the Ottomans or the zamorin of Calicut.<sup>83</sup> In China as well as Japan, however, he might have loosened the bonds between Jesuits and their Portuguese patrons, but these areas already experienced no direct European sovereignty and as such had to rely on the innovation of the missionaries themselves.

Nevertheless, the companions with whom Valignano selected to work in these far-flung contested spaces of conversion purposefully lacked Portuguese character. Observations from his earliest visits in Lisbon on through his time in Japan indicated a distaste for the Portuguese, as ‘too ethnocentric, conservative, and not well enough trained’ for the type of accommodationist programme he envisioned.<sup>84</sup> When discussing how the Portuguese could not, like others, ‘become all to all’, Roberto de Nobili remarked ‘Father Alessandro Valignano, a man worthy of eternal memory, used to say that, though the provincial in India could be Portuguese, the good of the Society demanded that the Visitor should never be’.<sup>85</sup> Valignano impressed upon his superiors the need for Spaniards or Italians to head the positions overseeing missions in East Asia, but in India he opined that the Provincial there must be from Portugal.

At the very least, Valignano exhibited an understanding of the crucial differences between Europe and Asia in a way that failed to appear substantially in prior accounts from other Jesuits; as Markus Friedrich put it, ‘juxtaposing Europe and India and insisting on their partial incommensurability became a key element of his reporting’.<sup>86</sup> Outside of the implications this had for governing either a foreign political entity or a religious organisation, as Friedrich’s work discusses, recognition of this distinctness also informed

---

<sup>83</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso*, pp. 86-7.

<sup>84</sup> Lach, *Asia in the Making of Europe*, p. 799; Schütte, *Valignano’s Mission Principles*, pp. 107-9.

<sup>85</sup> Roberto de Nobili to Claudio Acquaviva, 21 Oct 1610, Rome, ARSI, Goa 51, fos. 164-5; quoted from Županov, *Disputed Mission*, p. 68.

<sup>86</sup> Friedrich, “Government in India and Japan”, p. 6.

the necessary epistemological questions regarding the variety of cultural systems with which Jesuits interacted.

These issues emerged to light in some instances of collective decision-making in which Valignano included himself. With the Chorão consultation, the Jesuit superiors of various regions responded to a series of questions about dealing with war, the mandates of both Christian and Hindu princes, and the arrests of Hindus practicing idolatry and whether to take children of prisoners as orphans. Any one of these could perhaps have received a judgment based on either precedent or theological bases, yet the companions all agreed not to render any verdict. They noted that ‘it seems to all as concerns the first three items that a universal rule should not be given’, and expressed—somewhat harking back to early exercises of casuistry—that ultimately the decision should be up to the superior in which the affair arose and should not be made to the detriment of either the respective locality or the Estado, again implicitly resting on appreciation of cultural relativism.<sup>87</sup>

Despite all his decisions in determining the most fruitful places for the Jesuit missions to operate—not only outside the influence of the Portuguese, but also removed from the issues he perceived to be present within the perceived Brahmanic hegemony in Indian communities—Valignano nevertheless had rendered value judgments on the people of Asia in general, reckoning that there were inherent differences which created greater difficulties for his idea of successful propagation of the faith, systemised in racial classifications which he both subscribed to and further developed. He promoted, as many of his time did, an Aristotelian hierarchy of humankind, deeming most of the population of India as only capable of serving—part of this base condition of servitude and enslavement. On more than one occasion he was explicit about this opinion. In his *Historia*, Valignano

---

<sup>87</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 278; ‘Pareció a todos quanto a las tres primeras cosas que no se podia dar regla universal’.

described the people and customs of India, reaching the point of saying how ‘in truth compared with them [Europeans], the people are of little value and little skill, and a race that, as Aristotle said, appears of a nature born to serve, because commonly they are poor, miserable, and stingy’.<sup>88</sup> Having penned these words around 1582, it is tempting to view this as part of an overall laudatory history of the missions of the East Indies to a European audience, yet he had delivered almost the exact same verdict five years before. Two years prior to his first ever visit to Japan, and while residing in Malacca awaiting eventual passage to China, he composed a massive report entitled the *Summarium Indicum*, in which he gave similar ethnographic account of the Indies (that is, Asia as a whole). Again describing the people across the subcontinent, he noted that

‘it is common to all these people (I do not speak now of those from China nor from Japan who are white races, as it is said) to be of little skill and of little capacity and instead (as Aristotle says) by their nature born to serve than command, miserable and poor beyond measure, and all given to base and vile practices’<sup>89</sup>

Valignano’s distinction between Indian populations and those of China and Japan is oft cited, but less so in terms of the epistemology involved in distinguishing diverse Asian ethnicities. For instance, his understanding of East Asian people and culture had all arrived second-hand, with specific references to these areas absent in the later *Historia*, even though Valignano had actually interacted personally with those populations by then. Here the similarities between the perspectives of Valignano and Xavier make sense, as Rubiés notes the former incorporated the correspondence of the latter in his defence of his cultural

---

<sup>88</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progresso*, p. 24; ‘y a la verdad, comparada con ellos, es de poco ser y poco primor, y gente que parece, como dize Aristóteles, de naturaleza producida para servir, porque comúnmente es pobre, miserable y escassa’.

<sup>89</sup> Alessandro Valignano, *Summarium Indicum*, DI, xiii, pp. 5-6; ‘È commune a tutta questa gente (non parlo hora della Cina né del Giappone che è gente como si è detto bianca) l’essere di poco primore et di poca capacità et più tosto (como dice Aristotele) di sua natura nata per servire che per commandare, misera et scarsa sopra modo, et data tutta ad exercitii bassi et vili’; original in Rome, ARSI, Goa 31, fo. 339v. Cf. Schütte, *Valignanos Mission Principles*, p. 131; and Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 56.

preference.<sup>90</sup> His use of language provides clarity; in the earlier account, he viewed those of East Asia as ‘white like those of us from Europe’,<sup>91</sup> while the latter document instead chose to highlight the people he found in most of his Asian travels by their *prieto* colour—‘dark; black’.<sup>92</sup> It appears his anticipation of promising converts of lighter complexion informed his expectations, while his subsequent experience relied on a contrast to the darker-skinned populations to emphasise their comparatively less value.

Classifying peoples along skin colour certainly was not uncommon, nor was its grounding in Aristotelian thought on social hierarchies; more important is how this perception itself coloured decisions regarding methodologies and policies employed amongst diverse groups. Often discussed are the evaluations conducted by Valignano on the educational levels and ‘sophistication’ he found amongst the communities in Beijing and the Japanese archipelago, but even before fully understanding the context of all parts of Asia, his verdict had been rendered. Prevailing opinions meant that any non-European, indigenous clergy were continuously barred from taking the final vow of the Society of Jesus, while Japan would later prove to be the one exception, empowered by the greater liberty with which Valignano was endowed by his Superior General. All other aspects discussed above notwithstanding, this distinctly racial factor certainly played a role in the decision to, more or less, neglect India in favour of the newer frontiers farther east.

The racial classifications to which Valignano subscribed and contributed prove crucial in understanding such preconceived biases regarding the various peoples of Asia. The development of racial theories in the early modern period has been explored by other scholars, but it proves necessary to discuss how these relate to the views and decisions of

---

<sup>90</sup> Rubiés, *Travel and Ethnology*, p. 318.

<sup>91</sup> Valignano, *Summarius Indicium*, *DI*, xiii, p. 5; ‘quelli della Cina et del Giapone, che è bianca como la nostra di Europa’.

<sup>92</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progresso*, p. 24.

the Italian Visitor. Perhaps what played a consistent role in both Valignano's perspectives regarding the Portuguese and his interpretation of Asian civilizations was the concept of temperaments prevalent in Europe at the time, which connected 'observed differences in customs and behaviour amongst human societies to natural principles', at times enabling Renaissance Europeans to make claims based on some collective nature.<sup>93</sup> Acknowledgement of temperament or national character, however, did not necessarily beget negative discrimination, yet it certainly provided the means for observation of cultural difference to produce a racialised discourse pertaining to degrees of civility. In Valignano's case, this interpretation of civilizations arrived in a more comprehensive form years later, with the publication of *De Missione Legatorum ad Romanum Curiam* in 1590, a text printed in Macao and attributed to Duarte de Sande. In *De Missione*, Valignano suggested there were three universal levels of civility according to typology—Blacks, Asian Whites, and European Whites—establishing 'a racialist link between the lowest levels of barbarity and darker colours: although some of the peoples of Asia "can be considered white and intelligent, all those others who are dark are by nature rough and unrefined"'—hierarchical distinctions which had precedent in the early sixteenth century accounts of Duarte Barbosa.<sup>94</sup> Clearly related to earlier views expressed in the *Summarium Indicum* and *Historia*, *De Missione* allowed Valignano space to define these distinctions further.

It seems that even this view had some effect on the Portuguese systemisation of racial distinctions in the Estado, as early seventeenth century records considered converted Asians of some Portuguese descent as white and those lacking any European ancestry as

---

<sup>93</sup> Joan-Pau Rubiés, 'Were Early Modern Europeans Racist?', in Amos Morris-Reich and Dirk Rupnow (eds), *Ideas of 'Race' in the History of the Humanities* (Cham, 2017), p. 38.

<sup>94</sup> Rubiés, 'Were Early Modern Europeans Racist?', p. 58; Duarte de Sande [Alessandro Valignano], *De Missione Legatorum Iaponensium ad Romanam Curiam* (Macao, 1590), p. 398; Xavier, 'Languages of Difference', p. 99.

black.<sup>95</sup> Thus what ultimately underlined this interpretation was European superiority—East Asians (namely those from Japan and China) could be considered white due to their civility, but only some South Asians earned that same distinction if their forebears had intermarried with Europeans, thereby granting them a more ‘refined’ nature. Christianity proved the final piece. Whilst white Asians clearly received a place of prominence within the racial hierarchy, they nevertheless remained inferior to Europeans; in presenting these white Asians as distinct from ‘the “savage” Blacks, Valignano was also inviting them to convert to Christianity, the religion of the superior races’.<sup>96</sup>

It is possible that Valignano felt disappointed by a variety of issues occurring in the missions of the Indian subcontinent. Race still played a role here, as he subscribed to Xavier’s conclusion ‘by which he judged that Christianity may not very easily be established among the dark-skinned people [*los negros*]’.<sup>97</sup> Social and cultural significance of education figured prominently in his judgments, with most of these conclusions drawn from his experience concerning the class of Brahmins—both through records from previous Jesuits in India, which he consulted extensively before his visitation, as well as his own observations. As mentioned above, however, such judgments likely arose from not only interactions with more commercial populations along the Malabar Coast of India which lacked similar *literati* classes to those in China or Japan, but also Valignano’s racial classification in works such as *De Missione* which viewed barbarism as correlated with skin colour, with Indian populations south of Goa described as ‘black’ but only less dark than African populations.<sup>98</sup> Caste nevertheless played into conclusions about southern Indians’

---

<sup>95</sup> Francisco Bethencourt, *Racisms: From the Crusades to the Twentieth Century* (Princeton, 2013), pp. 177–8, 200; one example of such a record is António Bocarro, *Livro das plantas de todas as fortalezas, cidades e povoações do Estado da Índia Oriental*, Évora, Biblioteca Pública de Évora, ms. 1190.

<sup>96</sup> Rubiés, ‘Were Early Modern Europeans Racist?’, p. 59.

<sup>97</sup> Valignano, *Historia del principio y progreso*, p. 69; ‘y por esso juzgó que muy dificultosamente se haría cristiandad entre los negros’.

<sup>98</sup> Rubiés, ‘Were Early Modern Europeans Racist?’, p. 59.

supposed obstinacy to conversion. A year after his 1574 arrival, Valignano documented the various obstacles facing the mission in India, including the ‘diabolical superstition...which they call caste’ that held such significance among the people in all areas.<sup>99</sup> As has been pointed out, however, this perceived ‘pagan’ hegemonic system often served as an excuse for the difficulties (and failures) of proselytization—Brahmans remained obstinate to conversion, whilst lower castes more easily acquiesced to preaching and instruction but often were viewed as poor Christians later.<sup>100</sup> As such, Valignano saw caste as a system which enabled the power and ‘false doctrine’ of the Brahmans to flourish and hinder the success of Christianity in India.

Caste and race often merged in European observations of cultural difference, and Valignano was not immune to such conflation. Typologies of humanity in the early modern period came to develop greater religious prejudices linked initially with descent—that inherited behaviour associated with temperaments continued despite conversion—in contradiction with the universalist ideal of equality of believers, as St Paul had described.<sup>101</sup> This biological permanence of religion figured into the discussion of conversos through the blood purity statutes in Spain and Portugal through the sixteenth century, whilst chroniclers of Portuguese activity in South Asia simultaneously helped ‘build the association between “religion” and “blood” as part of caste characteristics’.<sup>102</sup> Therefore, caste presupposed hierarchy and difference along same lines as racialisation. For Valignano, Portuguese preoccupation with blood and ancestry proved problematic in its own right, but their Christianity and racial superiority vindicated this temperament; in the retention of caste distinctions amongst converted Hindu *gentios*, it was viewed as superstition and lack of

---

<sup>99</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 4 Dec 1575, *DI*, x, p. 180; ‘una diabolica superstitione, che tengono fra loro, delle divisioni delle proprie progenie che essi chiamano caste’.

<sup>100</sup> Strathern, *Kingship and Conversion*, p. 92.

<sup>101</sup> Bethencourt, *Racisms*, pp. 60-1.

<sup>102</sup> Xavier, ‘Languages of Difference’, p. 101.

civility natural to the skin colour by which they were identified. But even these temperaments could affect others who associated with such ‘base’ populations. In the Chorão consultation, all had agreed on the question of who to receive into the Society, that regarding the ‘very commercial’ Portuguese, ‘none should be received, or a few’, while Portuguese born in India could be received ‘with much election and proof’. Defending the need for such scrutiny with those born in India, two reasons were given: ‘because they participate in the bad qualities of the country, and are of little strength or ability; the second, because they are raised with many traits among black boys and girls, in a way that of boys they are very poorly accustomed’.<sup>103</sup> When compared to the opinion on Japan, the view was starkly different—‘with regards to the Japanese, the Father Visitor, when he will go to these parts, should seek counsel from experience’.<sup>104</sup> These more civilised ‘white’ Asians only needed to overcome their ignorance of the true faith by conversion, which would grant them greater superiority (in deference to European civilization, nonetheless).

Nevertheless, Valignano considered the limited resources afforded to the Jesuits by the *Padroado* to be misdirected towards a fruitless endeavour in India.<sup>105</sup> Whether he was motivated by his disapproval of Portuguese proclivities to use Jesuits to escort the political aggrandisement of Christendom from Goa outwards to the rest of the subcontinent, or his low opinion of the Indian people themselves and the potential for (or value of) their imminent conversion, Valignano decided the future of the Society lay in East Asia. Discontentment with the Portuguese certainly figured quite prominently into his opinions, but I find this was not nearly as significant in his decision to focus on lighter-skinned peoples as an indication of civility, whether through racial characteristics, caste distinctions, or

---

<sup>103</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 284.

<sup>104</sup> Chorão consultation, *DI*, x, p. 284.

<sup>105</sup> Cf. Alden, *Making of an Enterprise*, p. 56.

perception of intelligence—or even a confluence of factors. Overseeing the creation of a vice province of Japan (*Japonica*) in 1583 helped Valignano establish firmer boundaries between the Portuguese-dominated province of Goa and a more independent operation further east. The mission fields of the Malabar and Fishery Coasts for which Valignano supported greater Jesuit attention and training presented greater opportunities outside Portuguese jurisdiction, a distinction made even clearer with the establishment of a separate vice province of Malabar in 1601. As often reiterated, it was a Jesuit’s objective to determine what might bear the most fruit in the vineyard of the Lord, and clearly he envisioned a more bountiful harvest amongst the populations of China and Japan, striving to keep the Portuguese out lest they spoil it.

Nevertheless, caste and race served as useful tools for Valignano to determine which populations were innately worthwhile. In what Rubiés views as a ‘Machiavellian calculation of unique missionary needs’, Valignano privileged perceived civility along racial lines to focus his efforts and that of the Society in Asia on the supposedly superior civilizations of East Asia, adopting a ‘racialized view of cultural diversity in order to rationalize why some peoples deserved better treatment than others’.<sup>106</sup>

## Conclusion

‘...and I love them very much, even if this method that they maintain in governing has greatly dissatisfied me’<sup>107</sup>

Judging from the case of Valignano, it is not sufficient to say that the appointment of a non-Portuguese official led to the blossoming of a methodology such as accommodation; nevertheless, his position stood in contrast to the prevailing imperial

---

<sup>106</sup> Rubiés, ‘Were Early Modern Europeans Racist?’, p. 61.

<sup>107</sup> Alessandro Valignano to Everard Mercurian, 28/29 Jan 1574, *DI*, ix, p. 118; ‘et io li amo molto, anchorché questo modo, che tengono nel governo, mi ha grandemente discontentato’.

agendas left seemingly unchecked—or wilfully obliged—by his predecessors. Under his supervision, Valignano evinced an understanding of the influence of ‘national’ identity on the politics of mission through his directives for Asia, alongside insightful individualised readings of philosophical inclinations, technical abilities and strengths, and contextual needs. In the later context of China and Japan, his efforts had been far more prescient. By 1612, divisions amongst the mission superiors of China and the Provincial of *Iaponica* came to a head once again, as the visitor to Japan Francisco Vieira surmised that remaining Italians such as superior Niccolò Longobardo (1565-1617) might have sought to create an independent mission devoid of Portuguese; others desired to see only men from Portugal dispatched, using the *Padroado Real* as justification.<sup>108</sup> Clearly, Valignano had legitimate concerns about these divisions. Furthermore, issues of disobedience in creating more provincial autonomy in Portugal had arisen during Valignano’s early tenure as Visitor, and they continued in the following decades within the European continental provinces.<sup>109</sup>

Ultimately Valignano reified the significance of the particularity of the mission field—that is, the uniqueness of place and the constitutive elements of it—in a way that had not been realised before, even though all the basic principles had always been present through Loyola’s understanding of the Society’s objectives and procedures.<sup>110</sup> If we concede Valignano’s role in the introduction of cultural accommodation, primarily in the context of Japan and China, the policy shifts initiated during his visitation and provincialate must be taken into consideration, particularly those in India. Valignano’s idea of adopting commensurable Confucian *literati* attire arose through discussions with Matteo Ricci in 1592, borne out of a confluence of experience working within the various missions in China

---

<sup>108</sup> Clossey, *Salvation and Globalization*, pp. 41-2; cf. Dunne, *Generation of Giants*, pp. 169-70.

<sup>109</sup> Cohen, ‘Nation, Lineage, and Jesuit Unity’, p. 547.

<sup>110</sup> Schloesser, ‘Accommodation as Rhetorical Principle’, p. 352.

and their unsuccessful—and ultimately controversial—adaptations as Buddhist monks, European humanistic and concerted Confucian study, extensive language learning, and of course cultural traditions and social particularities.<sup>111</sup> India merited not nearly as much effort, a significant aspect of Valignano's mission which scholars have noted; as Franz Schütte mused, 'if he [Valignano] had acquired a better insight into India's ancient culture, he would probably have judged otherwise of the intellectual capabilities of its people, and his missionary methods might possibly have been radically different', even to the extent that Nobili achieved decades later.<sup>112</sup>

Within Valignano's perception of Asia and its people lay the ideal of universality; of the Church, of the Cross, of Christ. As with all manifestations of missionary accommodation, individuals made conscious decisions on which socio-cultural aspects deserved accommodation and which required subjection to, or imposition of, European (or at times more specifically, Portuguese) norms. In the case of 'dark' South Indians, adaptation to such cultural and intellectual 'baseness' in the eyes of some Jesuits appeared less fruitful than a similar endeavour directed towards the lighter complexions of East Asians. Though not always fond of the Portuguese Jesuit 'way of proceeding', Valignano nevertheless saw some value in certain applications, such as the political and military might of their royal patrons. As Josef Wicki once noted, much like the contested accommodationist Xavier, Valignano saw the coastal communities as existing strongholds for the future expansion of European Christianity where, 'since the inhabitants understood the godly things by means of power rather than reason, one needed to reinforce through the temporal

---

<sup>111</sup> Schloesser, 'Accommodation as Rhetorical Principle', pp. 366-67.

<sup>112</sup> Schütte, *Valignano's Mission Principles*, pp. 130-1.

arm of Portugal.<sup>113</sup> As with other particulars, to enter with love, then, perhaps did not suit all contexts; or, perhaps he merely showed that love in different ways.

---

<sup>113</sup> Josef Wicki, *Die Mitbrüder Franz Xavers in Indien: Methode ihrer Heidenbekehrung und Unterweisung der Christen (1545-1552)* (Beckenried, 1947), p. 7.

**Conclusion: Becoming All to All**

The Apostle Paul held a prominent place of reverence for the Society of Jesus, from the writings of Ignatius of Loyola to the dedication of a number of Jesuit colleges. Even the letters which Ignatius sent to guide and encourage his companions in their respective Christian communities evoked the biblical Epistles.<sup>1</sup> Saint Paul's renown as the apostle to the Gentiles had great significance for a religious order which saw as one of its primary objectives to spread the Gospel much wider; whereas Paul had made the Jewish origins of Christianity into a Hellenic tradition, it was now the responsibility of the Jesuits to do the same amongst the 'new' gentiles. In Goa, the first Jesuit college founded outside Europe was named after Saint Paul, and the term *Paulista* became synonymous with Jesuit in India. Despite this strong connection between Paul and the Jesuits, missionaries often did not acknowledge his example in their own ministry, either explicitly or implicitly.

As mentioned at the start of this thesis, Paul's letter to the Corinthians described how the Apostle adapted himself to each particular audience, whether Jew or Greek, in order to 'become all things to all people, that I might by all means save some.'<sup>2</sup> Throughout previous chapters, these words or the sentiment behind them have appeared in the core principles that constitute accommodation, from attention to cultural differences and language to forms of appearance and presentation. By the time of the Second Provincial Council of Goa in 1575, the terminus of our scope here, the church in India had understood the necessity of communication with indigenous Christians and potential converts through their own language and the Apostle: 'that following the example of Saint Paul you should command

---

<sup>1</sup> Correia-Afonso, *Ignatian Vision of India*, p. 16.

<sup>2</sup> 1 Corinthians 9:22. The final verse in the Latin Vulgate reads: 'Omnibus omnia factus sum, ut omnes facerem salvos'.

the people, that they know the language'.<sup>3</sup> Within Jesuit *accommodatio*, as part of the rhetorical device to adapt to one's audience, Paul's message extended into a number of different commitments through which some individuals translated attention to their audience into partial or wholesale adaptation of self. As Loyola stressed to his companions early on, 'take up their manner with them, because that is what pleases them; *omnia omnibus factus sum*'.<sup>4</sup> On the debate over the education of indigenous students in India, Niccolò Lancilotto recalled the passage as well, 'wherefore we might desire to be all things to others here...it might be ordered that in all things and to all we adapt ourselves'.<sup>5</sup> In a more direct connection to a Jesuit who implemented cultural accommodation in a stricter sense, Roberto de Nobili brought the rhetorical principle into a discussion of 1 Corinthians 9:

'If I preach the Gospel to them and accompany my preaching with weighty and compelling reasons, and of course lead a saintly life among them and they do not accept the faith, they are to blame not me : they will not be excused for not accepting the gospel just because they saw me its preacher following a custom which is both foreign and repelling to them. I wonder if St. Paul would have said so much, when with the Jews he behaved like a Jew, and when with the gentiles, made himself a gentile! And with the Indians, would he not have made himself a gentile?''<sup>6</sup>

Nobili's words emphasise the connection between Paul and the first missions to India, a perception often shared by those active at the time. Both faced the challenge of a culturally diverse environment which demanded some adjustment of the message to suit a gentile population. Despite the comparison drawn between these circumstances by Jesuits, Paul however lacked the support of a formidable political power to reinforce conversion and an organised ecclesiastical structure to prevent apostasy, an advantage of which many

---

<sup>3</sup> 'O Segundo Concilio Provincial de Goa', Acção Segunda, Decreto terceiro, *Archivo Portuguez Oriental*, ed. Joaquim Heliodoro da Cunha Rivara (8 vols, Nova-Goa, 1857-75), iv, p. 91. Cf. Joaquim Heliodoro da Cunha Rivara, *Ensaio historico da lingua Concani* (Nova-Goa, 1858), p. 16.

<sup>4</sup> Ignatius of Loyola, 'Further instruction to the same nuncios', Sept 1541, *MI Epp*, i, p. 179; 'tomar el modo dellos con ellos, porque aquello es lo que les agrada; *omnia omnibus factus sum*'.

<sup>5</sup> Niccolò Lancilotto to Ignatius of Loyola, *DI*, i, p. 142; '...ut in omnibus et per omnia acomodaremus nos'.

<sup>6</sup> Nobili, *Adaptation*, p. 17.

missionaries availed themselves. Nevertheless, the very basic challenges of communication may not have immediately impelled Jesuits to adjust firstly their linguistic capabilities, yet their experience played some role in the greater policy of the Society to overcome these deficiencies.

Jesuits who overlooked Paul's example of evangelism or did not understand his advice properly, however, were not perhaps less accommodationist. Looking at the letters, reports, and other documents analysed here, it would seem that accommodation derives more out of this principle of 'becoming all to all', with the participle indicating a continuous present rather than a definitive moment. This movement of self-fashioning towards a more indifferent as well as malleable approach is crucial to cultural accommodation, as it allows for greater impression to be made upon the agent seeking to transmit a message, but it always requires a wilfulness to open oneself up to adapting on a number of different levels. For the Society of Jesus, the foundational principles of *accommodatio* blossomed with the maturation of the order itself—empiricism, obedience with autonomy, decision-making, education, languages, and presentation—but in accordance with the distinctiveness of Jesuit identity the individual has *multiplex* ways through which they may act.

As has been shown by other scholars, the attempts of the *Estado da Índia* to create 'another Portugal' in Asia occurred through not only the installation of the Holy Office and persecution of *conversos*, but also through policies which forced conversion upon non-Christians under the crown's jurisdiction through the threat of exile, and the regulation of liminal space vis-à-vis those who refused conversion as well as those feared to apostatise.<sup>7</sup> One of the questions I have sought to address here, is to what extent their objectives and

---

<sup>7</sup> Cf. Catarina Madeira Santos, *Goa é chave de toda a Índia. Perfil político da capital do Estado da Índia (1505-1570)* (Lisbon, 1999); Giuseppe Marcocci, 'Construire un outro Portugal. Strategie di conversion a Goa fra Cinque e Seicento', *Rivista di Storia del Cristianesimo* 7 (2010), pp. 23-34; Ângela Barreto Xavier, 'Conversos and Novamente Convertidos', pp. 255-87.

actions at the least corresponded with and or mirrored the agenda of the Portuguese state in India during the first three decades of Jesuit missions there. I have argued here that this sort of activity is contradictory to the practice of cultural accommodation in that enlistment of the secular arm to enforce conformity of faith is associated with the state's encouragement of cultural and racial conformity. While missionaries nevertheless always possessed the intent to convert indigenous Indians to Catholic Christianity, and for some even to gradually assimilate them into a distinctly Portuguese expression of faith and identity, the question was to what extent they sought to make the transition as smooth as possible. Tying back into the recurring theme of *suaviter in modo*, the softer approach was typically not pursued by the state or those who identified with it.

A crucial conclusion of this thesis is the sheer minority of Jesuits during this period who show some recognition or application of principles which we find within the method of missionary accommodation, including the likes of Antonio Criminali, Niccolò Lancilotto, and Henrique Henriques. As shown, on account of the nature of the *Padroado Real* the vast majority of these early Jesuits were Portuguese, and the values undergirding(?) the Portuguese identity by and large fell in line not only with the interests of the state, but also other religious orders and ecclesiastics whose identities were often more 'nationalistic', as both Valignano and Nobili witnessed. These softer voices have been recognised at times, but certainly the prevailing Jesuit approaches—exemplified primarily by Xavier—have defined this period. Nevertheless, given the examples shown here, extricating these more accommodating opinions from amongst the greater philosophical and methodological trends remains a worthwhile endeavour. The multitude of letters contained within the *Documenta Indica* still lacking comprehensive analysis demonstrate the variety of topics and perspectives that might be explored. Although I have sought to accomplish a significant exposition of the documentation of the first thirty years of Jesuit missions, there remains

more work to be done and more questions to be asked of these individuals and how they approached their ministry in the incredibly complex cultural environments of southern India.

In general, the value of looking closer into early period of Jesuit missions in India remains. Simply because this period lacked the veritable accommodationist figures of later missions does not mean that other minor individuals failed to implement some measures of cultural accommodation on a smaller scale. This thesis provides a closer examination of the concept of accommodation and its constituent elements in order to open up the understanding of how it might materialise to varying degrees. The complex socio-cultural context of India is crucial in this regard, much as it has been in the discussions of Roberto de Nobili; as asked many times, why then has it not earned such scrutiny within earlier missions? Approaching this through the particulars of Jesuit distinctive identity has allowed for broader analysis of cultural accommodation as enabled by the rhetorical principle of *accommodatio* and the manifold ways Jesuits interpreted it.

## Bibliography

### A Primary Sources

#### 1 Manuscript and archival sources

##### Rome, Archivum Romanum Societatis Iesu (ARSI)

Congregationes 20/B, fos. 206-12

Fondo Gesuitico, ms. 2, II/121: 'Relação da morte do P. Dom Gonçalo da Comp.a [Titulus posterior:] Martyrium B. P. Consalvi Silveriae ex Lusitania missum'

Fondo Gesuitico, 721 VI, 1, fos. 1-8: 'Instructio data Superioribus a p. Visitatore, 1575'

Goa 22, fos. 1-10: *Exemplum Historiae foundationis Collegii Goani*,

Goa 34 I, fos. 22-31: 'Ragguaglio dell'inventione del corpo del P. Consalvo Silveria della Compagnia di Giesù, mandata al P. Franc. Govea della medesima Compagnia dal Sig.r licenciado Alfonso Barbuda'

Goa 38 II, fos. 298-309: Henrique Henriques, Dos Padres e Irmãos que na Pescaria são mortos, Punical, Dec 1582

Goa 51, fos. 27-8

Goa 51, fos. 164-5: Nobili, R. to Acquaviva, C, Madurai, 21 Oct 1610

Institutum 184 II, fos. 356-58: 'Decr. 68. Congreg. V - de iis qui nati ex origine Judaeorum aut Saracenorum'

Institutum 184 II, fos. 373-6: Card. Henricus contra Generalatum novorum Christianorum

Institutum 184 II, fos. 381-2: Melchior Carnero, De novis Christianes ad P. Mich. Torres

Institutum 184 II, fo. 383: Franc. Anriquez, Goa – De novis christianis (1557)

Lus. 43 I, fos. 1-4: Col. Conimbricens. Adm. 1542/1553

##### Lisbon, Arquivo Nacional de Torre do Tombo (ANTT)

Armário Jesuítico, mç. 29, no. 2: Cópia da cartado cardeal infante inquisidor geral para o rei D. Sebastião sobre a eleição do inquisidor e ministros da Inquisição [9 July 1574]

Corpo Cronológico, p. I, m. 66, doc. 47

Inquisição de Lisboa, Proc. 5265, fo. 123

Inquisição de Lisboa, Proc. 6369, fo. 57v

Inquisição de Lisboa, Proc. 185, fos. 21-21v

Manuscritos da Livraria, no. 805, fos. 280: 'Comentários do Padre Francisco Rodrigues da Companhia de Jesus sobre os casos versados na Índia e suas partes com muitas outras resoluções mui importantes e necessárias aos confessores, com seu index de todas as coisas que neste livro se contém'

## Lisbon, Biblioteca Nacional de Portugal

- Fundo Geral 6620: *Extracto das cousas pertencentes ao governo na India*, Dec 1582  
 Cod. 203 [F. 2545]: João Delgado Figueira, *Reportorio geral dos tres mil oito centos processos, que sam todos os despachados neste sancto Officio de Goa, & mais partes da India do anno de Mil & quinhentos & secenta & hum, que começou odito sancto Officio atè o anno de Mil & seis centos & vinte & tres, com a lista dos Inquisidores que tem sido nelle, & dos autos publicos da Fee, que se tem celebrado na dita CIDADE de GOA*. [1623]  
 Cod. 3141 (microfilme F. 33): Henrique Henriques, *Arte do língua malabar* [1548?]

## Lisbon, Biblioteca Ajuda

- Cod. 49-IV-9, fos. 76v-77r: Cosas que acaecieron a este Rey de Tanor para se impediren se venida a Goa  
 Cod. 49-VI-9, fos. 40v-41r: Carta do S. Pe. Francisco pera o Pe. Francisco Henriquez

2 Printed primary sources

- Acosta, Emanuel and Maffei, Gian Pietro, *Rerum a Societate Iesu in oriente gestarum* (Napoli, 1571)  
 Acquaviva, Claudio, *Industriae ad curandos animae morbos* (Florence, 1600)  
 Aquinas, Thomas, *Summa Theologica* (3 vols, New York, 1947-8)  
*Arquivo Portuguez Oriental*, ed. Joaquim Heliodoro da Cunha Rivara (8 vols, Nova-Goa, 1857-75)  
 Barbosa, Duarte, *O Livro em que dá relação de que viu e ouviu no Oriente Duarte Barbosa* (Lisbon, 1946)  
 Bellarmino, Roberto, *Opera oratorio postuma* (11 vols, Rome, 1942-68)  
*Bullarium Patronatus Portugalliae Regum in ecclesiis Africae, Asiae atque Oceaniae*, ed. José Tavares de Macedo (5 vols, Lisbon, 1872)  
*Cartas de Affonso de Albuquerque, seguidas de documentos que as elucidam*, ed. Raymundo António de Bulhão Pato (6 vols, Lisbon, 1884-1915)  
*Cartas de San Ignacio de Loyola: fundador de la Compania de Jesus* (6 vols, Madrid, 1874-89)  
 Correia, Gaspar, *Lendas da India* (8 vols, Lisbon, 1858-66)  
 Couto, Diogo do, *Da Asia. Decada Setima, Parte Primeira* (Lisbon, 1782)  
*Documenta Indica*, eds. Josef Wicki and John Gomes (18 vols, Rome, 1948-88)  
*Documentação para a história das missões do Padroado português do Oriente*, ed. António da Silva Rêgo (12 vols, Lisbon, 1947-58)  
 Duns Scotus, John, *Opera omnia*, ed. Luke Wadding (26 vols, Paris, 1891-95)  
*Epistolae et Monumenta P. Hieronymi Nadal V: Commentarii de Instituto Societatis Iesu*, ed. Miguel Nicolau (Rome, 1962)  
*Epistolae P. Hieronymi Nadal* (4 vols, Madrid, 1898-1905)  
*Epistolae PP. Paschasi Broëti, Claudii Jaii, Joannis Cordurii et Simonis Rodericii* (Madrid, 1903)  
 Fernandes, Gonçalo, *Tratado do P. Goncalo Fernandes Trancoso Sobre O Hinduismo*, ed. Josef Wicki (Lisbon, 1973)  
*Fontes Narrativi de S. Ignatio de Loyola et de Societatis Iesu initiis*, eds. Dionysius Fernández Zapico, S.J., and Candidus de Dalmases, S.J. (4 vols, Rome, 1943-65)

- Godinho, N., *Patris Gonzali Sylveriae S. I. sacerdotis in urbe Monomotapa martyrium passi* (Lugduni, 1612)
- Gonçalves, Diogo, *História do Malavar (Hs. Goa 58 des Arch. Rom S.I.)*, ed. Josef Wicki (Münster, 1955)
- Gonçalves, Sebastião, S.J., *Primeira Parte da História dos Religiosos da Companhia de Jesus e do que fizeram com a divina graça na conversão dos inféis a nossa sancta fee catholica nos reynos e provincias da Índia Oriental (Original, Bibli. Nacional, Fundo Geral 915)*, ed. Joseph Wicki, S.J. (3 vols, Coimbra, 1957)
- Guerreiro, Fernão, *Relação anual das coisas que fizeram os Padres da Companhia de Jesus nas suas Missões do Japão, China, Cataio [etc.]* (3 vols, Coimbra, 1930-42)
- Guzmán, Luis de, *Historia de las Misiones de la Compañía de Jesus* (Alcala, 1601)
- Laval, François Pyrard de, *The Voyage of François Pyrard of Laval*, eds. A. Gray and H.C.P. Bell (London, 1888)
- Lorenzana, Francisco Antonio, *Concilios provincials primero, y Segundo, celebrados en la muy noble y muy leal ciudad de México, presidiendo el Illmo. Y Rmo. Señor D. Fr. Alonso de Muntúfar, en los años de 1555, y 1565* (Mexico City, 1769)
- Loyola, Ignatius de, *The Constitutions of the Society of Jesus*, tr. George E. Ganss, S.J. (St. Louis, 1970)
- Loyola, Ignatius of, *Letters of St. Ignatius of Loyola*, tr. William J. Young (Chicago, 1959)
- Loyola, Ignatius de, *The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius*, tr. Anthony Mottola (New York, 1989)
- Loyola, Ignatius of, *Sancti Ignatii de Loyola Constitutiones Societatis Jesu* (4 vols, Rome, 1934-48)
- Lucena, João de, *Historia da vida do padre Francisco de Xavier* (Lisbon, 1600)
- Lyra, Nicholas of, *Biblia sacra cum glossis, interlineari et ordinaria* (6 vols, Venice, 1588)
- Maffei, Gian Pietro, *Historiarum Indicarum libri XVI. Selectarum item ex India epistolarum, eodem interprete* (Cologne, 1588)
- Mendieta, Jerónimo de, *Historia eclesiástica indiana: obra escrita á fines del siglo XVI* (4 vols, Mexico City, 1870)
- Monumenta Brasiliae*, ed. Serafim Leite (5 vols, Rome, 1956-68)
- Monumenta Ignatiana. Exercitia spirituali Sancti Ignatii de Loyola et eorum directoria* (2 vols, Rome, 1955)
- Monumenta Ignatiana. Sancti Ignatii de Loyola Societatis Iesu fundatoris epistolae et instructiones* (12 vols, Madrid, 1903-11)
- Monumenta Paedagogica Societatis Iesu: Novo Editio Penitus Retractata II (1557-1572)*, ed. Ladislaus Lukács (Rome, 1974)
- Monumenta Xaveriana, ex autographis vel ex antiquioribus exemplis collecta* (2 vols, Madrid, 1899-1900, 1912)
- Nobili, Roberto de, *Adaptation*, ed. S. Rajamanickam (Palayamkottai, 1971)
- Nobili, Roberto de, *Preaching Wisdom to the Wise: Three Treatises by Roberto de Nobili, S.J., Missionary and Scholar in 17th Century India*, ed. and tr. Anand Amaladass, S.J. and Francis X. Clooney, S.J. (St. Louis: The Institute of Jesuit Sources, 2000)
- Nobili, Roberto de, *Roberto de Nobili on Indian Customs*, part I, ed. S. Rajamanickam (Palayamkottai, 1972)
- Patrologiae Cursus Completus. Series Latina*, ed. Jacques-Paul Migne (217 vols, Paris, 1844-1855)
- Polanco, Juan Alfonso de, *Polanci Complementi: Epistolae et Commentaria P. Joannis Alphonsi de Polanco* (2 vols, Madrid, 1917)

- Polanco, Juan Alfonso de, *Vita Ignatii Loiolae et Rerum Societatis Jesu Historia* (6 vols, Madrid, 1894-98)
- Polanco, Juan Alfonso de, *Year by Year with the Early Jesuits (1537-1556): Selections from the "Chronicon" of Juan de Polanco, S.J.*, ed. and tr. John Patrick Donnelly (St Louis, 2004)
- Regulae Societatis Iesu (1540-1556)*, ed. Dionysius Fernández Zapico (Rome, 1948)
- Ribadeneyra, Pedro de, *Patris Petri de Ribadeneyra, Societatis Jesu sacerdotis, Confessiones, epistolae aliaque scripta inedita, ex autographis* (2 vols, Madrid, 1920-23)
- Rodrigues, Simão, *A Brief and Exact Account: The Recollections of Simão Rodrigues on the Origin and Progress of the Society of Jesus*, tr. Joseph J. Conwell, S.J. (Saint Louis, 2004)
- Stephens, Thomas, *Arte da lingua canarim*, ed. Diogo Ribeiro (Rachol, 1640)
- Torsellino, Orazio, *De vita Francisca Xaverii. Libri* (Rome, 1596)
- Trindade, Frei Paulo da, *Conquista Spiritual do Oriente*, ed. F. Felix Lopes, OFM (3 vols, Lisbon, 1962-67)
- Valignano, Alessandro, *Historia del principio y progreso de la Compañia de Jesús en las Indias orientales*, ed. Josef Wicki, S.J. (Rome, 1944)
- Varthema, Lodovico de, *The Itinerary of Ludovico di Varthema of Bologna from 1502 to 1508*, tr. John Winter Jones (London, 1863)
- Xavier, Francis, *Epistolae S. Francisci Xaverii aliaque eius scripta*, eds. Georg Schurhammer and Josef Wicki (2 vols, Rome, 1944-45)
- Xavier, Francis, *The Letters and Instructions of Francis Xavier*, ed. and tr. Joseph M. Costelloe (Gujarat, 1993)

## B Secondary Material

### 1 Printed secondary works

- Agnolin, Adone, 'Violence and Adaptability of the Word: Jesuits and Natives in Portuguese America (16<sup>th</sup>-17<sup>th</sup> centuries)' in Vincenzo Lavenia, Stefania Pastore, Sabina Pavone, and Chiara Petrolini (eds), *Compel People to Come In: Violence and Catholic Conversions in the non-European World* (Rome, 2018), pp. 69-87
- Alberts, Tara, *Conflict and Conversion: Catholicism in Southeast Asia, 1500-1700* (Oxford, 2013)
- Aldama, Antonio M., 'Origin and History of the Formula of the Institute', in *The Formula of the Institute* (Rome, 1982), pp. 11-33
- Alden, Dauril, *The Making of an Enterprise: The Society of Jesus in Portugal, Its Empire, and Beyond, 1540-1750* (Stanford, 1996)
- Ali, M. Athar, *Mughal India: Studies in Polity, Ideas, Society, and Culture* (New Delhi, 2006)
- Ames, Glenn Joseph, *Renascent Empire?: The House of Braganza and the Quest for Stability in Portuguese Monsoon Asia, c. 1640-1683* (Amsterdam, 2000)
- Ames, Glenn J., 'Serving God, Mammon, or Both?: Religious Vis-à-vis Economic Priorities in the Portuguese Estado da India, c. 1600-1700', *The Catholic Historical Review*, 86/2 (2000), pp. 193-216
- Amiel, Charles and Lima, Anne, *A Inquisição de Goa descrita por Charles Dellon (1687)*, tr. Bruno Feitler (São Paulo, 2014)

- Aranha, Paolo, 'Discrimination and Integration of the Dalits in Early Modern South Indian Missions: The Historical Origins of a Major Challenge for Today's Christians', *Journal of World Christianity* 6/1 (2016), pp. 168-204
- Aranha, Paolo, 'Early Modern Asian Catholicism and European Colonialism: Dominance, Hegemony and Native Agency in the Portuguese Estado da Índia', in Klaus Koschorke and Adrian Hermann (eds), *Polycentric Structures in the History of World Christianity* (Wiesbaden, 2014), pp. 285-306
- Aranha, Paolo, '«Glocal» Conflicts: Missionary Controversies on the Coromandel Coast between the XVII and XVIII Centuries', in Michela Catto, Guido Mongini, and Silvia Mostaccio (eds), *Evangelizzazione e Globalizzazione: Le missioni gesuitiche nell'età moderna tra storia e storiografia* (Città di Castello, 2010), pp. 79-104
- Aranha, Paolo, 'The Social and Physical Spaces of the Malabar Rites Controversy', in Giuseppe Marcocci, Wietse de Boer, Aliocha Maldavsky and Ilaria Pavan (eds), *Space and Conversion in Global Perspective* (Leiden, 2015), pp. 214-33
- Aranha, Paolo, 'Vulgaris seu Universalis: Early Modern Missionary Representations of an Indian Cosmopolitan Space', in Corinne Lefevre, Ines G. Zupanov, and Jorge Flores (eds), *Cosmopolitismes en Asie du Sud; Sources, itinéraires, langues (XVI-XVIII siècle)* (Paris, 2015), pp. 331-359
- Atherton, Ruth, 'Peter Canisius and the Development of Catholic Education in Germany, 1549-97', *Studies in Church History* 55 (2019), pp. 145-160
- Aurati, Agostino, *Nicolao Lancilotto: Un gesuita urbinato del secolo XVI in India benemerito della cultura* (Urbino, 1974)
- Austin, Nicholas, S.J., *Aquinas on Virtue: A Causal Reading* (Georgetown, 2017)
- Axelrod, Paul and Michelle A. Fuerch. 'Flight of the Deities: Hindu Resistance in Portuguese Goa', *Modern Asian Studies*, 30/2 (1996), pp. 387-421
- Baião, António, *A Inquisição de Goa, tentativa de história da sua origem, estabelecimento, evolução e extinção* (2 vols, Lisbon and Coimbra, 1930-45)
- Barthel, Manfred, *The Jesuits: History and Legend of the Society of Jesus* (New York, 1984)
- Bayly, Susan, *Saints, Goddesses and Kings: Muslims and Christians in South Indian Society, 1700-1900* (Cambridge, 2004)
- Bethencourt, Francisco, 'Early Modern Imperialism and Cosmopolitanism' in *Cosmopolitanism in the Portuguese-speaking World* (Leiden, 2017), pp. 82-107
- Bethencourt, Francisco, *Racisms: From the Crusades to the Twentieth Century* (Princeton, 2013)
- Bettray, Johannes, SVD, *Die Akkommodationsmethode des P. Matteo Ricci S.I. in China* (Rome, 1955)
- Blackburn, Stuart, 'The Legend of Valluvar and Tamil Literary History', *Modern Asian Studies*, 34/2 (2000), pp. 449-482
- Blum, P.R., 'Apostolato dei collegi: On the Integration of Humanism in the Educational Programme of the Jesuits', *Studies in Early Modern Aristotelianism* (Leiden, 2012), pp. 21-34
- Bodian, Miriam, 'Baptized or Not? The Inquisitors' Dilemma in Trials of Portuguese Jews from Dutch Brazil, 1645-1647' in Claude Stuczynski and Bruno Feitler (eds), *Portuguese Jews, New Christians, and 'New Jews': A Tribute to Roberto Bachmann* (Leiden, 2018), pp.123-44
- Borges, Charles, *The Economics of the Goa Jesuits, 1542-1759* (New Delhi, 1994)
- Borges, Charles, 'Foreign Jesuits and Native Resistance', in Teotónio R. de Souza (ed), *Essays in Goan History* (Goa, 1989), pp. 69-80

- Boxer, C.R., *The Christian Century in Japan: 1549-1650* (Berkeley, 1951)
- Boxer, C.R., *The Church Militant and Iberian Expansion, 1440-1770* (Baltimore, 1978)
- Boxer, C.R., *Four Centuries of Portuguese Expansion, 1415-1825: A Succinct Survey* (Berkeley, 1969)
- Boxer, C.R., *The Portuguese Seaborne Empire, 1415-1825* (London, 1969)
- Boxer, C.R., *Portuguese Society in the Tropics: The Municipal Councils of Goa, Macao, Bahia, and Luanda, 1510-1800* (Madison, 1965)
- Boxer, C.R., 'The problem of the native clergy', in G.J. Cuming (ed), *The Mission of the Church and the Propagation of the Faith* (Cambridge, 1970), pp. 85-105
- Boxer, C.R., 'The Problems of the Native Clergy in Portuguese India, 1518-1787', *History Today* 17/11 (1967), pp. 772-80
- Boxer, C.R., 'A tentative check-list of Indo-Portuguese imprints 1556-1674', *Boletim do Instituto Vasco da Gama*, 73 (1956), pp. 19-41
- Boyarin, Jonathan, *The Unconverted Self: Jews, Indians, and the Identity of Christian Europe* (Chicago, 2009)
- Brancaccio, Lavinia, *China accommodata: Chinakonstruktionen in jesuitischen Schriften der Frühen Neuzeit* (Berlin, 2007)
- Brockey, Liam Matthew, 'Conquests of Memory: Franciscan Chronicles of the East Asian Church in the Early Modern Period', *Culture & History Digital Journal* 5/2 (2006), e015, doi: 10.3989/chdj.2016.015
- Brockey, Liam, 'The Cruellest Honor: The Relics of Francis Xavier in Early-Modern Asia', *The Catholic Historical Review*, 101/1 (2015), pp. 41-64
- Brockey, Liam Matthew, 'Jesuit Missionaries on the Carreira da India in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries: A Selection of Contemporary Sources', *Itinerario*, 31/2 (2007), pp. 111-32
- Brockey, Liam, 'A Passage through India: Jesuit Missionaries en Route to East Asia, 1570-1700', *Revista de Cultura*, 3 (2002), pp. 115-25
- Brockey, Liam Matthew, 'Surpassing Sylvester: Jesuit Missionaries and Asian Rulers in the Early Modern Period', in Jay Levenson (ed), *Encompassing the Globe: Portugal and the World in the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> Centuries* (Washington, DC, 2008), pp. 151-167
- Brockey, Liam Matthew, 'Sympathy from the Devil: Francisco Xavier, o Santo, 1600-1650', *Oriente: Revista Quadrimestral da Fundação Oriente* 13 (2005), pp. 40-57
- Brockey, Liam, "'A Vinha do Senhor": The Portuguese Jesuits in China in the Seventeenth Century' *Portuguese Studies* 16 (2000), pp. 125-47
- Brockey, Liam Matthew, *The Visitor: Andre Palmeiro and the Jesuits in Asia* (Cambridge, 2014)
- Capoccia, A.R., 'Les destin des indipetae au-delà du XVIe siècle' in P.A Fabre and B. Vincent (eds), *Missions religieuses modernes: "Notre lieu est le monde"* (Rome, 2007), pp. 71-88
- Casalini, Cristiano, *Aristotele a Coimbra: Il Cursus Conimbricensis e l'educazione nel Collegium Artum* (Rome, 2012)
- Casalini, Cristiano, *Aristotle in Coimbra: The Cursus Conimbricensis and the Education at the College of Arts*, tr. Luana Salvarani (Abingdon, 2017)
- Celso De Castro Alves, José, 'Rupture and Continuity in Colonial Discourses: The Racialized representation of Portuguese Goa in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries', *Portuguese Studies* 16/1 (2000), pp. 148-16
- Cessario, Romanus, 'Molina and Aquinas', in Alexander Aichele and Mathias Kaufmann (eds), *A Companion to Luis de Molina* (Leiden, 2014), pp. 291-323

- Chakravarti, Ananya, 'Between bhakti and pieta: untangling emotion in Marathi Christian poetry', *History of Religions*, 56/4 (2017), pp. 365-387
- Chakravarti, Ananya, 'The many faces of Baltasar da Costa: *imitatio* and *accommodatio* in the seventeenth century Madurai mission', *Etnografica*, 18/1 (2014), pp. 135-158
- Chakravarti, Ananya, *The Empire of Apostles: Religion, Accommodatio, and the Imagination of Empire in Early Modern Brazil and India* (Oxford, 2018)
- Chakravarti, Ananya, 'In the Language of the Land: Native Conversion in Jesuit Public Letters from Brazil and India', *Journal of Early Modern History*, 17 (2013), pp. 505-524
- Chapple, Christopher (ed), *The Jesuit Tradition in Education and Missions: A 450-Year Perspective* (Cranbury, 1993)
- Christensen, Mark, 'Missionizing Mexico: Ecclesiastics, Natives, and the Spread of Christianity' in Ronnie Po-chia Hsia (ed), *A Companion to Early Modern Catholic Global Missions* (Leiden, 2018)
- Clines, Robert John, 'How to Become a Jesuit Crypto-Jew: The Self-Confessionalization of Giovanni Battista Eliano through the Textual Artifice of Conversion', *Sixteenth Century Journal* 48/1 (2017) pp. 3-26
- Clooney, Francis X., 'Roberto de Nobili, Adaptation and the Reasonable Interpretation of Religion' *Missiology: An International Review* 18/1 (1990), pp. 25-36
- Clooney, Francis X., *Seeing through Texts: Doing Theology among the Srivaisnavas of South India* (New York, 1996)
- Clossey, Luke, *Salvation and Globalization in the Early Jesuit Missions* (Cambridge, 2008)
- Coates, Timothy, *Convicts and Orphans: Forced and State-Sponsored Colonizers in the Portuguese Empire, 1550-1755* (Stanford, 2002)
- Coello de la Rosa, Alexandre, *Jesuits at the Margins: Missions and Missionaries in the Marianas (1668-1769)* (Abingdon, 2015)
- Cohen, Jeremy, *The Friars and the Jews: The Evolution of Medieval Anti-Judaism* (Ithaca, 1982)
- Cohen, Thomas, 'Jesuits and New Christians: The Contested Legacy of St. Ignatius', *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 42/3 (2010), pp. 1-46
- Cohen, Thomas, 'Nation, Lineage, and Jesuit Unity in Antonio Possevino's Memorial to Everard Mercurian (1576)' in *A Companhia de Jesus na Península Ibérica nos séculos XVI e XVII: espiritualidade e cultura: actas do Colóquio Internacional* (2 vols, Porto, 2004), ii, pp. 543-61
- Cohen, Thomas M., 'Racial and Ethnic Minorities in the Society of Jesus', in Thomas Worcester (ed), *The Cambridge Companion to the Jesuits* (Cambridge, 2008), pp. 199-214
- Coleridge, Henry James, *The Life and Letters of St. Francis Xavier*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (2 vols, London, 1902)
- Collins, Paul M., 'The Praxis of Inculturation for Mission: Roberto de Nobili's Example and Legacy', *Ecclesiology*, 3/3 (2007), pp. 323-42
- Colombo, Emanuele, 'A Muslim Turned Jesuit: Baldassare Loyola Mandes (1631-1667)', *Journal of Early Modern History*, 17/6 (2013), pp. 479-504
- Colombo, Emanuele, 'Defeating the Infidels, Helping Their Souls: Ignatius Loyola and Islam', in Robert Aleksander Maryks (ed), *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence* (Leiden, 2014), pp. 179-97
- Colombo, Emanuele and Rochini, Marco, 'Four Hundred Years of Desire. Ongoing Research into the Nineteenth-Century Italian *Indipetae* (1829-1856)', in Niccolò

- Guasti (ed), *Representations of the other and Intercultural Experiences in a Global Perspective (16<sup>th</sup>-20<sup>th</sup> Centuries)* (Milan, 2017), pp. 83-108
- Coogan, Robert, 'Review of Peter Walter, "Theologie aus dem Geist der Rhetorik"', *Bibliothèque d'humanisme et renaissance* 54/2 (1992), pp. 559-60
- Correia-Afonso, John, *The Ignatian Vision of India: A Historical Study* (Anand, 1991)
- Correia-Afonso, John, 'Ignatius and Indian Jesuit Vocations' in Teotónio R. de Souza and Charles Borges (eds), *Jesuits in India: in Historical Perspective* (Macau, 1992), pp. 73-82
- Correia-Afonso, John, *Jesuits in India, 1542-1773* (Anand, 1997)
- Correia-Afonso, John, *Jesuit Letters and Indian History: A Study of the Nature and Development of the Jesuit Letters from India (1542-1773) and of Their Value for Indian Historiography* (Bombay, 1955)
- Corsi, Elisabetta, *Órdenes religiosas entre América y Asia: ideas para una historia misionera de los espacios colonials* (Mexico City, 2008)
- Cronin, Vincent, *A Pearl to India: The Life of Roberto de Nobili* (London, 1959)
- Cummins, J.S., *Christianity and Missions, 1450-1800* (Aldershot, 1997)
- Cunha, Ana Cannas da, *A Inquisição no Estado da Índia: Origens (1539-1560)* (Lisbon, 1995)
- Da Cruz, Sharon, 'Empire and Mission: Portuguese State and Franciscan Collaboration in Establishing the Goa Mission, (1510-1534)', *Indian Church History Review*, 44/2 (2010), pp. 111-23
- Darnton, Robert, *The Great Cat Massacre and Other Episodes in French Cultural History* (New York, 1984)
- De Souza, Teotónio R., 'Asia and Christianity in History: Addressing Some Problems of Church Historiography', *Asian Christian Review* 7/1 (2013), pp. 18-27
- De Souza, Teotónio R., 'The Council of Trent (1545-1563): Its Reception in Portuguese India', in Klaus Koschorke (ed), *Transcontinental Links in the History of Non-Western Christianity* (Wiesbaden, 2002), pp. 189-201
- De Souza, Teotónio R., 'The Indian Christians of St. Thomas and the Portuguese Padroado: Rape after a century-long courtship (1498-1599)', in Klaus Koschorke (ed), *Christen und Gewürze: Konfrontation und Interaktion kolonialer und indigener Christentumsvarianten* (Göttingen, 1998), pp. 31-42
- De Souza, Teotónio R. "Portuguese Impact upon Goa: Lusotopic, Lusophonic, Lusophilic?" in Philip J. Havik and Malyn Newitt (eds), *Creole Societies in the Portuguese Colonial Empire* (Bristol, 2007), pp. 235-250.
- Denzinger, Heinrich Joseph Dominicus, *Enchiridion symbolorum, definitionum et declarationum de rebus fidei et morum*, 11<sup>th</sup> edn (Freiburg, 1911)
- Didier, Hugues, 'Muslim Heterodoxy, Persian Murtaddun and Jesuit Missionaries at the Court of King Akbar (1580-1605)', *The Heythrop Journal* XLIX (2008), pp. 898-939
- Dirks, Nicholas, *Castes of Mind: Colonialism and the Making of Modern India* (Princeton, 2001)
- Ditchfield, Simon, 'Of Missions and Models: The Jesuit Enterprise (1540-1773) Reassessed in Recent Literature', *The Catholic Historical Review* 93/2 (2007), pp. 325-343
- Ditchfield, Simon, 'The Jesuits in the Making of a World Religion', *History Today* 57.7 (2007), pp. 52-59
- Ditchfield, Simon, 'Trent revisited' in *La fede degli italiani: Per Adriano Prosperi I* (Pisa, 2011), pp. 357-370

- Donnelly, John Patrick (ed), *Jesuit Writings of the Early Modern Period, 1540-1640* (Indianapolis, 2006)
- D'Ortia, Linda Zampol, 'Purple Silk and Black Cotton: Francisco Cabral and the Negotiation of Jesuit Attire in Japan (1570-73)' in Robert Aleksander Maryks (ed), *Exploring Jesuit Distinctiveness: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Ways of Proceeding within the Society of Jesus* (Boston, 2016), pp. 137-55
- Dunne, George H., S.J., *Generation of Giants: The Story of the Jesuits in China in the last Decades of the Ming Dynasty* (South Bend, 1962)
- Ehalt, Rômulo da Silva, 'Casuística nos Trópicos: a pragmática teológico-moral de Francisco Rodrigues na Ásia portuguesa (séculos XVI e XVII)', *Revista de História da Sociedade e da Cultura* 19 (2019), pp. 399-418
- Emerich, Coreth, "In actione contemplativus." *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie* 76 (1954), pp. 55–82
- Fabre, P.A., 'La Conversion Infinie des *Conversos*. Des "nouveaux-chrétiens" dans la Compagnie de Jésus au 16e siècle' *Annales* 54/4 (1999), pp. 875-93
- Fernandes Pinto, Ana and Remédio Pires, Silvana, 'The "Resposta que alguns padres de Japão mandaram perguntar": a clash of strategies?' *Bulletin of Portuguese-Japanese Studies* 10-11 (2005), pp. 9-60
- Ferrolli, D., S.J., *The Jesuits in Malabar* (Bangalore, 1939)
- 'Fr. Josef Wicki, S.J.' *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 54 (1985), pp. 473-96
- Francis, Scott, 'Marguerite de Navarre, a Nicodemite? Adiaphora and Intention in *Heptaméron* 30, 65, and 72', *Renaissance and Reformation/Renaissance et Reforme* 39/3 (2016), pp. 5-31
- Franco, António, *Imagem da virtude em o noviciado da Companhia de Jesus no Real Collegio de Jesus de Coimbra* (2 vols, Coimbra, 1719)
- Franco, José Eduardo, 'A Companhia de Jesus e a Inquisição: afectos e desafectos entre duas instituições influentes (Séculos XVI-XVII)' *Actas do Congresso Internacional Atlântico de Antigo Regime: poderes e sociedades* (Lisbon, 2005), pp. 2-23
- Friedrich, Markus "Government in India and Japan is different from government in Europe": Asian Jesuits on Infrastructure, Administrative Space, and the Possibilities for a Global Management of Power', *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 4 (2017), pp. 1-27
- Gallagher, John, "'To Hear It by Mouth": Speech and Accent in Early Modern Language Learning', *The Huntington Library Quarterly* 82/1 (2019), pp. 63-86
- Geger, Barton T., 'Ten Things that St. Ignatius Never Said or Did' in *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 50/1 (2018), pp. 1-44
- Ginzburg, Carlo, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller*, tr. John and Anne Tedeschi (Baltimore, 1992)
- Ginzburg, Carlo, *Wooden Eyes* (New York, 2001)
- Gonçalves, Nuno da Silva, S.J., 'Jesuits in Portugal', in Thomas M. McCoog (ed), *The Mercurian Project: Forming Jesuit Culture, 1573-1580* (St. Louis, 2004), pp. 705-44
- Greco, Joseph, S.J., *Le pouvoir du Souverain Pontife à l'égard des infidèles* (Rome, 1967)
- Greenblatt, Stephen, *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to Shakespeare* (Chicago, 2005)
- Greenblatt, Stephen, et al, *Cultural Mobility: A Manifesto* (Cambridge, 2010)
- Grendler, Paul F., *Schooling in Renaissance Italy: Literacy and Learning, 1300-1600* (Baltimore, 1989)
- Guha, Sumit, 'The Frontiers of Memory: What the Marathas Remembered of Vijayanagara', *Modern Asian Studies*, 43/1 (2008), pp. 269-288

- Guillén, Antonio, 'Praise: the Fundamental Attitude in the Church', *The Way* 52/2 (2013), pp. 101-12
- Gunn, Geoffrey C., *History Without Borders: The Making of an Asian World Region (1000-1800)* (Hong Kong, 2011)
- Hankins, James, 'Machiavelli, Civic Humanism, and the Humanist Politics of Virtue', *Italian Culture* 32/2 (2014), pp. 98-109
- Harriss, Jonathan Gil, 'Hi Mho Jhi Kudd: Thomas Stephens's translated Flesh, or, coconuts in Goa', *postmedieval: a journal of medieval cultural studies* 4/4 (2013), pp. 491-502
- Henn, Alexander, *Hindu-Catholic Encounters in Goa: Religion, Colonialism, and Modernity* (Bloomington, 2014)
- Hollis, Christopher, *The Jesuits: A History* (New York, 1986)
- Höpfl, Harro 'Suaviter in modo, fortiter in re': Appearance, Reality, and the Early Jesuits' in Stephen Linstead and Heather Höpfl (eds), *The Aesthetics of Organization* (London, 2000), pp. 197-211
- Hosne, Ana Carolina. "Assessing Indigenous Forms of Writing: Jose de Acosta's View of Andean Quipus in Contrast with Chinese 'Letters.'" in *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1. Leiden: Brill Academic Publishers, 2014. Pp. 177-191.
- Hsia, R. Po-chia, *A Jesuit in the Forbidden City: Matteo Ricci, 1552-1610* (Oxford, 2010)
- Hsia, R. Po-chia, 'Jesuit Foreign Missions. A Historiographical Essay', *Journal of Jesuit Studies*, 1/1 (2014), pp. 47-65
- Hsia, R. Po-chia, 'Introduction: Catholic Global Missions and the Expansion of Europe', in R. Po-chia Hsia (ed), *A Companion to Early Modern Catholic Global Missions* (Leiden, 2018), pp. 1-14
- Hsia, R. Po-chia, *The World of Catholic Renewal, 1540-1770* (Cambridge, 2005)
- Huonder, Anton, *Der hl. Ignatius von Loyola und der Missionsbrief der Gesellschaft Jesu zum 300jährigen Gedächtnis seiner Heiligsprechung* (Aachen, 1922)
- Imbruglia, Girolamo, 'Ideali di civilizzazione: la Compagnia di Gesù e le missioni (1550-1600)', in Adriano Prosperi and Wolfgang Reinhard (eds), *Il Nuovo Mondo nella coscienza italiana e tedesca del Cinquecento* (Bologna, 1992), pp. 287-308
- Imbruglia, Girolamo, *The Jesuit Missions of Paraguay and a Cultural History of Utopia (1568-1789)* (Leiden, 2017)
- Kagan, Richard L., *Lucrecia's Dreams: Politics and Prophecy in Sixteenth-Century Spain* (Berkeley, 1990)
- Kamen, Henry, *The Rise of Toleration* (New York, 1967)
- Kaplan, Yosef, *An Alternative Path to Modernity: The Sephardi Jews of Amsterdam in Early Modern Times* (Leiden, 2010)
- Kainulainen, Jaska, 'Isocrates's phronesis and the Early Jesuits', *Journal of Early Modern History* 22/6 (2018), pp. 528-48
- Kim, Sangkeun, *Strange Names of God: The Missionary Translation of the Divine Name and the Chinese Responses to Matteo Ricci's "Shangti" in Late Ming China, 1583-1644* (Bern, 2004)
- Kimmel, Seth, *Parables of Coercion: Conversion and Knowledge at the End of Islamic Spain* (Chicago, 2015)
- Krop, Henri, 'Duns Scotus and the Jews: Scholastic Theology and Enforced Conversion in the Thirteenth Century', *Dutch Review of Church History* 69/2 (1989), pp. 161-75
- Lach, Donald F., *Asia in the Making of Europe, Volume I: The Century of Discovery* (Chicago, 1965)

- Langan, John, 'The Good of Obedience in a Culture of Autonomy', *Studies in the Spirituality of the Jesuits* 32 (2000), pp. 1-25
- Lantigua, David M. and Clairmont, David A., 'Between Inculturation and Natural Law', *Journal of Moral Theology* 2/2 (2013), pp. 60-88
- Leite, Bertha, *D. Gonçalo da Silveira* (Lisbon, 1946)
- Lobato, Manuel, 'Notas e correcções para uma edição crítica do Ms. da Livraria n.º 805 (IAN/TT), a propósito da publicação de um tratado do P.e Manuel de Carvalho SJ' *Anais de Historia de Alem-Mar* 3 (2002), 389–408
- Lopes, Fernando Felix, 'O ensino das doutrinas de Escoto na Universidade de Coimbra' *Colectânea de estudos de história e literatura* (3 vols, Lisbon, 1997), ii, pp. 473-534
- MacCormack, Sabine, "'The Heart has Its Reasons": Predicaments of Missionary Christianity in Early Colonial Peru', *The Hispanic American Historical Review* 65/3 (1985), pp. 443-66
- Madigan, Daniel, 'Global Visions in Contestation: Jesuits and Muslims in the Age of Empires' in Thomas Banchoff and José Casanova (eds), *Jesuits and Globalization: Historical Legacies and Contemporary Challenges* (Washington, D.C., 2016), pp. 69-91
- Maldavsky, Aliocha, 'Pedir las Indias. Las cartas *indipetae* de los jesuitas europeos, siglos XVI-XVIII, ensayo historiográfico' *Relaciones: Estudios de historia y sociedad* 33/132 (2012), pp. 147-81
- Malekandathil, Pius, 'The Jews of Cochin and the Portuguese: 1493-1668' *Proceedings of the Indian History Congress* 62 (2001), pp. 239-55
- Manickam, S. 'The politico-economic implications of the religious conversions of the paravas in the gulf of Mannar, AD 1532-1552', *Tamil Civilization* 1 (1983), pp. 57-73
- Mann, Nicholas, 'Origins of Humanism' in Jill Kraye (ed), *The Cambridge Companion to Renaissance Humanism*, (Cambridge, 2006), pp. 1-19
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Blackness and Heathenism. Color, Theology, and Race in the Portuguese World, c. 1450-1600', *Anuario Colombiano de Historia Social y de la Cultura* 43/2 (2016), pp. 33-57
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Conscience and Empire: Politics and Moral Theology in the Early Modern Portuguese World' *Journal of Early Modern History* 18 (2014), pp. 473-94
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, *A Consciência do Império: Portugal e o seu Mundo (sécs. XV-XVII)* (Coimbra, 2012)
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Construire un outro Portugal. Strategie di conversion a Goa fra Cinque e Seicento', *Rivista di Storia del Cristianesimo* 7 (2010), pp. 23-34
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'A fé de um império: a Inquisição no mundo português de Quinhentos,' *Revista de História* 164 (2011), pp. 65-100
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Inquisição, jesuítas e cristãos-novos em Portugal no século XVI', *Revista de História das Ideias* 25 (2004), pp. 247-326
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Jesuit Missionaries and the Portuguese Inquisition in South Asia: A Controversial History (16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Centuries)' in Ines G. Županov and Anand Amaladass (eds), *Intercultural Encounters and the Jesuit Mission in South Asia (16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Centuries)* (Bangalore, 2014), pp. 232-58
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, "'...per capillos adductos ad pillam". Il dibattito cinquecentesco sulla validità del battesimo forzato degli ebrei in Portogallo (1496-1497)' in Adriano Prosperi (ed), *Salvezza della anime, disciplina dei corpi. Un seminario sulla storia del battesimo* (Pisa, 2006), pp. 339-423

- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Saltwater Conversion: Trans-Oceanic Sailing and Religious Transformation in the Iberian World', *Intersections: Interdisciplinary Studies in Early Modern Culture* 35 (2015), pp. 235-59
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Teologia e missioni in un impero commerciale: casi di coscienza e sacramenti nel mondo portoghese, ca. 1550-1600' *Cristianesimo nella Storia* 31/2 (2010), pp. 451-82
- Marcocci, Giuseppe, 'Trading with the Muslim World: Religious Limits and Proscriptions in the Portuguese Empire (ca. 1480-1570)', in Francesca Trivellato, Leor Halevi, and Caiti Antunes (eds) *Religion and Trade: Cross-Cultural Exchanges in World History, 1000-1900* (Oxford, 2014), pp. 91-107
- Martin, John Jeffries, *Venice's Hidden Enemies: Italian Heretics in a Renaissance City* (Baltimore, 2004)
- Maryks, Robert, 'The Jesuit Missionary Ethos', *Eighteenth-Century Studies*, 46/3 (2013), pp. 431-4
- Maryks, Robert A., *The Jesuit Order as a synagogue of Jews: Jesuits of Jewish ancestry and purity-of-blood laws in the early Society of Jesus* (Leiden, 2010)
- Maryks, Robert, *Saint Cicero and the Jesuits: The Influence of the Liberal Arts on the Adoption of Moral Probabilism* (Abingdon, 2008)
- Mazur, Peter and Shinn, Abigail, 'Introduction: Conversion Narratives in the Early Modern World' *Journal of Early Modern History* 17 (2013), pp. 427-36.
- McPherson, Kenneth, 'Uma história de duas conversões: deus, a cobiça e o desenvolvimento de novas comunidades na região do Oceano Índico', *Oceanos* 34 (1998), pp. 74-85
- Mecherry, Antony, 'Archbishop Aleixo de Menezes OSA, A Portuguese Fidalgo: Behind the Curtain', *Vidyajyoti Journal of Theological Reflection* 82/1 (2018), pp. 8-34
- Mecherry, Antony, S.J., 'Sentir con la iglesia' and Ecumenical Rapprochements of the Sixteenth Century: An Indian Reality' in Robert J. Daly and Patrick Howell (eds), *Thinking and Feeling with the Churches* (Chestnut Hill, 2017), pp. 131-41
- Mecherry, Antony, S.J., *Testing Ground for Jesuit Accommodation in Early Modern India: Francisco Ros SJ in Malabar (16<sup>th</sup>-17<sup>th</sup> Centuries)* (Rome, 2019)
- Mercês de Melo, Carlos, *The Recruitment and Formation of the Native Clergy in India: An Historico-canonical Study* (Lisbon, 1955)
- Meyland, E.F., 'The Stoic Doctrine of Indifferent Things and Conception of Christian Liberty in Calvin's *Institutio Religionis Christianae*', in R. Gamble (ed), *Articles on Calvin and Calvinism* (14 vols, New York, 1992), iii, pp. 135-45
- McGinness, Anne B., 'Between Subjection and Accommodation: the Development of José de Anchieta's Missionary Project in Colonial Brazil', *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1.2 (2014), pp. 227-44
- McShea, Bronwen Catherine, 'Jesuit Missionary Perspectives and Strategies: Across the Early Modern Globe' *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1 (2014), pp. 171-6
- Meirinhos, José Francisco, 'Escotistas portugueses dos séculos XIV e XV', in Luís Alberto de Boni et al (eds), *João Duns Scotus (1308-2008). Homenagem dos scotistas lusófonos* (Porto Alegre, 2008), pp. 330-47
- Mooney, Catherine M., 'Ignatian Spirituality, A Spirituality for Mission' *Mission Studies* 26 (2009), pp. 192-213
- Mosse, David, 'The Politics of Religious Synthesis: Roman Catholicism and Hindu Village Society in Tamil Nadu, India' in Charles Stewart and Rosalind Shaw (eds) *Syncretism/Anti-Syncretism: The Politics of Religious Synthesis* (London, 1994)

- Mosse, David, *The Saint in the Banyan Tree: Christianity and Caste Society in India* (Berkeley, 2012)
- Mosse, David, 'South Indian Christians, Purity/Impurity, and the Caste System: Death Ritual in a Tamil Roman Catholic Community' *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 2/3 (1996), pp. 461-83
- Mostaccio, Silvia, *Early Modern Jesuits Between Obedience and Conscience During the Generalate of Claudio Acquaviva (1581-1615)* (Farnham, 2014)
- Motta, Franco, 'Jesuit Theology, Politics, and Identity: The Generalate of Acquaviva and the Years of Formation' in P.-A. Fabre and F. Rurale (eds), *The Acquaviva Project: Claudio Acquaviva's Generalate (1581-1615) and the Emergence of Modern Catholicism* (Boston, 2017), pp. 353-74
- Muller, Jeffrey, 'The Jesuit Strategy of Accommodation', in Wietse de Boer, Karl A.E. Enekel, and Walter Melion (eds), *Jesuit Image Theory* (Leiden, 2016), pp. 461-92
- Nalle, Sarah Tilchman, *Mad for God: Bartolome Sanchez, the Secret Messiah of Cardenete* (Charlottesville, 2001)
- Neill, Stephen, *A History of Christianity in India: The Beginnings to AD 1707* (Cambridge, 1984)
- Newitt, Malyn, 'Formal and Informal Empire in the History of Portuguese Expansion' *Portuguese Studies* 17 (2001), pp. 1-21
- Old, Hughes Oliphant, *The Shaping of the Reformed Baptismal Rite in the Sixteenth Century* (Grand Rapids, 1992)
- O'Malley, John W., *The First Jesuits* (Cambridge, MA, 1993)
- O'Malley, John, 'How the First Jesuits Became Involved in Education', in Vincent J. Duminico (ed), *The Jesuit Ratio Studiorum: 400<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Perspectives* (New York, 2000), pp. 58-63
- O'Malley, John W., *Saints or Devils Incarnate?: Studies in Jesuit History* (Leiden, 2013)
- O'Malley, John W., 'To Travel to Any Part of the World: Jerónimo Nadal and the Jesuit Vocation', *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 16/2 (1984), pp. 1-20
- O'Malley, John, S.J.; Bailey, Gauvin Alexander; Harris, Steven J.; and Kennedy, T. Frank, S.J. (eds), *The Jesuits II: Cultures, Sciences, and the Arts, 1540-1773* (Toronto, 2006)
- Pabel, Hilmar M., 'Peter Canisius and the Protestants: A Model of Ecumenical Dialogue?' *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1/3 (2014), pp. 373-99
- Pagden, Anthony, *European Encounters with the New World: From Renaissance to Romanticism* (New Haven, 1994)
- Paiva, José Pedro, 'The Inquisitional Tribunal in Goa: Why and for What Purpose?' *Journal of Early Modern History* 21 (2017), pp. 565-93
- Pastore, Stefania, 'Doubt in Fifteenth-Century Iberia', in Mercedes García-Arenal (ed), *After Conversion: Iberia and the Emergence of Modernity* (Leiden, 2016), pp. 283-303
- Panikkar, K.M., *Asia and Western Dominance: A Survey of the Vasco da Gama Epoch of Asian History, 1498-1945* (London, 1953)
- Pavone, Sabina, 'Anti-Jesuitism in a Global Perspective' in Ines G. Županov (ed), *Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits* (Oxford, 2019), pp. 833-54
- Pavone, Sabina 'Practices of Conversion in South India in the 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> Centuries: Strategies and Narratives', in in Vincenzo Lavenia, Stefania Pastore, Sabina Pavone, and Chiara Petrolini (eds), *Compel People to Come In: Violence and Catholic Conversions in the non-European World* (Rome, 2018), pp. 117-36
- Pearson, M. N., *The New Cambridge History of India 1.1: The Portuguese in India* (Cambridge, 1987)

- Phelan, John Leddy, *The Millennial Kingdom of the Franciscans in the New World. A Study of the Writings of Gerónimo de Mendieta* (Berkeley, 1971)
- Pickering, W.S.F., 'Introduction: Old Positions and New Concerns' *Journal of the Anthropological Society of Oxford* 23/2 (1992), pp. 99-110
- Perniola, V., *The Catholic Church in Sri Lanka: the Portuguese period: original documents translated into English*, vol. 1 (Dehiwala, 1989)
- Popkin, Richard, *The History of Skepticism: From Savonarola to Bayle* (New York, 2003)
- Prieto, Andrés, 'The Perils of Accommodation: Jesuit Missionary Strategies in the Early Modern World' *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 4 (2017), pp. 395-414
- Prieto, Andrés Ignacio, *Missionary Scientists: Jesuit Science in Spanish South America, 1570–1810* (Nashville, 2010)
- Priolkar, Anant, *The Goa Inquisition: Being a Quatercentenary Commemoration Study of the Inquisition in India* (Bombay, 1961)
- Priolkar, A.K., *The Printing Press in India: Its Beginning and Early Developments* (Bombay, 1958)
- Prosperi, Adriano, 'L'Europa Cristiana e il mondo. Alle origini dell'idea di missione', *Dimensioni e problem della ricerca storica* 2 (1992), pp. 198-204
- Rajamanickam, S., "Roberto de Nobili and Adaptation," *Indian Church History Review* 1 (1967), pp. 83-91
- Rajamanickam, S., "The Newly Discovered "Informatio" of Robert De Nobili." *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 39 (1970), pp. 221-67
- Redden, Andrew, 'Priestly Violence, Martyrdom, and Jesuits: The Case of Diego de Alfaro (Paraguay, 1639)' in Robert Aleksander Maryks (ed), *Exploring Jesuit Distinctiveness: Interdisciplinary Perspectives on Ways of Proceeding within the Society of Jesus* (Boston, 2016), pp. 81-113
- Reinhard, Wolfgang, 'Missionaries, humanists and natives in the sixteenth-century Spanish Indies – a failed encounter of two worlds?' *Renaissance Studies* 6/3-4 (1992), pp. 360-76
- Rey, Eusebio, 'San Ignacio de Loyola y el problema de los cristianos nuevos', *Razón y Fe* 153 (1956), pp. 117-204
- Rivara, Joaquim Heliodoro da Cunha, *Ensaio historico da lingua Concani* (Nova-Goa, 1858)
- Robinson, Rowena, 'Cuncolim: Weaving a Tale of Resistance' *Economic and Political Weekly* 32/7 (1997), pp. 334-40
- Robinson, Rowena, *Conversion, Continuity and Change: Lived Christianity in Southern Goa* (New Delhi, 1998)
- Rodrigues, Francisco, *História da Companhia de Jesus na Assistência de Portugal* (4 vols, Porto, 1931-50)
- Rodrigues da Silva Tavim, José Alberto, 'From Setúbal to the Sublime Porte: the Wanderings of Jácome de Olivares, New Christian and Merchant of Cochin (1540-1571)', in Sanjay Subrahmanyam (ed), *Sinners and Saints: the Successors of Vasco da Gama* (New Delhi, 1995), pp. 94-134
- Ross, Andrew C., 'Alessandro Valignano: The Jesuits and Culture in the East', in John W. O'Malley, Gauvin Alexander Bailey, Steven J. Harris, T. Frank Kennedy (eds), *The Jesuits: Cultures, Sciences, and the Arts, 1540-1773*, vol. 1 (Toronto, 1999), pp. 336-51
- Rubiés, Joan-Pau, 'The Concept of Cultural Dialogue and the Jesuit Method of Accommodation', *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 147 (2005), pp. 237-80

- Rubiés, Joan-Pau, 'The Jesuit discovery of Hinduism: Antonio Rubino's account of the history and religion of Vijayanagara (1608)', *Archiv für Religionsgeschichte* 3/1 (2001), pp. 210-56
- Rubiés, Joan-Pau. 'Reassessing 'the Discovery of Hinduism': Jesuit Discourse on Gentile Idolatry and the European Republic of Letters' in Ines G. Županov and Anand Amaladass (eds), *Intercultural Encounters and the Jesuit Mission in South Asia (16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Centuries)* (Bangalore, 2014), pp. 113-55
- Rubiés, Joan-Pau, *Travel and Ethnology in the Renaissance: South India Through European Eyes, 1250-1625* (Cambridge, 2004)
- Rubiés, Joan-Pau, 'Were Early Modern Europeans Racist?', in Amos Morris-Reich and Dirk Rupnow (eds), *Ideas of 'Race' in the History of the Humanities* (Cham, 2017), pp. 33-87
- Russell, Camilla, 'Imagining the 'Indies': Italian Jesuit Petitions for the Overseas Missions at the Turn of the Seventeenth Century', in Massimo Donattini, Giuseppe Marcocci, Stefania Pastore (eds), *L'Europa divisa e i Nuovi Mondi. Per Adriano Prosperi, Vol. II* (Pisa, 2011), pp. 179-89
- Samson, Alexander, 'The *adelantamiento* of Cazorla, *converso* Culture and Toledo Cathedral Chapter's 1547 *estatuto de limpieza de sangre*', *Bulletin of Spanish Studies*, 84/7 (2007), pp. 819-36
- Santos, Catarina Madeira, *Goa é chave de toda a Índia. Perfil político da capital do Estado da Índia (1505-1570)* (Lisbon, 1999)
- Santos Hernández, Angel, S.J., *Adaptación Misionera* (Bilbao, 1958)
- Santos Hernández, Angel, S.J., *Jesuitas y obispadas: La Compañía de Jesús y la dignidades eclesiásticas* (Madrid, 1998)
- Saraiva, A.J., *The Marrano Factory: The Portuguese Inquisition and Its New Christians, 1536-1765*, tr. H.P. Salomon and I.S.D. Sassoon (Leiden, 2001)
- Schloesser, Stephen, 'Accommodation as a Rhetorical Principle: Twenty Years after John O'Malley's *The First Jesuits* (1993)', *Journal of Jesuit Studies* 1 (2014), pp. 347-72
- Schurhammer, Georg, 'Die Bekehrung der Paraver', in *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 4 (1935) pp. 207-15
- Schurhammer, Georg, *Francis Xavier: His Life, His Times*, tr. M. Joseph Costelloe (4 vols, Rome, 1973-82)
- Schurhammer, Georg, *Gesammelte Studien* (4 vols, Rome, 1962-65)
- Schurhammer, Georg, *Orientalia*, ed. László Szilas, S.J. (Rome, 1963)
- Schütte, Josef Franz, *Valignano's Mission Principles for Japan*, trans. John J. Coyne (St. Louis, 1980)
- Schwartz, Stuart B., *All Can Be Saved: Religious Tolerance and Salvation in the Iberian Atlantic World* (New Haven, 2009)
- Selwyn, Jennifer, *A Paradise Inhabited by Devils: The Jesuits' Civilizing Mission in Early Modern Naples* (New York, 2004)
- Shokoohy, Mehrdad, 'The town of Cochin and its Muslim heritage on the Malabar coast, South India', *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* 8/3 (1998), pp. 351-94
- Shore, Paul, *The Vita Christi of Ludolph of Saxony and its Influence on the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola* (St. Louis, 1998)
- Silva Rego, António da, 'The Collected Writings of Georg Schurhammer (Review)', *Catholic Historical Review* 54/1 (1968), pp. 70-9
- Sluhovsky, Moshe, 'Loyola's Spiritual Exercises and the Modern Self', in Robert Maryks (ed), *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola: Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence* (Leiden, 2014), pp. 216-31

- Sommervogel, Carlos, *Bibliothèque de la Compagnie de Jésus* (11 vols, Brussels, 1890-1932)
- Spence, Jonathan D., *The Memory Palace of Matteo Ricci* (New York, 1984)
- Stone, Lawrence, 'The Revival of Narrative: Reflections on a New Old History', *Past and Present* 85 (1979), pp. 3-24
- Strathern, Alan, *Kingship and Conversion in Sixteenth-Century Sri Lanka: Portuguese Imperialism in a Buddhist Land* (Cambridge, 2007)
- Strathern, Alan, 'Os Piedosos and the Mission in India and Sri Lanka in the 1540s' in Roberto Carneiro and Artur Teodoro de Matos (eds), *D. João III e o Império. Actas do Congresso Internacional* (Lisbon, 2004), pp. 855-64
- Strathern, Alan, 'Transcendental Intransigence: Why Rulers Rejected Monotheism in Early Modern Southeast Asia and Beyond', *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 49/2 (2007), pp. 358-83
- Streit, Robert, *Biblioteca Missionum* (32 vols, Münster, 1916-74)
- Stuczynski, Claude B. 'The Imaginary Synagogue: Anti-Jewish Literature in the Portuguese Early Modern World (16<sup>th</sup>-18<sup>th</sup> Centuries), written by Bruno Feitler', *Journal of Jesuit Studies*, 6/1 (2019), pp. 174-78
- Stuczynski, Claude B., 'Negotiated Relationships: Jesuits and Portuguese *Conversos*—A Reassessment', in James Bernauer and Robert Maryks (eds), "*The Tragic Couple*": *Encounters Between Jews and Jesuits* (Leiden, 2013), pp. 43-64
- Subrahmanyam, Sanjay, 'Jews & New Christians in Portuguese Asia 1500-1700' (unpublished paper, delivered 5 June 2013, John W. Kluge Center, Library of Congress)
- Subrahmanyam, Sanjay, 'Morality and Empire: Cases, Norms, and Exceptions in Sixteenth-Century Portuguese Asia', in Carlo Ginzburg and Lucio Biasiori (eds), *A Historical Approach to Casuistry: Norms and Exceptions in a Comparative Perspective* (London, 2019), pp. 219-38
- Subrahmanyam, Sanjay, *The Portuguese Empire in Asia, 1500-1700: A Political and Economic History* (London, 1993)
- Sweetman, Will, *Mapping Hinduism: 'Hinduism' and the Study of Indian Religion, 1600-1776* (Wiesbaden, 2003)
- Thanh, Hélène Vu, 'The Jesuits in Asia under the Portuguese Padroado: India, China, and Japan (Sixteenth to Seventeenth Centuries)', in Ines G. Županov (ed), *Oxford Handbook of the Jesuits* (Oxford, 2019), pp. 400-26
- Thauren, Johannes, SVD, *Die Akkommodation im Katholischen Heidenapostolat* (Münster, 1927)
- Tiliander, Bror, *Christian and Hindu Terminology: A Study in Their Mutual Relations with Special Reference to the Tamil Area* (Uppsala, 1974)
- Tucker, John T., 'Portuguese Missionary in Malabar', *International Review of Missions* 45 (1956), pp. 232-4
- Üçerler, M. Antoni J., 'Alessandro Valignano: man, missionary, and writer', *Renaissance Studies* 17/3 (2003), pp. 337-66
- Üçerler, M. Antoni J., 'Gutenberg Comes to Japan: the Jesuits & the first IT Revolution of the Sixteenth Century', *The Ricci Institute Public Lectures Series* (September 2005), pp. 1-18
- Üçerler, M. Antoni J., 'The Jesuits in East Asia in the Early Modern Age: A New "Areopagus" and the "Re-invention" of Christianity', in Thomas Banchoff and José Casanova (eds), *Jesuits and Globalization: Historical Legacies and Contemporary Challenges* (Washington, D.C., 2016), pp. 27-48

- Udías Vallina, Agustín, *Jesuit Contribution to Science: A History* (Cambridge, 2014)
- Valle, Carlos Martínez, 'Jesuit psychagogies: an approach to the relations of schooling and casuistry' *Paedagogica Historica: International Journal of the History of Education* 49/4 (2013), pp. 577-91
- Vaz de Carvalho, José, S.J., 'The Rehabilitation of Simão Rodrigues, S.J.', in Thomas M. McCoog (ed), *The Mercurian Project: Forming Jesuit Culture, 1573-1580* (St. Louis, 2004), pp. 421-35
- Velinkar, Joseph, 'Jesuit Education and Inculturation in Sixteenth Century Goa', *Divyadaan: Journal of Philosophy & Education*, 14/1 (2003), pp. 49-60
- Verkamp, B.J., *The Indifferent Mean: Adiaphorism in the English Reformation to 1554* (Columbus, 1971)
- Wetmore, Kevin J., 'Jesuit Theater and Drama', *Oxford Handbooks Online* (published online 7 Jul 2016), doi: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199935420.013.55
- Wicki, Josef, 'Archives and Libraries in Rome', in John Correia-Afonso (ed), *Indo-Portuguese History: Sources and Problems* (Oxford, 1981), pp. 34-50
- Wicki, Josef, 'Die « Cristaos-Novos » in der Indischen Provinz der Gesellschaft Jesu von Ignatius bis Acquaviva' *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 46 (1977), pp. 342-61
- Wicki, Josef, *Die Mitbrüder Franz Xavers in Indien: Methode ihrer Heidenbekehrung und Unterweisung der Christen (1545-1552)* (Beckenried, 1947)
- Wicki, Josef, 'Problemas Morais no Oriente Portugues do Século XV' in *O Centro de Estudos Históricos Ultramarinos e as Comemorações Henriquinas* (Lisbon, 1961), pp. 257-63
- Wicki, Josef, Review of *A Inquisição de Goa*, by António Baião, *AHSI* 21 (1952), pp. 187-90
- Wright, Jonathan, *God's Soldiers: Adventure, Politics, Intrigue, and Power: A History of the Jesuits*, (New York, 2004)
- Xavier, Ângela Barreto, 'Conversos and Novamente Convertidos: Law, Religion, and Identity in the Portuguese Kingdom and Empire', *Journal of Early Modern History*, 15 (2011), pp. 255-287
- Xavier, Ângela Barreto, 'Languages of Difference in the Portuguese Empire. The Spread of "Caste" in the Indian World', *Anuario Colombiano de Historia Social y de la Cultura* 43/2 (2016), pp. 89-119
- Xavier, Ângela Barreto and Županov, Ines, *Catholic Orientalism: Portuguese Empire, Indian Knowledge* (Oxford, 2015)
- Xavier, Ângela Barreto and Županov, Ines G., 'Ser Brâmane na Goa da Época Moderna', *Rev. Hist.* 172 (2015), pp. 15-41
- Yovel, Yirmiyahou, *The Other Within: The Marranos; Split Identity and Emerging Modernity* (Princeton, 2009)
- Županov, Ines G., 'Accommodation', in Régine Azria and Danièle Hervieu-Léger (eds), *Dictionnaire des faits religieux* (Paris, 2010), pp. 1-4
- Županov, Ines G., 'Conversion Historiography in South Asia: Alternative Indian Christian Counter-histories in Eighteenth Century Goa', *The Medieval History Journal*, 12/2 (2009), pp. 303-325
- Županov, Ines, *Disputed Mission: Jesuit Experiments and Brahmanical Knowledge in Seventeenth-century India* (New Delhi, 1999)
- Županov, Ines, "'I Am a Great Sinner": Jesuit Missionary Dialogues in Southern India", *Journal of the Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 55 (2012), pp. 415-446
- Županov, Ines G., *Missionary Tropics: The Catholic Frontier in India (16th-17th centuries)*, (Ann Arbor, 2005)

- Županov, Ines, “‘One Civility, but Multiple Religions’: Jesuit Mission among St. Thomas Christians in India (16th-17th Centuries)”, *Journal of Early Modern History*, 9/3-4 (2005), pp. 284-325
- Županov, Ines, ‘Passage to India: Jesuit Spiritual Economy between Martyrdom and Profit in the Seventeenth Century’, *Journal of Early Modern History*, 16/2 (2012), pp. 121-59
- Županov, Ines G., ‘Le repli du religieux: les missionnaires jésuites du 17<sup>e</sup> siècle entre la théologie chrétienne et une éthique païenne’, *Annales: Histoire, Sciences Sociales* 51/6 (1996), pp. 1201-23
- Županov, Ines ‘South Asia’ in Ronnie Po-chia Hsia (ed), *A Companion to Early Modern Catholic Global Missions* (Leiden, 2018)
- Zwartjes, Otto, *Portuguese Missionary Grammars in Asia, Africa and Brazil, 1550-1800* (Amsterdam, 2011)

## 2 Unpublished theses

- Ehalt, Rômulo da Silva, ‘Jesuits and the Problem of Slavery in Early Modern Japan’ (Doctoral Thesis, Tokyo University of Foreign Studies, 2018)
- Montane, Carla Tronu, ‘Sacred Space and Ritual in Early Modern Japan: The Christian Community of Nagasaki (1569-1643)’ (PhD Thesis, SOAS, University of London, 2012)