

Supplementary file 10: cNMA model comparisons for withdrawals due to treatment outcome

[Return to index](#)

| Group | Component | Network Meta-Analysis (NMA) Excludes studies combining interventions | | Component Network Meta-Analysis (CNMA) Includes studies combining more than one intervention | | | | | | Component Network Meta-Regression (CNMR) Includes studies combining more than one intervention | | |
|--|-------------------------------|---|---|---|---|--|--|--|--|---|--|---|
| | | Analysis of intervention types <u>only</u> | Analysis of selected combinations of type and <u>delivery modes</u> | Analysis of selected combinations of type and <u>delivery modes</u> (main model) | Analysis of selected combinations of type and <u>delivery modes</u> (excluding high risk of bias) | Analysis of selected combinations of type and <u>delivery modes</u> (excluding arms with DIC ≥3) | Analysis of selected combinations of type, <u>delivery, and dose</u> | Analysis of selected combinations of type, <u>delivery, and tapering</u> | Analysis of selected combinations of type, <u>delivery, and timing</u> | Selected based on pre-existing condition (yes vs no) | Control arm withdrawal rate | Behavioural support (interactive, and self-help/mixed, vs no support) |
| | | (n studies: 72, n arms: 158, n patients: 44 961) | (n studies: 73, n arms: 161, n patients: 45 467) | (n studies: 81, n arms: 185, n patients: 48 861) | (n studies: 66, n arms: 151, n patients: 43 494) | (n studies: 80, n arms: 182, n patients: 48 200) | (n studies: 82, n arms: 190, n patients: 48 921) | (n studies: 83, n arms: 189, n patients: 49 061) | (n studies: 82, n arms: 187, n patients: 48 901) | (n studies: 81, n arms: 185, n patients: 48 861) | (n studies: 81, n arms: 185, n patients: 48 861) | (n studies: 81, n arms: 185, n patients: 48 861) |
| Control | Placebo | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) | 1.00 (Reference) |
| Type | Nicotine | 1.47 (1.16 to 1.87) | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery | Nicotine patch | - | 1.38 (1.03 to 1.84) | 1.27 (0.94 to 1.69) | 1.39 (1.02 to 1.90) | 1.29 (0.97 to 1.70) | - | - | - | 1.27 (0.93 to 1.71) | 1.30 (0.96 to 1.75) | 1.30 (0.91 to 1.86) |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine patch Standard | - | - | - | - | - | 1.31 (0.95 to 1.80) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine patch Higher | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine patch Lower | - | - | - | - | - | 0.44 (0.15 to 1.28) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine patch Mixed | - | - | - | - | - | 2.47 (0.70 to 9.32) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine patch Missing | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x tapering | Nicotine patch Tapering | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.39 (1.02 to 1.89) | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x tapering | Nicotine patch No Tapering | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.86 (0.47 to 1.51) | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x timing | Nicotine patch Pre quit | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 6.92 (0.20 to 1986.29) | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x timing | Nicotine patch No pre quit | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.25 (0.95 to 1.64) | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery | Nicotine EC | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery | Nicotine | - | 1.78 (1.17 to 2.72) | 1.63 (1.10 to 2.40) | 1.59 (1.01 to 2.49) | 1.75 (1.19 to 2.53) | - | - | - | 1.62 (1.09 to 2.41) | 1.58 (1.06 to 2.35) | 1.66 (1.07 to 2.58) |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine other Standard | - | - | - | - | - | 1.52 (0.86 to 2.67) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine other Higher | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine other Lower | - | - | - | - | - | 1.26 (0.57 to 2.83) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine other Mixed | - | - | - | - | - | 1.79 (0.66 to 4.88) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x dose | Nicotine other Missing | - | - | - | - | - | 2.42 (0.83 to 7.58) | - | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x tapering | Nicotine other Tapering | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.62 (0.98 to 2.70) | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x tapering | Nicotine other No Tapering | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.57 (0.86 to 2.82) | - | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x timing | Nicotine other Pre quit | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 3.59 (1.09 to 13.63) | - | - | - |
| Type x delivery x timing | Nicotine other No pre quit | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 1.40 (0.95 to 2.07) | - | - | - |
| Type | Varenicline | 1.43 (1.13 to 1.81) | 1.41 (1.11 to 1.80) | 1.39 (1.09 to 1.79) | 1.38 (1.08 to 1.80) | 1.39 (1.10 to 1.76) | 1.40 (1.09 to 1.80) | 1.40 (1.10 to 1.80) | 1.38 (1.08 to 1.76) | 1.38 (1.06 to 1.80) | 1.42 (1.10 to 1.84) | 1.41 (1.01 to 1.99) |
| Type | Cytisine | 1.25 (0.70 to 2.29) | 1.24 (0.69 to 2.29) | 1.24 (0.67 to 2.35) | 1.69 (0.76 to 3.81) | 1.23 (0.68 to 2.25) | 1.24 (0.67 to 2.35) | 1.25 (0.67 to 2.36) | 1.23 (0.67 to 2.30) | 1.25 (0.66 to 2.41) | 1.17 (0.62 to 2.24) | 1.27 (0.66 to 2.50) |
| Type | Bupropion | 1.66 (1.33 to 2.12) | 1.66 (1.31 to 2.12) | 1.54 (1.24 to 1.94) | 1.50 (1.19 to 1.90) | 1.54 (1.24 to 1.93) | 1.55 (1.23 to 1.96) | 1.55 (1.24 to 1.95) | 1.52 (1.22 to 1.90) | 1.55 (1.21 to 2.01) | 1.60 (1.25 to 2.06) | 1.59 (1.16 to 2.19) |
| Type | Nortriptyline | 2.33 (1.17 to 4.70) | 2.32 (1.15 to 4.64) | 2.45 (1.38 to 4.31) | - | - | 2.44 (1.39 to 4.35) | 2.32 (1.30 to 4.15) | - | - | 2.62 (1.47 to 4.70) | - |
| Moderator effect | B | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.964 (0.687 to 1.364) | 0.935 (0.863 to 1.039) | - |
| Moderator effect | B1 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.92 (0.389 to 2.141) |
| Moderator effect | B2 | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.972 (0.797 to 1.178) |
| Bupropion | beta[2] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Cytisine | beta[3] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Nicotine patch | beta[4] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Nicotine EC | beta[5] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Nicotine | beta[6] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Nortriptyline | beta[7] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Placebo EC | beta[8] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Placebo | beta[9] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Varenicline | beta[10] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Nicotine tapering | beta[11] | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - |
| Log Mean Odds outcome across trials | mubar | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | -3.67 | - |
| Mean outcome proportion across trials | | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | - | 0.02 | - |
| Between studies SD | sdbt | 0.36 | 0.37 | 0.40 | 0.39 | 0.37 | 0.40 | 0.40 | 0.39 | 0.42 | 0.43 | 0.43 |
| | deviance | 717.3 | 726.9 | 826.2 | 679.1 | 812.3 | 840.4 | 838.8 | 844.6 | 825.8 | 826.6 | 825.3 |
| | pD | 102 | 105 | 120 | 98 | 116 | 124 | 123 | 122 | 122 | 123 | 123 |
| | DIC | 820 | 833 | 947 | 778 | 928 | 965 | 963 | 967 | 948 | 950 | 949 |
| | Discarded iterations | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 | 15000 |
| | Pooling of iterations | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 | 3 |
| | Total iterations | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 | 30000 |
| | Continuity correction applied | no | no | no | no | no | no | no | yes | no | no | no |
| Component effects across models ran | | CNMA (only type) (withdrawals) | CNMA (type delivery) (withdraw) | CNMA (type del comb) (withdraw) | CNMA (excl high risk) (withdra) | CNMA (excl DIC3) (withdrawals) | CNMA (typ del dos) (withdrawal) | CNMA (typ del taper) (withdraw) | CNMA (typ del tim) (withdrawal) | CNMR (pre-exist dis) (withdraw) | CNMR (ctrl arm withdraw rate) | CNMR 2 (behsu) (withdrawals) |