

**TERESA DE CARTAGENA: A LATE
MEDIEVAL WOMAN'S THEOLOGICAL
APPROACH TO DISABILITY**

HILARY ELIZABETH PEARSON

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the
requirements for the degree of Doctor of
Philosophy

Somerville College
University of Oxford
Trinity Term 2010

ABSTRACT: TERESA DE CARTAGENA: A LATE MIEVEAL WOMAN'S THEOLOGICAL APPROACH TO DISABILITY

Hilary Pearson, Somerville College, Oxford
D.Phil. Thesis, Trinity Term 2010

This thesis studies, through a literary and theological analysis of her writings and an examination of her background, how a fifteenth century Spanish nun called Teresa de Cartagena dealt spiritually with disability. She was physically disabled, having become deaf as an adult but also having endured many illnesses. Her first book, *Arboleda de los enfermos*, was written to pass on to other sufferers the spiritual lessons she had learned from her own suffering; that suffering was good because it had saved her from sin and had brought her to God. Her second work, *Admiración operum Dey*, was written to answer those who had criticised her for the act of writing because of her gender, at that time a disability for any woman wishing to write or teach. She justified her writing as a special work of God, but did not claim mystical direct divine inspiration.

Teresa was a member of a prominent family of Jewish Christians (*conversos*). At the time she was writing, the second half of the fifteenth century, anti-*converso* prejudice and violence were growing in Spain. This culminated in the introduction of the Inquisition in order to deal with the so-called 'judaising *conversos*'. In these circumstances her *conversa* status was a distinct social disability, but there is no express mention of this in her writings. However, there are traces in her writings of *converso* concerns, and of a specifically *converso* theology.

Although there have been many studies of Teresa de Cartagena from the viewpoints of medieval Spanish literature, disability studies, feminist history and her use of rhetorical techniques, there has been no in depth study of her theology and spirituality. This thesis demonstrates that, although in general these were orthodox and unoriginal, they were unusual for a woman of her time and background.

ABSTRACT OF THESIS

TERESA DE CARTAGENA: A LATE MEDIEVAL WOMAN'S THEOLOGICAL APPROACH TO DISABILITY

Hilary Pearson, Somerville College, Oxford
D.Phil. Thesis, Trinity Term 2010

This thesis studies how a fifteenth century Spanish nun called Teresa de Cartagena dealt spiritually with disability. The main basis for the research is a detailed literary and theological analysis of her writings, including an identification of the Scriptural, Patristic and other religious and general sources she used. In order to understand her thinking in its historical context, documentary evidence of her life is reviewed and analysed, and her family background examined. Comparisons with the writings of male members of her family and of other fifteenth century Spanish women religious writers are made in relation to specific topics.

She was physically disabled, having become deaf as an adult but also having endured many illnesses. Her first book, *Arboleda de los enfermos*, was written to pass on to other sufferers the spiritual lessons she had learned from her own suffering; that suffering was good because it had saved her from sin and had brought her to God. Her second work, *Admiración operum Dey*, was written to answer those who had criticised her for the act of writing because of her gender, at that time a disability for any woman wishing to write or teach. She justified her writing as a special work of God, but did not claim mystical direct divine inspiration.

Teresa was a member of a prominent family of Jewish Christians (*conversos*). At the time she was writing, the second half of the fifteenth century, anti-*converso* prejudice and violence were growing in Spain. This culminated in the introduction of the Inquisition in order to deal with the so-called 'judaising *conversos*'. In these circumstances her *conversa* status was a distinct social disability, but there is no express mention of this in her writings. However, there are traces in her writings of *converso* concerns, and of a specifically *converso* theology.

Although there have been many studies of Teresa de Cartagena from the viewpoints of medieval Spanish literature, disability studies, feminist history and her use of

rhetorical techniques, there has been no in depth study of her theology and spirituality. This thesis demonstrates that, although in general these were orthodox and unoriginal, they were unusual for a woman of her time and background.

After an introduction, the thesis is in three parts. Section I provides background to Teresa de Cartagena, historical, political, social and familial. Section II contains the detailed analysis of her works. Section III uses this background and analysis to consider her approaches to her three forms of disability, in particular her theological and spiritual understanding of that disability.

Section I contains three chapters. Chapter 1 is an overview of the relevant period of Spanish history, concentrating on events in Castile which could have affected Teresa's family as well as Teresa herself. Teresa lived in a period of political instability and violence, which is echoed in her works. If the date for her writings put forward in this thesis is correct, she was writing in the early part of the reign of the Catholic Monarchs which was characterised by a struggle between Isabella and her half sister for the throne. Other scholars have suggested earlier dates, which would coincide with the civil unrest during the reign of Enrique IV. Although we do not know when she died, she probably did not live to experience the establishment of a strong monarchy under Isabella and Ferdinand and the final unification of the kingdom with the conquest of Granada. A section of this chapter deals with Burgos in this period, as her family were based in that town and active in its life and politics, and to the best of our knowledge she spent her whole life there. Chapter 2 specifically deals with the history of Jews and *conversos* in Spain in the relevant period, because Teresa came from a leading *converso* family and the final chapter of this thesis examines whether this was an influence on her writings. Chapter 3 deals with Teresa's life and her family. Although Teresa came from a prominent family, as so often with medieval women there is little hard information about her or her life, and the few sources contain conflicting information. This chapter examines both the internal clues to Teresa's life and circumstances from her works, and documentary sources which give us some information on her. The information from some genealogical sources that Teresa was betrothed to '*el señor de Ormazá*' is followed up with an investigation of the potential candidates for this role. On the other hand, a great deal is known about her grandfather, uncle and father, so we can put together a lot of information about

her family. The second half of the chapter deals with these leading members of a politically and ecclesiastically powerful family. The final part looks at the relationship between the family and two of the most powerful people in the early fifteenth century; Alvaro de Luna, the 'uncrowned king' during much of the reign of Juan II, and his uncle, Pope Benedict XIII, the last of the Avignon popes before the ending of the Great Schism.

In the second section I analyse the works of Teresa de Cartagena from various viewpoints in order to gain a comprehensive view of her thinking and sources. Chapter 4 is an analysis of the structure of and imagery used in her first book, *Arboleda de los Enfermos*, and Chapter 5 is a similar analysis of her second book, *Admiración operum Dey*. Chapter 6 examines her use of Scripture. The source for each of her express quotations is identified and compared to the Jerome Vulgate Latin. Appendices A and B list these quotations. There are also indirect references to Scripture, which are identified and listed in Appendices C and D, again with the relevant Vulgate Latin. Chapter 7 looks at her use of other sources. There are many direct quotations cited as authority, which are mainly from the Latin fathers and some from the liturgy. These sources are identified and Teresa's Spanish compared with the Latin of the original in Appendices E and F. This chapter also identifies and considers other sources which are referred to in her writing, including scientific information and general knowledge and proverbs.

Section III looks at Teresa's approach to disability. In this section 'disability' is used to describe an aspect of an individual which would be regarded by their society as adversely affecting that individual in some way. Teresa can be regarded as triply disabled in her society; by her deafness, by her gender (as an author) and by her race. These are discussed in turn in the chapters in this section. Chapter 8 looks at Teresa's treatment of physical disability and suffering. While this is the focus of her first book, *Admiración* also touches on this topic. The chapter begins, after discussing the modern distinction between impairment and disability, by considering possible causes for Teresa's deafness, how she dealt with it and whether, in her community of Cistercian nuns, that physical impairment would in practice be a disability. Next, various medieval approaches to physical suffering are discussed, in particular theological views of suffering and of the body including *imitatio Christi*. The

particular relationship between suffering and female spirituality in the late Middle Ages is also discussed. Teresa's approach in her writings to bodily suffering, physical, theological and spiritual, is examined and compared to the previously discussed medieval approaches, with particular consideration as to whether *imitatio Christi* can be found in her writings. Chapter 9 deals with her approach to gender, which is the primary focus of her second book. The chapter begins with some background on classical and medieval views of women (as seen by those who wrote, namely literate, powerful males who were predominantly high ranking ecclesiastics), and in particular the approaches to the role of the Virgin. The position and level of education of women in Spain in the Middle Ages is examined, including late medieval Spanish views of women as expressed in the literary *querrela de las mujeres*. The first main section of this chapter deals with the issue of authorship and authority as those terms were understood in the late Middle Ages in relation to Teresa's act of writing. The next section covers a related topic, medieval epistemology, as Teresa is very specific about her source of knowledge. This raises the question of mysticism, as most medieval women religious writers expressly relied on mystical experiences and revelations as their source of knowledge and authority. The question whether Teresa would have been considered a mystic by the standards of her day, and whether she would have considered herself a mystic is considered and answered in the negative. A related topic is that of the humility topoi, declarations of inferiority and insufficiency found in the works of Teresa and most other female (and some male) writers of the medieval and early modern periods. The next section of this chapter looks at how Teresa deals with gender roles and stereotypes and her theology of gender. Finally, her approach to gender and authority are compared to those of three contemporary female Spanish writers. The final chapter deals with her disability in her time and society as a *conversa*. Unlike the other two disabilities, she says nothing expressly about this. The chapter begins with a short overview of the history of the term 'race' and the controversial issue of whether Spanish treatment of *conversos* in the second half of the fifteenth century can be considered to be 'racist'. Various views on the theory put forward by the Spanish historian Américo Castro that *conversos* contributed a characteristic '*converso* voice' to Spanish literature are discussed. The next part of the chapter looks at things in Teresa's writings which could be understood as relating to *converso* issues, followed by a section which considers whether we can gain information from things on which Teresa is unexpectedly silent, 'unexpected' in

the context of most late medieval religious writing. Next, Teresa's theological understanding of her suffering is compared to the Jewish view of suffering which would have been known to at least her grandfather in his years as a rabbi. Finally, there is a discussion of recent research on the development of a specifically *converso* theology in the middle of the fifteenth century by Alonso de Cartagena, Teresa's uncle, and by Juan de Torquemada in response to the anti-*converso* sentiment in Spain in that period and an examination of whether there is any trace of that theology in Teresa's writings.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My acquaintance with Teresa de Cartagena began when I was looking through books in a sale. I had just completed an MA in Christian Spirituality at Heythrop College, University of London, and in that course had studied Teresa of Avila and read many other medieval women religious writers. I found a copy of the English translation of Teresa de Cartagena's works by Dayle Seidenspinner-Núñez. I was interested to find a female medieval writer I had not previously heard of, but the thing that got me to buy the book was the information on the back cover that Teresa had become deaf; both my children are hearing-impaired and my daughter is a teacher of the deaf. So my first acknowledgement is to Professor Seidenspinner-Núñez, who not only introduced me to Teresa but encouraged me when I contacted her with a tentative research proposal and who has continued to supply me with written materials and information that have come to her attention. Unfortunately we have never met in person.

My next acknowledgements are to the people who got me started on this project: Dr Edward Howells, my MA supervisor at Heythrop who encouraged me to go on to do research; Dr Benjamin Thompson of Somerville who found me my supervisor and who subsequently has been my college advisor and given me assistance in the arcane skill of formatting as required by the Oxford History Faculty; and Elizabeth Cooke, secretary to the Somerville Association, who suggested returning to Oxford to do a D.Phil.

I would next like to thank all those who have given me academic help and encouragement. From Oxford, Professor Chris Wickham, whose first year graduate seminars turned me into a historian and who has continued to give help and encouragement, Dr Juan-Carlos Conde who is preparing a new edition of Teresa's works, Dr Lesley Smith, Mrs Henrietta Leyser, Dr Philip Endean and Dr Barbara Harvey. I would also like to thank Dr Rosa Vidal Doval and Dr Jane Whetnall of Queen Mary, University of London; Dr Lesley Twomey of Northumbria University; Professor Caroline Barron of Royal Holloway, University of London; Professor Cynthia Robinson of Cornell University; and Professor Gary Macy of Santa Clara University.

I have previous experience of scientific research, which tends to be a collaborative experience done in laboratories together with colleagues. History research, on the other hand, is generally a solitary occupation. I would like to thank friends who have made it less lonely; Dr Kathryne Beebe, allotted to me as my graduate mentor who has turned into a very good friend, her husband Josh Hatton, Anna Campbell, and Liz Cooke; also, friends from undergraduate days who have remained in Oxford, Vera Sinton and Ginny Ross, and friends from the Third Order of the Society of St Francis and St Mary's Iffley. I would also like to acknowledge the mutual support of the 'survivors' from the first year medieval history graduate seminars who have continued to meet up socially; Margaret Coombe (to whom I owe special thanks for proof-reading my thesis), Rory Cox, Elizabeth Russell, Tiago Viula de Faria, George Molyneaux, Kerrith Davies, Patrick Wadden and Robert Shaw. My thanks also to my friend and neighbour Dr Philomene Verlaan who has looked after my house while I

have been away working on this research; a repayment for me doing the same for her while she was researching for a PhD in oceanography.

I would like to thank my family for their help and encouragement. I am particularly grateful to my daughter, Ruth Matthews, deaf herself and an experienced teacher of the deaf, for her help with understanding the problems Teresa would have had when she became deaf and for pointing me to the evidence from Teresa's vocabulary that she was most unlikely to have become deaf before her late teens.

Last, but most certainly not least, I want to thank my supervisor, Dr John Edwards, for his generous sharing of his encyclopaedic knowledge of this period of Spanish history, for his encouragement of and enthusiasm for my research, for his introduction to the resources of the Real Academia de la Historia in Madrid and the Escorial Library, for introducing me to many of the leading scholars in this field, and for the hospitality of himself and his wife. I also benefited from the work he has done on Alonso de Cartagena, known between us as 'Uncle Alonso'. This research would have been almost impossible to complete without him.

Finally, I would like to acknowledge the kind encouragement and help I received from Professor Alan Deyermond, a world-renowned medieval hispanicist and the person who introduced Teresa de Cartagena to the English-speaking world. I had so looked forward to his comments on my thesis, a hope dashed by his death in September 2009. This thesis is dedicated to his memory.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Abbreviations.....	2
Introduction.....	4
PART I: BACKGROUND	
Chapter 1: Spain in the fifteenth century.....	18
Chapter 2: Jews and <i>conversos</i> in medieval Spain.....	39
Chapter 3: Teresa de Cartagena and her family.....	59
PART II: ANALYSIS OF THE WORKS	
Chapter 4: Structure and imagery of <i>Arboleda</i>	96
Chapter 5: Structure and imagery of <i>Admiración</i>	121
Chapter 6: Teresa de Cartagena's use of Scripture.....	138
Chapter 7: Other sources.....	163
PART III: TERESA'S APPROACH TO DISABILITY	
Chapter 8: Deafness.....	178
Chapter 9: Gender.....	205
Chapter 10: Race.....	250
Conclusion.....	284
Appendices	288
Bibliography	300

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Cantera Burgos	Francisco Cantera Burgos, <i>Alvar García de Santa María y su familia de conversos: Historia de la Judería de Burgos y de sus conversos más egregios</i> (Madrid, 1952).
CCSL	<i>Corpus Christianorum Series Latina</i> (Turnhout, 1953-).
Hillgarth i	J.N. Hillgarth, <i>The Spanish Kingdoms 1250-1516 I: 1250-1410 Precarious Balance</i> (Oxford, 1976).
Hillgarth ii	J.N. Hillgarth, <i>Spanish Kingdoms, II: 1410-1516 Castilian Hegemony</i> (Oxford, 1978).
Hutton	<i>Arboleda de los Enfermos y Admiración Operum Dey</i> of Teresa de Cartagena, ed. L.J. Hutton (Madrid, 1967). Page references to the introduction are indicated as Hutton, p. x, page and line references to the text are indicated as Hutton, x:y.
KJV	King James Version (of the Bible).
PL	J.P. Migne (ed.), <i>Patrologiae cursus completus, series latina</i> (Paris, 1844-1864). PL references are given in the following form: 'PL volume number: column number'.
RAH	Real Academia de la Historia, Madrid.
Seidenspinner-Núñez	Dayle Seidenspinner-Núñez, <i>The Writings of Teresa de Cartagena</i> , (Cambridge, 1998). Page references to the introduction and interpretive essay are indicated as Seidenspinner-Núñez, p. x, page references to the translated text are indicated as Seidenspinner-Núñez, x.
Serrano:	R.P. Luciano Serrano, <i>Los Conversos D. Pablo de Santa María y D. Alfonso de Cartagena</i> , (Madrid, 1942).

Scripture references are given in the format generally used in modern theological writing, for example 2 Cor. 13:2. The psalms are numbered in accordance with the Vulgate numbering. All English Biblical quotations are from the New International

Version (NIV). Abbreviations for the names of Biblical books frequently cited in this thesis are as follows:

Cor.	Corinthians
Eph.	Ephesians
Heb.	Hebrews
Jn.	John
Lk.	Luke
Matt.	Matthew
Mk.	Mark
Ps.	Psalms
Phil.	Philippians
Rom.	Romans

INTRODUCTION

I first met Teresa de Cartagena when browsing through books on a sale table in a Cambridge bookshop. One of these was a copy of the English translation of her works by Dayle Seidenspinner-Nuñez. I had just completed a MA in Christian Spirituality at Heythrop College, London, during which I had studied the great sixteenth century Spanish mystics Teresa of Avila and John of the Cross and had encountered the works of many other medieval women religious writers, but Teresa de Cartagena's name had never come up in my studies. Reading the back cover of the book I found another reason to be interested in her; her deafness. Both my children are hearing impaired and my daughter is a teacher of the deaf – I bought the book intending to give it to her once I had read it.

When I did get round to reading it I was intrigued by how different her writing was from that of almost all of the medieval female religious writers I had read. Her first book, *Arboleda de los enfermos*, was about the religious lessons to be learned from suffering. Knowing of the strongly affective spirituality typical of the late Middle Ages, with its particular emphasis on the sufferings of Christ, I was surprised to find no trace of this spirituality. The Crucifixion was not even mentioned. Her second book, *Admiración operum Dey*, was written to justify her act of writing *Arboleda*. I had researched how Teresa of Avila claimed authority through her mystical experiences, and found that this was how almost all medieval women religious writers overcame the Church's prohibition on women's teaching. Although Teresa de Cartagena based her writing on her physical experiences, there was no mention of

anything meeting the usual definition of mystical experiences. I wanted to find out why she was different.

I did a preliminary literature review which showed that interest in her was comparatively recent, and that most of those who had written about her were either Hispanicists with an interest in medieval literature, or people with an interest in disability studies or feminism. Nothing I read explained the differences that had struck me. There did not seem to have been any real study of her theology or spirituality, the areas that I was interested in and, I would submit, the topics which would have been instrumental in informing the thinking of an educated, late medieval woman from a family which included prominent churchmen and who had spent all her adult life as a professed religious. Thinking about the issues which might hold the answers as to why her writing was different, it seemed to me that her disabilities could be important. These disabilities were not just physical, her deafness and illnesses, but also social, her gender and possibly her Jewish ancestry. I realised that to determine her thinking on these topics as accurately as possible it would be necessary to understand her background and circumstances, so a historical approach was required. Thus my research question is: what is Teresa de Cartagena's theology (in which term I include issues of spirituality) in respect of these three areas of disability and how does it differ from late medieval understanding of the topic, and in particular that of comparable women?

Literature review

The only known copy of the works of Teresa de Cartagena is in a manuscript in the Escorial library, h-III-24. The first reference to this manuscript is in the 1788 edition of Nicolás Antonio's *Biblioteca hispana vetus*, and the first commentary on Teresa's

works was in 1865 by José Amador de los Ríos¹. The first publication of a part of the text was in 1903 by Manuel Serrano y Sanz², but the first publication of a critical edition of the full text was not until 1967. This edition, by Lewis Hutton³, is that used in this thesis. I had hoped to be able to use a new edition being prepared by Dr Juan-Carlos Conde, but publication delays prevented this. I have also used the translation of the works into English by Dayle Seidenspinner-Nuñez⁴.

Modern interest in Teresa de Cartagena and her writings began with a 1976 article by Alan Deyermond, in which he gave short details of what was known about her and a description of her works⁵. He had briefly mentioned Teresa and her works in his 1971 *A Literary History of Spain: The Middle Ages*, giving fuller account in the 1979 *Historia y crítica de la literatura española. I Edad Media*. Deyermond continued to write and speak on Teresa: works include 'Spain's first women writers' in *Women in Hispanic Literature: Icons and Fallen Idols* (1983); *La voz personal en la prosa medieval hispánica* (1989); *Las autoras medievales castellanas a la luz de las últimas investigaciones* (1995), and he included Teresa in the list of authors he discussed in his paper on the attitude of authors to their readers, given to the opening plenary session of the 2009 Queen Mary University of London Medieval Hispanic Research Seminar Colloquium three months before his death.

¹ Amador de los Ríos, José, *Historia crítica de la literatura española VII* (Madrid, 1865).

² Serrano y Sanz, Manuel, *Apuntes para una biblioteca de las escritoras españolas desde el año 1440 al 1833* (Madrid, 1903-5).

³ *Arboleda de los enfermos y Admiración operum dey* ed. L.J. Hutton, (Madrid, 1967).

⁴ D. Seidenspinner-Nuñez, *The Writings of Teresa de Cartagena* (Cambridge, 1998).

⁵ A. Deyermond, "'El convento de dolencias': the Works of Teresa de Cartagena," *Journal of Hispanic Philology* 1 (1976), 19-29. Hutton had published an article in English on Teresa's spirituality in 1956, but this was in a theological journal, L.J. Hutton, 'Teresa de Cartagena: A Study in Castilian Spirituality,' *Theology Today* 12 (1956), 477-83. It does not appear to have come generally to the attention of medieval hispanicists; it is not cited by Deyermond in his 1976 article.

Ronald Surtz is another writer on Teresa de Cartagena, who has discussed the imagery used in her works⁶ and whether she can be considered a feminist writer⁷. There is a chapter on her in his 1997 book, *Writing Women in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain: the Mothers of Saint Teresa of Avila*.

Dayle Seidenspinner-Núñez, in addition to her translation, which is accompanied by a biographical study and an interpretive essay, has written on gender issues in Teresa's works⁸. In 2004 she published jointly with Yonsoo Kim the article *Historicizing Teresa: Reflections on new documents regarding sor Teresa de Cartagena*, which shed new light on Teresa's life and which is discussed in detail in chapter 3.

The Spanish historian, María-Milagros Rivera Garretas, has also written extensively on Teresa de Cartagena, generally from a feminist viewpoint. She has discussed Teresa's second work in the context of the late medieval Castilian pro- and anti-feminist literature⁹, considered Teresa's works as the record of a feminine journey to God through self-knowledge and self-love¹⁰ and her relationship to other women writers¹¹. Her 2007 article, *Teresa de Cartagena vivía en 1478*, is discussed in chapter 3. Another Spanish writer, Carmen Marimón Llorca, in her book *Prosistas*

⁶ R.E. Surtz, 'Image Patterns in Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los enfermos*' in G. Paolini (ed.) *LA CHISPA '87: Selected Proceedings* (New Orleans, 1987), pp. 91-108.

⁷ R.E. Surtz, 'El llamado feminismo de Teresa de Cartagena' in *Studia hispanica medievalia: IV Jornadas internacionales de literatura española medieval* (Buenos Aires, 1993), pp. 199-207.

⁸ D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'El solo me leyó': Gendered hermeneutics and subversive poetics in *Admiración operum Dey* of Teresa de Cartagena,' *Medievalia* 15 (1993), 14-23; D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'But I suffer not a woman to teach': two women writers in late-medieval Spain' in C. Davies and J. Whetnall (eds.), *Hers Ancient and Modern: Women's Writing in Spain and Brazil* (Manchester, 1997), pp. 1-14.

⁹ M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'La *Admiración de las obras de Dios* de Teresa de Cartagena y la querrela de las mujeres' in C. Segura Graño (ed.) *La voz del silencio, I: fuentes directas para la historia de las mujeres (siglos VIII-XVIII)* (Madrid, 1992), pp. 277-99.

¹⁰ M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'Teresa de Cartagena: la infinitud del cuerpo,' *Acta Historica et Archaeologica Mediaevalia* 1, no. 20-21 (1999-2000), 755-66.

¹¹ M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'Teresa de Cartagena: escritura en relación' in Á. Muñoz Fernández (ed.) *La escritura femenina: de leer a escribir II* (Madrid, 2000) 95-100.

*castellanas medievales*¹² looked at the works of Leonor López de Córdoba and Teresa de Cartagena in the context of fifteenth century Spanish views of women. María Mar Cortés Timoner examined preaching in Teresa's writings¹³ and her book *Teresa de Cartagena, la primera escritora mística en lengua castellana*¹⁴ argued that there are mystical elements in Teresa's works; I do not agree, as discussed in chapter 8.

To date the majority of articles on Teresa have dealt with feminist aspects of her works and her creation of a 'self' or 'voice'¹⁵. In other articles, Teresa's imagery was examined by Deborah Ellis¹⁶, and her specific use of botanical metaphor by John Moore¹⁷. Carmen García considered the classification of Teresa's works and her use of rhetorical principles¹⁸ and Jennifer Corry and María Cruz Muriel Tapia have

¹² Alicante, 1990.

¹³ M.M. Cortés Timoner, 'La predicación en palabras de mujer: Teresa de Cartagena y Juana de la Cruz' in Margarita Freixas and Silvia Iriso (eds.), *Actas del VIII Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval* (Santander, 2000), pp. 571-81.

¹⁴ Malaga, 2004.

¹⁵ J. Marichal, 'El derecho a una voz propia: vislumbres del ensayo en la prosa del siglo XV' in Alan Deyermond (ed.) *Historia y crítica de la literatura española I: Edad Media* (Barcelona, 1979), pp. 438-42; A. Redondo Goicoechea, 'La retórica del yo-mujer en las tres escritoras: Teresa de Cartagena, Teresa de Jesús y María de Zayas,' *Compás de Letras* 1 (1992), pp. 49-63; E.T. Howe, 'Sor Teresa de Cartagena and Entendimiento,' *Romanische Forschungen* 108 (1996), 133-45; R. Quispe Agnoli, 'El espacio medieval femenino: entre la escritura y el silencio en *Admiración operum Dey* de Teresa de Cartagena,' *Anuario Medieval* 5 (1993), 107-25; R. Quispe Agnoli, "Anse maravillado que muger haga tratados': Defensa y concepción de la escritura en Teresa de Cartagena' in José Manuel Lucía Megías (ed.) *Actas del VI Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval* (Alcalá de Henares, 1997), pp. 1227-39; M. Ochoa de Eribe, 'El yo polémico de Teresa de Cartagena en la *Admiración de las obras de Dios*: las argucias del débil por entrar en el canon,' *Letras de Deusto* 29 (1999), 179-88; G. Rodríguez Rivas, 'La autografía como 'exemplum': la *Arboleda de los enfermos* de Teresa de Cartagena' in J. Romera Castillo (ed.) *Actas del II Seminario Internacional del Instituto de Semiótica Literaria y Teatral* (Madrid, 1993), pp. 329-37; J.T. Snow, 'Speaking through Many Voices: Polyphony in the Writings of Teresa de Cartagena' in I.A. Corfis and R. Harris-Northall (eds.), *Medieval Iberia: Changing Societies and Cultures in Contact and Transition* (Woodbridge, 2007), pp. 16-29; R. Trillia, 'Teresa de Cartagena: Agent of Her Own Salvation,' *Revista canadiense de estudios hispánicos* 32, no. 1 (2007), 51-70.

¹⁶ D.S. Ellis, 'Unifying Imagery in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena,' *Journal of Hispanic Philology* 17 (1992), 45-53.

¹⁷ J.K. Moore, 'Conventional Botany or Unorthodox Organics?: on the Meollo/Corteza Metaphor in *Admiración operum Dey* of Teresa de Cartagena,' *Romance Notes*, 44.1 (2003), 3-12.

¹⁸ C. García, 'Los tratados de Teresa de Cartagena dentro de la evolución de la epístola' in Andrew M. Beresford (ed.) *"Quien hubiese tal ventura": Medieval Hispanic Studies in Honour of Alan Deyermond* (London, 1997), pp. 149-57.

looked at Teresa's use of humility tropes¹⁹. Those writing on Teresa's treatment of suffering include Joan Cammarata²⁰ and Encarnación Juárez²¹. Rodríguez has considered *Arboleda* as ascetic literature and as exemplary autobiography²².

The last decade has seen an increased interest in Teresa de Cartagena as a topic of research, with several doctoral theses having been published. Clara Castro Ponce's thesis provided a new critical edition of the works²³, and she has also published articles comparing Teresa de Cartagena and Juana Inés de la Cruz as intellectuals²⁴ and looking at *imitatio Christi* in Teresa's works²⁵. Mary Frieden analysed *Admiración* for its adherence to humanist rhetorical techniques²⁶. Theses with a feminist approach are those of Denise-Renee Barbaret who examined Teresa's writings in the context of fifteenth century Spanish texts denigrating or defending women²⁷, and of Kerry Kautzman who examined Teresa's construction of herself as 'Constructed-Self' and author²⁸, while Mary Baldrige looked at the gender strategies and feminine spirituality of Constanza de Castilla, using Catherine of Sienna and

¹⁹ J.M. Corry, 'Some Observations on Teresa de Cartagena's Humble Disclaimers,' *Quaderni Ibero-Americani* 95 (2004), 5-14; M. Cruz Muriel Tapia, *Antifeminismo y subestimación de la mujer en la literatura medieval castellana* (Caceres, 1991), pp. 277-83.

²⁰ J.F. Cammarata, 'Teresa de Cartagena: Writing from a Silent Space in a Silent World,' *Monographic Review/Revista Monográfica* 16 (2000), 38-51.

²¹ E. Juárez, 'The Autobiography of the Aching Body in Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los enfermos*' in S.L. Snyder, B.J. Brueggemann, and R. Garland-Thompson (eds.), *Disability Studies: Enabling the Humanities* (New York, 2002), pp. 131-43.

²² G. Rodríguez Rivas, 'La *Arboleda de los Enfermos*, de Teresa de Cartagena, literatura ascética en el siglo XV,' *Entemu* III (1991), 117-30; Rodríguez Rivas, 'La autobiographia' como 'exemplum'.

²³ C. Castro-Ponce, 'Teresa de Cartagena: *Arboleda de las Enfermas, Admiración Operum Dei, edición crítica singular*' (Brown Univ., Ph.D. thesis, 2001).

²⁴ C. Castro-Ponce, 'El sí de las hermanas: la escritura y lo intelectual en la obra de Teresa de Cartagena y Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz,' *Cincinnati Romance Review* 18 (1999), 15-21.

²⁵ C. Castro-Ponce, '*Imitatio Christi* in the Writings of Teresa de Cartagena,' *Magistra* 9, no. 2 (2003), 55-65.

²⁶ M.E. Frieden, 'Epistolarity in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena and Leonor López de Córdoba' (Missouri-Colombia, Ph.D. thesis, 2001).

²⁷ D.-R. Barbaret, 'Weak Womanly Understanding: Writers of Women from the Arcipreste de Talavera to Teresa de Cartagena' (University of Massachusetts, Ph.D. thesis, 1999).

²⁸ K. Kautzman, 'The Parallel and Intersecting Planes of Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los Enfermos and Admiración operum Dei*' (University of Cincinnati, Ph.D. thesis, 2003).

Teresa as comparators²⁹. She concluded that Constanza and Catherine were very similar in their approach, while Teresa was in many ways different and did not participate in the 'feminization of Christianity'. Yonsoo Kim³⁰ studied Teresa de Cartagena's writing on suffering in the historical context of medieval medical science and in the context of modern sociological understanding of how societies regard illness and treat invalids. She also looked at the position of women in fifteenth century Castile in the light of contemporary literature and discussed how Teresa and other women writers used medical discourse to incorporate themselves in society by giving a universal meaning to their individual sufferings. In a later article Kim considered Teresa's writings in the light of the work of the twentieth century philosopher, Emmanuel Levinas³¹.

In July 2009 I received a copy of the 2008 thesis of Miriam Majuelo Apiñániz³². The main purpose of her thesis is stated to be to expand biographical information about Teresa beyond what is to be found in the existing literature in order to provide '*una lectura longitudinal, trasversal y estratigráfica de la vida de Teresa...*'³³. To do this she took a historical approach, searching widely for documentary sources which proved to be few in number³⁴, and a literary approach through a detailed analysis of Teresa's works and comparison with contemporaries. She consulted many of the same genealogical sources that I consulted in 2007 and 2008. My conclusions from these materials are discussed in chapter 3; as indicated in that chapter, Majuelo did

²⁹ M. Baldrige, 'Christian Woman, Woman Christ: The Feminization of Humanity in Constanza de Castilla, Catherine of Sienna and Teresa de Cartagena' (U of Tennessee, Ph.D. thesis, 2004).

³⁰ Y. Kim, 'Dolor y sufrimiento en la temprana Edad Moderna peninsular: *Arboleda de los Enfermos y Amiraçion Operum Dey*' (Boston College Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, Ph.D. thesis, 2006).

³¹ Y. Kim, 'Transformative Crisis and Spiritual Development: Teresa de Cartagena,' *Ámbitos*, no. 21 (2009), pp. 11-9.

³² M. Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena. La obra de una mujer castellana del siglo XV' (Universidad del País Vasco, Ph.D. thesis, 2008).

³³ *Ibid.*, p. 687.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 23-7

not reach exactly the same conclusions as I did. Again, there are many similarities between her analysis of Teresa's works and the analysis in this thesis; at least some points of agreement and disagreement are indicated at relevant points in this thesis. Perhaps the most significant difference is her fairly brief discussion of the effects of Teresa's *conversa* status³⁵, in which she disagrees with those who detect crypto-Jewish influences in Teresa's writings and sees her as an orthodox third generation Christian; the last chapter of this thesis looks at possible *converso* influences in greater detail and concludes there are some aspects of Teresa's writing which are difficult to explain otherwise. Overall, this thesis has a narrower focus than Majuelo's work, concentrating on Teresa's theology and spirituality of disability.

Methodology

The main basis for this research has been a detailed literary and theological analysis of Teresa de Cartagena's writings. For this, I mainly used the printed edition of her works by Hutton but also had a photographic copy of the original manuscript of the only known copy of her works, which I used to check his reading of key words and phrases. I visited the Escorial library to examine this original manuscript, looking particularly for palaeographic information and marginalia and also looking at the works that her two books are bound in with. Before analysing her works I tried to discover as much as possible about the historical situation in which they were written, using secondary literature. For each of her books I have analysed the structure, including considering evidence of deliberate use of established rhetorical techniques, and her use of imagery. She makes extensive use of Scriptural quotations to support her arguments. Hutton identified most of these: I have checked all Hutton's identifications, corrected the few that were incorrect, and have compared Teresa's

³⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 590-602 – just over 12 pages out of 767.

Castilian to the Jerome Vulgate Latin. I have done the same for Patristic sources in her writing. I have also identified places where her words echo or allude to a Scripture passage without an express citation and identified the source, and again compared her language to the Jerome Vulgate. I have used writings by members of her family, her uncle Alonso de Cartagena and her cousin Fray Íñigo de Mendoza, as a comparison on certain issues, and have also made comparisons with the writings of contemporary female Spanish religious writers.

Teresa de Cartagena came from a prominent family, and her family background seemed to be an important factor in understanding her writings. A great deal of archival research on her family is published in Serrano and Cantera Burgos. I also undertook genealogical research, primarily in the extensive Salazar y Castro collection of genealogical documents in the archives of the RAH. This is a large collection of manuscripts, both original and copies, relating to genealogical matters made by Luis de Salazar y Castro (1658-1734). The entire collection has been catalogued in a searchable PDF file, which I used to identify documents of potential interest for examination. The documents I consulted were not dated and were in a number of different hands, and the information they contained was not always consistent. The results of this research are recorded in chapter 3. I judged the information from these documents in light of that from other sources, mainly the information from archival sources recorded by Cantera Burgos and Serrano and that given by three documents discussed at length in chapter 3, two papal petitions relating to a request for permission for Teresa to transfer from the Poor Clares and a document relating to her father's will. I also visited Burgos in order to see her home setting, including a visit to the church of the Poor Clare convent where she began her

religious life and a visit to the public areas of Las Huelgas convent where she probably spent most of her adult life (both are still operating convents so many areas are closed to the public). During a stay in Salamanca to take an intensive Spanish course at the university I used free time to explore possible places she could have stayed while studying there. I had been considering another trip to Spain to check whether there were any relevant documents in Burgos archives in addition to those discussed by Serrano and Cantera Burgos when I received the Majuelo thesis discussed above. She states (p. 24) that she looked in these (and other) archives, but did not find anything relevant.

Structure of this thesis

This thesis is in three parts. Section I provides background to Teresa de Cartagena, historical, political, social and familial. Section II contains the detailed analysis of her works. Section III uses this background and analysis to consider her approaches to her three forms of disability, in particular her theological and spiritual understanding of that disability.

Section I contains three chapters. Chapter 1 is an overview of the relevant period of Spanish history, concentrating on events in Castile which could have affected Teresa's family as well as Teresa herself. Teresa lived in a period of political instability and violence, which is echoed in her works. If the date for her writings put forward in this thesis is correct, she was writing in the early part of the reign of the Catholic Monarchs which was characterised by a struggle between Isabella and her half sister for the throne. Other scholars have suggested earlier dates, which would coincide with the civil unrest during the reign of Enrique IV. Although we do not know when she died, she probably did not live to experience the establishment of a strong

monarchy under Isabella and Ferdinand and the final unification of the kingdom with the conquest of Granada. A section of this chapter deals with Burgos in this period, as her family were based in that town and active in its life and politics, and to the best of our knowledge she spent her whole life there. Chapter 2 specifically deals with the history of Jews and converted Jews (*conversos*) in Spain in the relevant period, because Teresa came from a leading *converso* family and the final chapter of this thesis examines whether this was an influence on her writings. Chapter 3 deals with Teresa's life and her family. Although Teresa came from a prominent family, as so often with medieval women there is little hard information about her or her life, and the few sources contain conflicting information. This chapter examines both the internal clues to Teresa's life and circumstances from her works, and documentary sources which give us some information on her. The information from some genealogical sources that Teresa was betrothed to '*el señor de Ormazá*' is followed up with an investigation of the potential candidates for this role. On the other hand, a great deal is known about her grandfather, uncle and father, so we can put together a lot of information about her family. The second half of the chapter deals with these leading members of a politically and ecclesiastically powerful family. The final section looks at the relationship between the family and two very powerful people in the early fifteenth century, Alvaro de Luna, the 'uncrowned king' during much of the reign of Juan II, and his uncle, Pope Benedict XIII, the last of the Avignon popes before the ending of the Great Schism.

In the second section I analyse the works of Teresa de Cartagena from various viewpoints in order to gain a comprehensive view of her thinking and sources. Chapter 4 is an analysis of the structure of and imagery used in her first book,

Arboleda de los Enfermos, and chapter 5 is a similar analysis of her second book, *Admiración operum Dey*. Chapter 6 examines her use of Scripture. I have found the source for each of her express quotations, and compared her quotation to the Jerome Vulgate Latin. Appendices A and B list these quotations. There are also indirect references to Scripture, which are identified and listed in Appendices C and D, again with the relevant Vulgate Latin. Chapter 7 looks at her use of other sources. There are many direct quotations cited as authority, which are mainly from the Latin fathers and some from the liturgy. These sources are identified and Teresa's Spanish compared with the Latin of the original in Appendices E and F. This chapter also identifies and considers other sources which are referred to in her writing, including scientific information and general knowledge and proverbs.

Section III looks at Teresa's approach to disability. In this section 'disability' is used to describe an aspect of an individual which would be regarded by their society as adversely affecting that individual in some way. Teresa can be regarded as triply disabled in her society; by her deafness, by her gender (as an author) and by her race. These are discussed in turn in the chapters in this section. Chapter 8 looks at Teresa's treatment of physical disability and suffering. While this is the focus of her first book, *Admiración* also touches on this topic. The chapter begins, after discussing the modern distinction between impairment and disability, by considering possible causes for Teresa's deafness, how she dealt with it and whether, in her community of Cistercian nuns, that physical impairment would in practice be a disability. I then look at medieval approaches to physical suffering, in particular theological views of suffering and of the body including *imitatio Christi*. The particular relationship between suffering and female spirituality in the late Middle Ages is also discussed. I

next examine Teresa's approach to bodily suffering, physical, theological and spiritual, and compare it to the previously discussed medieval approaches. In particular, I consider whether *imitatio Christi* can be found in her writings. Chapter 9 deals with her approach to gender, which is the primary focus of her second book. The chapter begins with some background on classical and medieval views of women (as seen by those who wrote, namely literate, powerful males who were predominantly high ranking ecclesiastics), and in particular the approaches to the role of the Virgin. I also look at late medieval Spanish views of women as expressed in the literary *querrela de las mujeres*, and consider evidence as to the general level of literacy among women in this period. The first main section of this chapter deals with the issue of authorship and authority as those terms were understood in the late Middle Ages in relation to Teresa's act of writing. The next section covers a related topic, medieval epistemology, as Teresa is very specific about her source of knowledge. This raises the question of mysticism, as most medieval women religious writers expressly relied on mystical experiences and revelations as their source of knowledge and authority. I examine whether Teresa would have been considered a mystic by the standards of her day, and whether she would have considered herself a mystic. A related topic is that of the humility topoi, declarations of inferiority and insufficiency found in the works of Teresa and most other female (and some male) writers of the medieval and early modern periods. The next section of this chapter looks at how Teresa deals with gender roles and stereotypes and her theology of gender. Finally, her approach to gender and authority are compared to those of three contemporary female Spanish writers. The final chapter deals with her disability in her time and society as a *conversa*. Unlike the other two disabilities, she says nothing expressly about this. The chapter begins with a short overview of the history of the

term 'race' and the controversial issue of whether Spanish treatment of *conversos* in the second half of the fifteenth century can be considered to be 'racist'. I also look at views on the theory put forward by the Spanish historian Américo Castro that *conversos* contributed a characteristic '*converso* voice' to Spanish literature. The next part of the chapter looks at things in Teresa's writings which could be understood as relating to *converso* issues, followed by a section which considers whether we can gain information from things on which Teresa is unexpectedly silent, 'unexpected' in the context of most late medieval religious writing. Next, Teresa's theological understanding of her suffering is compared to the Jewish view of suffering which would have been known to at least her grandfather in his years as a rabbi. Finally, I look at recent research on the development of a specifically *converso* theology in the middle of the fifteenth century by Alonso de Cartagena, Teresa's uncle, and by Juan de Torquemada in response to the anti-*converso* sentiment in Spain in that period and examine whether there is any trace of that theology in Teresa's writings.

CHAPTER 1

SPAIN IN THE 15TH CENTURY

Political background

At the time Teresa de Cartagena was born there were five kingdoms in the Spanish peninsula; the Christian kingdoms of Castile-León, Aragon, Navarre and Portugal, and the Moslem emirate of Granada. She and her family were citizens of Castile, which during her life became the dominant power in the peninsula¹. About the time Teresa was writing her works, the crowns of Castile and Aragon were united as a result of the marriage of Isabella of Castile and Ferdinand of Aragon in 1469, Isabella's successful claim to the throne of Castile upon the death of her half-brother Enrique IV in 1474 and Ferdinand's accession to the Aragonese crown in 1479². We do not know whether Teresa was still alive when the armies of the Catholic Monarchs conquered Granada in 1492.

Castile in the fifteenth century

In order to understand the politics of Castile in the fifteenth century it is necessary to go back to the middle of the fourteenth century. Alfonso XI of Castile (1312-50) died from the Black Death in 1350, while laying siege to Gibraltar. His only surviving legitimate son was Pedro, then aged 15³, who became Pedro I of Castile (1350-69). Alfonso had openly neglected his wife, María of Portugal, and son in favour of his mistress, Leonor de Guzmán, and their children. It is not surprising that after Alfonso's death Queen María extracted her revenge by imprisoning and then

¹ Hillgarth ii, 3.

² J. Edwards, *The Spain of the Catholic Monarchs: 1474-1520* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 38-9.

³ Hillgarth i, 375.

arranging for the murder of her rival⁴. The eldest surviving illegitimate children were twin sons, Enrique and Fadrique, whom Alfonso had made Count of Trastámara and Master of Santiago respectively. Queen María's relative, the Duke of Alburquerque, arranged for Pedro to marry Blanche of Navarre⁵. A few days after the marriage Pedro rejected his wife and returned to his mistress. Alburquerque, Queen María, Enrique and other nobles, encouraged by the Pope, used this rejection to justify a revolt in 1354, which was finally crushed by Pedro two years later⁶. Pedro then embarked on a lengthy war with Aragon. Enrique sided with Aragon and attempted to invade Castile in 1360 and again in 1366. Pedro sought the help of the English, who defeated Enrique but left Castile when Pedro did not pay them. Enrique again invaded with French troops. Pedro was defeated by this force, then betrayed to Enrique who murdered him⁷. Pedro is often called 'Pedro the Cruel'; he was probably no worse than most of his contemporary monarchs, but Enrique's chroniclers successfully painted this image of the deposed king⁸. One of the allegations made against Pedro was that he unduly favoured Jews⁹. The effects on the Jewish population of Castile of the anti-Jewish rhetoric used by Enrique in the struggle for power will be discussed in chapter 2.

Enrique II (1369-79) spent a lot of his reign fighting off various challenges to his position¹⁰. He had to buy loyalty from his supporters with lavish grants of land and urban lordships, the '*mercedes enriqueñas*'. This policy weakened the Crown financially and created a number of very powerful families who remained dominant

⁴ C. Estow, *Pedro the Cruel of Castile: 1350-1369* (Leiden, 1995), pp. 21-2, 125-6.

⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 25, 134-5.

⁶ Hillgarth i, 376-7.

⁷ Hillgarth i, 377-81.

⁸ Hillgarth i, 373.

⁹ Estow, *Pedro the Cruel*, p. 155.

¹⁰ Hillgarth i, 386-8.

players in Spanish politics for many generations¹¹. It also forced his Trastámara dynasty to rely on increased taxes, which made royal tax collectors, often Jews, very unpopular¹². Enrique II was succeeded by his son Juan I (1379-90) and grandson Enrique III (1390-1406). This period of Trastámara rule was neither peaceful nor pleasant; besides the effects of the civil and foreign wars, there were repeated outbreaks of plague, inflation and widespread unemployment. Juan I tried to take control of Portugal, but was severely defeated at the battle of Aljubarrota, which weakened Castile militarily and economically¹³. Enrique III was a child of eleven when he succeeded to the throne. During his minority there was a struggle for power between members of the higher nobility, and it was during this power vacuum that the anti-Jewish riots of 1391, discussed in chapter 2, took place. This struggle led to a reduction in the power of the royal princes and the rise of the lesser nobility and of 'professional' royal advisers, typically friars, prelates and lawyers¹⁴.

Enrique III died at the end of 1406, leaving as his heir Juan, not yet two years old. Enrique's will appointed his queen and his brother, the Infante Fernando, as co-regents, and also appointed tutors for his son's education¹⁵. Fernando became the dominant regent, and remained as regent until his death in 1416, even after he was elected king of Aragon¹⁶. Juan II was declared of age to rule in 1419, aged fourteen. His long reign (1406-54) was a troubled one, not least because he showed no interest

¹¹ S. Barton, *A History of Spain* (Basingstoke, 2004), p. 87.

¹² Hillgarth ii, 55-6, 133-4.

¹³ Hillgarth i, 385, 394-7.

¹⁴ Hillgarth i, 401-3.

¹⁵ Hillgarth i, 405. One of these tutors was Teresa de Cartagena's grandfather.

¹⁶ J. Torres Fontes, 'The Regency of Don Ferdinand of Antequera', in R. Highfield (ed.), *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516; Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 154-5. One area of conflict was over the treatment of Jews and Moslems, *ibid.*, pp. 152-3.

in governing and preferred to enjoy himself¹⁷. Confronting this lethargic ruler were the energetic sons of Fernando, the Aragonese Infantes, and an increasingly powerful nobility. In 1420 the Infante Enrique forcibly seized the king and held him captive, although Juan managed to escape after four months. This escape was organised by Juan's *privado* (favourite) Alvaro de Luna¹⁸. Juan II probably survived for so long because for most of his reign Castile was in reality governed by de Luna, a skilful politician. Despite the opposition of the Infantes and the section of the nobility with whom he had not forged alliances, Alvaro de Luna ruled Juan II, and through him the kingdom, most of the time from 1420 until his fall from power and execution in 1453. Although the Infantes were finally defeated in 1445, there was still no peace as a new challenge to Juan came from his heir, Enrique, and Enrique's *privado* Juan Pacheco, Marquis of Villena¹⁹.

The rule of Enrique IV (1454-75) was also troubled. Like his father, he relied on his favourites for support and guidance²⁰. Like Pedro I, his posthumous reputation, in his case as being impotent and a bad ruler, was shaped by the propaganda of the successful regime which succeeded him on a dubious basis, that of Isabella and Ferdinand²¹. Enrique's first marriage to Blanche of Navarre was nullified as being unconsummated, and he had been married for six years to his second wife, Juana of Portugal, before she bore a daughter, also called Juana. When Enrique replaced Villena with Beltrán de la Cueva as favourite, Villena began to spread rumours that this daughter was in fact fathered by Beltrán; hence the epithet *la Beltraneja* which

¹⁷ F.P. de Guzmán, *Pen Portraits of Illustrious Castilians*, trans. Marie Gillette and Loretta Zehngut (Washington DC, 2003), p. 54.

¹⁸ Hillgarth ii, 312.

¹⁹ J.F. O'Callaghan, *A History of Medieval Spain* (Ithaca NY, London, 1975), pp. 562-5.

²⁰ Hillgarth ii, 323-4.

²¹ Hillgarth ii, 317-8.

became attached to her²². Led by Villena, in 1464 the nobles forced Enrique to disown his daughter and recognise his half-brother Alfonso as heir. A few months later Enrique repudiated these actions, leading to his deposition in effigy and the crowning of Alfonso by rebellious nobles at Avila in June 1465 and the outbreak of civil war. The balance of power between the two sides changed several times, but the revolt effectively came to an end when Alfonso died in July 1468. Although Enrique's opponents tried to promote the claims of Alfonso's sister Isabella, she soon realised that she could not win and recognised Enrique as king, although she refused to recognise Juana as his heir. Enrique agreed to recognise Isabella as his heir, and she agreed not to marry without the king's consent²³.

Villena, now back in power, proposed first that Isabella should be married to the elderly king of Portugal, Afonso V, then, when she refused that match, the heir to the French throne. However Isabella, probably understanding that either of these marriages would take her out contention for the throne of Castile, preferred to marry her cousin Ferdinand. She did this in 1469, without Enrique's permission and with a forged papal bull dispensing with the obstacle of consanguinity. In response Enrique disinherited her and proclaimed Juana as his legitimate daughter²⁴. Immediately after Enrique's death in December 1474, Isabella had herself proclaimed queen. Juana's main support came from Portugal, as Afonso V now proposed to marry Juana. He invaded Castile. Although at first things went badly for Isabella and Ferdinand, they eventually triumphed and in 1479 Portugal signed a peace treaty²⁵.

²² O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 572-3.

²³ *Ibid.*, pp. 573-4.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 574-5.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 575-7.

Political institutions

The fourteenth and fifteenth centuries in Spain saw the rise of the political power of the monarchy through the centralising of authority, which resulted in the decline in power of the municipalities and regional authorities. This process was more advanced in this period in Castile than in Aragon²⁶.

Kingship

In the Middle Ages there were two theories of monarchy prevalent in Western Europe, including Spain. One was that, while divine power came from God, the king received the right to use that power from the people; or at least from the class of powerful nobles who "elected" the ruler and who, in theory, had the power to replace him if he was guilty of misrule. The second was the absolutist theory of the divine right of kings; the king was chosen directly by God and must not be opposed, let alone replaced, by his people however unjustly he ruled²⁷. For Spanish writers supporting the first theory, the underlying relationship between the monarch and the people was contractual, and they appealed to Visigothic practice as its historical basis²⁸. While this view remained strong in Aragon during the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries, the Castilian monarchs with increasing success advanced the absolutist theory, which became the dominant theory under the Catholic Monarchs²⁹. The supporters of the absolutist theory appealed to Old Testament theories of kingship, and to the developing historical myths which pushed Castilian history back to pre-Roman times³⁰. Most of these supporters were university educated lawyers, the *letrados*, many of whom were *conversos*, and two of the leading writers on both

²⁶ Hillgarth ii, 190-3.

²⁷ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, p. 580.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 581-2.

²⁹ Hillgarth ii, 193.

³⁰ Hillgarth ii, 204.

absolute monarchy and the antiquity of Castile were Teresa de Cartagena's grandfather and uncle, Pablo de Santa María and Alonso de Cartagena³¹. The authority of the monarch was reinforced by the introduction of uniform codes of law to replace a patchwork of local laws³², and the introduction of a system of royal courts with professional, trained judges³³.

The Cortes

The rise of absolute monarchy in Castile during this period was matched by the decrease in power of the *cortes*, the representative body of the three estates³⁴. After the 1385 crisis, the *cortes* insisted on inspecting the royal accounts, granted a subsidy much less than the sum the king had asked for and insisted on controlling the administration of this subsidy. From this high point the power of the *cortes* to control royal subsidies declined, until in 1432 it was decreed that no non-noble could be a member of the *cortes*. As the nobles did not pay taxes, this had the effect of making the *cortes* a compliant source of money for the king³⁵.

The Royal Council

In the early Middle Ages the king of Castile ruled with the assistance of his court, his personal household and leading nobles and clergy³⁶. In 1385 Juan II, at the request of the *cortes* following the humiliating defeat by the Portuguese, set up a royal council (*consejo real*) independent of his household. The *cortes* intended that this council should be able to represent their interests and that it should be composed of twelve

³¹ H. Nader, *The Mendoza Family in the Spanish Renaissance 1350-1550* (New Brunswick NJ, 1979), pp. 21-4.

³² J. Ray, *The Sephardic Frontier: the Reconquista and the Jewish Community in Medieval Iberia* (Ithaca, NY, 2006), pp. 77-8.

³³ Barton, *History of Spain*, p. 79.

³⁴ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 584-6.

³⁵ Hillgarth ii, 195-6.

³⁶ L.G.de Valdeavellano, *Curso de historia de las instituciones españolas: De los orígenes al final de la Edad Media* (Madrid, 1968), p. 450.

persons, four from each of the three estates. However, the representatives of the *cortes* were quickly replaced by *letrados*, who supported the king³⁷. The membership of the council varied, tending to increase as great nobles and clergy insisted on membership, reaching an unwieldy 65 by 1426. An attempt to reform the council by returning it to twelve members was made by Enrique IV, but this reform was only successfully achieved by the Catholic Monarchs, who ensured *letrado* dominance by allotting nine of the twelve places to the lawyers³⁸.

The municipalities

By the fourteenth century the control of the cities and towns of Castile had passed into the hands of an urban elite, the *caballeros villanos*³⁹. Beginning with Alfonso XI, the monarchy increased its control over municipal government. He introduced the system of *regidores*, appointed by the crown from among the elite of that city, who then elected the municipal officials. The *regidores* increasingly came to regard the post as family property and their right to appoint officials as a source of income, a trade various *cortes* in the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries tried to prevent. Royal control over the cities was also increased by the system of *corregidores*, royal officials sent to correct abuses and to deal with factional disputes. At first only used when needed, these officials gradually became permanent appointments, representing royal interests and with the power to intervene in municipal government and judicial systems⁴⁰.

History and government of Burgos

As discussed in chapter 3, Teresa de Cartagena probably spent virtually all of her life in Burgos, and her family had been one of the leading Jewish families in the city up to

³⁷ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 583-4.

³⁸ Valdeavellano, *Curso de historia*, pp. 458-60.

³⁹ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, p. 447.

⁴⁰ Valdeavellano, *Curso de historia*, pp. 549-50.

her grandfather's conversion and its leading *converso* family thereafter. Like other Castilian cities, by the fifteenth century Burgos was ruled by a council of *regidores* appointed by the crown, amongst them Teresa's father, Pedro de Cartagena⁴¹. Members of her family managed to hold a significant number of leading positions in the government of Burgos throughout the fifteenth century, and a great-grandson of her father was a *regidor* in the first quarter of the sixteenth century⁴².

Burgos had its beginning when a castle was located on a hill near the Arlanzón river on what was then the frontier with the Moslem empire in the late ninth century. In the eleventh century it became an episcopal seat and began the trading activities which made it a major commercial centre by the fourteenth century⁴³. As a major political and commercial centre, Burgos had close relations with the monarchy and the political elite of Castile. As a result, Burgos was involved in and affected by the political upheavals and civil wars described above⁴⁴. At least part of the coronation ceremonies of several kings of Castile took place in Burgos, including those of Alfonso XI, Enrique II, Juan I and Enrique III. Burgos was one place where the *cortes* met. It was during such a meeting that Juan II's favourite Alvaro de Luna was arrested in 1453, as described in chapter 3, before being taken to Valladolid for trial and execution⁴⁵. Pedro I was born in Burgos, and baptised by its bishop in Burgos cathedral. However, as king he did not have a close association with the city,

⁴¹ As were his grandson Alonso de Cartagena, second son of Pedro's eldest son (who predeceased his father) and his eldest son, Pedro; J.A. Bonanchia Hernando and H. Casado Alonso, 'La segunda mitad del siglo XIV y el siglo XV', in J. Valdeón (ed.), *Burgos en la Edad Media* (Valladolid, 1984), chart at p. 400. This would indicate that the post was treated as de Cartagena family property.

⁴² *Ibid.*, p. 408 and chart at p. 400.

⁴³ T.F. Ruiz, *Crisis and Continuity: Land and Town in Late Medieval Castile* (Philadelphia PA, 1994), p. 182.

⁴⁴ Bonanchia and Casado, 'La segunda mitad', p. 223.

⁴⁵ Hillgarth ii, 314-5.

preferring Seville⁴⁶. Burgos was very involved in the Trastámara war of succession, being the first major city taken by Enrique in his 1366 invasion and the place where he was crowned⁴⁷. The revolt of the league of nobles against Enrique IV, led by the former favourite Villena after his fall from power, began in Burgos in September 1454. Burgos fell to Villena in the 1465-8 civil war, then came back to Enrique IV⁴⁸. In the war of succession that followed the death of Enrique IV, Burgos at first tended to support Juana. However, by the time Burgos castle was besieged by Ferdinand in July 1475 it was clear that the bulk of the population of Burgos supported Isabella, and the defenders of the castle surrendered after four months⁴⁹.

Social background

The Black Death and its aftermath

Like the rest of Western Europe, Castile was affected in the fourteenth century by repeated outbreaks of plague. Alfonso XI's premature death from plague may have contributed to the unstable political situation which ended in civil war between his legitimate heir and illegitimate sons. There is an absence of statistical information and of contemporary descriptions of the effect of the Black Death, but what evidence there is shows a significant loss of population and diminution in seignorial income⁵⁰. As in the rest of Europe, the shortage of labour resulted in inflated wage demands; to restrain this inflationary pressure the government sought, generally with limited

⁴⁶ V. de la Cruz, 'Personajes ilustres medievales', in S. Nebreda Perez (ed.), *Historia de Burgos II Edad Media* (2 vols, Burgos, 1987), ii, 408-9, 412.

⁴⁷ Hillgarth i, 380-1.

⁴⁸ Hillgarth ii, 333-6.

⁴⁹ Edwards, *Spain of the Catholic Monarchs*, pp. 30-2.

⁵⁰ Ruiz, *Crisis and Continuity*, pp. 318-22.

success, to regulate prices and to prevent the free movement of labour⁵¹. In Castile the labour shortage encouraged a dramatic growth in sheep rearing, which required much less manpower than arable agriculture⁵², with the economic effects discussed below (pp. 29-30). The effects of popular attribution of the plague to Jews, as well as other groups of outsiders, will be considered in chapter 2.

The structure of urban Castilian society

During this period the categorisation of Spanish society was changing. The old tripartite division of clergy, warrior nobles and labourers had long since ceased to correspond to reality. Trade, the rise of the urban merchant class and the upheavals caused by civil war and the plague were replacing a hierarchy based on birth with a class system based on privilege, wealth and power⁵³.

This societal change was particularly noticeable in the main cities such as Burgos. One route whereby money could be leveraged into privilege was through the institution of non-noble knights (*caballeros villanos*). Those with houses in a city and the considerable wealth needed to maintain a war horse and a full set of armour and weapons, and to have the training to fight on horseback, were given many privileges. They were exempt from royal taxes and were awarded grazing rights. They had great houses, coats of arms and were given much leeway under the sumptuary laws to display their wealth through dress of colours and cloths forbidden to those below them⁵⁴. Below the non-noble knights and wealthy merchants were the "good men", the class of skilled craftsmen and shopkeepers. They were the main taxpayers, apart

⁵¹ Hillgarth ii, 4-5.

⁵² Barton, *History of Spain*, p. 84.

⁵³ T.F. Ruiz, *Spanish Society 1400-1600* (Harlow, 2001), pp. 5-6.

⁵⁴ Ruiz, *Crisis and Continuity*, pp. 238-40, 251-4.

from the Jews, and supplied the foot soldiers⁵⁵. At the bottom of the urban social structure were the working poor, usually servants of the groups above them and the destitute. These people did not pay taxes, were almost always illiterate and had no say in the running of the city⁵⁶. Outside this social structure, but interacting with it at all levels, were the marginal groups. In the north of Castile these were primarily Jews; Burgos had a large Jewish quarter in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries and paid high levels of taxes⁵⁷. There were smaller populations of Moors, many of them working as agricultural or construction labourers, but some were skilled craftsmen or professionals⁵⁸.

The economy of Castile

The Castilian economy in the late Middle Ages was heavily dependent upon herding and agriculture. In particular, the wool from Spanish sheep was in demand by the weaving industries in the Low Countries and elsewhere. In the thirteenth century a centralised organisation for owners of flocks, known as the *Mesta*, was set up by Alfonso X, primarily as a way of efficiently taxing the industry. In return for the taxes the organisation obtained a number of privileges, including the right to supervise all flocks in the kingdom. Its main role was to organise the routes by which the flocks moved seasonally from summer to winter pasture, the *cañadas*. The flocks could be very large; in the fifteenth century major monasteries and land owners could have tens of thousands of sheep⁵⁹. During the fourteenth and fifteenth centuries trade became concentrated in a few major centres, including Burgos, which had been granted the right to hold fairs. In the second half of the fifteenth century Medina del

⁵⁵ Ibid., pp. 262-3.

⁵⁶ Ibid., pp. 268-70.

⁵⁷ Ibid., pp. 273-4.

⁵⁸ Ibid., p. 281.

⁵⁹ J.V. Vives, 'The Economies of Catalonia and Castile', in R. Highfield (ed.), *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516; Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 37-41.

Campo became the predominant trading centre for Castile, with the wool trade being concentrated there. The concentration of trade was encouraged by the monarchs as it aided the collection of royal taxes on buying and selling⁶⁰. Merchants from the rest of Castile and from the major trading nations traded in the exchange of wool for imported luxury items, in particular cloth. Although Castile had its own textile industry, this failed to develop to the standards of the Flemish and English industries, at least in part because the *Mesta* wanted the higher prices for their wool that international trade provided⁶¹.

Taxes were a source of income for both the royal and municipal governments. An important factor in the fiscal regime of Castile was that the nobility were exempt from taxation, which provided a major incentive to those striving to rise socially⁶². The Crown's revenues were also depleted during this period by royal grants of rights to certain tax incomes made to favourites or powerful nobles⁶³. Royal taxes were collected by use of tax farmers. Individuals would contract with the Crown to collect a specified sum in respect of named types of taxes in a specified area. Because tax farmers needed access to capital and financial acumen, many of them came from the Jewish and *converso* communities. The collector was paid by retaining any excess of the sum collected over the specified sum, while taking the risk that the specified sum was payable even if he collected less⁶⁴. While this method was advantageous to the

⁶⁰ Ibid., p. 43.

⁶¹ L. Suárez Fernández, 'The Kingdom of Castile in the Fifteenth Century', in R. Highfield (ed.), *Spain in the 15th Century 1369-1516; Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), p. 85.

⁶² Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, p. 75.

⁶³ Vives, 'Economies of Catalonia and Castile', p. 52.

⁶⁴ Valdeavellano, *Curso de historia*, p. 596.

royal treasury, in that they knew for certain what money would come into the treasury, the tax farmer was for obvious reasons an unpopular figure⁶⁵.

The economy of Burgos

Both its climate, long and cold winters which made it unsuitable for much agriculture, and its geographical location on the route between the products of the central plains of Castile and the ports on the Bay of Biscay, led to a strongly mercantile orientation of Burgos. By the fourteenth century merchants from Burgos were found in Flanders and England⁶⁶. Its location on the pilgrimage route to Compostella added to its cosmopolitan nature. By the fifteenth century Burgos had become a wealthy city, its wealth based on the wool trade. From Medina del Campo and the other fairs the wool was transported to Burgos, where shipment was organised by mule to the ports on the Basque coast for shipment to Flanders and the other markets in Northern Europe⁶⁷.

Religious background

The three religions

The earlier history of relations in the Iberian Peninsula between the three Abrahamic religions is discussed in Chapter 2. For the period relevant to the life of Teresa de Cartagena, by the end of the fourteenth century the Christians were clearly dominant everywhere except Granada, and subjected the Jews and Moslems to hostile, even violent, treatment⁶⁸. By the end of the fifteenth century the remaining Jews had been

⁶⁵ Ruiz, *Crisis and Continuity*, pp. 305-6.

⁶⁶ T.F. Ruiz, 'The Economic Structure of the Area of Burgos 1200-1350' in *The City and the Realm : Burgos and Castile, 1080-1492* (Aldershot, 1992), ch. II pp. 1-3.

⁶⁷ Suárez Fernández, 'Kingdom of Castile', pp. 86-7.

⁶⁸ Hillgarth ii, 129, 133-9.

expelled, the last Moslem kingdom on the Peninsula had fallen to the Christians and the Inquisition had started investigating the practices of the *converso* population.

This section will mainly deal with Spanish Christianity. As Teresa de Cartagena came from a prominent *converso* family, the history of Jews and *conversos* will be dealt with in detail in chapter 2. In Castile most of the Moslems lived in the countryside, concentrated in the southern part of the country. Many of them were agricultural slaves. Although they were allowed to practice their religion, there were restrictions on practice, such as no muezzins, and their dress and occupations were regulated although these regulations were not strictly enforced. One of the accusations against Enrique IV was that he favoured Moors, having a Moorish bodyguard and often wearing Moslem dress⁶⁹.

The state of the church in Castile

In the fifteenth century the Spanish church was still experiencing some of the moral and economic decay of the thirteenth century described by Linehan⁷⁰. Throughout the Middle Ages the vast majority of Spanish parish priests, as elsewhere in Europe, were recruited from the society they ministered to, poorly educated and of lax morals. Clergy had to be ordered to say mass at least four times a year, an indication of the widespread neglect of spiritual duties⁷¹. They were often poor: their main source of income was tithes, usually in kind in rural parishes. The higher clergy, who usually came from the nobility and gentry, although generally better educated were often morally as bad or worse⁷². Cathedral clergy often missed attendance in choir, rarely

⁶⁹ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 605-6.

⁷⁰ P. Linehan, *The Spanish Church and the Papacy in the Thirteenth Century* (Cambridge, 1971), p. 328.

⁷¹ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, p. 631.

⁷² Linehan, *Spanish Church*, p. 237-9.

confessed or celebrated mass⁷³. Higher clergy posts normally came with income from land (which might also be paid in kind) as well as tithes, usually representing considerable wealth⁷⁴. The grain and wine received often greatly exceeded the needs of the prelate and his household and the excess would be sold⁷⁵. Treatment of benefices as money-making property was also a major problem; powerful prelates could collect large numbers of benefices, and ownership of plural benefices often resulted in a lack of spiritual care⁷⁶. Clerical concubinage was widely practised in Spain by all grades of clergy, even monks and friars⁷⁷. When the Council of Basle issued a decree against the practice, the Castilian delegates tried to get an amendment protecting their laws and customs on the subject⁷⁸. Although in theory the clergy were exempt from taxation, in the fifteenth century the monarchy was still receiving from the Spanish church a tax, the *tercias* (two-ninths of the tithe), which had first been awarded by Innocent IV in 1247 in order to fund the war against the Moslem kingdoms in Spain⁷⁹. The parish clergy suffered the most, but by the end of the fourteenth century many religious houses were in financial trouble, even the largest ones such as Santa Domingo de Silos⁸⁰.

The lax state of the secular clergy was mirrored by many religious houses. One reason for this was that many monks and nuns were placed there by noble families because the family could not provide a living for younger sons or a dowry for a daughter. Lacking any religious calling, they sought to live a similar life in the

⁷³ Hillgarth ii, 96.

⁷⁴ Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, pp. 81-2.

⁷⁵ J. Edwards, *Christian Córdoba: the City and its Region in the Late Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 1982), p. 167. Alonso de Cartagena's will included bequests of grain to several religious houses in and around Burgos, Cantera Burgos, p. 435.

⁷⁶ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 629-630.

⁷⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 630-1.

⁷⁸ Linehan, *Spanish Church*, p. 326.

⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 158.

⁸⁰ A. MacKay, *Spain in the Middle Ages: From Frontier to Empire, 1000-1500* (London 1977), p. 188.

monastery or convent to that they had lived outside. Also, especially during periods when the crown was weak, the nobility 'commended' themselves as abbot to monastic houses in their domains in order to benefit from the income due to the abbot. A religious house full of occupants with no vocation to the religious life, and no resident, professed head of the house was a recipe for loose living⁸¹. During the Reconquest a number of Spanish military religious Orders, similar to the Templars, had developed. By the fifteenth century they were no longer warrior monks as the Moors had ceased to be a serious threat to Christian kingdoms. However, the major Orders, particularly those of Santiago, Calatrava and Alcántara, had become very wealthy as they owned extensive estates and flocks. As a result, mastership of these Orders was a major prize sought by leading nobles⁸².

Papacy – the Great Schism

In many ways the decayed state of the church in Spain was a reflection of the similar state of the papacy. During the twelfth and thirteenth centuries various popes had developed the concept that the papacy wielded power directly from the authority of Christ and therefore had dominion over the whole church and over temporal rulers⁸³. This aggregation of power to the pope and the growth of the papal curia encouraged corruption, nepotism, simony and the accumulation of benefices by absent clergy⁸⁴. The papacy was unpopular both with the ordinary clergy and the laity because of its frequent demands for money to finance the papal court and its appointment of non-resident foreigners as bishops and to other important posts⁸⁵. The weakening of the

⁸¹ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 631-2. A documented example of extremely loose living on the part of Dominican nuns in late thirteenth century Zamora is recounted by Peter Linehan, P. Linehan, *The Ladies of Zamora* (Manchester, 1997).

⁸² O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 632-3.

⁸³ G. Barraclough, *The Medieval Papacy* (London, 1968), pp. 85-90.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 108-9, 126-7.

⁸⁵ Hillgarth ii, 88-9.

powers of the papacy in the fourteenth and early fifteenth century due to the events described below was connected with the rise of nationalism and the assertion of power over national churches by secular rulers. The open corruption in the Church led to demands for reform that eventually led to the Protestant Reformation⁸⁶.

At the beginning of the fourteenth century, following major conflict between Pope Benedict VIII and Philip the Fair of France, the papacy came under the control of France. Clement V, French by birth, was crowned in Lyon in 1305 and did not return to Rome. Under pressure from the French king he settled in Avignon, which was under French influence although not at that time part of the French kingdom. He also changed the balance of the electoral body by creating mainly French cardinals, making the Italian cardinals a minority. He and his six successors remained in Avignon until 1378. Of these Avignon popes, the French nobleman Clement VI caused the greatest damage to the institution by his lavish and immoral lifestyle and his complete subservience to the French king⁸⁷. One reason why the popes remained in France was the turbulent political situation in Italy in the fourteenth century, but in the second half of the century France also became dangerous and disorderly. The fifth Avignon pope, Urban V, had tried to return to Rome in 1367 but turned back when the death of the papal commander-in-chief in Italy made the situation in Rome uncertain. His successor, Gregory XI, tried to leave Avignon in 1375, but was prevented by the French. The Italians rioted and threatened to elect another pope. Gregory XI returned to Rome in 1377, but died just over a year later⁸⁸. Under pressure from the Roman populace to elect a Roman pope, the cardinals hastily elected an Italian bishop who became Urban VI. Unfortunately, the new pope, who

⁸⁶ O'Callaghan, *History of Medieval Spain*, pp. 626-7.

⁸⁷ Barraclough, *Medieval Papacy*, pp. 143-4.

⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 163-4.

seems to have had a harsh personality, took an uncompromising line over the papal power, in particular he set about reforming the college of cardinals. Under the leadership of a French cardinal who had arrived too late to take part in the election, a group of discontented cardinals called on Urban VI to resign, then a few weeks later declared the pope deposed and elected another, a cousin of the king of France, who took the title of Clement VII and returned to Avignon. Thus began the schism which lasted over fifty years. The Avignon pope was supported by Charles V of France and his allies, in particular Castile and Aragon. The Roman pope was supported by the enemies of France (including Germany, England and Portugal)⁸⁹. After Charles' death in 1380, French support for the Avignon pope became much less firm as power shifted between the uncles of the young king Charles VI. When Clement VII died, the French court ordered the Avignon cardinals not to elect a successor but to recognise the Roman pope, Boniface IX. However, the cardinals at Avignon ignored this and elected Pedro de Luna as Benedict XIII⁹⁰.

The first attempt to put an end to the schism was by the cardinals themselves; both groups called the Council of Pisa, declared both the Roman and Avignon popes deposed and elected a new pope. However, neither of the existing popes would resign and no-one wanted to accept the dubious authority of the new pope, so now there were three contenders to the papacy. The next attempt to resolve the situation came from the German Emperor, Sigismund, who forced the pope elected by the cardinals, John XXII, to call the council of Constance, which sat from 1415 to 1418⁹¹. Again, the council called on all three popes to resign. John XXII fled the council and was then accused of misconduct and deposed, the Roman pope resigned, but Benedict XIII

⁸⁹ Ibid., pp. 165-6.

⁹⁰ Ibid., pp. 174-5.

⁹¹ Ibid., pp. 177-8.

refused to do so⁹². As Benedict was an Aragonese noble, he mainly looked for support to Aragon and Castile. Ferdinand de Antequera, as King of Aragon and regent of Castile played an important role in trying to resolve the schism. He arranged for the German Emperor to meet with Benedict XIII in an attempt to persuade Benedict to resign. When he refused to do so, Ferdinand withdrew the obedience of Aragon, the last major country supporting Benedict⁹³. The pope elected by the Council of Constance, Martin V, agreed to continue governing the church in consultation with general councils and his successor, Eugene IV, called the council of Basle in 1431. During the course of this council, which began with hopes of reform, Eugene IV appeared to accept the limitations on his powers but by astute political activity managed to raise the prestige of the papacy and its power over the council⁹⁴.

Religious reform

The reform of religious orders was an important movement throughout Western Christianity in the fifteenth century, in which Teresa de Cartagena's family was involved. Her grandfather and uncle, as successive bishops of Burgos, played an important role in the beginnings of the reform of the Dominican order. In 1435 the Council of Basel at the petition of Pablo de Santa María agreed that the Dominican house in Burgos should be reformed, and this reform was continued by his son, Alonso de Cartagena, when he succeeded his father as bishop in that same year. Also in 1435, don Pablo assisted in the foundation of a new Dominican house under the reformed observance in Rojas, in the Burgos diocese⁹⁵. Reform of the Franciscans began in Spain at the end of the fourteenth century, when the Observant movement,

⁹² K.S. Latourette, *A History of Christianity* (New York NY, 1975), pp. 629-30.

⁹³ I.I. MacDonald, *Don Fernando de Antequera* (Oxford, 1948), pp. 92, 198-9, 220-8.

⁹⁴ Latourette, *History of Christianity*, pp. 632-5.

⁹⁵ V. Beltrán de Heredia, 'The Beginnings of Dominican Reform in Castile', in R. Highfield (ed.), *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516; Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 227-8.

which began in Italy through the work of St Bernadine of Sienna, reached Spain⁹⁶. The fifteenth century saw an associated reform of the Franciscan second order throughout Europe, including Spain⁹⁷. The second order convent in Burgos, Santa Clara de Burgos, adopted the strict observance connected with the Santa Clara convent of Tordesillas⁹⁸.

⁹⁶ Hillgarth ii, 106-7.

⁹⁷ J.R.H. Moorman, *A History of the Franciscan Order: From its Origins to the Year 1517* (Chicago IL, 1988), pp. 548-59.

⁹⁸ Bonanchia and Casado, 'La segunda mitad', p. 445.

CHAPTER 2

JEWS AND CONVERSOS IN MEDIEVAL SPAIN

Introduction

Various terms have been used to designate Spanish Christians of Jewish origin. One term, 'New Christians', is generally used in opposition to 'Old Christians' which came to mean Spaniards with no (known) Jewish blood. The term most generally used in this thesis is *converso*; although this has the general meaning of 'a convert', it is almost always used to indicate Christians of Jewish origin, even if the conversion was several generations back. Those who converted from Islam are not referred to as *conversos* but rather as *moriscos*. The term '*marranos*' is also sometimes used to designate Christians of Jewish origin, but this word is clearly derogatory as its usual meaning is 'pigs'.

Historians and historiography

The history of the Jews in Spain is a subject where historians have often carried their backgrounds and viewpoints into their work. The two leading Jewish historians who have written on Jews and *conversos* in Christian Spain, Yitzhak Baer and Benzion Netanyahu, both lived through the era of the Holocaust and were involved in the founding of the modern Israel. This background is evident in their work, although interestingly they come to opposite conclusions about the religious position of *conversos*. Baer was a German Jew. As Gampel demonstrates in his introduction to the 1961 edition of *A History of the Jews in Christian Spain*, Baer viewed Sephardic Jewry through a 'prism' of features of Jewishness which were more characteristic of

Ashkenazi Judaism, including a hostility to rationalism¹. One aspect of this difference was the approach to threats to convert; the German Ashkenaz preferred martyrdom, the more pragmatic Sephardim allowed conversion to save life. This perhaps underlies Baer's view that the *conversos* were guilty as charged by the Inquisition, namely as being Jews in all but name. The British Jewish historian, Cecil Roth, agreed with Baer's opinion². Netanyahu (who is the father of the Israeli politician Benjamin Netanyahu) is American by origin. Netanyahu's views are that the persecution of *conversos* was rooted in race rather than in religion³. His opinion, expressed in two major works, is that the *conversos* were genuine Christians who were persecuted in late medieval and early modern Spain because of their race, with no foundation for the religious allegations made against them by the Inquisition⁴. Another American Jewish historian, Norman Roth⁵, largely agrees with Netanyahu.

Historical background

It is likely that the first Jews arrived in Spain during the period of Roman rule, possibly as part of the diaspora that occurred at the end of the first century CE following the destruction of the second temple⁶. It is uncertain how the status of this

¹ B.R. Gampel, 'Yitzhak Baer's *A History of Jews in Christian Spain*', in *A History of Jews in Christian Spain* (Philadelphia PA, 1961), i, xxiii-xxv, xlii.

² C. Roth, *A History of the Marranos* (New York NY, 1959).

³ M. Alpert, *Crypto-Judaism and the Spanish Inquisition* (Basingstoke, 2001), p. 16. Alpert points out that this theory hardly fits the fact that only a small proportion of the *converso* population was punished by the Inquisition, *ibid.*, p.17.

⁴ B. Netanyahu, *The Marranos of Spain From the Late XIVth to the Early XVIth Century: According to Contemporary Hebrew Sources* (New York, 1966); B. Netanyahu, *The Origins of the Inquisition in Fifteenth Century Spain* (New York, 2001). A reviewer of the latter work said that Netanyahu's devotion to Jewry seems essential to the work, and, talking of Netanyahu's polemic against Philip II and the Inquisitors which compared them to Hitler and the Nazis, said that he is clearly no dispassionate scholar 'but rather an academic zealot bent on carrying on intellectual warfare', B. Chalmers, 'The Jewish Question in 15th and 16th Century Spain,' *The Journal of Historical Review* 16, no. 1 (1996), p. 7.

⁵ N. Roth, *Conversos, Inquisition and the Expulsion of the Jews from Spain* (Madison, 1995).

⁶ Suárez dismisses as myth the claim by medieval Spanish Jewry that their ancestors came to the Iberian peninsula immediately after the destruction of the first temple, on which basis they claimed to be direct descendants of the tribe of Judah and also to have no responsibility for the death of Christ. Sephardic Judaism was based on synagogue worship and rabbinical teachings typical of the period after

Iberian Jewish community was affected by the beginnings of the official acceptance of Christianity under Constantine in the fourth century⁷, but in any event Roman rule of the peninsula was soon to end. At the beginning of the fifth century Visigoth invaders came from the north, and by 470 were in control of the whole peninsula⁸. The invaders were Christians, but Arians rather than Catholics, and appear to have tolerated their Jewish subjects. However, after the Visigoth kings adopted Catholicism in the late sixth century persecution of the Jews began, apparently for religious reasons⁹. This persecution may be why the Jews were later regarded as having welcomed the Arab invasion of Spain, which began in 711, although there is no reliable evidence that they actively supported the invasion¹⁰. Certainly, Jews had more personal, religious and economic liberty once Moslem rule was established¹¹. Under the Umayyad dynasty, which ruled Al-Andalus until the early eleventh century, the dominant Moslem group allowed considerable latitude to their Jewish and Christian subjects¹². Jewish communities and their culture flourished. The eleventh century is sometimes referred to as the 'Golden Age' of Spanish Jewry; Jews attained high political office and obtained wealth and prestige as merchants, diplomats and tax collectors, the Jewish literary culture flourished and they embraced the Arabic language and culture and thus played an important role as translators¹³. After the collapse of the caliphate there were brief periods of persecution of Jews and

the destruction of the second temple by the Romans, rather than the temple worship and priesthood of the first temple period. L. Suárez Fernández, *Judíos españoles en la Edad Media* (Madrid, 1980), p. 30.

⁷ Netanyahu, *Origins*, p. 29, records some Christian antagonism towards Jews in the fourth century.

⁸ R. Collins, 'Visigothic Spain, 409-711', in R. Carr (ed.) *Spain: a History* (Oxford, 2000), p. 39.

⁹ P.D. King, *Law and Society in the Visigothic Kingdom* (Cambridge, 1972), pp. 131-3. The Visigothic law codes include many draconian provisions relating to Jews, but the rulers seem to have been unable to enforce them effectively, *ibid.*, pp. 130-9. The purpose of these Visigothic laws is discussed in chapter 10.

¹⁰ H. Kennedy, *Muslim Spain and Portugal: a Political History of al-Andalus* (London, 1996), pp. 13-14.

¹¹ Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, pp. 35-7.

¹² S. Barton, *A History of Spain* (Basingstoke, 2004), p. 40.

¹³ *Ibid.*, pp. 71, 81. Jews were also also obtaining prominent position in courts in Northern Spain in the eleventh century, J. Ray, *The Sephardic Frontier: the Reconquista and the Jewish Community in Medieval Iberia* (Ithica, NY, 2006), p. 16.

Christians under the more fundamentalist Almoravid and Almohad invaders from North Africa¹⁴. However, more important for the Jews in the long term was the revival of Christian power that began in that period.

The reconquest of significant areas of Moslem-ruled Spain by Christians from the north, beginning in the early eleventh century, meant that many Jews and Moslems fell under Christian rule. Indeed, as Ray has demonstrated, many Jews from elsewhere in Spain moved to the newly conquered areas to take advantage of the land grants and other privileges given by the Crown to encourage settlement of the frontier¹⁵. Jews both farmed the land, often with Muslim slaves (Jews being forbidden Christian slaves), and carried out various urban professions and trades¹⁶. Américo Castro put forward the theory of *convivencia*, that during the period from the tenth to the fifteenth century the three 'castes' (as he termed the three religious groups) lived together in relative harmony, each caste acknowledging the cultural contributions of the other two¹⁷. Castro attributed this to the effects of Muslim tolerance and believed it to be an uniquely Spanish phenomenon¹⁸. Modern historians generally doubt whether there really was such a thing¹⁹ or give the term a narrower definition²⁰. Others have also argued that Spain was no more or less

¹⁴ T.F. Ruiz, *Spanish Society 1400-1600* (Harlow, 2001), p. 95.

¹⁵ Ray, *Sephardic Frontier*, pp. 27-32.

¹⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 37-9, 70-1.

¹⁷ A. Castro, *The Spaniards: an Introduction to Their History*, trans. W.J. King and S. Margaretten (Berkeley, CA, 1971), p. 584; T.F. Glick, 'Convivencia: An Introductory Note' in V.B. Mann, T.F. Glick and J.D. Dodds, (eds.), *Convivencia: Jews, Muslims and Christians in Medieval Spain* (New York, NY, 1992), p. 2.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 498-501.

¹⁹ The historiography of the idea of *convivencia* is critically reviewed in M. Soifer, 'Beyond *convivencia*: critical reflections on the historiography of interfaith relations in Christian Spain', *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies* 1, no. 1 (2009), 19-35.

²⁰ Glick says that 'Castro's *convivencia* survives', but defines it in terms of limited cross-cultural influences and complex social interaction, T.F. Glick, 'Convivencia: An Introductory Note', pp. 6-7. Ray uses the term merely to denote normal social interaction, Ray, *Sephardic Frontier*, p. 174.

tolerant than the rest of Europe²¹, although it does seem that the accusations against the Jews, such as ritual murder, Host desecration and the 'blood-libel', which spread widely in most of Western Europe in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries²² did not significantly feature in Spain until the fifteenth century²³.

Generally in Christian Spain the Jews were regarded as royal possessions, exempted from local jurisdiction and taxes (although they were heavily taxed directly by the crown) and often acted as royal agents, including tax gathering. Not surprisingly, this tended to make them unpopular with the local population²⁴. This relative harmony did not mean the absence of violence. In Spain, as in the rest of Europe, violence was pervasive in everyday life, in all communities and in every level of society²⁵. Nirenberg demonstrates that throughout the Middle Ages in Christian Spain there was a form of ritualised violence towards Jewish communities associated with Holy Week. He argues that, at least until the fourteenth century, these rituals in some ways contributed to the stability of the mixed Iberian society although they also contained the seeds of more serious violence²⁶.

Jews under Pedro I and the Trastámaras

The struggle between Pedro I and his illegitimate half-brothers for the throne of Castile discussed in chapter 1 began an extended period of what Ruiz categorises as

²¹ J.M. Elukin, *Living Together, Living Apart: Rethinking Jewish-Christian Relations in the Middle Ages* (Princeton, NJ, 2007), pp. 136-7. On the other hand, Ray argues that, at least in the frontier regions, Jews were given a greater degree of equality than prevailed in the rest of Europe, Ray, *Sephardic Frontier*, pp. 89-90.

²² J. Cohen, *Christ Killers: the Jews and the Passion from the Bible to the Big Screen*, (Oxford, 2007), p. 93.

²³ Netanyahu, *Origins*, p. 733. However, the *Siete Partidas* did mention (as hearsay) stories of Jewish ritual murder on Good Friday, although it reserved jurisdiction over such crimes to the king himself, Ray, *Sephardic Frontier*, p. 94.

²⁴ T.F. Ruiz, *Spain's Centuries of Crisis: 1300-1474* (Oxford, 2007), pp. 144-5.

²⁵ Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, pp. 163-7.

²⁶ D. Nirenberg, *Communities of Violence: Persecution of Minorities in the Middle Ages* (Princeton NJ, 1998), pp. 200-30.

'official violence'²⁷, which lasted at least until Isabella and Ferdinand secured their rule in 1479²⁸. The Jews were inevitably involved in this civil war between competing royal and noble claimants to power because they were regarded as servants of the monarchy²⁹. Part of the Trastámara campaign against Pedro was to portray him as favouring Jews and Moslems, seeking to obtain support from the Christian populace against the legitimate king³⁰. Anti-Jewish sentiment among this populace had been growing during the preceding century, mainly for economic and social reasons although there was also a religious component of this prejudice³¹. However, this was actually part of the Trastámara propaganda painting Pedro as a tyrant, an enemy of the church as well as his people, rather than being intended as a direct attack on the Jewish community³². Certainly, once Enrique de Trastámara had become king he generally protected the Jews and their economic interests, and in return the Jews supported the king, providing finance and services³³. However, because his government was unstable he had to make concessions to the Cortes, which involved at times giving in to the general anti-Jewish sentiments of that body.

Anti-Jewish riots of 1391

Anti-Jewish sentiment in the general populace continued to grow during Enrique's reign and that of his successor, Juan I, although Juan continued to use the services of leading Jews (including Teresa's grandfather)³⁴. Neither king was able to suppress

²⁷ Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, pp. 164-5.

²⁸ J. Edwards, *The Spain of the Catholic Monarchs: 1474-1520* (Oxford, 2000), p. 38. Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, p. 175 argues that noble violence continued throughout the next century.

²⁹ Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, p. 185.

³⁰ J. Valdeón Baroque, *Los judíos de Castilla y la revolución Trastámara* (Valladolid, 1968), p. 37

³¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 16-18.

³² *Ibid.*, pp. 37-8; J. Valdeón Baroque, *Enrique II de Castilla: la guerra civil y la consolidación de régimen (1366-1371)* (Valladolid, 1966), pp. 96-8.

³³ Valdeón, *Judíos de Castilla*, pp. 58-64.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 87; Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, pp. 204-5.

the rabidly anti-Jewish preaching of the archdeacon Ferrán Martínez in the Seville area, and both were persuaded to reduce the legal status of their Jewish subjects³⁵.

Juan I died in October 1390, leaving as his heir an eleven year old son, Enrique III. As usual in this era, the minority created a power vacuum. The disastrous effects of this vacuum on the Jewish population were first manifested in Seville. The archbishop of Seville, who had exercised some control over Archdeacon Martínez, died in July 1390 and the see was still vacant in 1391. In June 1391 the Christian populace of Seville, whipped up by Martínez, stormed the Jewish quarter and began to massacre the inhabitants or forcibly baptize them and to sack the buildings³⁶. The violence quickly spread; in the same month the Jewish quarters of Cordoba, Toledo, Burgos and several other towns and cities in Castile were attacked, and the troubles reached the kingdom of Aragon, in particular Valencia and Barcelona, within a few weeks³⁷. Many Jews were killed, and many more accepted baptism in order to escape death.

Modern historians have given a range of explanations for this apparently sudden and wide-ranging outbreak of violence against the Jewish communities in all parts of Spain. It could be considered to be part of a general rise in Western Europe from about the tenth century in hostility to minorities, heretics and lepers as well as Jews, which Moore attributes, at least in part, to the rise to power of a learned and clerical elite³⁸. However Spain, perhaps because of its unique circumstances of conflict against Muslim kingdoms in the Peninsular, does not seem to have had the same

³⁵ Hillgarth ii, 138.

³⁶ Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, pp. 206-7.

³⁷ Hillgarth ii, 139-40.

³⁸ R.I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950-1250* (Oxford, 1987), pp. 152-3.

problem with heresy as the rest of medieval Western Europe, at least until the alleged *converso* heresies of the late fifteenth century³⁹. Also, as discussed above, the anti-Jewish accusations, which were the roots of much violence in other countries from the twelfth century, were not prevalent in Spain until the fifteenth century. Therefore, the roots of this 1391 violence are probably to be found in the general situation in Spain at the end of the fourteenth century. The outbreaks of plague, which badly affected Spain as it did the rest of Western Europe, had been blamed by many on outsiders, in particular the Jews⁴⁰. There had been a period of high inflation just before 1391, making Jewish tax collectors even more hated than normal⁴¹. The papal Great Schism had both undermined the certainty which the Church had previously held out to the people in an uncertain time and had caused religious and political problems. There is general agreement that the immediate cause of the original outbreak in Seville was the preaching and actions of Ferrán Martínez combined with a national political power vacuum and a lack of ecclesiastical control in Seville itself. The real question is why the customary, partly symbolic, religious violence associated with Holy Week as described by Nirenberg escalated so quickly in Seville to a pogrom against the entire Jewish population of that city, and then why the troubles spread so quickly and widely. There is less agreement between historians on the answer to this question. Some, such as Hillgarth⁴², MacKay⁴³, Valdeón⁴⁴ and Nirenberg⁴⁵, see the primary motivation for the violence as religious with roots in the Trastámaran propaganda, mendicant and other preaching, and attacks on the Jewish religion by

³⁹ Hillgarth ii, p. 124.

⁴⁰ Barton, *History of Spain*, p. 85.

⁴¹ G.B. Kaplan, *The Evolution of Converso Literature: the Writings of the Converted Jews of Medieval Spain* (Gainesville FL, 2002), pp. 16-19.

⁴² Hillgarth ii, 141.

⁴³ A. MacKay, *Spain in the Middle Ages: From Frontier to Empire, 1000-1500* (London 1977), pp. 184-7.

⁴⁴ Valdeón, *Judíos de Castilla*, pp. 72-4.

⁴⁵ D. Nirenberg, 'Une société face à l'atérité: Juifs et chrétiens dans la péninsule Ibérique 1391-1449', *Annales HSS*, no. 4 (2007), pp. 758-9.

conversos. Others, such as Ruiz⁴⁶, Perez⁴⁷, Edwards⁴⁸, Elukin⁴⁹ and Wolff⁵⁰, give more importance to social and economic factors, although Ruiz and Wolff point out that the underlying factors varied from place to place. Netanyahu blames racial hatred on the part of the common people, whipped up by Ferrán Martínez, and sees a planned conspiracy in the immediate spread of violence from Seville to neighbouring communities⁵¹.

Towards the end – Jews in Spain from 1391 to 1492

The result of the murders and mass conversions of 1391 was that the Spanish Jewish community (as defined by religious practice) was greatly reduced in numbers, and many of its leaders had been removed by death or conversion⁵². In some cities, Jewish quarters that earlier had been wealthy and populous became almost extinct⁵³.

The pressure on the remaining Jews to convert continued during the first part of the fifteenth century, using direct and indirect means which had been employed previously but now used with greater intensity. One of the direct means used particularly by the mendicant orders was preaching, the Dominican Vincent Ferrar being the most celebrated of these preachers. Jews were ordered to attend such sermons, which might even be delivered in the synagogue⁵⁴. Another means was written works seeking to persuade Jews from their own sacred writings and by reason

⁴⁶ Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, p. 187.

⁴⁷ J. Pérez, *The Spanish Inquisition: a History*, trans. J. Lloyd, (London, 2004), pp. 4-10.

⁴⁸ J. Edwards, *Inquisition* (Stroud, 1999), pp. 62-5.

⁴⁹ Elukin, *Living Together*, pp. 111-2.

⁵⁰ P. Wolff, 'The 1391 Pogrom in Spain: Social Crisis or Not?', *Past and Present*, 50 (1971), p. 16.

⁵¹ Netanyahu, *Origins*, pp. 146-51.

⁵² Nirenberg, 'Société', p.758, points out that none of the contemporary chroniclers of the 1391 events give estimates of the number of victims. It was only centuries later that Jewish historians began to estimate numbers, but most modern historians think these estimates are not plausible.

⁵³ Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, pp. 216-7. This was not true everywhere, particularly in places where there had been little or no violence in 1391 such as Avila, Hillgarth ii, 146.

⁵⁴ Hillgarth ii, 142.

that the Messiah had already come in the form of Jesus Christ and of the truth of Christianity. Several of such works were written by *converso* authors, among them Pablo de Santa María. A third direct means used was formal disputations between Jewish and Christian theologians. Again, the latter were often *conversos* such as Alfonso of Valladolid, who were able to quote Jewish rabbinical writings and Biblical exegesis in their arguments⁵⁵. The most celebrated of these events in this period was the Disputation of Tortosa (1413-14), ordered by Benedict XIII, in which the *converso* Jerónimo de Santa Fé disputed with leading Jewish rabbis⁵⁶. Indirect pressure was applied through political means, by legislation passed by the cortes⁵⁷ and by papal decrees of Benedict XIII intended to increase the social and economic disadvantages of remaining Jewish, although after Benedict was deposed this legislation was either repealed or not strictly enforced⁵⁸. Over the fifteenth century many Jewish communities in Spain either disappeared or were greatly reduced in strength and economic importance, and became more strictly segregated within the towns where they lived. Further, the lack of strong monarchy in periods during the reigns of Juan II and Enrique IV meant that many Jews left the larger towns in favour of small communities where the local lord could provide protection in return for financial and other assistance⁵⁹.

The end of Jewish life in Spain came in 1492, when the Catholic Monarchs ordered the expulsion of the remaining Jews unless they immediately converted to

⁵⁵ R. Chazan, 'Undermining the Jewish Sense of Future: Alfonso of Valladolid and the New Christian Missionizing', in M.D. Myerson and E.D. English (eds.), *Christians, Muslims and Jews in Medieval and Early Modern Spain* (Notre Dame, Indiana, 2000), pp. 186-91.

⁵⁶ Hillgarth ii, 143.

⁵⁷ The most restrictive legislation in Castile was that of 1412, which is attributed in part to the influence of Ferrer and Pablo de Santa María, H. Kamen, *The Spanish Inquisition: a Historical Revision* (London, 1997), p. 14.

⁵⁸ Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, pp. 233-4.

⁵⁹ Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, pp. 98-9. However, M.D. Meyerson, *A Jewish Renaissance in Fifteenth-Century Spain* (Princeton NJ, Oxford, 2004) demonstrates that this decline was not universal.

Christianity. Very large numbers did accept baptism, either immediately, or shortly after leaving in order to be able to return⁶⁰. As with the causes of the 1391 violence, there is no agreement as to why Isabella and Ferdinand took this step. Apart from older historians, particularly Baer, there is general agreement that neither of the Catholic Monarchs was inherently anti-Jewish as both had before 1492 protected Jews in their respective realms and had employed Jewish financiers and physicians. The old accusation that Ferdinand and Isabella did this for financial gain is also generally rejected. The majority view seems to be that the basis for their decision was primarily religious, although there is disagreement whether this was unwilling acceptance of the view of the Inquisition or of Grand Inquisitor Torquemada, or a willing decision based on their own religious views. An alternative view, put forward by Edwards and by Suárez⁶¹, is that this action was an outcome of the absolutist monarchist theories (which were particularly promoted by educated *conversos* who belonged to the ranks of the *letrados*) and the related triumphalism arising from the conquest of Granada.

Conversos

Although the New Testament model of conversion, in particular that of St Paul, stressed individual decision, most of the spread of Christianity in its first millennium came about because rulers adopted it as the official religion for their realm. Kruger locates a return to the concept of conversion as a decision by the individual to the 'long' twelfth century. The mere rite of baptism was not sufficient to make one a Christian and conversion was seen as a continuing process⁶². As a result of this view

⁶⁰ Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, pp. 268-73.

⁶¹ Edwards, *Inquisition*, pp. 109-14; Suárez, *Judíos españoles*, pp. 260-2.

⁶² S.F. Kruger, *The Spectral Jew: Conversion and Embodiment in Medieval Europe* (Minneapolis MN, 2006), pp. 25-7, 76-8.

of conversion, the popular dislike and distrust of the Jews throughout the Middle Ages often continued even after their baptism⁶³. Questions relating to the meaning and process of conversion for Jews were particularly acute in Spain in the late Middle Ages, given the very large number of Jews coming to baptism in a short time under various forms of pressure. The approach at that time to these questions is indicated by the approach of the new Spanish Inquisition when it was first set up at the end of fifteenth century. The charges against the 'Judaisers' consisted mainly of accusations of Jewish ritual practice as well as expressions of disrespect of Christian teachings⁶⁴. As European Jews generally had adapted to their minority and marginal status by developing a tight, supportive community, Jewish converts to Christianity were faced with the problem of breaking away from that community and trying to gain acceptance from their new community, which in Spain was not generally supportive to these New Christians⁶⁵. It is not surprising that many Jewish converts retained at least some of the customs of their previous community.

How genuine were the conversions? Historians seem largely to have treated this in the same way as the Inquisition, as a black and white issue, an individual was either a Jew or a Christian with no allowance for nuances of belief. One school of historians, particularly Baer and his pupils such as Beinhard, accepted as true the Inquisition findings that those *conversos* which it condemned were actually secret Jews⁶⁶. Netanyahu challenged this view, mainly on the basis of Jewish materials, asserting

⁶³ J.M. Elukin, 'From Jew to Christian? Conversion and Immutability in Medieval Europe', in J. Muldoon (ed.), *Varieties of Religious Conversion in the Middle Ages* (Gainesville FL, 1997), pp. 179-80, 184.

⁶⁴ Edwards, *Inquisition*, pp. 100. Edwards points out that this reliance on externals rather than internal beliefs contrasts with the theological discussions relating to contemporary 'heretics' such as the Lollards and Hussites.

⁶⁵ J. Edwards, 'The *conversos*: a theological approach', in *Religion and Society in Spain. c.1492* (Aldershot, 1996), ch. I, pp. 46-7.

⁶⁶ H. Beinhard, *Conversos on Trial: The Inquisition in Ciudad Real*, trans. Y. Guiladi, (Jerusalem, 1981), pp. 2-6.

that in fact the *conversos* were genuine Christians who were persecuted by the Inquisition purely on the basis of their race⁶⁷. Others, perhaps more realistic, see this as shades of grey; *conversos* ranged from dedicated Christians who understood their new faith and completely repudiated the Jewish faith to those who remained Jewish in all but name. Between these extremes there was surely a wide variety of beliefs and practices as indeed there was in the non-Jewish Christian population⁶⁸. As Kamen puts it: 'Easy-going Jews who converted for convenience became, naturally, easy-going Christians.'⁶⁹

Ruiz classifies the *conversos* into three groups; the wealthy, well educated and influential families, the 'middle' class of merchants and royal agents and the 'lower' class of artisans, small shopkeepers and labourers. These groups had different experiences of conversion⁷⁰. Upper class Spanish Jews were generally the equivalent of nobility in their community and often regarded themselves as such⁷¹. They had previously led lives not dissimilar to their Christian neighbours, making easy the relatively minor lifestyle changes required by conversion. They also intermarried extensively with the aristocracy. This group largely escaped the growing popular resentment towards *conversos* and the associated violence, and from the attentions of the Inquisition⁷². The middle class continued as merchants and royal financial agents, but conversion opened other professions to them such as the upper ranks of clergy, entry into important monasteries and university education leading to a career in royal

⁶⁷ Netanyahu, *Origins*, p. 1043. Alpert points out that this theory hardly fits the fact that only a small proportion of the converso population was punished by the Inquisition, Alpert, *Crypto-Judaism*, p.17.

⁶⁸ Edwards, *Inquisition*, p. 101-2; Kamen, *Historical Revision*, pp. 39-40; Hillgarth ii, 151, 414-6.

⁶⁹ Kamen, *Historical Revision*, p. 37.

⁷⁰ Ruiz, *Centuries of Crisis*, p. 161.

⁷¹ A.A. Sicroff, *Les controverses des statuts de "pureté de sang" en Espagne du XV au XVII siècle* (Paris, 1960), p. 29.

⁷² Ruiz, *Centuries of Crisis*, pp. 161-2.

service as a *letrado*. This group drew the ire of the Old Christian middle classes as these *conversos* posed direct and effective competition for these well-paid positions. Therefore, they were the main target of *limpieza de sangre* (purity of blood) statutes discussed below. The lower classes suffered the most from violence from the urban mobs. As they rarely had much education in their new faith, this group was the most likely to retain Jewish daily customs and was therefore vulnerable to accusations of Judaizing and investigation by the Inquisition⁷³. Women were particularly vulnerable to these accusations as they were largely confined to the home and uneducated in the Christian faith⁷⁴.

Jewish views of conversos

Netanyahu based his views of the status of *conversos* on his study of the contemporary Jewish writings about them. One category of these writings is *responsa*, legal documents relating to rulings under Jewish law. These were based in rulings of rabbis in North Africa, several of whom had escaped from Spain in 1391. In determining who was to be considered Jewish, these documents took an increasingly hard line against *conversos*, equating failure to observe Jewish law with willing and genuine conversion to Christianity. Netanyahu makes the crucial but unsupported assumption that these *responsa* of rabbis exiled from Spain could be considered to reflect the traditional position towards *conversos* that prevailed in Spain itself⁷⁵. However, it would not be surprising if rabbis who had undergone the trauma of exile took a hard line towards these 'traitors'. This is supported by frequent references to the fact that the individual concerned could have escaped but chose not to, or did so and returned. Polemic writing by Jews who did not convert and who

⁷³ Alpert, *Crypto-Judaism*, p. 21.

⁷⁴ Edwards, *Inquisition*, p. 87.

⁷⁵ Netanyahu, *Marranos*, p. 69.

remained in Spain until 1492, which after 1391 tended to seek to prove that Christianity is false rather than that Judaism is true, is assumed by Netanyahu to be directed towards the converts, thus showing that they had voluntarily accepted Christianity⁷⁶. However, these writings could just as well have been directed to those who did not convert but were now wavering. While these documents cannot be taken as proof that all *conversos* were genuine and committed Christians, they do show a growing antagonism on the part of the remaining Jews who had clung to their ancestral religion towards those who had converted either voluntarily or under duress.

Anti-converso violence

For the first generation after the mass conversions of the end of the fourteenth century, the Old and New Christian populations co-existed fairly peaceably. However, the growing resentment amongst Old Christians caused by economic success of New Christian families erupted in violence in the Toledo uprising of 1449. The apparent immediate cause for this uprising was a loan towards the expenses of war demanded by the unpopular chief minister, Alvaro de Luna, and collected by a *converso* tax collector. A mob of townsmen, led by a disaffected official, Pedro Sarmiento, sacked the collector's property and then went on to attack a large part of the Toledo *converso* community. In control of the city, Sarmiento and his party passed the *Sentencia-Estatuto* (*Sentencia*), a law that no *converso* could hold a secular or religious official position in Toledo. This was the first *limpieza de sangre* statute⁷⁷. The belief that New Christians were all crypto-Jews and not to be trusted grew among the Old Christian population throughout Castile⁷⁸. During the political turmoil of the reign of Enrique IV there were sporadic outbreaks of anti-*converso*

⁷⁶ Ibid., p. 84.

⁷⁷ Kaplan, *Evolution of Converso Literature*, pp. 19-22.

⁷⁸ Edwards, *Inquisition*, p. 66.

violence, including in Ciudad Real, León and Seville, and in 1473 there were massacres of *conversos* in many towns in southern Castile following an incident in Córdoba⁷⁹.

Limpieza de sangre

The Toledo *Sentencia* was based on the allegation that there was a *converso* conspiracy to adopt Christianity in order to take control of the kingdom from the nobility and eventually all Old Christians. The 'logical' response was to bar, without need for proof, all *conversos* from all posts whether public or private⁸⁰. Pope Nicholas V, in response to a petition of Juan II, issued a bull condemning discrimination against Christians on the basis of race and also excommunicating the rebels⁸¹. However Juan II's waning power resulted in him ratifying the *Sentencia* and persuading the pope to annul the excommunications in order to regain control of Toledo⁸². Similar statutes were passed by other towns during the political turbulence of the end of Juan II's reign and that of Enrique IV⁸³. Further, despite the Scriptural and theological arguments against discrimination against Jewish Christians put forward by Alonso de Cartagena and others (discussed in chapter 10), religious orders began to enact their own *limpieza de sangre* provisions, beginning with the Jeronimites in 1486, while cathedral chapters, universities and the influential military orders also came to ban New Christians from membership⁸⁴.

⁷⁹ Ruiz, *Centuries of Crisis*, p. 156; Edwards, *Inquisition*, pp. 70-2.

⁸⁰ D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Prelude to the Inquisition: The Discourse of Persecution, the Toledan Rebellion of 1449, and the Contest for Orthodoxy', in W. J. van Bekkum and P.M. Cobb (eds.), *Strategies of Medieval Community Identity: Judaism, Christianity and Islam* (Paris, Leuven, Dudley MA, 2004), pp. 52-3.

⁸¹ Kaplan, *Evolution of Converso Literature*, p. 24.

⁸² Hillgarth ii, 155 n. 2.

⁸³ Kaplan, *Evolution of Converso Literature*, p. 23.

⁸⁴ H. Kamen, *The Spanish Inquisition* (New York NY, London, 1965), pp. 123-7.

The Inquisition

The beginning of what we know as 'the Spanish Inquisition'⁸⁵ was a bull issued on 1 November 1478 by Pope Sixtus IV at the request of Ferdinand and Isabella. This bull was not implemented until September 1480, when the first tribunal was set up in Seville. This was followed by a Córdoba tribunal in 1482, and by tribunals in Jaén and Ciudad Real in 1483⁸⁶. In the same year the Queen's confessor, Thomas de Torquemada, was appointed by Pope Sixtus as the Inquisitor General⁸⁷. These facts are certain, but the true reason for the institution of the new Spanish Inquisition is less certain and poses similar questions to those raised by the 1492 expulsion. The official reason given was religious, to deal with Judaising *conversos*⁸⁸. However, that does not answer the question why this was seen as a problem so severe as to require setting up the extensive and expensive judicial mechanism of the Inquisition and the correspondingly expensive public spectacles of the *autos de fe*, let alone justifying the social and economic damage that was caused to Spanish society. The Catholic Monarchs did not themselves appear personally hostile to *conversos*; they were supported by *conversos* in the war of succession and both employed *conversos* in important posts⁸⁹.

For those who insist that the *conversos* were genuine Christians, the official reason must have been a cover-up for something more sinister. Netanyahu's view is that Ferdinand was forced into establishing the Inquisition, despite foreseeing the social and economic damage it would do, in order to diminish the riots and disorders caused

⁸⁵ Edwards points out that this should correctly be known as the 'new' Spanish Inquisition because the medieval tribunals established to deal with the Cathars and other heretics had extended into Aragon and Catalonia in the thirteenth century, *Inquisition*, pp. 47, 67.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 73-6.

⁸⁷ J. Edwards, *Torquemada and the Inquisitors* (Stroud, 2005), p. 13.

⁸⁸ Hillgarth ii, 410.

⁸⁹ Roth, *Conversos*, pp. 126-33.

by those inspired by racial hatred of Jews⁹⁰. Norman Roth traces the origin to a 1434 decree of the Basle council branding Judaisers as heretics, which he attributes to Alonso de Cartagena, and states that Alvaro de Luna before his fall from power promoted the setting up of an inquisition to investigate Judaising as part of his political struggle with influential *converso* families. However, he does not give any reason why the Catholic Monarchs actually established the Inquisition apart from downplaying the involvement of any "proven *conversos*"⁹¹. For Baer, who believed that most *conversos* were at heart still Jews, the Inquisition arose from the same religious fanaticism which lay behind the 1492 expulsion⁹². Beinhard gives primacy to the declared religious reason, but the identification of church and state gave a political aspect to the Inquisition⁹³.

Historians who take a more nuanced view of the religious status of the *conversos* tend to take a similarly nuanced view of the reasons for the institution of the new Inquisition. For Hillgarth, the need to deal with anti-*converso* riots was the reason, coupled with a desire to keep the tribunals under royal control rather than the traditional form of inquisition which was under the control of the pope and the bishops as part of a deliberate program to acquire state control over the national church⁹⁴. Kamen and Edwards both place the institution of the Inquisition within the political context, the anti-*converso* disturbances coming at a time when the Catholic Monarchs were occupied with pacifying the country after the civil war of succession⁹⁵.

⁹⁰ Netanyahu, *Origins*, p. 1041.

⁹¹ Roth, *Conversos*, pp. 223-5.

⁹² Y. Baer, *A History of the Jews in Christian Spain* (2 vols., Philadelphia PA, 1961), ii, 424-5.

⁹³ Beinhard, *Conversos on Trial*, p. 25.

⁹⁴ Hillgarth ii, 422-3.

⁹⁵ Kamen, *Historical Revision*, pp. 44-5; Edwards, *Inquisition*, pp. 72-3.

Jews and *conversos* in Burgos

Teresa de Cartagena's family had been prominent in the Burgos Jewish community before her grandfather's conversion and quickly became one of the leading *converso* families in that city.

Late thirteenth century tax records show that Burgos then had the largest Jewish community in northern Spain, with its own administration and courts⁹⁶. Most Jews lived in the Jewish quarter, which was in the streets hugging the hill below the castle and behind the cathedral⁹⁷. Burgos was in some ways untypical of Castilian towns, as trade and money-lending were controlled by the Christian elite and most craftsmen were Christians. As a result, Burgos Jews concentrated on medical practice and serving the monarch's financial interests⁹⁸. The Burgos *aljama* was sufficiently prosperous to be able to pay the huge fines levied by Enrique Trastámara when he conquered Burgos for the first time in 1366, and again at his second conquest in 1368⁹⁹, albeit with considerable sacrifice¹⁰⁰.

The anti-Jewish riots of 1391 spread to Burgos in the middle of June. Jewish sources record the almost complete destruction of the Jewish community, mainly by baptism, although in 1392 Enrique III gave royal protection to any Jews returning to the city¹⁰¹. The diminution of the Burgos Jewish community in both numbers and wealth

⁹⁶ Y. Baer, *A History of the Jews*, i, 191, 214.

⁹⁷ G. Ramos de Castro, *Juderías de Castilla y León* (Zamora, 1988), pp. 36-7.

⁹⁸ Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, p. 96.

⁹⁹ Baer, *History of the Jews*, i, 365-6.

¹⁰⁰ Ramos, *Juderías*, p. 38, who also records that, at his coronation in Burgos in 1366, Enrique granted a sum of 3,000 maravedis to the Santa Clara convent (ironically, the house where Teresa started her religious life) for relief of suffering caused by the war, the sum to be paid by Burgos Jews under pain of imprisonment and starvation.

¹⁰¹ Suárez, *Judíos Españoles*, p. 209 n. 12. Baer blames this mass conversion on the 'disloyalty' of the community leaders, particularly Teresa's grandfather, Baer, *History of the Jews*, ii, 98.

does seem to be confirmed by the fact that royal taxes paid by them in the fifteenth century were a small fraction of what had been paid in the late 13th century¹⁰². There were only 22 Jewish households in 1440¹⁰³. However, Jews in Burgos and other provinces were taxed in 1485 and 1490 towards the expenses of the Granada campaign¹⁰⁴. Anti-Jewish legislation in Burgos increased in the 1480s, forbidding Jews to sell food, ordering them to stay within the closed gates of the Jewish quarter on Christian holy days and then trying to limit the number of houses in the quarter¹⁰⁵.

Burgos Jews in 1392 complained about persecution from their recently converted brethren¹⁰⁶. At the same time, the *conversos* complained to the king about molestation, including incarceration in private jails, by some Old Christian city officials, to which Enrique II responded by ordering that the New Christians should enjoy the same treatment as Old Christians and requiring that if any were arrested they should only be held in the public jail¹⁰⁷. Although the rioting of 1449 did not spread to Burgos, there was anti-*converso* unrest there during 1459 to 1464, and the actual violence against *conversos* which began in Seville and Toledo in 1467 reached Burgos¹⁰⁸. There was no Inquisition tribunal in Burgos during the fifteenth century. Burgos came within the jurisdiction of the Valladolid tribunal. There are indications that the introduction of the Inquisition was not popular in Burgos¹⁰⁹.

¹⁰² Ruiz, *Spanish Society*, p. 100.

¹⁰³ Hillgarth ii, 144.

¹⁰⁴ Roth, *Conversos*, p. 280.

¹⁰⁵ Kamen, *Historical Revision*, p. 17.

¹⁰⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 17.

¹⁰⁷ Netanyahu, *Origins*, pp. 267-8.

¹⁰⁸ Ruiz, *Centuries of Crisis*, p. 156.

¹⁰⁹ J.A. Bonanchia Hernando and H. Casado Alonso, 'La segunda mitad del siglo XIV y el siglo XV', in J. Valdeón (ed.), *Burgos en la Edad Media* (Valladolid, 1984), p. 461.

CHAPTER 3

TERESA DE CARTAGENA AND HER FAMILY

Teresa de Cartagena

Information about her from her writings

Although we have evidence that she was a member of the well-known Santa María /de Cartagena family of Burgos (see below, pp. 66-74), what little we know about Teresa de Cartagena is mostly gleaned from her writings. The first of these was *Arboleda de los enfermos* (Grove of the Infirm), followed by *Admiración operum Dey* (Admiration of the Works of God). I will refer to these works as *Arboleda* and *Admiración* respectively. The only known extant manuscript of these two works is in the Real Biblioteca de El Escorial, occupying 76 folios of M.S. h-III-24, which are in the characteristic orthography of the fifteenth century¹. At the end of *Arboleda* the copyist names himself as Pero López del Trigo.

The title of the work and the name of the author of each of the two works is given by the copyist in the prologue. With regard to the title, this is introduced with slightly different wording for each work. For the *Arboleda*, the copyist states that this 'is called' (*se llama*²) the Grove of the Infirm, while for the *Admiración* he uses the

¹ Hutton, p. 7. *Arboleda* occupies the first 49 pages, *Admiración* folios 50r to 66r. These are followed by two apparently unrelated works ('Treatise on the end of the world' which appears to be in the same hand and 'Sayings and advice of the prophets and philosophers' which is clearly in a different hand), which are separated from each other by five ruled but blank folios (personal observation).

² Hutton, 37:1, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 23.

words 'which can fittingly be called' ('*qual co[n]uinientemente pude llamar*')³. In both the author is named as Teresa de Cartagena.

The prologue to *Arboleda* tells us that she had suffered 'grave ailments' ('*graves dolencias*')⁴, and in particular that she had completely lost her hearing. The prologue to *Admiración* tells us that she was a nun, although her order was omitted by the copyist. We are also told that this work was composed at the request of Señora Juana de Mendoça, the wife of Señor Gómez Manrique. She was a member of the important aristocratic family of the Mendozas and was a lady-in-waiting to the *infanta* Isabel, the princess of Portugal; he was a famous poet and dramatist and a leading aristocratic political figure in the reigns of Juan II and Enrique IV of Castile⁵. This dedication is consistent with the evidence, discussed below, that Teresa came from a family which was well-connected at the Castilian royal court.

Her education

It is clear from Teresa's writings that she was certainly literate, at least in the vernacular, which, as discussed in chapter 9, would be expected at that time of a woman of her class. She speaks of the comfort that reading brought her after she lost her hearing⁶. In addition to extensive use of and quotations from the Bible, which will be examined later in chapter 6, she also quotes from the Church Fathers, including Ambrose, Augustine, Gregory the Great and Jerome, from Boethius and refers to the 'Master of Sentences', Peter Lombard (as discussed in chapter 7). Almost certainly she could write Castilian, so she must have been able to read it. In

³ Hutton, 111:1-2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86.

⁴ Hutton, 37:2-3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 23.

⁵ H. Nader, *The Mendoza Family in the Spanish Renaissance 1350-1550* (New Brunswick NJ, 1979), p. 79.

⁶ Hutton, 38:17-18, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 24.

Admiración she begins her defence of her authorial authority by stating that she has learned that people were marvelling at a treatise that 'was written by my hand' (*mi mano escriuió*)⁷. This would be an unlikely statement to make if she had used an amanuensis⁸. Female literacy in Latin was less common, but the analysis of her Biblical and patristic sources in chapters 6 and 7 gives a strong indication that she could at least read Latin. Castro-Ponce gives a detailed analysis of Latin influences on her written language, both in vocabulary and grammar⁹. All of this would indicate that she was well educated, perhaps unusually well educated for a late medieval Spanish woman; female education in this period is discussed further in chapter 9.

This internal evidence from her writings that she had a good level of education for a late medieval woman is supported by what is known about her family. The fact that amongst its male members her family included some of fifteenth century Spain's leading authors and intellectuals means that it is possible, indeed likely, that she would have received a good education even before entering the religious life. There is circumstantial evidence of this: the inventory of the library of the famous chronicler, Alvar García de Santa María, brother of Teresa's grandfather Pablo de Santa María, lists a copy of Boethius in Castilian and Latin which had been borrowed by Teresa's sister and not returned¹⁰. It seems unlikely that the book was borrowed for any reason other than the sister wanted to read it, and, if her elder sister was sufficiently educated to read a work of philosophy, it is likely that Teresa had a

⁷ Hutton, 113:4-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 87.

⁸ Use of an amanuensis would also be inconsistent with her refusal to speak as described in *Arboleda*, Hutton, 40:7-44:9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 26-9.

⁹ C. Castro-Ponce, 'Teresa de Cartagena: *Arboleda de los Enfermos, Admiración Operum Dei, edición crítica singular*' (Brown Univ., Ph.D. thesis, 2001), pp. 45-54. Castro-Ponce does point out errors in Teresa's Latin quotations (ibid., pp. 46-7); there is no way of knowing whether these were made by Teresa herself or by the scribe of the Escorial manuscript, who made numerous other errors (ibid., pp. 79-83).

¹⁰ Cantera Burgos, p. 200.

similar level of education. Indeed, Teresa quotes from Boethius in *Arboleda*¹¹. There is evidence that her uncle, Alonso de Cartagena, was interested in education; Lawrance gives reasons why an anonymous Latin tract on the education of the class of people who were literate but not professional scholars was written by him¹². Teresa would probably have had access to family libraries while she was growing up: her grandfather, uncle Alonso, and her great-uncle Alvar, in addition to the numerous books they wrote themselves, had extensive private libraries¹³. It is also likely that a wealthy convent like Las Huelgas would have a good library, the probable source of '*los libros, los quales de arboledas saludables tienen en sí maravillosos enxertos*'¹⁴ to which she refers at the beginning of *Arboleda*.

She makes an intriguing reference to 'the few years that I was at the University of Salamanca'. The context of this reference close to the end of *Arboleda* is a statement of authorial humility:

'My weak ability will attempt to honour patience by briefly and simply explaining how patience dwells in the abovementioned virtues and they in it, although this may not be proven and demonstrated as well as it should, due to my weak judgment: for my limited faculty and the few years I was at the University of Salamanca [*y los pocos años que yo estudié*¹⁵ *en el estudio de Salamanca*], while they make me fully responsible for the simplicity of what I said above, grant me no wisdom in what I say now.'¹⁶

¹¹ Hutton, 58:4-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42.

¹² *Un tratado de Alonso de Cartagena sobre la educación y los estudios literarios*, ed. J.N.H. Lawrance (Barcelona, 1979), pp. 10-12. In setting out the general principles governing what should be read, the author uses an analogy between physical and spiritual food which is echoed in Teresa's writings (see chapter 4).

¹³ Cantera Burgos, pp. 198-202, 323-4, 443.

¹⁴ Hutton, 38:18-19.

¹⁵ Hutton's reading (103:23-4). Cantera Burgos, p. 539 gives the original as '*estude*' and suggests *estuve* (was) and *estudié* (studied) as alternative readings. However, the penultimate letter is clearly a 'd' and there is a mark over the final 'e' which seems to indicate an abbreviation (personal observation). Castro-Ponce gives *estudé*, Castro-Ponce, 'Teresa de Cartagena Edición Crítica', p. 213.

¹⁶ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 80-1.

For reasons discussed in chapter 8 the apparent self-deprecation should not be taken at face value, but the reference to Salamanca is clearly made in the context of claiming to be educated¹⁷.

However, this raises the immediate question as to what Teresa was doing at the University of Salamanca. At this time, and for a long time afterwards, in none of the universities of Europe could women officially enrol as students¹⁸. There are examples of women receiving some higher education through private teaching; Abelard's teaching of Heloise is a notorious example. There is an intriguing illustration in a copy of Nicholas of Lyra's *Postilla litteralis super Bibliam* made in Paris in the second quarter of the fourteenth century¹⁹. It shows Nicholas teaching in a classroom (almost certainly the University of Paris where he spent his entire career); at the front is a figure which appears to be a young woman. Although she is modestly dressed with her head covered by a scarf (she looks very like a modern Moslem woman in a hijab), she does not appear to be in a religious habit. Beside her a man, who does not appear to be tonsured, seems to be putting her forward to Nicholas for teaching. The MS gives no clue as to who she might be. There is a statement in the Powicke and Emden edition of Rashdall's *Medieval Universities* that Isabella the Catholic was said to have summoned Doña Beatriz Galindo from Salamanca to teach

¹⁷ As discussed in chapters 4 and 5, Teresa's works show a knowledge of rhetoric, a subject taught in the first stage of university study, J.J. Murphy, *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages: A History of Rhetorical Theory from Saint Augustine to the Renaissance* (Berkeley CA, 1974), pp. 109-11.

¹⁸ F.J. Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights: Reform and Renaissance for Women in the Twelfth Century* (Philadelphia PA, 2007), p. 13. Further, there were statements by academic theologians that women could not study theology in an academic sense because they did not have the necessary mental capacity, A.J. Minnis, 'De impedimento sexus: Women's Bodies and Medieval Impediments to Female Ordination', in P. Biller and Minnis A.J. (eds.), *Medieval Theology and the Natural Body* (York, 1997), p. 123.

¹⁹ D.C. Klepper, *The Insight of Unbelievers: Nicholas of Lyra and Christian Reading of Jewish Text in the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia PA, 2007), p. 127, fig. 3.

her Latin²⁰. However, the cited reference for this statement is an 1884 piece on Salamanca by Henri Graux²¹, which is not an academic study but rather a somewhat lyrical travelogue about the town and university. Although there is evidence that Beatriz Galindo was known as 'la Latina', it is less certain that she ever taught Isabella Latin or that Beatriz learned her Latin at Salamanca²².

One possibility is that Teresa was sent by her family to study there, most likely in a convent, before she entered the Poor Clare convent in Burgos²³. Besides the Franciscan convents discussed below, another possible location for her in Salamanca would be the Dominican convent of Las Dueñas, founded in 1419 and facing the prestigious Salamanca headquarters of the Dominican Friars, St Esteban. There was a family connection with the University of Salamanca; at least two of her uncles, Gonzalo and Alonso de Cartagena studied canon and civil law there at the beginning of the fifteenth century before they both embarked on ecclesiastical careers. A third uncle, the youngest son of don Pablo, Alvar Sánchez de Santa María, may also have studied at Salamanca²⁴. Another possibility is that the Franciscans sent her there to study. There is a convent of the Poor Clares, Santa Clara, in Salamanca, founded in 1238. In the fourteenth century this convent gained the title 'Real' and it became prosperous, with noble ladies entering first as pensioners and then as nuns²⁵. The convent was extensively damaged by fire in 1413 and rebuilding was not completed

²⁰ *The Universities of Europe in the Middle Ages*, ed. H. Rashdall (3 vols, Oxford, 1936), ii, 88.

²¹ C.H. Graux and H. Graux, *Notices bibliographiques et autres articles publiés dans les revues critique* (Paris, 1884), p. 320.

²² B.F. Weissberger, *Isabel Rules: Constructing Queenship, Wielding Power* (Minneapolis MN, 2004), p. 137.

²³ The evidence that she was a member of this house is discussed below at p. 71.

²⁴ Cantera Burgos, pp. 416, 480.

²⁵ A. Riesco Terrero, *Datos para la historia del Real Convento de Clarissas de Salamanca: Catálogo documental de su archivo* (León, 1977), p. 14.

until the end of the fifteenth century²⁶. However, the community clearly remained in active existence; its archives record a gift of grain in July 1413 from the bishop of Salamanca expressly because of the catastrophe and numerous other donations up to 1449²⁷, the last year Teresa could have been sent to Salamanca as a Franciscan²⁸. This means that it is possible that Teresa could have been in this community, although it is uncertain whether she could have stayed in this building. Another possibility is that she lived in the Convento de Santa Isabel, a convent for Franciscan Third Order nuns founded in 1433²⁹. Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim speculate that she could be referring to the Franciscan centre for religious studies at Salamanca, the Convent of San Francisco³⁰. However, this was a male institution, so even if she could have studied there (which must be questionable as Poor Clares were supposed to be enclosed) she must have lived elsewhere.

The other question is what she would have studied at Salamanca. The main field of study at Salamanca was law, with the traditional arts subjects, grammar, logic, rhetoric, arithmetic, geometry, and astrology forming the foundation courses. The study of theology did not begin until 1381, and even then was not successfully established until Benedict XIII's reform in 1416³¹. As law and theology were advanced courses, it is unlikely that Teresa studied them; probably she took the introductory courses of grammar, logic and rhetoric.

²⁶ Ibid., p. 15.

²⁷ Ibid., pp. 88-95.

²⁸ In that year she received permission to transfer from that order, see below, p. 67.

²⁹ A.R.G. de Ceballos, *Guía artística de Salamanca* (León, 2005), p. 120.

³⁰ D. Seidenspinner-Núñez and Y. Kim, 'Historicizing Teresa: Reflections on new documents regarding sor Teresa de Cartagena', *La Corónica*, 32 no. 2 (2004), p. 139 n. 41.

³¹ Nader, *Mendoza Family*, pp. 146-7.

Her deafness

The 'few years that I was at the University of Salamanca' must have been prior to her deafness, as all teaching in medieval schools was oral.

Her text amply confirms the statement in the prologue that she suffered from chronic ill-health and that in adulthood she became completely deaf as a result of illness. The first section of *Arboleda*³² talks about the effect that her deafness had on her physical and spiritual life, as discussed in chapter 4. There are indications that deafness was not the only physical ailment she suffered. In expanding on the analogy made in *Arboleda* between physical chastisement administered by an earthly father and the discipline of her Heavenly Father, Teresa says that her 'whipping' began in early childhood and continued into adolescence, then was doubled in her youth, the latter probably referring to the onset of deafness (the timing of this onset is discussed below). At the beginning of *Admiración* she refers to 'the illnesses and physical sufferings I have continually for companions'³³. Also in *Arboleda*, discussing the need for invalids to embrace their suffering for its spiritual outcome and to abjure the world, she says:

'Worldly pleasures despise us, health forsakes us,
friends forget us, relatives get angry, and even one's
own mother gets annoyed with her sickly daughter...'³⁴

Seidenspinner-Núñez³⁵ argues that these words are 'obliquely autobiographical'.

While there is no evidence that this was the case, there does seem to be experiential

³² Hutton, 37:8-44:9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 23-6.

³³ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86.

³⁴ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 46. '*Los plazerres que en él son del todo nos habor[r]esçen, la salut nos desanpara, los amigos nos oluidan, los parientes se enojan, e avn la propia madre se enoja con la hija enferma...*', Hutton, 63:4-7.

³⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, p. 120.

feeling behind these words. If so, it is possible that Teresa was a sickly child before entering the monastery of Santa Clara.

Reasons to link her to the Santa María/de Cartagena family

Wills

The first documentary evidence that Teresa was a member of the well-known Santa María/de Cartagena family was uncovered by Francisco Cantera Burgos. In his work on the Santa María family he lists the bequests in the 1453 will of Alonso de Cartagena, bishop of Burgos, to the children of his brother, Pedro de Cartagena. These were the firstborn, Alfonso, brothers Alvaro and Lope de Rojas and their sisters 'Domine Johannes' (presumably Juana de Cartagena), Teresa, Marie Sarabie and Elvira de Rojas. The sum of 100 florines was left to 'Teresa, a nun, to subsidise her maintenance'³⁶. The level of education and court connections evidenced in her writings are consistent with membership of this well-connected and influential *converso* family.

Teresa is also mentioned in connection with the 1478 will of her father. Rivera³⁷ reproduces a section from a 1509 confirmation by Juana I of a charter of Ferdinand in favour of the heirs of Pedro de Cartagena, which contains the testimony of three witnesses as to the identity of those heirs. They all list Teresa as the youngest daughter of Pedro's first wife, María Saravia³⁸. Rivera notes that the son of Mencía de Rojas, Pedro's second wife, who predeceased his father is not listed although two other sons who also predeceased their father are listed. She thinks this could be

³⁶ 'Ad Teresie moniali centum fl. ad aliquod subsidium sustentacionis', Cantera Burgos, p. 537.

³⁷ M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'Teresa de Cartagena vivía en 1478', in G de la Peña (ed.), *Estudios en memoria del Profesor Dr. Carlos Sáez* (Alcalá de Henares, 2007), pp. 768-72.

³⁸ The others are sons Alonso and Alvaro and daughters Maria, Juana and Teresa, *ibid.*, p. 769.

explained by the fact that the two listed sons left legitimate heirs, whereas the unlisted son was a canon of Burgos cathedral and so could not have had legitimate children³⁹.

If this explanation is correct, it would suggest that childless Teresa was alive at the time her father died.

Papal petitions

The connection with the de Cartagena family was confirmed by two papal petitions which only recently came to the attention of Teresa scholars⁴⁰, although they had been published in 1966-7 in the *Bulario de la Universidad de Salamanca*. They are both from Alonso de Cartagena as bishop of Burgos and state that they are submitted on behalf of his niece, 'Teresa Gómez⁴¹ de Cartagena'.

The first, granted on 3 April 1449⁴², sought papal dispensation for Teresa's transfer from the Franciscans. It states that she was a professed nun in the monastery of Santa Clara outside the walls of Burgos, which must be the same Santa Clara convent which still exists in Burgos, housing Poor Clares⁴³. The petition goes on to state that she was:

'...no longer able to remain comfortably with peace of mind in a monastery and Order of this type, for specific and reasonable causes...'⁴⁴

³⁹ Rivera, 'Teresa de Cartagena vivía en 1478', p. 768.

⁴⁰ Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim, 'Historicizing Teresa', p. 123.

⁴¹ There is no other known use of this second name for Teresa or any other member of her family. Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim suggest that it might be a mistranscription by the editor of an abbreviation for 'García', which was used by members of the family in conjunction with the Santa María surname, *ibid.*, p. 124 n. 10.

⁴² *Registra Supplicationem* 436, fo. 114^v -115, Vatican Archives. A transcription and English translation of both of the documents is appended to Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim, 'Historicizing Teresa', pp. 142-6.

⁴³ Although this convent is located inside the present boundaries of Burgos, it is on the opposite side of the river Arlanzón from the walls of the medieval town.

⁴⁴ Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim, 'Historicizing Teresa', p. 143.

Unfortunately, we are not told what those 'specific and reasonable causes' were. The petition states that she bears 'a special devotion to the Benedictine and Cistercian Orders' and that in these orders 'she has found a kind welcome'. This seems to indicate that she no longer felt she was welcome among the Poor Clares.

One possible explanation for her desire to move could be personal problems and conflicts within her community. Given the strictness of several papal injunctions against leaving the Franciscan or Dominican orders⁴⁵, there must be a doubt as to whether a mere personality conflict would be a 'specific and reasonable' cause enough to justify a move from the Franciscans⁴⁶. While it was generally acceptable to move to a more severe order, both the Poor Clares and Cistercian nuns were strictly enclosed, and, at least in principle, the former had a stricter rule of poverty.

One source of conflict in the fifteenth century which gave rise to papal petitions asking for permission to leave was the monastic reform movement, which affected many orders⁴⁷. At the beginning of the fifteenth century many houses of the Poor Clares had become very lax⁴⁸, but the Colettine and other reforms of the Second Order spread widely in the middle of the century⁴⁹. There had been a reform of Teresa's monastery of Santa Clara during 1445, carried out by a daughter of the Duke of Arjona, a Poor Clare from Valladolid⁵⁰. The Santa Clara convents in Valladolid

⁴⁵ Ibid., p. 127.

⁴⁶ Although members of influential families seem to have been able to bend the rules, Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim, 'Historicizing Teresa', p. 127.

⁴⁷ L. Schmugge, 'Female Petitioners in the Papal Penitentiary', in P. Stafford and A.B. Mulder-Bakker (eds.), *Gendering the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 2001), p. 161.

⁴⁸ J.R.H. Moorman, *A History of the Franciscan Order: From its Origins to the Year 1517* (Chicago, 1988), p. 548.

⁴⁹ Ibid., pp. 552-6.

⁵⁰ Serrano, pp. 210, 232.

and Salamanca had been reformed in the 1440's, despite resistance from the nuns⁵¹. If Teresa had studied at the Salamanca convent after she joined the Poor Clares she could have been there while the reform had been taking place and therefore would have known what would be involved in living in a reformed convent. Teresa speaks of herself in *Arboleda* as:

'...enmeshed in the confusion of worldly chatter, with my understanding disordered and bound up in worldly cares...'⁵²

If this means that at the time of the petition she was still concerned with 'worldly chatter'⁵³, it could be that she found the reformed Santa Clara monastery had become too strict for her and wanted to move to a less restrictive and more 'social' community. Against this interpretation is the fact that members of her family, in particular her grandfather and great uncle, were closely involved with Juan II's monastic reform and sought the reform of the San Juan monastery in Burgos in 1434⁵⁴. Alonso de Cartagena was also involved in monastic reform⁵⁵, and this 1445 reform of Santa Clara de Burgos, done at royal command, occurred while he was bishop of Burgos.

Another potential explanation derives from her *conversa* status. This petition was presented at a time when the riots in Toledo, which started in January 1449, were turning increasingly anti-*converso*⁵⁶. Cohen⁵⁷ argues that the preaching and other activities of the mendicant orders, the Dominicans and the First Order Franciscans,

⁵¹ E.A. Lehfeldt, *Religious Women in Golden Age Spain* (Aldershot, 2005), pp. 131-2.

⁵² Seidenspinner-Núñez, 26. '*estando enbuelta en el tropel de las fablas mundas e bien rebuelto e atado mi entendimiento en el cuydado de aquéllos...*', Hutton, 40:29-30.

⁵³ She viewed this sin as the reason for her suffering (see chapter 8).

⁵⁴ Lehfeldt, *Religious Women*, p. 127.

⁵⁵ Serrano, p. 209.

⁵⁶ The first *limpieza de sangre* (purity of blood) statute in Spain, the *Sentencia-Estatuto*, was proclaimed by the Toledan rebels in June 1449, A.A. Sicroff, *Les controverses des statuts de "pureté de sang" en Espagne du XV au XVII siècle* (Paris, 1960), p. 34.

⁵⁷ J. Cohen, *The Friars and the Jews: The Evolution of Medieval Anti-Judaism* (Ithaca NY, 1982).

were a major factor in the growth across Europe of Christian hostility towards the Jews in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. In fifteenth century Spain, one of the leading anti-Jewish polemicists who presented Jews as a danger to Christians was the Franciscan, Alonso de Espina⁵⁸, and the Franciscans were the leaders in the fifteenth century move in Spain to warn against the danger posed by Judaizing converts through writing and preaching⁵⁹. Although these activities were carried out by First Order brothers, houses of Poor Clares often had First Order brothers as chaplains, preachers and confessors⁶⁰ so would be likely to share these beliefs. Teresa, a member of a family well-known to be of Jewish origins, could have been finding it increasingly difficult to live in a Franciscan convent.

This petition was granted. The statement in the petition that Teresa 'has found a kind welcome' in 'the aforementioned monasteries of the Cistercians and Benedictines' could mean that she had already made the move from Santa Clara. It is more likely that she moved shortly after the petition was granted, and that this reference relates to enquiries of one or more suitable houses made on her behalf before the petition was presented, because the petition continues with a request to the Pope that he 'deign to order that she be received there'. This latter possibility is also supported by the wording of the second successful petition from Alonso de Cartagena on behalf of his niece Teresa, granted on 2 May 1449⁶¹. This asks that, 'after she has entered this order', she be entitled to the common stipend of the nuns of that order, and that, once she has reached twenty-five years of age, she be entitled to be appointed or elected to

⁵⁸ Hillgarth ii, 156.

⁵⁹ Sicroff, *Controverses*, p. 67.

⁶⁰ Moorman, *History of the Franciscan Order*, pp. 214-5.

⁶¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim, 'Historicizing Teresa', p. 145.

any 'abbatial dignities', notwithstanding any contrary constitutions or regulations of the order or monastery to which she transfers.

Unfortunately, the petitions do not tell us which convent she entered after leaving Santa Clara. However, almost certainly this would have been the Cistercian foundation, Santa María La Real de Las Huelgas ('Las Huelgas'), also located in Burgos on the opposite side of the Arlanzón river from the medieval town. There are several reasons for this supposition⁶². First, this is the only Cistercian convent close to Burgos and there were no Benedictine convents near Burgos⁶³. Second, and more importantly, at this time this was the most powerful and prestigious convent in Spain, founded in the late twelfth century by Alfonso VIII of Castile and León and his wife Eleanor of England whose tombs lie in the centre of the choir of the huge convent church, and treated by their successors as a royal chapel⁶⁴. The abbess of Las Huelgas, who was always of noble blood and often royal, exercised unique and extensive powers⁶⁵. The choir nuns were almost exclusively drawn from the aristocracy⁶⁶. Alonso de Cartagena, an influential member of a well-connected family and bishop of the diocese, would surely have desired to promote his family's interests by placing his niece in this important convent⁶⁷.

⁶² Kim agrees, pointing out documented relationships between Teresa's family and Las Huelgas, Y. Kim, 'Dolor y sufrimiento en la temprana Edad Moderna peninsular: *Arboleda de los Enfermos y Amiraçion Operum Dey*' (Boston College Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, Ph.D. thesis, 2006), pp. 25-6.

⁶³ At this time there were only two convents in the Burgos area, Santa Clara and Las Huelgas, J.A. Bonanchia Hernando and H. Casado Alonso, 'La segunda mitad del siglo XIV y el siglo XV' in J. Valdeón (ed.) *Burgos en la Edad Media* (Valladolid, 1984), p. 444-5.

⁶⁴ P. Linehan, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (Oxford, 1993), pp. 262, 600.

⁶⁵ R.E. Surtz, *Writing Women in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain: the Mothers of Saint Teresa of Avila* (Philadelphia PA, 1995), p. 2. These powers are discussed further in chapter 9.

⁶⁶ Hillgarth i, 133.

⁶⁷ This raises the question why Teresa did not join Las Huelgas in the first place, as either her grandfather or uncle would have been Bishop of Burgos when she began her religious life. One reason could be that her father was not yet ennobled at that time (see below pp. 86-7). As stated above, the Las Huelgas nuns were recruited exclusively from the aristocracy.

A third reason could be to give Teresa protection from the rising tide of anti-*converso* feeling. Alonso de Cartagena was well aware of the dangers, as these petitions were presented in the same year he wrote his work *Defensorium Unitatis Christianae* against the threat to Christianity from divisions over issues of Jewish origin⁶⁸. Many of the nuns in La Huelgas would be members of aristocratic and powerful families with some Jewish blood in their genealogies⁶⁹, so his niece would be likely to have better protection in Las Huelgas than in the Franciscan order. The need for protection is another reason for thinking that she went to Las Huelgas, as it would have enabled the family to keep her close to their Burgos power base⁷⁰.

Other documents

The library of the RAH contains a manuscript in the Salazar y Castro collection entitled "*Casa de Cartagena. Sucesión de don Pablo de Santa María, obispo de Cartagena, canceller mayor de Juan II, rey de Castilla*"⁷¹. This gives details about the life and family of Pablo de Santa María up to the early seventeenth century. The section on Pedro de Cartagena states that he had two wives, five sons and four daughters. The four daughters are listed as (1) Doña María de Saravia, (2) Doña Juana de Cartagena, (3) Doña Elvira de Rojas and (4) Doña Teresa de Cartagena. In the brief note on each daughter, Teresa is stated to be the fourth daughter. The author

⁶⁸ Sicroff, *Controverses*, p. 41-2.

⁶⁹ By this time most of the great families of Spain had some Jewish blood, *Ibid.*, p. 39.

⁷⁰ Rivera has suggested that Teresa could have become an Augustinian canoness in a house founded by Alonso de Cartagena in 1456, 'Teresa de Cartagena vivía en 1478', p. 766. This assertion ignores the fact that the 1449 papal petition, which was granted, specifically requested transfer to the Cistercians or Benedictines. Further, she does not deal with the problem of a 7 year gap between the petition and the founding. She originally suggested (in M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'La Admiración de la obras de Dios de Teresa de Cartagena y la querella de las mujeres', in C. Segura Graiño (ed.), *La voz del silencio, I: fuentes directas para la historia de las mujeres (siglos VIII-XVIII)* (Madrid, 1992), p. 278), that Teresa was either in the Augustinian or Jeronomite orders on the basis of Teresa's references to the writings of these Fathers. However, a more likely explanation of these references is that Augustine and Jerome were regarded as being among the most important patristic authorities. Teresa's use of these authorities is discussed in Chapter 7.

⁷¹ RAH, B-92 (Salazar y Castro), fo. 67-82.

is generally concerned in the manuscript with descent and inheritance, and appears usually to be careful to give children in birth order, but this order conflicts with the testimony given by contemporary witnesses discussed above (p. 66). It is also inconsistent with known dates. Lope de Cartagena, the eldest child of Pedro de Cartagena and his second wife, was born in 1444⁷², so Elvira, the known daughter of that marriage and listed in third place, must have been born later. We know from the papal petition discussed above that Teresa had been a nun for some time in 1449, so it is impossible that she was born after Elvira. Her placement in the Salazar y Castro manuscript is perhaps explained by the fact that the author clearly knew a lot less about her than her sisters, and, having no children, was of little interest to a genealogical writer. Two other manuscripts relating to the De Cartagena family in the same collection mention Teresa⁷³, giving the same information as B-92; it is possible that they are all derived from the same source but as none of them are dated it is impossible to say which came first.

With respect to the other sisters, the author states to whom they were married and lists their children. All that is recorded of Teresa is '*que fue desposada con el s^{or} de Hormaza y muria sin surz^{on}.*' The manuscript uses these last three words in connection with other members of the family, but Teresa is the only person described as *desposada con* rather than *caso con*. An explanation of the unusual language in connection with Teresa could be that *desposada* has here the meaning 'betrothed', indicating that only the first stage of marriage, the mutual declaration of intention (*los desposarios*) had been gone through⁷⁴. Majuelo saw another document in the Salazar

⁷² Cantera Burgos, p. 505.

⁷³ RAH, E-7 (Salazar y Castro), fo. 27-30; RAH, O-19 (Salazar y Castro), fo. 251v.

⁷⁴ This usage is demonstrated in another document in the same collection, RAH, D-25 (Salazar y Castro), fo. 195v-196, at fo. 195r, which states that Gonzalez Nuñez de Casteñada "*fue desposada con*

y Castro collection, which I did not see as it is now withdrawn from public access because of its poor condition, which may be earlier than the manuscripts discussed above. Majuelo says that it is dated 1622 but is stated to be a copy of an original, and that it mentions Teresa last in a list of Pedro de Cartagena's children, although it does state that his first wife was her mother so the list cannot be intended to be in birth order. She is described as: '*Monja fue desposada con el señor de ormaza*'. Her sisters, who all married, are described as '*mujer de*' their respective husbands⁷⁵. This would seem to confirm that Teresa was not married but merely betrothed.

El señor de Hormaza

Hormaza is a village about 30 kilometres due west of Burgos, and contains the remains of a fortified castle. According to another RAH document in the Salazar y Castro collection, which sets out the genealogy of the Carrillo family⁷⁶, the lordship of Hormaza was held by that family from about the thirteenth century. The document states that the eighth Señor de Hormaza, Juan Carrillo, died without an heir (this document does not state whether he was married) and his brother Pedro succeeded to the title. Pedro died leaving only a daughter, Doña Juana, who became Señora de Hormaza and was married to Gonzalo Nuñez (or Muñoz) de Casteñada. The Casteñada family then held the lordship until they, in turn died out in the sixteenth century⁷⁷.

Juana Lopez de la Serna...se mato morias...despues de [habia] consumado el matrimonial". The second stage, *las velaciones*, was the religious ceremony after which the marriage could be consummated, I. Beceiro Pita and R Cordoba de la Llave, *Parentesco, poder y mentalidad: la nobleza castellana siglos XII-XV* (Madrid, 1990), p. 197.

⁷⁵M. Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena. La obra de una mujer castellana del siglo XV' (Universidad de País Vasco, Ph.D. thesis, 2008), pp. 133-5, 137.

⁷⁶ RAH, B-31 (Salazar y Castro), fo. 117-147.

⁷⁷ RAH D-25 (Salazar y Castro), fo. 195v gives a different lineage as it states that Juan de Carrillo was the father of this Doña Juana. His wife is named in a different hand as Doña Inés Hinestrosa. The same lineage is given in a genealogical table of the Casteñadas in the chapter on Hormaza in E. Cooper, *Castillos señoriales en la corona de Castilla* (4 vols., Salamanca, 1991), iii, 574.

Documents from the Burgos archives cited by Cantera Burgos show that the Santa María/Cartagena and Carrillo families knew each other. In 1426 Alvar García de Santa María and Juan Carrillo are named, along with Pero Carrillo de Toledo from another branch of the family, as *regidores* of Burgos⁷⁸. The first reference to Pedro de Cartagena in those records relate to a major joust organised by Burgos in 1424 to celebrate the first visit of Juan II to the city, in which both Pedro de Cartagena and Juan Carrillo de Hormaza took part⁷⁹. In December 1432 an entry dealing with a dispute in the Burgos ruling council names Pero Carrillo, Alvar García de Santa María, his brother Pedro Suárez, his nephew Cartagena (presumably Pedro) and others. Juan Carrillo is named as being involved in the debate on this issue⁸⁰.

It is not clear who was the "Señor de Hormaza" to whom Teresa was betrothed, if indeed she was. The Juan Carrillo referred to in these documents would presumably have been about the same age as or older than Teresa's father. Salazar y Castro B-31 states of the last Juan Carrillo to be Señor de Hormaza that he died at the War of Antequera⁸¹, and gives four references to the *Crónica de Juan II*. There is one reference to Juan Carrillo de Ormaza in the section of that chronicle that gives an account of the battle of Antequera and surrounding events; he is listed as fighting in a skirmish with a force of Moors who had attacked the camp of the Bishop of

⁷⁸ Cantera Burgos, p. 92.

⁷⁹ Ibid. p. 465.

⁸⁰ Ibid. p. 121.

⁸¹ The words are '*murio en la Guerra de Antequera*', RAH B-31 (Salazar y Castro), f. 120v. This battle was in 1410. The manuscript ends the entry on him with the words "Hasta año 1431", but the meaning of this is unclear as it conflicts with the statement as to his death. Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena,' p. 139 has transcribed this as '*servió*', but, while this would make sense, it is not a possible transcription of the word in the manuscript which is clearly '*murió*'. Another dubious transcription in Majuelo's thesis is from RAH O-19 (Salazar y Castro). The entry for Teresa is crammed into a narrow column in the right hand margin and very abbreviated. After her name there is a single letter which looks like a 't' before '*desposada con el señor de Hormaza*' - Majuelo at p. 136 gives this as '*murió*', which seems most unlikely.

Palencia⁸². Juan Carrillo de Ormaza appears again later in this chronicle, which describes in detail his heroic role in the capture of Ximena (Jimena la Frontera) on 10th March 1431⁸³. The Burgos documents referred to above show that Juan Carrillo de Hormaza was alive 14 years after Antequera. They also seem to show him still alive in December 1432. If the chronology of Teresa's life discussed below is correct, Teresa would have been about eight in 1432, a possible age for a betrothal for reasons of family alliances⁸⁴. Such considerable discrepancies in age were not unknown; in particular, as if Juan was without an heir, as indicated by Salazar y Castro B-31, he would want a young wife. With regard to other candidates, Salazar y Castro B-31 states that Pedro Carrillo's daughter inherited the lordship of Hormaza, indicating that she was the legitimate child of a marriage. She married Gonzalez de Castañeda, then the title passed to their eldest son, Alonso, who was married to Maria Guzmán y Castilla and died in 1460, and their heir died unmarried aged 16. There is no possible Castañeda candidate for betrothal to Teresa⁸⁵.

If Teresa was indeed betrothed, there are a number of possible reasons why she did not marry. If she was betrothed to Juan Carrillo, he may well have died before she

⁸² Fernán Pérez de Guzmán, 'Comienza la crónica del serenísimo príncipe Don Juan, segundo rey deste nombre en Castilla y en León' in *Crónicas de los reyes de Castilla*, (3 vols, Madrid, 1877), ii, p. 318.

⁸³ *Ibid.*, pp. 493-4. There are other Juan Carrillos mentioned in the accounts of the battle of La Higuera, which was part of the same campaign (and in which Teresa's father fought), in *Crónica de don Álvaro de Luna, condestable de Castilla, Maestro de Santiago* ed. J. de Mata Carriazo (Madrid, 1940), but they are consistently distinguished by titles; there is a Juan Carrillo '*adelantado de Caçorla*' (pp. 128-9) and another who was '*alacade mayor de Toledo*' (p. 133).

⁸⁴ The minimum age for betrothal under Spanish law at that time was seven, although noble families sometimes arranged the betrothal of even younger children, Berceiro and Cordoba, *Parentesco, poder y mentalidad*, pp. 202-3.

⁸⁵ Rivera in 'Teresa de Cartagena vivía en 1478', p. 765, states that Teresa was married to the brother of Juan Carrillo, whom she names as Alfonso Fernández de Castro, but this is inconsistent with the documentary evidence discussed above. She was unable to find any documentary evidence of a connection to Teresa (as did Majuelo, 'Teresa de Cartagena,' p. 138), but she does cite in support a coat of arms on Hormaza castle which in the wife's field has '*flores de lis*' (*ibid.*, pp. 765-6). However, the Santa María/de Cartagena coat of arms, as displayed on Alonso de Cartagena's tomb in Burgos Cathedral, is a single fleur de lys (personal observation). Cooper says of a shield on Hormaza castle, which contains three fleurs de lys in one quartering, that it is not possible to say for certain to whom it belonged, Cooper, *Castillos señoriales*, iii, 572; a photograph of the shield is on p. 1521.

reached an age at which the marriage could be consummated, which would explain the termination of the betrothal and a possible motive for her entry to the convent. However, as mentioned in n. 77 on p. 74, other sources indicate that he married someone else and had a daughter. The same problem would arise if the betrothal was to Pedro Carrillo, if Salazar y Castro B-31 is correct and he inherited the title on his brother's death. Another explanation for the termination of the betrothal might be found in what Teresa says in *Arboleda* about her poor health and apparently autobiographical references to a sickly child. If her health while young indicated that she was unlikely to successfully bear children, that would be a reason for the man to want to terminate the betrothal. Although *los desposorios* resulted in a legally binding marriage, there were ways of terminating the marriage prior to *las velaciones* and consummation. One way was if one of the couple entered a religious order⁸⁶. This opens the possibility that Teresa may have entered the Santa Clara convent in order that her marriage resulting from going through a ceremony of *los desposorios* could be dissolved⁸⁷. This would explain her apparent lack of religious fervour in her early days as a nun, a sinful state from which she believes she was saved by her deafness sent from God.

Chronology of Teresa's life

There is no known record of the date of either Teresa's birth or death. Cantera Burgos suggested a date within the range between 1420 and 1435⁸⁸, and placed her as the

⁸⁶ Berceiro and Cordoba, *Parentesco, poder y mentalidad*, p. 214. This arose from a decision of Pope Alexander III that if one partner to an unconsummated marriage decided to enter the religious life, even if the other did not agree, the marriage would be dissolved and the other partner was free to remarry, D. D'Avray, *Medieval Marriage: Symbolism and Society* (Oxford, 2005), pp. 173-4.

⁸⁷ D'Avray cites two examples from late fifteenth century Spain where an unconsummated marriage was dissolved when the woman entered the religious life. However, in one case the woman had been forced into the convent and, although professed, she did not stay; as a result, the husband's second marriage was invalid, D. D'Avray, *Medieval Marriage*, pp. 186-7.

⁸⁸ Cantera Burgos, p. 538.

fourth child and second daughter of Pedro de Cartagena, the third son of Pablo de Santa María, by his first wife María de Sarabia⁸⁹. The best information we have on her date of birth derives from the second papal petition which asks that she be eligible for appointment or election to a conventual dignity '...as soon as she has reached the twenty-fifth year of her age...'⁹⁰. This petition is dated May 1449, so we know that she had not reached twenty five by that date. However, the need for haste stated in the petition would indicate that she must have been close to her twenty-fifth birthday. This would indicate a birth date sometime after May 1424, perhaps no later than early 1425.

The request that Teresa be eligible for positions of authority in the convent to which she was transferring would also indicate that she was not deaf at that time. Any position of authority in monastic life, from the head of the community downwards, requires the ability to communicate with members of the community. Teresa makes it clear that, once she became deaf, she felt very isolated because she was not able to communicate⁹¹.

We do not know when she first entered religious life in the Monasterio de Santa Clara. However, her references to her worldliness before her deafness would seem to indicate that her entrance to the religious life was not the result of an individual religious conversion. It may have resulted from the termination of her betrothal before she reached marriageable age as discussed above, particularly if the reason for that termination was that she was sickly and therefore any marriage was unlikely. In any event it would not be surprising that a family with so many leading clerics would

⁸⁹ Cantera Burgos, p. 504.

⁹⁰ Seidenspinner-Núñez and Kim, 'Historicizing Teresa', p. 145.

⁹¹ Hutton, 37:8-38:13, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 25-6.

consider placing one of its female members in the religious life. This would point to a conventional age of entry into the religious life, at this time probably about fourteen or fifteen⁹², giving a date of entry shortly before 1440. This would be consistent with the possibility that she was not eligible to join the prestigious La Huelgas at that time because her father was not ennobled until 1440. The January 1446 document setting up the *mayorazgo* (entail or right of primogeniture) granted to Pedro de Cartagena does not list Teresa⁹³ although it does refer to the son or legitimate descendent of her sisters, which would indicate that by that date she was a professed religious with no prospect of legitimate male descendents⁹⁴.

There are a number of pointers to the approximate date of the illness which caused her deafness. As discussed above, the second papal petition makes it almost certain that this occurred after 1449. Another work in the Escorial manuscript containing both her works, by the same copyist, is dated 1481, so this is the likely approximate date for this copy of Teresa's works⁹⁵. We know that *Arboleda* was completed first because she says so in *Admiración*⁹⁶, so that the former must have been written before 1480. There must have been a time period between the two works long enough for *Arboleda* to have been sufficiently circulated to attract the criticism from the 'prudente varones' that she refers to at the beginning of *Admiración*, which would indicate a date no later than the mid 1470's⁹⁷. In *Arboleda* she states that she was

⁹² P.D. Johnson, *Equal in Monastic Profession: Religious Women in Medieval France* (Chicago, 1991), p. 106.

⁹³ Cantera Burgos, p. 472.

⁹⁴ García agrees with this conclusion, C. García, 'Los tratados de Teresa de Cartagena dentro de la evolución de la epístola', in A.M. Beresford (ed.), *"Quien hubiese tal ventura": Medieval Hispanic Studies in Honour of Alan Deyermond* (London, 1997), p. 152.

⁹⁵ Kim, 'Dolor y Sofrimento', p. 42 n. 38.

⁹⁶ Hutton, 113:19-114:19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 88.

⁹⁷ This is consistent with the dating given by Castro-Ponce on the basis of characteristics of the language of the works, which is typical of the period 1474-1525, Castro-Ponce, 'Teresa de Cartagena Edición Crítica', p. 14.

writing twenty years after the illness that caused her deafness⁹⁸, so, if the supposition about the date of *Arboleda* is correct, that illness occurred before 1460, possibly in the second half of the 1450's⁹⁹. If that dating is correct, Teresa would have been in the second half of her twenties when she became deaf. In *Arboleda* she says that the suffering came to her 'at an opportune time'¹⁰⁰ and that her punishment, her suffering, was 'redoubled in my youth'¹⁰¹. There were a number of schemes for the division of the human lifespan in use in the later Middle Ages, into three, four or seven ages¹⁰². While the spans of each age vary somewhat between sources, the term 'youth' (*jouentut*) which Teresa uses begins at the earliest at 25 and finishes between 40 and 50¹⁰³. This is supported by Teresa's statement, when discussing in *Arboleda* the way suffering combats the seven deadly sins, that '...suffering so impugns youth [*la jouentud*] that it makes a thirty-year-old seem more ancient than Simeon the Just...'¹⁰⁴. Combined with the evidence from the manuscript date, this points to her deafness beginning in the second half of her twenties and while she was living in Las Huelgas, but certainly no earlier than late 1449¹⁰⁵. There is also circumstantial evidence for an adult onset of her hearing loss. She mentions hearing sermons 'before my ears closed

⁹⁸ Her actual words are '...for it is now twenty years since this bridle constrained the jaws of my vanities!' (Seidenspinner-Núñez, 36; '*que oy son veinte años que este freno ya dicho començó a costreñir la haz de mis vanidades*' Hutton, 51:30-1); this statement comes at the end of a long passage applying the words of Psalm xxxi. 19 'With bit and bridle bind fast their jaws, who come not near to thee' to her affliction.

⁹⁹ And therefore after the death of her protector, Bishop Alonso.

¹⁰⁰ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 36; '*a buen tiempo*', Hutton, 51:33.

¹⁰¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 37; '*en la jouentut doblar el açote*', Hutton, 53:3.

¹⁰² J.A. Burrow, *The Ages of Man: A Study of Medieval Writing and Thought* (Oxford, 1986), p. 5.

¹⁰³ Dante's three age scheme had youth from 25 to 50, the four age scheme from 28 to 48 and the Ptolemaic seven age scheme from 22 to 41, *ibid.*, pp. 7, 18, 37. An earlier six age scheme used by Isidore had youth from 22 to 41, *ibid.*, p. 82.

¹⁰⁴ Hutton, 77:20-23, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 59.

¹⁰⁵ This would mean that she was in her late forties when she wrote *Arboleda*. Mulder-Bakker points out that several important medieval women, including Hildegard of Bingen, Bridget of Sweden and Christine de Pizan found their voice in their forties A.B. Mulder-Bakker, 'The Metamorphosis of Woman: Transmission of Knowledge and the Problems of Gender', in P. Stafford and A.B. Mulder-Bakker (eds.), *Gendering the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 2001), p. 129.

their doors to human voices¹⁰⁶ in which the preacher referred to Peter Lombard's *Libri Quattuor Sententiarum* for authority; it seems unlikely that she would have heard, or at least absorbed, this type of sermon as a child or young teen. Teaching at Salamanca in the first part of the fifteenth century was predominantly oral¹⁰⁷, so it would seem probable that she was still able to hear well when she was in Salamanca, likely to have been in her late teens or very early twenties. Castro Ponce argues that Teresa became deaf after she learned to speak¹⁰⁸. Modern understanding of the effect of deafness on development of language would also indicate that Teresa did not lose a significant amount of hearing until her education was well advanced, because she had acquired an extensive and sophisticated vocabulary. Loss of hearing, even temporary loss caused by conditions such as glue ear, has a discernable adverse affect on a child's vocabulary, even when that child is able to read¹⁰⁹. Another pointer to late onset of deafness is Teresa's apparent inability to lip-read; if she had acquired this skill she would not have felt so cut off from the hearing world around her. Children who experience partial hearing loss from birth or at an early age usually acquire good lip-reading skills, while those who lose hearing as adults generally find it almost impossible to learn to understand speech from lip movements¹¹⁰.

Some scholars have put forward earlier dates for Teresa's deafness. Before the 1449 papal petitions came to light many thought that she must have been put in the convent by her family because she was deaf, therefore putting the onset of deafness at the

¹⁰⁶ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 75; '*era antes que mis orejas çer[r]asen las puertas a las bozes humanas*', Hutton, 96:33-4.

¹⁰⁷ S. Gilman, *The Spain of Fernando de Rojas: The Intellectual and Social Landscape of La Celestina* (Princeton NJ, 1972), p. 311.

¹⁰⁸ C. Castro Ponce, 'Teresa de Cartagena: *Arboleda de las Enfermas, Admiración Operum Dei, edición crítica singular*' (Brown Univ., Ph.D. thesis, 2001), p. 6.

¹⁰⁹ Personal communication from Ruth Matthews, a trained and experienced teacher of the deaf who herself has been hearing impaired from birth.

¹¹⁰ Personal communication from Ruth Matthews.

latest in her early teens¹¹¹. More recent works tend to accept a later age, although Majuelo, after discussing the 1449 petitions, decides for linguistic and other literary reasons that the date for the composition of *Arboleda* is between 1452 and 1467, pushing back the age for the onset of Teresa's deafness to between 7 and 14, and concludes that, although she was not born deaf, she began to go deaf as a small child, becoming totally deaf before she was 14¹¹². This is inconsistent with the evidence given above for an onset of deafness in adulthood.

The family

Pablo de Santa María

Teresa's grandfather was born in Burgos, some time between 1350 and 1355, into the prominent Jewish ha-Levi family and was named Šelomó¹¹³. He received an extensive education; in addition to Hebrew and rabbinical studies he learned Latin, studied Hebrew and Arabic philosophy and read Latin and Castilian literature¹¹⁴. He married in his twenties and set up a school of rabbinical studies in Burgos which attracted students from all over Spain. He was appointed chief rabbi of Burgos in 1379, a post which carried judicial and political as well as religious responsibilities¹¹⁵. He was also active in national politics. As chief rabbi of Burgos he was sent on behalf of the Spanish rabbis, with a rabbi from Valencia, to the papal court in Avignon to get

¹¹¹ Marimón Llorca, *Prosistas*, p. 110; Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 21; D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, "'But I suffer not a woman to teach": two women writers in late-medieval Spain', in C. Davies and J. Whetnall (eds.), *Hers Ancient and Modern: Women's Writing in Spain and Brazil* (Manchester, 1997), p. 8; J.F. Cammarata, 'Teresa de Cartagena: Writing from a Silent Space in a Silent World', *Monographic Review/Revista Monográfica* 16 (2000), p. 39; E. Juárez, 'The Autobiography of the Aching Body in Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los enfermos*', in S.L. Snyder, B.J. Brueggemann, and R. Garland-Thompson (eds.), *Disability Studies: Enabling the Humanities* (New York, 2002), p. 134.

¹¹² Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena.', pp. 160-3.

¹¹³ Cantera Burgos p. 286. In Spanish the name is written as 'Salomón'.

¹¹⁴ He was described by a contemporary as a man of great learning and a great scholar in both Christian and Jewish doctrine, Fernán Pérez de Guzmán, *Pen Portraits of Illustrious Castilians*, trans. M. Gillette and L. Zehngut (Washington DC, 2003), p. 39.

¹¹⁵ Serrano, pp. 10-12.

a ruling from the pope over the question whether Christian courts could make Jews repay interest they had received on loans on the pretext that it was illegal usury¹¹⁶. In 1388 or 1389 he went to London in the service of Juan I of Castile, who was seeking to annul the pretensions of the Duke of Lancaster to the crown of Castile by negotiating the marriage of the duke's daughter to Juan's eldest son, who later became Enrique III¹¹⁷.

About this time he was experiencing religious uncertainty, which culminated in his conversion to Christianity¹¹⁸. There is some dispute as to whether his baptism occurred in 1390 or 1391¹¹⁹, but it took place in Burgos cathedral on 21 July. His children and brothers Pedro Juárez, Alvar García and Tomás García were baptised at the same time. They all took the surname, de Santa María. His wife had refused to convert, and on this ground the episcopal court of Burgos dissolved his marriage¹²⁰. However, she later converted¹²¹ and was buried in the chapel of the Dominican monastery of San Pablo in Burgos in 1426, as were Don Pablo's mother (1425), Teresa's father (1478) and both his wives, and some other members of the de Cartagena family¹²². About a year later he went to study in Paris. While there he met and apparently was befriended by Pedro de Luna, who in 1394 became the antipope

¹¹⁶ Ibid., p. 12.

¹¹⁷ Information about his role in this embassy is largely derived from the so-called "Purim Letter" he was believed to have written from London in about 1389, Cantera Burgos, pp. 292-304.

¹¹⁸ Serrano, pp. 17-18.

¹¹⁹ Serrano, p. 21-2, gives 1390, based on a sixteenth century biography of Pablo de Santa María which cites documents that have since disappeared. This date is also given in RAH B-92 fo. 67r. It is generally the Jewish historians who view don Pablo as an apostate, particularly Baer and Netanyahu (see discussion in Chapter 2), who say it must have been 1391 so that the conversion is explained by fear of the anti-Jewish violence of that year. Cantera Burgos, pp. 304-6, points out that there had been no violence in Burgos before July 1391. L. Fernández Gallardo, *Alonso de Cartagena: Una biografía política en la Castilla del siglo XV* (Valladolid, 2002), pp. 16-23 argues that Pablo de Santa María's writings show evidence of a genuine conversion to Christianity, and prefers the 1390 date.

¹²⁰ Serrano, pp. 22-3.

¹²¹ Serrano says that this was the result of correspondence between her and Don Pablo while he was in Paris and Avignon, p. 23.

¹²² RAH, D-17 (Salazar y Castro), fo. 12r.

Benedict XIII (see chapter 1) and who appointed don Pablo as papal legate to the Castilian court¹²³. He enjoyed success in both the church, having become bishop of Cartagena in 1403 and bishop of Burgos in 1416¹²⁴, and in politics. He was appointed by Enrique III as royal chancellor and as tutor-councillor to Enrique's newborn son, who at twenty-two month's old became Juan II on his father's death¹²⁵. He died in 1435. Pablo de Santa María was an influential author, particularly in the field of theology¹²⁶ with his commentary on the Biblical exegesis of Nicholas of Lyra, *Additiones ad postillam Magistri Nicolai Lyrai* and his work on Judaism, *Scrutinium scripturarum*. He also wrote on Spanish history, helping to formulate and promote the *letrado* theories of political power discussed in Chapter 1 (pp. 24-5)¹²⁷.

Alonso de Cartagena

The second son of Pablo de Santa María, he followed his father and elder brother into the priesthood. Born in Burgos some time between 1385 and 1386 and baptised with his father, he studied civil and canon law at Salamanca, receiving his doctorate in 1414¹²⁸. He became politically active almost as soon as he finished his studies, being appointed auditor of the royal court by Juan II in 1415 and in 1419 was given a seat on the Royal Council¹²⁹. This political activity continued throughout his life. His royalist views were displayed when he gave the sermon at the funeral of Juan II, who was buried in the Carthusian monastery in Burgos, praising the dead king's

¹²³ Serrano, pp. 27, 29-31.

¹²⁴ Both of these bishoprics were held directly from the Holy See, so in both cases don Pablo was directly appointed by Benedict XIII, Serrano, pp. 47, 63.

¹²⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 49-52. Henry III's will entrusted the boy to three tutors; a dispute ensued between the other two and the queen over the custody of the small child. Don Pablo took no part in this quarrel, I.I. MacDonald, *Don Fernando de Antequera* (Oxford, 1948) p. 31.

¹²⁶ Nader, *Mendoza Family*, p. 131.

¹²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 21.

¹²⁸ This training meant that Alfonso was a member of the group of *letrados*, who became increasingly powerful during fifteenth century Castile, *ibid.*, pp. 19-23.

¹²⁹ Serrano, pp. 123-4.

continuous descent from the first Gothic king of Spain¹³⁰. He was absent from Spain for about five years between 1434 and 1439 while participating in the Council of Basle as part of the Castilian royal embassy and representing various Spanish bishops¹³¹. During this period he helped to negotiate a peace treaty between the Holy Roman Emperor and the King of Poland as ambassador of the king of Castile and papal legate¹³².

He also advanced rapidly in the Church. Even before he completed his studies he had collected several ecclesiastical posts. In 1415 Benedict XIII named him Dean of Santiago de Compostela¹³³ and in 1417 pope Martin V appointed him Apostolic Nuncio and collector of papal taxes in Castile¹³⁴. At the end of 1419 or beginning of 1420 he became a canon of Burgos¹³⁵. In 1435 he was appointed to succeed his father as bishop of Burgos¹³⁶. In that position he successfully defended an attempt by the Archbishop of Toledo to exert authority over the see of Burgos, and he built the Chapel of the Visitation in Burgos Cathedral¹³⁷ and began the building of the cathedral tower¹³⁸. He died in 1453.

¹³⁰ R.M. Pidal, 'The Significance of the Reign of Isabella the Catholic, According to Her Contemporaries', in R. Highfield (ed.), *Spain in the 15th Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), p. 381.

¹³¹ Serrano, p. 133.

¹³² L. Rojas Donat, 'Alonso de Cartagena, jurista y diplomático del humanismo Español', *Revista de estudios histórico-jurídicos* no. 22 (2000), pp. 77-85.

¹³³ Serrano, p. 123.

¹³⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 124.

¹³⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 124.

¹³⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 185.

¹³⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 204-5. Alonso's tomb is in this chapel.

¹³⁸ N. López Martínez, *Burgos Cathedral: World Heritage*, trans. G. Keith (León, 2004), p. 11.

Alonso de Cartagena wrote several important works, and has been recognised as one of the most important intellectuals in his generation¹³⁹. He is regarded as one of the leaders of the movement which introduced humanism into Castile¹⁴⁰. His defence of *conversos*, the *Defensorium Unitatis Christianae*, written during the Toledo riots of 1449, will be considered in chapter 10.

An interesting pointer to the posthumous maintenance of the high reputation of both Alonso and his father can be found in the letter of Fernando del Pulgar, chronicler and secretary to Queen Isabella, about the statute of Guipúzcoa on the purity of blood, and in the anonymous impugnation of Pulgar's letter, examined by Cantera Burgos¹⁴¹. In Pulgar's letter, written shortly after the Inquisition began work, he criticises the inquisitors, stating that:

'...they will not make such good Christians with their fire as the bishops Don Pablo and Don Alonso made with water. And not without cause; for the latter were chosen by our Redeemer Christ for the task, and these others have been chosen by the licentiate our chancellor for theirs.'¹⁴²

The anonymous response makes a sustained attack on Pulgar and his arguments in an aggressive and insulting manner. However, in respect of the passage quoted above, the respondent calls the two bishops 'reverend bishops to whom Christ entrusted His flock'¹⁴³.

¹³⁹ B. Rosenstock, *New Men: Conversos, Christian Theology, and Society in Fifteenth-Century Castile*, (London, 2002), p. 14 n. 2.

¹⁴⁰ G.B. Kaplan, *The Evolution of Converso Literature: the Writings of the Converted Jews of Medieval Spain* (Gainesville, 2002), pp. 58-9.

¹⁴¹ F. Cantera Burgos, 'Fernando del Pulgar and the Conversos', in R. Highfield (ed.) *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972).

¹⁴² *Ibid.*, p. 310.

¹⁴³ *Ibid.*, p. 320.

Pedro de Cartagena

Teresa's father was the third son of Pablo de Santa María. He was born in 1387, and was baptised at the same time as his father, brothers and sister María¹⁴⁴. He was a *regidor* of Burgos for virtually all of his adult life¹⁴⁵, becoming the chief *regidor* in about 1441, and was named *procurador* in 1428. In these roles he had frequent contacts with the royal court¹⁴⁶. He was also a notable soldier during the reigns of Juan II and Enrique IV of Castile, including fighting in the victory of La Higuera against the Moors of Granada¹⁴⁷.

His family home was in calle de Canterras la Menor (modern calle de San Lorenzo) in Burgos. In April 1440 Blanca de Navarre, daughter of the king of Navarre, stayed there on her way to Valladolid for her marriage to Enrique IV, then heir to Juan II¹⁴⁸. Probably as a result of this hospitality and the influence of his brother Alonso, later that year the king gave Pedro's family noble title with a change of name to de Cartagena¹⁴⁹, and granted him the right of *mayorazgo*. This entail of his estates was set up in January 1446 for his legitimate descendents¹⁵⁰. In April 1453 Alvaro de Luna, the powerful favourite of Juan II, was arrested while he was staying in Pedro de Cartagena's house¹⁵¹. This event, and the family's relationship to don Alvaro, are discussed below.

¹⁴⁴ Cantera Burgos, p. 464.

¹⁴⁵ There is a record dated 1415 which names him as such, Cantera Burgos, p. 465.

¹⁴⁶ Cantera Burgos, p. 466.

¹⁴⁷ Cantera Burgos, p. 467; Serrano, p. 23.

¹⁴⁸ Cantera Burgos, p. 471.

¹⁴⁹ Derived from don Pablo's role as bishop of Cartagena.

¹⁵⁰ Cantera Burgos, pp. 471-3; Serrano, pp. 164-5.

¹⁵¹ Serrano, pp. 180-2.

Pedro de Cartagena married twice. His first wife, María Saravia, was the mother of two sons, Alonso and Alvaro, and three daughters, Juana, Teresa and María. She must have died some time before 1446, because the *mayorazgo* also names his second wife, the Castilian noblewoman¹⁵² Mençia de Roias, her son Lope and daughter Elvira. As Lope was born in 1444¹⁵³, it is possible that Teresa entered the Santa Clara convent about the time her mother died. Don Pedro also had three recognised illegitimate sons¹⁵⁴. He died in 1478¹⁵⁵.

Two families: the Cartagenas and the Lunas

The political astuteness of the Cartagena family may be deduced from their close relations with two prominent members of the Luna family, Pedro de Luna who became the anti-pope Benedict XIII, and his nephew, Alvaro de Luna, the favourite of Juan II who was in effect the uncrowned king for a significant part of that king's reign. This astuteness is even better demonstrated by the fact that the family appears to have successfully survived the downfall of both these Lunas.

Pedro de Luna

Pedro de Luna was a younger son of the Count de Luna. As a young man he had supported Henry of Trastámara in his campaign for the throne of Castile, and he was a professor of civil and canon law at Montpellier university¹⁵⁶. He was only in minor orders, even after being appointed a cardinal in 1375 by Pope Gregory XI, the last of

¹⁵² Cantera Burgos, p. 504.

¹⁵³ *Ibid.*, p. 505.

¹⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 506-10.

¹⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 478.

¹⁵⁶ A. Glasfurd, *The Antipope (Peter de Luna, 1342-1423): A Study in Obstinance* (London, 1965), p. 16.

the unchallenged Avignon popes¹⁵⁷. He was one of the electors of Urban VI in the hurried election that followed the death of Gregory XI in March 1378 shortly after his return to Rome¹⁵⁸, but later went over to the rival pope, Clement VII, elected by rebellious cardinals under pressure from France¹⁵⁹. Pedro de Luna returned to Avignon where Clement VII was based.

Between 1393 and 1394 Pedro de Luna was Papal Legate to the French court, and to England, Scotland and the Netherlands, based in Paris. During this period he met Pablo de Santa María, who was studying at the University of Paris. This university had since 1391 taken a position against Clement VII, despite support for Clement by the French crown¹⁶⁰. Although don Pablo had agreed with the university's suggestion that the schism should be ended as soon as possible, either by both popes resigning, or by arbitration between them, or by a general council¹⁶¹, he seems to have retained Pedro de Luna's favour. After Pedro de Luna was elected pope in 1394 by the Avignon cardinals to succeed Clement VII, taking the title Benedict XIII, he called Pablo de Santa María to his court¹⁶². Don Pablo obviously was recognised as an effective diplomat, as he was sent as part of the delegation from Benedict to the Castilian court in 1396 when its loyalty to the Avignon pope was wavering under pressure from France¹⁶³. Again, in 1401 he persuaded an embassy from the court of Castile to return to obedience to Benedict XIII¹⁶⁴. Don Pablo's loyalty was rewarded by Benedict with a number of clerical appointments. In 1396 he was made

¹⁵⁷ Indeed, he was only ordained priest after his election to the papacy, *ibid.*, pp. 128-9.

¹⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 69-70.

¹⁵⁹ G. Barraclough, *The Medieval Papacy* (London, 1968), p. 165.

¹⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 174-5.

¹⁶¹ Serrano, p. 30.

¹⁶² *Ibid.*, p. 31.

¹⁶³ *Ibid.*, pp. 31-2.

¹⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 35-6.

Archdeacon of Treviño in the Burgos diocese, which post made him a canon of Burgos cathedral¹⁶⁵. As stated above (p. 83) he was made Bishop of Cartagena, then Bishop of Burgos; both of these sees were in the gift of the pope.

It is notable that this close association with Benedict XIII did not seem to affect the Cartagena family's status or influence after he ceased to be recognised as pope by the church and almost all European rulers. Pablo de Santa María retained his bishopric and political influence. Alonso de Cartagena, having been appointed by Benedict XIII in 1415 as dean of Santiago de Compostela (after the antipope had been 'deposed' by the Council of Pisa but while he was still recognised as pope by Castile), two years later was given an important appointment by Martin V, who was elected pope in 1417 by the Council of Constance after Castile had abandoned its recognition of Benedict XIII.

Alvaro de Luna

The Cartagenas also seem to have successfully survived their association with another member of the Luna family, Alvaro de Luna, after his downfall.

Alvaro de Luna was the nephew of Benedict XIII¹⁶⁶ and the illegitimate son of don Alvaro de Luna. Apparently his father did not acknowledge his son until he was on his deathbed, when he was persuaded to leave the boy some money. After his father's death the boy was introduced to his uncle, the pope, and was then raised in Rome by another uncle¹⁶⁷. He was clearly both talented and charismatic, and once he had

¹⁶⁵ Ibid., p. 36.

¹⁶⁶ D.T. Jaen, *John II of Castile and the Grand Master Alvaro de Luna: A Biography Compiled from the Chronicles of the Reign of King John II of Castile (1405-1454)* (Madrid, 1978), p. 20.

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., p. 20.

gained entry to the royal court through yet another uncle, the Archbishop of Toledo, he quickly became a favourite of the young Juan II¹⁶⁸. Once Juan II reached his majority in 1419, he began to rely more and more on Alvaro de Luna¹⁶⁹, making him his *privado*¹⁷⁰. Despite constant opposition from the noble families, don Alvaro managed to retain the king's confidence and remained in power, apart from three short periods of exile, until he lost the king's favour shortly before his arrest in 1453¹⁷¹.

The Santa María/Cartagena family generally supported don Alvaro, possibly because, as *conversos* in a period increasingly difficult for anyone of Jewish ancestry, they had an interest in a strong monarchy¹⁷². The king was the traditional protector of Jews. One member of the family who responded positively to Alvaro de Luna was don Pablo's brother, Alvar García de Santa María, official chronicler to Juan II. His *Crónica de Juan II*, written in about 1435¹⁷³ when don Alvaro was at the height of his power, gives more than conventional praise to him and his administrative system, including his fiscal management and appointment of office holders on the basis of ability¹⁷⁴. Although Alonso de Cartagena was already a member of the Royal council before Alvaro de Luna rose to power, he must have been involved in working with don Alvaro and was appointed to represent Castile at the Council of Basle during the 1430s when don Alvaro's power was unchallenged¹⁷⁵.

¹⁶⁸ Ibid., p. 21-4.

¹⁶⁹ Ibid., pp. 33-4.

¹⁷⁰ N. Round, *The Greatest Man Uncrowned: A Study of the Fall of Don Alvaro de Luna* (London, 1986), at p. 6 states that this term is 'at once more neutral and more accurate than the English "favourite"'.
¹⁷¹ Ibid., p. 39.

¹⁷² Hillgarth ii, 309.

¹⁷³ Cantera Burgos, pp. 124-6.

¹⁷⁴ Round, *Greatest Man*, pp. 12-19.

¹⁷⁵ Hillgarth ii, 313.

One reason suggested for his downfall was that he angered the *converso* elite by policies favouring the Jews¹⁷⁶. Round lists the reasons why, with one exception, this allegation is unfounded. The one exception was the Toledo revolt of 1449, which did threaten the *converso* administrative families, a group which included the de Cartagenas¹⁷⁷. Don Alvaro's policy of using *converso* local administrators to enforce his fiscal and other unpopular policies had created resentment against the whole *converso* community, and his failure to deal militarily with the rebels (this was left up to Crown Prince Enrique) and then his pardon to all Toledans except the ringleaders must have caused concern that he would not support *conversos* if it did not suit him politically¹⁷⁸. On the morning of his arrest don Alvaro is said to have accused Bishop Alonso de Cartagena of being his greatest enemy¹⁷⁹, but there is no evidence that any of the family were directly involved in the downfall of Alvaro de Luna.

The Cartagenas were more directly involved in the events of Alvaro de Luna's arrest. This occurred at Easter 1453, when he was in Burgos for a meeting of the *Cortes*. In Burgos he had chosen to stay with Pedro de Cartagena¹⁸⁰. The castle in Burgos was held by the Estúñiga family, who were known to be hostile to don Alvaro¹⁸¹, and soon after his arrival there had been threatened conflict between Luna and Estúñiga supporters, the possible cause for Bishop Alonso putting his own troops on the streets of Burgos¹⁸². The immediate cause for the arrest was the murder on Good Friday of an associate of Alvaro de Luna, who was killed on don Alvaro's orders for plotting with the Estúñigas. The same morning, while Alvaro de Luna was attending mass in

¹⁷⁶ Round, *Greatest Man*, pp. 63-4.

¹⁷⁷ Round, *Greatest Man*, p. 64.

¹⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 64.

¹⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 64.

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 64-5.

¹⁸¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 36-8.

¹⁸² *Ibid.*, p. 65.

Burgos cathedral, a Dominican friar preached a sermon clearly directed against don Alvaro and so openly hostile that the king commanded the preacher to stop. Bishop Alonso was asked to investigate; the friar, now in prison, would only say that his sermon was divinely inspired. It is likely that these factors combined to make don Alvaro feel threatened, but the plan to make the death look accidental did not work and suspicion fell on him¹⁸³.

Early in the morning of the following Wednesday, Pablo de Cartagena's eldest son (and Teresa's full brother), Alvaro de Cartagena, arrived at his father's house with news that an armed force had left Burgos castle and was marching towards the town¹⁸⁴. When it became clear that the hostile troop movement was directed against don Alvaro, and that Pedro de Cartagena's house was blockaded, Alvaro de Cartagena offered to help Alvaro de Luna escape through the back alleys. This offer was at first rejected, apparently because Alvaro de Cartagena was related to the Bishop of Burgos who don Alvaro regarded as an enemy¹⁸⁵, then accepted. However don Alvaro changed his mind part way through the flight and turned back to the house¹⁸⁶. There followed lengthy negotiations for Alvaro de Luna's surrender, in which one of the negotiators was Alonso de Cartagena. The *Crónica de Don Alvaro* records that Alvaro de Luna insulted the bishop by referring to him to a 'wearer of long skirts' who should 'keep quiet when knights are talking'¹⁸⁷. The negotiations eventually resulted in Alvaro de Luna surrendering without a fight, which must have come as a relief to the

¹⁸³ Ibid. pp. 67-72.

¹⁸⁴ Round, *Greatest Man*, pp. 76-7. Ironically, at first it was thought this troop was on its way to attack *conversos* and don Alvaro offered the Cartagena family his protection.

¹⁸⁵ Jaen, *John II*, p. 224.

¹⁸⁶ Round, *Greatest Man*, p. 77.

¹⁸⁷ Jaen, *John II*, p. 228.

Cartagena family, both personally (Pedro de Cartagena's home was at risk) and in their civic roles as bishop (Alonso) and chief regidor (Pedro) of Burgos¹⁸⁸.

Alvaro de Cartagena's attempt to save Alvaro de Luna was obviously well known, but there is no record of this causing him or his father any problems, and the family's previous relationship with don Alvaro does not seem to have been held against them by Juan II. It is likely that Alonso de Cartagena's clear loyalty to the king would have saved the family from any taint.

¹⁸⁸ Round, *Greatest Man*, p. 65.

CHAPTER 4

STRUCTURE AND IMAGERY OF ARBOLEDA

Genre of work

Although *Arboleda* gives information about Teresa's experience of disability, it is not autobiography in the modern sense. Her primary purpose is not to describe her personal experience but to use it as a point of departure for, and illumination of, a spiritual treatise¹. It belongs to the medieval genre of *consolatio*², of which the model is Boethius' *Consolations of Philosophy*. Hutton demonstrates that there are many parallels between *Arboleda* and the *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana* of Pedro de Luna (Benedict XIII)³, a work inspired by Boethius⁴. *Arboleda* is best described in modern terms as a spiritual reflection, in which the author applies Scripture and theological principles to her experience in order to draw spiritual lessons.

Given that Teresa's declared purpose in writing is to share with her fellow sufferers the spiritual lessons she has learned, a likely genre for the work is that of the medieval sermon. By the thirteenth century rules of rhetoric had developed for the structure of

¹ G. Rodríguez Rivas, 'La autografía como 'exemplum': la *Arboleda de los enfermos* de Teresa de Cartagena', in J. Romera Castillo (ed.), *Actas del II Seminario Internacional del Instituto de Semiótica Literaria y Teatral* (Madrid, 1993).

² Seidenspinner-Núñez, p. 2.

³ Hutton, pp. 17-23. Hutton elsewhere states that it was clear that Teresa 'must have been greatly inspired by' this work and comments on the fact that she does not expressly mention it (L.J. Hutton, 'Teresa de Cartagena: A Study in Castilian Spirituality', *Theology Today* 12 (1956), p. 479); however, given the fact that Pedro de Luna was deposed as pope, it is most unlikely that his writings would at that time have been recognised as the kind of authority which could be quoted by other writers, discussed in Chapter 9.

⁴ J.B. Simó Castillo, 'Estudio preliminar', in *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana* (Vinaròs, Castellón, 1998), p. 46.

a sermon, the *ars praedicandi*, the subject of numerous late medieval manuscripts from all over Western Europe, including Spain⁵. The parts of a sermon were: the theme (usually an appropriate Scriptural passage); the protheme, in which the preacher sought to gain the sympathetic attention of his congregation and ended with a prayer for divine aid; the antetheme, an introduction to the purpose of the sermon; division of the theme, usually into three with authorities to support each division; an optional subdivision of each of these divisions; amplification or dilation of each of the divisions and subdivisions⁶. There might also be a conclusion⁷. Teresa does seem to have some knowledge of the theory of rhetoric⁸: *Arboleda* shows many indications of having been constructed in accordance with the *ars praedicandi*, although the rules are not strictly followed. In particular, at the beginning of the work there are also some elements of the established medieval rules for letter writing, the *ars dictaminis*⁹. The approved format for a letter was that it began with a *salutatio*, the formal greeting, followed by an introduction designed to get the sympathetic attention of the addressee. This is followed by the *narratio*, the circumstances on which the petition is based, and the petition. Optionally, there may be a conclusion. In medieval *ars*

⁵ Murphy, *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages*, pp. 332, 338.

⁶ J.J. Murphy, *Three Medieval Rhetorical Arts* (Berkeley, 1985), p. xix.

⁷ Murphy, *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages*, pp. 331-2.

⁸ As discussed in Chapter 3, she may have studied rhetoric while at Salamanca. Certainly, there was an interest in rhetoric in her family; Cicero was the major classical authority on rhetoric, and his *De inventione* was translated into Castilian by Alonso de Cartagena. However, Teresa seems to be using standard late medieval rhetoric rather than classical Ciceronian rhetoric.

⁹ Majuelo and Cortés both think that the bulk of the work follows the contemporary *ars praedicandi* structure but begins in epistolary form, M. Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena. La obra de una mujer castellana del siglo XV' (Universidad de País Vasco, Ph.D. thesis, 2008), p. 205; M.M. Cortés Timoner, 'La predicación en palabras de mujer: Teresa de Cartagena y Juana de la Cruz', in M. Freixas and S. Iriso (eds.), *Actas del VIII Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval*, (Santander, 2000), p. 572-3. Gómez believes that the work is a '*doble tratado*' in which the first part, the '*consolatoria*', has the structure of a sermon, F. Gómez Redondo, *Historia de la prosa medieval castellana* (4 vols., Madrid, 2002), III, 3058, 3060-3. Redondo discerns oral techniques used by preachers in Teresa's language, A. Redondo Goicoechea, 'La retórica del yo-mujer en las tres escritoras: Teresa de Cartagena, Teresa de Jesús y María de Zayas', *Compás de Letras*, 1 (1992), pp. 55-6.

dictaminis most emphasis was put on the first two items¹⁰. Looking at *Arboleda* as a whole, it does not seem to fit the *ars dictaminis* structure, although Rodríguez thinks it is in the literary epistle form increasingly used in the fifteenth century¹¹. It seems likely that Teresa had at least a basic knowledge of contemporary rhetoric but felt free to pick and choose the most suitable forms for each part of her work¹².

Surtz says that *Arboleda* creates a first impression of a 'rambling essay that proceeds mostly through association of ideas', although he sees coherence being provided by the imagery¹³. Deyermond in his seminal article on Teresa saw structure through use of the technique of amplification of themes, although he thought she lacked rhetorical technique¹⁴. In my analysis below of the structure of this work I hope to demonstrate that *Arboleda* is a carefully thought-out and structured work.

Introduction and dedication

The first two sentences of the manuscript were presumably authored by the copyist (named at the end of the manuscript as Pero Lopez del Trigo). The first sentence names the work, the author and a brief description of her solely in terms of her physical suffering. The second sets out the reasons why this work was written.

¹⁰ Murphy, *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages*, p. 225.

¹¹ G. Rodríguez Rivas, 'La *Arboleda de los Enfermos*, de Teresa de Cartagena, literatura ascética en el siglo XV', *Entemu*, III (1991), p. 118.

¹² García sees Teresa's works as typical of the period of transition between medieval strict rules of rhetoric and Renaissance innovation in literary form, C. García, 'Los tratados de Teresa de Cartagena dentro de la evolución de la epístola', in A.M. Beresford (ed.) *"Quien hubiese tal ventura": Medieval Hispanic Studies in Honour of Alan Deyermond* (London, 1997), pp. 155-7.

¹³ R.E. Surtz, 'Image Patterns in Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los enfermos*', in G. Paolini (ed.), *LA CHISPA '87: Selected Proceedings* (New Orleans LA, 1987), p. 297.

¹⁴ A. Deyermond, "'El convento de dolencias': the Works of Teresa de Cartagena", *Journal of Hispanic Philology*, 1 (1976), pp. 23-4. Although, like Castro-Ponce (above, n. 7), he disagreed with Marichal's conclusion that this meant she could not be considered 'una escritora auténtica', p. 24.

This is followed by an introductory section written by Teresa. Although there is no formal dedication, Teresa's first sentence addresses personally an unnamed *virtuosa señora*. The salutation is much briefer than would have been normal at the time (and also much briefer than that in Teresa's second work). In the first sentence of *Admiración* she uses the same form of address, and the introduction to that work tells us that it was composed at the request of Juana de Mendoza. This information has led a number of commentators to the reasonable conclusion that *Arboleda* was probably dedicated to the same lady¹⁵. Teresa states that her reason for writing to avoid succumbing to the dangers of '*la soledad*' (which Seidenspinner-Núñez translates as 'solitude' but which might better in context be translated as 'loneliness') and '*la vçiosidad*' (reprehensible idleness). As she cannot get rid of the loneliness, she says that she must drive idleness away as the combination of the two would be dangerous, and does so by busying herself with writing this 'little treatise' (*esta pequeña obra*)¹⁶. This may seem a selfish and self-centred reason for writing; Teresa goes on to declare her good intention in writing, seeking to please God and to declare the truth. However, this declaration seems to have one eye on anticipated criticism, trusting that her Lord:

'...who judges intentions rather than works, may find my writing, which seems vexing and reprehensible to some people, pleasing and acceptable to His merciful eyes.'¹⁷

¹⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, p. 12; M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'Teresa de Cartagena: escritura en relación', in Á. Muñoz Fernández (ed.), *La escritura femenina: de leer a escribir* (2 vols., Madrid, 2000), ii, 98; J.T. Snow, 'Speaking through Many Voices: Polyphony in the Writings of Teresa de Cartagena', in I.A. Corfis and R. Harris-Northall (eds.), *Medieval Iberia: Changing Societies and Cultures in Contact and Transition* (Woodbridge, 2007), pp. 17-18; J.F. Cammarata, 'Teresa de Cartagena: Writing from a Silent Space in a Silent World', *Monographic Review/Revista Monográfica* 16 (2000), pp. 46-7.

¹⁶ Hutton, 38:34-39:3,19-22, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 25.

¹⁷ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 25; '*...que más las voluntades que las obras acata, quier [a] hazer aplazible e açebto delante los ojos de su grande clemencia lo que enojoso e digno de reprehensyon a las gentes paresçe.*' Hutton, 39:25-7.

The reference to reactions to her writing is interesting, as it would seem to indicate that she had previously produced writings that attracted this criticism: it is hard to see how this wording could apply to this book which she had only just begun, unless it was internal criticism from her fellow nuns. This passage contains one of the 'humility' tropes that are found throughout both books and which were often used by authors in medieval and early modern times¹⁸. The use of these tropes is examined in chapter 9. This introductory section does seem to follow the format for a medieval letter. After the brief salutation, the bulk of the rest of the section is taken up with Teresa's description of her suffering and isolation which must be intended to produce empathy from her addressee. There is no express petition, but as Teresa has narrated the reasons why she has written this work there seems to be an implied request to her patroness to make the work available to the wider community of sufferers to whom the rest of *Arboleda* is addressed.

The text of *Arboleda* following the introductory section can be regarded as having three main parts. The first deals with Teresa's own experience in an exegesis of her key text, Ps. 31:9. The second part seeks to promote those spiritual lessons to her fellow-sufferers, while the third is a treatise on the importance of patience.

First part: experience

In the first main section of the work, Teresa speaks about her sufferings and her reflections on and reactions to those sufferings¹⁹. The main cause of her suffering was deafness, but she also refers to other causes.

¹⁸ A. Weber, *Teresa of Avila and the Rhetoric of Femininity* (Princeton NJ, 1990), p. 49.

¹⁹ Although the first section is expressly autobiographical, there are more indirectly autobiographical references to suffering throughout *Arboleda*, discussed below (pp. 101-2).

The scribal introduction to the work states that Teresa lost completely her sense of hearing. As discussed in chapter 3 this probably happened in her late twenties or early thirties and, although she seems to have been subject to illness for much of her life, the total loss of hearing seems to have come quite suddenly²⁰. She had meditated on this deafness and its meaning for twenty years before writing this book. Teresa uses a range of images to convey her experience of deafness. The first paragraph of the book describes her experience as being carried off as in a whirlwind and deposited on an island she names '*Oprobrium hominum et abiectio plebis*' (scorn of mankind and outcast of the people), living a life not worthy of that name, in exile and shadowy banishment and living in a sepulchre. However, the theme of the book is immediately set out; the light of God illuminated the darkness of the island and she saw that it was, for her, a good and healthful place, with groves of 'good counsel and spiritual consolation'²¹. The trees in these groves, which provide restful shade and a cooling breeze (a poignant image in the heat of a Spanish summer), are her books, in particular the Psalter²². Another image of deafness used by Teresa is that of the cloister; 'God has placed such cloisters on my hearing' ('*tanta claustra Dios a puesto en mi oír*')²³ and 'the cloisters of my ears' ('*las claustras de mis orejas*')²⁴. Cloisters for nuns at this time meant physical enclosure, permanent separation from the world behind a high wall²⁵. Nuns were also taught to think of this enclosure as physical protection from the world, and were encouraged to develop a matching internal

²⁰ The possible medical causes of this are discussed in chapter 8.

²¹ Hutton, 37:8-38:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 23-4.

²² Hutton, 38:17-28, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 24.

²³ Hutton, 42:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 28.

²⁴ Hutton, 44:6, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 29.

²⁵ J.T. Schulenburg, 'Strict Active Enclosure and its Effects on the Female Monastic Experience (ca. 500-1100)', in J.A. Nichols and L.T. Shank (eds.), *Medieval Religious Women: Distant Echoes* (Kalamazoo MI, 1984), pp. 51-2.

claustration, protecting their minds and hearts from worldly things²⁶. Teresa later extends the use of this image to all her fellow invalids, referring to '*el convento de dolencias*'²⁷.

These are images of isolation and it is clear that her strongest emotion is loneliness. In describing why she wrote the work she talks of being beset on her right side by loneliness and on the left by idleness which she must constantly drive away with the appropriate hand. While we might have expected a medieval writer to refer to these as demons or evil spirits, Teresa combines the physical image of driving them away with the more abstract idea of them as psychological dangers which she realises, if allowed to combine, would be devastating to her mental state. She then poignantly describes herself as being more alone in the company of many than when she is alone in her cell, because when she is alone she has herself for company. However, in the company of others she feels completely forsaken as she cannot enjoy the companionship and conversation of those around her. Without hearing she is completely isolated and always lonely²⁸. This reaction would indicate that she is very conscious of what she is missing, which would tend to confirm the chronology of her life discussed in chapter 3, that she became deaf as an adult²⁹. Her sense of isolation is not helped by those who in good faith encourage her to visit and speak to people who want to see her, even if she cannot hear them. Even though she knows this is said out of friendship, she finds it annoying because she knows that 'speech without

²⁶ J.M. Pinder, 'The Cloister and the Garden: Gendered Images of Religious Life from the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries', in C.J. Mews (ed.), *Listen Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages* (New York NY, 2001), p.167.

²⁷ Hutton, 58:30-1; Surtz, 'Image Patterns', p. 300.

²⁸ Hutton, 39:6-22, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 25.

²⁹ Issues of lip reading and sign language will be discussed in chapter 8.

hearing is worth nothing and only increases one's torment³⁰. She also describes her situation by the image of a noisy crowd, who begin to discern distant voices. Those who hear the voices signal to the rest to be quiet and listen, but some 'go on gabbing'. However, if there is someone there who knows that it is important to listen to the distant voices, that person will signal the chatterers to be quiet by putting his finger to his lips. If that person is someone who they must obey, they will listen, even if unwillingly³¹.

It is clear from *Arboleda* that deafness was not the only source of Teresa's suffering. Near the start of the section on patience, she breaks into her discussion to refer to other hardships she has received from God for her own good; afflictions, poverty, family deaths and other misfortunes³². There is no indication elsewhere in her works of what she means by 'poverty' (*pobrezas*), and no evidence that the de Cartagena family or her convent had fallen on hard times in this period. The reference to 'death of family' (*muertes de parientes*) could be to the deaths of her mother, probably about the time Teresa entered the religious life, and her uncle Alonso who died in 1453. Her father died in 1478, probably after *Arboleda* was written. One clue to possible other misfortunes is in the introduction to *Arboleda*, which refers to her being afflicted with grave ailments, in particular deafness. One affliction of sufferers she refers to, rejection by family, specifically relates to chronic illness. Although the reference is in the third person, it has the ring of experience³³. There may be pointers to her family experiences in her use of the text from Psalm 44 which begins 'Listen, O

³⁰ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 27; '*el fablar syn el oír no uale nada nin faze otro bien sino acreçentar tormento a su dueño*', Hutton, 41:31-42:4.

³¹ Hutton, 40:15-27, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 26.

³² Hutton, 66:16-20, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 49.

³³ Hutton, 63:4-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 46.

daughter³⁴. In rejecting a literal interpretation of the exhortation to forget 'the house of thy father', she says that to do this with regard to our human fathers would be to contradict the command to 'honour thy father'³⁵ and as we cannot honour those we do not love this is also a commandment to love our father. Overall this passage gives an impression that Teresa's relationship with her father was one of conventional respect rather than heartfelt love.

Teresa also talks about the physical effects of illness, such as lack of appetite and pale and emaciated appearance³⁶. There are similar indirect autobiographical references to the physical and emotional pain caused by humiliation and contempt from those around³⁷. The 'contempt' (*'despreçio'*) that seems to have most troubled her was criticism for being obviously unhappy about her afflictions. She complains that some people judge this as impatience, while calling dissembling and feigned happiness in hardships patience³⁸. It is to counter this attitude that she invokes Job, the 'Master of Patiences'. There is also a strong note of experience in her description of the intellectual challenges of affliction. This is even worse if the sufferer loses hearing or speech, '...for no matter how subtle his intellect, he can only exercise it for himself...' ³⁹.

³⁴ Hutton, 44:10-47:16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 29-32. There is a detailed analysis of her exegesis of this verse in chapter 6.

³⁵ Although she quotes Exodus 20:12 as saying 'honour thy father', the sixth of the Ten Commandments actually says 'Honour thy father and thy mother...' As discussed in chapter 3, it is likely that Teresa's mother died about the same time she first entered the convent of the Poor Clares, which may explain the absence of any reference to the full wording of the commandment.

³⁶ Hutton, 62:25-7, 83:2-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 46, 64.

³⁷ Hutton, 88:23-89:23, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 68-9. Teresa says that her descriptions of affliction are from 'my own experience'.

³⁸ Hutton, 96:13-16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 74.

³⁹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 59. '*Por muy sutil yngenio que tenga, dentro su puerta se puede dél aprouechar...*' Hutton 77:35-6.

Teresa uses a number of images to convey her experiences to her readers. She equates suffering with being forced to go on a long journey – in her case longer than a pilgrimage to Rome⁴⁰. She also uses the image of a dangerous sea voyage, in which suffering provides a secure ship⁴¹. She challenges those who say that invalids are idle, saying she believes that the bed-ridden invalid works more than a peasant hoeing all day⁴². Contemporary medical treatments, which tended to cause more suffering, are mentioned several times. She knows the contemporary theory that physical illness was caused by an imbalance of humours and equates the seven deadly sins to bad humours which suffering purges from the soul⁴³. Teresa compares the physical mortification of suffering to a stamp or seal which impresses on the body and face of the sufferer a seal bearing affliction's coat of arms so that observers may recognise that this individual is a servant of suffering, part of its retinue⁴⁴.

Theresa uses several images of violence, both political and domestic, in her writing. As discussed in chapter 6, her exegesis of Ps. 44:11 interprets the word 'people' as being a violent mob. In speaking of her physical sufferings, Teresa also uses images of physical violence. In arguing in *Arboleda* that excessive sadness is bad but cannot be cured by seeking human pleasures, one image used is of litigation and war, which are like the effect of excessive sadness on the afflicted. To combat excessive sadness, itself a vice, sufferers should arm themselves with virtues, not vices⁴⁵. For her theological treatment of her suffering, discussed in chapter 8, the most important image is that of parental chastisement - she talks of whipping, lashing, the rod

⁴⁰ Hutton, 72:20-3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 55. Pilgrimage to Rome is discussed in chapter 7.

⁴¹ Hutton, 92:26-33, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 71.

⁴² Hutton, 80:28-31, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 61-2.

⁴³ Hutton, 75:24-32, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 57-8.

⁴⁴ Hutton, 82:34-83:15, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 63-4.

⁴⁵ Hutton, 60:7-16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 44. She also uses martial imagery at the beginning of *Admiración* to explain her delay in writing, see chapter 5.

applied to her shoulders⁴⁶. A related image is that of a bit and bridle, used to control obstinate animals, taken from Psalm 31⁴⁷. Teresa's use of this text is discussed in chapter 6.

Second part: lessons for others

In the second part of the work Teresa moves from theological reflection to sermon, seeking to extend to other sufferers the lessons she has learned. This is no sermon from a pulpit; throughout Teresa identifies with her fellow-sufferers, speaking always of 'us'. She invokes a sense of community amongst the afflicted by the image of being professed members of a convent⁴⁸ and having signed a pledge of sisterhood⁴⁹. The structure of this section can be compared to a simple version of the *ars praedicandi* discussed above (p. 95). Her theme is that through suffering God not only punishes the sufferer for past sin but prevents future sin and leads the sufferer to Himself⁵⁰. This theme is then divided into two sections, each based on a passage of Scripture, which she then develops and illustrates.

The first section is based on Teresa's exegesis of the parable of the marriage feast in Luke 14:16-24 in which, when the invited guests fail to turn up, the host sends his servants into the streets to find the poor and afflicted and compel them to come to the feast. Her exegesis of this passage is discussed in chapter 6. In summary, the sick, through involuntary suffering, are compelled by God to attend what Teresa describes as 'the magnificent supper of eternal health'⁵¹. They should accept this through prayer. Her moral lesson is that the sick should not try to stay outside in the street by

⁴⁶ Hutton, 52:19-53-11, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 37-8.

⁴⁷ Hutton, 47:28-9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 33.

⁴⁸ Hutton, 58:30-1, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42.

⁴⁹ Hutton, 61:27-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 45.

⁵⁰ Hutton, 53:34-54:26, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 39.

⁵¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 39. '*la çena manífiça de la salut perdurable*' Hutton, 55:8-9.

trying to hang on to worldly goods and pleasures, damaging their understanding and discretion⁵². She accuses herself as one who tried to do this for a long time, but had now recognised the dangers of her obstinacy and recognised and gave thanks for the good purposes of God in her punishment⁵³. The central image of this passage is a meal, the heavenly banquet. It is described as being the 'table of spiritual platters'⁵⁴ and 'such a rich supper'⁵⁵. Teresa continues the food imagery in this passage by calling prayer spiritual nourishment for the soul, a nourishment most needed by the sickly whose physical strength is depleted by their afflictions. Other food-related imagery occurs throughout *Arboleda*⁵⁶. Referring to the advice that she found in the Psalms, Teresa says that it would not all fit on her small plate and talks of it as dishes at a meal, served at various times⁵⁷. Later, she refers to worldly blessings as food for the healthy, so sufferers should not hunger for what they cannot have but instead eat a diet suitable for their stomachs. She lists six specific dishes that sufferers should eat: sadness, patience, contrition, frequent and heartfelt confession, prayer and perseverance in virtuous works⁵⁸. Patience and prudence are likened to bread and water⁵⁹. It is of interest that all of Teresa's food imagery is positive; suitable food is nourishing and should be consumed. This is in contrast to the late medieval female food practices described by Bynum in which food was used in a negative way as a method of control of the body, by fasting, and of the family and community, by

⁵² Hutton, 56:20-57:1, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 40-1.

⁵³ Hutton, 57:1-22, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 41.

⁵⁴ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 40. '*los espirituales manjares*' Hutton, 56:1.

⁵⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 40. '*tan rica presa*' Hutton, 56:19.

⁵⁶ Surtz, *Image Patterns*, pp. 298-300.

⁵⁷ Hutton, 38:28-32, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 24.

⁵⁸ Hutton, 62:24-31, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 46.

⁵⁹ Hutton, 94:17-26, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 73.

distributing it to the poor⁶⁰. Another significant absence is that Teresa makes no mention of the Eucharist; this is discussed in chapter 10.

The theme of the second section is that excessive sadness should be avoided, but the remedy for such sadness should not be looked for in worldly pleasures. The link from the first theme is her gratitude for her afflictions which have forced her to leave worldly pleasures to enter the heavenly banquet. Her text is 2 Cor. 12:9b, which she gives as; 'I will gladly glory in my sickness so that the virtue of Christ may dwell in me'⁶¹. She begins by exploring the phrase 'the virtue of Christ'. No invalid should be sad if glorying in her sufferings brings 'the virtue of Christ'. This should be contrasted with temporal and human joy; although this is not bad, it is not a virtue and so cannot be the basis for the indwelling of Christ's sovereign virtue⁶². Her core argument is that sufferers should accept this spiritual happiness, in which temporal and human happiness has no place. However, while not seeking human happiness, excessive sadness, which is a sin, should also be avoided⁶³. The images used by Teresa to press home her point that excessive sadness is bad but cannot be cured by seeking human pleasures seem to indicate painful personal experience. The first is of family ties and strife; it is bad for relatives to fight each other and, she says, excessive sadness and human pleasures are members of the same family. Bad sadness derives from a lack of human pleasures, and seeking to alleviate such sadness through human pleasures brings sin and ultimately makes the suffering worse⁶⁴. The second is of litigation and war, which are like the effect of excessive sadness on the afflicted. If they try to

⁶⁰ C.W. Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley CA, London, 1987), pp. 220-44.

⁶¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42. The Latin text and Teresa's translation are discussed in chapter 6.

⁶² Hutton, 58:27-35, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42-3.

⁶³ Hutton, 59:9-19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 43.

⁶⁴ Hutton, 59:21-34, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 43.

overcome sadness with human pleasures, they will be defeated. To combat excessive sadness, itself a vice, sufferers should arm themselves with virtues, not vices⁶⁵. The third is of family rejection. Even if invalids wanted worldly pleasures, they do not get them. Friends, relatives, even parents get annoyed with and may despise sickly family members⁶⁶.

The conclusion of her sermon is that sufferers should endure their pain because of its good purpose, that it will bring Christ's virtue to dwell in their souls⁶⁷.

Third part: the primacy of patience

The primacy of patience is introduced by the image of a formal procession in which the most important person always comes last. Patience is the abbess of the convent of affliction⁶⁸. Teresa's discussion of patience has an introduction and three main sections: the parable of the talents; her discussion of Job; and patience as a primary virtue. Each of these sections is introduced with a humility trope⁶⁹. The introduction begins by considering the meaning of the name 'patience' (*paçiençia*), deriving from the first part *paz* (peace), *pasión* (suffering) and *padesçar* (endurance) and from the second part *çiençia* (wisdom), so that 'patience' means to suffer with prudence. This gives the overall theme of her discussion: that patient endurance converts bad hardships to good and beneficial things⁷⁰. Bad hardships are those from a bad source, worldly desires. Teresa contrasts the suffering from such hardships with the suffering of martyrs; martyrs suffered only in their bodies, those suffering from bad hardships

⁶⁵ Hutton, 60:7-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 44.

⁶⁶ Hutton, 63:2-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 46.

⁶⁷ Hutton, 62: 3-19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 45-6.

⁶⁸ Hutton, 64:3-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 47-8.

⁶⁹ Hutton 63:36-34:2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 47; Hutton, 96:7-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 74; Hutton, 103:19-26, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 80.

⁷⁰ Hutton, 64:18-25, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 48.

suffer in their bodies and their souls. Her discussion of the purposes of suffering will be examined in chapter 8. She classes herself and her fellow sufferers as belonging to the sinful, who are given suffering to make them amend their ways. The suffering from bad hardships can be converted to good if the suffering is born with prudence, which is the exercise of patience⁷¹. In this context, she distinguishes between two degrees of patience. The first, which is reasonably good, is to consider the source of hardships, God, and to avoid excessive grief⁷². The second, which is better, is for the sufferer to also strive to obtain spiritual benefit from these hardships. To illustrate how this can be done, she passes to the first, and longest, section in her discussion of patience, her allegorical treatment of the parable of the talents⁷³.

The Gospel parable of the talents⁷⁴ is about three servants given money by their lord before he departs on a journey, the first given ten coins ('talents' in the KJV), the second five and the third only one. Teresa only refers to the second servant, who on his lord's return gave back five talents in addition to the five he received. She lists and discusses five talents given to the servant (the sufferer) by his lord (God) and pairs them with the corresponding five talents that the sufferer returns to God, as set out in the table below:

Received from God	Returned to God
Singular love	Reverential love
Afflictions	Filial fear
Mortification of body	Mortification of sins
Humiliation and scorn	Willing humiliation
Prevention of time wasting	Repayment, acts of gratitude

⁷¹ Hutton, 64:28-67:3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 48-50.

⁷² Hutton, 67:19-68:2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 51.

⁷³ Hutton, 69:17-24, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 52.

⁷⁴ Matt. 25:14-30, Luke 19:12-27.

Teresa calls the first talent received from God 'singular' love because this love, shown through affliction, is not shown to everyone. She also distinguishes between voluntary and forced suffering. Because this love shows that God has special care for the sufferer's soul, she should return reverential love⁷⁵.

In discussing the second pair of talents Teresa uses medical imagery; affliction is a physician or the medicine to cure the injured soul⁷⁶. Within her discussion of the second talent she compares the seven cardinal (principal) sins⁷⁷ to bad humours, which medieval medical theory saw as the cause of illness, and describes how affliction combats these sins to provide spiritual health. This is a variant on the more common medieval theme of showing how each of these sins is cured by its corresponding virtue⁷⁸. The roots of the doctrine of seven cardinal sins is generally traced to desert monasticism, in particular to the writings of Evagrius who talked about eight generic vices relevant to the monastic life⁷⁹. The doctrine in its more familiar form originated with Gregory the Great⁸⁰. He made pride (*superbia*) the root of all sin, with seven principal sins below it, vainglory (*inanis gloria*), envy (*invidia*), anger (*ira*), sloth (*tristitia*), avarice (*avaritia*), gluttony (*ventris ingluves*) and lust (*luxuria*)⁸¹. Vainglory is a lesser form of pride, defined as seeking the power of an

⁷⁵ Hutton, 70:23-74:28; Seidenspinner-Núñez, 53-7.

⁷⁶ Hutton, 74:29-75:17; Seidenspinner-Núñez, 57.

⁷⁷ Teresa uses the term '*los syete pecados principales*', Hutton 75:25. Seidenspinner-Núñez 57-8 translates this as 'the seven deadly sins', but this is not accurate. Catholic theology has always distinguished between the *cardinal* sins, the most important sins, and the *deadly* sins, which are those which inevitably lead to damnation, M.W. Bloomfield, *The Seven Deadly Sins* (East Lansing MI, 1952), p. 43.

⁷⁸ R. Newhauser, *The Treatise on Vices and Virtues in Latin and the Vernacular* (Turnhout, 1993), p. 159.

⁷⁹ Bloomfield, *Seven Deadly Sins*, p. 59.

⁸⁰ Gregory, *Moralia in Job Chap. XXXI Cap. XLV*, PL 76 (Paris, 1862) pp. 626-7; S. Schimmel, *The Seven Deadly Sins: Jewish, Christian, and Classical Reflections on Human Psychology* (Oxford, 1997), pp. 22-6.

⁸¹ This passage from Gregory appears in P. López de Ayala, *Las flores de los "Morales de Job"*, ed. F. Branciforti (Firenze, 1963), p. 228.

empty name⁸². Teresa lists the same sins, but in a somewhat different order⁸³; pride (*soberuia*), avarice (*auariçia*), envy (*enbidia*), gluttony (*gula*), carnal desires (*ynçendios*), anger (*yra*) and idleness (*ocçiosydat*)⁸⁴. She states that pride is the captain and origin of all spiritual bad humours. The six roots of pride that she lists, illustrious lineage, well-proportioned body, youth and beauty, eloquence and elevated mind, dignity and worldly honours and wealth all indicate that she is thinking of what Gregory called vainglory. She describes how affliction combats each of these six roots⁸⁵. Avarice is the love of money, and suffering cures avarice because the meanest person becomes liberal with his money once he falls ill, spending his wealth on doctors and medicine, on alms and sponsoring masses⁸⁶. Envy is defined as sorrowing over someone else's good fortune, but a sufferer is more concerned with sorrowing over his own misfortune. Teresa says that desiring good health and envying it in others is not a sin as long as there is no wish for harm to someone else's health⁸⁷. She then gives very brief treatment to the remaining four cardinal sins. Suffering extinguishes carnal desires, robs the sufferer of appetite for food so that gluttony is impossible, converts anger into meekness and never allows sloth as being ill is hard work⁸⁸.

The third talent received from God, physical mortification, lets the world recognise the sufferer through observable physical changes; pale and withered faces, bony and

⁸² C. Straw, 'Gregory, Cassian and the Cardinal Vices' in R. Newhauser (ed.), *In the Garden of Evil: the Vices and Culture in the Middle Ages* (Toronto, 2005), p. 50.

⁸³ Bloomfield, *Seven Deadly Sins*, pp. 72-3, 84-6, 88, demonstrates that the ordering of this list varied over time and between authors, although none of the orderings that he lists corresponds to Teresa's.

⁸⁴ Hutton, 75:26-32, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 58.

⁸⁵ Hutton, 76:14-78:25, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 58-60.

⁸⁶ Hutton, 79:18-32, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 61.

⁸⁷ Hutton, 79:32-80:4, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 61.

⁸⁸ Hutton, 80:4-16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 61.

translucent hands, difficulty in walking⁸⁹. The spiritual advantage of this bodily mortification is that it not only saps strength to carry out sinful acts but it even helps to control wayward human thoughts. To illustrate the extent of human thought and imagination, which even in sufferers can be directed to worldly ends such as imagining involvement in activities such as hunting and jousting, Teresa compares human thought to the dromedary, which she says she has both heard and read can walk four times further in a day than other beasts. However, the bodily weakness caused by this mortification drains these worldly thoughts of power, giving the sufferer the opportunity to control his thoughts by his own will and thus gaining virtue⁹⁰. This is the repayment to the Lord for the third talent.

At this point Teresa inserts a discussion of two of the cardinal virtues to which she will return in the third section, prudence and fortitude. Prudence is introduced by the picture of an invalid who does not have the strength to go to church, but instead wanders about the village or spends hours gambling. Such a person lacks prudence because he multiplies his afflictions and turns a physical affliction into a spiritual danger. Instead, prudence aids and exhorts the sufferer to leave useless, worldly remedies and instead turn to spiritual remedies. She quotes Jerome as saying that the person who stifles worldly thoughts at birth and 'ties them to a stone' will be blessed⁹¹. Jerome says that this stone is Christ, but Teresa says that it is also the virtue of fortitude because fortitude shares stone's characteristics of immobility and resistance to blows. As human vices proceed from weakness, they cannot survive in the presence of fortitude⁹². Teresa then ties this discussion into her main theme of

⁸⁹ Hutton, 82:34-83:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 63-4.

⁹⁰ Hutton, 83:29-85:14, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 64-5.

⁹¹ Hutton, 85:32-86:26, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 66.

⁹² Hutton, 86:32-87:19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 67.

patience, stating that just as suffering without prudence is not true patience, so patience in the absence of fortitude is greatly endangered⁹³.

The fourth talent received by the sufferer is humiliation and contempt, which should be repaid with voluntary humility. Failure to do so is to be like the servant in the parable who was given a single talent and buried it in the ground. She defines voluntary humility as despising oneself more and valuing oneself less than our detractors do. The result of such voluntary humility is to alleviate the pain of insults and scorn from others and to bring contentment⁹⁴. The final pair of talents are the prevention against time wasting that suffering can give, repaid by using the time to pray and praise God. This is a special grace from God to prevent the sufferer from sinning; the imagery is of correction, discipline and punishment, which will be discussed in connection with Teresa's theology of suffering in chapter 8. The sufferer should give thanks for this salvation, like a sailor who has survived a great storm at sea⁹⁵.

This second section challenges those who judge as impatient sufferers expressing pain and suffering and who praise as patient those who dissemble and feign happiness. Teresa uses Job as a prime example of the patient man, and from his words and actions demonstrates that sadness and lack of false happiness can be signs of patience on the part of the afflicted, rather than the contrary. Her scriptural exegesis of Job is dealt with in chapter 6, but it should be noted that this is very limited, dealing only with those aspects of the book which support her argument on patience. She makes

⁹³ Hutton, 87:26-32, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 67-8.

⁹⁴ Hutton, 88:23-90:36, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 68-70.

⁹⁵ Hutton, 91:1-92:33, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 70-1.

no attempt to discuss the theology of suffering and evil which is the subject of the book of Job.

The final section is devoted to a discussion of patience as a virtue. In this Teresa argues that patience is the primary virtue, which provides unity between each of the four cardinal virtues and between these virtues and the three theological virtues.

The origins of theoretical treatment of universal virtues is found in Greek philosophy. Plato was the first to provide an express theory of four principal virtues, prudence, courage, temperance and justice, and held that who ever truly has any one of the virtues has all of them. Aristotle's theory required more than four specific virtues, with no unity of the virtues. However, prudence acted as a unifying factor because Aristotle taught that the exercise of prudence would develop the moral virtues⁹⁶. The dominant schools of philosophy of the later classical period tended to be closer to Plato. The Stoic school was of particular importance historically because some aspects of its teaching were readily adaptable to Christian thinking. Stoic teachings were transmitted to the medieval philosophers mainly through Cicero's *De inventione*, which discusses each of the four main virtues and identifies their 'subsidiary' parts, themselves virtues. Patience appears as one of the subsidiary parts of courage, along with magnificence (or magnanimity), confidence and perseverance⁹⁷. These theories were Christianised by the Fathers. Ambrose apparently invented the term 'cardinal' for the four Platonic principal virtues, from the Latin *cardo* which carries a number of meanings relating to important points of transition⁹⁸. Ambrose and others such as

⁹⁶ R.E. Houser, *The Cardinal Virtues: Aquinas, Albert, and Philip the Chancellor* (Toronto, 2004), pp. 13-15; *Aristotle's Nichomachean Ethics*, ed. I. Bywater (Oxford, 1894), sec. 6:13.

⁹⁷ Houser, *Cardinal Virtues*, pp. 25-8.

⁹⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 32-4.

Jerome, Augustine and Gregory the Great also accepted the unity of the four virtues, basing this on the Beatitudes or, in Augustine's case, on love⁹⁹. The rediscovery of the works of Aristotle in the high Middle Ages led to further developments in the thirteenth century by scholastic philosophers and theologians¹⁰⁰. Major contributors to the medieval theory of virtue were three Dominicans, Philip Chancellor, Albert the Great and Thomas Aquinas. Philip's major contribution to virtue theory was to say that the four main virtues could be looked at in two ways, specifically and generically. Looked at in the generic sense, they are the basis of all virtues and are therefore necessarily unified. However, when they are considered specifically, they are separate. The general cardinal virtues could then be distinguished from their 'parts', the specific virtues dependent upon them¹⁰¹. Albert expanded and systematised the treatment of the 'parts' of each of the virtues¹⁰². Philip and Albert had problems in justifying why there were four cardinal virtues; they could not link this to the powers of the soul because the Augustinian tradition was that there were only three such powers; reason (in which prudence is located), emotion (courage) and desire (temperance). Albert's pupil, Aquinas, overcame this problem by adding a fourth power, free will, the location of justice¹⁰³. The overall scheme of Aquinas' treatment was that the general cardinal virtues were necessarily united in every good deed, but the life of moral virtue, directing men back to God, required specific virtues, either given by God or acquired through virtuous habits¹⁰⁴. Aquinas gives a detailed discussion of each of the 'parts' of the four specific cardinal virtues, including patience

⁹⁹ Ibid., pp.36-8.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., p. 6.

¹⁰¹ *Summa de bono of Phillip the Chancellor* ed. N. Wiki (2 vols, Berne, 1985), ii, 744-56.

¹⁰² Houser, *Cardinal Virtues*, p. 61.

¹⁰³ Ibid., pp. 69-70.

¹⁰⁴ Aquinas, 'De virtutibus cardinalibus' in P. Bazzi (ed.) *Quaestiones disputatae vol. 2*, (Rome, 1953), Art. 2.

which is a part of courage and which gives us strength to face the difficulties and sorrows of life¹⁰⁵.

Alonso de Cartagena discusses the virtues in his *Oracional* using the tripartite division of virtues, theological, intellectual and moral¹⁰⁶. The three theological virtues are faith, hope and love¹⁰⁷, the five intellectual virtues are understanding, knowledge, wisdom, art and prudence¹⁰⁸. The third class, the moral virtues, is more numerous but the principal members of this class are stated to be the four cardinal virtues, prudence, justice, fortitude and temperance¹⁰⁹. There is a brief discussion of prudence, none at all of fortitude or temperance, but a long discussion of justice¹¹⁰.

Teresa gives a conventional list of virtues, the four cardinal virtues (prudence, fortitude, justice and temperance), three theological virtues (faith, hope and charity) and seven lesser virtues which are opposed to the seven cardinal sins¹¹¹. This list shows that she was faced with a problem. She wished to give primacy among the virtues to patience, but, as discussed above, patience was not thought of as one of the main virtues but merely a part of the cardinal virtue of courage. She bravely states that she will show that patience is in a higher, more honoured position than those

¹⁰⁵ Aquinas, *Summa theologiae*, (London and New York, 1964-9), Secunda secundae partis.

¹⁰⁶ A. de Cartagena, *Oracional*, ed. S. González-Quevedo (Valencia, 1983), p. 51. The work was addressed to Fernán Pérez de Guzmán, a Castilian nobleman. It seems likely that Teresa would have been aware of this work of religious instruction by her uncle; Castro-Ponce points out linguistic similarities between this work and Teresa's writings, C. Castro-Ponce, 'Teresa de Cartagena: *Arboleda de las Enfermas, Admiración Operum Dei, edición crítica singular*', (Brown Univ., Ph.D. thesis, 2001), pp. 49-50.

¹⁰⁷ de Cartagena, *Oracional*, p. 51.

¹⁰⁸ Ibid., p. 64.

¹⁰⁹ Ibid., p.71.

¹¹⁰ Perhaps this is not surprising in view of the author's training at Salamanca as a lawyer and his political activities (see chapter 3).

¹¹¹ Hutton, 103:9-14, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 80.

virtues to which tradition and authorities gave the highest places ¹¹². Echoing the language of Prov. 9:1, the seven pillars of wisdom, Teresa says that patience:

"...has founded its dwelling over the four firm pillars of the cardinal virtues and climbs its stairway leading directly to the theological virtues."¹¹³

It is at this point, after a conventional humility trope, she makes her reference to her years at the University of Salamanca (discussed in chapter 3). The reference here to her being at the University of Salamanca, in the context of education and knowledge, would seem to be a signal that she knows that what is to follow was not supported by accepted authority. She bases her authority to continue this theme on a statement that those writing on spiritual matters should neither heed nor fear abuse nor desire praise¹¹⁴. Teresa then goes through the four cardinal virtues and states how each of them depends upon patience:

Prudence She refers back to her discussion of the meaning of patience as suffering with prudence to show that the first cardinal virtue not only sustains the edifice of patience but is a principal part of this virtue.

Fortitude The example of Job, she says, shows that no-one afflicted with hardships can avoid offending God or bear them with patience without this virtue. She quotes the friends of Job as asking where was his fortitude and patience (Job 4:6), and explains this as showing that, if he had not had the virtue of fortitude, he would not have been able to bear his sufferings patiently. The reason she gives why the friends mention fortitude before patience is not because fortitude is greater than patience but because it is the second pillar upon which patience is built and sustained.¹¹⁵ She

¹¹² Hutton, 103:14-34, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 80-1.

¹¹³ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 80. '*Ca tiene fundada su casa sobre los firmes quatro pilares de las virtudes cardinales y sube por escala derecha a las theologales*', Hutton, 103:16-18.

¹¹⁴ Hutton, 103:26-30, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 81.

¹¹⁵ Hutton, 104:35-105:4, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 81-2.

believes that Job's reply to this accusation, that his strength was not the strength of stones, supports this interpretation. If the sufferer did not feel his suffering, there would be no virtue in his fortitude, but if he felt the emotion without the fortitude he would become impatient. Thus, fortitude supports patience.

Justice Teresa refers to the common image of justice as holding scales, and speaks of these as balancing the hardships given by God and the tribute owed to God by the sufferer. This balance is maintained by patience, balancing sentiment with reason, so justice is incorporated in patience as the third pillar.

Temperance This virtue is needed to permit the sufferer to contemplate hardship with moderation so that he neither offends God nor increases the harm. She sees temperance as an active virtue¹¹⁶.

As discussed above, there was disagreement amongst the authorities as to whether there was a unity among the cardinal virtues, such that one either possessed all or none of them. Teresa concludes that there is such a unity, based on patience¹¹⁷. Again, this varies from the accepted view because those scholars who taught the unity of the cardinal virtues based that unity on charity or prudence rather than patience¹¹⁸. Teresa then ties this unity of the cardinal virtues into a discussion of the theological virtues by saying that it is reasonable to suppose that anyone who has and practices the cardinal virtues will not be far from the theological virtues. This differs from Aquinas who taught that a person could have the cardinal virtues alone although a fully unified life could only be achieved through the theological virtues¹¹⁹. Teresa gives a detailed discussion of the relationship between patience and the first

¹¹⁶ Hutton, 105:21-7, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 82.

¹¹⁷ Hutton, 106:19-23, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 83.

¹¹⁸ J. Porter, *The Recovery of Virtue: the Relevance of Aquinas for Christian Ethics* (Louisville, 1990), pp. 163-4.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 168-9.

theological virtue, faith, showing that faith and patience are interconnected¹²⁰. Her treatment of hope and charity, on the other hand, is very brief, leading to the conclusion that the three theological virtues as well as the cardinal virtues are needed in the virtue of patience¹²¹.

Teresa's treatment of the virtues in her theme of the primacy of patience seems to demonstrate a knowledge of scholastic theology and philosophy going beyond the mere identification of the classes of virtues and the individual virtues within those classes. However, she is not afraid to differ from the approach of the scholastics in order to assert her insistence on the primacy of patience.

Teresa concludes the work by tying patience to her overall topic of suffering. After showing that patience is directly linked to the first theological virtue, faith, she states that true faith is only revealed by suffering and adversity, which then refine and purify that faith¹²². She finishes by showing how applying each of the cardinal and theological virtues to suffering and hardship leads, through patience, directly to God¹²³.

¹²⁰ Hutton, 106:25-107:36, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 83-4.

¹²¹ Hutton, 108:16-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 84.

¹²² Hutton, 107:25-36, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 84.

¹²³ Hutton, 108:21-109:3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 85.

CHAPTER 5

STRUCTURE AND IMAGERY OF ADMIRACIÓN

Genre and structure of the work

Frieden¹ gives a detailed analysis of *Admiración* to demonstrate that it was composed as a letter in accordance with the rhetorical principles of the late medieval *ars dictaminis*, although she admits that it also contains much from the rules laid down for sermons in the *ars praedicandi*. Cortés says that *Admiración* begins in epistolary form but then becomes a sermon², while Quispe believes Teresa used the structure of a forensic discourse with elements of the medieval sermon³. As with *Arboleda*, this work provides evidence that Teresa knew the rules of rhetoric but chose to mix the forms.

After an introduction which sets out her reasons for writing, namely to deal with criticism of *Arboleda*, Teresa first discusses gender roles in light of God's purpose in creation, and God's omnipotent ability through grace to do things outside conventional human understanding of those roles. She then considers the right and wrong ways to respond to displays of this divine creative power and grace. In the final, and longest, section, Teresa describes how her experience provided the

¹ M.E. Frieden, 'Epistolarity in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena and Leonor López de Córdoba' (Missouri-Colombia, Dissertation, 2001).

² M.M. Cortés Timoner, 'La predicación en palabras de mujer: Teresa de Cartagena y Juana de la Cruz', in Margarita Freixas and Silvia Iriso (eds.), *Actas del VIII Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval* (Santander, 2000), p. 573.

³ R. Quispe Agnoli, 'El espacio medieval fememino: entre la escritura y el silencio en *Admiración operum Dey* de Teresa de Cartagena,' *Anuario Medieval*, 5 (1993), pp. 108-9; R. Quispe Agnoli, "'Anse maravillado que muger haga tratados": Defensa y concepción de la escritura en Teresa de Cartagena', in J.M. Lucía Megías (ed.), *Actas del VI Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval*, (Alcalá de Henares, 1997), p. 1229.

knowledge and understanding of God, his purposes and his blessings which were the subject of her writing.

Introduction and dedication

As in *Arboleda*, there is a short introduction presumably authored by the copyist (unnamed in this manuscript but almost certainly the same as for *Arboleda*, Pero Lopez del Trigo⁴). The first sentence names the work: it is not clear whether the title was given by Teresa or by the copyist⁵. The second sentence tells us that the author is Teresa de Cartagena, a nun, but the name of her order was omitted⁶. It also states that this work was written 'at the petition and request' of Señora Juana de Mendoza (Mendoza), the wife of Señor Gómez Manrique⁷. Teresa's text begins by directly addressing her as 'virtuous lady' (*virtuosa señora*). This is the most common form of address, being used five times. In other places she is addressed as 'very discreet lady' (*muy discreta señora*), 'most discreet and beloved lady' (*muy discreta e amada señora*), 'most virtuous lady' (*muy virtuosa señora*), 'my great lady' (*mi grand señora*), 'most beloved lady' (*muy amada señora*) and 'very fortunate lady' (*muy venturosa señora*).

The reason given by Teresa for writing this work was a promise to do so⁸, although on reading the whole work it becomes clear that her main reason was to answer the critics of *Arboleda*. We are not told the basis for this promise, but it could be that

⁴ The two works are bound next to each other in the Escorial manuscript and appear to be by the same hand (personal observation).

⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, p. 131 n. 33 points out the intermingling of Latin and Spanish in the title and suggests this was a deliberate choice by Teresa to indicate, as with the use of Latin in *Arboleda*, an entry in to the Latin-based field of male authorship.

⁶ Evidence as to which order she belonged to is discussed in chapter 3.

⁷ Hutton, 111:1-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86. Juana de Mendoza's husband was a well-known supporter of *conversos*, and both belonged to aristocratic families into which *conversos* had married, G.B. Kaplan, *The Evolution of Converso Literature: the Writings of the Converted Jews of Medieval Spain* (Gainesville FL, 2002), pp. 20.

⁸ Hutton, 111:6-7, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86.

Juana, having heard the criticisms, encouraged Teresa to reply. Teresa apologises for delay in fulfilling this promise, pleading not only her illnesses and physical sufferings but also psychological and spiritual disturbances, referring first to physical sufferings which she calls her constant companions. She had already dealt extensively with this topic in *Arboleda*, thus tying the two works together. However, she says that physical sufferings alone would not have caused the delay in fulfilling her promise. For this she blames 'a secret and dangerous army full of inner conflicts and spiritual dangers', and continues the martial theme by referring to her soul being besieged by an armed mob of vain and inconstant thoughts⁹. She laments that her 'weak womanly understanding', while able on its own to see what is clearly evil, is unable to recognise the bad which comes disguised as good. For this she requires divine illumination. She also blames many and diverse 'hidden spiritual scandals' (*'espirituales e ocultos escándalos'*), the nature of which she does not specify but seems to believe that her patroness will understand. She likens the effect of these 'scandals' to flood water breaking down walls; the river Arlanzón in Burgos tends to flood, sometimes with catastrophic effects¹⁰. Water imagery recurs later in the book when she speaks of her experience of despair as a deep sea of misfortunes, again an image of danger rather than life¹¹. On the other hand, the book opens and closes with positive images of water, God's grace scattered on a dry land and the well of salvation¹².

⁹ Hutton, 112:3-9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86. This is a recurrence of the imagery of warfare and mob violence used in *Arboleda*.

¹⁰ T.F. Ruiz, *Crisis and Continuity: Land and Town in Late Medieval Castile* (Philadelphia PA, 1994), p. 21.

¹¹ Hutton, 131:28-30, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103. This negative image can be contrasted with the extensive positive imagery of water to be found in the writings of the great Spanish sixteenth century saints, Teresa of Avila and John of the Cross.

¹² Hutton, 112:29-36, 141:25-30, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 87, 112.

Teresa's model of the soul

Teresa discusses the problems which have delayed this work in terms of a model of the soul (*ánima*), which term for the medieval philosopher included the concepts of mind and personality. She expands on this model later in the work¹³, in connection with her exegesis of the Gospel story of the blind beggar. The model she uses is that of the threefold powers of the soul, understanding (*entendimiento*), memory (*memoria*) and will (*voluntad*). Among these she gives primacy to understanding, arguing that knowledge is necessary for the exercise of the other two powers¹⁴.

Understanding. The understanding acts by comprehending, knowing and recognising. Information about the physical world comes to the understanding from the physical senses, so illness or disability (such as her deafness) can affect this operation of understanding¹⁵. Understanding can be also disturbed by emotional turmoil. In turn, an impaired understanding affects the operation of both the will, by delaying execution of desires, and the memory, by causing forgetfulness¹⁶. However, in Teresa's model the understanding deals with knowledge of the spiritual as well as the physical world, and an unhealthy physical operation of the understanding can adversely affect the spiritual operation of all three powers. She uses the image of the understanding as an idle woman, going around her neighbours' houses gossiping and neglecting her household duties¹⁷. When the understanding which has been absorbed in this way by worldly activities is forced to return home, it is too disturbed to take

¹³ Hutton, 134:4-140:22, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 105-11.

¹⁴ Hutton, 134:9-11, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 106. However, in her introduction to the work she seems to adopt a more bipartite model of understanding and will, with memory subordinate to, and disruptive of, the activities of her understanding, which in turn affects (and so seems to be subordinate to) her will, Hutton, 111:13-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86.

¹⁵ Teresa here returns to the contemporary theory of disease based on the four humours which she used in *Arboleda* as a physical analogy to the spiritual disease of sin.

¹⁶ Hutton, 134:35-135:27, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 106-7.

¹⁷ This image is discussed in chapter 9.

spiritual advantage of the quiet. However, when the understanding concentrates on the knowledge of God the three powers of the soul will work together to fulfill the purpose for which they were created¹⁸. Here we have an echo of the theme of *Arboleda*, the need for separation from worldly concerns in order to achieve spiritual fulfillment.

Memory. By 'memory' she seems to mean the mental power both to store information, as she says 'we cannot remember what we do not know', and to recall information, including the information that she has forgotten something¹⁹.

Will. For Teresa the will is the source of intentions and inner desires²⁰, and it acts by loving or abhorring what is presented to it by the understanding and memory. This act of loving what is good and abhorring what is bad is compelled by reason. All humans, men and women alike, she says, are rational creatures but they require their understanding to correctly identify what is good and what is evil²¹. When this understanding is weak, divine illumination is needed²². Teresa expands upon this concept of divine illumination later in the work in connection with her discussion of the diseased understanding, and the concept is central to her claim to authorial authority²³. When the understanding has been blinded by harmful and immoral perceptions, it is living in the darkness of sin which can only be dispelled by the true Light (Jn. 1:9).

¹⁸ Hutton, 138:16-139:21, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 109-10.

¹⁹ This is shown in her explanation of her delay in writing, that spiritual troubles had swept away everything her understanding had prepared to write, leaving in her memory only the topic about which she intended to write.

²⁰ Hutton, 111:13-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86.

²¹ Hutton, 134:23-35, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 106.

²² Hutton, 112:11-15, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86.

²³ This is discussed further in chapter 9.

This tripartite model of the soul was widely accepted in the medieval period. The source usually quoted as authority is Augustine²⁴, who found an image of the Trinity in these threefold powers of the mind, and in their interdependence saw an image of the Trinitarian relationships between the three persons of the Godhead²⁵. Augustine understood memory as a vast storehouse of sense experiences, remembered emotions and acquired knowledge, but also with the ability to remember that something has been forgotten²⁶. The will was the conscious acceptance of a set of habitual loves and desires, whether good or bad²⁷. Our own knowing, remembering and loving point us to God, although Augustine taught that we also need illumination from God in order to use these powers properly²⁸. Augustine's doctrine of divine illumination seems to point to all human understanding arising from this source, and certainly is his explanation for knowledge which cannot be derived from the physical senses²⁹. He also held that all human beings possess a rational mind because they are made in the image of God, men as well as women, although he shared the prejudice of his time that women's minds were 'inferior'³⁰. Teresa's model of the soul is so close to Augustine's that it is unlikely she arrived at it independently. However, despite frequent express references to Augustine as authority throughout both works (see Appendices E and F), she gives no authority of any kind for her statements about the

²⁴ Augustine was often cited by scholastic writers as *the* Christian authority, M.W.F. Stone, 'Augustine and medieval philosophy', in E. Stump and N. Kretzmann (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2001), p. 257.

²⁵ Augustine, 'De Trinitate', in W.J. Mountain (ed.), *CCSL 50* (Turnhout, 1968), 10.11.18; M.T. Clark, 'De Trinitate', in E. Stump and N. Kretzmann (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2001), p. 98.

²⁶R. Teske, 'Augustine's Philosophy of Memory', in E. Stump and N. Kretzmann (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2001), pp. 151-2.

²⁷ J.M. Rist, *Augustine: ancient thought baptised* (Cambridge, 1994), pp. 176-7.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 77.

²⁹ G.B. Matthews, 'Knowledge and Illumination', in E. Stump and N. Kretzmann (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2001), pp. 180-1.

³⁰ Rist, *Augustine* p. 116.

soul. This could indicate that she had been taught this as the generally accepted theory, without reference to any source.

Criticism of her writing

Teresa lists three types of criticism of *Arboleda* which have come to her attention. The first purported to be of the content. She doubted that this was real, on the basis that she found it hard to believe that *los prudentes varones* could take note of such a brief and insubstantial text, and that this was really the second type of criticism, which was directed to the character of the author. There were two bases for this criticism: her gender and her afflictions. She had already anticipated criticism on the basis of her moral status in the previous paragraph, where she asks what 'good words' (*palabra buena*) could be expected of a woman 'so infirm in her body and wounded in her spirit' (*tan enferma en la persona e tan bulnerada en el anima*)³¹. Although she responds by statements of humility, she cannot conceal her annoyance when she is told that the wonder expressed by these critics at her writing is flattering. As an intelligent person she clearly regarded this 'wonder' as offensive. The third group of critics doubted, based on the same factors, that she was indeed the author³². This particular insult seems to have been what stung her into writing *Admiración*.

By answering her critics in writing, Teresa would be understood by the readers of *Admiración* to be asserting that she actually wrote *Arboleda* and to be claiming authority to have done so. Of course, the act of writing *Admiración* is also an

³¹ Hutton, 112:28-9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 87. In raising her own defects she may have been hoping to bring to the minds of her readers the late medieval view that the sins of an author did not necessarily detract from his authority if in some way others were helped to avoid sin through his writings, A.J. Minnis, *Medieval Theory of Authorship: Scholastic Literary Attitudes in the Later Middle Ages* (Aldershot, 1988), pp. 110-11.

³² One such allegation was that she had copied from books written by others, Hutton, 131:17-21; Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103.

assertion of authorial authority, and this work is clearly directed to an audience which included her male critics. Teresa bases her unspoken claim to authority firstly on God's power and blessing, freely bestowed, and secondly on her experience and the divinely inspired lessons it taught her. Teresa's answer to her critics can be summed up as follows: God is able to do anything, including enabling a woman to write a book, and the response to such a display of his power should be wonder and gratitude for his blessings. To doubt that he can do this is offensive to God. However, within her exposition of this answer she discusses male and female roles and natures in a way that subtly challenges the conventional views of her time about women's abilities and proper place in society. She begins with a statement with which no-one in her society could quarrel – that everything was created by God's omnipotence and everything in God's creation is worthy of human wonder. She goes on to qualify this statement by asserting that it applies equally to the smallest as well as the greatest, which is orthodox theology but contains an implied challenge to social hierarchy³³. However, humans wonder more at some of God's works than others. To explain this she invokes the authority of Augustine, who, preaching on the feeding of the five thousand, stated that the greater miracle was the governing of the five thousand rather than the satisfaction of their hunger by five loaves, but that the latter was considered a miracle because it happened rarely³⁴. She draws the conclusion that, if the understanding is properly directed to the contemplation of God's works, everyday events are as marvellous as those which happen rarely. Again, this is an orthodox and uncontroversial statement³⁵. She then applies this conclusion to her situation, arguing that male wonder at her having written a treatise derives from the rarity of female authorship. Male authorship, she argues, is taken for granted because it is common

³³ Hutton, 114:20-31, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 89.

³⁴ Augustine, 'Sermo CXXX', PL 38:725.

³⁵ Hutton, 114:31-115:19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 89.

but it is just as much a work of God as female authorship³⁶. God's omnipotence is just as able to overcome any deficiencies of female understanding as that of men, because men only have sufficiency because God gave it to them. This latter assertion is backed up by the authority of St Paul himself (2 Cor. 3:5)³⁷.

Discussing the nature and roles of the two sexes, Teresa begins by stating her agreement with the universal belief of her time, that God made the male first and created the female as an adjunct to the male. However, she immediately diverges from accepted teaching by asserting that God did not do so in order to favour the male, but for a secret purpose known to God alone³⁸; as discussed in chapter 9, the medieval church taught that women were inferior to men, particularly because woman was the cause of the Fall³⁹. She then states her view that the main difference between the sexes is that men are courageous while women are timid⁴⁰. We will see how this choice is necessary to support the argument she is about to set out, but in the context of Spanish aristocratic machismo it is a clever choice. From the dedication of the book it looks as if Teresa was addressing her writing to an aristocratic audience. Although by the late fifteenth century the Spanish nobility were generally well educated, as a class they still preferred to distinguish themselves by their military

³⁶ By the late middle ages a theory of authorship based on Aristotelian causality had emerged, particularly in respect to the authors of Scripture. Whilst the human author exercised his own creativity and independence, divine inspiration of the author meant God was the primary efficient cause of the work, Minnis, *Medieval Theory of Authorship*, pp. 82-3. Teresa's discussion of authorship in this passage seems to be consistent with this theory.

³⁷ Hutton, 115:19-116:9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 89-90. It should be noted that Teresa several times cites Paul as authority; it is likely that this was deliberate, because the Church's insistence that women should not teach men (and therefore not write books) was based on 1 Tim. 2:12, then believed to have been written by Paul.

³⁸ Hutton, 116:9-25, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 90.

³⁹ G. Macy, *The Hidden History of Women's Ordination: Female Clergy in the Medieval West* (Oxford, 2008), p.119-22.

⁴⁰ Hutton, 116:25-117:4, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 90-1. Teresa uses an amusing, very Spanish, image, contrasting the brave man awaiting the charge of a bull with the timid woman terrified of a mouse.

prohess⁴¹. Thus it is likely that they would readily agree to courage, rather than intellect, being the prime male characteristic. She goes on to argue that men and women have complementary roles, using a botanical image. She compares men to the cortex (bark) of a plant or tree, women to the medulla (inner core). This itself is subversive because of the allegorical meanings attached in medieval thought to these botanical elements. The cortex stood for the external or corporeal and was therefore less important than the medulla which represented the internal, spiritual or intellectual. Examples of this allegorical treatment were regarding the physical body of Christ as the cortex and his divine nature as the medulla, or equating literal interpretation of Scripture with the cortex and the spiritual interpretation with the medulla⁴². Teresa uses the botanical fact that the cortex protects the medulla, while the medulla nourishes the cortex. In the same way, she says, strong and brave men protect things on the outside such as running and defending the country, while weak and timid women stay at home and support the men. However, Teresa insists that the male role was not given by God to the detriment of women, but that their complementary roles were of equal importance in God's plan for creation. She cites Gen. 2:18, that God created woman as a helper to man in support of her argument, slyly raising the question whether the helped or the helper has the greater strength⁴³. Teresa dodges the controversial answer she hints at by saying such arguments are for worldly purposes and a diversion from her real purpose, which is not to offend men or favour women but rather to praise God's omnipotence and wisdom⁴⁴.

⁴¹ T.F. Ruiz, *Spanish Society 1400-1600* (Harlow, 2001), p. 70.

⁴² J.K. Moore, 'Conventional Botany or Unorthodox Organics?: on the Meollo/Corteza Metaphor in *Admiración operum Dey* of Teresa de Cartagena', *Romance Notes*, 44.1 (2003), pp. 6-9; T.R.J. Hart, "'El Conde Arnaldos" and the medieval scriptural tradition,' *Modern Language Notes* 72, no. 4 (1957), p. 281.

⁴³ Augustine taught that in her role as helper woman was not in the image of God to the extent that she was subordinate to men, Rist, *Augustine* p. 116, so again Teresa contradicted authority.

⁴⁴ Hutton, 117:4-118:34, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 91-2.

Teresa then appeals to Scripture read as history to support her argument that God can give women power to do things generally reserved to men. The example she chooses is the Old Testament character, Judith⁴⁵. Judith's fame rests on her courage in defeating the feared general Holofernes, which no Israelite male dared to do. This shows why Teresa gave primacy to courage among male characteristics. She derives from the story this argument: if God could give a woman the most unusual power to wield a sword⁴⁶ to kill Holofernes, there could be no doubt that he could give a woman the power for the much easier task of wielding a pen⁴⁷. Her answer to the anticipated argument that Judith was given this power only because she was an exceptionally virtuous and holy woman is the orthodox theological statement that none of God's gifts are given based on the merit of the recipient but rather from his great goodness. She cites Paul (Rom. 2:11, 3:22-4) for the proposition that God has no favourites but bestows his grace on sinners as well as the righteous⁴⁸.

Wonder at the works of God

Teresa then returns to her original argument, that the only reason why there is wonder that a woman has written a book is that it is something that rarely occurs. While it is right to wonder at the works of God, she distinguishes between two kinds of wonder, one of which praises God and the other which insults him. This section, which

⁴⁵ Judith's victory was regarded as an allegory of the triumph of the Virgin over the devil or of the Church over evil, R.E. Surtz, *Writing Women in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain: the Mothers of Saint Teresa of Avila* (Philadelphia PA, 1995), p. 32. She was also a popular pro-feminine role model in medieval literature, A. Blamires, *The Case for Women in Medieval Culture* (Oxford, 1997), pp.171-2.

⁴⁶ Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 32. At that time the sword symbolised male royal power, as discussed in chapter 9.

⁴⁷ Hutton, 119:31-120:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 93.

⁴⁸ Hutton, 120:12-121:18, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 93-4.

expounds theological reasons justifying her rejection of her critics, is the heart of this work⁴⁹.

Teresa defines the first, admirable, kind of wonder as being mixed with devotion and faith, believing that God in his omnipotence can do anything, and that his goodness means that what he does is for our profit and advantage. This leads to a long passage⁵⁰ on the topic of the divine blessings. She distinguishes between two types of blessing, those she calls 'general' (*los bienes generales*), which are the blessings of nature and fortune, and the 'exceptional or special' blessings (*los singulares o especiales bienes*)⁵¹. Both should be regarded with wonder and both come from God. Although God is the source of all blessings, Teresa points out the human tendency to attribute the first kind of blessing to fortune or to the abilities of the individual. She gives as examples personal attributes, bravery, beauty, intelligence, and property. As examples of the latter she lists 'riches, estates, villages and rents'⁵², clearly identifying her as a member of the upper classes. She sees these general blessings as coming from the general creative activity of God, nature, which according to the Bible he has allowed to be controlled by mankind. These are to be distinguished from acts of God's grace, which only God can give and control. To illustrate this distinction, Teresa gives as an allegory the powers of the Pope: some papal powers are delegated to cardinals and bishops to exercise for the general benefit of members of the clergy and religious orders, others he reserves to himself⁵³. The special acts of God's grace are bestowed as he pleases, without regard to the sex, intellect or fitness of the recipient. To justify this key assertion in her argument,

⁴⁹ The title, whether given by Teresa or the copyist, is in agreement with this.

⁵⁰ Hutton, 122:13-126:15, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 94-8.

⁵¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 95; Hutton, 122:24-30.

⁵² Seidenspinner-Núñez, 96; *la riqueza e hacienda, villas e rentas*, Hutton, 123:7-8.

⁵³ This image is consistent with her membership of a family containing leading ecclesiastics.

Teresa relies on the authority of St Paul⁵⁴. If, as the apostle says, grace is in superabundance where sin, a spiritual defect, abounds, she asks why grace cannot also superabound where physical defects and suffering are abundant, as these are not sins. Indeed, she argues that this must be so, because where there are physical defects natural blessings are withheld, but God's grace restores and repairs. Teresa states her conclusion that the blessings of grace are greater and more exceptional than those of nature and fortune. This being so, both the recipient of these blessings and those who see these blessings given to others should marvel devoutly and give praise and worship to God, the author of these blessings. She gives a list of God's works that should make us praise the relevant divine attribute, ending up with 'and if we see that women write treatises, we shall praise the gifts of his holy grace and divine generosity.'⁵⁵

The second, bad, kind of wonder is when wonder at a blessing bestowed on another is accompanied by doubts whether it can be true because of the nature or abilities of that other. Those whose wonder derives from belief that it is doubtful or impossible that a woman could write a book fall into this category, according to Teresa. As she says, no-one marvels that men write books, attributing this to male brains and intellect and forgetting where these male attributes and male knowledge came from. She points out that this 'natural' knowledge has been passed down from master to disciple, but that its origin is God. In support of this proposition she cites a book she said she had read recently⁵⁶ which she names as *De Sabiduria* ('On Wisdom'). As shown in the

⁵⁴ Rom, 5:20b '...where sin increased, grace increased all the more.' NIV.

⁵⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 98; '*e sy viéremos que las henbras hazen tractados, e loaremos los dones de la su santa graçia e diuinal larg[u]eza*', Hutton, 126:5-6.

⁵⁶ Somewhat curiously she specifically says that she read this '*próxima o çercana de las calendas de agosto*', near the beginning of August, Hutton, 127:11-12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 99. This could indicate that she wrote this work in a relatively short time towards the end of a year.

table of Scriptural citations in Appendix B, these quotations are taken from the Book of Sirach, also called Ecclesiasticus. As the wisdom originates from God, she argues that someone who dedicates himself to the study which is loving God and who implants in his soul the root of wisdom, which is the fear of God (this is a Scriptural quotation, Prov. 9:10) would not be denied God's grace. Indeed, God is willing to instruct the simple, even those who are unworthy through human frailty. From this she concludes:

'...if my own wickedness and human frailty could contain His teachings, the works my sovereign Master would teach me to do would be better than the words He instructed me to write.'⁵⁷

Here is the heart of her argument, that her writing was divinely inspired. If God is the source of inspiration, which is the doctrine of divine illumination (discussed further in chapter 9), then it is impious to doubt that this is possible because of the nature of the inspired human. She argues that it is offensive to God to accept that human knowledge can be transmitted by teaching but doubt that God can teach whoever he wants. She anticipates the counter-argument, that, while this is theoretically possible, normally God provides for the teaching of the subjects of human knowledge by organised teaching and learning, by saying that she is not talking about the sort of knowledge taught in schools and universities, '*las naturales ciencias*'⁵⁸. She is talking about the 'true science' ('*verdadera ciencia*') which is what draws us to know and love God. This true science and good wisdom is taught in the school of continuous

⁵⁷ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 99; '*sy mi propia malicia e flaqueza humana no lo derrama, se puede dezir que mejores serían las obras que Éste mi soberano Maestro me mostraría a hazer que no las palabras que me enseñó a escreuir*', Hutton, 127:29-31.

⁵⁸ She makes specific reference to theology, law, canon law and liberal arts, Hutton, 128:12-14; Seidenspinner-Núñez, 100.

remembrance of God's blessings, and it is this wisdom, not *las naturales çiençias*, that was the subject of 'the treatise that I wrote'⁵⁹.

Enlightenment through experience

We now come to the heart of Teresa's defence of her authorship. Having set out her argument in principle for divine wisdom bestowed on those who fear God, she turns to her own experience of divine illumination. Despite her inadequacies, the True Light was able to make clear and easy anything that was obscure and difficult for her 'womanly intellect'⁶⁰. This light shines where it is most needed, where there is sin, ignorance and affliction. Only God can make a sinner virtuous or impart wisdom to someone of little understanding.

Here Teresa returns to the theme of *Arboleda*; her travails came from God in his justice and wisdom to correct her poverty of soul and insufficiency of understanding. Through these afflictions she learned from God, and she states the heart of her defence:

'For my experience makes me sure, and God of truth knows that I had no other master not consulted with any other learned authority nor translated from other books...this alone is the truth: that God...alone consoled me, He alone taught me, He alone read (to) me.'⁶¹

She then describes her experience by analogy to the Gospel story of the blind beggar of Jericho. For Teresa it was her understanding that was blind, blinded by sin and struggling with human emotion and desires. However, her understanding desired the light, so when she heard her Saviour ask, as he did the blind beggar, what she wanted

⁵⁹ Hutton, 128:2-33; Seidenspinner-Núñez, 100-1.

⁶⁰ Hutton, 129:27-32; Seidenspinner-Núñez, 101.

⁶¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103; '*Pues la yspiriencia me faze çierta e Dios de la verdad sabe que yo no oue otro Maestro ni me consejë con otro algund letrado, ni lo trasladé de libros...Mas sólo ésta es la verdad: que Dios...solo me consoló, e Él solo me enseñó, e Él solo me leyó.*', Hutton, 131:17-24.

him to do for her, she asked for spiritual, rather than physical, health. This was granted by an immediate spiritual illumination, apparently a 'conversion' experience⁶². She explains the nature of this illumination by reference to the workings of the understanding, will and memory and of divine illumination, discussed above. In the middle of her discussion of divine illumination, Teresa again expresses her experience by reference to the blind beggar: this story was clearly important to the theological understanding of her sufferings which she set out in *Arboleda*⁶³.

She returns to this theology at the end of the work, tied in to her discussion of the effects on the soul of involvement in or withdrawal from worldly distractions. When the three powers of understanding, memory and will combine to dedicate themselves to spiritual matters, God is quick to make up deficiencies by his grace. Teresa returns to the image of the ark of God's grace which she used at the beginning. This is a positive image of water, the ark being opened to scatter the water of God's grace over a dry and sterile land⁶⁴. By God's grace we are corrected in this life which is the time of mercy and grace, rather than in the future of judgment and justice. By exercising judgment in a time of mercy, God shows he will exercise mercy in the Last Judgment. Teresa writes about her experience in order to encourage others to come to God's

⁶² Hutton, 133:34-7, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 105. She describes this experience as the rending of the veil of darkness that blinded her eyes, a reference to the rending of the veil of the Temple at the death of Jesus, Matt. 27:51.

⁶³ Hutton, 136:31-137:32, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 108-9.

⁶⁴ Hutton, 140:16-22, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 111. It is unclear to what Teresa is referring by her reference to the 'ark', of which she says God opens the door and scatters drops of divine grace like water. The two Biblical candidates are the ark of the covenant and Noah's ark. While the ark of the covenant was a source of divine grace, there is no reference to a door in that ark as it is described in Ex. 37. According to Gen. 7:16, Noah's ark had a door which God shut before the flood came, but what emerged was Noah and the animals. Noah's ark is generally regarded by Christians as an allegory for baptism, which could be what Teresa was thinking of.

mercy, where he will get the true Bread of understanding and the true Water of life,
the Lord and Saviour⁶⁵.

⁶⁵ Hutton, 141:5-30, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 111-2.

CHAPTER 6

TERESA DE CARTAGENA'S USE OF SCRIPTURE

Introduction

Teresa de Cartagena's primary source of authority for the propositions she puts forth in both her books is Scripture. Besides formal quotation of Scripture to support what she says, her writings show the deep influence of the Bible on her thought in both ideas and expressions.

Medieval Biblical exegesis

The various types of Biblical exegesis in use in the medieval period were well established by Teresa's time, although writers differed as to number and nomenclature of the types¹. For analysis of Teresa's treatment of Scripture, the most appropriate approach seems to be the three-fold scheme of literal/historical, spiritual/allegorical and moral/tropological, as she shows no interest in the fourth 'sense', the anagogical or eschatological approach. This threefold scheme was the approach used by Gregory the Great, as described in his preface to *Moralia in Job*².

Literal/historical

The literal or historical approach³ to exegesis, as understood at least after Aquinas, is to look at a passage in its historical context and, by looking at the grammatical

¹ H. de Lubac, *Medieval Exegesis 1: The Four Senses of Scripture*, trans. M. Sebanc (Edinburgh, 1998), pp. 90-2.

² Gregory the Great, *Moralium Libri Sive Expositio In Librum Beati Job Pars I*, PL 75 (Paris, 1862), p. 511.

³ These terms are practically interchangeable, H. de Lubac, *Medieval Exegesis 2: The Four Senses of Scripture*, trans. E.M. Macierowski (Edinburgh, 2000), p. 41.

construction and lexicography, to consider what the author intended it to mean⁴. Where the passage was not by its nature intended to be taken literally, such as parables or prophecies, the literal exposition would include an explanation of its meaning⁵. Literal interpretation was derived from one rabbinical approach to the Torah (discussed below, pp. 138-9), the Church Fathers even called it the *sensus Judaicus*⁶. The twelfth to the fourteenth centuries was a period in which Christian scholars increasingly consulted Hebrew texts and rabbinic commentaries for assistance in exegesis⁷. By the late Middle Ages this approach to Biblical exegesis had gained in importance, in contrast with the early medieval period when spiritual interpretation was considered to be the most important⁸. Smalley traces this to the influence of the mendicant orders, in particular the Franciscan emphasis on the historical truth of the Gospel events and literal following of the Gospel precepts⁹. Another reason was the effect of the arrival of Aristotelian philosophy in the universities, which among other things resulted in the teaching of theology (which involves going behind the literal interpretation of the text) being separated from the teaching of Biblical exegesis¹⁰.

Spiritual/allegorical

Spiritual exposition, the typological explanation of Old Testament events or prophecies as pointing to or being fulfilled by Christ or the Church, goes back to the

⁴ B. Smalley, *The Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 1952), p. 300.

⁵ B. Smalley, 'The Bible in the Medieval Schools', in G.W.H. Lampe (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible* (3 vols., Cambridge, 1969), ii, 215.

⁶ E.I.J. Rosenthal, 'The Study of the Bible in Medieval Judaism', in G.W.H. Lampe (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, ii, p. 254.

⁷ D.C. Klepper, *The Insight of Unbelievers: Nicholas of Lyra and Christian Reading of Jewish Text in the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia PA, 2007), pp. 14-30.

⁸ J. Leclercq, 'The Exposition and Exegesis of Scripture: from Gregory the Great to St Bernard' in G.W.H. Lampe (ed.) *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, ii, 184.

⁹ Smalley, *Bible in the Middle Ages* pp. 283-5.

¹⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 292-4. De Lubac believes that she overstated the degree of change of approach, *Medieval Exegesis*, ii, 49-52.

early church and is to be found throughout the New Testament¹¹. Mostly this exposition is directly based on the historical interpretation of the original text, but in a few cases, such as the equation of Christ with Melchizedek King of Salem¹² found in the Epistle to the Hebrews¹³, the reference is allegorical¹⁴. In the later Middle Ages, the spiritual meaning of Old Testament texts was increasingly used in contrast to the literal meaning to attempt to persuade Jews to convert or to point out to Christians the errors of Jewish belief, in a period of increasing hostility in western Europe towards the Jewish community¹⁵.

Moral/tropological

By the later Middle Ages this type of exposition was more generally found in connection with sermons or monastic *lectio divina*¹⁶ than with scholastic exegesis¹⁷. Although the literal meaning remained as a base, a wider use of allegory and simile was made in order to exhort morality and encourage holiness¹⁸.

Medieval Jewish exegesis

Spain was a major centre for the development of Jewish exegesis during the medieval period¹⁹. The grammatical and lexicographical Hebrew studies needed as a foundation for a linguistic, literal exegesis of the Torah, *peshat*, were laid in early medieval Spain and were used by other Jewish exegetes, in particular the very

¹¹G.W.H. Lampe, 'The Exposition and Exegesis of Scripture: to Gregory the Great', in G.W.H. Lampe (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, ii, 155-8.

¹² Gen. 14:18-20.

¹³ Heb. 7.

¹⁴ Lampe, 'Exposition and Exegesis of Scripture', p. 161.

¹⁵ Klepper, *Insight of Unbelievers*, p. 1.

¹⁶ This is the monastic method of contemplative reading of a short passage of Scripture, seeking spiritual enlightenment, prescribed by St Benedict. A short summary of the method is given by William of St Thierry in his Golden Epistle (William of Saint Thierry, *The Golden Epistle: A Letter to the Brethren at Mont Dieu*, trans. Shewring, W., (London, 1930), pp. 56-7.

¹⁷ Smalley, *Bible in the Middle Ages* pp. 243-5.

¹⁸ Smalley, 'Bible in Medieval Schools', pp. 212-3.

¹⁹ Rosenthal, 'Bible in Medieval Judaism', p. 258.

influential French rabbi known as Rashi²⁰. The leading exponent of the *peshat* method was the twelfth century Spanish rabbi, Abraham ibn Ezra²¹. Two later Spanish developments were philosophical interpretation, of which the leading work was *Guide to the Perplexed* by Maimonides, and the mystical approach, *kabbalah*, developed in the thirteenth and fourteenth century by Maimonides and his pupils²². One of these pupils wrote a commentary on the Pentateuch which used four different methods of exegesis; *peshat* (literal/historical), *midrash* (traditional rabbinic homiletic and figurative), *sekhel* (philosophical) and *kabbalah* (mystical)²³. Jewish exegesis in the later Middle Ages was greatly influenced by the circumstances described in chapter 2. As Christians were increasingly using the Jewish scriptures and rabbinical writings in anti-Jewish polemic, Jewish exegetes needed to produce a response, primarily to help Jews to withstand the challenge to their faith²⁴. As the challenge came from Christian spiritual exposition of the Old Testament, the finding of Christ and the Church as foreshadowed in and the fulfilment of those scriptures, Jewish exegesis mainly emphasised the *peshat* method²⁵. Teresa's grandfather trained as a rabbi before his conversion, so would have been fluent in Hebrew and familiar with Jewish scriptural exegesis. After conversion he passed some of this knowledge on to his son by writing extensive marginal notes in his copy of the *Postillae* of Nicholas of Lyra, the leading medieval proponent for the Christian use of Jewish exegesis²⁶. This family connection means that Teresa may have had some knowledge of medieval

²⁰ Ibid., p. 261-3.

²¹ Ibid., pp. 266-8.

²² Ibid., pp. 274-8.

²³ Ibid., p. 278.

²⁴ Ibid., p. 270.

²⁵ Ibid., p. 255.

²⁶ Klepper, *Insight of Unbelievers*, pp. 124-5. These notes were later published as the *Additiones ad Postillam magistri Nicolai de Lyra* and became closely connected with the *Postillae*.

Jewish traditions of exegesis. However, her method of exegesis would seem to be more closely related to the Christian *lectio divina* than to these rabbinical methods.

Quantitative analysis

Teresa makes extensive use of express quotations from Scripture in her writing. This is not surprising as Scripture was the primary source of proof for the medieval religious writer and preacher²⁷. Appendices A and B are tables of these quotations for each of her works, giving Teresa's Spanish, the Latin Jerome Vulgate equivalent²⁸ and the Biblical citation, also the page references in both the printed edition and the English translation. These are single quotations, not passages the subject of extended exegesis and are the scriptural quotations she uses deliberately and expressly, usually to provide authority for a statement or proposition. This should be contrasted with the implicit use of Scripture and typological references to contemporary situations often found in medieval literature, for example as found in the *Poema de Fernán González* as explained by Deyermond (1990)²⁹. While Teresa also uses phrases derived from the Bible while not expressly quoting a verse, she does not use this kind of extended typological reference.

²⁷ J.J. Murphy, *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages: a History of Rhetorical Theory from Saint Augustine to the Renaissance* (Berkeley, 1974), p. 323.

²⁸ There is the difficulty of knowing what the exact text of any Vulgate in use in Las Huelgas in Teresa's time would have been, as she wrote before the Vatican acted at the end of the sixteenth century to produce a standardised version, the Clementine Vulgate. The long cultural isolation of Spain from the rest of Europe meant the Latin Bible in Spain had a distinctive history, described in R. Loewe, 'The Medieval History of the Latin Vulgate', in G.W.H. Lampe (ed.) *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, ii, 120-9. The Latin quotations are taken from a version of the Jerome Vulgate available from the Perseus Digital Library of Tufts University, <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus:text:1999.02.0060>.

²⁹ A. Deyermond, 'Uses of the Bible in the *Poema de Fernán González*', in D. Hook and B. Taylor (eds.), *Cultures in Contact in Medieval Spain* (London, 1990). Indeed, such uses are found in other cultures steeped in Biblical knowledge, such as the African slaves in America who identified their situation with that of the Israelites in Babylon.

As shown in the tables, she does not in general specify the particular book of the Bible that she is quoting from. However, that was the general practice at the time. Writers who were highly educated and fluent in Latin used similarly vague references. For example, her uncle Alonso de Cartagena, when quoting Scripture in his *Oracional*³⁰, uses phrases such as '*commo dixo el Apostol*' (St Paul), '*onde dize nuestro Redemptor*', '*segund aquella palabra del Profeta que dize*' or '*el Profeta dize en el Salmo*'. Only in a small minority of these quotations is the actual Biblical book named.

Biblical sources of citations

The 45 Scriptural quotations in *Arboleda* (Appendix A) are made up of 32 from the Old Testament and 13 from the New Testament (counting the five partial quotations from 2 Cor. 12:9 found in one section³¹ as one quotation). The 28 from *Admiración* (Appendix B) have a similar split, 20 Old Testament to 8 New Testament. However this raw analysis, which seems to show a strong preference on Teresa's part for the Old rather than the New Testament, is probably misleading because, of the 32 Old Testament quotations in *Arboleda*, 17 are from the Psalms and the 20 from *Admiración* contain 15 from the Psalms. Teresa herself says at the beginning of *Arboleda* that the Psalter was her main inspiration³². This emphasis on the Psalter is, of course, to be expected from someone who had been a vowed religious for many years at the time she was writing, because of the central role of the Psalter in the

³⁰ A. de Cartagena, *Oracional*, ed. S. González-Quevedo (Valencia, 1983).

³¹ Hutton, 58-62, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42-6.

³² Hutton, 38:19-23, Seidenspinner-Núñez. 24. She calls the Psalter David's "songbook (*cancionero*)". By the fourteenth century scholars were using literary form as the main basis of classification of the Scriptures, including identifying the Psalms as a collection of poems, A.J. Minnis, *Medieval Theory of Authorship: Scholastic Literary Attitudes in the Later Middle Ages* (Aldershot, 1988), p. 135. *Cancionero* is a form of late medieval courtly verse.

liturgical life of all religious orders³³. In particular, the Cistercians in their offices recited the whole Psalter in the course of each week³⁴, while the reading of the Old Testament was spread out over an entire year³⁵. Counting the psalm quotations separately, in *Arboleda*, there are 17 quotations from the Psalms, 15 from the rest of the Old Testament, and 13 from the New Testament. Of *Admiración*'s 28 quotations, 15 are from the Psalms, 5 from the rest of the Old Testament, and 8 from the New Testament. Combined, this shows a preponderance of quotations from the Psalms, with the Old and New Testaments about equal.

The passages the subject of a more extended exegesis in *Arboleda* are Ps. 31:9, Ps. 44:11, the Parable of the talents (Matt. 25:14-30; Lk. 19:12-26), 2 Corinthians 12:9 and Job. In *Admiración* they are Judith and the story of the blind beggar (Matt. 20:29-34; Mk 10:46-52; Lk. 18:35-43). Thus, between Teresa's two books there are two from each of the Old Testament and the Psalter, and three from the New Testament.

Also of interest are the sources of her quotations. In the Old Testament, apart from her extensive use of Job and Judith, she has four quotations from the Pentateuch which was attributed to Moses (two from Genesis, one each from Deuteronomy and Exodus), four from the Prophets (two each Isaiah and Jeremiah), four from Solomon (two from Sirach, one from Ecclesiastes and one from Song of Songs) and two from Tobit. In the New Testament, Gospel quotations predominate (although only one is from John). None of these is from the Sermon on the Mount. From the Epistles there

³³ S.J.P. van Dijk, 'The Bible in Liturgical Use', in G.W.H. Lampe (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, ii, 244.

³⁴ J. Kerr, 'An Essay on Cistercian Liturgy', http://cistercians.shaf.ac.uk/cistercian_life/spirituality/index.php, p. 3.

³⁵ van Dijk, 'Bible in Liturgical Use', pp. 233-4.

are two from Romans, two from 2 Corinthians and two from James. Revelation provides two quotations. This list can be compared to a list of suggested reading (for private use and for public reading at meals) given to nuns by Teresa's contemporary Hernando de Talavera while he was bishop of Avila (1485-1497)³⁶. From the Bible he lists the Gospels and then all the rest of the New Testament, Tobit, Esther, Judith and the five books attributed to Solomon. Among other reading he includes the *Moralia* of Gregory the Great, thus indirectly adding Job to the list³⁷. The Psalms would not be on this list for the reason given above. Teresa's material differs from this list in that she includes Moses and the Prophets. By contrast, a study of the use of the Bible in Clarissan writings, particularly those of St. Clare herself and of the fifteenth century reformer, St. Collette, shows that Biblical quotations are primarily from the sections of the Gospel containing the evangelical counsels (primarily found in the Sermon on the Mount and Matt. 10) in connection with the rule of life, and from the Song of Songs in connection with the inner spiritual life³⁸.

Teresa's source for quotations

Oral sources

One possible source could be that she is quoting from memory, based on her hearing of Scripture quoted in the liturgy and sermons. This seems unlikely. For a start, a comparison of her quotation with the corresponding passage in the Vulgate shows that her quotations are usually quite accurate. As explained above (p. 141), the fact that she generally does not name the exact source of the quotation is not evidence that she

³⁶ Near the end of his life, Talavera was accused by the inquisitor of Córdoba of operating a secret Jewish synagogue in his household, but it is not known whether Talavera was actually a *converso*, J. Edwards, 'Trial of an Inquisitor: the Dismissal of Diego Rodriguez Lucero, Inquisitor of Córdoba, in 1508', in *Religion and Society in Spain. c.1492* (Aldershot, 1996) ch. IX, pp. 253-5.

³⁷ R. Llamas, *Biblia en Santa Teresa* (Madrid, 2007) p. 23.

³⁸ A.E. Matter, 'Bible and Rule in the Clarissan Tradition,' *Magistra*, 8 no. 2 (2002), pp. 77-83.

was quoting from memory because this was the usual practice. Further, at the time she was writing she had been deaf for at least 20 years, after about 15 hearing years in the religious life, and so would have had to retain these extensive and accurate memories for that period. As she was probably in her mid-fifties when she was writing, she would also have to contend with the deterioration of memory that comes with age. As a result, it would seem likely that she had a written source for her quotations. She was clearly able to read, at least in the vernacular, because she states at the beginning of *Arboleda* that, after she became deaf, she received 'consoling counsels' from her books³⁹.

Vernacular sources

A second possibility is that she had access to a vernacular translation of the Bible. We do know that vernacular translations had been made by the fifteenth century, although Margherita Morreale⁴⁰ in the Cambridge History of the Bible points out that there are very many fewer existing manuscripts of medieval translations into the various Spanish languages than exist for other languages. This is almost certainly due to the prohibition by the Inquisition of the use of vernacular versions which resulted in the destruction of copies⁴¹. This prohibition in relation to the Old Testament and complete Bibles, aimed at recent converts from Judaism, began soon after the Inquisition was established (1478 in Castile), and reading the Bible in Spanish was regarded as a sign of suspicious religious tendencies⁴².

³⁹Hutton, 38:13-18, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 24. She also says 'I have heard people say, and even read...' in connection with the characteristics of a dromedary, Hutton, 84:1-2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 64.

⁴⁰M. Morreale, 'Vernacular Scriptures in Spain', in G.W.H. Lampe (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, ii, 466.

⁴¹The fifteenth century vernacular Bible in Spain included in the Old Testament translations directly from Hebrew, rather than from the Vulgate, and included some elements of Jewish exegesis. This may help explain the ban on this vernacular Bible by the Inquisition, R.N. Swanson, *Religion and Devotion in Europe, c. 1215-c.1515* (Cambridge, 1995), p. 78.

⁴²G.D. Starr-LeBeau, *In the Shadow of the Virgin: Inquisitors, Friars, and Conversos in Guadalupe, Spain* (Princeton, N.J., 2003), pp. 59-60, 222.

There were also a number of florilegia in Spanish; in particular, Pero López de Ayala produced a Spanish florilegia from Gregory the Great's *Moralia in Job*, which is discussed in chapter 7. Other potential sources of short passages of Scripture were translations of popular works such as the *Vita Christi* of Ludolphus of Saxony⁴³, and works in Spanish which quoted extensively from the Bible. One such work, which it is highly likely was known to Teresa, is the *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana* by Pedro de Luna, Benedict XIII, which quotes extensively from the Bible and the Fathers. She may also have had access to vernacular translations of works used for the formation and instruction of nuns, such as the *Speculum Virginum*⁴⁴, which included discussion of biblical texts.

Latin sources

Another possible source of Scriptural quotes is the Latin Breviary or other liturgical books; she does quote directly from liturgical sources, as discussed in chapter 7. The request in the second Papal petition that she be entitled to be elected to abbatical office in her new Order means that she must have been a choir nun. Probably in her Franciscan convent, and certainly in Las Huelgas, the choir nuns must have been at least able to recite the Latin of the daily liturgy which took up so much of their day and would have had instruction in its meaning⁴⁵.

⁴³ R.E. Surtz, *Writing Women in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain: the Mothers of Saint Teresa of Avila* (Philadelphia PA, 1995), p. 14.

⁴⁴ There are known copies of the Latin text from Spain, it was widely transmitted through Cistercian houses and the work was widely translated into the vernacular in the fifteenth century, J. Seyfarth, 'The *Speculum Virginum*: The Testimony of the Manuscripts', in C.J. Mews (ed.), *Listen Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages* (New York NY, 2001), p. 54, nn. 23, 24.

⁴⁵ Surtz, *Writing Women*, p.4.

The final possibility is that she knew enough Latin to be able to use the Latin Bible. For reasons discussed in chapter 3, it seems likely that she was well educated and very probably could at least read Latin. She may also have had access to Latin texts on biblical exposition such as the Sentences of Peter Lombard⁴⁶, a version of the *Glossa Ordinaria* or the *Postilla* of Nicholas of Lyra⁴⁷. These works contain extensive quotes from the Fathers, and Teresa also quotes from the Fathers (discussed in chapter 7).

Qualitative analysis

The heart of Teresa's use of Scripture is her extended exegesis of certain passages to convey her spiritual message, which is examined in this section. She also makes reference to Scripture by brief quotations not subject to exegesis or by implied reference, which will be examined in the next section.

Teresa's exegesis in Arboleda

Psalm 44:11

The first passage of extended exegesis in *Arboleda* is based on Ps. 44:11 (this is the Vulgate numbering, based on the Greek; in the Hebrew numbering, adopted in Protestant versions, it is Psalm 45)⁴⁸:

'Listen, O daughter, consider and give ear:
Forget your people and your father's house.'

⁴⁶ She does refer to the Master of Sentences, Hutton, 96:32-6, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 75, but in terms of hearing him referred to in sermons rather than having read his writings.

⁴⁷ Pablo de Santa María owned a copy of this work which he bequeathed to Burgos cathedral, Cantera Burgos, p. 323, and wrote a major work on the *Postilla*, the *Additiones*, Serrano, pp. 109-11.

⁴⁸ This text features in *Speculum Virginum* in connection with the nun's decision to leave the world and enter the enclosure of the convent, J.M. Pinder, 'The Cloister and the Garden: Gendered Images of Religious Life from the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries', in C.J. Mews (ed.), *Listen Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages* (New York, 2001), p. 163, but that exegesis is mainly literal and very different from Teresa's.

She begins the book with a description of her sufferings and how they affected her. She particularly discusses how her enforced physical silence forced her to start listening to God's voice in the Scriptures. This is the 'abovementioned silence' with which the passage begins.

She introduces her text with the words 'I seem to hear spiritually these words resound'⁴⁹. The use of the word 'spiritually' would seem to be a deliberate indication that this was not intended to be a formal, scholastic exegesis of the text. She seems to be saying that this particular verse has been brought to her attention by the Holy Spirit, and she is seeking the meaning that God has for her in the text. She never considers this verse in context, which would be the first step in any modern exegesis. Psalm 44 is in praise of an unnamed king (traditionally Solomon), and this verse seems to be addressed to his queen at the time of her marriage to the king. In this context, there would seem to be an obvious literal/historical meaning of the verse.

Teresa begins by finding a warning in the initial words of the verse, with their repeated injunctions 'listen', 'behold' and 'incline your ear', to look for a meaning other than 'what is literally represented.' She sees this as an indication that the true interpretation of the verse is not the literal meaning of the words⁵⁰. Despite that, she feels it necessary to first consider the literal meaning⁵¹. She begins by analysing the meaning of the word 'house' (*casa*). '*Casa*' has the same dual meaning in Spanish and English, both the building, 'home', and the people, 'family'. She uses common sense

⁴⁹ Hutton, 44:10-11, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 29.

⁵⁰ Hutton, 44:14-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 30.

⁵¹ Hutton, 44:23-24, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 30.

and the context to determine that it is the latter sense which is meant here⁵². In the meaning of family, she argues that forgetting her father's 'house' would involve forgetting her father. Indeed, forgetting would be inconsistent with loving, so would, in her argument, amount to abhorring him. This, she says, cannot be the correct meaning because it conflicts with the fifth commandment, 'honour thy father and thy mother'. It is interesting to note that she does not mention the sayings of Christ which could be read as supporting this literal reading, such as Matt. 8:21-22 in which a disciple said 'Lord, first let me go and bury my father ' to which Jesus replied 'Follow me, and let the dead bury their own dead', or Matt. 10:37 'Anyone who loves his father or mother more than me is not worthy of me'. Having decided that this conflict means that the passage cannot be interpreted literally, particularly in the light of the initial words, she abandons literal interpretation for the 'spiritual' meaning (although she does not expressly state that is what she is doing)⁵³.

Teresa then proceeds to give an allegorical interpretation of the word 'people' in this verse, which she decides represent 'a mob (*turba multa*) of temporal and human lusts'. Ellis demonstrates that this is part of a sustained contrast in this work between *casa* and *calle*, between a well-ordered household and the surrounding disorder of the world⁵⁴. Just as there is a wide diversity of people in any community, Teresa says that there are many different human 'temporal and vain' desires. However, she extends the allegory from mere diversity of people/lusts to the behaviour of these people. Teresa speaks about revolt, the noise and danger of the mob⁵⁵. Her

⁵² Ellis points out that this is a divergence from traditional allegories between houses or castles and the soul, D.S. Ellis, 'Unifying Imagery in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena', *Journal of Hispanic Philology*, 17 (1992), 45-53, pp. 47-8.

⁵³ Hutton, 44:25-45:30, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 30-1.

⁵⁴ Ellis, 'Unifying Imagery,' p.44.

⁵⁵ Hutton, 45:30-46:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 31.

experiences, and that of her family, would incline her to think of a group or mob in this way. The anti-Jewish riots of 1391 discussed in chapter 2 spread to Burgos in August of that year. Her family must have been in danger, even though her grandfather had converted and been baptised by then. Her father and uncles, who were small boys at the time, would surely have had vivid memories of that turbulent period. There had been armed conflict between her father's men and those of the dean of Burgos cathedral in 1435-6 when she was almost certainly living at home, a conflict which was finally settled, after her father had killed a member of the other family in a duel, by marriage alliances between the families. She herself may have felt threatened indirectly by the anti-*converso* riots of 1449 in Toledo. Her father's house in Burgos was surrounded by mobs in 1453 when Alvaro de Luna was staying there immediately before his arrest, as described in chapter 3. Although Teresa was not living in her father's house as she was in Las Huelgas by then, she must have had detailed accounts of these events from her family. Also during her lifetime, Burgos was involved in the fighting in the civil war of 1465-8 during the reign of Enrique IV and in the war of succession following his death.

Continuing the allegory, she talks of the vices as bad inhabitants of the city, who crowd out the virtues, the good people, indeed prevent them from settling in the city in the first place⁵⁶. Again, we hear echoes of the *converso* anxiety of her time, the fear of being turned against by their Old Christian neighbours and being driven from their homes. The *converso* population in Northern Castile, like the Jewish population from which they came, were almost exclusively urban and carried on urban trades and

⁵⁶ Hutton, 46:13-19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 31.

professions⁵⁷. Losing their homes and being refused entry to other cities also would involve loss of their source of income and likely destitution. From this allegorical interpretation she draws the moral that we must allow our conscience to speak and not to allow ourselves to be taken captive by these temporal lusts and vain desires⁵⁸.

She goes on to interpret allegorically the word 'house' in 'house of my father' as human inclination, which houses the father, who is the desire and habit of sinning. The latter interpretation she justifies by the analogy between the generative role of a human father and the ability of bad desire to engender sins. She backs this up by a quotation from what seems to have been one of her favourite books of the Bible, Job⁵⁹. This interpretation leads to her moral explanation; the advice to forget these human lusts and vain cares and the human inclination to sin is 'healthy advice and a sound warning'. The desire to sin would not engender such a huge clan of sins if it were not housed in human inclination. The image she paints of these sins and evil inclinations is of the family and followers of a great noble, an indication of her familiarity with the aristocratic world⁶⁰.

Psalm 31:9

Teresa states at the outset of her discussion in *Arboleda* that this is her foundation text:

*'In camo et freno maxillas eorum constrinje qui non
approxima[n]t [a]d te'*⁶¹.

⁵⁷ T.F. Ruiz, *Crisis and Continuity: Land and Town in Late Medieval Castile* (Philadelphia PA, 1994), pp. 273-7.

⁵⁸ Hutton, 46:19-32, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 31-2.

⁵⁹ Hutton, 46:33-47:5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 32.

⁶⁰ Hutton, 47:5-16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 32.

⁶¹ Hutton, 40:4-6. It can be seen from Appendix A that the Latin of this quotation differs from the Vulgate in one word, 'approximant' instead of 'accedunt' (and the spelling change in 'constrinje').

Although she makes no express reference to the literal sense in her discussion of this passage, looked at in context the words are directly applicable to her situation as she describes it. In the earlier part of this psalm the psalmist is describing the effects of unconfessed sin and the experience of forgiveness after the sin is confessed to God. The preceding verse then appears to be God speaking; 'I will instruct you and teach you in the way you should go...'. There is a clear contrast here between freely following God's way and, in the following verse, God having to force obedience through the use of 'bit and bridle'. Teresa's thesis is that her sufferings and disability were this 'bit and bridle', necessary because she did not voluntarily follow God's teachings and guidance⁶².

She begins by describing how bits and bridles are actually used to control and guide 'dumb animals' who lack reason, in effect a literal exegesis of this verse. She then makes the allegorical comparison that for rational beings the bit is reason and the bridle temperance and discretion, because reason guides us towards what is good while temperance and discretion constrain us from following sinful desires⁶³. There follows the central thesis of her moral interpretation; experience shows that rational beings do not always use these tools properly to control their inclination to wrongdoing. Such people therefore equate to irrational animals, and need another bit and bridle⁶⁴. One such bit and bridle is a 'good and lasting ailment', because it constrains spiritually dangerous desires⁶⁵. Teresa then goes on to apply this teaching to her own experience.

⁶² Hutton, 47:25-29, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 32-3.

⁶³ Hutton, 47:30-48:6, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 33.

⁶⁴ Hutton, 48:6-34, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 33-4.

⁶⁵ Hutton, 49:9-11, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 34.

Luke 14:16-24

Her conclusion is that her suffering leads her to the 'marriage feast of the Lamb' described in Revelation. She links this to the parable of the great feast found in Lk. 14 and Matt. 22. After the invited guests send their excuses, the master sends his servants out into the streets to bring in the poor, crippled, blind and lame. When even then there was still room the servants were ordered to go out and 'compel them to come in'. The parable as told by Christ was directed towards the invited guests, because he finishes by saying that none of them will taste his banquet in the kingdom of God. In both Gospels the context of the telling of this parable is in conflict with the pharisees and other parts of the Jewish religious establishment, generally understood as the people Christ was referring to as the 'invited guests'. Teresa's interpretation shifts the emphasis to the experience of the substitute guests, with whom she identifies herself and her fellow sufferers. Teresa uses the contrast between the invitation to the original guests, 'tell them', and to the sick, 'compel them', to give a moral interpretation, namely that sickness causes those who do not willingly enter 'the magnificent supper of eternal health' to be brought there by force⁶⁶. However, they should enter gladly, and immediately abandon the streets and market places, which she treats allegorically as the places where temporal pleasures are to be found. She continues the allegory by saying that if the sufferer finds the door shut, he should not be surprised as it is bolted by his own sins. Rather, he should use the doorknocker of prayer until he gains entry. Teresa bases her analogy to prayer of a doorknocker on Gospel statements about prayer, in particular Matt. 21:22 and Lk. 9:9⁶⁷.

⁶⁶ Hutton, 54:28-55:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 39-40.

⁶⁷ Hutton, 55:30-56:8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 40.

Tobit 5:9

One of the books of the Apocrypha is known in English as the Book of Tobit, the story of a father (Tobit) and a son (Tobias). The Vulgate calls it the book of Tobias, giving that name to both father and son. Teresa repeats a short passage from this book, where the angel Raphael (in disguise) is introduced to the blind father. Upon the angel's greeting wish of joy, the father retorts that this is no longer possible because of his blindness. Teresa literally interprets this reply as showing that he was not pleased with his suffering, and draws the moral lesson that no-one, however saintly, suffers illness against his will⁶⁸. This is tied in with her treatment of the parable of the marriage feast discussed above.

2 Corinthians 12:9

Early in her discussion based on this verse, then again in the middle and at the end, Teresa quotes two Latin words '*Libenter*⁶⁹ *gloriabor*'. This is the start of the second part of the verse, which in the Vulgate reads '*libenter igitur gloriabor in infirmitatibus meis ut inhabitet in me virtus Christi*'. Her omission of the '*igitur*', which of course is redundant because she is only using the second half of the verse, is perhaps an indication of some level of understanding of Latin. As before, she does not consider the literal meaning of this verse in context. Paul does not say that his infirmity, the 'thorn in the flesh' the nature of which is not specified, was the result of sin but rather to keep him humble after a profound mystical experience (2 Cor. 12:7). Teresa gives a moral exegesis of this verse, the lesson is to rejoice in the suffering of sickness so that '...we can bring to our soul such a good guest as the virtue of Christ'⁷⁰. Teresa

⁶⁸ Hutton, 55:15-27, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 40.

⁶⁹ Hutton's suggestion. For the first use the MS has '*liberer*', Hutton, 58:26. For the second use, Hutton, 60:32-3, the MS is '*Libenter gloriabor, etç*', for the third, Hutton, 61:33-4, it is '*Libenter gloriabor etç*' in the MS.

⁷⁰ Hutton, 58:27-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42.

translates the Latin '*virtus Christi*' as '*la virtud de Cristo*'. Seidenspinner-Núñez points out⁷¹ that in medieval Spanish '*virtut(d)*' could mean both power and virtue. Reading the verse in context, the word must have the former meaning as it is contrasted with weakness. However Teresa's discussion, which repeatedly contrasts '*virtut*' with '*viçio*', seems to stress the latter meaning.

The parable of the talents

The exegesis of this parable⁷² comes in the long discussion on patience which takes up most of the second half of *Arboleda*. Parables are, of course, one of the types of Scripture not meant to be interpreted literally⁷³. However, Teresa takes only a passing interest in the possible message which Jesus intended to convey to his listeners, and instead uses the five monetary talents of the parable as the basis of an allegory. She gives a meaning relevant to sufferers for each of the talents provided to the servant by the master, and then matches them with five things that the sufferers can earn using these talents⁷⁴.

Job

Teresa introduces Job as her authority for what she is saying on patience, as her 'coarse womanly judgement' means that her writings have little or no authority⁷⁵. In choosing a character from Scripture as her witness and authority 'because there are so few learned people of this type in our time', she seems to be having a dig at the '*prudente varones*' whose criticism of her writing caused her to write *Admiración*,

⁷¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42 n. 39.

⁷² Matt. 25:14-30; Luke 19:12-27.

⁷³ de Lubac, *Medieval Exegesis 2*, p. 41. Indeed, scholastic commentators realised that none of the four senses of Scripture truly described the way parables were employed, Minnis, *Medieval Theory of Authorship*, pp. 74, 136-7.

⁷⁴ Hutton, 69:17-70:22, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 52-3

⁷⁵ Hutton, 96:7-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 74.

those who 'learned their laws' in Paris or Salamanca⁷⁶. She calls Job 'the Master of Patiences', making an express analogy to the accepted theological authority of the time, the Master of Sentences⁷⁷.

The first part of the story of Job that Teresa uses is his action in tearing his clothes and falling to the ground when he learns of his misfortunes (Job 1:20). She begins with a historical approach, commenting that this was the custom at the time to demonstrate great sorrow and supports this by reference to Jacob's actions when he is told that Joseph has been killed by wild animals and David's on learning of the death of Saul and Jonathan⁷⁸. The moral she draws is that there is nothing wrong in feeling sorrow at our hardships and sufferings because this is a harbinger that we should be open to the arrival of patience⁷⁹. Teresa then deals with a text that seems to contradict what she has just said about Job. When Job is challenged by his friends who say 'Where is your patience?' (Job 4:6) he responds '...what is my end that I should keep patience?' (Job 6:11). Teresa glosses this response as saying that Job was not pretending to a worldly patience in order to be praised by men, but rather his patience was directed to not offending God. Immediately after indicating human emotion by tearing his clothes, he fell to the ground and worshipped God, which Teresa says, 'teaches us prompt and willing humility', and that prompt humility leads to patience⁸⁰. She uses the example of Job to establish that patience is not shown by a lack of complaining about one's suffering but rather wholly consists of not

⁷⁶ Hutton, 96:27-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 75.

⁷⁷ Hutton, 96:32-97:4, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 75. Peter Lombard, the Paris master, was often referred to by this title because of his Books of Sentences, which were the standard medieval academic textbook in theology.

⁷⁸ Hutton, 97:17-31, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 75-6.

⁷⁹ Hutton, 97:31-98:5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 76.

⁸⁰ Hutton, 98:23-99:21, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 76-7.

offending God or speaking with pride⁸¹. Her next appeal to Job is in a passage demonstrating that patience, although not listed as one of the four cardinal virtues, rests on those virtues. Discussing the second virtue, fortitude, she refers again to the challenge from the three friends 'Where is your fortitude, your patience...?' (Job 4:6). From the fact that fortitude is mentioned before patience she draws the conclusion that it is one of the pillars on which patience is built⁸². She finds support for this conclusion in Job's reply 'My strength is not the strength of stones' (Job 6:12), which she reads as meaning that fortitude does not mean lack of feeling, which would not be a virtue. Fortitude is sustaining hardship and emotion without becoming impatient or offending God⁸³.

Teresa's exegesis in Admiración

Judith

Teresa's use of the story of Judith depends upon acceptance of its historical truth and a literal exegesis of the Biblical book, even though the usual medieval exegesis allegorised Judith as a prefiguration of either the Virgin Mary or the Church, and her defeat of Holofernes as the defeat of Satan⁸⁴. Judith is used as authority for Teresa's thesis that God can confer a special grace and skill where it might normally be absent. If God could confer such grace and skill on Judith to allow her to achieve something normally far beyond the capability of a woman, the slaying of the great general Holofernes, he could certainly enable a woman to achieve something easier for a woman, the use of the pen⁸⁵. Teresa is making a direct analogy between her situation

⁸¹ Hutton, 99:30-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 77.

⁸² Hutton, 104:20-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 81-2.

⁸³ Hutton, 104:28-105:4, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 82.

⁸⁴ R.E. Surtz, 'El llamado feminismo de Teresa de Cartagena', in *Studia hispanica medievalia: IV Jornadas internacionales de literatura Española medieval* (Buenos Aires, 1993), p. 203.

⁸⁵ Hutton, 119:20-120:7, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 93.

and Judith's, not using allegory or typology. Following this analogy, Teresa then seeks to forestall an argument that this grace and skill were only given to Judith because of her virtue and holiness. She uses New Testament teachings that God does not confer grace based on our individual merits but on His goodness and mercy, and then applies these back in history to the Old Testament story⁸⁶. This is really a moral interpretation as she is using it to justify her act of writing, rather a spiritual exegesis showing that these teachings were foreshadowed in the Old Testament. Teresa probably also relied on her readers' knowledge of the Biblical story to make an implied point supporting the theme of *Admiración*; when Judith brought the head of Holofernes back to her people, their immediate response was to praise God for what he had done through Judith (Judith 13:17).

The blind beggar

Teresa begins with a literal summary of the story of the blind beggar on the road to Jericho, who persistently cried for mercy to Jesus as he passed by. She then applies the story to herself through means of a sustained allegorical interpretation. She makes the physical blindness of the beggar an allegory for her spiritual blindness. The physical footsteps heard by the beggar are transformed to the spiritual inspirations God sends to our souls to prepare us for his coming. The bystanders who told the beggar to be quiet are compared to her disordered thoughts and the temporal concerns that tried to keep her quiet. She makes an analogy between Jericho and the world, so the worldly thoughts that she had were analogous to the residents of Jericho telling the beggar to keep quiet⁸⁷. She then equates her desire for spiritual light with the persistent cries of the beggar despite being told to keep quiet. This struggle pleased

⁸⁶ Hutton, 120:12-121:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 94-5.

⁸⁷ Hutton, 131:30-132:15, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103-4.

the Lord, and by grace her understanding was taken into His presence, fulfilled and led to prayer. The Lord put the same question to her that He put to the blind man, 'what do you want me to do for you?'. Realising that God's concern was for her salvation and that he would not answer her request if it would be contrary to her salvation, she resisted the temptation to ask for what she naturally wanted (not stated, but quite possibly the restoration of her hearing) and instead asked only for what would please the Saviour⁸⁸. She asked to see the Light; to see the reason for her suffering, for knowledge of God's presence, for wisdom and understanding. In this respect her spiritual response to the Saviour's question has the opposite effect to the historical request of the blind beggar, who asked for (and received) physical healing. Completing the analogy, she says that her spiritual eyes were opened and she saw and followed her Saviour⁸⁹.

Teresa's exegesis – conclusions

Teresa generally begins her exegesis with the literal sense. Indeed, as noted above (p. 147), in her exegesis of Ps. 44:11 she seems to have felt obliged to begin with a literal exegesis. An explanation of this compulsion could be that she had received an elementary training in the accepted methods of Scriptural exegesis in the fifteenth century. Particularly if she received this training through the Franciscans, she could have been exposed to the influence of Nicholas of Lyra, with his emphasis on the importance of the literal/historical meaning of the text. There is another reason to think that she may have been acquainted with the works of Nicholas of Lyra; as mentioned above, her grandfather, Pablo de Santa María, owned a set of the

⁸⁸ Hutton, 132:15-133:9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 104-5.

⁸⁹ Hutton, 133:17-37, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 105.

*Postillae*⁹⁰, and he wrote a commentary on them, the *Additiones*⁹¹. By contrast, Teresa does not use the spiritual or allegorical approach to the Old Testament so common in the Patristic writings and medieval exegesis. A likely explanation for this is that she is writing to convey a moral message rather than a theological exposition. It is also possible that her Jewish ancestry made her uncomfortable with a form of exegesis closely connected by this time with anti-Jewish polemic. As Teresa's writings are in effect written sermons, it is not surprising that most of her exposition falls into the category of moral or tropological exegesis.

Other use of Scripture

In common with other medieval authors, Teresa uses phrases and ideas taken either directly from Scripture or adapting well known sayings from the Bible. Appendices C and D, in similar format to Appendices A and B, list those examples of this practice that I have been able to identify in her two works. There is a greater bias to the New Testament than in the express quotations: eight Old Testament sources, half of these from the Psalms, seven from the Gospels (five from the synoptics and two from John), four from the Pauline epistles (three from Romans and one from 2 Corinthians), two from other epistles (James and 1 Peter) and one from Revelation. A possible reason for this different balance is that these Scriptures would be ones that she had absorbed through regular participation in the liturgy, in which the New Testament, being considerably shorter than the Old Testament, is read through more frequently during the year.

⁹⁰ Cantera Burgos, p. 323.

⁹¹ Serrano, pp. 109-10. However her exegesis of this text is not derived from the *Postillae*.

Some examples show a creative reworking of the original scripture; for example, when she says that the sufferer should thank the Lord 'who in the secure ship of arduous suffering has freed him from the dark waves of this dangerous sea'⁹² she is probably thinking of the Gospel story in which the boat containing the disciples and a sleeping Jesus ran into a sudden storm on Galilee. When the terrified disciples woke Jesus, he stilled the waves. Teresa sees suffering as a boat, in which the saving presence of Christ stills the dangerous sea of sin. Another Scriptural quotation of interest is that used at the outset of *Arboleda* in naming her island '*Oprobrium hominum et abiectio plebis*' (the scorn of mankind and outcast of the people). This is taken from Psalm 21 (Psalm 22 in Protestant Bibles) which in the Vulgate begins '*Deus Deus meus quare dereliquisti me longe a salute mea verba rugitus mei*' and is regarded as a prophecy of the sufferings of Christ; indeed, the Gospels of Mark and Matthew (Mk. 15:34; Matt. 27:46) record Jesus as crying out these words shortly before he died⁹³. Her quotation is the second half of verse 7; the first half of that verse is 'But I am a worm and not a man;'. This was the basis for the care Francis of Assisi took to protect worms⁹⁴, so this verse may have become familiar to her through her Franciscan formation.

⁹² Seidenspinner-Núñez, p. 71.

⁹³ The question of whether use of this verse was identified with *imitatio Christi* by Teresa is discussed in chapter 8.

⁹⁴ This story appears in the First Life by Thomas of Celano, *Francis of Assisi: early documents*, trans. and eds. R.J. Armstrong, J.A.W. Hellmann, and W.J. Short, (3 vols., Hyde Park, NY, London, 1999), i, 250.

CHAPTER 7

OTHER SOURCES

Use of sources

Medieval authors, teachers and preachers always sought to give authority to a statement or argument by basing it on a Scriptural text or an unquestioned authority such as a patristic text¹. Sources used would also indicate common background knowledge or assumptions of the writer or speaker with the readers or listeners. The usual types of source were the Bible, classical and patristic authors, scientific and general knowledge and proverbs and popular sayings². Most of these were also used by Teresa. Biblical sources are dealt with in chapter 6. There are no quotations from classical pagan authors, although she might be expected to have some knowledge of them as her uncle, Alonso de Cartagena, translated Seneca and Cicero into Castilian³.

Patristic and religious sources

Teresa often gives a quotation from one of the Latin Church Fathers as authority for a statement. Appendices E and F are tables of these quotations for each of her works, giving Teresa's Spanish, and the original Latin and the location of the quotation (where known), also the page references in both the printed edition and the English translation. Analysing these tables shows that Teresa most frequently quotes from Augustine (7 references), followed by Gregory the Great (4 references), Jerome (2 authentic references plus one attributed in her time to Jerome but now regarded as

¹ J. Huizinga, *The Waning of the Middle Ages* (London, 1924), p. 208.

² H. Goldberg, *Jardín de Nobles Donzellas, Fray Martin de Córdoba: A Critical Edition and Study* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1974), p. 71.

³ Serrano, pp. 246-7.

non-authentic) and one from Ambrose⁴. She also quotes once from Boethius and once from Bernard of Clairvaux, and she also quotes from the Missal.

Augustine

Teresa quotes from only a few of Augustine's numerous works. There are three quotations from his lectures on St John's Gospel, three from two of his sermons and one which could be from either his letters or *De agone Christiano*.

The first quotation from Augustine in *Arboleda* is from Sermon CCLXXXV, given in celebration of the feast day of two martyrs, Castus and Aemilius⁵. Teresa in Spanish accurately quotes Augustine's Latin, but none of the rest of the sermon seems to have any relationship to Teresa's thesis that there are bad as well as good hardships. In *Admiración* she quotes twice from Augustine's sermon CXXX, which is on the account in John's Gospel of the miracle of the loaves and fishes⁶. She correctly identifies her source, and she accurately paraphrases the opening of this sermon. However, the sermon goes on to give an allegorical interpretation of the five loaves and the two fishes and a moral interpretation of the miracle, neither of which are used by Teresa. The second quotation in *Arboleda* attributed by Teresa to Augustine is in connection her exposition of the 'third talent', physical mortification. After using a quotation from Jerome to show that vain thoughts and temptations can be vanquished by tying them to the stone 'which the builders rejected', she says that of 'this the most saintly doctor Augustine says, "Whoever is bitten by Satan's cunning should

⁴ These were main sources of patristic authority for medieval theologians, J.W. Baldwin, *The Scholastic Culture of the Middle Ages, 1000-1300* (Lexington, 1971), p. 82.

⁵ *In die Natali martyrum Casti et Aemili*, PL 38:1293.

⁶ *De verbis Evangelii Joannis, ubi narratur miraculum de quinque panibus et duobus piscibus*, PL 38:725.

contemplate Christ on the cross."⁷ This seems to be a reference to John 3:14. Augustine's discussion of this verse in his lectures on John's Gospel does not use this exact language, but says that those who look in faith on Christ's death are healed from the bites of sin⁸, which has a similar meaning. Teresa also quotes from the same work in *Admiración* in connection with her treatment of the story of the healing of the blind beggar. When deciding how to respond to Christ asking her what she wants him to do, she says that she recalls what Augustine said about 'this verse in the gospel', quoting in Latin the first part of John 16:23. Her quotation of Augustine's comment, '*...non peti in nomine Salvatoris quidquid petitur contra rationem salutis*',⁹ is not exact ('*Onde dize que no pide [e]n nonbre del Saluador aquel que pide alguna cosa contra la razón de su espiritual salud*')¹⁰ but has the same meaning. The remaining quotation is in *Arboleda*, where she says that 'the saintly master Augustine the Bishop says "Tribulations work patience."¹¹ This is a direct quotation from Paul's Epistle to the Romans (Rom. 5:3). It is strange that Teresa quotes Augustine rather than directly quoting Paul, as she quotes from the same chapter of Romans in *Admiración*¹², prefacing the quotation by 'the Apostle says'. The omission of any mention of Paul here might indicate that her quotation is taken from Augustine's letters (the phrase '*tribulatio patientiam operatur*' occurs in Letters XCIX¹³ and CXLV¹⁴ without any attribution), rather than from *De agone Christiano* where Augustine expressly attributes this saying to the Apostle¹⁵.

⁷ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 67.

⁸ '*sic qui intuentur fide mortem Christi, sanantur a morsibus peccatorum*', Augustine, *In Evangelium Joannis Tractatus, Tractate XII*, PL 35:1490.

⁹ Augustine, *In Evangelium Joannis Tractatus, Tractate CII*, PL 35:1896.

¹⁰ Hutton, 133:5-7, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 104-5.

¹¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 81. The Latin is '*tribulatio patientiam operatur*'.

¹² Hutton, 124:5-6, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 96.

¹³ PL 33:365.

¹⁴ PL 33:595.

¹⁵ PL 40:295.

There are some perhaps surprising omissions from Teresa's use of Augustine. She makes no reference to his most popular work, the *Confessions*, although *Arboleda* belongs to the same genus of works, the history of salvation of an individual. There is also no apparent use of Augustine's lesser-known work on patience, despite the importance Teresa gives to this virtue.

Gregory the Great

All Teresa's express quotations from Gregory are taken from his homilies on the Gospels¹⁶. However, the only quotation which directly relates to what she is discussing is that relating to the parable of the talents¹⁷. Both Gregory and Teresa give an allegorical interpretation to this parable, but they are completely different. The only homily from which Teresa twice quotes is on the parable of the sower (Luke 8:4-15)¹⁸, but she makes no reference to that parable in either work. Thus it seems that she was using these quotations in the scholastic manner to give authority to what she says, rather than her writing being a gloss on the homilies. This is relevant to the charge, mentioned and indignantly refuted in *Admiración*, that the contents of *Arboleda* were copied or translated from other works¹⁹. Other of Gregory's homilies, not expressly quoted by Teresa, relate to New Testament passages which she uses. As she clearly was familiar with these homilies, some of them show some similarities with her treatment of the same passage and could have influenced her. For example, there are some similarities between the homily of Gregory on the parable of the wedding feast (Luke 14:16-24)²⁰ and Teresa's exegesis. Gregory equates the meal to the sweetness of God's goodness, Teresa refers to the table of divine generosity. In

¹⁶ In this section the translation used is Gregory, *Forty Gospel Homilies*, trans. D. Hurst (Kalamazoo MI, 1990) (Hurst).

¹⁷ Hutton, 89:6-11, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 69, *Homilia IX*, PL 76:1107.

¹⁸ Hutton, 73:24-6, 136:7-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez 56, 107, *Homilia XV*, PL 76:1131.

¹⁹ Hutton, 131:17-21, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103.

²⁰ *Homilia XXXVI*, PL 76:1265.

relation to the fact that the servants are told to compel, rather than invite, Gregory says that this relates to those who understand what they should do but fail to do it; they will be thwarted in their material desires by adversity, 'including illnesses', which turns them to God. He also says that God uses adversity to prevent us from sinning²¹. Both these themes are found in Teresa's discussion of the parable²². There are also similarities between Teresa's treatment of the story of the blind beggar of Jericho (Luke 18:31-43) and Gregory's²³, although Gregory sees the blind man as representing the humanity, while Teresa equates him to herself. For both, blindness represents spiritual darkness and those who realise they are in this darkness must cry out to the Lord, while the crowd that tries to silence the beggar are bodily desires and vices²⁴.

A surprising omission from Teresa's express quotations from Gregory the Great is the best known source of exegetical teaching on Job in her time, the *Moralia*, which was widely known as evidenced by the large number of existing manuscripts²⁵. Parts of this were translated into Castilian in the fourteenth century by Pero López de Ayala²⁶. There are some similarities between Teresa's exegesis and that of Gregory, particularly his historical interpretations of the passages she deals with. In commenting on Job 1:20 Gregory praises Job for walking the middle path, sensing the pain so that he accepted the correcting lash but not feeling it so strongly that he raged

²¹ Hurst, pp. 320-1.

²² Hutton, 54:28-58:3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 39-42.

²³ Hutton, 131:30-133:37, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103-5, *Homilia II*, PL 76:1081.

²⁴ Hurst, p. 96.

²⁵ Adriaen in the introduction to Gregory the Great, *Moralia in Job*, CCSL 143 (Turnhout, 1979) lists 57 complete manuscripts and over 500 partial copies, pp. vii-xxix.

²⁶ López de Ayala was a leading statesman, poet and chronicler, J.F. O'Callaghan, *A History of Medieval Spain* (Ithaca NY, London, 1975) pp. 645-6. He and Pablo de Santa Maria knew each other as they both served Enrique III, including both being part of an embassy from Castile to the court of Benedict XIII in Avignon, Serrano, pp. 31-2.

against God²⁷. According to Gregory, Job's worship of God showed he remained humble, a comment also made by Teresa²⁸. However, Gregory gives this praise in terms of Job's adherence to true philosophy²⁹, rather than as an exemplar of patience, which is Teresa's theme. In Book V Gregory does talk about patience in connection with his discussion of Job 4:6³⁰. He says that, while fortitude is only shown in adversity, patience is called for in the wake of fortitude (*'et mox post fortitudinem patientia subrogatur'*) which is similar to Teresa's connection between fortitude and patience. Gregory goes on to say that patience begets perfection (*'Quia uero perfectio de patientia nascitur'*), and this is the main theme of Teresa's discussion of patience. The first mention of the purpose of patience, which comes in the section in which her suffering is compared to paternal chastisement, is the blessing of salvation³¹. The final mention, in the last sentence of *Arboleda*, speaks of patience climbing a stairway leading directly to the theological virtues which lead straight to 'the Lord of the virtues'³². Gregory's discussion of Job's reply (Job 6:11) is in Book VII³³. His commentary contrasts the fortitude of the righteous with that of the reprobate. The righteous subdues his flesh in order to gain eternal rewards, the reprobate holds onto temporal things regardless of any suffering they cause. This is somewhat different from Teresa's exegesis, which interprets what Job said as being concerned not to offend God rather than gaining human praise³⁴. Of the following verse 'My strength is not the strength of stones, nor is my flesh of brass', Gregory makes a detailed analogy between the different sounds made by stone and brass when struck and the

²⁷ Gregory the Great, *Moralia in Job*, CCSL 143, p. 77.

²⁸ Hutton, 99:14-19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 77.

²⁹ Perhaps influenced by Boethius.

³⁰ Gregory the Great, *Moralia* pp. 240-1.

³¹ Hutton, 53:17-54:2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 38.

³² Hutton, 108:32-109:1, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 85.

³³ Gregory the Great, *Moralia* pp. 350-2.

³⁴ Hutton, 99:3-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 77.

effect of suffering on those hardened to religion (stones) and those who respond with a temporary religiosity which fades when the suffering ceases (brass). By this statement, according to Gregory, Job is declaring that he is neither, but rather that he is strong because he is in a state of salvation. Teresa's interpretation is different; she understands Job to be saying that his fortitude should never become the result of being unfeeling (like a stone)³⁵.

While it seems probable that Teresa had some familiarity with *Moralia in Job*, she has clearly not just copied Gregory's exegesis but has her own interpretation of the cited verses which fits with her overall theme. As there is no close correspondence between Gregory's words and Teresa's, it is difficult to say whether that familiarity came through Ayala's *De flores* or directly from the Latin. However, of the passage in Book V which shows the closest resemblance to Teresa's treatment, *De flores* contains only the sentence about patience giving birth to perfection³⁶. Gregory's contrast between the strengths of the righteous and the reprobate in his comment on Job 6:11 is translated by Ayala³⁷, but his comments on Job following the balance of true philosophy in connection with Job 1:20 is not found in *De flores*. This is an indication that Teresa's source was probably the original work rather than Ayala's collection.

Jerome

The two authentic Jerome quotations are both taken from his epistles. These were perhaps his most popular and widely read works in Teresa's time. The first quotation

³⁵ Hutton, 104:30-35, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 82.

³⁶ 'Por quanto la perfección nasce de la paçiençia...' P. López de Ayala, *Las flores de los 'Morales de Job'*, ed. F. Branciforti (Firenze, 1963) p. 58.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 76.

is taken from Epistle CLXVII. This is addressed to Sabanius, a deacon. Jerome accuses Sabanius of adultery and, even worse, of attempting to seduce a nun and begs him to repent³⁸. It is possible that this epistle would be read by or to nuns to warn them of the dangers of having private dealings with men, even clergy. However, there is nothing in the content of this epistle other than the quotation which seems to have had an effect on the contents of Teresa's writings. The second quotation is from one of the most popular of Jerome's epistles, Epistle XXII to Estochium, which deals at length with the life of vowed virginity³⁹. Teresa does not quote entirely accurately; she talks of these thoughts being 'tied (*atarará*)' to a stone⁴⁰, whereas Jerome mirrors the more violent language of Psalm 137:9, saying that the thoughts are 'dashed against (*allidit ad*)' the stone⁴¹. Also, although both writers relate this stone to Christ, Teresa uses a different scripture to do so. She refers to the stone which the builders rejected (Psalm 117:22), while Jerome refers to 1 Cor. 10:4 which is talking about the Israelites in the wilderness; '...they drank from the spiritual rock that accompanied them, and that rock was Christ' (NIV). However, Jerome begins with the same quotation from Psalm 44, verse 11, that Teresa uses near the beginning of *Arboleda*. Teresa's interpretation of the command to 'forget your father' as meaning to forsake the human inclination to sin, discussed in chapter 6, is very similar to Jerome's. He says:

'Truly a marvellous thing, a father charges his daughter not to remember her father. "Ye are of your father the devil, and the lusts of your father it is your will to do."' (Jn. 8:44)⁴²

³⁸ Jerome, 'Letters and Selected Works', in Schaff, P. and Wace, H., (eds.), *A select library of Nicene and post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church : second series, Vol 6* (Edinburgh, Grand Rapids, MI, 1988), pp. 289-95. Teresa's quotation is on p. 291.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 22-41.

⁴⁰ Hutton, 86:24-6, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 66.

⁴¹ Jerome, 'Letters', p. 24.

⁴² *Ibid.*, pp. 22.

It seems likely that Teresa had read these works of Jerome, although she does not slavishly copy his ideas.

Ambrose

The single quotation attributed to Ambrose comes from his work on Luke's Gospel⁴³. Teresa correctly attributes this to his exposition of the story in Luke 1:62-4 of the restoration of speech to Zacharias after the birth of John the Baptist. There is nothing in her exposition of either of the passages in Luke that she deals with in detail, the wedding banquet (Lk. 14:15-24) and the blind beggar (Lk. 18:35-42), which could have been derived from this same work of Ambrose. In his exposition of Luke 14 he regards those who are compelled to attend as sinners who have been cured of the disease of sin by the mercy of God⁴⁴, and in Luke 18 he omits the story of the blind beggar and goes straight onto that of Zaccheus (Lk. 19:1-10).

Boethius

The quotation used by Teresa comes from a section of the *Consolations of Philosophy* in which Boethius is discussing with Lady Philosophy the fate and unhappiness of the wicked and how the wise should pity rather than hate them. Her use is consistent with this context. However, overall there is a difference in approach to suffering between the two works. Boethius seeks to overcome his suffering at the hands of an unjust ruler by remembering the wisdom of philosophy that he had learned in the past. Teresa welcomes her suffering as sent by God to turn her from the worldly distractions she had learned in the past.

⁴³ Ambrose, *Expositio Evangelii Secundum Lucam Libris X Comprehensa*, PL 15:1526-1850, (Paris, 1879).

⁴⁴ PL 15:1753-5.

The *Consolations* had an important influence on thought in the Middle Ages. This is shown by the very large number of manuscripts of the work and its use in education throughout the period⁴⁵. The work was translated into many languages, and was translated into Catalan and Castilian in the fourteenth century⁴⁶. It influenced many authors, in particular in the genre of works described as *consolatio*⁴⁷. One example of a late medieval *consolatio* is the *Libro de consolaciones de la vida humana* of Pedro de Luna, Pope Benedict XIII⁴⁸. Hutton demonstrates a number of parallels between this and Teresa's work⁴⁹. Given the close relationship between Pedro de Luna and her grandfather (discussed in chapter 3), it would be surprising if she was not familiar with this work. However, there are no passages of close similarity between Teresa and the *Consolations*.

Bernard of Clairvaux

Teresa attributes a single quotation to Bernard, founder of the Cistercian order. This is from the work *Liber de modo bene vivendi*, which modern scholars do not believe to be by Bernard, but which was clearly influenced by his writings, particularly his sermons on the Song of Songs⁵⁰. Her quotation is taken from the section headed *De infirmitate*⁵¹. The theme of this section is very similar to the approach of *Arboleda*: the author says that the health of the body is bad if it leads to sickness of the soul and

⁴⁵ H.R. Patch, *The Tradition of Boethius: A Study of his Importance in Medieval Culture* (New York, 1935), pp. 20-2.

⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 65. As mentioned in [Chapter 3 n.], Teresa's uncle had a copy in Latin and Castilian which was borrowed by her sister.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 92.

⁴⁸ J.B. Simó Castillo, 'Estudio preliminar: el autor y la obra', in *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana* (Vinaròs, Castellón, 1998), p. 46.

⁴⁹ Hutton, pp. 17-23.

⁵⁰ A. McGovern-Mouron, 'Listen to me, daughter, listen to faithful counsel': The *Liber de modo bene vivendi ad sororem*', in D. Renevey and C. Whitehead (eds.), *Writing Religious Women* (Cardiff, 2000), pp. 82-3.

⁵¹ *Liber de modo bene ad sororem*, PL 184:1264.

vice versa⁵². He says that God always afflicts those he has preordained to everlasting happiness⁵³, and that this is fatherly chastisement, intended for your good if you accept them and turn to God⁵⁴. He also says that you are punished in the same bodily aspect in which you sinned⁵⁵, which corresponds to Teresa's belief that she became deaf because of her sin of addiction to worldly conversations. Other sections of the same work find echoes in Teresa. In the section *De tristitia*⁵⁶ the sisters are exhorted to cast aside melancholy, not to be addicted to too much sadness, although they should be sorrowful for their sins. In *De silentio*⁵⁷ the author counsels against idle talk, urging the sisters to 'put a cloister of silence on your tongue'⁵⁸. The reading of good books is recommended in *De lectione*⁵⁹.

Liturgical sources

Teresa expressly quotes from the liturgy three times, in each case identifying the source by saying that the Church says (or sings), although in only one case is the exact source identified (the first Introit for Lent)⁶⁰. She also uses language taken from liturgical sources; for example, she twice refers to the exiled children of Eve in this vale of tears⁶¹, which is from the Salve Regina: '*Ad te clamamus, exules, filii Evae...in hac lacrimarum valle...*' Her exclamation, 'Oh, eternal Light and Sun of justice, Key of David and Sceptre of the House of Israel'⁶², is based on two of the titles of God from the refrains used with the Magnificat in the eight days before

⁵² Bernard, *A Rule of Good Life*, trans. A. Batt (Menston, 1971) (Batt), p. 282.

⁵³ Batt, p. 283.

⁵⁴ Batt, p. 285.

⁵⁵ Batt, p. 288.

⁵⁶ PL 184:1219-20.

⁵⁷ PL 184:1254-5.

⁵⁸ Batt, p. 237.

⁵⁹ PL 184:1272.

⁶⁰ Hutton, 66:30-2, 91:35-92:1, 121:2-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 50, 71, 94.

⁶¹ '*los desterrados hijos de Eva en este valle de lágrimas*', Hutton, 122:15-16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 95, 111. Her repeat of this phrase differs slightly: '*...valle de miseria y de lágrimas*', Hutton 140:15.

⁶² Hutton, 136:35-137:1, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 108.

Christmas. She speaks of the need to make amends before 'that day of great ire and bitterness'⁶³, which is how the Last Judgement is described in the poem *Dies irae* from the requiem mass.

Science and general knowledge

Teresa's discussion of the structure of plants and trees, with a correct understanding of the respective roles of the outer bark or cortex and the inner core or medulla, shows an accurate knowledge of botanical science. These roles were well known by Teresa's time, as is shown by detailed discussions of the cortex and medulla throughout the thirteenth century work on botany of Albert the Great⁶⁴. However, her knowledge of the behaviour of animals is less accurate. Unsurprisingly, she is familiar with how horses are controlled with bit and bridle, but her knowledge of the dromedary must have been derived from bestiaries, which traditionally describe the beast as being swift and capable of covering long distances⁶⁵. The effects of drought on agriculture, killing the crops and encouraging thorns and weeds⁶⁶, would surely have been well known to anyone in Spain with its arid central plains.

When Teresa compares her sufferings to the journey to Rome⁶⁷, she would evoke in her readers ideas about pilgrimage in general, and specifically about pilgrimage to Rome. Pilgrimage was connected in the medieval mind with the idea that life itself was a journey, a journey with the goal of salvation. Pilgrims should undertake the journey in a penitential manner, and this meant that they should expect to suffer in the

⁶³ Hutton, 92:4-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 71.

⁶⁴ Albertus *De vegetabilibus*, eds. K.F.W. Jessen, and E.H.F. Meyer (Berolini, 1867).

⁶⁵ For example, in a thirteenth century bestiary the dromedary was stated to cover a hundred or more miles in a day, R.W. Barber, *Bestiary: An English Version of the Bodleian Library, Oxford M.S. Bodley 764* (Woodbridge, 1993), p. 101.

⁶⁶ Hutton, 94:13-15, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 73.

⁶⁷ Hutton, 72:20-3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 55.

course of their pilgrimage⁶⁸. Although pilgrims from Spain did not have to endure the perilous crossing of the Alps which was the lot of those from most of the rest of Europe as they could reach Italy by going around the Mediterranean coast⁶⁹, the journey was still lengthy and risked danger from robbers⁷⁰.

As might be expected, she shows familiarity with contemporary medical treatments. She talks about the 'great torments' that were endured in order to gain physical healing; bitter medicine, burning instruments, the surgeon's knife, even amputation (truly torments in the ages before effective anaesthesia). She also mentions the dangers of medical treatment, saying that however much the doctor knows, he may cure one complaint at the same time causing another⁷¹, and refers to the expense of medical treatment⁷². She also refers to the theory that physical illness was caused by an imbalance of the four humours which held sway in medieval medicine⁷³.

One area of general knowledge and common assumptions that she relies on is that of religious beliefs and practices. Her readers would understand, when she refers to her 'cloister', that this involved separation from the world. Naming patience as abbess of this convent would convey both the primacy and authority of that virtue. She refers to holy water as cleansing and causing the devil to flee. In the same passage she equates worldly dignities and honours to idols, which she states were entered by demons in

⁶⁸ D.J. Birch, *Pilgrimage to Rome in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge, 1998), pp. 2-4.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 48, 55-6.

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 50-2.

⁷¹ Hutton, 75:10-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 57-8.

⁷² Hutton, 79:10-11, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 60-1.

⁷³ This was based on the teachings of Galen, which were used in the teaching of medicine at Salamanca in Teresa's time, L. Garcíá Ballester, 'Galenism and Medical Teaching at the University of Salamanca in the Fifteenth Century' in Philip Banks (trans.) *Galen and Galenism: Theory and Medical Practice from Antiquity to the European Renaissance* (Aldershot, 2002), ch. X.

order to deceive people. She adds the surprising comment that devil had sometimes entered prelates or pontiffs, leading them and their people to a bad end⁷⁴.

Teresa also expects her readers to have knowledge of social manners and customs, particularly those of the upper classes. She talks about the meaning of '*casa*' as being the household, both relatives and servants. In comparing the physical mortification of suffering to a seal which impresses on the body and face of the sufferer affliction's coat of arms⁷⁵ she combines the sealing of an important document, which often in medieval times related to property, and the custom of a noble's retainers wearing a badge of their master's coat of arms so that they are recognisable as his servants. Processions, both religious and on state occasions, were arranged by importance of the participants, with the least important coming first and the most important last⁷⁶. A distinguished visitor would not arrive unannounced but would send a messenger ahead so that the host would be ready for the visitor when he arrived⁷⁷. Kings grant benefits and privileges to their servants and those in their favour, whereas nothing is given to those out of favour or who are disobedient⁷⁸.

Proverbs and sayings

Proverbs and popular saying were widely used in the late Middle Ages, in literature of all kinds, speeches and sermons⁷⁹. Teresa uses several of these in a way that shows she assumes they are known to her readers. For example, in explaining how her suffering came at a opportune time in her life she says that it was more opportune

⁷⁴ Hutton, 78:2-19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 60.

⁷⁵ Hutton, 82:34-83:12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 63-4.

⁷⁶ Hutton, 64:4-8, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 47-8.

⁷⁷ Hutton, 97:36-98:2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 76.

⁷⁸ Hutton, 120:26-30, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 94.

⁷⁹ Huizinga, *Waning*, pp. 209-11.

'than that of Escalona'⁸⁰. This is a reference to an apparently well known proverb of the time '*Socorra de Escalona, cuando llega la agua, la villa está quemada*.'⁸¹ (the rescue of Escalona, by the time the water came the village was burned). Teresa's reference to the 'gadding woman' may well have reminded her readers of the proverb '*La muger y la gallina, por andar se pierden ayna*'⁸². An example of use of a popular saying is how Teresa stressed the importance to the sick of taking spiritual matters seriously because their life expectation is short by saying they are already '*tener el pie en el estribo*' (putting the foot in the stirrup)⁸³. This is an image of imminent departure⁸⁴.

⁸⁰ Hutton, 51:34, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 36.

⁸¹ G. Correas et al., *Vocabulario de refranes y frases proverbiales (1627)* (Madrid, 2000), p.463; he explains this was because the village was high up, a long way uphill from the river.

⁸² E.S. O'Kane, *Refranes y frases proverbiales españolas de la Edad Media* (Madrid, 1959), p. 51.

⁸³ Hutton, 49:32-3. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 34 translates this as 'to have one foot in the grave', which gives the colloquial English equivalent.

⁸⁴ S. de Covarrubias, *Tesoro de la lengua castellana o española* (Barcelona, 1943), p. 570.

CHAPTER 8

DEAFNESS

Introduction

The very first thing we learn about Teresa de Cartagena, in the first sentence of the scribal introduction to *Arboleda*, is that she suffered from serious illnesses and had completely lost her hearing. Indeed, this is one of the few facts that we have about Teresa's life. The first part of *Arboleda* describes how profoundly the loss of hearing affected her life.

Modern disability studies differentiate between the terms 'disability' and 'impairment'. Impairment is the physical fact, disability is the social construct put on an impairment. Whether or not an impairment is seen as a disability depends on the view of the impaired individual's culture and society¹. While this distinction was not made in the Middle Ages, indeed there was no clear umbrella term such as 'disability'², Metzler argues that this approach is useful in examining medieval ideas about physical impairment³. Where appropriate, that approach will be adopted here.

Teresa's deafness

As discussed in chapter 3, the evidence strongly indicates that the loss of hearing was the result of illness in her late twenties. It is much less clear if this was a sudden loss,

¹ I. Metzler, *Disability in Medieval Europe: Thinking about Physical Impairment in the High Middle Ages, c.1100-1400* (London and New York, 2006), pp. 20-1.

² *Ibid.*, pp. 5-6.

³ *Ibid.*, p. 1.

or whether she experienced gradual hearing loss. Her reference to her harmful struggle against the silencing imposed by force could be read either way; either she became deaf slowly and struggled to overcome this, or she became deaf suddenly but struggled to go on conversing with people. According to a list of etiologies and causes of deafness published on the Internet by Gallaudet University,⁴ the American university for the deaf, there are several possible causes which would fit, but the most likely cause for sudden hearing loss would be as the result of inflammation caused by an illness characterised by high fever, such as typhoid or scarlet fever. Meningitis is another possibility. If the loss was more gradual, a possible cause is otosclerosis which is the most common cause of deafness in Jewish adults and causes hearing loss over months or a few years⁵.

There is a question as to how far Teresa's physical impairment, deafness, would have been considered a disability in her community. It seems likely that by the time she became deaf she was a member of an enclosed Cistercian convent, which raises the issue of how far, if at all, she would have been prevented from playing a normal role in that community. She would still have been able to take part in all the daily offices, as those losing their hearing in adulthood do not lose the ability to speak, although she may have had a problem with the correct pitch in singing. The daily chapter meeting would cause her problems: becoming deaf as an adult, she probably did not become proficient in lip-reading and in any event the chapter house in Las Huelgas is so large she would have had difficulty seeing the speaker's lip movements most of the time⁶.

⁴[http://library.gallaudet.edu/Library/Deaf_Research_Help/Frequently_Asked_Questions_\(FAQs\)/Cultural_Social_Medical/Etiologies_and_Causes_of_Deafness.html](http://library.gallaudet.edu/Library/Deaf_Research_Help/Frequently_Asked_Questions_(FAQs)/Cultural_Social_Medical/Etiologies_and_Causes_of_Deafness.html).

⁵ M. Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena. La obra de una mujer castellana del siglo XV' (Universidad de País Vasco, Ph.D. thesis, 2008), p. 149.

⁶ Personal observation.

For most of the rest of the day, the Cistercian rule required silence⁷; indeed, in the foundational writings of the Cistercian order, silence is regarded as a positive good leading to spiritual growth of the monk. Reasons given include self-discipline, avoidance of temptation, withdrawal from worldly concerns and allowing God's voice to be heard⁸.

Cistercians, following the Cluniac order from which they sprang, used an established system of signs to communicate, although to discourage idle 'chatter' this was not a fully operational language⁹. Teresa's expressed loneliness raises the question whether this form of signed communication was in use in Las Huelgas in her day, but even if it was it is possible that the limited scope of this form of communication did not allow her to express herself¹⁰. Interestingly, when referring to her annoyance with people who suggest that she goes to see people and talk to them even if she can't hear, she says that these people 'beg me and say' and that this was 'said in good friendship'¹¹ (emphasis supplied) which seems to indicate these communications were not written but instead 'spoken' in some way.

Teresa is certain that, although she is capable of speech, God has commanded her to remain silent. It seems that this happened in two stages: at first, although her deafness made it difficult, she struggled to continue having conversations but then, due to some

⁷ Although it is possible that by the late Middle Ages this rule was not strictly followed in an aristocratic convent like Las Huelgas. The Catholic monarchs sought to reform this convent beginning in 1486, but the evidence is that this reform was strongly resisted and progressed slowly, E.A. Lehfeldt, *Religious Women in Golden Age Spain* (Aldershot, 2005), pp. 143-4.

⁸ C.W. Bynum, *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley, 1982), pp. 72-4.

⁹ S.G. Bruce, *Silence and Sign Language in Medieval Monasticism: the Cluniac Tradition c. 900-1200* (Cambridge, 2007), pp. 161-5.

¹⁰ It is of interest that the first attempts to educate congenitally deaf children using hand signs for letters were made in the sixteenth century by a Spanish Benedictine, Pedro Ponce de León, *ibid.*, pp. 173-6.

¹¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 27; '...me ruegen y *dizen*...se me *dize* con buena amistad...' Hutton 41:32-4.

further unspecified suffering, she realised that God wanted her to remain completely silent. The first reason she gives for this command, which seems have come during the first stage, is based on the purposes for which humans speak; besides praising God and preaching, for which there is no need to hear what others say, the other purposes relate to forms of human communication which require dialogue. Before printed texts became widely used, books were generally read aloud and learning was oral¹², so in Teresa's time 'the whole sense of language was profoundly a sense of speech'¹³, which of course requires a sense of hearing. With regard to the second stage of complete silence, she gives the monastic reasons of separation from worldly concerns and ability to hear God's voice¹⁴. Without doubting the honesty of these expressed reasons for her silence, there is another possible reason. As it is likely (as discussed in chapter 3) that Teresa here is talking about the period from about 1450, she was surely aware of the increasing danger to *conversos* from accusations of heresy and judaising in this period when pressure for an Inquisition specifically to deal with judaising *conversos* was growing. Given her known *conversa* status, and the prominence of her family in Burgos¹⁵, for her to speak when she did not know what the other person was saying could have been dangerous. As we have seen in chapter 3, her family seem to have been politically adept in avoiding trouble in times of turmoil (and there is no known record of any of them later getting into trouble with the Inquisition), so Teresa too could well have been aware of the need to avoid potential political danger.

¹² S. Gilman, *The Spain of Fernando de Rojas: the Intellectual and Social Landscape of La Celestina* (Princeton, 1972), pp. 311-3.

¹³ *Ibid.*, p. 318.

¹⁴ Hutton, 41:13-42:19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 27-8.

¹⁵ When the Inquisition started in Ciudad Real (1483) it 'made sure that the first to stand trial before it would be drawn from among the outstanding public and social personalities of the Converso population.' H. Beinhart, *Conversos on Trial: The Inquisition in Ciudad Real*, trans. Y. Guiladi (Jerusalem, 1981), p. 203.

Medieval approaches to bodily suffering

Medieval approaches to illness and disability were closely tied to theological views of the physical body and the origin and purpose of bodily suffering. Attitudes towards suffering, in particular physical pain, changed over the Middle Ages. In the earlier part of the period impassivity in the face of pain was a mark of nobility, an attitude carried over from the late classical period, and a characteristic of martyrs. It followed that Christ also had to be portrayed as impassive¹⁶. However, the change in emphasis in the later Middle Ages to Christ as the suffering Saviour, discussed below (pp. 187-8), brought about a changed attitude to suffering in which physical expression of pain was regarded as *imitatio Christi*¹⁷. Solomon lists six beliefs about the cause of bodily suffering prevalent in late medieval Spain of which four causes are theological and two are based on medieval scientific theories¹⁸.

The Christian approach to illness and other suffering is part of the wider theological issue of theodicy; the problem of reconciling the concept of a good, loving, omniscient creator God with the presence of evil in creation. Religions such as Hinduism deal with the issue by the fatalistic law of *karman*, in which both gods and humans are powerless in the face of fate, while others (eg Zoroastrianism) and some 'heretical' variants of Christianity (eg Manichaeism) deal with the problem by positing two sources of creation with equivalent powers, one good (God) and one evil

¹⁶ E. Cohen, 'Towards a History of European Physical Sensibility: Pain in the Later Middle Ages', *Science in Context*, 8 no. 1 (1995), 47-74, pp. 53-4, 58.

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 58-9. Cohen calls this 'philopassianism'.

¹⁸ These are (1) disease is a normal condition of mortal existence as a result of the Fall; (2) disease is a punishment for, or the result of, sin; (3) through disease God tests, strengthens and corrects human beings; (4) disease is demonic; (5) disease is imbalance caused by excess or deficiency; (6) disease is related to cosmological and political disorder, M. Solomon, *The Literature of Misogyny in Medieval Spain: the Arcipreste de Talavera and the Spill* (Cambridge, 1997), pp. 41-4.

(the Devil), in conflict with each other¹⁹. This solution is not open to orthodox Christian theology, with its dominant premise of one omnipotent creator God (nor, indeed, to Judaism or Islam for the same reason). However, Christianity has often been expressed in dualistic terms, with the physical being regarded as intrinsically bad.

Theological sources

The primary source for medieval theologians was the Bible, albeit with the text filtered through medieval methods of exegesis as described in chapter 6. Almost as important were the writings of the Fathers, at least the Latin fathers of the Western Church.

Old Testament

There are various approaches to the problem of suffering in the Old Testament. Laato and de Moor²⁰ posit six main categories of theodicy in monotheism:

- (1) Retribution – punishment for failure to comply with God's will. This is the predominant theodicy in the Old Testament.
- (2) Educative – suffering leading to a better understanding of God. This can both be deserved suffering, leading to an improvement in the individual or undeserved suffering on the part of righteous prophets for the purpose of educating Israel.
- (3) Eschatological – justice will be done in the end. As a result of Jewish experience, particularly the Babylonian Exile and Greek and Roman imperial rule, this moved from justice happening in the individual's life ('lifetime') to justice at the end of time ('Judgement').

¹⁹ A. Laato and J.C. de Moor, 'Introduction', in A. Laato and J.C. de Moor (eds.), *Theodicy in the World of the Bible* (Leiden, 2003), pp. ix, xx, xxvi.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. xxx-liv.

- (4) Mysterious – our minds are unable always to comprehend the reason for suffering.
- (5) Communion – suffering brings humans, either as individuals or as a community, closer to God.
- (6) Determinist – like the Hindu *karman*, this is the idea that humans cannot escape their fate. This is uncommon in the Hebrew scriptures, and is mainly found in Ecclesiastes and other Wisdom literature.

Given Teresa's declared dependence on the Psalms²¹, a useful approach to determining the theodicies she would have encountered is to list (with examples) the different explanations of suffering found in the Psalter (with references to the above categories):

- (1) Good things happen to the righteous and bad things to the wicked (Ps. 112) (educative, retributive).
- (2) No cause for the suffering is given, but God hears the sufferer's prayer and heals/saves (Ps. 18) (lifetime eschatological).
- (3) Suffering is caused by an enemy, but God hears the sufferer's prayer and heals/saves (Ps. 143) (lifetime eschatological).
- (4) Suffering is caused by God for no apparent reason (Ps. 44) (mysterious).
- (5) Suffering is caused by God as a punishment for sin (Ps. 38) (retributive).
- (6) Suffering is caused by God to purify the sufferer (Ps. 66) (educative, deserved).
- (7) Suffering because of righteousness, for the sake of God (Ps. 69) (educative, undeserved).

²¹ Hutton, 38:19-28, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 24.

The book of Job, which was also important to Teresa's thinking about suffering, seems to have been written to challenge the first explanation, which does not accord with human experience, and perhaps also the fifth. The book's answer to the theodicy problem is to say that the suffering was caused by an enemy, Satan, but with God's permission, to test the sincerity of Job's faith. This could be thought of as a combination of explanations 3 and 6.

New Testament

The fact that Jesus himself stated that one of the major signs of his mission was that he healed both physical and mental illness (Lk. 7:18-23) indicates that, for the Christian faith, ultimately illness and other suffering are not God's will. Jesus did not have a single approach to the relationship between sin and suffering. In the case of the man born blind (Jn. 9) he specifically rejected the suggestion that the blindness was the result of either his or his parents sin. In many examples of healing, both by Jesus and the Apostles (including the blind beggar of Jericho, Lk. 18:35-43, to whose physical experience Teresa equates her own spiritual experience²²), there is no mention of sin. There does appear to be a relationship between physical illness and sin in the case of the paralysed man lowered by his friends through the roof of the house where Jesus was preaching (Mk. 2:1-12) in which Jesus first told the man his sins were forgiven before the physical healing was effected. Jesus also says that disaster happening to someone does not mean that person was a worse sinner than everyone else (Lk. 13:1-5).

The Epistles show some of the Old Testament explanations of suffering, but with a Christian emphasis. The famous passage in 2 Corinthians in which Paul speaks of his

²² Hutton, 131:30-133:37, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103-5.

'thorn in the flesh' is a combination of explanations 2 and 6 in that he says that it was sent by a messenger of Satan, but that God refused to take it away so that Paul would not become conceited and would rely on Christ's strength (2 Cor. 12:7-10). Hebrews, quoting Proverbs 3:11-12, says that hardship is God's fatherly discipline (Heb. 12:4-11) and 1 Peter compares persecution to a refiner's fire, refining believers like gold (1 Pet. 1:6-7)²³, both the sixth explanation.

The suffering and death of Jesus provided a new basis for thought about the meaning and purpose of suffering. Holmén, after pointing out the large number of soteriological interpretations of the death of Christ found in the New Testament as a whole, analyses texts from the epistles to look for how they address the problem of suffering and concludes that, in the New Testament, the death of Jesus had no explicit theodicean function²⁴. The main themes of these texts relate to the identification of the Christian with the suffering of Christ and of Christ's support for the suffering Christian, and the majority show an eschatological approach to suffering²⁵.

The Fathers and Aquinas

Augustine dealt with the problem of suffering by holding that it must be 'good' for bad things to exist, because otherwise God would not permit them. Human suffering must therefore be either to punish sin, the fifth of the explanations listed above (under his theory of original sin, we all inescapably share in Adam's sin) or to begin the process of purification of the soul, the sixth explanation²⁶. Gregory the Great's commentary on Job, the *Moralia*, was much read in the Middle Ages. In the introductory epistle

²³ A comparison made by the Old Testament prophets Zechariah (Zech. 13:9) and Malachi (Mal. 3:2-3).

²⁴ T. Holmén, 'Theodicean Motifs in the New Testament: Response to the Death of Jesus' in A. Laato and J.C. de Moor (eds.), *Theodicy in the World of the Bible* (Leiden, 2003), p. 646.

²⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 647-8.

²⁶ J.M. Rist, *Augustine: Ancient Thought Baptised* (Cambridge, 1994), p. 275.

Gregory said that he had been ill during the time he was writing the book, and that in his sufferings he pondered Heb. 12:6, which talks of God's chastisement of those he loves (explanation 6). He also said that perhaps:

'Divine Providence designed, that I, a stricken one, should set forth Job stricken, and that by these scourges I should the more perfectly enter into the feelings of one that was scourged.'²⁷

This would seem to be an early forerunner of the late medieval approach to *imitatio Christi*, discussed below. Aquinas in Article 5 of Question 85 of his *Summa theologiae* argued that death and bodily defects (which presumably included illness and suffering) were the effect of Adam's sin which, in damaging the soul, caused disorder in the body which was governed by the soul. From this disorder resulted death and corruption of the body²⁸.

Late medieval theology of the body

Perhaps the dominant issue in late medieval theological thinking about the body was the need to counter the Cathar heresy, which taught that the soul was good but matter, including the body, was evil²⁹. This heresy, which began in the twelfth century³⁰, became a serious threat to the Catholic Church in the thirteenth century³¹. The Dominican order was formed to convert Cathars to Catholicism by preaching and ascetic life style³², while the Franciscans contributed their stress on the life of Jesus

²⁷ Gregory, 'Epistle' in trans. J.H. Parker, *The Books of the Morals of St. Gregory the Pope, or an Exposition on the Book of Blessed Job, Volume 1 – the First Part*, <http://www.lectionarycentral.com/GregoryMoralia/Epistle.html>, Epistle V.

²⁸ T. Aquinas, *Summa Theologica, Question 85*, ed. K. Knight (New Advent), <http://www.newadvent.org/summa/2085.htm>.

²⁹ M. Lambert, *Medieval Heresy: Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation* (Oxford, 2002), pp. 132-3.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 62.

³¹ *Ibid.*, p. 114.

³² *Ibid.*, pp. 103-4.

and a joy in creation³³. This led to the growth in the affective spirituality characteristic of the high and late Middle Ages, with its emphasis, often sentimental, on the humanity and human life of Christ and identification with and imitation of that humanity, particularly his suffering³⁴. That spirituality also stressed the importance of the Eucharist and the doctrine of transubstantiation, one result of which was the establishment of the feast of Corpus Christi³⁵. A factor in this intensely emotional approach to Christ's suffering in the late medieval period was the heightened sense of sin arising from the trauma of the Black Death, which gave rise to a greater stress on sacramental confession and an emphasis on individual discipline and personal piety³⁶. Another reason for this growth in affective devotion could be that it was a reaction to the increasingly sterile and rigid scholastic theology, particularly that of Ockham³⁷.

Christian thought has from early days had two theologies of the body which impacted on medieval views of suffering, particularly those of women³⁸. The first, the ascetic model, viewed physicality negatively and suffering as inevitably connected to physicality; its spirituality was to be identified with the suffering Christ³⁹. The second, inspired by the Song of Songs and Platonic thought, was more positive in that it identified by allegory the body with the soul, and bodily suffering could be seen as an expression of the soul. This second view produced the spirituality of union with Christ expressed in erotic, mystical terms⁴⁰.

³³ Ibid., p. 105

³⁴ Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, pp. 130-1.

³⁵ C.W. Bynum, *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion* (New York NY, 1991), pp. 122, 146.

³⁶ D.S. Ellington, *From Sacred Body to Angelic Soul: Understanding Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Washington DC, 2001), pp. 34-6, 75.

³⁷ A. Levi, *Renaissance and Reform: the Intellectual Genesis* (New Haven CT, 2002), pp. 59-60.

³⁸ D. Neal, 'Women, Religion and the Significance of Suffering in Medieval Thinking', *Feminist Theology*, no. 3 (1994), 62-72, p. 64.

³⁹ Ibid., p. 65.

⁴⁰ Ibid., pp. 66-7.

Imitatio Christi

The concept of *imitatio Christi* has been present in Christianity from the earliest days. Jesus himself called his followers to imitate him by renouncing self and taking up their cross, thus including suffering as part of discipleship⁴¹. Paul says that as God's children we must be like him⁴², and, after speaking of his own conformity with Christ's sufferings, encourages others to follow his example⁴³.

The concept of *imitatio Christi* changed in meaning over time from the early church to the late middle ages. From the early church through the early middle ages the emphasis was on the divinity of Christ, who is the Saviour showing the way to eternal life. Imitation of Christ meant imitating his divine characteristics and thus recovering the likeness to God that was lost through Adam's sin⁴⁴. This went with the dominant imagery of Christ as triumphant king, the cross signifying triumph rather than suffering⁴⁵. In the eleventh and twelfth centuries the emphasis changed from Christ's divinity to his humanity, and *imitatio Christi* became more concerned with the modelling of individuals' lives on the human life of Christ and on the lives of saints who were regarded as examples of *imitatio Christi*. Although salvation was still the main concern, there was a shift in emphasis on how it was attained⁴⁶. Cistercians, whose order was founded and flourished in this period, particularly emphasised that imitation of Christ's humanity was essential to a full Christian life, and Cistercian spirituality was affective and sensual⁴⁷. In the twelfth and thirteenth centuries this

⁴¹ Matt. 16:24.

⁴² Eph. 5:1.

⁴³ Phil. 3:8-17.

⁴⁴ G. Constable, *Three studies in medieval religious and social thought* (Cambridge, 1995), pp. 147, 164, 166-7.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, p.157; Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, p. 16.

⁴⁶ Constable, *Three Studies*, p. 169-70, 177-9; Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, p.17.

⁴⁷ Constable, *Three Studies*, p.190; Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, pp. 77-80.

emphasis on Christ's humanity came increasingly to dwell on his body and bodily sufferings, and the cross was portrayed as the crucifix bearing a suffering or dead Christ. This was associated with the belief that the cross was a sacrifice necessary for salvation, a sacrifice mysteriously present in the Mass⁴⁸. As a consequence, *imitatio Christi* increasingly became identified with bearing physical suffering, some of it self-inflicted⁴⁹. In this period the phenomenon of stigmata began, in the sense of wounds directly imitating the wounds of the crucified Christ. Francis is the best known of the saints exhibiting stigmata, and the rapid growth of the Franciscan movement in the thirteenth century helped to spread this emphasis on suffering as *imitatio Christi*. By the late Middle Ages *imitatio Christi* was almost entirely concentrated on sharing Christ's sufferings and with identification with Christ's passion through the Eucharist⁵⁰. This went with popular devotion to the wounds and blood of Christ, the instruments of his passion and to the Sacred Heart of Jesus⁵¹. A more internal model of *imitatio Christi*, with an emphasis on individual holiness and mental prayer, is characteristic of the fifteenth century *Devotio Moderna* movement in Northern Europe⁵². The *Devotio Moderna* arose from the same dissatisfaction with scholastic theology and the religious establishment that gave rise to humanism and, eventually, Reform⁵³. Another late medieval theme was the mystical union with God in which imitation led to identification, characteristic of Northern European writers such as Eckhart⁵⁴.

⁴⁸ C.W. Bynum, *Wonderful Blood: Theology and Practice in Late Medieval Northern Germany and Beyond* (Philadelphia PA, 2007), pp. 196-9.

⁴⁹ C.W. Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley CA, London, 1987), pp. 255-6.

⁵⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 256-7.

⁵¹ Constable, *Three Studies*, p. 225-6; Bynum, *Wonderful Blood*, pp. 2-5.

⁵² Ellington, *From Sacred Body*, pp. 149-50.

⁵³ Levi, *Renaissance and Reform*, p. 135; J. Van Engen, *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia PA, 2008), pp. 248-9.

⁵⁴ Constable, *Three Studies*, p. 246.

Two late medieval works on following Christ which were widely read and influential are the *Imitatio Christi* generally attributed to Thomas À Kempis and the *Vita Christi* of Ludolphus of Saxony. The *Imitatio* is a work emanating from the *Devotio Moderna*, so has little to say about imitation of Christ in the late medieval sense of identification with Christ's suffering, but rather Christ is constantly held up as model. A recurrent theme is need to struggle and suffer, together with need to withdraw into an inner spiritual life⁵⁵. There is a chapter on Christ's words 'deny yourself, take up your cross and follow me', which talks about the cross in terms of trials and self-denial as well as physical suffering⁵⁶. Elsewhere suffering is discussed in terms of purgation and development of patience⁵⁷. The *Vita* is primarily a compilation of texts on the life of Christ, giving great detail and intended to promote meditation on Christ's sacred humanity throughout the whole of his earthly life and presenting Christ as the ideal human⁵⁸. It also encouraged actual imitation of Christ, for example not simply meditating on the scene of Christ being slapped but also self-administering a 'moderate' slap⁵⁹. There is a chapter on following Christ, which emphasises self-denial and carrying the cross but also promotes meditation on the life of Christ as the key to perfection⁶⁰. There is no way of knowing if Teresa had access to these works: there are very few known manuscript copies in Castile before the printed publication of translations of both works into Spanish at the very end of the fifteenth century⁶¹, but both were certainly influential in sixteenth century Spain, in particular on Ignatius Loyola⁶².

⁵⁵ Ibid., p. 243.

⁵⁶ T. À Kempis, *The Imitation of Christ*, trans. L. Sherley-Price (London, 1952), pp. 84-9.

⁵⁷ Ibid., pp. 60, 68-9, 109.

⁵⁸ M.I. Bodenstedt, *The Vita Christi of Ludolphus the Carthusian* (Washington, 1944), pp. 93-4.

⁵⁹ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, p. 256.

⁶⁰ Bodenstedt, *Vita Christi*, pp. 115-6.

⁶¹ C. Robinson, 'Preaching to the Converted: Valladolid's *Cristianos nuevos* and the *Retablo de don Sancho de Rojas* (1415)', *Speculum*, 83 (2008), 112-63, p. 124.

⁶² Constable, *Three Studies*, p. 242; Bodenstedt, *Vita Christi*, pp. 75-9.

Miraculous cures

A consideration of the medieval approach to illness and disability would not be complete without a reference to the important role that miraculous healing, usually at the shrine of a saint, played in the Middle Ages. The centralising reforms of the canonisation of saints instituted in the late twelfth century by Pope Alexander III made attested miracles, mainly therapeutic, essential to a successful canonisation process⁶³. Metzler's examination of miracle accounts from a number of shrines shows that medieval people often consulted doctors before resorting to seeking help from the saint whose shrine they visited and that a significant proportion of the miracles related to conditions considered incurable by contemporary medicine, such as deafness and blindness⁶⁴.

Medieval female spirituality and suffering

The affective piety of the late Middle Ages described above was particularly characteristic of women; indeed, many of the practices associated with it were created by women, who also showed an affective devotion to the humanity of Christ and to the Eucharist in their writings⁶⁵. Women particularly identified with Christ's sufferings, and illness and suffering were a very common element in the lives of medieval holy women. Women were much less likely than men to be cured; in medieval saints' *vitae*, patient suffering was a common sign of sanctity in women, while this theme was much less common in male *vitae*⁶⁶. The theme commonly

⁶³ Metzler, *Disability in Medieval Europe*, p. 129.

⁶⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 139-44.

⁶⁵ Bynum, *Fragmentation*, pp. 55-6, 60.

⁶⁶ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, pp. 199-200.

found in accounts of this female suffering is that of identification with the suffering of others⁶⁷: of Christ, of contemporaries and of those in purgatory.

Both illness and self-inflicted suffering (in the case of women this was primarily abstinence from food although they also used physical discomfort and self-wounding) was seen as *imitatio Christi*, and in the late middle ages women's visions increasingly had the theme of direct identification with the crucified body of Christ⁶⁸. This identification was often expressed in vivid, physical imagery⁶⁹.

As well as identifying with the sufferings of Christ, there are examples of holy women expressly identifying their suffering as being on behalf of others. Sometimes it was on behalf of a specific individual: the *vita* of Mary of Oignies records her struggles to save a young nun who was in suicidal despair from incessant blasphemous and impure thoughts, attributed to the Devil. Her community brought her to Mary as their prayers had been unavailing. When Mary found her prayers also did not provide deliverance, she fasted for a long time. By this suffering the Devil was defeated and the nun delivered⁷⁰. More commonly the suffering was seen as being on behalf of sinners in general or specific groups. Catherine of Siena talks of suffering herself for the sins of her neighbours, for the salvation of souls and for the reform of the Church⁷¹.

⁶⁷ Bynum, *Wonderful Blood*, p. 203.

⁶⁸ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, p. 207-9.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 246-50, 255-6.

⁷⁰ *Medieval Writings on Female Spirituality*, ed. E. Spearing, (New York, 2002), pp. 97-8.

⁷¹ Catherine of Siena, *Little Talks with God: Catherine of Siena* ed. H.L.J. Carrigan, (Brewster, Mass, 2001), pp. 5, 11, 38.

Late medieval religious women tended to see their suffering as directly related to the pains of purgatory. As developed throughout the period, the doctrine of purgatory stressed its role as providing redemptive suffering, rather than being a sort of physical half-way house between hell and heaven. All living Christians, clergy and laity, were obliged to pray and offer masses for the redemption of souls from purgatory, and the right sort of suffering on earth could reduce the amount of suffering needed in purgatory. This was taken further by many holy women, who believed their earthly suffering could redeem others from purgatory as well as themselves⁷². Both Catherine of Siena and Teresa's contemporary, Catherine of Genoa, viewed saving souls from purgatory as an express purpose of their self-imposed suffering⁷³. Juana de la Cruz provides a late medieval Spanish example of the belief that the suffering of the living could free souls from purgatory⁷⁴.

Teresa's approach to bodily suffering

Practical

Teresa clearly had dealings with the medical profession, although her attitude to doctors was not positive:

'Where can you find a physician so adept in medical arts that with one potion he cures his patient of all his ills? For no matter how much a doctor knows, if he cures your spleen, he injures your liver; if your stomach is healed, your head aches.'⁷⁵

⁷² Bynum, *Holy Feast*, p. 120; B. Newman, *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature* (Philadelphia, 1995), pp. 111-2, 119.

⁷³ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, pp. 171, 183-4.

⁷⁴ R.E. Surtz, *The Guitar of God: Gender, Power and Authority in the Visionary World of Mother Juana de la Cruz (1481-1534)* (Philadelphia, 1990), p. 38.

⁷⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 58. '*¿Pues dónde se podrá hallar físyco tan discreto en el arte de medeçina [que] con vn solo xarope cure al enfermo de todos sus males? Ca por mucho que sepa, sy sanare el baço, dañará el figado; ca sy conseruar el estómago, hará doler la cabeça.*' Hutton, 75:33-6.

She also refers to the 'great torments' inflicted by medical treatments⁷⁶ and their impoverishingly high cost⁷⁷. She makes no express reference to medical treatment for her deafness. That may be because, although diseases of the ear were recognised by medieval medical science, deafness, particularly profound deafness, was generally regarded as incurable and medieval physicians normally would not attempt to treat incurable diseases⁷⁸.

She also makes no reference to having sought, or even considered, a miraculous cure, even though the late fourteenth century Christ of Burgos, a life-size figure which had a reputation for working numerous miracles, was in her time housed in St Augustine's monastery in the city of Burgos⁷⁹. However, she surely must have prayed for healing; her description of the non-devout sufferer praying for physical health in order to better serve God⁸⁰ sounds like a stratagem she adopted during the period when she was still struggling against what she later came to accept as God's will for her.

Theological and philosophical

Teresa's theological approach to her own sufferings is set out in her exegesis of what she states to be the key text for her treatise, namely Ps. 31:9 (her exegesis of this verse is examined in chapter 6). Her suffering, like a bit and bridle on an unruly horse, forcibly removed her from what she wanted, worldly activities, and drew her towards something she did not want, solitude and isolation. However, she acknowledges that this is for her good:

⁷⁶ Hutton, 75:10-16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 57.

⁷⁷ Hutton, 79:22-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 61.

⁷⁸ Metzler, *Disability in Medieval Europe*, pp. 102, 69.

⁷⁹ N. López Martínez, *Burgos Cathedral: World Heritage*, trans. G. Keith (León, 2004), p. 29. The image is now housed in Burgos cathedral. It is possible that Teresa originally sought either a medical or miraculous cure for her deafness because she does say that at first she did not submit willingly to God but 'struggled to further my own harm', Seidenspinner-Núñez, 27.

⁸⁰ Hutton, 102:2-24, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 79-80.

'My suffering's intention is much better than mine. I am coming to know its goodwill, for it labours not so much to torment me as to save me, nor so much to make me suffer as to make me worthy. And if it makes me experience great pain, it does so desiring my salvation.'⁸¹

This view is also the basis of her comparison of her sufferings to parental chastisement, which is administered by a loving parent in order to correct faults in the child⁸². Another image she uses to the same end is based on the parable of the wedding feast (see chapter 6) in which she speaks of her suffering tugging at her robe to force her to enter the divine feast⁸³. Teresa quotes St Bernard as saying that suffering wounds the body and heals the soul⁸⁴, and she gives an extended analysis of how suffering is the medicine which can cure all seven deadly sins, discussed in chapter 4.

When Teresa discusses justice, whose true purpose is to punish the guilty, she ties it to mercy because the punishment makes her avoid future sin. However, she does say that in the exercise of this justice, only the person who deserves pain suffers while the worthy are free of suffering⁸⁵. On its face, this could be read as a simple equation of suffering with sin. However, this was not her view: she later says that if suffering only occurred because of sin, the righteous would never suffer and the wicked would never be exempt, but we know that this is not the case. She believes that this proves that the main reason for suffering is that it is given by God to those he particularly

⁸¹ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 35. *'Mucho mejor es la yntinçión de mi pasyón que no la mía. Ya voy conociendo su buena voluntad, ca no la ha tanto por me penar como por me saluar, ni tanto trabajar por me hazer padecer, como por me hazer mereçer. E sy me haze sentir grande afliçión, con deseo de mi saluaçión lo haze.'* Hutton, 50:30-3.

⁸² Hutton, 52:20-53:16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 37-8. This understanding of suffering is found in both the Old Testament (Proverbs) and the New Testament (Hebrews).

⁸³ Hutton, 54:28-33, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 39.

⁸⁴ Hutton, 75:2-3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 57.

⁸⁵ Hutton, 54:3-24, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 39.

loves and desires to save, because only a few sinners are so afflicted⁸⁶. This seems to indicate that Teresa had a theology of salvation which emphasised individual salvation and election by God of individuals for salvation. It was typical of monastic life to concentrate on the salvation of the individual⁸⁷, while late medieval scholastic theology taught predestination of the elect⁸⁸. However, at the end of *Admiración* Teresa speaks more generally of God mercifully scourging and correcting sinners⁸⁹.

In a passage which seems to derive from St Bernard⁹⁰ (although she does not expressly cite him), Teresa cites three reasons why God permits hardships as punishment; to test the righteous, to correct the sinner and to condemn the wicked⁹¹. She includes herself and her readers in the second category. She also discusses the source and types of suffering. God is the ultimate source; sometimes she says that he 'permits (*permite*)' suffering, but generally she uses language indicating that he causes it. However, this is qualified by her discussion of good and bad suffering. Bad suffering is always from a bad source, the worldly troubles that those who love this world suffer because of their wrong desires; this is clearly not from God but is permitted by him. There is good suffering from a bad source, which is the suffering of martyrs. However, even bad suffering can be transformed by the exercise of prudence and by the realisation of the source of the suffering. Teresa describes her own suffering as good suffering, because it brought her salvation, from a good source, namely the hand of God⁹². She also categorises suffering as voluntary or forced;

⁸⁶ Hutton, 73:16-21, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 56.

⁸⁷ Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, p. 72.

⁸⁸ Levi, *Renaissance and Reform*, pp. 54-6.

⁸⁹ Hutton, 141:5-21, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 111-2.

⁹⁰ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 50 n. 52.

⁹¹ Hutton, 66:20-4, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 50.

⁹² Hutton, 64:28-66:20, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 48-9. Teresa of Avila also saw her suffering as coming from God in order to prepare her for a better life than that to which her sensuality and vanity were

voluntary suffering is that endured in this life by martyrs and saints for the sake of eternal life (she includes self-induced suffering such as fasting, vigils and scourging in this category) while forced suffering is imposed against the will of the sufferers, who have no thought of heavenly benefits, in order to lead them to eternal life⁹³. It is interesting that she speaks of her salvation as resulting from this suffering imposed by God. In the late medieval period there were two main theories of salvation; that Christ's death was a sacrifice which paid the price for our sin, or that Christ on the cross represented all humanity. Further, the representation theory was seen by some as inclusive, salvation for all (which explains how women could see their sufferings as contributing to the salvation of others) rather than salvation for an individual⁹⁴. Teresa's theology of suffering does not seem to correspond to either of these theories, as she makes no mention of the cross or Christ's sufferings. It should also be noted that she makes no reference to penance or the sacrament of confession and absolution in relation to sin, both of which were prominent in late medieval theology and religious practice⁹⁵.

Thus, in terms of the Biblical explanations of suffering derived from the Psalms described above (p. 182), Teresa clearly views her own suffering and that of those to whom she addresses her book as being the sixth one, correction of sinners. Her three general reasons for suffering seem to correspond to the seventh, sixth and fifth explanations respectively.

leading her, *The Collected Works of Teresa of Avila*, trans. K. Kavanaugh and O. Rodriguez (trans.) (3 vols, Washington DC, 1987), i, 62.

⁹³ Hutton, 71:24-72:2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 54.

⁹⁴ Bynum, *Wonderful Blood*, pp. 202-4.

⁹⁵ Bynum, *Jesus as Mother*, pp. 17-19.

In light of her use of the violent imagery noted in chapter 4, it is notable that she often uses words relating to force in relation to the beneficial affects of suffering. In relation to the bit and bridle imagery, Teresa talks of her suffering using all its force (*todas sus fuerças*) and dragging her behind it (*me lleuas rastrando y mal paresciendo en pos de ti*)⁹⁶. She uses a related image when she talks of hardships goading the sufferer with their spurs and making them run along the narrow path that leads to eternal life⁹⁷. The imagery of parental chastisement is all about the use of force, and in the parable of the marriage feast she emphasises the fact that the master does not tell his servants to 'ask' the sufferers to come, as he did the invited guests, but rather to 'make' them come.

Another theme, philosophical as well as theological, is that suffering can be a means of overcoming vices and assisting the sufferer in attaining virtues. Teresa views her continuing suffering as being good and necessary, as it prevents her from continuing in worldly conversation by removing her desire to do so, and she fears that if her suffering were removed she would sin more greatly⁹⁸. However, this enforced inability to commit bad deeds does not give the sufferer merit; instead, what is required is a willing mortification of thoughts and desires and pursuit of the virtues⁹⁹. She first discusses virtue in a theological context, her exegesis of 2 Cor. 12:9b (see chapter 6). Glorifying in suffering (rather than merely enduring it) brings to the soul of the sufferer the virtue of Christ¹⁰⁰. A more philosophical approach is found in the

⁹⁶ Hutton, 50:19, 51:4, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 35.

⁹⁷ Hutton, 72:11-15, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 55.

⁹⁸ Hutton, 43:25-33, 57:23-31, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 29, 41.

⁹⁹ Hutton, 84:30-85:9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 65.

¹⁰⁰ Hutton, 58:24-59:9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 42-3. The importance of this virtue is mentioned again at the beginning of *Admiración*, Hutton, 112:11-15, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86. With reference to her theology of salvation discussed above, again the stress is on her sufferings rather than those of Christ.

final section of *Arboleda*, which is devoted to the discussion of the virtues, in particular patience and how they are obtained through the positive use of suffering.

Spiritual

Teresa's spirituality of suffering is directly related to her theology, in that it is directed to using suffering for spiritual gain. Her spiritual advice is addressed to those who are, like her, sinful and unwilling sufferers¹⁰¹. The general theme is that the sufferer should first accept the suffering as just and merciful, appropriate the spiritual benefits that suffering can bring, then go on to thank and praise God for his mercy and grace.

In the first part of *Arboleda*, which deals with her own experience, Teresa speaks of a number of ways in which her suffering has affected her spiritually. These are generally related to what she viewed as her main sin, concern with worldly chatter and concerns. The silence and solitude enforced by her deaf ears isolated her from this sin and drove her to seeking comfort from books, particularly the Psalter. However, rather than comfort she found good counsel¹⁰². In *Arboleda* Teresa shares this good counsel with fellow sufferers. Her main theme is that her suffering has effected a conversion from worldly concerns and conversation to concern for God and a desire to hear his voice and do his will¹⁰³, and she urges her readers to permit their suffering to effect the same transformation¹⁰⁴. Another spiritual theme is that of the role of prayer for sufferers. At the end of her passage on the parable of the marriage

¹⁰¹ Hutton thought that Teresa identified with martyrs and enjoyed the same spiritual joy, but this is a misreading of her discussion of good and bad hardships, L.J. Hutton, 'Teresa de Cartagena: A Study in Castilian Spirituality,' *Theology Today* 12 (1956), 477-83, p. 481. Martyrdom was a hardship from a bad source which could be regarded as good because of the spiritual nature of the martyr who voluntarily embraced the suffering; she says that hers was a good hardship from a good source, namely God, imposed as involuntary suffering for her own good: Hutton, 64:25-66:20, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 48-9.

¹⁰² Hutton, 38:13-39:27, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 24-5.

¹⁰³ Hutton, 43:10-33, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 28-9.

¹⁰⁴ Hutton, 59:1-12, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 43.

feast, Teresa says that any sufferer who abandons worldly things but finds the door to the feast shut should knock on that door with the 'doorknocker of humble and devout prayer', citing Gospel sayings on prayer¹⁰⁵. The patient sufferer prays always, because even when he is silent his physical pains and suffering pray for him¹⁰⁶.

A recurrent theme is that of her experience of sadness and joy. At the beginning of *Arboleda* Teresa says that her cloud of heavy sadness which she was experiencing on her island of isolation was dispelled by the true Light¹⁰⁷. One spiritual lesson she teaches is the need to distinguish between temporal and spiritual happiness. While temporal joy is not a bad thing, it is not a virtue and sufferers who seek human pleasure as a way of alleviating their pain are on a wild goose chase¹⁰⁸. Her second theme is that, while human sadness is not itself bad, there is a need for moderation in this emotion. Indeed, in moderation it can be a good thing, because it is the first step towards attaining spiritual joys¹⁰⁹. Teresa justifies this approach to human sadness by reference to Job, who was criticised by his friends for displaying grief. Her message from her exegesis of this scripture is that patient suffering is shown not by lack of complaint about pain but rather by being humble and not offending God¹¹⁰.

This analysis shows that the themes typical of medieval women's spirituality of suffering discussed above (pp. 190-2) are largely absent from Teresa's writing. There is no suggestion that she viewed her suffering as being on behalf of others, except in

¹⁰⁵ Hutton, 56:1-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 40.

¹⁰⁶ Hutton, 93:8-16, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 72.

¹⁰⁷ Hutton, 38:2-5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 24.

¹⁰⁸ Hutton, 59:34-60:7, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 43-4.

¹⁰⁹ Hutton, 60:17-30, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 44.

¹¹⁰ Hutton, 97:17-99:11, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 76-7.

the rather abstract sense that she passes on to other sufferers the lessons she had learned. She certainly did not regard herself as liberating souls from purgatory.

***Imitatio Christi* in Teresa's writings**

Given the ubiquity of the concept of *imitatio Christi* in medieval spirituality, particularly that of women as discussed above, it is interesting to examine Teresa's approach to and use of the concept. The following are the references in her works which expressly or impliedly relate to following Christ or identification with his life and sufferings (page references to Seidenspinner-Núñez):

Page 23. Teresa names her island of exile with a phrase from Ps. 21. This psalm begins with the words "My God, my God, why have you forsaken me" which Christ used on the cross and has traditionally been regarded by Christians as a prophecy of the crucifixion¹¹¹.

Page 29. In a passage thanking God for removing the harmful desire for worldly conversations, she says that she used to think of her suffering as her crucifixion, but now thinks of it as her resurrection.

Pages 42-5. This is the passage where Teresa gives a moral exegesis of 2 Cor. 12:9b.

Pages 54-6. Based on the saying of Christ that the road that leads to eternal life is narrow (Matt. 7:14), Teresa says that involuntary suffering should be borne in the understanding that it has been imposed by God to bring the sufferer to that narrow path. She contrasts this with the voluntary suffering of martyrs and saints and ascetics, whose type of suffering is closer to the late medieval understanding of *imitatio Christi*. Christ's own suffering was voluntary. It is clear that she identifies not with this group but with the involuntary sufferers.

¹¹¹ A. Harman, *Commentary on the Psalms* (Fearn, Scotland, 1998), p. 120.

Pages 108-9. In her allegorical treatment of the Gospel story of the blind beggar of Jericho, Teresa says that the blindness of her understanding was removed and it saw and followed its Saviour. 'Following the Saviour' can be understood in many ways, but she says that the most appropriate way is based on Christ's saying in Matt. 16:24. For her, the cross that she must take up is her physical suffering, while the following of Christ is spiritual rather than physical.

It can be seen that these references are very different in tone from the emotional and highly physical language often used by late medieval religious women when talking about their identification with the physical sufferings of Christ, examples of which are given by Bynum¹¹². There is only an abstract identification of her sufferings with the crucifixion, made entirely in terms of New Testament texts. This is far from late medieval understanding of suffering as *imitatio Christi*. Castro-Ponce¹¹³ compares what she characterises as *imitatio Christi* in Teresa's writings (the first, third and fifth passages discussed above) with the experiences of María de Ajofrin, a largely illiterate fifteenth century peasant Spanish beata. María was a stigmatic who saw visions, suffered physical pain including head pains identified with Christ's crown of thorns, and prophesied against corrupt clergy. As opposed to this example of late medieval *imitatio Christi*, extreme but not uncommon, Teresa's approach is restrained and intellectual. The most that Castro-Ponce can put forward as complying with the late medieval *imitatio* is that the 'constant references to suffering are [plausibly] a guarded attempt to emphasise pain'¹¹⁴, without giving any reason why Teresa should make such a 'guarded' attempt. I would suggest this is because Teresa's sufferings

¹¹² Bynum, *Holy Feast*, pp. 247-9.

¹¹³ C. Castro-Ponce, 'Imitatio Christi in the Writings of Teresa de Cartagena', *Magistra* 9, no. 2 (2003), 55-65.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 65.

were primarily psychological, whereas the *imitatio Christi* of her day emphasised physical pain.

CHAPTER 9

GENDER

Introduction

Teresa's female gender was a disability in her society in her role as author. In *Admiración*, when describing the criticisms made of *Arboleda*, she refers to it as a 'womanly text of little substance' and says that 'prudent men' and indeed some 'discreet women' marvelled at it because of the 'defects' of its author. While she expressly includes her sufferings in these defects, it is clear that her gender was also a problem. Indeed, her defence of her authorship in *Admiración* is based on the premise that female authorship is so unusual as to be counted a special work of God.

Here the term 'gender' is used in the modern, sociological context adopted by feminist historians. Scott, defining the term as being constructed through kinship and the systems of economic and political power and also as relating to the subjective identity of the individual, argues that it is a useful concept in historical analysis¹. However, in dealing with the medieval sources we must remember that most of them were written by senior male clergy and monks who may have had an unusually misogynistic outlook because of their training and compulsory celibacy. Pastoral handbooks actually used by parish clergy showed a more nuanced view of women².

¹ J.W. Scott, 'Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis', in J.W. Scott (ed.), *Feminism and History* (Oxford, New York, 1996).

² J. Murray, 'Thinking about Gender: The Diversity of Medieval Perspectives', in J. Carpenter and S-B. MacLean (eds.), *Power of the Weak: Studies on Medieval Women* (Chicago, 1995), pp. 1-3, 7-8, 16.

Background

Classical and medieval views of women

The views on women put forward by medieval clerical and scholastic writers were heavily influenced by classical writers. From Plato came the idea that a person was a soul trapped in a material body, and that the soul, the seat of knowledge and wisdom, was essentially male while the emotional and irrational body was female³. Aristotle supplied a 'scientific' basis for this denigration of the female, teaching that a female foetus was a mutilated male and that in procreation the woman took a passive role, supplying only the material substance of the foetus, while the man supplied the soul⁴. The patristic writers brought together these ideas from classical philosophy with those from the Hebrew Scriptures, which also cast women into a secondary role by excluding them from all the central rites of worship in the Temple and synagogue⁵. By the medieval period the Catholic church had followed this example by excluding women from any ordained office and thus from any position of influence in the ecclesiastical establishment⁶. The Jewish ritual purity rules made women unclean as a result of the natural functions of menstruation and childbirth⁷. Gender roles were seen as set from the beginning of mankind by the traditional exegesis of Genesis 2, in particular that man was created first, that woman was created from the body of the man and that she was created for the sake of man, all of which meant that woman was

³ G. Jantzen, *Power, Gender and Christian Mysticism* (Cambridge, 1995), pp. 32-6.

⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 41.

⁵ R.R. Ruether, *Women and Redemption: A Theological History* (London, 1998), p. 17.

⁶ There is evidence that until about the twelfth century women were ordained to various roles, other than priesthood, within the church, G. Macy, *The Hidden History of Women's Ordination: Female Clergy in the Medieval West* (Oxford, 2008), pp. 129-30. There is New Testament evidence that women served as deacons in the early church, J. Wijngaards, *No Women in Holy Orders? The Women Deacons of the Early Church* (Norwich, 2002), pp. 12-16.

⁷ Leviticus 12, 15:19-24.

subordinate to, and dependent upon man⁸. Above all, for patristic and scholastic writers the primary blame for the Fall was placed on the shoulders of Eve and all her female descendents⁹. Indeed, Eve's role is the reason given for the requirement in 1 Timothy 2:11-12 that women remain silent and not be authorised to teach or have authority over a man. This scripture, unquestioningly believed throughout the medieval period to have been written by St Paul¹⁰, was the main basis for the Church's prohibition on women preaching or teaching, at least where the audience included men. As well as relying on Paul for the prohibition against women teaching, male writers stressed women's weakness and susceptibility to seduction. Women's supposed intellectual and moral inferiority was invoked to attack their ability to discern between the divine and the diabolical¹¹. Although Augustine and other authoritative writers saw the creation of Eve from Adam's side, rather than his head or his foot, as showing that God intended equality, women were now subordinate to men because of Eve's role in the Fall¹².

Another aspect of medieval views of women came from the long tradition of allegorising the physical aspects of humanity as female and the spiritual or intellectual aspects as male; indeed some of the more extreme patristic writers went so far as to deny that women as females (as opposed to as human beings) were made in the image of God¹³. Related to this was the teaching that women were weak and inferior to men, both physically and intellectually. However, not all medieval women

⁸ P. Tribble, *God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality* (London, 1992), p. 73.

⁹ Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, pp. 45-7.

¹⁰ Most scholars now think that this was written at the end of the first century or the beginning of the second, after Paul's death, by a follower of Paul, A.J. Hultgren, 'The Pastoral Epistles' in J.D.G. Dunn (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to St Paul* (Cambridge, 2003), pp. 142-4.

¹¹ Macy, *Hidden History* pp. 122-3.

¹² A. Blamires, *The Case for Women in Medieval Culture* (Oxford, 1997), pp. 101-2.

¹³ C.W. Bynum, *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion* (New York, 1991), p. 146.

internalised this misogynist view. There is evidence that many religious women saw their female bodies as a symbol of, and a means of approach to, the humanity of God¹⁴.

Marian devotion became particularly prevalent in the late Middle Ages. While this may at first seem to be positive for the position of women, in many ways the opposite was true. The doctrine of the Immaculate Conception, that Mary was conceived without the stain of original sin, was developed during this period¹⁵. This made her different from all other women descended from Eve. As a result, the contrast between Mary and Eve, present throughout Christian history and often used in a misogynist context, was more strongly emphasised¹⁶. Praise of the Virgin in misogynist literature was put in the context of denigration of all other women¹⁷. Bernard of Clairvaux, the founder of the Cistercian order, venerated Mary because she had put right what Eve had caused to go wrong but had a very low opinion of women in general.¹⁸ In the early and high Middle Ages the queenship of the Virgin was the primary focus of her cult, often linked politically to powerful female rulers¹⁹. However, beginning in the late eleventh century the emphasis changed to the humility and suffering of Mary, a trend particularly linked to the Cistercians and Franciscans²⁰. This change mirrors the change in the emphasis on Christ on the cross, from victorious king to suffering saviour, discussed in chapter 8. There were some aspects

¹⁴ C.W. Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley CA, London, 1987), p. 296.

¹⁵ M. Rubin, *Mother of God: A History of the Virgin Mary* (London, 2009), pp. 303-4.

¹⁶ L.K. Twomey, *The Serpent and the Rose: the Immaculate Conception and Hispanic Poetry in the Late Medieval Period* (Leiden, 2008), pp. 217-20.

¹⁷ Blamires, *Case for Women*, pp. 120-2.

¹⁸ Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, pp. 130-2.

¹⁹ S.J. Boss, 'The Development of the Virgin's Cult in the High Middle Ages', in S.J. Boss (ed.), *Mary: The Complete Resource* (London, 2007), pp. 156-7.

²⁰ E. de Visscher, 'Marian Devotion in the Latin West in the Later Middle Ages', in S.J. Boss (ed.), *Mary: The Complete Resource* (London, 2007), pp. 182-3.

of Marian devotion that were helpful to women: the medieval belief that a child's flesh was supplied by the mother was used by both men and women to identify Christ's flesh as female, supplied by his mother Mary²¹. This was particularly important to women in the religious culture of the late Middle Ages, in which it was the physical suffering of Christ's human body that provided salvation. As a result, for many women and some men that body could be identified as symbolising the feminine and Mary as representing the humanity of Christ. Mary's exaltation through humility, expressed in the *Magnificat*, was also used by 'weak' women to authenticate their divine revelations²². Another traditional approach to Mary was to associate her with the Old Testament references to Wisdom, particularly in Proverbs²³. Towards the end of the period, popular devotion to Mary increasingly saw her as the main intercessor between men and God and with a status close to divine. The late fifteenth century humanist emphasis on the Scriptures and rationality, followed even more emphatically by the sixteenth century reformers, led to a reaction against this exaggerated devotion to Mary²⁴.

The representative aspects of Mary led some to stress *imitatio Mariae* rather than (or in addition to) *imitatio Christi*. The emphasis on *imitatio Mariae* was stronger in women's *vitae* from southern Europe. However, it seems that women rarely saw themselves as following Mary rather than Christ; it was male biographers who described holy women as imitating Mary²⁵. For example, male writers identified St Clare as a follower of Mary, whereas in Clare's own writings she talks only about

²¹ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, pp. 263-9.

²² S.J. Boss, *Empress and Handmaid: On Nature and Gender in the Cult of the Virgin Mary* (London, 2000), pp. 35-6.

²³ *Ibid.*, p. 80.

²⁴ D.S. Ellington, *From Sacred Body to Angelic Soul: Understanding Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Washington DC, 2001), pp. 2-3, 19-21.

²⁵ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, p. 269.

following Christ²⁶. One way in which Mary was held up to late medieval women as an example was as a silent, enclosed contemplative, who rarely ventured outside her house²⁷. The late medieval emphasis on Mary's suffering caused by her son's suffering made her an ideal model for the Christian contemplating Christ's Passion²⁸.

Women in late medieval Spain

Although Castilian women of the upper classes were better off in this period than in some other European countries as they seem to have been able to hold and deal with property in their own right, they were still under the control of their fathers or husbands²⁹. In particular, fathers chose their daughter's husbands; Teresa's sister Juana was married to a son of Juan Hurtado de Mendoza, who had been killed in a duel by their father Pedro de Cartgena, in order to prevent a family feud³⁰.

A prominent feature of cultural life in late medieval Spain was the literary *querrela de las mujeres*³¹, in which extremely misogynistic poetry and prose was pitted against works praising women. Probably the best known of the misogynist works in Spanish is the mid-fourteenth century *Libro de buen amor (Libro)* by Juan Ruiz, Arcipreste de

²⁶ C.M. Mooney, 'Imitatio Christi or Imitatio Mariae? Clare of Assisi and Her Interpreters', in C.M. Mooney (ed.), *Gendered Voices: Female Saints and their Interpreters* (Philadelphia PA, 1999), p. 76.

²⁷ Ellington, *From Sacred Body*, pp. 143-4.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 78.

²⁹ R.E. Surtz, *Writing Women in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain: the Mothers of Saint Teresa of Avila* (Philadelphia PA, 1995), p.2; C. Marimón Llorca, *Prosistas castellanas medievales* (Alicante, 1990), pp. 58-9. Ruiz has demonstrated that women from wealthy Burgos families had control of their own property in making charitable donations throughout the fourteenth century, T.F. Ruiz, 'Notas para el estudio de la mujer en al area del Burgos medieval', in *The City and the Realm: Burgos and Castile, 1080-1492* (Aldershot, 1992), ch. V.

³⁰ Cantera Burgos, pp. 470-1. At the same time Teresa's eldest brother was married to a daughter of the slain man; sons also came under patriarchal control.

³¹ This is more widely known under its French name, *la querelle des dames*, because this literary genre began in France with the famous misogynist work, the *Roman de la Rose*, and the equally influential responses by Christine de Pizan, D.F. Hult, 'The *Roman de la Rose*, Christine de Pizan, and the *querelle des femmes*', in C. Dinshaw and D. Wallace (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Women's Writing* (Cambridge, 2003), pp. 186, 191-3. This debate started later in Spain than the rest of Europe, M.M. Cortés Timoner, *Teresa de Cartagena, primera escritora mística en lengua castellana* (Málaga, 2004), p.174.

Hita. Other well-known works in this category are *Llibre de les dones* of Francesc Eximenis, Torroella's *Maldezir de mugeres*, *Corbacho* of Alfonso Martínez de Toledo, *La Celestina* of Fernando de Rojas and Jaume Roig's *Espill*. All were written by men. It is interesting that a misogynistic work, *Coplas en vituperio de las malas hembras*, was written by Teresa's nephew, Fray Iñigo de Mendoza³². In these works women were presented as full of vice, temptresses, adulterers, naggers, disease carriers and general bringers of misery to men³³. They are criticised for neglecting their household duties to gad about, gossiping, eating and drinking. Women often are accused in misogynist works of talking too much. For example, the *Libro* has long passages of female speech, usually complaining/nagging/inane, intended to show that women are defective corporeally and verbally³⁴. In the Middle Ages the chatterer, female or male, was regarded as weak and effeminate³⁵. Teresa obviously had absorbed this attitude, as she understands her deafness as being imposed by God to stop her 'worldly chatter'³⁶. On the other side, there were treatises in defence of women; *El triunfo de las donas* of Rodríguez de la Cámara, de Valera's *Tratado en defensa de virtuosas mujeres* and Alvaro de Luna's *El libro de las virtuosas y claras mugeres*. Teresa's uncle, Alonso de Cartagena, translated Boccaccio's *De claris mulieribus* for the queen of Juan II³⁷. However, these male-authored works tended to

³² He was the son of Teresa's sister Juana and Diego Hurtado de Mendoza, *Fray Iñigo de Mendoza: Cancionero* ed. J. Rodríguez-Puértolas, (Madrid, 1968), p. ix.

³³ Ornstein argues that, apart from *Corbacho*, these works were just a fashionable literary game, J. Ornstein, 'La misoginia y el profeminismo en la literatura castellana', *Revista de filología hispánica*, 3 (1941), 219-32, p. 231. This seems to overlook the context of the general and real misogyny in classical and medieval thought discussed above.

³⁴ M. Solomon, *The Literature of Misogyny in Medieval Spain: The Arcipreste de Talavera and the Spill* (Cambridge, 1997), p. 145.

³⁵ B. Newman, *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature* (Philadelphia PA, 1995), pp. 23-4.

³⁶ Hutton, 40-2, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 26-8.

³⁷ Cortés, *Teresa de Cartagena*, pp. 173-4. Boccaccio's work deals only with women from classical literature (apart from Eve); the main emphasis is on courage and marital faithfulness and not all were virtuous. This may show the beginning of a renaissance movement away from the prevailing medieval attitude towards women Boccaccio, *Concerning Famous Women*, trans G.A. Guarino (London, 1964), pp. xxvi-xxvii.

consist of descriptions of virtuous women from Scripture³⁸ and the classics, rather than being a general defence of the female nature and character. They particularly emphasised the virtues valued by patriarchy, namely chastity, passivity, silence and humility³⁹.

The pre-eminent example of these virtues was Mary, whose vital role in salvation history was a central doctrine in late medieval Spanish Christianity⁴⁰. However, this exalted status given to the Virgin hindered rather than helped Spanish women as they were encouraged to imitate her in these patriarchal virtues⁴¹, while misogynist works such as the *Libro* and *Espill* praised the Virgin in order to denigrate all other women⁴². On the other hand, the view of Mary as a powerful heavenly queen and military patron was one that persisted and remained popular in Spain even in the late Middle Ages, perhaps because she was seen as supporting the Christians in their struggle against the Moslems⁴³. For example, by the fifteenth century the cult of the Virgin of Guadalupe had become very popular and was supported by Castilian royalty and leading clergy. The legend of this Virgin was that her statue had been buried to

³⁸ Judith was almost always included in such works, Blamires, *Case for Women*, p. 171. However, Judith is the only prominent woman mentioned by Teresa, in contrast to the long lists of virtuous women found in the pro-female literature. A possible reason why Teresa selected Judith as her sole example of an empowered woman was the allegorical identification that her readers would instinctively make with the Virgin, the pre-eminent example of a woman endowed with grace and divine power.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 4-5.

⁴⁰ This was particularly emphasised by the debate over the doctrine of the Immaculate Conception which was very active in late medieval Spain, Twomey, *The Serpent and the Rose*, pp. 37-42. However, there was another face to the Spanish Virgin; the military patron, such as the Virgen del Pilar, A. Castro, *The Structure of Spanish History*, trans. E.L. King (Princeton NJ, 1954), p. 197. See also Rubin, *Mother of God*, p. 481 n. 4.

⁴¹ Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 5.

⁴² Twomey, *The Serpent and the Rose*, pp. 2-6.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, p. 85. From the thirteenth century the Virgin was seen as an icon of the reconquest, a commander of battles against the Muslims, A.G. Remensnyder, 'Christian Captives, Muslim Maidens and Mary', *Speculum*, 82 (2007), p. 645. An example of the Virgin as military patron is the Virgen del Pilar, Castro, *Structure of Spanish History*, p. 197.

protect it after the Moslem invasion and it had been found as the result of a vision⁴⁴. Prevalent among the miracles attributed to that Virgin were the rescue of Christians from Moslem captivity and the conversion of Moslems⁴⁵. Part of the propaganda promoting the royal power of Isabella as queen in her own right was to identify her with this powerful image of Mary⁴⁶ and generally with Mary as regal and as partner to Christ⁴⁷.

Education of medieval women

Because women could not participate in the 'official' education system, which was primarily aimed at training men for the clerical and other professions, it is not easy to determine the means and level of education of medieval women. The sources indicate that the level of education of a woman varied with her class, status and location. For example, certain religious houses in German speaking areas of Europe in the High Middle Ages contained women such as Hildegard of Bingen, Herrad of Hohenbourg and Gertrude the Great of Helfta whose writings show a high level of education and knowledge of Latin⁴⁸. It seems that the education of religious women, the group for which we have the most evidence, became less rigorous as the Middle Ages advanced⁴⁹. This may be as a result of the rise of the university, an institution officially closed to women, as the source of education for clergy and religious⁵⁰. On

⁴⁴ G.D. Starr-LeBeau, *In the Shadow of the Virgin: Inquisitors, Friars, and Conversos in Guadalupe, Spain* (Princeton, N.J., 2003), pp. 14-15.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 17-18. Although other Spanish virgins were attributed with miracles of liberation, by the late fifteenth century the Virgin of Guadalupe had the leading reputation in this field, Remensnyder, 'Christian Captives', pp. 648-50.

⁴⁶ Starr-LeBeau, *Shadow of the Virgin*, pp. 254-5.

⁴⁷ Rubin, *Mother of God*, pp. 379-80.

⁴⁸ R. Voaden, 'God's Almighty Hand: Women Co-Writing the Book', in L. Smith and J.H.M. Taylor (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995), p. 62.

⁴⁹ A. Blamires, 'The Limits of Bible Study for Medieval Women', in L. Smith and J.H.M. Taylor (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995), p. 4.

⁵⁰ F.J. Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights: Reform and Renaissance for Women in the Twelfth Century* (Philadelphia PA, 2007), pp. 12-13. The *Hortus* of Herrad of Hohenbourg provided the nuns for which it was written with a theological curriculum comparable to that taught to students in Paris, *ibid.*, pp. 3-

the other hand, by the late Middle Ages there was significant improvement in the level of education of women from the nobility, gentry and urban merchant elites⁵¹. Evidence about the level of education of laywomen other than the upper classes is very limited, but tends to indicate that it was higher in Northern Europe than in the south of the continent⁵². This may explain why Spain was much later than the Germanic region or France in producing female writers⁵³. The education of women was one topic discussed in the '*querelle des dames*' debate throughout Europe; the anti-feminists saw women's role as being confined to the home, so girls only needed a basic education which should be aimed at promoting virtue⁵⁴. The pro-feminists did encourage a somewhat wider education for women, particularly as the humanist influence of the Renaissance spread, but the aims of educating women were nevertheless different from the aims of educating men so there were still different standards of education for the two sexes⁵⁵.

As Scripture was the primary authority for medieval authors, the level of Biblical education for women is an important factor in considering gender as a disability in connection with authorship. The church discouraged study of the Scripture by the laity, men as well as women; a major ground for the condemnation of evangelizing lay movements such as the Waldensians and Lollards was their encouragement to lay

4. The Helfta novices were instructed in the same seven liberal arts as were taught in the universities, supplemented by a study of theology, *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*, ed. E.A. Petroff (New York, 1986), p. 208. However, these examples were probably unusual.

⁵¹ S. McSheffrey, 'Literacy and the Gender Gap in the Late Middle Ages: Women and Reading in Lollard Communities', in L. Smith and J.H.M. Taylor (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995), p. 170.

⁵² P. Biller, 'Women and Texts in Languedocian Catharism', in L. Smith and J.H.M. Taylor (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995), p. 182.

⁵³ Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 2.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 3.

⁵⁵ Cortés, *Teresa de Cartagena*, pp. 177-8. Weissberger points out that the Spanish humanist, Juan Luis Vives, wrote a book of instruction at the behest of Catherine of Aragon for her daughter Mary Tudor. In the preface Vives stated that the only purpose of educating a woman would be to the end of preserving her honesty and chastity, B.F. Weissberger, *Isabel Rules: Constructing Queenship, Wielding Power* (Minneapolis MN, 2004), p. 31.

men and women to study the Bible for themselves⁵⁶. The one part of the Bible which the laity were allowed to read for themselves were the Psalms. There was widespread ownership by laywomen of Books of Hours, which contained at least part of the Psalter⁵⁷. While women in religious orders were certainly familiar with the Psalms, they may not have been encouraged by the male clerical establishment to undertake general Biblical or theological studies⁵⁸.

I have already argued in chapter 3 that the evidence indicates that Teresa was well educated for a woman by the standards of the day. Apart from the reference to study at Salamanca, it seems clear that she could at least read Latin and had read more than just florilegia or the more popular works of authorities such as Augustine.

Authorship and authority

Teresa's writings must be examined in the context of the late medieval understanding of 'authorship' and authority. An author, *auctor*, was a source of authority, *auctoritas*, so an *auctor* was more than a mere writer but was someone who was respected and believed. The first criterion for being regarded as an *auctor* was intrinsic worth, *auctoritas*, which meant conformity with Christian truth and links to a continuous stream of tradition. The ultimate source of *auctoritas* was God. The second criterion was authenticity, which meant that the work was the genuine product of a named writer. These criteria meant that it was almost impossible for a contemporary writer to be regarded as an *auctor*, and *auctoritas* was only acquired

⁵⁶Blamires, 'Limits of Bible Study', pp. 2-3.

⁵⁷E. Duffy, *Marking the Hours: English People and their Prayers* (New Haven, 2006), p.6.

⁵⁸Blamires, 'Limits of Bible Study', pp. 10-11.

after the writer's death.⁵⁹ It is important in considering questions of authorship in the Middle Ages to bear in mind this medieval understanding of authorship rather than the modern understanding in which the primary criterion of authorship is originality and self-expression⁶⁰.

Under the literary theory developed in the medieval universities based on Aristotelian theories of causation, primarily in connection with Biblical exegesis, God or the Holy Spirit was the 'moving' efficient cause while the human author was the 'operating' efficient cause. However, this theory of divine inspiration was not viewed as analogous to dictation to a scribe but rather God using the talents and personality of each individual human author⁶¹. The role of author was distinguished from those of scribe, compiler and commentator by the level of contribution. The scribe contributes nothing to the work, merely copying it as accurately as possible. The compiler collects or selects and arranges the works of others without adding anything of his own, while the commentator adds his explanation of the views of others and comments on them. The author contributes original material, although using authoritative statements from *auctors* as support⁶².

It followed from these high criteria for being an *auctor* that it was not easy for a medieval man to attain this status; it was virtually impossible for a woman. First, *auctoritas* was exclusively associated with Latin whereas, as discussed above, very

⁵⁹ A.J. Minnis, *Medieval Theory of Authorship: Scholastic Literary Attitudes in the Later Middle Ages* (Aldershot, 1988), pp. 10-12. This theory persisted; until recently a book could not be cited to an English court as an authoritative statement of the law unless the writer was dead.

⁶⁰ Griffiths, *Garden of Delights*, pp. 84-5. Rivera seems to have adopted the modern understanding, arguing that in *Admiración* Teresa was asserting that she was an '*autora original*', M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'La Admiración de la obras de Dios de Teresa de Cartagena y la querrela de las mujeres', in C. Segura Graiño (ed.), *La voz del silencio, I: fuentes directas para la historia de las mujeres (siglos VIII-XVIII)* (Madrid, 1992), p. 284.

⁶¹ Minnis, *Medieval Theory of Authorship*, pp. 83-4.

⁶² *Ibid.*, pp. 94-5.

few women had the opportunity to learn Latin. Even those who knew Latin were often writing for other women or for lay readers, therefore wrote in the vernacular. Second, women often wrote anonymously or under pseudonyms or their names were not included on copies, so the criterion of authenticity was not met⁶³. However, the main obstacle to authorial status was the church's ban on women teaching or having authority over men.

The first question to be addressed in examining whether Teresa de Cartagena should be considered to be an 'author' is how Teresa herself viewed her role in writing her works. The internal evidence is that she regarded herself as an author, in the sense discussed above, not as a compiler or commentator and certainly not as a scribe. At an early stage in each of the works she supplies the evidence of authenticity. In *Arboleda* she states that she is 'busying herself with this little treatise' in order to stave off idleness, that it was written with a good intention⁶⁴. In *Admiración* she authenticates both that work and the challenged *Arboleda*, referring to her offer to her patron to write, apologising for the delay in putting pen to paper and then referring to *Arboleda* as the 'treatise I wrote' and referring to a sheaf of 'rough draft papers'⁶⁵. The best evidence that she regarded herself as an author, that is as a writer providing original material supported by statements of *auctoritas* from generally accepted *auctores*, is her strong reaction in *Admiración* to those who could not believe that she had written anything original. She insists that she did not have any master other than God, that she did not consult with other learned men nor get it from other books, '*ni lo*

⁶³ J. Summit, 'Women and Authorship', in C. Dinshaw and D. Wallace (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Women's Writing* (Cambridge, 2003), p. 94.

⁶⁴ Hutton, 38:34-39:3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 25.

⁶⁵ Hutton, 111:6-114:19, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 86-8.

*trasladé de libros*⁶⁶. While *trasladé* could mean 'translate', here it is more likely to mean 'copy'; Teresa is denying that her role was merely as scribe or copyist⁶⁷. The works are not structured as a commentary and, as demonstrated in chapter 7, she was not merely commenting on the *auctores* she quoted in support because she sometimes took a different approach to that taken by the original *auctor*.

Having established that Teresa thought of herself as an author, we then have to look at how she dealt with the issue of authority. It is clear that, unlike her Hispanic contemporaries Constanza de Castilla and Isabel de Villena discussed below, she was not writing purely for her sisters in the convent, so, unlike them, she had to deal with the Church's prohibition against women teaching men. The title of her book is *Arboleda de los enfermos*, not '*las enfermas*', so Teresa is also addressing male invalids.

In this period women religious writers were much more likely than their male equivalents to base their claim to authority on their experience, while the men were more likely than the women to begin with a study of Scripture⁶⁸. Most medieval women who either wrote themselves or through a (usually male) scribe claimed authority through direct divine inspiration. Indeed, this was usually a double claim to divine authorisation; that the content was divinely inspired (or even dictated) and that the female recipient of this divine revelation had been divinely commanded to publish

⁶⁶ Hutton, 131:17-20, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 103.

⁶⁷ A. Deyermond, 'Spain's First Women Writers', in B. Miller (ed.), *Women in Hispanic Literature: Icons and Fallen Idols* (Berkeley CA, London, 1983), pp. 41-2, suggests that, as incorporation of material from authorities was usual in literary works of the time, these allegations of copying made against a woman writer showed that a double standard prevailed.

⁶⁸ Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, pp. 158-9. Jantzen explains the difference as resulting from the closure of formal higher education to women.

the revelation to others through writing⁶⁹. Those who used clerical scribes added another layer of authorisation, that of a representative of theological orthodoxy and the ecclesiastical establishment who could test the validity of the woman's claim that the content was inspired by God rather than a demonic delusion. For example, the *Book of Angela of Foligno* begins with a statement by the friar who wrote it down that it had been examined by a cardinal and several learned Franciscans and found to be orthodox⁷⁰. The same type of authorisation could be acquired by the woman being in obedience to a spiritual director and submitting her revelations to him for discernment, particularly if he then ordered her to write them down⁷¹. Teresa of Avila repeatedly uses this route to validation through obedience to her director⁷². Another characteristic of medieval women authors is that they almost all claim authority based on their experience as well as recognised *auctores*⁷³.

Taking these three forms of validation in reverse order, there is no evidence that Teresa de Cartagena used a male scribe to make the original record of her work; indeed, what internal evidence there is points to her having physically written the works herself⁷⁴. Although at end of the Escorial copy of *Arboleda* there is a statement that it was copied by Pero Lopes de Trigo, clearly male, there is no indication from the scribal introduction to either work that this individual had any role

⁶⁹ Voaden, 'God's Almighty Hand', p. 56.

⁷⁰ Angela of Foligno, *Complete Works*, trans. P. Lachance (New York NY, 1993), p. 123.

⁷¹ Voaden, 'God's Almighty Hand', pp. 62-3. Indeed, many male medieval authors also claimed that they were ordered to write in order to justify doing so, S. Flanagan, *Hildegard of Bingen, 1098-1179: A Visionary Life* (London, 1989), pp. 50-3.

⁷² R. Williams, *Teresa of Avila* (London, 1991), pp. 42-3.

⁷³ K. Greenspan, 'Autohagiography and Medieval Women's Spiritual Autobiography' in J. Chance (ed.), *Gender and Text in the Later Middle Ages* (Gainesville FL, 1996), p. 220.

⁷⁴ At the beginning of *Admiración* she refers to *Arboleda* as a 'treatise...written by my hand' (*vn tratado...mi mano escriuió*) and to the 'abovementioned sheaf of rough draft papers' (*el ya dicho bolumen de papeles borrados*). She also refers to a promise to her patron 'to write at your discretion' (*a escreuir a vuestra discreción*) and apologises for her delay in 'committing this to paper' (*de lo encomendar a la obra*).

in the original recording or composition of these works. Certainly, given the number of scribal errors remaining in this copy of her works even though there are some marginal corrections in a different hand, it seems most unlikely that Teresa had any opportunity to proof read this manuscript. She makes no reference to obedience to a spiritual director or any other form of male, clerical validation of her writings⁷⁵. Her act of writing is at best validated by being dedicated to a leading female aristocrat; while this might provide political protection against adverse effects of having presumed to write, it could not provide ecclesiastical validation of her act of writing or of what she says⁷⁶. There is no appeal to validation by divine command as she at no point claims that she was commanded by God to write. In *Arboleda* she gives as her reason for writing the need to avoid succumbing to the dangers of solitude and idleness. She also says that she hopes that God will find her writing acceptable because it was written for a good purpose⁷⁷; that statement would not make sense if she was claiming that she was writing at a specific divine command. Even in *Admiración*, written specifically to deal with criticism of her authorship, Teresa makes no claim that she wrote *Arboleda* at God's express command. The closest she comes is to say that anyone blessed by God is under a duty to use those blessings in God's service⁷⁸. This is different from the express divine commands to write found in the works of other medieval women. These commands were often initially resisted by

⁷⁵ This could be another piece of evidence that *Arboleda* was written after the death of her uncle Alonso (see chapter 3): as her bishop and a leading churchman and intellectual, his imprimatur of the work would have provided her with protection from much of the criticism she complained about in *Admiración*, and seems to have anticipated in *Arboleda* when she refers to 'my writing, which seems vexing and reprehensible to some people', Seidenspinner-Núñez, 25.

⁷⁶ Frieden thinks that Teresa chose a female dedicatee for *Admiración* because it would give her advantages in her defence against male criticism, particularly because Juana is put in the context of her marriage to the leading writer Gómez Manrique, M.E. Frieden, 'Epistolarity in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena and Leonor López de Córdoba' (Missouri-Colombia, Ph.D. thesis, 2001), pp. 57, 79.

⁷⁷ Hutton, 39:23-7, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 25.

⁷⁸ Hutton, 124:25-9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 97. Teresa's illness was not removed by the act of writing.

the woman from a sense of inadequacy, this resistance resulting in illness until she obeyed the command⁷⁹.

Teresa does, however, have things in common with these other medieval women writers. Like her, their writings often show a high level of education even though they were barred from the formal theological training of the monasteries and universities. Without that training, they were forced to use a careful examination of their experience as their route to understanding⁸⁰ just as Teresa did, but, although Teresa's experience of physical and gender disability was the basis for her writings, they could be said to be closer to the typical male style rather than that of these other women in that she makes considerable use of scriptural exegesis and patristic quotations in putting forward her arguments.

Whether she claims divine inspiration for the content of her works, as such a claim would have been generally understood in the late Middle Ages, requires more detailed consideration. While Surtz says that there is no claim of divine inspiration in *Arboleda* itself and that Teresa makes the claim retrospectively in *Admiración*⁸¹, a careful reading of *Arboleda* shows that she attributes to God the understanding of her suffering and its purpose, which she seems to have gradually arrived at over the twenty years between the onset of deafness and her writing.

⁷⁹ *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*, pp. 42-4. Teresa's illness was not cured by writing.

⁸⁰ E. Dreyer, 'Medieval Women Mystics: A Foreign World?', *Spirit and Life: A Journal of Contemporary Franciscanism*, 1 (1991), pp. 3-4.

⁸¹ Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 30.

Knowledge and divine illumination

An important question is how that understanding came to Teresa, which raises issues of medieval epistemology. At the beginning of *Arboleda* she speaks in terms of light and illumination in describing how she had come to understand the purpose behind her affliction, which she goes on to expound in the rest of the book. The same imagery occurs in her self-identification with the blind beggar of Jericho towards the end of *Admiración*. The role of divine illumination in acquisition of knowledge was an important topic in medieval philosophical discourse⁸². As discussed in chapter 5, Teresa's model of understanding through progressive divine illumination seems to resemble that of Augustine. Her writing also shows an acquaintanceship with medieval theories of how knowledge is imparted. She says that in her case this understanding provided by divine illumination was acquired through reading books, in particular the Psalter, and this statement is supported by her use of *auctoritas* throughout her writings. This context makes it almost certain that when she says that God 'alone taught me' she is not asserting that she had a sudden and direct divine revelation of the kind related by many other medieval religious women, discussed below. Instead, she is referring to Augustinian divine illumination, imparted by faith and mediated through study of the Scriptures and of *auctores*⁸³. The Church had always taught that true understanding of the Scriptures required both study and the illumination of the Holy Spirit⁸⁴.

Teresa is very clear about how men acquire knowledge; they learn from teachers who previously were themselves students learning from teachers, and so on back to the

⁸² E. Gilson, *The Spirit of Medieval Philosophy*, trans. A.H.C. Downes (London, 1936), pp. 267-8.

⁸³ J.W. Baldwin, *The Scholastic Culture of the Middle Ages, 1000-1300* (Lexington KY, 1971), pp. 86-7.

⁸⁴ H. de Lubac, *Medieval Exegesis Vol 1*, trans. M. Seban (Edinburgh, 1998), pp. 263-4.

original source of knowledge, which is God⁸⁵. By Teresa's time this teaching had become academic, located mainly in universities; she does not seem to have a high regard for such teaching, because when she is looking for a teacher of patience she rejects those who studied in Paris or Salamanca in favour of someone who practised what he taught (Job)⁸⁶. She does not accept that university teaching is the only way to learn, asserting that God can teach women by infusing their understanding, including remedying any imperfection or 'small insufficiency'⁸⁷. Again, the context suggests that here she is referring to acquisition of the same kind of learning as men, in the same way.

This is in contrast to the concept of 'infused' knowledge directly transmitted from God through visions and other forms of mystical experience⁸⁸. An example of this type of knowledge is given by Hildegard of Bingen; at the beginning of *Scivias*, her main work, she speaks of a vision of brilliant, fiery light pouring from heaven into her brain which resulted in a sudden understanding of the Scriptures⁸⁹. This infused knowledge was recognised by Bernard of Clairvaux in his letter to Hildegard, in which he speaks of her being favoured with 'hidden knowledge'⁹⁰. Angela of Foligno also speaks of

⁸⁵ Hutton, 127:2-10, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 99.

⁸⁶ Hutton, 96:20-9, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 74-5. In the late Middle Ages scholastic theology was attacked by Renaissance humanists as irrelevant to ordinary Christians, A. Levi, *Renaissance and Reform: The Intellectual Genesis* (New Haven CT, 2002), pp. 65. Teresa's view of the scholastics may have been influenced by this humanist movement as her uncle had contacts with Italian humanists and helped to bring Renaissance learning to Spain through his translations of Seneca, Cicero and Boccaccio, Serrano pp. 153, 245-7.

⁸⁷ Hutton, 115:25-116:3, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 90.

⁸⁸ A.B. Mulder-Bakker, 'The Metamorphosis of Woman: Transmission of Knowledge and the Problems of Gender', in P. Stafford and A.B. Mulder-Bakker (eds.), *Gendering the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 2001), p. 121.

⁸⁹ *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*, p.151. Newman points out that Hildegard must have been familiar with the Scriptures since childhood, so she is here talking about something more than familiarity with the texts; this had to be resolved not in terms of what she knew but how she knew, B. Newman, 'Hildegard of Bingen: Visions and Validation', *Church History*, 54 no. 2 (1985), 163-76, pp. 169-70.

⁹⁰ Bernard, *Letters of St Bernard of Clairvaux*, trans. B. James (London, 1953), p. 460.

understanding the Scriptures as the result of mystical experiences⁹¹ and the prologue to the early sixteenth century Castilian translation of her works distinguishes between two types of knowledge, that acquired through formal studies and divinely infused knowledge⁹². The difference between the two kinds of divine illumination is well illustrated by the experience of Thomas Aquinas. He spent his life building up by study and reason a body of theology and philosophy which is still of great importance, but near his death he had a mystical experience after which he wrote no more, reportedly saying that 'all I have written now seems like straw.'⁹³ The two kinds can be combined in arriving at understanding; a good example of this is Julian of Norwich, whose original visions were direct and sudden revelation but who then spent many years learning the meaning of these visions through meditation and study yielding gradual understanding⁹⁴.

Mystical experience and authority

Jantzen has traced the historical relationship between the exercise of ecclesiastical power, gender and mysticism, and concluded that, beginning with Hildegard of Bingen, in the high and late Middle Ages women claimed spiritual authority through visions and other mystical experiences⁹⁵. In order to determine what kind of claim to knowledge and authority Teresa was making, it is helpful to examine the kinds of claims to divine authority made by other medieval women who addressed themselves to male audiences. There is no way of knowing whether Teresa was familiar with the works of any of these women, although Angela of Foligno was a Franciscan and her *Book of the Experience of the Truly Faithful* was known in Spain in the fifteenth

⁹¹ Angela of Foligno, *Complete Works*, p. 214.

⁹² R.E. Surtz, *The Guitar of God: Gender, Power and Authority in the Visionary World of Mother Juana de la Cruz (1481-1534)* (Philadelphia PA, 1990), p. 2.

⁹³ R. Pasnau, *Theories of Cognition in the Later Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 1997), p. 18.

⁹⁴ *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*, p. 309.

⁹⁵ Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, p. 325.

century⁹⁶, and the works of Catherine of Siena, canonised during Teresa's lifetime, were widely disseminated. As mentioned above, Hildegard of Bingen in the twelfth century based the teachings in her works on visions and the ecclesiastic authorities agreed that they were divinely inspired⁹⁷. In the thirteenth century many women writers recounted visionary experiences as the basis of and justification for their writings: for example Hadewijch of Brabant, probably a Beguine; Mechtild of Magdebourg, a Beguine who later entered the Benedictine convent of Helfta; and nuns of that convent including Gertrude the Great⁹⁸. Angelina of Foligno's *Book* sets out her thirty steps leading to union with God, which began with a vision of St Francis and which continued with divine illumination and visions throughout⁹⁹. The fourteenth century St Catherine of Siena, equipped with the authority of the visions that she had seen since childhood, wrote her *Dialogue*, conversations with God on the Christian life, and intervened in Church politics to urge reform¹⁰⁰. Shortly after Teresa's time, the Spanish nun Juana de la Cruz asserted that she was authorised by God both to preach her 'sermons', which were directly inspired speech, and to have them written down¹⁰¹. A century later, Teresa of Avila claimed authority from direct divine revelation or revelation combined with her own insight¹⁰². Along with this claim of direct divine inspiration there usually went a statement of lack of education and intellectual ability, used both to validate the divine origin of the revelation and, often, to impliedly criticise the learning of clerics and theologians¹⁰³.

⁹⁶ Angela of Foligno, *Complete Works*, p.113.

⁹⁷ B. Newman, *Sister of Wisdom: St Hildegard's Theology of the Feminine* (Berkeley CA, 1987), pp. 9, 34-5.

⁹⁸ *Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*, pp. 174, 210.

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 237-8.

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 238-40.

¹⁰¹ Surtz, *Guitar of God*, p. 119.

¹⁰² G.T.W. Ahlgren, *Teresa of Avila and the Politics of Sanctity* (Ithaca NY, 1996), pp. 80-1.

¹⁰³ Summit, 'Women and authorship', p. 96-8.

It is clear that, although Teresa does use her experience as the basis for her teaching on suffering, there is no mention in Teresa's writings of any vision of the type described by the women discussed above. However, Rivera has described *Arboleda* as 'un itinerario místico'¹⁰⁴, Cortés wrote a book entitled *Teresa de Cartagena, primera escritora mística en lengua castellana* and Majuelo considers that *Arbolda* can be classified as a mystical work¹⁰⁵ so the issue of whether Teresa was truly a mystic (or at least whether she would have been considered a mystic by her contemporaries) must be examined. The definition of 'mystic' is of critical importance to answering this question. Cortés and Majuelo both agree that whether or not Teresa was a mystic depends on how you define that term; both think that the absence of evidence of mystical experiences such as visions, ecstasies, stigmata or levitation does not exclude Teresa from being a mystic¹⁰⁶. Rivera relies on the statement '*la idea primera que del amor se crea, es ya mística*'¹⁰⁷; this seems a very wide definition. McGinn, one of the leading contemporary scholars of the subject, states that there are three elements to mysticism; it is a part or element of religion, it is a process or way of life and it is an attempt to express a direct consciousness of God¹⁰⁸. With respect to this last element, almost all mystical writers assert that this direct consciousness of God is different from that found in ordinary consciousness, even that gained through religious rituals and prayer, in that it is more direct and at a deeper level¹⁰⁹. McGinn suggests the test for whether a person was a mystic should

¹⁰⁴ M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'Teresa de Cartagena: escritura en relación', in Á. Muñoz Fernández (ed.) *La escritura femenina: de leer a escribir II* (Madrid, 2000), p. 100.

¹⁰⁵ M. Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena. La obra de una mujer castellana del siglo XV' (Universidad del País Vasco, Ph.D. thesis, 2008), p. 458.

¹⁰⁶ Cortés, *Teresa de Cartagena*, pp. 241-6; Majuelo, 'Teresa de Cartagena,' pp. 447-50.

¹⁰⁷ M.-M. Rivera Garretas, 'Teresa de Cartagena: la infinitud del cuerpo', *Acta Historica et Archaeologica Mediaevalia*, 1, no. 20-21 (1999-2000), p. 761.

¹⁰⁸ B. McGinn, *The Foundations of Mysticism* (London, 1991), pp. xv-xvi.

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, p. xix.

be the significance of their writings in the history of Christian mysticism¹¹⁰. However Jantzen, writing a feminist history of the relationship between power, gender and mysticism, does not agree that McGinn's third element is essential, regarding the emphasis on intense psychological experiences as being a modern approach, and not considered important by the mystics themselves¹¹¹. She argues that the concept of 'mysticism' is a social construct which has changed over time¹¹². During the Middle Ages there were two strands of mysticism. One, derived from Pseudo-Dionysius, emphasised the intellect and its leading exponent was Meister Eckhard. The other, more affective and stressing love, was promoted by Bernard of Clairvaux¹¹³.

While it is clear that Teresa makes no mention of the kind of intense spiritual/psychological experience that would meet the popular modern test for a mystic, the relevant questions are whether her contemporaries would have regarded her as a mystic and whether she would have regarded herself as a mystic. It seems that women were not expected (at least, by men) to be capable of the intellectual kind of mysticism; Eckhart certainly saw his mysticism as being in opposition to the visionary female mystics of Northern Europe in the high Middle Ages¹¹⁴. This would suggest that in the late Middle Ages visions or similar experiences would be expected for a woman to be regarded as a mystic. Certainly, by the sixteenth century mystical writers commonly authorised their statements by appeal to their interior experience

¹¹⁰ Ibid., p. xv.

¹¹¹ Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, pp. 4-7. However another leading theologian of spirituality has pointed out that McGinn refers to 'consciousness', a wider term than 'experience', which includes questioning, understanding and judgement, M.A. McIntosh, *Mystical Theology: The Integrity of Spirituality and Theology* (Oxford, 1998), p. 31.

¹¹² Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, p. 12.

¹¹³ Ibid., pp. 109-10, 123

¹¹⁴ Ibid., p. 118. The definitions of mysticism adopted by Majuelo in arguing that Teresa was a mystic all appear to be of this intellectual type of mysticism, Majuelo, 'Teresa de Cartagena', pp. 446-8.

rather than to Scripture or traditional authorities¹¹⁵. It would therefore seem unlikely that Teresa's contemporaries would have regarded her as a mystic, particularly as she was first a Franciscan and then a Cistercian, and therefore a member of orders particularly associated with affective spirituality and mysticism¹¹⁶. Against this understanding of the meaning of the term, it seems most unlikely that Teresa would have regarded herself as a mystic. If she had had the type of direct experience of the divine which had become expected of at least the affective type of mysticism, it is most surprising that she made no mention of it when justifying her authorship. It is possible that her *conversa* status may have made her hesitant to discuss such experiences, but she was not in the position of Teresa of Avila who had to avoid association with the *alumbrados*.¹¹⁷ Majuelo argues that Teresa de Cartagena's experiences were mystical because she experienced God's love through her disability, and compares her to Julian of Norwich¹¹⁸. However, there are significant differences between the two women; Julian had prayed for her affliction in order to share Christ's passion and be cleansed from her sins¹¹⁹ while Teresa's was imposed on her against her will. Also, Julian's initial revelations were clearly mystical visions¹²⁰, whereas Teresa makes no mention of similar experiences. Her starting point seems to have been reading the Bible¹²¹.

¹¹⁵ McIntosh, *Mystical Theology*, pp. 67-9.

¹¹⁶ As discussed in chapter 8, there is an absence of such affective spirituality in Teresa's writing.

¹¹⁷ This illuminist reform movement, closely associated with *conversos* and condemned as heretical by the Inquisition in the sixteenth century, had not even surfaced at the time Teresa de Cartagena was writing. It emerged partly as a result of the encouragement of mysticism and personal spirituality by Archbishop Cisneros at the beginning of the sixteenth century, Ahlgren, *Politics of Sanctity*, pp. 9-13.

¹¹⁸ Majuelo, 'Teresa de Cartagena', pp. 450-1.

¹¹⁹ Julian of Norwich, *Revelations of Divine Love*, trans. Wolters, C. (London, 1966), pp. 63-4.

¹²⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 26. Majuelo seems to disagree with this general understanding of Julian's experiences, 'Teresa de Cartagena', pp. 450-1.

¹²¹ It could also be noted that Teresa's experience of God seems to be as a stern father, while Julian's was as a loving mother, Julian of Norwich, *Revelations*, p. 33.

Humility topoi

For most of the medieval women visionaries, authorship involved a suspension rather than an assertion of self-hood and they adapted the culturally available language of female humility and debasement to describe this suspension¹²². However, these 'weak woman' humility topoi were so universal they cannot be accepted at face value, particularly as they are used by women who clearly were not weak and who were ready to challenge ecclesiastical and political power, such as Hildegard, Catherine of Siena and Teresa of Avila¹²³. Jantzen suggests that women who claimed authority from divine revelations needed to proclaim their humility as proof of the validity of these revelations, with an implicit reference to the humility of the Virgin which made her a suitable receptacle of God's grace¹²⁴. Similar topoi are sometimes used by male writers and were a recognised rhetorical device¹²⁵, as well as having Biblical authorisation; Moses, Isaiah and Jeremiah all protested their inability and weakness when called by God to deliver a divine message¹²⁶. However, Greenspan thinks that for women they were more than a rhetorical convention but served to validate the truth of the women's writing and to disarm male critics¹²⁷. Obermeir¹²⁸, after an extensive examination of male auctorial self-criticism up to 1500, looks at the self-criticism in the writings of some medieval women writers (including Teresa de

¹²² Summit, 'Women and authorship', pp. 95-6.

¹²³ Newman, *Virile Woman*, pp. 25-6. Hildegard had two strategies of validation, stressing that her female weakness showed God's power and emphasising the feminine aspects of the divine, Newman, *Sister of Wisdom*, p. 35. Teresa uses the first but not the second. Jantzen suggests that female imagery for God was suppressed in the late medieval and early modern period, *Power, Gender*, p. 299.

¹²⁴ Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, p. 170.

¹²⁵ There are examples in the writings of Teresa's male relatives. Alonso de Cartagena ends his *Oracional* by referring to it as '*este breve e flaco tractado*', A. de Cartagena, *Oracional* ed. S. González-Quevedo, (Valencia, 1983), p. 197) and Fray Íñigo de Mendoza at the start of his poem on the Last Supper asks God to '*Da fuerças a mi flaqueza/a mis desdones donaire/discepción a mi simpleza*', *Fray Íñigo de Mendoza: Cancionero*, p. 163.

¹²⁶ Ex. 3:11; Is. 6:5; Jer. 1:6.

¹²⁷ Greenspan, 'Autohagiography', p. 221. She also suggests that they are essential to autohagiography so that the writer is not seen as claiming sanctity for him or herself, *ibid.*, p. 224.

¹²⁸ A. Obermeier, *The History and Anatomy of Auctorial Self-Criticism in the European Middle Ages* (Amsterdam, 1999).

Cartagena). She finds clear gender differences; in particular, men generally used humility topoi in order to apologise to God for youthful indiscretions while women used them to placate male hierarchies. A major reason for male self-criticism was fear of God, whereas women enlisted God as their inspiration and ally¹²⁹. One exception to this use of self-criticism is Marguerite Porete: her book is not only free from humility topoi, but the personifications who in the dialogue put forward her ideas and criticise aspects of the teachings and practice of the Catholic church are often invested with an arrogance which must have contributed to the undoubted clerical hatred for the book, leading to her death at the stake and an attempt to destroy all copies¹³⁰.

It is instructive to examine where Teresa uses humility topoi in her works, as this sheds some light on how sincere were these protestations. There are three in the opening section of *Arboleda*; opening in such a way was at that time a recognised rhetorical technique for use in letter writing and preaching as a way of gaining the goodwill of the addressees¹³¹. In the next section each of her two main exegetical comments on Ps. 44:11 is introduced by a brief disparagement of her intellect. The next humility topos does not occur until she introduces the topic of patience, then there are two in close succession at the beginning of her lengthy discussion of the five talents. The next, a brief reference to her 'simplicity', is at the beginning of the section on the 'bad spiritual humours'. The beginning of the section on the 'Master of Patiences', Job, contains a reference to her 'coarse womanly judgement' and lack of authority. Another in that section refers to her 'simple sayings', but the longest and

¹²⁹ Ibid., pp. 251-64.

¹³⁰ P. Dronke, *Women Writers of the Middle Ages: A Critical Study of Texts from Perpetua to Marguerite Porete* (Cambridge, 1984), pp. 217, 226.

¹³¹ J.J. Murphy, *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages: A History of Rhetorical Theory from Saint Augustine to the Renaissance* (Berkeley CA, 1974), p. 308.

fullest disparagement of her knowledge and understanding, which contains the reference to her studies at Salamanca, comes at the beginning of the section giving primacy among the virtues to patience. I have suggested in chapter 4 that this is inserted here because she knows that, in making patience the pre-eminent virtue, she is going against all *auctoritas*. In *Admiración*, as might be expected from the context, she begins with six statements of female intellectual inadequacy in quick succession. However, once she warms to her theme these become much more widely spaced; there are only two more in the rest of the work. Even though she is discussing the general theme of how God can impart knowledge even to simple women (and, she adds, simple men) she does not make this personal to herself. The overall effect of Teresa's use of these humility topoi gives the strong impression she is using them as conventional rhetorical devices at the beginning of each work and to introduce a new topic, but that she did not really believe that she was intellectually inferior to the men who criticised her writing¹³². For example, in the part of *Admiración* where she is arguing that God is able to give a woman the ability to write, she says:

'...He who could infuse the understanding of men with knowledge can thus infuse the understanding of women, even though our understanding may be imperfect or not as able to receive or retain knowledge as that of males. For God's divine greatness can readily repair this imperfection and small insufficiency and even remove it completely and give perfection and ability to female understanding just as to male...'¹³³

¹³² Corry's analysis of Teresa's humility topoi comes to the same conclusion: 'While her humble disclaimers appear to impart a genuine sense of inferiority, they have, rather, the opposite effect; she not only mocks those who believe women inferior with these statements, but also challenges her judges to transcend their pride in order to be able to perceive and value Teresa's intelligence, competence and contribution to society.' J.M. Corry, 'Some Observations on Teresa de Cartagena's Humble Disclaimers', *Quaderni Ibero-Americani*, 95 (2004), 5-14, p. 7. Cruz's contrary conclusion, that Teresa did not question the inferiority attributed to women, seems to be based on accepting the topoi at face value without any analysis of how Teresa used them, M. Cruz Muriel Tapia, *Antifeminismo y subestimación de la mujer en la literatura medieval castellana* (Caceres, 1991), pp. 277-83.

¹³³ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 90; '*...ca el que pudo e puede enxerir las çiençias en el entendimiento de los onbres, [puede] sy quiere enxerirlas en el entendimiento de las mugeres avnque sea ynperfecto o non tan ábile ni sufiçiente para las reçibir ni retener como el entendimiento de los varones. Ca esta ynperfiçión e pequeña <e> sufiçiençia pu[é] dela muy [bien] reparar la grand[eza] divina e avn quitarla del todo e dar pe[r]fiçión e abilidad en el entendimiento fimíneo asý como en el varonil...'* Hutton, 115:29-116:1.

Teresa clearly regarded any imperfection of women's understanding as being minor ('small insufficiency', '*pequeña suficiencia*') and entirely removable; as this statement is made in connection with the activity of writing books which she had undertaken, it suggests that she believed she had obtained this male level of understanding.

Gender roles

As discussed in chapter 5, in *Admiración* part of Teresa's defence of her authorship involves an examination of the different roles of men and women. Medieval thought provided a number of contrasts between male and female, expressed by Bynum¹³⁴ as 'intellect/body, active/passive, rational/irrational, reason/emotion, self-control/lust, judgment/mercy and order/disorder.' These roles justified educating men and giving them active roles in the world, while women were generally given only a basic education and limited to passive domestic or religious roles, confined to the house or convent. Teresa uses this active/passive, external/internal model but subtly modifies it to aid her argument, using two different images.

The first image is of a man with a sword in his hand bravely facing a charging bull as opposed to a woman shrinking from a mouse near her skirts. Rather than the rational or emotional superiority generally attributed to males, Teresa selects physical courage as the pre-eminent male characteristic. She may well have been familiar with her uncle's Castilian translation of Boccaccio's *De claris mulieribus*, in which many of the women he praises were notable for their physical courage, even taking up arms in defence of family or state. This may suggest that Teresa did not actually believe that

¹³⁴C.W. Bynum, "'...and Woman his Humanity': Female Imagery in the Religious Writing of the Late Middle Ages", in C.W. Bynum, S. Harrell, and P. Richman (eds.), *Gender and Religion: On the Complexity of Symbols* (Boston, 1986), p. 257.

courage was the pre-eminent male virtue, nor that women generally lacked it¹³⁵, but that she deliberately selected this characteristic to set up her argument based on the story of Judith (see chapter 5). This relationship between 'normal' female timidity and Judith also appears in the *Jardín de nobles donzellas* written by Fray Martín de Córdoba at the end of the 1460's. This book was addressed to Isabella, who was at that time about to marry Ferdinand. The version of the story of Judith occurs in the section of the book where Fray Martín has urged Isabella to be a strong queen despite the normally weak and timorous nature of women¹³⁶.

Teresa's second image is bark and medulla, outer and inner. The male is equated to the bark, because as being strong and valiant he acts on the outside to protect. The female, weak and timid, is the medulla, which provides support and nurture to the protecting bark. The symbiotic relationship between men and women is as essential to the continuance of the human race as that between bark and medulla is to the life of the tree. As mentioned in chapter 5, Teresa's use of this image subtly reverses the conventional view of the external bark as being fleshly, thus feminine, while the central core is equated to the spiritual which is masculine. By bringing out the mutuality of the respective male and female roles¹³⁷, she also undermines the misogynist view that women were not only inferior but also a positive menace to men.

¹³⁵ However Hildegard regarded timidity as a female attribute, although she tried to correlate this to the Biblical 'fear of the Lord', B. Newman, 'Divine Power Made Perfect in Weakness: St. Hildegard on the Frail Sex', in J.A. Nichols and L.T. Shank (eds.), *Medieval Religious Women: Peaceweavers* (Kalamazoo MI, 1987), pp 106-7.

¹³⁶ H. Goldberg, *Jardín de Nobles Donzellas, Fray Martin de Córdoba: A Critical Edition and Study* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1974), pp.111, 247-9.

¹³⁷ Something also done by Hildegard of Bingen, F. Beer, *Women and Mystical Experience in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge, 1992), p. 41.

Teresa's third source for gender roles is the Bible, the creation story of Genesis 2. This states that woman was created to be man's helpmeet. Teresa's comment is that you could argue 'whether the helped or the helper has the greater strength, and you could clearly see what reason would respond.' She clearly realised how dangerous it was to say this, as she hastily added that such arguments were worldly and vain and that the important thing was for both women and men to praise God¹³⁸. Although she acknowledges God-created differences between the genders in abilities and roles, Teresa insists that this is not because God prefers one sex to the other but because he has some secret purpose¹³⁹. In support of her contention that God treats both sexes equally she quotes Rom. 2:11¹⁴⁰. This view of equality in divine regard is not Teresa's alone; for example, Hildegard of Bingen appealed to the idea that God had created men and women with equal dignity¹⁴¹. Teresa also cites the Bible as proof that God is able to reverse gender roles, namely the story of Judith. Judith often featured in lists of admirable women in pro-feminist literature of the *Querrela*. However, the male writers of such literature tended to stress Judith's status as a widow living in seclusion and her modesty and chastity, while ignoring the Biblical accounts of her oratory which criticised the male leaders of her community to their faces for their pusillanimity and lack of faith (Judith 8:11-27) and, after the death of Holofernes, giving military orders to her townsmen (Judith 14:1-5)¹⁴². Although Teresa does not expressly refer to Judith's speeches, there is a clear implied reference when she draws the conclusion from the story of Judith that 'clearly it is more within the reach of a woman to be eloquent than strong'¹⁴³.

¹³⁸ Hutton, 118:19-34, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 92.

¹³⁹ Hutton, 116:9-17, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 90-1.

¹⁴⁰ "No es allegamiento de personas acerca de Dios", Hutton, 120:35-6, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 94.

¹⁴¹ Cortés, *Teresa de Cartagena*, pp. 190-1.

¹⁴² E.T. Howe, *Education and Women in the Early Modern Hispanic world* (Aldershot, 2008), p. 22.

¹⁴³ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 93.

There are other, subtle, inversions of conventional gender stereotypes in Teresa's writing. Using a bilingual title for her second work with a vernacular first word and the other two Latin is subversive, as is her use of Latin quotations in *Arboleda*, because by her time learning Latin was the distinguishing characteristic of male education¹⁴⁴. In her use of the story of the blind beggar in *Admiración* she even appropriates to her own mouth the Latin words of the beggar's response¹⁴⁵. Less subtly, she states that everyone 'men and women alike' are called rational creatures¹⁴⁶, going against the male/rational, female/irrational gender stereotypes.

Looked at in context, *Admiración* must be considered as a 'feminist' work in the broadest sense. Surtz¹⁴⁷ regards this as very circumscribed feminism, but he is looking at it in a modern context when he says that Teresa does not support the right of all women to express themselves in writing¹⁴⁸. Given that she was a *conversa* writing at a time when all New Christians were viewed with suspicion and that she did not have any apparent male clerical approval for what she wrote, even her subtle subverting of accepted norms was daring. While *Admiración* deals with a specifically female issue, *Arboleda* is addressed to all sufferers, male and female. It could be described as feminist in that Teresa does not use any of the medieval approaches to suffering particularly used by women discussed in chapter 8. *Arboleda* also comments obliquely on the patriarchal family; in her exposition of Ps. 44:11 Teresa

¹⁴⁴D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'El solo me leyó': Gendered hermeneutics and subversive poetics in *Admiración operum Dey* of Teresa de Cartagena', *Medievalia*, 15 (1993), 14-23, p. 17.

¹⁴⁵Hutton, 133:20, Seidenspinner-Núñez, p. 104; Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 37.

¹⁴⁶Hutton, 134:25-6, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 106.

¹⁴⁷R.E. Surtz, 'El llamado feminismo de Teresa de Cartagena', in *Studia hispanica medievalia: IV Jornadas internacionales de literatura Española medieval* (Buenos Aires, 1993), p. 204.

¹⁴⁸Care must be taken in reading medieval writers to avoid the individualist perspectives introduced by the Enlightenment and modern psychology. For example, Rivera talks about Teresa coming to self-knowledge and discusses gender differences in the light of modern feminist writers such as Luce Irigaray, Rivera, '*Admiración* y la querrela de las mujeres', pp. 290-3.

speaks about the commandment 'Honour thy father' in terms of love and obedience but later talks about parental rejection of sickly children. Teresa seems to have had strong feelings about fathers, but not necessarily close or emotional ones¹⁴⁹.

Teresa's views of the relationship between male and female roles and of female abilities may have roots in the historical period and community in which she lived. If, as discussed in chapter 3, *Admiración* dates from the late 1470's, then it was written during the early years of the reign of Isabella as queen of Castile. In most medieval European kingdoms women could not rule in their own right although they could exercise power as a wife, widow or mother of a king. While Castile did allow a woman to inherit the throne, she could only do so if there were no male heirs and the preceding woman to rule in her own right (as opposed to being the queen mother during a minority) had been in the early twelfth century¹⁵⁰. When Isabella seized power on the death of her half brother Enrique IV by being declared queen by a ceremony in Segovia, there was scandal because she was preceded in the procession by a retainer carrying the unsheathed sword of state although Isabella's husband was not present¹⁵¹. The sword was the main masculine symbol of power, a typology we see reflected in Teresa's writing. It was also a symbol of the principal royal function of doing justice. Further, the Spanish custom was to hold the sword upright by the point, thus forming a cross and invoking the particular role of Spanish Christian

¹⁴⁹ D.S. Ellis, 'Unifying Imagery in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena', *Journal of Hispanic Philology*, 17 (1992), 45-53pp. 46-7.

¹⁵⁰ Weissberger, *Isabel Rules*, p. 32. Although at the time of her accession Isabella was married to Ferdinand, then heir to the throne of Aragon, the agreement negotiated by their representatives at Segovia made it clear that Isabella was the queen of the kingdom of Castile, entitled to exercise on her own the powers that went with that position, and that the throne would pass to her heirs, rather than to Ferdinand and his heirs, J. Edwards, *The Spain of the Catholic Monarchs: 1474-1520* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 21-2.

¹⁵¹ J. Edwards, *Ferdinand and Isabella* (Harlow, 2005), p. 3.

monarchs in waging holy war against the Moslems¹⁵². Thus this sword symbolised a number of royal characteristics which in that society were exclusively associated with male rulers¹⁵³. Weissberger in *Isabel Rules* demonstrates how Isabella had to construct an image of royal power in the face of the prevailing misogynist outlook and male anxiety about the exercise of power by a woman, in the same way that Elizabeth I of England had to do in the next century. One pro-Isabella approach was to compare her to the Virgin Mary, bringing salvation to her troubled country¹⁵⁴. Isabella encouraged the royalist theories of the *letrados*, and at the start of her reign she was the subject of adulatory literature building up her image as a monarch, much of it written by *conversos*¹⁵⁵. It is interesting to note that the two advice treatises which Weissberger selects as being the most likely to have influenced Isabella¹⁵⁶ were written by Gómez Manrique, a leading counsellor to Isabella and the husband of Teresa's patron Juana de Mendoza, and by Teresa's nephew Fray Iñigo de Mendoza, who was the queen's royal preacher and almoner (who also compared Isabella to the Virgin¹⁵⁷). One can speculate that Teresa may have been emboldened in her defence of women's position and authorship by these influential connections to the queen and by Isabella's evident exercise of power.

¹⁵² P. Liss, 'Isabel of Castile (1451-1504), Her Self-Representation and Its Context', in T. Earenfight (ed.) *Queenship and Political Power in Medieval and Early Modern Spain* (Aldershot, 2005), p. 121. As discussed above (pp. 210-11), in Spain Mary was regarded as the patroness of the *reconquista* and Spanish armies went to war under the banner of *Santa María de las Batallas*, so Isabella's use of the symbolic sword also connects her to the Virgin, *ibid.*, p. 122.

¹⁵³ Alfonso de Palencia, a chronicler close to Ferdinand, states that Ferdinand was critical of this action of Isabella because there was no precedent for a queen, as opposed to a king, to act in this way, E.A. Leffeldt, 'The Gender of Shared Sovereignty: Texts and the Royal Marriage of Isabella and Ferdinand', in M.V. Vicente and L.R. Corteguera (eds.), *Women, Texts, and Authority in the Early Modern Spanish World* (Aldershot, 2003), pp. 39-40.

¹⁵⁴ Edwards, *Ferdinand and Isabella*, p.140. One such comparison was made by Martín de Córdoba, who also urged Isabella to preserve her virginity, *ibid.*, pp. 5-6. Of course, unlike the English protestant queen who made a political cult of her virginity, Isabella did not (and for dynastic reasons could not) do so.

¹⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 139-42.

¹⁵⁶ Weissberger, *Isabel Rules*, pp. 55-67.

¹⁵⁷ Edwards, *Spain of the Catholic Monarchs*, p. 40.

Teresa may well also have been influenced by the religious communities she was part of. We know that Teresa began her religious life as a Poor Clare, and the Order's founder, Saint Clare, was celebrated as being a courageous, intelligent and tenacious woman. One story Teresa would have known is how Clare protected her sisters when the convent was under threat from an invading army. She would also have known that Clare was the first woman to write a rule which was accepted by the Church authorities, and that, after a long struggle, she wrested from the Pope the right to absolute poverty¹⁵⁸. If it was to Las Huelgas that Teresa moved in 1449, she thereafter lived in a female community of considerable influence. It was the pre-eminent Cistercian convent in Spain, giving its abbess rights of visitation over the other Cistercian convents and the ability to convene synods¹⁵⁹. The Lordship of Las Huelgas, over which the abbess had civil and criminal jurisdiction, was extensive and extended from Burgos in all directions. The only woman in Spain more powerful than the abbess of Las Huelgas was the queen¹⁶⁰. The abbess, who in Teresa's time was elected for life, also appointed priests to parishes in her lordship and chaplains to the Hospital del Rey, which was controlled by Las Huelgas. The abbess during Teresa's early years in the convent, Doña María de Guzmán (elected December 1436, died March 1457), sacked the Comendador of the Hospital after an investigation disclosed wrongdoing, and when he failed to comply with her orders they were confirmed by the Vatican. She also successfully resisted attempts to take over a daughter convent by monks from another foundation in the name of reform¹⁶¹. This abbess must have been a powerful example to the nuns under her rule that a woman could have the ability to operate successfully in a male world.

¹⁵⁸ *Francis and Clare: The Complete Works* trans. and eds. R.J. Armstrong and I.C. Brady, (Mahwah, N.J., 1982), pp. 171-3.

¹⁵⁹ J.M. Escrivá de Balaguer, *La abadesa de Las Huelgas* (Madrid, 1944), pp. 62-6.

¹⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 41-2.

¹⁶¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 104-6, 215-6.

Teresa and the *querella de las mujeres*

Teresa must have been aware of the literary debate pro and anti women going on in her time because her uncle and her nephew contributed to it, one on either side. In one place in *Admiración* Teresa does use imagery which is commonly found in the misogynist works discussed above (p. 209), namely that of the gadding woman. She likens the powers of a soul which has become confused through dissolution of the physical senses to women who neglect their household duties to go wandering through the area visiting neighbours¹⁶². A number of scholars have considered whether Teresa's works should be considered as part of the *querella de las mujeres*. In modern times Teresa was first mentioned in connection with the *querella* by Hutton, who saw the rehabilitation of women as an essential issue in her life and works¹⁶³. Rivera looked at *Admiración* in the context of the *querella*, using a modern feminist historical analysis, and regarded it as a defence of women in general so it could be regarded as participating in the debate¹⁶⁴. Ochoa believes that Teresa's motives for writing *Admiración* were much wider than just participating in the *querella*¹⁶⁵, while Castro does not regard it as a defence of women in general¹⁶⁶. While Teresa's motive for writing *Admiración* clearly was to defend herself, that defence takes the form of general statements about the power of God to give women intellectual abilities equal

¹⁶² Hutton, 138:16-139:23, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 109-10. Ellis contrasts this image to the image of the home in *Arboleda* as a well-ordered patriarchal space, Ellis, 'Unifying Imagery,' p. 53.

¹⁶³ Hutton, p.12.

¹⁶⁴ Rivera, '*Admiración* y la *querella de las mujeres*', pp. 284, 288. She also puts up a spirited defence of Teresa against dismissive and condescending comments by some modern male writers, *ibid.*, pp. 285-8.

¹⁶⁵ M. Ochoa de Eribe, 'El yo polémico de Teresa de Cartagena en la *Admiración* de las obras de Dios: las argucias del débil por entrar en el canon', *Letras de Deusto*, 29 (1999), p. 188.

¹⁶⁶ C. Castro Ponce, 'Teresa de Cartagena: *Arboleda de las Enfermas, Admiración Operum Dei, edición crítica singular*' (Brown Univ., Ph.D. thesis, 2001), p. 18. Both Castro and Rivera point out parallels between the writings of Christine de Pizan and Teresa. There is no evidence that Christine's works were known to Teresa, although Christine's fame as a writer was beginning in Paris in the final years of the fourteenth century when Pablo de Santa María was at the University of Paris and then at the papal court in Avignon, C.C. Willard, *Christine de Pizan: Her Life and Works* (New York NY, 1984), p. 51.

to those of men. To that extent, the work could be considered to participate in the *querella*, although there is no express intention on Teresa's part to do so.

Teresa's theology of gender

The main argument Teresa makes in *Admiración* in support of her authorship is that it is a gift bestowed by God, with the clear implication that He does not discriminate between men and women. Indeed, she says that:

'...God gives graciously to whomever he pleases, for with blessings of grace it is not fitting to scrutinize or judge the condition of the person - male or female - nor the disposition and ability of his intellect, whether very capable or totally insufficient, nor the merit of his deeds, whether he is righteous or a very great sinner. For divine grace surpasses and exceeds all this and more and abundantly fills the blank spaces of our defects.'¹⁶⁷

She also quotes Paul as saying 'God has no favourites'¹⁶⁸ (Ro. 2:11). Although Paul makes that statement in respect of Jews and Gentiles, elsewhere he adds to the list of lack of distinction in Christ between slaves and freemen and 'male and female' (Gal. 3:28). This text from Galatians was a foundation text for her uncle's defence of *conversos*¹⁶⁹, discussed in chapter 10; this raises a question why Teresa did not quote it herself in her argument that there is no divine discrimination against women. It may be that the Jew/Gentile part of this verse had become so associated with the arguments against anti-*converso* legislation that the other pairings of slave/free and

¹⁶⁷ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 96. '*...Dios da graçiosamente a quien le plazze, ca en éstos no conviene escadruñar nin aver respecto al estado de la persona, que sea varón o enbra; ni a la dispusyçión e abilidad del entendimiento, que sea muy capaz o del todo ynsuficiente; ni al mérito de las obras, que sea justo o muy grand pecador. Ca todo esto o más desto sobra e eçede la graçia divina e hinche muy abundantamente los logares vazios de nuestras defetuositydades.*' Hutton, 123:36-124:4.

¹⁶⁸ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 94. "*No es allegamiento de personas açerca de Dios.*" Hutton 120:35-6.

¹⁶⁹ J. Edwards, 'The *Conversos*: A Theological Approach', in *Religion and Society in Spain. c.1492* (Aldershot, 1996), ch. I, pp. 40-1.

male/female were overlooked, or perhaps the increasing hostility to *conversos* at the time Teresa was writing made her uncomfortable about relying on the verse.

Teresa's description of the creation of human beings is clearly based on Genesis 2, because she says that: 'This most powerful Creator made the male sex first and the female second and adjunct to the male.'¹⁷⁰ The creation story in Genesis 1 gives no hint of sequential creation of men and then women (Gen. 1:26-7)¹⁷¹. However, it is clear that she does not accept that this creation story establishes that women are intended to be inferior to men. She does say that woman is to be the 'helpmeet of man' (*ayudadora del varón*)¹⁷² quoting Gen. 2:18, but clearly does not think this denotes inferiority on the part of the woman, given her comment that it is arguable whether helped or helper is stronger. Tribble points out that the Hebrew word translated 'helper' in English ('adiutor' in the Vulgate) carries no connotation of subordination and is often used to describe God, and that a better translation would be 'companion'¹⁷³. Teresa also stresses that, although the differences between men and women were created by God, this was not to make women inferior but for the mutual help and preservation of both men and women. Against this it might be argued that Teresa specifically speaks about her inferiority. However, as discussed above, this occurs in the context of humility tropes which I believe can all be explained as carefully placed rhetorical devices and as conventional in medieval writing, particularly that of women.

¹⁷⁰ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 90. '*Este potentísimo Hazedor hizo el sexu beril primeramente, e segunda e por adjutorio de aquél fizo al fimíneo.*' Hutton, 116:12-14.

¹⁷¹ While it is still generally believed that Genesis 2 teaches a sequential creation of the two sexes, the Old Testament scholar Phyllis Tribble argues that, until the creation of Eve in Gen. 2:21-4, the Hebrew word generally translated as 'man' in fact means 'earth-creature' and is sexually neutral. Only when the woman is brought forth are Hebrew words for gendered male and female used, so here as well as in Genesis 1 there is simultaneous creation of the two genders, Tribble, *Rhetoric of Sexuality*, pp. 80, 97-9.

¹⁷² Seidenspinner-Núñez, 92, Hutton, 118:19.

¹⁷³ Tribble, *Rhetoric of Sexuality*, p. 90.

Some of Teresa's silences also give information about her theology of gender. Interestingly, given her culture and circumstances, the only mention Teresa makes of the Virgin is when describing the invalid's lack of wit as he moans, '*¡[ay] cabeça, ay estómago, ay Santa María, ay Sant Pedro!*'¹⁷⁴. There is no hint of any consideration of the role of the Virgin either in Teresa's own life and suffering or in her defence of female authority. Given the portrayal of the Virgin in almost all medieval literature, including both pro and anti-women Spanish *querella de las mujeres* literature discussed above, as being silent, humble and submissive, it is hardly surprising that Teresa makes no reference to her in *Admiración*. Medieval women writers tended to largely ignore Mary as a model and stressed the imitation of Christ¹⁷⁵. The lack of mention in *Arboleda* is perhaps more surprising given the late medieval stress on the suffering of the Virgin and her help to sufferers. This will be examined further in the next chapter. Similarly, there is no mention of the Virgin's antitype, Eve, or of original sin. Given the use of Eve by Church authorities to condemn all women and to require their silence, the absence of Eve from Teresa's writings is understandable. Although the sin which Teresa believed was the reason why God caused her to become deaf was one particularly regarded as female, namely gossip and excessive love of conversation, her teachings about suffering in *Arboleda* are directed to both sexes so she does not seem to have a gendered view of sin. Another absence is that of bridal imagery, so prevalent in the writings and spirituality of women in the High and Late Middle Ages¹⁷⁶. This is particularly interesting because one of Teresa's key texts in *Arboleda*, Psalm 44:11, is taken from a psalm which, together with the Song of Songs, was the basis for this imagery. It may be because this imagery was closely

¹⁷⁴ Hutton, 77:28-9.

¹⁷⁵ Bynum, *Fragmentation*, p. 153.

¹⁷⁶ Jantzen, *Power, Gender*, pp. 133-4.

associated with affective mysticism and, as discussed above, there is no trace of such mysticism in Teresa's writings.

In conclusion, Teresa's theology of gender stresses the equality before God of women and men. Although gender differences are real (and the differences she discusses are those of society as well as biology), they were part of God's plan of creation but do not connote superiority of men over women nor domination by one sex over the other.

Other contemporary Spanish religious female writers

In order to see Teresa de Cartagena's writings in context, they can be compared with those of other contemporary Spanish female religious writers. Two, Constanza de Castilla and Isabel de Villena, wrote before the likely date for the composition of Teresa's works but there is no evidence that she had any access to the works of either of them. They were both high born, well-educated women who wrote their works themselves. The works of the third, Juana de la Cruz, date from the first decade of the sixteenth century. Unlike Teresa, Constanza and Isabel, Juana was of peasant stock and a visionary, and her ecstatic sermons were recorded by other members of her community.

Constanza de Castilla (?-1478)

Constanza was a granddaughter of Pedro I. After Enrique Trastámara murdered Pedro, his son Juan fled to asylum in Gascony but was handed back as part of the agreement for the 1388 marriage of Enrique's heir to Catherine of Lancaster. Juan was then imprisoned for the rest of his life. In prison he married his gaoler's daughter and fathered a son and Constanza. Being legitimate heirs of Pedro meant they were both a potential danger to the Trastámara dynasty. Catherine of Lancaster persuaded her

husband to pardon them and allow the son to become a priest while Constanza entered the Dominican convent of Santa Domingo el Real in Madrid in 1406. Constanza remained in contact with the queen, and within a decade had become prioress, a post she retained until old age, retiring in 1465¹⁷⁷. She wrote a collection of prayers, liturgies and devotional works¹⁷⁸, some of which she compiled from other sources but for others she uses language indicating that she claims authorship¹⁷⁹. The internal evidence indicates that these were intended for a female audience, presumably the nuns of her convent¹⁸⁰. She authenticates the works by references to herself as '*Yo, Constança*', and these self-references serve to assert her authority as royalty¹⁸¹ and as leader, protector and teacher of the nuns of her convent. She does not assert direct divine authority, but submits to the authority of the Church, and Surtz argues that Constanza seems to rely for authority on following the example of the Virgin as a woman who broke with tradition¹⁸². She does use humility topoi, but these emphasize her status as sinner, one equally shared with men, rather than as a woman¹⁸³. The works place considerable emphasis on the sufferings of Christ and of the Virgin¹⁸⁴. In places Constanza imitates Mary by assuming the Virgin's mediatory role and interceding for the souls of her ancestors¹⁸⁵.

¹⁷⁷ Surtz, *Writing Women*, pp. 41-4.

¹⁷⁸ Some of the liturgies are in Latin and other works are translated from Latin into Castilian, indicating that Constanza was literate in both languages, *ibid.*, p. 46.

¹⁷⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 45, 47-9.

¹⁸⁰ *Ibid.*, pp.46, 49.

¹⁸¹ Although in this context there is nothing to indicate her rank, which was a conventional attitude of humility, in official documents she named herself as royal and prioress, *ibid.*, p.49.

¹⁸² D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'But I suffer not a woman to teach': two women writers in late-medieval Spain', in C. Davies and J. Whetnall (eds.), *Hers Ancient and Modern: Women's Writing in Spain and Brazil* (Manchester, 1997), p. 7, Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 56.

¹⁸³ Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 44-5.

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 52-5. Surtz also points out that Constanza chose to transcribe and translate apocryphal letters of Ignatius which include a letter to the Virgin and her reply, *ibid.*, pp. 50-2.

¹⁸⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Two women writers', p. 7.

Isabel de Villena (1430-90)

Isabel was an illegitimate daughter of the noble Villena family, educated at court. She entered the Valencian Santa Trinitat convent, a house of Poor Clares, at the age of 15 and at age 33 was elected abbess. She wrote a *Vita Christi* in Catalan¹⁸⁶ for her sisters. This work contains no claim of divine inspiration, no command to write by God or by a male confessor, and no humility topoi¹⁸⁷. Although some commentators have considered that she was responding to the anti-feminist works current in Valencia, Twomey argues from the content of the work that it was written for a female readership, her sisters, and was intended to build up the spiritual life of the community¹⁸⁸. In this context, the absence of these conventional markers of claims to authority by female authors who know they are addressing male audiences is less surprising than appears at first. Barnett compares Villena's version of the Visitation with that in Luke's Gospel and in three male-authored *Vitas* and concludes that Villena makes the text authoritative by putting her words into Mary's mouth, which provided her sisters with an authoritative, learned yet accessible role-model not found in the equivalent works by men¹⁸⁹. This meant that Villena gave Mary a great deal to say, including non-Biblical, male-authored liturgical texts¹⁹⁰, thus undermining the characteristics of passivity, humility and silence for which the Virgin was generally praised by male authors.

¹⁸⁶ All quotations, whether Scriptural or Patristic, are given first in Latin, followed by a translation into Catalan, indicating that Isabel knew Latin. Barnett suggests that the Latin was included because this was written for nuns, some of whom would have learned some Latin and all of whom would have been familiar with sound of the Latin texts from their recitation of the Office, D. Barnett, 'The Voice of the Virgin: Accessible Authority in the Visitation Episode of Isabel de Villena's *Vita Christi*', *La Corónica*, 35 no. 1 (2006), 23-45, pp. 32-3.

¹⁸⁷ L.K. Twomey, 'Sor Isabel de Villena, her *Vita Christi* and an Example of Gendered Immaculist Writing in the Fifteenth Century', *La Corónica*, 32 no. 1 (2003), 89-103, pp.89-91. However, a preface and concluding text written by Isabel's successor for the first printed edition in 1497 did contain claims of divine inspiration and praise for Isabel's humility, *ibid.*, pp. 91-2.

¹⁸⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 102.

¹⁸⁹ Barnett, 'Voice of the Virgin', p. 38.

¹⁹⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 32, 36-7.

Juana de la Cruz (1481-1534)

Juana was born in 1481 to peasant farmers in the Toledo area. At fifteen she ran away in male disguise to avoid marriage, and entered the convent of Santa María de la Cruz in Cubas, a house of Franciscan third order regulars. She was said to have experienced visions from a very early age, and as a nun she was distinguished for her asceticism and raptures. In her mystical experiences she would speak out loud words she believed came straight from the Holy Spirit, which she called sermons. There are two extant manuscript copies of those delivered in the liturgical year 1508-9 and written down by her nuns, known as *El libro del conorte*¹⁹¹. She was elected abbess in 1509, and in the following year Cardinal Cisneros, the archbishop of Toledo and inquisitor-general of Castile, annexed the parish of Cubas to the convent and gave the abbess the privilege of appointing the parish priest. Despite Cisneros' position as head of the Spanish church, this grant was strongly opposed by male clergy as giving women authority over men contrary to Church teachings¹⁹². Juana did not meekly give in, but instead obtained a papal bull confirming her choice of candidate¹⁹³.

Juana claimed that the words she spoke were not hers but God's; she likened herself to a flute or trumpet blown by the breath of God. The trumpet was often used as a medieval symbol of preaching, which was reserved exclusively to men. Juana through her mystical experiences thus claims both the masculine role of preacher (hence naming her discourses 'sermons') as well as the more feminine role of visionary. There is no mention of a confessor or other male authority figure

¹⁹¹ Surtz, *Writing Women*, pp. 104-5.

¹⁹² The abbess of Las Huelgas had such authority (see above p. 235) but this was a special case.

¹⁹³ Surtz, *Guitar of God*, pp. 4-5. For this action she was denounced by her assistant superior and was forced to stand down for a while, being reinstated when her accuser fell ill and confessed.

validating her visions¹⁹⁴. She expressly justified her words, in particular her addition of details to or even variations on Bible stories, by attributing them to the Holy Spirit and says that God ordered that her sermons be written down. Her ecclesiastical superiors also ordered that Juana's revelations be recorded¹⁹⁵. Her companions asked that the book containing her works should be examined by the authorities, saying that any mistake could not be attributed to the Holy Spirit but must have been caused by the transcribers¹⁹⁶. There are no humility topoi; not unexpected as she is claiming these are not her words but God's. Her sermon on the creation story sheds light on her view of gender roles. This sermon varies a great deal from that found in Genesis, and Surtz points out that, although on the surface it appears to confirm the traditional view that the story justifies the subordination of women to men, looked at more carefully it is highly subversive. There is no mention of the serpent, the apple is offered by Adam to Eve, Eve is silent throughout and the Fall seems to be attributed to Adam's lust for Eve, which is not mutual¹⁹⁷. In Juana's version at the beginning Adam is subordinate to Eve and only by an arbitrary divine act of giving Adam a beard allows him to dominate Eve by fear. The manuscript in the Vatican has an additional passage in which Juana says that both Adam and Eve have a female soul (in Spanish the word, *anima* is feminine in gender) and both have a male spirit (*espíritu* being a masculine noun), so a man can be said to be a 'woman' and a woman a 'man'¹⁹⁸. In another sermon she said that God was indifferent as to whether it was a man or a

¹⁹⁴ Ibid., pp. 63-6, 24.

¹⁹⁵ Ibid., pp. 110-1.

¹⁹⁶ Ibid., p. 132.

¹⁹⁷ Ibid., p.21.

¹⁹⁸ Ibid., p.25. An interesting sidelight on this statement is the story in her *Vida* (written by one of her nuns) that Juana was conceived as a male but the Virgin prevailed upon the Lord to change her in the womb to a female. The evidence of this was that Juana had a prominent Adam's apple so it is possible that Juana had one of the intersex conditions known to modern medicine, which would incline her to masculine modes of thought, *ibid.*, pp. 6-7.

woman who wrote down his words¹⁹⁹. Her sermon for the feast of St Clare also evidences ambiguity about gender roles and the view that differences between these roles were the result of worldly imperfection²⁰⁰. Juana clearly saw her physical suffering as *imitatio Christi* and accepted increased pain in order to save souls in Purgatory²⁰¹. The Virgin also plays an important role in Juana's revelations, revealing to her details not recorded in the Gospels²⁰². The sermon for the nativity of the Virgin has as its theme the role of Mary in salvation, in particular her role as intercessor²⁰³.

A comparison of these writers shows that Teresa clearly has much more in common in terms of social class and education with Constanza and Isabel than with Juana. Juana also differs from the other three in claiming authority for her works on the basis of direct divine inspiration. However, prior to the late fifteenth century the militant Christianity of a Spain fighting against the Moors was not congenial to mysticism, which only began to flourish in the messianic atmosphere after the fall of Granada in 1492²⁰⁴. Teresa, Constanza and Isabel all wrote before this period. Constanza and Isabel were writing for a purely female audience; Juana's sermons were delivered in her convent but it is not clear whether her nuns were the sole intended audience and she was aware that at least some of her sermons would be recorded and seen by her superiors. Teresa was clearly addressing her works to men as well as women and so, not having the cover of direct divine revelation, had to deal with the prohibition against women teaching men. This may be a reason why Teresa is the only one of

¹⁹⁹ Ibid., p. 123.

²⁰⁰ Ibid., p. 103.

²⁰¹ Ibid., pp. 37-42, 69.

²⁰² Ibid., p.111

²⁰³ Surtz, *Writing Women*, p. 110.

²⁰⁴ Surtz, *Guitar of God*, pp. 1-2.

these four to use specifically female humility topoi. Teresa differs from the other three in two important aspects; she makes no express identification with the suffering of Christ and there is no reference to any role of the Virgin, whether as example, intercessor or sufferer. However, all four in some way subvert the conventional gender roles and indicate an underlying belief that women are not intrinsically inferior to men.

CHAPTER 10

RACE

Introduction

The two previous chapters have dealt with Teresa's physical disability and the disabling effects of her gender. *Arboleda* is largely dedicated to her views on the first, *Admiración* was intended to counter the second. As discussed in chapter 2, in the second half of the fifteenth century her status as a *conversa* was becoming an increasing disability in Spanish society. However, she makes no express mention of it in either of her works. It might be argued that this was because she was either not discriminated against or was unaware of any discrimination¹. On the other hand, her silence may, like the dog that didn't bark², convey important information. The increasing hostility against and suspicion of New Christians at the time she was writing would shortly be given official recognition in the setting up of the Inquisition. It would therefore have been surprising if an intelligent woman like Teresa had made express reference to her Jewish origins. However, as MacKay warns, these dangers to the author meant that any 'predicament message' in *converso* literature would have had to be virtually undetectable, so there is often more than one reading of the text.

¹ E.M. Gerli, 'The *Converso* Condition: New Approaches to an Old Question', in I.A. Corfis and R. Harris-Northall (eds.), *Medieval Iberia: Changing Societies and Cultures in Contact and Transition* (Woodbridge, 2007), pp. 7-9 argues that the driving forces behind Teresa's alterity were her deafness and her gender and that she does not show awareness of her *conversa* status. However, much of Gerli's argument is based upon an assumption, probably incorrect (see chapter 3), that she was deaf from childhood and had been treated as a social outcast for that reason.

² From the Sherlock Holmes story *The Adventure of Silver Blaze*, in which Holmes makes an important deduction from the fact that a dog on the premises where the crime was committed did not bark.

The modern scholar must be wary of a single reading directed to detecting *converso* issues³.

The use of the word 'race' as the title of this chapter is a convenient shorthand, but is anachronistic in the context of the fifteenth century. In trying to understand the cultural background to Teresa's writing, it is important to put aside the dominant understanding of the term in the last two centuries. The concept of 'race' as a way of categorising humans into groups according to fixed sets of biologically transmitted characteristics began to develop in the Enlightenment, reaching the status of unquestioned truth in the late nineteenth century⁴. It is clear that human groups have discriminated against other groups throughout history, but there is disagreement as to whether this discrimination in earlier times was based on anything resembling the nineteenth century theory of 'race'⁵. In the specific case of Jews, they were disliked by the Greeks because the Jews rejected Greek religion and culture but generally tolerated by the pagan Roman empire so long as they did not pose a political threat⁶. Discrimination against Jews in the Roman Empire became more systematic after

³ A. MacKay, 'The Hispanic-Converso Predicament,' *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 35 (1985), 159-79, p. 173. An example of such a reading is found in an article by Hussar, in which he decides that Teresa's reluctance to provide autobiographical detail about her deafness 'invites allegorical readings of *Arboleda*' and finds such a reading in the 'fifteenth century association of Jews and *conversos* with sickness', J.Hussar, 'The Jewish Roots of Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los enfermos*', *La corónica*, 35 (2006), p. 156.

⁴ I. Hannaford, *Race: the history of an idea in the West* (Washington DC, 1996), pp. 3-4. Racism, prejudice against the 'other', usually on the part of members of a dominant group in society, found a 'scientific' justification in this theory of race. After the first half of the twentieth century when this concept was pursued to its terrible logical conclusion by the Nazis, racism lost its legitimacy and the underpinning theory of 'race' has been dismantled, M. Eliav-Feldon, B. Isaac, and J. Ziegler, 'Introduction.' in M. Eliav-Feldon, B. Isaac, and J. Ziegler (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 1-2.

⁵ For example, Hannaford contends that before the Enlightenment discrimination was based on political ideas rather than anything resembling the concept of race, Hannaford, *Race*, pp. 8-9, while Isaacs argues that even in antiquity there was a form of racism based at least in part on contemporary scientific ideas about environmental determinism and characteristics acquired through heredity, B. Isaac, 'Racism: a Rationalization of Prejudice' in M. Eliav-Feldon, B. Isaac, and J. Ziegler (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 54-6.

⁶ R.L. Rubenstein and J.K. Roth, *Approaches to Auschwitz: the Holocaust and its legacy* (Louisville, KY, 2003), pp. 31-3.

Christianity became the official religion, but this was primarily based on theological grounds⁷.

The earliest uses of the word 'race' in Western languages related either to fast-flowing water (eg a mill-race) or to a trial of speed⁸. The concept of a clear differentiation between species, with some being said to be 'noble', arose first in Europe in the High Middle Ages in connection with animals used for hunting. This concept was then transferred to the owners of those 'noble' animals, and a link was made with hereditary 'noble' blood⁹. The first use of '*raza*' in Spanish literature was by Martínez de Toledo in *Corbacho* (1438)¹⁰. In this work it was used in conjunction with the assertion that class characteristics are inherited; that if a son of a peasant and a son of a knight were brought up on a mountain, the peasant's son would naturally undertake farming activities while the knight's son would take to the practice of arms¹¹. Clearly, this is not the modern understanding of 'race'. Use of '*raza*' in connection with *conversos* and *limpieza de sangre* did not appear until the end of the sixteenth century¹².

Sexual relations are often the area where 'racial' anxieties are closest to the surface.

In the case of Spain, although there was evident anxiety in the Middle Ages about

⁷ Ibid., pp. 50-3. Rubenstein and Roth trace the basis of the conflict between Judaism and Christianity to the fact that they have so much in common but place different interpretations on the meaning of facts central to Christian belief, the life and teaching of Jesus Christ.

⁸ Hannaford, *Race*, p. 5.

⁹ C. de Miramon, 'The Invention of the Concept of Race' in M. Eliav-Feldon, B. Isaac, and J. Ziegler (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 204-10.

¹⁰ J. Corominas and J.A. Pascual, *Diccionario crítico etimológico castellano e hispánico*, vol. IV (Madrid, 1980), p. 800.

¹¹ A. Martínez de Toledo, *Arcipreste de Talavera, o, Corbacho*, ed. E.M. Gerli (Madrid, 1979), p. 108. Gerli's edition gives the word as '*raça*', other printed editions as '*rraza*' or modernised as '*raza*'. The word '*raça*' had an earlier use as meaning a crack in the upper part of a horse's hoof, L.A. Kasten and F.J. Cody, *Tentative dictionary of Medieval Spanish* (New York NY, 2001), p. 589.

¹² Corominas and Pascual, *Diccionario crítico etimológico*, p. 800.

sexual relations between the three religious groups, Nirenberg argues that there was no evidence that before the mass conversions of Jews in 1391 this anxiety was racial in origin¹³. Visigothic legislation relating to Jews, beginning with Reccared after his conversion to Catholicism, continued the Theodosian code provision that treated marriage between a Jew and a Christian as the crime of adultery but extended it to concubinage. Reccared further provided that children of such unions should be baptised¹⁴. However, the reasons behind these anti-Jewish laws seem to be religious, or at least politico-religious: after Reccared's conversion the idea arose that the state was a body bound together by a common faith and with a divinely sanctioned ruler¹⁵. The provisions of the *Siete Partidas* of Alfonso X relating to prohibition of sexual relations between Christians and either Jews or Moslems specifically refer to religious issues¹⁶. Behind these prohibitions appears to be a fear of conversion of the Christian to their partner's faith¹⁷. The degree of intermarriage in the late Middle Ages between the Spanish aristocracy, with their immense pride in lineage, and Christian Jews (discussed in chapter 3) would also indicate that 'racial' origins were not the issue in sexual relations between the communities.

¹³ D. Nirenberg, *Communities of Violence: Persecution of Minorities in the Middle Ages* (Princeton NJ, 1998), pp. 148-51.

¹⁴ A.M. Rabello and J. Juster, *A tribute to Jean Juster* (Mount Scopus, 1976), pp. 567-8. Bachrach argues that Reccared's law (589) that any children resulting from the union of a Jew and a Christian must be baptised was not necessarily anti-Jewish because Jewish law would not regard any such child as a member of the Jewish community. B.S. Bachrach, *Early medieval Jewish policy in Western Europe* (Minneapolis MN, 1977), pp. 5-6.

¹⁵ P.D. King, *Law and Society in the Visigothic Kingdom* (Cambridge, 1972), pp. 132-3.

¹⁶ D.E. Carpenter, *Alfonso X and the Jews: an edition of and commentary on Siete Partidas 7.24 "De los judíos"* (Berkeley CA, 1986), pp. 91-3. The term 'raza' does not appear in the *Siete Partidas* and it is not listed in L.A. Kasten and J.J. Nitti, *Diccionario de la prosa castellana del Rey Alfonso X* (New York NY, 2002).

¹⁷ R. Collins, *The Arab conquest of Spain: 710-797* (Oxford, 1989), pp. 68-9. The reason given in the Visigothic legislation for forbidding Jewish men to have sexual relations with Christian women is expressly religious; these women are 'spiritually espoused to Our Lord Jesus Christ by virtue of the faith and baptism they received in His name', Carpenter, *Alfonso X and the Jews*, p. 35. The traditional Jewish prohibition on social and sexual relationships with non-Jews found in the Pentateuch (Deut. 7:1-4) is expressly linked to the danger of idolatry. Christianity also taught that Christians should not marry non-believers, based on 2 Cor. 6:14-18, again because of the dangers of the Christian being led astray from his or her faith.

The changes in the treatment by the Old Christians of *conversos* in Spain after the middle of the fifteenth century do require further consideration. In particular, the idea of *limpeiza de sangre*, purity of blood, does appear to be based on a concept at least similar to the nineteenth century idea of race¹⁸. Most nineteenth and early twentieth century Spanish historians saw the relations between Old Christians and Spanish Jews and Muslims as a racial struggle governed by Darwinian principles. This certainty was challenged later in the twentieth century, most notably by Américo Castro who challenged all Spanish racial theories, including those of Old Christians, and referred instead to 'castes'¹⁹. However, Castro has been criticised as continuing many of the old racist historical theories under a new name²⁰. For example, Castro traces the origins of the concept of purity of blood and the Spanish Inquisition to Jewish ideas and practices brought over to Christianity by the *conversos*, stating that no traces of such ideas could be found among Spanish medieval Christians²¹. Nirenberg instead traces these ideas to an Spanish obsession with genealogy. He explains this Spanish approach as arising from the destabilisation of established religious categories and uncertainties about religious status caused by the mass conversions between 1391 and 1415, which caused all three groups concerned (Jews, Old Christians and *conversos*) to derive new forms of communal identity through reworking genealogical ideas traditional to each group and developing a related historiography²². The accusations of the Toledan supporters of the *Sentencia Estatuato*, that all those descended from

¹⁸ V. Groebner, 'The Carnal Knowing of a Coloured Body: Sleeping with Arabs and Blacks in the European Imagination, 1300-1550', in M. Eliav-Feldon, B. Isaac, and J. Ziegler (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 229-30.

¹⁹ D. Nirenberg, 'Was There Race before Modernity? The Example of 'Jewish' Blood in Late Medieval Spain.' in M. Eliav-Feldon, B. Isaac, and J. Ziegler (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 242-5.

²⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 245-7.

²¹ A. Castro, *The Structure of Spanish History*, trans. E.L. King (Princeton, 1954), pp. 521-44.

²² D. Nirenberg, 'Mass Conversion and Genealogical Mentalities: Jews and Christians in Fifteenth-Century Spain', *Past and Present*, 174 (2002), 3-41, pp. 6-7, 18.

the 'perverse lineage'²³ of the Jews would continue the anti-Christian views and actions traditionally attributed to Jews, were based on a contemporary understanding derived from animal husbandry that cultural characteristics were transmitted through genealogy²⁴.

This emphasis on lineage was intimately tied up with the importance in Spanish society of the concept of nobility, *hidalguía*. Upwardly mobile *converso* families sought to attain *hidalgo* status in any way possible, often by marrying into noble families who needed a wealthy bride or husband for their offspring²⁵. Until the Inquisition made it a dangerous assertion, many *conversos* also claimed Hebrew nobility²⁶. Both Pablo de Santa María and Alonso de Cartagena made such claims for their ancestry. Indeed, a major section of Alonso de Cartagena's *Defensorium* (discussed further below) is devoted to his argument that a Jew could have an inherent, moral nobility which upon conversion was released and could be recognised by an award of civic nobility²⁷. Shortly after the *Defensorium* was written, the fifteenth century *converso* courtier Mosén Diego de Valera wrote *Espejo de verdadera nobleza*. Valera had become the leading expert on the nobility and was consulted by the Catholic Monarchs on etiquette²⁸. His theory of nobility was socio-political as opposed to Cartagena's theological approach, but was equally intended to

²³ The Spanish word '*linaje*' had been used generally in the Middle Ages to link genealogy to character, Nirenberg, 'Race before Modernity', p. 248.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 254-5. This is the same as the view expressed in *Corbacho* about human cultural characteristics, in connection with which the term '*raza*' was first used [ref above].

²⁵ S. Gilman, *The Spain of Fernando de Rojas: the Intellectual and Social Landscape of La Celestina* (Princeton NJ, 1972), pp. 144-6.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 145.

²⁷ B. Rosenstock, *New Men: Conversos, Christian Theology, and Society in Fifteenth-Century Castile* (London, 2002), pp. 48-9.

²⁸ E.M. Gerli, 'Performing Nobility: Mosén Diego de Valera and the Poetics of *Converso* Identity,' *La Corónica*, 25 no. 1 (1996), 19-36, pp. 21-3.

open the way for *conversos* of noble Jewish origin to be awarded civil nobility²⁹. For both Cartagena and Valera, nobility was more a question of possessing noble qualities than of possessing a noble genealogy, and nobility could be both gained and lost³⁰.

A number of modern scholars have argued that *limpieza de sangre* was a mechanism of social, rather than religious or racial, exclusion, related to *hidalgo* status³¹. Certainly, grants of *limpieza de sangre* were made to families with high social status who demonstrably had Jewish blood: in 1604 such a grant was made by Philip III to Pablo de Santa María and his descendants³².

The 'converso voice'

Converso authors contributed significantly to late medieval and early modern Spanish literature. They wrote chronicles (e.g., Alvar García de Santa María), historical treatises (e.g., Pablo de Santa María), religious and theological works (e.g., Juan de Torquemada, Teresa of Avila), religious and secular poetry (e.g., Fray Íñigo de Mendoza, Antón de Montoro), novels and plays (e.g., Fernando de Rojas), humanist works (e.g., Alonso de Cartagena, Luis Vives), political advice and polemics (e.g.,

²⁹ Ibid., pp. 24-5.

³⁰ Rosenstock, *New Men*, p. 49; B. Netanyahu, *The Origins of the Inquisition in Fifteenth Century Spain* (New York NY, 2001), p. 558; Gerli, 'Performing Nobility,' pp. 25-6.

³¹ J. Edwards, 'The Beginnings of a Scientific Theory of Race? Spain 1450-1600', in *Religion and Society in Spain. c.1492* (Aldershot, 1996), ch. VII, pp. 634-6 states that this policy was very different from the racial anti-semitic policies of the Nazis. Beverley agrees that social factors were very important because the concept of purity of blood related to noble blood, so that non-noble Old Christians were excluded along with *conversos* from high office and promotion, J. Beverley, 'Class or Caste: A Critique of the Castro Thesis', in R.E. Surtz, J. Ferrán, and D.P. Testa (eds.), *Américo Castro: the Impact of His Thought* (Madison, 1988), p. 144. Beverley criticises Castro's 'caste' theory on the ground that it ignores issues of class, *ibid.*, p. 141. However, Castro did not simply ignore class; he claimed that this caste system had actually hindered the development of a class system like that which prevailed in the rest of Europe and also explained the absence of feudalism in medieval Spain, Castro, *Structure of Spanish History*, p. 607. Nirenberg emphasises the economic effects of the injection into Spanish society of large numbers of upwardly mobile *conversos* as the driver for these policies, Nirenberg, 'Mass Conversion,' pp. 22-5.

³² Cantera Burgos, pp. 280-4.

Diego de Valera). The development of fifteenth century Spanish humanism can be largely attributed to *converso* authors, in particular Alonso de Cartagena³³.

Américo Castro was one of the first to realise this connection between *converso* heritage and Spanish literature³⁴. His idea of the defining characteristic of the Spanish as '*vivir desviviéndose*', living in disagreement with one's own self, he traced to Moslem and Jewish influence³⁵. He pointed out how many of the creators of important Spanish literary genres in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries were *conversos* and claimed to have detected a darkness of outlook in these writers, which he attributed to a combination of their 'Hispano-Hebrew' culture and its Arabic influences with the social exclusion and persecution by the Inquisition they experienced³⁶. He also believed that *conversos* had a strong self-consciousness and a tendency to look within³⁷. Gilman, who acknowledged Castro as his master³⁸, understood this leading role of *conversos* in creating Spanish literature not as being based on Jewish racial characteristics or culture but rather as a product of the situation of these individuals who were both inside and outside their social circumstances. This liminal position provided the ironic distance from, yet identification with, their society that allowed them to successfully mirror their world in fiction³⁹. Gilson saw this position as also leading to a form of 'adolescent' self-consciousness, primarily concerned with the impression made on others⁴⁰. A more extreme view of *converso*

³³ G.B. Kaplan, *The Evolution of Converso Literature: the Writings of the Converted Jews of Medieval Spain* (Gainesville FL, 2002), pp. 58-61.

³⁴ Gilman, *Spain of Fernando de Rojas*, p. 118.

³⁵ Castro, *Structure of Spanish History*, pp. 10-11, 54-5.

³⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 525, 557-60, 567-70.

³⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 571. Castro comments on Teresa of Avila that her "strong propensity for autobiography" as well as her mysticism had led him to suspect an Islamic or Judaic connection even before her *conversa* status was uncovered, *ibid.* p. 566.

³⁸ Gilman, *Spain of Fernando de Rojas*, p. x.

³⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 154-5.

⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, pp. 200-1.

literature is given by Nepaulsingh, who sees it as a deliberate provision of writing that could be read in one, harmless, way by those sharing the dominant 'monoculture' (in this case, Spanish Christianity), but containing a potentially dangerous coded message readable by those within the culture of the minority⁴¹.

More recently, scholars have criticised this '*converso* voice' theory as imposing an alluringly simple set of characteristics on the literary products of people who were themselves very different from each other⁴² and who, being upper class, educated and almost exclusively male, were not representative of *conversos* as a whole. In 1996-7 the first part of volume 25 of the journal *La Corónica* was devoted to articles by scholars of late medieval and early modern *conversos* on the topic of the *converso* voice, and the second part of that volume contained letters from more scholars commenting on these articles. Although the latter group had some criticisms of the former, particularly finding an over-reliance on Netanyahu's conclusions and an insufficient appreciation of the potential value of Inquisition records in uncovering the lived *converso* experience and beliefs, there was a general agreement that there were a wide range of *converso* identities, outlooks and experiences which could not be fitted to a single, simple theory such as put forward by Castro⁴³.

⁴¹ C.I. Nepaulsingh, *Apples of Gold in Filigrees of Silver: Jewish Writing in the Eye of the Spanish Inquisition* (New York NY, 1995), pp. 30, 34.

⁴² Asensio points out that *conversos* were members of different social groupings and influenced by different cultures, E. Asensio, *La España imaginada de Américo Castro* (Barcelona, 1992), pp. 91-2.

⁴³ D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Inflecting the *Converso* Voice: A Commentary on Recent Theories', *La Corónica*, 25 no. 1 (1996), 16-17; Gerli, 'Performing Nobility', 32-4; J. Edwards, 'Letter', *La Corónica*, 25 no. 2 (1997), 160-1; D. Gitlitz, 'Letter', *La Corónica*, 25 no. 2 (1997), 163-6; M.D. Meyerson, 'Letter', *La Corónica*, 25 no. 2 (1997), 179-80. The same issue contained a reply to these criticisms, D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Responses from the Authors: "Navigating the Minefield"', *La Corónica*, 25 no. 2 (1997), 195-201. Round also rejects a simple theory of *converso* literary characteristics, but does believe that a *converso's* identity in historical context could influence his writing, N. Round, 'La "peculiaridad literaria" de los conversos ¿unicorno o "snark"?', in A. Alcalá (ed.), *Judíos, sefarditas, conversos : la expulsión de 1492 y sus consecuencias* (Valladolid, 1995), pp. 570-1.

Taking into account the need to be sensitive to individual circumstances, is there anything in Teresa de Cartagena's writing that could be said to be a *conversa* voice? Castro dedicates a footnote to Teresa, stating that the then-recent confirmation of her descent from Pablo de Santa María changed his view of her thought, from it anticipating 'modern' psychology to belonging to what he calls the 'Hispano-Hebrew' family of literature and anticipating the writings of Teresa of Avila, also of Jewish descent⁴⁴. While there is an undoubted 'darkness of tone' in her writings, this seems mainly attributable to her sufferings, the isolation caused by her deafness and the denigration of her authorship by the '*prudente varones*'. Again, while she makes a number of ironic comments on her society, such as the description of invalids spending their time at the gaming table or wandering around the village⁴⁵ or the derogatory treatment of suffering members of great families by their family⁴⁶, her deafness and gender are obvious sources of her outsider status without the need to consider her Jewish roots. It could be said that Teresa has, like her more famous namesake, a "propensity for autobiography" (see above, n. 37), but it is far from clear that this has anything to do with her Jewish ancestry. It is more likely to result from her gender. As noted in the previous chapter, Teresa de Avila made extensive use of the claim that she wrote her 'biographical' works at the insistence of her male confessors, one route to authority for women. Medieval women, because they were barred from the universities where scholastic theology was taught and developed, had

⁴⁴ Castro, *Structure of Spanish History*, p. 346 n. 60. Asensio points out that this is inconsistent with his previous treatment of Teresa of Avila: in *España en su historia: cristianos, moros y judíos* (Buenos Aires, 1948) Castro said that she showed influences of Muslim spirituality, but after it was shown that she had *converso* ancestry he instead detected Jewish influences, Asensio, *La España imaginada*, pp. 98-9. Another thing that Castro generally attributes to Jewish influence is praise of the book, which he remarked seemed to be a novelty in fourteenth century Spain (*ibid.*, p. 555); Teresa de Cartagena praises books at the beginning of *Arboleda*.

⁴⁵ Hutton, 85:32-5, Seidenspinner-Nuñez, 66.

⁴⁶ Hutton, 76:30-77:5, Seidenspinner-Nuñez, 59.

to use their experience as the basis for their theological reflection⁴⁷. Men were more likely to discuss suffering in general terms, even if they were writing because they had experienced it; for example, even though it is generally believed that Pedro de Luna wrote his *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana* after he was deposed as Pope, he makes only one brief reference to this in the preface to the work⁴⁸. Although John of the Cross, like Teresa of Avila, had *converso* origins⁴⁹, unlike her there is no trace in his writings of autobiography although much of his spiritual teaching came out of his sufferings.

Converso issues in Teresa's writing

Although there are no direct references to Teresa's origins, there are echoes of *converso* anxieties in her writings. First, there is the unusual exegesis of Psalm 44:11⁵⁰ (discussed in chapter 6) in which she interprets allegorically the word 'people' in the phrase 'Forget thy people' as meaning lusts, which resemble a hostile mob of townspeople⁵¹. Although there is no doubt that she lived in a time of political instability and violence, Old Christian women of her class would have been more likely to be the indirect victims of violence resulting from the political activities of the males in their families than of mob violence. Although upper class *converso* families

⁴⁷ T. Beattie, *Woman* (London, 2003), pp. 70-1.

⁴⁸ P. de Luna, *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana* ed. J.B. Simó Castillo (Vinaròs, 1998), p. 84.

⁴⁹ M. Dodd, 'John of the Cross: His Person, His Times, His Writings' in *Carmelite Studies IV* (Washington DC, 1992), p10.

⁵⁰ E.T. Howe, 'Sor Teresa de Cartagena and Entendimiento,' *Romanische Forschungen* 108 (1996), 133-45, pp. 137-8 says that in her treatment of this verse Teresa "seems to imply the rejection by her family of its Jewish heritage". However, this is based on her use of the translation of the verse from the modern Jerusalem Bible which includes the words 'forget your nation'; the version quoted by Teresa gives '*el pueblo tuyo*' (Vulgate '*populi tui*') so clearly means 'your people'. Further, as is discussed below, both Pablo de Santa María and Alonso de Cartagena retained pride in their Jewish heritage and saw it as central to their Christian belief. Howe also suggests that Teresa's frequent citation of the Psalms would 'remind readers of her [Jewish] background' (p. 138); this ignores the importance of the Psalms in Christian liturgy, particularly in the religious life.

⁵¹ Although similar imagery was used by Francesc Eiximenis, M.M. Cortés Timoner, *Teresa de Cartagena, primera escritora mística en lengua castellana* (Málaga, 2004), p.100.

were also involved in such political activities (Teresa's father was involved in violence between leading families in Burgos⁵²), in addition they could suffer mob violence. The first target of the Toledo uprising in 1449 was Alonso Cota, the wealthy *converso* merchant who was municipal treasurer and who was ordered by Álvaro de Luna to collect a large sum in tax from the citizens of Toledo to support Juan II in his war with Aragon. The mob pillaged his house and burned it, then went on to sack the area where the richest *conversos* lived⁵³.

In her discussion of the 'seven bad humours', the seven deadly sins, it is striking that Teresa's discussion of pride is twice as long as her discussion of the other six put together⁵⁴. She discusses six roots of pride; illustrious lineage, handsome body, youth and beauty, eloquence and wit, worldly honours, and riches⁵⁵. There is no similar detailed discussion of any of the other sins. There are a number of reasons why Teresa might have wanted to give this prominence to pride. The first possibility is that she realised that she was vulnerable to this sin and that these were the things that had caused her to be proud. Her family certainly enjoyed honours and riches and they considered themselves to have an illustrious lineage, claiming relationship to prominent Spanish families (even the Castilian royal family⁵⁶) and also claiming to have descended from the line of King David and the Virgin⁵⁷. The importance she gave to worldly conversation before God 'silenced' her and the fluency of her writings

⁵² Cantera Burgos, pp. 470-1.

⁵³ A.A. Sicoff, *Les controverses des statuts de "pureté de sang" en Espagne du XV au XVII siècle* (Paris, 1960), pp. 32-3.

⁵⁴ In the discussion of the deadly sins in *Corbacho*, the discussion of pride, the first deadly sin, is the same length as the seventh, laziness; both are only slightly longer than that of the other sins, Martínez de Toledo, *Arcipreste de Talavera, o, Corbacho*, pp. 126-35.

⁵⁵ Hutton, 76:21-78:25, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 58-60.

⁵⁶ Nirenberg, 'Mass Conversion,' p. 31.

⁵⁷ Cantera Burgos, pp. 284-5. As discussed above (p. 252), this *converso* emphasis on Jewish nobility became increasingly dangerous as anti-*converso* feelings rose and the Inquisition was established; Teresa may have been conscious of the beginnings of this situation.

are an indication that she may have been considered to have eloquence and wit. However, if her references to sickly children and the adverse physical effects of illness are autobiographical, it would seem unlikely that she could have had pride at any time in either her body or her beauty. A second possible reason for her stress on pride is that the other nuns in Las Huelgas, all from established aristocratic families who doubtless were very aware of their *hidalgo* status, despised her for her lack of these things she lists. In terms of nobility, in their eyes her family were probably not regarded as having *hidalguía* as her father had only recently been ennobled. She must have been in some ways a burden to the community after she became deaf, and after her uncle's death she would have lost her ecclesiastical protector whose influence may have got her admitted to Las Huelgas in the first place. These factors may in part explain the intense loneliness which she expresses in the first part of *Arboleda*.

While neither of these factors is peculiar to *conversos*, there is a third possibility which could point to anxiety arising from her *conversa* status. This explanation is suggested by the fact that Teresa's first root of the vice of pride is glorification of illustrious lineage and great family. As discussed above, 'lineage' (*linaje*) was by the second half of the fifteenth century becoming the main source of discrimination between Old and New Christians. By the probable time that *Arboleda* was written, *limpieza de sangre* statutes were becoming more common in towns, and, although the first statute excluding New Christians from a religious organisation was not until 1486, the Franciscans in 1461 had demanded that the General of the Jeronimites expel judaising *conversos* from the Order⁵⁸. As a member of a prominent religious

⁵⁸ Sicroff, *Controverses*, pp. 67-8.

house who was well-known to have Jewish ancestry, it would be surprising if this growing emphasis on lineage and 'purity of blood' was not of concern to Teresa.

On first reading Teresa seems to have a strong preference for the Old Testament over the New Testament, which has been suggested to show a Jewish bias⁵⁹. However, as shown in chapter 6, the Psalms must be treated separately given their importance in the daily religious life of any monk or nun, which leaves approximately equal numbers of quotations from the Old and New Testaments. Similarly, a suggestion by Surtz⁶⁰ that Teresa's selection of Judith as her example in *Admiración* could be attributable, at least in part, to her Jewish heritage does not carry much weight given the popularity of Judith in pro-feminist literature of the time⁶¹.

A possible Jewish echo derives from the medieval idea of the Fall of Fortune, the turn of Fortune's wheel that brings down the powerful and successful, which applied with particular force to the *conversos*⁶². This theme is echoed in *Arboleda*, although Teresa attributes the fall to God's action rather than to the pagan goddess.

Explaining the silences

Besides these more obvious echoes of *converso* anxieties, there are some omissions in Teresa's writings that seem surprising given her topics and the fact that she went through Franciscan and Cistercian religious formation in the mid-fifteenth century. In particular, her work on suffering, *Arboleda*, makes no reference to the sufferings of

⁵⁹ M. Majuelo Apiñániz, 'Teresa de Cartagena. La obra de una mujer castellana del siglo XV' (Universidad de País Vasco, Ph.D. thesis, 2008), p. 596.

⁶⁰ R.E. Surtz, *Writing Women in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain: the Mothers of Saint Teresa of Avila* (Philadelphia PA, 1995), p.32.

⁶¹ See chapter 5, n. 45.

⁶² S. Gilman, 'The *Conversos* and the Fall of Fortune', in M.P. Hornik (ed.) *Collected Studies in Honour of Américo Castro's Eightieth Year* (Oxford, 1965), pp. 127-9.

Christ in his Passion, her justification of women in *Admiraçion* has no mention of the Virgin and none of her food imagery has any Eucharistic context. We must examine whether these and other unexpected silences could be attributed to her *conversa* status and Jewish roots, or whether there are other cogent explanations.

The Passion

There are a number of reasons why *conversos* would be uncomfortable with the late medieval concentration on the physical sufferings of Jesus during his Passion and Crucifixion. The first is the issue at the heart of the medieval Christian-Jewish debate; was Jesus of Nazareth the long-awaited Jewish Messiah? The Jews were expecting a political ruler who would free them from foreign domination and restore the Kingdom of Israel⁶³; a crucified man who renounced earthly power clearly did not meet those expectations. Another theological objection was the Deuteronomic curse on criminals executed by hanging; crucifixion was viewed as coming within this curse⁶⁴. The accusation against medieval Jews that they were personally responsible for their ancestors' demand for Christ to be crucified must have made dwelling on that crucifixion very uncomfortable for Jewish Christians. All Jews were forbidden by the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215 to walk out in public during the last three days of Holy Week and Easter Sunday to prevent them insulting or making fun of Christians who were showing grief over Christ's sufferings⁶⁵. Spanish *conversos*, who before conversion had endured ritual (or even actual) violence every Holy Week directed against urban Jewish quarters⁶⁶, would have had even stronger personal reasons for disliking celebrations of the Passion.

⁶³ E.P. Sanders, *The Historical Figure of Jesus* (London, 1993), pp. 28-31.

⁶⁴ Deuteronomy 21:23; Galatians 3:13.

⁶⁵ S. Grayzel, *The Church and the Jews in the XIIIth Century* (New York NY, 1966), p. 309.

⁶⁶ Nirenberg, *Communities of Violence*, pp. 200-30.

An interesting view of how the Spanish church approached the task of instructing the large numbers of newly converted Jews in the early part of the fifteenth century is given by Robinson in her analysis of a 1415 *retablo* of scenes of the life of Christ⁶⁷. This was located over the main altar in a church in the area of Valladolid where most of the city's *converso* population lived⁶⁸. She begins by pointing out that the culture of images related to Passion devotions that were common in most of the rest of Europe in the late Middle Ages did not appear to have been an important part of Castilian devotional practices in the same period⁶⁹. Robinson's interpretation is based on three groups of documents: works written by *conversos* for use in debates with Jews; the sections of Eiximenes' *Life of Christ* dealing with the infancy through to post-Resurrection events; and two existing *sanctorales* which are probably similar to one known to be owned by the monastery to which the church was attached, containing excerpts from this *Life* and probably used in sermons and liturgy. The *Life* differs from its better known equivalents such as Ludolph of Saxony's *Vita Christi* in the way it presents the sufferings of Christ and the Virgin. Instead of encouraging meditation on these sufferings and identification with the human Jesus, it presents Christ as bearing his sufferings with willing and joyful forbearance. Similarly, his mother is portrayed as similarly bearing her sufferings and enjoying visionary experiences to help her understand her son's sufferings. In his treatment of the Passion, Eiximenes expressly states that he is not including lengthy passages meditating on Christ's sufferings and that those wanting such material can find it elsewhere. Instead, he concentrates on the debates between Christ and the authorities

⁶⁷ C. Robinson, 'Preaching to the Converted: Valladolid's *Cristianos nuevos* and the *Retablo de don Sancho de Rojas* (1415)', *Speculum*, 83 (2008), 112-63.

⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 120-1.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 112-3.

and presents Christ as calm and regal throughout all the Passion events⁷⁰. Robinson explains this difference by seeing Eiximenes' purpose in writing as part of the early fifteenth century push to convert the remaining Spanish Jews through preaching and disputation; those aspects of the Christian faith which Jews found most off-putting or even offensive, such as the Crucifixion, would not be emphasised⁷¹.

The *retablo* contains six scenes from the Passion, the most numerous group. Robinson demonstrates how each of these images is consistent with the approach taken by Eiximenes to that particular event. Throughout the Passion Christ is shown as dignified and regal and as understanding the significance of what is happening, and Mary is similarly calm and displaying mystical understanding⁷². Both Eiximenes and the *retablo* avoid presenting the humiliation of Jesus in the Passion events, instead concentrating on his regal role and nature⁷³. This approach seems to be close to the early medieval imagery of Christ as triumphant King, even on the cross (see chapter 8). As shown by the Christian-Jewish debates, the main Christian arguments were directed to showing that Jesus was the expected Messiah, seeking to overcome the Jewish belief that the Messiah would be a political saviour for the Jewish nation which Christ clearly was not⁷⁴. The image of Christ in his Passion as calm, kingly and in control would be more attractive to Jews, both before and after conversion, than the tortured, suffering and humiliated figure of the usual late medieval devotional literature and images. Between the earlier depictions of Christ on the Cross as a

⁷⁰ Ibid., pp. 133-8.

⁷¹ Ibid., p. 125.

⁷² Ibid., pp. 137, 142-3, 146.

⁷³ Ibid., p. 161. Robinson points out that the *retablo* image of the Mass of St Gregory clearly shows the inscription '*iesus rex iudeorum*' over the cross in the vision of Christ above the altar, *ibid.*, p. 160.

⁷⁴ R. Chazan, 'Undermining the Jewish Sense of Future: Alfonso of Valladolid and the New Christian Missionizing', in M.D. Myerson and E.D. English (eds.), *Christians, Muslims and Jews in Medieval and Early Modern Spain* (Notre Dame IN, 2000), p. 181.

crowned king, often in priestly robes, and the crucifixes of the High and late Middle Ages showing Christ as a man suffering terribly, there were depictions of the crucified Christ without crown and robes but clearly alive and triumphant over death⁷⁵. A famous example of these would have been known to Teresa, as it is the San Damiano cross from which St Francis at the beginning of his mission heard Christ command him to rebuild his church⁷⁶. Franciscan houses always have a copy of this crucifix as it played such a central role in the life of their Founder. She would also have seen an interesting fourteenth century crucifix in Las Huelgas, which shows an upright Christ wearing a loincloth covered with the castle symbol of the Castilian crown⁷⁷, surely intended as a reference to his kingly status.

Evidence that Teresa shared this regal image of Christ can be seen in the names she uses for God in her works. While the overwhelming majority of references are to '*Dios*', there are a significant number of names that include the word 'Sovereign', such as 'Sovereign Lord' (*soberano Señor*), 'Sovereign Virtue' (*Virtud soberana*) and 'Sovereign Truth' (*soberana Verdad*). One of the few express references to Christ is to 'the great Prelate and sovereign Pontiff, Jesus Christ our Lord'⁷⁸ (*grand Perlado e soberano Pontífice, Jhesuchristo nuestro Señor*)⁷⁹, which is her only use of the name Jesus. Examination of Alonso de Cartagena's references to God in the *Oraçional* shows similar usage: he almost always uses the word *Dios*, with related terms *Señor*

⁷⁵ G. Constable, *Three studies in medieval religious and social thought* (Cambridge, 1995), pp. 157-65.

⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 164. San Damiano is the church which became the convent in which St Clare founded the Franciscan Second Order, the Poor Clares, to which Teresa belonged until 1449. The original crucifix is now in the Basilica of Santa Chiara in Assisi.

⁷⁷ M.J. Herrero Sanz, *Santa María la Real de las Huelgas Burgos* (Madrid, 2002), p. 33.

⁷⁸ Hutton, 92:9-10, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 71.

⁷⁹ It is interesting to note that, although Teresa has many references to God as 'Father', there is only one reference to the Holy Spirit and none to God the Son or to Christ as Son of God. Rosenstock notes that neither Torquemada in the *Tractatus* nor Cartagena in the *Defensorium* mention the Trinity except in passing and both only briefly refer to Jesus as being both human and divine, Rosenstock, *New Men*, pp. 75-6.

and *El*. He also uses *soberano* in the terms *soberano Verdad*, *Señor soberano*, *Immortal Señor Soberano Bienfechor* and *soberano Trinidad*. There is only one reference to Jesus Christ, where he advises always to conclude prayers with '*por Nuestro Señor Jesucristo que con el Padre e con el Spiritu Santo vive e regna un Dios por sienpre*' (through our Lord Jesus Christ who with the Father and the Holy Spirit lives and reigns one God for ever) or equivalent words⁸⁰. This phrase is a standard liturgical ending to prayers.

There are good reasons why Teresa would be unlikely to identify with this image of Christ in his Passion. Whereas he is shown as willingly accepting his suffering, she clearly fought against hers for a long time. While he knows what is going on, understands its significance and calmly accepts his persecutors' misunderstanding of his mission, her deafness meant that she did not know what was being said by those around her so felt lonely and confused, and her evident anger at those who suggested she still ought to go and talk to people showed she felt misunderstood. The angry, confused and misunderstood Job would be a much more sympathetic figure for her to identify with than this calm, stoical Christ. For example, the first thing she says about Job is that he tore his clothes when news of his misfortune reached him, justifying the natural feeling of sorrow that life's hardships cause the sufferer⁸¹.

As Teresa had relatives who were prominent authors, we can get some idea of the approach to the Passion of other members of the family. Edwards and Rosenstock both point out that Alonso de Cartagena's discussion of the process of redemption in Part 1 of the *Defensorium* makes no reference to the Crucifixion. Instead, using an

⁸⁰ A. de Cartagena, *Oracional*, ed. S. González-Quevedo, (Valencia, 1983), p. 119.

⁸¹ Hutton, 97:17-98:16, Seidenspinner-Nuñez, 75-6. Teresa's treatment of the Book of Job is discussed in chapter 6.

image of the transformation from night to day, Cartagena sees 'noon', the high point in the story of the redemption of humanity, as the giving of the Holy Spirit and the inauguration of the apostolic mission at Pentecost. When he does mention the Crucifixion later he views it in the context of its ongoing effect of the Passion as bringing the Jews first and then the gentiles to conversion and of the shared guilt of Jews and gentiles for the Crucifixion⁸². This is consistent with his theological view that there is no supersession of the old covenant by the new, that they are part of a single salvation history. Teresa's nephew, Fray Íñigo de Mendoza, wrote a '*Vita Christi*' in poetry, dedicated to his mother⁸³. Despite its title, the poem stops with the massacre of the Innocents. This means that there is no detailed description of the Passion, although there are several references in this work to the purpose of the Incarnation as foreshadowing of Christ's sufferings⁸⁴. If the dating of Teresa's writings put forward in chapter 3 is correct, it is possible that Teresa had read this poem before she wrote *Arboleda*⁸⁵. Fray Íñigo wrote other poems which dealt with later events in the life of Christ, but these were probably written in the period 1483-4⁸⁶, after Teresa wrote her works.

⁸² J. Edwards, 'New Light on the *Converso* Debate? The Jewish Christianity of Alfonso de Cartagena and Juan de Torquemada', in S. Barton and P. Linehan (eds.), *Cross, Crescent and Conversion: Studies on Medieval Spain in Memory of Richard Fletcher* (Leiden, 2008), p. 320; Rosenstock, *New Men*, p. 30.

⁸³ *Fray Íñigo de Mendoza y sus "Coplas de vita Christi"* ed. J. Rodríguez-Puértolas, (Madrid, 1968).

⁸⁴ In the course of the poem there are three verses on the difference between pagan idols and the true God, and a long passage on the Circumcision including explanations of why God commanded the Jews to circumcise, why Christ was not required by the Law to be circumcised and why he nevertheless submitted to this ceremony. These are topics which would be of interest to Jews; while their inclusion could be explained by his Jewish ancestry, this poem is dated to about 1467, well before the final expulsion of the Jews in 1492, so the author may have thought that it might contribute to the literature directed to their conversion.

⁸⁵ Íñigo de Mendoza was born in Burgos and may have been close in age to Teresa, *Fray Íñigo de Mendoza: Cancionero* ed. J. Rodríguez-Puértolas, (Madrid, 1968), p. xi, so there are grounds for believing that they knew each other well.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 1.

The name of Jesus

The special devotion to the name of Jesus, in particular its inclusion in the Western Church liturgical calendar, began in the fifteenth century and can be attributed to the extremely popular preaching of the Franciscan reformer, Bernardino of Siena. He originated the now familiar symbol of the letters 'IHS' surmounted by a cross and surrounded by rays⁸⁷. His Observant Franciscan reform spread to Spain in the mid to late fifteenth century, as did the devotion to the name of Jesus⁸⁸. One member of the Spanish Observant friars was Alonso de Espina, who preached on the necessity for an inquisition to investigate the *conversos* and played an important role in the introduction of the Spanish Inquisition. He also pushed for enforcement of the law that required Jews to wear distinguishing badges, and together with other Franciscans encouraged Old Christians to themselves wear a distinguishing badge, namely the name of Jesus, sewn onto their hats⁸⁹. There were clearly reasons for even truly Christian *conversos* to have been uncomfortable with the name of Jesus and this devotion. One of the transgressions of *conversos* listed by Alonso de Espina in his *Fortalium Fidei* is that they avoided mentioning the names of Jesus or Mary⁹⁰, an accusation that is repeated in Inquisition records⁹¹. A related accusation was that

⁸⁷ J. Edwards, 'Fifteenth-Century Franciscan Reform', pp. 204-5.

⁸⁸ This devotion did not derive from Francis himself. Although the hagiographies stress his mysticism and affective devotion to the humanity of Christ, his own writings give little evidence of either and show that he regarded his personal relationship to God being as to God the Father rather than to Christ, I. Delio, *Crucified Love: Bonaventure's Mysticism of the Crucified Christ* (Quincy IL, 1998), pp. 3, 5-7.

⁸⁹ Edwards, 'Fifteenth-Century Franciscan Reform', p. 204.

⁹⁰ H. Beinart, *Conversos on Trial: The Inquisition in Ciudad Real*, Yael Guiladi (trans.) (Jerusalem, 1981), p. 13.

⁹¹ R.L. Melammed, 'Crypto-Jewish Women Facing the Spanish Inquisition: Transmitting Religious Practices, Beliefs, and Attitudes', in M.D. Myerson and E.D. English (eds.), *Christians, Muslims and Jews in Medieval and Early Modern Spain* (Notre Dame, IN, 2000), pp. 207, 217 n. 33. Beinart cites an example of a woman in Ciudad Real being accused of saying only "in the name of the Father" instead of "in the name of the Father, the Son and the Holy Ghost", Beinart, *Conversos on Trial*, p.289.

conversos repeated the psalms without ending with the 'Gloria'⁹², although this could also be an indication of a heretical rejection of the Trinity and Christ's divinity.

As noted above, Teresa only uses the name Jesus only once in her works. Gilman points out that the *converso* author of *La Celestina* only uses the word as an expletive uttered by his characters and also does not refer to Christ by name, and suggests that this reluctance was shared by other *conversos*⁹³. This seems to be corroborated by an examination of the poems of Fray Íñigo de Mendoza: in the total of 433 known verses of his *Vita Christi*, a topic in which use of the names 'Jesus' and 'Christ' might be expected, there are only two references to 'Jesus', one to 'Christ' and three to the composite '*Ihsuschristos*'. In the rest of his poems there is only one use of 'Jesus', in a political poem expressed as a sermon to the king, Ferdinand, and none of 'Christ'. This is particularly surprising as Fray Íñigo was an Observant Franciscan⁹⁴. Similarly, as mentioned above, Alonso de Cartagena only uses the word once in his *Oracional*. Generally, when referring to the second person of the Trinity he uses the terms *Nuestro Salvator* and *Nuestro Redemptor*. By comparison, Pedro de Luna in his *Libro* makes frequent use of the name *Jesucristo*.

An aversion to the use of the name 'Jesus' could also help explain the absence in Teresa's writings of any late medieval affective spirituality. This spirituality was largely focussed on the humanity of Christ, symbolised by his human name, Jesus⁹⁵.

⁹² M.d.l.A. Fernández García, 'Criterios inquisitoriales para detectar al marrano: los criptojudíos en Andalucía en los siglos XVI y XVII', in A. Alcalá (ed.), *Judíos, sefarditas, conversos: la expulsión de 1492 y sus consecuencias* (Valladolid, 1995), p. 485. This was the most common accusation relating to prayer in the Inquisition records, *ibid.*, p. 491.

⁹³ Gilman, *Spain of Fernando de Rojas*, p. 363.

⁹⁴ *Cancionero*, p. xvi. The Catholic Monarchs supported the Observants as part of their programme of monastic reform, E.A. Lehfeldt, *Religious Women in Golden Age Spain* (Aldershot, 2005), pp. 153-4.

⁹⁵ C.W. Bynum, *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion* (New York NY, 1991), pp. 130-1.

An example of this devotion to the name of Jesus is the famous hymn 'Dulcis Jesu memoria', often attributed to Bernard of Clairvaux⁹⁶.

The Virgin

As discussed in the previous chapter, the image of Mary generally presented to women as embodying all that the patriarchal system wanted women to emulate was not one that fitted with Teresa's views. On this basis there would seem to be no need to invoke Jewish sensitivities about the Christian title 'Mother of God' in order to explain Teresa's silence on this topic⁹⁷. Teresa's nephew, Fray Íñigo, extensively praises Mary in his poetry, using the title '*madre de Dios*' and referring to the divine nature of her son⁹⁸.

However, there was a particularly Spanish reason for Jewish sensitivity about the Virgin. Along with the devotion to the Name of Jesus discussed above, Bernadino of Siena and his followers promoted a strong and all-knowing image of Mary. This image had already found favour in medieval Spain; the thirteenth century *Milagros de Nuestra Señora* of Berceo presents a Virgin who, as Mirrer demonstrates, is active and assertive and independent of male authority⁹⁹. While this image of the Virgin fits Teresa's views of women, it was closely associated with the *reconquista* and the military orders¹⁰⁰. With this view of the Virgin went with preaching of the belief that

⁹⁶ C.W. Bynum, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley CA, London, 1987), p.66; *Jubilus rhythmicus, de nomine Jesu, 'Jesu Dulcis Memoria'*, PL 184:1317-20.

⁹⁷ It is also likely that Teresa knew of the allegorical association between Judith and the Virgin (discussed in Chapter [6]) and may have intended her readers to make that association.

⁹⁸ For example, in his '*Los gozos de Nuestra Señora*', *Cancionero*, pp. 155-63.

⁹⁹ L. Mirrer, *Women, Jews, and Muslims in the texts of reconquest Castile* (Ann Arbor MI, 1996), pp. 106-9.

¹⁰⁰ N. Perry and L. Echeverría, *Under the Heel of Mary* (London, 1988), pp. 17-18, 30. An example is the Virgin of Guadalupe, among whose miracles were examples of rescue of Christians from slavery to Moslems and conversion of Moslems, G.D. Starr-LeBeau, *In the Shadow of the Virgin: Inquisitors, Friars, and Conversos in Guadalupe, Spain* (Princeton NJ., 2003), pp. 17-18.

Jews were opposed to Mary, both during her life (and at her death) and during the later Middle Ages¹⁰¹. This belief of Jewish hostility seems to have been extended to include *conversos*; the anti-*converso* riots in Cordoba in 1473 started when liquid was thrown from a house owned by *conversos* and fell on a statue of the Virgin which was being paraded through the streets. The crowd immediately assumed that this was a deliberate insult to the Virgin, a mindset that seems likely to have derived from this anti-Jewish rhetoric¹⁰². A reluctance to name the Virgin has been noted in the works of *converso* authors other than Teresa: in particular, John of the Cross, despite belonging to the Carmelites which is an order particularly dedicated to the Virgin Mary, only refers to her expressly four times in his major works¹⁰³.

The Eucharist

The final image of the *retablo* discussed by Robinson shows the Mass of St Gregory, an image which became popular in the late Middle Ages, particularly in Northern Europe¹⁰⁴. This is usually directly related to the Eucharist being celebrated by Pope Gregory directly in front of the vision of the crucified Christ, with blood flowing from Christ's wounds into the chalice¹⁰⁵. However, this early Spanish depiction of the legend has no flowing blood; instead, Robinson points out that Christ is shown in the form of the famous miraculous *imago pietatis*¹⁰⁶, thus removing the usual image's emphasis on the doctrine that the chalice contained the blood of Christ by transubstantiation, a difficult doctrine for those with a Jewish background whose

¹⁰¹ M. Rubin, *Mother of God: A History of the Virgin Mary* (London, 2009), pp. 59-60, 252, 300-2.

¹⁰² J. Edwards, *Christian Córdoba: the City and its Region in the Late Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 1982), pp. 183-4.

¹⁰³ E.J. Sullivan, 'Mary and the Holy Spirit in the Writings of John of the Cross', in *Carmelite Studies IV* (Washington DC, 1992), pp. 112-13.

¹⁰⁴ Robinson, 'Preaching to the Converted,' p. 159.

¹⁰⁵ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, p. 68.

¹⁰⁶ The image of Christ rising from the sarcophagus with his eyes closed and his hands crossed, Robinson, 'Preaching to the Converted', p. 159.

dietary laws stressed the need to avoid consuming blood¹⁰⁷. Examining Teresa's food images, as mentioned in chapter 4 there does not seem to be any express or implied Eucharistic reference, although there might be a faint echo of Jewish dietary rules in her description of how the sick have to control their diet, with references to harmful foods¹⁰⁸. She does talk about the heavenly banquet, which was the main metaphor for the sacrament in the early church and the early Middle Ages and which was adopted from Jewish approaches to food¹⁰⁹. However, the development of the doctrine of transubstantiation in the High Middle Ages transformed the Eucharist from a communal meal to a manifestation of Christ to be adored, and it also became closely associated with Christ's Passion and with suffering¹¹⁰. Bynum has demonstrated that Eucharistic devotion was common to all classes of medieval women from the thirteenth century onwards¹¹¹, so Teresa's silence here seems significant.

Theodicy

Chapter 8 examined Teresa's theology of suffering in the context of Biblical and medieval Christian theodicies. There is another theodicy to which she could have had access; that developed by rabbis in the centuries after the fall of Jerusalem which her grandfather would have studied as a rabbi. These Jewish theologians had to deal with the apparent conflict between belief in one God who is all-powerful and just, and the suffering experienced by the Jewish people. They did this by positing two main propositions. The first is that God matches a meritorious act with an appropriate reward and a sinful act with an appropriate punishment. Some suffering is to lead the sinner to repentance, some is to atone in this life for sin, and both types are consistent

¹⁰⁷ Ibid., pp. 159-60.

¹⁰⁸ Hutton, 49:11-27, Seidenspinner-Nuñez, 34.

¹⁰⁹ Bynum, *Holy Feast*, pp. 48-9.

¹¹⁰ Ibid., pp. 53-4.

¹¹¹ Ibid., p. 55; Bynum, *Fragmentation*, pp. 122-5. Bynum points out that all thirteenth century female religious writers emphasised the Eucharist except Margaret Porete, *ibid.*, p. 124.

with a just God. However, not all suffering falls into these categories, especially the suffering of the innocent. The rabbis dealt with this by their second main proposition: there will be a personal resurrection and eschatological judgment which will ensure that justice is done¹¹². Teresa certainly saw her suffering as leading to repentance, and stressed the close match between what she perceived as her sin, love of worldly conversation, and her punishment, the 'bit and bridle' of her deafness and imposed silence¹¹³. As discussed in chapter 8, Teresa does not mention the role of the Christ and the Cross in salvation, and seems to see her salvation in terms of her individual response to the suffering imposed by God. Her theology of salvation seems to be closer to this Jewish model than to the orthodox Christian theology of her time.

Converso theology

Spain was not noted for the study of theology in the Middle Ages¹¹⁴. Some Spaniards studied theology in Paris, and Pablo de Santa María was one of the first of these to show a concern for theology in his writings. Nader suggests that this interest in theology is directly linked to the *letrado* political theories put forward by don Pablo and by Alonso de Cartagena¹¹⁵. However, it was in response to the increasing discrimination against New Christians in the fifteenth century that a distinctive *converso* theology began to emerge, as discussed by Edwards¹¹⁶, Rosenstock¹¹⁷ and Seidenspinner-Núñez¹¹⁸. The leading proponents of this theology were Alonso de

¹¹² J. Neusner, 'Theodicy in Judaism' in A. Laato and J.C. de Moor (eds.), *Theodicy in the World of the Bible* (Leiden, 2003), pp. 688-9, 709-16.

¹¹³ Hutton, 57:6-23, 141:5-33, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 41, 111-2.

¹¹⁴ H. Nader, *The Mendoza Family in the Spanish Renaissance 1350-1550* (New Brunswick 1979), pp. 146-7.

¹¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 133.

¹¹⁶ Edwards, 'Scientific Theory of Race'; Edwards, 'New Light on the *Converso* Debate'.

¹¹⁷ Rosenstock, *New Men*.

¹¹⁸ D. Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Prelude to the Inquisition: The Discourse of Persecution, the Toledan Rebellion of 1449, and the Contest for Orthodoxy' in W. J. van Bekkum and P.M. Cobb eds.), *Strategies of Medieval Community Identity: Judaism, Christianity and Islam* (Paris, Leuven, Dudley, MA, 2004).

Cartagena and Juan de Torquemada. The latter, whose mother was probably a New Christian and who was uncle of the Inquisitor Tomas de Torquemada, had a distinguished ecclesiastical career. He represented Castile at the Council of Basle and, as a result of his support for the Pope in that council, became a cardinal and the senior papal theologian in Rome¹¹⁹. This theology was primarily expounded in Cartagena's *Defensorium Unitatis Christianae (Defensorium)* and Torquemada's *Tractatus contra Madianitas et Ismaelitas (Tractatus)*. Both were written to counter the 1449 Toledo purity of blood statute, the *Sentencia*, and in particular to answer the defence of the *Sentencia* in the *Memorial contra los conversos (Memorial)* of Marcos García de Mora, written after the papal bulls condemning the statute and excommunicating the rebels had arrived in Spain¹²⁰.

Netanyahu puts the reasons given by the Toledan rebels for the *Sentencia* into four classes, legal, religious, social and racial¹²¹. The legal reasons, based upon two seventh century decisions and an alleged privilege given to Toledo by Alonso VII, had been countered by the first response to the rebels, the *Instrucción* of the Relator Fernán Díaz de Toledo¹²². There was a basic assertion underlying the other three classes: that all Jews, whether or not 'converted', had an overriding motive to damage and even destroy Old Christians, indeed had converted for this purpose. This conspiracy was said to arise from the moral depravity which was inherent in all Jewish blood (and which, by implication, could not be washed away by baptism). For those holding such a belief it was a logical conclusion that all persons of Jewish blood, even those who had been born and raised as Christians, should not be given

¹¹⁹ Rosenstock, *New Men*, p. 14; Edwards, 'New Light on the *Converso* Debate', p. 313.

¹²⁰ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Prelude', p. 54, n. 17.

¹²¹ Netanyahu, *Origins*, pp. 367-82.

¹²² *Ibid.*, pp. 399-403.

any public office or allowed to testify against an Old Christian¹²³. These allegations were put in their most extreme form in the *Memorial*, which attempted to use Scripture to show that the Jews were inherently evil and were incapable of salvation by Christ¹²⁴. It is these allegations that Torquemada and Cartagena were writing to refute.

The *Memorial* allegations were clearly inconsistent with the Church's established teaching on the role of the Jewish people in the era following the death and resurrection of Christ. The basis for this teaching was what Augustine had to say on the topic, which was adopted and developed by Aquinas. The conflict between the Church and the Synagogue, which began very early in the history of Christianity, resulted in the development during that early period of certain almost universal Christian beliefs, all of which are found in Augustine's works and for which Aquinas gives detailed justifications: that the Law had been superseded by the sacrifice of Christ on the Cross¹²⁵; that the purpose of studying the Old Testament was to find prophetic 'types' of Christ¹²⁶; and that all Jews bore responsibility for Christ's death¹²⁷. However, once Christianity had become the dominant religion in Europe, the issue of how to treat the Jewish diaspora in its midst had to be dealt with. Four theological reasons were given for the papal policy of granting them a measure of protection and allowing them to continue with their faith: their existence and current degraded state were proof of the truth of Jesus and the supersession of Judaism by Christianity; the Jews were guardians of the Hebrew scriptures which were vital to the Christian faith, even though they failed to understand them; the conversion of the

¹²³ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Prelude,' p. 53.

¹²⁴ Netanyahu, *Origins*, pp. 491-3.

¹²⁵ J.Y.B. Hood, *Aquinas on the Jews* (Philadelphia, 1995), p. 62.

¹²⁶ *Ibid.*, pp. 39-40.

¹²⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 71-5.

Jews had to be patiently awaited; and the Bible was clear that a remnant would be saved¹²⁸. However, it was important to make non-coercive attempts to convert individual Jews, both to save their souls because there was no salvation outside the Church and to hasten the Second Coming, at which all the Jews would be converted¹²⁹. The *Memorial*, in denying that Jews could truly convert, was contrary to this established teaching of the Church. Even worse, it denied that Christ's death was effective to save a whole class of mankind and denied the effectiveness of the sacrament of baptism. Torquemada in the first part of his *Tractatus* demonstrated that these denials were heretical deviations from long-established Christian doctrine and canon law¹³⁰. Cartagena used the Jewish prophet Ezekiel to prove that baptism was effective to wash away all sins without exception¹³¹.

The *Defensorium* discusses the role of Jews in the whole salvation history, from the Creation to Christ. Cartagena began by stressing the unity of mankind, beginning with their common origin in Adam. This unity was lost through sin, salvation history is the history of God's plan to restore this unity. This history begins with God's choice of Abraham and the patriarchs, then of their descendants the Jewish people¹³². Cartagena insisted that the history of the Jewish people and the Church was a single history, the gradual unfolding of God's plan of salvation for both Jew and gentile, which would not be complete until all the Jews accepted Jesus as the Christ and this world ends¹³³. There was continuity in message and purpose between the Old and

¹²⁸ Grayzel, *The Church and the Jews*, pp. 11-12.

¹²⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 13.

¹³⁰ Netanyahu, *Origins*, pp. 451-6.

¹³¹ Sicroff, *Controverses*, p. 51.

¹³² *Ibid.*, p. 43.

¹³³ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Prelude', p. 60. This idea of continuity is accepted by a leading modern Pauline theologian, J.D.G. Dunn. In his commentary on Romans 9:5, J.D.G. Dunn, *Word Biblical Commentary, Romans* (Dallas, 1988), p. 535, he states: 'Paul makes plain his fundamental conviction as to the continuity between Israel of old and the believer now, Jew first but also Gentile. His gospel is

New Testaments, any difference between them being due to the spiritual maturity of the people to whom they were originally addressed¹³⁴. This continuity meant for Cartagena that there was a distinction between Jewish and gentile converts to Christianity: for Jews acceptance of Jesus Christ as their Messiah was a fulfilment of Judaism so it was not really a 'conversion', whereas conversion for gentiles meant a complete break from their former life and religion¹³⁵. Cartagena and Torquemada both saw that this continuity meant a continuous unfolding of salvation history, with the crucifixion and resurrection as events in that history rather than a sharp break between the old and the new covenants and a replacement of the old by the new¹³⁶. Cartagena gave a literal exegesis to the Old Testament prophecies of the redemption of Israel and, perhaps influenced by his father, rejected the 'double literal' exegesis of Nicholas of Lyra. Lyra's approach treated the Christological interpretation as being literal rather than allegorical because the author, inspired by the Holy Spirit, intended the prophecy to relate to the 'spiritual Israel', the Church, as well as the 'carnal Israel'¹³⁷.

This theology of continuity makes more acute the problem of the rejection of Christ by most Jews. Cartagena and Torquemada both dealt with this by reference to the approach to the problem adopted by the apostle Paul in his epistle to the Romans, chapters 9-11. Using the image of the gentiles as a wild olive branch grafted into the olive tree of Israel, some of whose branches had been broken off, Paul says that because of the sin of the Jews who did not accept Christ salvation came to the

the good news of Israel's heritage and Israel's covenanted blessings. To break the link between old and new covenant is not to liberate his gospel but to destroy it, for his gospel is nothing if it is not the continuation and fulfilment of all that God intended for and through his chosen people.'

¹³⁴ Sicroff, *Controverses*, p. 44.

¹³⁵ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Prelude', p. 67.

¹³⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 60.

¹³⁷ Rosenstock, *New Men*, p. 39.

gentiles, but God had not rejected his chosen people. When the full number of the gentiles is saved, all Israel will be saved. Thus Paul makes the Jewish rejection of Christ an essential step in the salvation of the gentiles and the re-unification of mankind. This is the central plank of the arguments of Cartagena and Torquemada that the Jews are not rejected by God¹³⁸. Rostenstock demonstrates how Torquemada used all his theological skill to steer round the traditional supersessionist teachings of Augustine (see above) and others in his exegesis of Romans 11¹³⁹ in order to 'put the Jews front and centre in the drama of salvation history'¹⁴⁰. Cartagena discusses Romans 11 in the context of his exegesis of Luke's Nativity narrative, in which the shepherds, the first to come to worship Christ, represent the poor and humble, the magi, who are the next to arrive, represent gentile believers, while he made Simeon, who acknowledged the infant when he was presented in the Temple after forty days, the representative of rest of the Jews who will convert when the fullness of the gentiles is brought in¹⁴¹.

Each of these *converso* theologians also had a unique contribution to make. Torquemada appealed to Catholic sensibilities when he noted that the revered Virgin was a Jewish woman and that St Peter and many other of the saints who interceded for the faithful at the throne of God were also Jews¹⁴². He also invoked the theology of the Eucharist, pointing out that Jewish bodies and blood could not be eternally damned because the body and blood of Christ, contained in the bread and wine of that sacrament through transubstantiation, were also Jewish¹⁴³. Cartagena devoted a large

¹³⁸ Seidenspinner-Núñez, 'Prelude', p. 69.

¹³⁹ Rosenstock, *New Men*, pp. 53-68.

¹⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 66.

¹⁴¹ *Ibid.*, p. 37.

¹⁴² Edwards, 'New Light on the *Converso* Debate', pp. 322-3.

¹⁴³ Rosenstock, *New Men*, pp. 53-5.

section of the *Defensorium* to the issue of nobility, using the accepted theory of three nobilities, theological, moral and civil¹⁴⁴. His thesis was that, although the Jewish people had lost these nobilities after they rejected Christ, any Jew who converted would recover those nobilities consistent with his personal character. This meant that Jews, traditionally regarded by Christians as timid and lacking martial character, on conversion could be valiant warriors and suitable for civil nobility¹⁴⁵. He also pointed out that Christ had some female gentiles in his ancestry but only Jewish males, so the Incarnation is a typological representation of that restoration of human unity which Cartagena viewed as the ultimate end of salvation history¹⁴⁶.

While there is no way of knowing whether Teresa knew of the *Tractatus*, there are several reasons why it is probable that Teresa knew of the *Defensorium*, or at least of the ideas expressed in that work. First, Alonso de Cartagena was both her uncle and her bishop, and the 1449 papal petitions show that they were in contact in the period when he was writing the book, which is dated 1450¹⁴⁷. Second, Netanyahu must be correct in supposing that the ideas expressed in the book were developed over many years¹⁴⁸, and were surely discussed in the family. *Defensorium* shows clear influences from the writings of Pablo de Santa María¹⁴⁹. Alonso's theory about the

¹⁴⁴ These derive from Bartolo de Sassoferato's *Commentaria* on Justinian, Gerli, 'Performing Nobility,' p. 23.

¹⁴⁵ Rosenstock, *New Men*, pp. 47-8. Pablo de Santa María felt that the Jewish theological nobility which had been his as a Levite, the hereditary priestly tribe of Israel, was fulfilled when he became a Christian priest, *ibid.*, p. 36. Nirenberg points out that this was a dangerous line of argument for the *conversos*, as it extended theories of genetic heritability based on livestock breeding to human characteristics and thus could be said to be 'racial', Nirenberg, 'Race before Modernity', pp. 258-9.

¹⁴⁶ Rosenstock, *New Men*, pp. 43-4. Rosenstock suggests that the declaration that Jesus had only Jewish male blood was intended to counteract the gentile racial pride that underlay *limpieza de sangre*, *ibid.*, p. 46.

¹⁴⁷ Sicoff, *Controverses*, p. 41.

¹⁴⁸ Netanyahu, *Origins*, p. 528.

¹⁴⁹ Rosenstock, *New Men*, pp. 35-7.

regaining of Jewish nobility and valour by Jews who convert¹⁵⁰ would have been of direct interest to Teresa's father, who was a soldier and was ennobled.

As neither of Teresa's works is a treatise on systematic theology, the question of whether she adopted any of the basic principles of the *converso* theology described above can only be dealt with by inference. There is nothing that would contradict a belief in the unity of the salvation history of the Old and New Testaments. She certainly treats literally rather than allegorically the Old Testament stories about Job and Judith. Her exegesis of Psalm 44:11 makes no reference to the Christological interpretation of this psalm (whether allegorical or 'double literal') as referring to Christ the heavenly Bridegroom. As discussed above, she makes virtually no reference to the Passion or to the suffering humanity of Christ. God's saving intention towards her is shown by the suitability to that end of her sufferings rather than through Christ's death. An echo of the emphasis in the *Defensorium* on the martial and violent nature of gentile males¹⁵¹ is found in Teresa's choice in *Admiración* of martial courage as the main characteristic differentiating men from women. Another indication that she accepted her uncle's view of noble nature is in the discussion her first root of pride, the glorification of great lineage. She talks about how illness and disability can result in even the firstborn son of a noble family being treated with contempt and rejected by his peers and servants and even by his family¹⁵². This is consistent with an understanding that nobility was related to the characteristics of the person, rather than being purely an issue of lineage, and could be lost if an individual did not manifest noble qualities. Such an understanding is taught in both Cartagena's and Valera's writings on nobility, discussed above.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid., pp. 25-8.

¹⁵¹ Ibid., pp. 43-9

¹⁵² Hutton, 76:30-77:5, Seidenspinner-Núñez, 59.

Teresa the *conversa*

The strongest evidence that Teresa's Jewish ancestry had an effect on her thought seems to be her silences, in particular her apparent avoidance of the name of Jesus for which it is hard to see another explanation, and the echoes in her writing of prevailing *converso* anxieties. It is also arguable that she had accepted and adopted the *converso* theology put forward by her uncle, and had also accepted his view of nobility. Her theology of suffering and salvation seems closer to contemporary rabbinic Jewish teachings than the prevailing Christian theology of her time.

CONCLUSION

The title of this thesis gives the topic as 'a late medieval woman's theological approach to disability'. Teresa de Cartagena undoubtedly lived in the late medieval period, but her theology of disability, and indeed other aspects of her thought, were not typical of late medieval women religious writers. This is most obvious in her treatment of physical disability and suffering, in which she makes no reference to the suffering and death of Christ. Her understanding of her suffering, that it was imposed by God for her salvation, although not heretical is more typical of parts of the Old Testament than late medieval Christian thought. Although she acknowledges her sin, she makes no mention of the doctrine of salvation through Christ's death and resurrection nor of Catholic confession, penance and absolution. The second striking difference between Teresa and her sister medieval religious writers is the lack of conventional routes to claiming authority as an author, discussed in chapter 9. There is also the difference that she clearly did not accept in any way the teaching that women were intrinsically inferior to men; although she employs the conventional female humility tropes, a careful reading of her works shows that they are just that, conventions. While some of the other medieval and early modern writers who used such tropes were strong and influential women, for example Hildegard, Catherine of Sienna and Teresa of Avila, it is less clear that they had not to some extent accepted the concept of female inferiority.

There are other aspects of her writing that seem to be more modern than medieval. For example, when giving her reasons for writing in *Arboleda*, she explains her mental state and temptations in terms of psychology rather than demons. In *Admiración* she uses scientific facts in her botanical imagery of the core and medulla rather than the established allegorical treatment.

So, to return to the question which began this research project, why was Teresa de Cartagena different? I agree with those who say that we cannot just look at the Jewish background of *converso* authors as an explanation of everything: Teresa must be considered in the round. I believe the most important component of the explanation for her difference is her family. We know that her immediate family produced many men of outstanding intelligence and ability¹; it would not be surprising if it also produced intelligent and able women. The family also clearly valued education, and I have argued in chapter 3 that the evidence is that Teresa was well educated for a fifteenth century woman, perhaps unusually so, although she did not appear to have been inclined to scholarship until after she became deaf. The family were well-connected and politically astute; as discussed in chapter 8, Teresa's self-imposed silence could be explained, at least in part, by realisation of political dangers in speaking without knowing what had been said by others. However, I think it is clear, as discussed in chapter 10, that the family Jewish history and *converso* status was a significant factor in Teresa's theology and writing. The almost complete absence of any use of the name of Jesus, not only in her works but in works by other members of the family where it would naturally have been expected to occur, is in my

¹ Cantera Burgos discusses more than 30 male members of the family in four generations who were prominent in either the Church, politics or literature.

view the strongest evidence of *converso* sensibilities for which it is difficult to think of another explanation.

Besides her family background, her deafness is a second important factor. It is clear that her complete loss of hearing as an adult and the sense of isolation that it brought forced Teresa to look inside herself and to take seriously a faith that previously seems to have been superficial. However, while her suffering brought about theological reflection and acceptance of her fate, her relationship with God seems to have remained remote, one of respect rather than love. This mirrors what appears from what she says in her writings about fathers, which very likely was Teresa's relationship to her own father.

With regards to her gender, we might call Teresa a 'proto-feminist', particularly with regard to her evident belief that, contrary to the prevailing view and the Church's teaching, women were not inferior to men and could equally be endowed by God with knowledge and the ability to write and teach. In chapter 9 I suggest that the time and place in which she was writing could have influenced this view, with a queen in her own right on the throne of Castile and the likelihood that she was living in the most powerful and influential female monastic community in the kingdom. There are evident similarities between Teresa's views and those of Christine de Pizan, although there is no evidence that Teresa knew of Christine other than the mere fact that Pablo de Santa Maria was in France at the time Christine's writings were becoming known. However, both were intelligent women who had to overcome personal tragedies as young adults, and these may have been the circumstances that helped to shape their thinking on gender.

What is the historical relevance of these works? The fact that there is only one known manuscript of these works is evidence that they were not widely read and the works and their author seem to have been quickly forgotten. In the course of this research I feel that I have come to know Teresa, and I believe these works are important because, although not an autobiography in the modern sense, they provide a window into the mind of an intelligent and well-connected woman living in Castile at an important time in Spanish history, in particular in the history of Jewish-Christian relations in the Iberian peninsula. They are also important in the wider context of medieval women's writings because they were not contaminated by the needs of hagiography or the formal process for recognition as a saint, nor filtered through the male lens of a clerical amanuensis or confessor.

In conclusion, while Teresa de Cartagena was not a particularly original or profound theological thinker, although medieval women such as Julian of Norwich were capable of such thought, and did not evidence a deep spirituality such as that of Teresa of Avila, she has a unique voice which is of interest to scholars of late and early modern women writers.

TERESA DE CARTAGENA: A LATE MEDIEVAL WOMAN'S THEOLOGICAL APPROACH TO DISABILITY

APPENDICES

- Appendix A.....*Arboleda* - express Scriptural quotations.
Appendix B.....*Admiración* – express Scriptural quotations.
Appendix C..... *Arboleda* - other Scriptural quotations.
Appendix D..... *Admiración* – other Scriptural quotations.
Appendix E.....*Arboleda* - other quotations.
Appendix F..... *Admiración* – other Scriptural quotations.

APPENDIX A

ARBOLEDA – EXPRESS SCRIPTURAL QUOTATIONS

H	S	Teresa	Jerome Vulgate	Cite
38:1-2	23	Los que morauan en tiniebras y en sonbra de muerte, luz les es demonstrada	populus qui ambulabat in tenebris vidit lucem magnam habitantibus in regione umbrae mortis lux orta est eis	Is. 9:2
40:4-6	26	In camo et freno maxillas eorum constrinje, qui non approximant ad te.	[nolite fieri sicut equus et mulus quibus non est intellectus] in camo et freno maxillas eorum constringe qui non adproximant ad te	Ps. 31:9
41:24-25	27	(el Profecto donde dize) Pregunta al to padre e anunçiará a ti;; ellos tus mayors dirán a ti	memento dierum antiquorum cogita generationes singulas interroga patrem tuum et adnuntiabit tibi maiores tuos et dicent tibi	Dt. 32:7
44:8-9	29	La boz tuya es dulce e la tu cara fermosa	[columba mea in foraminibus petrae in caverna maceriae ostende mihi faciem tuam sonet] vox tua in auribus meis vox enim tua dulcis et facies tua decora	Ca. 2:14
44:12-14	29	Oye fija, e acata e ynclina tu oreja, oluida el pueblo tuyo y la casa de tu padre.	audi filia et vide et inclina aurem tuam et obliviscere populum tuum et domum patris tui	Ps. 44:11
45:15	30	(el meso Mandiamente que dize) Honrrarás al padre	honora patrem tuum [et matrem tuam ut sis longevus super terram quam Dominus Deus tuus dabit tibi]	Ex. 20:12
47:3	32	(lo que dize el Profeta) Conçibió dolor	concepit dolorem [et peperit iniquitatem et uterus eius praeparat dolos]	Jb. 15:35
47:28-29	32-3	(cañción de Dauit) En cabestro e freno las maxillas de aquellos costríñes, que a tí no se Allegan e quieren allegar	in camo et freno maxillas eorum constringe qui non accedunt ad te	Ps. 31:9
50:13-14	35	(aquella palabra evangélica que dize) Bienaventurado aquel siervo que quando viniere el Señor suyo le hallare vigilante.	beati servi illi quos cum venerit dominus invenerit vigilantes [amen dico vobis quod praecinget se et faciet illos discumbere et transiens ministrabit illis]	Lk. 12:37
51:14	36	(este mesmo Profecta dize en otro lugar) Señor, muéstranos la tu haz y seremos saluos.	Deus converte nos et ostende faciem tuam et salvi erimus	Ps. 79:4
53:20	38	(dezir con el Profecta) Castigando me castigó el Señor e muerte no me traxo	castigans castigavit me Dominus et morti non tradidit me	Ps. 117:18
54:30-31	39	(es escripto) Bienaventurados aquellos que a la çena del Cordero son llamados	[et dicit mihi scribe] beati qui ad cenam nuptiarum agni vocati sunt [et dicit mihi haec verba vera Dei sunt]	Rev. 19:9
55:3-6	39	(lo declara aquella parábola que nuestro Señor dize en el Evangelio) de lo qual yndignado aquel paterfamilias, dixo al siervo: Sal lugeo a las plaças y mercados y cuántos enfermos, claudos y débiles hallares, costríñelos que entran, porque sea llena mi casa.	[et reversus servus nuntiavit haec domino] suo tunc iratus pater familias dixit servo suo exi cito in plateas et vicos civitatis et pauperes ac debiles et caecos et claudos] introduc huc et ait dominus servo exi in vias et sepes [et compelle intrare ut impleatur domus mea]	Lk. 14:21, 23

55:21-23	40	(Onde avemos exemplo en Tobías) E como el angel Rafael la saludase diziendo "Gozo a ti syempre sea", respondió el santo onbre: "Quál gozo sera a mi, pus la luz del çielo no veo?"	ingressus itaque salutavit eum et dixit gaudium tibi semper sit et Tobias ait quale mihi gaudium erit qui in tenebris sedeo et lumen caeli non video	Tob. 5:11-12
56:7	40	(su mesmo palabra lo declara) Qualquier cosa que orando pidieres, creedque lo reçibirés.	et omnia quaecumque petieritis in oratione credentes accipietis	Matt. 21:22
56:8	40	(E dize mas) Llamad e sera abierto a vostros.	[et ego vobis dico petite et dabitur vobis quaeerite et invenietis] pulsate et aperietur vobis	Lk. 11:9
58:26 60:33-4 61:33-4	42 44 45	Libenter gloriabor.	[et dixit mihi sufficit tibi gratia mea nam virtus in infirmitate perficitur] libenter igitur gloriabor in infirmitatibus meis ut inhabitet in me virtus Christi	2 Cor. 12:9
59:1	43	(Ca dize) Porque more en mí la virtut de Cristo	[et dixit mihi sufficit tibi gratia mea nam virtus in infirmitate perficitur libenter igitur gloriabor in infirmitatibus meis] ut inhabitet in me virtus Christi	2 Cor. 12:9
61:4-6	44	(Dize el Profeta) Llamaron al Señor como fuesen atribulados; de las sus neçesidades los libró.	et clamaverunt ad Dominum cum tribularentur et de necessitatibus eorum liberavit eos	Ps. 106:13
61:15-17	45	(este mesmo Profeta donde dize) Llamarás a Mí e Yo lo exaudiré; con esto en la tribulaçión library le heñ e glorificar le he.	clamabit ad me et exaudiam eum cum ipso sum in tribulatione eripiam eum et clarificabo eum	Ps. 90:15
62:10-11	45	(vna palabra que en la estoria deste santo Apóstol de escriue, donde dize) La virtut en la enfermedad es acabada e perfecta.	[et dixit mihi sufficit tibi gratia mea] nam virtus in infirmitate perficitur [libenter igitur gloriabor in infirmitatibus meis ut inhabitet in me virtus Christi]	2 Cor. 12:9
65:16-17	49	(E por estos dize el Profeta) Suben fasta los çielos, desçienden los abismos; e las animas de aquéllos en males desfallesçen.	ascendunt in caelum et descendunt in abyssos anima eorum in adflictione consumitur	Ps. 106:26
66:28-29	50	(dize el Profeta) En el fuego me esaminaste e non es fallada en mi ninguna maldat	probasti cor meum visitasti nocte igne me examinasti et non est inventa in me iniquitas	Ps. 16:3
68:33-34	52	(Donde dize el Apóstol) La paçiençia es obra perfecta	patientia autem opus perfectum habeat [ut sitis perfecti et integri in nullo deficientes]	Ja. 1:4
71:16-17	54	(Ca escrito es) Angosta es la vía que lleva al onbre a la vida eternal	quam angusta porta et arta via quae ducit ad vitam [et pauci sunt qui inveniunt eam]	Matt .7:14
72:27-28	55	(quel Profeta dize en el Salmo) Yrán de virtud en virtud y verán a Dios de los dioses en Syón	etenim benedictiones dabit legis dator ibunt de virtute in virtutem videbitur Deus deorum in Sion	Ps. 83:8
73:29-30	56	(que Él mesmo declara y apreuva allý donde dize) A los que yo amo, arguyo e castigo	ego quos amo arguo et castigo [aemulare ergo et paenitentiam age]	Rev. 3:19
81:14-15	62	(Onde dize el Salmista) El temor del Señor es y permanesçe en todos los syglos	timor Domini mundus perseverans in saecula [iudicia Domini vera iustificata in semet ipsis]	Ps. 18:10

81:16	62	(Y en otro lugar dize) Comienço de sabiduría es el temor de Dios	initium sapientiae timor Domini [intellectus bonus omnibus facientibus eum laudatio eius manet in saeculum saeculi]	Ps.110:10
87:25- 26	67	(dize el Profecta) Dios fué justo, fuerte, paçiente	tu autem Domine Deus misericors et clemens patiens [et multae misericordiae et verus]	Ps. 85:15
90:14- 15	69- 70	(Onde escripto es) En el ombre nasçido es el trabajo, etç	homo ad laborem nascitur [et avis ad volatum]	Jb. 5:7
91:22- 23	70	(Onde dize el Profecta) Señor, preveniste a él bendiçiones dulçes	quoniam praevenisti eum in benedictionibus dulcedinis [posuisti in capite eius coronam de lapide pretioso]	Ps. 20:4
91:36- 92:1	71	Corréjeme, Señor, en misericordia e non en furor etç	corripe me Domine verumtamen in iudicio et non in furore tuo [ne forte ad nihilum redigas me]	Jer. 10:24
97:28	75	(del Patriarca Jacob ... diziendo) Bestia pésyma devoró al mi fojo Josep	[quam cum agnovisset pater ait tunica filii mei] est fera pessima comedit eum bestia devoravit Ioseph	Gen. 37:33
98:26- 30	76	(...lo tres amigos suyos [Job] ... yncrepauan diziendo) Enseñaste a muchos e las manos flacas rebaxaste, y agora vino sobre to plaga y defallesçiste. ¿Dónde es la paçiençia tuya e la perfección de las tuas vías, etç?	ecce docuisti multos et manus lassas roborasti ... nunc autem venit super te plaga et defecisti tetigit te et conturbatus es timor tuus fortitudo tua patientia tua et perfectio viarum tuarum	Jb. 4:3,5,6
98:35- 36	76- 77	(el muy estudiosa Maestro de las Paçiençias ... respondiό éstas que se syguen) ¿Quál es el mi fin porque paçientemente me aya, etç?	[quae est enim fortitudo mea ut sustineam] aut quis finis meus ut patienter agam	Jb. 6:11
100:1-3	78	(onde dize) En todas estas cosas non pecó Job en los sus labrios, ni alguna palabra vana contra Dios a fablado, etç	in omnibus his non peccavit Iob neque stultum quid contra Deum locutus est	Jb. 1:22
100:23- 24	78	(onde dize) El riso reputa a herr or e al gozo dixe (el Sabidor): ¿por qué engañas? etç	risum reputavi errorem et gaudio dixi quid frustra deciperis	Ecc. 2:2
101:12	79	(son respondidos de aquella respuesta que fué respondida y dada a la madre de los hijos de Zebedeo) No sabés qué demandaes.	[respondens autem Iesus dixit] nescitis quid petatis [potestis bibere calicem quem ego bibiturus sum dicunt ei possumus]	Matt. 20:22
104:22- 23	81	(esto aquellos tres amigos de Job ... dezian) ¿Dónde as la foruleza tuya, etç?	timor tuus fortitudo tua patientia tua et perfectio viarum tuarum	Jb. 4:6
104:30	82	(el Maestro de Paçiençias quanto les dixo) ¿Por ventura es fortaleza de piedra la mi forteleza?	nec fortitudo lapidum fortitudo mea nec caro mea aerea est	Jb. 6:12
106:5-6	82- 3	(es escripto) Sabidores son para hazer mal, pero el obrar bien no lo saben.	[quia stultus populus meus me non cognovit filii insipientes sunt et vecordes] sapientes sunt ut faciant mala bene autem facere nescierunt	Jer. 4:22
108:6-7	84	(Onde dize el Profeta) Yncliné mi coraçón a fazer las tus justificaçkiones por la retribuçion.	inclinavi cor meum ut facerem iustitias tuas propter aeternam retributionem	Ps. 118:112

APPENDIX B

ADMIRACIÓN – EXPRESS SCRIPTURAL QUOTATIONS

H	S	Teresa	Jerome Vulgate	Cite
116:3-5	90	(Onde el Apóstol dize) No somos ydonios o suficiētes de cogitar algune cos de nostros asý como de nostros mesmos; mas la nuestra suficiēncia, de Dios es.	non quod sufficientes simus cogitare aliquid a nobis quasi ex nobis sed sufficientia nostra ex Deo est	2 Cor. 3:5
118:11-12	92	(Onde dize el Profeta) Todas las cosas en la tu sabiduría feziste.	[quam multa sunt opera tua Domine] omnia in sapientia fecisti impleta est terra possessione tua	Ps. 103:24
118:21-23	92	(en el Génesy ... que Dios ... dixo) No es bueno que sea el onbre solo; hagámosle adjutorio semejante a él.	[dixit quoque Dominus Deus] non est bonum esse hominem solum faciamus ei adiutorium similem sui	Gen. 2:18
120:35-36	94	(Ondel Apóstol dize) No es allegamiento de personas açerca de Dios.	non est enim personarum acceptio apud Deum	Rom. 2:11
123:25-26	96	(Onde dize el Profeta) Todas las cosas sojuzgaste so los pies del omne, etç	omnia subiecisti sub pedibus eius [oves et boves universas insuper et pecora campi]	Ps. 8:8
124:5-6	96	(E dize el Apóstol) Donde abundó el delito, ende sobreabundó graçia.	[lex autem subintravit ut abundaret delictum] ubi autem abundavit delictum superabundavit gratia	Rom. 5:20
125:12-13	97	(el Profeta ... en el salmo donde dize) Señor, Señor nuestro, ¡quán maravilloso es el tu nombre en toda la tierra!	Domine Dominus noster quam admirabile est nomen tuum in universa terra [quoniam elevata est magnificentia tua super caelos]	Ps. 8:2
125:21-22	97	(repetir su admiración diziendo) O Señor, Señor nuestro, ¡quán admirable a maravilloso es el tu nombre en toda la tierra!	Domine Dominator noster quam admirabile est nomen tuum in universa terra	Ps. 8:10
126:14-15	98	(Onde el Profeta en persona del Señor de los profetas dize) El sacrefiçio de alabaças me honrrarás, etç	tibi sacrificabo hostiam laudis [et in nomine Domini invocabo]	Ps. 115:17
127:13	99	(en el libro que se llama <i>De Sabiduría</i> , onde dize) Toda la sabiduría es del Señor Dios	omnis sapientia a Deo Domino est et cum illo fuit semper et est ante aevum	Sir. 1:1
127:14	99	(E dize adelante) Él mesmo la crío por espíritu.	ipse creavit illam spiritu sancto [et vidit et dinumeravit et mensus est]	Sir. 1:9
129:20-21	101	(Onde dize el Profeta) Quánd grande es la multitud o muchedunbre de la tu dulçesa, la qual ascondiste a los que temen a ti.	quam magna multitudo dulcedinis tuae Domine; [quam abscondisti timentibus te perfecisti eis qui sperant in te in conspectu filiorum hominum]	Ps. 30:20
131:10-12	102	(que syn subda puedo dezir el Profeta) Segund la muchendunbre de los dolores míosen el mi coraçón, las consolaciones tuyas letificaron e alegraron al ánima mía.	secundum multitudinem dolorum meorum in corde meo consolationes tuae laetificaverunt animam meam	Ps. 93:19

131:27-28	103	(le llamaua con el Profeta diziendo) Sáluame Señor, ca entra el agua hasta al ánima mía.	salvum me fac Deus quoniam intraverunt aquae usque ad animam meam	Ps. 68:2
132:4,18-19	103	Ave merçed de mi, Fijo de Daud (twice)	[et clamavit dicens] Iesu Fili David miserere mei	Lk.18:38 (twice)
132:34	104	(o pregunta que nuestro Redentor hizo a aquel çiego que le daua bozesen el camino açerca de Jericó, conviene a saber) ¿Qué quieres que faga a ti?	[dicens] quid tibi vis faciam [at ille dixit Domine ut videam]	Lk.18:41
133:34	105	Réspice	[et Iesus dixit illi] respice [fides tua te salvum fecit]	Lk. 18:42
136:2-3	107	(el çiego Tobías ... diziendo) No quieras temer, hijo, porque pobre vida hazemos, ca avremos muchos bienes sy timiéremos a Dios, etç	noli timere fili mi pauperem quidem vitam gerimus sed multa bona habemus si timuerimus Deum [et recesserimus ab omni peccato et fecerimus bene]	Tob. 4:23
136:12	107	(onde el Profeta ... dize) Venid, hijos, oýd a mi; el temor del Señor enseñará a vos.	venite filii audite me timorem Domini docebo vos	Ps. 33:12
136:14	107	(E antes ... como preguntando dize) ¿Quién es el onbre que quiere la vida? etç	quis est homo qui vult vitam cupit videre dies bonos	Ps. 33:13
136:20-21	107-8	(este mismo Profeta añade, diziendo) Mejor es vn solo día en last us moradas, etç	quia melior est dies una in atriis tuis [super milia elegi abiectus esse in domo Dei mei magis quam habitare in tabernaculis peccatorum]	Ps. 83:11
136:28	108	(E luego adelante declara la su enseñanza e dotrina diziendo) Apártate del mal e faz bien, etç	deverte a malo et fac bonum [inquire pacem et persequere eam]	Ps. 33:15
137:12-14	108	(al Saluador ... dize en el Evangelico) Quien quiere venir en pos de mí, niegue a sí mismo, a tome la cruz suya e sígame, etç	[tunc Iesus dixit discipulis suis] si quis vult post me venire abneget semet ipsum et tollat crucem suam et sequatur me	Matt. 16:24
138:11-12	109	(Ondel Profeta ... dize) La tu manifiçençia e gloria tuya recontán	magnificentiam gloriae sanctitatis tuae loquentur [et mirabilia tua narrabunt]	Ps.144:5
138:13	109	([Ondel Profeta ... dize] e) recuentan los çielos la gloria de Dios	caeli enarrant gloriam Dei et opera manuum eius adnuntiat firmamentum	Ps. 18:2
138:14-15	109	(e gloria suya diziendo) Cantad al Señor, ca magnificamente lo hizo. Anunçiad esto en todo la tierra.	cantate Domino quoniam magnifice fecit adnuntiate hoc in universa terra	Is. 12:5
140:22-23	111	(el Profeta e santo Rey Daud dize) Maravilloso es Dios en los santos suyos, etç	terribilis Deus de sanctuario suo [Deus Israhel ipse dabit fortitudinem et robur populo benedictus Deus]	Ps. 67:36
140:31-32	111	(dixera la soberana Verdad) Mayor gozo sera en el çielo por vn pecador haziente peniençia, etç	[dico vobis quod ita] gaudium erit in caelo super uno peccatore paenitentiam habente [quam super nonaginta novem iustis qui non indigent paenitentia]	Lk. 15:7

APPENDIX C

ARBOLEDA – OTHER SCRIPTURAL QUOTATIONS

H	S	Teresa	Jerome Vulgate	Cite
37:11	23	Oprobrium hominum et abiecio plebis	[ego autem sum vermis et non homo] obprobrium hominum et dispectio plebis	Ps. 21:7
38:2-3	24	E con esta Luz verdadera que alumbra a todo omne qe viene en este mundo	erat lux vera quae inluminat omnem hominem venientem in mundum	Jn. 1:9
42:1	27	La fe sin obras es muerta	[vis autem scire o homo inanis quoniam] fides sine operibus otiosa est	Ja. 2:20
42:9-10	27	Ca el que no oye, ¿cómo responderá?	quomodo ergo invocabunt in quem non crediderunt aut quomodo credent ei quem non audierunt quomodo autem audient sine praedicante	Rom. 10:14
44:12-14	31	(E sy todo el linaje de las cobdiçias tenporales e vanas ouises dezir, non dubdo) que ygualase su número a los doze tribus.	et audivi numerum signatorum centum quadraginta quattuor milia signati ex omni tribu filiorum Israhel	Rev. 7:4
52:21-4	37	...e como el padre discreto castiga al hijo culpable con amor e piadat bien asý el çeestial Padre quiso corregir mis culpas con paternal caridat.	quem enim diligit Dominus castigat flagellat autem omnem filium quem recipit	Heb. 12:6
58:12-13	42	¿Cómo seré dina, o qué retribuyré yo al Señor por tantos bienes como en este mi mal se continenen?	quid retribuam Domino pro omnibus quae retribuit mihi	Ps. 115:12
58:17-18	42	Y son multiplicados mis pecados sobre las arenas del mar	tu locutus es quod bene mihi faceres et dilatares semen meum sicut harenam maris quae prae multitudine numerari non potest	Gen. 32:12
59:10-11	43	...porque como somos yguales en las pasiones seamos en las resureçiones...	si enim conplantati facti sumus similitudini mortis eius simul et resurrectionis erimus	Rom. 6:5
62:4-5	45	...e no temamos senbrar en lágrimas por exultaçión e gozo	qui seminant in lacrimis in exultatione metent	Ps. 125:5
63:25-26	47	...y renovarás asý como águila la jouentut nuestra.	qui replet bonis ornamentum tuum innovabitur sicut aquilae iuventus tua	Ps. 102:5
65:36-66:1	49	E sy el uelo de la cobdiçia redraren delante sus ojos...	sed usque in hodiernum diem cum legitur Moses velamen est positum super cor eorum [16] cum autem conversus fuerit ad Deum aufertur velamen	2 Cor. 3:15-16
73:27-8	56	...la fuente que es llamada fuente de agua biua...	respondit Iesus et dixit ei si scires donum Dei et quis est qui dicit tibi da mihi bibere tu forsitan petisses ab eo et dedisset tibi aquam vivam	Jn. 4:10
75:38	58	...del aquel soberano Fýsico...	et respondens Iesus dixit ad illos non egent qui sani sunt medico sed qui male habent non veni vocare iustos sed peccatores in paenitentiam	Lk. 5:31-2
77:20-2	59	Pues la jouentad tanto la ynpuña que de hedat de treynta años	et ecce homo erat in Hierusalem cui nomen Symeon et homo iste iustus et	Lk. 2:25

		hazer paresçer más viejos que Symeón el Justo.	timoratus expectans consolationem Israhel et Spiritus Sanctus erat in eo	
81:19-20	62	El temor de seruidunbre es el que el syervo teme a su señor y el temor filial es el que el hijo a su padre	non enim accepistis spiritum servitutis iterum in timore sed accepistis Spiritum adoptionis filiorum in quo clamamus Abba Pater	Rom. 8:15
86:26-7	66-7	Esta piedra no es otra syno aquella angular que reproaron los hedificantes...	vobis igitur honor credentibus non credentibus autem lapis quem reprobaverunt aedificantes hic factus est in caput anguli	1 Pet. 2:7
92:30-2	71	...al Señor poderoso que en la nave segura de trabajosa dolencia le a librado de las hondas oscuras deste mar peligroso...	navigantibus autem illis obdormiit et descendit procella venti in stagnum et conplebantur et periclitabantur [24] accedentes autem suscitaverunt eum dicentes praeceptor perimus at ille surgens increpavit ventum et tempestatem aquae et cessavit et facta est tranquillitas	Lk. 8:23-4

APPENDIX D

ADMIRACIÓN – OTHER SCRIPTURAL QUOTATIONS

H	S	Teresa	Jerome Vulgate	Cite
112:23-6	87	...y pues el fundamento quedó sin fazer, sea el hedifiçio no tal ni tan bueno como a vuestra grand discreçión presentar se deufa, mas asý pequeño e flaco como de mi pobre facultad se espera.	similis est homini aedificanti domum qui fodit in altum et posuit fundamenta supra petram inundatione autem facta inlismus est flumen domui illi et non potuit eam movere fundata enim erat supra petram qui autem audivit et non fecit similis est homini aedificanti domum suam supra terram sine fundamento in quam inlismus est fluvius et continuo concidit et facta est ruina domus illius magna	Lk. 6:48-9
116:12-14	90	Este potentisymo Hazedor hizo el sexu buril primeramente, e segundo e por adjutorio de aquél fizo el fimíneo.	et aedificavit Dominus Deus costam quam tulerat de Adam in mulierem et adduxit eam ad Adam	Gen 2:22
120:32-4	94	[Dios]...asý a los malos como a los buenos...a todo haze merçedes e graçias...	ut sitis filii Patris vestri qui in caelis est qui solem suum oriri facit super bonos et malos et pluit super iustos et iniustos	Matt. 5:45
141:29-30	112	...e cogerá agua en gozo de las fuentes del Salvador.	haurietis aquas in gaudio de fontibus salvatoris	Is. 12:3

APPENDIX E

ARBOLEDA – OTHER QUOTATIONS

p. H	p. S	Teresa	Original Latin	Cite
53:13-14	38	Saber Dios mudar la sentençia, si tu supieres emendar el delito	Novit Dominus mutare sententiam, si tu noveris emendare delictum.	St Ambrose, <i>Expositio evangelii secundum Lucam libris X comprehensa</i> , PL 15:1564
58:4-5	42	Onde diz Bo[e]çio que el mayor mal que tienen los malos es tener este poder para hazer mal.	Nam si miserum est volvisse prava, potuisse miserius est, sine quo voluntatis miserae langueret effectus.	Boethius, <i>Philosophiae consolationes, liberq quartus, prosa IV</i> , PL 63:804
58:15-16	42	desque miro lo que dize Sant Gerónimo: que el loor en la boca del pecador no hes hermoso.	[Secunda ad sanctus, qui ad Dei canticum provocatur.] Non est enim pulchra laudatio in ore peccatoris.	St Jerome, 'Epistola CXLVII' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 22:1198
65:6-7	48	segunt aquello que dize Agustino que no haze ser mártir la pena, mas la causa	Illud ergo praecipue commonendi estis, quod assidue commoneri, et semper cogitare debetis, quod martyrem Dei non facit poena, sed causa.	St Augustine, 'Sermo CCLXXXV' in <i>Opera omnia</i> PL 38:1293
66:30-2	50	Asý comc oro en el fuego prouó el Señor a sus escojidos, e que asý [como] olocausto o sacrificio los reçibió.	Et si coram hominibus tormenta passi sunt, Deus tentavit eos; tanquam aurum in fornace probavit eos, et quasi holocausta accepit eos.	Common of Several Martyrs, <i>Missal</i>
71:22-3	54	Ond dize Sant Gregorio: "A los grandes guardalones ninguo puede venir syno per grandes trabajos."	Sed ad magna praemia perveniri non potest, nisi per magnos labores	St Gregory the Great, 'Homiliarium in Evangelia, Liber II Homilia XXXVII' in <i>Opera omnia</i> PL 76:1275
73:24-26	56	Como dize Sant Gregorio en vna omelia: "Aquello que la verdat por sí mesma espone o declara, la fragelidad vmana escudriñar no presume."	Quam enim per semetipsam Veritas exposuit, hanc discutere humana fragilitas non praesumit.	St Gregory the Great, 'Homiliarium in Evangelia, Liber I Homilia XV' in <i>Opera omnia</i> PL 76:1131
75:2-3 and 80:31-33	57 and 62	oia a Sant Bernaldo que dize: "La dolença llaga el cuerpo y cura la alma."	Adversa carnis, remedia sunt animi: aegritudo carnem vulnerat, mentem curat: languor enim vitia excoquit, languor vires libidinis frangit.	St Bernard, 'Liber de modo bene vivendi, LXIII, De Infirmirate', in <i>Opera omnia</i> PL 184:1264
86:23-26 and 87:34-88:8	66 and 68	dize Sant Gerónimo en vna epístola: "Aquél será loado, aquél será predicado bienadventurado, que como començare a	Quia enim impossibile est in sensum hominis non irruere innatum medullarum calorem, ille laudatur, ille praedicatur beatus, qui ut coeperit	St Jerome, 'Epistola XXII ad Eustochiam, Paulae Filium' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 22:398

		maginar, matará sus cogitaciones e las atará a la piedra."	cogitare sordida, statim interficit cogitatus, et allidit ad petram: 'petram autem Christus est '	
86:31-33	67	Onde dize el santímyo doctor Agustino: "Quien fuere mordido de la astuça de Santaná, mire a Christo en la Cruz."	"Quomodo qui intuebantur illum serpentum, non peribant morsibus serpentum; sic qui intuentur fide mortem Christi, sanantur a morsibus peccatorum."	St Augustine, 'In Evangelium Joannis Tractatus, Tractate XII' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 35:1490
89:6-11	69	Onde Sant Gregorio en la omelia sobre este Evangelio, espondiendo est mesma palabra dize: "El marco esconderen la tierra es recibir el ygenio e aplicarle en las obras terras, el elogro espiritual no querer, el coraçón nunca alcançar de las cogitaciones baxas"	Talentum in terra abscondere est acceptum ingenium in terrenis actibus implicare, lucrum spiritale non quaerere, cor a terrenis cogitationibus numquam levare.	St Gregory the Great, Homiliarium in Evangelia, Liber I Homilia IX' in <i>Opera omnia</i> PL 76:1107
104:1-2	81	Onde dize el santo doctor Agustín, obispo: "Las tribulaciones obran pasçiença."	Nihil enim mali patientur, qui jam possunt dicere quod ille vir spiritualis exsultat et praedicat Apostolus dicens: 'Gloriamus in tribulationibus; scientes quoniam tribulatio patientiam operatur...' OR ...scientes quia tribulatio patientiam operatur, patientia probationem, probationem spem, spes vero non confundit.	St Augustine, 'De Agone Christiano, Liber unus, Caput VII' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 40:295 St Augustine, 'Epistola CXLV' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 33:595

APPENDIX F

ADMIRACION – OTHER QUOTATIONS

p. H	p. S	Teresa	Original Latin	Cite
114:31-115:3	89	E a esta synple quistión parésceme que soy respondida e avn satisfecha por el glorioso doctor Sant Agostín en la omelía sobre el Evangelio que recuenta el milagro que nuestro Redentor hizo de los çinco panes. E dize asý: 'Mayor milagro es la governaçión que no la saturaçión de çinco mil con çinco panes'	[Miraculum grande factum est, dilectissimi, ut de quinque panibus et duobis piscibus saturarentur quique hominum millia, et residua fragmentorum implerent duodecim cophinus.] Grande miraculum: sed non multum mirabimur factum, si attendamus facientem	St Augustine, 'Sermo CXXX' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 38:725
115:6-9	89	E añade más este snato e doctor en la sentençia syguiente diziendo: "Aquello es mirado non porque mayor sea, mas porque pocas vezes o raramente acaesca."	Sed quia illud omni anno fecit, nemo miratur. Admirationem tollit non facti vilitas, sed assiduatis.	St Augustine, 'Sermo CXXX' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 38:725
116:17-20	90	Onde San Gerónimo en el sermón de la Asunçión de nuestra Señora, dize: "Tel es e tan grand es e ynmenso e bueno este Señor quanto e qual Él mesmo se conosçe o Él mesmo se sabe"		Unknown – not Jerome, spurious (Catholic Encyclopedia)
121:2-5	94	E avn asý me paresçe que lo canta la Yglesia en el Introyto primero de Quaresama onde dize: "Mercedeador de todos, o merçed ayas de todos, Dios, e ninguna cosa aborreçiste de aquello que en el mundo heziste."	Misereris omnium, Domine, et nihil odisti eorum quae fecisiti...	Missal
133:2-5	104	E avn menbrose estonçes me entendimiento aquello que dize Santo Agostín sobre aquella palabra del Evangelio: "Quidquid pecieritis Patrem yn nomine meo, etç."	Domini verba nunc ista tractanda sunt, 'Amen, amen dico vobis, si quid petieritis Patrem in nomine meo, dabit vobis.'	St Augustine, 'In Joannis Evangelium Tractatus CII' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 35:1896.
133:5-7	104-5	Onde dize que no pide en nonbre del Saluador aquel que pide alguna cosa contra la razón de su espiritual salud	...non peti in nomine Salvatoris quidquid petitur contra rationem salutis.	St Augustine, 'In Joannis Evangelium Tractatus CII' in <i>Opera omnia</i> , PL 35:1896

BIBLIOGRAPHY

MANUSCRIPT AND ARCHIVAL SOURCES

Escorial

Real Biblioteca de El Escorial

h-III-24, fo. 50–65 Admiración operum Dey.

h-III-24, fo. 1–49 Arboleda de los enfermos.

Madrid

Real Academia de la Historia (RAH)

Colección Salazar y Castro

B-31, fo. 117-147.

B-92, fo. 62-82.

D-25, fo. 197v-196.

E-7, fo. 27-30.

D-17, fo. 12r.

O-19, fo. 251v.

Rome

Vatican archives

Registra Supplicationem 436, fo. 114v -115.

PRINTED PRIMARY SOURCES

À Kempis, T., *The Imitation of Christ*, trans. Sherley-Price, L., (London, 1952).

Albertus, *De vegetabilibus*, eds. Jessen, K.F.W., and Meyer, E.H.F., (Berolini, 1867).

Ambrose, *Expositio Evangelii Secundum Lucam Libris X Comprehensa*, PL 15:1527 – 1850 (Paris, 1879).

Angela of Foligno, *Complete Works*, trans. Lachance, P., (New York, NY, 1993).

Aquinas, T., 'De virtutibus cardinalibus', in Bazzi, P. (ed.), *Quaestiones disputatae vol. 2* (Rome, 1953).

_____, *Summa theologiae*, ed. Gilby, T., (London, New York, NY, 1964-9).

Aristotle, *Nichomancean Ethics*, ed. Bywater, I., (Oxford, 1894).

- Augustine, *De agone Christiano, Liber unus*, PL 40:289-310 (Paris, 1861).
- _____, *Epistolae*, PL 33:60-1094 (Paris, 1861).
- _____, *In Evangelium Joannis Tractatus*, PL 35:1379-976 (Paris, 1861).
- _____, *Sermones ad Populam*, PL 38:23-1483 (Paris, 1865).
- _____, *De Trinitate I-XII*, ed. Mountain, W.J., CCSL 50 (Turnhout, 1968).
- Beltrán de Heredia, V., *Bulario de la Universidad de Salamanca (1219-1549)*, 3 vols (Salamanca, 1966).
- Bernard, *A Rule of Good Life*, trans. Batt, A., (Menston, 1971).
- _____, *Letters of St Bernard of Clairvaux*, trans. James, B., (London, 1953).
- Boccaccio, *Concerning Famous Women*, trans. Guarino, G.A., (London, 1964).
- Bodenstedt, M.I., *The Vita Christi of Ludolphus the Carthusian* (Washington, DC, 1944).
- Cartagena, A. de, 'Oracional', ed. González-Quevedo, S., (Valencia, 1983).
- Cartagena, T. de, *Arboleda de los enfermos y Admiración operum Dey*, ed. Hutton, L.J., (Madrid, 1967).
- The Collected Works of Teresa of Avila*, trans. Kavanaugh, K. and Rodriguez, O., 3 vols (Washington, DC, 1987).
- Córdoba, Fray Martin de, *Jardín de Nobles Donzellas, Fray Martin de Córdoba: A Critical Edition and Study* ed. Goldberg, H., (Chapel Hill, NC, 1974).
- Crónica de don Álvaro de Luna, condestable de Castilla, Maestro de Santiago*, ed. J. de Mata Carriazo, (Madrid, 1940).
- Crónica de Juan II de Castilla*, ed. Carriazo y Arroquia, J.d.M., (Madrid, 1982).
- Francis and Clare: The Complete Works*, trans. and eds. Armstrong, R.J., and Brady, I.C., (Mahwah, N.J., 1982).
- Francis of Assisi: Early Documents*, trans. and eds. Armstrong, R.J., Hellmann, J.A.W., and Short, W.J., 3 vols (Hyde Park, N.Y., 1999).
- Gregory the Great, *Homiliarum In Evangelia, Libri Duo*, PL 76:1075-1312 (Paris, 1857).
- _____, *Forty Gospel Homilies*, trans. Hurst, D., (Kalamazoo, MI, 1990).
- _____, *Moralium Libri Sive Expositio In Librum Beati Job. Pars I*, PL 75:509 - 1162 (Paris, 1849).

- _____, *Moralia in Job I-X*, ed. Adriaen, M., CCSL 143, (Turnhout, 1979).
- Guzmán, F.P. de, 'Comienza la crónica del serenísimo príncipe Don Juan, segundo rey deste nombre en Castilla y en León', in L. Galíndez de Carvajal (ed.), *Crónicas de los reyes de Castilla*, (3 vols, Madrid, 1877), ii, pp. 273-719.
- _____, *Pen Portraits of Illustrious Castilians*, trans. Gillette, M. and Zehngut, L., (Washington, DC, 2003).
- Jerome, 'Letters and Selected Works', in Schaff, P. and Wace, H., (eds.), *A select library of Nicene and post-Nicene Fathers of the Christian Church : second series*, Vol 6 (Edinburgh, Grand Rapids, MI, 1988).
- Jubilus rhythmicus, de nomine Jesu, 'Jesu Dulcis Memoria'*, PL 184:1317-20 (Paris, 1859).
- Julian of Norwich, *Revelations of Divine Love*, trans. Wolters, C. (London, 1966).
- Lawrance, J.N.H., *Un tratado de Alonso de Cartagena sobre la educación y los estudios literarios*, (Barcelona, 1979).
- Liber de modo bene vivendi, ad sororem*, PL 184: 1199 - 1306 (Paris, 1859).
- Libro de devociones y oficios de Constanza de Castilla*, ed. Wilkins, C.L., (Exeter, 1998).
- López de Ayala, P., 'Las flores de los "Morales de Job"', in Branciforti, F. (ed.), *Biblioteca letteraria 7* (Firenze, 1963).
- Luna, P. de, *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana*, ed. Simó Castillo, J.B., (Vinaròs, 1998).
- Martínez de Toledo, A., '*Arcipreste de Talavera, o, Corbacho*', ed. Gerli, E.M., (Madrid, 1979).
- Medieval Women's Visionary Literature*. ed. Petroff, E.A., (New York, NY, 1986).
- Mendoza, Fray Íñigo de, *Fray Íñigo de Mendoza: Cancionero*, ed. Rodríguez-Puértolas, J., (Madrid, 1968).
- _____, *Fray Íñigo de Mendoza y sus 'Coplas de vita Christi'*, ed. Rodríguez-Puértolas, J., (Madrid, 1968).
- Riesco Terrero, A., *Datos para la historia del Real Convento de Clarissas de Salamanca: Catálogo documental de su archivo*, (León, 1977).
- Seidenspinner-Núñez, D., *The Writings of Teresa de Cartagena*, (Cambridge, 1998).
- '*Speculum Virginum: Selected Excerpts*', in Mews, C.J. (ed.), *Listen Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages*, (New York, NY, 2001), pp. 269-96.

Summa de bono of Phillip the Chancellor, ed. N. Wiki, 2 vols (Berne, 1985).

William of Saint Thierry, *The Golden Epistle: A Letter to the Brethren at Mont Dieu*, trans. Shewring, W., (London, 1930).

ELECTRONIC PRIMARY SOURCES

Aquinas, T., 'Summa Theologica, Prima Secundae Partis' ed. Knight, K., (New Advent), <http://www.newadvent.org/summa/2085.htm>.

Gregory the Great, 'Epistle' in Parker, J.H. (trans.) *The Books of the Morals of St. Gregory the Pope, or an Exposition on the Book of Blessed Job, Volume 1 – the First Part* (Lectionary Central), <http://www.lectionarycentral.com/GregoryMoralia/Epistle.html>.

Jerome Vulgate Bible (Perseus Digital Library of Tufts University), <http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/text?doc=Perseus:text:1999.02.0060>

PRINTED SECONDARY WORKS

Ahlgren, G.T.W., *Teresa of Avila and the Politics of Sanctity* (Ithaca, NY, 1996).

Alpert, M., *Crypto-Judaism and the Spanish Inquisition* (Basingstoke, 2001).

Amador de los Ríos, José, *Historia crítica de la literatura española* 7 vols (Madrid, 1865).

Bachrach, B.S., *Early Medieval Jewish Policy in Western Europe* (Minneapolis, MN, 1977).

Baer, Y., *A History of the Jews in Christian Spain* 2 vols (Philadelphia, PA, 1961).

Baldwin, J.W., *The Scholastic Culture of the Middle Ages, 1000-1300* (Lexington, MA, 1971).

Barber, R.W., *Bestiary: An English Version of the Bodleian Library, Oxford M.S. Bodley 764* (Woodbridge, 1993).

Barnett, D., 'The Voice of the Virgin: Accessible Authority in the Visitation Episode of Isabel de Villena's *Vita Christi* ', *La Corónica*, 35, no. 1 (2006), 23-45.

Barraclough, G., *The Medieval Papacy* (London, 1968).

Barton, S., *A History of Spain* (Basingstoke, 2004).

Beattie, T., *Woman* (London, 2003).

Beceiro Pita, I. and Cordoba de la Llave, R., *Parentesco, poder y mentalidad* (Madrid, 1990).

- Beer, F., *Women and Mystical Experience in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge, 1992).
- Beinart, H., *Conversos on Trial: The Inquisition in Ciudad Real*, trans. Guiladi, Y., (Jerusalem, 1981).
- Beltrán de Heredia, V., 'The Beginnings of Dominican Reform in Castile', in Highfield, R. (ed.), *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain*, (London, 1972), pp. 226-47.
- Beverley, J., 'Class or Caste: A Critique of the Castro Thesis', in Surtz, R.E., Ferrán, J. and Testa, D.P. (eds.), *Américo Castro: the Impact of His Thought*, (Madison, WI, 1988), pp. 141-9.
- Billier, P., 'Women and Texts in Languedocian Catharism', in Smith, L. and Taylor, J.H.M. (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995), pp. 171-82.
- Birch, D.J., *Pilgrimage to Rome in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge, 1998).
- Blamires, A., 'The Limits of Bible Study for Medieval Women', in Smith, L. and Taylor, J.H.M. (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995), pp. 1-12.
- _____, *The Case for Women in Medieval Culture* (Oxford, 1997).
- Bloomfield, M.W., *The Seven Deadly Sins* (East Lansing, MI., 1952).
- Bonanchia Hernando, J.A., and Casado Alonso, H., 'La segunda mitad del siglo XIV y el siglo XV', in Valdeón, J. (ed.), *Burgos en la Edad Media*, (Valladolid, 1984), pp. 213-502.
- Boss, S.J., *Empress and Handmaid: On Nature and Gender in the Cult of the Virgin Mary* (London, 2000).
- _____, 'The Development of the Virgin's Cult in the High Middle Ages', in Boss, S.J. (ed.), *Mary: The Complete Resource* (London, 2007), pp. 149-72.
- Bruce, S.G., *Silence and Sign Language in Medieval Monasticism: The Cluniac Tradition c. 900-1200* (Cambridge, 2007)
- Burrow, J.A., *The Ages of Man: A Study of Medieval Writing and Thought* (Oxford, 1986).
- Bynum, C.W., *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (Berkeley, CA, 1982).
- _____, "'...and Woman his Humanity': Female Imagery in the Religious Writing of the Late Middle Ages', in Bynum, C.W., Harrell, S. and Richman, P. (eds.), *Gender and Religion: On the Complexity of Symbols* (Boston, MA, 1986), pp. 257-88.
- _____, *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women* (Berkeley, CA, London, 1987).

- _____, *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion* (New York, NY, 1991).
- _____, *Wonderful Blood: Theology and Practice in Late Medieval Northern Germany and Beyond* (Philadelphia, PA, 2007).
- Cammarata, J.F., 'Teresa de Cartagena: Writing from a Silent Space in a Silent World', *Monographic Review/Revista Monográfica*, 16 (2000), 38-51.
- Cantera Burgos, F., *Alvar García de Santa María y su familia de conversos* (Madrid, 1952).
- _____, 'Fernando del Pulgar and the Conversos', in Highfield, R. (ed.), *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 296-353.
- Carpenter, D.E., *Alfonso X and the Jews: An Edition of and Commentary on Siete partidas 7.24 'De los judíos'* (Berkeley, CA, 1986).
- Castro, A., *España en su historia: cristianos, moros y judíos* (Buenos Aires, 1948).
- _____, *The Structure of Spanish History*, trans. King, E.L., (Princeton, NJ, 1954).
- _____, *The Spaniards: An Introduction to Their History*, trans. King, W.F. and Margaretten, S., (Berkeley, CA, 1971).
- Castro-Ponce, C., 'El sí de las hermanas: la escritura y lo intelectual en la obra de Teresa de Cartagena y Sor Juana Inés de la Cruz', *Cincinatti Romance Review*, 18 (1999), 15-21.
- _____, 'Imitatio Christi in the Writings of Teresa de Cartagena', *Magistra*, 9, no. 2 (2003), 55-65.
- Catherine of Siena, *Little Talks with God: Catherine of Siena*. ed. Carrigan, H.L.J., (Brewster, MA, 2001).
- Ceballos, A.R.G. de, *Guía artística de Salamanca* (León, 2005).
- Chalmers, B., 'The 'Jewish Question' in 15th and 16th Century Spain', *The Journal of Historical Review*, 16, no. 1 (1996), 2-22.
- Chazan, R., 'Undermining the Jewish Sense of Future: Alfonso of Valladolid and the New Christian Missionizing', in Myerson, M.D. and English, E.D. (eds.), *Christians, Muslims and Jews in Medieval and Early Modern Spain* (Notre Dame, IN, 2000), pp. 179-94.
- Clark, M.T., 'De Trinitate', in Stump, E. and Kretzmann, N. (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine*, (Cambridge, 2001), pp. 91-102.
- Cohen, E., 'Towards a History of European Physical Sensibility: Pain in the Later Middle Ages', *Science in Context*, 8, no. 1 (1995), 47-74.

- Cohen, J., *The Friars and the Jews: The Evolution of Medieval Anti-Judaism* (Ithaca NY, 1982).
- Collins, R., *The Arab Conquest of Spain: 710-797* (Oxford, 1989).
- _____, 'Visigothic Spain, 409-711', in Carr, R. (ed.), *Spain: a History* (Oxford, 2000), pp. 39-62.
- Constable, G., *Three Studies in Medieval Religious and Social Thought* (Cambridge, 1995).
- Cooper, E., *Castillos señoriales en la corona de Castilla*, 4 vols (Salamanca, 1991).
- Corominas, J., and Pascual, J.A., *Diccionario crítico etimológico castellano e hispánico*, 6 vols (Madrid, 1980).
- Correas, G., Combet, L., Jammes, R., and Mir-Andreu, M., *Vocabulario de refranes y frases proverbiales (1627)* (Madrid, 2000).
- Corry, J.M., 'Some Observations on Teresa de Cartagena's Humble Disclaimers', *Quaderni Ibero-Americani*, 95 (2004), 5-14.
- Cortés Timoner, M.M., 'La predicación en palabras de mujer: Teresa de Cartagena y Juana de la Cruz', in Freixas, M. and Iriso, S. (eds.), *Actas del VIII Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval*, (Santander, 2000), pp. 571-81.
- _____, *Teresa de Cartagena, primera escritora mística en lengua castellana* (Málaga, 2004).
- Cruz Muriel Tapia, M., *Antifeminismo y subestimación de la mujer en la literatura medieval castellana* (Caceres, 1991).
- Cruz, V. de la, 'Personajes ilustres medievales', in Nebreda Perez, S. (ed.), *Historia de Burgos II Edad Media*, 2 vols (Burgos, 1987), ii, 387-432.
- Covarrubias, S. de, *Tesoro de la lengua castellana o española*, Riquer, Martin de (ed.), (Barcelona, 1943).
- D'Avray, D. L., *Medieval Marriage: Symbolism and Society* (Oxford, 2005).
- Delio, I., *Crucified Love: Bonaventure's Mysticism of the Crucified Christ* (Quincy, IL, 1998).
- Deyermond, A., "'El convento de dolencias': the Works of Teresa de Cartagena", *Journal of Hispanic Philology*, 1 (1976), 19-29.
- _____, 'Spain's First Women Writers', in Miller, B. (ed.), *Women in Hispanic Literature: Icons and Fallen Idols*, (Berkeley, CA, London, 1983), pp. 27-52.
- _____, 'Uses of the Bible in the *Poema de Fernán González*', in Hook, D. and Taylor, B. (eds.), *Cultures in Contact in Medieval Spain*, (London, 1990), pp. 47-70.

- Dodd, M., 'John of the Cross: His Person, His Times, His Writings', *Carmelite Studies IV*, (Washington, DC, 1992), pp. 7-28.
- Dreyer, E., 'Medieval Women Mystics: A Foreign World?', *Spirit and Life: A Journal of Contemporary Franciscanism*, 1 (1991), 1-10.
- Dronke, P., *Women Writers of the Middle Ages: A Critical Study of Texts from Perpetua to Marguerite Porete* (Cambridge, 1984).
- Duffy, E., *Marking the Hours: English People and their Prayers* (New Haven, CT, 2006).
- Dunn, J.D.G., *Word Biblical Commentary, Romans* (Dallas, TX, 1988).
- Edwards, J., *Christian Córdoba: The City and its Region in the Late Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 1982).
- _____, 'Fifteenth-Century Franciscan Reform and the Spanish *Converso*: The Case of Fray Alonso de Espina', in *Monastic Studies: the Continuity of Tradition* (Bangor, 1989), pp. 203-10.
- _____, 'Trial of an Inquisitor: The Dismissal of Diego Rodriguez Lucero, Inquisitor of Córdoba, in 1508', in *Religion and Society in Spain. c.1492* (Aldershot, 1996), ch. IX.
- _____, 'The Beginnings of a Scientific Theory of Race? Spain 1450-1600', in *Religion and Society in Spain. c.1492* (Aldershot, 1996), ch. VII.
- _____, 'The *Conversos*: A Theological Approach', in *Religion and Society in Spain. c.1492* (Aldershot, 1996), ch. I.
- _____, 'Letter', *La Corónica*, 25, no. 2 (1997), 159-63.
- _____, *Inquisition* (Stroud, 1999).
- _____, *The Spain of the Catholic Monarchs: 1474-1520* (Oxford, 2000).
- _____, *Torquemada and the Inquisitors* (Stroud, 2005).
- _____, *Ferdinand and Isabella* (Harlow, 2005).
- _____, 'New Light on the *Converso* Debate? The Jewish Christianity of Alfonso de Cartagena and Juan de Torquemada', in Barton, S. and Linehan, P. (eds.), *Cross, Crescent and Conversion: Studies on Medieval Spain in Memory of Richard Fletcher* (Leiden, 2008), pp. 311-26.
- Eliav-Feldon, M., Isaac, B., and Ziegler, J., 'Introduction', in Eliav-Feldon, M., Isaac, B. and Ziegler, J. (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 1-31.
- Ellington, D.S., *From Sacred Body to Angelic Soul: Understanding Mary in Late Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (Washington, D.C., 2001).

- Ellis, D.S., 'Unifying Imagery in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena', *Journal of Hispanic Philology*, 17 (1992), 45-53.
- Elukin, J.M., 'From Jew to Christian? Conversion and Immutability in Medieval Europe', in Muldoon, J. (ed.), *Varieties of Religious Conversion in the Middle Ages* (Gainesville, FL, 1997), pp. 171-89.
- _____, *Living Together, Living Apart: Rethinking Jewish-Christian Relations in the Middle Ages* (Princeton, NJ, 2007).
- Escrivá de Balaguer, J.M., *La abadesa de Las Huelgas* (Madrid, 1944).
- Estow, C., *Pedro the Cruel of Castile: 1350-1369* (Leiden, 1995).
- Fernández Gallardo, L., *Alonso de Cartagena: Una biografía política en la Castilla del siglo XV* (Valladolid, 2002).
- Fernández García, M.d.l.A., 'Criterios inquisitoriales para detectar al marrano: los criptojudíos en Andalucía en los siglos XVI y XVII', in Alcalá, A. (ed.), *Judíos, sefarditas, conversos: la expulsión de 1492 y sus consecuencias* (Valladolid, 1995),
- Flanagan, S., *Hildegard of Bingen, 1098-1179: A Visionary Life* (London, 1989).
- Gampel, B.R., 'Yitzhak Baer's *A History of Jews in Christian Spain*', in Baer, Y. *A History of Jews in Christian Spain* (Philadelphia, PA, 1961), i, xv-lvii.
- García Ballester, L., 'Galenism and Medical Teaching at the University of Salamanca in the Fifteenth Century', in Arrizabalaga, J. (ed.), *Galen and Galenism: Theory and Medical Practice from Antiquity to the European Renaissance* (Aldershot, 2002), ch. X.
- García, C., 'Los tratados de Teresa de Cartagena dentro de la evolución de la epístola', in Beresford, A.M. (ed.), *'Quien hubiese tal ventura': Medieval Hispanic Studies in Honour of Alan Deyermond* (London, 1997), pp. 149-57.
- Gerli, E.M., 'Performing Nobility: Mosén Diego de Valera and the Poetics of *Converso* Identity', *La Corónica*, 25, no. 1 (1996), 19-36.
- _____, 'The *Converso* Condition: New Approaches to an Old Question', in Corfis, I.A. and Harris-Northall, R. (eds.), *Medieval Iberia: Changing Societies and Cultures in Contact and Transition* (Woodbridge, 2007), pp. 3-15.
- Gilman, S., 'The *Conversos* and the Fall of Fortune', in Hornik, M.P. (ed.), *Collected Studies in Honour of Américo Castro's Eightieth Year* (Oxford, 1965), pp. 127-36.
- _____, *The Spain of Fernando de Rojas: The Intellectual and Social Landscape of La Celestina* (Princeton, NJ, 1972).
- Gilson, E., *The Spirit of Medieval Philosophy*, trans. Downes, A.H.C., (London, 1936).

- Gitlitz, D., 'Letter', *La Corónica*, (1997), 163-6.
- Glasfurd, A., *The Antipope (Peter de Luna, 1342-1423): A Study in Obstinance* (London, 1965).
- Glick, T.F., 'Convivencia: An Introductory Note' in Mann, V.B., Glick, T.F. and Dodds, J.D. (eds.) *Convivencia: Jews, Muslims and Christians in Medieval Spain* (New York, NY, 1992), pp. 1-9.
- Gómez Redondo, F., *Historia de la prosa medieval castellana*, 4 vols (Madrid, 2002).
- Graux, C.H., and Graux, H., *Notices bibliographiques et autres articles publiés dans les revues critique* (Paris, 1884).
- Grayzel, S., *The Church and the Jews in the XIIIth Century* (New York, NY, 1966).
- Greenspan, K., 'Autohagiography and Medieval Women's Spiritual Autobiography', in Chance, J. (ed.), *Gender and Text in the Later Middle Ages* (Gainesville, FL, 1996), pp. 216-35.
- Griffiths, F.J., *The Garden of Delights: Reform and Renaissance for Women in the Twelfth Century* (Philadelphia, PA, 2007).
- Groebner, V., 'The Carnal Knowing of a Coloured Body: Sleeping with Arabs and Blacks in the European Imagination, 1300-1550', in Eliav-Feldon, M., Isaac, B. and Ziegler, J. (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 217-31.
- Hannaford, I., *Race: the history of an idea in the West* (Washington, DC, 1996)
- Harman, A., *Commentary on the Psalms* (Fearn, Scotland, 1998).
- Hart, T.R.J., "'El Conde Arnaldos" and the Medieval Scriptural Tradition', *Modern Language Notes*, 72, no. 4 (1957), 281-5.
- Herrero Sanz, M.J., *Santa María la Real de las Huelgas Burgos* (Madrid, 2002).
- Hillgarth, J.N., *The Spanish Kingdoms 1250-1516 I: 1250-1410 Precarious Balance* (Oxford, 1976).
- _____, *Spanish Kingdoms, II: 1410-1516 Castilian Hegemony* (Oxford, 1978).
- Holmén, T., 'Theodicean Motifs in the New Testament: Response to the Death of Jesus', in Laato, A. and de Moor, J.C. (eds.), *Theodicy in the World of the Bible* (Leiden, 2003), pp. 605-51.
- Hood, J.Y.B., *Aquinas on the Jews* (Philadelphia, PA, 1995).
- Houser, R.E., *The Cardinal Virtues: Aquinas, Albert, and Philip the Chancellor* (Toronto, 2004).

- Howe, E.T., 'Sor Teresa de Cartagena and Entendimiento', *Romanische Forschungen*, 108 (1996), 133-45.
- _____, *Education and Women in the Early Modern Hispanic world* (Aldershot, 2008).
- Huizinga, J., *The Waning of the Middle Ages* (London, 1924).
- Hult, D.F., 'The *Roman de la Rose*, Christine de Pizan, and the *querelle des femmes*', in Dinshaw, C. and Wallace, D. (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Women's Writing* (Cambridge, 2003), pp. 184-94.
- Hultgren, A.J., 'The Pastoral Epistles,' in Dunn, J.D.G. (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to St Paul* (Cambridge, 2003), pp. xx, 301.
- Hussar, J., 'The Jewish Roots of *Arboleda de los enfermos*', *La corónica*, 35 (2006), 151-69.
- Hutton, L.J., 'Teresa de Cartagena: A Study in Castilian Spirituality', *Theology Today*, 12 (1956), 477-83.
- Isaac, B., 'Racism: A Rationalization of Prejudice', in Eliav-Feldon, M., Isaac, B. and Ziegler, J. (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 32-56.
- Jaen, D.T., *John II of Castile and the Grand Master Alvaro de Luna: A Biography Compiled from the Chronicles of the Reign of King John II of Castile (1405-1454)* (Madrid, 1978).
- Jantzen, G., *Power, Gender and Christian Mysticism* (Cambridge, 1995).
- Johnson, P.D., *Equal in Monastic Profession: Religious Women in Medieval France* (Chicago, IL, 1991).
- Juárez, E., 'The Autobiography of the Aching Body in Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los enfermos*', in Snyder, S.L., Brueggemann, B.J. and Garland-Thompson, R. (eds.), *Disability Studies: Enabling the Humanities* (New York, NY, 2002), pp. 131-43.
- Kamen, H., *The Spanish Inquisition* (New York, NY, London, 1965).
- _____, *The Spanish Inquisition: A Historical Revision* (London, 1997).
- Kaplan, G.B., *The Evolution of Converso Literature: the Writings of the Converted Jews of Medieval Spain* (Gainesville, FL, 2002).
- Kasten, L.A., and Cody, F.J., *Tentative Dictionary of Medieval Spanish*, 2 vols (New York, NY, 2001).
- Kasten, L.A., and Nitti, J.J., *Diccionario de la prosa castellana del Rey Alfonso X* (New York, NY, 2002).
- Kennedy, H., *Muslim Spain and Portugal: a Political History of al-Andalus* (London, 1996).

- Kim, Y., 'Transformative Crisis and Spiritual Development: Teresa de Cartagena', *Ámbitos*, no. 21 (2009), pp. 11-9.
- King, P.D., *Law and Society in the Visigothic Kingdom* (Cambridge, 1972).
- Klepper, D.C., *The Insight of Unbelievers: Nicholas of Lyra and Christian Reading of Jewish Text in the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, PA, 2007).
- Kruger, S.F., *The Spectral Jew: Conversion and Embodiment in Medieval Europe* (Minneapolis, MN, 2006).
- Laato, A., and de Moor, J.C., 'Introduction', in Laato, A. and de Moor, J.C. (eds.), *Theodicy in the World of the Bible* (Leiden, 2003).
- Lambert, M., *Medieval Heresy: Popular Movements from the Gregorian Reform to the Reformation* (Oxford, 2002).
- Lampe, G.W.H., 'The Exposition and Exegesis of Scripture: To Gregory the Great.' in Lampe, G.W.H. (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, 3 vols (Cambridge, 1969), ii, 155-83.
- Latourette, K.S., *A History of Christianity* (New York, NY, 1975).
- Leclercq, J., 'The Exposition and Exegesis of Scripture: From Gregory the Great to St Bernard', in Lampe, G.W.H. (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, 3 vols (Cambridge, 1969), ii, 183-97.
- Lehfeldt, E.A., 'The Gender of Shared Sovereignty: Texts and the Royal Marriage of Isabella and Ferdinand', in Vicente, M.V. and Corteguera, L.R. (eds.), *Women, Texts, and Authority in the Early Modern Spanish World* (Aldershot, 2003), pp. 37-55.
- _____, *Religious Women in Golden Age Spain* (Aldershot, 2005).
- Levi, A., *Renaissance and Reform: The Intellectual Genesis* (New Haven, CT, 2002).
- Linehan, P., *The Spanish Church and the Papacy in the Thirteenth Century* (Cambridge, 1971).
- _____, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (Oxford, 1993).
- _____, *The Ladies of Zamorra* (Manchester, 1997).
- Liss, P., 'Isabel of Castile(1451-1504), Her Self-Representation and Its Context', in Earenfight, T. (ed.), *Queenship and Political Power in Medieval and Early Modern Spain* (Aldershot, 2005), pp. 120-44.
- Llomas, R., *Biblia en Santa Teresa* (Madrid, 2007).
- Loewe, R., 'The Medieval History of the Latin Vulgate', in Lampe, G.W.H. (ed.), *The*

- Cambridge History of the Bible*, (Cambridge, 1969), ii, 102-54.
- López Martínez, N., *Burgos Cathedral: World Heritage*, trans. Keith, G., (León, 2004).
- Lubac, H. de, *Medieval Exegesis Vol 1*, trans. Sebanc, M., (Edinburgh, 1998).
- _____, *Medieval Exegesis Vol 2*, trans. Macierowski, E.M., (Edinburgh, 2000).
- MacDonald, I.I., *Don Fernando de Antequera* (Oxford, 1948).
- MacKay, A., *Spain in the Middle Ages: From Frontier to Empire, 1000-1500* (London 1977).
- _____, 'The Hispanic-Converso Predicament', *Transactions of the Royal Historical Society*, 35 (1985), 159-79.
- Macy, G., *The Hidden History of Women's Ordination: Female Clergy in the Medieval West* (Oxford, 2008).
- Marichal, J., 'El derecho a una voz propia: vislumbres del ensayo en la prosa del siglo XV', in Deyermond, A. (ed.), *Historia y crítica de la literatura española I: Edad Media*, (Barcelona, 1979), pp. 438-42.
- Marimón Llorca, C., *Prosistas castellanas medievales* (Alicante, 1990).
- Matter, A.E., 'Bible and Rule in the Clarissan Tradition', *Magistra*, 8, no. 2 (2002), 77-83.
- Matthews, G.B., 'Knowledge and Illumination.' in Stump, E. and Kretzmann, N. (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2001), pp. 171-85.
- McGinn, B., *The Foundations of Mysticism* (London, 1991).
- McGovern-Mouron, A., "'Listen to me, daughter, listen to faithful counsel": The *Liber de modo bene vivendi ad sororem*', in Renevey, D. and Whitehead, C. (eds.), *Writing Religious Women* (Cardiff, 2000), pp. 81-106.
- McIntosh, M.A., *Mystical Theology: The Integrity of Spirituality and Theology* (Oxford, 1998).
- McSheffrey, S., 'Literacy and the Gender Gap in the Late Middle Ages: Women and Reading in Lollard Communities', in L. Smith and J.H.M. Taylor (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995).
- Medieval Writings on Female Spirituality*, ed. Spearing, E., (New York, NY, 2002).
- Melammed, R.L., 'Crypto-Jewish Women Facing the Spanish Inquisition: Transmitting Religious Practices, Beliefs, and Attitudes', in Myerson, M.D. and English, E.D. (eds.), *Christians, Muslims and Jews in Medieval and Early Modern Spain*, (Notre Dame, IN, 2000), pp. 197-219.
- Metzler, I., *Disability in Medieval Europe: Thinking about Physical Impairment in the High*

- Middle Ages, c.1100-1400* (London, New York, NY, 2006).
- Meyerson, M.D., 'Letter', *La Corónica*, 25, no. 2 (1997), 179-80.
- _____, *A Jewish Renaissance in Fifteenth-Century Spain* (Princeton, NJ, Oxford, 2004).
- Minnis, A.J., *Medieval Theory of Authorship: Scholastic Literary Attitudes in the Later Middle Ages* (Aldershot, 1988).
- _____, 'De impedimento sexus: Women's Bodies and Medieval Impediments to Female Ordination', in Biller, P. and A.J., M. (eds.), *Medieval Theology and the Natural Body* (York, 1997), pp. 109-39.
- Miramón, C. de, 'Noble Dogs, Noble Blood: The Invention of the Concept of Race in the Late Middle Ages', in Eliav-Feldon, M., Isaac, B. and Ziegler, J. (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West*, (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 200-16.
- Mirrer, L., *Women, Jews, and Muslims in the Texts of Reconquest Castile* (Ann Arbor, MI, 1996).
- Mooney, C.M., 'Imitatio Christi or Imitatio Mariae? Clare of Assisi and Her Interpreters', in Mooney, C.M. (ed.), *Gendered Voices: Female Saints and their Interpreters* (Philadelphia, PA, 1999), pp. 52-77.
- Moore, J.K., 'Conventional Botany or Unorthodox Organics?: On the *Meollo/corteza* Metaphor in *Admiración operum Dey* of Teresa de Cartagena', *Romance Notes*, 44.1 (2003), 3-12.
- Moore, R.I., *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Power and Deviance in Western Europe, 950-1250* (Oxford, 1987).
- Moorman, J.R.H., *A History of the Franciscan Order: From its Origins to the Year 1517* (Chicago, IL, 1988).
- Morreale, M., 'Vernacular Scriptures in Spain', in Lampe, G.W.H. (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, 3 vols (Cambridge, 1969), ii, 465-91.
- Mulder-Bakker, A.B., 'The Metamorphosis of Woman: Transmission of Knowledge and the Problems of Gender', in Stafford, P. and Mulder-Bakker, A.B. (eds.), *Gendering the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 2001), pp. 112-34.
- Murphy, J.J., *Rhetoric in the Middle Ages: A History of Rhetorical Theory from Saint Augustine to the Renaissance* (Berkeley, CA, 1974).
- _____, *Three Medieval Rhetorical Arts* (Berkeley, CA, 1985).
- Murray, J., 'Thinking about Gender: The Diversity of Medieval Perspectives', in Carpenter, J. and MacLean, S.-B. (eds.), *Power of the Weak: Studies on Medieval Women* (Chicago, IL, 1995).

- Nader, H., *The Mendoza Family in the Spanish Renaissance 1350-1550* (New Brunswick, NJ, 1979).
- Neal, D., 'Women, Religion and the Significance of Suffering in Medieval Thinking', *Feminist Theology*, no. 3 (1994), 62-72.
- Nepaulsingh, C.I., *Apples of Gold in Filigrees of Silver: Jewish Writing in the Eye of the Spanish Inquisition* (New York, NY, 1995).
- Netanyahu, B., *The Marranos of Spain From the Late XIVth to the Early XVIth Century: According to Contemporary Hebrew Sources* (New York, NY, 1966).
- _____, *The Origins of the Inquisition in Fifteenth Century Spain* (New York, NY, 2001).
- Neusner, J., 'Theodicy in Judaism' in Laato, A. and de Moor, J.C., (eds.), *Theodicy in the World of the Bible* (Leiden, 2003),
- Newhauser, R., *The Treatise on Vices and Virtues in Latin and the Vernacular* (Turnhout, 1993).
- Newman, B., 'Hildegard of Bingen: Visions and Validation', *Church History*, 54, no. 2 (1985), 163-76.
- _____, 'Divine Power Made Perfect in Weakness: St. Hildegard on the Frail Sex', in Nichols, J.A. and Shank, L.T. (eds.), *Medieval Religious Women: Peaceweavers*, (Kalamazoo, MI, 1987), pp. 103-22.
- _____, *Sister of Wisdom: St Hildegard's Theology of the Feminine* (Berkeley, CA, 1987).
- _____, *From Virile Woman to WomanChrist: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature* (Philadelphia, PA, 1995).
- Nicolás, Antonio: *Biblioteca Hispana Antigua*, Perez Bayer, D.F. (ed.) (Madrid, 1998).
- Nirenberg, D., *Communities of Violence: Persecution of Minorities in the Middle Ages* (Princeton, NJ, 1998).
- _____, 'Mass Conversion and Genealogical Mentalities: Jews and Christians in Fifteenth-Century Spain', *Past and Present*, 174 (2002), 3-41.
- _____, 'Une société face à l'atérité: Juifs et chrétiens dans la péninsule Ibérique 1391-1449', *Annales HSS*, no. 4 (2007), 755-90.
- _____, 'Was There Race before Modernity? The Example of 'Jewish' Blood in Late Medieval Spain', in Eliav-Feldon, M., Isaac, B. and Ziegler, J. (eds.), *The Origins of Racism in the West* (Cambridge, 2009), pp. 232-64.
- O'Callaghan, J.F., *A History of Medieval Spain* (Ithaca, NY, London, 1975).
- O'Kane, E.S., *Refranes y frases proverbiales españolas de la Edad Media* (Madrid, 1959).

- Obermeier, A., *The History and Anatomy of Auctorial Self-Criticism in the European Middle Ages* (Amsterdam, 1999).
- Ochoa de Eribe, M., 'El yo polémico de Teresa de Cartagena en la *Admiración de las obras de Dios*: las argucias del débil por entrar en el canon', *Letras de Deusto*, 29 (1999), 179-88.
- Ornstein, J., 'La misoginia y el profeminismo en la literatura castellana', *Revista de filología hispánica*, 3 (1941), 219-32.
- Pasnau, R., *Theories of Cognition in the Later Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 1997).
- Patch, H.R., *The Tradition of Boethius: A Study of his Importance in Medieval Culture* (New York, NY, 1935).
- Pérez, J., *The Spanish Inquisition: A History*, trans. Lloyd, J., (London, 2004).
- Perry, N., and Echeverría, L., *Under the Heel of Mary* (London, 1988).
- Pidal, R.M., 'The Significance of the Reign of Isabella the Catholic, According to Her Contemporaries', in Highfield, R. (ed.), *Spain in the 15th Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 380-404.
- Pinder, J.M., 'The Cloister and the Garden: Gendered Images of Religious Life from the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries', in Mews, C.J. (ed.), *Listen Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages*, (New York, NY, 2001), pp. 159-79.
- Porter, J., *The Recovery of Virtue: The Relevance of Aquinas for Christian Ethics* (Louisville, KY, 1990).
- Quispe Agnoli, R., 'El espacio medieval fememino: entre la escritura y el silencio en *Admiración operum Dey* de Teresa de Cartagena', *Anuario Medieval*, 5 (1993), 107-25.
- _____, 'Anse maravillado que muger haga tratados': Defensa y concepción de la escritura en Teresa de Cartagena', in Lucía Megías, J.M. (ed.), *Actas del VI Congreso Internacional de la Asociación Hispánica de Literatura Medieval*, (Alcalá de Henares, 1997), pp. 1227-39.
- Rabello, A.M., and Juster, J., *A Tribute to Jean Juster* (Mount Scopus, 1976).
- Ramos de Castro, G., *Juderías de Castilla y León* (Zamora, 1988).
- Ray, J., *The Sephardic Frontier: the Reconquista and the Jewish Community in Medieval Iberia* (Ithica, NY, 2006).
- Redondo Goicoechea, A., 'La retórica del yo-mujer en las tres escritoras: Teresa de Cartagena, Teresa de Jesús y María de Zayas', *Compás de Letras*, 1 (1992), pp. 49-63.

- Remensnyder, A.G., 'Christian Captives, Muslim Maidens and Mary', *Speculum*, 82 (2007), 642-77.
- Rist, J.M., *Augustine: Ancient Thought Baptised* (Cambridge, 1994).
- Rivera Garretas, M.-M., 'La Admiración de la obras de Dios de Teresa de Cartagena y la querrela de las mujeres', in Segura Graiño, C. (ed.), *La voz del silencio, I: fuentes directas para la historia de las mujeres (siglos VIII-XVIII)* (Madrid, 1992), pp. 277-99.
- _____, 'Teresa de Cartagena: la infinitud del cuerpo', *Acta Historica et Archaeologica Mediaevalia*, 1, no. 20-21 (1999-2000), 755-66.
- _____, 'Teresa de Cartagena: escritura en relación', in Muñoz Fernández, Á. (ed.), *La escritura femenina: de leer a escribir*, 2 vols (Madrid, 2000), ii, 95-110.
- _____, 'Teresa de Cartagena vivía en 1478', in de la Peña, G. (ed.), *Estudios en memoria del Profesor Dr. Carlos Sáez* (Alcalá de Henares, 2007), pp. 763-72.
- Robinson, C., 'Preaching to the Converted: Valladolid's *Cristianos nuevos* and the *Retablo de don Sancho de Rojas* (1415)', *Speculum*, 83 (2008), 112-63.
- Rodríguez Rivas, G., 'La Arboleda de los Enfermos, de Teresa de Cartagena, literatura ascética en el siglo XV', *Entemu*, III (1991), 117-30.
- _____, 'La autografía como 'exemplum': la *Arboleda de los enfermos* de Teresa de Cartagena.' in Romera Castillo, J. (ed.), *Actas del II Seminario Internacional del Instituto de Semiótica Literaria y Teatral* (Madrid, 1993), pp. 329-37.
- Rojas Donat, L., 'Alonso de Cartagena, jurista y diplomático del humanismo español', *Revista de estudios histórico-jurídicos [online]*, 2000, no. 22 (2000), 77-85.
- Rosenstock, B., *New Men: Conversos, Christian Theology, and Society in Fifteenth-Century Castile* (London, 2002).
- Rosenthal, E.I.J., 'The Study of the Bible in Medieval Judaism', in Lampe, G.W.H. (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, 3 vols (Cambridge, 1969), ii, 252-79.
- Roth, C., *A History of the Marranos* (New York, NY, 1959).
- Roth, N., *Conversos, Inquisition and the Expulsion of the Jews from Spain* (Madison, WI, 1995).
- Round, N., *The Greatest Man Uncrowned: A Study of the Fall of Don Alvaro de Luna* (London, 1986).
- _____, 'La "peculiaridad literaria" de los conversos ¿unicorno o "snark"?' in Alcalá, A. (ed.), *Judíos, sefarditas, conversos: la expulsión de 1492 y sus consecuencias* (Valladolid, 1995), pp. 557-76.

- Rubenstein, R.L., and Roth, J.K., *Approaches to Auschwitz: the Holocaust and its legacy* (Louisville, KY., 2003).
- Rubin, M., *Mother of God: A History of the Virgin Mary* (London, 2009).
- Ruether, R.R., *Women and Redemption: A Theological History* (London, 1998).
- Ruiz, T.F., 'The Economic Structure of the Area of Burgos 1200-1350', in *The City and the Realm: Burgos and Castile, 1080-1492* (Aldershot, 1992), chap. II.
- _____, 'Notas para el estudio de la mujer en al area del Burgos medieval', in *The City and the Realm: Burgos and Castile, 1080-1492* (Aldershot, 1992), ch. V.
- _____, *Crisis and Continuity: Land and Town in Late Medieval Castile* (Philadelphia, PA, 1994).
- _____, *Spanish Society 1400-1600* (Harlow, 2001).
- _____, *Spain's Centuries of Crisis: 1300-1474* (Oxford, 2007).
- Sanders, E.P., *The Historical Figure of Jesus* (London, 1993).
- Sbarbi, J.M., *Gran diccionario de refranes de la lengua española* (Buenos Aires, 1943).
- Schimmel, S., *The Seven Deadly Sins: Jewish, Christian, and Classical Reflections on Human Psychology* (Oxford, 1997).
- Schmugge, L., 'Female Petitioners in the Papal Penitentiary', in Stafford, P. and Mulder-Bakker, A.B. (eds.), *Gendering the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 2001), pp. 155-73.
- Schulenburg, J.T., 'Strict Active Enclosure and its Effects on the Female Monastic Experience (ca. 500-1100)', in Nichols, J.A. and Shank, L.T. (eds.), *Medieval Religious Women: Distant Echoes* (Kalamazoo, MI, 1984), pp. 51-86.
- Scott, J.W., 'Gender: A Useful Category of Historical Analysis', in Scott, J.W. (ed.), *Feminism and History* (Oxford, New York, NY, 1996), pp. 152-80.
- Seidenspinner-Núñez, D., "'El solo me leyó": Gendered hermeneutics and subversive poetics in *Admiración operum Dey* of Teresa de Cartagena', *Medievalia*, 15 (1993), 14-23.
- _____, 'Inflecting the *Converso* Voice: A Commentary on Recent Theories', *La Corónica*, 25, no. 1 (1996), 6-18.
- _____, 'Responses from the Authors: "Navigating the Minefield"', *La Corónica*, 25, no. 2 (1997), 195-201.
- _____, "'But I suffer not a woman to teach": two women writers in late-medieval Spain', in Davies, C. and Whetnall, J. (eds.), *Hers Ancient and Modern: Women's Writing in Spain and Brazil* (Manchester, 1997), pp. 1-14.

- _____, 'Prelude to the Inquisition: The Discourse of Persecution, the Toledan Rebellion of 1449, and the Contest for Orthodoxy.' in van Bekkum, W.J. and Cobb, P.M. (eds.), *Strategies of Medieval Community Identity: Judaism, Christianity and Islam* (Paris, Leuven, Dudley, MA, 2004), pp. 47-74.
- Seidenspinner-Núñez, D., and Kim, Y., 'Historicizing Teresa: Reflections on new documents regarding sor Teresa de Cartagena', *La Corónica*, 32, no. 2 (2004), 121-50.
- Serrano, R.P.L., *Los conversos D. Pablo de Santa María y D. Alfonso de Cartagena* (Madrid, 1942).
- Serrano y Sanz, Manuel, *Apuntes para una biblioteca de las escritoras españolas desde el año 1440 al 1833*, 2 vols (Madrid, 1903-5).
- Seyfarth, J., 'The *Speculum Virginum*: The Testimony of the Manuscripts.' in Mews, C.J. (ed.), *Listen Daughter: The Speculum Virginum and the Formation of Religious Women in the Middle Ages* (New York, NY, 2001), pp. 41-57.
- Sicroff, A.A., *Les controverses des statuts de "pureté de sang" en Espagne du XV au XVII siècle* (Paris, 1960).
- Simó Castillo, J.B., 'Estudio preliminar: el autor y la obra', *Libro de las consolaciones de la vida humana* (Vinaròs, Castellón, 1998).
- Smalley, B., *The Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages* (Oxford, 1952).
- _____, 'The Bible in the Medieval Schools.' in Lampe, G.W.H. (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, 3 vols (Cambridge, 1969), ii, 197-220.
- Snow, J.T., 'Speaking through Many Voices: Polyphony in the Writings of Teresa de Cartagena', in Corfis, I.A. and Harris-Northall, R. (eds.), *Medieval Iberia: Changing Societies and Cultures in Contact and Transition* (Woodbridge, 2007), pp. 16-29.
- Soifer, M., 'Beyond *convivencia*: critical reflections on the historiography of interfaith relations in Christian Spain', *Journal of Medieval Iberian Studies* 1, no. 1 (2009), 19-35.
- Solomon, M., *The Literature of Misogyny in Medieval Spain: The Arcipreste de Talavera and the Spill* (Cambridge, 1997).
- Starr-LeBeau, G.D., *In the Shadow of the Virgin: Inquisitors, Friars, and Conversos in Guadalupe, Spain* (Princeton, N.J., 2003).
- Stone, M.W.F., 'Augustine and medieval philosophy.' in Stump, E. and Kretzmann, N. (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2001), pp. 253-66.
- Straw, C., 'Gregory, Cassian and the Cardinal Vices.' in Newhauser, R. (ed.), *In the Garden of Evil: the Vices and Culture in the Middle Ages* (Toronto, 2005), pp. 35-58.

- Suárez Fernández, L., 'The Kingdom of Castile in the Fifteenth Century.' in Highfield, R. (ed.), *Spain in the 15th Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 80-113.
- _____, *Judíos españoles en la Edad Media* (Madrid, 1980).
- Sullivan, E.J., 'Mary and the Holy Spirit in the Writings of John of the Cross', in *Carmelite Studies IV*, (Washington DC, 1992), pp. 109-22.
- Summit, J., 'Women and Authorship.' in Dinshaw, C. and Wallace, D. (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Medieval Women's Writing* (Cambridge, 2003), pp. 91-108.
- Surtz, R.E., 'Image Patterns in Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los enfermos*.' in Paolini, G. (ed.), *LA CHISPA '87: Selected Proceedings* (New Orleans, LA, 1987), pp. 297-304.
- _____, *The Guitar of God: Gender, Power and Authority in the Visionary World of Mother Juana de la Cruz (1481-1534)* (Philadelphia, PA, 1990).
- _____, 'El llamado feminismo de Teresa de Cartagena', in *Studia hispanica medievalia: IV Jornadas internacionales de literatura española medieval*, (Buenos Aires, 1993), pp. 199-207.
- _____, *Writing Women in Late Medieval and Early Modern Spain: the Mothers of Saint Teresa of Avila* (Philadelphia, PA, 1995).
- Swanson, R.N., *Religion and Devotion in Europe, c. 1215-c.1515* (Cambridge, 1995).
- Teske, R., 'Augustine's Philosophy of Memory', in Stump, E. and Kretzmann, N. (eds.), *The Cambridge Companion to Augustine* (Cambridge, 2001), pp. 148-58.
- Torres Fontes, J., 'The Regency of Don Ferdinand of Antequera', in Highfield, R. (ed.), *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 114-70.
- Trible, P., *God and the Rhetoric of Sexuality* (London, 1992).
- Trillia, R., 'Teresa de Cartagena: Agent of Her Own Salvation', *Revista canadiense de estudios hispánicos*, 32, no. 1 (2007), 51-70.
- Twomey, L.K., 'Sor Isabel de Villena, her *Vita Christi* and an Example of Gendered Immaculist Writing in the Fifteenth Century', *La Corónica*, 32, no. 1 (2003), 89-103.
- _____, *The Serpent and the Rose: the Immaculate Conception and Hispanic Poetry in the Late Medieval Period* (Leiden, 2008).
- The Universities of Europe in the Middle Ages*, ed. Rashdall, H., 3 vols (Oxford, 1936).
- Valdeavellano, L.G.d., *Curso de historia de las instituciones Españolas: De los orígenes al final de la Edad Media* (Madrid, 1968).

- Valdeón Baroque, J., *Los Judios de Castilla y la Revolución Trastámara* (Valladolid, 1968).
- Valdeón Baroque, J., *Enrique II de Castilla: la Guerra Civil y la Consolidación de Regimen (1366-1371)* (Valladolid, 1966).
- van Dijk, S.J.P., 'The Bible in Liturgical Use', in Lampe, G.W.H. (ed.), *The Cambridge History of the Bible*, 3 vols (Cambridge, 1969), ii 220-52.
- Van Engen, J., *Sisters and Brothers of the Common Life: The Devotio Moderna and the World of the Later Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, PA, 2008).
- Visscher, E. de, 'Marian Devotion in the Latin West in the Later Middle Ages', in Boss, S.J. (ed.), *Mary: The Complete Resource*, (London, 2007), pp. 177-201.
- Vives, J.V., 'The Economies of Catalonia and Castile', in Highfield, R. (ed.), *Spain in the Fifteenth Century 1369-1516: Essays and Extracts by Historians of Spain* (London, 1972), pp. 31-57.
- Voaden, R., 'God's Almighty Hand: Women Co-Writing the Book.' in Smith, L. and Taylor, J.H.M. (eds.), *Women, the Book and the Godly* (Cambridge, 1995), pp. 55-65.
- Weber, A., *Teresa of Avila and the Rhetoric of Femininity* (Princeton, NJ, 1990).
- Weissberger, B.F., *Isabel Rules: Constructing Queenship, Wielding Power* (Minneapolis, MN, 2004).
- Wijngaards, J., *No Women in Holy Orders? The Women Deacons of the Early Church* (Norwich, 2002).
- Willard, C.C., *Christine de Pizan: Her Life and Works* (New York, N.Y, 1984).
- Williams, R., *Teresa of Avila* (London, 1991).
- Wolff, P., 'The 1391 Pogrom in Spain: Social Crisis or Not?' *Past and Present*, 50 (1971), 3-18.

ELECTRONIC SECONDARY SOURCES

- Gallaudet University, 'FAQ: Etiologies and Causes of Deafness',
[http://library.gallaudet.edu/Library/Deaf_Research_Help/Frequently_Asked_Questions_\(FAQs\)/Cultural_Social_Medical/Etiologies_and_Causes_of_Deafness.html](http://library.gallaudet.edu/Library/Deaf_Research_Help/Frequently_Asked_Questions_(FAQs)/Cultural_Social_Medical/Etiologies_and_Causes_of_Deafness.html).
- Kerr, J., 'An Essay on Cistercian Liturgy',
http://cistercians.shef.ac.uk/cistercian_life/spirituality/index.php.

UNPUBLISHED THESES

- Baldrige, M., 'Christian Woman, Woman Christ: The Feminization of Humanity in Constanza de Castilla, Catherine of Sienna and Teresa de Cartagena ' (U of Tennessee, Ph.D. thesis, 2004).
- Barbaret, D.-R., 'Weak Womanly Understanding: Writers of Women from the Arcipreste de Talavera to Teresa de Cartagena ' (University of Massachusetts, Ph.D. thesis, 1999).
- Castro-Ponce, C., 'Teresa de Cartagena: *Arboleda de los Enfermos, Admiración Operum Dei, edición crítica singular*' (Brown Univ., Ph.D. thesis, 2001).
- Frieden, M.E., 'Epistolarity in the Works of Teresa de Cartagena and Leonor López de Córdoba' (Missouri-Colombia, Ph.D. thesis, 2001).
- Kautzman, K., 'The Parallel and Intersecting Planes of Teresa de Cartagena's *Arboleda de los Enfermos* and *Admiración operum Dei*' (University of Cincinnati, Ph.D. thesis, 2003).
- Kim, Y., 'Dolor y sufrimiento en la temprana Edad Moderna peninsular: *Arboleda de los Enfermos y Amiraçion Operum Dey*' (Boston College Graduate School of Arts and Sciences, Ph.D. thesis, 2006).
- Majuelo Apiñániz, M., 'Teresa de Cartagena. La obra de una mujer castellana del siglo XV.' (Universidad de Pais Vasco, Ph.D. thesis, 2008).