

Supplementary file 8: cNMA model comparisons for smoking abstinence outcome

[Return to index](#)

Group	Component	Network Meta-Analysis (NMA) Excludes studies combining interventions		Component Network Meta-Analysis (CNMA) Includes studies combining more than one intervention							Component Network Meta-Regression (CNMR) Includes studies combining more than one intervention							
		Analysis of intervention types only	Analysis of selected combinations of type and delivery modes	Analysis of selected combinations of type and delivery modes	Analysis of selected combinations of type, delivery, and dose	Analysis of selected combinations of type, delivery, and tapering	Analysis of selected combinations of type, delivery, and timing	Analysis of selected combinations of type, delivery, and any form of nicotine tapering (main model)	Analysis of selected combinations of type, delivery, and any form of nicotine tapering (excluding high risk of bias)	Analysis of selected combinations of type, delivery, and any form of nicotine tapering (excluding arms with DIC ≥3)	Selected based on pre-existing condition (yes vs no)	Length of follow-up (≥52 weeks vs <52 weeks)	Behavioural support (interactive, and self-help/mixed, vs no support)	Year of publication (per additional year)	Control arm quit rate	Control arm quit rate	Funding of (the study vs no funding or intervention only)	Funding of (the study vs no funding or intervention only)
		(n studies: 244, n arms: 551, n patients: 116 404)	(n studies: 246, n arms: 556, n patients: 116 511)	(n studies: 296, n arms: 702, n patients: 142 435)	(n studies: 304, n arms: 743, n patients: 145 163)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 710, n patients: 145 494)	(n studies: 301, n arms: 728, n patients: 144 772)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 709, n patients: 145 460)	(n studies: 204, n arms: 463, n patients: 91 634)	(n studies: 292, n arms: 699, n patients: 144 490)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 711, n patients: 145 494)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 711, n patients: 145 494)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 711, n patients: 145 494)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 711, n patients: 145 494)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 711, n patients: 145 494)	(n studies: 299, n arms: 711, n patients: 145 494)	(n studies: 264, n arms: 633, n patients: 134 861)	(n studies: 264, n arms: 633, n patients: 134 861)
Control	Control	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)	1.00 (Reference)
Type	Nicotine	1.68 (1.51 to 1.89)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery	Nicotine patch	-	1.71 (1.48 to 1.98)	1.47 (1.32 to 1.65)	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.29 (1.13 to 1.48)	1.31 (1.15 to 1.50)	1.32 (1.16 to 1.52)	1.32 (1.15 to 1.50)	1.33 (1.17 to 1.52)	1.33 (1.17 to 1.53)	1.25 (1.09 to 1.43)	1.25 (1.07 to 1.46)
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine patch Standard	-	-	-	1.50 (1.31 to 1.72)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine patch Higher	-	-	-	1.72 (1.29 to 2.31)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine patch Lower	-	-	-	1.40 (1.14 to 1.72)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine patch Mixed	-	-	-	1.40 (1.14 to 1.72)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine patch Missing	-	-	-	1.98 (1.43 to 2.79)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x tapering	Nicotine patch Tapering	-	-	-	-	1.55 (1.37 to 1.76)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x tapering	Nicotine patch No Tapering	-	-	-	-	1.40 (1.18 to 1.66)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x timing	Nicotine patch Pre quit	-	-	-	-	-	1.46 (1.14 to 1.87)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x timing	Nicotine patch No pre quit	-	-	-	-	-	1.48 (1.32 to 1.66)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery	Nicotine EC	-	2.66 (1.92 to 3.73)	2.45 (1.80 to 3.39)	2.31 (1.68 to 3.23)	2.40 (1.76 to 3.30)	2.44 (1.77 to 3.36)	2.37 (1.73 to 3.24)	2.40 (1.57 to 3.70)	2.35 (1.73 to 3.21)	2.30 (1.68 to 3.16)	2.35 (1.71 to 3.24)	2.35 (1.71 to 3.25)	2.36 (1.72 to 3.26)	2.41 (1.74 to 3.32)	2.07 (1.53 to 2.82)	2.50 (1.80 to 3.48)	2.80 (1.98 to 4.03)
Type x delivery	Nicotine	-	1.62 (1.44 to 1.84)	1.45 (1.32 to 1.59)	-	-	-	1.41 (1.29 to 1.55)	1.46 (1.24 to 1.72)	1.39 (1.26 to 1.53)	1.35 (1.22 to 1.48)	1.36 (1.24 to 1.51)	1.37 (1.23 to 1.52)	1.38 (1.25 to 1.52)	1.36 (1.23 to 1.50)	1.37 (1.24 to 1.52)	1.33 (1.21 to 1.47)	1.33 (1.19 to 1.48)
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine other Standard	-	-	-	1.71 (1.45 to 2.04)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine other Higher	-	-	-	1.66 (1.04 to 2.65)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine other Lower	-	-	-	1.42 (1.25 to 1.63)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine other Mixed	-	-	-	1.43 (1.21 to 1.69)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x dose	Nicotine other Missing	-	-	-	1.31 (1.09 to 1.59)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x tapering	Nicotine other Tapering	-	-	-	-	1.64 (1.39 to 1.93)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x tapering	Nicotine other No Tapering	-	-	-	-	1.40 (1.27 to 1.55)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x timing	Nicotine other Pre quit	-	-	-	-	-	1.69 (1.31 to 2.19)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery x timing	Nicotine other No pre quit	-	-	-	-	-	1.44 (1.31 to 1.58)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type	Varenicline	2.51 (2.13 to 2.96)	2.58 (2.19 to 3.06)	2.29 (1.99 to 2.65)	2.34 (2.03 to 2.70)	2.34 (2.03 to 2.70)	2.31 (2.01 to 2.66)	2.33 (2.02 to 2.68)	2.16 (1.77 to 2.66)	2.28 (1.99 to 2.62)	2.16 (1.89 to 2.49)	2.20 (1.93 to 2.53)	2.21 (1.92 to 2.55)	2.24 (1.95 to 2.58)	2.22 (1.94 to 2.56)	2.18 (1.91 to 2.50)	2.07 (1.79 to 2.39)	2.03 (1.68 to 2.45)
Type	Cytisine	2.36 (1.76 to 3.20)	2.36 (1.76 to 3.21)	2.19 (1.64 to 2.94)	2.23 (1.68 to 3.00)	2.23 (1.67 to 3.00)	2.20 (1.65 to 2.94)	2.21 (1.66 to 2.97)	1.57 (1.09 to 2.32)	2.18 (1.65 to 2.90)	2.12 (1.59 to 2.85)	2.14 (1.60 to 2.89)	2.13 (1.58 to 2.86)	2.13 (1.59 to 2.87)	2.13 (1.60 to 2.87)	2.09 (1.59 to 2.76)	2.19 (1.59 to 3.03)	2.23 (1.62 to 3.10)
Type	Bupropion	1.60 (1.36 to 1.88)	1.61 (1.37 to 1.90)	1.40 (1.23 to 1.58)	1.43 (1.26 to 1.63)	1.43 (1.26 to 1.63)	1.41 (1.24 to 1.59)	1.43 (1.26 to 1.62)	1.36 (1.13 to 1.65)	1.41 (1.24 to 1.59)	1.33 (1.18 to 1.51)	1.34 (1.18 to 1.52)	1.35 (1.19 to 1.53)	1.36 (1.20 to 1.54)	1.35 (1.20 to 1.53)	1.37 (1.20 to 1.56)	1.31 (1.15 to 1.50)	1.28 (1.11 to 1.47)
Type	Nortriptyline	1.95 (1.28 to 2.98)	1.95 (1.29 to 2.96)	1.34 (0.99 to 1.79)	1.38 (1.02 to 1.84)	1.36 (1.02 to 1.82)	1.35 (1.01 to 1.80)	1.35 (1.02 to 1.81)	1.31 (0.90 to 1.82)	1.34 (1.01 to 1.78)	1.27 (0.95 to 1.69)	1.33 (0.99 to 1.77)	1.31 (0.98 to 1.75)	1.29 (0.97 to 1.73)	1.31 (0.98 to 1.75)	1.50 (1.10 to 2.00)	1.21 (0.88 to 1.66)	1.30 (0.95 to 1.78)
Type	Placebo	0.89 (0.79 to 1.02)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Type x delivery	Placebo EC	-	1.23 (0.72 to 2.05)	1.19 (0.76 to 1.87)	1.12 (0.71 to 1.77)	1.16 (0.74 to 1.80)	1.17 (0.74 to 1.83)	1.16 (0.74 to 1.80)	0.93 (0.49 to 1.72)	1.16 (0.75 to 1.79)	1.12 (0.72 to 1.75)	1.14 (0.72 to 1.77)	1.14 (0.73 to 1.79)	1.15 (0.72 to 1.80)	1.17 (0.74 to 1.81)	1.50 (0.91 to 2.46)	1.17 (0.74 to 1.86)	1.27 (0.80 to 1.99)
Type x delivery	Placebo	-	0.89 (0.78 to 1.02)	0.82 (0.73 to 0.91)	0.84 (0.76 to 0.94)	0.84 (0.75 to 0.94)	0.82 (0.74 to 0.92)	0.84 (0.75 to 0.93)	0.80 (0.68 to 0.95)	0.83 (0.75 to 0.92)	0.76 (0.68 to 0.85)	0.77 (0.69 to 0.87)	0.78 (0.69 to 0.89)	0.80 (0.72 to 0.89)	0.79 (0.71 to 0.88)	0.78 (0.71 to 0.87)	0.79 (0.70 to 0.89)	0.86 (0.76 to 0.98)
Tapering	Nicotine tapering	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.14 (1.00 to 1.29)	1.04 (0.87 to 1.24)	1.14 (1.01 to 1.29)	1.10 (0.97 to 1.25)	1.09 (0.95 to 1.25)	1.10 (0.96 to 1.27)	1.13 (0.99 to 1.28)	1.09 (0.96 to 1.24)	1.10 (0.96 to 1.25)	1.17 (1.02 to 1.34)	1.14 (0.97 to 1.34)
Prediction	Nicotine patch + Nicotine other	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.93 (1.61 to 2.34)	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
Moderator effect	B	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.12 (1.03 to 1.23)	1.04 (0.99 to 1.10)	-	1.002 (0.998 to 1.006)	1.046 (1.008 to 1.083)	-	0.97 (0.9 to 1.040)	-
Moderator effect	B1	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.03 (0.84 to 1.26)	-	-	-	-	-
Moderator effect	B2	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.02 (0.97 to 1.07)	-	-	-	-	-
Bupropion	beta[2]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.057 (0.894 to 1.257)	-	1.1 (0.9 to 1.36)	
Cytisine	beta[3]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.767 (0.582 to 1.069)	-	-	
Nicotine patch	beta[4]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.073 (0.962 to 1.192)	-	1.03 (0.82 to 1.30)	
Nicotine EC	beta[5]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.709 (0.585 to 0.884)	-	0.6 (0.24 to 1.50)	
Nicotine	beta[6]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.023 (0.916 to 1.144)	-	1.05 (0.84 to 1.30)	
Nortriptyline	beta[7]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.848 (0.582 to 1.359)	-	-	
Placebo EC	beta[8]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.058 (0.877 to 1.246)	-	-	
Placebo	beta[9]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1.156 (1.092 to 1.226)	-	0.92 (0.84 to 1.01)	
Varenicline	beta[10]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.997 (0.87 to 1.146)	-	0.98 (0.75 to 1.26)	
Nicotine tapering	beta[11]	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.991 (0.885 to 1.111)	-	0.98 (0.78 to 1.24)	
Log Mean Odds Quit across trials	mubar	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-2.10	-	-	-
Mean quit rate across trials		-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	0.11	-	-	-
Between studies SD	sdbt	0.29	0.28	0.29	0.29	0.28	0.29	0.28	0.29	0.27	0.29	0.29	0.30	0.29	0.29	0.28	0.29	0.28
	deviance	2981	3007	3785	3994	3838	3900	3852	2513	3770	3840	3839	3838	3839	3847	3422	3423	3423
	pD	372	375	470	495	475	481	474	316	461	476	478	481	479	483	425	425	424
	DIC	3354	3383	4255	4489	4314	4381	4327	2829	4231	4316	4318	4319	4318	4330	4345	3848	3847
	Discarded iterations	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000	15000
	Pooling of iterations	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
	Total iterations	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000	30000
Component effects across models ran		CNMA (only intervention type)	CNMA (type and delivery)	CNMA (type and delivery comb)	CNMA (type delivery dose)	CNMA (type delivery tapering)	CNMA (type delivery timing)	CNMA (full model)	CNMA (excl high risk)	CNMA (excl DIC3)	CNMR (pre-existing disease)	CNMR (length fup)	CNMR 2 (behsu)	CNMR (year)	CNMR (control arm quit rate)	CNMR DI (control arm quit rate)	CNMR CI (funding)	CNMR DI (funding)