Catholics in Scotland: Overview and Literary Culture

The traditional view of the Scottish Reformation of 1560 is that it was a mass movement culminating in the creation of a monolithic Presbyterian church while successive rulers attempted to foist episcopalianism on an unwilling people. Like most simple pictures, this one represents some of the truth but by no means all of it. . It also assumes that no Scots remained Catholic. But Diarmaid MacCulloch has characterized the Scots experience crisply as "an optional Reformation."[1] Some key individuals in mid-16th-century Scotland certainly did choose reform.[2] Others did not, notably the dukes of Gordon, who wielded immense power in the northeast, and other noble families stayed Catholic at least in some branches, notably the Hays, Leslies, Maxwells, and Kennedys.

Catholicism had penetrated deep into the cultural life of Scotland by the 16th century. A thousand years previously, contact with Roman Britain and Ireland had brought Celtic Christianity, organized and spread by monastic federations, into 5th- and 6th-century Scotland. It was this form of Christianity which was practiced until the 11th century, century, Malcolm III (known as Malcolm Canmore) married an Anglo-Saxon princess, Margaret, a descendant of the pre-Conquest kings of Wessex, as his second wife. Brought up on the Continent, probably in Hungary, the deeply pious Margaret encouraged the development of the Scottish church towards international norms. She invited the Benedictines to Scotland and established an abbey at Dunfermline. Following this initiative, her sons Alexander and David

---

[1] Diarmaid MacCulloch, *Reformation: Europe's House Divided, 1490-1700* (London: 2003), 381.

[2] For example, Archibald Campell, 5th Earl of Argyll, a key figure given his position s a magnate among both Gaelic- and Scots-speakers; see Jane E.A. Dawson, *The Politics of Religion in the Age of Mary, Queen of Scots: The Earl of Argyll and the Struggle for Britain and Ireland* (New York: 2002).

continued the ecclesiastical reform she had initiated. Alexander encouraged the Augustinians and founded abbeys at Scone and Inchcolm.[3] David overhauled the diocesan system and founded monasteries with a lavish hand: the Tironensian order (an offshoot of the Benedictines) was settled at Selkirk, Kelso, and Lesmahagow. He founded Holyrood Abbey, Saint Andrew's Cathedral Priory, and Cambuskenneth for the Augustinians; Melrose, Kinloss, and Newbattle Abbeys for the Cistercians; and put Benedictine monks into Coldingham. There were a few foundations for women: a Cistercian convent was founded at Haddington, and in 1517, a Dominican convent was founded in Edinburgh and rapidly established a reputation for holiness and learning.[4]

All these houses were secularized or dissolved at the Reformation. Some embraced reform: for example, when the Cistercian abbey of Coupar was purged of "Idolis and Imagis and tubernacuilis" in 1559, the abbot and his community became Protestants.[5] None of the religious orders was able to maintain a foothold within Scotland. Priests were required to conform at the Reformation: an act passed in 1573 required all benefice holders to subscribe to the Confession of Faith. Many did. Some refused, and were deprived of their livings, and a substantial number left the country.[6] Others became tutors and household chaplains in the homes of Catholic magnates and so continued to function as priests from the safety of attachment to a great household.[7] Catholic culture was kept alive in Scotland by the Jesuits' and secular priests'

---

[3] Kenneth Veitch, "'Replanting Paradise': Alexander I and the Reform of Religious Life in Scotland," *Innes Review* 52 (2001): 136-66.
[4] For an overview of the religious orders' presence in Scotland, see Ian B. Cowan and David E. Easson, *Medieval Religious Houses: Scotland* (London: 1976).
[5] F.D. Bardgett, *Scotland Reformed: The Reformation in Angus and the Mearns* (Edinburgh: 1989), 73.
[6] Margaret H.B. Sanderson, "Catholic Recusancy in Scotland in the Sixteenth Century," *Innes Review* 21(1970): 87-107, esp. 88-89.
[7] Sanderson, "Catholic Recusancy in Scotland," 96.

missions to the Lowlands and the Northeast, and an Irish Franciscan mission to the Gaelic speakers of the Western Isles.[8]

The Northeast was noticeably cooler towards reform, and the reception of reform in Gaelic-speaking Scotland was extremely mixed.[9] Even in the largely reformed South, Alexander Seton, Lord Dunfermline, chancellor of Scotland and one of the most powerful men in the Scotland of James VI, and the guardian of the infant Prince Charles, was discreetly Catholic like most of his family. In an English memorandum called "The Present State of the Nobility of Scotland," made in 1583, he is described thus: "He hath ben alwayes Frenche in affection, and is in harte a Papiste, thoughe he dare not aduowe it."[10] None of the nobles surveyed are described as unequivocally "Papist," but a good third are given as "religion suspected," "religion doubted," or "religion not thoroughly assured." Dunfermline's education is outlined in obituary verses published by the Presbyterian minister of Dalkeith, which suggest that his religion was a fairly open secret:[11]

Scotia prima dedit lucem: dat Gallia semen
Grammatices: docuit juraque Patavium
Romaque rhetoricen, ubi notus Tullius ille
Noscere scripta patrum, sic Salamanca dedit.
Scotia prima dedit cui lumina, et ultima ademit;
Haec fuit ipsa Parens, ipsa Noverca fuit.

---

[8] Cathaldus Giblin, *The Irish Franciscan Mission to Scotland, 1619-1656* (Dublin: 1964). Also see Michael Lynch, *Scotland: A New History* (London: 1992), 365-66.
[9] Fiona A. Macdonald, *Missions to the Gaels: Reformation and Counter-Reformation in Ulster and the Highlands and Islands of Scotland, 1560-1760* (Edinburgh: 2006).
[10] "A briefe opinion of the state, faction, religion and power of the severall noble men of Scotland," in David Laing (ed.), *Bannatyne Miscellany,* vol. 1 (Edinburgh: 1827), 53-72, esp. 69.
[11] Archibald Simson, "Musarum Lachrymae de obitu cancellarii," preface to *Hieroglyphica Animalium* […] *Quae in Scripturis Sacris inveniuntur* […] (Edinburgh: 1622).

> Scotland first gave him the light, France, the rudiments of grammar, Padua taught him the laws, and Rome, rhetoric, where [lived] that well-known Tullius. To know the writings of the fathers, thus Salamanca taught him. Scotia first gave him the light, and took it away at the last; she was thus both his parent and his stepmother.

Evidently, Dunfermline was sent abroad to study in Catholic universities and colleges in Paris, Padua, Rome, and Salamanca, emerging as a man of wide cultivation, with particular interests in mathematics, architecture, and heraldry. Gordon Donaldson points out that there were clearly some Scottish families, among whom the Setons are notable, who must have been as much at home in France as in Scotland; and France, of course, remained a Catholic country.[12] Incidentally, it would be hard to point to a single noble family that had a similarly close relationship with England.

The Kirk doubtless would have liked to have the power to force such men into conformity or exile, but it was evidently unable to do so. The Catholic William Douglas, 10th Earl of Angus was indeed forced into exile and died in Paris in 1611, but though a French eulogist represented this as "for the sake of religion," there had also been a good deal of actively treasonable conduct to his discredit.[13] *The First Book of Discipline* (1560) proscribed Catholic worship, but even after the deposition of Mary, there were still Catholics and crypto-Catholics in positions of power. Moreover, powerful families such as the Hays, Hamiltons, and Gordons resented insults to family members, even if they were Jesuits. Thus, for example, Fr John Hay, SJ, dined comfortably in the Protestant stronghold of Dundee because the local

[12] Gordon Donaldson, *All the Queen's Men: Power and Politics in Mary Stewart's Scotland* (London: 1983), 67.
[13] Thomas Pelletier, *Discours funèbre sur la mort de feu M. le Cte d'Anguys, seigneur escossois, décédé à Paris, où il estoit réfugié pour y avoir libre exercice de la religion catholique* (Paris: 1611).

minister had previously told his landlord exactly when to expect the arresting officers. This posse took good care to arrive *after* the Jesuit had gone his way and congratulated the landlord on his tact: as Hay commented subsequently, "they quite understood they had gone as far as they durst without offending any of my clansmen."[14]

One factor which made things easier for Scottish Catholics is that the experience of recusancy was rather different to that of English Catholics. They were similarly required to conform in order to play any part in the public life of the country, but many seem to have considered they could legitimately be church papists, making a show of outward conformity while maintaining their own religion in private. Lord Dunfermline is an obvious example, but at lower levels of society, there were Catholic baillies who managed to hold onto office and, importantly, a number of schoolmasters, in a position to influence the next generation.[15] Also, it was up to local Kirk sessions and magistrates to inquire into the orthodoxy of suspected individuals, so in areas where suspected Catholics were either numerous or influential, inquiry was not always made very closely. In 1587/8, the General Assembly of the Kirk was aware that Jesuits were openly active in Aberdeen, celebrating Mass and distributing Catholic literature, but could do nothing, due to the power of George Gordon, 6th Earl of Huntly. [16] English Catholics were forbidden to attend Protestant services, but there is not an equivalent literature for Scotland.[17] By contrast with English Catholic leaders such as Cardinal William Allen, who wrote passionately on this topic, Robert Abercromby, SJ, leader of the clandestine Jesuit mission to Scotland in the 1580s and

---

[14] Anthony Ross, "Reformation and Repression," in David McRoberts (ed.), *Essays on the Scottish Reformation* (Glasgow: 1962), 371-414, at 410.
[15] Sanderson, "Catholic Recusancy in Scotland," 94-95.
[16] Sanderson, "Catholic Recusancy in Scotland," 90-92.
[17] Alexandra Walsham, *Church Papists: Catholicism, Conformity and Confessional Polemic in Early Modern England* (Woodbridge: 1999), 22-49.

1590s, permitted Scottish Catholics to attend the Kirk, or at least did not make a point of forbidding them to do so.[18]

Furthermore, Scotland did not persecute Catholics. Though popular opinion has it that early modern Scotland was considerably wilder and more violent than its southern neighbor, in 16th- and 17th-century England, some hundreds of priests and Catholic laymen, and also some -women, were tortured and judicially murdered: more than in any other European country.[19] By contrast, in Scotland, hardly any Catholics were killed for their faith. Some unfortunate monks and priests fell victim to mob violence, and a few priests were hanged: David Chalmers's account of the sufferings of his coreligionists singles out an Aberdeen Dominican and Catholic apologist, John Black, executed in Edinburgh, and a priest called Thomas Robertson, executed in Glasgow for saying Mass.[20] Cardinal David Beaton was certainly murdered but not necessarily martyred: he had provoked both the reformers, by executing George Wishart, and the secular nobility, for being implicated in bringing about war with England. Archbishop John Hamilton was executed for alleged involvement in the assassination of Regent Moray (the assassin, a relative of his, fired from his house).[21] Saint John Ogilvie was executed for refusing to acknowledge the rule of James VI, not for being a priest. No laypeople whatsoever are known to have been killed for their religion, though a good few were fined for attending Mass, or otherwise put under pressure to conform.

---

[18] This policy of discreet accommodation was objected to in Rome but seems in practice to have continued. See G. Martin Murphy, "Abercromby, Robert (1536-1613)," in *ODNB,* https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/46.

[19] MacCulloch, *Reformation*, 392.

[20] Ross, "Reformation and Repression," 386, 402. See David Chalmers, *De Scotorum fortitudine, doctrina ac de ortu et progressu haeresis in regnis Scotiae et Angliae libri quatuor, nunc primum in lucem editi* (Paris: 1631), 202-03.

[21] Amy Blakeway, "The Response to the Regent Moray's Assassination," *SHR* 88 (2009): 9-33, at 10-11.

However, Catholics clearly did not find it easy to live in Protestant Scotland. William Chisholm, Bishop of Vaison, published a book denouncing the Calvinist creed, which, alongside its main theme, laments the destruction of the Scottish monasteries and churches. Chalmers's *De Scotorum Fortitudine* also gives some insight into the trials of Scottish Catholics, though it is worth noticing that he knows of very few contemporary confessors or martyrs.[22] Thus, though they were not persecuted to the extent that their English contemporaries were, Catholic Scots could not worship openly, could not get a Catholic education within Scotland, could not publish without going abroad (an issue to which I will return), and seldom enjoyed the services of a priest. In the second half of the 17th century, a remarkable secular priest, Robert Munro, was the only Gaelic-speaking Scottish priest active in the Highlands, where he labored for 33 years.[23] Toleration was highly area specific. In areas controlled by covertly or openly Catholic magnates such as the dukes of Gordon in the Northeast, Jesuit and secular missionaries could preach, say Mass, and minister to the faithful with relative impunity; and there were also Catholics at James VI's court, protected by Anne of Denmark.[24] Anyone trying to stay Catholic in the environs of Saint Andrews, on the other hand, would have found life very difficult.

One area where there were conspicuous difficulties was education. Scotland's universities were officially Calvinist. Their principals and staff were required to subscribe to the reformers' Confession of Faith and reform their discipline in 1560:

---

[22] William Chisholm, *Examen confessionis fidei Caluinianæ, quam Scotis omnibus ministri Caluiniani subscribendam et iurandam proponent: an rectius, propter i[n]numeras veraæ fidei detestationes Catholicæ fidei confossionem [*sic*] uocemus* (Avignon: 1601), 226-28; Chalmers, *De Scotorum fortitudine,* 273.

[23] Gerald FitzGibbon, "Robert Munro, Secular Priest in the Highlands (1645-1704)," *Innes Review* 48 (1997): 165-73.

[24] On the Jesuits, see Thomas M. McCoog, "'Pray to the Lord of the Harvest': Jesuit Missions to Scotland in the Sixteenth Century," *Innes Review* 53 (2002): 127-88, and on the secular priests' mission in Scotland, see Thomas McInally, *The Sixth Scottish University: The Scots Colleges Abroad, 1575 to 1799* (Leiden: 2012), 43-47.

though Aberdeen initially refused, it was forced to conform in 1569.[25] Some Catholics squared this with their consciences and took a first degree in Scotland, but in any case, the intellectually ambitious tended to regard a Scottish degree as no more than a step on the way. A glance at the biography of any early modern Scottish intellectual, whatever his religious position, usually reveals a first degree taken in Scotland in his midteens, followed by some years of study on the Continent: in effect, Scottish universities were performing the function of high schools, where students perfected their Latin. Catholics were more likely go on to centers such as Paris, Orléans, Poitiers, or Rome; Protestants to Protestant universities such as Sedan, Leiden, or Wittenberg (though very seldom to England, where the requirement to subscribe to the Thirty-Nine Articles was a real stumbling block to almost all Scots).

Catholic Scotland did not go down without a fight. Reform was bitterly disputed in the years around 1560, both in public debates and in print. John Knox was challenged by, among others, Quintin Kennedy, abbot of Crossraguel (in debate) Bishop John Leslie (in debate), Ninian Winzet (in debate and in print), the Jesuit James Tyrie (in print), and John Hamilton (in debate).[26] On more than one occasion, the defender of Catholicism was considered to have the better of the argument, but that was insufficient to prevent the reform. One by one, these men left Scotland, mostly for France, where Scots felt most at home outside their native land,[27] though Leslie and Winzet both initially spent some time in England with Mary, Queen of Scots.

---

[25] McInally, *Sixth Scottish University,* 7.
[26] Quintin Kennedy, *The refutation of ane ansuer made be Schir Iohne Knox to ane letter send be Iames Tyrie, to his vmquhyle brother. Sett furth be Iames Tyrie* (Paris: 1573). Kennedy also published *Ane compendius tractiue conform to the Scripturis of Almichtye God* ([Edinburgh]: 1558), arguing against reform.
[27] Norman Macdougall, *An Antidote to the English: The Auld Alliance, 1295-1560* (East Linton, East Lothian: 2001).

Exile was always problematic: the first question always had to be how the exile was going to establish a financially viable life, since he had to abandon his preexisting livelihood. For example, David Chalmers of Ormond took service with James Hepburn, 4th Earl of Bothwell and amassed a considerable landholding on the Black Isle. In June 1567, he shared the downfall of Bothwell and Mary. He was forfeited in August 1568, and his estates passed to the Munros of Newmore. In 1574-75, he was in Spain and the Netherlands, trying unsuccessfully to enter Spanish service. By February 1576, he had reentered Mary's service and was thus dependent on her limited resources. By 1578, he was her master of requests. He eventually returned to Scotland in 1582 and was successful, after a fight, in dislodging the Munros and regaining his estates, a battle which took him four years. [28] His story illustrates the difficulty exiles faced: if the individual was deemed to be an outlaw, he might lose his property. Though there were such things as bills of exchange and by the 1650s, a Scottish banker at Rome, James Mowat, who specialized in dealing with English and Scottish exiles,[29] even when the family as a whole retained control of their lands, there was no way of translating Scottish landholdings into any kind of stipend payable in France. Exiles were therefore forced to find a job, or a patron, with the odds stacked against them, since they were normally outside the networks of kinship and recommendation that formed the basic structure of early modern life.

One conspicuous group of Scottish Catholic exiles took military service with foreign rulers, some of them very successfully--the Leslie family is particularly noteworthy in this context.[30] The Catholic neo-Latin poet James Halkerston similarly

[28] Julian Goodare, "Chalmers [Chambers], David, of Ormond (*c*.1533-1592)," in *ODNB,* https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/5069. He became a judge and royal administrator under James VI without relinquishing his Catholic faith.

[29] McInally, *Sixth Scottish University*, 42.

[30] David Worthington et al., "Leslies in Central and Northern Europe during and after the Thirty Years' War," in *Ad Honorem Josef Polišenský (1915-2001),* ed. Ivo Barteček, Miloš Kouřil, and Zdeněk Šamberger (Prague: 2007), 350-69 and *Scots in*

fled Scotland for Antwerp in 1574 and became a mercenary.[31] Additionally, and more relevantly to the literary culture of Scottish Catholics, Catholic scholars could compete with natives for positions in foreign universities, as many did with success: the stress on teaching Latin that characterized Scottish education in the 16th and 17th centuries was of considerable help to such men.[32] Others were successful in attracting the direct patronage of Philip III of Spain, as David Colville did, for example, or of one of France's successive Henrys, Sigismund II of Poland, or a Catholic magnate--again, this meant direct competition both with the native born and with other exiles.

The Catholic Scots also established alternative centers of education abroad, which both taught Scottish students and provided employment for Scottish professors. Scots colleges were founded in Paris, Rome, Madrid, and Valladolid, with financial assistance from Mary, Queen of Scots, who funded the Rome college with her French dowry estates; Philip II of Spain; and a variety of wealthy or committed individuals, who included the Guise family, Archduke Albert, Hapsburg regent in the Netherlands, (who contributed to the Scots college at Douai), successive popes, and private individuals such as the Scottish Jesuit Hippolytus Curle, who also helped to fund Douai.[33] There were also Scottish Benedictine monasteries in Germany: Würzburg, Regensburg (also known as Ratisbon), and Erfurt, known as *Schottenklöster*,[34] though there was no Continental foundation for Catholic Scotswomen.

Habsburg Service, 1618-1648 (Leiden: 2003).

[31] Roderick J. Lyall, "Kinship, Kingship and Latinity: The Surprising Career of James Halkerston," in *Sixteenth-Century Scotland: Essays in Honour of Michael Lynch,* ed. Julian Goodare and Alasdair A. MacDonald (Leiden: 2008), 237-55.

[32] See John Durkan and Jamie Reid-Baxter, *Scottish Schools and Schoolmasters, 1560-1633* (Edinburgh: 2013).

[33] McInally, *Sixth Scottish University*. On funding, see John Durkan, "Early Letters of John Brown, Minim & Report to Propaganda, 1623, by Scots Minims," *Innes Review* 52 (2001): 63-79, at 74-75, and Jos E. Vercruysse,"A Scottish Jesuit from Antwerp: Hippolytus Curle," *Innes Review* 61 (2010): 137-49.

[34] See Mark Dilworth, *The Scots in Franconia: A Century of Monastic Life* (Edinburgh: 1974).

All of these institutions were culturally active. The most intellectually lively of the monasteries was Würzburg, where Francis Hamilton, the rector, published both controversial writings and public orations and the monk Thomas Duff left a variety of Latin verse, mostly in manuscript. In addition to his published Latin translation of Alexander Montgomerie's *The Cherrie and the Slae*,[35] two of these manuscript poems indicate Duff's knowledge of, and affection for, Scottish poetry. There was something of a Scottish tradition of sacred parody, and it is this that explains his reworking of a popular song, "Lowse Thy Pock, Laurie," into a poem celebrating Abbot John Whyte of Würzburg and a version of Montgomerie's "Solsequium," a courtier's tribute to his king, into "Κἀποιδία de solsequio / Ad Iesum solem in praesepio Ootum" ("Cradle-Song of the Solsequium / To Jesus the Sun Risen in the Manger").[36] Bishop John Leslie was instrumental in getting his fellow exile Ninian Winzet elected as abbot of Regensburg, the richest of the three *Schottenklöster*, on 13 June 1577, which solved the problem of what the latter was going to live on.[37] Winzet became a Benedictine and concentrated on building up his community; he also provided for it by instituting a college. By 1583, this had up to 100 pupils. Winzet taught the higher forms himself and continued to publish works of controversy.[38]

The reason why the Scots came into possession of Würzburg, Regensburg, and Erfurt after the Reformation does them little credit. The tale is set out by an ingenuous traveler from Aberdeenshire, James Fraser, who visited Regensburg in the mid-17th century and wrote a journal of his travels. He wrote,

---

[35] Thomas Duff, *Cerasum et sylvestre prunum* […] (Würzburg: 1631).
[36] Mark Dilworth, "The Latin Translator of *The Cherrie and the Slae*," *Studies in Scottish Literature* 5 (1967): 77-82. The poems are preserved in Würzburg Universitätsbibliothek, M.ch.q.62.
[37] MacInally, *Sixth Scottish University*, 13.
[38] J.H. Burns, "Catholicism in Defeat: Ninian Winzet, 1519-1592," *History Today* 16 (1966): 788-95.

> When we came to the gate of this Monastery, the Porter stopt our entry until he would acquaint the Prior; who came instantly to us and asked quhat we were and finding by our passes, and Father William Leslies Letter of recommendation from Rome that I was a Scotchman & my Cammarad Godfrey an Englishman, he heartily welcomed us; and made an Apology for the porter who denied us onely Because the Irish Croud up and down the Country; and they never admitt of any of these, within any of the Scottish Convents, and lest we might be Irish the Prior himselfe came in person to know the Certainty of it For as he insisted and told us what the Irish most Cunninly & Knavishlie had asserted, tearming them selves *Scoti Maiores*, And thus gulled and cheated the [Brethren] out of many Monasteries in Germany which now they possesse & by a right from severall Popes are Confirmed in them, and this hath bred that Jarr and animosity betwixt the two Nations all this Country over, for that off ten Convents which the Scotsh had within this Kingdom they enioy now but 3 of them, viz Ratisbon, Erfort, & Wirtspurg, the Irish possess all the other 7, this many yeares by gon.[39]

Of course, the Irish were perfectly right, and it was the Scots who had gulled and cheated them, not vice versa. Under leaders such as Marianus Scotus, the 11th-century founder of Regensburg, early medieval Irishmen had founded a variety of monasteries on the Continent, including the three that came under Scottish rule. These Irishmen were known to their contemporaries as "Scoti," a term that in the Middle Ages meant someone culturally Irish and hailing from either Ireland or Highland Scotland. For various reasons, these monasteries were ailing institutions by the 16th

[39] Aberdeen, University Library, MS 2538, III, fol. 8v.

century. Würzburg was left empty after its last Irish abbot, Philip, died in 1497 and was taken over by the German Benedictine congregation of Bursfelde. After the Reformation, Scots petitioned the pope to have these three monasteries reassigned to them, claiming that since they were "the Scots," these institutions properly belonged to them, and their argument was treated as either true, or expedient, although there was no ethnic or cultural connection between Lowland Scots-speakers such as Winzet and the Irish founders of these institutions.[40]

Since many Catholic exiles, both Scottish and Irish, were desperately looking for means of subsistence, ancient Continental possessions were of considerable importance.[41] Thomas Dempster, whose work is discussed below, cannot have been the original author of this fable, since the first Scots claims to the German monasteries date back to the 16th century, but it is certainly one he enthusiastically promoted, as did Chalmers. It is clear from Fraser that early modern Scots believed it and that it drove a most unfortunate wedge between the two exiled Catholic communities. Rather than making common cause as dispossessed Catholics, early modern Scots and Irish were competing for scarce resources.

Once their own education was complete, Scots taught at many Continental universities. Many taught at Paris in the course of the 15th century, and after the Reformation, many Scottish Catholics still did.[42] Other French universities that had a considerable variety of Scottish Catholic professors throughout the early modern period include Orléans, Bordeaux, Poitiers, Avignon, and Montpellier. For example, William Hegate and Robert Balfour overlapped as professors at Bordeaux: Élie Vinet

[40] McInally, *Sixth Scottish University*, 12n25.
[41] McInally, *Sixth Scottish University*, 12-16.
[42] See Hubert Elie, "Quelques maîtres de l'université de Paris vers l'an 1500," *Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du moyen âge* 18 (1950-511): 193-243 and John Durkan, "The French Connection in the Sixteenth and Early Seventeenth Centuries," in *Scotland and Europe, 1200–1850*, ed. T.C. Smout (Edinburgh: 1986), 19-44, at 41-43.

was may have been referring to them when he wrote to George Buchanan in 1581, "This school is rarely without a Scotsman; it has two at present, one of whom is Professor of Philosophy, the other of the Greek language and mathematics. Both are good, honest, and learned men, and enjoy the favourable opinion of their auditors."[43] Balfour published nine books on theology and philosophy. Hegate published four sets of occasional verse and was also the author of a Latin allegorical drama, *Gallia Victrix*, published in Poitiers in 1591, which celebrates the triumphs of Henry IV over the Catholic League.[44] Both wrote exclusively in Latin and were highly regarded by their colleagues.

The willingness of Scottish Catholic intellectuals to travel far in search of employment is illustrated by the life of William Bruce. He had an unusually adventurous career: having been born at Stanshill in Caithness, *c.*1560, he took a doctorate of law at Cahors in 1586. After a period lecturing in law at Toulouse and Cahors, he went via Rome to Würzburg to take up the chair of law at the university there. He then interrupted his academic career to join the military campaign against the Ottoman Empire on the Slovak/Hungarian front and subsequently accepted the Polish chancellor's offer to teach Roman law at a new humanist academy, the Hippaeum, in Zamość in 1596. The rest of his career was spent in Poland, with occasional sabbaticals from his academic duties in order to undertake military or diplomatic missions. He was the author of two books, a diatribe urging war against the Ottoman Empire, *Ad principes populorumque Christianos de bello adversum*

---

[43] David Irving, *Lives of Scotish Writers* (Edinburgh:1839), 237, *Georgij Buchanani Scoti ad viros sui seculi clarissimos, eorumque ad eundem, epistolae* (London: 1711), 33.

[44] Henry converted to Catholicism only in 1593. However, he was undoubtedly ruler by right of descent, a principle that many Scots considered important, especially in the light of the deposition of Mary, Queen of Scots. For more on Hegate and Balfour, see John Durkan, "A Post-Reformation Miscellany II," *Innes Review* 55 (2004): 52-72, at 67-71.

Turcos gerenda, published in both Leipzig and Kraków, and a descriptive account of the customs of the Tatars, *De Tataribus diarum Gulielmi Brusci*, published in Frankfurt am Main.

Additionally, a number of Scots joined the Society of Jesus. Some of them taught at Jesuit colleges such as Pont-à-Mousson and Ingolstadt while others returned to their native land: there was a continuous Jesuit mission in Scotland from 1582 to 1603.[45] Robert Abercromby was one of the most visible Jesuits within Scotland, since he spent 19 years there, and it was he who secretly received Anne of Denmark into the Catholic Church.[46] He was not, however, a writer, though other Scottish Jesuits published quite extensively. Two of the more productive were both called James Gordon and both from Aberdeenshire, unsurprisingly, since the Gordons were a major Catholic family in the Northeast. They mutually distinguished themselves as James Gordon of Lesmore and James Gordon of Huntly (the 5th son of the 4th earl of Huntly). Gordon of Huntly was a controversialist who taught at the Sorbonne: he issued a series of works in Latin defending the Catholic faith, some of them answering Protestants, which were very widely distributed, since they were printed in Vienna, Cologne, Wittenberg, Greifswald, Poitiers, Paris, Zaragoza, and Bordeaux. Most of his writings were also translated into English and printed at the English College press at Saint-Omers. Gordon of Lesmore wrote a world history, which was evidently successful since editions were published at Cologne, Poitiers, and Paris; a compendium of moral theology; and a Bible commentary. Some insight into his life is given by a letter he wrote to the Jesuit General Claudio Acquaviva in 1607, asking to be excused from returning to Scotland as head of the Jesuit mission following the retirement of Robert Abercromby. In this, he details his health problems but also

[45] McCoog, "'Pray to the Lord of the Harvest.'"
[46] W.J. Anderson, "Narratives of the Scottish Reformation, I: Report of Father Robert Abercrombie, S.J., in the Year 1580," *Innes Review* 7 (1956): 27-59.

explains that, having left Scotland aged 14 to pursue his education abroad, in the intervening 40 years, he had completely forgotten the Scottish language and communicated with fellow Scots only in French or Latin.[47]

One of the most remarkable of all early modern Scots, George Strachan of the Mearns (*fl.*1592-1634), was associated with the Society of Jesus, though not himself a Jesuit: when he returned to Scotland in 1602 after studies at Paris and a variety of southern French universities,[48] it was as a courier between Claudio Acquaviva and Robert Abercromby and other Jesuits in Scotland.[49] Later in life, he became fascinated by Oriental languages. He accordingly went to Constantinople *c.*1613, and from there, to Aleppo and into Persia, acquiring a deep and thorough knowledge of Arabic by taking service with Emir Feyyad, a Bedouin prince, for some years. He also learned Hebrew, Syriac, and Greek. He took service with the East India Company in 1619, based in Isfahan, and eventually died in Persia after a visit to India.[50] He made an important collection of more than 60 Oriental manuscripts, some of them old and very rare, at least 25 of which ended up in the Vatican Library, and he translated a number of works from Arabic to Latin.[51] He was also the author of a long Latin elegy on the death of Patrick Seton, a young nobleman for whom he had acted as cicerone until the latter's untimely death in Rome, which was admired by contemporaries: William Barclay, a professor of medicine at Paris and Nantes, wrote two poems in its praise.[52]

---

[47] Alasdair Roberts, "Gordon, James (1553-1641)," in *ODNB,* https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/11049.

[48] Pont-à-Mousson, Leceur, Toulouse, Bordeaux, Montauban, Montpellier, and Carpentras: quite a few 17th-century Scots university hopped, though not normally to quite this extent.

[49] Georgio Levi Della Vida, *George Strachan: Memorials of a Wandering Scottish Scholar of the Seventeenth Century* (Aberdeen: 1956), 7-9.

[50] Della Vida, *George Strachan*, 50-55, 59.

[51] Della Vida, *George Strachan*, 71, 108. London, BL, Add MS 7720 contains two of his translations.

[52] George Strachan, "Lacrymae in obitu Patricii Setoni, filii Baronis a Parbroto," in

Strachan was not the only early modern Scottish Catholic Orientalist. Fr James Bonaventure Hepburn, a Catholic convert, became keeper of Oriental books and manuscripts at the Vatican. His publications include an extraordinary broadsheet of praise for the Virgin in 72 languages.[53] Another, David Colville, took his first degree from Saint Andrews in 1601 and in 1617, after further studies at Avignon, was made royal interpreter to Philip III. His other duties included teaching Greek, Hebrew, and Arabic to the Hieronymite monks of the Escorial, and his contributions to the study of Arabic are of lasting value.[54] Another Scottish Minim friar, John Brown, was an outstanding Hebraist,[55] and in 1580, a young Scottish polymath called James Crichton so impressed the Venetians, particularly the scholar-publisher Aldo Manuzio, that he was dubbed "admirabilis," meaning wonderful or astonishing: a title not readily accorded in that sophisticated city.[56]

It is clear from these stories that many Scottish Catholics were writers of both poetry and prose and that they published their work in in all the Catholic countries of Europe. They did not, however, publish in Scotland. Until quite late in the 17th century, there were seldom as many as three printing presses active in Scotland at any one time, so the authorities, religious and secular, were able to keep printing under very tight control. A printer called John Scot was active from the 1550s and does not

---

Delitiae Poetarum Scotorum huius aevi illustrium, ed. John Scot and Arthur Johnstone, 2 vols. (Amsterdam: 1637), 2:504-09. Barclay's poems are at 1:141.

[53] James Bonaventure Hepburn, *Virga Aurea septuaginta duobus encomiis b.v. Mariae coelata* (Rome: 1616).

[54] John Durkan, "Three Manuscripts with Fife Associations: And David Colville of Fife," *Innes Review* 20 (1969): 47-58 and "David Colville: An Appendix," *Innes Review* 20 (1969): 139. For Colville's significance as an Arabist, see Peter E. Pormann, "Colville, David (*c.*1581-1629)," in *ODNB,* https://doi.org/10.1093 /ref:odnb/98330.

[55] Durkan, "Early Letters of John Brown," 63 and "The Career of John Brown, Minim," *Innes Review* 18 (1967): 164-70.

[56] James Crichton, *Nobilissimo Iuueni Iacobo Critonio Scoto, in M. Tullii Ciceronis paradoxa cum commentario Aldi Mannuccij, Paulli F. Aldi N. praefatio* (Venice: 1581).

seem to have held religious views that stood in the way of his business. But the year after the Reformation, in 1561, Robert Lekpreuik also began printing and was encouraged by the general assembly of the Kirk: he printed *The Forme of Prayers* in 1562, a Protestant service book based on Genevan practice, along with three polemics against the Catholic Quintin Kennedy in 1563, one of which is by John Knox. He was also given a £200 loan to print an edition of the Psalms, which appeared in 1564, and in 1565, he was licensed to print parliamentary records. The capacity of print to influence opinion was recognized by the reformers and was evidently a source of anxiety. A close eye was kept on Lekpreuik, and each individual book was separately licensed. John Scot was raided by the Edinburgh magistrates in 1562 and caught in the act of printing the priest Ninian Winzet's *The Last Blast of the Trompet*. He was imprisoned, perhaps for as long as six years, and his press was impounded. *The Last Blast* was the last Catholic book to be printed in Scotland till the 18th century: with the Kirk exercising control as tight as this, no printer was prepared to risk his liberty and livelihood.[57]

It should be added that printing Catholic books in Scotland would have been unnecessarily risky. It was much easier to print them abroad and smuggle them in: in 1601 the Burntisland General Assembly complained about "the iniquitie of skippers, mariners and owners of shippes, that under the name of passingers, transport from other places, and bring within the countrie, Seminarie Preests, Jesuits and uther traffiquing Papists, with their coffers and books; and the impunitie of such as convoy and sparpell their books through the countrie." (Burntisland was a seaport on the coast of Fife, on the other side of the forth from Edinburgh, but not far from the capital.)[58]

---

[57] Alastair J. Mann, *The Scottish Book Trade, 1500-1720: Print Commerce and Print Control in Early Modern Scotland* (East Linton, East Lothian: 2000), 59.
[58] Mann, *Scottish Book Trade*, 57.

From the viewpoint of Catholics, this more probably felt like a highly discontinuous supply of religious instruction.

It is hardly surprising in these circumstances to find that Catholic literary culture thrived on the Continent but not at home. The most important Catholic writer to remain in Scotland after 1560 is Alexander Montgomerie, a member of James VI's coterie of poets. He was a poet in Scots, a talent that would have availed him nothing outside his native land; it is significant that the only verse of his that was published outside Scotland is a Latin translation of his *The Cherry and the Slae* by the Scottish monk Thomas Duff of Würzburg, mentioned above, and that most of his work was scribally circulated.[59] He converted to Catholicism as an adult, but his close relationship with the king seems to have protected him for much of his life.[60] Montgomerie avoided writing about controversial issues in his verse although his Catholicism eventually manifested in a treasonous sympathy for Catholic Spain. He became involved, in late 1596 or early 1597, in a Catholic plot to seize the castle of Ailsa Craig, in the Firth of Clyde, as support for a Spanish intervention in Tyrone's Rebellion in Ireland, led by his friend, fellow poet and fellow Catholic, Hew Barclay of Ladyland. Barclay was killed in the attempt, and on 14 July 1597, Montgomerie was declared an outlaw.[61] He died a year later, without having left Scotland although, according to Thomas Duff, intending to become a monk in Würzburg.[62] After 1600,

---

[59] Alexander Montgomerie, *Cerasum et silvestre prunus opus poematium* (Würzburg: 1631). His published works within Scotland were *The Cherrie and the Slae* (Edinburgh: 1597), and posthumously, *The Mindes Melodie. Contayning certayne Psalmes of the Kinglie Propheete David* (Edinburgh: 1605) and *The Flyting betwixt Montgomery and Polwart* (Edinburgh: 1629). The bulk of his verse survives in the Ker manuscript, Edinburgh, Edinburgh University Library Special Collections, William Drummond of Hawthornden Collection, De.3.70.

[60] Roderick J. Lyall, *Alexander Montgomerie: Poetry, Politics, and Cultural Change in Jacobean Scotland* (Tempe: 2005), 223-24.

[61] Lyall, *Alexander Montgomerie*, 118.

[62] Mark Dilworth, "New Light on Alexander Montgomerie," *Bibliotheck* 4 (1965): 230-35.

scribally published Catholic poets are not conspicuous in Scotland; Montgomerie's poet nephew, William Mure of Rowallan, was proud of his association with his uncle, but he was himself a Calvinist.

Montgomerie aside, it is evident that Scottish Catholic writers, or would-be writers, went abroad after the Reformation, where they could publish their work and find employment in Catholic universities or in the service of Catholic rulers. However, it is interesting to find that although the majority, of course, wrote in Latin, and some of them also wrote in French, some of them made a point of writing in Scots. Whether Scots is properly described as a dialect or a language is a matter of opinion, but by the early 16th century, the written language had its own literary characteristics, vocabulary, grammar, and orthography. It was used by educated Scots and was quite distinct from English.

However, the Kirk embraced an increasingly anglicized form of the written language. This was partly because its early architects hoped for a "godly conjunction" of the two realms: as the Englishman Anthony Gilby put it, "joyninge that Ile togither in perfect religion, whom God hath so many waies coupled and strengthened by his work in nature."[63] To achieve this end, Scots were prepared to read English, but the English were not prepared to read Scots; the Scottish reformers therefore wrote in English.[64] Furthermore, the economic logic of printing drove towards the creation of English as a master language: for pragmatic reasons, the reformers focused on smuggling English-language Geneva Bibles into Scotland rather than on persuading

---

[63] Anthony Gilby, *An Admonition to England and Scotland to Call Them to Repentance* (Geneva: 1558).

[64] The upmarket French printer Antoine Vérard published, he thought, an English translation of two popular French texts, *The kalendayr of the shyppars* and *The book intitulyd the art of good lyvyng and good deyng* (Paris: 1503), which were in fact translated into Scots. Richard Pynson, explaining why he was publishing a new English translation in 1506, observed that "these bokes that were brought into Englande no man coude understand."

Continental printers to issue a Scots-language Bible, even though one such existed, the creation of the Scottish Lollard Murdock Nisbet.[65] The greater cost effectiveness of printing in English gave the reformers access to the English book market, and that was a consideration that outweighed national sentiment. The 1576 Scottish edition of the Geneva Bible, which is in English, has a preface in heavily anglicized Scots, addressed to James VI, which says: "Trueth it is that the godly (men of the nation of England for the maist part) banisht from thair countrie for the Gospelis cause and convenit at Geneva, quha did faithfullie and lernedlie translate this buke … aucht to have thair awne praise for thair labouris bestowit to the common weil of thame that speake *our languag*e." Thus the architects of the Kirk used an anglicized vocabulary, orthography, and even grammar, and the core texts of the reformed religion were printed in English.[66]

As a minor aspect of their total output, Scottish Catholics abroad fostered the survival of Scots as a literary language. With a Latin Bible and liturgy at the center of their religious practice, they did not have to sacrifice their vernacular to the economics of producing instructional material as the reformers had to. They therefore refused to elide the difference between English and Scots, and some were even inclined to taunt the reformers for selling out their own language: the Catholic priest Ninian Winzet wrote to John Knox (all of whose published works are in English), "gif you throw curiositie of narations has forgot our auld plane Scottish quhich yor mother lerit [taught] you, in tymes cuming I sall write to you my mynd in Latin, for I am not acquynted with your southeroun." William Bruce is another clear example of a

[65] David Reid, "Prose after Knox," in *The History of Scottish Literature: Origins to 1660 (Medieval and Renaissance)*, ed. R.D.S. Jack (Aberdeen: 1988) and Roderick J. Lyall, "London or the World? The Paradox of Culture in (Post-) Jacobean Scotland,"
in *The Accession of James I: Historical and Cultural Consequences,* ed. Glenn Burgess, Rowland Wymer, and Jason Lawrence (Basingstoke: 2006), 88-100.
[66]M.A. Bald, "The Anglicisation of Scottish Printing," *SHR* 23 (1926): 107-15.

Scottish Catholic whose education had been in Scots and Latin but had not included English: as English representative in Danzig, he began a letter to Robert Cecil, dated 4 November 1606, with the apology, "Pardon me Lord that I wrytte to your honor in Scottis. I had not ane that I might trust qhua culde wrytte Inglesse at this time."[67]

Among the Scots-language texts published on the Continent are Nicol Burne's *The Disputation Concerning the Controversit Headdis of Religion, haldin in the Realme of Scotland* […] *Betuix the pretendit Ministeris of the deformed Kirk of Scotland, and, Nicol Burne Professor of philosophie in S. Leonardis College, in the Citie of Sanctandrois* (Paris: 1581); John Colville's *Paraenese or admonition* (Paris: 1602); and works by John Hamilton, James Tyrie, Adam King, and Ninian Winzet.[68] One of Winzet's translations is titled *The Necessare and Assvrit Way to pluk awa al discord in Religion* […] *Translatir in Scottishe be Niniane Winzet à catholik Preist* (Paris: 1565). These works must have had some circulation among the Scottish Catholics in Continental exile, but it seems probable that most of them were written to be read at home. As we have seen, Catholic controversial writing was certainly smuggled into Scotland, for the authorities' eagerness to control the circulation of contraband books outran their capacity to do so.

Additionally, since most educated Scots spent some time abroad, nothing prevented travelers from picking up such works in recognized centers of the book trade such as the Rue Saint-Jacques in Paris. The library lists of Protestant Scots such as William Drummond of Hawthornden and John Lindsay of Balcarres, Lord Menmuir often contain Catholic Latin belles-lettres and even controversy: Drummond

---

[67] Sebastian Sobecki, "The Authorship of *A Relation of the State of Polonia*, 1598," *Seventeenth Century* 18 (2003): 172-79, at 173.

[68] This was not without its problems: an address to the reader in Hamilton's *A Facile Traictise, Contenand, first ane infallible reul to discerne trew from fals religion* (Louvain, 1600) apologizes, "Excuse, guid reider, the erreurs commitit in ye prenting; considder the difficultie to prent our langage in a strage [*sic*] country."

owned John Colville's *Paraenesis* (the Latin version), two poems by Thomas Dempster of Muiresk, the Jesuit James Gordon of Huntly's *Controversiae*, a copy of Ignatius of Loyola's *Spiritual Exercises*, and even Robert Persons's scurrilous anti-Elizabeth pamphlet published under the name of Andreas Philopater. Menmuir, who was a colleague and close friend of the Catholic Lord Dunfermline, owned a copy of James Tyrie's *The Refutation of Ane Answer Made Be Schir Iohne Knox, to ane letter, send be James Tyrie, to his ymquhyle brother* (Paris: 1573), which is now in the Bibliothèque Nationale de France. When Scot of Scotstarvit (in Fife) wanted to round up Scottish neo-Latin for *Deliciae poetarum Scotorum*, an enterprise that was under way by 1615,[69] although the volumes were not forthcoming till 1637, he seems to have had no trouble procuring texts of Scottish Catholic writers such as William Barclay and James Halkerston.

One interesting minor Catholic poet is Thomas Bicarton from Caskie, who published five collections of neo-Latin verse, mostly in Poitiers, where he was professor of rhetoric. Like a number of other Scottish Catholic writers, he retained an interest in writing in Scots, since in one of these volumes, *Miscellanea*, he included an elegy in Scots and Latin parallel texts:[70]

Si coram Phrygio certans pastore fuisset
  Forma, inter ternas Cynthia visa Deas
Non collapsa forent antiquae moenia Troiae,
  Hectora Pelides non rapuisset equis:
Non Phrygii tanto stagnassent sanguine campi,
  Non foret à Graio rapta Lacaena viro
Nec pastor croceo donasset Cyprida pomo:

[69] Alexander Crawford Lindsay, *Lives of the Lindsays; or, A Memoir of the Houses of Crawford and Balcarres,* 3 vols. (London: 1849), 2:5-6.
[70] Thomas Bicarton, "Elegia 6, Latinoscotica," in *Miscellanea* (Poitiers: 1588), 176.

Cessissent Dominae praemia tanta meae.

Hed scho bein sein amang the laddays thri
Before Paris striuing of pulchritude
Troy zet hed stand vith tours and castels hi;
Hed nocht bein spelt sa mekle gentle blude,
Quein Helena in Grece hed bedden gude,
Venus het nocht the aple borne avay,
She hed bein vard, and baith ye uter tuay.[71]

These parallel versions show an interesting sense of the different discourse he felt appropriate to the two languages. A literal version of the Latin would be, "If her shape had been competing before the Phrygian shepherd and [my] Cynthia seen among the goddesses, the ancient walls of Troy would not have collapsed, the son of Peleus would not have dragged Hector with his horses, nor would the Phrygian fields have stifled with so much blood; and the Lacanian [woman] would not have been snatched from Greece by a man, nor would the shepherd have given the yellow apple to the Cyprian: they would have yielded the entire reward to my Mistress." The Scots version sticks to names rather than sobriquets and with the exception of "pulchritude," chooses a notably un-Latinate vocabulary. It has an engaging simplicity and is written in rhyme royal, a form associated with Geoffrey Chaucer, and with older Scottish poets such as William Dunbar, and in this and other ways, it has more in common with the poetry of the pre-Reformation court than with the new style of Scottish poetry popularised in the circle of James V1.[72]

[71] *Zet*, "yet" (with a ȝ); *spelt*, "spilt"; *bedden*, "remained," preterite of *bide*. *Vard*, probably "expended," in the sense of "made as nothing," preterite of *war*, "to use, use up, spend, expended," a verb cognate with the English noun *ware*, meaning something vendible.

[72] David J. Parkinson (ed.), *James VI and I, Literature and Scotland: Tides of Change,*

One cause célèbre that naturally generated a good deal of Catholic literature was the downfall of Mary, Queen of Scots. Many Scottish Catholics had personal cause to be grateful to her. Adam Blackwood, who went into exile *causa religionis* in 1558, was sponsored by her at the University of Paris during her brief reign as queen of France. Later he became a member of the Parliament of Poitiers and a judge. His various writings include poetry addressed to Scottish Catholic exiles in France and praise of the house of Guise, to which Mary belonged on her mother's side. When Mary was executed, he published *Martyre de la Reine d'Ecosse*, which went through five editions.[73] Similarly, John Leslie, bishop of Ross, received the personal patronage of his queen, to whom he owed his bishopric. He was her principal adviser in religious matters and remained unwaveringly loyal. He acted as her ambassador once she was under arrest in England and published a series of works on her behalf: *A defence of the honour of the right highe, mightye and noble Princesse Marie, Quene of Scotlande*, printed in Reims in 1569; a similar book in French exculpating her from involvement in Henry Stuart, Lord Darnley's murder; a book defending the right of women to rule, countering the well-known argument of John Knox; a treatise on her right to inherit the English throne (published in French, Latin, Spanish, and English); and several responses to her death. It is worth observing that Leslie and Blackwood write in English--unlike the works of writers such as Winzet cited above, these pro-Mary tracts are evidently hoping to reach English readers, as well as the Continental Catholic readership implied by French, Spanish, and Latin editions. The Englishman

---

1567-1625 (Leuven: 2013).

[73] His poems are in *In novae religionis asseclas carmen inuectiuum* […] (Paris: 1563) and *Varii generis poemata* (Poitiers: 1609), his praise of the Guise in *De Principis Augustissimi Francisci Ducis Guisani Obitu* (Paris: 1563), and the first edition of *Martyre de la Reine D'Escosse* […] came out in Paris under a false imprint, 1588.

Gabriel Harvey, for one, was reading "thos tragical pamflets of the quen of Scots" by 1573.[74]

Another Scottish Catholic writer whose work is replete with political subtexts is the brilliant but erratic Thomas Dempster, who was born at Cliftbog in Aberdeenshire, probably in 1579. Having briefly been a student at Cambridge and Paris, he subsequently matriculated at Louvain. However, William Crichton, SJ, principal of the Scottish College at Louvain, decided to send a group of promising Scots for further education in Rome, Dempster among them. After further travels and misadventures, he finally took his MA from Douai. His adult life was as checkered as his student career, but he published quite extensively throughout it. His most famous, or notorious, work is his *Historia Ecclesiastica Gentis Scotorum*, first published in Bologna in 1627, two years after his death. Despite its title, it is not an equivalent to Bede's Anglo-Saxon ecclesiastical history but a calendar of Scottish Catholic luminaries--interpreting "Scottish" so liberally that his list includes Saint Aldhelm, from Malmesbury in Wiltshire, the author of 18 books (of which three are genuine); Saint Boniface, from Crediton in Devon (author of ten books of which two may be genuine); and Budica, queen of the Iceni, to whom he attributes six.[75] He also caused utter fury in Irish learned circles by claiming the entire body of Ireland's saints and scholars as Scots, due to the fact that early medieval sources refer to them as "Scoti": as we have seen, this claim had a significant impact on the practical question of who controlled the ancient Irish foundations in Germany and greatly damaged Scoto-Irish relations.[76] A proportion, how large a proportion is unclear, of Dempster's worthies

[74] Priscilla Bawcutt, "Crossing the Border: Scottish Poetry and English Readers in the Sixteenth Century," in *The Rose and the Thistle: Essays on the Culture of Late Medieval and Renaissance Scotland,* ed. Sally Mapstone and Juliette Wood (East Linton: East Lothian: 1998), 59-76, at 62.

[75] Thomas Dempster, *Historia Ecclesiastica Gentis Scotorum* […] (Bologna: 1627), 6-8, 71-74, 108.

[76] Irish refutations include G.F., *Hiberniae sive antiquioris Scotiae vindiciae adversus*

are simply invented, though his work bears some relation to fact: Thomas Bicarton certainly existed, and Dempster's information about him is accurate. However, Dempster also writes, for example, about a Patrick Bisset, a professor of canon law at Bologna in 1401, who wrote two treatises entitled "De Irregularitate" and "Lectiones Feriales."[77] There is no evidence in Bologna or anywhere else for this man or his works. Dempster's method overall is to create a vast Scoto-Latin prosopography, featuring a host of shadowy figures from the Middle Ages, and an inflated bibliography: the author of one known and surviving work is often credited with four or five other plausible-sounding books for which there is no evidence whatsoever. Dempster's wholesale annexation of early medieval Irish and Anglo-Saxon Christianity for Scotland was supported by Chalmers, in *De Scotorum Fortitudine*, and by Robert Strachan, a monk of Würzburg, whose *Germania Christiana* similarly claims the Irish and Anglo-Saxon missions of the Carolingian era for Scotland: however, this latter work was never printed.[78]

Dempster, while clearly unscrupulous, albeit patriotic, was by no means a fool; he was a considerable scholar, and his Latin poetry was admired by contemporaries. These virtues are more evident in another, very different publication, a neo-Latin play called *Decemviratus Abrogatus*, based on the story of Virginia and Appius, from Livy, one of several plays Dempster wrote, though it is not clear, due to his tendency towards multiplication, how many.[79] Although most other Scottish

immodestam parecbasim Thomae Dempsteri (Antwerp: 1621); David Roche, *Hibernia resurgens, sive refrigerium antidotale* […] (Rouen: 1621); and Poitiers, Médiathèque François-Mitterand, MS 258 (Stephen White, "Scoto-Caledonica cornix deplumanda ab avibus orbis, hoc est refutatio recentium pseudo-historiarum prisco-scoticarum Thomae Demsteri, Scoto-Britanni, uxorati, professoris latinarum in Academia Bononiensium Italiae"), anciently 229.

[77] Dempster, *Historia Ecclesiastica*, 95.

[78] Mark Dilworth, "'Germania Christiana': A Seventeenth-Century Trilogy," *Innes Review* 18 (1967): 118-40. The manuscript is Würzburg, Universitätsbibliothek, M.ch.q. 53.

[79] Thomas Dempster, *Tragoedia, decemviratus abrogatus* (Paris: 1613).

Catholic writers tended to support royal authority, especially in the context of the deposition of Mary, Queen of Scots, Dempster here sides with revolution. His play is the product of a specific political context, since, at the time of its performance, the University of Paris was debating James I's theory of absolute monarchic power. The Jesuit Francisco Suárez countered this with two treatises published 1612 and 1613, both of which defend the position that the civil community of the people has the right to depose an unjust or tyrannical ruler. [80] While this principle is more often found among Calvinists, such as, in Scotland, George Buchanan and Andrew Melville, it should be remembered that the bull Regnans in Excelsis issued by Pius V in 1570 had dispensed English Catholics from allegiance to Elizabeth I and encouraged her overthrow. Thus, it was evidently not entirely alien to early modern Catholic thought.

Dempster's play was performed on 1-2 May 1613: as it is plotted, the tragedy of Virginia is made to illustrate Suárez's political argument. The Senate and its magistrates are the authentic repository of Roman political authority. The usurping *decemviri* are headed by Appius, who schemes to get his hands on the chaste Virginia and is foiled only when her father murders her so she may keep her honor. The decemviri are deposed for reasons of personal wickedness, political illegitimacy, and political incompetence: Rome is under serious threat from a coalition of Italian peoples (Dempster has re-dated this conflict for the purposes of his plot), and they are failing to respond adequately to the emergency. It was not unusual for neo-Latin dramatists to use stories from classical history to point a contemporary moral, but the nature of the moral here is unusual for a Scottish Catholic writer.

---

[80] Francisco Suárez, *Tractatus de Legibus ac Deo Legislatore* (Coimbra: 1612) and *Defensio Fidei Catholicae et Apostolicae Adversus Anglicanae Sectae errores* […] (Coimbra: 1613). See Ronald G. Asch, *Sacral Kingship between Disenchantment and Re-Enchantment: The French and English Monarchies, 1587-1688* (New York: 2014), especially the chapter "The Anglo-Gallican Moment: The French and English Monarchies from the Death of Mary Queen of Scots to James I's *Remonstrance for the Right of Kings,* 1587-1615."

Among Scoto-Latin poets, the greatest was undoubtedly George Buchanan (1506-82), who began his career as a Catholic but subsequently embraced Protestant reform,[81] but there were some able Catholic Latin poets. One of the more industrious was George Crichton. He was professor of civil law in the University of Paris, and his status as a man of letters is suggested by the fact that he was chosen to pronounce the funerary oration on Pierre de Ronsard.[82] He was a very prolific writer of *vers d'occasion* and Latin orations: 34 survive. He was admired by the Dane Ole Borch (Olaus Borrichius), who singled him out in his study of contemporary neo-Latin poets, and also praised other Catholic Scottish Latin poets, notably Thomas Segat.[83] Adam Blackwood and his brother and nephew, both called Henry, all based in France, published occasional Latin verse celebrating patrons, execrating Elizabeth I and so forth, as did the Jesuit Andrew Leech, whose 68 or more pamphlet poems were printed in various cities of Poland.[84] The poetry of many Catholic exiles was heavily biased towards *vers d'occasion,* for the obvious reason that many of these men needed either to express gratitude to existing patrons or to solicit the attention of new ones.

One who seems to have had the leisure to write for less interested reasons was George Chalmers, professor of humanities at Padua. He published a volume dedicated to his friend John Leech (a talented and prolific wandering Scot, a Protestant, though he had Catholic friends and acquaintances), and he also published an elegant volume of emblems and Ovidian elegies, *Emblemata Amatoria*.[85] The illustrations of the

[81] Having taught at a number of Catholic institutions, he was tried by the Inquisition in Coimbra in 1550; he was released in 1552 but thereafter it was increasingly clear that his sympathy was with the Protestants.
[82] *Georgii Crittonii laudatio funebris habita in exequiis Petri Ronsardi, apud Becodianos, cui praeponuntur ejusdem Ronsardi carmina partim a moriente, partim a languente dictata* […] (Paris: 1586).
[83] Ole Borch [Olaus Borrichius], *Dissertationes Academicae De Poetis* […] (Frankfurt: 1683), 151, 157.
[84] Antoni Krawczyk, "The British in Poland in the Seventeenth Century," *Seventeenth Century* 37 (2002): 254-71, 265-66.
[85] George Chalmers, *Sylva Leochaeo suo* […] (Paris: 1620) and *Emblemata Amatoria*

emblems are mostly taken from Crispin de Passe's *Thronus Cupidinis*, and the contents mostly cast an eye over the ardors and errors of human love. However, some seem intended to bear a more spiritual interpretation, notably this one, where Perseus merges into Christ, Andromeda into the Catholic Church, or the human soul:[86]

Pro pulchris militat Aether

[Image: Perseus flies to the rescue of Andromeda]

Ut te monstra petant, ut te spumantia Cete
Fortunam vincit forma, virago, tuam.
Undis orta Venus, crudelibus imperat undis,
Et sua magnanimus regna tuetur Amor
Ales eques summis te protegit ortus ab astris
Qui sola, qui saevas iam tibi subdet aquas.
Quid vehit hunc? Virtus. Sed et haec cur surgit in alas
Hanc fert quae nostrum gloria spernit humum.
Quicunque innocuae defendit munera formae
Spiritus e celo devolat ille suo.

The Air fights for the Fair

Though monsters seek you, and spouting whales,
Lady, your beauty overcomes your fortune.
Venus, risen from the waves, commands the cruel waves

(Venice: 1627).

[86] Chalmers, *Emblemata Amatoria*, 36-37.

And great-hearted Love defends his kingdom.
A winged knight protects you, appearing from the starry heights
Who now subdues the earth and the savage waters for you.
What rides here? Virtue. But also, why this ascends on wings,
Is that it brings that which rejects our earth for glory.
Whoever defends the gifts of innocent beauty,
That Spirit will fly down from heaven for him.

Other Continental exiles achieved a reputation as writers of prose, locally or even internationally. The most successful was John Barclay, a Scoto-French Catholic, the son of William Barclay, exiled from Scotland on account of his religion. John Barclay was the author of one of the most notable bestsellers of the 17th century, *Argenis* (first published 1621). This is a very long picaresque romance, with a dashing hero, shipwrecks, pirates, a heroine in danger of being forced to marry the wrong man, and other *topoi* of the classical novel. It was believed by many to be a political allegory, and some issues were printed with "keys," which added to its popularity, and it certainly has much to say about government, both good and bad. There were at least 40 Latin editions before 1700, and it was translated into French (three times), English, Italian, Spanish and German (twice in each case), Dutch, Polish, Greek, and Icelandic. There were also continuations, responses, condensed versions, and dramas. His *Satyricon*, the earlier of his two romances (first published in 1610), was also enormously popular and repeatedly issued in most European countries: more loosely plotted, it is a series of episodes rather than a coherent narrative, and to some extent an imitation of the *Satyricon* of Petronius. While some of his satire was directed against the Jesuits, they are one of many targets, along with parvenus, university

professors, and doctors: there is no reason to think that his mockery implies Protestant sympathies. In another work, *Paraenesis ad sectarios* (1617), he detailed his experiences as a Catholic in Protestant England, where he briefly attempted to establish himself, in which he made it clear that he had not been prepared to sacrifice his religion for the sake of personal advancement.

George Con, chiefly remembered as papal envoy to Charles I, was also a published poet and controversialist, who wrote in Latin; his works also included a life of Mary, Queen of Scots, published in Rome in 1624, which, like other writings by Scottish Catholics, makes the point of the legitimacy of her claim to the English throne, occupied at the time by her grandson.[87] Another Scottish queen is memorialized by a 17th-century Leslie, William Aloysius Leslie, SJ, who became a canon of Bratislava Cathedral. He wrote a life of Margaret of Scotland, in French: Italian and English translations were also issued.[88] Margaret (*c.*1045-93), apart from being Scotland's principal royal saint, was mainly remembered for reforming the Church of Scotland and bringing it into conformity with Roman Catholicism. She is represented here as a model of perfect queenship: pious, chaste, obedient to her confessor, and maternal. The book has the secondary, or perhaps primary, purpose of publicizing an alleged relic of Saint Margaret in the Scots College at Douai, with a careful account of its provenance and how it came to survive.

There were also a number of Scottish Catholic scientists. A Scottish Jesuit, Hugh Semple, published on mathematics, a subject that interested many Scots of various religious persuasions. As rector of the Scots college in Madrid, he amassed a

[87] George Con, *Vita Mariae Stuartae Scotiae Reginae, Dotariae Galliae, Angliae et Hiberniae Haeredis* (Rome: 1624).

[88] Guillaume Aloys Leslie [William Aloysius Leslie], *L'Idée d'une reine parfaite en la vie de S. Marguerite, reine d'Ecosse; avec les éloges de ses enfans, David et Matilde* (Douai: 1660), *The Idaea of a perfect princesse in the life of St Margaret Queen of Scotland* […] *written originally in Franch and now Englished* (Paris: 1661), and *Vita di Santa Margherita Regina di Scozia* (Rome: 1675).

fine collection of astronomical instruments.[89] His work was not particularly original, but another Scottish Catholic who made genuine contributions to knowledge was William D'Avissone, or Davidson. He took a first degree at Aberdeen, then went on to Montpellier, where he took his MD. He was a Paracelsian chemiatrist, and by 1644, he had become royal physician to Louis XIV, professor of chemistry, and superintendent of the Jardin du Roi, the king's physic garden. Thomas Segat of Seton, astronomer and poet, is also worth mentioning in this context. Something of a wandering scholar, he spent some time at the University of Padua, when Galileo was resident in the city, and subsequently went to Prague, where Johannes Kepler was astronomer to Rudolf II.[90] Arthur Williamson has drawn attention to the intricate connections between Protestant apocalyptic, the measurement of time, mathematics, and political thought, but an interest in chronography, astronomy, and mathematics is also found among Catholics, notably Lord Dunfermline.[91]

It is thus clear that Scottish Catholic culture was extensive and, also, that it was the culture of a diaspora. It could hardly be said to have a center; the Scots colleges and monasteries provided permanent homes for a variety of individuals in which a distinctively Scottish culture could be, and was, maintained, but large numbers of Catholic Scots lived by ones and twos throughout Catholic Europe. Evidence such as *alba amicorum* and letters makes it clear that Scottish Catholics networked and maintained connections among themselves.[92] But a notable feature of

[89] McInally, *Sixth Scottish University*, 74.
[90] O. Szabolcs Barlay, "Thomas Seget's (from Edinborough) Middle European Connections in Reflection of Cod. Vat. Lat. 9385," *Magyar Könyvzsemle* 97 (1981): 204-20.
[91] Arthur H. Williamson, *Scottish National Consciousness in the Age of James VI* (Edinburgh: 1979).
[92] Two particularly important and informative *alba amicorum* are those of Thomas Seget, Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Lat. 9385 and George Strachan, Aberdeen, University of Aberdeen Library, Special Collections, SCA CB/57/12, previously Edinburgh, National Library of Scotland, Deposit 221, MS 12. For the latter see James Fowler Kellas Johnstone (ed.), *The Alba Amicorum of George*

the Scottish Catholic diaspora is that it appears to be entirely male. There were, of course, university professors who married: not all these men were celibate. But, when their wives can be identified, they are locals from wherever that particular wandering Scot had come to rest. Catholic Scots were not going abroad by families; and, unlike early modern Englishwomen, some 3800 of whom joined English convents abroad before 1800,[93] mostly in the Low Countries, with the rarest of exceptions, Scotswomen did not exile themselves as nuns.

One such exception is revealed by James Drummond, 4th Earl of Perth, lord chancellor of Scotland, in a letter to his sister, Anne Hay, Countess of Erroll, in August 1674:

> We went to Bruxelles the 16th July, where we waited for a second time on our old great-aunt Mad[lle] d'Argile, who is near 80 years old. … She speaks no English, is a good soul as lives, and in esteem with all the great folks of Bruxelles. She has another sister a *chanoinesse religieuse* of Saint Augustine, Lady Victoria, a very fine lady. She herself is a most excellent musician, and although her voice fails much she sings true still, and plays finely on many instruments, but chiefly the organ. She composed a song for my wife.[94]

The family history of the cultivated Isabella Campbell, "Mad[lle] Argile," was exceptional in a variety of ways. Her father, Archibald Campbell, 7th Earl of Argyll, had converted to Catholicism in 1618: under the pretext of taking the waters at Spa, he and his wife, a Catholic Englishwoman, fled to the Continent together, where the

---

Strachan, George Craig, Thomas Cumming (Aberdeen: 1924), 1-17.

[93] Information from database Who Were the Nuns?, https://wwtn.history.qmul.ac.uk.

[94] John Wilcock, *The Great Marquess: Life and Times of Archibald, 8th Earl, and Ist (and Only) Marquess of Argyll* (Edinburgh: 1903), 342-44.

earl took service with the Spanish army in Flanders. It seems that he set up a household in Brussels with his wife and their children. His Scottish estates had passed to his son by his first wife.[95] The earl and his countess eventually went to England and lived quietly in London from 1629, but their daughters chose to enter religion in Belgium, though apparently not together: Victoria became an Augustinian canoness, Barbara a Benedictine, and it is not known where Isabella and Anne (the fourth sister, who entered a convent in widowhood), were professed. Another aristocratic Scotswoman, Alexander Lindsay, 1st Earl of Balcarres's oldest daughter Anne Lindsay, spent a couple of years at the English court after the Restoration, converted to Catholicism under the influence of the dowager queen Henrietta Maria and her circle, and became an Augustinian canoness in Paris in 1663.[96]

These women's circumstances were quite exceptional. The experience of most Scottish Catholic women was very different. In his elegiac poem on Patrick Seton, a youthful cadet of the Seton family who died at Rome, George Strachan writes,

> Nunc ignara parat redituro mater honores,
>
> Emptaque Patricio nomine villa jacet.
>
> Forte etiam votis expectant scripta sorores,
>
> Etque peregrinis dona remissa locis …
>
> Now his mother, unaware, prepares a reception in honour of the expected one, and a country house, bought in Patrick's name, lies empty. Perhaps his sisters, too, are looking forward to letters and to gifts sent from far countries …

---

[95] John Callow, "Campbell, Archibald, 7th Earl of Argyll (1575/6-1638)," in *ODNB,* https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/4471 and Rosalind K. Marshall, "Cornwallis, Anne, Countess of Argyll (d. 1635)," in *ODNB,* https://doi.org/10.1093/ref:odnb/68036.

[96] Lindsay, *Lives of the Lindsays,* 2:115.

The passage is reminiscent of the famous ballad of Sir Patrick Spens, which Strachan may well have known.[97] What it takes for granted is that women stay at home and wait. And that in turn tells us that though Scottish Catholic intellectual life is effectively synonymous with exile, its continuity lay within Scotland itself.

[97] O lang, may their ladies sit
Wi' thair fans into their hand,
Or eir they se Sir Patrick Spens
Cum sailing to the land.