

Early Twentieth-Century
Discourses of Violin Playing

Stefan Knapik

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Musicology

Magdalen College, Oxford

Trinity Term, 2011

ABSTRACT**Early Twentieth-Century Discourses of Violin Playing****Stefan Knapik****Doctor of Philosophy in Musicology****Magdalen College, Oxford****Trinity Term 2011**

The thesis is a critical reading of pedagogical and biographical texts by and on violinists, written in the early twentieth century. It contributes to historical and discursive studies by providing a limited engagement with a largely neglected group of historical sources relating to musical performance, and further advances the historical research on subjectivity, the body, pathology, and erotics, in relation to discourses of music. The thesis also contributes to studies of performance practice, and empirical and psychological studies of musical performance, in that it engages with discursive notions of theoretical and performance categories, such as tempo, melody, vibrato and portamento. By taking a hermeneutic approach to detailed discussions of performative practices, primarily found in pedagogical texts, the project aims to provide a more nuanced assessment of many of the topics that have played a central role in the ongoing research on early twentieth-century performance (which principally consists of recordings analysis). The project does this by demonstrating the extent to which these practices are culturally and historically mediated.

Following an introduction, chapter 2 demonstrates that notions of consciousness inform writers' notions of musical virtuosity, and shows that Nietzschean and Wagnerian notions of self underpin the idea of the violinist as a superior producer of art. Chapter 3 argues that these ideas combine with metaphysical notions of melody to make the concept of 'tone'/'*Ton*' the cornerstone of string playing during this period, which in turn has important implications for how writers conceive of tempo, rhythm, vibrato, portamento and dynamics. Chapter 4 demonstrates that writers perceive their ideal of tone to be threatened by moral and physiological disease, manifested in individual/social bodies, which leads to a very different articulation of these same practices. Chapter 5 explores traces

of notions of intersubjectivity, arising from metaphors of erotic desire, which challenge the hegemonic ideal of universal mind. The conclusion frames the discourse as a problematic attempt to posit an authoritarian model of string playing. It also includes a preliminary study of early twentieth-century discourses of cello playing, and engages with the research to date on national styles of violin playing in the same period.

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Table of Contents	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Prefatory Note on Translations	v
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Chapter 2: Infinite Self and Inadequate Matter: Notions of Consciousness in the Discursive Mediation of String Playing	41
Chapter 3: Transcendent Voice as a Model for String Practices	93
Chapter 4: Medico-Moral Anxieties and the Problem of Individual and Social Bodies	127
Chapter 5: Metaphors of Erotic Conquest and Surrender: Challenges to the Hegemony of Pre-Eminent Self in the Artwork	163
Chapter 6: Conclusion: The Significance of a Discursive Study of String Playing in the Early Twentieth Century for Wider Musicological Approaches to Performance	187
Bibliography	225

Acknowledgements

I thank my supervisor, Professor Eric Clarke, for his measured and encouraging guidance in bringing this study to completion. Thanks also go to Professor Laurence Dreyfus, who oversaw the inception of the project. I am grateful to those who commented on drafts along the way: Doctor Elizabeth Eva-Leach, Professor Peter Franklin, Kate Wulfson, Ceri Owen and Mike Watkins. Many thanks go to my parents, Steven and Denise, as well as my wider family in Wales, for their loving support during my time at Oxford. Warm gratitude also goes to Kristin, Anna and Venya, for being good friends along the way.

The James Pantyfedwen Foundation awarded me three generous grants in the course of my studies, for which I am very grateful. I also thank my College, Magdalen, for financial awards from the Foreign Language Study Fund, the Research Fund, and the Travel Fund: these assisted with two language courses at the *Institut Linguistique Adenet*, Montpellier, and a conference at the Sibelius Academy, Helsinki, all of which enriched the quality of my research greatly. The library of the Royal Academy of Music, London, also kindly allowed me to view several sources from their collection, for which I am thankful.

Prefatory Note on Translations

Primary sources which have not already been translated into English have been translated by the author. All existing translations used in the thesis have been adapted by the author.

The text by Carl Flesch that was posthumously published in German as *Erinnerungen eines Geigers*, and in English as *Memoirs*, varies in terms of the choice of passages from the original manuscript that were included in the publications. Passages appearing only in the German version have been translated by the author. Where a passage appears in both the English and German versions, the English translation has been modified to convey the sense of the German original more faithfully.

Chapter 1

Introduction

This thesis constitutes a critical reading of texts surrounding violin playing in the early twentieth century, and its purpose in doing so is twofold: one aim is to contribute to the historical and discursive study of music by engaging with the largely neglected area of early twentieth-century texts surrounding performance; the other is to provide a culturally informed assessment of concepts developed in performance practice studies, as well as empirical and psychological approaches to music. The first section of this chapter generally positions the thesis in the context of the multiple research fields with which it engages. The second section contextualises the primary sources for this study and explains why its central focus will be the writings of Andreas Moser, Leopold Auer and Carl Flesch. The chapter will then go on to identify key themes in the thesis: it begins by looking at the topics of self and expression, and proceeds to demonstrate how studies of voice and speech, from both the critical and scientific approach, shed further light on these areas. Discussions of these topics will engage with research from performance practice studies as well as empirical and psychological studies of performance, which focus on aspects of performance such as rhythm, metre, tempo, harmony, melody, timbre, vibrato and portamento. The chapter ends with an introduction to the cultural context for the sources.

Among historical studies of music there are comparatively few which focus on musical performance. The study of music history now engages with a wide variety of contexts for study (such as gender, sexuality, nationalism, and geographical centres of musical production) but the emphasis of this research is largely on composers and the reception of their music. In terms of early contributions to the historical study of performance, Laurence Dreyfus has traced the metaphor of interpretation across a broad time period and across a wide range of texts surrounding singing and instrumental playing, and in a series of essays and articles collected in *Text and Act*, Richard Taruskin has posited a broad cultural critique of performance in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, incorporating a

particular emphasis on the ideology behind the Early Music Movement.¹ There have been several studies of musical pianism, including those of Susan Bernstein and Lawrence Kramer.² In addition to several other neglected time periods and instruments (including singing), it is clear that string playing across the nineteenth and twentieth century is a largely neglected area for study, with Mary Hunter's critique of Baillot, Rode and Kreutzer's treatise on violin playing (1803) constituting an exception.³

A historical study of early twentieth-century performance will further contribute to the scholarly understanding of recorded practices in the same era. The research on sound recordings has documented a vast range of recorded data and with the aid of computer software has developed sophisticated methods for analysing aspects of recordings such as tempo and portamento: it would benefit, however, from a greater consideration of the beliefs and ideas which underpin the recorded practices. There is now an increasing consideration of how cultural issues can inform the study of recorded music. In his seminal work in the field, as well as in a later book of 2004, Robert Philip combines empirical analysis with more personal, critical readings of the data: Philip also links the evidence to a limited range of cultural and theoretical issues.⁴ The CHARM project (Centre for the History and Analysis of Recorded Music, 2004–2009) initiated several large scale projects which utilised and developed computer software to extract and present information taken from sound recordings. Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, for example has used spectrographic analysis to look at the ways in which performers have conveyed emotion in recordings of Schubert song, particularly in the

¹ Laurence Dreyfus, 'Beyond the Interpretation of Music', *The Dutch Journal of Music Theory*, 12/3 (1997), 253–272. Taruskin, Richard, *Text and Act* (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1995). Laurence Dreyfus's article, 'Early Music Defended Against Its Devotees: A Theory of Historical Performance in the Twentieth Century' (*The Musical Quarterly*, 69/3 (1983), 297–322) and John Butt's extensive study of the Early Music Movement (*Playing with History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002)) also suggest useful topics for study, in terms of mainstream cultures of performance extending back into the twentieth and nineteenth centuries.

² Susan Bernstein, *Virtuosity in the Nineteenth Century: Performing Music and Language in Liszt, Heine and Baudelaire* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998). Lawrence Kramer, *Musical Meaning: Toward a Critical History* (Berkeley, London: University of California Press, 2002), ch.4: 'Franz Liszt and the Virtuoso Public Sphere', 68–99.

³ Mary Hunter, "'To Play as if from the Soul of the Composer': The Idea of the Performer in Early Romantic Aesthetics", *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 58/2 (2005), 357–398.

⁴ Robert Philip, *Early Recordings and Musical Style: Changing Tastes in Instrumental Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992). Robert Philip, *Performing Music in the Age of Recording* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 2004). Timothy Day has also written a book with a similar scope and aim as Philip's later book, *A Century of Recorded Music: Listening to Musical History* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 2000).

articulation of, and movement between, notes.⁵ In the Mazurka Project, Craig Sapp developed software to record and analyse tempo and metre in around three thousand recordings of Chopin's Mazurkas for piano.⁶ Having surveyed methods for analysing recordings, Nicholas Cook argues, however, that the research would benefit in the future from a more nuanced engagement with the complexity of components that comprise a sound recording, and also a greater interpretive approach to the collected data:

The hope, then, is that analysis focused on specific features of performance will give rise to more meaningful interpretations of changes in performance style than analysis based on such undifferentiated data as total duration or overall tempo profile. It is possible to imagine a set of style-analytical tools, of which phrase arching might be one, that could be used together to characterise the style of individual performers, so facilitating the same kind of aesthetic and interpretive study of performers that traditional musicology has lavished on composers. The result would be a musicology that does better justice to music as a performing art.

Cook looks to cultural issues as the answer: 'cultural analysis can be supported by empirical analysis and empirical analysis given purpose by cultural analysis'.⁷ In his article on histories of performance style in the same volume, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson remarks that 'an increasing number of PhD theses points towards a vigorous future', but there is still a 'great deal to learn and do'.⁸

A cultural study of aspects of recorded practices (such as tempo or portamento) will benefit from insight into categories developed in psychological approaches. The extensive research which music psychology has applied to performance provides an important context for the issues on which this project chooses to focus, and one of the aims of this thesis is to initiate a greater engagement between psychological and historical approaches to performance. For example, the state of the psychological research to date on pitch, timbre, melody and metre/rhythm provides a foil for chapter 3's observations regarding early twentieth-century writers' notions of singing tone. Furthermore,

⁵ Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, 'Sound and Meaning in Recordings of Schubert's 'Die junge Nonne'', *Musicae Scientiae*, 11/2 (2007), 209–233.

⁶ Craig Sapp, 'Comparative Analysis of Multiple Musical Performances' [conference paper] (2007). Austrian Computer Society (OCG) <http://ismir2007.ismir.net/proceedings/ISMIR2007_p497_sapp.pdf> accessed 31 March 2009.

⁷ Nicholas Cook, 'Methods for Analysing Recordings', in Nicholas Cook, Eric Clarke, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, and John Rink, eds, *The Cambridge Companion to Recorded Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 221–245, 241, 245.

⁸ Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, 'Recordings and Histories of Performance Style', in Nicholas Cook, Eric Clarke, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, and John Rink, eds, *The Cambridge Companion to Recorded Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 246–262, 247.

psychological research on contemporary performance would benefit from a culturally informed study of it, and this study contributes to such research by providing a foundation for a historical and/or cultural study of performance later in the twentieth century and leading up to present day. Short teacher–pupil lineages, often comprising of only two or three generations between early twentieth- and early twenty-first century performers, suggests that such research would discover a high degree of continuity between early twentieth-century notions of performance and those of the present day.

The thesis continues in the same vein as performance practice studies in that it seeks to acquire detailed information on specific performative practices. Many of the traditional focuses of performance practice studies, at least in the area of twentieth-century performance, are being drawn up into the burgeoning empirically and psychologically orientated research, and in this sense the thesis participates in this wider integration. Unlike research to date in this sub-discipline, there is a greater emphasis in this thesis on the network of culturally received ideas that underpin these practices, which means that there is a limited engagement with the ‘harder’ evidence of cultures of performance, such as biographical details, evidence of performers’ professional collaborations, teacher–pupil genealogies, pedagogical and performing institutions, geographical centres of performance, and cultures of sound recordings.⁹ Early twentieth-century performance is a little studied area in any case, however, and thus the study makes an early contribution to an area which requires further research: Clive Brown’s and David Milsom’s studies of string performance practice both stop at 1900.¹⁰ The conclusion of this study does include a discussion of national styles, from the perspective of literary discourses in the early twentieth century, but further research would be needed using recordings and further biographical information in order to fully develop the study of teacher–pupil lineages and schools of playing.

The critical approach of this study leads to a more complex defining of performative categories which were once more stable in performance practice studies. Under the doctoral

⁹ Robin Stowell, for example, takes this kind of approach in contributions to his edited volume *The Cambridge Companion to the Violin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

¹⁰ Clive Brown, *Classical and Romantic Performing Practice 1750–1900* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999). David Milsom, *Theory and Practice in Late Nineteenth-Century Violin Performance: an Examination of Style in Performance, 1850–1900* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003).

supervision of the performance practice scholar Robert Donington, Robert Philip was the first to introduce recordings into the source field for performance practice studies. As with earlier performance practice studies, Philip's approach continues to prioritise an exhaustive collecting and categorising of sources, a privileging of pedagogical treatises as sources which provide evidence, and a continued engagement with the long-favoured categories for focus, namely tempo, portamento, vibrato and ornaments. This thesis similarly consults a wide range of pedagogical treatises, and extensively focuses on the same issues. The approach is more hermeneutic than that of Philip, however, and leads to a more complex redefinition of these categories of performative practices, according to their interaction with cultural ideas. In certain circumstances, two or more of the above categories are more fundamentally underpinned by a single idea; for example, chapters 3 and 4 demonstrate that several practices are underpinned by a more basic notion of tone.

The shift away from the dominating ideology of the work concept in all branches of musicology has enabled this study to investigate a wider range of issues in relation to performance than has been studied in earlier performance practice studies. Thus, earlier performance practice scholars view the performer as realising musical material already designated by the composer, and possessing creative monopoly over a limited range of practices (mostly portamento, vibrato, ornaments, and flexibility in the execution of pulse, metre and rhythms). In contrast, this study begins with the assumption that notions of a musical performance are cultural in origin, which implies that even the desire to faithfully realise the musical score itself consists of a variety of metaphors of what it means to interact with the composer and/or the work (as Dreyfus has already begun to show in his article 'Beyond the Interpretation of Music'). This basic conceptual framework of the thesis leads to a discussion of what performers understand the work itself to be, by considering the culturally received ideas behind their notions of the work. It also allows for a readdressing of the categories of melody, tone(s), dynamics, and the large-scale approach to the tempo of a movement, topics which previous scholars of performance practice would have considered the creative domain of the composer, but on which, this thesis will argue, performers possess original views.

The Genre of the Pedagogical Treatise

This section presents the range of interlocking contexts and issues which led to the choice of sources forming the focus of the thesis. This study primarily focuses on pedagogical texts, and it does so for several reasons. To begin with, since the thesis engages with not only historical and discursive themes but also topics in performance practice, empirical and psychological studies, pedagogical treatises constitute the most important genre for study because they not only present material of interest to historians but also provide substantial evidence relating to key issues in performance practice, empirical and psychological studies. As well as negotiating notions of subjectivity, gender, sexuality, health, nationalism, race, and erotics, these texts also provide detailed advice on the execution of tempo, metre, dynamics, portamento, vibrato and phrasing. Moreover, these topics densely intertwine with each other in the course of the flow of passages. A consideration of both wider cultural themes and specific elements of music theory and performance practice has the additional advantage of producing a thorough assessment of these sources.

Even if the project were an entirely historical study of performance, however, pedagogical sources would still constitute an important source type. There are an extremely large number of pedagogical sources in existence, which by and large have yet to form the focus of critical studies. Many of these contain no more than small amounts of prose interpolated with musically notated examples, but some are also substantial literary volumes. Examples of these, within the confines of a study of early twentieth-century writings on string playing, are the treatises on violin playing by Andreas Moser, Leopold Auer and Carl Flesch, which form the central focus of this study.

In contrast to previous performance studies, the critical approach of this study extends to re-evaluate the genre of the pedagogical treatise itself. The thesis does not view evidence of historical performative practices as neutral descriptions of how such practices were executed, but as specifically

bound up with the attempted construction of an authoritative discourse. Drawing on theories of power, the thesis considers how pedagogical texts might incorporate and assemble cultural ideas for the purposes of creating an authoritative, or even authoritarian, discourse. Consequently, it further questions the intended purpose of the text, and challenges the assumption that pedagogical texts are designed to render performative practices intelligible to learners. It asks whether the purpose of the imposition of authority might have been to limit the accessibility of violin playing to a select group, and, in the midst of increasing social mobility, discourage a wider readership from taking up the 'high art' of musical interpretation.

The thesis aims to demonstrate to other branches of performance studies that a scholarly accounting for cultural ideas and generical issues shaping the discourse makes them viable sources of information on performance in history. By considering how performers' views centrally arise out of the prevalent cultural ideas of their age, their position in the performance community (usually as respected performers and/or pedagogues), the interests of publishers, the constraints of conventional generic formats, and financial exigencies, the thesis makes an early contribution to the inclusion of a vast number of writings by and on performers into the source base for academic studies of musical performance.

The focus of this thesis is further aimed at the increasing engagement between musicology departments and music conservatoires. Most conservatoires possess extensive collections of pedagogical treatises, and one of the aims of this study is to facilitate their proper use by both academics and performers. As Anthony Gritten has argued, there is a risk that, in the increasing interest from scholars and practitioners in the ergonomics of performance, aesthetic judgement will fall by the wayside.¹¹ This study aims to show that whereas the advice given to performers by older pedagogies may have been supplanted by progressive research in ergonomics, their rich engagement with wider cultural ideas holds relevance for contemporary performers, as inheritors of a cultural legacy. In other words, whereas the findings of more recent research surpasses the technical advice

¹¹ Gritten, Anthony, 'From Ergonomics to Energetics: Alongside the Interpretation of Music', *Dutch Journal of Music Theory (Tijdschrift voor Muziektheorie)*, 14/3 (2009), 155–165.

given by older treatises, with regard to how the body may be optimised or used more efficiently during performance, a study of the historical texts might enable performers to enrich their beliefs, ethics, understanding of their wider culture, and so on, through an engagement with history. The future aim would not be to provide straightforward instructions for how to play based on the evidence, however, but to invite performers to engage in a reflexive dialogue, as living agencies, with both historical performance practices and the wider cultural contexts that gave birth to them.

Moser & Joachim's *Violinschule*

What makes the early twentieth century a particularly attractive period for study is the extensive and rich prose contained in the period's pedagogical literature. Furthermore, Andreas Moser, Leopold Auer and Carl Flesch are all notable figures in nineteenth- and twentieth-century musical culture, making their writings of particular interest to musicologists. The German music scholar Andreas Moser (1859–1925) was an important figure in the rise of historical source studies in music in late nineteenth-century Germany. Moser's extensive knowledge of historical treatises on violin playing is demonstrated in his essay 'On Interpretation' (*Vom Vortrag*) which opens the third volume of his *Violinschule* (1905), as well as his later texts *Methodik des Violinspiels* (1920) and *Geschichte des Violinspiels* (1923). This last text comprises of two extensive volumes covering the history and technique of violin playing from the earliest times until the present day, and demonstrates particularly well Moser's knowledge of historical documents relating to performance.

Moser's views are further notable for their potential to provide access to the beliefs and ideas of Joseph Joachim (1831–1907), one of the most famous violinists of the nineteenth century. Joachim's personal and professional relationships with central figures in music history such as Felix Mendelssohn, Franz Liszt and Johannes Brahms, and his central role in the forming of a German national culture following political unification (Joachim founded the *Königliche Hochschule für Musik* in 1872), demands a separate body of further research: this project makes a limited contribution, however, by focussing on *Violinschule*, a text on which both Joachim and Moser

collaborated.¹² Moser wrote most of the text, with only four introductions to edited violin scores in the third volume signed ‘J. J’. In the preface to the entire work, however, Joachim attests to Moser’s acquaintance with his ideas, having studied the violin with him, and writes that the two exchanged ideas on violin playing through extended discussions: Joachim writes that Moser ‘thoroughly knew my art through constant and faithful observation’ (*meine Art aus jahrlanger, treuer Beobachtung gründlich kannte*), and in the writing of *Violinschule* ‘the handling of insignificant questions of detail principally came to a conclusion through joint assessment and complete agreement’ (*die Behandlung unscheinbarer Detailfragen erst nach gemeinschaftlicher Prüfung und volliger Übereinstimmung unserer Ansichten zum Abschluß kam*).¹³ Moser was a pupil of Joachim at the *Hochschule* in the late 1870s and early 1880s, and would have had further contact with Joachim as a longstanding teacher at the institution between 1888 and 1925.

Both Joachim and Moser were learned: as has already been noted, Moser, in particular, was heavily involved in the expansion of musical source studies during the period. What this thesis is particularly interested in exploring is the intersection between source analysis and prior knowledge: German scholars of source studies in the nineteenth century deliberately applied a broad knowledge to their critiques, and what one finds in Moser’s writings in the *Violinschule* is a self-consciously critical approach to the sources. Moser is likely to have been taught to some extent by Philipp Spitta, whose own rich prose reflects the melee of cultural ideas circulating in the period, particularly strains of neo-Kantian philosophy.¹⁴ The aim of this thesis is to demonstrate the highly ideological nature of Moser’s

¹² Beatrix Borchard has written an extensive biography of Amalie and Joseph Joachim (*Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2005)). The third volume of the Austrian yearbook for musicology, *Anklaenge* (Calella, Michele and Glanz, Christian, eds, *Anklaenge 2008: Joseph Joachim (1981-1907): Europäischer Bürger, Komponist, Virtuose* (Vienna: Mille Tre, 2008)) has also been devoted to Joachim, comprising of several articles in German and English.

¹³ Joachim, Joseph and Moser, Andreas, *Violinschule in 3 Bänden*, 3 vols, trans. Alfred Moffat (Berlin: N. Simrock, Schott, 1905), 1/3-4. Translation adapted from the original.

¹⁴ In his obituary of his father, H. J. Moser relates that his father had been an ‘academic pupil of Spitta’s lectures’ (*Hochschüler Spittas Vorlesungen*), but does not say when (H. J. Moser, ‘Andreas Moser’ in Arnold Ebel, ed., *Berliner Musikjahrbuch 1926* (Berlin, Leipzig: Deutscher Tonkünstler, 1926), 106-110, 108). This may have been between 1878 and 1883, during which time Moser was a student of Joachim. If Moser received his tuition at the Berlin Hochschule, of which Joachim was director, he may have simultaneously studied with Philipp Spitta, who had been appointed assistant director in 1875. Moser may have also attended Spitta’s lectures, however, in his professional capacity as teacher at the Hochschule from 1888 onwards. In his New Grove article on Spitta, Christoph Wolff writes that Spitta’s ‘aesthetic judgments were strongly influenced by neo-Kantian philosophy’. Christoph Wolff, ‘Spitta, Philipp’, *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online* [online

writings, and to unpack his dense interweaving of appeals to wider cultural themes. Joachim is also known to have associated with many musical, artistic and literary figures, and his sustained correspondences with figures such as Brahms, Liszt, Clara Schumann, Hans von Bülow, Julius Otto Grimm and Herman Grimm have been published.¹⁵

Joachim was first and foremost, however, a practising musician. Beatrix Borchard's biography of Joachim attests to his lifelong devotion to playing the violin.¹⁶ Joachim became famous at a young age for his talent as a performer, having performed Mendelssohn's Violin Concerto, with the composer conducting, at the age of twelve. In early adulthood he focused his energies on composing, but throughout his sixty-year career, whether operating as composer, performer, or teacher, Joachim was intensively and continuously involved with the day-to-day musical culture of Europe.

Similarly, although Moser performed much less than Joachim, his early commitment was to the art of violin playing. At a young age, Moser had intended to follow in Joachim's footsteps: he began studying with Joachim at the age of eighteen, and went on to secure a position as leader of an orchestra in Mannheim in 1883. His career as a full-time performer was cut short, however, by an arm ailment, after which Moser divided his time between teaching the violin, writing for journals and conducting scholarly research. That almost all of his major publications are on the topic of violin playing, however, demonstrates that violin performance remained at the heart of his interests throughout his life.

In its frequent switching between prose and notated pieces of music, *Violinschule* reflects the intertwining of learned discourse with practical musicking throughout the lives of both men. The

reference source] <<http://oxfordmusiconline.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/26438>> accessed 23 September 2011.

¹⁵ Moser himself published Joachim's letters: one publication is entirely devoted to Joachim's correspondence with Johannes Brahms (Johannes Brahms and Joseph Joachim, *Johannes Brahms im Briefwechsel mit Joseph Joachim*, 2 vols, ed. Andreas Moser (Berlin: Deutsche Brahms-Gesellschaft, 1908)) and the other is to various authors including those mentioned in the main text (Joseph Joachim, *Briefe von und an Joseph Joachim*, ed. Johannes Joachim and Andreas Moser (Berlin: Bard, 1911–1913)). There is also an edition in English of Joachim's letters: Joseph Joachim, *Letters from and to Joseph Joachim*, ed. and trans. Nora Bickley (London: Macmillan, 1914).

¹⁶ Beatrix Borchard, *Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2005).

prose is learned and is varied, and the progressive sections of the treatise are organised not purely according to stages of technical development but also increasingly complex theoretical and analytical concepts, as well as an accumulating knowledge of the history of violinists and performance practice. The text is not mainly theoretical but practical in outlook, however. The central focus of the book is not an aesthetic or philosophical model into which notion of violin playing are placed but the opposite: violin playing is put first, and aesthetic, historical, theoretical, analytical, philosophical, cultural, medical, and practical concepts and frameworks are employed to make sense of this primary topic. A more prosaic piece of evidence supporting the argument that this is a practical pedagogy is that the text is mostly comprised of notated music, designed to practically lead the violinist from commencement of study to the highest stages of artistic maturation. Around 30% of the first and second volumes is devoted to prose, and 70% to notated music. The third volume opens with an extended essay lasting 35 pages, and the remaining 233 pages are devoted to edited scores of sixteen 'masterworks'. Each of these is introduced with a short introduction lasting between 1 and 5 pages. It is also worth bearing in mind that Simrock was a well-established music publishing company, which further supports the notion that the text was principally intended to be a compilation of music with a pedagogical purpose, rather than a literary text which uses notated music to support its arguments.

Various aspects of the notated music further demonstrate that it was intended for practical use. The scores provide a mixture of exercises, written-out scales and complete pieces, and the pieces range from simple folk songs at the earliest stages, to the 'masterworks' of the final volume, which include the violin parts of the Beethoven and Brahms concertos. That the volumes of the text were designed to closely resemble printed editions of music suggests that they were intended to be placed on music stands, to be read by the player with violin under chin, and to be portable between home, places of study and concert venues. The volumes are quarto in size (approximately 30 x 24cm), making them roughly the same size as most printed violin scores from the same period. The spacing of the notes and staves is similar to that of music editions of the same period (there are between ten and fifteen staves on pages devoted entirely to musical scores). In the earlier pages of the first volume there is greater spacing between notes (but not fewer staves on the page) which suggests that the text

had been designed to accommodate younger students (Moser advises that the ideal age to begin violin studies is between the ages of 8 and 10 years).¹⁷

Aspects of the binding and weight of the text suggests that the publisher did not design it to be housed in a library but anticipated that it would be carried by a student or a teacher from home to place of study. None of the volumes was originally hard bound, and the covers are not much thicker than the content pages. The number of pages for each volume is as follows: volume I, 242 pages; volume 2, 199 pages; volume 3; 268 pages. Bearing in mind the size of the books (quarto), one might imagine that the texts are not particularly light, but it certainly would not have been difficult for even a young pupil to carry one of the volumes at a time: the first volume covers many years of training, and thus the young student would not have had to carry more than one volume at a time. The second volume covers advanced technique, however, and might have been used in conjunction with the study of masterworks, in which case the older student might have had to carry both.

Despite their accommodating design for students, however, the texts were intended to be used strictly through the guidance of a teacher. The varied appeals of the texts' argument coupled with long and grammatically complex sentences demonstrates that they were intended to be read by adults, and their having been placed at the beginning of each section suggests that the authors believed an engagement with their writings to be essential before trying out the notated music. Furthermore, the text does not merely provide straightforward instructions for how to achieve a certain technique, or how to execute the pieces, but weaves into its practical advice a variety of practical, theoretical, analytical and historical issues.

Other aspects of the text further support the argument that it was designed to be read first by teachers and then presented to students to learn from while under their guidance. Although the first two volumes lack content pages, Joachim and Moser explicitly say that the texts are not to be followed strictly from front to back covers: rather, they say, the teacher may chose to skip or return to a section, as he or she sees fit:

¹⁷ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 1/7.

It is therefore up to him to decide, according to his insight, and according to the will and ability of the student, whether or not to pass over one or another chapter and return to it later.¹⁸

That the first volume progresses through levels of difficulty at a very fast pace further suggests that the work was intended to supplement other exercises and pieces provided by the teacher.

Moser and Joachim's text therefore attempts to be both a practical teaching aid and a text deserving of reflection. Although each volume by itself is portable, the work standing together as three volumes assumes greater stature and less mobility, leading one to imagine its being housed in a library of some kind. Considering that it was intended for teachers' presiding over pupils' progress at all levels, it is reasonable to conclude that the texts were intended for libraries in places of practical study, perhaps at the teacher's home, or at a school or conservatoire. These were to be working and preservation libraries, however: as noted above, the texts were not originally hard bound. It is important to reiterate that theory is subordinate to practice, in the text, and not the other way round. The text is a manual of violin playing that is reflective; it is not a theory or philosophy that uses violin playing as some kind of tangible or familiar support for its claims.

The Writings of Leopold Auer

Considering his central role in the development of violin playing in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the writings of Leopold Auer (1845–1930) are of particular interest. Having studied with Joachim in Hannover between 1863 and 1864, Auer went on to establish his reputation as performer in the aristocratic culture of St Petersburg. Although Auer lived there for almost fifty years of his life (1868–1917), his autobiography, *My Long Life in Music* (1924), attests to Auer's having toured and taught extensively in Europe during this time. Auer's reputation as pedagogue to some of the most important violinists of the twentieth century, including Efrem Zimbalist, Jascha Heifetz, Mischa Elman, Toscha Seidel and Eddy Brown, in particular calls for a comprehensive understanding

¹⁸ *Es bleibt daher ganz seiner Einsicht überlassen, ob er den eingeschlagenen und Fähigkeiten des Schülers, eines oder das andere Kapitel überschlägt, um später darauf zurückzukommen.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 1/11.

of his views as set down in his pedagogical work, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (1921). This is the most interesting out of Auer's three books, all of which were written in the early 1920s. His autobiography records mostly names, dates, places and events and does not include extensive reflections on performers or performances. Auer's *Violin Works and their Interpretation* (1925) covers a large number of pieces from the violin repertoire, providing a brief description of each. Observations regarding general theoretical elements, such as themes, key modulations and structures, are less remarkable, and descriptions providing evidence of the influence of wider cultural ideas are shorter and vaguer than they are in *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, which is why this thesis focuses more on the latter work. The chronological narratives of musical works in *Violin Works and their Interpretation*, however, might prove useful to future studies of cultural ideas in conjunction with sound recordings.

As with Joachim and Moser's treatise, Auer's *Violin Playing as I Teach It* combines practical advice for students with a good deal of discursive reflection, but it lacks the scholarly input that Moser was able to provide in *Violinschule*. Like Joachim, Auer was first and foremost a practising violinist, and was, from a young age, intensively involved with the day to day business of musical production. The purpose of Auer's book, as he writes in his preface, is simply to 'explain the art of violin playing as wellnigh sixty years of experience as an interpreting artist and teacher have revealed it so me'.¹⁹ The chapters entitled 'Nuance – The Soul of Interpretation' (chapter 10) and 'Style' (chapter 11) broaden the scope of the book outwards to quite general aesthetic concepts, but Auer makes an apology for the 'informality of my treatment of the subject [of violin playing]', making the excuse that 'I am not a writer – I am a violinist'.²⁰ And indeed, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, does not include extensive information on theoretical and analytical concepts extending beyond the act of violin playing, or information on past performance practices and violinists. Whether this was due to ignorance or a wilful dismissal of scholasticism, however, is a question which this thesis will attempt to answer.

¹⁹ Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921), v.

²⁰ *Ibid*, vi.

Auer's pedagogy differs again from that of Moser and Joachim in that it by no means attempts to be an exhaustive tutorial on violin playing. The text adopts the same structural approach as the many string treatises that came before it, dividing chapters according to compartmentalised aspects of string technique, and progressing from basic elements of technique through to advanced elements of virtuosic and artistic playing. Early chapters focus on how to hold the violin and basic bowing technique, whereas later chapters go on to discuss more virtuosic devices such as harmonics and double stopping. Similar to Moser's extended essay in the third volume of *Violinschule*, Auer saves the more reflective chapters on aspects of mature artistry for the later stages of the text. Auer clearly indicates his intended audience in the preface, saying that it was written for 'the serious teacher and student', yet the text is by no means a practical tutor: there are very few notated examples, and the ones that are included, in both the Duckworth and Stokes editions, are too small for the violinist to play from.²¹ The book would almost certainly not fit on a music stand, not being long enough for the pages to reach the page holders (when opened out, the breadth of the book is 24cm), and the depth of the book as well the weight of its hard cover would make it likely to fall off a music stand. The discussions of various aspects of technique are shorter than those in the *Violinschule*, and, as has already been noted, there is no guidance on general music theory and history.

The book's design and content strongly suggests that if it was intended to mentor at all then this activity was not to be done in the practice room. The book is quite small and very light (18.5 x 12cm, and only 0.4kg), which would have made it portable. The hard cover makes it durable, but one could also argue that this also made it fit to be kept in reference libraries. There are other aspects of the book which steer the reader away the acts of teaching and practising: the book opens not with the basics of violin technique but with Auer's biography (an aspect of the text considered further in chapter 2). Black and white portrait photographs inserted at regular intervals throughout the Stokes edition would not be out of place in either Auer's or Joachim and Moser's texts: both texts place an emphasis on achieving artistic greatness and such portraits would have encouraged the student along the way. At the same time, however, they have the effect of presenting Auer's book as a text and

²¹ Ibid, v. Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (New York: Stokes, 1921). The texts of both editions are almost identical, and this thesis has consulted the Duckworth edition.

artefact to be enjoyed in its own right, and detract from the notion that it is a manual, on hand to serve the ultimate goal of mastering the violin.

Auer's less than ideal financial circumstances around the time of writing the book may account for its brevity. In his memoirs, Carl Flesch introduces Auer as 'a charming, jovial, lively old man whom circumstances had obliged to work hard until death' (*ein lebenswürdiger, jovialer, lebhafter Greis, den die Verhältnisse gezwungen hatten, bis zu seinem Tode hart zu arbeiten*).²² Both Auer and Flesch himself applied for the same position as teacher at The Curtis Institute, in Philadelphia in the early 1920s. Flesch was granted the position, further preventing Auer from securing a stable and comfortable wage. Flesch believes that Auer's lack of success even harmed Auer's reputation, noting that 'my exceptionally favourable contract with the Curtis Institute was a blow to his prestige' (*bedeutete meine Anstellung am Curtis Institute... einen harten Schlag für sein Prestige*), although Flesch may here be merely gloating in his surpassing of an older and more eminent violinist than he at the time.²³ Auer did eventually gain a position at the Institute in 1928, only two years before his death. Auer's need to make money, then, may explain his hastening to publish, by way of capitalising on his fame. Perhaps it was the case that, burdened with teaching commitments, Auer did not have the time to prepare as thorough and lavish a publication as Joachim and Moser's *Violinschule*.

Having said this, Auer's publishers were not exactly of minor repute, which suggests that the writing of the text was a serious literary effort. Frederick A. Stokes had published some fairly major American authors, including Francis Hodgson Burnett, Franck Buck and Stephen Crane. Duckworth had published authors of less high renown: the catalogue included at the end of *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, includes a text by Hillaire Belloc and two plays by August Strindberg, but most of the authors listed are fairly minor. Both publishers, however, had established reputations as producers of educational books on art, which suggests that they would not have published Auer's text unless it were a halfway serious attempt to explicate the art of violin playing.

²² Carl Flesch, *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Freiburg, Zurich: Atlantis, 1960), 148. Translation adapted from Carl Flesch, *Memoirs*, ed. Hans Keller and C. F. Flesch, trans. Hans Keller (London: Rockliff, 1957), 252.

²³ *Ibid.* 339 and 185.

If Auer's text was not merely an attempt to remedy financial problems, then, the question of what relationship it had to the act of violin playing, or what effect it had on it, becomes more interesting. The varied designs of these pedagogies suggest a more complex relationship between theoretical reflection and practice than that of text describing act. The differences between Auer's, and Joachim and Moser's texts provide starting points for exploring this relationship: in contrast to Joachim and Moser's pedagogy, what is the significance of the greater separation between reflection and practice made and implied by Auer's text? The frequent interpolating of text with notated music in *Violinschule* supports Moser's expressed intention in his introduction for how the discourse was meant to be used: thinking of how the text would be used by the teacher in the context of the lesson, Moser regards the alternate acts of speaking and thinking about ideas, and playing the violin, as sitting comfortably next to each other:

What distinguishes the able teacher from the mechanical lesson-giver is that in addition the necessary patience and love of his work, he must possess sufficient intelligence to keep his pupil's interest alive even during the painful process of trying to grasp serious subjects. If, during the explanation of some difficult question, a certain listlessness is observable in the pupil... the teacher will do well to make a pause and relate to his pupils for example some incidents from the lives of the great musicians... at another time he might take the opportunity of telling him about the most important representatives of violin-playing in different countries.²⁴

There is a congenial relationship here between discourse and practice that is lacking in *Violin Playing Teaching as I Teach It*, and this thesis seeks to find out how the cultural ideas negotiated by the text provide answers for why this is the case. The thesis asks whether this parting of ways leads to an equating of mind with musical discourse and body with musical practice, and asks how Western notions of the hierarchical mind-body relationship might have informed the text's approach to the relationship between theory and practice. Furthermore, it seeks to comment on the implications of this severance: is the result merely an impoverishing of the discourse, as it loses its basis in practices and

²⁴ *Das charakterisiert ja den tüchtigen Pädagogen vor dem stundengebenden Handwerker, daß er neben der unerläßlichen Geduld und Liebe zum Lehrberuf auch die nötige Intelligenz besitzt, um das Interesse des Schülers auch da wach zu erhalten, wo es sich um die mühsame Aneignung ernster Dinge handelt. Wenn sich bei der Erörterung schwieriger Fragen beim Schüler eine gewisse Abspannung einstellt... tut der Lehrer gut, eine Pause zu machen und während derselben dem Schüler einiges aus dem Lebens des großen Musiker zu erzählen... Bei einer andern Gelegenheit mache er ihn mit den bedeutendsten Vertretern des Violinspiels in den verschiedenen Ländern.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 1/6.

notation, or perhaps the effecting of a different kind of relationship, perhaps one more strained and mutually suspicious.

Carl Flesch's *Die Kunst des Violinspiels* and *Memoirs/Erinnerungen eines Geigers*

Carl Flesch (1873–1944) is a notable figure for his role as major violin pedagogue of the twentieth century, for his renown as performer, and for the thoughtful content of his literary works. Flesch studied with Jakob Grün between the ages of 13 and 17 and went on to study at the Paris Conservatoire, where he studied with Eugène Sauzay and Martin Marsick.²⁵ After settling in Berlin in 1908, Flesch formed a trio with the noted pianist Arthur Schnabel and cellist Hugo Becker. Flesch also collaborated with many famous conductors, such as Arthur Nikisch and Wilhelm Furtwängler. His pupils included Max Rostal, Szymon Goldberg, Henryk Szeryng, Henri Temianka, Ida Haendel, Ginette Neveu and Alma Moodie. The two works focused on in this thesis are his two major literary works of the early-twentieth century, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels* (1923, 1928), an authoritative and substantial exposition of Flesch's teachings, as well as a more critical and explorative text, written between the late 1920s and late 1930s, and later published in English as *Memoirs*, in 1957, and in the original German as *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Memoirs of a Violinist) in 1960 (discussed further in the next section).²⁶ *Das Klangproblem im Geigenspiel* (1931) is a much shorter literary work and is considered occasionally in the thesis.

Several details surrounding the publishing, design and content of *Die Kunst des Violinspiels* plant it firmly in the tradition of the practical pedagogical treatise. As with the texts by Auer, and Joachim and Moser, the aim of the Flesch's text is to address all matters related to violin technique. The structure is similar to that of *Violinschule* and *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, in that Flesch moves

²⁵ In contrast to Joachim and Auer, Flesch's thought thus potentially reflects the influence of a French performing culture: together with Auer's supposed initiating of a Russian school of string playing, the range of sources considered by these thesis thus covers all three of the supposed schools of violin playing in the early-twentieth century, the German, Russian and French schools.

²⁶ Flesch's other publications, *Urstudien für Violine* (1911), *Etüden-Sammlung für Violine* (1921), and *Das Scalensystem* (1926) mostly consist of notated exercises and contain little prose. *Die Hohe Schule des Fingersatzes* (1943) contains more prose but is too late a source for this study's designated period of focus, and is therefore not considered in the thesis.

from basic to advanced elements of violin technique: whereas volume I, entitled ‘General and Applied Technique’ (*Allgemeine und Angewandte Technik*) addresses more basic elements of playing, volume II, entitled ‘Artistic Creation and Instruction’ (*Künstlerische Gestaltung und Unterricht*), addresses more advanced topics. Flesch’s text is similar in design to *Violinschule* in that all publishers made it the same size as printed music (a large quarto size, standing at 33 x 26cm), which allows the publication to sit comfortably on a music stand, and gave it soft covers. All publishers of the text specialised in publishing composers’ works or educational music, which further vouches for the intended practical outcome of engaging with Flesch’s work. Ries & Erler, publishers of minor composers’ works, were the first to put Flesch’s text into print. Later publishers who published the text in the 1920s include Carl Fischer in the United States, Maxeschig in France, and Bohn in Holland.²⁷

Surprisingly, though, the majority of Flesch’s work is comprised not of notated music but of written text. As with Joachim and Moser’s text, there are several scores of well-known violin works included in the last section of the work (the end of the second volume in Flesch’s case). This takes up around a third of this volume, and the rest of the volume, as well as the entire first volume, contain mostly prose, with perhaps around 15% devoted to notated examples of music. These are clearly examples supporting the text, however, and are not, as in Moser’s case, designed to serve as exercises or pieces for students to play. It would not be impossible for the executing player to play the examples as they are presented in the publications, but they would need to be examined more closely first, and not in a playing position (this includes the complete scores at the end of the second volume), before being executed.

By including a copious amount of text but retaining the outward appearance of a practical manual, it seems that Flesch wishes to impress on the reader the importance of discourse in shaping the practising violinist’s development. Indeed, in his opening remarks Flesch wishes to remind

²⁷ Carl Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928). Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, trans. Frederick H. Martens (New York: Fischer, 1930). Carl Flesch, *L’art du Violon* (Paris: Maxeschig, 1926). Carl Flesch, *De Kunst van het Vioolspel* (Haarlem: Bohn, 1924).

teachers and students, almost with a sense of irritation, that they need to think about what they do as players:

This work is not intended to be a ‘School of Violin Playing’, in the accepted meaning of the word. The concept of pedagogy is interpreted here in its widest sense: on the one hand I propose to give guidance to teachers on the most suitable methods of instructing their pupils in the latest developments of violin technique; on the other, I would like to equip violinists generally with the tools enabling them to think logically for themselves and to analyse violin-technical problems in depth. In this way, I hope to bring them gradually to a point where they can function as their own teachers as it were. Thus, I am addressing myself neither to beginners nor to advanced pupils, but to *thinking* violinists and those aspiring to join that category.²⁸

It is the ideological make-up of Flesch’s notion of ‘thinking’, the wider cultural resonances of the idea, which this thesis intends to explore, by way of beginning to uncover how practising violinists such as Flesch approached the acts of thinking, speaking and writing about performance, and what kind of relationship these acts had to their playing.

The importance attached to writing about violin playing in these texts is what prompts an inquiry into their wider significance. Out of all three treatises, Flesch’s text demonstrates this importance the most: it is the most extensive, discussing all topics in much greater detail than do Joachim and Moser’s, and Auer’s texts, and demonstrating a more reflective approach to each subject. Whereas in Joachim and Moser’s text, written passages mostly play the role of companions to notated music, Auer and Flesch are confident that a discourse about performance can stand alone: having said this, this thesis is mostly interested in the only piece of writing that does stand alone in *Violinschule*, the essay entitled *Vom Vortrag* (On Interpretation) at the opening of the third volume. One question for this thesis is whether the texts’ meanings derive from a more inward-looking rhetoric or whether they extend their grasp to provoke a complex relationship with violinistic practices: the retaining of

²⁸ *Das vorliegende Werk soll keine Schule des Violinspiels, im landläufigen Sinne des Wortes sein. Der Begriff der Pädagogik wird hier weit gefaßt, da beabsichtigt ist, nicht bloß auf Grund der modernen geigentechnischen Errungenschaften dem Lehrer Anweisungen für die zweckmäßigste Art der Erziehung seiner Schüler zu geben, sondern durch Anleitung zu logischem Denken, durch zergliedernde Untersuchung der geigentechnischen Probleme den Geiger auf eine Stufe zu bringen, die ihn befähigt, mit der Zeit sein eigener Lehrer zu werden. Es wendet sich demnach weder an Anfänger, noch an fortgeschrittene Schüler, sondern an denkende Geiger oder an solche, die es werden wollen.* Carl Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928), 1/iii, translation adapted from Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, ed. and trans. Eric Rosenblith (New York: Fischer, 2000), 1/iii.

aspects of the practical treatise and the structuring of the text according to progressively more difficult aspects of violin technique already suggests that the latter is the case.

Other Sources

By limiting the time period to ca.1900–1935 the intention is to provide a close reading of the central literary publications of the above three authors as well as cover a variety of other texts relating to violin playing. In addition to a further set of shorter pedagogical treatises, the source base also contains several biographies, the most important of which are Moser's biography of Joachim (*Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild*, 1899), and two volumes by the American librettist and writer on music Frederick Martens (1874–1932), *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (1919) and *String Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists, Viola Players and Violoncellists* (1923). In each of these books Martens presents the biographies of string players as interviews which he conducted with each of them. In terms of the backgrounds of the writers considered, Martens is an anomaly in that he is the only non-string player whose writings are considered. The other major biographical work is Carl Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers*. Although the genres of pedagogy and biography are commonly understood to be distinct from each other, texts considered in this dissertation that are belonging to both of these genre have much in common with each other: Martens's texts have a distinct pedagogical purpose, and, conversely, the pedagogical treatises often celebrate eminent performers or tailor their advice to pupils aspiring to become eminent artists. The end of chapter 2 further consider this issue, and suggests ways in which one might consequently re-envision the generical map of early twentieth-century writings on violin playing.

A common theme in both pedagogies and biographies, then, is the great performer, and in this regard, Flesch's *Memoirs/ Erinnerungen eines Geigers* potentially provides answers as to the fundamental objective of texts relating to violin playing across the board. It is a text which is

primarily concerned with eminent performers, and with finding out was so great about them. Flesch's stated aim in writing perhaps suggests a more impersonal approach: his intention was to 'create a trustworthy source for the history of violin playing, particularly from 1883 to 1933' (*ein vertrauenswürdigen Quellenwerk für die Geschichte des Violinspiels insbesondere zwischen 1883 und 1933 zu schaffen*), yet he also wished to write the 'write the memoirs of others rather than my own' (missing from German edition), and, indeed, whereas the English edition divides the material according to the chronological stages of Flesch's life, the German edition organises the material according to each of the violinists whom Flesch discusses, while still retaining a sense of chronological progression through Flesch's own life.²⁹

Evidence from the text suggests that Flesch wrote the manuscript between the late 1920s and late 1930s. Flesch did not indicate exactly when he wrote his manuscript, and there are no passages which ascertain exact dates of writing. Flesch's manuscript does not chronicle events beyond the year 1928, but a reference to Furtwängler's 'fifty years' (Furtwängler was born in 1886) suggests a date of 1936, but potentially also a few years later or earlier if the number is a reference to Furtwängler's approximate rather than exact age. In another passage, Flesch says that the last time he heard the violinist Max Reger play was in 1910, but shares none of the 'contemptuous judgement that has been passed on him during the past twenty years', which suggests an approximate date of 1930.³⁰ There is thus a period of roughly a decade in which the manuscript might have been written, between the late 1920s and late 1930s.

Two questions which this thesis seeks to address is why Flesch did not publish his manuscript at the time of writing, and why the English and German edition are so heavily and differently edited. It was certainly not beyond Flesch to write an authoritative and credible text for the public domain; the publishing of his *Die Kunst die Violinspiels* in the 1920s and 1930s was a success, demonstrated by its translation into several language. Furthermore, Flesch faced considerable financial difficulties after the stock market crash of 1929, and the publication of his memoirs would have brought financial

²⁹ Flesch, *Erinnerungen*, 18. Flesch, *Memoirs*, 5.

³⁰ Flesch, *Memoirs*, 272, 90.

relief.³¹ C. F. Flesch, Carl Flesch's son published a book in the 1980s which provides invaluable information on Flesch and issues surrounding the writing of his memoirs: he writes that 'in order to avoid being influenced by considerations of tact or friendship, he stipulated that the book should be published only after his and my mother's death'.³² Chapter 5 attempts to provide answers for why Flesch's text was not published during his lifetime, and why it was edited in the way that it was in the published editions.

Because of the thesis's position in relation to performance studies the source base is smaller than would suit a purely historical study. The thesis focuses primarily on detailed discussions of performative practices, with a view to fostering present and future engagement with performance practice, empirical and psychological research on the same practices. Shorter references to string playing, as might appear in poetry, fiction, music criticism and more general cultural criticism in newspapers and periodicals, have largely been excluded from this study's source base.

The Idea of Joachim

An important theme in this thesis is the centrality of ideas attributed to Joachim in the forming of early twentieth-century models of violin playing. Auer reminisces about his early studies with Joachim in his pedagogical work (discussed further in chapter 2), and in Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* Flesch attests to Joachim's supreme importance in the development of violin playing during this period. At the beginning of the book Flesch devotes a significant amount of prose to Joachim and the Spanish violinist Pablo Sarasate, and wishes to vouch for his own reliability, as literary conduit to their artistic worth: 'I was in a position to follow both their careers from 1886 until their deaths in

³¹ In an appendix to Hans Keller's edition of the memoirs, Carl F. Flesch relates that his father had invested all of his savings in American shares, and had even bought a large number of them 'on margin', meaning that he had only paid for a small portion of their actual price. Following the crash, Flesch therefore did not only lose all his money but was left with a debt of 100,000 marks. To repay this he had to sell his Stradivarius violin. When Flesch moved to London in 1934, by which time he had written most of the manuscript of his memoirs, C. F. Flesch writes that in addition to teaching a large number of pupils 'economic conditions forced him to keep up his concert career'. Between 1934 and 1939, when Flesch became unable to return from unoccupied Holland after a short visit there, the publication of his memoirs would have brought financial relief to Flesch. Flesch, *Memoirs*, 361, 363.

³² *Ibid.* 126.

1907 and 1908 respectively’, Flesch writes, and ‘I also came to know them personally’.³³ Joachim’s influence was more extensive than that of Sarasate, however: ‘while Joachim through his personality and his art set his stamp on the world of the violin for half a century and educated it towards a radical change in the customary conception of art, Sarasate influenced his violinist contemporaries for no longer than twenty-five years’.³⁴ Although Flesch notes the seductive influence of both Joachim and Sarasate over other players, it is Joachim’s sway over successive generations of violinists to which Flesch repeatedly returns in the course of his text. Chapter 5 discusses this topic in greater detail. Flesch’s comments on Joachim and Sarasate introduce interesting ideas of intersubjectivity which will be looked at further in chapter 5. Bronisław Huberman praises Joachim, with whom he revered as a child virtuoso, in his *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* (1912), and these passages will be looked at further in chapter 4. Even Eugène Ysaÿe, the purported embodiment of the nineteenth-century Franco-Belgian school, championed Joachim’s performance ethos (see chapter 6). The inclusion of Joachim’s name in the titles of several violin tutor books from the early twentieth century demonstrates the extent to which the name had become synonymous with an ideal of violin playing in the period.³⁵ This study does not trace the influence of Joachim’s own ideas, however, or chart Joachim’s influence in terms of genealogies of players descending from his pupils: it is a study of Joachim as a cultural construct, and the model of interpretative performance with which many violinists, first-hand observers of Joachim’s ideas or not, credited him as having inaugurated.

³³ *Ich habe beider Laufbahn von 1886 bis zu ihrem 1907 bzw. 1908 eingetretenen Tode verfolgen können, bin später auch in persönliche Beziehung zu beiden getreten.* Flesch, *Erinnerungen* 32, *Memoirs*, 29.

³⁴ *Während Joachim durch seine Persönlichkeit und seine Kunst der Geigerwelt ein halbes Jahrhundert lang seinen Stempel aufdrückte und sie zu einer radikalen Änderung der bis dahin üblichen Kunstauffassung erzog, hat Sarasate nicht viel länger als ein Vierteljahrhundert seine geigenden Zeitgenossen beeinflusst.* Ibid. 43 and 43.

³⁵ Several texts no doubt increased their commercial success by including Joachim’s name in their title, for example, Carl Courvoisier’s *Technics of Violin Playing on Joachim’s Method* (1899), Edith Lynwood’s *Violin Talks: A Book for Teachers and Students Containing Suggestions for Teachers of Children, Analyses of Important Teaching Works: And a Short Treatise on the Joachim and Sevcik Schools of Violin Playing* (1905), and ‘M.R.’’s *Some Points of Violin Playing and Musical Performance : as Learnt in the Hochschule für Musik (Joachim School) in Berlin During the Time I Was a Student There, 1902–1909* (1939). Furthermore, there are a large number of editions of musical works by Joachim which happily boast his name on their title pages. The appearance of Auer’s and Flesch’s names on title pages to their editions demonstrates the elevated statuses of these violinists also.

Which String Instruments?

The preponderance of writings devoted to violin playing over other string instruments in the early-twentieth century was an important factor in the decision to focus exclusively on texts surrounding this instrument. By the early twentieth century, the violin had acquired a well-established cultural resonance thanks to the nineteenth-century bravura tradition, in which the perennially popular image of the bewitched Paganini revived itself in successive generations of virtuosi. This also resulted in a substantial repertory, comprising not only dazzling showpieces but also highbrow works such as Beethoven's and Brahms's Violin Concertos. No doubt this legacy ensured the commercial viability of published texts on violin playing: in 1919 Martens tested the success of the title *Violin Mastery* before venturing to publish *String Mastery*; the title of Auer's pedagogical treatise, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, monopolised on the combination of the name of the instrument with his reputation; Bronislaw Huberman banked on the allure of the virtuoso figure, coupled with his own reputation as violinist, in the title of his *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen*. There is little in the way of writings surrounding viola, bass and ensemble string playing, and documents relating to these would receive their proper contextualisation in a study spanning a wider time period. For example, a study of writings surrounding viola playing might wish to take into account the later, twentieth-century writings of William Primrose. Since pedagogical treatises constitute a major focus of this study, the lack of substantial pedagogical treatises on viola, bass and ensemble playing from the early twentieth century is another reason why it does not consider these instruments. There are a greater number of texts relating to cello playing dating from the period, however, and these form the focus of a preliminary study in the conclusion.

Self and Expression

The remaining sections of this chapter identify the key themes with which the thesis engages, from the perspective of its contextualisation in both discursive/historical studies, and performance practice and psychological studies of performance. The notion that to perform is to express self has been a

mainstay of Western performance since Romanticism, and underpins much of the scholarly literature on musical performance. Mary Hunter has demonstrated the extent to which varying models of subjectivity centrally underpin discourses of musical performance in late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century texts relating to performance. It is Richard Taruskin's view in *Text and Act* that a subjective approach to performance dominated classical music until the rebellion of the Early Music movement from the 1950s onwards, which called for greater objectivity. However, since the subjective–objective binarism itself is a central tenet of Romanticism, this suggests that many advocates of the Early Music movement did not override the Romantic model of performance but worked within the same ideological framework. The idea of selves that express is still part of an assumed critical framework for some researchers: for example, in his chapter on style in performance, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson describes vibrato and dynamics as bearing 'most of the expressive load' in post-World War II performances.³⁶ The notion of the performer as self, and the resulting notion of expressing one's emotions, is a mainstay of music psychology: this basic understanding of the performer underpins Patrik Juslin's work on the expression of emotions in performance, for example.³⁷

The aim of this study is to critique notions of self. Hunter and Taruskin have already begun to do this, in their historical approaches, and, taking a more theoretical and philosophical approach, Naomi Cumming and Nicola Dibben have shown that notions of subjectivity constitute a richly rewarding theme for the study of performance.³⁸ Chapter 2 will demonstrate that metaphors of self-expression and other notions surrounding selfhood, such as vitality, mind-spirit and genius, are a central feature of the primary literature. This chapter as well as following chapters will demonstrate the complex engagement of ideologies of self with notions of the work concept and music theory, as well as metaphors which draw on experiences of the body and the surrounding physical world, thus

³⁶ Leech-Wilkinson, 'Recordings and Histories of Performance Style', 253.

³⁷ Juslin gives an overview of his own work and that of others in Patrik Juslin, 'Emotion in Music Performance', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 377–389.

³⁸ See, for example, Naomi Cumming, 'The Subjectivities of 'Erbarne Dich'', *Music Analysis*, 16/1 (1997), 5–44. Also Naomi Cumming, *The Sonic Self: Musical Subjectivity and Signification* (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2000). Nicola Dibben, 'Subjectivity and the Construction of Emotion in the Music of Björk', *Music Analysis*, 25/1 (2006), 171–197.

demonstrating the complex interaction of metaphysical ideas with sensory experiences. The thesis will demonstrate that notions of subjectivity constitute a rich nexus of ideas that are open to negotiating a wide range of experiential metaphors.

With regard to the theme of self expression, an important focus of this study is how notions of self are shaped by power dynamics. Michel Foucault's central thesis in his writings (notably, *Discipline and Punish* and *The History of Sexuality*) is that the judicial, medical and educational systems of modern Western societies exert control over bodies by colonising notions of self. Whereas Foucault imagines isolated individuals to have transcended this order, however, Judith Butler argues that there can be no experience of total liberation from modern self constructs, inscribed, as they are, on bodies, and embedded in the fabric of Western culture.³⁹ Similarly, chapter 5 of this thesis does not draw a clear distinction between conventional notions of self and moments of liberation from them, but rather examines writers' complex relationships to such bourgeois norms: the focus is on subversion as appearing 'through the cracks', as it were, rather than escaping the binding matrixes of notions of self.

A critique of the idea of self centrally requires a rediscovery of the idea of the body. In addition to the extensive excavation of bodies in historical/discursive studies, the research on self expression in music psychology also acknowledges their central role in the communication of emotions during performance. This study takes forward the interesting idea advanced by music psychologists that expressivity arises out of a struggle with the body. Having surveyed the research on the expression of emotions in performance, Patrik Juslin has argued that a basic source of expression in performance is 'random fluctuations' in motor precision. Juslin draws attention to the gap between performers' intentions and their outcome in performance: 'it has been revealed in several studies that even expert performers who try to play perfectly even time intervals show small, involuntary

³⁹ In *Gender Trouble* Butler argues that Foucault, in his edited memoir of the hermaphrodite Herculine Barbin, suggests that Barbin was exempt from society's code of gender and sexuality because of her unusual bodily features. Butler argues, to the contrary, that notions of self are so embedded in the fabric of Western culture that there can be no opting out of them, even briefly. Rather, such codes can only be subverted from within, which is, Butler asserts, the goal of her present text. Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble* (2nd edn, London: Routledge, 1999), 46. Michel Foucault, *Herculine Barbin, Being the Recently Discovered Memoirs of a Nineteenth Century Hermaphrodite* (New York: Vintage Books, 1980).

fluctuations in the timing of their performance'.⁴⁰ Anthony Gritten argues that a fast-expanding body of research on ergonomics in musical performance overemphasises the ideal of physical ease in musical execution, and limits the body's role to that of a functional executor of intentions. Gritten argues that it fails to take account of how it might generate musical meaning itself, when engaging, or even conflicting, with the mind.⁴¹ The worth of a performance might therefore arise from a struggle between mind and body, rather than a frictionless translation of mental intentions into bodily gestures. This thesis centrally examines the idea of a struggle between mind and body, both in notions of singing tone (chapter 3) and in writers' engagement with medico-moral notions (chapter 4).

Voice is a key concept to emerge out of both psychological and discursive studies, with regard to the interaction of mind and body. In the psychological research on emotion in performance, the human voice has emerged as a primary locus of shared meaning between performers and listeners. Emotions are rendered intelligible by their commonly understood manifestation in the use of the voice. Thus, as Patrik Juslin notes, what researchers are looking for 'is not the emotion itself, but rather its expressive form'.⁴² In his own research, Juslin takes his cue from Herbert Spencer who in 1857 argued that one can locate expressivity in physiological changes which have come to be associated with certain emotions.⁴³ This was named 'Spencer's Law' by Juslin and Laukka, who offer empirical support for parallels between vocal and musical expression of emotions.⁴⁴ Historians and cultural theorists, such as Carolyn Abbate and Roland Barthes, have also developed the idea of voice as bridging the gap between mind and body, a topic discussed further below.

Psychologists' research on the parallels between speech/language and music suggests that metaphors of performance as voice also conceptualises the act of performance as speaking or as a language. Musacchia, Sams, Skoe and Kraus have measured auditory brainstem responses to speech using electroencephalography (EEG) and found that musicians have a more highly developed ability

⁴⁰ Juslin, 'Emotion in Music Performance', 378.

⁴¹ Anthony Gritten, 'From Ergonomics to Energetics: Alongside the Interpretation of Music', *Dutch Journal of Music Theory (Tijdschrift voor Muziektheorie)*, 14/3 (2009), 155–165.

⁴² Juslin, 'Emotion in Music Performance', 378.

⁴³ *Ibid.* 385.

⁴⁴ Patrik Juslin and P. Laukka, 'Communication of Emotions in Vocal Expression and Music Performance: Different Channels, same Code?' *Psychological Bulletin*, 129 (2003), 770–814.

to respond to the articulation of syllables than do non-musicians.⁴⁵ Thomas Stainsby and Ian Cross have noted the use of pitch in spoken languages to denote whether a sentence is a statement or question, and also the use of pitch in Asian languages to denote meanings of words.⁴⁶ In the historical research Laurence Dreyfus has noted the use of the German verb *vortragen*, to recite, in nineteenth-century German writings on performance.⁴⁷ Chapter 3 will look at how writings on violin playing in the early twentieth century incorporate metaphors of speech, and asks whether these metaphors incorporate notions of speech as articulation and/or speech as change in pitch. Furthermore, the chapter will ask whether writers use such metaphors to denote speech as an embodied act and/or the rhetorical, grammatical or representational functions of language.

Destabilising the Idea of Individual Self Expression

This thesis aims to enrich the understanding of how composers, performers and listeners interact through a critique of metaphors of interaction. This fundamentally concerns notions of self, because the question at hand is whether writers understand self as embodied, in which case selves need to transcend their isolation to connect with other selves, or whether they posit a model of collective self, in which case communication occurring outside of selves is not a necessary metaphor. Metaphors of interaction resulting from the first model will evoke a non-subjective entity or means through which subjectivities interact. No such metaphors are needed for a model of communal self, but ideas might be incorporated to conceive of how heterogeneous, possibly embodied selves, distinguish themselves from the collective.

The idea that performers ‘communicate’ to listeners, as the psychological research on the expression of emotions in performance assumes, is problematic from the perspective of a historical

⁴⁵ G. Musacchia, M. Sams, E. Skoe and N. Kraus, ‘Musicians Have Enhanced Subcortical Auditory and Audiovisual Processing of Speech and Music’, *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA*, 104 (2007), 15984–15898.

⁴⁶ Thomas Stainsby and Ian Cross, ‘The Perception of Pitch’, in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 47–58

⁴⁷ Dreyfus, ‘Beyond the Interpretation of Music’, 265–266.

study. Patrik Juslin writes that much research on the expression of emotions in performance focuses on how performers ‘communicate’ emotions to listeners, yet the media historian John Durham Peters argues that the idea of communication as the normal mode of interaction between individuals only acquired this meaning in the course of the nineteenth century. This was due to the shift away from thinking as social bodies and towards individual autonomy. Peters writes that an ideal of communication, as the frictionless sending of information from one repository to the other, became particularly prevalent in the aftermath of the two World Wars, the events of which seemingly proved the efficacy of fast transfer of information between isolated repositories of meaning. Sets of signs rendered intelligible the information produced by heterogeneous repositories of meaning. As a means of developing a richer theoretical framework for studying the idea of communication, however, Peters turns the dominant model on its head: drawing on the philosophy of Martin Heidegger, Peters suggests that one start with assuming universally shared knowledge and experience, then proceed to identify articulations of difference, or otherness, through which selves gain independence from one another. By adopting this alternative model the scholar may not only locate the event of communication in instances of easy transfer of information via signs, but also in supposed breakdowns of communication.⁴⁸

The aim of this study is to find out if the discourses of performance under scrutiny posit models of communally shared knowledge and experience, and whether these lead to articulations of difference, rather than of attempts to bridge gaps between information repositories, in their negotiation of performing as a social activity. It does this by looking to models of subjectivity and/or intersubjectivity, as sources of notions of oneness transcending bodily boundaries. The aim is to challenge the assumption that the performing agency is an autonomous, embodied self that is attempting frictionless communication. Notions of a collective self suggest a complex negotiation of agency: either the performer is an autonomous agency or allows other agencies to act through him or her, thus invoking active and passive as an important dimension in the scholarly understanding of

⁴⁸ John Durham Peters, *Speaking into the Air: A History of the Idea of Communication* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999).

notions of self in musical performance. Another possibility is that the range of ideas undermine the idea of ‘self’ at their core: in other words, without its discursive manifestation in bodies and materials, the category of self might in fact turn out to be a rather impoverished one, which would suggest that the search for self expression in the study of performance (as in the psychological research) is not a particularly rich area for research, and that concepts which negotiate both self and its material manifestations, such as voice, constitute more enlightening themes guiding scholarly enquiry.

The Components of Performance: Pulse/Metre/Rhythm, and the Relationship of these Musical Components to Pitch and Timbre

The aim of the study is to enrich the understanding of the various theoretical or musical categories and frameworks used to make sense of music, as they are currently defined by music psychology and studies of recorded music, by uncovering culturally derived notions of such categories. The intention is to find out whether early twentieth-century notions of the components of performance correlate with, or contradict, the categories which scholars now apply to performance. It is possible that such notions transcend the current boundaries, and posit concepts that incorporate several of the current divisions. The result may be that the current classifications, for the purpose of studying performance in the early twentieth century, become synonymous with one another, undergo a transformation of identity, or become obsolete altogether.

In light of the intense scholarly focus on rhythm, metre and tempo, the project attempts to find out how early twentieth-century writers conceive of performance as a temporal event. It focuses on writers’ negotiation of these same terms, as a means of making a limited set of comparisons between these categories as products of cultural ideas, and as they are understood by contemporary music psychologists. Considering the psychological research as a whole, W. Luke Windsor writes that ‘psychological studies of performance that derive from measurements exhibit a strong bias towards the measurement and analysis of onset timing’, and furthermore notes that timing is ‘often argued to

be at the beat level in the metrical hierarchy'.⁴⁹ With regard to expert ensemble playing, however, L. H. Shaffer argues that performers coordinated their timing at the level of the bar.⁵⁰ In his seminal work in both psychological studies and recordings analysis, Bruno Repp has measured the timings of recordings and performances at both the beat and bar level.⁵¹ Rhythm is a further factor to consider in relation to pulse and metre: Mari Riess Jones notes that the psychological research largely distinguishes between rhythm and metre.⁵² The study will show that writers of pedagogical treatises discuss rhythm, meter and tempo as important categories of performance and that they consider the relationship of the categories to one another. The primary focus is on the underlying metaphors combining to produce these categories: chapter 2 demonstrates that the idea of tempo arises from the vitality–mechanism binarisms and chapter 3 demonstrates that the idea of singing tone confronts the tension between the idea of performance as a continuous/gradually evolving stream of sound and the periodisation created by rhythm, metre and tempo. Although the primary focus of these chapters is on these categories of performance as a product of cultural ideas, to a small extent the chapters will also compare these culturally produced concepts to music psychologists' understanding of the same categories in more recent work.

From the perspective of psychological approaches, one of the advantages of critiquing the idea of singing tone is that it sheds light on the relationship of events which create gradual change or transformation during, and components creating periodisation. It is Windsor's opinion that in psychological approaches to performance 'the relationship between the different variables that make up a performance is still little understood', though there have been some attempts to look at the relationship between timing and dynamics.⁵³ In terms of the research on the relationship between tempo and dynamics, Nicholas Cook draws attention to Gerhard Widmer's research at the Austrian

⁴⁹ W. Luke Windsor, 'Measurement and Models of Performance', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 323–331, 325.

⁵⁰ L. H. Shaffer, 'Timing in Solo and Duet Piano Performances', *The Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 36/A (1984), 577–595. Noted in Windsor, 'Measurement and Models of Performance', 326.

⁵¹ For example, B. Repp, 'Diversity and Commonality in Music Performance: An Analysis of Timing Microstructure in Schumann's 'Träumerei'', *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 92/5 (1992), 2546–2568. B. Repp, 'A Microcosm of Musical Expression: I. Quantitative Analysis of Pianists' Timing in the Initial Measures of Chopin's Etude in E Major', *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 104 (1998), 1085–1100.

⁵² Mari Riess Jones, 'Musical Time', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 81–92, 87.

⁵³ Windsor, 'Measurement and Models of Performance', 325.

Research Institute for Artificial Intelligence. Widmer's research produced a real-time animation of a worm which moved up or down according to tempo fluctuations, and from left to right according to changes in dynamics.⁵⁴ Researchers have also considered timing data in the context of phrasing and structure.⁵⁵

Music psychologists define several musical components by their relational properties. Marie Riess Jones notes that the research on metre and rhythm posits the identities of both as arising out of a conflict between the two. Rhythms, Riess Jones shows, nevertheless acquire meaning through the relationship of isolated beats to each other in discrete groups, in the same way that metre designates this function to individual bars.⁵⁶ Thomas Stainsby and Ian Cross acknowledge research that demonstrates how listeners derive the sense of an isolated pitch, but they argue that 'when we experience pitch in music we do not experience single pitches, or arbitrary collections of individual pitches; we experience pitch *patterns*'.⁵⁷ Similarly, as Mark Schmuckler shows, studies of melody repeatedly confirm that cognition of melody, at least in Western tonality, derives from how notes indicate different keys (which, of course, exist in relation to each other), and also from the position of notes in an overarching contour.⁵⁸ In their review of the research on tonal cognition, Emmanuel Bigand and Bénédicte Poulin-Charronnat posit a hierarchy of musical elements, which gives rise to the notion that 'secondary' elements, such as melodies and ornaments, are more fundamentally ordered by the relationship of keys posited in Western tonality.⁵⁹ Cognition resulting from discrete and contrasting musical events is what mostly interests music psychologists, then, which shifts the overall focus of the research field away from music's sonic properties, such as volume and timbre.

⁵⁴ Cook, 'Methods for Analysing Recordings', 229.

⁵⁵ In his study of recordings by well-known pianists of Schumann's *Träumerei*, Bruno Repp noted that all performers slowed down at the end of phrases and at the end of large structural divisions. Eric Clarke has looked at expression in relation to structural aspects of musical scores. See, for example, Eric Clarke, 'Expression in Performance: Generativity, Perception and Semiosis', in John Rink, ed., *The Practice of Musical Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 21–54.

⁵⁶ Jones, 'Musical Time', 81–92.

⁵⁷ Stainsby and Cross, 'The Perception of Pitch', 53.

⁵⁸ Mark A. Schmuckler, 'Components of Melodic Processing', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 93–106.

⁵⁹ Emmanuel Bigand and Bénédicte Poulin-Charronnat, 'Tonal Cognition', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 59–71.

The historical and discursive research often posits the musical event as a singular and sonic presence, however. Carolyn Abbate's notion of voice is an example of such, described in her work as a static 'sound-object'. The efficacy of this notion of voice, for Abbate, lies in its ability to disrupt plots posited by the all-powerful author or composer, which tends to appropriate participating subjectivities. In her *In Search of Opera*, a broad account of opera in modernity, Abbate takes a middle ground between the notion of opera as abstract work and as performance, recasting the characters posited by the plot, as well as embodied performers, as possessing autonomous agency. Abbate's focus on literary sources as fertile ground for the mediation of self suggests that the more specific period and subject matter for focus in the present study will uncover a rich discourse.⁶⁰

Jonathan Dunsby has argued that the cultural theorist Roland Barthes similarly championed the idea of music as singular presence, as opposed to a set of elements organised by systemic principles. Barthes posited the notion of voice in opposition to what he perceived as an eclipsing of performance, following the Second World War, by the notion of a linguistic system. Dunsby argues that what caused voice to resist integration into an impersonal structure, for Barthes, was its embodiment, as the sound of 'the tongue, the glottis, the teeth, the mucous membranes, the nose'.⁶¹ Verbal articulation resulted from the friction of these body parts against the unhindered flow of sound emanating from the lungs and vocal chords, which contrasted with the notion of speech as a self-referential system of signs, which has the effect of disembodiment of the singing voice. For Barthes, this latter approach to diction is what characterised the post-War performances of the German tenor Dietrich Fischer-Dieskau, which Barthes denounces in favour of a lost style of singing heard in the voice of Charles Panzéra. Panzéra's singing, Barthes claims, resulted from an integrated working together of lungs, vocal chords and the vocal apparatus. The idea here that holds relevance for this thesis is that sung speech is always tied to a self: speech articulates concepts far-flung from the body in which it originated, yet it never gains complete autonomy from it. Chapter 3 will demonstrate that

⁶⁰ Carolyn Abbate, *Unsung Voices* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1991). Carolyn Abbate, *In Search of Opera* (Princeton, N.J., Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001).

⁶¹ Roland Barthes, 'The Grain of the Voice', in *Image – Music – Text*, ed. and trans. Stephen Heath (London: Fontana, 1977), 179–189, 183.

violinists apply the notion of song, as a conflict between the extra- and intra-corporeal, to their models of violin playing.⁶²

One of the aims of the thesis, then, is to find out if this idea of voice sheds light on the interaction of notions of multiple theoretical/performative categories. Chapter 3 argues that voice provides a common source for both pitch/timbre, as continuous sound, and pulse/rhythm, as its periodic articulation. Whereas pitch and timbre are regarded by psychological research as distinct categories of musical cognition, it shows that embodied voice, as both pitch cognition and material sound, dissolves the distinction. Melody, as the cognition of continuity or movement paradoxically arising from a string of static pitches, retains its perceived manifestation as physical sound, its volume, and its timbral qualities.

The Cultural Context

By way of developing a historical and cultural context for the primary literature, the thesis incorporates an exposition of discourses of metaphysical self. Chapter 2 will demonstrate that Nietzsche's philosophy of life/will to power exerted a widespread influence on early twentieth-century aesthetic discourses, and provides an exposition of principal themes in Nietzsche's thought. The chapter subsequently discusses Richard Wagner's essay 'On Conducting' (*Über das Dirigieren*, 1869), because for writers on violin playing it serves as a conduit to Nietzschean ideas. Moreover, it further develops these ideas in relation to musical performance, thus providing writers with a template for their own models of violin playing.

In the decades following its publication, Wagner's *Über das Dirigieren* contributed to the rise of a privileging, in wider culture, of eminent musical figures. The essay's lauding of Beethoven's music, as central to conductors' concerns, foreshadows the equally panegyric tone of Wagner's essay 'Beethoven' (1870). The publication date of this essay coincided with both the centennial year of

⁶² Jonathan Dunsby, 'Roland Barthes and the Grain of Panzéra's Voice', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 134/1 (2009), 113–132.

Beethoven's birth and Bismarck's triumph over Napoleon III in the Franco-Prussian War, and in the following decades both Wagner and Beethoven would become emblems of German nationalist pride. 'On Conducting' posits an ideal of subjective re-creation over slavish execution of literal score readings: rather than discussing detailed aspects of scores, Wagner imagines Beethoven to appear from beyond the grave, commanding the execution of his music with his own voice. For example, Wagner writes, 'now suppose the voice of Beethoven were heard from the grave admonishing a conductor: "Hold my fermata long and terribly!"'.⁶³ It was probably not lost on Wagner that a claim to have re-discovered the spiritual essence of Beethoven's music reinforced his own reputation, as a leading German conductor, as much as it documented his ideas.

Wagner's individualism in matters of musical execution prompted criticism, however. In a review of the German conductor Felix Weingartner's *Über das Dirigieren* (1896), the *Musical Times* wished to portray a congenial relationship between the two texts, characterising Weingartner's views as generally affirming those of Wagner's 'famous essay', yet also 'counteracting the evil effects which Wagner foresaw would probably arise from the publication of his views'.⁶⁴ This, namely, was the rise of a generation of conductors with a liberal approach to interpreting scores, particularly in terms of tempi choices. Leon Botstein argues, however, that the correctives of Weingartner's text 'marked the onset of a post-Wagnerian and objectivist phase of conducting'.⁶⁵

Nevertheless, the cult of the towering musical personality initiated by Wagner continued to captivate early twentieth-century musicians. Leopold Auer took the widespread notion of Wagner's greatness so seriously that he dismissed the possibility of self interest on Wagner's part:

⁶³ *Nun setzen wir den Fall, die Stimme Beethoven's habe aus dem Grabe einem Dirigenten zugerufen: „Halte du meine Fermate lange und furchtbar!* Richard Wagner, 'Über das Dirigieren', in *Gesammelte Schriften und Dichtungen von Richard Wagner*, 8 vols (Leipzig, E. W. Fritsch, 1873), 8.328–410, 8.350. Translation adapted from Richard Wagner, *On Conducting*, trans. Edward Dannreuther [ebook] Project Gutenberg <<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/4523>> accessed 30 December 2010.

⁶⁴ 'Felix Weingartner on Conducting', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, 37, no. 643 (1896), 590–593, 590.

⁶⁵ John Spitzer, Neal Zaslaw, Leon Botstein, Charles Barber, José A. Bowen and Jack Westrup, 'Conducting', in *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online* [online reference source] <<http://oxfordmusiconline.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/06266?q=Conducting&search=quick&pos=1&_start=1#firsthit> accessed 16 November 2011.

Among the great of the earth I have known one only, Richard Wagner, who was altogether immune to the lure of titles and decorations; his genius aside, it was his own way of distinguishing himself from the rest of mankind.⁶⁶

There is evidence that Moser read at least part of *Über das Dirigieren*, and it is likely that Flesch also read it, judging by his grasp of several important ideas contained in Wagner's essay, and his attributing of them to Wagner. Moser includes an extended quote from Wagner's essay in his essay *Vom Vortrag*, which opens the third volume of *Violinschule*, and, with nationalistic fervour, builds on Wagner's subjectivist model of performance to privilege a German over a Franco-Belgian school of violin playing (discussed further in chapter 2). With the suppression of German nationalism following the War, Flesch's privileging of German music making is more muted, in his pedagogical writings from the 1920s (see the concluding chapter for a further discussion). Nevertheless, the same ideal of the powerful and elite violinist posited by Moser centrally informs Flesch's model of violin playing, and he had clearly understood more specifically musical principles from Wagner's essay, namely the idea of 'dynamic monotony' and Wagner's central concept of 'melos'.⁶⁷ Chapter 3 will further discuss the development of Wagner's ideas in Flesch's writings.

Chapter 2 will discuss in further detail how Wagner builds a subjectivist model of performance, and how this shapes Moser's model of violin playing. Wagner begins his essay by diagnosing the state of decline German orchestral playing in his day, denouncing its 'exhaustion' (*Mattigkeit*) and 'weakening' (*Schwächen*).⁶⁸ What is lacking, Wagner argues, is 'energy' (*Energie*) and 'power' (*Kraft*) in orchestral performance, and Wagner asserts that these can be gained by discovering the 'melos' of the music.⁶⁹ Wagner traces his proposed solution to a performance he heard given by the Orchestra of the Paris Conservatoire in 1839, who, through the efforts of the conductor François-Antoine Habeneck, were able to 'capture the melos of the symphony' (*das Melos der*

⁶⁶ Leopold Auer, *My Long Life in Music* (London: Duckworth, 1924), 107.

⁶⁷ 'Wagner coined the expression 'dynamic monotony' to describe a continuous 'p' lasting for a great length of time.' (*Wagner prägte für längerwährende anhaltende 'p' den Ausdruck „dynamische Monotonie.“*) 'Beethoven divested ornamentation of its more trifling character, his turns in particular, appear as indispensably necessary constituents of his melos.' (*Beethoven entkleidete die Verzierungen ihres mehr spielerischen Charakters, insbesondere seine Doppelschläge erschienen als unumgänglich notwendige Bestandteile des Melos*). 'The rise and fall of the melos will be unconsciously used by every half-way musical violinist' (*dem Steigen und Fallen des Melos verständlichkeit von jedem halbwegs musikalischen Geiger unbewußt angebracht*). Flesch, 2/42, 2/42, 2/22, 2/39. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2/47, 2/24, 2/42.

⁶⁸ Wagner, 'Über das Dirigieren', 8.336, 8.328.

⁶⁹ *Ibid.* 8.333.

Symphonie zu erfassen).⁷⁰ Whereas chapter 2 discusses how melos relates to metaphysical notions of self, chapter 3 discusses how, in the course of Wagner's essay, these notions are interwoven among more localised observations regarding revered musical works and specific passages in scores, and how these cultural ideas strengthen Wagner's more specific ideas regarding how conductors and orchestral players should approach tempo, articulation and dynamics.

The central notions of music as melody and as 'dynamic' (*Dynamik*) in Wagner's essay also characterises energeticist theories and analyses in the early twentieth century, with which the thesis makes a limited engagement. It takes only the more general principles of this work, however, as found in the writings of August Halm, Heinrich Schenker, Arnold Schering, Hans Mersmann, Hugo Riemann, and Ernst Kurth, and as discussed in Lee Rothfarb's studies of these writers, to support points made regarding the primary sources. For energeticist writers, music is essentially subjective experience, which results in their emphasising of dynamic events in music perception, and the privileging of melody as a central locus of such processes. Chapter 3 relates these ideas to the central notion of singing tone in violin playing, and the resulting notion of musical components (such as tempo, dynamics, and so on) as fundamentally acquiring their meaning from a basic and continually fluctuating power. The concluding chapter identifies the elitist aspirations of both energeticist analysts and writers on violin playing, which results from the privileging of a select canon of musical works.

Conclusion

To summarise, this thesis has two main questions which it seeks to address. Firstly, it attempts to find out what how writers on violinists and violin playing make sense of their subject matter in the context of their surrounding culture. In doing so, the aim is to find out how writings on performance can add to, or modify, the current musicological understanding of musical cultures in the early twentieth

⁷⁰ *Der alte Habeneck... fand das richtige Tempo, indem er durch anhaltenden Fleiß sein Orchester darauf hinleitete*, Ibid. 8.341.

century. More specifically, the project seeks to develop a history of musicking from the perspective of how performers understood it, as a means of revising a mostly composer-centred understanding of music history in musicological research to date. At the same time, it tries to find out what performers' views of composers and musical works were, and how they understood their own identities and practices to relate to composers and works.

The second major question which this thesis attempts to answer is what relationship writings on performance have to performative practices, from the perspective of the primary texts themselves. It anticipates the uncovering of a highly complex relationship of discourse to practice, as descriptions of the act of violin playing are extensively shaped by generical considerations, the assertion of authority (particularly in the case of pedagogies), writers' intentions for how they wish their texts to be understood and practically responded to, and the mutual influence of a variety of culturally received metaphors, and experiential notions of playing, on each other. The anticipated result is a highly mediated describing of performative practices in written form. The thesis aims to find out which concepts and approaches are needed in order to make writings on performance a viable means of accessing performative practices (most importantly, those found on historical sound recordings), yet also wishes to allow for the possibility that a discourse of performance will retain a high degree of autonomy from actual practices. In other words, a discourse of performance does not merely exist to make sense of actual practices but itself performs new areas of meaning and experiences of music, which may or may not enter into a dialogue with acts of violin playing.

With regard to the question of the relationship of discourse to practice, and in response to music psychologists' central focus on the mind-body relationship, the thesis attempts to centrally find out what writers' notions of the mind-body relationship were. It seeks to find out how philosophies of mind and vitality, as well as popular notions of health and disease, shaped writers' understanding of mind and body, and how, precisely, they applied this to their own understanding of the relationship between thinking, speaking and writing about performance, and enacting it with body and instrument.

The thesis attempts to find out how writers of pedagogical treatises assert their authority, as eminent violin players and teachers. The thesis tries to find out how writers draw on other fields of knowledge, i.e. philosophies of self and theories of disease and degeneration, as well as an existing discourse surrounding high art performance, to construct a particular form of authority in relation to violin playing. The thesis looks at Foucauldian theories of power and studies of the exertion of power at the height of Western colonialism, and asks whether writers succeed or fail in adopting these robust forms of imposing control.

The central methodological approach of the thesis is to present the primary sources in the context of an unfolding complex of cultural themes. The chapters are organised in such a way as to gradually map out a terrain of cultural notions: chapter 2 provides an exposition of notions of self, and in doing so lays the groundwork for topics considered later in the thesis. Chapter 3 demonstrates how notions of self interact with metaphysical notions of song and the voice, thus demonstrating how notions of self interact with notions of the body. Chapter 4 builds on this by demonstrating that notions of health and disease from the period add further complexity to this conceptual framework of mind and body. Having constructed this edifice, the thesis then explores challenges to it, in the primary literature, in chapter 5. The exposition of the conceptual terrain is what governs when and where the primary sources appear as evidence: where an extended critique of a single source does not significantly disturb the development of this exposition, however, it is included in the course of the chapter. There a good number of these throughout the thesis and they have the advantage of developing a sense of the meaning and significance of individual sources in their own right.

Throughout each chapter, the secondary aim is to engage with the multiple scholarly frameworks and issues discussed above. Observations will thus be made along the way with regard to how the evidence throws light on notions of musical meaning developed in psychological studies, for example, or how it contributes to scholarly understandings of the work concept. These are then summarised in the concluding chapter.

Chapter 2

Infinite Self and Inadequate Matter: Notions of Consciousness in the Discursive Mediation of Violin Playing

This chapter demonstrates that notions of subjectivity centrally underpin early twentieth-century discourses of violin playing. The aim is to demonstrate that notions of consciousness directly shape writers' beliefs regarding the role of the performer in the performance network, as well as a variety of notions of performative practices. In doing so, the chapter provides an exposition of varying models of self in preparation for the themes of later chapters. Notions of subjectivity centrally relate to the Romantic positing of consciousness in the artwork, a commonly studied feature of Romantic and post-Romantic art and literature in general, but not extensively studied in relation to discourses of musical performance.

This chapter will demonstrate that nineteenth-century notions of consciousness centrally support the notion of the violinist as a 'high art' performer. Conversely, these enable writers to denigrate unwanted qualities of violin performance sometimes associated with the idea of virtuosity. This dichotomous role of notions of consciousness further shapes notions of specific performative practices, including tempo, pizzicato and harmonics. The chapter then considers how notions of self shape the perceived role of the interpretive violin player in the context of the performance network of composer, performer and listener. It considers how different models of consciousness lead to varying outcomes regarding the cooperation or conflict of agencies in the network, as well the issue of whether the performer possesses active agency or is a passive recipient of consciousness in the artwork. The notion of the performer as a powerful and active re-creator of the musical work then forms the focus of the rest of the chapter: a discussion of this model in Nietzsche's and Wagner's writings leads to a critique of Moser's and Auer's notion of the violinist as pre-eminent over lesser beings, and over musical historicism.

The Vitality–Mechanism Metaphor and the Idea of Virtuosity

The debate over whether life is sustained by a vital or spiritual essence, or whether ‘animate’ beings are in fact composites of mechanistic processes that occur in nature, is longstanding throughout Western modernity. Whereas in the seventeenth century Descartes maintained that animals and plants were types of machines, and in the early nineteenth century the chemist Jacob Berzelius provided a mechanistic account of the chemistry of living organisms, the seventeenth-century biologist Nicolas Malebranche and the eighteenth-century anatomist Xavier Bichat posited a vital principle in their research.⁷¹ In the late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries the principle of life centrally featured in the work of the philosophers Johann Georg Hamann and Johann Gottfried Herder, as well as in the Idealist philosophies of Schelling and early Hegel.

Long the preserve of scientific and philosophical debates, notions of vitality later came to order a wide range of cultural concepts. In the Romantic period, the idea of vitality found expression in notions of *Lebensphilosophie* (life philosophy), *Lebensweisheit* (wisdom of life) and *Lebenskunst* (the art of living). These terms appeared in texts providing general advice of a moral and practical kind, for example in G. B. von Schirach’s *Über die moralische Schönheit und Philosophie des Lebens* (*On Moral Beauty and the Philosophy of Life*, 1772). Speaking specifically of musical performance in a section on ‘artistic execution’ (*künstlerische Exekution*) of his *Vorlesungen über die Ästhetik* (1835–1838), Hegel posits ‘life’ in opposition to the idea of the human as machine to conceive of the performer’s relationship to the score. He writes that ‘the executant has a duty, rather than giving the impression of an automaton who recites a mere lesson and repeats mechanically what has been dictated to him, to give life and soul to the work in the same sense that the composer did’.⁷² Vitalistic notions prominently feature in a variety of discourses of the late-nineteenth and early twentieth centuries: the idea of *Lebensphilosophie* continued to manifest itself in Germany during this period,

⁷¹ William Bechtel and Robert C. Richardson, ‘Vitalism’, in E. Craig, ed., *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [online reference source] <<http://rep.routledge.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.rep.routledge.com/article/Q109>> accessed 11 November 2011.

⁷² *Der Künstler [hat] die Pflicht, statt den Eindruck eines musikalischen Automaten zu geben, der eine bloße Lektion hersagt und Vorgesprochenes mechanisch wiederholt, das Werk im Sinne und Geist des Komponisten seelenvoll zu beleben.* Hegel, G. W. F., *Vorlesungen über die Ästhetik* [online text] Textlog.de: Historische Texte & Wörterbücher <<http://www.textlog.de/5804.html>> accessed 25 July 2011.

and became something of a national and cultural movement, reflected in the writings of Ludwig Klages, George Simmel and Ludwig Klages. Brian McLaughlin has shown that the idea of vitality experienced a resurgence in biology during this period, particularly in the work of the embryologist Hans Driesch (1867–1941).⁷³ The idea of vitality in this period also finds expression in the French philosopher Henri Bergson’s notion of *élan vital*, as well as Nietzsche’s notion of life/will to power.

The aligning of music with vitality, in the post-Romantic era, led to the denigration of music that was perceived to be mechanistic, or merely fabricated from bodies and instruments. ‘Inner-ness’ or *Innerlichkeit*, often appears as an ideal of music, alongside vitality, in nineteenth-century aesthetic philosophies (as it does in Hegel), and helps to explain anxieties over what were perceived to be music’s ‘outer’ manifestations. The investing of musical performance with the Idealist complex of notions incorporating life, spirit, and mind cast aspersions over its material manifestations. For example, a critic constructs his appraisal of a performance given by Franz Liszt in the 1840s, around the mind–mechanism dualism: he applauds the presence of consciousness in Liszt’s performance (‘thought’, ‘mental’), rejecting the possibility that it resulted from ‘mechanical exertion’ and mere ‘physical’ execution:

His efforts seem rather like the flight of thought than the result of mechanical exertion, thus investing his execution with a character more mental than physical.⁷⁴

Music’s ultimate manifestation as real sound not only attracted a negative reception but also gave rise to suspicions that it was this and nothing else. Proponents of the Romantic/Idealist conception of music were plagued by music’s sensuousness. In the nineteenth century, debates over vital–mechanistic music centred around the idea of the virtuoso, and, referring specifically to instrumentalists, Lawrence Kramer draws attention to the longstanding cultural association of virtuosity, as appearance, with deception:

Unlike the singer, whose instrument is invisible, the virtuoso must show what he does and thus so court the charge that showing is all he is does. He thus becomes a magnet for the

⁷³ Brian McLaughlin, ‘Vitalism and Emergence’, in Thomas Baldwin, ed., *The Cambridge History of Philosophy 1870–1945* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 631–639.

⁷⁴ Taken from a review in the *Manchester Morning Post*, of a recital given in 1840 or 1841. Found in James Huneker, *Franz Liszt* (New York: Scribners, 1911), 316.

multiple ambivalences that haunted the concept of appearance itself at least since Plato—in relation to the body, theatricality, deception, rhetoric, and the like.⁷⁵

Deception in the form of the magic show was a widespread cultural preoccupation in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. Simon During has documented the rise of the magic spectacle, as part of the wider growth of the leisure industry: ‘between 1860 and 1910’, During writes, ‘entertainment magic reaches its zenith’.⁷⁶ That magic played on the hazy boundaries between life and mechanism is demonstrated by the popularity of ‘automata’ as a feature of the spectacle: for example, in the late nineteenth century John Nevil Maskelyne and George Alfred Cooke invented an ‘automated ‘Oriental sage’, which played card games, smoked, spelled words and solved mathematical problems’.⁷⁷ In another example, During notes how Eugène, the son of the famous illusionist Robert-Houdin, was ‘mutated into a mechanism’, as he was ‘put to sleep and turned by means of ether into a human balloon’.⁷⁸ Nineteenth-century spiritualist groups incorporated optical illusions into their meetings, unwittingly creating a market in the process for magic shows designed to expose spiritualists’ fraudulence.⁷⁹

The cultural predilection for magic in the latter half of the nineteenth century demonstrates that high ideals of consciousness were not always carefully guarded but were often playthings of the commercial realm. Notions of the fundamentally immaterial essence of human beings, such as soul, spirit, mind, life, subjective, and so on, were toyed with for the purpose of financial gain. The question for this thesis, therefore, is whether, and if so, how, did writers on musical performance negotiate this complex interplay of ideas: did they condemn the desecration of ideals of consciousness in the name of upholding music’s alignment with them, or did they themselves adopt strategies produced by the wider cultural penchant for deception? This chapter and the rest of the thesis will look at instances of where writers court both high-minded ideals of self, as well as the materialism and commercial interest that conjured illusions of such from behind the scenes.

⁷⁵ Lawrence Kramer, *Musical Meaning: Toward a Critical History* (Berkeley, London: University of California Press, 2002), 69.

⁷⁶ Simon During, *Modern Enchantments: The Cultural Power of Secular Magic* (Cambridge, Mass., London: Harvard University Press, 2002), 135.

⁷⁷ *Ibid.* 157.

⁷⁸ *Ibid.* 129.

⁷⁹ *Ibid.* 149–156.

Early twentieth-century writers on violin playing adopt the metaphor of trickery or magic to denigrate virtuosity. The Austrian violinist and pedagogue Hans Wessely (1862–1926) wishes to guide readers away from assuming that merely taking the advice provided in his 1913 manual of violin playing will lead to true artistry. This Wessely equates with ‘mechanical’ skill, and Wessely’s resulting suspicion that violinists who over-rely on technique have given too much time to ‘tricks’ demonstrates his equating of mechanism with deception:

Up to this point the Author’s advice and warning has been mainly concerned with technique— yet what a delusion is it to think that mechanical skill alone can be of any interest to the cultured listener! Although it is absolutely necessary to have full command over the finger-board and bow arm, these qualities will be of infinitesimal value if the violinist does not possess the higher gifts of art which spring from the head and soul. There are now plenty of technically well-equipped violinists who somehow fail to show sufficient individuality to hold our attention for any length of time. Have they given too much time to technical tricks, thereby neglecting their best feeling for art?⁸⁰

Wessely’s opposition of ‘the higher gifts... from head and soul’ to the bodily (‘bow arm’) and the material (‘fingerboard’) reinforces the alignment of interpretation with the positing of consciousness in art, and virtuosity with the revealing of mechanisms. In contrast, writers value non-deceptive character traits as the hallmarks of good performance. Prompted by Frederick Martens in 1919, the violinist Fritz Kreisler emphatically asserts that ‘sincerity’ is essential in violin playing:

“Of course you do not regard technic as the main essential of the concert violinist’s equipment?” I asked him. “Decidedly not. Sincerity and personality are the first main essentials.”⁸¹

Writers on violin playing were particularly keen to denounce virtuosity because they perceived there to be many violinists who had embraced its ills. The well-known violinist Nicolò Paganini (1782–1840) was a target of such complaints, as were more contemporary players such as Otto Sevcik and Jan Kubelik. Early twentieth-century writers associate Paganini’s playing with deception: Achille Rivarde surmises that listeners were ‘dazzled by his [Paganini’s] amazing technical achievements’, and Andreas Moser calls him a ‘wizard’ (*Hexenmeister*), yet wishes to commend

⁸⁰ Hans Wessely, *A Practical Guide to Violin-Playing* (London: Joseph Williams, 1913), 114. Wessely was taught by Jakob Grün, a violinist who studied alongside Joachim under Joseph Böhm. He went on to become professor at the Royal Academy of Music in London in 1889.

⁸¹ Martens also writes that listeners heard in the performances of the violinist Franz Kneisel and his quartet ‘the authority of superb musicianship and sincerity’. Frederick H. Martens, *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1919), 102, 111.

Paganini for also being ‘a spirit-filled musician’ (*ein geistvoller Musiker*).⁸² Sevcik was Kubelik’s teacher, but Frederick Martens reports that Jacques Thibaud considered Kubelik “‘one of his [Sevcik’s] victims.’” Thibaud speaks of Sevcik’s “‘purely soulless and mechanical system’”, which “‘killed real talent’”, by which Thibaud implies Kubelik.⁸³ Carl Flesch produces a similar appraisal of Kubelik’s playing of later years, writing that he was a ‘classic case... of the drawbacks of an unthinking-mechanical replication’ (*ein Schulbeispiel... für die Nachteile gedankenlos-mechanischer Wiederholung*).⁸⁴ However, Flesch argues that the younger Kubelik resisted the counterfeit tricks of the virtuoso, characterising his playing as ‘the renunciation of bogus slovenliness’ (*Abkehr von schwindelhafter Schludrigkeit*). This ersatz manner of playing often took the form of ‘pseudo-brilliant racing’ (*pseudo-brillantem Schleudern*), which Flesch describes in his pedagogical treatise as ‘rushing madly along... in favour of a trick exhibition of super-agility, reminiscent of the circus’. To the contrary, Flesch relates that he benefitted from observing Kubelik’s strict tempi.⁸⁵

What cast a shadow over virtuosity was the Idealist notion of music as consciousness. The same group of words that surround Hegel’s concept of *Innerlichkeit*, as shared subjectivity, appear in early twentieth-century notions of a subjectivist ideal of violin performance: there is ‘life’, ‘spirit’,

⁸² Achille Rivarde, *The Violin and Its Technique as a Means to the Interpretation of Music* (London: Macmillan, 1921), vii. Rivarde was born in the United States and studied in France with Wieniawski. From 1899 on he taught at the Royal College of Music in London.

Andreas Moser, *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild* (Berlin: E. Behr, 1898), 261. Moser’s rescuing of Paganini’s reputation probably results from his idealising of the Italian violin school of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, of which Paganini was a product. Moser writes that contemporary Belgian and French virtuosos have ‘entirely forgotten that healthy and natural method of singing and phrasing which originated in the *bel canto* of the old Italians’ (*jene gesunde, natürliche Art des Singens und Phrasierens, die im bel canto der alten Italiener begründet ist... völlig verlernt haben*). See ‘The Use and Abuse of History’, and chapter 3 for a further discussion. Joseph Joachim and Andreas Moser, *Violinschule in 3 Bänden*, 3 vols, trans. Alfred Moffat (Berlin: N. Simrock, Schott, 1905), 32. All translations adapted from the original.

⁸³ Martens, *Violin Mastery*, 262.

⁸⁴ Flesch, *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Freiburg, Zurich: Atlantis, 1960), 116. Flesch’s use of ‘replication’ (*Wiederholung*) contrasts with the more commonly used *Vortrag*, meaning literally ‘recitation’ to describe interpretive art performance: in doing so, Flesch draws further attention to the mechanical nature of Kubelik’s playing by comparing it to a product of machine-like reproduction. The English edition of the text gives a different rendition of Flesch’s manuscript: Kubelik’s playing was characterised by ‘(I) a defective practising hygiene, by which I mean a tendency to long, slow and mechanical studies, resulting in an atrophy of elemental feeling; (II) a disregard of purely musical thought in favour of a perfect but lifeless, soulless mechanization of the playing movements.’ Carl Flesch, *Memoirs*, ed. Hans Keller and C. F. Flesch, trans. Hans Keller (London: Rockliff, 1957), 176. Since both editions extensively edit Flesch’s manuscript (judging from their differences), it is therefore unclear which is the more unmediated rendition of Flesch’s original text.

⁸⁵ Flesch, *Erinnerungen*, 115. Flesch, *Memoirs*, 175. *Dahinrasen... zugunsten einer Schaustellung trickhafter Überfertigkeit, die an den Zirkus erinnert*. Carl Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928), 2.48. All translations adapted from Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, trans. Frederick H. Martens (New York: Carl Fischer, 1930), 2.53.

and in opposition to the materiality and bodily constitution of virtuosity there is ‘head’ and ‘soul’. These notions reinforce a post-Kantian musical aesthetic, which endowed art, especially music, with a privileged metaphysical status: Wessely includes in his admixture of ideals ‘the higher gifts of art’, and ‘best feeling for art’. By the early twentieth century, however, significant cultural shifts had occurred since the zenith of Idealism. Nietzsche’s thought had a significant impact on early twentieth-century culture, and the success of Wagner and the cult of Bayreuth significantly influenced musical aesthetics. Before further addressing notions of subjectivity in light of these and other developments, however, the chapter takes a more in-depth look at the kinds of ideas surrounding performance practices and theoretical categories which stemmed from the vitality–mechanism binarism.

A Model of Performance Based on the Rejection of Mechanistic Virtuosity, and the Ideal of Vitality

Early twentieth-century writers on violin playing adopt the vitality–mechanism binarism to argue that since tempo, metre and rhythm should be vital, a performance should never be strictly metronomic. Flesch writes that ‘a tempo which proceeds with metronomic exactitude may be termed correct, but for the auditor the whole interpretation becomes somewhat spiritless, dead and mechanical (*Maschinenmäßiges*). Living expression in interpretation arises from the agogic alterations of the rigid time measure’.⁸⁶ Moser similarly advocates flexible tempo on the grounds of vitality: he specifically refers to the performance of a Handel sonata here, but his statement regarding the insufficiency of

⁸⁶ *Ein metronomisch genau verlaufendes Zeitmaß mag korrekt genannt werden, für den Zuhörer jedoch bekommt der ganze Vortrag dadurch etwas Geistloses, Totes, Maschinenmäßiges. Der lebendige Ausdruck im Vortrag entsteht durch die agogischen Verschiebungen des starren Zeitmaßes.* Ibid. 2.45, and 2.50. Flesch credits Hugo Riemann with having provided him with a theoretical support for his notion of agogics, which Flesch defines as ‘the modification of tempo chiefly brought about by little extensions, such as are most characteristically revealed in the tempo rubtato’ (*die hauptsächlich durch kleine Dehnungen bewerkstelligte Modifikation des Tempos, wie sie im tempo rubato am bezeichnendsten zutage tritt*). Ibid. 2.11 and 2.11. Flesch’s definition of agogics provides historical support for Roger Philip’s positing of Riemann’s theory as a basis for small tempo modifications, which Philip observes in early twentieth-century sound recordings. Flesch’s idea of agogics as vitality adds a further cultural basis for this aspect of early twentieth-century musical performance. Philip observes in early twentieth-century recordings a ‘genuine practice of a rubato, which is flexible either side of the basic pulse.’ Robert Philip, *Early Recordings and Musical Style: Changing Tastes in Instrumental Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 47.

playing the notes correctly, on the grounds that this is not a living interpretation, generalises Moser's proceeding comments regarding the Sonata:

No doubt can be felt that a metronomic rendition of the melodies in question, lying over the continuo, would certainly in itself be correct, but with regard to expression the effect would be one of deadly boredom. It is not sufficient if only the word is fulfilled; the spirit of a work of art must be living if its reproduction is to make an impression. If the player is a musician in his inner being, as one might describe it, his feeling for a certain freedom will impel him to push through the constraint exerted by the continuo. He will, as it were, try to thaw its rigidity, and help the life budding in the melodies to blossom forth. In other words, wherever the course of the cantilena suggests it with inner necessity, the performer will slacken the rhythmic structure of the bar so that he will no longer feel the continuo as a burdensome fether, but rather 'freedom's hallowed guard.' Since freedom is not arbitrariness, but rather the inward assimilation of, and conformity to, law, it is hardly necessary to point out with what caution this means of slackening must be used.⁸⁷

Moser's description of the continuo's metronomic bass line as 'rigid' strengthens the alignment of metronomic tempo with mechanism since this is what living, changing, moving life forms are not: rigidity rather suggests a dead organism, or the non-scientific perception of inanimate phenomena as static. To make the contrast between this and the violinist's proper execution of the melody, Moser conceives of the melody as growing plant life ('life budding in the melodies to blossom forth'). In this particularly colourful passage one also notes Moser's neo-Hegelian notion of musical execution as the manifestation of 'inner necessity', as well as his use of the biblical dialectic of Word and Spirit to convey the mutual inter-dependence of score and the act of interpretation. In the New Testament both Word and Spirit are essential for divine revelation to occur: biblical texts are originally God-breathed, yet they also require the continual mediating presence of Spirit for their present-day revelation. The metaphor expediently conveys Moser's notion that although music, as consciousness, is the more foundational element, the scores is the sole locus in which it manifests itself.

⁸⁷ *Darüber dürfte ein Zweifel wohl nicht bestehen, daß eine metronomisch genaue Ausführung der angeführten Melodien über dem Continuo zwar und an für sich richtig sein könnte, nach der Seite des Ausdrucks hin aber die Wirkung tödtlicher Langweile hervorbrächte. Es genügt eben nicht, wenn nur das Wort erfüllt ist, sondern der Geist des Kunstwerkes muß lebendig werden, wenn seine Reproduktion Eindruck machen soll. Ist der Vortragende das, was man einen innerlich musikalischen Menschen nennt, so wird ihn sein Empfinden nach einer gewissen Befreiung von dem Zwange drängen, den der Continuo ausübt; er wird seine Starrheit gleichsam aufzutauen suchen, um dem Leben, das in den Melodien keimt, zur Blüte zu verhelfen. Mit andern Worten: überall da, wo der Verlauf der Kantilene mit innerer Notwendigkeit darauf hinweist, wird der Ausführende das rhythmische Gefüge des Taktes so weit lockern dürfen, daß er den Continuo nicht mehr als lästige Fessel empfindet, sondern als „der Freiheit heil'gen Schutz“ beim künstlerischen Gestalten. Da Freiheit nicht Willkür ist, sondern innerlich verarbeitete Gesetzmäßigkeit, so ist es kaum nötig, zu sagen, wie überaus vorsichtig jenes Lockerungsmittel gebraucht werden muß. Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.16.*

Tempo may momentarily fluctuate, but the basic pulse of a piece must remain the same because writers conceive of it as a single and unified life form. Moser's metaphor of the melody as 'blossom' (*die Blüte*) that 'buds' (*keimen*) suggests the blossoming of a tree or a plant, thus drawing attention, on the one hand, to the transformative component, the budding blossom, and on the other, the relatively static nature of the plant or tree. In a passage on rubato, Flesch, like Moser, argues that 'the irregularity in the distribution of the individual time-beats characteristic of the rubato should express itself chiefly in the treatment of the parts carrying the melody, while the rhythmic structure remains unaltered'. To support his claim, Flesch conceives of the piece of music as a tree:

Liszt explained Chopin's rubato to his pupil Neillissow as follows: "Look at these trees! The wind plays among the leaves, it develops life among them, but the tree remains the same: that is Chopin's rubato." According to Lenz, Chopin himself thus defined it: "The left hand is the conductor, it must neither give way nor waver—do what you will and are able with the right."⁸⁸

Flesch's assigning of the left hand to stricter rhythm and tempo, and melodic freedom to the right, as well as Moser's assigning of the two to the continuo and violinist respectively, concords with Timothy Day's observation of this trait in early twentieth-century sound recordings.⁸⁹

⁸⁸ *Das Rubato charakterisierende Unregelmäßigkeit in der Verteilung der einzelnen Takteinheiten sich hauptsächlich in der Behandlung der melodieführenden Stimmen äußern soll, während die rhythmische Struktur unverändert bleibt. Liszt erklärte seinem Schüler Neillissow das Chopinsche Rubato in folgender Weise: „Sehen Sie diese Bäume! Der Wind spielt in den Blättern, entwickelt unter ihnen Leben; der Baum bleibt derselbe; das ist Chopinsches Rubato.“ Nach Lenz hat Chopin selbst es folgendermaßen definiert: „Die Linke, die ist der Kapellmeister, die darf nicht weichen, nicht wanken – macht mit der rechten Hand, was Ihr wollt und vermögt.“ Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.51. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.57.*

⁸⁹ Day notes the 'lack of coordination between singer and accompaniment' in early recordings of singers, as well as 'similar dislocations in the performance of Chopin's Nocturne in D flat op. 27 no.2 recorded by Vladimir de Pachmann in 1925.' Furthermore, Day notes tempo deviations in the melodic line: 'there are slight accelerations through unimportant or ornamental melody notes and stresses, tenutos on strong beats or on important melody notes.' Timothy Day, *A Century of Recorded Music: Listening to Musical History* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 2000), 144. Day's study shows that flexible tempo is a more general issue in nineteenth- and twentieth-century performance practice. John McEwen's classic study of tempo from the period also confirms the importance of flexibility as both idea and practice in the early twentieth century (John McEwen, *Tempo rubato; or, Time-variation in musical performance* (London: Oxford University Press, 1928)).

Another longstanding metaphor for flexible tempo is *Elastischer Takt*, or 'elastic time', and indeed, the English musicologist J. A. Fuller-Maitland wrote of Joachim in 1901 that 'elasticity' is the word which best expresses the effect of his delivery of some characteristic themes', which Fuller-Maitland describes as 'slight modifications of the strict metronomic value of the notes'. In Fuller-Maitland's case, at least, it is the more specific notion of elastic materials' dual ability to bend and return to their original shape which makes the metaphor apt to describe Joachim's tempo deviations: he describes the approach to tempo as 'a constant and perfect restoration of balance between pressure and resistance taking place, as an indiarubber ball resumes its original shape after being pressed'. One may thus observe the points of affinity between the elastic and organic metaphors of flexible tempo: the ability to retain original shape corresponds to the immovable tree—both

The organicist model of uniform tempo predominates in Flesch's complex of ideas to the extent that he advises against following score markings indicating a halting of the pulse. Flesch recommends that caesuras be merely thought over an actual halting of the pulse:

Yet these caesuras should not always be noticeable in a 'time' sense—that is, in the form of an interruption (//)—since in that case a dismemberment of the whole would be unavoidable. In the case of certain caesuras a mere 'disembarking' (*Absetzen*), of which the player alone is conscious, one imperceptible to the auditor, hence one that is merely thought (/), will suffice.⁹⁰

This is an example of a performative practice arising from the notion of fidelity to the score as a union of minds, over literal execution. The idea that the loss of the basic pulse is a mechanistic trait is further strengthened by Flesch's alignment of it with deceptive virtuosity (see above).

Flesch's anxiety over rushed tempo relates to his and others' denigration of 'runs', as a typically virtuosic trait, on the basis that these are largely enacted by the left hand. Flesch believes that for 'speeding up' (*Hetzen*) the 'left hand is always the guilty part. It is the left hand which gives the impulse to race. The bow merely runs after it.'⁹¹ It is not obvious why the fingering and not the bowing should bring about the downfall of vitalist performance: one explanation is that writers may have felt the extremities to be quite some distance from the inner origins of music. Furthermore, the relative ease with which the violinist is able to lay down and remove fingers in any given position may have given rise to the notion that the action was liable to occur beyond the violinist's centralised agency. An ostentatious display of left hand dexterity in much of the virtuosic repertoire is likely to have tarnished the left hand's reputation for violinists wishing to distance themselves from the nineteenth-century bravura tradition: an example of such is a passage from Paganini's *Moto Perpetuo* (op.11):

represent the notion of a fixed tempo or metre—while elasticity corresponds to the blossoming buds or branches blowing in the wind, as the element of deviation. J. A. Fuller-Maitland, *Joseph Joachim* (London: The Bodley Head, 1905), 28.

⁹⁰ *Doch dürfen dieser Zäsuren nicht immer zeitlich – also in Form einer Unterbrechung (//) – wahrnehmbar sein, sonst wäre eine Zerstückelung des Ganzen unvermeidlich. Für gewisse Zäsuren genügt ein bloß dem Spieler bewußtes, nicht dem Hörer bemerkbares, also ein nur gedachtes Absetzen (/).* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.14. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.16.

⁹¹ *Stets die linke Hand der schuldige Teil ist. Sie ist es, die den Anstoß zum Rennen gibt. Der Bogen läuft ihr nur nach.* Ibid. 2.49 and 2.55.

Example 1:⁹²

VIOLINO PRINCIPALE. N. Paganini, Op.11.

Allegro vivace.
staccato

dolce

Having heard their forebearers play such music, as well as having played it themselves, violinists forged a trenchant connection between their perception of the left hand and virtuosity.⁹³

Prejudices toward the left hand explain why the Polish violinist Bronisław Huberman (1882–1947) regards it necessary to advise subordinating runs to ‘the higher purpose of the musical expression’:

A run which singularly serves as a means to an end, i.e. for the higher purposes of musical expression, requires much subtler control than the same run, as an end in itself, would require. [When playing] a run that serves as a means to this end, namely the higher purpose of musical expression... the spirit of the player must nevertheless bring about the free joining together of each note of the run, and at great speed: for example, [this will incorporate] hardly perceptible stresses of the thematic notes, if the melody is embellished or a kind of variation, or individual accents, crescendi etc., according to the requirements of the melodic or harmonic expression.⁹⁴

⁹² Nicolo Paganini, *Moto Perpetuo: Concert-Allegro für Violine mit Pianofortebegleitung*, for Violin and Piano, Op. 11, ed. Ferdinand David (Leipzig, Breitkopf und Härtel, n.d.), bars 1–8.

⁹³ The evidence from the literature shows that violinists during the period played much of the virtuosic repertoire. Flesch makes numerous references in his *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* to violinists’ having played virtuosic repertoire in the early twentieth century. For example, the violinist Karl Klingler asked Flesch in 1907 to play Paganini’s seventeenth violin study (Flesch, *Memoirs*, 82), and Flesch attests to his having played Paganini’s Concerto in D Major frequently in the years straddling the turn of the twentieth century (Ibid. 115, 118, 131, 135, 160, 200, 225). In 1911, the Belgian violinist Eugène Ysaÿe performed a concerto by Vieuxtemps (Ibid. 81). In his *Violin Works and their Interpretation*, Auer sees it fit to provide sections on virtuosic pieces alongside more high canonical ones: included is Paganini’s D Major Concerto, B Minor Concerto and the Caprices, three concertos by Vieuxtemps, two concertos by Wieniawski and *Zigeunerweisen* by Pablo de Sarasate.

⁹⁴ *Ein Lauf, der nur als Mittel zum Zweck, nämlich zum höheren Zwecke des musikalischen Ausdrucks dient... muß der Geist des Spielers auch in der größten Geschwindigkeit sich noch immer die freie Verfügung über jedes Tönchen des Laufes vorbehalten, z. B. kaum wahrnehmbare Betonung der thematischen Noten, wenn es sich um Variationen oder Fiorituren handelt, oder einzelne Akzente, Crescendi usw., je nach den Geboten des melodischen oder harmonischen Ausdrucks.* Bronislaw Huberman, *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* (Leipzig, Vienna: Hugo Heller, 1912), 29. Huberman undertook light periods of training (among others, with Joachim’s assistant, Markees) before winning acclaim at an early age. Through his teenage years he courted fame across Europe, performing at Adelina Patti’s farewell concert and gaining Johannes Brahms’s approval with his

What disciplines the left hand's recklessness for Huberman is the music, now cast as the latter of the spirit-word dialectic, the score. The mainstays of score-based analysis, as developed in the late nineteenth century, i.e. harmonic developments and treatment of themes, save the left hand from dragging the interpretation down to the level of unwanted virtuosity.

In discursively defining their heritage of virtuosos and a virtuosic repertoire, it was inevitable that writers would single out the use of pizzicato and harmonics, mainstays of violin showpieces, as evidence of mechanistic virtuosity. Examples from Paganini's *Violin Concerto No.2 in B Minor* (op.7) demonstrates the extensive use of both left and right hand pizzicato, as well as natural and 'artificial' harmonics (created by stopping the string with a finger of the left hand and touching the string lightly with another finger to create a harmonic):

Example 2.⁹⁵



performance of the composer's *Violin Concerto*. In 1903 Huberman was invited to play the Guarneri violin that Paganini once owned.

⁹⁵ Paganini, Nicolo, *Concerto No.2 in B Minor*, op.7, for violin and reduced piano accompaniment, ed. August Wilhelmj (Mainz: Schott, n.d.). First excerpt occurs 28 bars before the end of the 3rd movement. Second excerpt occurs 29 bars before the end of the 1st movement.



Huberman incorporates pizzicato and harmonics into his denigration of virtuosity:

I cannot resist an inward smile... when I see how the public sometimes falls on the simplest hazards of effect (*Effektfallen*)... when also mostly with ephemeral success sand is strewn in the eyes. To these... belongs, for example, the manipulation with *pizzicati* and harmonics (*flageolets*).⁹⁶

In Martens's interview with the Dutch violinist Leon Sametini there is an extended section on natural and artificial harmonics, in which after relating how such harmonics are technically achieved, Sametini warns against relying solely on technique to produce harmonics, which is akin to the illusion of the magic show:

"Students should never get the idea that you press down the string as you press a button and – presto – the magic harmonics appear!"

And:

"Of course, harmonics are only a detail of the complete mastery of the violin; but mastery of all details leads to mastery of the whole."⁹⁷

Early twentieth-century writings surrounding violin playing reflect a process of separation between high and low models of musical performance, and are themselves implicit in furthering it. The varied programmes of early twentieth-century violinists and the disputed status of the term 'virtuoso' suggest that the boundaries between high and low musical performance were not clearly defined in this period, which supports the argument that the purpose of publications surrounding violin playing was to bolster a culture of high art performance and purify it of unwanted elements. The association of undesirable aspects of violin playing with the term 'virtuoso', however, is not

⁹⁶ *Eines inneren Lächelns kann ich mich... nicht erwehren, wenn ich sehe, wie das Publikum manchmal auf die einfachsten Effektfallen hereinfällt... wenn auch meistens mit ephemeren Erfolg Sand in die Augen gestreut wird. Zu den... Effekten gehören z. B. die Manipulationen mit Pizzicatti und flageolets.* Huberman, *Werkstatt*, 28–29.

⁹⁷ Martens, *Violin Mastery*, 208.

consistent. “The old days of virtuoso ‘tricks’ have passed—I should like to hope forever”, says Maud Powell to Frederick Martens, and Franz Kneisel relates that “as I see it, ‘virtuoso’ is a kind of flattering title, no more”, and he prefers the term “‘tone-artist’”.⁹⁸ Yet Mischa Elman praises Leopold Auer as “a great virtuoso player” and there seems to be a sense that virtuosity occupies a limited but valid place in violin playing. Jacques Thibaud calls it “a field” and Eddy Brown speaks of “solos of the virtuoso type”, but this was not to be mixed with performances of the high canonical repertoire—Tivadar Nachéz relates that Sarasate’s “Bach playing was excruciating – he played Bach sonatas as though they were virtuoso pieces.”⁹⁹ There is also an attempt to redefine the word in terms of the ideology of high art performance: Fritz Kreisler has the virtuoso aspire to organic wholeness (“the modern *virtuoso*, the true concert artist, is not worthy of the title unless his art is the outcome of a completely unified nature”), as does Adolfo Betti when speaking of the democratic ideal of the modern-day string quartet, which replaced the older privileging of the first violinist above the other three players (“now the quartet as a whole has established itself in the *virtuoso* field—using the word *virtuoso* in its best sense”).¹⁰⁰ The attraction of gleaning the performing secrets of the ‘virtuoso’ presented by Huberman’s 1912 book title (*Auf der Werkstatt des Virtuosen*) demonstrates that the word still held a positive appeal for the wider public. The significations of the term ‘virtuoso’ in the early twentieth century are thus shifting and complex: sometimes writers puritanically eschew virtuosity, attempting to distance themselves from lesser performers, and at other times they adopt a more disinterested tone, in their observing a performance culture with shifting segregations.

These findings support earlier scholarly observations that nineteenth- and early twentieth-century writers place virtuosity in opposition to fidelity to the musical work, but they do not support the view that expressivity is in opposition to *Werktreue*. In his *Nineteenth-Century Music*, Carl Dahlhaus observes a distinction between virtuosity and interpretation in nineteenth-century performance, and notes the denigration of virtuosity in favour of fidelity to the musical work by performers such as the violinist Joseph Joachim. In her *The Quest for Voice: Music, Politics and the*

⁹⁸ Ibid. 189, 112.

⁹⁹ Ibid. 49, 181, 81, 172.

¹⁰⁰ Ibid. 103, 181.

Limits of Philosophy, Lydia Goehr has argued that expressivity is in opposition to fidelity to the musical work, yet the above evidence shows that expressivity, if it be taken to mean the input of self into performance, is in fact synonymous with the musical work.

Notions of Self: An Active or Passive Vitality?

Moser, to a greater extent than other writers, incorporates notions of spirit (*Geist*) into his model of performance. Moser had attended Philipp Spitta's lectures, which is where he may have absorbed some of Spitta's neo-Kantian spiritualism (see chapter 1). That Moser opens his long essay 'On Interpretation' (*Vom Vortrag*) in the third volume of his *Violinschule* with the statement 'for the performance of a musical composition in the spirit of its creator, two conditions must necessarily be fulfilled' (*der Vortrag einer musikalischen Komposition im Geist ihres Schöpfers ist an die Erfüllung zweier Bedingungen geknüpft*) suggests that the act of performing in another's spirit is the cornerstone of Moser's model of performance. Towards the end of his essay Moser discusses what he perceives as the 'decline of spiritual playing in modern France' (*geistigen Verfall des Violinspiels in modernen Frankreich*), in which violinists 'copied' (*abgucken*) the 'outward qualities' (*Äuserlichkeiten*) of Paganini's playing but did not 'sense his spirit' (*seines Geistes... verspüren*).¹⁰¹ In his biography of Joachim, Moser relates that whereas others only played the Concerto with 'correctness (*Korrektheit*), Joachim 'pushed with his spiritual concentration' (*drang... in seinen geistigen Gehalt*).¹⁰²

Spitta's spiritualism, as well as Russian neo-Idealism, are two likely sources for Auer's inclusion of Idealist ideas in his writings. That Auer had read Spitta's works is suggested by his inclusion of an extended passage from Spitta's seminal Bach biography of 1873 into his *Violin Works and Their Interpretation*.¹⁰³ This passage is an appraisal of Bach's Chaconne in D Minor for Solo

¹⁰¹ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.5, 3.33.

¹⁰² Moser, *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild*, 269.

¹⁰³ Auer, *Violin Works and their Interpretation* (New York: Carl Fischer, 1925), 21–22.

Violin, which Spitta hails as a ‘a triumph of spirit over matter’.¹⁰⁴ Auer believes violin tone to be spiritual in origin, and pits it in opposition to the material dimensions of performance: tone, Auer writes in his pedagogical treatise, is ‘not primarily a matter of hair on the [bow] stick’, but originates in the player’s ‘intelligence’ and ‘mental and spiritual concentration’.¹⁰⁵ Auer wrote *Violin Playing as I Teach It* only four years after he had moved to the United States from Russia. He had spent fifty years living in St Petersburg, where he may have come into contact with Russian neo-Idealism, a philosophical movement that revived earlier strains of German Idealism. Vladimir Soloviev (1853–1900), a significant writer in the movement, held that the divine realm was more concrete than the natural world, and that it sustained the natural world.¹⁰⁶ This idea may have provided Auer with his notion of ‘Nature the divine’:

True inspiration – the inspiration of a Bach or Beethoven – harks back to Nature the divine, to that Nature which, according to a great writer, “is the Art of God.” And this inspiration merely lies dormant in the printed page until we make it live and glow and radiate in tone.¹⁰⁷

The notion that spirit is able to overcome the boundaries of multiple bodies leads to the uniting of agents in the performance network. Mary Hunter has already demonstrated that writings on performance in the late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries incorporate the Romantic ideal of art as a portal for spiritual transcendence, in which the subjectivities of composer, performer and listener collapse into each other. Hunter emphasises, however, that this idea did not obliterate subjectivities, but dynamically mediated them, and contests the view that the work concept obscured agency, temporality and bodies, a view advanced by Lydia Goehr in her *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works*.¹⁰⁸ Passages in Moser’s essay point towards the Hegelian ideal of *Geist*, as a harmonious form of collective subjectivity. In his introduction to an edited violin part of Beethoven’s Violin Concerto Moser speaks of the ‘shared glory’ of the listener’s spirit which is brought into being by the performer’s ‘spiritful’ (*geistvoll*) representation:

¹⁰⁴ Philipp Spitta, *Johann Sebastian Bach*, 2 vols (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1873–1880), 2.705. Cited in Beatrix Borchard, *Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2005), 504.

¹⁰⁵ Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921), 51–52.

¹⁰⁶ David Bakhurst, ‘Idealism in Russia’ in Thomas Baldwin, ed., *The Cambridge History of Philosophy 1870–1945* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 60–66.

¹⁰⁷ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 160.

¹⁰⁸ Mary Hunter, ‘“To Play as if from the Soul of the Composer”: The Idea of the Performer in Early Romantic Aesthetics’, *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 58/2 (2005), 357–398.

Merrily felt and spiritedly (*geistvoll*) represented, this delicious piece releases also in the listener a feeling of glad content, and ignites the shared glory of his spirit (*Geist*).¹⁰⁹

In addition, with reference to the entry of the second theme in the solo part, Moser recommends that ‘the greater the mildness and quietness of expression with which the melody is played, the more devotional will be the atmosphere (*Stimmung*) produced’.¹¹⁰ One can translate *Stimmung* as ‘mood’ or ‘atmosphere’ but with the word’s additional meaning of musical ‘tuning’ or ‘temperament’, one might rather translate the word, as it is used here, as ‘harmonious mood’. Moser’s further description of this mood as ‘devotional’, further strengthens this meaning, since devotion often takes place in the context of religious worship that is communal. Indeed, notions of performance in the nineteenth century often took metaphors of Christian or Jewish acts of worship. Adolf Weismann, for example, likened Joachim to a priest, the audience to a congregation of believers, and the concert hall to a ‘temple of art’ in his 1911 history of musical life in Berlin:

A temple of art had arisen, and the believers flocked in droves to hear from the priest’s mouth the new teachings. I am speaking of the Joachim quartet evenings in the *Singakademie*.¹¹¹

A further idea influencing Moser’s emphasis on a harmonious spiritual community is the cultural ideal of fraternity. It is significant that Moser is speaking of Beethoven’s Violin Concerto in the above quote: the figure of Beethoven, as the champion of Schiller’s ideal of fraternity in his musical setting of *Ode to Joy*, was integral to the rise of German nationalism in the latter half of the nineteenth century.

Moser’s language contains something of the visions for social unity, more prominent earlier in the nineteenth century, which contrast with more pessimistic accounts of vitality’s outworkings that came later in the century. The spread of evolutionary theories in the latter half of the nineteenth century gave greater credence to a biological over a spiritual account of existence, and to the idea that

¹⁰⁹ *Fröhlich empfunden und geistvoll dargestellt, wird dann das köstliche Stück auch im Zuhörer frohsinniges Behagen auslösen und im Mitgenießen seinen Geist entzünden.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.184.

¹¹⁰ *Je milder und ruhiger im Ausdruck man diese Melodie spielt, eine um so andächtigere Stimmung wird sie erzeugen.* Ibid. 3.182.

¹¹¹ *Ein Tempel der Kunst war entstanden, und in hellen Scharen strömten die Gläubigen hin, um aus Munde eines Priesters die neue Lehre zu vernehmen. Ich spreche von den Joachimschen Quartettabenden in der Singakademie.* Adolf Weismann, *Berlin als Musikstadt. Geschichte der Oper und des Konzerts von 1740 bis 1911* (Berlin, Leipzig: Schuster & Löffler, 1911), 311. Cited in Beatrix Borchard, *Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2005), 522.

life was a selfish and unjust struggle for survival. The metaphor of shared spirit was a convenient metaphor for an earlier social and political optimism. Whereas Hegel conceived of the collective *Geist* of nations or ages, however, Nietzsche's idea of vitality was more of a biological entity, or rather a dynamic, that was enacted by the strong. Intersubjective interaction in the context of the performance network is, for Flesch, a question of unification of 'beings' (*Wesens*): this is not so much a readily achieved state, however, as a process that the performer actively brings about:

The reproductive artist... is not merely the middleman between the creative composer and the listener who enjoys. He also posits (*stellen*), in this respect, a synthesis of the natures (*Wesens*) of both, as he combines the neo-creation of the note-symbols in tone, the transformation of the dead letter into living feeling, with his own acoustic perception.¹¹²

The idea of vitality here does not operate in the same way that spirit does in Moser's writings; it is a singular entity which operates on its dualistic opposite ('the transformation of the dead letter into living feeling'). Granted, it is this which brings about the synthesis of the composer's and listener's beings, but the performer's wielding of vitality to bring about this synthesis is an action, not a state of being; *stellen* can mean to place, stand, or set something, which suggests that the synthesis itself has already happened, but nevertheless, the act is a dynamic one, a 'transformation' (*Umwandlung*). Furthermore, the aligning of vitality with the original act of creation by the composer (*Neuschöpfung*) grants further dynamism to the performer's wielding of vitality. Flesch's comment is similar to Auer's notion that the composer's inspiration is actively re-animated through the violinist's producing of tone (see above).

Even in Moser's spiritualism, however, the performer does not lose his monopoly over subjectivity. There are no statements like Hans von Bülow's remarks on Joachim in 1853, for example, in which Bülow states 'it was not Joachim who played Beethoven and Bach yesterday, Beethoven himself played!'¹¹³ Although Moser's description of the performer as 'a full representative' (*ein Bevollmächtigter*) draws attention to the extent to which the performer fully

¹¹² *Der reproduktive Künstler ist... nicht bloß der Mittelsmann zwischen schaffendem Komponisten und genießendem Hörer, er stellt auch insofern eine Synthese des Wesens beider dar, als er die Neuschöpfung des Notensymbols in Klang, die Umwandlung des toten Buchstabens in lebensvolle Empfindung mit eigener akustischer Wahrnehmung verbindet.* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.1. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.1.

¹¹³ Quoted in Moser, *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild*, 140.

represents the composer, so that the composer's intentions (*Intentionen*) 'enunciate themselves in his representation as if from his own experience' (*sich in seiner Darstellung wie ein Selbsterlebnis aussprechen*), the usual connotation of *Mächtiger* as a business or legal representative conveys the sense of responsibility inherent in the performer's task.¹¹⁴ Furthermore, Moser's performer is the active executor of performance, and does not have to wait to be filled suddenly or unexpectedly by the person of the composer.

Flesch affirms that the performer always takes an active role in performance in a section on 'The Human Personality' (*Die Menschliche Persönlichkeit*), in which Flesch takes the original approach of classifying personality types according to the four medieval humours, i.e. choleric, sanguine, melancholic and phlegmatic. These, Flesch writes, 'can be divided into only two groups... the *active* and *passive* temperaments, which... cultivate the incentive for an active or a passive mode of playing' (*die aktiven und die passiven Temperamente, die... wieder die Veranlassung für eine aktive oder passive Spielweise bilden*). Whereas active players 'have a powerful inner urge which bids them achieve their task with an enthusiasm independent of the object they are to recreate [the musical work]', 'passive types, however, lacking this powerful impulse, cannot stand on their own, and [are] driven without will of their own on the waves of the creator's emotion, so that at best they land in the tepid waters of a musically correct yet impersonal reproduction'.¹¹⁵ Flesch would not call into question the principle of fidelity to the composer's wishes, but he regards it essential that the performer take control of his own decisions in performance: performance is a 'neocreation', a reconstructing from the bottom level up of a composition, not small-scale embodied responses to successive individual signs presented by the score.

There are instances in which Flesch downplays the performer's intentionality, but the origins of this idea in an emerging culture of psychoanalysis suggests that the basis for Flesch's idea is the

¹¹⁴ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.5.

¹¹⁵ *Besitzen einen starken inneren Antrieb, der sie ihre Aufgabe mit einer vom nachzuschaffenden Objekt unabhängigen Begeisterung vollbringen heißt... Die Passiven, entbehren hingegen des kraftvollen inneren Antriebes, lassen sich nicht von den eigenen, sondern von des Schöpfers Gefühlswogen willenlos treiben, um bestenfalls in den lauen Wässern einer musikalisch korrekten, jedoch unpersönlichen Wiedergabe zu landen.* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.61–62. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.69.

idea of the unconscious mind of the performer himself, and not the idea of a passive recipient of the composer's agency. Flesch warns against holding fermatas too long because 'they summon forth the annoying expression of a preconceived intention' (*rufen den verstimmenden Eindruck einer vorgefaßten Absicht hervor*), and the inclusion of a written sign to indicate an appropriate agogic accent on the highest note of a melody would risk 'an intentional underlining whereby the spontaneity of the interpretation would suffer' (*eines absichtlichen Unterstreichens... wodurch die Unmittelbarkeit einer Wiedergabe leiden würde*).¹¹⁶ This downplaying of consciously willed actions resulted from the spread of the idea of the unconscious mind. For a society which had been used to receiving treatments for psycho-somatic disorders, such as nervous malfunctions, this was a step in a new direction, and one of which Flesch was in favour. Flesch demonstrates his support of proposed 'psychic' (*seelische*) cures in his section on 'Purely Psychic Hindrances' (*Rein Seelische Hemmungen*), in which Flesch confronts the problem of stage fright:

We know that this nervous malady has hitherto defied every effort to relieve or cure it. Thus far, no more has been attempted than to oppose its consequences (at times even by the use of internally taken medicines depressing the nerve action as a whole), instead of trying to eliminate the cause, that is to say, to strengthen a wavering self confidence.¹¹⁷

As a remedy Flesch embraces the French psychologist Emile Coué's technique of 'autosuggestion'.

The idea of the psyche (*das Unbewusste*) originates in earlier metaphysical notions of mind and spirit, however, and thus Flesch's notion of performance as the unconscious workings of the psyche *does* suggest a certain passivity. Scholars have argued for the basis of Freudian notions of the mind in earlier metaphysical notions of self in German philosophy: therefore it would not be too far-fetched to say that mind/self operates *through* a body. It is not possible to make a firm distinction between earlier metaphysical notions of a disembodied subjective principle, and Freud's concept of the unconscious (*das Unbewusste*) as physical and embodied. Hegel makes no distinction between spirit and mind in his concept of *Geist*, and, as Günter Götde has argued, an important influence on

¹¹⁶ Ibid. 2.20, 2.52 and 2.21, 2.59.

¹¹⁷ *Wir wissen, daß dies nervöse Übel bisher allen Versuchen einer Linderung oder gar Heilung getrotzt hat. Man hat sich bisher damit begnügt, seine Folgen zu bekämpfen (zuweilen selbst durch innerliche, die gesamte Nerventätigkeit herabsetzende Medikamente), statt zu versuchen, die Ursache auszuschalten, d.h. das wankende Selbstvertrauen zu kräftigen.* Ibid. 2.93 and 2.104.

Freud's thought is Schopenhauer's notion of will and Nietzsche's concept of life/will to power, both of which are foundational and universal in dimension. What Freud gained from Schopenhauer's and Nietzsche's models was the idea of the will as dangerous and destructive. For Götter this notion of the will defines one of three philosophical traditions of thinking about the unconscious, which also incorporates Schelling's definition of the will as 'impulse', 'drive' and 'desire'. In conjunction with the focus on the fantastic and irrational nature of the unconscious, found in the work of philosophers such as Hamann, Herder and Goethe, Freud developed significant notions of the unconscious's erotic and violent desires.¹¹⁸ Chapter 5 focuses further on writers' notions of active and passive agents in the performance network by looking at metaphors of erotic and physical conquest and surrender.

The rest of this chapter begins to show how violinists use notions of consciousness to construct authoritative models of the ideal violinist. The central idea of the emerging profession of psychoanalysis was not only that a person is not in control of his or her unconscious, but that they would consult an expert on the unconscious to understand it and take control of it for them. Notions of consciousness thus operate through a hierarchy of authorities: Flesch came to regard himself as a kind of psychiatric specialist in matters concerning violin playing. The rest of this chapter considers the powerful rhetoric of Nietzsche and Wagner in order to understand how writers act, in their capacities as authorities on violin playing, to construct a model of performance. It will demonstrate how notions of self take on a particularly dynamic character as writers employ them to construct powerful arguments.

The Violinist as Elite Self: Wagnerian and Nietzschean Notions of Pre-Eminent Artistry

This section further addresses the significance of a central point made in the previous section, namely that writers ascribe to violinists an active and original vitality. It surveys the writings of Richard

¹¹⁸ The idea of the unconscious as irrational constitutes Götter's second philosophical tradition of thinking about the unconscious. This developed out of the Enlightenment notion of the conscious unconscious, which constitutes Götter's first tradition. Günter Götter, 'Freud and Nineteenth-Century Philosophical Sources', in Angus Nicholls and Martin Liebscher, eds, *Thinking the Unconscious: Nineteenth-Century German Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 261–286, 262–263.

Wagner and Friedrich Nietzsche in order to gain a deeper understanding of this particular notion of vitality. The section goes on to show that Wagner's and Nietzsche's moulding and executing of vitalistic ideas, and the imitating of these techniques in writings on violin playing, prompt a re-evaluation of the pedagogical and biographical genres of violin playing, and help to understand the wider import of the discourse, taken as a whole, in this period.

Nietzsche's thought received a widespread cultural reception in the early twentieth century, and his ideas were particularly appealing to artistic and literary figures. Ernst Behler has demonstrated Nietzsche's widespread reception across Europe and the United States from the 1890s on. Behler notes an 1888 edition of *The Gay Science* which includes an extensive list of publishers of multiple European nationalities. Russian dissidents produced a pre-revolutionary 'Nietzschean Marxism' and English intellectuals, such as George Bernard Shaw, saw in Nietzsche a source of subversion to stifling Victorian morality. In France and Germany, Nietzsche's thought was critiqued by authors such as André Gide and Thomas Mann.¹¹⁹ 'Art is the great stimulus to life', Nietzsche wrote, and a recurring theme in his works is art's ability to reverse the depleting effects of scientific knowledge, or 'truth' on modern culture.¹²⁰ Erich Heller suggests that Nietzsche's aphorism, collected posthumously in *The Will to Power*, that 'we possess art lest we perish of the truth' is 'perhaps... meant as Nietzsche's last word concerning a problem which – apropos his rereading... of his youthful *Birth of Tragedy*... [is] the earliest which compellingly demanded his serious attention'.¹²¹ Aaron Ridley has addressed the issue of Nietzsche's views on art in each of Nietzsche's major works, and concludes that one can locate the wider significance of Nietzsche's views in their early twentieth-century reception in art, rather than philosophy:

If Nietzsche's thoughts about art can be said to have left a legacy behind them, it has not been to philosophical aesthetics. It has, rather, been to two areas much more central to his own concerns: to art itself, and to Wagner criticism. No other philosopher, so far as I am aware, has been translated into music by composers of the calibre of Mahler, Delius and Richard Strauss, for instance, nor have many had so clear an influence upon writers and poets of the

¹¹⁹ Ernst Behler, 'Nietzsche in the Twentieth Century', in Bernd Magnus and Kathleen M. Higgins, eds, *The Cambridge Companion to Nietzsche* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 281–322.

¹²⁰ Friedrich Nietzsche, *Twilight of the Idols*, trans. R. J. Hollingdale (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1968), 24.

¹²¹ Erich Heller, *The Importance of Nietzsche: Ten Essays* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988), 158.

stature of D. H. Lawrence, Rilke, Yeats and Thomas Mann, to name but a few. Nietzsche's, thought has spoken to artists, it seems, in a peculiarly direct voice.'¹²²

In contrast to the systematic philosophies of Kant and Hegel, and their reliance on fixed laws drawn from geometry, mathematics and Newtonian physics, Nietzsche's philosophical project turned to issues of temporality, which incorporated narratives of time such as decadence, and the dynamic interplay of dialectical opposites. Whereas Hegel posited a future synthesis of *Geist*, as God and humanity's shared spirit, with the material realm, Nietzsche resisted such finalities, instead focusing on the dynamic course of his partially related notions of life and will to power. Nietzsche's work runs parallel to an increasing penchant in wider German culture for historicism.

As Andrew Bowie has argued, Nietzsche's notions of life/will to power essentialise not according to eschatological resolutions, as with Hegel, but to supposed origins: Bowie draws attention to Nietzsche's notion in *The Birth of Tragedy* (1872) of a primal, Dionysian force, which is prior to ethical consideration. The idea supports Nietzsche's hope for the resurgence of a 'splendid, internally healthy, age-old power'.¹²³ Bowie continues, 'unlike Schlegel and the Idealists, who wished to synthesise a new mythology out of cosmopolitan diversity, Nietzsche at this time sees the answer in terms of a *re-birth of German myth*'. Bowie remarks that 'given his [Nietzsche's] thoughts on the need for the special producers of art to be sustained by the suffering of the masses, this is highly politically suspect' (Bowie is here referring to Nietzsche's concept of the strong, who gain their strength from exploiting the weak).¹²⁴ The overarching argument of Bowie's book is that although *Geist* is an operative concept in earlier Romantic literature, earlier writers in fact conceive of subjectivities operating *within* a shared *Geist*, these subjectivities being multiple, embodied, and changeable. In contrast, Nietzsche's notion of life/will to power is singular, foundational, homogenizing, and predetermines its embodied subjects.

¹²² Aaron Ridley, *Routledge Philosophy Guidebook to Nietzsche on Art* (New York, London: Routledge, 2007), 141–142.

¹²³ Friedrich Nietzsche, *Sämtliche Werke. Kritische Studienausgabe in 15 Bänden*, ed. Giorgio Colli andazzino Montinari (Munich: Deutscher Taschenbuch, Mouton de Gruyter, 1980), 146. Cited in Andrew Bowie, *Aesthetics and Subjectivity from Kant to Nietzsche* (Manchester, New York: Manchester University Press, 1990), 225.

¹²⁴ Bowie, *Aesthetics and Subjectivity*, 225.

Despite his resistance to philosophical system building, Nietzsche's philosophy was markedly essentialist. Nietzsche's legacy for wider late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century culture, especially for notions of art, was a strengthening of a 'philosophy of origins'. Life, or the will to power, was prior, and superior, to any further attempts to mitigate it through ethics, aesthetic autonomy, or modification through political negotiation. As Bowie writes, Nietzsche's argument 'precludes any consideration of aesthetic autonomy by reducing aesthetics to the 'intoxication' of the creative artist... It also dismisses the aesthetics of reception as 'wench-aesthetics', because it involves a passive relation to the object'.¹²⁵ He further notes the arbitrariness and circularity of a theory of art that singularly reduces everything to the will to power. Yet, for the artist who lacked an external source of meaning, once provided by the church and the courts, it was the robustness of Nietzsche's philosophical arguments that no doubt made it an appealing artistic creed. Art could continue to possess relevance for an increasingly fragmented society if, as Nietzsche claimed, it needed no external contextualisation, but simply gushed forth from primal and all-consuming life.

The persuasiveness of Nietzsche's notion of will to power is made manifest in Wagner's essay of 1869, *Über das Dirigieren*. The central problem that Wagner addresses in this essay is the decline in the standard of playing in German orchestras. As a remedy Wagner suggests that German conductors and performers rediscover the true 'melos' of music. The connotation of 'melody' (*Melodie*) in this word is a theme which the next chapter takes up more fully. The only other reference point which German readers might have found for this term would have been its appearance as the name of a Greek island in Classical Greek texts, which suggests that Wagner hoped that the term would acquire a certain classical authority. However, this is just one of several ways in which Wagner fashions melos into an entity resembling Nietzsche's life/will to power, and constituting the cornerstone of all music making.

Melos, overall, is an idea bearing little resemblance to the notion of melody as a chronological succession of pitches. Wagner had good reason to use a word which clearly alluded to *Melodie* but was distinct from it: although 'melos' does incorporate the idea of melody as an

¹²⁵ Ibid. 225, 251.

arrangement of pitches it also transcends this more theoretical and pragmatic definition to include a wider range of musical components. Wagner relates that he first heard melos in a performance that he attended in Paris in his younger days:

Ultimately, I received the most thorough lesson, however, from the so-called ‘Conservatoire Orchestra’ in Paris in 1839, when I heard the... Ninth Symphony played. The scales fell from my eyes... and I instantly understood what the secret of the successful solution to the challenge comprised of. The orchestra had learned to look for Beethoven’s melody in every bar.¹²⁶

By ‘melody’ Wagner implies melos: as he relates here, the conductor of the Orchestra, François-Antoine Habeneck, found the correct tempo by finding the melos of the music:

Old Habeneck... found the right tempo by persistently focusing the unwavering efforts of his orchestra on it, in order to capture the melos of the symphony.¹²⁷

Melos, then, arose in this instance out of tempo, but the relationship between the two is not hierarchical: the two are ‘inseparable’, and mutually engage with each other:

The right comprehension of the melos is the sole guide to the right tempo. The two are inseparable: the one brings into being (*bedingen*) the other.¹²⁸

Wagner further aligns melos with rhythm and dynamics. ‘Tone’ (*Ton*) is a concept akin to melos and it incorporates both melodies and rhythms. The passage which Wagner particularly admired in the performance given by the Paris Conservatoire Orchestra consisted of tone:

In later life this passage often holds for me the clear memory of what is important in orchestral execution. It comprises movement and sustained tone, together with the laws of dynamics.¹²⁹

¹²⁶ *Von der allergründlichsten Belehrung jedoch ward es für mich, endlich von dem sogenannten Konservatoir-Orchester in Paris im Jahre 1839 die... „neunte Symphonie“ gespielt zu hören. Hier siel es mir denn wie Schuppen von den Augen... und sogleich verstand ich, was hier das Geheimnis der glücklichen Lösung der Aufgabe ausmachte. Das Orchester hatte eben gelernt, in jedem Takte die Beethoven’sche Melodie zu erkennen.* Richard Wagner, ‘Über das Dirigiren’, in *Gesammelte Schriften und Dichtungen von Richard Wagner*, 8 vols (Leipzig, E. W. Fritsch, 1873), 8.328–410, 8.338. All translations adapted from Richard Wagner, *On Conducting*, trans. Edward Dannreuther [ebook] Project Gutenberg <<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/4523>> accessed 30 December 2010.

¹²⁷ *Der alte Habeneck... fand das richtige Tempo, indem er durch anhaltenden Fleiß sein Orchester darauf hinleitete, das Melos der Symphonie zu erfassen.* Ibid. 8.341.

¹²⁸ *Nur die richtige Erfassung des Melos’ giebt aber auch das richtige Zeitmaaß an: beide find unzertrennlich; eines bedingt das andere.* Ibid. 8.341

¹²⁹ *An dieser einen Stelle ist es mir, bei oft in meinem späteren Leben erneueter Erinnerung, recht klar geworden, worauf es beim Orchestervortrag ankommt, weil sie die Bewegung und den gehaltenen Ton, zugleich mit dem Gesetze der Dynamik in sich schließt.* Ibid.8.339.

Wagner later speaks of the tension between tone and rhythm ('when the reaction of the rhythmical movement against the sustained tone is entirely carried out'). Rhythm is not fundamentally opposed to tone, however, but the two are 'subject to the laws of mutual relationship and interdependence', which are the same laws which govern 'sustained tone', in all its 'conceivable nuances':

In Mozart, as with Beethoven, the exclusive character of the Allegro is only felt when the figuration gets the upper hand of the song, that is, when the reaction of the rhythmical movement against the sustained tone is entirely carried out... Here the purely rhythmical movement, so to speak, celebrates its orgies, and it is consequently impossible to take these movements too quickly. But whatever lies between these two extremes is subject to the laws of mutual relationship and interdependence, and such laws cannot be too delicately and variously applied, for they are fundamentally identical with the laws which modify all conceivable nuances of the sustained tone.¹³⁰

A discussion of Wagner's concept of melos is necessary for grasping the idea of tone in notions of violin playing, and chapter 3 further discusses this theme: the focus in the present chapter is how the idea of melos sheds further light on writers' notions of consciousness, in relation to violin playing.

In order to make melos appear as the most fundamental principle of music Wagner aligns it with life and health. Like Nietzsche's life/will to power, melos is life-like: what Wagner is looking for is the life of the music, something that the German orchestras of his youth failed to achieve:

What appeared to me on the piano, or from reading the score, to be so soulfully *enlivened* (*belebt*) in expression, I then hardly recognized again as it largely passed, fleetingly and unnoticed, over the listeners.¹³¹ (italics inserted)

Wagner further strengthens the appeal of melos by aligning it with physical health. Several writers have attested to the growing importance of health and hygiene in the course of the nineteenth century, for Germany as much as other Western countries. They have further noted the simultaneous spread of anxieties regarding disease, particularly 'nervous diseases', which were thought to cause

¹³⁰ *Der eigentliche exclusive Character des Allegro's tritt bei Mozart, wie bei Beethoven, erst dann ein, wenn die Figuration über den Gesang gänzlich die Oberhand erhält, also wenn die Reaktion der rhythmischen Bewegung gegen den gehaltenen Ton vollständig durchgesetzt wird... Hier feiert die rein rhythmische Bewegung gewissermaßen ihre Orgien, und daher können auch diese Allegro-Sätze nicht bestimmt und schnell genug genommen werden. Was aber zwischen diesen äußersten Punkten liegt, ist dem Gesetz der gegenseitigen Beziehungen zu einander unterworfen, und diese Gesetze können nicht zartsinning und mannigfaltig genug erfaßt werden, denn sie sind in einem tiefen Grunde dieselben, welche den gehaltenen Ton selbst in allen erdenklichen Nüancen modifizirten. Ibid. 8.355–356.*

¹³¹ *Was mir am Klaviere, oder bei der Lesung der Partitur, im Ausdrücke so seelenvoll belebt erschienen, erkannte ich dann kaum wieder, wie es meistens ganz unbeachtet flüchtig an den Zuhörern vorüberging. Ibid. 8.336.*

exhaustion.¹³² Nietzsche frequently uses the language of pathology to conceive of his notion of life/will to power. Mark Letteri has shown, however, that for Nietzsche the will to power had to overcome necessary obstacles in order to thrive, which is why, in *The Gay Science* (1882), he asks ‘whether we can dispense with sickness’, and ‘whether... the will to health alone, is not a prejudice, cowardice, and perhaps a bit of very subtle barbarism and backwardness’. And again, ‘for a typically healthy person... being sick can even become an energetic stimulus for life, for living more’.¹³³ As with Nietzsche, Wagner is preoccupied with sickness as much as he is with health, but he does not go as far as to say that sickness is essential to the healthy functioning of melos. Wagner denigrated the ‘exhaustion’ or ‘lassitude’ (*Mattigkeit*) of a German orchestra’s playing of a Mozart cantilena, and refers to the ‘weakening’ (*Schwächen*) of German orchestras, a word which connotes physical enfeeblement or enervation. One of the reasons for this was that German orchestras tended to rank players according to seniority, with the result that players take first positions ‘at the onset of the weakening of their powers’ (*bei eingetretener Schwächung ihrer Kräfte*), while ‘the younger and stronger musicians are seated second’ (*die jüngeren und tüchtigeren Musiker an den zweiten sitzen*). Wagner also claims that the viola tends to be played by ‘invalid’ (*invalid*) violinists.¹³⁴

Wagner’s aligning of melos with the great composers is akin to Nietzsche’s aligning of life/will to power with the privileged producers of art. It is ‘Beethoven’s melody’ (*Beethoven’sche Melodie*) which Habeneck had persisted in bringing his orchestra to realise, in the performance of 1839 that Wagner so admired.¹³⁵ Throughout his essay, Wagner repeatedly interweaves markings

¹³² Roy Porter (*The Greatest Benefit to Mankind: a Medical History of Humanity from Antiquity to the Present* (London: Harper Collins, 1997)) has documented the sharp rise in the importance of physical health and hygiene to the political agendas of Western nation states in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Writers contributing to *Cultures of Neurasthenia: From Beard to the First World War* (Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2001)) have demonstrated that neurasthenia was a classification of disease that was developed by the medical community in the latter half of the nineteenth century, and was used, both within medical institutions and in wider culture, to explain a wide variety of physical and psychiatric symptoms. These were further linked to anxieties over morally ambiguous issues and notions of the strain of modern living. These authors, as well as Daniel Pick (*Faces of Degeneration: a European Disorder, c.1848–1918* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989)) have also looked at related notions of degeneration, which focus more on the cultural and political implications of the spread of medico-moral abnormalities.

¹³³ Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Gay Science, with a Prelude in Rhymes and an Appendix of Songs*, ed. and trans. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Vintage Books, 1974), 177, 224. Cited in Mark Letteri, ‘The Theme of Health in Nietzsche’s Thought’, *Man & World*, 23 (1990), 405–417, 411–412.

¹³⁴ Wagner, ‘Über das Dirigiren’, 8.336, 8.328, 8.329, 8.329.

¹³⁵ *Ibid.* 8.338.

from composers' scores with his complex of notions surrounding melos: for example, in the Orchestra's playing of bars (116–122) from the first movement of Beethoven's Symphony No.9, in the 1839 performance, what Wagner admired was their ability to maintain a constant dynamic without increasing and decreasing the tone according to the ascents and descents of the melodic contour:

Example 3:¹³⁶



Wagner writes that this corresponds to both his predilection for 'sustained tone' as well as Beethoven's marking 'sempre *pp*' for the entire passage, thus attempting to convince the reader that Beethoven's score markings and his own agenda are the same. A social hierarchy is further set up in order to support the alignment: the uncouth in sentiment (*Grobfühlig*) are unable to grasp Wagner's more refined revelation of the composer's true intentions, which is why they often perform this passage without a sustained tone and uniform dynamic.¹³⁷ Ideally, Wagner writes, an institution needs to be set up in which composers could supervise the performances of their works. This is what German musical culture currently lacks and is the reason for the unhealthy constitution of the orchestras he describes:

Assuredly, these [shortcomings in performance] are primarily due to the lack of a conservatory for German music: a conservatory, in the strictest sense of the word, in which the traditions of the classical master's own style of execution are preserved in practice. This would of course imply that the masters should, once at least, have had a chance personally to supervise performances of their works in such a place. Unfortunately German culture has missed all such opportunities; and if we now wish to become acquainted with the spirit of a classical composer's music we must rely on this or that conductor, and upon his notion of what may, or may not, be the proper tempo and style of execution.¹³⁸

¹³⁶ Beethoven, Ludwig van, *Symphony No. 9 in D Minor*, Op. 125 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1865), violin I orchestral part, first movement, bars 116–122,

¹³⁷ Wagner, 'Über das Dirigieren', 8.340.

¹³⁸ *Gewiß liegen diese zuvörderst in dem gänzlichen Mangel eines wahrhaften deutschen Musikonservatoriums, im strengsten Sinne des Wortes, wonach in ihm die genaue Tradition des ächten, von den Meistern selbst ausgeübten Vortrages unserer klassischen Musik durch stete lebendige Fortführung aufbewahrt worden wäre, was natürlich wiederum voraussetzen lassen müßte, daß diese Meister dort selbst dazu gelangt wären, ihre*

An institution in which composers supervise the performances of their works is now impossible since most of the music which Wagner and his surrounding musical culture desired to play and hear most was by dead composers. From Wagner's point of view this is quite convenient, of course, because it leaves more room for his authority to go unchallenged.

Much of Wagner's essay demonstrates that he possessed an intimate knowledge of revered musical works, but their content and worth ultimately bow to his skilful polemic. This was designed to reinforce Wagner's social standing, as a living conductor. Wagner does not wish to play second fiddle to master works but rather bends their supposed content to fit his overriding argument. It is Wagner's self that wins through by the end of the essay, not the supposed inner life of the artworks considered. It is quite convenient, then, that few of the composers whose works Wagner conducted were living, as this reduced the threat of opposing authorities. Similarly, if performers are not geniuses then they also do not pose a threat: nowhere does Wagner mention the genius or greatness of performers, and, indeed, 'Habeneck... was devoid of genius' (*Habeneck... war ohne alle „Genialität“*).¹³⁹ *Über das Dirigieren* is essentially a persuasive piece of rhetoric in which Wagner, by fashioning melos into a foundational principle, asserts his authority over matters pertaining to musical performance. By espousing popular ideals of late nineteenth-century German culture, namely life, health, and the superior artist as the reviver of the modern age, Wagner is able to construct a persuasive argument.

The rest of this chapter and later chapters will show that writers on violin playing adopt both the ideas and the forms of argument found in Nietzsche's and Wagner's writings. Nietzsche's and Wagner's readership were sympathetic to these writers' ideas because they were already used to encountering notions of the Absolute (such as *Geist*): what they encountered in Wagner's and Nietzsche's writings, however, was a more all-consuming model of self than they had previously experienced, which did not allow for counter-arguments and moderating external influences.

Werke ganz nach ihrem Sinne aufzuführen. Diese Voraussetzung, wie das darauf sich gründende Ergebnis, hat sich leider der deutsche Kultursinn entgehen lassen, und wir find nun auf die Einfälle jedes einzelnen Dirigenten dafür angewiesen, was dieser etwa von dem Tempo oder dem Vortrage eines klassischen Musikstückes halte, um uns über den Geist desselben zu orientiren. Ibid. 8.336–337.

¹³⁹ Ibid. 8.341.

Furthermore, Nietzsche and Wagner rely on persuasive rhetoric over a systematic building of a philosophy (as is the case with Kant's and Hegel's work), to give credibility to their writings: notions of life/will to power and melos are thus infused throughout their writings, like *Leitmotifs*, and every aspect of Nietzsche's and Wagner's arguments is fundamentally rooted in them.

The Use and Abuse of History

The rise of historicism in the nineteenth century brought a greater awareness of the past and its role in mediating present concerns. In Germany, historicism intertwined with the philosophical developments of the age: Wilhelm Windelband's notion of history was informed by his neo-Kantian presuppositions, and the rise of classical philology inspired the hermeneutics of Dilthey. In the emerging field of musicology, too, late nineteenth-century scholars such as Robert Eitner, Emil Vogel and Johannes Zahn unearthed a large number of source materials. Moser himself had been active in this process, as is demonstrated by his extensive knowledge of historical treatises on performance in *Violinschule* (1905) and *Geschichte des Violinspiels* (1923).

Nietzsche responds to the rise of historicism with typical intellectual muscle, and his command of a rich complex of issues in relation to the topic proves enlightening for a critique of others' notions of history in the period. In his essay *On the Use and Abuse of History*, Nietzsche berates what he calls the 'antiquarian' method of historiography, which he describes as an undifferentiated reverence for every historical detail, merely by virtue of its pastness:

The antiquarian... accords everything it sees equal importance and therefore to each individual thing too great importance. There is a lack of that discrimination of value and that sense of proportion which would distinguish between the things of the past in a way that would do true justice to them.

The opposite of this approach Nietzsche calls the 'monumentalist' method: Nietzsche characterises this as the selective privileging of great deeds or achievements in history, such as are 'celebrated at popular festivals [and] at religious or military anniversaries', but without regard for their causes, or the questionable means by which such ends were achieved. Nietzsche reasonably contends that such

an approach is problematic if celebrated facts fall into the hands of ‘gifted egoists and visionary scoundrels’: Nietzsche’s response, however, is not to develop an ethical code to protect against such a danger, but to dismiss these suspect persons as ‘inartistic’ and ‘weakly endowed’. He condemns them for turning against ‘the strong artistic spirits, that is to say against those who alone are capable of learning from that history in a true, that is to say life-enhancing sense’. Nietzsche argues that a selective approach to history is in safe hands if it is in the service of this dominant group. Indeed, Nietzsche even endorses a third method of historiography (‘critical’), in which history is dropped altogether:

If he is to live, man must possess and from time to time employ the strength to break up and dissolve a part of the past... It is not justice which here sits in judgement: it is even less mercy which pronounces the verdict: it is life alone, that dark, driving power that insatiably thirsts for itself. Its sentence is always unmerciful, always unjust.¹⁴⁰

Nietzsche is indeed aware of his trampling over ethics here. History does not constitute an autonomous agent, then, at hand to qualify present actions; rather, it is subservient to the dictates of all-consuming ‘life’. What Nietzsche posits in his text is not a dialogue with a history but a prescription for an ahistorical philosophy, which privileges life above all else.

Moser’s discourse demonstrates that the subjective self is central to the negotiation of historical evidence. Moser’s discussion of ornaments occupies sections seven to nine out of the ten sections of his essay ‘On Interpretation’, which opens the third volume of his *Violinschule*. He begins his discussion by referring to the numerous discrepancies presented by the historical evidence with regard to the execution of ornaments, ‘often even in the same place and at the same period’ (*oftmals sogar am selben Ort und zu gleicher Zeit*). The mid eighteenth-century treatises of Quantz, C. P. E. Bach and Leopold Mozart all constitute a ‘praiseworthy trend to correct these obvious drawbacks’ (*löbliche Tendenz, diese offenbaren Mißstände zu beseitigen*) yet these also contain many disagreements. Moser attributes this to writers’ impressing (*drücken*) ‘more or less unconsciously, the character of their individual taste’ (*mehr oder weniger bewußt – das Merkmal ihres individuellen Geschmacks*), on their writings, which is not so much an explanation for their failing so much as an

¹⁴⁰ Friedrich Nietzsche, *Untimely Meditations*, ed. Daniel Breazeale, trans. R. J. Hollingdale (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 74, 70, 71, 71, 75–76.

attempt on Moser's part to guide the reader toward an important point that Moser wishes to make later, namely that the subjective plays a central role in governing the execution of ornaments.¹⁴¹

Moser's notions of subjectivity are many of those discussed in this chapter and the previous. Moser reflects the close association of notions of consciousness with high art: the first type of ornament that Moser turns to consider in his discussion is the 'shake', and Moser briefly discusses some of C. P. E. Bach's and Leopold Mozart's recommendations, before commenting that 'a player will do well, in spite of Emmanuel Bach and Leopold Mozart, not to bind himself to strictly by these rules, but to let himself be governed by his sense of what is artistic' (*daß man gut tut, sich, trotz Em. Bach und L. Mozart, nicht allzustreng an jene Vorschrift zu binden, sondern den eigenen Kunstverstand walten zu lassen*).¹⁴² What follows is a further extended passage negotiating advice from the treatises with issues of national styles, musical theory and violinistic considerations. Moser then tempers this advice against the player's own subjectivity: 'if... the interpreter wishes to introduce such [a turn], on the grounds of personal choice [lit. on the grounds of a personal hobby], it can hardly be said that any great offence has been committed against the rules (*Komment*) governing the old ornaments.'¹⁴³

In the rest of his discussion Moser continues to interweave historical evidence with notions of consciousness. Moser posits a living self as a source of authority in his complex negotiation of ornaments. He wishes to contend with C. P. E. Bach's instructions on the use of long appoggiaturas, which if taken literally, in Moser's view, would lead to erroneous dissonances. Moser appeals to an exemplary violinist to support his assertion that appoggiaturas must last up to a quaver in length in any musical circumstance, since 'in this way, at least, it is felt and played by Joachim' (*so wenigstens empfindet und spielt ihn Joachim*).¹⁴⁴ The alignment of self with biological health also operates in

¹⁴¹ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.18.

¹⁴² *Ibid.* 3.19.

¹⁴³ *Sollte jedoch in einem besonderen Fall der Vortragende aus Gründen persönlicher Liebhaberei einen solchen anbringen wollen, so wäre das jedenfalls kein schwerer Verstoß gegen den Komment der alten Ornementik.* *Ibid.* 3.21.

¹⁴⁴ *Ibid.* 3.26.

Moser's denigration of short appoggiaturas: these 'often violate the healthy character of popular melody' (*vielen verstößt sie gegen die gesunde Natur volkstümlicher Melodik*).¹⁴⁵

There is also the sense of a conflict between the dictates of the past and the shared consciousness of the age. The idea of *Zeitgeist* as the cultural, political and moral and spiritual climate of a nation or group of people in a specific time period extends back to German Romanticism, and most notably features in the work of Hegel. Nietzsche carries forward this idea in his assertion of life's ascendancy over history. The logical implication of the essential engagement of the living violinist in the mediation of historical evidence on ornaments is that the execution of ornaments is fundamentally dictated by performance as a present act. Thus, Moser's citing of Joachim as a source of authority is further significant, since Joachim was a living exemplary performer. Moser conveys the sense of a shared consciousness unique to the age when he argues for the use of higher positions when playing the music of Tartini, on the basis that an approach to his music 'will well bear a treatment in the matter of expression which, while in no way spoiling the uniformity of style, will answer more to the feeling of the present day, than one characterised by a timid anxiety to hold true to the letter.'¹⁴⁶

Overall, Moser's negotiation of history in his discussion of ornaments resists total appropriation by a subjectivist ideology, but the benefit of open engagement with history is a more peripheral aspect of Moser's wider model of performance. In his discussion of ornaments Moser engages in a hermeneutic exercise which resists any final resolution in the assertion of an ideology. His final comment at the end of the discussion posits a self that is open to the mitigating influence of external evidence and points of view:

¹⁴⁵ Ibid. 3.31.

¹⁴⁶ *Unbeschadet ihrer sonstigen Stileinheit, nach der Seite des Ausdrucks hin sehr wohl eine Behandlung vertragen, die unserem heutigen Empfinden mehr entspricht als das ängstliche Festhalten an der Treue des Buchstabens.* Ibid. 3.11.

We see therefore that rules in art, no matter from whom they proceed, provide no arguments that cannot be overthrown. It is much more essential to know when and where they should be employed—and when and where avoided.¹⁴⁷

The confinement of Moser's engagement with history to his section on ornaments, coupled with its appearance some way into Moser's essay, however, downplays the centrality of historical mediation to Moser's overall model of performance. The discussion of ornaments appears following a lengthy exposition of tone, vibrato, portamento and tempo in which Moser barely does not refer historical evidence to support his points. Appearing as it does in this point in the essay, then, and having its relevance confined to a single aspect of performative practice, open engagement with historical evidence appears to be a rather marginal aspect of Moser's model of performance.

The notion of history as an externally moderating agent is equally weak in the final section of Moser's essay, in which he co-opts the historical evidence in the service of ideologically privileging a Germanic school of violin playing. The central cultural notion on which Moser builds his argument here was one widely upheld in nineteenth-century Germany, namely that *bel canto*, a style of playing based on the singing voice and believed to have originated in eighteenth-century Italy, constituted an ideal of musical performance.¹⁴⁸ From here, Moser proceeds to provide a historical account of how German violin playing derived directly from this style. Assuming that styles of playing are passed directly from teacher to pupil, Moser presents a direct lineage, from eighteenth-century Italian players, to the most important German violinists of the latter half of the nineteenth century. George Hellmesberger senior, Heinrich Wilhelm Ernst and Joseph Joachim trained with the German violinist Joseph Böhm, who studied with the French violinist, Pierre Rode. Rode had in turn studied with Giovanni Battista Viotti, an Italian violinist.¹⁴⁹ Clive Brown contends, however, that the 'historical

¹⁴⁷ *Wir ersehen daraus, daß Kunstregeln, sie mögen ausgehen, von wem sie wollen, keine unumstößlichen Tatsachen schaffen, daß es vielmehr darauf ankommt, sie zu rechter Zeit und an gehöriger Stelle anwenden und – vermeiden zu wissen.* Ibid. 3.31.

¹⁴⁸ As Owen Jander and Ellen T. Harris have explained, *bel canto* was understood in the latter half of the nineteenth century as the lost vocal art of the Italians of the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. No doubt the attraction of this idea, in the rising culture of historicism in nineteenth-century Germany, lay in its ability to provide a history of music with a point of genesis. Owen Jander and Ellen T. Harris, 'Bel Canto', in *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online* [online reference source] <<http://oxfordmusiconline.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access:

<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/02551?q=bel+canto&search=quick&source=omo_gmo&pos=1&_start=1#firsthit> accessed 16 June 2010.

¹⁴⁹ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.34.

perspectives are in some respects questionable', citing early nineteenth-century evidence which suggests that the Viotti school was quite distinct from other Italian styles of playing. Brown further argues that by the time Joachim came to receive this tradition, through Böhm, the style had picked up the influence of Paganini, and that Böhm's own compositions contain bowing techniques that were not characteristic of the playing of Viotti and his pupils.¹⁵⁰

Moser's ability to scholarly reference people and places fails him, however, when accounting for the supposed simultaneous demise of the Franco-Belgian school. He is certainly aware of French players' inheritance of *bel canto* in the first half of the nineteenth century. Moser begins the tenth section of his essay with an extended quote from the passage, discussed above, in Wagner's *Über das Dirigieren*, in which Wagner relates how he had obtained melos from hearing the musicians of the Paris Conservatoire Orchestra perform in 1839. Moser proceeds to expand on Wagner's passage by relating how French violinists acquired the Italian singing style: the Italian violinist Viotti brought *bel canto* to Paris, and in addition to Rode, Moser mentions Kreutzer and Baillot, violinists known to have been influenced by Viotti. Moser also mentions the importing of *bel canto* to Paris by Jean-Marie Leclair, a violinist who is known to spent part of his training and early career in Turin. When it comes to recounting the demise of the Franco-Belgian school, however, Moser is reticent in naming names. He cannot afford to ignore Henri Vieuxtemps (although his failure to refer to Eugène Ysaÿe or Henryk Wieniawski is conspicuous), whom he describes as a 'brilliant virtuoso' (*ein glänzenden Virtuose*), and Moser absolves himself of contradiction by saying that among the exponents of the Franco-Belgian school of virtuosi there are some 'distinguished artist-appearances' (*hervorragende Künstlererscheinungen*).¹⁵¹

To disparage the Franco-Belgian School, Moser must rather rely on his complex of ideas surrounding subjectivity. Its exponents have 'altogether forgotten that healthy and natural method of

¹⁵⁰ Clive Brown, 'Joachim's Violin Playing and the Performance of Brahms's String Music', in Michael Musgrave and Bernard D. Sherman, eds, *Performing Brahms: Early Evidence of Performance Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 48–98, 59, 60–61.

¹⁵¹ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.33, 3.33. There is a sting in the tail of Moser's tribute to Franco-Belgian violinists here, however, in that he describes them as 'artist-appearances', suggesting that they are still superficial virtuosi, and not deep- and organically whole selves.

singing and phrasing which originated in the *bel canto* of the old Italians' (*jene gesunde, natürliche Art des Singens und Phrasierens, die im bel canto der alten Italiener begründet ist... völlig verlernt haben*).¹⁵² Furthermore, there is an appeal to the spirit–matter binarism: exponents of the school 'aim merely at the sensuous in sound', thus the purely material, and neglect 'the characteristic', which is characterised by 'all nuances of expression':

Their bowing and tone production envision the pure sensuality of sound; in their performance of the various bowings there is as little trace of the 'characteristic' (a quality with which the interpretation of both German and Romance classical masterpieces is intimately bound up) as there is of that modulation-rich art of tone production, which has all nuances of expression on the palette. They do not bring out the spirit of the artwork, which they imagine to interpret.¹⁵³

Moser's aligning of *bel canto* and the German school of violin playing with German and Austrian compositions further strengthens his argument for the privileged position of German violin playing. Although Moser claims that the 'characteristic' is a central principle of both German and Romance music in the above quote, it is the great Viennese composers who become woven into the fabric of Moser's history of violin playing: Moser draws attention to Haydn's compositions for the violinist Luigi Tomasini, Leopold Mozart's training from Guiseppe Tartini, and notes that Beethoven wrote music for Kreutzer, Rode and Böhm. As discussed above, Wagner also aligns melos with the great composers: to create the impression of intimacy with Beethoven, Wagner has him speak in support of his idea of tone as 'held' (discussed further in the next chapter). The historical evidence provides proof of an affinity between Austro-German compositions and Italian playing styles, but again, Moser only incorporates the evidence to support a subjectivist and German nationalist ideology of performance. There is no consideration, for example, of how the Italian and French music of Moser's day was similarly legitimated by a heritage of *bel canto*. Nationalism is clearly at work in Moser's

¹⁵² Ibid. 3.32.

¹⁵³ *Ihre Bogenführung und Tongebung hat nur das rein Sinnliche des Klanges im Auge; von einer Charakteristik der Stricharten, die mit der Darstellung nicht nur der deutschen, sondern auch der romanischen Klassiker unlösbar verknüpft ist, ebensowenig eine Spur wie von jener modulationsreichen Art der Tongebung, die alle Nuancen des Ausdrucks auf der Palette hat! Sie geben nicht den Geist des Kunstwerkes wieder, das sie vorzutragen wähen.* Ibid. 3.32. Moser may in fact be accusing French and Belgian players of aiming at sexual stimulation of the senses when he accuses them of merely attaining to the 'sensuous' (*sinnliche*) in sound. Laurence Dreyfus has argued that the term *Sinnlichkeit* is a euphemism, in texts from the latter half of the nineteenth century, for the view that Wagner's music 'provokes an explicit erotic charge' (Laurence Dreyfus, *Wagner and the Erotic Impulse* (Cambridge, Mass., London: Harvard University Press, 2010), 3). Chapter 4 will expand further on the notion that self control via the will/mind/spirit is opposed to sexual gratification, and its importance in writers' complexes of beliefs and ideas surrounding violin playing.

vouching for the superiority of German music, and although he fends off likely assumptions from his readers that he is arguing for racial superiority, he does not rule the possibility of this out altogether: ‘if the racial psyche comes into question at all in this matter, it is only at the twelfth hour’.¹⁵⁴

Auer’s Denial of History

Although Moser’s engagement with history is ultimately circumscribed by his subjectivist ideology, there is a limited dialogue with history, especially in his discussion of ornaments. Auer goes further, however, in his belief that historical evidence should have no hold over the living performer’s playing. Auer includes a chapter entitled ‘Style’ in his book, in which one of his central aims is to dispel the notion of style as conforming to external guidelines, and to posit style as pure individuality. He opens his chapter with the following:

Buffon once said: *Le style est l’homme* (style is the man). I believe that style in literature is the author, and certainly in music it is the musician himself.¹⁵⁵

Auer eschews any evidence of past approaches to performance: ‘let them [violinists] not hamper that most precious individual quality the artist has’, Auer writes, ‘with the dusty precepts handed down from times gone by’.¹⁵⁶ Auer’s belief results from his view of history as fixed and dictating, akin to Nietzsche’s ‘antiquarian’ model of history: ‘if respect for tradition were carried to its logical conclusion we should still be living in the Stone Age, doing as our forefathers had done before us’, he writes.¹⁵⁷ For Auer the present provides the only context:

There is no one definitely established way of playing a given work by a master, for there is no absolute standard of beauty by which the presentation of a violinistic art-work can be judged. A type of playing extravagantly admired and cultivated in one age, may be altogether rejected in another. The general aesthetic sense and sensibility of the period in which we ourselves live, our own contemporary feeling for what is true and acceptable in musical style is the only standard of judgement to which we can refer the artist’s interpretation.¹⁵⁸

¹⁵⁴ *Wenn in dieser Angelegenheit die Psyche der Rassen überhaupt in Frage kommt, so doch erst in zwölf Stunden.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.32.

¹⁵⁵ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 169.

¹⁵⁶ *Ibid.* 176,

¹⁵⁷ *Ibid.* 175.

¹⁵⁸ *Ibid.* 173.

The potential incongruence arising from the idea of style as individuality and style as dictated by contemporary culture is not a problem for Auer because he elevates the artist to a superior position, as the producer of meaning for the collective. At the same time as declaring style as the manifestation of the collective sensibility of the age, Auer also posits a highly individual definition:

One tradition only do I recognize – that is the function of the artist to enter into the spirit of a composition, and reveal to us the intentions of its composer.¹⁵⁹

Individual and collective style are one and the same, however, because Auer's notion of the ideal artist is akin to Nietzsche's primary producer of art, as the fount of the collective's sense of style:

For the violinist whose technique is assured, and who possesses that peculiar magnetism which exerts irresistible and convincing charm [,] is able to sway the greatest audience with compelling power – like the Hebrew prophets and the great masters of the plastic arts, the public speakers of all ages – in a word, like all other artists whose appeal is to the multitude.¹⁶⁰

Auer's chapter is a discursive prescription of individuality, however, and not an engagement with individual artists, as other to Auer's own model of violin playing. Auer recognises the difference that arises out of individualism: 'does Elman play the Tchaikowsky Concerto' he asks, 'in the same style that Heifetz plays it? How could he? Each violinist is individual'.¹⁶¹ Yet he does not venture to tackle questions such as whether multiple primary producers conflict with each other, whether they exist in a ranking order with each other, or whether they perhaps speak to multiple cultures. Perhaps Auer refrains from describing what is so great about these violinists because he wishes to discourage students from imitating them:

A student's acquisition of certain technical tricks and individual mannerisms... copied from some famous virtuoso or teacher – does not for a moment imply that the student who has copied them really plays in the master's manner. Imitation may be the sincerest form of flattery – but any student who flatters a master in this way in doing so at the expense of his own individual development.¹⁶²

In the absence of an engagement with greatness, however, all that is left is the model of violin playing that Auer posits in his book. The model of violin playing rendered intelligible by Auer's book fills the

¹⁵⁹ Ibid. 177.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid. 171.

¹⁶¹ Ibid. 180.

¹⁶² Ibid. 187.

void posited by his rather impoverished exposition of individual style. This suggests that Auer's 'pedagogical' work does not merely provide helpful tips to assist the student violinist in the road to mastery, but is itself the articulation of this mastery. The rest of this chapter develops this idea further.

The Violinist as Genius

In Romanticism, genius is a transcendent spirit that redeems society; in Modernism, society is hostile, which forces the genius to retreat into elitism. In his study of genius, Robert Currie portrays the contrasting ontological frameworks of Romanticism and Modernism as follows:

A romantic posits a higher order which is, in general estimation, a better world, and which can be attained. A modernist doubts, almost to the point of disbelief, that the higher order can be attained; and he interprets the higher order in terms so ascetic, or even so objectionable, as to repel all but those who can rise to the austerity of his creed.¹⁶³

In his *The Intellectuals and the Masses*, Peter Carey identifies in Nietzsche's figure of Zarathustra the personification of superior and isolated genius. Nietzsche's quasi-mythological narrative of Zarathustra incorporates Romantic imagery of a natural landscape, which in Nietzsche's hands receives an anti-democratic subtext: 'let us live above them like strong winds' Nietzsche has Zarathustra utter, 'neighbours of the eagles, neighbours of the snow, neighbours of the sun. Their bodies and their spirits would call our happiness a cave of ice.'¹⁶⁴

Modernism's genius reinforces the elitist agenda by relying on a longstanding notion of genius: namely, that it has been brought about by a foundational and trustworthy form of subjectivity, logically implying that it alone, therefore, produces the best, or the most authentic, mode of being. As Barbara Will puts it:

The term 'genius' is, of course, a construct, a signifier for individual value whose meaningfulness is contingent upon social, institutional and discursive hierarchies and exclusions. Yet precisely because of its association with timeless originality and

¹⁶³ Robert Currie, *Genius: An Ideology in Literature* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1974), 12.

¹⁶⁴ Friedrich Nietzsche, *Thus Spoke Zarathustra*, trans. R. J. Hollingdale (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1961), 196. Cited in Carey, *The Intellectuals and the Masses*, 74.

transcendence, the notion of ‘genius’ has functioned in such a way as to occlude these social and historical contingencies.¹⁶⁵

The longstanding paradox of the idea of genius is that it is both a highly autonomous yet porous model of self: the containment reassures as to the sufficiency of this idealised self, but the boundaries are wide enough to accommodate the ambitious ideals of the writer who has written the genius into being. In *Geschlecht und Charakter*, a widely read volume in the early decades of the twentieth century, Otto Weininger remarks that the genius ‘feels things deeply’, yet ‘universality is... the mark of genius’, and ‘there is no such thing as a special genius, a genius for mathematics, or for music, or even for chess, but only a universal genius’.¹⁶⁶ An important stage in the development of notions of genius was Francis Galton’s *Hereditary Genius* (1869), in which Galton contains genius in a body, and prefigures its potential in the act of scientific study: for Galton, as for Cesare Lombroso later in his influential *Man of Genius* (1891), the genius has specific physical and mental traits, such as a high forehead, hormonal irregularities, and extraordinary powers of concentration.¹⁶⁷ The objectification of genius becomes particularly pronounced in high modernist discourses, with Ortega y Gasset’s calling for a dehumanized art, and T. S. Eliot’s claim that ‘poetry is... an escape from emotion... an escape from personality’.¹⁶⁸ The Modernist deployment of the power dynamics inherent in the idea of genius, then, is a more bare-faced and prescriptive imposition of an ideology of art, whether in its description of an embodied genius, or in a more direct articulation of highbrow subject matter.

At the outset of his *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, Auer posits the idea of the genius’s isolation in order to cast doubt on the pedagogical treatise’s ability to directly assist violin students. Auer begins his introduction by acknowledging the existing literature in his field: as well as the treatises of Baillot, de Bériot and Spohr, there are more modern treatises which have ‘undertaken to demonstrate, in scientific fashion, the essentials of the more recent evolutions of their art’. Auer then proceeds to

¹⁶⁵ Barbara Will, *Gertrude Stein, Modernism, and the Problem of Genius* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000), 2.

¹⁶⁶ Otto Weininger, *Sex and Character: An Investigation of Fundamental Principles*, trans. Ladislaus Löb (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2005), 98.

¹⁶⁷ Galton’s book was a pioneering study in his research on the hereditary sources of human behaviours and abilities. Galton was to later turn his findings into practical advice on how society should encourage good breeding, or ‘eugenics’, as he first called it in 1883. Having been heavily influenced by Charles Darwin’s *The Origin of Species* (1859), Galton first forays into eugenics were an attempt to find out if intelligence could be traced through blood lines, of which *Hereditary Genius* was a product.

¹⁶⁸ T. S. Eliot, *The Sacred Wood: Essays on Poetry and Criticism* (London: Faber, 1920: repr. 1997), 48.

vouch for the worth of his own book in the context of this current market: the problem with these more recent treatises, Auer claims, is that they treat ‘their subject from the physical point of view’. ‘The most essential factor...’ Auer writes, ‘has been largely overlooked. This factor is the mental one.’ Auer here establishes the central theme of the rest of his book, of violin playing as constructed according to notions of consciousness. Auer aligns his notion of mind with the idea that genius is inimitable: these scientific treatises, Auer says, give the false impression that ‘all the conscientious student needs to do is follow them [their instructions] in order to attain perfection!’ Yet genius in violin playing is rare and cannot be reduced to a facile formula: Auer will write later that ‘the great artists are exceptional... and one must not and should not try to imitate any one of them blindly. Rather you must try to catch the reflection of his genius’. Auer has yet to present the case more fully for why genius is essential to violin playing, however, and so he appeals to his professional status for support; ‘I know from my long years of experience as a violin teacher in Europe, and more recently in this country, that this is true’.¹⁶⁹

Paralleling Galton’s and Lombroso’s diagnoses of the embodied genius, Auer then discusses at length the attributes which qualify violinists to attain to his ‘mental’ ideal of violin playing. These include a basic ‘auditory sensibility’, ‘the very important question of the physical conformation of the hand, of the arm, of the wrist, of the elasticity and power which the fingers possess’, as well as a ‘sense of rhythm’ with which ‘nature has gifted the young musical aspirant’. More striking in this passage, however, is the lurid display of physical deformities which bar students from becoming geniuses:

Many aspiring student have hands, the fingers of which are too fat... There are hands with fingers which are too flaccid, bending, which refuse to work at the very moment when they should be firmest. There are hands the fingers of which are so short that they can scarcely move within the limits of the first position... and there are also fingers whose weakness inherently is so great that the very endeavor to strengthen them by exercise only increases their flaccidity.¹⁷⁰

¹⁶⁹ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 1, 1, 2, 3, 46, 3.

¹⁷⁰ *Ibid.* 4, 4, 4, 4–5.

It is difficult to say what gains the upper hand in this passage, an ideal of genius arising out of a strict censure of bodies or the wayward body parts themselves. The ambiguity is itself, however, a reflection of an age which toyed with, rather than strictly uphold, ideals of self.

The emphasis throughout Auer's introduction is on the elite status of genius. Auer wishes to discourage the many who wish to take up the violin from doing so. The failure to recognise one's own physical gifts and deformities is a 'great mistake'. Parents who decide that their 'child shall have a musical career' do not heed 'the hazards of such an undertaking'. Auer then goes on to show the root of his irritation in his own career; Auer relates, rather defensively, that many parents brought their children to him, but when he turned them away many 'went off discontented, and hunted up other advisers who would look upon their pet scheme with more favor'. Auer then goes to appeal to the idea of the great man's heroic struggle to further discourage; 'the majority of those who wish to become musicians... have no idea of the difficulties they will have to surmount, the moral tortures they will be called upon to endure, the disillusionments they will experience, before they win recognition'.¹⁷¹

The central purpose of Auer's next chapter, recounting his autobiography, is to articulate Auer's belief that genius is innate and cannot be learned. Auer discusses his period of tuition with Joseph Joachim, in Hannover between 1863 and 1864, in which he relates that Joachim did not go to great lengths to help his pupils, except to play the passages himself by way of demonstration:

Joachim very rarely entered into technical details, and never made suggestions to his pupils as to what they were to do to gain technical facility... whenever he was dissatisfied with the way the student played a passage or a musical phrase, the master would draw his bow and play the passage or phrase himself in a manner truly divine.

By describing Joachim's playing as 'divine', Auer is beginning to draw attention to Joachim's genius and the subsequent ineffability of his technique. A few sentences later, Auer draws attention to the universality of Joachim's artistry, and his superior grasp of style, as the primary producer of the sensibility of the age:

Whenever I had an opportunity of hearing Joachim play, I always felt as though he were a priest, thrilling his congregation with a sermon revealing the noblest moral beauties of a

¹⁷¹ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 4, 6, 7, 8.

theme which could not help but interest all humanity. His playing, while one listened to it, revealed unsuspected horizons, but it would have been asking the impossible of him to have demanded that he be a teacher in the ordinary sense of the word.

The genius speaks for the masses, but cannot teach them how to become intrinsically great in themselves, which is why Auer thinks it impossible that Joachim could have been a teacher. The only way Joachim could assist other violinists were if members of the crowd possessed original greatness: Auer goes on to further suggest that only those pupils themselves approaching greatness could understand Joachim. Auer is reticent in his naming of greatness, but he implies it of a fraction of Joachim's pupils, and of himself, by casting those who fell short of genius as only possessing the aptitude to imitate the virtuosic elements of Joachim's playing. Auer appeals to the distinction between organic self and mechanistic virtuosity: since self is organic it is deep, which subsequently implies that opposing virtuosity is superficial. This is why the non-geniuses only pick up on the 'exterior' parts of Joachim's playing, and only 'parts' of it, implying that Auer and the select few were able to grasp the depth and the whole of Joachim's self:

Those among us who were able to understand him, who could follow his inarticulate indications, benefitted enormously by them, and tried as far as possible to imitate him; the others, less fortunate, stood with wide-open mouth uncomprehending, and fixed their attention on one or another of the great virtuoso's purely exterior habits of playing.

Auer's unusual decision to place his autobiography at the beginning of his pedagogical work serves the purpose of emphasising that genius is the foundation of violin playing. This is a point which he continues to reinforce at various points throughout the book. In his fourth chapter Auer describes in practical terms how to produce tone on the violin, but he follows it immediately with a warning that tone essentially emanates from the great violinist, and at base is not an aspect of violin technique that can be learned:

They [great violinists] may have nothing in common either in talent or temperament yet, notwithstanding this fact, each one of them will, according to his own individuality, produce a beautiful tone. The tone of the one may be more sonorous, that of the other more transparent, yet both will be ravishing to hear, and not even the closest attention will enable you to divine which form or degree of finger pressure the artist has exerted to produce his tone.¹⁷²

¹⁷² Ibid. 22, 23, 23, 37–38.

Similarly, Auer's later portrayal of genius as rare and inimitable ('the great artists are exceptional... and one must not and should not try to imitate any one of them blindly) follows his advice on practising habits.

If the function of genius is, as Barbara Will puts it, to establish 'hierarchies and exclusions', then Auer's concept of genius is an intended means of eliminating violinists who lie outside of Auer's privileged circle of teachers, pupils and colleagues. Having spent fifty years in small aristocratic circles in St Petersburg, perhaps it was the cosmopolitanism of America's cities that had caused Auer to become defensive over the music profession, as he understood its workings. Wagner's downplaying of genius, in contrast (see p.), equally supports his desire for power, because without the interfering of past geniuses of composers, and the geniuses that might arise among present and future performers, Wagner's model of performance gains complete hegemony, most certainly in the discursive context of his essay, and, Wagner probably hoped, in the orchestral contexts in which Wagner found himself as conductor. Auer, on the other hand, could not afford to deny the existence of other great violinists, having established his reputation as pedagogue to renowned violinists such as Mischa Elman and Jascha Heifetz. What Auer could do, however, was posit genius as an attempt to limit the numbers of the profession to these few greats, 'the elect', as Auer describes them in his *Violin Works and their Interpretation*.¹⁷³ As the above section on Auer's concept of style demonstrated, however, Auer posits a model of self that is robust yet hollow. As with Wagner, this allows him to assert his own model of violin playing. Despite Auer's lauding of the great violinists they ultimately function as little more than a smokescreen for his own views.

The function of Auer's text, as with the existing wider discourse surrounding the idea of genius, is to prescribe greatness, and protect it from the masses. Even though Auer nominally refers to the great violinists of the present day, and full-size photographs are interpolated at regular intervals throughout *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, what is missing from Auer's text is an engagement with the great artists as Other. As with Wagner, Auer does not downplay his own beliefs to seek out those of

¹⁷³ 'There are only a few of the elect who are able to correctly grasp the character of the music which they interpret.' Leopold Auer, *Violin Works and their Interpretation* (New York: Carl Fischer, 1925), vii.

others; rather they bend to his own polemic. The only biography that Auer considers it worth including is that of his own. Auer's book is the performance of himself, then, or the performance of himself as the great individual who is able to commune with greatness.

The positing of an elite model of self in early twentieth-century writings on violin playing transformed the genre of the pedagogy from a handbook of performative gestures to the locus of a discursive self. This explains why Auer's title of his pedagogy, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, deliberately makes the first person singular pronoun conspicuous, and why his autobiography occupies an entire chapter at the opening of his book. To become proficient at the violin, Auer says, is to possess greatness in the first place, and one cannot learn how to play the violin just from reading Auer's text. It is the 'manual' aspect of the pedagogical treatise that is repugnant to writers upholding the ideal of the subject located in the artwork's execution: the mechanistic workings of fingers, hands, arms, and horsehair moving across wound cat gut, are offensive. Furthermore, these draw attention to music as a visual display, which contradicts the Kantian and Idealist aligning of the subjective with music, by dint of its medium as sound. Music acquires pre-eminence over the visual arts because it chiefly consists of sound; the response, then, was to downplay music's visual side, as Lawrence Kramer and Richard Leppert have shown in their studies of the nineteenth-century bourgeois culture of performance.¹⁷⁴ The music pedagogy leads to a similar problem because mimesis of bodily and instrumental gestures relies on sight, and indeed, this is what Auer finds offensive with regard to those scientific manuals that include 'anatomical tables' and 'photographic reproductions' of embodied gestures.¹⁷⁵ Moser makes this connection between sight and sexual licentiousness in his denigration of the empty virtuosity of Franco-Belgian virtuosos who 'hold the pure sensuality of the sound in their eye' (*hat nur das rein Sinnliche des Klanges im Auge*).¹⁷⁶

¹⁷⁴ Lawrence Kramer shows that in discourses surrounding Liszt the denigration of music as sight produces sexualised metaphors of exhibitionism and voyeurism. See ch.4, 'Franz Liszt and the Virtuoso Public Sphere', in Lawrence Kramer, *Musical Meaning: Toward a Critical History* (Berkeley, London: University of California Press, 2002), 68–99. Richard Leppert, *The Sight of Sound: Music, Representation, and the History of the Body* (Berkeley, London: University of California Press, 1993).

¹⁷⁵ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 2.

¹⁷⁶ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3/32.

The Discourse on Violin Playing as the Positing of an Elite Model of Self, and its Implications for the Genres of Biography and Pedagogy

It is not only pedagogies but biographies of violinists from this period which centrally build their narratives on the idea of the violinist as elite self. The early twentieth-century biographical literature on violinists, taken as a whole, is unfailingly uncritical of its subjects, and the authors of such writings singularly see themselves as oracles to the messiahs of art. Andreas Moser's *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild* echoes the celebratory mood surrounding Joachim's golden jubilee, a concert initiated by Moser himself in honour of Joachim's sixty year-long career, held in Berlin on the 22nd of April, 1899.¹⁷⁷ Moser's purpose in writing is to frame Joachim's career wholly as that of unified genius: acting in his role of scholar of historical sources, Moser includes extensive quotes from letters written to and from Joachim, noting a particular set of letters written by Joachim between 1848 and 1850 which testify to the 'high seriousness with which Joachim had perceived his artistic vocation, thus we see him as a mere youth following the path which was to lead him to its lonely heights' (*der hohe Ernst ausspricht, mit dem Joachim seinen Künstlerberuf aufgefasst hat, so sehen wir ihn als Jüngling schon die Richtung einschlagen, in der er binnen kurzem seine einsame Höhe erreichen sollte*).¹⁷⁸ Moser thus writes Joachim's genius into being, as a self construct that maintained its coherence across multiple performances, collaborating colleagues, countries performed in, and cultural epochs traversed by Joachim's long career. The biography of Joachim by the English musicologist J. A. Fuller-Maitland (1856–1936) is similarly panegyric in tone: Fuller-Maitland echoes the strong association between interpretive musical execution and self, putting the emphasis on a way of performing that reveals individual selves, however, over a communal spirit or vitality:

Besides the ideal interpretation of the music he plays, Joachim unconsciously tells every one who has ears to hear what manner of man he is in himself. Truth, rectitude, earnestness of purpose, singleness of artistic aim, a childlike clarity of the inner vision, combined with the highest dignity – all these are evident to any but the most superficial listener, and there is a certain quiet ardour, eloquent of strong emotion strongly controlled, such as distinguishes only those who possess the highest imagination.¹⁷⁹

¹⁷⁷ Noted in Moser, *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild*, 324.

¹⁷⁸ Moser, *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild*, 268.

¹⁷⁹ J. A. Fuller-Maitland, *Joseph Joachim* (London: The Bodley Head, 1905), 48.

In H. Morgan-Browne's 1922 article *An Approximation to the Truth about August Wilhelmj*, the truth about Wilhelmj is that he is 'not a king, but a god among violinists'.¹⁸⁰ The sole exception to these literary conduits to greatness is Carl Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Memoirs of a Violinist), which possesses an unusually critical tone in its appraisals of many of Flesch's fellow musicians (discussed further in chapter 5).

One can define the body of literature on violin playing in the early twentieth century, taken as a whole, as the articulation of elite self, and this basic characterisation weakens the distinction between the genres of biography and pedagogy. Several publications from the period defy these generical boundaries—or rather possess aspects of both—instead promoting greatness, both as a goal to be desired by readers aspiring to be successful violinists, and as a quality to be celebrated in its embodiment in past or present artists. Frederick Martens's books *Violin Mastery* (1919) and *String Mastery* (1923) are ideal examples in this respect: Martens's recounting of interviews with numerous eminent string players of the period, in these volumes, mixes biographical information on each player with their advice for students. Bronisław Huberman's book *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* (1912) similarly blends the author's autobiography with a privileged insight, as promised by the title, into details of Huberman's playing style.

Conclusion

The writing of pedagogical treatises by eminent performers has a long history and no doubt prompted early twentieth-century writers to carry on the tradition, as a way of affirming their privileged status. Yet this sense of heritage was troubled by a sense that historical texts sapped the vitality of the present. Writers construct an ideology with a view to subordinating historical evidence to it, or obliterating it entirely. Moser weaves in and out of the historical evidence, sometimes upholding it as the exemplary model for violinists today and at other times dismissing it on the grounds that the player's own subjective inclinations should reign in the matter in question. Auer, on the other hand, dismisses historical evidence entirely, and, like Nietzsche's notion of the strong, who are able to sever

¹⁸⁰ H. Morgan-Browne, 'An Approximation to the Truth about August Wilhelmj', *Music & Letters*, 3/3 (1922), 219–228, 219.

their link to history entirely, venerates the artist as powerful creator of meaning for the multitude of the present age.

What restores a potential loss of vitality is Nietzsche's empowering model of the artist, as well as Wagner's handing the reins over to the performer, as the primary executor of the composer's original creativity. Nietzschean and Wagnerian rhetoric boosts the power of esteemed pedagogues' constructs of violin playing, already granted authority by the established genre of the pedagogical treatise. One can more generally frame twentieth-century writings on violin playing, biographies included, as fires ignited by Nietzsche's championing of the artist as the fount of vitality for the present age. Discourses of violin playing in this period join the wider artistic and literary response to the dissemination of Nietzsche's works from the 1890s on. What violinists found in Wagner's 1869 essay, *Über das Dirigieren* was a substantial account of their art, which with its persuasive rhetoric appealed to many of the Nietzschean ideals of the artist which they had also embraced. By convincingly demonstrating how performers themselves could resurrect the vitality and health of the dead composers, and what this sounded like in specifically musical terminology, Wagner's richly critical discourse served as a foundation for later writings on performance. Published as he was in major German periodicals and in hefty volumes of his collected works, Wagner's writings were influential in the wider intellectual culture of late nineteenth-century Europe: taking this into account, writers on violin playing realised that in *Über das Dirigieren* they had found a relevant and potent template for their own discursive intentions, and that its author's elevated standing in wider culture bestowed authority on their own writings.

As well as dealing specifically with matters of performance, the literature participates in a wider cultural defence of subjectivism. Nietzsche's and Wagner's writings are central to this event, participating as they do in a German critical tradition rooted in a late eighteenth-century revolt against Enlightenment values. Writers such as Hamann and Herder rejected the tendency for intellectual products of the Enlightenment, such as Newtonian laws of physics, to reduce self to little more than the fixed and inanimate mechanisms which regulated the universe. More specifically, what they objected to was the disintegration of social cohesion, perceived to result from this dehumanising trend

in Western thought. The advance of scientific methods and knowledge continued to expand in the nineteenth century, however, which explains why Nietzsche's work continues to sustain the hermeneutical tradition's defence of vitality, in the face of what Nietzsche himself saw as the depleting effects of scientific knowledge. One can view early twentieth-century texts on violin playing, then, as participating in the wider cultural defence of vitality and metaphysical notions of self. Their denigration of virtuosity is a more immediate symptom of a larger cultural problem, namely the dehumanising effects of materialism and capitalism, of which the virtuoso's public display of technical feats, along with circuses, freak shows and magic spectacles, was a product. The response was, alongside the rise of modernist art and literature, to defend a high culture in which the model of self, as vital, healthy, powerful, elite, autonomous and isolated, aligned with the execution of a canon of select musical works.

As well as addressing wider cultural problems, writers also assume stances on issues closer to home, namely the role of the performer in the network of agencies involved in musical production and reception. The bewildering array of notions of merging and diverging subjective entities, used to make sense of the interaction of composer, performer and listener, had demanded constant discursive mediation since the Romantic era. Whereas, as Mary Hunter demonstrates, early-Romantic discourses defend the performer's role as providing access to genius, however, Lydia Goehr has demonstrated how discourses privileged the musical work, and tended to overlook the contributions of competing agencies in the performance network. Furthermore, since the early nineteenth century the veneration of composers and their musical works had considerably heightened. The birth of musicology in the late nineteenth century institutionalised this veneration in source studies leading to biographies of great composers, and the sub-discipline of music analysis focused attention on properties of the score. Biographies and pedagogies of performance, then, were a way of vouching for the continuing essential role of the performer in the context of the performance network. In the same way that composers had been canonised through literature, the need arose for a fitting literary tribute to performers such as Joachim and Casals, who by the early twentieth century had achieved widespread fame.

Surprisingly, the fast-expanding business of sound recordings in the early twentieth century is not an issue which violinists consider necessary for discussion. In wider culture, the birth of the gramophone made problematic the equating of agency with embodiment: in the recorded artefact the act of musical production was severed from the body that gave rise to it. As Carolyn Abbate argues in *In Search of Opera*, this revived longstanding metaphors of vitality and mechanism in relation to the performance network: confidence in locating self or being was undermined by the resounding of dead composers' music and ersatz imitations of life in the form of musical automata and virtuosos, and the gramophone was the latest source of such doubt.¹⁸¹ For violinists so concerned with defending consciousness in the artwork from dead virtuosity, however, the rise in popularity of commercial recordings did not pose a threat. Perhaps understandably so in the case of Moser's *Violinschule* (1905), when recording technology was in its infancy, but one would expect it to have been an issue that later writers would have considered it important to address, when providing a detailed exposition of the responsibilities of the eminent violinist. There is no mention of recordings in Huberman's *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* (1912), Martens's *Violin Mastery* (1919), and Auer's *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (1921), and Flesch only briefly mentions it in his *Die Kunst des Violinspiels* (1923, 1928), to suggest that later advances in recording technology might function as a practising aid to the performer.¹⁸²

There is the faint suggestion that recordings represent a threat to the early twentieth-century model of interpretive violin playing, however, in Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers/ Memoirs*. Perhaps this is due to the later date of writing (the text was written between the late 1920s and the late 1930s). 'Will the disc enable the reproductive artist to live beyond his death, and transmit the impress of his art to posterity?' Flesch asks. His answer in the negative asserts that a machine cannot possibly contain a self: it can capture its material manifestation, but not the subject at its core: 'The great interpretation, born of individual feeling, must needs be immediate, spontaneous and unique', Flesch

¹⁸¹ See Carolyn Abbate, *In Search of Opera* (Princeton, N.J., Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2001), 202–213.

¹⁸² Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.4.

asserts. The recording, conversely, can only capture “how he hems and how he spits”.¹⁸³ There is also the idea, in Flesch’s notion of the ‘great interpretation’ as ‘immediate’, that the gramophone is an obstacle between the community and its leader, the artist.

This assertion of vitality is the same as that given by writers opposing virtuosity and history, however, and still does not explain why recordings did not undermine their notions of violin playing. One possible explanation is that even by the 1930s the quality of recordings still did not match those of live performances, and there was no evidence that the popularity of recordings was threatening the live music business. Having said this, writers’ engagement with nineteenth-century Germanic notions of self suggests that recordings could not match their ideal in any case, and thus even an improved quality of reproduction would not have undermined the centrality of live performance to their ethos: if self arises out of conflict with the collective (or in opposition to Other, see chapter 1), then the problem with recordings, for Flesch, was not that they captured imperfectly but they captured too perfectly. Recording technology allowed for frictionless communication, and thus in itself was anathema to the idea of self at the centre of interpretive performance. For Flesch, recording technology was good enough, but it still could not capture the higher complexities of self:

The microphone is too narrowly responsive to smoothness of tone and execution and far too insensitive to many of the higher values of personality to be able to transmit a true picture of an artistic performance.¹⁸⁴

Whereas this chapter has attempted to find out what the idea of consciousness looks like, the next chapter attempts to discover how it sounded. It explores how the model of consciousness in violin playing, propounded in this chapter, gives rise to a set of performative practices. The idea of noumenal self operates in tension with the generical demand of the pedagogy to render intelligible the craft of violin playing. Grandiose claims to the presence of boundless self in violin performance interact with more prosaic notions of vibrato, types of bow stroke, and tempo, and the chapter discusses the points at which the two intersect. It will demonstrate that notions of metaphysical melody constitute the vital link between self and its encasing in the violinist’s localised bodily

¹⁸³ Flesch, *Memoirs*, 291–292. This is a quote from Schiller’s play *Wallensteins Lager*.

¹⁸⁴ *Ibid.* 291–292.

gestures. Writers use such notions to develop their idea of 'singing tone', which, as the chapter will demonstrate, constitutes the cornerstone of every aspect of their art.

Chapter 3

Transcendent Voice as a Model for Performative Practices on the Violin

The overarching aim of this chapter is to investigate how writers apply their subjectivist ideology of performance to more detailed discussions of performative practices. It extends the discussion at the opening of chapter 2, of the influence of notions of vitality and mechanism on the idea of tempo, to uncover how these same ideas order the full spectrum of theoretical, or more generical musical elements, as well as performative practices specifically relating to the act of violin playing. Furthermore, it takes forward the central theme presented in the previous chapter, of the violinist as privileged producer of art, to show how writers furnished this ideal with a complex range of notions of embodied and localised practices. The chapter further extends the range of cultural ideas negotiated in the literature to consider historical notions of voice, and considers the resulting complex of ideas about performative practices in the context of more recent developments in the psychological and empirical research.

To summarise chapter 2's exposition of Wagner's *Über das Dirigieren*, Wagner's notion of 'melos' has affinities with nineteenth-century philosophical notions of the Absolute. Chapter 2 demonstrated that although Nietzsche's work attempted to deconstruct the metaphysics of Idealism, his writings posited life/will to power as an absolute principle, thus continuing in a longstanding tradition of metaphysics in philosophy. The chapter went on to demonstrate that Wagner's notion of melos resembles Nietzsche's notion of life/will to power in several respects. Wagner uses vitalistic language to describe melos and aligns it with physical health, these qualities attributing a sensitivity to melos with the superior producers of art, who for Nietzsche are the strong that triumph over the weak, and for Wagner are the revered, dead composers of German musical culture in the latter half of the nineteenth century. The chapter also demonstrated that melos, for Wagner, is largely synonymous with tone: Wagner describes the playing of the violinists of the Paris Conservatoire Orchestra, who had learned to look for the melos of the piece they were performing, as characterised by a 'sustained tone' (*gehaltenen Ton*). It becomes clear later in Wagner's essay that tone is akin to melos in its

universality: tone not only manifests itself through melodies but also incorporates rhythm, tempo and dynamics.

The idea of musical melody received a wider historical application, in the nineteenth century, as a foundational form of subjectivity. In *Metaphor and Musical Thought*, Michael Spitzer discusses the metaphor of melody as life, demonstrating how the nineteenth century granted melody an elevated ontological status, as the manifestation of a vital force or energy. Early Romantics, such as Goethe, Wackenroder, Schelling, Hölderlin and Novalis favoured the idea, and the theme was later taken up by Schopenhauer, for whom melody is a manifestation of *Will*. Schopenhauer's particular notion of the Absolute manifests itself as an insatiable desire or search for satisfaction, and Schopenhauer recognised in melody 'the highest grade of the objectification of Will, the intellectual life and effort of man': relentless longing, Schopenhauer further notes, is reflected in melody's 'constant digression and deviation from the key note'. Foreshadowing Nietzsche's aligning of life with the superior man, Schopenhauer also makes an explicit connection between melody and genius, asserting that 'the disclosure in it [melody] of all the deepest secrets of human willing and feeling is the work of genius'.¹⁸⁵

Early twentieth-century energeticists posited melody as the primary musical component that made manifest the ebb and flow of psychic forces. For music theorists such as August Halm, Heinrich Schenker, Arnold Schering and Hans Mersmann, what rescued music from Hanslickian formalism and a purely materialist conception was the idea that music originated in the unconscious, and as such produced content that through its symbolism or latent energy (thought to reside in individual tones and motives) created internal dynamic relationships. It was the mind's dynamic aural experience of music that made redundant the identification of static formal properties. Further supporting the notion of music as originating in mind, a theory of intersubjectivity was posited which conceived of musical

¹⁸⁵ *Die höchste Stufe der Objektivation des Willens, das besonnene Leben und Streben des Menschen. Ein stetes Abweichen, Abirren vom Grundton; die Aufdeckung aller tiefsten Geheimnisse des menschlichen Wollens und Empfindens in ihr, ist das Werk des Genius.* Arthur Schopenhauer, *Die Welt als Wille und Vorstellung*, Vol. 1, Book 3, § 52. In Arthur Schopenhauer, *Zürcher Ausgabe. Werke in zehn Bänden*, 2 vols (Zurich: Diogenes, 1977) [online text]
<<http://www.zeno.org/Philosophie/M/Schopenhauer,+Arthur/Die+Welt+als+Wille+und+Vorstellung>> accessed 28 Jan 2010.

components as possessing empathy (*Einfühlung*) for each other, consolidating the idea of music as potentiality and becoming. In this conceptual framework, melody was proposed as the primary locus within which tones took their place. As Ernst Kurth wrote, melody is not merely ‘acoustic-sonic phenomena’ but the ‘sensations of a dynamic procedure between the tones’.¹⁸⁶ Lee Rothfarb demonstrates that ‘melody is motion’—Kurth’s opening sentence of his monograph *Foundations of Linear Counterpoint* (1917)—is the underlying premise of the analytical method of his book.¹⁸⁷ A key concept in energeticist analyses, then, is motion, which found varying expression in notions such as Hugo Riemann’s *Lebenskraft* (life-power), Halm’s ‘force (*Trieb*), ‘dynamic impulse’ (*Bewegungsanstoss*), and ‘spiritual power (*geistige Macht*). The notion of linear development further helped to conceptualise the growth in tensions between the building blocks of the music, as reflected in Schenker’s central concept of the *Urlinie* of a musical work. This chapter will later address notions of motion in relation to early twentieth-century notions of violin playing.

There is a clear alignment in early twentieth-century writings on violin playing between tone and universalising notions of subjectivity. Andreas Moser describes tone, in 1905, as ‘the outward expression in sound of his [the violinist’s] inner feeling’.¹⁸⁸ Similarly, the German violinist Hans Wessely describes tone as ‘the soul of the violin’.¹⁸⁹ The violinists August Wilhelmj and James Brown demonstrate the closeness of tone to pure being when they assert, rather exaggeratedly, that ‘without a beautiful tone the violinist, however dexterous, has no excuse for existing’.¹⁹⁰ Auer aligns tone with his ideal of the violinist as pre-eminent artist: tone is what the great violinists, such as Joachim, Sarasate and Ysaÿe, have in common with each other, regardless of their individuality. ‘They may have nothing in common either in talent or temperament’, Auer writes, ‘yet... each of them

¹⁸⁶ Ernst Kurth, *Grundlagen des linearen Kontrapunkts: Bachs melodische Polyphonie* (5th edn, Bern: Krompholz, 1956), 10. Cited in Lee Rothfarb, ‘Energetics’ in Thomas Christensen, ed., *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 927–955, 940.

¹⁸⁷ *Ibid.* 1 and 940.

¹⁸⁸ *Die klingende Äusserung seines inneren Empfindens*. Joseph Joachim and Andreas Moser, *Violinschule in 3 Bänden*, 3 vols, trans. Alfred Moffat (Berlin: N. Simrock, Schott, 1905), 3.6. All translations adapted from the original.

¹⁸⁹ Hans Wessely, *A Practical Guide to Violin-Playing* (London: Joseph Williams, 1913), 93.

¹⁹⁰ August Wilhelmj and James Brown, *A Modern School for Violin Playing*, 6 vols (London: Novello, 1898), 3b.vii.

will, according to his own individuality, produce a beautiful tone'.¹⁹¹ With regard to forms of collective subjectivity, tone may create a congenial shared experience between performer and listener, demonstrated by Auer's promotion of an 'agreeable tone'¹⁹². The high priest of art, who speaks for the multitude of the present age, impresses tone on the listener:

The tone of the one may be more sonorous, that of the other more transparent, yet both will be ravishing to hear, and not even the closest attention will enable you to divine which form or degree of finger-pressure the artist has exerted to produce his tone.¹⁹³

At the same time as assuming quite abstract and universal properties, however, writers at times continue to conceive of tone as physical sound. Although Wagner's melos resembles Nietzsche's basic philosophical principle of life, he also describes its manifestation in the act of performance as 'sustained tone' (*gehaltenen Ton*, see chapter 2), for which he gives the example of how the violins of the Paris Conservatoire Orchestra realised the melos of a passage in Beethoven's ninth symphony with a legato bow stroke and at a constant dynamic level. Furthermore, Wagner locates melos in the singing voice:

The right comprehension of the melos is the sole guide to the right tempo; the two are inseparable; the one brings into being the other... Our conductors basically know nothing about finding the right tempo because they do not understand anything about song. I have not yet met with a German *Kapellmeister* or other music-director who, be it with a good or bad voice, can really sing a melody.¹⁹⁴

Michael Spitzer notes a constant shifting in the Romantic literature between localised and transcendent notions of melody. Melody's philosophical resonance led Novalis to deviate from its meaning as a musical component, alongside rhythm, harmony and so on, and conceive of melody as a higher organising principle for every other musical element. Spitzer's purpose is to demonstrate the alignment of melody with self expression:

¹⁹¹ Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921), 38.

¹⁹² Ibid. 50, 87. Auer also discourages a 'disagreeable' tone, 98, 121, 180.

¹⁹³ Ibid. 38.

¹⁹⁴ *Nur die richtige Erfassung des Melos' giebt aber auch das richtige Zeitmaas an: beide find unzertrennlich; eines bedingt das andere... Unsere Dirigenten vom richtigen Tempo aus dem Grunde nichts wissen, weil sie nichts vom Gesange verstehen. Mir ist noch kein deutscher Kapellmeister oder sonstiger Musikdirigirent vorgekommen, der, sei es mit guter oder schlechter Stimme, eine Melodie wirklich hätte singen können.* Richard Wagner, 'Über das Dirigiren', in *Gesammelte Schriften und Dichtungen von Richard Wagner*, 8 vols (Leipzig, E. W. Fritsch, 1873), 8.328–410, 8.341. All translations adapted from Richard Wagner, *On Conducting*, trans. Edward Dannreuther [ebook] Project Gutenberg <<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/4523>> accessed 30 December 2010.

The point about metaphorical melody is that it operates beneath the level at which the literal distinction between rhythm and melody applies, a level denoting dynamic, energetic flow. Just as melody for Rousseau was a metaphor for expression, rather than the literal melodies of opera, romantic melody ultimately means ‘energy,’ *energeia*.¹⁹⁵

For Auer, the word ‘tone’ may denote both a particular performative practice and a more general guiding principle in violin playing. At times he uses the word to refer specifically to a legato bow stroke, but on other occasions ‘tone’ is a principle which orders several large-scale dimensions of music, such as dynamics, metre and rhythm. Thus, tone is simultaneously confined to a measurable and localised material form, and expanded to become a principle which transcends material limitations. Auer begins his chapter on tone production by providing a set of guidelines for producing a legato bow stroke. Following this, Auer goes on to offer advice on a variety of bowing types, such as the staccato, *martelé*, and *detaché* bow strokes, but he ends the chapter by confirming that legato is the default mode of tone production, as well as equating it with singing:

Legato... is the realizing of an ideal – the ideal of a smooth, round, continuous flow of tone. Legato bowing, if developed as I have suggested, gives us the beautiful singing tone which is the normal tone of the instrument. The violin is... a homophone instrument, a melody instrument, a singing instrument. Its chief beauty in expression is still the cantabile melody line... and that is why the legato bow-stroke, which is the melody-producing stroke, will continue to be one of the strokes most used.¹⁹⁶

Auer’s use of language here suggests a possible difference between ‘melody’ and ‘song’: one might take his ‘homophone instrument, a melody instrument, as singing instrument’ to be a way of emphasising his point that the violin is a melody/singing instrument, but Auer’s progression from ‘homophone’ to ‘melody’ to ‘singing’ suggests a transition from the theoretical—or perhaps metaphysical—melody, to the physical sound waves of singing. The similarity of the violin to the singing voice has its roots in a more philosophically resonant notion of voice. Although Auer asserts that the legato tone, which is the ‘singing tone’, or ‘melody-producing stroke’ is the ‘normal’ tone of the instrument, elsewhere he expands his notion of tone to cover a much wider range of musical elements:

In the orchestra, the great advantage the violin has over all the other orchestral instruments in expressiveness is due to the player’s control of tone production and tone inflection. He can

¹⁹⁵ Michael Spitzer, *Metaphor and Musical Thought* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004), 281.

¹⁹⁶ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 80-81.

make the violin speak, he can make it sing. He can run the whole gamut of emotions on its strings – if he can translate feeling into the expressional terms of dynamics and nuance, into tone graduation and the tone inflection by means of rhythm, of stress, of musical shading.¹⁹⁷

Auer here treats dynamics, rhythms and metrical considerations not as separate elements to the legato singing tone, but folds them into the superior category of tone, and portrays them as ways of creating variation within it ('inflection'). Vibrato and portamento also find themselves incorporated into the all-enveloping category of tone: Auer says that 'like the portamento, the vibrato is primarily a means to... embellish and beautify a singing passage or tone'.¹⁹⁸ According to Moser, the portamento descended from the idea that the four strings of the violin constituted four separate vocal registers, since this idea gave rise to the belief that one should play the notes of a melody entirely on the same string (or in the same vocal register), and therefore one would need to slide to reach notes that lay beyond first position (which only produces notes up to a perfect fifth above the open string).¹⁹⁹

There are several tensions and issues accumulating here. Tone stands at an indefinite point between the abstraction of subjectivity and the exactitude of the bodily/material. Both the OED and *Langenscheidts Enzyklopädisches Wörterbuch* refer to 'tone'/*Ton* as an embodied or physical entity, whether as musical tone/tones or the tone of one's written or spoken words. Indispensable to the meaning of tone/*Ton*, however, is the inference that these physically based, or more easily located practices point to less graspable aspects of subjectivity: with reference to one's style of writing, the OED defines tone as that which 'expresses the person's sentiment or reveals his character'. With reference to voice, the OED defines tone as 'a particular quality, pitch, modulation, or inflexion of the voice expressing or indicating affirmation, interrogation, hesitation, decision, or some feeling or emotion'.²⁰⁰ This definition suggests that tone lies in the pitch modulations of the spoken sentence, yet Auer suggests that it includes some form of articulation. Expressivity in violin playing, for Auer is 'due to the player's control of tone production and tone inflection. He can make the violin speak, he

¹⁹⁷ Ibid. 144–145.

¹⁹⁸ Ibid. 59.

¹⁹⁹ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.8.

²⁰⁰ Oxford English Dictionary [online reference source] (Oxford University Press) <<http://dictionary.oed.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/203150?rskey=rw6O3G&result=1&isAdvanced=false#eid>> accessed 29 May 2010. German meanings cited in O. Springer, ed., *Langenscheidts Enzyklopädisches Wörterbuch: Der Englischen und Deutschen Sprache*, 2 vols (6th edn, Berlin: Langenscheidt, 1992), 2.1532–1533.

can make it sing.’ Is the pure sound of the voice and its articulation the same thing, however, or are they opposed to each other? Tone may be speaking melody, or *Sprachmelodie*. That the word ‘tone’/*Ton* resides in ‘intonation’/*Intonation* further suggests that this is an important facet of the performer’s execution of singing tone. To ‘intone’ (*intonieren*) also bears the connotations of religious or ceremonial speaking, which may further explain why for early twentieth-century interpreters, as the high priests of music, tone is central.

The chapter addresses this complex of issues in four sections. The first section looks at how writers conceive of the binarism of self and body as a dialectic, in which opposites interact or conflict with each other, and lead to further notions of theoretical elements of music and violinistic practices. The second section examines a further binarism that partially maps onto the noumenal–physical dualism, namely that of tone as wordless song and tone as speech or language. The third section looks at the dualism in relation to the singer, as physical model, and show that tone’s ambiguous status, as both a noumenal and material entity, leads to conflicting views over whether it can be imitated or not. The fourth section looks at more nuanced aspects of writers’ concept of tone in the context of more recent notions of musical components in psychological and empirical approaches to music.

Negotiating the Noumenal–Physical Dualism 1: The Dialectic of Subjective and Objective Tone

No matter how strong tone’s roots are in metaphysical notions of self, a pressing issue for writers on violin playing is how it interacts with the material world. Moser’s tone is not only ‘innermost’ feeling but also ‘sounding’ (see above). Reflecting the influence of nineteenth-century German thought, Moser and Auer make sense of the interaction of self and body/instrument by conceiving of it as a dialectic of opposites, which has important implications for their further conceptual structuring of elements of violin technique. As chapter 2 demonstrated, Auer may have absorbed something of Spitta’s neo-Kantian thought, as well as strains of Russian neo-Idealism, so that he conceives of consciousness as spirit, and as essentially distinct from the material world. It is this idea which manifests itself in his conception of tone, which is the product of utmost ‘mental and spiritual

concentration' on the part of the violinist, and is 'not primarily' a matter of the physical parts of the violin, nor the player's body ('the hairs on the stick, of rosin, of change of bow on the strings, nor of change of position by means of the fingers of the left hand')

The problem involved in the production of an entirely agreeable tone – that is to say a tone which is singing to a degree that leads the hearer to forget the physical process of its development is one whose solution must always be the most important task of those who devote themselves to mastering the violin.

The question of tone production, we might as well acknowledge at once, is not primarily a matter of the hairs on the stick, of rosin, of change of bow on the strings, nor of change of position by means of the fingers of the left hand. All these really signify nothing, absolutely nothing, when it comes to the production of a pure crystalline and transparent violin tone. ... The student must not only expect to sacrifice whatever time may be necessary, but he must be willing to bring to bear on the problem all his intelligence, all the mental and spiritual concentration of which he is capable.²⁰¹

Even though Auer is emphatic regarding the non-material origins of tone, there is still the vague suggestion that this is a trick on the violinist's part ('a tone.. that leads the hearer to forget the physical process'). The active verbs constantly remind that spiritual tone is something enacted by the violinist, as embodied individual, although as the previous chapter showed, the notion of a biological and actively wielded vitality nevertheless has strong roots in metaphysical philosophy.

Wagner also downplays tone's origins in materiality in order to emphasise its alignment with metaphysical notions of self. He provides a practical example of where the German orchestras of his day fail to realise the sustained tone that centrally characterises melos. In the second bar of the opening of Beethoven's fifth Symphony, Wagner, writes, the fermata written over the Eb minim 'is not held any longer than a forte produced with a careless stroke of the bow will last upon the stringed instruments'.²⁰² Wagner here draws attention to the limitations of materiality that thwart the transcendence of the subjective. He then goes on to provide a vivid defence of sustained tone, as a vital and biological entity, and emanating directly from the god-like creator, who commands the neo-Romantic natural world that Wagner portrays:

²⁰¹ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 51–52.

²⁰² *Wird gewöhnlich nicht länger ausgehalten, als bei einem achtlosen Bogenstriche der Saiteninstrumente ein Forte andauert.* Wagner, 'Über das Dirigieren', 8.350.

Now suppose the voice of Beethoven were heard from the grave admonishing a conductor: “Hold my fermata long and terribly! I hurl this [whole and fully absorbed tone] when I want it in a tempestuous and quickly figured allegro, as a rapturous or terribly arresting spasm. Then the life of the tones will be extracted to its last drops of blood; then I halt the waves of my sea, and make the depths visible; or I hold back the clouds, disperse the mist, and show the pure blue ether and the glorious eyes of the sun. For this I set fermatas, that is to say, sudden long-sustained notes in my Allegros.”²⁰³

It is the difficulty of producing tone which further guarantees its vital/spiritual/mental origins: Auer and Wagner imagine that tone, as matter, must strive to be imbued with its properly spiritual nature. For Auer tone is a ‘problem’ that is time-consuming (‘the student must not only expect to sacrifice whatever time may be necessary’) and intellectually exhausting (‘all his intelligence... mental... concentration’). Wagner recommends that string players imitate wind players in seeking to produce a good tone, but precisely because tone is more difficult, and not easier, to produce on wind instruments:

Of course, it is easy enough to produce a susurrating whisper by gently passing the bow over the strings, but it requires great artistic command of the breath to produce a recognisable and pure tone upon a wind instrument. Violinists should learn the tone-filled piano from the best winds, and the latter, again, should endeavour to acquire the same from the best vocalists.²⁰⁴

Note that singers stand at the top of the performers’ hierarchy (discussed further below).

Since tone is spirit/self it conceals mechanisms. Tone’s origin in an independent spiritual realm leads Auer to think that it should conceal materiality (‘a tone which is singing to a degree that leads the hearer to forget the physical process of its development’).²⁰⁵ This idea stems from the

²⁰³ *Nun setzen wir den Fall, die Stimme Beethoven’s habe aus dem Grabe einem Dirigenten zugerufen: „Halte du meine Fermate lange und furchtbar!... Werfe ich [der ganz und voll aufzusaugende Ton], wenn ich es brauche in das heftig und schnell figurirte Allegro als wonnig oder schrecklich anhaltenden Krampf. Dann soll das Leben des Tones bis auf seinen letzten Blutstropfen aufgesogen werden; dann halte ich die Wellen meines Meeres an, und lasse in seinen Abgrund blicken; oder hemme den Zug der Wolken, zertheile die wirren Nebelstreifen, und lasse einmal in den reinen blauen Äther, in das strahlende Auge der Sonne sehen. Hierfür setze ich Fermaten, d.h. plötzlich eintretende, lang auszuhaltende Noten in meine Allegro’s.* Ibid. 8.350.

²⁰⁴ *Es allerdings sehr leicht fällt, den Bogen recht locker über die Saiten zu führen, um sie eben nur zu einem flüsternden Schwirren zu bringen, wogegen es großer künstlerischer Bewältigung des Athems bedarf, um auf einem Blasinstrumente bei mäßigster Ausströmung desselben immer noch den Ton kenntlich und rein zu produziren. Von ausgezeichneten Bläsern müßten daher die Geiger das wirklich tonerfüllte Piano lernen, sobald jene ihrerseits es sich angelegen sein ließen, dasselbe sich von vorzüglichen Sängern anzueignen.* Ibid. 8.352.

²⁰⁵ Achille Rivarde also expresses a desire that mechanism be concealed in his pedagogical treatise of 1921: ‘To me technique is only interesting from the moment it becomes so subtle as to be unnoticeable; when it gives the impression of facility rather than of technical ability. Sarasate had the greatest technique of any violinist, but it was so easy and so natural that it attracted no attention; the listener merely heard the finished result without being disturbed by the consideration of his method of producing it.’ Achille Rivarde, *The Violin and Its Technique as a Means to the Interpretation of Music* (London: Macmillan, 1921), 16–17.

Romantic and Idealist idea that through the drawing up of the material, or objective into the subjective principle, the material/objective ceases to be a collection of unconnected parts and becomes integrated with the whole. This is why Auer's description of undesirable material tone draws attention to its pluralistic nature ('not primarily a matter of the hairs on the stick, of rosin, of change of bow on the strings'). Subsequently, when advising on playing a passage with ascending or descending stepwise motion, Auer recommends that the replacement of fingers as the hand changes position (for example, as the first finger replaces the second when moving up into third position), take place without any glissando, since neglect of this rule is 'certain to spoil a 'singing' passage'.²⁰⁶ Auer does not mean here that slides interfere with a legato bow stroke, since slides require a legato bow stroke in the first place (as opposed to lifting the bow) in order to be heard. What Auer wishes to conceal, rather, is the element of mechanism: Auer insists that the sound produced by the left hand's mechanisms must not obstruct the essentially subjective nature of tone.

A further performative practice resulting from subjective tone for Auer is that the bowing arm should refrain from applying excessive pressure. Tone cannot result solely from an embodied act: as a transcendent 'power' which exceeds human dimensions, it has to be 'called forth':

Hold the bow lightly, yet with sufficient firmness to be able to handle it with ease; above all, do not try to bring out a big tone by pressing the bow on the strings. Do not press down the bow with the arm: the whole body of sound should be produced by means of a light pressure of the wrist, which may be increased, little by little, until it calls forth a full tone, perfectly pure and equal in power.²⁰⁷

Deliberate and purely physical mechanisms are done away with here: there is no need to 'press', and one does not 'bring out' the tone, as if it were a material object. Rather the player employs his higher faculties in 'calling forth' the tone, in keeping with Auer's earlier assertion that tone emanates from the violinist's 'spirit' and intellect'. Auer also indicates how such a tone might sound tangibly: as a force with fundamentally immaterial origins, subjective sound must sound 'pure', and after describing how to produce tone on the violin Auer recommends practising a scale without 'forcing' the tone,

²⁰⁶ Auer, Leopold, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 87.

²⁰⁷ *Ibid.* 55.

which would cause it to become ‘rough’.²⁰⁸ A rough-sounding tone would draw attention to the mechanisms of the instrument, since one’s ear would be drawn to the friction of the hair (and possibly stick) of the bow on the strings.

Auer’s advice regarding the bowing arm is practical in kind, and one can imagine similar instructions’ being given for the playing of stringed instruments in other periods and cultures, as advice on how to make a taut string freely resonate. Nevertheless, Auer’s application of a culturally specific metaphor onto an existing practice serves as an example of the reciprocal relationship of conceptual metaphors and practices. Although underlying metaphors create practices, these practices subsequently amend their metaphorical underpinnings.

Whereas Auer pits subjective tone against objective body/instrument, Moser uses the subject–object binarism to conceive of two types of tone. As well as the subjective tone (*subjectiv-Ton*), which is an ‘inborn gift’ (*angeborene Gabe*), there is the ‘objectively beautiful tone’ (*objektiv-schöne Ton*). Objective tone, however, is denounced on account of its material limitations:

It is really only sound of a certain height or depth, the resonance and colouring of which depend on the quality of the instrument used. It is different with the subjective, expressive tone, which results from an interplay, somewhat difficult to explain, between the gripping of the left-hand fingers and the drawing of the bow across the strings.²⁰⁹

One notes here also, that ‘sound’, *Klang*, as mere sensuousness, is aligned with objective tone. Although Moser describes subjective tone in terms of material as opposed to metaphysical terms his description of vibrato, which follows soon after the above quote, demonstrates his idea of subjective tone as a vital energy:

First, of that factor of tone production, which is capable of thawing the original stiffness of the objective-beautiful sound, that the tone, which from hence has become alive, is able to release in the listener the feeling of pleasant warmth: of trembling or vibrato.²¹⁰

²⁰⁸ Ibid. 55–56, 88, 57.

²⁰⁹ *Er ist eigentlich nur Klang von bestimmter Höhe oder Tiefe, dessen Resonanz und Farbe von der Qualität des betreffenden Instrumentes abhängen. Anders der subjective, ausdrucksvolle Ton, der aus einer schwer zu beschreibenden Wechselwirkung zwischen den greifenden Fingern der linken Hand und dem streichenden Bogen resultiert.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.6.

²¹⁰ *Zunächst von jenem Faktor der Tongebung, der die ursprüngliche Starrheit des objektiv-schönen Klanges soweit aufzutauen imstande ist, daß der nunmehr lebendig gewordene Ton im Zuhörer das Gefühl wohltuender Wärme auszulösen vermag: von der Bebung oder dem vibrato.* Ibid. 3.6.

The import of Moser's sentence is that vibrato plays a central role in bringing about tone's vital properties. 'That factor of tone production' is vibrato, through which the tone becomes 'alive'. The metaphor is made more vivid by the addition of imagery associated with dead or inanimate objects ('stiffness') and signs of life ('thawing', 'warmth').

To return to Auer's and Wagner's notion of the difficulty of producing tone, subjective tone may be so difficult to produce that performance may ultimately be a struggle between self and the material, and not the triumph of mind over body and instrument. In both the pedagogical treatise and the memoirs of Carl Flesch one encounters similar ideas to Moser's and Auer's regarding tone's basis in metaphorical/real melody. In Flesch's posthumous assessment of Joachim's performances, however, a seeming paradox arises between the perceived ideological significance of Joachim's performances and the manifestation of this ideology in the sound and gestures of his playing. Flesch suggests that Joachim's tone production was vitalistic even though his technique faltered:

It was not the perfection of his [Joachim's] violinistic means which left him enthroned on so lonely a height, for Sarasate's sensuous euphony, Wilhelmj's powerful tone and Wieniawski's fire were all superior to what Joachim had to offer in this respect. It was not the beautiful sound 'in itself' that made his quartet playing a profound experience. Rather, it was the inner soulfulness... which gave his playing that indefinable charm. ... In his last years, I sometimes heard him play impurely, dryly, and insecurely. Owing to the absence of any kind of vibrato, his tone had assumed a somewhat senile character... Nevertheless, one could not but be deeply impressed by his genius for shaping his phrases, by the somnambulistic certainty of his intuitions which always seemed to find the only true violinistic expression for the inner significance of the music.²¹¹

For Auer and Moser, as well as elsewhere in Flesch's writings, vibrato, power and good intonation are essential features of subjective tone production. Here, however, Flesch separates them from 'genius' and 'inner life'. As with Moser, Flesch distinguishes between 'sound' (*Klang*) and vitality in performance. Yet what Flesch may have heard was the struggle between the subjective ideal of tone

²¹¹ *Es war nicht die Vollkommenheit seiner geigerischen Mittel, die ihn auf so einsamer Höhe thronen ließ* ('for Sarasate.. respects' omitted in German edition); *es war nicht der schöne Klang „an sich“, der sein Quartettspiel zum Erlebnis werden ließ: es war die innere Beseeltheit... die seinem Spiel jenen undefinierbaren Reiz gaben... Ich habe ihn in seinem letzten Jahren zuweilen unsauber, trocken und unsicher spielen hören. Sein Ton hatte infolge der Abwesenheit jeder Art von Vibrato einen Anstrich von Greisenhaftigkeit bekommen... - und doch konnte man sich dem Eindruck dieser wahrhaft genial zu nennenden intuitiven Gestaltungsgabe nicht entziehen, die mit traumhafter Sicherheit für den inneren Ausdruck stets die einzig richtig scheinende geigerische Übertragung zu finden wußte.* Carl Flesch, *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Freiburg, Zurich: Atlantis, 1960), 32–33. Translation adapted from Carl Flesch, *Memoirs*, ed. Hans Keller and C. F. Flesch, trans. Hans Keller (London: Rockliff, 1957), 30.

and its objective working out in the physicality of the performer's body and instrument. One can say, then, that Joachim's struggle to make subjective tone command his body and instrument captures the essence of tone more than if the subjective were to triumph outright, as the complete realisation of a full legato, correctly vibrating sound, and the concealing of instrumental and bodily mechanisms.²¹²

There is a further precedent for the idea of a struggle between subjectivity and material resources in Philipp Spitta's narrating of Bach's famous Chaconne in D Minor for solo violin. This was written sometime between 1873 and 1880, appearing as it does in Spitta's biography of Bach, and Auer demonstrates his approval of it by quoting it in his *Violin Works and Their Interpretation*. Spitta asserts that 'this chaconne is a triumph of spirit over matter', yet he also refers to the struggle of the two elements: 'whoever once considered musical ideas to be abstract will imagine that the instrument is bound to burst and break under this enormous force'.²¹³ Aside from the encyclopaedic variety of techniques and stamina required to play this lengthy piece, a passage which demonstrates Spitta's idea particularly well is that which delineates four-part polyphony through rapid bariolage. Listeners might recall the ease with which a keyboard instrument performs such polyphonic writing, and would therefore find their attention drawn to the strenuous physical activity required on the violinist's part to produce the same polyphonic texture.

The historical evidence of performance as centrally characterised by the conflict of mind and body contributes to growing evidence, in performance studies, that this is a key issue in the scholarly

²¹² One also notes that Flesch supports his defence of Joachim's playing, as emanating from the inner life of the music, by referring to its 'dreamlike certainty' (*traumhafter Sicherheit*): by this time Freud's study of dreams as a means of accessing the subconscious had already become widely known. In the late nineteenth century the French psychologists Pierre Janet and Jean-Martin Charcot also considered how somnambulism (sleepwalking) and hypnotism shed light on the nature of self. Although *traumhaft* can have the more general meaning of 'dreamlike', Hans Keller's translation of it as 'somnambulist', retained in the above translation, is fitting considering the cultural context of the idea: furthermore, sleepwalking, as the act of performing one's dreams, is an appropriate metaphor since the emphasis here is on the temporal act of shaping phrases.

²¹³ Philipp Spitta, *Johann Sebastian Bach*, 2 vols (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1873), 2.705–706. Cited in Beatrix Borchard, *Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2005), 511. Auer includes a section of Spitta's 'admirable description' into his book, incorporating much of Spitta's Romantic imagery, which, he writes, 'will help the student realize' the 'emotional content' of the Chaconne. Auer's quote does not include Spitta's remarks given in the text here, but they nevertheless convey the same sense of a dialectic of spirit and matter, and of the violin's transcendence of its material limitations; Spitta, in Auer's translation, is quoted as saying 'the master's spirit inspires the instrument to express the inconceivable; at the end of the D major movement the music wells like organ-tone, at times one hears a whole chorus of violins.' Leopold Auer, *Violin Works and their Interpretation* (New York: Carl Fischer, 1925), 21–22.

understanding of performance. As discussed in the introduction, Anthony Gritten and several music psychologists studying the communication of emotion in performance have already suggested that an alternative notion to the idea of the body as the executor of will is the body as competing agency with the mind's intentions. This section has demonstrated that early twentieth-century writers expressed this same experience of performance by drawing on the most readily available cultural concepts to them, namely dialectical thinking and metaphysical notions of consciousness.

Negotiating the Noumenal–Physical Dualism 2: The Embodied Singing Voice as Contested Model for Violinists

Notions of foundational subjectivity tend to repress the idea of imitation. If aesthetic experience arises from the dialectic of self and material then this leaves no room for imitating the material. The Enlightenment view of art as the imitation of nature gave way to the Romantic notion that nature is ordered by art, aligned as it is with the subjective principle. The centrality of a foundational principle of self to post-Romantic aesthetics explains why Auer conceives of the artist's 'true individuality' as something which is 'at bottom', and which contrasts with the relative insignificance of the surface level. After discussing the practising habits of some of the great violinists of his time, Auer continues:

But what I have meant to suggest here is that the great artists are exceptional. Each has his peculiarities, and one must not and should not try to imitate any one of them blindly. Rather you must try to catch the reflection of his genius and, utilizing whatever light it may shed, readapt it to your own individual needs. It is often the case, in fact, that when a great artist stresses some small defect or peculiarity in his playing, any number of young students will first of all seize upon the unessential personal quirk and believe that in so doing they have grasped the very essence of the artist's genius. It is much easier, of course, to imitate this trifling defect than the more substantial qualities which, at bottom, make up the artist's true individuality.²¹⁴

Direct imitation of readily apparent qualities undermines the sanctity of deep self, which is why Auer insists that the violinist should rather try to see how the genius's qualities mirror those in his own self, and then draw his violinistic practices from these.

²¹⁴ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 46–47.

The imitation of the singer's bodily functions is thus an undesirable idea for writers on violin playing, although it is also conceivable that through mimesis the violinist acquires both the body and the self, as manifested in metaphysical song. As was shown above, although Wagner's melos is a highly metaphysical notion he fully endorses its acquiring through imitating singers. In Moser's essay on interpretation the singer is indeed a central model for violinists. Moser begins a section on tone by creating a parallel between the singer and violinist:

The musical singer with a well-sounding voice must partly ascribe the impression he produces to that gift from heaven; likewise, for the interpretation-artist whose instrument is the violin, a beautiful, warm tone is of the greatest importance. It is the sounding utterance of his inner feeling.²¹⁵

The violinist is here not advised to imitate the singer, however. A distinction is set up between the material production of sound and its abstracted origins, and both the singer and violinist are placed on the side of the corporeal—the 'musical' singer, by which Moser is thinking of music as a sensuous performative act, and the violinist, with his physical instrument. But both, says Moser, owe their physical gestures and equipment to tone, which is both of the greatest external ('heaven-born') and internal ('inner') origin. Thus tone, as pure consciousness, is indivisible, and is only portioned in its material outworkings. Nevertheless this quote still suggests that Moser might regard the singer as a model for violinists. Perhaps this is only at the primal level of subjectivity, which is where tone originates. Later, however, there are references to singing which suggests that not only the base subjectivity of the singer constitutes a model but also his or her practices. Moser upholds *bel canto* as an ideal in violin playing, which as Owen Jander and Ellen T. Harris have explained, was understood in the latter half of the nineteenth century as the lost vocal art of the Italians of the eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries.²¹⁶ This does not mean that Moser subsequently advocates the imitation of singing: his commendation of *bel canto* is used to justify looking to historical violin over other

²¹⁵ *Wie selbst der musikalische Sanger, der eine wohlklingende Stimme hat, nicht umhin konnen wird, einen Teil seiner Wirkung jener Himmelsgabe zuzuschreiben, so ist auch fur den geigenden Vortragskunstler ein schoner, warmer Ton von groter Wichtigkeit. Er ist die klingende uerung seines inneren Empfindens.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.6.

²¹⁶ Owen Jander and Ellen T. Harris, 'Bel Canto', in *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online* [online reference source] <<http://oxfordmusiconline.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/02551?q=bel+canto&search=quick&source=omo_gmo&pos=1&_start=1#firsthit> accessed 16 June 2010.

instrumental treatises for guidance on such issues as ornaments, and also to writers who display a direct link to the *bel canto* tradition. Moser shows here that he believes Leopold Mozart's *Violinschule* of 1741 to be such a document:

Since the violin is primarily a singing instrument, and always finds its most characteristic expression in the imitation of the *bel canto* of the Italians, we are surely justified in following the teaching transmitted to us by Leopold Mozart.²¹⁷

Moser's quote suggests, however, that it is because *bel canto* is a model of singing that the violinist should imitate it, and elsewhere he encourages violinists to directly copy vocal practices. For example, Moser uses the example of a singer, 'whose breath fails him at the last moment' to deter violinists from making a break in the middle of the phrase: phrasing is thus comparable to singing all in one breath. Providing an example of a phrase in Louis Spohr's second Violin Concerto, Moser says that 'anyone making a pause here [in the middle of a phrase] in the raising of the bow... creates the same impression as an asthmatic singer whose breath fails him at the most important moment'.²¹⁸ Edmund Severn also recalled to Martens that Joachim would say "we must imitate the human voice" during lessons.²¹⁹

Negotiating the Noumenal—Physical Dualism 3: Endless Song and Enunciation

This section asks whether the subjective–objective binarism extends to make sense of the potentially binaristic notions of tone as pitch inflection and tone as articulation. Spitzer draws attention to a story by Wackenroder in his *Phantasien über die Kunst* in which melody is placed in opposition to rhythm and transcends it. An Oriental hermit is captivated by the imaginary sound of the wheel of time, which constituted 'the regular, metrical beat of time'. On hearing a melody sung by two lovers, however, 'the roaring of the wheel of time fell silent for the naked saint'. As was shown above, Spitzer also

²¹⁷ *Da nun die Violine in erster Linie ein Gesangsinstrument ist und ihre ureigenste Betätigung stets in der Nachahmung des bel canto der alten Italiener gefunden hat, so dürfen wir uns mit weit größerer Berechtigung an die Überlieferungen L. Mozarts. Joachim and Moser, Violinschule, 3.19.*

²¹⁸ *Wer hier... durch Aufheben des Bogens eine Luftpause verursacht, ruft den Eindruck eines asthmatischen Sängers hervor, dem in entscheidenden Moment der Atem ausgeht. Joachim and Moser, Violinschule, 3.14.*

²¹⁹ Frederick, H. Martens, *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1919), 238.

draws attention to Novalis's grouping of melody with rhythm, so that, as the subjective principle, melody's transcendence is not a breaking away from rhythm but a transformation into the Absolute, which then comes to order the lesser principle of rhythm.²²⁰ In relation to notions of tone, then, this section asks whether melody and rhythm are independent categories from one another, or whether they unite in some way. A further question is whether tonal inflection and tonal articulation map onto the melody–rhythm dichotomy, or whether the two constitute a separate concept. Auer's comments suggest that the two domains do map onto each other, in that a constant sound duration, or its modification through dynamics, aligns with song, and rhythms/accents with speech. The positioning of his words suggests this: expression 'is due to the player's control of tone production and tone inflection. He can make the violin speak, he can make it sing.' Tone inflection could indicate changes in pitch but Auer goes on to suggest that speaking tone is essentially rhythmic: on the one hand the violinist expresses through 'dynamics and nuance... tone graduation', and on the other through 'tone inflection by means of rhythm, of stress, of musical shading'.²²¹

Wagner's notion of the simultaneous assimilation and retained autonomy of melody and rhythm helps to make sense of notions of melody and rhythm in writings on violin playing. What Wagner rejects entirely is the notion that melody and rhythm exist independent of each other. The problem manifests itself in conductors' choice of tempo: Wagner argues that conductors erroneously try to acquire the right tempo for a piece by 'spying out something that comes from a figuration and at once arranging their tempo to match' (*spähen... nach irgend welcher darin vorkommenden Figuration aus, um sogleich... ihr Tempo einzurichten*), but rather, Wagner argues, they should use adagio movements, especially the Adagio from Beethoven's 9th symphony, to discover the true tempo, because in such movements tone and rhythm unite.²²² Wagner introduces this issue by asking whether the right tempo results from the sustained tone or 'figured movement' (*figurirte Bewegung*), thus drawing an opposition between the two:

²²⁰ Wilhelm Heinrich Wackenroder, *Werke und Briefe*, ed. Lambert Schneider (Heidelberg: Lambert Schneider, 1967), 198, 201. Cited in Spitzer, *Metaphor as Musical Thought*, 280.

²²¹ In addition, Auer's 'musical shading' suggests that control over timbral qualities does not align with pitch and melody but with rhythm.

²²² Wagner, 'Über das Dirigiren', 8.353.

Obviously the proper pace of a piece of music is determined by the particular character of the reciting it requires. To ascertain this we must be singularly agreed as to the answer. The question, therefore, comes to this: do the requirements of the recitation lean towards the sustained tone (the song), or the rhythmical movement (the figuration)?²²³

Wagner merges the two, however, in order to argue that the adagio movement, in which rhythm ‘dissolves’ into tone, provides the correct tempos of both adagio and allegro movements:

The Adagio stands to the Allegro as the sustained tone stands to the figured movement. The tempo of the adagio gives the law of the sustained tone: here the rhythm dissolves into that which it belongs, alone it is sufficiently pure tone-life. ... A feasting confidence in the sureness of pure musical speech should reign here. ... That which in the Allegro was expressed by changes of figuration, speaks now through the infinite variety of inflected tone.²²⁴

Rhythm dissolved in melodious tone now becomes speech-like (‘a rapt confidence in pure musical speech should reign here’). Wagner does not relate further what he means by inflected tone, as opposed to rhythmical figuration, however. In fact, the two appear to retain their autonomy even in the context of Beethoven’s adagio movement:

This movement... offers a conspicuous example of the breaking up of the pure Adagio by the more marked rhythms of an independent accompaniment, during which the cantilena is steadily and broadly continued. In this section we may recognize, as it were, a fixed and consolidated reflex of the Adagio’s tendency towards infinite expansion; there, limitless freedom in the expression of sound, with fluctuating yet delicately regulated movement; here the firm rhythm of the figured accompaniments, imposing the new regulation of a steady and distinct pace—the consequences of which, when fully developed, we have got the law that regulated the movement of the Allegro in general.

We have seen that sustained tone with its modifications is the basis of all musical execution. Similarly the Adagio, developed, as Beethoven has developed it in the third movement of his Ninth Symphony, may be taken as the basis of all regulation as to musical time.²²⁵

²²³ *Offenbar kann das richtige Zeitmaß nur nach dem Charakter des besonderen Vortrages eines Musikstückes bestimmt werden; um jenes zu bestimmen, müssen wir über diesen einig sein: die Erfordernisse des Vortrages, ob er vorwiegend dem gehaltenen Tone (dem Gesange), oder der rhythmischen Bewegung (der Figuration) sich zuneigt. Ibid. 8.353.*

²²⁴ *Hier steht nun das Adagio dem Allegro gegenüber, wie der gehaltene Ton der figurirten Bewegung. Dem tempo adagio giebt der gehaltene Ton das Gesetz: hier zerfließt der Rhythmus in das sich selbst angehörnde, sich allein genügende reine Tonleben...: hier muß ein schwelgerisches Vertrauen in die überzeugende Sicherheit der reinen Tonsprache herrschen...; was im Allegro der Wechsel der Figuration ausdrückte, sagt sich hier durch die unendliche Mannigfaltigkeit des flektirten Tones. Ibid. 8.353.*

²²⁵ *Dieser Satz... bringt... das deutlichste Beispiel der Brechung des reinen Adagio-Charackters durch die schärfere Rhythmisirung der nun zu eigener Selbständigkeit erhobenen begleitenden Bewegung, bei stets in ihrer charakteristischen Breite forterhaltener Kantilene. Hier erkennen wir das gleichsam fixirte Bild des zuvor nach unendlicher Ausdehnung verlangenden Adagio’s und wie dort eine uneingeschränkte Freiheit für die Befriedigung des tonischen Ausdruckes das zwischen zartesten Gesetzen schwankende Maas der Bewegung angab, wird hier durch die feste Rhythmik der figurativ geschmückten Begleitung das neue Gesetz der*

Rhythm clearly opposes melody, here: the periodicity of its pace imposes regulating order over melody's transcendence ('infinite expansion', 'limitless freedom'). More importantly, however, the two are in tension, and they are encased by Wagner in a singularity, the adagio movement (which constitutes the exemplary model for all other kinds of movements). If one can singularly describe Wagner's basic duality then it is 'articulated tone', in the sense that tone, as infinite melody, intermittently halts and contorts, as it hits the vocal apparatus that articulate.

The simultaneous autonomy and interdependence of melody and rhythm also characterises Flesch's writings on the topic. For Flesch, tone and rhythm conflict with each other, but they also find a common origin in sung poetry, or declaimed music. Flesch draws attention to the unity of melody and rhythm by evoking their common origin in an Arcadian ideal. Flesch appeals to the writings of Rudolf Westphal (1826–1892), a scholar of Ancient Greek music, whom he quotes as follows:

“We need not hesitate to affirm, that the first beginnings of poesy were at the same time the first beginnings of music. The earliest poetry was sung; the earliest music consisted of the melody of the poetic text. Not until they had reached a later stage of their unfolding could both arts develop independently and separately, one from the other: poetry as the epic poem no longer sung but declaimed, music as instrumental music. The first instrumental music was a song without words.”²²⁶

Flesch acknowledges that Westphal is primarily referring to metre here, but Flesch himself includes rhythm in this definition, since he claims that from the point of view of the violinist preparing for performance it is difficult to distinguish between them.²²⁷ Rhythm, as 'hammered tones' (*Klopftöne*),

Festhaltung einer bestimmten Bewegung gegeben, welches in seinen ausgebildeten Konsequenzen uns zum Gesetz für das Zeitmaß des Allegro wird.

Wie der gehaltene und in seiner Andauer modifizirte Ton die Grundlage alles musikalischen Vortrages ist, wird das Adagio, namentlich durch so konsequente Ausbildung, wie sie ihm Beethoven eben in diesem dritten Satze seiner neunten Symphonie gegeben hat, auch die Grundlage aller musikalischen Zeitmaßbestimmung. Ibid. 354–355.

²²⁶ „Wir dürfen ungescheut die Behauptung aufstellen, daß der erste Anfang der Poesie zugleich der erste Anfang der Musik war. Die früheste Poesie war eine gesungene Poesie, die früheste Musik bestand in der Melodie des poetischen Textes. Erst auf einer späteren Stufe der Entwicklung können sich die beiden Künste selbständig und getrennt voneinander entwickeln; die Poesie als das nicht mehr gesungene, sondern deklamierte epische Gedicht, die Musik als Instrumentalmusik. Die erste Instrumentalmusik war ein Lied ohne Worte.“ Carl Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928), 2.9–10, all translations adapted from Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, trans. Frederick H. Martens (New York: Carl Fischer, 1930), 2.10.

²²⁷ Flesch says that one cannot distinguish between metre and rhythm in 'practical art-exercise' (*praktischen Kunstübung*), which seems to draw attention more to musical training rather than the finished composition or performance. It is possible, then, that a sense of metre is regained in the final performance and in the act of listening. 'It would, however, needlessly complicate our work, were we to devote separate consideration to

conflicts with the manifestation of transcendent tone, in the form of dynamics.²²⁸ Dynamics, which Flesch describes as ‘the gradation of tonal strength’ (*Abstufung der Tonstärke*), are also an important aspect of Wagner’s model of tone (‘tone sustained with equal power is the basis of all dynamics’), and of Auer’s (the violinist translates ‘feeling into the expressional terms of dynamics and nuance, into tone gradation’).²²⁹ Flesch highlights a movement in 4/4 from Schumann’s Violin Sonata No.2, op. 121, in which the notes are slurred together in bowings lasting two beats each. A down bow on the first group, then, would provide the expected sense of emphasis on the first beat, and the change of bow would provide the usual weaker emphasis on the third beat. Many of the bars in this movement, however, contain a *sforzando* marking on the third beat, which occurs at the high point of a melodic ascent of two octaves over eight semiquavers in the first two beats of the bar. This is followed by a symmetrical melodic descent:

Example 4:²³⁰

Flesch suggests that the bowing should therefore be inverse: the first grouping should begin on an up bow so that the *sforzando* is played on a down bow, thus realising the growth and abating of tonal power:

metre and rhythm. For in spite of their theoretical differences, it is difficult to distinguish between them in the practical art-exercise, and this last, after all, is the chief consideration of the present work.’ *Es würde jedoch unsere Arbeit unnötigerweise komplizieren, wenn wir der Metrik und der Rhythmik eine gesonderte Behandlung zuteil werden ließen. Denn trotz ihrer theoretischen Verschiedenheit können sie in der praktischen Kunstübung schwer auseinandergehalten werden, und auf diese kommt es ja in der vorliegenden Arbeit in der Hauptsache an.* Ibid. 2.10 and 2.11.

²²⁸ Ibid. 2.10 and 2.11.

²²⁹ Ibid. 2.38 and 2.42.

²³⁰ Robert Schumann, *Sonata for Violin and Piano No.2, Op. 121* (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1881), 4th movement, bars 1–6.

Hand in hand with the regression (*Rückbildung*) of expression, brought about by a descent from tone's height (*Tonhöhe*), is a regression of tone's power. Hence an ascending melos = *cresc.*; a descending melos = *decresc.*²³¹

Flesch demonstrates his awareness that this rule, accompanied by bowing to match, undermines the idea of 'percussive tone', as realising the metrical/rhythmical accents:

A general acquaintance with the fact that a crescendo as a rule, is always associated with the V [up bow] and a decrescendo with the [down bow], even at the cost of a continuous 'inverse' bowing, may probably be taken for granted.²³²

Tone, as both melody and dynamics, then, is both the same as rhythm (in that historically both find a common origin), and is in conflict with it. In the course of his discussion on dynamics, Flesch notes the congruence of dynamic increase/decrease with the rise/fall of melodic contour, thus demonstrating that dynamics and melody occupy the same conceptual space in his model of performance.²³³ The German music theorist Hugo Riemann posited the same idea in his *Musikalische Dynamik und Agogik* (1884), in which he aligns the rise and fall of dynamics and melodic contour with the increase and decrease of his notion of *Lebenskraft* (life-force). Flesch indicates that he had read this text in his section on agogics (see chapter 2).

In wider cultural notions of melody and song the emphasis is often on an increase, but not a decrease, in dynamics. The concept of *Steigerung* helps to make sense of why the emphasis in early twentieth-century writings on violin playing is often on an increase, but not a decrease, in the player's volume. Michael Spitzer demonstrates that the concept of *Steigerung* had an important influence on nineteenth- and early twentieth-century conceptions of melody, as a dynamic manifestation of subjectivity. *Steigerung* (the closest translation of the German is 'intensification') is an important feature of Goethe's organicist concept of language and biology, and, as Spitzer shows, influences A.

²³¹ *Hand in hand mit der Rückbildung des Ausdrucks mittels Verminderung der Tonhöhe geht meist auch die der Tonstärke. Also steigendes Melos = cresc., fallendes = decresc.* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.40. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.44. Flesch's use of the word 'melos' here, which he uses infrequently in the course of his book, suggests he is primarily thinking of Wagner's similar insistence on the importance of realising tonal power.

²³² *Es darf wohl als allgemein bekannt vorausgesetzt werden, daß ein crescendo als Regel stets mit V, decrescendo mit π zu verbinden sei, selbst auf Kosten eines fortlaufend „verkehrten“ Strichs.* Ibid. 2.39, and 2.43.

²³³ 'This climax [to a forte]... in accordance with its verbal meaning, in the great majority of cases is actually the highest, the melodic top note.' *Dieser Höhepunkt... liegt seiner wörtlichen Bedeutung nach in den weitaus meisten Fällen auch tatsächlich auf der höchsten, auf der melodischen Gipfelnote.* Ibid. 2.40 and 2.44.

B. Marx's analyses of music (in his *Die Lehre von der musikalischen Komposition* 1837–63), as well as Ernst Kurth's early twentieth-century analyses of Bach and Wagner. The concept makes sense of dynamic growth through a melody (partly brought about by its linear ascent, which is further supported by *Steigerung*'s connoting of *steigen*, to climb), but is less helpful in explaining melodic descent and the inevitable decay of sound: as Spitzer demonstrates, this leads to a paradox in Marx's writings, in which Marx describes a descending consequent of an antecedent–consequent phrase (labelled as such by Marx himself), as containing both 'intensified motion' and 'melody leading to rest'.²³⁴

The idea of a continual growth or expansion in relation to the metaphysical concept of melody, gives rise to Auer's and Huberman's concept of 'tonal climaxing'. Tonal climaxing is a central feature of the Polish violinist Bronisław Huberman's performing ethos. In an interview with Frederick Martens, in 1923, Huberman outlines his concept of 'endurance study', which consists of the build up of 'a colossal reserve of tonal and technical power and strength'. The primary purpose of this is to prevent loss of power when playing in the higher positions. Martens here directly quotes Huberman:

"I have developed a special technique of power and endurance in the high registers on long notes. Why? Because, as I have already mentioned, violinists usually fall short of the fullness of tone and power needed when a climaxing phrase or a climaxing melody occurs in a high position. I admit that it is difficult to gain lyric breadth and fullness of tone high up on the E string, but it can be done. Caruso made his high climaxing notes gloriously powerful: the violinist can do the same."²³⁵

Huberman's final appeal to how Caruso maintained power in his climaxes shows that it is because tone is the manifestation of subjectivity, with the singer constituting an ideal in this respect, that it needs to be sustained in power. The purpose of building up tonal strength, then, is primarily not to realise melodic and dynamic decrease, or a sustained tone, but to successfully deliver climaxes. Furthermore, as Marx equates *Steigerung* with melodic ascent, Huberman also equates tonal climaxing with melodic ascent.

²³⁴ A. B. Marx, *Die Lehre von der musikalischen Komposition* (2nd edn, Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1841–51), 1.28. Cited in Spitzer, *Metaphor and Musical Thought*, 295–297.

²³⁵ Frederick, H. Martens, *String Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists, Viola Players and Violoncellists* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1923), 68.

That Auer and Huberman do not mention an abating of tonal power in their discussions of dynamic tone further suggests that the concept of *Steigerung* has informed their ideas. A similar incongruity to Marx's simultaneous references to 'intensified motion' and 'melody leading to rest' arises in a passage of Auer's pedagogical treatise, in which Auer discusses the importance of observing both gradual *crescendi* and *diminuendi*, as well as the marking *fp* and further loud–soft emphases which the performer should add according to metrical considerations:

The average student pays no attention to... the value of the crescendo and diminuendo, preceded by a poco a poco... The forte-piano (*fp*)... is often indicated. The accent > is sometimes found stressing the strong and sometimes the weak beat of the measure... [and] should be indicated by the violinist himself over certain notes in every composition in which the composer has omitted to make his own indications. An artist playing a work must resemble the orchestra conductor, who knows how to nurse along both his climaxes of expression, as well as his dynamic climaxes.²³⁶

This final sentence is a strange way to end such a paragraph: if climaxing denotes growth in volume then it is difficult to see how this sums up both the growth and abating of volume, whether through gradual dynamics or sudden pianos. This may be the wholesale application of the idea of dynamics as continual growth, however, to all kinds of uses of dynamics. There are two possible models of performance arising out of this idea: either *Steigerung* is merely an idea for Auer, and has little bearing on the growth and decay of tone; or, like Huberman, the emphasis, in terms of performative practices, is on the growth of tone as opposed to its decay. If the latter is the case then further research on the recorded evidence might wish to find out how the idea of *Steigerung* manifests itself in performative practices: a decay of volume following the climax is inevitable at some point but perhaps in the recorded evidence this point of climax is pushed closer to the end of phrases so as to bring the act of climaxing to the fore much more than its inevitable decay. This further depends on where the composer places the melodic climax and how the performer has interpreted this.

With reference to Wagner's articulation of tone in 1869 there appears to have been a shift, in early twentieth-century notions of violin playing, away from the idea of sustained tone to dynamic tone. It is not fully clear from Wagner's essay whether he regards tone as more sustained and equal in volume or more modulatory in nature. After discussing the 'powerful sustained tone' (*stark*

²³⁶ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 142–144.

ausgehältene Ton) in his example of the fermata at the opening of Beethoven's fifth symphony (see above), Wagner goes on to argue for the production of a 'soft sustained tone' (*leise... ausgehältene Ton*). The powerful and soft tone Wagner describes as 'the two poles of all orchestral dynamics' (*die beiden Pole aller Dynamik des Orchesters*), which despite the inclusion of 'sustained' suggests modulations of volume between the two poles.²³⁷ Wagner describes his first hearing of melos as characterised by 'dynamical monotony' (*dynamischen Monotonie*), but whether this is a particular or general example, however, is unclear.²³⁸ Wagner discovered tonal monotony in a specific musical passage, yet it was also a full revelation of melos in itself. Nevertheless, Flesch interprets Wagner's idea as characterising tone in general, but he writes that this sustain is difficult to obtain on a string instrument, and that therefore it is more 'psychic' (*psychischer*) in nature.²³⁹ As the above evidence from Flesch's, Huberman's and Auer's writings show, the general aim is to discursively defend the modulatory nature of tone's dynamics, not the ability to sustain tone at a single volume level.

In terms of its wider role in the subjectivist ideology of the violinist, the idea of tonal/melodic growth supports the idea of the performer as the pre-eminent fount of vitality for his present culture. As the seed for a culture's flourishing, the violinist can only create growth, and does not stem this blossoming. 'Dynamic'/*Dynamik* commonly denotes power, energy or vitality itself: in the context of contemporary musical production and discoursing it is more common to think of 'dynamics' in a more abstract sense, as a component of musical expression, but the incorporation of the word into Germanic discourses of music in the course of the nineteenth century demonstrates the centrality of the idea that musical expression is vital growth itself, not merely the delineation of growth and decay, in whichever direction it takes. In his general pedagogical treatise of musical interpretation of 1843, Gustav Schilling uses 'dynamic' (*Dynamik*) to denote vital and spiritual interpretation in general.²⁴⁰ This further supports the idea that Auer and Huberman (but not Flesch) put more of an emphasis on tonal growth on their writings (and possibly their practices) over tonal decay.

²³⁷ Wagner, 'Über das Dirigieren', 8.352.

²³⁸ Ibid. 8.341.

²³⁹ Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.42. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.47.

²⁴⁰ Gustav Schilling, *Musikalische Dynamik oder die Lehre vom Vortrage in der Musik* (Kassel: J. G. Krieger, 1843). Schilling's conception of music broadly follows the Romantic and Idealist conception of music as the art most intimately bound up with inner life or spirit.

Articulated Tone as the High Priest's Oratory

Before considering further implications of the idea of modulatory tone, the chapter further contextualises the idea of tone as speech. Speaking, as enacted by the living subject, was a valid metaphor of vital performance; language, however, was not. As a set of signs once removed from the body, or as an autonomous system in itself, language was problematic for notions of an inclusive Absolute, which incorporated both the noumenal and the material. The shift from Enlightenment to Romantic thought brought with it a profound change in the idea of music, from music as representing nature, to music as nature itself. For Schopenhauer, melody is not a representation of Will but Will itself. For Romantic thought and for much of German thought throughout the nineteenth century, however, the aligning of music with subjectivity made problematic its relationship to that which subjectivity was thought to be prior to, namely language, culture, aesthetics and ethics. This is reflected in nineteenth- and early twentieth-century assertions of music's supremacy, even as composers such as Strauss and Mahler engaged with art and literature in the craft of composing. An example of such is Mahler's use of what he described as 'signposts' in the *Marcia Funebre* of his First Symphony, in the form of children's illustrations of *Des Jägers Leichenbegräbnis* (The hunter's funeral). These only function as aides to accessing the music itself, and disappear from view once the listener arrives at this inner core of the music: as Carl Dahlhaus puts it, the signpost functions, for Mahler, 'as what Wagner would call a 'formal motive,' but is not part of the 'thing-in-itself,' being no more than a scaffolding to be torn down as soon as the edifice it helped to erect is finished'.²⁴¹

This conceptual background explains why the metaphor of language, as formal representation, is absent from notions of violin playing in the early twentieth century. The reason why writers such as Moser, Auer and Flesch retained the metaphor of playing as speaking, however, was because it was another way of articulating the idea of the violinist as elite self. These writers' subjectivism prevented them from incorporating the idea of representation: to play the violin is to wield an actual vitality or

²⁴¹ Carl Dahlhaus, *Nineteenth-Century Music*, trans. J. Bradford Robinson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989), 366.

transcendent spirit, not merely to represent it. The idea of performing as declamation or oratory is central to the art of musical interpretation, however: nineteenth-century German texts privilege *vortragen*, to recite, as the chosen verb for playing or singing from scores. Laurence Dreyfus notes that this lasted well into the early twentieth century in German discourses of performance, in contrast to the adoption of *interprétation* in France in the 1890s and ‘interpretation’ in England several decades earlier. To interpret, nevertheless, is to invest the interpreter with authority:

To describe a performance as ‘an interpretation’ is to elevate the act of music-making, to invest it with high, even philosophic, value. Far superior to a mere *rendition* of notes on the page, an *interpretation* takes a considered view of a masterpiece, and offers a personal ‘reading’ which lends itself to a characterisation in words. Whereas one discounts renditions, one argues about interpretations. That is why an interpretation is never a neutral synonym for a performance, and why one elevates interpreters above performers.²⁴²

For Auer, the verb ‘declaim’ is interchangeable with the verb ‘interpret’, and he demonstrates the close relationship of the idea of declamation with the idea of the privileged interpreter of canonical works. This is found in the opening comments of his chapter on style, in which, as the previous chapter demonstrated, he constructs the idea of the performer as the pre-eminent producer of art for the present age:

In dramatic art style is essentially the element of declamation. Music also calls for declamation – interpretation – based on a thorough understanding and grasp of the character of a composition.²⁴³

Hans Letz, as quoted by Frederick Martens in 1919, gives a more tangible definition of what declamation is:

“The attack of the bow on the string should be as incisive as the utterance of the first accented syllable of a spoken word.”²⁴⁴

The ideal metaphor for the privileged declaimer of art music was that of the high priest, as Adolf Weismann described Joachim in 1911 (see chapter 2). The high priest is one who sings and speaks the canonical words, an idea well known by a Christian culture that read both Old and New Testaments, as well as a familiar practice to those modern Jews who had ever attended a Jewish ceremony.

²⁴² Laurence Dreyfus, ‘Beyond the Interpretation of Music’, *The Dutch Journal of Music Theory*, 12/3 (1997), 253–272, 265–267, 253.

²⁴³ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 169.

²⁴⁴ Martens, *Violin Mastery*, 142.

Considering that so many violinists were practising Jews or of Jewish decent, Carl Flesch essentialises the link:

Is it a mere matter of coincidence that the Jewish race, so remarkably gifted for the string instruments, largely employs a singing manner of speech?²⁴⁵

For those that were aware of their heritage—violinists such as Flesch, Joachim, Auer, Huberman, Heifetz—perhaps the image of the singing-speaking authoritative figure was particularly prominent in their idea of the ideal violinist.

Certain passages suggest that to intone is also to produce good intonation. Both the words ‘tone’/*Ton* and ‘intone’/*intonieren*, are present in the word ‘intonation’/*Intonation*. Whereas English usually refers to the musical ‘notes’, German more frequently refers to *die Tönen*, which draws the idea of adjusting the tuning of discrete and stable pitches, nearer to the act of producing tone. Arthur Hartmann and Auer both advise practising tone production by playing a scale. Arthur Hartmann demonstrated to Martens the “secret” of achieving a “singing tone” by playing a scale to him and emphasising the crucial role of a successful sliding mechanism in the left hand. The result is “absolute accuracy of intonation and a singing legato”.²⁴⁶ The use of a scale to practise tone production with the bowing arm suggests a close relationship between tone production and the range of pitches at base constituting a piece of music: tone production is thus closely related to intonation because Auer regards scales as principally a means of practising intonation: Auer regards scales as the ‘one and only one efficacious means of acquiring the technique indispensable to the left hand’, and these are to be practised to develop good intonation: Auer recommends that the student begin with playing ‘the scale in the compass of one octave only, paying the greatest attention to your intonation’. Intonation continues to be the primary goal in the remainder of Auer’s advice on scales: ‘neglect of

²⁴⁵ *Sollte es bloßer Zufall sein, daß die für die Streichinstrumente so auffallend begabte jüdische Rasse sich vielfach einer singenden Sprechweise bedient?* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.78. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.87.

²⁴⁶ Martens, *String Mastery*, 70. Auer’s recommendation of using the scale to develop a legato singing tone with the bow occurs in pages 55–58.

the half-tone progressions is at the very root of poor intonation – which does not mean, of course the correct intonation of the whole tones is not to be just as carefully cultivated? ²⁴⁷

Metaphors surrounding singing tone are not interwoven with notions of intonation in the literature, however, which weakens the argument that intonation is an essential facet of singing tone. A performing ideal of good intonation often appears in conjunction with the ideal of singing tone in the literature, and Mischa Elman (according to Martens) asserts that good intonation is crucial to success in violin playing, which suggests that intonation is on a par with the production of singing tone, as the foundation of violin technique: according to Martens Elman claims that ““without perfect intonation he [the violinist] can never attain the highest perfection””. ²⁴⁸ Flesch provides the strongest evidence that intonation is a facet of singing tone, yet at the same time suggests that his view is not widely held:

Apparently intonation and sound effect are only loosely connected. However, tone production loses through imperfect intonation, inasmuch as our satisfaction at hearing a beautiful sound will be considerably lessened through deviation from correct pitch, without our being conscious at all times of the real cause. ²⁴⁹

Furthermore, there is no extensive integration in any of the primary sources of notions of intonation into the nexus of ideas surrounding tone. Although intonation is important to violin playing, then, it is not possible to say that notions of it are bound up with the idea of singing tone.

Conclusion

²⁴⁷ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 91, 94, 94.

²⁴⁸ Martens, *Violin Mastery*, 48.

²⁴⁹ *Intonation und Klangwirkung stehen miteinander in nur anscheinend losem Zusammenhang. Die Tongebung kann nämlich durch unreine Intonation insofern ungünstig beeinflusst werden, als sich unser Wohlgefallen an einem an sich schönen Klang infolge seiner Abweichung von der korrekten Tonhöhe erheblich vermindert, ohne daß wir uns der eigentlichen Ursache bewußt werden.* Carl Flesch, *Problems of Tone Production in Violin Playing*, trans. Gustav Saenger (New York: Fischer, 1931), 11. Carl Flesch, *Das Klangproblem im Geigenspiel* (Berlin: Ries and Erler, 1931), 11.

The idea of modulatory tone in the early twentieth-century model of violin playing leads to an emphasis on gradual transitions between chronological musical events, as opposed to their abrupt juxtaposition. Michael Spitzer argues that the incorporation of the metaphor of melody as life into nineteenth-century musical discourses contributes to a shift from the eighteenth century's predominantly metrical, or 'pulse' model of rhythm, to 'a model of rhythm as continuous: a move from particle to wave'.²⁵⁰ The idea of gradual modulation of tone informs Flesch's views on dynamics. Flesch initially appeals to the idea of progress in the material development of musical instruments, which allows them to produce more than the simple terraced dynamics suggested by eighteenth-century musical scores. Flesch decries a sudden *f* following a *p* in the chamber music of Mozart and Haydn, on the basis that it is 'a mode of expression no longer consonant with contemporary means' (*zeitgenössischen künstlerischen Mitteln nicht mehr in Einklang stehenden Ausdrucksweise*).²⁵¹ Flesch continues:

The *fp*, that is the immediate abatement of tonal power, may not always be taken too literally, any more than the *sfz* accent. The latter, in particular, is usually carried out with a crude, undifferentiated deployment of strength—'torn out'—whereas its dynamic colouring should adapt itself to the momentary fundamental strength as well as the character of the entire work.²⁵²

This final comment here properly demonstrates that the gradual growth and abating of tone is the basic musical event which underpins all other aspects of the performed piece of music—it is 'fundamental strength', and as such is always gradual, which thus renders sudden dynamical contrasts incomprehensible.

Although Moser regards the articulation of rhythm as essential to performance, he is keen to emphasise that the continuity of the song must not be interrupted. Providing an example of a phrase in Louis Spohr's second Violin Concerto, Moser says that 'anyone making a pause here [in the middle of a phrase] in the raising of the bow... creates the same impression as an asthmatic singer whose breath

²⁵⁰ Spitzer, *Metaphor and Musical Thought*, 281.

²⁵¹ Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 43. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 47.

²⁵² *Das fp, also das sofortige Nachlassen der Tonstärke, darf auch nicht immer wörtlich genommen werden, ebensowenig wie der sfz-Akzent. Insbesondere der letztere wird zumeist mit roher indifferenzierter Kraftentfaltung – „gerissen“ – ausgeführt, während seine dynamische Färbung sich der momentanen Grundstärke sowie dem Charakter des ganzen Werkes anzupassen hat.* Ibid. 43, 43 and 47, 48.

fails him at the most important moment'.²⁵³ Also, vibrato should be applied to notes with greater rhythmical and metrical stress, resulting in lost time (*verlorne Zeit*) in the application of vibrato. This event or process (*Vorgang*), however, should 'take place without creating an interruption (*Störung*) to the rhythmic flow (*Taktfluss*) of the passage'.²⁵⁴

The similarity of writers' notion of modulatory tone to the idea of dynamic musical processes in energeticist analyses suggests that writers on violin playing do not regard their idea as exclusively characterising musical execution but as synonymous with the musical work itself. As was noted earlier, energeticists base their analyses on the premise that music is not frozen forms but subjective experience. Furthermore, their analyses stem from the idea of music as a temporal event, thus bringing their idea of music closer to performers' experience of music: they consider the expectations and frustrations arising from tensions created by musical events or components separated by time, such as delays in harmonic resolutions. The energeticists' subjectivism helps to explain why writers such as Moser, Auer, Flesch and Huberman did not regard their notion of dynamic tone as exclusively the performer's addition to the existing musical work, but as the work itself. There are more infrequent passages in the primary sources which refer to theoretical elements existing on the periphery of the nexus of ideas surrounding singing tone: for example, Moser's introductions to edited violin works in his *Violinschule* and Auer's discussions of the violin repertoire in his *Violin Works and their Interpretation* contain comments on key modulations, treatment of themes and large-scale structures (such as sonata form, rondo, and so on). For Moser, theoretical knowledge helps the violinist to understand a piece of music, but it is his 'ability to grasp the intentions of the composer', as an act of spiritual empathising, which has the final word: theoretical knowledge only 'provides the key' to this:

Furthermore, a good performing (*ausübender*) musician must have at least as much knowledge of composition [lit. the art of composing tone] as will enable him to understand the harmonic progression of a piece, to trace thematic work in large movements, and to be able to see the structure of a work in its entirety. Although a knowledge of such matters is in no way synonymous with the spiritual capturing (*geistigen Erfassen*) of a composition, it does

²⁵³ *Wer hier... eine Luftpause verursacht, ruft den Eindruck eines asthmatischen Sängers hervor, dem in entscheidenden Moment der Atem ausgeht.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.14.

²⁵⁴ *Der Vorgang ohne jede Störung des Taktflusses.* Ibid. 3.7.

provide the key to it. The decisive factor in an artistic performance will always lie in the capacity of the player to empathise with the intentions of the composer, that during the rendering of the piece they seem to speak out as self experience.²⁵⁵

The richest portions of writers' texts centrally build on the idea of subjective tone, and these incorporate a wide range of notions of performative practices. Tone is not only a legato bow stroke, but, as an idea which structures notions of portamento, vibrato, articulation, dynamics, tempo and rhythm, extends to underpin music in its entirety.

The idea of music as continuity challenges a basic conceptual framework in psychological approaches to music, of music as patterning. As the discussion of the psychological research in chapter 1 showed, much of the research in music perception and cognition appears only to be concerned with hierarchical patterns. Early twentieth-century literary sources on violin playing suggest, however, that music is always in a process of growing or receding. Dynamic shaping occurs in the ever-elusive present that is continuously transforming, not on musical components that acquire meaning through their static temporal or spatial positioning in relation to each other, and across large expanses of memorised musical events. Tone is fundamentally both the present and possessed of a sense of 'presence' (closely aligned with a sense of a subjectivity). Barthes was listening for the 'grain' of the voice, as the presence of lips, teeth, glottis, and lungs, as opposed to the sounding of a static and non-subjective linguistic code. In *In Search of Opera*, Abbate revises the history of opera to present operas not as narratives that structure large expanses of time and multiple characters and events, but as sites of 'presences', in which self-governing human subjects are brought forth.²⁵⁶

²⁵⁵ *Des weiteren wird ein guter ausübender Musiker wenigstens so viel von der Tonsetzkunst wissen müssen, daß er imstande ist, sich über den harmonischen Verlauf eines Stückes Rechenschaft zu geben, der thematischen Arbeit in größeren Sätzen nachzugehen und den formalen Aufbau eines Werkes zu überblicken. Ist die Kenntnis dieser Dinge an sich auch noch keineswegs gleichbedeutend mit dem gesitigen Erfassen einer Komposition, so liefert sie doch den Schlüssel dazu. Das Entscheidende beim künstlerischen Vortrag wird immer in der Fähigkeit des Ausführenden liegen, die Intentionen des Autors so nachzuempfinden, daß sie sich in seiner Darstellung wie ein Selbsterlebnis aussprechen.* Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.6

²⁵⁶ Whereas Abbate also investigates discursive articulations of absence, however, there is a clear repression of absence in the discourse surrounding early twentieth-century discourse. The zeal with which writers seek to articulate and guard the vital, healthy and singing genius of the performer suppresses any discursive play on absence. Chapter 5 will look at exceptions to this trend, however, in Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers*, in which rather than positing pre-existent and self-sufficient presences, Flesch invokes a more dynamic sense of the performer's process of becoming.

One consequence of this model of music is that its embodied qualities come to the fore as central aspects of the performed musical work. Since music is at base the increase and decrease of tone then dynamics, as the increase and decrease of sound volume, plays an important role in achieving this, as the primary literature suggests. Furthermore, writers are primarily discussing musical execution, as necessarily involving bodies, which supports the argument that writers on performance favour music's embodied or physical qualities in their discursive models. Examples from the literature discussed in this chapter support this argument: notions of the body's role in the creation of vibrato, portamento, bow strokes, and so on, draw notions of it into a close relationship with writers' metaphysical notions of mind. It is not the case, then, as Emmanuel Bigand and Bénédicte Poulin-Charronnat assert, that tonal cognition, as an example of complex patterning, is superior to the embodied qualities of music, i.e. pitch, timbre and volume.²⁵⁷ This is not to say that the body is unproblematic, however, and the next chapter will focus more on the body's subjugation by notions of mind, even as it continues to play an indispensable role in writers' discursive models.

Since tone occupies the present moment, an important definition of rhythm and pulse is the inflection of the present sound-object. Subsequently, the idea of rhythm and pulse gains an affinity with performers' notion of articulation, as the speech-like attack which notes receive. Metre is not an important concept in writers' nexus of ideas, which makes sense considering that it acquires its meaning from repetitive patterns, thus detracting from the present/presence of tone. Writers also conceive of vibrato and portamento as assisting in the continual increase and decrease of tone, and do not conceive of their meanings as arising from long-term patterning or forward planning. It might even be possible to revise commonly used notions of musical structure according to the idea of modulatory tone. Huberman's, Auer's and Flesch's writings show that climaxes are important milestones in tone's continuous increase and decrease. Thus future research on recordings might wish to portray the piece as moving to, and away from, several climaxes, rather than delineating the start and end points of phrases and sections (for example, the various sections of sonata form).

²⁵⁷ This is the view of Emmanuel Bigand and Bénédicte Poulin-Charronnat in their survey of the research on tonal cognition. Emmanuel Bigand and Bénédicte Poulin-Charronnat, 'Tonal Cognition', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 59–71.

This is not to suggest, however, that rhythm and metre, as patterning, lose their identity in tone, but rather that they enter into a dialectical relationship with it. This study has demonstrated the centrality of the idea of a dialectic to early twentieth-century writers' thought, influenced as they were by a nineteenth-century, and largely Germanic, culture and philosophy. A culturally informed analysis of early twentieth-century recordings should thus broadly apply this principle. Whereas most analytical studies of recordings have hitherto studied theoretical categories, especially tempo, in isolation from each other, a culturally-informed study of early twentieth-century string recordings would consider these musical elements in relation to each other, since they all participate in the execution of modulatory tone. Such a study might therefore take a clear passage in which tone grows towards a climax and examine how the rhythm, pulse, metre and also perhaps the structure of phrases, might both assist in the creation of this climax, as the articulation of notes, or contradict it through their own internal patterning. The patterning would not be viewed as autonomous from modulating tone (executed through dynamics, vibrato, portamento articulation, and timbre), but as having the ultimate purpose of conflicting with tone, as the basic musical event.

The next chapter takes forward the various manifestations of the noumenal–material dichotomy to focus on the idea of tone as physical and moral health. A meaning of the noun 'tone' given by the OED is 'the degree of firmness or tension proper to the organs or tissues of the body in a strong and healthy condition'. According to the OED's examples this meaning was in usage up until the end of the nineteenth century, as demonstrated by an advert in *Chatauqua Magazine* in 1896 that spoke of 'some remedy that will tone-up the nervous system'.²⁵⁸ The idea of tone as both song and physical health is united in the manner in which Moser uses the metaphor of an asthmatic singer to discuss failures of tone production.

More specifically, the central idea which the next chapter takes forward is the complex relationship which tone negotiates between notions of self and body. This chapter has shown that self

²⁵⁸ Tone, v. Oxford English Dictionary [online reference source] (Oxford University Press) <<http://dictionary.oed.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/203152?rskey=CGTDPV&result=2&isAdvanced=false#eid>> accessed 30 September 2011.

and body are in harmony with each other, as an ideal of tone production, and in conflict with each other. The cultural privileging of notions of consciousness asserts their dominance over body, but bodies and instruments ultimately localise these transcendent entities and create friction against them. The next chapter explores this relationship further by shifting the focus away from the more reflective and elevated discourse of metaphysical self, to one of the pressing anxieties of early twentieth-century Europe, namely the question of physical and moral hygiene.

Chapter 4

Medico-Moral Anxieties and the Problem of Individual and Social Bodies

This chapter develops the model of superior self and its materialisation in singing tone, as expounded in the previous two chapters, to consider how it interacts with notions of health and morality. In terms of the cultural fields which writers negotiate, the chapter broadens its focus, outwards from a reflective and high discourse of metaphysical notions of self, to a discourse of disease that preoccupied society at large in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. Notions of disease proliferate in political, sociological and medical discourses of the period, and fill the pages of newspapers and cheap tracts offering advice on morals and hygiene. They also infiltrate the more refined discourses of self and aesthetics, however: as chapter 2 demonstrated, notions of physiological health are integral to Nietzsche's construct of the superior producer of art, as well as Wagner's notion of melos. This chapter will demonstrate, then, that the notion of superior consciousness and its subservient social/individual body also extends to centrally structure pathological notions of violin playing. The inclusion of medical and moral anxieties into the discourse further enriches notions of the mind-body relationship, which in turn produce new sets of ideas of performative practices.

The Spread of Unconscious and Uncontrollable Behaviour

In the late nineteenth century anxieties grew in Russia over notions of the crowd and its potentially destructive behaviour. Daniel Beer has argued that the events of the French Revolution constituted a lasting source of anxiety for the Russian ruling class, the size of which was small compared to the country's vast peasant population. As an example, Beer notes a passage in Tolstoy's *War and Peace*, in which Vereshchagin stands accused of disseminating defeatist literature in Moscow, as the city faces Napoleon's siege. A crowd of Muscovites take the law into their own hands, however, and on hearing a cry from Vereshchagin, 'the barrier of human feeling... suddenly broke', and the 'wave burst... carrying them off their feet and engulfing them all'. Only when the accused was dead, did

‘each one come up, glanced at what had been done, and with horror, reproach and astonishment, pushed back again’.²⁵⁹ Tolstoy’s narrative articulates an imagined disempowerment of state justice and individual will powers, and the arising of a hidden agency that compels the collective to commit brutal violence.

In response to this anxiety the medical profession formed theories concerning how ideas could spread unconsciously through the populace. Beer demonstrates that the fear of the crowd merged with theories of the spread of bacterial infection to produce the theory that ideas, feelings or behaviours could be transmitted unconsciously from person to person. These theories acquired credibility from sociologists’ notion of imitation, as well as the idea of suggestion or suggestibility, drawn from scientific studies of hypnosis. Beer argues that these theories became progressively more pessimistic in outlook, which, he says, ‘provides a fascinating lens through which to examine the evaporating faith of the progressive intelligentsia in its own tutelary mission of national enlightenment’. Whereas earlier writers sustained a faith in reason and willpower:

Under the conjoined influence of Italian and French studies of the crowd, Russian clinicians began to register serious concerns that human agglomerations wielded disturbing transformative powers. They were able to alter the moral and intellectual nature of all their constituents, not just the unenlightened, from civilized and sensible individuals to violent and destructive animals. Finally, studies of moral contagion began to emphasize that essentially irrational forces governed all human beings. A series of institutional and political structures capable of filtering out the baser impulses of human beings was required in order to hold these forces in check.²⁶⁰

Similarly, this chapter explores violinists’ notions of diseased collective behaviour, in the context of performance communities. Furthermore, it asks whether, as authorities in their field, they retain their faith in an ideal of consciousness or resort to methods of control, in their search for remedies.

For Leopold Auer, undesirable violin practices spread unconsciously from teachers to pupils. Auer had received extensive exposure to intellectual developments in the educated and aristocratic circles of late Imperial Russia: four years prior to writing *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (1921), Auer

²⁵⁹ Leo Tolstoy, *War and Peace*, trans. Louise and Aylmer Maude (Ware: Wordsworth, 1993), 705. Cited in Daniel Beer, ‘Microbes of the Mind: Moral Contagion in Late Imperial Russia’, *The Journal of Modern History*, 79/3(2007), 531–571, 531–532.

²⁶⁰ *Ibid.* 570.

had emigrated from St Petersburg, where he had previously spent fifty years of his life (Auer moved there in 1868). Auer's autobiography (*My Long Life in Music*), attests to his longstanding association with the elite of St Petersburg.²⁶¹ It is also worth remembering that before leaving Russia in 1917, Auer would have experienced the events of the Russian Revolution, where accumulating fears over mob violence would have appeared, to many, to have been confirmed. Auer thus wrote his series of books in the 1920s with this very real experience of social collapse in his memory. In his pedagogical treatise, Auer complains about the spread of bad habits from teachers to pupils:

In those countries... which have no state-supported or state-endowed schools of music, anyone who takes a fancy to give music-lessons may – if he can receive a few pupils – enter the profession! I do not by any means wish to imply that all private teachers are irresponsible. Many are indeed desirous of doing their best, but alas, having themselves been ill-taught, they spread the poison of their own ignorance, broadcast a plague, which carries off many hapless innocent victims of their pernicious teaching methods.²⁶²

Auer believes that all are helpless victims of an inanimate and destructive force. Auer's particularly strong language further reflects the pessimism that, as Beer shows, had grown acute by the early decades of the twentieth century.

Notions of behavioural contagion further lead Auer to advise against imitating great violinists. Chapter 2 demonstrated that Auer disparages imitation on the basis that genius is deep in origin, and that therefore one cannot acquire genius by imitating its surface manifestations. Wider cultural anxieties over the disastrous consequences of imitated behaviour give Auer further reason to denounce imitation. More specifically, these pessimistic accounts of collective behaviour cause Auer to become distrustful of appearances of genius. Auer is sure that genius exists, but from the collective's point of view it can be easily forged:

It is, alas, only too easy to caricature, with complete unconsciousness and a sincere belief that one is improving one's interpretation, some great artist's interpretation of a movement or a passage. The slightest additional emphasis, the tiniest exaggeration of a rubato, will often

²⁶¹ In the absence of a middle class population, most Russian intellectuals were of aristocratic origin and therefore Russian intellectual developments and aristocratic social life very much overlapped. It is clear from Auer's autobiography that he and a handful of other musicians (such as the cellist Charles Davidoff and the pianist Anton Rubinstein) constituted the musical elite of Russia, and Auer recalls their extensive social interaction with members of the aristocracy: for example, Auer recalls his private performances for Czar Alexander II in the 1870s, and his performances at the coronations of Alexander III in 1882 and Nicholas II in 1894. Leopold Auer, *My Long Life in Music* (London: Duckworth, 1924), 185–186, 273–283.

²⁶² Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921), 54.

produce the most grotesque results, and the student, in his earnest effort to achieve a perfect replica of the expressional feature he is imitating, does not realize that he is worshipping the perversion of an ideal.²⁶³

It is this thinking on behalf of the collective that cause Auer and Flesch to turn from idealistic models of consciousness to notions of troubled group behaviour. In a fickle exchange of one set of ideas for another, these writers drop their serene accounts of singular and inclusive forms of subjectivity for the notion that multiple performers and listeners constitute an inanimate threat. Anxieties over the destructive behaviour of crowds constituted a pan-Western cultural *more* in the nineteenth century, and were not exclusively Russian in origin. As with Russian writers, the harmful legacy of the French Revolution also caught the attention of the German cultural commentator Max Nordau, who in 1895 wrote that the Revolution had caused the modern-day French to become ‘nervously strained and predestined to morbid derangement’.²⁶⁴ The influence of theories of destructive crowd behaviour on late nineteenth-century French politics, as found in the writings of Gustav LeBon and Gabriel Tarde, has been documented by Robert Nye and Susanna Barrows.²⁶⁵ Similar ideas also caught on in England: the *Spectator* wrote in 1886 that the perception of the mob as ‘more thievish, more cruel, more murderous’ than ‘any of its compound individuals... is not born of terror only, but is more or less substantially true’.²⁶⁶ The response of the public to performances is a fraught issue for Carl Flesch, who spends several pages going into much depth on the kinds of members of the audience, and to what extent the performer should value the criticism of each. These range from uneducated listeners to critics with general musical knowledge, as well as fellow performers acquainted with the practice of violin playing. Flesch’s more general idea here is that the response of individuals are valuable, but responses generated among the collective are repugnant, and this manifests itself in the form of the applause:

²⁶³ Ibid. 156.

²⁶⁴ Max Nordau, *Degeneration* (New York: Appleton, 1895), 42.

²⁶⁵ Robert Nye, ‘Degeneration, Neurasthenia and the Culture of Sport in Belle Époque France’, *Journal of Contemporary History*, 17 (1982), 51–68. Susanna Barrows, *Distorting Mirrors. Visions of the Crowd in Late Nineteenth-Century France* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 1981).

²⁶⁶ ‘The Fear of Mobs’, *The Spectator*, 59 (1886), 218–19. Cited in Daniel Pick, *Faces of Degeneration: A European Disorder, c.1848-1918* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), 222.

It is well known that individual modes of feeling, once they are massed in a crowd, undergo a change in so far that they lose much of their independence... Man in the mass allows himself to be carried away to deeds of which the individual never would be capable.²⁶⁷

For Flesch the audience *en masse* represents a threat: to gauge the success of one's performance by the applause 'leads to dangerous illusions' (*verleitet zu gefährlichen Illusionen*).²⁶⁸ This contrasts distinctly to Flesch's confident assertion, a few pages earlier, that the performer 'is not merely the middleman between the creative composer and the listener who enjoys' (*nicht bloß der Mittelsmann zwischen schaffendem Komponisten und genießendem Hörer*) but 'posits... a synthesis of the natures of both' (*stellt... eine Synthese des Wesens beider*).²⁶⁹ In place of this singularity, Flesch now presents a plurality of listener types and goes into extensive detail regarding the kinds of criticism to expect from each. In doing so he replaces the pre-eminent artist's command over the collective sensibility with a treacherous field of dissenting individuals.

Vibrato and Anxieties over the Nerves

In wider culture, a central idea fuelling fears over social disintegration was that of nervous exhaustion. The American neurologist George Miller Beard's efforts to increase awareness of nervous afflictions culminated in his influential texts *A Practical Treatise on Nervous Exhaustion (Neurasthenia): Its Symptoms, Nature, Sequences, Treatment* (1880), and *American Nervousness: Its Causes and Consequences* (1881), and he is responsible for coining the term 'neurasthenia', a classification of disease which became widespread in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century culture. Neurasthenia was essentially a 'catch-all' disease, which accounted for all kinds of maladies and shortcomings, including physical and mental exhaustion, susceptibility to fantastical ideas, inability to perform sexually, and masturbation. Hysteria was a syndrome purported to have similar effects to

²⁶⁷ *Es ist bekannt, daß die Gefühlswaise der Individuen, wenn sie zu einer Masse vereinigt sind, insofern eine Veränderung erleidet, als sie viel von ihrer Unabhängigkeit einbüßt... Menschensammlungen lassen sich oft zu Taten hinreißen, deren der Einzelne niemals fähig gewesen wäre.* Carl Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928), 2.5, all translations adapted from Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, trans. Frederick H. Martens (New York: Fischer, 1930), 2.5–6.

²⁶⁸ *Ibid.* 2.6 and 2.6.

²⁶⁹ *Ibid.* 2.1 and 2.1.

those of neurasthenia, the difference being, as Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra notes, that whereas neurasthenia was associated more with the middle classes, hysteria was associated more with women and the lower classes.²⁷⁰ Notions of nervous decline are further central to the concept of degeneration, but writers contributing to *Cultures of Neurasthenia: From Beard to the First World War* emphasise that whereas cultures of neurasthenia were concerned with more strictly medical and domestic problems, discourses of degeneration focus more on pathological threats to nation states. In doing so, discourses of degeneration incorporate a wider range of social, political and cultural notions: as this chapter will go on to show, one such idea is that the modern age is essentially a period of decline.

Auer combines his notions of behavioural contagion with the idea of nervous maladies to assert that continuous vibrato is the result of nervous malfunctioning. Auer's comments on vibrato occur in a sub-section on vibrato ('The Vibrato', 58–63), as part of his chapter on tone production (chapter 4, 'Tone Production', 51–68). The purpose of vibrato for Auer is to 'embellish... a singing passage or tone', which suggests that the problem for Auer was the tendency to use vibrato on every note instead of on select notes: many violinists 'habitually make use of the device' and are 'convinced that an eternal vibrato is the secret of soulful playing', Auer writes. Auer is convinced, however, that this is not a willed action but results from a nervous affliction in the body:

But this curious habit of oscillating and vibrating on each and every tone amounts to an actual *physical* defect, whose existence those are cursed with it do not in most cases even suspect. The source of this physical evil generally may be traced to a group of sick or ailing nerves, hitherto undiscovered.

Auer's comments demonstrate that his concerns over vibrato usage derive from his notion of behavioural contagion and a suppressing of will power: 'in some cases, no doubt,' Auer writes, sufferers of continuous vibrato are 'perhaps against their own better instincts, conscientiously carrying out the instructions of unmusical teachers'.²⁷¹ His switch to religious language, seen in the previous quote, however, begins to articulate the notion of an overriding agency, but of a very different kind to those discussed so far in this thesis: that individuals are 'cursed' with the 'plague' of vibrato evokes

²⁷⁰ Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra, 'Introduction: Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First-World War', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 1–30, 10.

²⁷¹ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 59, 59, 60, 61, 60.

the idea of a hostile and judgemental deity. The conclusion further considers the significance of this form of self in the wider context of notions of consciousness, such as spirit and vitality.

Auer's discourse further demonstrates the influence of notions of neurasthenia in that he compares continuous vibrato to eating overly rich food. Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra notes that among other symptoms, George Miller Beard applied the label of neurasthenia to indigestion, and having surveyed patient records in Germany from around the turn of the twentieth century, Joachim Radkau notes that digestion was 'a main topic of neurasthenic experience'. 'Probably digestion problems', continues Radkau, 'are a typical outcome of a general crisis in early modern lifestyles generated by the combination of a sedentary way of life and meals which were too heavy'.²⁷² Auer likens continuous vibrato to the addition of highly flavoursome ingredients to every component of a meal, thus resulting in monotony, even though the original intention was to create variety:

But their own appreciation of musical values ought to tell them how false is the notion that vibration, whether in good or bad taste, adds spice and flavour to their playing. If they attempted to eat a meal in which the soup were too salty, the entrée deluged with a garlic-sauce, the roast too highly peppered with cayenne, the salad-dressing all mustard, and the dessert over-sweet, their palates would not fail to let them know that the entire dinner was overspiced. But their musical taste (or what does service for them in place of it) does not tell them that they can reduce a programme of the most dissimilar pieces to the same dead level of monotony by peppering them all with the tabasco of a continuous *vibrato*.²⁷³

An additional motive for including a culinary metaphor is to promote taste, as a socially elitist concept, in violin playing, which reinforces Auer's notion of the violinist as superior and rare genius.

Although other violinists are less hostile to the use of continuous vibrato they still express an anxiety over an unhealthy nervous vibrato. Hans Wessely writes that the ability to vibrate continuously from one note to the next in a 'cantabile' phrase marks the highest level of technical achievement. However, Wessely still distinguishes between continuous vibrato and an uncontrollable

²⁷² Gijswijt-Hofstra, 'Introduction', 2. Joachim Radkau, 'The Neurasthenic Experience in Imperial Germany: Expeditions into Patient Records and Side-looks upon General History', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 199–218, 209. Although there is a large number of existing studies possessing a high degree of relevance to the topic at hand, the limited number of secondary sources used in this chapter provide a sufficient context for beginning to open up a field of research addressing how discourses of performance negotiate pathological notions.

²⁷³ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 60.

‘swinging’ of the left hand and arm which, he says, ‘is no longer the outcome of expression but a very bad habit, or a matter of uncontrolled nerves’.²⁷⁴ Whereas Auer and Wessely distinguish between a healthy vibrato and a spurious kind resulting from ‘sick’ nerves, the American violinist Achille Rivarde maintains that vibrato is always caused by nervous activity in the left arm and hand. Rivarde advises players to harness the nervous system’s ever-present influence over vibrato, however, in order to make correct use of the device:

A person with an excess of nervous energy would need to practice [sic] very different movements from another person who had very little nervous power. What would produce just the right degree of nervous tone sensibility in the latter would result in an almost unnatural frenzy in the former.²⁷⁵

This discussion of writers’ notions of pathological vibrato raises several questions which the following sections address. Having established in chapter 3 that vibrato is an integral facet of singing tone, an important question is how pathological notions of vibrato modify this model. Another question is why vibrato is shaped by pathological notions more than other aspects of violin playing. The chapter further asks what the response of violin pedagogues was to violinists’ supposed lack of control over vibrato, and explores their suggested remedies. Do writers continue to exert their ideal of the violinist as high artist, as a way of ensuring standards, or whether, as with attempts to police uncontrollable behaviours in early twentieth-century Russia, do they resort to other means of control? In addition to vibrato, the chapter will consider these issues in relation to notions of tempo, portamento, and ornaments also, and the following section constitutes an introduction to medico-moral notions of these practices.

Notions of Sexuality and Substance Abuse, and their Influence on Notions of Tempo, Portamento and Ornaments

²⁷⁴ Hans Wessely, *A Practical Guide to Violin-Playing* (London: Joseph Williams, 1913), 89–90.

²⁷⁵ By ‘tone sensibility’ Rivarde is mainly thinking of vibrato, since this quote is taken from a chapter entitled ‘Vibrato’. Achille Rivarde, *The Violin and Its Technique as a Means to the Interpretation of Music* (London: Macmillan, 1921), 30.

The perennial moral issues of sexual behaviour and alcohol/narcotic usage were drawn up into discourses of the nerves and degeneration in the latter half of the nineteenth century. Volker Roelcke has drawn attention to the influential work of Emil Kraepelin, who in the early twentieth century argued that degeneration was largely caused by the damaging effects of alcohol and syphilis.²⁷⁶ Max Nordau's 'Degeneration' (*Entartung*, 1895) was a sensationalist diatribe on the destructive effects of nervousness: among the symptoms of an 'exhausted central nervous system' Nordau lists a compendium of sexual aberrations, including 'ego-mania', 'sexual psychopathy', subversion of male and female roles and attire, attempts to make legal same-sex marriages, sadism, bestiality, and necrophilia.²⁷⁷ In his study of bourgeois culture, Peter Gay writes that prostitution was 'doubtless a conspicuous and distressing presence', in the nineteenth century, which, as Gay shows, prompted a range of responses, from moral outrage, to attempts to regulate the activity in the context of state institutions.²⁷⁸

Carl Flesch uses notions of sex and substance abuse to denigrate virtuosity, mechanistic practising habits and the improper use of portamento. Flesch denounces violin virtuosos on the grounds that they crave the constant attention of the public, which he compares to 'the constant use of some narcotic' (*fortwährend Gebrauch eines Narkotikums*), and 'practice carried on as a sport, without any musical need, however... a narcotic which creates the gratifying illusion of duty fulfilled' (*Sportmäßig betriebenes Üben ohne musikalische Notwendigkeit hingegen ist... ein Narkotikum, das die Befriedigung erfüllter Pflicht vortäuscht*).²⁷⁹ Deceptive mechanism, the antithesis to the artwork as consciousness, combines here with society's condemnation of substance abuse to produce the idea of a narcotic, which masks the true extent to which the player has served the requirements of consciousness/ the artwork. Flesch also condemns practice which does not meet the requirements of the artwork as mere bodily and mechanistic exercise. With regard to the portamento, Flesch

²⁷⁶ Volker Roelcke, 'Electrified Nerves, Degenerated Bodies: Medical Discourses on Neursathenia in Germany, circa 1880–1914', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 177–198.

²⁷⁷ Max Nordau, *Degeneration* (New York: Appleton, 1895), 536–539.

²⁷⁸ Peter Gay, *The Bourgeois Experience; Victoria to Freud*, ii: *The Tender Passion* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986), 352.

²⁷⁹ Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.65, 2.59. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.94, 2.105.

personifies it as a seductive agent which should be held at arm's length: 'every true artist', he wrote, 'should have enough self control to relinquish a beautifully sounding—and oh, so seductive—portamento'.²⁸⁰ And:

He [the teacher] should make clear the structure and emotional content of the work to the pupil, and in case a doubt regarding the portamento arises, he should present it to the pupil as a matter of conscience whether he had really experienced the need of heightened expression at the place in question, or whether he had succumbed to the sensual tonal charm.²⁸¹

The portamento, as with the vibrato, is cut loose from the player's centralised will, and acquires an agency of its own.

Flesch and Auer strengthen their vitalist model of tempo with notions of sex and intoxication. As chapter 2 demonstrated, writers argue that a vital performance should contain flexible rhythms but they use the related metaphor of the work as organism to argue that the basic pulse of the work should always remain the same. By using notions of undesirable moral behaviour, Auer and Flesch are able to exert prohibition over the loss of basic pulse. The idea of 'tonal charm' reappears in a section on tempo in Flesch's *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, in which Flesch commends the reliance on time signatures, as opposed to Italian tempo markings (in the absence of metronome indications), as indicators of the correct pulse. Flesch identifies an unfortunate tendency, however, for the violinist to be 'seduced through the good sound of his cantilena' (*durch den Wohllaut seiner Kantilene dazu verleiten*) and by way of an example he draws attention to a Beethoven minuet movement in 3/4, in which, he writes, tonal charm tempts the violinists into erroneously regarding the quaver notes rather than the crotchets as constituting the basic pulse.²⁸² In terms of rushing the tempo, on the hand, Auer attributes the tendency for students to rush the pulse to the intoxication of executing notes fast with the left hand:

²⁸⁰ *Jeder wirkliche Künstler sollte genügend Selbstüberwindung besitzen, um auf ein schön klingendes – und ach, so verführisches – Portamento zu verzichten.* Ibid. 1.18, translation adapted from Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, ed. and trans. Eric Rosenblith (New York: Fischer, 2000), 1.15.

²⁸¹ *Er muss dem Schüler Bau und Gefühlsgehalt des Werkes klar machen, ihm bei zweifelhaften Portamenti die Gewissensfrage vorlegen, ob er an der bewußten Stelle tatsächlich das Bedürfnis nach gesteigertem Ausdruck empfand oder ob er dem sinnlichen Klangreiz erlag.* Ibid.1.18, and 1.16.

²⁸² Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.47. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (1930), 2.52.

The young student is prone to allow himself to be carried away by the impulse to execute a passage in a precipitate tempo, intoxicating himself with the sheer pleasure of his own digital velocity. This makes it impossible for him to follow each note with his ear, to hear the intonation of what he is playing. He cannot distinguish his imperfect intonation; he is unable to detect inequalities in the rapid flow of his passage-work: he does not know whether his tone production is good. ... I have had students, however, who in spite of good intention became the victims of a nervous agitation the moment they took up their violins.²⁸³

Drawing again on his notions of behavioural contagion, Auer asserts the annulling of will power that accompanies the manifestation of unhealthy morals: the intoxication that results from rushing the tempo results in the student's loss of control over his or her intonation and tone production.

Control and Self Control

One reason why Auer and Flesch associate these particular aspects of violin playing with social, moral and pathological notions is that they are not dictated by the score. Until the late nineteenth century composers rarely included directions for vibrato and portamento in their scores, and the question of how the score provides indications of tempo is a complex one: Italian tempo markings are not precise by any means, but even with metronome markings the combining factors of metre, rhythm, and markings which call for significant changes to the pulse, such as *rubato*, pause marks and caesura signs, make pulse anything but a simple affair.²⁸⁴ With regard to vibrato and portamento, writers often group these together in their negotiating of the devices according to medico-moral notions: Hans Wessely, for example, writes that 'misfortunes seldom come singly – overdone slides nearly always go hand in hand with excessive vibrato'.²⁸⁵

²⁸³ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 41–42.

²⁸⁴ Late nineteenth century composers such as Debussy and Brahms include occasional portamento markings (a line connecting two notes), as well as the performance indication *non vibrato*. Some of the eighteenth-century Italian repertoire that violinists played at this time also contain vibrato markings, but by and large most of the music which these violinists played, namely works by Bach, Handel, Beethoven, Haydn, Schubert and Schumann, do not contain such markings. With regard to tempo, a large quantity of the works which violinists performed, most certainly before the introduction of Maelzel's metronome at the beginning of the century, and continuing throughout it, do not contain tempo markings.

²⁸⁵ Wessely, *A Practical Guide to Violin-Playing*, 85. Similarly, Auer writes of the vibrato that 'unfortunately, both singers and players of string instruments frequently abuse this effect just as they do the portamento' (Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 59), and Maximilian Pilzer, according to Martens, relates that "'an exaggerated vibrato is as bad as what I call 'the sentimental slide'". Frederick H. Martens, *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1919), 179.

The idea of decadence provides an illuminating context for writers' discursive construction of practices unbound by scores. Broadly defined, decadence is the idea that the passing of time necessarily brings with it the onset of decay. In his study of the idea of decadence, Matei Calinescu notes that it is common to many religious and cultural narratives, such as the Indian notion of the Age of Kali, the Greeks' and Romans' idea of the Iron Age and the Christian notion of the Antichrist's earthly reign which will precede the Second Coming of Christ.²⁸⁶ In the latter half of the nineteenth century the idea received amplification through the growing pessimism of the age, a sense of the lateness of the modern age, and newfound anxieties over disease: equating these qualities with the epitome of the present-day artist, Nietzsche writes that that 'precisely because nothing is more modern than this total sickness, this lateness and overexcitement of the nervous mechanism, Wagner is the modern artist par excellence'.²⁸⁷

The idea of decadence gives rise to the notion that the pedagogical treatise guards against abuses of the musical score. Writers' negotiation of the idea becomes particularly plain in their discussions of ornaments. Moser and Auer appeal to the idea of decadence to justify giving instructions on how ornaments should be executed. Moser claims that passing notes in melodies used to be added freely by performers but then musical executors (*die Ausführenden*) began to write these out, because, 'as is often the case when new means of stimulating (*Neue-Reizmittels*) are brought in, they felt led to mark these [passing notes] with little signs'.²⁸⁸ Here is Moser's equivalent of Flesch's cantilena that seduces, melodic passing notes that possess an allure (connoted by *Reiz*), as did the burgeoning commerce in sensual pleasures in the nineteenth century. More to the point, its newness (*Neue*) is the seed of its potential for decay. As Calinescu demonstrates, modernism finds its etymological root in the Latin *modo*, meaning today: in the context of a linear timeline (which, Calinescu demonstrates, is also a product of modernity), then, modernism incorporates a sense of

²⁸⁶ Matei Calinescu, *Five Faces of Modernity: Modernism, Avant-Garde, Decadence, Kitsch, Postmodernism* (Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press, 1987), 151.

²⁸⁷ Friedrich Nietzsche, 'The Case of Wagner' in *Basic Writings of Nietzsche*, trans. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Vintage Books, 1967), 601–654, 622.

²⁸⁸ *Erst als sich, wie solches bei Neue-Reizmittels einstellen, fand man sich veranlaßt, es [Durchgangsnoten] durch kleine Zeichen anzudeuten.* Joseph Joachim and Andreas Moser, *Violinschule in 3 Bänden*, 3 vols, trans. Alfred Moffat (Berlin: N. Simrock, Schott, 1905), 3.24. All translations adapted from the original.

lateness.²⁸⁹ The passing of time inevitably leads to destruction, which explains why the linear narrative of progress and innovation goes hand in hand with the linear narrative of decline and destruction. Moser's ultimate purpose here is to impose his own authority: since passing notes are now a question of historical notation, Moser, an expert on historical performance treatises, can provide authoritative advice on the matter. In doing so, his pedagogical treatise carries out its intended purpose, to protect against the growing evils of the modern age.

There is a similar argument in Flesch's writings, where there is the suggestion that time has brought about a decay in the vitality of individual or collective self. Flesch takes the absence of written-out short notes following a trill, such as the following, as an opportunity to dictate himself how such notes should be executed:

Example 5:



Flesch's justification for doing so is that 'in this respect, the executing artists of former times seem to have possessed more intuitive feeling for style than we, the progeny, who have followed suit, so that the composers of the classical period could indulge themselves in the luxury of inaccuracy.'²⁹⁰ What Flesch is suggesting here is that the falling prey of the moderns to moral sickness means that they cannot trust their intuition, as did the ancients. Flesch demonstrates that the moderns' pathological

²⁸⁹ A narrative of progress goes together with a narrative of decadence, as two sides of the same coin: for all Auer's pessimism regarding the onset of nervousness in the present age, Auer embraces wholesale a simple progressivism in his chapter on 'style' in which he entirely rejects the past in order to assert his model of the powerful, present violinist, as unrestrained by the dictates of tradition. Auer reasons that 'the truth of one age is bound to be modified by another, for truth is progressive'. Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 175.

²⁹⁰ *Die ausübenden Künstler früherer Zeiten scheinen in dieser Hinsicht eben mehr intuitives Stilgefühl besessen zu haben als wir Nachkommen, so daß die Komponisten der klassischen Periode sich den Luxus der Ungenauigkeit gestatten konnten.* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.30. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (1930), 2.32.

succumbing is what is on his mind when he claims that ‘indulgence’ and ‘luxury’ is what the ancients of the classical period could get away with: the Latin word *luxus* can mean lustfulness and softness, and in modern French the word possesses the meaning of dissolution. Modern writers equated the idea with the threat of moral downfall, resulting from the feminising influence of oriental ‘luxury’.²⁹¹

The violin pedagogy’s purpose as regulator of unruly practices is the product of a wider attempt to impose control over social and moral values and behaviours. In his study of nineteenth-century bourgeois culture, Peter Gay notes that ‘physicians from Scandinavia to Great Britain, the Germanies to the United States, produced a very avalanche of books of advice for the young, for those about to be married, for those keeping house’. A particular area for focus was sexual practices, particularly in relation to female sexuality, sexual conduct in marriage, and masturbation. This was expressed in ‘a vast and interminable outpouring of clerical and pedagogic polemics’. In his widely read *Psychopathia Sexualis* (1886), for example, the German doctor Richard von Krafft-Ebbing framed female sexuality as naturally passive and characterised by ‘physiological subordination’ to men. Many of these texts resorted to scare-mongering as a means of more forcefully imposing their views: throughout his career the English doctor Henry Maudsley warned of the perils of masturbation, and in ‘the bullying manner’ that characterised his later writings, Gay notes, ‘Maudsley could reiterate that if masturbatory mania has gone far, there is little the physician can do to save the patient’s life’.²⁹²

As well as possessing social, moral and medical dimensions, however, the drive to exert control fundamentally relies on how writers engage with notions of consciousness. James Kennaway observes that pathological notions surrounding Wagner in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries centrally emerge from an anxiety over self control and willpower. Kennaway draws attention to Kant’s outlining of a rational and autonomous model of self in his *Was ist Aufklärung?*, as a basis for the nineteenth-century bourgeois idea of self, and draws attention to the German

²⁹¹ Colonial studies have repeatedly observed this Western perspective of the East. For example, in his introduction to the field of study, John McLeod observes that ‘popular gendered stereotypes circulated, such as the effeminate Oriental male or the sexually promiscuous exotic Oriental female. The Oriental male... displayed a luxuriousness... that made him appear a grotesque parody of the ‘gentler’ female sex.’ John McLeod, *Beginning Postcolonialism* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000), 45.

²⁹² Peter Gay, *The Bourgeois Experience: Victoria to Freud, i: Education of the Senses* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1984), 163, 157, 154, 299.

psychiatrist Wilhelm Griesinger's definition of mental health as 'self control'.²⁹³ Furthermore, nervous exhaustion for writers such as Max Nordau was termed *Willenschwäche*, a weakening of the will, and H. C. Sawyer wrote in his 1900 text on nervous afflictions that drug habits in 'old and wealthy families' led to 'the impairment of will power'.²⁹⁴ This explains why violinists frequently refer to the need for control of self, or mind: as noted above, 'self control' (*Selbstüberwindung*) is what Flesch recommends to curb one's falling prey to seductive portamentos. The kind of control that Auer advocates springs from metaphysical ideas of self, which includes the idea of mind: Auer writes that although training and innate talent are important to the violinist's attaining of mastery, 'the main essential is for him to cultivate the habit of close self observation and above all to accustom himself to direct and control his efforts. For it is this mental labour which is the true source of all progress.'²⁹⁵

In the (post-) Christian West there is a particularly close relationship between self discipline and knowledge of self. Foucault draws attention to the paradox that behavioural restriction can lead to intellectual expansion, citing the confession as a central Western practice in which this occurs. The discipline of confessing one's sins, with the supposed consequence that one is freed from their burden through divine forgiveness, is simultaneously the act of constructing self according to externally prescribed prohibitions.²⁹⁶ The practice of confession has long been central to the Christian tradition, which teaches that regular confession of sins to God reaffirms the death to one's former self and renews the sinner's taking on of a new self in Christ. This belief that one becomes an entirely new self, as well as the doctrine that one's former sinful self can know nothing of the truth without its revelation enacted by God, strengthens the belief that the confessional plays a crucial role in the forming of the righteous self. Judith Peraino has suggested that the confession was secularised, in the early twentieth century, by the culture of psychoanalysis, and goes on to show that many texts,

²⁹³ James Kennaway, 'Musical Pathology in the Nineteenth Century: Richard Wagner and Degeneration', PhD thesis, University of California, Los Angeles, 2004, 95–96.

²⁹⁴ H. C. Sawyer, *Nerve Waste: Practical Information Concerning Nervous Impairment in Modern Life* (San Francisco: Kicks-Judd, 1900), 36. Cited in Kennaway, 'Musical Pathology', 187.

²⁹⁵ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 141.

²⁹⁶ Michel Foucault, 'Technologies of the Self', in *Ethics, Subjectivity and Truth*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York: The New Press, 1994), 223–51.

particularly relating to music, form notions of self (especially of gender and sexuality) out of a belief that music is a means of self confession.²⁹⁷

The idea that the constructing of self according to divine truth essentially depends on a self that is *a priori* conducive to receiving the truth appears in a short pedagogical treatise by the English violinist Wallace Ritchie. In this text Ritchie points out that knowledge of violin playing provided by the pedagogical treatise (the supposed source of knowledge), arises from the prior presence of a self that is conducive to receiving such truths:

In the place of his original perverse nature, he has now acquired a second nature, which instead of being adverse to doing right, finds it congenial to do it, which instead of experiencing a feeling of irksomeness in the obeying of rules, has satisfaction in doing so.²⁹⁸

The idea of self as wholly constructed by external rules is present in Auer's writings, in which he also draws in the notion of the confessional, as a simultaneous affirmation of the self that already exists and the act of constructing self. This affirmation is more specifically the articulation of self as a set of transgressive practices, but at the same time it leads to new practices that exclusively arise *out of* this articulation of transgression. Thus, Auer adds to his range of techniques for preventing student violinists from adopting a continuous vibrato by likening it to a sin that blinds the sinner from its true nature, and subsequently asserting that it requires a confession to expose it as a sin, leading to self improvement:

Some of the performers who habitually make use of the vibrato are under the impression that they are making their playing more effective, and some of them find the vibrato a very convenient device for hiding bad intonation or bad tone production. But such an artifice is worse than useless. That student is wise who listens intelligently to his own playing, admits to himself that his intonation or tone production is bad, and then undertakes to improve it.²⁹⁹

Auer elsewhere enforces the idea of confession after listing a multitude of violinistic transgressions which a rushed tempo masks. After his comments on the student who 'intoxicates' himself with the speed at which he can use his left hand fingers (leading to a rushed tempo), Auer says that this habit

²⁹⁷ Judith Peraino, *Listening to the Sirens: Musical Technologies of Queer Identity from Homer to Hedwig* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006), 68–92. Peraino specifically focus on the articulation of the newly defined category of the homosexual, in the late nineteenth century, in texts from this period and also for the early twentieth century, by writers such as Krafft-Ebbing, Magnus Hirschfeld and Havelock Ellis.

²⁹⁸ Wallace Ritchie, *Chats with Violinists, or, How to Overcome Difficulties* (London: William Reeves, 1916), 9.

²⁹⁹ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 59.

masks faulty intonation, bad tone production, and the clear enunciation of each note. He then proceeds to reassert the confession as the process through which the player re-examines his technique, or rather comes to assess his technique in the context of Auer's prescribed malpractices:

I thoroughly believe... that when they [my pupils] practise without observing and criticizing themselves they merely develop and perfect their faults. They are worse than wasting their time.³⁰⁰

Bodies in the modern West, then, are readily primed to have self inscribed on them by an external, rule-imposing source. Notions of consciousness combine to subdue the body through a culturally justified condemning of the body as diseased or morally corrupt, and which therefore needs redemption through the higher ideals of self. Hans Wessely pits intellect in opposition to the manual origins of vibrato and portamento, berating excessive vibrato and slides (see above) because 'these are quite enough to ruin a perhaps otherwise *clever* performance'.³⁰¹ In his remarks on portamento, Flesch recommends that the teacher should challenge the pupil as to whether he or she felt the 'expression' behind it, or had succumbed to its 'sensual tone'.³⁰² Similarly, Achille Rivarde contrasts the 'nobler stimulus and appeal that music makes to the imagination' to a tone that creates 'the purely sensuous effect of 'thrills down the spine''.³⁰³

Pathological Notions of Tone

Tone's identity shifts, in the course of its negotiation with pathological notions, from that of external seductress to the sounding expression of superior mind. On the one hand tone's mellifluous properties lead Flesch and Rivarde to denounce its sensual allure, and Moser to decry the susceptibility of passing notes in a melody (the idea of which closely relates to that of singing tone) to the corrupting influence of the modern age. On the other hand, writers align tone with health, as a facet of both spiritual and biological vitality. As the concluding remarks of chapter 3 noted, 'tone' denoted

³⁰⁰ Ibid. 42.

³⁰¹ Wessely, *A Practical Guide to Violin Playing*, 85.

³⁰² Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 1.18. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (2000), 1.16.

³⁰³ Rivarde, *The Violin and Its Technique*, 27.

physiological health, at least up until the end of the nineteenth century, and the meaning is further reflected in Moser's notion that the failure to execute singing tone as a long phrase is akin to a physiological ailment. Wagner aligns an ideal of melos with tone and decries the weak and exhausted playing of German orchestras in his day. As chapter 3 demonstrated, writers consider vibrato and portamento to be facets of tone, which, if it is understood as health, explains why they direct their medico-moral concerns mostly at these devices. Since a certain amount of evidence suggests that intonation is an integral aspect of tone, it is further possible to see why the pitch oscillations resulting from the overuse of vibrato were particularly repugnant to writers.

The idea of tone as health further manifests itself in Auer's advocating of strength. Physical strength became an ideal for late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century culture because weakness and exhaustion were perceived to be an endemic consequence of the strains of modern living. When advising on the *spiccato* bow stroke, Auer recommends using the third finger of the right hand to turn the bow in such a way as to cause more bow hairs to touch the string, 'since otherwise the tone will be feeble'. Auer advises against using the muscular strength of the bowing arm in tone production, but he readily commends developing finger strength: Auer writes that 'the more one tries to diminish the body of tone... the more one should increase the finger pressure'. This is particularly the case in the higher registers: 'the greater the finger pressure you exert in this region of the fingerboard, the more rapidly these notes will vibrate beneath a slight pressure of the bow'. Scales 'supply an excellent exercise for strengthening the fingers and increasing their powers', yet the violinist can only go as far as his physical strength will allow: 'fingering is primarily an individual matter; the conformation of the hand, the structure and the strength of the fingers determine whether one or another fingering is easier or more difficult for a particular student.'³⁰⁴

One can attribute Auer's refraining from describing tone in plainly physiological language to the strong metaphysical roots of the idea of tone as health. The meaning of 'strong' (*stark*) is suitably broad, and is not limited to the physical kind, as is the word 'powerful' (*kraftvoll*), an adjective which also appears often in the literature to generally describe desirable playing. The use of the German

³⁰⁴ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 75, 90, 91, 97, 98.

adjectives generally corresponds to the use of their English equivalents. Furthermore, Auer aligns tone with spirit, which, as chapter 3 demonstrated, he pits against bodily gestures: this further explains why Auer stops short of using exclusively physiological language when describing tone. As this chapter will later show, differing opinions over whether physical strength is the same as, or the opposite of, subjective tone, hold further implications for the discursive modelling of violin playing.

Masculinity and Tone

Anxieties over affronts to notions of self autonomy and the supremacy of mind centrally incorporate an anxiety over masculinity. Judith Peraino's chapter on discourses of music as confession shows that anxieties over homosexuality were acute in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century writings on music. Masculinity was aligned with heterosexuality, which is why homosexuality came to be associated with feminine, or effeminate, traits and behaviours. James Kennaway summarises his study of pathological notions surrounding Wagner by writings that 'what was on the surface a debate about music and science was in fact a discourse on masculinity and the self'. Kennaway's statement is somewhat reductive, and risks essentialising masculinity and self, but his study nevertheless provides plentiful evidence to show that notions related to these key themes substantially mould the critiqued discourses.³⁰⁵

In developing his notions of tone, Carl Flesch combines an ideal of masculinity with anxieties over the nerves and loss of strength:

Beside the ideal violinist, whose emotion flows in equal proportion from his soul into his arms, we have there the cold type of violinist with slight vibratory capacity, and a tendency to force the tone, as well as the excessively vibrating, effeminate violinist, who has at his command no more than a small tone, incapable of modulation.³⁰⁶

³⁰⁵ Kennaway, 'Musical Pathology', 12.

³⁰⁶ *Neben dem Idealgeiger, dem die Empfindung in gleicher Proportion (1/2: 1/2) aus der Seele in die Arme fließt, gibt es den kalten Geigertypus mit geringer Vibrationsfähigkeit und mit einer Neigung zum Forcieren des Tones (1/4 links: 3/4 rechts) sowie den übermäßig vibrierenden weichlichen Geiger (3/4 links), dem stets nur ein kleiner, wenig modulationsfähiger Ton zur Verfügung steht (1/4 rechts).* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 1.76. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (2000), 1.79.

Flesch posits the ideal violinist here as one in whom the binarism of spirit and mechanism, or mind and body, unite ('soul into his arms'). For Flesch there are two possible ways of falling short of this ideal, one whereby the violinist forces the tone and uses little vibrato, the other where the violinist can only produce a small tone and uses an excessive amount of vibrato. Flesch's description of this second type as 'effeminate' indicates the fusion of the masculine ideal with his ideal of self/mind/spirit. As noted above, excess, or luxury, is often thought of as a pathological trait, and Max Nordau includes 'effeminacy' with his list of abnormalities produced by nervous exhaustion. Flesch, like Rivarde, also views the problem of vibrato as a question of producing the right amount of nervous energy, as opposed to distinguishing between a healthy and diseased continuous vibrato.

The idea of a powerful and climaxing tone (see chapter 3) closely relates to the masculine ideal, which further explains concerns in the primary literature over loss of strength. As chapter 3 demonstrated, an important way in which singing tone manifests itself is in the gradual increase and decrease of volume, directed by dynamic markings in the score. This leads Flesch to think of ruptures to these gradual processes as 'stereotyped effeminacy' (*stereotypen Verweichlichung*): he perceives this problem to potentially arise when realising the written echo effects often found in eighteenth-century music (where the immediate repetition of a forte passage is played piano). Flesch does not condemn this gesture outright, however, which is why he denounces only the 'stereotyped', or the mechanistic reproduction, of it to correspond with every instance of its appearance in the score. Flesch summons the binarism of spirit/vitality and mechanism here, equating echo effect passages with repetitive figurations, which is why he goes on to say that in earlier music these are 'not organically connected' (*nicht in organischem Zusammenhang*), whereas in Beethoven's music and later they become soul-filled (*beseelte*), and are 'entwined' (*umrankt*) around the melody, 'as the ivy does about the oak' (*wie der Efeu die Eiche*). Combining these ideas with that of the living, collective spirit of the age, Flesch largely dismisses the echo effect, as a valid aspect of performance, on the basis that the

echo effect ‘contradicts with our feeling for style in the post-Beethovenian period’ (*in der Nach-Beethovenschen Epoche unserem Stilempfinden widerspricht*).³⁰⁷

There are overtones of the masculine ideal as sexual performance in Flesch’s language, or more specifically, an anxiety over affronts to it. The more general idea of the performer in this period, as the active partner in the performer-listener relationship, readily lends itself to the notion that to perform is to perform, as the male partner, sexually. One might also read further significance into the idea of performance as “coming through with the goods” as Laurence Dreyfus puts it, of a fluid *Lebensenergie*, as well as the notion of climaxing.³⁰⁸ Typical for early twentieth-century violinists, though, is a preoccupation with a failure to perform: in a particular instance of discussing the violinist’s wielding of tone, Flesch applies his dystopian notion of the divided performance community, fearing that in executing staccato the violinist will experience *Stakkatounfähigkeit*, which can be translated as ‘staccato impotence’. A staccato run might fail, Flesch writes, first because the player is technically and musically incompetent, but also because ‘the presence of even a single auditor is enough to call forth the paralyzing sensation of staccato impotence in the player’ (*wenn die Anwesenheit auch bloß eines Zuhörers genügt, um die lähmende Empfindung der Stakkatounfähigkeit im Spieler zu erwecken*). Flesch’s further comment that ‘the power of the individual will is not strong enough’ (*ist die Kraft des eigenen Willens nicht genügend*), to rectify the problem shows that the central anxieties here is over a deep-seated concept of self, not just over technical proficiency with regard to a staccato bowstroke. At all times in musical performance, violinists’ sense of self, as masculine potency, is in danger of being annulled.³⁰⁹

The Deviant Body

³⁰⁷ Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.41. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (1930), 2.45–2.46.

³⁰⁸ Dreyfus notes that, in the High Middle Ages, to perform was to carry out a promise, and suggests that this meaning of ‘coming through with the goods’ still resides in the use of the word in relation to sport and law. Laurence Dreyfus, ‘Beyond the Interpretation of Music’, *The Dutch Journal of Music Theory*, 12/3 (1997), 253–272, 256.

³⁰⁹ Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.99. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (1930), 2.111.

The mind–body hierarchy is clearly at work in the forming of early twentieth-century notions of violin playing, but it would be more correct to say that in these notions the mind has not so much conquered the body but is at war with it. The ideology of mind/spirit/vitality/the musical work denounces the body for its sensuality and for its susceptibility to nervous afflictions, yet as writers become drawn into the workings of the body, and become mired in its supposed problems, the body acquires an order of its own. Following its suppression under Enlightenment thought and eighteenth-century philosophical developments, the body returns, in the course of the nineteenth century, to play a central role in discourses. In the literature on violin playing authors veer between a confident assertion of the ascendancy of mind over body to anxiously warning of the perils of unruly body parts.

As chapter 2 and this chapter have shown, the left hand is a particular source of anxiety, which explains why writers harbour an anxiety over rushed tempi. The mechanisms of the right hand, the bowing hand, were directly at the service of self, as singing tone: as chapter 3 demonstrated, Auer gives advice regarding how to ‘call forth’ a tone that transcended the body’s limitations, by holding ‘the bow lightly, yet with sufficient firmness’.³¹⁰ In contrast, or perhaps because it stood out as an obvious contrast, the left hand gets left out this ideological construction. Although the left hand vibrato, portamento and correct intonation are facets of tone’s intrinsic identity, the disdained virtuosic tradition overshadowed this by characterising the left hand as the executor of showy scalic runs. The left hand was seen as a kind of stronghold of mechanisms that refused to be drawn up into the subjective. This explains why Auer conceives of it as a source of intoxication for the student, and why Auer and Flesch blame rushed tempi on it. Under the direct auspices of mind, the bowing arm, for Flesch, comes to the left hand’s rescue:

We will... try to regulate the rapidity of the fingers by means of the bow. Thus we can intersperse legato or détaché passages which we tend to play too fast, with bowing accents, and in this way force the left hand to follow the bow.³¹¹

³¹⁰ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 55.

³¹¹ *Werden wir... versuchen, die Schnelligkeit der Finger mittels des Bogens zu regulieren. Wir werden demnach Legato- oder Détaché-Passagen, bei denen Neigung zum Überhasten besteht, mit Bogenakzenten durchsetzen und auf diese Weise die linke Hand zwingen, dem Bogen zu folgen.* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.49. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (1930), 2.55.

Auer's and Flesch's notion of the dissenting left hand also helps to explain why there are pronounced concerns over the misuse of vibrato and portamento in the literature. Since masturbation was a particular concern for the guardians of moral and physical hygiene during this era, it would not be too far-fetched to view these anxiety over roving hands as fuelling Auer's and Flesch's condemnation of the left hand.

Accommodating or Conquering the Nerves? Ideals of Mental Control and Strength in Violin Playing

A widespread notion in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries is that the body operates on an economy of nervous energy. Anson Rabinbach has demonstrated a shift, in the late nineteenth century, from a prior optimism surrounding the unlimited potentials of industrialisation to the limits on productivity presented by 'the human motor'.³¹² An important influence on this idea was the prior formation of the laws of thermodynamics by such figures as Hermann Helmholtz, Julius Robert Mayer and Rudolf Clausius, who produced the famous first law that 'energy can be neither created nor destroyed. It can only change forms.' Volker Roelcke writes that the work of Helmholtz, Emil Du-Bois Raymond and Guillaume Duchenne firmly established the importance of electricity for the functioning of the nervous system, and that coupled with the notion of a limited and constant supply of energy in a closed system, this resulted in the idea, promoted by George Miller Beard, that an over-expenditure of energy in one part of the body would result in a deficiency in another.³¹³ In his study of articles and advertisements in the German-language magazines *Gartenlaube* and *Simplicissimus* between 1880 and 1919, Heinz-Peter Schmiedebach confirms Roelcke's argument, writing that a common notion was that 'the brain and nervous system worked like batteries that lost their power in the case of 'over-excitement' and serious strain'. Schmiedebach also says, however, that in addition to

³¹² Anson Rabinach, *The Human Motor: Energy, Fatigue, and the Origins of Modernity* (New York: Basic Books, 1990).

³¹³ Roelcke, 'Electrified Nerves', 178–185.

the idea of the body as an energy field there also existed a more mechanical model of the nervous system, which concentrated on its static form and various components.³¹⁴

In his collaborative pedagogical treatise with the Czech violinist František Ondříček, the Austrian physician S. Mittelman similarly constructs his model of the violinist on the idea of the body as a limited and closed-circuit energy field. He claims that the brain succumbs to exhaustion (*Erschöpfend*) as the result of the overworking of a small number of muscles, giving the example that machinery that only employs the hands causes a worker to tire faster than if the machinery employs his or her legs also:

Experience teaches that if a machine pre-determines labour in such a way that only the hands are employed, fatigue occurs much more quickly than if the same work performed on such a machine also engages the lower extremities.³¹⁵

Mittelman's metaphor of workers' interaction with machinery reflects the period's emphasis on the limited productivity of the body with specific relation to industrial productivity.

Mittelman's next step in arriving at a solution to the above problem is to assume that the nerves behave in the same way as the muscles. He believes that if a greater number of nerves are used there is a greater capacity to store the 'products of decomposition' which lead to fatigue, resulting in the delayed onset of fatigue:

The consumption of usable material and the storing of products of decomposition are distributed in the latter case among a greater number of muscles, so that the moment of fatigue sets in later. Of course the processes of activity of the nerve cells are not clear, but from their mode of reaction (they are capable of stimulus summation, and with continual irritating finally get into a state of exhaustion) the above mentioned can be applied also to the nervous system.³¹⁶

³¹⁴ Heinz-Peter Schmiedebach, 'The Public's View of Neurasthenia in Germany: Looking for a New Rhythm of Life', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 219–238, 231.

³¹⁵ *Die Erfahrung lehrt, dass, wenn die Arbeit an einer Maschine derart eingerichtet ist, dass z.B. nur die Hände in Anspruch genommen sind, die Ermüdung viel rascher eintritt, als wenn die gleiche Arbeit an einer derart konstruierten Maschine vollführt wird, an welcher auch die unteren Extremitäten beteiligt sind.* Franz Ondricek and S. Mittelman, *Neue Methode zur Erlangung der Meisterechnik des Violinspiels auf anatomisch-physiologischer Grundlage* (Vienna: Nickau & Welleminsky, 1909), 73. The English translation is given side by side with the German original but the translator is not named. All translations adapted from the original.

³¹⁶ *Der Verbrauch von nutzbarem Material und die Anhäufung von Zersetzungsprodukten verteilt sich ihm letzteren Falle auf eine größere Anzahl von Muskeln, weshalb der Moment der Ermüdung später eintritt. Freilich sind die Vorgänge in der Tätigkeit der Nervenzellen nicht klar, aber aus der Reaktionsweise derselben,*

Mittelman regards his ideal of life-energy (*Lebensenergie*) as dependent on the ‘working and discharge of the circuit processes’ (*Verarbeitung und Ablauf der Leitungsvorgänge: Leitung* connotes electrical circuits), but he appears to not understand exactly how the relaying of nervous energy between the brain and muscles causes the brain to become exhausted.³¹⁷ Rather, Mittelman makes the rather unscientific assumption that the nerves operate in the same way the muscles do.

Mittelman’s proposed cure for exhaustion is to employ a greater number of nerves by using more parts of the brain. He writes that ‘diversified work, which claims nearly all sections of the brain, leads much later to fatigue than monotonous occupation’ (*abwechslungsreiche Arbeit, welche fast alle Hirnabschnitte in Anspruch nimmt, führt viel später zur Ermüdung als monotone Beschäftigung*).³¹⁸ Mittelman says that ‘muscular gymnastics’ (*Muskelgymnastik*) are not sufficient by themselves but require ‘the intellectual/spiritual substratum’ (*geistige Substrat*). He goes on to explain that this is acquired by retracing the composer’s thought processes:

In the study of the great composers’ works the master helps the pupil to capture the spiritual (*geistig*) value of them through presenting word- and speech-pictures, with which the thought processes of the composer might have been filled. The labour becomes varied because large complexes of ideas will be brought into motion.³¹⁹

These comments demonstrate that a strong influence on Mittelman’s thought are the metaphysical notions of self discussed so far in this thesis chapter. One finds here the idea of a spiritual/intellectual (*geistig*) affinity with the composer as well as the rejection of ‘muscle gymnastics’, as the mere body. This section has focused on one of many texts from this period taking a medical or scientific approach to violin playing, and further research might wish to critique these in greater depth. It would be interesting to find out how such texts relate to *Körperkultur* in early twentieth-century Germany: i.e.

da sie die Fähigkeit der Reizesummutation besitzen und bei fortgesetzter Reizung nach Entfaltung intensiver Wirkungen schließlich in den Zustand der Erschöpfung geraten, läßt sich das oben Gesagte auch auf das Nervensystem beziehen. Ibid. 73–74.

³¹⁷ Ibid. 61.

³¹⁸ Ibid. 74.

³¹⁹ *Beim Studium der Werke großer Komponisten hilft der Meister dem Schüler, den geistigen Wert derselben zu erfassen, durch Vorführung von Wort- und Klangbildern, mit denen der Gedankengang des Komponisten erfüllt gewesen sein konnte. Die Arbeit wird abwechslungsreich, weil große Vorstellungskomplexe in Bewegung gebracht werden. Ibid. 74.*

how they respond to the wider cultural predilection for gymnastics, one the main purposes of which was to muster nationalistic fervour.³²⁰

Although Auer disparages pedagogies with a ‘scientific’ approach, he incorporates a physiological description of the mind–body hierarchy similar to that of Mittelman. At the beginning of his *Violin Playing As I Teach It*, Auer begins by stating that several recent authorities on violin playing have, ‘in scientific fashion’, made ‘a careful analysis of the physical elements of the art [of violin playing]’. Yet what has been overlooked, Auer claims, is the ‘mental’ factor:

Yet the most essential factor, if the observance of these carefully formulated principles is to show any practical results, has hitherto been largely overlooked. This factor is the mental one. By no means enough stress has ever been laid on the importance of mental work, on the activity of the brain which must control that of the fingers.³²¹

Ironically, Mittelman and Ondříček’s treatise is the kind of text which Auer denigrates: Mittelman’s extensive anatomical study of the violinist’s bodily mechanisms takes up most of his and Ondříček’s treatise (the section added by Ondříček consists of little text and mostly exercises written in musical notation). In contrast, Auer presents his text as a literary exposition of the higher ideals of artistic execution, recalling nineteenth-century German philosophy’s courting of art, as found in texts by Hegel, Schopenhauer, Wagner and Nietzsche. Yet both Auer and Mittelman espouse the same conceptual underpinning to their models of playing, in that they regard the command of the ‘brain’ over the body as the key to success.

The notion that mental variety is essential to violin playing prompted Auer to declare nuance as ‘the soul of interpretation’.³²² The centrality of the idea to Auer’s overall model of performance prompted him to devote an entire chapter to the subject (chapter 10 of *Violin Playing as I Teach It*). Auer’s notion of nuance is similar to Mittelman’s idea of mental variety in that Auer believes that one can achieve it by apprehending the wealth of variety that is found in the musical work. In the first

³²⁰ Other texts of this kind include F. A. Steinhausen, *Die Physiologie der Bogenführung auf den Streichinstrumenten* (1907), A. Jahn, *Die Grundlagen der Natürlichen Bogenführung auf der Violine* (1913), K. Klingler, *Über die Grundlagen des Violinspiels* (1924), W. Trendelenburg, *Die natürlichen Grundlagen der Kunst des Streichinstrumentenspiels* (1925) and J. Winkler, *Die Technik des Geigenspiels* (1922).

³²¹ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 1, 2.

³²² *Ibid.* 141.

paragraph of his chapter on nuance Auer promptly explains that ‘a genius of Beethoven’s calibre excels in teaching us how to shade, how to develop nuance. Study his quartets, his trios, his violin sonatas – not to forget his symphonies! – and you will find them replete with the greatest imaginable abundance of nuances.’³²³ To return to Auer’s culinary metaphor with regard to the abuse of vibrato, his notion of the musical work as a several-course meal further supports his ideal of variety in performance. Continuous vibrato in this context becomes a ‘tabasco’ that causes monotony through its application to every course.

An ideal of mental variety receives a broad application in the early twentieth-century literature. For Moser, the ideal of tonal variety is what Franco-Belgian players fail to realise in their playing: what is missing, Moser writes, is a ‘modulation-rich manner of tone production, which has all nuances of expression on the palette (*modulationreichen Art der Tongebung, die alle Nuancen des Ausdrucks auf der Palette hat!*)’³²⁴ While discussing a passage containing a succession of rhythmically identical figurations in Beethoven’s Violin Concerto, Flesch recommends varying how the notes in each figuration are emphasised because of an ‘an all too even and continuous... tone production greatly taxes the listener’s attention’ (*allzu gleichmäßige und andauernde... Betonung bewirkt leicht eien, die Aufmerksamkeit des Hörers auf eine harte Probe stellende Monotonie*).³²⁵ Hans Wessely recommends that ‘single slides should vary so as not to become monotonous and distasteful’.³²⁶ David Milsom has shown that the idea extends back into the nineteenth-century literature surrounding violin playing: he draws attention to violinists’ notion of what he calls a ‘Doctrine of Diversity’, which he describes as ‘the importance of light and shade, contrast and more general heterogeneity’ in the literature between 1850 and 1900.³²⁷

The ideal of variety in violin playing can be traced to wider cultural concerns regarding exhaustion. Mittelman’s medical approach illuminates what is less clear in other texts on violin

³²³ Ibid. 141–142.

³²⁴ Joachim and Moser, *Violinschule*, 3.32.

³²⁵ Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.12. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing* (1930), 2.13.

³²⁶ Hans Wessely, *A Practical Guide to Violin-Playing*, 85.

³²⁷ David Milsom, *Theory and Practice in Late Nineteenth-Century Violin Performance: An Examination of Style in Performance, 1850–1900* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003), 189.

playing from the period, namely the widely held belief that mental variety prevents nervous exhaustion from debilitating the performer (and the listener, as Flesch's above comments regarding the passage in the Beethoven Concerto show). Despite their accommodating of the body's limitations, however, writers do not grant it agency: the body's limitations are respected, but it is not allowed to dictate how it wishes to expend its limited energy. The mind continues to preside over all matters, and the following section explores what happens in the writings of Bronisław Huberman when the body further loses its independence, and is drawn closer into mind's centralised command.

Bronisław Huberman and the Denial of Nervous Exhaustion

In the historical development of nervous discourses, scholars recognise a significant shift in focus when notions of neurasthenia become drawn up into discourses of degeneration. Whereas an earlier culture of neurasthenia centred around domestic affairs, notions of degeneration raised ideas about neurasthenia to the level of ailments which plagued the collective health of the nation state. Volker Roelcke has chartered this shift in the work of the influential German psychiatrist, Emil Kraepelin, who by 1896 had replaced the term 'neurasthenia', as a medically classified disease, with 'disorders of exhaustion'. Roelcke notes the increasing inclusion, in Kraepelin's work, of the ideas of social Darwinism, which Kraepelin used to provide hereditary accounts of the spread of nervous afflictions. Kraepelin's work contributed to the implementing of eugenics policies in many Western countries throughout the twentieth century: he wrote that to counteract the 'undoubtedly threatening dangers', urgent preventive 'measures' had to be taken, which included 'sensible racial hygiene'.³²⁸

³²⁸ Emil Kraepelin, 'Psychiatrisches aus Java', *Centralblatt für Psychiatrie und Nervenheilkunde*, 27, NF 15 (1904), 468–9. Cited in Volker Roelcke, 'Electrified Nerves', 189–190.

The disappearance of a neurasthenic culture shifted priorities away from accommodating nervous exhaustion to eradicating it. Whereas an earlier culture of the nerves sought cures for it, and advocated lifestyle changes to accommodate it, the heightened chauvinism and militarism of the early twentieth century mixed with increased fears over the nervous collapse of whole nations to induce a reproachful or dismissive attitude to nervous conditions. As seen in Kraepelin's work, the shift is from cure to prevention, which came in the form of fitness programmes in schools, and the cultural glorification of feats which demonstrated physical and mental strength and endurance. Having written extensively on the topic, Joachim Radkau suggests, however, that perhaps 'there is more than one single story of neurasthenia', having discovered that research on patient records from around the turn of the twentieth century in Germany continue to display a 'soft', humane tendency'. This contrasts, Radkau writes, 'to the polemical use or rather abuse of 'nervousness' as a reproach,' which Radkau nevertheless recognises as a central attribute of cultures of the nerves in the early twentieth century.³²⁹

Bronisław Huberman builds on the preventative approach to nervous exhaustion to advocate a building up of strength, on the violinist's part, prior to performance. Huberman holds the same ideas as Mittelman and others with regard to the central role the mind plays in overcoming nervous exhaustion. Like these authors, Huberman shuns 'mechanical aids, which by themselves achieve hardly anything. The actual achievement comes only through the way the brain employs all these aids' (*mechanische Hilfsmittel, die allein noch gar nichts zuwege bringen. Die eigentliche Leistung kommt erst durch die Art und Weise zustande, wie das Gehirn alle diese Mittel verwendet*).³³⁰ Like Mittelman, Huberman emphasises the importance of imagination for healthy violin playing: Huberman here equates the practising of études with mechanical practising:

"To get the final polish of brilliancy on the strings, the player must rely on his imagination, his artistic vision. The purely theoretical way in which the étude deals with these matters cannot arouse the imagination of the artist."³³¹

³²⁹ Radkau, 'The Neurasthenic Experience', 214–15.

³³⁰ Bronislaw Huberman, *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* (Leipzig, Vienna: Hugo Heller, 1912), 7.

³³¹ Frederick H. Martens, *String Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists, Viola Players and Violoncellists* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1923), 67.

Like the above authors, Huberman associates the brain with the connected metaphysical notions of soul, spirit and the musical work:

To this enlivening of the work technique may play only a subordinated role... It must serve the gentleman, the spirit and the lady, the soul.³³²

The problem for Huberman is that too many violinists become exhausted from technically demanding passages:

“For instance, most violinists cannot play, clearly and distinctly, the *stretto* of the first movement of the Tchaikovsky Concerto since, owing to the amount of passage-work preceding it, their hand is exhausted when the *stretto* is reached.”

The answer is to build up a reserve of strength prior to performance:

“As regards virtuoso violin playing, two great technical factors are required: a colossal reserve of tonal and technical power and strength, built up by endurance study; and absolute purity of intonation.”³³³

Huberman’s chief concern with regard to nervous exhaustion is loss of tonal power, and his prevention cure for this is endurance study. Chapter 3 demonstrated that notions of singing tone gave rise to idea of tone as a continually rising and falling power. It further demonstrated the Auer and Huberman put an emphasis on climaxing and pay less attention the abating of tonal power and the sustaining of a single dynamic level. Huberman’s comments, as recorded by Martens, demonstrate that an anxiety over nervous exhaustion further fuels his promotion of tonal climaxing:

“I might truthfully say that I am as much a pupil, or more, of Jean de Reszké or Caruso as I am of Joachim. Take Caruso, for instance. He pointed one great lesson which every violinist might follow. In spite of being none too economical in using his voice, in producing his tone, he had developed a great reserve of strength, a natural reservoir of power and expression, and showed wonderful ability in building up an aria to its natural climax.”

Auer is particularly concerned about loss of tonal power in higher left-hand positions on the E string.

This is Huberman’s chief concern also, and his language shows how his notion of nervous exhaustion gives rise to this concern:

³³² *Bei dieser Belebung des Werkes darf die Technik nur eine untergeordnete Rolle spielen... Sie muß dem Herrn dienen, dem Geist und der Herrin, der Seele.* Huberman, *Auf der Werkstatt*, 32.

³³³ Martens, *String Mastery*, 65.

“I have developed a special technique of power and endurance in the high registers on long notes. Why? Because, as I have already mentioned, violinists usually fall short of the fullness of tone and power needed when a climaxing phrase or a climaxing melody occurs in a high position. I admit that it is difficult to gain lyric breadth and fullness of tone high up on the E string, but it can be done. Caruso made his high climaxing notes gloriously powerful: the violinist can do the same.”

Huberman’s endurance technique consists of playing extended sections repeatedly and at a rapid tempo, an idea which is unique to Huberman’s thought in the context of early twentieth-century writings on violin playing. This passage demonstrates the root of Huberman’s notion of endurance study in the idea of the mind, and its superiority over bodily mechanisms, through Huberman’s contrasting of the two:

“As to daily mechanical exercises, I do not believe very much in them. For what might be called daily ‘technical baths’ I think the scales in thirds are excellent, especially for endurance. But the best thing to do is to pick out entire difficult sections and practice them, whether you think you need them or not. I do this myself because endurance training in the highest sense can only be developed by innumerable repetitions of difficult passages at a rapid tempo.”

Numerous bodily mechanisms are drawn up into endurance study, as the product of the mind:

“Of course, the major difficulties vary with individual compositions; sometimes it may be a double trill, a series of fingered octaves or tenths – there are so many technical forms – but the *endurance* study which builds up the technical reserve, it rightly carried out, will take care of them all.”³³⁴

Huberman’s thought gives clear evidence of the influence of a culture of nervous reproach. The culture of most European countries in the early twentieth century celebrated the achievements of expeditioners, mountaineers and sportsmen who had achieved remarkable feats of physical aptitude. This is clearly what Huberman was thinking of when developing his idea of endurance study:

“The violinist should have, in reality, twice as much technical power and strength at his disposal in order to play a given composition as he *thinks* necessary. And this he can only get by endurance study, the true key to violin virtuosity. Before Nansen undertook his Polar expeditions he trained himself to sleep in the open under conditions as nearly as possible approaching those he was to encounter.”³³⁵

Huberman extends the metaphor to conceive of the appealing end of such toil, as the higher plain that only the strong and healthy geniuses may reach. One recalls here Nietzsche’s figure of Zarathustra,

³³⁴ Martens, *String Mastery*, 64, 67–8, 66, 66.

³³⁵ *Ibid.* 65.

who calls for the elite to be ‘neighbours of the eagles, neighbours of the snow, neighbours of the sun’.³³⁶ Huberman is here speaking of his attendances in his younger days of performances given by the Joachim Quartet:

What I loved most was to follow him into those highest regions of the music, the opening up of which is one of his everlasting services [to music]. Where one had previously expected only ice and rocks he plucked the most beautiful alpine roses and Edelweiss, and he opened up the most magnificent view of blue lakes, softly stirred by the balmy air, and surrounded by sun-drenched meadows filled with flowers.³³⁷

Whereas other violinists consider it best to accommodate exhaustion, Huberman believes that fatigue can be eradicated. Mittelman and Auer remedy exhaustion with a limit imposed on muscle and nerve usage: the assumption here is that fatigue will always be present and that it is therefore best not to provoke it into impairing performance. Huberman, in contrast, advocates increased exertion as a way of eliminating the threat of exhaustion: referring to Paganini’s *Les Clochettes*, he asserts that ‘in order to bring his technique to the point that he is able to play ‘Les Clochettes’ just *once* on the concert platform, the violinist must be able to play it through *twenty* times without interruption at home!’ Unanimously agreed is the goal of realising the musical work: whereas Huberman seems to recommend playing it through as much as possible, however, Auer recommends the opposite:

“How long should the advanced pupil practice?” Professor Auer was asked. “The right kind of practice is not a matter of hours,” he replied. “Practice should represent the utmost concentration of brain. It is better to play with concentration for two hours than to practice eight without.”³³⁸

Similarly, for the young Jascha Heifetz, Auer’s pupil, the goal of violin playing is to overcome the strain of machine-like labour by grounding it in the mind. This leads him to equate exhausting practice with an erroneously mechanical approach to playing:

“In the first place I have never believed in practicing too much—it is just as bad as practicing too little!... I have never believed in grinding. In fact I think that if one has to work very hard

³³⁶ Friedrich Nietzsche, *Thus Spoke Zarathustra*, trans. R. J. Hollingdale (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1961), 196. Cited in John Carey, *The Intellectuals and the Masses* (London: Faber, 1992), 74.

³³⁷ *Am liebsten folgte ich ihm in jene höchsten Regionen der Musik, in deren Erschließung eines seiner unvergänglichen Verdienste liegt. Wo man bis dahin nur Eis und felsiges Gestein vermutete, da pflückte er die schönsten Alpenrosen und Edelweiß, und eröffnete den herrlichsten Fernblick auf blaue, von linden Lüften sanft bewegte Seen, umrahmt von blumengeschmückten, im Sonnenschein erstrahlenden Fluren.* Huberman, *Aus der Werkstatt*, 61.

³³⁸ Frederick, H. Martens, *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1919), 18.

to get his piece, it will show in the execution. To interpret music properly, it is necessary to eliminate mechanical difficulty; the audience should not feel the struggle of the artist with what are considered hard passages. I hardly ever practice more than three hours a day on an average.”³³⁹

The reason why Huberman equates the ideal of self in the artwork with an increased strain on the body is because he merges his notions of mind and body in the single idea of a subjective dynamic. The idea of violin playing as underpinned by a fundamental strength thus extends to cover all domains: strength is both metaphysical and physical in kind.

Conclusion

The congenial relationship between mind and body advocated in Mittelman’s and Auer’s notions of mental variety obscures the body’s subjugation. In Mittelman’s and Auer’s advocating of mental variety, the mind cares for the body in that it does not allow any one part to be worked harder than the others, thus preventing exhaustion. The state, as collective mind/the masculine thus improves the welfare of the social body, improves its working conditions, and, as Auer’s and Heifetz’s comments according to Martens show, recognises the importance of rest. What this ostensibly happy state of affairs conceals, however, is the powerlessness of the body to effect any of its own initiatives. In this model of violin playing there is no room for the workings of bodies and instruments to disrupt intentions and potentially lead to their revision. There is no room here for a fruitful dialogue between mind and body, only the one-directional issuing of directives from mind to body. Thus the pleasure that the left hand fingers feel in scalar runs, or the ear experiences in the amassing of sound waves in melodies and slides, is denounced as intoxication and succumbing to seductive tone. Huberman’s theory of endurance study is an even greater subjugation of the body because he galvanises both mind and body into a single entity. What is missing from this model of performance is a plurality of

³³⁹ Martens, *Violin Mastery*, 79.

elements contributing to the make-up of performance, and their varied interactions with other. There is no room for mind, body and instrument to comment on, disagree with, oppose, or co-operate with each other; rather all submit to a domineering ideology.

Self's powerful authority is most elusive in portrayals of dissenting individual and social bodies, but the attempt to exert prohibition, in the name of guarding against the threat of anarchy, is nevertheless a means of exerting control over violinistic practices. As the opening material of this chapter showed, notions of self are absent in the idea of the uncontrollable spread of diseased string practices, the most salient of these being vibrato. Nevertheless, assertions of destructive forces constitute the attempted imposition of authority all the same, albeit of a more nameless kind. Auer's notion that players were infected by continuous vibrato by their teachers, and were powerless to cure it, justified his contempt for the device, and invested credibility in his stringent suggestions for a cure.³⁴⁰ This scene of lawlessness justified Auer's attempt to police vibrato, in the same way that writers' equating of excessive portamenti, idiosyncratic use of ornaments, and rushed tempo, to the unpopular scourges of wanton sexual behaviour and substance abuse, qualified them to issue regulations designed to bring such devices under their jurisdiction. Behind this portrayal of an anarchic state is the same authoritarian agency that attempted to control violinistic practices through subjectivism. It is at first surprising to read that the all-powerful artist, as Flesch writes, could be undermined by the crowd's applause. The power dynamic inherent in this discourse, however, is the same as that which posited the Nietzschean model of the artist in the first place. Both are designed to grant authority to writers' more specific suggestions regarding the use of the player's body and instrument, in the form of advice on vibrato, portamento, and so on.

It is precisely in those passages attempting to police bodies, however, that the body gains the most agency, and one speculates that the performance culture of the age incorporated practices

³⁴⁰ Auer gives his remedy as follows: 'There is only one remedy which may be depended upon to counteract this ailing nervous condition, vicious habit, or lack of good taste – and that is to deny oneself the use of the *vibrato* altogether. Observe and follow your playing with all the mental concentration at your disposal. As soon as you notice the slightest vibration of hand or finger, stop playing, rest for a few minutes, and then begin once more, continuing to observe yourself. For weeks and months you must continually guard yourself in this fashion until you are confident that you have mastered your *vibrato* absolutely, that it is entirely within your control.' Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 61.

resulting from a conflict of both successful and unsuccessful attempts to impose order. The anxious attempts to impose order reveal fears over the body's potential which at the same time grant to it that potential. Speaking from a wider cultural perspective, the history of liberalised political orders from the eighteenth century onwards not only witnesses the crushing of minority groups but also instances in which the oppressed gain the upper hand. In terms of the primary sources critiqued in this thesis, the passages which denounce the diseased left hand, for example, are those in which the left hand begins to acquire rights of its own. In Auer's vague evocation of a hostile, judgmental deity (in the notion that individuals become cursed with continuous vibrato), the disobedient body is even possessed by a form of self to rival that of mind/spirit. Similarly, then, one speculates that the performance culture that obsessively tried to proscribe unruly performance practices was one in which performance was a constant conforming to, and transgressing of, the rules. Vibrato, portamento and ornaments lost their meaning as embellishments and were turned by prohibitive rules into caged degenerates: their disease was nevertheless felt, however, and, one speculates, they sometimes managed to break free of their containment. This might help to explain the discrepancy, identified by Robert Philip, between Auer's discursive assault on continuous vibrato and his more liberal use of it in performance. Philip encounters the problem when listening to Auer's recordings that his 'vibrato is not quite as sparing as one might expect from his own criticism of 'violinists who habitually make use of the device''.³⁴¹ Further research on the recorded evidence would shed further light on this issue.

The next chapter engages further with notions of prohibition on medical and moral grounds to consider ethical responses to performative practices which diverge from the predominating moral outrage. It further differs from the current chapter, and indeed the thesis so far, in that it explores challenges to an ideal of mind not from the body, but from notions of subjectivity themselves. Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* becomes further significant in the next chapter, but the aim is not to posit a clear distinction between pedagogical treatises, as sites of the raising of an ideology, and biographies and memoirs as sites for its critique. What it will demonstrate is that Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* continues to rely on an ideal of universal mind for its construction of

³⁴¹ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 59. Cited in Robert Philip, *Early Recordings and Musical Style: Changing Tastes in Instrumental Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 104.

critical frameworks for performance, and conversely, there are passages in the pedagogical treatises which turn against the predominating ideology.

Chapter 5

Metaphors of Erotic Conquest and Surrender: Challenges to the Hegemony of Pre-Eminent Self in the Artwork

One of the aims of the present chapter is to explore in more detail the effects of prohibition, not from the perspective of the proscribers but from the perspective of the proscribed. The aim is to find out if notions of erotic interaction were colonised through and through, or whether there were attempts to escape the domineering order. It will look for traces of an alternative set of metaphors to rival those of the pathological model and will ask what were the consequences of daring to bring about such liberty. It will show that such liberties was perceived to be dangerous, and that, subsequently, notions of erotic interaction are contained in different ways: either they simply do not appear at all in print, in the literature surrounding violin playing, or if they do, are cloaked in euphemistic language. As this chapter will show, an overly candid exposing of such ideas, as in the case of an auto-biographical text by Carl Flesch, met with the debilitating effects of prohibition. The emancipation from the rhetoric of individual and social hygiene enable metaphors of erotic interaction to transcend the mind–body dualism to some extent: although erotic metaphors centre around notions of the body, this chapter will demonstrate that they extend to challenge the notion of a singular and universal self. The previous chapters showed that the body enters into dialogue with, challenges, conflicts with, becomes the same as, and surrenders to mind, but it never topples its hegemony, as a universal and all-powerful entity. In contrast, this chapter looks at the fragile articulation of a model of intersubjectivity, in which selves are defined not by what they are, but what they might become, through their joining with others. The chapter looks at the repercussions of this imagined possibility, however, in notions of the violations committed against self autonomy, and what happens when the idea of the pre-eminent artist lingers in this new arena of multiple selves, to dominate lesser violin players.

Erotic metaphors are distinct from pathological metaphors of sex because they harbour a moral ambivalence. Writers on violin playing do not consistently use metaphors of sexual behaviour

to condemn certain aspects of performance, but in some cases tread an ambiguous path between prohibiting and condoning, and sometimes even boldly declare their approval of human interaction that could be termed erotic or sexual, as a metaphor for performance. Carl Flesch's pedagogical advice that 'every true artist should have enough self control to relinquish a beautifully sounding—and oh, so seductive—portamento' at once betrays a puritanical denial of sexual pleasure and an acknowledgement of its real power.³⁴² Flesch's remark accords with Foucault's portrayal of bourgeois sexuality (*The History of Sexuality, Volume 1*), as a perpetual and alternating submission to, and transgression of, rules governing sexual behaviour.

Flesch is aware of the moral shortcomings of his fellow artists, yet it is in these very qualities that he locates their artistic worth. Flesch relates that a performance given by Kreisler in 1896 was an 'unrestrained orgy of sinfully seductive and depravedly fascinating sounds' (*eine hemmungslose Orgie sündhaft-verführerischer, lasterhaft-faszinierender Klänge*): 'sinful' is a clear signifier of immorality, and 'unrestrained' reflects the period's anxieties over loss of self control, yet Flesch prefaces his description of Kreisler's performance by saying that 'in this performance I gained, for the first time, something of Kreisler's greatness and originality' (*damals ging mir zum erstenmal eine Ahnung von Kreislers Größe und Ursprunglichkeit auf*). Similarly, Flesch's description of Thibaud's playing as characterised by an 'unchastity' indicates a moral shortcoming, yet Thibaud played, says Flesch, with an 'unchastity that was all the more seductive for its refinement' (*verfeinerter, aber desto verführischer Unkeuschheit*).³⁴³

Andreas Moser similarly equates erotic appeal with artistic greatness. As with Flesch, morally suspect behaviour is not far from Moser's mind in his appraisal of the erotic appeal of Joachim's performances. In describing Joachim's performance of Tartini's Sonata in G Minor ('Devil's Trill'), Moser alludes to the source of Christian immorality ('demoniacal'), as well as the more specific moral

³⁴² *Jeder wirkliche Künstler sollte genügend Selbstüberwindung besitzen, um auf ein schön klingendes – und ach, so verführisches – Portamento zu verzichten.* Carl Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928), 1.18, translation adapted from Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, ed. and trans. Eric Rosenblith (New York: Fischer, 2000), 1.15.

³⁴³ Carl Flesch, *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Zürich: Atlantis, 1960), 85, 127, all translations adapted from Carl Flesch, *Memoirs*, ed. Hans Keller and C.F. Flesch, trans. Hans Keller (London: Rockliff, 1957), 118, 197.

sensibility of his age, which was particularly sensitive to the perils of substance abuse ('intoxicating'). Furthermore, Moser's description of Joachim's performances as 'mad' connotes anxieties over mental disease, and 'agitated' points to the attributing of mental disease to malfunctions of the nervous system:

From a violinistic standpoint this achievement may be called the high point of Joachim's ability, for it simultaneously gives him the opportunity to prove himself the noblest singer on the violin, and occasion to show his colossal technical ability in a gleaming light. The demoniacal passion and the ravishing fire to which he gives expression in this fine work, is only matched by his interpretation of the Hungarian Concerto. The hot glow and luxurious sensuality with which he plays the warm-blooded melodies of the first movement into the soul of the listener, and the mad, agitated gaiety in the *Finale alla Zingarese*, they exert an intoxicating effect which is impossible to put into words.³⁴⁴

Moser's description of Joachim's performances as possessing a 'a hot glow and luxurious sensuality', however, is a candid flaunting of sexual behaviour: having surveyed late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century texts which describe the erotic or sexual appeal of Wagner's music, Laurence Dreyfus has argued that the term *Sinnlichkeit* is a euphemism, in texts from the latter half of the nineteenth century, for the view that Wagner's music 'provokes an explicit erotic charge'.³⁴⁵ Thus, one would be justified in translating *sinnlich* as 'sexual' for a modern readership. Furthermore, as chapter 4 demonstrated, 'luxurious' (*üppige*) is a word which connotes the sexually licentious orient.

Moser's comparison here to Joachim's performing of his own 'Hungarian' concerto (no. 2, op.11) again summons the very idea of transgression itself. Jonathan Bellman has explored the idea of a Hungarian style in late nineteenth- and early twentieth-century performance, citing Brahms's performance indication *alla zingarese* (in the gypsy style), the gestures found in his *Ungarische Tänze*, together with evidence from early twentieth-century recordings. Bellman notably concludes that 'it is in the flagrant contradiction of normative 'classical' performance style that the *style*

³⁴⁴Vom violinistischen Standpunkt bezeichnet diese Leistung Joachims wohl den Höhepunkt seines Könnens, denn sie giebt ihm gleichzeitig Gelegenheit, sich als den edelsten Sänger auf der Geige zu erweisen, wie sein kolossales technisches Vermögen ins glänzendste Licht zu setzen. Die dämonische Leidenschaft und das hinreissende Feuer, welche er in diesem herrlichen Kunstwerk zum Ausdruck bringt, finden nur in seinem Vortrag des ungarischen Konzerts ihr Gegenstück. Die heisse Glut und üppige Sinnlichkeit, mit denen er dem Zuhörer die warmblütigen Melodien des ersten Satzes in die Seele geigt, und die tolle, aufgeregte Lustigkeit in dem Finale a la Zingarese, sie üben eine berausende Wirkung aus, die in Worten wiederzugeben nicht gut möglich ist. Andreas Moser, *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild* (Berlin: E. Behr, 1898), 276. 'The Hungarian Concerto' that Moser refers to is a concerto that Joachim himself wrote, his second concerto, 'in the Hungarian manner', in D Minor, op.11.

³⁴⁵ Laurence Dreyfus, *Wagner and the Erotic Impulse* (Cambridge, Mass., London: Harvard University Press, 2010), 3.

hongrois is most convincingly played'. Through a comparative study of recordings of Hungarian Dances by Joseph Joachim, Bronisław Huberman, Alexander Schmuller and Nikisch himself, Bellman notes that what these recordings have in common is their favouring of 'powerful gestures' over 'control and accuracy'.³⁴⁶

Like Flesch, Moser also assembles a metaphor of seduction in the above quote: the sentence in which Moser's description occurs ('the hot glow and luxurious sensuality with which he plays the warm-blooded melodies of the first movement into the soul of the listener'), joins the suggestion of sexual appeal with Joachim's gaining of intimate access into the listener. Joachim's penetration is thus of a sexual kind. Most importantly, Moser, like Flesch, regards Joachim's playing of this Sonata as one of the high points of his artistic career.

Moser's and Flesch's equating of artistry with dubious moral standards has a cultural precedent in the idea of decadence. As Chapter 4 discussed, decadence is the idea that the passing of time leads to inevitable decay, which in the late nineteenth century was fuelled by the sense of the belatedness of the modern age, as well as anxieties over the spread of pathological and moral degeneration. However, since for Nietzsche, and for artists associated with the French *décadence* movement, decline was inevitable, the purpose of art was to raise modern sickness to the level of artistic greatness. Nietzsche wrote of Wagner that 'precisely because nothing is more modern than this total sickness, this lateness and overexcitement of the nervous mechanism, Wagner is the modern artist *par excellence*'.³⁴⁷

Flesch and Moser view great artists as creators of, and not subjects of, the moral sensibilities of their age, and thus the stature of the primary producers of art alone justifies their values and actions. Nietzsche's remarks on Wagner are not a condemnation of the composer: to the contrary, Nietzsche demonstrates his continued attachment to him when he writes that 'the last thing I

³⁴⁶ Bellman, Jonathan, 'Performing Brahms in the *Style Hongrois*', in Michael Musgrave and Bernard D. Sherman, eds, *Performing Brahms: Early Evidence of Performance Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 327–348, 340.

³⁴⁷ Friedrich Nietzsche, 'The Case of Wagner' in *Basic Writings of Nietzsche*, trans. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Vintage Books, 1967), 601–654, 622.

want to do is start a celebration for any other musician... Other musicians don't count compared to Wagner'.³⁴⁸ For Nietzsche the primary producers of art do not operate within external moral codes but themselves create them, and it is with this concept in mind that Moser and Flesch create their narratives of performers such as Kreisler, Thibaud, and Joachim. Moser and Flesch see themselves not as moral arbitrators of performers' artistic worth but view great violinists as themselves creators of meaning.

In addition to notions of decadence, Nietzschean and Freudian ideas of the irrational and destructive will also created a conceptual platform for the notion of artistry as characterised by violently erotic desire. Nietzsche wrote of the essentially Dionysian nature of life, an unrestrained and destructive energy, which was made bearable by the Apollonian's positing of forms. What prevails in Nietzsche's thought taken as a whole though, as chapter 2 demonstrated, is the idea of life as a 'dark, driving power' that is 'always unmerciful, always unjust'.³⁴⁹ Chapter 2 discussed the influence on Freud's notion of the unconscious of a Germanic philosophical tradition centred around notions of the dark and irrational aspects of mind, and showed how Flesch's notion of the psyche had borrowed from the emerging culture of psychoanalysis.

Flesch had experienced the *décadence* movement as a student in Paris in the 1890s, and his comments appear to be direct products of the artistic ethos of the epoch. He fashions Thibaud as a typical decadent, morally suspect in his lifestyle and art making, yet in these very qualities he attains to the *finesse* to which the French artists of the time aspired:

To the young Thibaud, women were everything. However unconsciously, his art as well as his thought and actions were dominated by the eternal feminine. His playing was saturated with a yearning for sensual pleasure, with an unchastity that was all the more seductive for its refinement.³⁵⁰

³⁴⁸ Ibid. 642.

³⁴⁹ Friedrich Nietzsche, *Untimely Meditations*, Daniel Breazeale, ed., trans. R. J. Hollingdale (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), 76.

³⁵⁰ *Dem Jüngling Thibaud gingen die Frauen über alles.* ('However unconsciously... eternal feminine' omitted from German edition). *Sein Spiel war durchtränkt von der Sehnsucht nach sinnlichem Genuß, von verfeinerter, aber desto verführischer Unkeuschheit.* Flesch, *Erinnerungen eines Geigers*, 127. Flesch, *Memoirs*, 197.

It is possible that these notions had been kept fresh in Flesch's mind through his long attachment to French literature: Flesch remarks that during his years in Paris he had 'formed a special predilection for French literature, which I was to retain all my life'. Perhaps this is where he learned of the 'poisonously seductive blossoms' of Baudelaire's *Fleurs du mal*, and Verlaine's 'magically depraved fantasies'.³⁵¹

It is also possible to view Flesch's comments as a kind of pastiche, however, designed to camouflage his controversial opinions. One has to bear in mind that Flesch was writing thirty years after *décadence* had experienced its peak, and thus one can view his chapter on his student years in Paris (in which the above comments on Kreisler and Thibaud appear), as a deliberate evocation of a philosophy which matches the period in question. The idea of sickness as greatness prevails most in this chapter over others. That Flesch attempts this imitation of a style makes more sense when one bears in mind the exploratory approach of *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* to finding critical frameworks for assessing artistic worth, as opposed to the more consistent positing of a coherent artistic ethos in *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*. Flesch's parody of decadence may have been an attempt to camouflage his controversial opinions, as a way of making them more palatable to puritanical tastes. This parallels much avant-garde, kitsch and camp art in the early twentieth century, which used parody, humour and a sense of the absurd to attempt a subverting of bourgeois norms.

The Seducer and the Seduced: the Problem of Original Creativity

The metaphor of the violinist as seducer accords with the idea of the artist as primary producer of art. As chapter 2 demonstrated, although the primary literature sometimes considers the spirits of composer and performer as uniting in the act of artistic production, the idea that predominates is that of the performer as the original creator of vitality: Auer downplays the agency of the composer by describing his works as 'merely' lying 'dormant in the printed page', and by construing the performer

³⁵¹ Omitted from German edition. Flesch, *Memoirs*, 128, 127.

as the active agent ('until we make it live and glow and radiate in tone').³⁵² Auer's description of the tone of the virtuosi of his age as 'ravishing' evokes the sense of assault of the performer on the listener, and one notes here also that the metaphor may not only be one of sexual conquest but also military or political: the verb to 'ravish' has been historically used to denote violent destruction of foreign territory (usually as a means of conquering it), as well as denoting sexual pursuit or assault.³⁵³ Elsewhere, Auer asserts that 'the violinist whose technique is assured, and who possesses that peculiar magnetism which exerts irresistible and convincing charm [,] is able to sway the greatest audience with compelling power'.³⁵⁴ Similarly, according to Martens, Ysaÿe relates that "'the violin was made to charm, to move, and Vieuxtemps knew it. Like Rubinstein, he held that the artist must first of all have ideas, emotional power.'"³⁵⁵

A challenge to the performer's hegemony over the act of seduction or assault comes in a passage by Joachim, in which he portrays the composer as the active partner. In his introduction to his edited violin part to Tartini's Sonata in G Minor ('Devil's Trill), Joachim writes:

There are works of art which so insurmountably work an effect that the trembling excitement of their creator seems to exhale on us like a living breath. To such, as it appears to me, belongs the sonata before us, with its surging outpouring of soundwaves, now tender, now passionate.³⁵⁶

Joachim's comments echo Moser's portrayal of erotic and subversive excitement, with reference to the same musical work. There is a decided focus on the sensual: the composer 'exhales' on the performer and/or listener (Joachim does not specify who 'us' is, although the introductions are written for violinists following the edited scores, thus the performer is the likely addressee) and the melodies are not metaphysical in origin but consist of 'soundwaves'. There is also a vague suggestion of loss of

³⁵² Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921), 160.

³⁵³ Ibid. 38. 'Ravish', Oxford English Dictionary [online reference source] (Oxford University Press) <<http://dictionary.oed.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/158684?rskey=MG6BBi&result=2&isAdvanced=false#eid>> accessed 29 July 2011.

³⁵⁴ Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, 171.

³⁵⁵ Frederick H. Martens, *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1919), 3.

³⁵⁶ *Es gibt Kunstwerke, die deshalb so unbezwinglich wirken, weil uns aus ihnen die innerliche Erregung des Schaffenden wie mit lebendigem Hauch entgegen zu atmen scheint. Zu diesen gehört für mich die vorliegende Sonate mit ihrem quellenden Fortgang bald zarter, bald leidenschaftlicher Tonwellen.* Joseph Joachim and Andreas Moser, *Violinschule in 3 Bänden*, 3 vols, trans. Alfred Moffat (Berlin: N. Simrock, Schott, 1905), 70. All translations adapted from the original.

control in the composer's 'trembling excitement' and the 'surging outpouring of soundwaves'. Unlike Moser's comments, however, the direction of vitality is switched here so that Joachim does not drive 'warm-blooded melodies' into the soul of the listener but the composer's 'living breath' instead pours out onto the performer himself.

What allowed Joachim to diverge from a felt need to moralise was the protection that the work's classical status provided from moral and pathological decay. Joachim's erotic description of Tartini's sonata stands in stark contrast to his three other introductions to works in the *Violinschule*. Joachim's introduction to Mendelssohn's Violin Concerto is laden with anxieties over decaying (*verfallen*) and 'degenerating' (*ausarten*) tempi changes, and loss of the 'chaste charm' (*keuschen Reiz*) of the music to 'excessive vibrating' (*übermäßige Vibrieren*). For Joachim, Mendelssohn's Concerto clearly needs a guardian: he stakes his position as chief oracle to the composer's wishes in his opening remarks:

At the age of sixteen, I repeatedly had the good fortune to be accompanied in this concerto by the composer, whose precise intentions are thus familiar to me.³⁵⁷

Joachim is surprisingly relaxed, however, about the 'insurmountable... effect' that Tartini's work has on the performer: like Moser's language, Joachim's choice of words alludes to loss of autonomy and control over will power. The recipient is powerless to resist the composer's onslaught, in breath and soundwaves, although Joachim is careful to remind the reader of the continued and reassuring presence of vitality ('living breath') in the sensuous deluge. The reason for Joachim's change in tone lies in his contrasting concepts of the two works: Joachim regarded Tartini's Sonata, an eighteenth-century Italian work, as 'classical', which therefore separated it from the pathological scourges of the modern age (one recalls that Moser describes the opening melody of Handel's Violin Sonata in A Major as 'unaffected naturalness' and '*bel canto* under clear blue Italian skies').³⁵⁸ In contrast, the Mendelssohn Concerto, written in 1844, was a product of the fallen, post-classical age. Furthermore, Mendelssohn was never canonised in the nineteenth century to the extent that Beethoven, Schumann

³⁵⁷ *Als Sechzehnjähriger hatte ich wiederholt das Glück, dieses Konzert vom Komponisten begleitet zu spielen, dessen Intentionen mir somit genau vertraut sind.* Ibid. 3.228.

³⁵⁸ *Ungesuchten Natürlichkeit... bel canto unter klarblauem italienischen Himmel.* Ibid. 3.16.

and Brahms were; indeed, Wagner's vitriolic denigration of Mendelssohn did much to tarnish his reputation. It seems that Joachim was anxious to impose a kind of authentic and authoritative model of performance onto the authority of the Concerto as a work.

The idea of the performer's original creativity faces a further challenge from discussions of the interaction between teachers and pupils. In a section of Martens's interview with the violinist Maud Powell entitled 'The Influence of the Teacher', Powell, in Martens's words, initially upholds an ideal of original creativity in violin playing:

“The problem of the teacher is to prevent his pupils from being too imitative—all students are natural imitators—and furthering the quality of musical imagination in them. Pupils generally have something of the teacher's tone—Auer pupils have the Auer tone, Joachim pupils have a Joachim tone, an excellent thing. But as each pupil has an individuality of his own, he should never sink it altogether in that of his teacher.”

Powell's assertion of original creativity is similar to Auer's privileging of autonomous genius and his denouncing of imitation. In contrast to Auer, however, Powell acknowledges a tension between individuality and the sharing of tone between teachers and pupils. Powell goes on to further contradict her proclaimed ideal of originality by portraying her own training as a complex amalgam of influences. Dancla taught her “‘De Bériot's wonderful method of attack’”, “‘purity of style’”, and a “‘technical equipment which carried bowing right along, 'neck and neck' with the finger work of the left hand’”. In contrast, there is the suggestion that Joachim and/or Schradieck's teaching method was hampered by their overemphasis on left hand “‘finger development at the expense of the bow’”. Powell relates that owing to her technical proficiency on arriving in Paris, Dancla switched her over to a French method of teaching, which is characterised by “‘taste, elegance, imagination; the German is more conservative, serious, and has, perhaps, more depth’”. Powell's account of her violinistic constitution is in fact not so much a testament to creative originality but a story of extensive engagement with teachers, teaching practices, periods, places of study, and national styles. In short, a mediation of bodies, practices, events and practices is the stuff of Powell's playing, which undermines her ideal of original genius.³⁵⁹

³⁵⁹ Martens, *Violin Mastery*, 186–188.

Martens and Flesch apply metaphors of the performer's power over the listener to the teacher's relationship with the pupil, again making it difficult to see where original genius lies. Eddy Brown, as related by Martens, adopts a metaphor of physical coercion to describe Auer's approach to teaching:

“While Hubay tells a student how to do things, Auer, a temperamental teacher, literally drags out of him whatever there is in him, awakening latent powers he never knew he possessed.”

Whereas for Brown this was empowering for the student, for Mischa Elman it was detrimental to the student's development:

“There was a magnetism about him: he literally hypnotized his pupils into doing better than their best—though in some cases it was evident that once the support of his magnetic personality was withdrawn, the pupil fell back into the level from which he had been raised for the time being.”³⁶⁰

In Flesch's writings one again encounters the overlap between metaphors of physical violence and seduction, here fused in the metaphor of the vampire:

He [Joachim] was the ideal type of a training teacher, the playing teacher (*Vorspieler*) *par excellence*. He influenced by his example, without being able to analyse its origin and effect, or comprehensibly convey it to others. Only those whose technical training was firmly established could profit by his teaching. His performances were distinguished by a poetic quality which, once one had experienced it, accompanied one all one's life. Marsick and Hubay, for instance, were thus affected; and I, too, have been unable all my life to free myself from the memory of his interpretation of certain works. But here again lay the danger of a repression of the pupil's individuality if, that is, he remained too long exposed to Joachim's seductive influence. As teachers, towering individualities usually are vampires who suck out their pupils' personality.³⁶¹

Joachim's assault on the autonomy of pupils is commented on several times throughout the memoirs: the French violinist Lucien Capet was 'hypnotically influenced by the old Joachim' (*vom alten Joachim in hypnotischer Weise beeinflusst*), the German violinist Karl Klingler stood under the 'posthumous hypnosis of Joachim' (*posthumen Hypnose Joachims*), and the female German violinist

³⁶⁰ Ibid. 26, 47.

³⁶¹ *Er war der Idealtypus des trainierenden Lehrers, des Vorspielers par excellence, der durch das Beispiel wirkt, ohne imstande zu sein, dessen Entstehung und Wirkung analysieren und rein verstandesmäßig auf andere übertragen zu können. Nur diejenigen, deren technische Vorbildung unterschütterlich feststand, konnten von ihm Nutzen ziehen. [‘His performances... all one's life’ missing from the German edition.] So ist es beispielsweise Marsick und Hubay ergangen, und auch ich habe mich von der Erinnerung an Joachims Vortragsart gewisser Werke, die ich von ihm gehört hatte, zeitlebens nicht mehr frei machen können. Darin lag ja auch die Gefahr einer Verdrängung der Individualität des Schülers, falls er dieser verführerischen Einwirkung allzulange ausgesetzt blieb. Übertreffende Individualitäten sind als Lehrer meist Vampyre, die ihren Schülern die Persönlichkeit aussagen.* Flesch, *Erinnerungen*, 36. Flesch, *Memoirs*, 35.

Wilma Norma Neruda ‘played wholly in Joachim’s spirit’ (*ganz in Joachimschem Geist spielte*).³⁶² Flesch here draws on the wider cultural preoccupation with hypnosis, a topic researched and made popular by the French psychologist Jean-Martin Charcot (1825–1983), by way of giving credibility to his notion that Joachim robbed his pupils of their independent will power.

Flesch veers between condoning and condemning this loss of personal autonomy. Flesch’s praise for Neruda is almost as pronounced as his lauding of Kreisler, writing that ‘although I could not hear a truly personal note, her playing left an extraordinarily profound impression on me’ (*wenngleich eine eigentlich persönliche Note nicht zu erkennen war, hinterließ mir ihr Spiel dennoch einen außergewöhnlich tiefen Eindruck*), and of Klingler Flesch says ‘I, myself, always enjoyed listening to his quartet because many an interpretative point reminded me of Joachim’ (missing from German edition).³⁶³ Flesch includes ‘myself’ here because he is aware that his approval would not have been widespread, and in the preceding sentences to this one Flesch gives some idea of why: as in the case of Neruda, Klingler’s holistic personality had been violated:

His creative power (*Gestaltungskraft*), on the other hand, was considerable, and he even inherited some of the holy fire of his unforgettable master—though to the detriment of his own personality.³⁶⁴

Flesch condemns Lucien Capet’s imitation of Joachim on the basis that in doing so Capet overlooked his innate national/racial characteristics, with the result that his playing sounded artificial. Flesch maps onto the French–German distinction the binarism of romantic–classical: thus, Capet’s neglect of ‘his true French nature’ emerges as the imitation of Joachim’s ‘classicism’, which resulted in a ‘deliberate’, as opposed to natural, imitation of a style:

The impression I thus obtained was thoroughly favourable: exact ensemble playing, serious interpretation, cultivated technical resources. However it seemed to me that the artistic personality of the leader did not afford a homogeneous picture. It fluctuated between touches of ‘classical’ dryness and an occasional emergence of a somewhat effeminate sweetness... Like Klingler, Capet was hypnotically influenced by the old Joachim.. His dry style was

³⁶² Ibid. 76, 146–147, 100, and 94, 251, 145.

³⁶³ Ibid. 100 and 145, 251.

³⁶⁴ *Andererseits verfügt er über eine bedeutende Gestaltungskraft, während er auch etwas von der heiligen Glut seines unvergeßlichen Meisters geerbt hat, –allerdings zum Schaden der eigenen Persönlichkeit.* Ibid. 146 and 250–251.

deliberate—the Romance conception of German classicism. Only now and then did he allow for his true French nature to break through.³⁶⁵

Dryness is the ill-effect of an attempt to imitate classicism, a quality which was alien to Capet's French, and therefore, romantic, nature. Flesch thinks that Capet has fallen short of the ideal of the artist as a unified self: his true French nature has been broken up by attempts to imitate German classicism. On the one hand this results in a dry playing style, resulting from an attempt to imitate, and on the other hand it results in a loss of masculinity ('effeminate sweetness'), which, one speculates, is the warped emergence of his romantic French nature.³⁶⁶

Metaphors of seduction thus render problematic the ideal of original creativity, when considering multiple artists. Discursive mediations of the artist with a powerful erotic influence often fail to mention his casualties—his pupils—who also become artists in their own right. In discussions of the interaction of teachers and pupils, the autonomy of some artists is ultimately corrupted, as they are superseded by the potent erotic drive of their superiors. A hierarchy of vitality, or a chain of predators and prey, whether between composer and performer, or between performers themselves, inevitably posits recipients of the active drive, with the result that some artists lose their claim to original creativity.

³⁶⁵ *Die hierbei erhaltenen Eindrücke waren in der Hauptsache durchaus günstiger Art: exaktes Zusammenspiel, ernste Auffassung, gepflegte technische Mittel. Es schien mir allerdings, als ob die künstlerische Persönlichkeit des Primarius kein einheitliches Bild böte. Es schwankte zwischen einem gelegentlichen Anflug von „klassischer“ Trockenheit und zeitweise durchbrechender, etwas weichlicher Süßlichkeit... Capet war..., ähnlich wie Klingler, vom alten Joachim in hypnotischer Weise beeinflusst... Seine Trockenheit war Absicht und entsprach der romanischen Auffassung vom deutschen Klassizismus. Seiner wahren französischen Natur erlaubte er nur hie und da durchzubrechen. Ibid. 75–76 and 93–94.*

³⁶⁶ The idea of intersubjectivity between teachers and pupils, for Flesch, is a principle which applies to any instance of where an eminent performer influences lesser performers encompassing him. Joachim's encroachment upon others' self autonomy also characterises the influence wielded by Sarasate's renowned artistry, until, Flesch implies, the equally famed reputation of Ysaÿe's playing annuls it. Flesch writes that Sarasate's 'hypnotic effect on the oncoming young violinists was almost irresistible until Ysaÿe's appearance. His influence was so enduring that everybody who had once succumbed to it found it thereafter difficult to free himself from it. As late as 1914 I was able to discern clear traces of this influence in the playing of Franz Kneisel in New York. I too, long had the tendency to slip into Sarasate's style, especially in pieces I had often heard him play.' *Suggestion die heranwachsende geigerische Jugend sich bis zum Auftauchen Ysayes nahezu widerstandlos hingab. Sein Einfluß war ein so nachhaltiger, daß alle, die ihm seinerzeit unterlagen, zeitlebens die größte Mühe hatten, sich hiervon wieder zu befreien. Noch 1914 konnte ich deutlich die Spuren dieser Entwicklung im Spiel Franz Kneisels in New York feststellen. Auch ich hatte lange Zeit die Neigung, insbesondere in Stücken, die ich oft von ihm gehört hatte, in seine Manier zu verfallen. Ibid. 43–44 and 43.*

A Singular Form of Self or the Erotic Attraction of Multiple Selves?

Metaphors of seduction and conquest begin to radically alter the metaphorical terrain because they move away from the idea of universal mind to focus on the conflicting and converging of multiple and different selves. All of the above examples posit a hierarchical chain of command, from seducer to seduced, conqueror and conquered, which in itself serves to reinforce the idea that vitality is singular in origin. Vitality is the Absolute that begins in one undivided and all-powerful artist and spreads outwards to sustain the masses. However, there are validated artists in the above passages who owe their existence to the invasive influence of others: Flesch approves of the artistry of Neruda and Klingler, both of whom played in the spirit of Joachim. Is there a point, then, at which the chain of command loses its significance, and the participating agents constitute a non-hierarchical network of multiple selves? Furthermore, might there a point at which self stops being defined by what it already is and is re-defined as a process of becoming?

Passages in Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* point towards the emergence of a philosophy of the performance network which articulates the process of interaction between heterogeneous selves. The boldest declaration of this conceptual framework appears in a passage in which Flesch presents a reflective statement on his notion of 'the erotic', which he describes as a 'yearning for the unattainable':

At the turn of the century my development as a violinist began to enter a more hopeful phase. Through the example of Marteau and Kubelik my playing had been favourably influenced as regards both expression and technique, and my emotional life, too, had undergone a change, in which unspent powers, that until now were bound, were made free, and were placed at the service of my art. The deep connection between music and the endless gradations of erotic feeling is indisputable, if by 'erotic' one understands not simply sensual love but the aggregate of all emotions which not only attach people to each other but also find expression in the relations with God and nature, as a yearning for the unattainable in every form. Down to my twenty-fifth year my erotic feelings had wavered between the extremes of idealistic selflessness and earthbound love. Not long after my installation at Bucharest, relations had developed between myself and a married woman some years older than I, in whom, for the first time, I loved the human being too, and who succeeded to some extent in melting the ice which had so far separated my instinct from my spiritual self.³⁶⁷

³⁶⁷ *Um die Wende des Jahrhunderts begann meine geigerische Entwicklung in ein hoffnungsvolleres Stadium zu treten. Durch das Beispiel von Marteau und Kubelik war mein Spiel sowohl ausdrucksmäßig als auch in technischer Hinsicht in günstiger Weise beeinflusst worden, und auch in meinem Gefühlsleben war mittlerweile*

This passage continues in the same vein as Flesch's other erotic or sexual metaphors applied to performance because he is referring to changes in his 'emotional life', namely an affair with a married woman, which led to changes in his playing ('unspent powers... placed at the service of my art'). In the middle of this autobiographical section, however, Flesch digresses to philosophical reflection, defining his joint sexual and musical developments as 'the erotic', which is defined by a 'yearning for the unattainable in every form'. Here, then, Flesch defines sexual and performative interaction not in terms of seducers and the objects of their affections but in terms of desire itself. In the metaphors which this thesis and chapter have looked at so far there is a linear vector of power running along a hierarchical line of authority, whether from performers to listeners, composer to performers and listeners, and from more eminent performers to their pupils. Flesch's moment of reflection, however, presents a multiplicity of incomplete and hierarchically unordered subjectivities, each yearning to be completed by one another.

There are elements in this passage, however, which continue to posit a binaristic hierarchy. Flesch's inclusion of 'the relations between God and nature' in his conception of the erotic is an appeal to the Idealist notion of God/mind, which vitalises the lesser principle of nature/the mechanistic. Furthermore, Flesch may have conceived of his affair in terms of the masculine–feminine binarism, which maps onto the binarism of God and nature. Furthermore, Flesch's articulation of erotic interaction is still self centred: the erotic attraction in this passage does not arise in the course of interaction between Flesch and his lover, but originates in Flesch himself ('unspent powers, that until now were bound, were made free'). An important idea in Flesch's model of violin playing in his pedagogical treatise is the removal of 'hindrances' to the flow of the spirit of the artwork: it is this idea which appears here, when Flesch says that the freeing of his unspent powers

eine Wandlung eingetreten, durch die unverbrauchte, bislang gefesselte Kräfte frei wurden. ('And were placed at the service of my art' and the rest of the quote is missing from the German edition). Ibid. 123 and 188. 'And were placed at the service of my art' is not rendered in the German, although it may have occurred in the next sentence of the manuscript, which the German edition may have chosen to omit, but the English added to the first sentence. Keller is generally not liberal in his approach to translation and so it is unlikely that he would have added this sentence without its existing in the manuscript.

improves his violin playing. Flesch's brief championing of desire over prescribed identity, then, is mired in continuing notions of a hegemonic model of self.

Although the passage in which it appears harbours internal contradictions, Flesch's reflective statement on erotic interaction serves to make sense of other passages in his text. So far this chapter has looked at the idea of erotic relations from the perspective of inter-personal dynamics, but it is also possible to speak of an internal erotics of self. One can interpret Flesch's 'a yearning for the unattainable' as a desire for subjectivities to join with each other, that is, of 'God and nature', and 'people to each other', yet 'not simply sensual love but the aggregate of all emotions' might suggest the attraction of heterogeneous parts to each other *within* self. Indeed, Flesch's statement occurs in a paragraph in which his main point is that the woman with whom he had an affair inspired changes in his inner being. One could interpret Flesch's ambiguous statement on 'the erotic' as implying that it is an 'aggregate' of both high and low sentiments, i.e. a person's holism resulting from an internal erotics, which enables him or her to join with another person: it was the knitting together of Flesch's spiritual and instinctual parts into a whole which enabled him to enter into a relationship.

Philosophical contemplation of the part–whole relationship form an important part of the nineteenth-century hermeneutical tradition in German philosophy, and reflect its engagement with Eastern philosophies. The part–whole relationship also constituted an important theme in the early twentieth-century work of Wilhelm Dilthey and Martin Heidegger. The idea surfaces in Flesch's book in simple form and expressed in more familiar terms: the conductor Arthur Nikisch's whole self, Flesch says, is comprised of opposing elements in terms of gender and racial/national characteristics:

Born in a part of Hungary that was racially very mixed, he combined German musicality with Hungarian fire and Slavonic morbidezza. From this rare mixture came an integral whole that left the impression on the hearer of something absolutely unique of its kind, especially when the work in question was in harmony with his individuality.³⁶⁸

³⁶⁸ *In einem rassisch so gemischten Winkel Ungarns geboren, vereinigte seine Persönlichkeit deutsche Musikalität mit ungarischem Feuer und slawischer Morbidezza. Aus dieser seltenen Mischung entstand ein Ganzes, das im Hörer die Empfindung eines in seiner Art Volkommenen, Einmaligen entstehen ließ, insbesondere, wenn das aufzuführende Werk seiner Eigenart entgegenkam.* Ibid. 102 and 148.

One notes Flesch's incorporation of the listener here in discussing Nikisch's holism, providing further evidence that the reason why holism matters for Flesch is because of the connection with another person resulting from it.

As with his comments on Kreisler and Thibaud, Flesch again straddles the boundary between the socially acceptable and the socially subversive. Flesch gained his idea of Nikisch as a combination of German and Hungarian characteristics from the practice of incorporating the *style hongrois*, or elements taken from Hungarian-gypsy music, into cultivated European music. As discussed above, Jonathan Bellman has shown that this principally consisted not so much of musical practices native to Hungary or gypsies but of a deliberate contravening of the normative practices of 'classical' performance. Flesch's 'Hungarian fire', then, is not just another musical style, rooted in race, but is essentially the transgression of bourgeois norms. In 1928 the American composer Samuel Barber wrote to his mother about the gypsy music in Budapest which 'swept me off my feet', and which sounded 'too naked': according to Bellman, Barber left Budapest early wishing not to hear this kind of music again.³⁶⁹ For early twentieth-century listeners, then, the incorporation of gypsy styles into their native tradition would clearly have undermined their moral fibre.

One could argue that the *style hongrois* was appropriated by more central European composers as a way of bringing it under control, but there is no suggestion of this in Flesch's book. To the contrary, Flesch wholly affirms the Hungarian-gypsy element in cultivated performance, describing Georges Enescu's earlier performances as constituting a 'a highly attractive combination of gypsy daredevilry and cultivated artistry' (*höchst reizvolle Verbindung von zigeunerischem Draufgängertum und kultivierter Künstlerschaft*): it was in fact the separation of these qualities which was to the detriment of Enescu's later playing, so that he alternated between a 'merely virtuosic hollowness' (*nur-virtuosen Niederungen*) and a 'deliberately dry and scholastic pseudo-classicism' (*klassisch seinsollenden Mäntelchens gewollt-trocken und schulmeisterlich*) on the other.³⁷⁰ One notes

³⁶⁹ Quoted in a letter from Barber to his family, 21 August 1928, as quoted in Barbara Heyman, *Samuel Barber: the Composer and His Music* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1992), 57. Cited in Bellman, 'Performing Brahms', 338.

³⁷⁰ Flesch, *Erinnerungen*, 119. Flesch, *Memoirs*, 179.

again the intersubjective element in Flesch's comments: the combination of elements in Enescu's playing was 'highly attractive'.

Flesch's part-whole idea also accords with his idea of genius, as incorporating both masculine and feminine elements. In doing so, Flesch also appeals to a more longstanding cultural idea, that of the sexless genius. The idea that because genius is universal it incorporates both masculine and feminine essences was common in Romantic discourses in the late-eighteenth and early-nineteenth centuries. Furthermore, the idea of genius's dual gender is absent from Moser's and Auer's negotiations of the idea, which makes Flesch's use of the idea unusual. In his passage on Nikisch, whom he describes as 'a musician of genius' (*genialen Musikanten*), Flesch writes that Nikisch possessed both masculine and feminine natures:

His being (*Wesen*), as that of every interpreter of strong direct appeal, contained a fair dose of femininity, which with his otherwise thoroughly masculine clothing formed an attractive whole.³⁷¹

Flesch makes an ostensible attempt to vouch for Nikisch's basic masculinity ('otherwise thoroughly masculine'), but he undermines this by suggesting that it was in appearance only: Nikisch's masculinity is only a dressing (*Habitus*). Flesch also terms Nikisch an 'interpreter', not a 'conductor', which might indicate that Flesch was thinking of all kinds of interpretive artists. If so, then one encounters here another challenge to the performer's identity as masculine and active seducer, or wielder of power: Flesch inverts the roles of performer and listener, so that the performer coquettishly parades himself as an attractive object of the listener's desires. Interestingly, though, this femininity is not passive: the interpreter is 'of strong direct appeal'.

The significance of Flesch's part-whole idea is that it distinctly contrasts with the more widespread appeal to notions of singularities, in the form of notions of consciousness. The idea of holism values unity without undermining the heterogeneity of contributing parts: thus Flesch celebrates the difference of nationalities and their individual value in their unification, which contrasts

³⁷¹ *In seinem Wesen wie in dem eines jeden unmittelbar wirkenden Interpreten war eine entsprechende Dosis Feminität enthalten, die mit seinem sonst durchaus männlichen Habitus ein reizvolles Ganzes bildete.* Ibid. 102, 102 and 148, 149.

with Moser's promotion of Germanic ideals over Romance ones. As this chapter has shown, however, Flesch is not consistent in the application of his idea: in Flesch's comments on Lucien Capet he appeals to the very idea that racial/national origins should not be contaminated in order to denigrate Capet's playing. The following section addresses further the significance of these contradictions in Flesch's text.

Prohibition and the Case of Flesch's Memoirs

Although it did not suppress discourses of sex and eroticism, bourgeois society's prudish morals served to narrow the focus of these topics, at least in public discourses, to matters of morality and disease. As Foucault argues in his *History of Sexuality, Volume 1*, the Victorians' prohibitive attitude to sex did not silence talk of it: to the contrary, discourses surrounding sex flourished in the nineteenth century, but were centrally constructed around the twin notions of submitting to, and transgressing, norms of sexual behaviour. As James Kennaway and Laurence Dreyfus have shown in their studies of discourses surrounding Richard Wagner, and as the previous chapter of this thesis showed, notions of sexual behaviour abound under the guise of publications expressing moral outrage. Recorded medical diagnoses, similarly, often contain obsessively detailed accounts of sexual acts.

What is largely missing from discourses of this period, and what this chapter has tried to tease out, are writings which dare to articulate open-ended desire. It has identified passages which take a more explorative and playful attitude to sex, and which more openly celebrate the pleasures of erotic interaction, as opposed to tying it to an essentialised chain of macroscopic consequences. Overstepping the mark would have certainly elicited censorship: obscenity laws prevented many books from being disseminated in various countries, such as the ban on John Cleland's *Fanny Hill* in several Western countries throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, as well as the United States's ban on James Joyce's *Ulysses* between 1918 and 1933. Under the Comstock law of 1873 the U.S. Postal Service even refused to mail highbrow literature such as Aristophanes's *Lysistrata*, Chaucer's *The Canterbury Tales*, and Daniel Defoe's *Moll Flanders*. The publishers of Hans Fuchs's

History of Erotic Art (1912–1926) attempted to avoid censorship by enclosing the volumes in a box and advising on the title page that the work only be distributed ‘to scholars, collectors, and libraries’.³⁷² Even outside of the law, however, high Victorian social values effected their own justice: even as late as 1956, when the English conductor Sir Eugene Goossens pleaded guilty to pornography charges, for example, his career abruptly came to a halt.

As James Kennaway has pointed out, and as this chapter has demonstrated, what was at stake was a concept of self that was stable and fixed. The mediation of erotic behaviour was offensive to the Kantian notion of the rational and autonomous self because it let carnal desire gain the upper hand, and led the self into all kinds of risky relations. This chapter has highlighted instances of where the ideology of robust and all-sufficient self is challenged, and where metaphors of erotic interaction shift the focus to the space between selves, or components of self, to their multiplicity, and to their incompleteness without each other. These are few, however, in comparison to the predominating ideology of a singular and fixed vitality which, emanating from the god-like executive artist, is sufficient to sustain the populace.

In his study of eroticism in relation to Richard Wagner, Laurence Dreyfus writes that musical discourses, in comparison to artistic and literary kinds, are particularly silent about the topic. Dreyfus points out that paintings and sculptures have produced nudes, and literature requires a certain amount of naming of its subject matter in its erotic depictions (although for the sake of propriety, genres of literature that consider themselves higher than pornography refrain from including more graphic details). In contrast, the erotic content of music is more difficult to pin down, which has allowed it to escape censorship: ‘the naming of the phenomenon elicited condemnation’ Dreyfus, writes, and ‘why... should anyone have invited trouble in an age obsessed with proscription when music’s immateriality exempted it from censure?’³⁷³ In engaging in musical practices as opposed to writing about them, then, people could privately indulge in erotic reveries without having to bear witness to them.

³⁷² Eduard Fuchs, *Geschichte der erotischen Kunst*, 4 vols (Munich: A. Langen, 1922–26).

³⁷³ Dreyfus, *Wagner and the Erotic Impulse*, 13.

Written in the midst of this ‘conspiracy of silence’, as Dreyfus calls it, it is easy to see why Flesch’s *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* failed to succeed, both in terms of its internal coherence and its courting of publishers. In the course of this chapter Flesch’s text has emerged as unique in that it incorporates erotic and sexual analogies to a greater extent than other texts surrounding violin playing from the period, and for the originality of Flesch’s ideas with regard to this metaphorical terrain. Flesch’s private diaries reveal an even bolder and less unashamed negotiation of erotic and sexual metaphors. Extracts from these are recorded in his son Carl F. Flesch’s book, published in the far less censorial era of the late twentieth century. For example, it is difficult to imagine that Flesch’s liberal attitude to prostitution and masturbation would have been included in the manuscript of his memoirs intended for publication:

“The erotic disposition of pupils is a secret which they anxiously strive to protect. The teacher can only sense it but he must not – at least openly – take it into account. Otherwise he would have to advise many a male pupil to ‘go to a woman’. Or if he masturbates, not to burden himself with unnecessary twinges of conscience.”³⁷⁴

According to his son, what prevented Flesch from going further in his book was Georg Schünemann’s advice to omit details of his relationships with women:

One piece of advice (which I remember because my father happened to remark on it) was to delete as far as possible purely personal details, including his relations with the female sex; Schünemann felt that such topics would not fit into a serious book... It may or may not have been the right advice in this case, but it did result in a rather scant picture of the author’s personality.³⁷⁵

Flesch’s style of writing did not lend itself easily, however, to a clear distinguishing between his professional career and personal life. As was demonstrated above, Flesch’s account of an affair with a married woman simultaneously narrates changes in his violin playing as well as his emotions, and leads to his enlightening musings on the ‘deep connections between music and erotic feeling’. Unfortunately, it is most of this passage which the German edition of Flesch’s text omits, however, surely out of a similar conviction to that of Schünemann, that such details were irrelevant to a book on high art performance.

³⁷⁴ Carl F. Flesch, *And Do You Also Play the Violin?* (London: Toccata Press, 1990), 88–89. C. F. Flesch believes the entry to have ‘probably’ been written on November 9th, 1931.

³⁷⁵ *Ibid.* 127.

Societal prohibition prevented Flesch's text from becoming a successful publication. As noted in the introduction, C. F. Flesch writes that Flesch's frank critiques of his colleagues in the text led to his refusing to publish it until after his death. An additional reason must surely have been the threat of censorship and/or damage to his career, however. From the perspective of Flesch's own expressed purpose for writing the book is also unsuccessful: his goal of recording violinists' biographies and providing a history of violin playing from 1883 to 1933, is corrupted, from the perspective of highbrow literature, by Flesch's subversive introspections, which muddy his attempts to write a social history of musical performance. By way of an attempt to rescue Flesch's text from its supposed failings, and to create a text fit for approval among a cultured readership, the German edition attempts to take Flesch at his word and divide Flesch's text into sections entitled with the name of the performer/conductor whom Flesch is discussing in that particular section, even though much of these sections are taken up with biographical information about Flesch's own career. These labels are absent from Hans Keller's edition. As the missing translations of Hans Keller's English edition of the book throughout this chapter shows, however, in the process the German edition omitted many of the more interesting passages. Even Keller's edition is 'condensed', though, as he writes in his preface, and gives priority to musical over supposedly unrelated personal details: 'I think it can be said', Keller writes, 'that scarcely anything of musical relevance has been omitted'.³⁷⁶ As noted in the introduction, Flesch was more than able to produce an authoritative and credible text for the public domain, judging by the success of *Die Kunst die Violinspiels* in the 1920s and 1930s, and his publishing of the memoirs would have brought financial relief. The temptation to push beyond a mere eulogy to the genius of his fellow artists, and explore more unconventional frameworks of criticism, was too great, however.

What does survive in the English and German translations of Flesch's text, however, presents a rich, and sometimes original, model of musical performance. Flesch's robust ideology of self posited in his *Die Kunst des Violinspiels* is less convincing in *Erinnerungen eines Geigers*, and multiple critical frameworks merge and conflict with each other: each appraisal of performers and

³⁷⁶ Flesch, *Memoirs*, ix.

conductors is a dense fusion of metaphysical notions of self, gender, sexuality, pathology, race and nationalism. As this chapter has shown, however, it is this unresolved conflict of ideas that allows for new ideas to peer through the cracks: behind the dominant ideology of the vital artist lie more tentative and controversial ideas about musical performance. Exemplary of this is Flesch's veering between a condemning of sex, according to pathological and moral norms, and a condoning of it. This itself is a symptom of Flesch's failure to totally conform to a stifling bourgeois morality but at the same time of his being unable to free himself of it. In an excerpt from his private diaries closely resembling his appraisal of Fritz Kreisler in the German and English publications, Flesch at once praises Kreisler's uninhibitedly erotic playing, yet his faith in the rectitude of this ethos ultimately gives way to a stronger conviction that sexual behaviour is essentially a disease, unless it conforms to strict norms:

“[Kreisler was] once a man lashed by unrestrained impulsiveness, oozing salaciousness on the violin, seductive, arousing all the so-called ‘bad’ instincts – in brief, an exceedingly exciting artist. In the long run there can be little doubt that he would have been destroyed by this hypertrophic sexuality as a man as well as an artist.”³⁷⁷

Conclusion

The metaphor of the interpretative violinist as seducer or conqueror thus affirms the predominant model of the performer, in the literature, as the powerful primary producer of art. Artists who subsequently lose their own original creativity and autonomous will, in the context of teacher–pupil relationships, as the seduced or conquered, reaffirm the supremacy of towering personalities such as Joachim and Auer. In some passages, however, the positing of a seduced or conquered agency, together with their evoking of a conflict between heterogeneous bodies, sometimes undermines the idea of the artist as wielder of a singular vitality. Joachim inverts the composer–performer relationship

³⁷⁷ Flesch, *And Do You Also Play the Violin?*, 323.

and Flesch inverts the performer–listener relationship, in his appraisal of Arthur Nikisch, so that the performer becomes the seduced. Furthermore, Flesch begins to conceive of selves, as well as the internal components of self, as multiple, heterogeneous and incomplete parts which require a knitting together with one another in order to achieve artistic success. These occasional passages have the potential to radically alter the predominant model of a fixed and singular model of vitality, but their further development was prevented by a culture which suppressed discourses of sex, except for their appearance as regulated by medico-moral codes. This helps to explain why Carl Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers*, a text which goes further than others in its innovative exploration of notions of sexual and erotic behaviour, struggled to free itself of wider medico-moral norms in its negotiation of musical performance in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. It also explains why the author refused to publish it in his lifetime and why it received heavy editing in preparation for publication in the late 1950s and early 1960s.

With regard to more specific notions of musical components, as centrally underpinned by the idea of singing tone, metaphors of intersubjectivity by and large do not extend to provide detailed descriptions of the musical and performative manifestations of these ideas. This chapter has largely focused on how members of the performance network interact with each other, but it is also the case that the literature does not extend to describe how performance as erotic/violent interaction, performance as erotic desire, or performance as the holistic interweaving of heterogeneous elements, sounds in terms of tone, dynamics, tempo, vibrato and so on. This is partly because the literature that goes into the most detail regarding the components of performance is the pedagogical literature, which is mostly dedicated to constructing a robust model of the high art performer and performance. This literature largely relies on pathological notions to denounce the free flow of sound, as uncontrolled by a superior self, as the mere sensuous: an exception, however, is Joachim's evocation of the inescapable filling of the performer/listener with the composer's 'excitement', in which 'soundwaves' here elicit no condemnation. *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* lacks detailed descriptions of performances, however, to accompany those constructs that break free of the model of pre-eminent self.

Chapter 6

Conclusion: The Significance of a Discursive Study of Violin Playing in the Early twentieth century for Wider Musicological Approaches to Performance

The first section of this chapter presents a preliminary study of texts surrounding cello playing in the early twentieth century. As was explained in the introductory chapter, the majority of writings surrounding string instruments in the early twentieth century focus on violinists and violin playing, with very few relating to the viola and double bass. There are fewer texts surrounding cellists and cello playing from the period than there are relating to violin playing, yet they nevertheless constitute a substantial group of documents. Thus, while this study has focused exclusively on the violin, a smaller, independent critique of texts relating to the cello occupies the concluding chapter, by way of demonstrating that many of the cultural ideas underpinning a discourse of violin playing also help to make sense of a discourse relating to cello playing, and also providing a basis for future research on texts relating to the instrument.

The second section considers how the findings of this thesis fit into several existing narratives of both music history and history more generally. The chapter considers ways in which the findings of the study revise the composer-centred approach of historical musicology. The third section of the chapter considers the content of this study in relation to issues developed in performing practice research, particularly the question of national styles, as well as empirical and psychological approaches.

A Preliminary Study of Texts Surrounding Cello Playing in the Early twentieth century: Pablo Casals and the Vitalist Philosophy of Henri Bergson

The negotiation of metaphysical notions of self in early twentieth-century texts relating to cello playing presents an interesting parallel to the mediation of related notions of consciousness in writings on violin playing from the same period. This thesis has at several points demonstrated how the violinist Joseph Joachim was implicated in cultural constructs of violin playing, in his last years and in the decades following his death in 1907. Auer, Flesch and Huberman uphold Joachim as the embodiment of their ideal of the rare and elite artist, and several titles of literary works and editions of scores (noted in the introductory chapter) monopolise on Joachim's name to bestow authority to their contents: the most important of these, in this respect, is Moser's *Violinschule*, which lists the authors as Joachim and Moser, even though Joachim wrote very little of it. In the same way, texts relating to cello playing cluster around the figure of the Catalan cellist Pablo Casals (1876–1973). Very generally speaking, too, the cultural ideas follow a similar theme: writers on both violin and cello implicate these celebrated performers in their defence of the interpretive artist as elite self. Joachim's dominating presence in the musical culture of late nineteenth century Europe, and Casals's in the early twentieth, provide tangible evidence of the necessity of the interpretive artist to musical production and reception, and his or her revitalising influence over the rendering of dead composers' scores to audiences. Furthermore, both performers' commitment to a select canon of works fuelled writers' shunning of deceptive virtuosity and their inculcation of a model of high art performance. Chapter 2 considered largely Germanic notions of consciousness, which is appropriate considering the strong links that Moser, Auer and Flesch all had to German culture. This section demonstrates that among more general metaphysical notions of self, the mediation of such notions in the work of Henri Bergson is particularly relevant to a study of texts surrounding Casals.

In contrast to Nietzsche's baldly elitist life-philosophy, the evolution of notions of self in French thought displays a marked concern for how individual desires are compatible with the collective good. In *The Idea of Self*, Jerrold Seigel portrays developments in French philosophy, psychology and political debate as negotiating a tension between the idea of the state and of

individual resistance.³⁷⁸ On the one hand, Cousin and Durkheim promoted a strong model of the state, as a powerful collective institution that moulds individuals according to prefigured models. In many ways this was already a reality in the highly centralised institutions of the French state. On the other hand, subversion and political opposition thrived in avant-garde aesthetic movements, reflected in the work of Rimbaud, Huysmans and Mallarmé (among others). Seigel goes on to demonstrate that from the 1880s on, however, several writers began to conceive of how the individual self and the collective self could be compatible with each other. The psychologist Pierre Janet maintained that self was not a substantive and fixed entity but an *idée-force*, a person's effort to unify his or her history, which at base was formed from a multiplicity of experiences. Agreeing with Janet was the philosopher and psychologist Alfred Fouillé, who posited a tension between the collective, divided through the individualising impulse, and individual selves that required social experience in the first place in order to recognise themselves as such.

In the work of the vitalist philosopher Henri Bergson this dualism is more greatly informed by Idealist and spiritualist veins of thought. Bergson's work, like that of Janet, harbours positivist and materialist leanings: in his youth he had solved a classic problem in geometry and during his years of study at the *École Normale Supérieure* he was a devoted follower of Herbert Spencer. Unlike Janet and Fouillé, however, Bergson posited an *a priori* self: the *moi intérieur* intrinsically has no spatial dimensions, and manifests itself as *durée*, a temporal event which is independent of the regular instances of time marked off by a clock. It is also indivisible in the sense that if a part of *durée* is portioned off, like water bottled from a stream, the spatial constraints kill its essence. In his first major text, *Essai sur les données immédiates de la conscience* (1888, published in English as *Time and Free Will*), Bergson maintained that 'one can very well divide up a thing, but not an act'.³⁷⁹ In this and later texts, however, (notably, his most famous book, *Creative Evolution* (1907)) Bergson views the relationship between the *moi profond* and spatial existence as dialectical. Superficial existence hems

³⁷⁸ Jerrold Seigel, 'Society and Selfhood Reconciled: Janet, Fouillé and Bergson', in *The Idea of Self: Thought and Experience in Western Europe since the Seventeenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 508–536.

³⁷⁹ Henri Bergson, *Essai sur les Données Immédiates de la Conscience* (7th edn, Paris: Alcan, 1909), 85. Cited in Seigel, *The Idea of Self*, 519. Translation by Jerrold Seigel.

in *élan vital* (another term expressing the *moi profond*'s existence in *durée*) but needs its liberating potential: at the same time, however, the deep self would be inert in the absence of space's form. It is important to view Bergson's views as centrally modelled around the issue of civic duty, a question which he confronts in his *Good Sense and Classical Studies* (1895). As Guy la France observes, Bergson maintained that 'the true personality is one which, after having reconquered its interiority, rejoins social life, adapts to it and contributes to it by its action'.³⁸⁰

The Catalan cellist Pablo Casals (1876–1973) met Bergson in Paris, where he began his international career around the turn of the twentieth century. In his youth Casals had become acquainted with the Spanish royal family through the Count de Morphy, who oversaw a prodigious period of learning through Casals's teenage years. In 1895 the Queen Regent further awarded Casals with a scholarship to study the cello with Eduoard Jacobs at the Brussels Conservatoire. A disagreement with Jacobs led Casals to leave Brussels, however, and take work with minor orchestras in Paris and Barcelona. Success on a grand scale came in 1899 with a performance for Queen Victoria of Great Britain and for the French conductor Charles Lamoureux. In his scholarly biography of Casals, Robert Baldock writes that Casals's settling in Paris around this time inaugurated a second period of intellectual absorption: in addition to befriending Bergson, Casals also became acquainted with Romain Rolland, Eugène Carrière and Marcel Proust. Baldock considers it 'remarkable that Casals so 'single-mindedly' devoted himself in this period to the 'business of acquiring intellectual and social acquaintances'.³⁸¹

Baldock notes that Casals inherited from Bergson the idea of a powerful, *a priori* self, yet he does not comment on how this fits with the more prevalent theme of technical innovation in the literary evidence of Casals's thought. Having surveyed unpublished documentary evidence from the early twentieth century, Baldock notes Bergson's influence on Casals:

He [Casals] wrote of the impact of discussions with Bergson about the decisive role of intuition in artistic creativity; Casals' fundamental conviction, crucial to him throughout his

³⁸⁰ Guy La France, *La Philosophie Sociale de Bergson* (Ottawa: Université d'Ottawa, 1974), 24. Cited in Seigel, *The Idea of Self*, 524. Translation by Jerrold Seigel.

³⁸¹ Robert Baldock, *Pablo Casals* (London: Gollancz, 1992), 59.

life, of the supremacy of musical instinct over both intelligence and technical competence received from Bergson a sort of higher philosophic validation.³⁸²

Although evidence of Casals's thought demonstrates his privileging of instinct, it is certainly not the case that he rejected technical innovation, however. To the contrary, Casals's changes to cello technique constitute a dominant theme in the literature. In his short introduction to Diran Alexanian's pedagogical treatise on cello playing (1914), Casals clearly supports the idea of chronological progression in technical developments, but one could argue that this merely adds commercial viability to Alexanian's treatise.³⁸³ Texts by others, however, provide reliable evidence of Casals's penchant for technical innovation: Frederick Martens's journalistic style in his *String Mastery* (1923) includes direct quotes from Casals, and two articles by the cellist Guilhermina Suggia reflect her extensive experience of Casals's ideas, having been his pupil, as well as lover, for six years. 'The Newer Cello Technique', Martens's title for his chapter on Casals, shows that he regarded the issue of technical innovation to be the central theme of the interview, conducted in New York in 1923. In the interview Casals mostly discusses his technical innovations, consisting of greater stretches between the fingers of the left hand, thus eliminating functional sliding between notes, and a more varied use of the bow. Despite Suggia and Casals's difficult separation in 1912, Suggia clearly remains an ardent supporter of Casals's artistic mission in her articles of 1921 and 1922, writing that Casals 'revolutionised all the cello schools and created one which gives scope to all possibilities of the cello'.³⁸⁴

³⁸² Ibid. 59.

³⁸³ Casals denigrates older pedagogical treatises for the cello, writing that 'if I attack this absence of pedagogic progress it is because of the personal conviction that certain 'rules,' considered at one time as indispensable for perfect execution, are not only useless, but might in our day be considered nefarious. Instrumental music has gone through an evolution that the violoncello 'Methods' alone have refused to follow.' *Si je m'attaque à cette absence de progrès pédagogique, c'est par persuasion personnelle que certaines „règles" considérées autrefois comme inséparables d'une exécution soignée, sont non seulement inutiles, mais pourraient même nous être néfastes aujourd'hui. La musique instrumentale a, elle aussi, suivi l'évolution à laquelle se refuse seule, la „Méthode de violoncelle."* Diran Alexanian, *Traité Théorique et Pratique du Violoncelle*, trans. F. Fairbanks (Paris: Mathot, 1914: repr. 1922), 3. At the end of the text Alexanian includes his name and the dates of writing, which were December 1910 to February 1914.

³⁸⁴ Guilhermina Suggia, 'The Violoncello', *Music & Letters*, 1/2 (1920), 104–110, 107. Robert Philip has argued that both the literary evidence and recorded evidence confirm Casals's technical innovations for the left hand, arguing that the cellist Joachim Stutschewsky systematised Casals's stretching technique in the early 1930s, and making a comparison between a 1945 recording made by Casals and one made by W. H. Squire, an older player, as sonic evidence. The recording is too late to use as evidence of Casals's thought in the 1920s, and further work would need to be done on Casals's earlier recordings (Casals began recording in 1915) but the literary evidence nevertheless strongly suggests that Casals had made these technical innovations in the early twentieth century. Robert Philip, *Performing Music in the Age of Recording* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 2004), 195–196.

Bergson's influence on Casals not only led Casals to champion deep self, then, but more specifically the idea that deep self requires an essential material and spatial outworking to exist at all. Bergson's philosophy provided Casals with a harmonious model of self and the spatial realm which mapped easily onto his notion of the cellist's mind and body. The attraction of the idea of an *a priori* self in the first place, no doubt for Bergson as well as Casals, was the authority which interrelated notions of spirit, vitality and mind bestowed on discourses, having gained their repute from high philosophical and artistic discourses of the nineteenth century. Casals further picked up from these artistic discourses the fusing of these same notions of self with the idea of the musical work. Crucially, though, the Romantic and Idealist origins of these ideas led to an emphasis on the dialectic of self and body, expressed also in the binarisms of spirit–matter and vitality–mechanism. According to Martens, Casals relates that “music comes first, then, and not the particular instrument; yet, once you have chosen a particular instrument as your medium of interpretation, then, you must use it as perfectly as possible.” There is an even stronger sense of this co-dependency of mind and body a few paragraphs later, when Casals discusses his left-hand innovations:

“This whole system of fingering I developed through my own mental effort. I was really driven to invent it – by necessity. It was a logical mental development. I had to find the fingering in order to produce the musical effects I desired.”³⁸⁵

As a result of learning about metaphysical notions of mind in his earlier adulthood, Casals here views his own mind from a distance. He adopts the passive tense (“I was really driven to invent it”) and objectifies the workings of his mind (“it was a logical mental development”).

Like Bergson, Casals equates his notion of a numinous consciousness with an ideal of working for the collective good. Casals's notion of mind does not have a strong biological or evolutionary basis: as the Idealist idea of universal mind, it is an entity that exists independent of bodies so that it may enter each and unite them:

“One of the most interesting things I can tell you with regard to my system of extension fingering is that many years after I had established this theory I found it confirmed by a man who had never heard of me and of whom I had never heard.

³⁸⁵ Frederick, H. Martens, *String Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists, Viola Players and Violoncellists* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1923), 226, 229.

I happened to be in a *café* in Budapest, in another part of the world, so to speak, and there in the *café* orchestra was a *tzigane* ‘cellist, a Gypsy. This man, who had an abnormally sized hand, was no educated musician, yet he was fingering his ‘cello as though it were a violin. This, of course, was not exactly my idea, yet he had hit upon the same *principle* of fingering for the ‘cello which I had developed in detail. Like myself he had found that he needed this fingering and had developed it practically as naturally as a dog finds the herb which cures him of a stomach ache. And everywhere the academic teachers, the professed technicians, had passed it by. It proved to me that it was a *natural* method of fingering.”³⁸⁶

As with Bergson, although metaphysical self is universal, it works for the collective good. It does this not by prefiguring social practices but by manifesting itself differently in each individual. In this way Bergson’s thought corresponds to Germanic individualism and the idea of self as organic, internally integrated and therefore autonomous. For Bergson, however, these independent realisations of deep self must lead to the collective redemption of all individuals. Nevertheless, one can trace in Casals’s discourse a vague prescribing of the outward manifestation of social equality: Casals aligns himself with a gypsy, a social deviant, and demonstrates his belief, as Baldock observes, that the social hierarchies valorised by intelligence should not work to suppress the basic sanctity of music/the mind (“the academic teachers... had passed... [the gypsy’s method of fingering] by”). The affinity between man and other animals, as well as a disdain for the snobbery of intellectualism, also characterises Bergson’s thought:

Human intelligence... does not have the function of watching vain shadows pass by any more than of turning round and contemplating the blazing sun. It has other things to do. Yoked, like plough-oxen, to a heavy task, we feel the play of our muscles and joints, the weight of the plough and the resistance of the soil: the function of human intelligence is to act and to know that it is acting, to enter into contact with reality and even to live it, but only in so far as it is concerned with the job being done, and the furrow being ploughed.³⁸⁷

Those whose professions mostly centred on their bodies suffered the moral condescension of high bourgeois society: thus the appeal of Bergson’s thought for Casals was that it redeemed the body, as one and the same as nature drawn into a perfect marriage with deep self, and implicated in the realisation of a democratic ideal. Republicanism and social equality were most certainly ideals which Casals held throughout his life: according to Baldock, Casals’s father was a passionate supporter of the republican federalism of Pi i Margall, a figure whom Casals would later hear debating at the

³⁸⁶ Ibid. 229–30.

³⁸⁷ Henri Bergson, *L’Évolution Créatrice* (Paris: Alcan, 1907), reprinted 1986 (Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 1986), 192. Cited in F. C. T. Moore, ‘Bergson’ in Thomas Baldwin, ed., *The Cambridge History of Philosophy 1870–1945* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 67–73, 69.

Spanish *Cortes*, and on whom he would regularly write reports, as part of his education under the Count de Morphy.³⁸⁸ In 1927 Casals assisted in founding a workingmen's association in Barcelona, which provided access to literature and cultural events at a small cost. Reflecting on his tuition with Casals, Christopher Bunting tells the story that Casals once wrote 'manual labourer' as occupation on a form. Bunting writes that when Casals said, “*Si la pensée est juste, tout vient*” ('If the thought is right, everything else will come') he meant 'something vastly different from what a philosopher might mean by the word 'thought''.³⁸⁹

Further contrasting his discourse with those more firmly rooted in the German critical tradition, Casals's vitalism also takes on elements of a French neo-classicism. His comments reflect the ideals of lightness, agreeability and ease of communication:

“The old idea that the cello was a very heavy instrument, that it had to be played like a double bass, with many *glissandi* and great apparent effort, undoubtedly prejudiced the public against it. The newer 'cello technique, which allows the instrument to be played in a lighter, freer way, has made the public like it and explains why the 'cello recital has become a favourite.”

In addition, the reason why the fingering method used by Casals's gypsy comrade worked well was because it treated the cello like its more compact counterpart, the violin. In addition to Suggia's notion that Casals's reforms led to the establishing of a single school of playing, Casals's remarks also negotiate a cosmopolitan ideal:

“I do not believe in 'schools' of bowing, whether they are known as French, Belgian, Russian, German or what not. Bowing, fingering, technique in all its phases should not be a matter of nationality but of logic and musical perfection.”³⁹⁰

The classical ideal of unity further manifests itself in Casals's approach to left-hand technique: in addition to providing notated scales as exercises, Alexanian's pedagogical treatise also includes several sections of musical exercises which include a wide range of intervals. Alexanian's aim, as he explains in his introduction to the first of these sections, is that the cellist may travel to any note 'as easily as though on a keyboard' (lit. as easily as with the help of a keyboard, *aisément qu'à l'aide*

³⁸⁸ Baldock, *Pablo Casals*, 24, 38.

³⁸⁹ Christopher Bunting, *Essay on the Craft of 'Cello-Playing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), 1–2.

³⁹⁰ Martens, *String Mastery*, 227, 227.

d'un clavier).³⁹¹ Such exercises are not to be found in any other pedagogical treatise of this period (both for violin and cello) and appear to be unique to Casals and Alexanian's model. Whereas other writers advocate scalar exercises for left hand technique, the idea behind this model is not one of linear travel to notes, as in Huberman's analogy of scalar runs to scaling *Mont Blanc*, but of the accessibility of all areas to a governing nucleus.³⁹² There is a parallel here between Casals's and Alexanian's thought and the centralised educational, medical and judicial systems of the French state.

Early biographies of Casals portray him as an ideal example of deep self. Both Lillian Littlehales's biography and Suggia's comments on Casals in her articles are highly eulogistic. Suggia rather melodramatically introduces Casals in her article on cello playing:

I shall avoid talking here of living cellists as much as I can, or mentioning names for the sake of comparison, but I am bound to bring a name forward which is, in the opinion of the whole world, the one which stands pre-eminent among those of living cellists. This name is Pablo Casals.

Suggia echoes the idea of a perfect union between music/the mind and the body: 'he realised the work of art in such a way that his body took naturally the corresponding shapes and movements'.³⁹³ Littlehales's description of Casals's left hand innovations harbours a democratic ideal: 'cello-virtuosos there were, [before Casals,] distinguished and world-renowned artists; nevertheless, the principles of fingering taught in their day left the ordinary student struggling'. Littlehales's hagiographic tone unreservedly endows Casals with an other-worldly genius, as when she describes his mysterious attraction to the score of Bach's Cello Suites as a child. Judging from Littlehales's quoted speech, however, (Littlehales had visited Casals before coming to writing her biography) it seems that Casals himself was perpetuating the image of the genius:

When Pablo saw these suites "for cello alone", he was instantly absorbed by the "mystery of it." He forgot that the purpose of his visit was to make choice of solos and other things to

³⁹¹ Alexanian, *Traité*, 33.

³⁹² 'Nobody would expect their legs to carry them straight up Montblanc after several weeks of lying in bed, and what tourist legs of Montblanc, which are the violinists' hands on the fingerboard, with the difference that the tracks of the fingerboard are much narrower and breakneck.' *Kein Mensch würde nach einem mehrwöchigen Zubetteliegen seinen Beinen zumuten, ihn schnurstracks auf dem Montblanc zu tragen und was Touristenbeinen der Montblanc, das bedeutet Geigerhänden das Griffbrett, mit dem Unterschied, daß des Griffbretts Wege nur noch viel enger und halsbrecherischer sind.* Bronislaw Huberman, *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* (Leipzig, Vienna: Hugo Heller, 1912), 22–23.

³⁹³ Suggia, *The Violoncello*, 107, 107.

play, and began looking to see what was in these compositions for cello alone. He felt “a terrible attraction” (he was twelve and a half!). Nobody had ever told him there were such things to be played, and his teacher had not even known that unaccompanied suites by Bach existed. He went from the shop in a trance, carrying his precious “discovery” with him, and immediately upon reaching home began to read through these suites.³⁹⁴

By the 1920s, Casals’s celebrated reputation had become widespread: Achille Rivarde echoes the mantra of mind over matter:

Perhaps the greatest artist among instrumentalists to-day is Señor Pablo Casals, and there is no greater advocate than he of the necessity and even obligation on every serious artist to practice constantly, and to give to his work his best gifts of heart and head.³⁹⁵

Flesch writes in his *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* that ‘he stands in his field not only as the most distinguished artist, but also as the greatest reformer’ (*er kann in seinem Fach nicht nur als der bedeutendste Künstler, sondern auch als großer Reformator gelten*).³⁹⁶ After having lamented the declined state of cello playing, Hugo Becker, a celebrated cellist himself, writes that ‘a praiseworthy exception exists in more recent times, the playing of Pablo Casals’ (*ein rühmliche Ausnahme bildet in neuerer Zeit das Spiel Pablo Casals*).³⁹⁷

Panegyrics to Casals are not without substance, however: the biographical evidence strongly supports the notion that Casals drew solely on his inner resources to achieve greatness. Casals received a mere five years of training, in his teenage years, with José García, a reputable cellist but who was by no means of international renown. In his earlier years Casals had been self taught, having had a makeshift cello made for him by his father. No doubt, Casals learned much through other circumstances: countless hours playing in cafés and orchestras throughout his childhood and early adulthood, his chamber music coaching with Jesús de Monasterio at the Spanish court, and the trio he formed with Mathieu Crickboom, a pupil of Ysaÿe, and the pianist and composer Enrique Granados. By the time Casals had reached widespread international fame, however, his training must have

³⁹⁴ Lillian Littlehales, *Pablo Casals* (London: Dent, 1929), 189, 26.

³⁹⁵ Achille Rivarde, *The Violin and Its Technique as a Means to the Interpretation of Music* (London: Macmillan, 1921), 39. The verb to practice is consistently spelt with a ‘c’ throughout this British publication.

³⁹⁶ Carl Flesch, *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Freiburg, Zurich: Atlantis, 1960), 138. The English edition, again, is different, and more praising: ‘There are many who consider Casals not only the greatest cellist of our time, but altogether the greatest artist among modern performers.’ Carl Flesch, *Memoirs*, ed. Hans Keller and C. F. Flesch, trans. Hans Keller (London: Rockliff, 1957), 236.

³⁹⁷ Hugo Becker and Dago Rynar, *Mechanik und Ästhetik des Violoncellspiels* (Vienna, Leipzig: Universal, 1929), 267.

appeared barely worth considering compared to the aristocratic lineages that had produced every violinist of high renown.

The task for future critical studies is to uncover further the implications of the ideology surrounding Casals for the development of cello playing in the rest of the twentieth century. The early biographical accounts of Littlehales and Suggia set the tone for the later sycophantism of Corredor's, Kahn's, and Blum's books on Casals.³⁹⁸ An important question is how this eulogistic discourse shaped developments in cello playing: it may have been akin to a modern self help mantra, a sort of catalyst that inspired cellists on to create truly rich musical practices; or, the extremely high level of perfection that the model propounded may have discouraged more than it inspired, and in place of a flourishing of diversity came a narrow sect of converts to Casals's preached message. A third possibility is that the discourse merely validates Casals and his pupils for a logocentric society, and that its rather impoverished message of the supremacy of deep self and the musical work had little impact on the actual development of performative gestures.

Early indications show, however, the early discourses surrounding Casals suggest the imposition of a rather restrictive model of cello playing. The discourse is characterised by a zealous defence of a musical technique based wholly on the music: Casals, as reported by Martens, repeatedly makes the point that music/mind must come first in all matters, and Suggia vociferously denounces unmusical playing. This begs the question, however, as to what kinds of performative practices were being inculcated in the name of this ideology: following his apparent commending of the gypsy cellist's idiosyncratic process of learning, Casals is startlingly dogmatic in his denigration of a particular aspect of his playing:

“This Gypsy ‘cellist also played his vibrato with two fingers instead of one. I have heard many ‘cellists play who produced the vibrato with two fingers in order to make it more powerful. But this two-finger vibrato is only excusable in the case of rhapsodic Gypsy music; used in other ‘cello music it is merely an affectation, not really musical, one which I do not hesitate to condemn.”³⁹⁹

³⁹⁸ J. M. Corredor, *Conversations avec Casals* (1955), Albert Kahn, *Joys and Sorrows: Reflections by Pablo Casals* (1970) and David Blum, *Casals and the Art of Interpretation* (1977).

³⁹⁹ Martens, *String Mastery*, 230.

The liberating, democratising power of *élan vital* that earned the gypsy equality with Casals is suddenly dropped in favour of a plain denouncing of the gypsy and his music as second class, replete with performative gestures that are acceptable for this lower order, but not for Western high art interpreters. It is possible, then, that diversity suffered under the new authoritative order of Casals and his proselytising pupils and followers. Further research on genealogies of cellists and of sound recordings would shed light on this issue.

With regard to cello playing in the twentieth century, developments relating to Casals constitute the most salient gap in the research. A future literary study would take into account the texts mentioned above, by Blum, Corredor and Khan, as well as texts by Casals's pupils: Maurice Eisner's pedagogical work, *Cello Playing of Today* (1957), places a marked emphasis on Casals's 'vital' cello playing, particularly of the left hand; there is a small amount of prose in Paul Tortelier's *How I Play, How I Teach* (1975), as well as a much more extensive literary work, *Paul Tortelier : a Self-Portrait in Conversation with David Blum* (1984), written in conjunction with David Blum; Christopher Bunting, another pupil of Casals's, muses at length on the significance of Casals's philosophy of cello playing in his *Essay on the Craft of Cello Playing* (1982).

There are many texts relating to cello playing that do not refer to Casals's influence, however, which would prove useful for a critique of the notion of Casals's superiority over other twentieth-century cellists. Carl Flesch's *Erinnerungen eines Geigers/Memoirs* provides interesting information on Joachim Stutschewsky's pedagogical treatise, *Die Kunst des Cellospiels* (1929–38) and Hugo Becker's *Mechanik und Ästhetik des Violoncellspiels* (1929) negotiate a highly similar set of ideas to those in Auer's, Flesch's and Moser's treatises, and posit alternative models of cello playing to that of Casals, in the early twentieth century. In her scholarly book on the Austrian cellist Emmanuel Feuermann (*Emanuel Feuermann*, 2002), Annette Morreau argues that in some ways Feuermann's technical advances were more significant than those of Casals, and were it not for his untimely death at the age of forty, in 1942, his fame would have equalled that of Casals.

Texts on String Playing: The Locus of Society's Mediation of Self

One can view discourses of string playing in the early twentieth century as one branch of the cultural reception of Western metaphysical philosophy. As with a wide range of discourses of the period, writings on string playing reflect the significant and lasting impact that Romantic and Idealist thought had on nineteenth- and twentieth-century culture. Although Nietzschean and Wagnerian ideas had a greater impact on early twentieth-century notions of string playing than Idealist notions of *Geist*, reflecting a shift to more biologically based notions of self, they bear basic similarities to earlier developments in metaphysical thought in that they too posit a model of self that is foundational, autonomous, singular, indivisible, and able to subsume embodied selves.

Conversely, discourses of string playing also constitute a site on which metaphysical notions actively develop and from which they continue to wield an influence over wider culture. The vector of influence does not always run from philosophy to art: as was discussed in chapter 2, Aaron Ridley regards art rather than philosophical aesthetics as the primary inheritors of Nietzsche's views on art in the early twentieth century. Writers, painters and composers drew strength from Nietzsche's central belief that artists were the primary fount of life/will to power in the modern age. Widening the time frame, art, and especially music, has always been central to the Romantic and Idealist project, as the locus of inner consciousness. Discourses of music in nineteenth-century Germany are central to the development of broader philosophical and cultural discourses, both in Germany and further abroad.

As a site for the active development of notions of self, discourses of string playing imitate other domains on which metaphysical philosophies had an influence. One can list the wider manifestations of metaphysical philosophy as follows:

- i) as a defence of Western religious frameworks of thought and a means of their continuation, with the rise in secularism.

- ii) as a stimulus for political and social reform.
- iii) as providing grounding principles for morality.
- iv) as informing developments in medical knowledge.
- v) as a precursor to twentieth-century psycho-analysis.

The discourses of string playing display distinct overtones of canonical religious texts. Moser's references to performing in the spirit of the composer and Auer's notion of tone as spiritual and immaterial in essence betray the influence of bold articulations of an otherworldly realm. Auer's fusing of his neo-Idealist notions with his prior knowledge of César Franck's reputation as a composer of religious music is a particularly pronounced mediation of religious sentiment;

The whole work may be regarded as four evolutions of the human soul toward the Divine. Its sorrow is mystic: in playing the sonata the violinist has to express at times a feeling of anguish withheld, of tears which cannot flow. And the serene joy of the last movement is not of this earth. Most violinists are too apt to express an earthly and human rather than a celestial and spiritual happiness in their playing of the *Allegretto meno mosso*, but the violinist who wishes to do justice to the Sonata in A major in his interpretation must approach it with a reverence, like the officiant at some sacred mystery.⁴⁰⁰

Auer provides a tangible evocation of a person's relationship with the Divinity: the Sonata is the progress of emotions, from sorrow, to anguish, and finally to joy.⁴⁰¹ There are also the important Christian themes of divine sorrow, tears (if one thinks of settings of the Passion), and the mysterious act of transubstantiation in the Eucharistic ceremony. The Passion drama may have been in Flesch's mind in his portrayal of the nefarious crowd (see chapter 4) as a sort of turba, who give rise to the persecutions in the performer's psyche:

The presence of the listener is enough, in order, as in the temptation of St Anthony, to conjure up little devils from every corner of one's consciousness who, with mocking grins, leave no stone unturned in their efforts to deliver up the artist to all sorts of demoniac conceptions, and to bring his good intentions to naught.⁴⁰²

⁴⁰⁰ Leopold Auer, *Violin Works and their Interpretation* (New York: Carl Fischer, 1925), 152.

⁴⁰¹ This model also corresponds to the model of heroic suffering and final overcoming, repeatedly applied to accounts and analyses of the four movements of Beethoven's *Eroica* Symphony. See Scott Burnham, *Beethoven Hero* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1995).

⁴⁰² *Die Anwesenheit des Zuhörers genügt, um, wie in der Versuchung des heiligen Antonius, kleine häßliche Teufelchen aus allen Ecken des Bewußtseins hervorzuzaubern, die, höhnisch grinsend, nichts unversucht lassen, um den Künstler höllischen Einfällen zu überliefern und seine Absichten zunichte zu machen.* Carl Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928), 2.3. All translations adapted from Carl Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, trans. Frederick H. Martens (New York: Carl Fischer, 1930), 2.3.

In religious parlance the superior interpreting artist is a saint who delivers the divine message to the ‘great multitude’ (*großen Masse*).⁴⁰³ The Passion’s traditional message of weakness and shedding of the sinful self in order to enter into an intersubjective relationship with Jesus is here aligned with the dark side of writers’ privileging of the Nietzschean superior self: Flesch’s anxiety over the spread of pathological behaviours in crowds further evolves into the notion of the unrepentant people who persecute the bearer of good news.

Metaphysical philosophy as social reform extends back to the early Romantics, who regarded their idealistic visions as a source of healing for a society ravaged by science and technology. As chapter 2 discussed, this gave rise to the proliferation of *Lebenskunst* (art of living) texts which offered guidance on personal and social wellbeing. An extended quote from Robert Schumann’s *Rules for a Musical Life and Home* (*Musikalischen Haus- und Lebensregeln*) in the opening essay of Moser’s third volume of his *Violinschule* receives a prime position near the opening of Moser’s essay, which suggests that Moser saw Schumann’s text as an exemplary model, and therefore his own essay as a continuation of this genre. As chapter 4 demonstrated, discourses of morality converge with medical knowledge later in the century, and early twentieth-century discourses of violin playing emulate this development too. Chapter 4 argued that the mediation of self according to medico-moral notions in texts on violin playing mirror the same trend found in the proliferation of texts offering more general advice on physical and moral hygiene. In the early twentieth century a discourse of mind gained autonomy from these psycho-somatic discourses, and Carl Flesch’s writings borrow ideas and techniques taken from an emerging culture of psychoanalysis.

Aside from this more domestic ordering of self, there are also more overtly political overtones in the literature. The promotion of the Bergsonian idea of deep self in 1920s discourses surrounding Casals incorporates overtones of the era’s political drive towards international cooperation, in the resulting notion that Casals replaced multiple schools of playing with a single unified one. In the Nietzschean glorification of individual self in writings by Auer and Huberman it is possible to see a political ideal: central European countries particularly valued individual improvement as the source of

⁴⁰³ Ibid., 2.2 and 2.2.

the nation state's strength, but across Europe and the United States the image of the strong man was promoted, in the culture of warfare that dominated the first half of the twentieth century.

Given the appeal of these texts to a broad readership, further research might wish to focus on the reception of texts on performance, for the early twentieth century as well as beyond. A title such as *Violinschule* suggests an appeal to a specialised readership of violin teachers and students, but *Violin Mastery*, *Violin Playing as I Teach It*, and *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* seem deliberately less specific. The blend of biography, professional anecdotes, and privileged insights into the master's art, in these texts, essentially amounts to a portal to a model of elite self; how readers responded to this model, however, is a question that requires further clarification. Unrestricted dissemination following publication as well as paraded pedagogical purposes may have signified to readers an egalitarian motive on the part of the authors, but considering the promotion of rare and inimitable talent, even genius, as a prerequisite for playing in these texts, it is unlikely that readers would have expected to learn from them. To apply a Foucauldian analysis, it is more probable that readers responded with the same kind of passivity that they were used to when interacting with other forms of authority. In the same way that individuals accepted other canonised texts, artworks, literacy conventions, political propaganda, advertisements, fines, jail sentences, medical remedies, and psychiatric therapies, they expected to be impressed, cajoled and instructed by the self constructs lauded by these texts. Here was a gateway to mastery that manifested itself in a plurality of different guises. It is also likely that for an age in which people were increasingly divorced from the land and manual labour, these texts (in conjunction with live performances and recordings) spoke of a lost arcadia in which mind and body more closely engaged with each other.

Another possibility is that such discourses mediated the collective self, and thus had a wider political and social resonance. This becomes quite obvious in Casals's outspoken Republicanism, found in later texts such as J. M. Corredor's *Conversations avec Casals* and Albert Kahn's *Joys and Sorrows*. Still, Casals's vision for a harmonious and international political order was rooted not in external structures but in the deep self of each embodied individual. Social accord sprung from the ability of each individual to rejuvenate his or her own mind or body. Thus, Casals's ideas were not far

removed from those who more boldly lauded aspirations to individual supremacy, whether this came in the form of learning, enculturation or physical health. Discourses of musical performance may well have acted as a mirror, then, for society's aspirations to personal and social overcoming, and it would be interesting to further find out how this role of the discourse continued to function in the latter half of the twentieth century and up to present day. A cursory glance at developments in this period suggests that classical performance continued to promote the idea of an innate, steadfast, and self-rejuvenating consciousness that possesses mastery over matter. There may be parallels with developments in psychiatry (carrying on from Flesch's early engagement with psychoanalytical ideas and techniques), as well as the emergence of 'self help' literature, which was in part a continuation of the moral and physical hygiene literature. Yehudi Menuhin's embracing of yoga and his subsequent reforms to violin technique also suggests an engagement with Eastern philosophies that offered the West new solutions to the mind-body dilemma.

Two areas for future expansion with regard to the research on notions of self in string playing are masculinity and Jewish identity. An interesting area for research would be female violinists in the early twentieth century. Maud Powell, in the words of Frederick Martens in *Violin Mastery*, discusses briefly her earlier ideal of playing in a "masculine manner", only to be replaced later with her conviction that playing in the "spirit" is not gender specific.⁴⁰⁴ There are many more sources relating to Maud Powell listed on the website of the Maud Powell Society (<<http://maudpowell.org>>), and there is a chapter in Henry Lahee's *Famous Violinists of To-Day and Yesterday* (1899) entitled 'Women Violinists'. From the perspective of a cultural study, notions of Jewish identity in relation to string playing in the early twentieth century are limited: there is little more than Carl Flesch's racial essentialism, briefly noted in chapter 3 (in his notion of the Jewish race as possessing a special aptitude for melding song and speech, as an explanation for why so many violinists were of Jewish descent). In terms of studies of later periods, the cellist Joachim Stutschewsky's and Bronisław Huberman's emigrations to Israel might prove to be of interest to further discursive studies, however.

⁴⁰⁴ Frederick H. Martens, *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1919), 191.

Huberman was particularly prodigious in terms of his literary output, and would form the focus of an extensive study. With regard to a study of Jewish identity among string players in the early twentieth century, a historical over a purely discursive study might do greater justice to the topic.

Uncovering a History of the Body

The privileging of metaphysical notions of mind in early twentieth-century writings on string playing gave rise to the ideal of the immanent artwork: this, however, conflicted with the manifold contingencies of musical performance. The writers of the texts considered in this thesis were mostly working performers, who were familiar with the particularities that undermined the ideal performance of the artwork. This ideal incorporated the notion of the self as a singular, ubiquitous and eternal presence which implied that the act of performance should essentially aspire to embody these qualities. Changes in psychic and bodily states, the clearing and onset of illness, the effects of temperature and humidity on performer and instrument, collaborations with varying performers, and the sonic conditions of varying performance venues, constantly undermined the ideal of the immanent artwork, however. Improvements might have been made in the latest performance, to be sure, but there would also have been much lost from the previous performance.

In some ways, then, one can say that writings on string playing expose conflicts between notions of consciousness and of the body to a greater extent than wider discourses incorporating metaphysical notions. Unlike more abstracted and idealistic philosophical visions that articulated the marriage of the Absolute with the material world, writers on string playing could not ignore the body's multiple transgressions against the all-consuming subjective principle. Writers adopt the popular neo-Romantic and -Idealist binarisms of vitality–mechanism, spirit–matter, subjective–objective, and mind–body, but the relationship between the secondary components of these binarisms to their primaries is by no means straightforward. One area in which the mediation of notions of self in wider society is not unproblematic is the mediation of pathological and moral ideas: nevertheless, the amplification of the medico-moral discourse in this branch of writings on musical performance

further characterises it generally as a troubled mediation of the body. In this context, one can further provide another general characterisation of the discourse as a whole, as a branch of medical and psychiatric history.

To a certain extent, writers try to account for the constant change essentially entailed in the immediacy of musical performance, but this is not unproblematic. Moser and Auer endow the contingencies of performance, as a present act, with a higher philosophical validation: while Moser conceives of the interaction of performers and listeners as unified by a neo-Idealist spirit, Auer presents an optimistic vision of a performance community in any given age, as the collective submission of the populace to the pre-eminent performing artist. The audience allows its sensibilities to be entirely governed by the dictates of the performer, thus freeing Auer from the burden of the past, in the form of historical treatises. The magnitude of this responsibility for the performer, however, is surely what induces Auer's anxieties over the individual health and strength of the performer: even in his isolation, the performer must live up to his high calling, as elite genius that speaks for the crowd. Similarly, anxieties over health are what mar the ideal of singing tone, as endless song: Moser worries about breaks in musical phrases, which he compares to an asthmatic singer's inability to sing through a phrase.

Further research is needed to find out how medico-moral notions develop in discourses of string playing in the course of the nineteenth century, and whether or not they correlate with the rise in notions of nervous diseases and degeneration from the mid-nineteenth century onwards. In terms of the legacy for the rest of the twentieth century, the trend earlier in the century is for writers to continue to harbour medico-moral anxieties well into the 1920s and 1930s, even though they are generally supposed to have receded following the First World War. Auer's acute worries in the early 1920s are perhaps more understandable considering his age (Auer was born in 1845), but Flesch's extensive incorporation of medico-moral notions into his writings in the 1920s and 1930s is unusual: the question for future research, then, is whether medico-moral notions in Flesch's writings are fossilised tropes, or whether such notions continue to centrally inform constructs of performance in the 1940s and beyond. Flesch's humorous tone in certain passages of his *Erinnerungen eines Geigers*,

such as his notions of Fritz Kreisler's sexually uninhibited playing, suggest that fears over the dangers of morally- and biologically-destructive behaviours had receded in the years following the First World War, and that such ideas had been reduced to turns of phrases.

The Discourse as the Articulation of a Culture of High Art Performance

In many ways one can interpret wider society's conflicted mediation of the mind and body as an attempt to fathom the nature of being in the face of the dismantling of hierarchical social structures. The retreat of religious institutions, as governors of social practices and arbiters of meaning, as well as greater movement between social strata, due to increased mobility in terms of transport, wealth and social status, induced an urgently felt need to seek new sources of order. At one time in service to the church and courts, art in particular now demanded redefinition. As chapter 2 discussed, the growth of the entertainment industry led to a divergence between high and low art, and whereas commercial spectacles toyed with metaphysical beliefs for financial gain, the literary, artistic or musical work became promoted as the true and steadfast seat of the soul, in its isolation from the contingent marketplace of everyday life. Thus mind/soul/the artwork became evermore numinous, which cast the body in direct opposition, as the locus of the deceptions flaunted by ersatz virtuosos, travelling circuses and freak shows.

The disputed boundary between high and low art is what prompted a discourse designed to mediate it. In contrast to the quickly produced and forgotten press advertisements that ensured the success of the entertainment industry, the publication of more respectable journals and weightier books owe their existence in the first place to the need to defend a high art culture. Thus for the most part, the more comprehensive artistic discourses of the nineteenth century, or at least those that are preserved in libraries and are bequeathed to later generations, are largely those that articulate and defend high art.

This thesis has argued that the discourse on string playing joins in this defence of a high art culture of performance. This fundamentally redefines the genre of the pedagogical treatise in this period as guardian of the elect, which prevented its potential use as an *en masse* dissemination of practices to the masses. Despite Moser's extensive practical advice in the first two volumes of the *Violinschule*, the third volume serves to render this composite of practices incomplete by positing the superior self as a prior necessity to the execution of these practices: the opening essay negotiates metaphysical notions of self and the introductions and edited violin parts to sixteen 'masterworks' discursively perform the self as posited in the artwork. The second volume of Flesch's *Die Kunst des Violinspiels* ('Artistic Realization and Instruction'), with its essay and similar discursive performance of several canonical works, serves a similar purpose.

The string pedagogical treatise in the early twentieth century promotes high art, and itself aspires to be highbrow literature, yet the very publishing of this elitism undermines its proclaimed ideals. The pedagogical treatise is not a manual: it is not a book at hand, in the violinist's practice room, and the pages are not to be thumbed, in between picking up the violin, to execute their recommendations. By positing a model of disembodied and noumenal consciousness the pedagogical treatise attempts to stand quite some distance from bodies and materials. The reader experiences it as an independent, organic and deep model of the violinist's self, from which the reader might 'catch some reflection of its genius', as Auer writes. If the violinist can only be the elite and rare primary strong man, the Nietzschean primary producer of art, however, this must surely induce strong doubt, on the part of the reader, as to whether he or she qualifies as such. The act of publishing this self, however, in itself undermines this discursive positing of a high ideal. Despite their proclaimed ideals of artistry as rare and innate talent, writers published 'pedagogical' literature in order to toy with the possibility that this form of self could be sold. In doing so they thus betray their own shunning of the lowbrow entertainment industry, as the cheap exchange of the promise of re-enchantment for money.

Authoritarianism and its Implications

By and large, however, one can characterise discourses of early twentieth-century string playing as a problematic but coercive imposition of authority. Each of the above historical narratives of the discourses demonstrates how writers construct authority in different ways: the discourses' mediation of metaphysical notions of consciousness posits attractive foundational principles that are difficult to contest, and gather strength from Nietzsche's and Wagner's rhetorical prose. Writers' incorporations of psychoanalytical and medico-moral notions grant their texts a ready-made authority established by the medical and emerging psychiatric professions. The articulation of a culture of high art performance also thrived on the back of a revered canon of musical works.

Future research might wish to trace how this authority rises in the course of the nineteenth century, or perhaps how it evolved from other kinds of authority. It would be interesting to find out how performance discourses evolve from early Romanticism in this respect: one speculates that the shift from Romanticism's notions of roaming to the cultural glorification of the universal, healthy and normal man brought with it a depletion of variety. Perhaps early Romanticism's taste for ethereal transcendence, the uncanny, far-off lands, and forming and collapsing subjectivities (as Mary Hunter demonstrates in her article on the idea of the performer in early Romantic discourses), harboured a greater tolerance for the atypical and fortuitous in performance, therefore leading to greater diversity.⁴⁰⁵ Perhaps it was the fixing of this dynamism that led to the increased domination of a uniform model of performance: from spirit to mind/psyche, or to the healthy body. Another interesting area is the increase in methodical approaches to musical performance, in the early nineteenth century, and particularly in France, leading to greater separation of technique from musical content, and the mechanisation of bodily gestures. It would be interesting to compare the subjugation of the player's body through mechanisation in these earlier texts to the subjugation of the player's body and mind in early twentieth-century discourses.

The implications of an early twentieth-century authoritarianism for later generations of performers will be a central question for future studies of performance in the twentieth and twenty-

⁴⁰⁵ Mary Hunter, '“To Play as if from the Soul of the Composer”: The Idea of the Performer in Early Romantic Aesthetics', *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 58/2 (2005), 357–398.

first centuries. Richard Taruskin has already posited a broad cultural narrative of high art performance in the twentieth century: he argues that a high degree of conservatism stifled dissent and eventually led to a revolt, in the form of the Early Music Movement. Taruskin argues that the belatedness of this revolt was due to the extent of the repression imposed by the subjectivist ideology of performance. The shift from terms used in the early twentieth century to denote a high art culture, such as ‘noble’ and ‘fine’, to the all-purpose term ‘classical’ later in the century suggests that perhaps the rich discourse and practices resulting from the complex tension between high/mind/art and low/body/virtuosity in the early twentieth century were replaced with a more uniform model of performance later in the century. Several scholars on twentieth-century performance have remarked that there is a richness in both the literary and recorded evidence in the early twentieth century that disappears from the 1930s onwards. A possible reason for this is that although a handful of eminent violinists created an authoritative model of string playing in the early twentieth century, the performative gestures resulting from this model were still in tension with a variety of performative gestures that lay outside of this model, and that it was trying to eschew. For example, although writers denounce rushed tempi as a virtuosic trait, their reason for writing in the first place may have been to eradicate what was still a widespread practice of the period. It may have been the case, then, that it took time for a model of high art performance to exert its authority, through teacher–pupil interactions and the imitation of performative gestures. The homogenising influence of this high model took time to become inculcated in more commonly executed string practices later in the century.

Early research indicates that there is a high degree of continuity in ideas about string playing from the early twentieth century up to present day, which supports the argument that the authority of the early twentieth-century model extended a far-reaching influence. A cursory review of literature from later in the twentieth century shows that many performers continue to propound early twentieth-century ideas. Continuing the differing responses to notions of exhaustion, the cellist Paul Tortelier in 1975 advocates the building up of strength (‘one must constantly fight natural weaknesses’), whereas the violinist Yehudi Menuhin prefers to focus on conserving energy (‘conservation of energy as

momentum is also essential to my approach’).⁴⁰⁶ The notion of high art as consciousness surfaces even recently in comments from the British violinist Nigel Kennedy, who praises Menuhin’s ‘spiritual’ playing, and sees his own role as executor of the ‘emotional core’ of Bach’s music. Conversely Kennedy denigrates his competition by appealing to the mind–body hierarchy; he characterises the playing of Ivan Galamian’s pupils as ‘self-satisfied smugness of sound’, recalling the notion that the body, as the seat of the sensuous (denoted by ‘sound’), incarcerates universal mind, and causes a preoccupation with one’s self at the expense of the collective.⁴⁰⁷ An alternative explanation for this high degree of continuity is that these ideas about performance possess historical longevity, and might be found in earlier periods also. The perennial appearances of such ideas might suggest that themes developed in psychological, cultural and anthropological approaches are more appropriate tools with which to approach the discourse.

Developing a Cultural Study into Historical Narratives of Performance

This study has organised its findings according to principal cultural themes but future research might wish to consider other ways of narrating performance history, as a means of developing richer modes of contextualisation for the emerging study of performance history. A particularly enlightening narrative of string playing in the latter half of the nineteenth century and twentieth century would document the careers and influence of celebrated artists. As this study has shown, the long artistic careers of Joachim and Casals, or perhaps more importantly, their prominent and sustained impression on the wider public consciousness, is central to the development of discourses of string playing.

Further research could also frame twentieth-century music history as comprised of genealogies of performers. David Milsom’s enlightening genealogy of nineteenth-century players shows that Louis Spohr is the most central figure in the development of nineteenth-century playing,

⁴⁰⁶ Paul Tortelier, M. Tortelier and R. C. Baumberger, *How I Play, How I Teach*, (2nd edn, London: Chester, 1976), 9. Yehudi Menuhin, *Violin: Six Lessons with Yehudi Menuhin* (London: Faber, 1971), 14.

⁴⁰⁷ Dalya Alberge, ‘Nigel Kennedy Accuses Fellow Violinists of Destroying Bach’s Legacy’, *The Guardian* [online newspaper article], (13 August 2011). <<http://www.guardian.co.uk/music/2011/aug/13/nigel-kennedy-violinists-bach>> accessed 3 November 2011.

and further work might wish to link this research with a map of teacher–pupil relationships in the twentieth.⁴⁰⁸ A more exhaustive study, however, would also consider performer collaborations, such as a violinist and conductor in the performance of a concerto, or the forming of a string quartet or piano trio. This would require more extensive research on both collaborations and teacher–pupil lineages for other instruments, however.

Future research might also aim to engage with the growing body of research centred around geographical centres, and performing or pedagogical institutions of performance. One question which the current study poses is how the construction of authority in pedagogical treatises relates to actual methods of teaching. On the one hand, Auer’s investing of authority in eminent individuals (including himself, if one views his construct of elite self as implementing a power dynamic) suggests the desire to resist professionalization (as the embodying of knowledge in texts rather than people), yet his own pedagogical text may have been intended as a contribution to professionalisation, and Auer indicates that several of his expressed concerns over the spread of bad violinistic practices stem from the lack of an external structuring of violin pedagogy.⁴⁰⁹ Auer’s views would gain context from a consideration of the extent to which string pedagogy in late Imperial Russia and in the United States was institutionalised, in the early twentieth century. It would also be interesting to consider the approaches of pedagogical treatises in relation to proposed philosophical and social models of musical performance: in *Musical Performance: A Philosophical Study*, Stan Godlovitch, for example, argues that leading performers of any chosen instrument hold the monopoly over developments in ideas and practices relating to that instrument. Frederickson and Rooney argue that music is semi-professionalised.⁴¹⁰

⁴⁰⁸ David Milsom, *Theory and Practice in Late Nineteenth-Century Violin Performance* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003), 15.

⁴⁰⁹ ‘In those countries... which have no state-supported or state-endowed schools of music, anyone who takes a fancy to give music-lessons may – if he can receive a few pupils – enter the profession! I do not by any means wish to imply that all private teachers are irresponsible. Many are indeed desirous of doing their best, but alas, having themselves been ill-taught, they spread the poison of their own ignorance, broadcast a plague, which carries off many hapless innocent victims of their pernicious teaching methods.’ Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921), 54.

⁴¹⁰ Stan Godlovitch, *Musical Performance: A Philosophical Study* (London: Routledge, 1998). J. Frederickson and J. F. Rooney, ‘How the Music Occupation Failed to Become a Profession’, *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music*, 21/2 (1990), 189–206.

A particularly interesting topic is the large-scale emigration of musicians to the United States in the early decades of the twentieth century, and an important question in this area would be the extent to which the European cultures of performance that they brought over are preserved or transformed. There was also a smaller wave of immigration to England, which included Achille Rivarde, Hans Wessely and Carl Flesch (for a limited period of time). Another area for further work is Moser's literary output in the context of cultural life in Berlin, particularly for the 1872 inauguration and development of the *Berlin Hochschule für Musik*.

Revising a Composer-Centred Music History

A comparison of discourses surrounding high art performers with those of canonical composers reveals multiple parallels. The discursive articulation of Beethoven in the early twentieth century aligns him with the same ideal of the artist found in the discourses of string playing: Beethoven, like the ideal string player, embodies Germanic soulfulness, is in harmony with his material outworking, and revitalises the collective of the present age. Scott Burnham argues that Beethoven reception between 1870 and 1927 generally portrays him as 'redeemer', and draws attention to Wagner's aligning of Beethoven with the immediacy of Will (betraying the influence of Schopenhauer), as well as the harmony between the inner consciousness that Beethoven's music embodies and its sounding materialisation. Burnham shows that, for Wagner, Beethoven's music captures the essence of the German spirit, which triumphs over French superficiality. This parallels Moser's attempt to exclusively link German violin playing to Germanic ideals of subjectivity, and place it in opposition to Franco-Belgian virtuosity. Burnham goes on to highlight the deflation of this German nationalistic sentiment from the 1920s onwards, in a period which sees 'Beethoven as lawgiver and bearer of classical values'. As this study's findings have shown, however, many of the ideals of the post-War period, in both wider culture and discourses of string playing, continue earlier ideals of healthy genius: comparable to the ideal of health in writings on violin playing is the British music analyst

Donald Tovey's praising of Beethoven's music as 'the epitome of Victorian normality and health', and Guido Adler's notion of it as 'a viable moral force'.⁴¹¹

Early twentieth-century discourses of interpretive string playing are a close counterpart to biographical, analytical and theoretical writings of the same era: what surely prevented the absorption of writings on performance into twentieth-century musicological research and syllabuses, however, was their digression from the dominant ideology, as texts which unavoidably dealt with bodies, instruments, multiplicities and contingencies. The elitist aims of early twentieth-century energeticist theories and analyses of music were much the same as discourses of string playing: Lee Rothfarb notes that the energeticists saw themselves as 'missionaries with the sacred duty of rescuing and reviving a moribund musical culture', and notes their anti-historicism and appeal to the idea of natural 'law' in their attempt to establish a 'foundation for authoritative criticism'.⁴¹² Both these analysts and writers on string playing purport to ground their claims solely in the content of musical works, but in the process invoke a quasi-biological and evolutionary certainty, as well as protect themselves from counter-arguments by denouncing historicism (as is particularly the case in Auer's writings, see chapter 2). However, what surely prevented the academic canonisation of texts on performance, along with those of Riemann and Schenker, was their unshakable association with the very elements that the energeticists were trying to eschew. Despite their elevated social statuses, writers such as Auer and Flesch were still daily fraternisers with the world of commerce. Their work necessarily entailed cooperation with fickle impresarios, next-day concert reviewers and avaricious record producers. This world of the deceptive, the ephemeral and the mercenary was antithetical to the high values of the socially elite musical academy. Despite their attempt to posit a subjectivist ideal, violinists' writings unavoidably deal with the practicalities of a performing career.

The legacy, even for more recent music historians, is an academic tradition that prevents the integration of performers into music history. Contexts for historical study have considerably

⁴¹¹ Scott Burnham, 'The Four Ages of Beethoven: Critical Reception and the Canonic Composer', in Glenn Stanley, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Beethoven* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 278–287.

⁴¹² Lee Rothfarb, 'Energetics' in Thomas Christensen, ed., *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, Cambridge Histories Online, 2002), 927–955, 928.

diversified in recent years but it is fair to say that there is still less in the way of more large-scale and definitive historical narratives that are structured around performers and performances: despite his insightful work on historical cultures of performance, Richard Taruskin could not see a way for this research to be integrated into his history of western music (*The Oxford History of Western Music*, 2005–2009), and almost entirely excludes performers and performances from his text. Similarly, Ruth Katz marginalises performers in her account of the rise of Western ‘art’ music (*A Language of Its Own: Sense and Meaning in the Making of Western Art Music*, 2009).

A more balanced view of music history would give greater consideration to performance. This would either take the form of the cultural narratives developed in this study or the potential frameworks for future research suggested above. If there is still a place for the construction of music history around the biographies and works of distinguished individuals, then Auer’s and Flesch’s names, and especially Joachim’s and Casals’s names, deserve to be added to those of Wagner, Brahms, Schoenberg and Stravinsky, in the history of music in the late-nineteenth and early-twentieth centuries. In terms of historical narratives that form around dimensions such as traditions, networks of influence, urban centres, institutions and recording cultures of music there is also much scope for the inclusion of performers and performances. The aim should be to stake out a more nuanced landscape of performed music, beyond Taruskin’s simple dichotomy of mainstream and Early Music performance, to produce narratives that rival those that have been lavished on composers.⁴¹³

National Styles of Violin Playing in the Early twentieth century: Ideology or Reality?

⁴¹³ It would be possible to gain greater insight into the texts critiqued in this study through developing a more nuanced landscape of past cultures of performance: whereas this study has unveiled a terrain of cultural ideas, a more detailed mapping of figures, genealogies of performers, recorded practices and centres of musical production and reception would enable scholars to frame these same texts as products of specific authors, writing with certain pupils or colleagues in mind, and with certain musical events occurring around them. On acquiring this kind of knowledge it would be interesting to find out to what extent Martens’s two collections of ‘interviews’ accurately record the ideas of his interviewees. It would subsequently be possible to either argue that early twentieth-century violinists from differing backgrounds, such as Kreisler and Heifetz, have remarkably similar beliefs and ideas about performance, or to conclude that Martens’s supposed interviews are more a record of his own beliefs than those whom he claimed to have interviewed.

It is difficult to attribute each writer's thought predominantly to a single national culture. To begin with, many of the authors considered in this thesis lived in several European countries, received tuition from teachers of varying nationalities, themselves taught in several countries, and collaborated with musicians of many nationalities. Carl Flesch was born in the modern-day town of Mosonmagyaróvár, which in 1873 was part of the Austro-Hungarian Empire. He received early tuition in Vienna from the Austrian Jakob Grün, and then went on to study in Paris and with Eugène Sauzay and Martin Marsick. Before coming to write in the 1920s, Flesch had thus spent a significant amount of time living and working in France, England, Holland, Germany and the United States. Auer lived in Germany, Russia and the United States before writing his series of texts, and his autobiography also notes periods of touring undertaken in the United Kingdom and Scandinavia. Bronisław Huberman's training and career were markedly pan-European in scope, having included training in Poland, France and Germany, and a young life of concert touring across Europe and the United States.

Furthermore, this thesis has uncovered a centralised ideology of self to which writers of all nationalities ascribe, in their articulation of a model of high art performance. The sole exception to the widely travelled authors above is Moser, who spent all his life living and working in Germany. Nevertheless, chapter 2 demonstrated that Moser's championing of a German school of playing lacks historical veracity and is essentially built on an ideological nexus of ideas surrounding self, including the ideals of vitality, health and Nietzschean notions of the superior artist. These wider cultural notions were also pan-Western in scope of influence: Nietzsche was published in several European languages from the 1890s onwards, notions of neurasthenia and degeneration were received throughout Europe and the United States, and the forming of a high artistic culture, as a means of resisting the disenchantment wrought by the commercialised entertainment industry, took place in many countries. 'Classical', the name that this high culture of performance came to receive later in the twentieth century, is thus a fitting term, if it is taken to mean unity and cosmopolitanism.

National styles or schools of playing, therefore, seem irrelevant, yet in performance scholarship at large they continue to play an important role in shaping the understanding of early

twentieth-century performance. This study can only speak for the literary evidence and is not able to contend with scholars regarding the recorded evidence: both the literary and recorded evidence used in studies, however, does seem rather scant, and the aim of the present discussion is first to demonstrate the unreliability of the literary evidence, in arguing the case for national styles, and to suggest that, without substantial recorded evidence, the use of national styles as a scholarly framework should give way to more insightful frameworks such as lineages of players and urban centres of playing. Much of Robert Philip's discussion of national styles seems to argue against the existence of national styles; as he writes, 'by the time the twentieth century was under way, the spread of new approaches to violin-playing seemed to be due more to the influence of charismatic individual performers (especially Kreisler and Heifetz) than to any particular schools, national or otherwise'. Yet Philip continues to regard the framework as indispensable, opening his discussion by saying that 'it is possible to categorise violin-playing in the early twentieth century into separate schools and traditions', and presenting the reader with the tentative divisions of Russian, French and German schools of playing.⁴¹⁴ In his study of an earlier period of violin playing, David Milsom similarly notes the problems involved with the schools of playing model, and like Philip acknowledges the significance of individuals, yet continues to centrally use the category to make sense of the evidence.⁴¹⁵

Philip begins with the provisional category of a Russian school of violin playing, but goes on to largely refute its existence. He draws attention to Flesch's notion of the 'Russian bow grip', as possible evidence of a distinct Russian school of playing. This bow grip exaggerates the French bow grip, in which the hand is tilted towards the index finger, to the extent that the index finger curls round the bow. Philip attributes much of the development of a supposed Russian school to the career of Leopold Auer, but nevertheless questions the extent of Auer's influence: as he observes, Szigeti later pointed out that Auer recommends the German bow grip in his writings (in which the hand is placed more or less at a right angle to the bow and the fingers are kept close together), and believed that it

⁴¹⁴ Robert Philip, *Performing Music in the Age of Recording* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 2004), 194, 191.

⁴¹⁵ Milsom, *Theory and Practice*, 14–28.

was Auer's pupils, rather than Auer himself, who had developed the so-called 'Russian' bow grip. Furthermore, Philip observes from the recorded evidence that Auer's pupils tend to sound different from each other, and as further evidence cites Auer's comment in *Violin Playing As I Teach It*, that 'I have always insisted... that my pupils express themselves, and that they must not try to express me'.⁴¹⁶

This study's critique of the literary evidence suggests that Auer was more influential over his pupils than Philip suggests, but that his teachings were not different enough from those of other European teachers to warrant categorisation as a distinct Russian school of playing. Chapter 2 of this thesis argued that the autonomy of the superior, self-expressing artist is an ideology found in all writings on violin playing from this period, and is thus weak literary evidence that Auer's pupils actually sounded different to Auer. Furthermore, Eddy Brown and Mischa Elman related to Martens in 1919 that Auer was a coercive teacher (see chapter 5), which suggests that Auer was indeed influential over his pupils' playing styles. How different Auer's style of playing was from that of his Western European counterparts, however, is questionable, since, as this thesis has repeatedly shown, Auer's discursive model of performance is highly similar to that of Flesch and Moser. Auer's anxieties over medico-moral notions are more pronounced than those of Flesch and Moser, and he goes further in his privileging of elite performers, as well as his separation of them from the aspiring masses. Yet these differences are a question of subtle shades and do not constitute fundamental differences: what is far more striking is the similarity of Auer's ideas to those of Moser and Flesch, despite the possible isolation that might have come with spending fifty years in Tsarist Russia, as well as the generational gap between him and Flesch.

The literary evidence does not support the existence of a German and French school of playing. Philip argues that the recorded evidence demonstrates a difference between the tone, vibrato and portamento of players trained in France and Belgium, and that of Joachim and his pupils (supposed representatives of a German school of playing), which he characterises as 'broad bowing [due to the difference in bow holds], restraint in vibrato, and slow portamenti'.⁴¹⁷ This alone does not

⁴¹⁶ Leopold Auer, *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921), 189.

⁴¹⁷ *Ibid.* 192.

seem sufficient evidence of the existence of two separate schools of playing, however: it is clear that Joachim disseminated a unique and contrasting style of playing, but again this is evidence of the influence of a single individual and not of an entire school. To repeat, the written evidence has demonstrated that writers of all nationalities, including Joachim's acolyte, Moser, and the comments of Ysaÿe, posit the same subjectivist ideology of performance. The only writer who draws the schools dichotomy into his writings in a significant way is Moser, who aligns the German with self and the French with empty virtuosity, by way of denigrating Franco-Belgian players. Moser's thought reflects the heightened nationalistic sentiment of Wilhelminian Germany, however, and is weak evidence of a fundamental difference in performative practices, since non-German writers also overwhelmingly embrace subjectivism and denigrate mechanistic playing. In an unpublished manuscript written in later life, the Belgian violinist Ysaÿe wrote of the noumenal self at the centre of the artwork, and its ascendancy over matter:

The power not merely to bring sounds from an instrument but to awaken its very soul, to instil feeling into mere pieces of wood and metal, to create visions, to express good and bad, joy and sorrow, by melodies or rhythms, is a gift from on high, it cannot be acquired.

Ysaÿe's model of performance contains all the same basic components as those of Moser, Auer and Flesch. Metaphysical melody is at the centre: song, Ysaÿe writes, is the 'very reason of existence of the violin'. Performance is aligned with the composer/artwork : the composer is an 'author whose work he [the performer] interprets with the faith and conviction of an apostle'. Ysaÿe even champions Joachim's approach to performance (although it is not clear by 'elements... of interpretation' whether Ysaÿe includes Joachim's performative practices or just his ethos of interpretation):

The feelings to which music gives rise re-create themselves, and those that Joachim gave to the world were penetrating enough to be felt even by the deaf. They were infinite. Just as we have had transmitted to us the intention and the interpretative detail of even the earliest works, so we shall know how to hand on the elements of Joachim's interpretation.

The only difference between Ysaÿe's and Moser's discourse is that for Ysaÿe the term 'virtuoso' is not synonymous with the body and mechanism: for Ysaÿe the virtuoso has to 'set up that mysterious magnetic current between himself and the audience', to 'penetrate its mind and its heart', and to 'hold it under the domination of the bow'. These are qualities which might be interpreted as deceptive

virtuosity, dead mechanism parading as life, were it not for Moser's and others' inclusion of the same metaphors of intersubjective coercion, as characterising the actions of the all-powerful performing artist.⁴¹⁸

In terms of violin playing in the nineteenth century, the literary evidence to support the existence of French and German schools is similarly lacking. Evidence which might support the existence of two separate schools stems from the supposed embodied epitomes of the distinction in the nineteenth century—Ysaÿe and Joachim. Ysaÿe spent most his life working in France and Belgium, whereas Joachim spent most of his life in Germany (although he toured extensively). Further research might therefore find that the map of nineteenth-century performance is brought into proper relief through the correlation of urban centres of performance, notably Paris, Liège and Berlin, to approaches to performance. David Milsom's use of the literary evidence to argue the existence of French and German schools of playing is unconvincing: as evidence Milsom cites an 1836 text by Dubourg, which is too early a text to constitute appropriate evidence of violin playing in the latter half of the nineteenth century. More significantly, it merely repeats the ideology of self: the French, according to Dubourg, are deceptive virtuosi, automatons parading as living beings (they 'dazzle you... but they commonly fail to reach your heart'). Dubourg's later championing of French players adopts the trait commonly ascribed to the French, of *finesse* ('the graces and refinements which have been so readily caught up with the more imitative Frenchmen'), but this is only a variation on the basic metaphysical philosophy: the idea is still that the Germans hold the monopoly over original self, their failing being that they do not give this the necessary finish that it needs ('they [German players] are below them in that which their dignity has not thought proper to make the subject of completion'). The dichotomous ideology clearly extends back into the nineteenth century, then, of the German as foundational self, but lacking refinement, and the French as possessing refinement but lacking inner

⁴¹⁸ Quoted in Antoine Ysaÿe and Bertram Ratcliffe, *Ysaÿe: His life, Work and Influence* (London, Toronto: Heinemann, 1947), 209, 212, 210, 212, 208, 209.

substance.⁴¹⁹ Literary evidence which posits this distinction is thus not reliable evidence of actual differences between German and French performative practices in the nineteenth century.

A critical study of the literary sources reveals that notions of national styles superficially mask a more fundamental ideology of self that transcends national boundaries. Historians widely recognise the increasing influence, in the nineteenth century, of the ideology of nationalism in many Western national states and over a wide range of topics. In the early twentieth century one observes a contrast between heightened nationalistic sentiment prior to the First World War, and following it a call for international cooperation and *die Neue Sachlichkeit*. Similarly, Moser's pro-Germanic model of violin playing contrasts with 1920s notions of Casals's globalised school of cello playing. Yet both are rooted in an ideology of noumenal subjectivity, and what is striking about Auer's, Huberman's and Martens's writings is their outright resistance to embracing nationalism of any kind. In his post-World War I writings Flesch privileges German music making above other kinds but this is not interwoven into a nationalist-subjectivist ideology, however, and he also celebrates the music making of other nationalities. Flesch opaquely proclaims the German musical sensibility to be superior to all others because of its universality:

German musical literature, in my opinion, has no purely national hallmarks. It employs universal expressional means. It is the music of the entire cultural world.⁴²⁰

This idea receives very little integration into the wider network of ideas influencing the rest of his extensive prose volume, however. Even in the passage in which it occurs Flesch colourfully evokes the attractions that other styles hold and recommends embracing authentic conduits to such styles: Spanish music possesses 'passion' (*Leidenschaftlichkeit*) that is 'aristocratic' (*vornehm*); for Hungarian music 'the non-Hungarian will find a good gypsy orchestra to be the best teacher' (*gute Zigeunerkapellen sind... die besten Lehrmeister für den Nicht-Ungarn*); and 'here only a knowledge of the French language, art and literature, in short, of French culture in general, can create that

⁴¹⁹ G. Dubourg, *The Violin, Being an Account of the Instrument and its Most Eminent Professors* (London, 1836), 159–160, Cited in Milsom, *Theory and Practice*, 25–26.

⁴²⁰ *Die deutsche Musikkultur hat meines Erachtens keine rein nationalen Kennzeichen. Sie bedient sich universeller Ausdrucksmittel. Sie ist die Musik der gesamten Kulturwelt.* Flesch, *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2.57. Flesch, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2.63.

atmosphere in which the artist unlocks an understanding of the French nature'.⁴²¹ In his *Erinnerungen*, the idea of a plurality of national styles takes on a greater significance as a decentring notion opposing the hegemony of the superior-self model of performance. Viewing Flesch's literary *oeuvre* as a whole, however, his construct of the singular and sufficient self eclipses his views on embracing a plurality of national styles. As chapter 5 argued, this embracing of plurality is chiefly an attempt to undermine the hegemony of this model: further research on the recorded evidence of Flesch's playing and that of his pupils would reveal if this embracing of national styles of playing underpins performative practices. This study cannot speak definitively for the rest of the twentieth century, but it is likely that, as Philip writes, as the centrality of the idea of national styles becomes weaker, styles of classical performance become globally homogeneous.⁴²²

Findings of the Study in the Context of Performing Practice, Empirical, and Psychological Approaches

Chapter 3 provided specific suggestions regarding how future empirically and psychologically orientated research might engage with the findings of this cultural study. The purpose of this final section is to summarise the research in the context of future studies of performative practices as developed in chapter 4, and to make a few more suggestions regarding how future research might proceed. This study found that the idea of singing tone is the cornerstone of violin playing, from a literary perspective, in the early twentieth century. The idea bears strong links to the idea of consciousness as materially immeasurable, and therefore infinite, which in descriptions of performative practices leads to an emphasis on continuity over periodicity. This takes multiple forms: in terms of the basic sound of singing tone, writers conceive of it as essentially a legato tone, but they incorporate varying bow strokes into the metaphor by conceiving of them as speech inflections.

⁴²¹ *Hier kann nur Kenntnis der Sprache, der Kunst und Literatur, kurz der französischen Kultur im allgemeinen jene Atmosphäre schaffen, in der sich dem Künstler das Verständnis für französisches Wesen erschließt.* Ibid. 2.56, 2.55, 2.56 and 2.62, 2.62, 2.63.

⁴²² Philip writes that 'separate schools and traditions... become less and less distinct as the century wears on'. Philip, *Performing Music*, 191.

Writers also conceive of rhythms and pulse as speech inflections, but sets of beats which combine to form discrete rhythmic patterns are more independent of continuous tone. Rhythmic patterning constitutes an antithesis to continuous tone, but nevertheless is incorporated into it by acting as its dialectical opposite. There is also the possibility that continuous tone leads to a preference for longer over shorter phrasing, and in terms of structure, more sustained events over compartmentalisation.

There is also the notion that continuous tone also evolves in the course of a piece's performance, as the idea of dynamic/dynamics. In the primary literature 'dynamics' often denotes an increase and decrease of sound volume, but the strong conceptual root of the idea in the central notion of performance as superior self—'dynamic' thus denoting this self's power—serves as a reminder that the modulation of tone might not be solely limited to this definition. Indeed, the idea of tonal climaxing is particularly ideological, and descriptions of this musical event do not describe the inevitable decay of sound volume that must follow a climax. Furthermore, modulatory tone might be enacted through the use of other integral components of tone, i.e. vibrato, portamento and articulation.

Vibrato and portamento are also integral aspects of singing tone, but writers' emphasis on the importance of nuance further requires that they receive a varied application. Portamento and vibrato should therefore not be used constantly, even if the basic idea of the music is that of a continuously-sounding tone. There is also evidence to suggest that command of intonation is also an integral aspect of tone, but it is weak considering that there are no passages which rhetorically argue this point, or structure the idea of intonation with the central metaphors of singing tone. It may be the case, however, that writers consider the centrality of intonation to tone to be obvious, and therefore do not regard it necessary to elaborate the point further.

Writers severely denounce the improper execution of certain aspects of tone, yet this study has demonstrated the integral role that anxieties over the diseased body play in shaping the whole corpus of notions of violin playing. Chapter 4 demonstrated the almost janus-faced nature of writers' model of tone, in that they commonly drop the nexus of ideas surrounding metaphysical melody to conceive of tone as disease and/or deviant morals. Continuous or excessive vibrato, excessive

portamenti, divergence from the uniform tempo of a movement, sudden dynamic changes, and liberal use of ornaments that lack justification for their use from the score or authoritative guides, entirely shed the conceptual structuring that links vibrato, portamento, tempo, dynamics and ornaments to metaphysical melody, and/or the idea of the healthy and superior self, and align themselves with the body, as the seat of deception, decadence, infectious and/or nervous diseases, sexually immoral behaviour, and loss of self control through intoxication or inability to discipline oneself. Chapter 4 showed, however, that the negotiation of the body in these texts is in fact a rich and extensive region of the discourse, and that what emerges from polemics designed to promote the healthy, superior self, is in fact a model of performance arising out of the undesirable elements of wider society. A key question for future research on sound recordings, then, is how this tension between an ideal of consciousness in the artwork and the widespread existence of bodily temptations plays itself out in the recorded artefact.

Voice will be one of the most important categories for future research on performance. The theme is already central to performance research coming from a wide range of disciplinary approaches (see chapter 1), and this thesis has shown that the concept enables a dialogue to occur between historical, empirical and psychological approaches to the study of performance. Chapter 5 suggested that, although the idea of voice is ideological, writers also advocate imitating the human voice, and thus it would be interesting to use the scientific research on the emotive and physiological dimensions of the human voice (such as that of Patrik Juslin), in conjunction with the recorded evidence, to foster a more comprehensive understanding of how string players' metaphysical notions of tone engage with possible responses to the human voice in their instrumental playing, to give rise to performative practices.

Future research on sound recordings in conjunction with the cultural evidence will allow a more comprehensive assessment of the relevance of the literary evidence than has previously been achieved. In comparison to the studies of Philip and Milsom discussed above, one of the overall effects of this study has been to distance the literary discourse from practices. For example, the idea of French playing as refined, nuanced, or superficial, as a result of this study's findings, now seems

closer to an abstracted ideology rather than a direct description of French violin playing. It is safer to attribute writers' recommendations on how to curb vibrato, portamento, and so on, to the heightened pathological anxieties of the era, rather than regard them as accurate descriptions of how performers actually played. What this study has provided, however, is a more carefully articulated model of performance that begins to narrow the parameters of understanding how string players' sets of ideas underpinned their practices. Rather than match discrete literary descriptions to specific practices this study has begun with large-scale cultural ideas that give rise to the idea of singing tone, which then proceeds to order increasingly exacting ideas regarding performative practices.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

Alexanian, Diran, *Traité Theorique et Pratique du Violoncelle*, trans. F. Fairbanks (Paris: Mathot, 1914; repr. 1922).

Alvin, Juliette, 'The Logic of Casals's Technique', *The Musical Times*, 71/1054 (1930), 1078–1079.

Auer, Leopold, *My Long Life in Music* (London: Duckworth, 1924).

— *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (London: Duckworth, 1921).

— *Violin Playing as I Teach It* (New York: Stokes, 1921).

— *Violin Works and their Interpretation* (New York: Carl Fischer, 1925).

Alberge, Dalya, 'Nigel Kennedy Accuses Fellow Violinists of Destroying Bach's Legacy', *The Guardian* [online newspaper article], (13 August 2011).
<<http://www.guardian.co.uk/music/2011/aug/13/nigel-kennedy-violinists-bach>> accessed 3 November 2011.

Becker, Hugo and Rynar, Dago, *Mechanik und Ästhetik des Violoncellspiels* (Vienna, Leipzig: Universal Edition, 1929).

Brahms, Johannes and Joachim, Joseph, *Johannes Brahms im Briefwechsel mit Joseph Joachim*, 2 vols, ed. Andreas Moser (Berlin: Deutsche Brahms-Gesellschaft, 1908)

Bunting, Christopher, *Essay on the Craft of 'Cello-Playing* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982).

Courvoisier, Karl, *The Technics of Violin Playing on Joachim's Method* (London: The Strad Library, 1899).

Flesch, Carl, *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, ed. and trans. Eric Rosenblith (New York: Fischer, 2000).

— *The Art of Violin Playing*, 2 vols, trans. Frederick H. Martens (New York: Carl Fischer, 1930).

— *Erinnerungen eines Geigers* (Freiburg, Zurich: Atlantis, 1960).

— *Das Klangproblem im Geigenspiel* (Berlin: Ries and Erler, 1931), 11.

— *Die Kunst des Violinspiels*, 2 vols (Berlin: Ries & Erler, 1923, 1928).

— *Memoirs*, ed. Hans Keller and C. F. Flesch, trans. Hans Keller (London: Rockliff, 1957).

— *Problems of Tone Production in Violin Playing*, trans. Gustav Saenger (New York: Fischer, 1931).

Flesch, Carl F., *And Do You Also Play the Violin?* (London: Toccata Press, 1990).

Fuller-Maitland, J. A., *Joseph Joachim* (London: The Bodley Head, 1905).

- Huberman, Bronislaw, *Aus der Werkstatt des Virtuosen* (Leipzig, Vienna: Hugo Heller, 1912).
- Joachim, Joseph, *Letters from and to Joseph Joachim*, ed. and trans. Nora Blickley (London: Macmillan, 1914).
- Joachim, Joseph, *Briefe von und an Joseph Joachim*, ed. Johannes Joachim and Andreas Moser (Berlin: Bard, 1911 – 1913).
- Joachim, Joseph and Moser, Andreas, *Violinschule in 3 Bänden*, 3 vols, trans. Alfred Moffat (Berlin: N. Simrock, Schott, 1905).
- Lahee, Henry C., *Famous Violinists of To-Day and Yesterday* (Boston: Page, 1899).
- Littlehales, Lillian, *Pablo Casals* (London: Dent, 1929).
- Lynwood, Edith, *Violin Talks: A Book for Teachers and Students Containing Suggestions for Teachers of Children, Analyses of Important Teaching Works: And a Short Treatise on the Joachim and Sevcik Schools of Violin Playing* (New York: Fischer, 1905).
- Martens, Frederick, H., *String Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists, Viola Players and Violoncellists* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1923).
- *Violin Mastery: Talks with Master Violinists and Teachers* (New York: Frederick A. Stokes, 1919).
- Menuhin, Yehudi, *Violin: Six Lessons with Yehudi Menuhin* (London: Faber, 1971).
- Morgan-Browne, H., ‘An Approximation to the Truth about August Wilhelmj’, *Music & Letters*, 3/3 (1922), 219–228.
- Moser, Andreas, *Geschichte des Violinspiels. Mit einer Einleitung: Das Streichinstrumentalspiel im Mittelalter*, 2 vols, ed. Hans Joachim Nösselt (2nd ed, Tutzing: Schneider, 1966).
- *Joseph Joachim: Ein Lebensbild* (Berlin: E. Behr, 1898).
- *Methodik des Violinspiels* (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1920).
- Ondricek, Franz and Mittelman, S., *Neue Methode zur Erlangung der Meistertechnik des Violinspiels auf anatomisch-physiologischer Grundlage* (Vienna: Nickau & Welleminsky, 1909).
- Ritchie, Wallace, *Chats with Violinists, or How to Overcome Difficulties* (London: William Reeves, 1916).
- Rivarde, Achille, *The Violin and Its Technique as a Means to the Interpretation of Music* (London: Macmillan, 1921).
- R., M., *Some Points of Violin Playing and Musical Performance: as Learnt in the Hochschule für Musik (Joachim School) in Berlin During the Time I Was a Student There, 1902–1909*, 8 vols (Edinburgh: privately printed, 1939).
- Schilling, Gustav, *Musikalische Dynamik oder die Lehre vom Vortrage in der Musik* (Cassel: J. G. Krieger, 1843).
- Suggia, Guilhermina, ‘The Violoncello’, *Music & Letters*, 1/2 (1920), 104–110.

Tortelier, Paul, Tortelier, M, and Baumberger, R. C., *How I Play, How I Teach*, (2nd edn, London: Chester, 1976).

Wessely, Hans, *A Practical Guide to Violin-Playing* (London: Joseph Williams, 1913).

Wilhelmj, August and Brown, James, *A Modern School for Violin Playing*, 6 vols (London: Novello, 1898).

Ysaÿe, Antoine and Ratcliffe, Bertram, *Ysaÿe: His life, Work and Influence* (London, Toronto: Heinemann, 1947).

Secondary Sources

Abbate, Carolyn, *In Search of Opera* (Princeton, N. J.: Princeton University Press, 2003).

— *Unsung Voices* (Princeton, N. J.: Princeton University Press, 1991).

Abrams, M. H., *The Mirror and the Lamp: Romantic Theory and the Critical Tradition* (London: Oxford University Press, 1971).

Bakhurst, David, 'Idealism in Russia' in Thomas Baldwin, ed., *The Cambridge History of Philosophy 1870–1945* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 60–66.

Baldock, Robert, *Pablo Casals* (London: Gollancz, 1992).

Barthes, Roland, 'The Grain of the Voice', in *Image – Music – Text*, ed. and trans. Stephen Heath (London: Fontana, 1977), 179–189.

Barrows, Susanna, *Distorting Mirrors. Visions of the Crowd in Late-Nineteenth Century France* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 1981).

Bechtel, William and Richardson, Robert C., 'Vitalism', in E. Craig, ed., *Routledge Encyclopedia of Philosophy* [online reference source] <<http://rep.routledge.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.rep.routledge.com/article/Q109>> accessed 11 November 2011.

Beer, Daniel, 'Microbes of the Mind: Moral Contagion in Late Imperial Russia', *The Journal of Modern History*, 79/3(2007), 531–571.

Beethoven, Ludwig van, *Symphony No. 9 in D Minor*, Op. 125 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1865).

Behler, Ernst, 'Nietzsche in the Twentieth Century', in Bernd Magnus and Kathleen M. Higgins, eds, *The Cambridge Companion to Nietzsche* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996), 281–322.

Bellman, Jonathan, 'Performing Brahms in the Style Hongrois', in Michael Musgrave and Bernard D. Sherman, eds, *Performing Brahms: Early Evidence of Performance Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 327–348.

Bergeron, Katherine and Bohlman, Philip K., eds, *Disciplining Musicology and Its Canons* (Chicago, London: University of Chicago Press, 1992).

Bergson, Henri, *Creative Evolution*, trans. Arthur Mitchell (London: Macmillan, 1911).

— *Time and free will: an essay on the immediate data of consciousness*, trans. F. L. Pogson (London: George Allen & Unwin; New York: MacMillan, 1910).

Bernstein, Susan, *Virtuosity in the Nineteenth Century: Performing Music and Language in Liszt, Heine and Baudelaire* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998).

Bigand, Emmanuel and Poulin-Charronat, Bénédicte, 'Tonal Cognition', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 59–71.

Borchard, Beatrix, *Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Böhlau, 2005).

Bowie, Andrew, *Aesthetics and Subjectivity from Kant to Nietzsche* (Manchester, New York: Manchester University Press, 1990).

Brown, Clive, *Classical and Romantic Performing Practice 1750–1900* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999), 48–98.

— 'Joachim's Violin Playing and the Performance of Brahms's String Music', in Michael Musgrave and Bernard D. Sherman, eds, *Performing Brahms: Early Evidence of Performance Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003).

Burnham, Scott, *Beethoven Hero* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1995).

— 'The Four Ages of Beethoven: Critical Reception and the Canonic Composer', in Glenn Stanley, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to Beethoven* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 272–291.

Butler, Judith, *Gender Trouble* (2nd edn, London: Routledge, 1999).

Butt, John, *Playing with History* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

Calella, Michele and Glanz, Christian, eds, *Anklaenge 2008: Joseph Joachim (1881–1907): Europäischer Bürger, Komponist, Virtuose* (Vienna: Mille Tre, 2008).

Calinescu, Matei, *Five Faces of Modernity: Modernism, Avant-Garde, Decadence, Kitsch, Postmodernism* (Durham, N. C.: Duke University Press, 1987).

Carey, John, *The Intellectuals and the Masses* (London: Faber, 1992).

Chua, Daniel K., *Absolute Music and the Construction of Meaning* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

Clarke, Eric, 'Expression in Performance: Generativity, Perception and Semiosis', in John Rink, ed., *The Practice of Musical Performance: Studies in Musical Interpretation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 21–54

Cook, Nicholas, 'Methods for Analysing Recordings', in Nicholas Cook, Eric Clarke, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, and John Rink, eds, *The Cambridge Companion to Recorded Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 221–245.

Currie, Robert, *Genius: An Ideology in Literature* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1974).

Cummings, Naomi, *The Sonic Self: Musical Subjectivity and Signification* (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2000).

— 'The Subjectivities of 'Erbarne Dich'', *Music Analysis*, 16/1 (1997), 5–44.

- Dahlhaus, Carl, *Nineteenth-Century Music* (Berkeley, London: University of California Press, 1989).
- Day, Timothy, *A Century of Recorded Music: Listening to Musical History* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 2000).
- Dibben, Nicola, 'Subjectivity and the Construction of Emotion in the Music of Björk', *Music Analysis*, 25/1 (2006), 171–197.
- Downes, Stephen, *Music and Decadence in European Modernism: The Case of Central and Eastern Europe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010).
- Dreyfus, Laurence, 'Beyond the Interpretation of Music', *The Dutch Journal of Music Theory*, 12/3 (1997), 253–272.
- 'Early Music Defended Against Its Devotees: A Theory of Historical Performance in the Twentieth Century', *The Musical Quarterly*, 69/3 (1983), 297–322.
- *Wagner and the Erotic Impulse* (Cambridge, Mass., London: Harvard University Press, 2010).
- Dunsby, Jonathan, 'Roland Barthes and the Grain of Panzéra's Voice', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association*, 134/1 (2009), 113–132.
- During, Simon, *Modern Enchantments: The Cultural Power of Secular Magic* (Cambridge, Mass., London: Harvard University Press, 2002).
- Eliot, T. S., *The Sacred Wood: Essays on Poetry and Criticism* (London: Faber, 1920: repr. 1997).
- 'Felix Weingartner on Conducting', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular*, 37, no. 643 (1896), 590–593.
- Foucault, Michel, *Discipline and Punish: the Birth of the Prison*, trans. Alan Sheridan (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1991).
- *Herculine Barbin, Being the Recently Discovered Memoirs of a Nineteenth Century Hermaphrodite* (New York: Vintage Books, 1980).
- *The History of Sexuality*, 3 vols, trans. Robert Hurley (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1990).
- *Ethics, Subjectivity and Truth*, ed. Paul Rabinow (New York: The New Press, 1994).
- Frederickson, J. and Rooney, J. F., 'How the Music Occupation Failed to Become a Profession', *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music*, 21/2 (1990), 189–206.
- Fuchs, Eduard, *Geschichte der erotischen Kunst*, 4 vols (Munich: A. Langen, 1922–26).
- Gay, Peter, *The Bourgeois Experience: Victoria to Freud*, i: *Education of the Senses* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1984).
- *The Bourgeois Experience; Victoria to Freud*, ii: *The Tender Passion* (New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1986).
- Gijswijt-Hofstra, Marijke, 'Introduction: Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First-World War', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 1–30.

Gödde, Günter, 'Freud and Nineteenth-Century Philosophical Sources', in Angus Nicholls and Martin Liebscher, eds, *Thinking the Unconscious: Nineteenth-Century German Thought* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010), 261–286.

Godlovitch, Stan, *Musical Performance: A Philosophical Study* (London: Routledge, 1998).

Goehr, Lydia, *The Imaginary Museum of Musical Works* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1992).

— *The Quest for Voice: Music, Politics and the Limits of Philosophy* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).

Grimley, Daniel M., *Carl Nielsen and the Idea of Modernism* (Woodbridge: The Boydell Press, 2010).

Gritten, Anthony, 'From Ergonomics to Energetics: Alongside the Interpretation of Music', *Dutch Journal of Music Theory (Tijdschrift voor Muziektheorie)*, 14/3 (2009), 155–165.

Hegel, G. W. F., *Vorlesungen über die Ästhetik* [online text] Textlog.de: Historische Texte & Wörterbücher <<http://www.textlog.de/5804.html>> accessed 25 July 2011.

Heller, Erich, *The Importance of Nietzsche: Ten Essays* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988).

Huneker, James, *Franz Liszt* (New York: Scribners, 1911).

'Intellect', n.' Oxford English Dictionary [online reference source] (Oxford University Press) <<http://dictionary.oed.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/97378?rskey=SyfP7v&result=1&isAdvanced=false#eid>> accessed 13 September 2011.

Hunter, Mary, '“To Play as if from the Soul of the Composer”: The Idea of the Performer in Early Romantic Aesthetics', *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 58/2 (2005), 357–398.

Jander, Owen and Harris, Ellen T., 'Bel Canto', in *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online* [online reference source] <<http://oxfordmusiconline.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/02551?q=bel+canto&search=quick&source=omo_gmo&pos=1&_start=1#firsthit> accessed 16 June 2010.

Juslin, Patrik and Laukka, P., 'Communication of Emotions in Vocal Expression and Music Performance: Different Channels, same Code?', *Psychological Bulletin*, 129 (2003), 770–814.

Juslin, Patrick, 'Emotion in Music Performance', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009).

Katz, Ruth, *A Language of Its Own: Sense and Meaning in the Making of Western Art Music* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2009).

Kennaway, James, 'Musical Pathology in the Nineteenth Century: Richard Wagner and Degeneration', PhD thesis, University of California, Los Angeles, 2004.

Kramer, Lawrence, *Musical Meaning: Toward a Critical History* (Berkeley, London: University of California Press, 2002).

Leech-Wilkinson, Daniel, 'Recordings and Histories of Performance Style', in Nicholas Cook, Eric Clarke, Daniel Leech-Wilkinson, and John Rink, eds, *The Cambridge Companion to Recorded Music* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), 246–262.

— ‘Sound and Meaning in Recordings of Schubert’s ‘Die junge Nonne’’, *Musicae Scientiae*, 11/2 (2007), 209–233.

Leppert, Richard, *The Sight of Sound: Music, Representation, and the History of the Body* (Berkeley, London: University of California Press, 1993).

Letteri, Mark, ‘The Theme of Health in Nietzsche’s Thought’, *Man & World*, 23 (1990), 405–417.

McLaughlin, Brian, ‘Vitalism and Emergence’, in Thomas Baldwin, ed., *The Cambridge History of Philosophy 1870–1945* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 631–639.

McLeod, John, *Beginning Postcolonialism* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2000).

Milsom, David, *Theory and Practice in Late Nineteenth-Century Violin Performance: an Examination of Style in Performance, 1850–1900* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003).

Moore, F. C. T., ‘Bergson’ in Thomas Baldwin, ed., *The Cambridge History of Philosophy 1870–1945* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), 67–73.

Morreau, Annette, *Emanuel Feuermann* (New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press, 2002).

Moser, H. J., ‘Andreas Moser’, in Arnold Ebel, ed., *Berliner Musikjahrbuch 1926* (Berlin, Leipzig: Deutscher Tonkünstler, 1926), 106–110.

Musacchia, G., Sams, M., Skoe, E. and Kraus, N., ‘Musicians Have Enhanced Subcortical Auditory and Audiovisual Processing of Speech and Music’, *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA*, 104 (2007), 15984–15898.

Nordau, Max, *Degeneration* (New York: Appleton, 1895).

Nietzsche, Friedrich, ‘The Case of Wagner’, in *Basic Writings of Nietzsche*, trans. Walter Kaufmann (New York: Vintage Books, 1967), 601–654.

— *Twilight of the Idols*, trans. R. J. Hollingdale (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1968).

— *Untimely Meditations*, ed. Daniel Breazeale, trans. R. J. Hollingdale (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).

Nye, Robert, ‘Degeneration, neurasthenia and the culture of sport in Belle Époque France’, *Journal of Contemporary History*, 17 (1982), 51–68.

Paganini, Nicolo, *Moto Perpetuo: Concert-Allegro für Violine mit Pianofortebegleitung*, for Violin and Piano, Op. 11, ed. Ferdinand David (Leipzig, Breitkopf und Härtel, n.d.).

Paganini, Nicolo, *Concerto No.2 in B Minor, Op.7*, for violin and reduced piano accompaniment, ed. August Wilhelmj (Mainz: Schott, n.d.).

Peraino, Judith, *Listening to the Sirens: Musical Technologies of Queer Identity from Homer to Hedwig* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006).

Peters, John Durham, *Speaking into the Air: A History of the Idea of Communication* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1999).

Philip, Robert, *Early Recordings and Musical Style: Changing Tastes in Instrumental Performance* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

— *Performing Music in the Age of Recording* (New Haven, Conn., London: Yale University Press, 2004).

Pick, Daniel, *Faces of Degeneration: a European Disorder, c.1848–1918*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989).

Porter, Roy, *The Greatest Benefit to Mankind: a Medical History of Humanity from Antiquity to the Present* (London: Harper Collins, 1997).

Rabinach, Anson, *The Human Motor: Energy, Fatigue, and the Origins of Modernity* (New York: Basic Books, 1990).

Radkau, Joachim, 'The Neurasthenic Experience in Imperial Germany: Expeditions into Patient Records and Side-looks upon General History', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 199–218.

'Ravish', Oxford English Dictionary [online reference source] (Oxford University Press) <<http://dictionary.oed.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/158684?rskey=MG6BBi&result=2&isAdvanced=false#eid>> accessed 29 July 2011.

Repp, B., 'Diversity and Commonality in Music Performance: An Analysis of Timing Microstructure in Schumann's 'Träumerei'', *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 92/5 (1992), 2546–2568.

— 'A Microcosm of Musical Expression: I. Quantitative Analysis of Pianists' Timing in the Initial Measures of Chopin's Etude in E Major', *Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 104 (1998), 1085–1100.

Ridley, Aaron, *Routledge Philosophy Guidebook to Nietzsche on Art* (New York, London: Routledge, 2007).

Riess Jones, Mari, 'Musical Time', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 81–92.

Roelcke, Volker, 'Electrified Nerves, Degenerated Bodies: Medical Discourses on Neursathenia in Germany, circa 1880–1914', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 177–198.

Rothfarb, Lee, 'Energetics' in Thomas Christensen, ed., *The Cambridge History of Western Music Theory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), 927–955.

Schmiedebach, Heinz-Peter, 'The Public's View of Neurasthenia in Germany: Looking for a New Rhythm of Life', in Marijke Gijswijt-Hofstra and Roy Porter, eds, *Cultures of Neurasthenia from Beard to the First World War* (Amsterdam, New York: Rodopi, 2001), 219–238.

Schmuckler, Mark A., 'Components of Melodic Processing', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 93–106

Schopenhauer, Arthur, *Die Welt als Wille und Vorstellung*, Vol. 1, Book 3, § 52. In Schopenhauer, Arthur, *Zürcher Ausgabe. Werke in zehn Bänden*, 2 vols (Zurich: Diogenes, 1977) [online text] <<http://www.zeno.org/Philosophie/M/Schopenhauer,+Arthur/Die+Welt+als+Wille+und+Vorstellung>> accessed 28 Jan 2010.

Schumann, *Sonata for Violin and Piano No.2*, Op. 121 (Leipzig: Breitkopf und Härtel, 1881).

Seigel, Jerrold, 'Society and Selfhood Reconciled: Janet, Fouillé and Bergson', in *The Idea of Self: Thought and Experience in Western Europe since the Seventeenth Century* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 508–536.

Sapp, C., 'Comparative Analysis of Multiple Musical Performances' [conference paper] (2007). Austrian Computer Society (OCG)
<http://ismir2007.ismir.net/proceedings/ISMIR2007_p497_sapp.pdf> accessed 31 March 2009.

Shaffer, L. H., 'Timing in Solo and Duet Piano Performances', *The Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 36/A (1984), 577–595.

Spitzer, John, Zaslaw, Neal, Botstein, Leon, Barber, Charles, Bowen, José A., Westrup, Jack, 'Conducting', in *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online* [online reference source] <<http://oxfordmusiconline.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/06266?q=Conducting&search=quick&pos=1&_start=1#firsthit> accessed 16 November 2011.

Spitzer, Michael, *Metaphor and Musical Thought* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2004).

Springer, O., ed., *Langenscheidts Enzyklopädisches Wörterbuch: Der Englischen und Deutschen Sprache*, 2 vols (6th edn, Berlin: Langenscheidt, 1992).

Stainsby, Thomas and Cross, Ian, 'The Perception of Pitch', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 47–58.

Stowell, Robin, ed., *The Cambridge Companion to the Violin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).

Taruksin, Richard, *The Oxford History of Western Music*, 5 vols (rev. ed., New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010).

— *Text and Act* (Oxford, New York: Oxford University Press, 1995).

'Tone, n.' Oxford English Dictionary [online reference source] (Oxford University Press) <<http://dictionary.oed.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/203150?rskey=rw6O3G&result=1&isAdvanced=false#eid>> accessed 29 May 2010.

'Tone, v.' Oxford English Dictionary [online reference source] (Oxford University Press) <<http://dictionary.oed.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oed.com/view/Entry/203152?rskey=CGTDPV&result=2&isAdvanced=false#eid>> accessed 30 September 2011.

Wagner, Richard, 'Über das Dirigieren', in *Gesammelte Schriften und Dichtungen von Richard Wagner*, 8 vols (Leipzig, E. W. Fritsch, 1873), 8.328–410.

— *On Conducting*, trans. Edward Dannreuther [ebook] Project Gutenberg <<http://www.gutenberg.org/ebooks/4523>> accessed 30 December 2010.

Weininger, Otto, *Sex and Character: An Investigation of Fundamental Principles*, trans. Ladislaus Löb (Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University Press, 2005).

Windsor, W. Luke, 'Measurement and Models of Performance', in Susan Hallam, Ian Cross and Michael Thaut, eds, *The Oxford Handbook of Music Psychology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2009), 323–331.

Will, Barbara, *Gertrude Stein, Modernism, and the Problem of Genius* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2000).

Wolff, Christoph, 'Spitta, Philipp', in *Grove Music Online. Oxford Music Online* [online reference source] <<http://oxfordmusiconline.com>> access via subscription. University of Oxford access: <<http://www.oxfordmusiconline.com/subscriber/article/grove/music/26438>> accessed 23 September 2011.