VOLUME TWO

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AASS	Acta Sanctorum, Antwerp/Brussels 1643+
AB	Analecta Bollandiana, Brussels 1882+
AIΣ	Ἀνάλεκτα ἱεροσολυμιτικῆς σταχυολογίας, ed. A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, 5 vols., St. Petersburg 1891-1898.
AKBAW/PPHK	Abhandlungen der (königlich) bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. Philosophisch-philologische (und historische) Klasse, Munich 1835+
AP	Apophthegmata Patrum
BBGG	Bollettino della Badia Greca di Grottaferrata, Grottaferrata (Rome) 1929
BHG	Bibliotheca Hagiographica Graeca, Brussels 1957³ + 1969
BHL	Bibliotheca Hagiographica Latina, Brussels 1898 - 1901 + 1911
BLE	Bulletin de littérature ecclésiastique, Toulouse 1909+
BS	Bibliotheca Sanctorum, edd. F. Caraffa et al., 12 vols. + Indices, Rome 1961-1970.
BZ	Byzantinische Zeitschrift, Munich/Leipzig 1892+
CPG	Clavis Patrum Graecorum, ed. M. Geerard, vol. 2 [2000-5197] Turnhout 1974; vol. 3 [5200-8228] Turnhout 1979
CR	Compte-rendu
DHGE	Dictionnaire d'Histoire et de Géographie ecclésiastiques, Paris 1912+
DOP	Dumbarton Oaks Papers, Cambridge, Mass. 1941+
DSp	Dictionnaire de Spiritualité ascétique et mystique. Doctrine et histoire, Paris 1932+
DTC	Dictionnaire de Théologie Catholique, Paris 1923+
ECR	Eastern Churches Review, London 1966+

EEBΣ	Ἐπετηρὶς ἑταιρείας βυζαντινῶν σπουδῶν, Athens 1924+
EO	Echos d'Orient, Paris 1897+
GCS	Die griechischen christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten drei Jahrhunderte, Leipzig 1897+
GOTR	Greek Orthodox Theological Review, Brookline 1954+
GRBS	Greek Roman and Byzantine Studies, San Antonio/ Durham 1958+
HE	Historia Ecclesiastica
HL	Historia Lausiaca
HM	Historia Monachorum in Aegypto
HR	Historia Religiosa
JAC	Jahrbuch für Antike und Christentum, Münster 1958+
JEH	Journal of Ecclesiastical History, London 1950+
JOBG	Jahrbuch der österreichischen byzantinischen Gesellschaft, Vienna 1951+
JTS	Journal of Theological Studies, London 1900+
NF	Neue Folge
NPB	Nova patrum bibliotheca, ed. A. Mai, 7 vols., Rome 1852-1854; ed. G. Cozza-Luzi, vols 8-10, Rome 1871-1905.
NS	New Series
OCP	Orientalia Christiana Periodica, Rome 1935+
OLP	Orientalia Lovaniensia Periodica, Louvain 1970+
PG	J.P. Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus, series graeca, vols 1-161, Paris 1857-1866.
PGL	A Patristic Greek Lexicon, ed. G.W.H. Lampe, Oxford 1972.
PL	J.P. Migne, Patrologiae cursus completus, series latina, vols. 1-221, Paris 1844-1864.
PO	Patrologia Orientalis, Paris 1903+
PPS	Pravoslavniy palestinskiy sbornik', St. Petersburg 1881+
PW	Paulys Realencyklopädie der klassischen Altertumswissenschaft, edd. G. Wissowa/W. Kroll, Stuttgart 1893+

RAM	Revue d'ascétique et de mystique, Toulouse 1920+
RcSR	Recherches de science religieuse, Paris 1910+
REB	Revue des études byzantines, Paris 1946+
RHE	Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, Louvain 1900+
RHLR	Revue d'Histoire et de Littérature religieuses, Paris 1896+
ROC	Revue de l'Orient chrétien, Paris 1896+
RSLR	Rivista di Storia e Letteratura Religiosa, Florence 1965+
RSR	Revue des sciences religieuses, Strasbourg 1921+
SAWW/PHK	Sitzungsberichte der (kaiserlichen) Akademie der Wissenschaften (in Wien). Philologisch-historische Klasse, Vienna 1848+
SC	Sources Chrétiennes, Paris 1941+
SeT	Studi e Testi, Vatican City 1900+
SKBAW/PPHK	Sitzungsberichte der (königlich) bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften (zu München) Philosophisch-philologische und historische Klasse, Munich 1871+
SVTQ	St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly, Crestwood 1957+
TS	Theological Studies, New York 1940+
TU	Texte und Untersuchungen zur Geschichte der altchristlichen Literatur. Archiv für die griechisch-christlichen Schriftsteller der ersten drei Jahrhunderte, Leipzig/Berlin 1882+
VC	Vigiliae christianae, Amsterdam 1947+
VV	Vizantiyskiy Vremennik, St. Petersburg 1894+
ZIAN	Zapiski imperatorskoy akademii nauk' [po istoriko-filologicheskomu otdĕleniyu], St. Petersburg, 1726+
ZINU	Zapiski imperatorskago novorossiyskago universiteta, Odessa 1867+
ZKT	Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie, (Innsbruck), Vienna 1877+
ZMNP	Zhurnal' ministerstva narodnago prosvĕschcheniya, St. Petersburg 1834+

ZNW	Zeitshrift für die neutestamentliche Wissenschaft und die Kunde der älteren Kirche, Giessen 1900+/ Berlin 1934+
ZSSR/KA	Zeitschrift der Savigny-Stiftung für Rechtswissenschaft. Kanonistische Abteilung, Weimar 1880+

ADDENDA

EHR	English Historical Review, London 1886+
JRS	Journal of Roman Studies, London 1911+
ZKG	Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte, Stuttgart 1876+

CHAPTER ONE: NOTES

1. J. Pargoire, L'Eglise byzantine de 527 à 847, Paris 1905 is one of the rare sources of information for Byzantine cura pastoralis. H.-G. Beck, Kirche und theologische Literatur im byzantinischen Reich, Munich 1959 is disappointing in this area (see pp. 79-92) and H. Jedin, Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte, 6 vols., Freiburg etc. 1965-1973 has no sections for the Eastern church comparable to various chapters on pastoral care in the Latin church.

2. All dates in this study are to be read henceforward as AD.

3. Luther showed no interest in the practice or teaching of the Eastern church in the matter of penance: Resolutiones disputationum de indulgentiarum virtute (1518) Weimar. Ausgabe 1.525-628, especially pp. 545-548 and 551, and Confitendi ratio doctoris Martini Lutheri Augustiniani (1520) WA 6.158-169. Calvin's concern was more profound but did not go beyond Chrysostom: Institutions de la religion chrestienne, III.4 (ed. J. -D. Benoit, t. 3, Paris 1960, pp. 97-142). Catholic writers tended to be satisfied with contemporary Greek support for the practice of confession and showed little interest in the history of the Greek practice itself: Johann von Eck, De poenitentia et confessione secreta semper in ecclesia dei observata, contra Lutherum, libri duo, Ingolstadt 1522, caput 7 (no pagination); Marianus Victorius (Reatinus), De sacramento confessionis seu paenitentiae, historia..., Rome 1562; Robert Bellarmine, Disputationes de controversiis Christianae fidei adversus huius temporis haereticos, 3 vols., Ingolstadt 1586-1593, especially III.3, 5 and 10.

4. Important works in the period before Morin include: J. Filesac, "De confessionis secretae seu auricularis, ut vocant, usu et praxi apud Christianas gentes," an appendix to De origine paroeciarum, Paris 1615 and De poenitentia syntagma, Paris 1633; Gabriel de l'Aubespine, De veteribus ecclesiae ritibus observationum libri duo, Paris 1623; Antoine Arnauld, De la fréquente communion..., Paris 1643 and La tradition de l'église sur le suiet de la pénitence et de la communion..., Paris 1644; Denis Petau, De la pénitence publique et de la préparation à la communion, Paris 1644; J. Sirmond, Historia poenitentiae publicae, Paris 1651. Even the studies of Petrus Arcudius, De concordia ecclesiae occidentalis et orientalis in septem sacramentorum administratione, Paris 1619 and Leo Allatius, De ecclesiae occidentalis atque orientalis perpetua consensione libri tres, Cologne (Antwerp?) 1648 add little to the history of Byzantine penance.

5. The full title of the Paris edition of 1651 was Commentarius historicus de disciplina in administatione sacramentali poenitentiae tredecim primis seculis in ecclesia occidentali, et huc usque in orientali observata, in decem libros distinctus. Subsequent editions appeared at Antwerp in 1682 (reprinted Farnborough 1970), at Brussels in 1687 and finally at Venice in 1702. See also P.F. Palmer, "Jean Morin and the Problem of Private Penance," TS 6(1945) 317-357 and 7(1946) 281-308.

6. Commentarius..., VI. xxiii. 3, p. 420 (Antwerp 1682): "Testimonia multa istarum observationum huc non afferemus, eo quod ad finem operis huius antiquos Graecorum poenitentiales edimus, Ioannis scilicet Ieiunatoris Patriarchae Constantinopolitani...."

7. As, for example, the works of Jean Daillé, De sacramentali sive auriculari latinorum confessione disputatio, Geneva 1661, Noël Alexandre, Dissertatio de sacramentali confessione adversus Waldenses, Albigenses, et Wickleffianos in Calvinistis redivivos, qua Joannis Dallaei Calviniani ministri libri quattuor refelluntur, Paris 1678 and Jacques Boileau, Historia confessionis auricularis ex antiquis scripturae, patrum, pontificum et conciliorum monumentis cum cura et fide expressa, Paris 1684.

8. The full title: Enthusiasmus und Bussgewalt beim griechischen Mönchtum. Eine Studie zu Symeon dem Neuen Theologen, Leipzig 1898. Before Holl most treatments of Eastern penance ended with Chrysostom; exceptions were A.J. Binterim, Die vorzüglichsten Denkwürdigkeiten der Christ-Katholischen Kirche aus den ersten, mittlern und letzten Zeiten, 7 vols., Mainz 1825-1833 [especially V, ii, 227, 370-371, 386, 390, 402, 415-419 and V, iii, 272-277, 292, 313-314, 341-342, 361-362, 379-381, 383-390] and K. Frank, Die Bussdisciplin der Kirche von den Apostelzeiten bis zum siebenten Jahrhundert, Mainz 1867, especially pp. 650-664.

9. The other major study is J. Hörmann, Untersuchungen zur griechischen Laienbeicht. Ein Beitrag zur allgemeinenBussgeschichte, Donauwörth 1913, but the book is rare and Hörmann accepts the main lines of Holl's presentation with supplementary information and corrections. The article by E. Vacandard, "Confession du 1er au XIIIe Siècle. IIe Période [IVe-XIIIe siècle] 1. Discipline de l'Eglise Grecque," DTC 3.1:861-874, Paris 1906, is easily accessible but not greatly original. For other works see n. 36 below.

10. M. Lequien's text of this letter is reprinted among the works of John Damascene in PG 95.283-304. Holl's own critical edition is published in Enthusiasmus..., pp. 110-127. A new edition by Paramelle has yet to appear. See also the works cited in Chapter Four, n. 108 below.

11. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 273-288, 301-302.

12. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 259-273, 308-314, 321-325.

13. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 186-191, 314-322. Holl held that even in monastic practice it was only under Basil of Caesarea that confession first emerged as an expected and constitutive part of monastic discipline (pp. 261-270), although the practice itself was as old as monasticism. According to Holl this Basilian custom of confession had no influence on the practice of lay people (pp. 268-270).

14. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 191-211 and cf. John of Antioch, Oratio de disciplina monastica et de monasteriis laicis non tradendis 7, PG 132. 1128B-C who observes that the monks have been in effective possession of the ministry of confession for a period of four centuries (Enthusiasmus..., pp. 323-324).

15. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 314-319.

16. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 204, 208, 311, 321 and especially pp. 186-191.

17. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 285-290.

18. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 54, 77, 105-106, 131, 147, 153-155 etc.

19. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 119.24-120.15, 123.1-4, 124.12-21, 125.11-14.

20. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 328-331; nor was confession ever an obligation for Byzantine Christians according to Holl (pp. 304-308).

21. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., p. 153: "Das Mönchtum hat also nicht bloss die Bedeutung gehabt dass es das sittliche Ideal auf eine höhere Stufe hob, sondern es hat auch den Enthusiasmus in der Kirche wieder geweckt.... Ein Erbteil aus der alten Kirche ist somit auf das Mönchtum übergegangen...."

22. See V. Ermoni, "La pénitence dans l'histoire, à propos d'un ouvrage récent," Revue des questions historiques 34 (1900) 5-55; G. Rauschen, Eucharistie und Busssakrament in den ersten sechs Jahrhunderten der Kirche, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1908, and the article by Vacandard cited in n. 9 above.

23. A good example is Vacandard who on occasion simply refers his readers to Holl for pages at a time (DTC 3.1:866). J. Pargoire is an exception to this rule. While his treatment of penance is brief, it is clearly based on an independent reading of the sources: L'Eglise byzantine..., pp. 94-95, 225-226, 344-350. Protestant authorities have followed Holl closely: H. Karpp, "Busse II. Busswesen in den christlichen Kirchen," Evangelisches Kirchenlexicon, vol. 1, Göttingen 1956, cc. 631-635 and P. Meinhold, "Busswesen II. In der christlichen Kirche," Die Religion in Gegenwart und Geschichte, 3rd edition, vol. 1, Tübingen 1957, cc. 1544-1554. It is disappointing that B. Poschmann allots scarcely a dozen lines to Byzantine matters in his very influential summary of the history of penance: Busse und Letzte Ölung, Freiburg 1951, pp. 51-52, 63. The revised English edition (Penance and the Anointing of the Sick, London 1964, pp. 99, 120) adds nothing more despite B. Schultze's criticism of the lack of attention Poschmann had shown to Eastern sources and problems (OCP 18 [1952] 43).

24. See the lengthy review by N.S. Suvorov in VV 6(1899) 475-524, a far more searching examination of Holl's book than anything that appeared in Western Europe.

25. E. Herman has provided a useful and accessible, though incomplete, list of these studies in "Il più antico penitenziale greco," OCP 19 (1953) 71-125 at pp. 72-78. The following works should be added to his list: V.N. Beneševič, "CR: A.I. Almazov, Taynaya ispověd' v' pravoslavnoy vostochnoy tserkvi," ZMNP 353(1904) 231-244, 397-425; A. Dmitrievsky, "Taynaya ispověd' v' izsledovanii prof. A.I. Almazova (kriticheskii etyud')," Trudy kievskoy dukhovnoy Akademii (1897) 3.11:419-452 and 3.12:623-638; N.S. Suvorov, "K' istorii nravstvennago ucheniya v' vostochnoy tserkvi," VV 10(1903) 31-62; P. Gidulianov, "Vopros' o taynoy ispovědi i dukhovnikakh' vostochnoy tserkvi v' nověyshey russkoy literaturě," VV 14(1907) 399-442.

26. A. Palmieri, then the Russian correspondent for the Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique, was one of the few who tried to bring Western scholars to explore the works of their Russian colleagues. His long review of S.I. Smirnov, Dukhovniy otets v' drevnei vostochnoy tserkvi, vol. 1, Sergiev Posad 1906 in the Rivista storico-critica delle scienze teologice 3(1907) 121-133 concluded with a warning that Western theologians could no longer afford to neglect Russian scholarship (p. 133). Herman has been almost alone in responding to this call; cf. V. Grumel, Les régestes des actes du patriarcat de Constantinople, vol. 1.1, Paris 1972², N. 270, pp. 197-201.

27. This is especially true of the collection of liturgical texts in the third volume of Almazov's study of confession, Taynaya ispověd'..., 3 vols., Odessa 1894-1896, in which over sixty manuscripts from Russia, France, Italy and Greece are represented. The textual corrections and criticisms of Dmitrievsky and the remarks of Beneševič in the articles cited in n. 25 above should accompany the use of Almazov's texts. Also of importance is the edition by Suvorov of penitential texts from Monacensis 498 ("Věroyatny sostav drevněyshago ispovědnago i pokayannago ustava v' vostochnoy tserkvi," VV 8[1901] 357-434 and 9[1902] 378-417) and from Vindobonensis Theolo-

gicus Graecus 333 ("K' istorii nravstvennago ucheniya...," pp. 55-62).

28. This was especially true of the debate between A.S. Pavlov and N.S. Suvorov: Herman, "Il più antico...," pp. 74-76. For a more detailed presentation of the results see the article by Gidulianov cited in n. 25 above.

29. The most important of their works are the following: Suvorov, K' voprosu o taynoy ispovědi i o dukhovnikakh' v' vostochnoy tserkvi, Moscow 1906[2] and Ob'em' distsiplinarnago suda i yurisdiktsii tserkvi v' period' vselenskikh' soborov', Moscow 1906[2]; Smirnov, Dukhovniy otets..., vol. 1, Sergiev Posad 1906.

30. Suvorov, Ob'em'..., pp. 20-87.

31. Suvorov, Ob'em'..., pp. 88-169.

32. Suvorov, K' voprosu..., pp. 155-174.

33. The promised second volume to Smirnov's Dukhovniy otets..., which was to deal with the question of lay confession (meaning confession to unordained monks), was never published.

34. Smirnov, Dukhovniy otets..., pp. 117, 200.

35. Smirnov, Dukhovniy otets..., pp. 314-328.

36. To the titles already cited in nn. 9, 22, 23 and 25 above, the following should be added.

HISTORICA: H. Koch, "Zur Geschichte der Bussdisziplin und Bussgewalt in der orientalischen Kirche," Historisches Jahrbuch 21(1900) 58-78; F. Diekamp, "Brief an einen Sünder. Zur Geschichte des griechischen Busswesens," in Aus Ethik und Leben. Festschrift Joseph Mausbach zur Vollendung des siebzigsten Lebenjahres (7 Februar 1931), edd. M. Meinertz/A. Donders, Münster 1931, pp. 43-54; H. Dörries, "The Place of Confession in Ancient Monasticism," in Studia Patristica 5, ed. F.L. Cross [= TU 80], Berlin 1962, pp. 284-311; E. Timiades, Αἱ ἀρχαὶ τῆς μετανοίας , Athens 1967[1966]; K. Rahner, Frühe Bussgeschichte in Einzeluntersuchungen. Schriften zur Theologie, vol. 11, Zürich etc. 1973; M.-F. Berrouard, "La pénitence publique durant les six premiers siècles. Histoire et sociologie," La Maison-Dieu N° 118(1974) 92-130; J. van Rossum, "Priesthood and Confession in St. Symeon the New Theologian," SVTQ 20(1976) 220-228.

LITURGICA: P. de Meester, Studi sui sacramenti amministrati secondo il rito bizantino, Rome 1947; A. Raes, "Les formulaires grecs du rite de la pénitence," in Mélanges en l'honneur de Monseigneur Michel Andrieu, Strasbourg 1956, pp. 365-372; L. Ligier, "Pénitence et Eucharistie en Orient. Théologie sur une interférence de prières et de rites," OCP 29(1963) 5-78 with "Dimension personnelle et dimension communautaire de la pénitence en Orient," La Maison-Dieu N° 90(1967) 155-188 and "Le sacrement de pénitence selon la tradition orientale," Nouvelle revue théologique 89(1967) 940-967; F. van de Paverd, "La pénitence dans le rite byzantin," Questions liturgiques 54(1973) 191-203; G. Winkler, "Über der Busscharakter der byzantinischen Missa Praesanctificatorum," Ephemerides Liturgicae 88 (1974) 117-123; A. Pistoia/A. Triacca edd., Liturgie et rémission des péchés, Rome 1975.

CANONICA: P. Seriski, Poenae in iure byzantino ecclesiastico ab initiis ad saeculum XI (1054), Rome 1941; E. Herman, "Hat die byzantinische Kirche von selbst eintretende Strafen (poenae latae

sententiae) gekannt?" BZ 44(1951) 258-264; B. Botte, "Les plus anciennes collections canoniques," L'Orient syrien 5(1960) 331-350; J. Hajjar, Le synode permanent (ΣΥΝΟΔΟΣ ΕΝΔΗΜΟΥΣΑ) dans l'église byzantine des origines au XIe siècle, Rome 1962; J. Gaudemet, "Nomokanon," PW Supplementband 10, Stuttgart 1965, cc. 417-429; J. H. Erickson, "Penitential Discipline in the Orthodox Canonical Tradition," SVTQ 21(1977) 191-206.

MISCELLANEA: J. Bossy, "The Social History of Confession in the Age of the Reformation," Transactions of the Royal Historical Society 5th Series, 25(1975) 21-38; H.P. Forshaw, The Pastoral Ministry of the Priest-Confessor in the Early Middle Ages, 600-1100, Dissertation: University of London 1975; T. N. Tentler, Sin and Confession on the Eve of the Reformation, Princeton 1977; E. Dassman, Sündenvergebung durch Taufe, Busse und Martyrerfürbitte, Münster 1973.

The patient and even courageous work of Benešević in carrying his critical editions of Greek canonical sources through to publication also deserves mention here: Syntagma canonum XIV Titulorum, Petrograd 1905; "Monumenta Vaticana ad Ius Canonicum Pertinentia," Studi Bizantini 2(1927) 127-186; Ioannis Scholastici Synagoga L Titulorum, Munich 1937.

37. See nn. 25-35 above. Much valuable but unused research still lies buried in the notes and appendices of these Russian works.

38. Among the serious weaknesses are Holl's identification of John the Faster, that is, the author of the Byzantine penitential, with an eleventh-century monastic figure (Enthusiasmus..., pp. 289-301) and his use of the canons attributed to Nicephorus (pp. 250 n. 1, 282, 319, 326) as ninth-century documents. See Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.2, Kadiköy 1936, NN. 405-407, pp. 35-39.

39. The study by J. Seiber, The Urban Saint in Early Byzantine Social History, Oxford 1977, is less cogent in many points of detail because of its restricted choice of only the "best" hagiographical texts.

40. An invaluable introduction to the topic by F. Halkin, "L'hagiographie byzantine au service de l'histoire," in Proceedings of the XIIIth International Congress of Byzantine Studies. Oxford 5-10 Sept. 1966, edd. J.M. Hussey/D. Obolensky/S. Runciman, London 1967 pp. 345-354 with further references there. See also the dissertation of H.J. Magoulias, The Lives of the Saints as Sources of Data for Sixth and Seventh Century Byzantine Social and Economic History, Harvard 1962 and the subsequent articles: "The Lives of the Saints as Sources of Data for the History of Byzantine Medicine in the Sixth and Seventh Centuries," BZ 57(1964) 127-150; "The Lives of Byzantine Saints as Sources of Data for the History of Magic in the VIth and VIIth Centuries: Sorcery, Relics and Icons," Byzantion 37 (1967) 228-269; "Bathhouse, Inn, Tavern, Prostitution and the Stage in the Lives of the Saints of the Sixth and Seventh Centuries," EEBΣ 38(1971) 233-252; "The Lives of the Saints as Sources of Data for the History of Commerce in the Byzantine Empire in the VIth and VIIth Centuries," κληρονομία 3(1971) 303-330. To this list may be added: E. Patlagean, "Ancienne hagiographie byzantine et histoire sociale," Annales. Economies, Sociétés, Civilisations 23[1-2](1968) 106-126; D. Z. de F. Abrahamse, Hagiographic Sources for Byzantine Cities. 500-900 AD, Dissertation: University of Michigan 1967; J.W. Nesbitt, "The Life of St. Philaretos (702-792) and Its Significance for Byzantine Agriculture," GOTR 14(1969) 150-158; the welcome reprint of A.P. Rudakov, Ocherki vizantijskoj kul'tury po dannym grecheskoj agiografii, rp. London 1970; P. Brown, "The Rise and Function of the

Holy Man in Late Antiquity," JRS 61(1971) 80-101 and "A Dark Age Crisis: Aspects of the Iconoclastic Controversy," EHR 88(1973) 1-34;J.Wortley, "The Vita Sancti Andreae Sali as a Source of Byzantine Social History," Societas 4(1974) 1-20; W.E. Kaegi Jr., "Notes on Hagiographic Sources for Some Institutional Changes and Continuities in the Early Seventh Century," Byzantina 7(1975) 59-70; E. Gamillscheg, "Historische Gegebenheiten im Spiegel hagiographischer Texte," JÖBG 25(1975) 1-23; K.M. Ringrose, Saints, Holy Men and Byzantine Society 726-843, Dissertation: Rutgers University 1976; A. Moffatt, "Schooling in the Iconoclast Centuries," in Iconoclasm, edd. A. Bryer/J. Herrin, Birmingham 1977, pp. 85-92; I. Ševčenko, "Hagiography of the Iconoclast Period," in Iconoclasm, pp. 113-131. The list is by no means exhaustive.

41. Halkin, "L'hagiographie byzantine...," p. 347; cf. the reservations of Patlagean, "Ancienne hagiographie...," pp. 106-107 and 107 n. 1 and C. Mango, Byzantine Literature as a Distorting Mirror, Oxford 1975.

42. Patlagean, "Ancienne hagiographie...," pp. 106-119 and Brown, "The Rise and Function...," pp. 86-91.

43. Brown, "The Rise and Function...," pp. 90-91; Patlagean, "Ancienne hagiographie...," p. 112.

44. Cf. C. Lévi-Strauss, Structural Anthropology, London 1968, p. 281 and p. 21.

45. A theme well illustrated in M. Douglas, Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo, London 1966.

46. See n. 39 above. In collecting evidence for penance Holl, Hörmann and Pargoire together used only 28 Lives, scarcely even a fraction of the available material.

47. F. Halkin, Bibliotheca Hagiographica Graeca, 3 vols., Brussels 1957 and Auctarium Bibliothecae Hagiographicae Graecae, Brussels 1969. These four volumes must always be used together, and henceforward all references to the BHG will presume that the combined information of the four volumes under the appropriate BHG number is taken as read.

48. The work of H. Delehaye is fundamental: Cinq leçons sur la méthode hagiographique, Brussels 1934; Les légendes hagiographiques, Brussels 1955⁴; Les Passions des martyrs et les genres littéraires, Brussels 1966, 2nd ed. rev. For the manuscripts see A. Ehrhard, Überlieferung und Bestand der hagiographischen und homiletischen Literatur der griechischen Kirche, 3 vols., Leipzig 1937-1952 [= TU 50-52]; Hagiographi Bollandiani/P. Franchi de' Cavalieri, Catalogus codicum hagiographicorum graecorum bibliothecae Vaticanae, Brussels 1899; C. Van de Vorst/H. Delehaye, Catalogus codicum hagiographicorum graecorum Germaniae Belgii Angliae, Brussels 1913; F. Halkin, Manuscrits grecs de Paris. Inventaire hagiographique, Brussels 1968.

49. H. Delehaye, L'oeuvre des Bollandistes à travers trois siècles, 1615-1915, 2nd ed. Brussels 1959 and P. Peeters, Figures bollandiennes contemporaines, Brussels 1948. For the pitfalls which may trap the unwary see Delehaye, Les légendes..., pp. 202-217.

50. The Epistula itself has not been dated but it is likely that it falls within the period from 981 to 1005. See J. Darrouzès, Syméon le Nouveau Théologien. Chapitres théologiques, gnostiques et pratiques,

Paris 1957, pp. 9-11 and Chapter Four, n. 108 below. For the synaxaria see Chapter Five, nn. 214-215 below.

51. For the shape of penance in the Greek tradition and for the relationship of the present rite to the past see de Meester, Studi..., pp. 134-156 and van de Paverd, "La pénitence...," pp. 191-203 with the bibliography and sources cited there.

52. It is true that Novatianism had made the very existence of ecclesiastical penance a theological issue, and that the refutation of Novatianism continued throughout this period as a standard entry in the lists of heresies; cf. M. Richard, "Le Traité de Georges hiéromoine sur les hérésies," REB 28(1970) 239-269 at pp. 254.22-255.20. Nevertheless, the issue of the ministry of penance in relation to church order arose and was ultimately settled within the church (Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 326-331).

53. A convenient summary of the issues with extensive bibliography can be found in Rahner, Frühe Bussgeschichte..., pp. 19-45 and 499-512 to which the following should be added: G.d'Ercole, "Foro interno e foro esterno nella penitenza delle origini cristiane," Apollinaris 32(1959) 273-302 and the extremely valuable analysis by J. Bernhard, "Excommunication et pénitence-sacrement aux premiers siècles de l'Eglise," Revue de droit canonique 15(1965) 265-281, 318-330 and 16 (1966) 41-70.

54. See, for example, the debate between P. Galtier and R.C. Mortimer; Galtier: L'Eglise et la rémission des péchés aux premiers siècles, Paris 1932 and "Comment on écarte la pénitence privée," Gregorianum 21(1940) 183-202 - Mortimer: The Origins of Private Penance in the Western Church, Oxford 1939. For the underlying difficulties attached to the resolution of any of these problems see the remarks of S.L. Greenslade reviewing J. Grotz, Die Entwicklung des Bussstufenwesens in der vornicänischen Kirche, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1955, in JTS NS 8(1957) 330-333.

55. The shift began with B. Xiberta, Clavis Ecclesiae. De ordine absolutionis sacramentalis ad reconciliationem cum Ecclesia, Rome 1922 (reprinted with new introduction by J. Perarnau in Analecta Sacra Tarraconensia 45(1972) 241*-341*). It is reflected in the work of Rahner and is well illustrated by a recent thesis of M. Mügge, Reconciliatio cum ecclesia. Eine dogmengeschichtliche Untersuchung über den ekklesiologischen Aspekt des Bussakramentes, Dissertation: Münster(Westfalen) 1975.

56. Whether the famous text in Origen, Homilia 2.6 in Psalmum 37 (PG 12. 1386A-1387A) points to this kind of spiritual direction/confession between laymen has long been a matter of dispute; cf. Grotz, Die Entwicklung..., pp. 206-229. For monastic penance see n. 61 below.

57. For the rigorist groups see B. Poschmann, Paenitentia Secunda: Die kirchliche Busse im ältesten Christentum bis Cyprian und Origenes, Bonn 1940, pp. 261-348 and H. Vogt, Coetus Sanctorum. Der Kirchenbegriff des Novatian und die Geschichte einer Sonderkirche, Bonn 1968. Episcopal ἔλεγχος/νουθεσία: Didascalia Apostolorum 2.6.10-17, 2.10.4, 2.37.1-4 ed. F.-X. Funk, Didascalia et Constitutiones Apostolorum, Paderborn 1905, vol. 1, pp. 40.15/42.18, 46.8-10, 122.20/126.9. The priest-penitentiary: Socrates HE 5.19, ed. R. Hussey, Oxford 1853, vol. 2, pp. 614.1-616.15 and Sozomen, HE 7.16, edd. J. Bidez/G. Hansen [= GCS 50], pp. 322.17-324.15. The Bussstufen: J. Grotz, Die Entwicklung..., passim with texts and literature.

58. E. Herman, "Il più antico...," pp. 84-85, 118-120.

59. For the Kanonarion see Morin, Commentarius historicus..., [ed. 1682] Appendix, pp. 108C-114E, 116A-E (penances) and 115A-115E (rite and absolution).

60. The possibility of Western influence on this development is another matter relevant here; cf. H.-F. Schmid, "Pénitentiels byzantins et occidentaux," in Actes du VIe Congrès international d'études byzantines. Paris 27 juillet - 2 août 1948, vol. 1, Paris 1950, pp. 359-363.

61. See the fundamental study by I. Hausherr, Direction spirituelle en Orient autrefois, Rome 1955 to which add two of his other works: "L'origine de la théorie orientale des huit péchés capitaux," Orientalia Christiana 30.3(1933) 164-175 and Penthos. La doctrine de la componction dans l'Orient chrétien, Rome 1944.

62. The monastic literature of the Apophthegmata Patrum and of the other collections (Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Historia Lausiaca, Historia Religiosa, Pratum spirituale) are a fund of illustration for these different circumstances.

63. The real danger of introducing anachronistic canonical distinctions into earlier literature must be recognized here and guarded against; but cf. Chapter Two, n. 143 and Chapter Five, nn. 58-61 below.

64. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 136-137, 312-326 and Hörmann, Untersuchungen.... pp. 252-270.

65. Hausherr, Direction spirituelle..., pp. 105-110, 213-229.

66. The lists provided by Beck, Kirche..., pp. 402-413, 459-467, 506-515, 557-582 and J. Nesbitt, "A Geographical and Chronological Guide to Greek Saint Lives," OCP 35(1969) 443-489 are very useful but by no means complete.

67. For Antonius III Studites see Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.2, Kadiköy 1936, NN. 798, 799, pp. 228-229 and A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, "Ἀντώνιος Στουδίτης," Νέα Σιών 2(1905) 807-815.

68. Towards the same end every chapter, and indeed each major section within the chapters, has been provided with a set of general observations and conclusions.

69. The principle that a Life reflects the circumstances of its author has been followed in general, but absolute consistency in the assignment of Vitae to Constantinople or to other geographical areas has not always been possible, especially when authors and subjects moved from place to place.

70. G. Dagron provides the most recent and convenient summary of the evidence: Naissance d'une capitale. Constantinople et ses institutions de 330 à 451, Paris 1974, pp. 367-517.

71. On the population of Constantinople Dagron is cautious (Naissance..., pp. 518-541), but suggests an increase from about 20-30,000 to 150,000+ in the course of the fourth century (pp. 524-525).

72. Each separate number in the BHG is counted as a document in this

reckoning; consult the Index Vitarum in the bibliography. Despite the large numbers of these documents the temptation to arrange them in statistical charts and comparisons has been resisted. Moreover, when the distribution of these sources over a period of 600 years is recalled, the real numbers applicable to a given time have no mathematical significance and any statistics formed on such a basis would be meaningless.

73. Three Lives have been consulted only in the portions published to date: Euthymius Sardensis (BHG 2145), Gregentius (BHG 705) and Gregory of Nyssa (BHG 717). Of the unpublished Vitae the absence of the following is most to be regretted: a) from Constantinople - Dius (BHG 2105), Hilarion of the monastery of Dalmatus (BHG 2177) and the priest Sampson (BHG 1614z); b) from outside the City - Donatus of Euroea (BHG 2111, 2112), Nicon Iordanites (BHG 2315), Nilus of Ancyra (BHG 2316), Theodorus "Graptus" (BHG 1745z) and Timothy of Proconnesus (BHG 2459).

74. All Passiones which suggested any possible relevance to penance, either by character or by plot, have been included. The sample is more than representative.

75. Most of the hagiographical material of the Cappadocians, Chrysostom, Asterius and others of the period is homiletical by nature. However, it forms an essential part of the hagiographical tradition and confirms the close link between the cult of the saints and their Vitae; cf. Delehaye, Cinq leçons..., pp. 10-13.

76. BHG 1317d-1322zk and BHG 1433-1450zz. Dated collections like the Historia Religiosa or the Pratum spirituale have been included as have other collections linked to a particular name (Daniel, Zosimas), but here too complete consistency has not been possible. Moreover, many promising texts remain undated and unpublished: BHG 1318nb, 1322zd, 1450zp.

77. The main collection of the Apophthegmata Patrum (BHG 1443-1444) has been omitted for this reason. A separate study of its penitential teaching able to take into account the complexities of text and tradition would be most valuable.

78. Some of the early apocryphal Acts of the Apostles are extant only in Latin, for example, Acta Petri (BHL 6656). Other Lives are simply too important not to be consulted: Symeon Stylites, Cyril and Methodius; cf. Chapter Four, n. 79 below.

79. An excellent example of the topos in Vita Elizabeth 4 (BHG 2121) ed. Halkin, p. 256.14-17 with n. 4.

80. In a few cases, such as that of Peter of Atroa (BHG 2364, 2365), this principle may result in the dating of certain pieces of evidence a few years later than might be possible otherwise, but in the great majority of cases the obvious elements of literary convention and outright fiction in the Lives demand that the principle be respected.

81. Where a Life is uncertainly dated, the latest of the possible choices has always been preferred. A separate category has been created to contain Vitae which are clearly pre-Metaphrastic but which cannot be given a firm terminus ad quem; cf. Chapter Five, pp. 180-185 below.

CHAPTER TWO: NOTES

1. Socrates, HE 5.19, ed. Hussey, vol. 2, Oxford 1853, pp. 614.1-616.15; Sozomen, HE 7.16, edd. Bidez/Hansen [=GCS 50], pp. 322.17-324.15. For a discussion of the evidence for ecclesiastical penance in these two authors see J. Ibañez Ibañez and F. Mendoza Ruiz, "La praxis penitencial y sus presupuestos teologicos en los historiadores griegos de la epoca constantiniana," in El sacramento de la penitencia. Otros estudios. XXX Semana española de teologia 14-18 Sept. 1970, Madrid 1972, pp. 197-221 at pp. 202-209. Reference to the Nectarius incident may be found in every history of penance and in most church histories as well. F. Frank, "Die verhängnisvolle Beicht zu Konstantinopel unter der Regierung des Patriarchen Nektarius," Theologische Quartalschrift 49(1867) 529-558 has given a brief résumé (pp. 542-548) of previous interpretations. Further extended treatments of the incident after the time of Frank can be found in: G. Rauschen, Jahrbücher der christlichen Kirche unter dem Kaiser Theodosius dem Grossen, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1897, pp. 537-544; Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 246-253 and 274-275; E. Vacandard, "L'origine des prêtres-pénitenciers," Revue du clergé français 42(1905) 361-386, 449-456 (= a reply to Vacandard by P. Batiffol) and 640-643.

2. Cf. K. Frank, Die Bussdisciplin der Kirche..., pp. 651-652; Rauschen, Eucharistie und Busssakrament..., pp. 147-148.

3. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 274-275; Poschmann, Penance and the Anointing of the Sick, pp. 98-99. The Nectarius incident requires a new study which will take into account its relationship to the Thessalonica massacre and Theodosius' penance at Milan and also its relationship to the tension at Constantinople between the Orthodox and the Arian-Macedonian elements in the wake of the emperor's policy of religious coercion.

4. The literature includes: P. Galtier, "Saint Jean Chrysostome et la confession," RcSR 1(1910) 209-240, 313-350; A. Lagarde [= J. Turmel] "St. Jean Chrysostome a-t-il connu la confession?" RHLR NS 4(1913) 540-559, 5(1914) 26-62; H. Keane, "The Sacrament of Penance in St. John Chrysostom," Irish Theological Quarterly 14(1919) 305-317; J. Korbacher, Ausserhalb der Kirche kein Heil? Eine dogmengeschichtliche Untersuchung über Kirche und Kirchenzugehörigkeit bei Johannes Chrysostomus, Munich 1963; F. Leduc, "Péché et conversion chez S. Jean Chrysostome," Proche Orient Chrétien 26(1976) 34-58, 27(1977) 15-42.

5. Compare the evidence gathered for the litany of penitents at Antioch and at Constantinople in F. van de Paverd, Zur Geschichte der Messliturgie in Antiocheia und Konstantinopel gegen Ende des vierten Jahrhunderts. (Analyse der Quellen bei Johannes Chrysostomus), Rome 1970, pp. 184-198, 453-460.

6. Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.1, Paris 1972^{2}, N. 26, pp. 20-21.

7. Many of the materials for the Bussstufen have been collected in Grotz, Die Entwicklung..., pp. 478-485.

8. Cf. Berrouard, "La pénitence publique...," pp. 118-119. Holl stresses the existence of a diversity of penitential methods of which the Bussstufen represented only one: Enthusiasmus..., pp. 240-253.

9. For the movement of canonical texts and traditions and for the influence of certain regions and centres see: E. Schwartz, "Die Kanonessammlungen der alten Reichskirche," ZSSR/KA 56(1936) 1-114 especially pp. 33-43; W. Selb, "Die Kanonessammlungen der orientalischen

Kirche und das griechische Corpus Canonum der Reichskirche," in Speculum Iuris et Ecclesiarum. Festschrift W.M. Plöchl, Vienna 1967, pp. 371-383; E. Honigmann, Trois mémoires posthumes d'histoire et de géographie de l'Orient chrétien, Brussels 1961, pp. 1-83; F. van de Paverd, "Die Quellen der kanonischen Briefe Basileios des Grossen," OCP 38(1972) 5-63.

10. It ought not to be forgotten that episcopal discretion in the administration of ecclesiastical penance was an acknowledged reality even in areas where a detailed penitential "system" is well attested: Basil of Caesarea, canon 3, 54, 84, PG 32.672C, 796B, 808A-809A; Gregory of Nyssa, canon 4, 5, PG 45.228D-229C, 233B-D; cf. also Ancyra, canon 2, Mansi 2.513B and the role of the bishop in Didascalia Apostolorum 2.11.1-2 and 2.18.2, ed Funk, pp. 46.17-23 and 64.21-25. For the understanding of οἰκονομία and its role in the Eastern canonical tradition see P. Rai, "L'économie dans le droit canonique byzantin des origines jusqu'au XIe siècle," Istina 18(1973) 260-326 and J.H. Erickson, "Oikonomia in Byzantine Canon Law," in Law, Church and Society. Essays in Honor of Stephan Kuttner, edd. K. Pennington/R. Somerville, University Park 1977, pp. 225-236.

11. The elements of the civil-episcopal relationship are set out with a guide to the bibliography and texts in K.L. Noethlichs, "Materialien zum Bischofsbild aus der spätantiken Rechtsquellen," JAC 16(1973) 28-59, especially pp. 36-48.

12. "L'établissement de l'orthodoxie en 380 est donc, comme celui de l'arianisme en 360, une manière de coup d'Etat qui traduit les visées politiques de l'empereur sur Constantinople et brouille la ville avec son Eglise officielle." (Dagron, Naissance..., p. 451 and cf. pp. 422-425 and 436-442). See also Socrates, HE 5.7.3, 5.10.25-26, 5.20.4-7, ed. Hussey, vol. 2, Oxford 1853, pp. 581-582, 594, 617-618; W. Ensslin, Die Religionspolitik des Kaisers Theodosius des Grossen, Munich 1953, p. 8; G. Dagron, "Les moines et la ville. Le monachisme à Constantinople jusqu'au concile de Chalcédoine," Travaux et Mémoires 4(1970) 229-276 at pp. 246-249 and 253-257.

13. The rite is found in the so-called Seventh canon of Constantinople (381) and was later included in the canonical tradition as the 95th canon of the Trullan Council of 691-692. Text in Conciliorum Oecumenicorum Decreta, edd. J. Alberigo et al., 3rd ed. Bologna 1973, p. 35. Honigmann dated the original text to 428 as part of the kanonikon of Ephesus: Trois mémoires..., pp. 74-80.

14. It was common to distinguish between the guilt of the heretical leader and of followers; Vita Athanasii 24, 30-31[BHG 186] edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1092A-B, 1117C-1120A. The distinction may imply that reconciliation for the followers was less formal and perhaps not even individual.

15. Gregory Nazianzen, Gregory Nyssa, John Chrysostom and Proclus of Constantinople are among those who appealed to their hearers not to delay their baptism. See, for example, Gregory Nyssa, Adversus eos qui differunt baptismum oratio, PG 46.416C-432A.

16. Evidence for the Novatianist presence is in R. Janin, "Les novatiens orientaux," EO 28(1929) 385-397 and Vogt, Coetus Sanctorum..., pp. 276-290.

17. D. Chitty, The Desert a City, Oxford 1966, pp. 1-28, 208-209 observes that the year 330 is marked as the moment when the influence of the

great monastic champions of Egypt and Palestine began to spread outwards and into the life of the wider church. For the particular circumstances of monasticism at Constantinople see: Dagron, "Les moines ...," especially pp. 274-275; H. Bacht, "Die Rolle des orientalischen Mönchtums in den kirchenpolitischen Auseinandersetzungen um Chalkedon," and L. Ueding, "Die Kanones von Chalkedon in ihrer Bedeutung für Mönchtum und Klerus," in Das Konzil von Chalkedon, edd. A. Grillmeier/H. Bacht, 3 vols., Würzburg 1951-1954, vol. 2, pp. 431-519 and 569-676.

18. Evidence of the anti-monastic reaction collected by P. de Labriolle, ("Les débuts du monachisme," in Histoire de l'Eglise, edd. A. Fliche/V. Martin, vol. 3, Paris 1936, pp. 299-369 at pp. 358-364) should not be overlooked in this context. Monastic "influence" in specific areas of ordinary Christian life cannot simply be presumed where its presence has not been demonstrated.

19. The formal or literary relationship of the Christian Vitae to earlier pagan sources, as, for example, the Life of Apollonius of Tyana, lies outside the scope of this study. The state of the question is discussed conveniently in F. Lo Cascio, La forma lettararia della Vita di Apollonio Tianeo, Palermo 1974, pp. 82-96. The interest of this study will be focussed instead on Christian antecedents to the hagiographical flowering of the fourth century.

20. The importance of genre to an appreciation of historical usefulness is the burden of the works by Delehaye, Les Passions des martyrs..., and G. Lazzati, Gli sviluppi della letteratura sui martiri nei primi quattro secoli, Turin 1956.

21. These include the Vitae of the martyrs Acacius (BHG 13), Agathonicus (BHG 40), Horaeozele (BHG 2179), Lucillianus et socii (BHG 998y, 999a, 999b), Mocius (BHG 1298, 1298b, 1298c), Paula (BHG 2361) and those of the early bishops Metrophanes and Alexander (BHG 1278y, 1279, 1280).

22. See H. Delehaye, "Les saints de Thrace et de Mésie," AB 31(1912) 161-300 at pp. 225-240. The Acta of these earliest Byzantine martyrs are a tissue of topoi common to the genre of the Passio, and the episcopal Vitae are accounts "written up" from materials already to hand in the works of the fifth-century church historians.

23. T.D. Barnes, "Pre-Decian Acta Martyrum," JTS NS 19(1968) 509-531 at pp. 527-528. It may be emphasized here once and for all that "historicity" is not the only quality of a Vita that is of concern to this study. Even totally imaginary accounts of the past can reflect information about attitudes and institutions belonging to the author's own time.

24. Acta martyrum Lugdunensium 1.26 (BHG 1573) ed. Musurillo, p. 70.3-4.

25. Acta martyrum Lugdunensium 2.6-8 (BHG 1573) ed. Musurillo, p. 84.4-16, especially Acta 2.8: ταῦτα καὶ περὶ τῆς τῶν μακαρίων ἐκείνων πρὸς τοὺς παραπεπτωκότας τῶν ἀδελφῶν στοργῆς ὠφελίμως προσκείσθω, τῆς ἀπανθρώπου καὶ ἀνηλεοῦς ἕνεκα διαθέσεως τῶν μετὰ ταῦτα ἀφειδῶς τοῖς Χριστοῦ μέλεσι προσενηνεγμένων.

26. The ὁμολόγησις of the martyr refers only to the confession of faith that causes his death: Acta martyrum Lugdunensium 1.26 (BHG 1573) ed. Musurillo, p. 70.3-4. Compare the place given to the martyr's prayer just before execution in H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, p. lii.

27. See V. Reichmann, Römische Literatur in griechischer Übersetzung, Leipzig 1943, pp. 14-16. Musurillo speaks of the Passion of Perpetua and Felicity as the "archetype of all later Acts of the Christian martyrs": Acts..., p. xxv.

28. Acta Perpetuae et Felicitatis 12.6 and 13.1-3,5-6 (BHG 1482) ed. van Beek, pp. 33.13-15 and 33.18/35.1-5,7-12.

29. Eusebius' own work includes the De martyribus Palaestinae (BHG 1193) and the fragments dealing with Pamphilus (BHG 1405/1406), Apphianus and Aedesius (BHG 161) and Theodosia (BHG 1775). The Historia Ecclesiastica contains earlier Acta of Apollonius (HE 5.21.2-5), Marinus (HE 7.15.1-5), Potamiaena and Basilides (HE 6.5.1-7) and Phileas (HE 8.10.1-12). For the dates of these texts (all before 324) see J. Moreau, "Eusèbe de Césarée en Palestine," DHGE 15.1451-1455, Paris 1961-1963.

30. This is most interestingly illustrated by the case of the soldier Marinus who is taken into a church by his bishop during the hour of grace accorded him before execution. There his faith is strengthened before the trial, but no reference is made to any confession or absolution or indeed to anything penitential by way of preparation for an imminent death: Acta Marini 4 [= Eusebius, HE 7.15.4] ed. Schwartz, pp. 668.24/670.5; cf. Antiquorum martyriorum collectio 5 (BHG 1182) ed. Iriarte, PG 20.1528C-D. It is a topos that martyrs facing death intercede for others rather than for themselves: Acta Potamiaenae et Basilidis 3 [= Eusebius, HE 6.5.3] ed. Schwartz, p.532.6-8 and n. 26 above.

31. The Acts of Carpus, Papylus and Agathonica (BHG 293) may indeed contain some pre-Constantinian kernel, but the present form of the text is too late (5th/6th centuries) to be used for this early period. See Barnes, "Pre-Decian Acta...," pp. 514-515, 527 and Musurillo, Acts..., pp. xv-xvi. The Acts of Agape, Irene and Chione (BHG 34) and the Testament of the Forty Martyrs of Sebaste (BHG 1203) are also too insecurely dated to be used with confidence here. In any case, none of these contains any evidence for ecclesiastical penance.

32. Acta Pionii et sociorum 4.10 and 13.1 (BHG 1546) ed. Musurillo. pp. 140.2-5 and 152.15-21; the distinction is also found in the fragmentary Acts of Phileas dated to 310-325: Acta Phileae (BHG 1513k) ed. Musurillo, p. 334.79-83 = Bodmer Papyrus XX, Column V.12-16.

33. Acta Pionii et sociorum 14.16 (BHG 1546) ed. Musurillo, p. 156.2-5.

34. Cf. Chapter Four, pp.138-140 below.

35. Discussion of the sources with bibliography by W. Schneemelcher and K. Schäferdiek, "Second and Third Century Acts of Apostles," in E. Hennecke, New Testament Apocrypha, ed. W. Schneemelcher, London 1975, vol. 2, pp. 167-188 at pp. 174-178.

36. For the dating of these texts see Hennecke, NT Apocrypha, vol. 2, pp. 275, 351 and 396-397. The correspondence between the "original" texts of the Acta as printed by Hennecke and the actual state of the Greek texts (Acta Petri [BHG 1483-1485], Acta Pauli [BHG 1451-1452, 1710], Acta Andreae [BHG 95]) is by no means exact, and no texts have been admitted for this early period which might better be taken with the later Acta considered in Chapter Three, pp. 99-100 below. References to pre-baptismal repentance and forgiveness: Acta Pauli Pagina 1.14-17 and 2.29-31 (BHG 1451-1452) ed. Schmidt, pp. 24 and 30 [= Hennecke

NT Apocrypha, vol. 2, pp. 379 and 381: Acta Pauli 7].

37. Acta Petri 10 (BHL 6656) ed. Lipsius, p. 57.14-22. The Greek text of chapters 1-29 has been lost but Vita Abercii (BHG 2) cites material from chapters 2, 7, 20 and 21 which suggests that at the end of the fourth century the Greek text of the Acta Petri 1-29 was circulating. The Latin text used here may therefore be considered an adequate witness at least to the general outlines and movement of the episode. See the study by C. Schmidt, "Studien zu den alten Petrusakten. II Die Komposition," ZKG 45 NF 8(1926) 481-513 at pp. 486-497.

38. Acta Petri 10 (BHL 6656) ed. Lipsius pp. 57.22-58.11.

39. Acta Petri 10-11 (BHL 6656) ed. Lipsius, pp. 58.11-59.32.

40. Acta Petri 2 (BHL 6656) ed. Lipsius, p. 46.12-27.

41. Acta Petri 2 (BHL 6656) ed. Lipsius, pp. 46.27-47.34 and cf. Acta Petri 28, p. 77.2-4 where the possibility of forgiveness is assured even to one like Simon Magus. The theme of assurance (the later πληροφορία) will have a long history in Byzantine spiritual writing and practice. See n. 138 below, and Chapter Three, nn. 35, 95 and 99 below.

42. Acta Thomae 51 (BHG 1811) ed. Bonnet, p. 167.4-9.

43. Acta Thomae 51-52 (BHG 1811) ed. Bonnet, pp. 167.9-169.6.

44. Acta Thomae 132, 157 (BHG 1819, 1823-1824) ed. Bonnet, pp. 239.8-17, 267.13-15.

45. Acta Ioannis 107 (BHG 911) ed. Bonnet, pp. 205.11-206.5.

46. Acta Ioannis 84 (BHG 908) ed. Bonnet, p. 196.16-35.

47. Acta Ioannis 48-54 (BHG 905) ed. Bonnet, pp. 175.7-178.15.

48. De latrone converso [= Quis dives salvetur 42.1-15] (BHG 918p) ed. Stählin, pp. 187.27-190.19.

49. In the case of the young man turned robber John offers to die in his place: ὑπὲρ σοῦ τὴν ψυχὴν ἀντιδώσω τὴν ἐμήν (De latrone converso [= Quis dives salvetur 42.13] [BHG 918p] ed. Stählin, p. 190.7). He then kisses the murderous hand of the young man ὡς ὑπὸ τῆς μετανοίας κεκαθαρμένην καταφιλῶν (p. 190.13-14), a gesture which recalls the later monastic practice of the ἀνάδοχος in similar cases of despair and near-despair. See Chapter Four, nn. 96, 109 and Chapter Five, n. 41 below.

50. For example, the Vitae of the notaries Marcianus and Martyrius (BHG 1028y, 1028z), of Paul the Confessor (BHG 1472, 1473) and of the priest Zoticus (BHG 2479). The date of the Vita Zotici falls outside the limits of this study.

51. In Oratio 24.8, In laudem sancti martyris Cypriani (BHG 457) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1177B-C, Gregory holds up Cyprian as an excellent example of ἐξαγόρευσις, but the context is again pre-baptismal. The Cyprianic tales are discussed on p. 30 above.

52. The evidence for penance is ostensibly taken from an Alexandrian setting, but Gregory is plainly describing an ideal for church disci-

pline at Constantinople as well. For Gregory of Nazianzen see J. Mossay, "Gregor von Nazianz in Konstantinopel (379-381 AD)," Byzantion 47(1977) 223-238.

53. Vita Athanasii 9 (BHG 186) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1092A-B.

54. Vita Athanasii 9 (BHG 186) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1092A: "οἱ πλείως ὑπὲρ ἑαυτῶν, ἢ τῶν τοῦ λαοῦ ἀγνοημάτων, τὰς ψυσίας ὀφείλουσι· καὶ πάντως τῶν δύω τὸ ἕτερον ἁμαρτάνουσιν, ἢ τῷ δεῖσθαι συγγνώμης, ἄμετρα συγκινώσκοντες, ὡς ἂν μήτε ἀνακόπτοιτο κακία, ἀλλὰ καὶ διδάσκοιτο, ἢ τῇ τραχύτητι τῆς ἀρχῆς, τὰ ἑαυτῶν συγκαλύπτοντες. Ὧν οὐδέτερον ἐκεῖνος." Cf. Vita Athanasii 30-31, PG 35.1117C-1120A.

55. Vita Athanasii 9 (BHG 186) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1092B: "ἐλάχιστα μὲν λόγου διὰ τὸν τρόπον δεόμενος ἀρκοῦντα πρὸς παιδαγωγίαν· ἐλάχιστα δὲ ῥάβδου διὰ τὸν λόγον· ἔτι δὲ ἐλάττω τομῆς· διὰ τὴν ῥάβδον μετρίως πλήττουσκν." Cf. Vita Athanasii 10, PG 35.1093B.

56. Vita Athanasii 24 (BHG 186) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1109B-C.

57. Vita Athanasii 26 (BHG 186) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1112C.

58. See F. Winkelmann, "Die Beurteilung des Eusebius von Cäsarea und seiner Vita Constantini im griechischen Osten," in Byzantinische Beiträge, ed. J. Irmscher, Berlin 1964, pp. 91-118 and A. Linder, "The Myth of Constantine the Great in the West: Sources and Hagiographic Commemoration," Studi Medievali Serie Terza 16.1 (1975) 43-95 at pp. 48-61.

59. Pre-baptismal confession: Vita Constantini 4.61.1-3 cf. 3.63.3 (BHG 361x) ed. Winkelmann, pp. 145.17-24 and 117.16-19(= reconciliation/μετάνοια). Certain texts in the Vita Constantini such as 3.59.2-3 and 3.64-65 (pp. 112.5-8 and 117.21-119.8) show that the language of medicinal penance was common in the time of Constantine, but the texts themselves do not treat directly of ecclesiastical penance.

60. For the Oratio see T.D. Barnes, "The Emperor Constantine's Good Friday Sermon," JTS NS 27(1976) 414-423 and "Two Speeches by Eusebius," GRBS 18(1977) 341-345. One theme present in the Oratio ad sanctorum coetum and of interest here is the importance attached to the state of the soul at the very moment of death when judgement is rendered, a concern apparently not yet translated, however, into penitential customs or a practice like the deathbed confession: Oratio 23 (BHG 361y) ed. Heikel, pp. 189.24-190.3.

61. For the Life of Antony see J. Quasten, Patrology, vol. 3, Utrecht 1960, pp. 39-45 and C. Mohrmann, "La 'Vita Antonii' di Sant Atanasio," in Vita di Antonio, edd. G.J.M. Bartelink/C. Mohrmann, Milan 1974, pp. lxix-lxxxiii and B.R. Brennan, "Dating Athanasius' Vita Antonii," VC 30(1976) 52-54.

62. Vita Antonii 15, 54, 87, 88 (BHG 140) edd. Lopin/Montfaucon, PG 26. 865A, 921A, 964C-965B, 965B-C.

63. Vita Antonii 88 (BHG 140) edd. Lopin/Montfaucon, PG 26.965B-C.

64. Vita Antonii 55 (BHG 140) edd. Lopin/Montfaucon, PG 26.921C-925A. See H. Dörries, "Die Vita Antonii als Geschichtsquelle," Nachrichten von der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen. Philologisch-Historisch-

e Klasse, Göttingen 1949, N. 14, pp. 357-410 at p. 381.

65. Vita Antonii 70, 87 (BHG 140) edd. Lopin/Montfaucon, PG 26.941C,964C-965B. The first text may refer to heretics rather than to demoniacs.

66. This relationship is explored in P. Rousseau, "The Spiritual Authority of the 'Monk-Bishop'. Eastern Elements in Some Western Hagiography of the Fourth and Fifth Centuries," JTS NS 22(1971) 380-419 at pp. 395-402.

67. Conversio Cypriani (BHG 452), Confessio Cypriani (BHG 453) and Passio Cypriani (BHG 455); problems of dating, history and literary relationship between the documents are set out in H. Delehaye, "Cyprien d'Antioche et Cyprien de Carthage," AB 39(1921) 314-332 with further bibliography at p. 314 n.1, and in A. Amore, "Cipriano, Giustina e Teoctisto," BS 3.1281-1285, Rome 1963. To these add L. Radermacher, Griechische Quellen zur Faustsage, Vienna 1927, pp. 3-41.

68. Conversio Cypriani 10 (BHG 452) ed. Radermacher, p. 104.1-11 where the burning of the magical books is much emphasized; cf. also Confessio Cypriani 23 (BHG 453) ed. Maran, p. 239A.

69. Confessio Cypriani 15-20 (BHG 453) ed. Maran, pp. 233B-236E. The confession (ὁμολογία) is public and includes crimes of murder, sexual depravity, blasphemy, magic and much more. Cyprian cannot believe that a man more depraved than himself exists: Confessio Cypriani 17, p. 234F.

70. Confessio Cypriani 22 (BHG 453) ed. Maran, p. 238F where the priest Eusebius who has been standing by during Cyprian's confession tells him: διὸ καὶ ἠσύχασα, καὶ τοὺς φίλους τοῦτο ποιῆσαι ἔπεισα, ἵνα ἐμέσαντός σου τοῦ ἐχθροῦ τὸ φρόνημα, ἐπικουφισθῇ σου ἡ δίκυοια, ἀναπνεύσασα πρὸς τὴν εὐσέβειαν. Cyprian had earlier made it clear that despair (the remedy of Judas) seemed to him the only real solution to his problems: Confessio Cypriani 19, p. 235B:

71. Oratio 2 De fuga sua (BHG 730c), Oratio 7 In laudem Caesarii fratris (BHG 286), Oratio 8 In laudem Gorgoniae sororis (BHG 704), Oratio 10 Ante consecrationem suam (BHG 730t), Oratio 9 Post consecrationem suam (BHG 730u), Oratio 12 Ad patrem (BHG 730v), Oratio 18 In patrem suum (BHG 714), Oratio 11 Ad Gregorium Nyssenum (BHG 716), Oratio 43 In laudem Basilii magni (BHG 245) and Epitaphia in Basilium (BHG 245b).

72. The five: Oratio 7 (BHG 286), Oratio 12 (BHG 730v), Oratio 10 (BHG 730t), Oratio 11 (BHG 716) and the Epitaphia in Basilium (BHG 245b). The two: Oratio 8.13, 22 (BHG 704) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.804C, 813C (reference to private works of penance and to the pastor as πατὴρ πνευματικός) and Oratio 9.6 (BHG 730u) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.825B-C (use of Ezek. 34.3-6 as model in the pastoral care of sinners.

73. Oratio 42.13; 9.6; 36.10 and 2.16-35 (the medical analogy) (BHG 730b 730u, 730x and 730c) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.473A-B; 35.825B-C; 36.297B and 35.425A-444A.

74. In Gordium martyrem (BHG 703), In martyrem Iulittam (BHG 972), In Mamantem martyrem (BHG 1020) and In quadraginta martyres Sebastenses (BHG 1205).

75. In martyrem Iulittam 9 (BHG 972) ed. Garnier, PG 31.257D: Ὅταν ἴδῃς

ἐπὶ μετανοίᾳ τῶν ἡμαρτημένων τὸν ἀδελφὸν ὀδυρόμενον σύγκλαυσον τῷ τοιούτῳ, καὶ συμπάθει. Cf. In martyrem Iulittam 7, p. 256B-C. These texts are the closest any hagiographer of the period comes to mentioning the various stages of public penance (Bussstufen) familiar from the canons of the period and from Basil's own letters.

76. Oratio in quadraginta martyres (BHG 1208), Vita Macrinae (BHG 1012), Oratio in laudem Basilii (BHG 244), Vita Gregorii Thaumaturgi (BHG 715) and Oratio in Theodorum martyrem (BHG 1760); dates for the orations are discussed by J. Daniélou, "La chronologie des sermons de Grégoire de Nysse," RSR 29(1955) 346-372.

77. Intercession of the saints: Oratio in quadraginta martyres 9, 10 (BHG 1208) ed. Morel, PG 46.785B, 788A and Oratio in Theodorum martyrem 6 (BHG 1760) ed. Morel, PG 46.748B. νουθεσία as the bishop's task: Vita Gregorii Thaumaturgii 13 (BHG 715) ed. Morel, PG 46.921D-924A. More striking than these indirect suggestions is the absence of any reference to Basil's canonical activity in the Oratio in laudem Basilii (BHG 244) by one who was himself familiar with the problems raised by sin after baptism; cf. Gregory's Epistula canonica ad Letoium, in Discipline générale antique (IIe-IXe s.), ed. P.P. Joannou, vol. 2, Rome 1963, pp. 203-226.

78. Outline of the major problems with bibliography by J. Irmscher, "The Pseudo-Clementines," in Hennecke, NT Apocrypha, vol. 2, pp. 532-570, especially at pp. 532-535. Because of the absence of the Greek text the Recognitiones will not be discussed here.

79. The nature of sin and penance: Homilia 2.13.3; 3.5.3-4; 3.6.2-3; 10.12.2-3; 11.16.5; 11.27.3; 12.31.2; 13.19.1 (BHG 323, 324, 331, 332, 333, 334) ed. Rehm, pp. 40.13-15; 58.21-25; 59.4-8; 146.23-147.1; 162.20-163.1; 167.22-168.1; 190.11-14; 202.10-12. Episcopal binding and loosing: Epistula Clementis ad Iacobum 2.4 and 6.3-4 (BHG 321) ed. Rehm, pp. 7.6-8 and 10.9-12 with Homilia 3.72.4 (BHG 324) ed. Rehm, p. 83.14-15.

80. Epistula Clementis ad Iacobum 12.1 (BHG 321) ed. Rehm, pp. 14.12-15.2. In Homilia 3.67.3 (BHG 324) ed. Rehm, p. 81.10-12 the presbyters under the bishop are shown acting as the officers of reconciliation within the community, but the context refers to legal disputes rather than to sin. Fraternal intercession is also important for securing the forgiveness of sin: Homilia 12.30.1-2 (BHG 333) ed. Rehm, p. 189.17-25.

81. Homilia 18.23.5 (BHG 339) ed. Rehm, p. 251.27-29.

82. Homilia 18.23.6 (BHG 339) ed. Rehm, pp. 251.29-252.3. The possibility of forgiveness for sin after baptism is assumed throughout the work: Homilia 3.6.2-3 (although the text here is corrupt); 18.2.6; 20.19.7 (forgiveness possible even for Simon Magus) (BHG 324, 339, 341) ed. Rehm, pp. 59.4-8; 242.3-4; 279.23-25.

83. The exhortation to forgiveness in Homilia 12.32.3-5 (BHG 333) ed. Rehm, pp. 190.28-191.7 strongly suggests that any treatment of such serious sinners would not have been "rigorist", but the context is admittedly not that of ecclesiastical penance.

84. See nn. 7 and 8 above.

85. Excommunication: Oratio 36.10 (BHG 730x) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 36.277B: ὡς λύμην τῆς Ἐκκλησίας, καὶ τῆς ἀληθείας ὄν, ἀποπέμπ-

οισθε, μὴ μισοῦντες ἀλλ' ἐλεοῦντες τοῦ πτώματος. Forgiveness: Carmen 11.1441-1474 (BHG 730a) ed. Jungck, pp. 124/126; cf. Chapter Three pp. 90-91 below.

86. See Carmen 11.1466-1471 (BHG 730a) ed. Jungck, p. 124. Oratio 35 De martyribus et contra Arianos (BHG 1185) is not now considered a genuine work of Gregory, although it is dated to 381: T. Sinko, De traditione orationum Gregorii Nazianzeni. Pars I, Cracow 1917, pp. 43-48. It contains nothing about penance.

87. Oratio consolatoria in Pulcheriam (CPG 3181) and Oratio funebris in Flacillam imperatricem (BHG 1548); for the dates see Daniélou, "La chronologie...," pp. 364-365.

88. For the dates see L. Meyer, Saint Jean Chrysostome, maître de perfection chrétienne, Paris 1933, pp. xxxii and xxxvi; the Antiochene homilies are discussed below, pp. 39-41.

89. In martyres Aegyptios 1 (BHG 1192) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.694:24-695:2. The context here is civic and collective and the martyrs' intercession renders God propitious towards the sinful city as a whole.

90. Vita Phocae 1 (BHG 1537) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.699:16-18: ὃ μὲν γὰρ πολλάκις εἶπον, τοῦτο καὶ λέγων οὐ πεύσομαι· οὐκ εὐθύνας ἀπαιτῶ ἁμαρτημάτων, ἀλλὰ τοῖς ἀσθενοῦσι φάρμακα κατασκευάζω.

91. Vita Phocae 2 (BHG 1537) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.702:45-51.

92. Later Lives and encomia of Chrysostom are dealt with below in the chronological order of their composition.

93. Excommunication: Dialogus 6 (Alexandria) and 8 (Constantinople) (BHG 870) ed. Coleman-Norton, pp. 37.7-9 and 44.27-45.5.

94. See Seriski, Poenae..., pp. 54-75, 92-103.

95. Dialogus 2 (ἐπιτίμιον), 18 (power of the keys), 11 (episcopal ἔλεγχος) (BHG 870) ed. Coleman-Norton, pp. 15.1-5, 118.10-13, 68.12-16; for the Nectarius incident see nn. 1-3 above.

96. Dialogus 20 (BHG 870) ed. Coleman-Norton, pp. 132.15-133.36.

97. For the nature of the λογισμοί and their number see Hausherr, "L'origine de la théorie...," pp. 164-175. Palladius lists: "γαστριμαργία. φιλησδονία, φιλαργυρία, ὀργή-θύμος, ἀκηδία - λήθη, εὐδοξία ἄλογος, ἀλαζονεία - τῦφος," in Dialogus 20 (BHG 870) ed. Coleman-Norton, pp. 132.25-30 and 133.1-15. The passage is discussed by G.M. de Durand, "Evagre le Pontique et le Dialogue sur la Vie de Saint Jean Chrysostome," BLE 77(1976) 191-206 at pp. 194-200.

98. The tantalizing reference to a certain Philip "τὸν ἀσκητὴν καὶ πρεσβύτερον τῶν σχολῶν"(Dialogus 20[BHG 870] ed. Coleman-Norton, p. 128.5-6) may suggest the advent already of military chaplains chosen from among the monks.

99. There is more of the traditional medical language in Dialogus 19 (BHG 870) ed. Coleman-Norton, p. 124.30-36.

100. For the history of monasticism at Constantinople see Dagron, "Les moines..., pp. 229-276 with bibliography.

101. M. Aubineau, "La Vie inédite de Chrysostome par Martyrius. Un nouveau témoin: Athos, Koutloumousiou 13," AB 94(1976) 394 and F. van Ommeslaeghe, "La valeur historique de la Vie de S. Jean Chrysostome attribuée à Martyrius d'Antioche (BHG 871)," in Studia Patristica 12, ed. E.A. Livingstone, Berlin 1975 [= TU 115], pp. 478-483. Van Ommeslaeghe's edition of the text (in a Louvain thesis of 1974; see CPG 6517) has not been available for use in this study.

102. For homilies on the martyrs see M. Aubineau, "Une homélie grecque inédite 'sur tous les martyrs' attribuée à Jean Chrysostome (BHG 1191e)," in Forma Futuri. Studi in Onore del Cardinale Michele Pellegrino, Turin 1975, pp. 614-632 at pp. 616-619.

103. See p. 30 above.

104. Vita martyrum omnium 4 (BHG 1189) ed. Montfaucon, PG 52.836:1-7.

105. See G.J.M. Bartelink, Vie d'Hypatius, Paris 1961, pp. 11-12. Other Lives of monastic saints of the period (Isaacius, Dalmatus, Olympias) are of later composition: Dagron, "Les moines...," pp. 231-232, 237-238.

106. Spiritual direction: Vita Hypatii Prologus 10 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, p. 70. Visits of the imperial family: Vita Hypatii 37.1-4, p. 228. The latter text does not imply, however, any regular relationship between Theodosius II and Hypatius as a spiritual director. The meetings are presented as special occasions only.

107. Vita Hypatii 31.13-14 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, pp. 206/208; for the martyria at Constantinople see H. Delehaye, Les origines du culte des martyrs, Brussels 1933, 2nd ed. rev., at pp. 55-57 and 233-241.

108. Vita Hypatii 28.2-6, 28.9-13, 37.1-4, 44.8-19. 44.27-33 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, pp. 184/186. 186/188. 228, 262/264, 266/268.

109. As, for example, In epistulam ad Ephesios homilia 3.4, PG 62.28:25-29:18.

110. Vita Hypatii 28.11 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, pp. 186/188.

111. Vita Hypatii 28.9-11 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, pp. 186/188.

112. Vita Hypatii 28.12-13 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, p. 188.

113. Note that Hypatius had been ordained priest by this time and moreover was hegumen of a monastery; cf. Vita Dalmati 3 (BHG 482) ed. Banduri, p. 699A where the hegumen is ordained and installed by the Patriarch of Constantinople. See also n. 143 below.

114. Vita Hypatii 42.8-40 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, pp. 252-256.

115. Vita Hypatii 42.27-31 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, p. 254.

116. Vita Hypatii 42.31-32 (BHG 760) ed. Bartelink, p. 254.

117. Canon 18 of the contemporary Armenian synod of Sahavipan (444) shows sensitivity to the same problem. See E. Carr, "Penance among the Armenians: Notes on the History of its Practice and its Theology,"

Studia Liturgica 11(1976) 65-100 at pp. 65-66.

118. Oratio 44.8 (BHG 1021) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 36.616D-617A.

119. See Daniélou, "La chronologie...," pp. 362-363.

120. The twenty four encomia in the chronological order suggested by Meyer (Saint Jean Chrysostome..., pp. xxi-xxxiii) for the years from 382 to 392: Babylas (BHG 208), Ignatius (BHG 816), Pelagia (BHG 1477), Philogonius (BHG 1532), Lucianus (BHG 998), Meletius (BHG 1244), Babylas (BHG 207), Iuventinus (BHG 975), Romanus (BHG 1601), Eustathius (BHG 644), Martyres omnes (BHG 1191r), Sancti omnes (BHG 1616, 1617v, 1617w, 1617x), Bernica et socii (BHG 274, 275), Iulianus (BHG 967), Barlaam (BHG 222), Martyres omnes (BHG 1186, 1191n), Drosis (BHG 566), Martyres omnes (BHG 1187, 1188). Of these, the Vitae of Lucianus, Babylas (BHG 207), Iuventinus, Eustathius, Bernica and companions and Barlaam, and the encomia In sanctos omnes contain nothing relevant to ecclesiastical penance. The only significant silence is perhaps that of the Vita Eustathii which suggests that by the end of the fourth century, mention of the penitential ministry of the bishop was not yet a topos in an episcopal Life.

121. Punishment: Vita Babylae 5 (BHG 208) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.541:15-20. Excommunication: Vita Meletii 1 (BHG 1244) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.516:34-40.

122. Vita Babylae 5 (BHG 208) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.541:18-19: καὶ διὰ τῆς μετανοίας ἐξισωθῆναι τοῖς οὐδὲν εἰργασμένοις δεινόν.... The same teaching is repeated in Vita martyrum omnium 5 (BHG 1191n) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.452:8-10: Ἔξεστι γὰρ καὶ τὸν ἐν κακίᾳ, μεταστάντα τῆς πονηρίας, πρὸς ἀρετὴν ἐπανελθεῖν, κἂν δυνηθῆναι γενέσθαι τῶν ἐξ ἀρχῆς εὖ βεβιωκότων ἴσον.

123. Forgiveness at the martyrs' shrines: Vita Ignatii 5 (BHG 816) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.595:22-596:19; Vita martyrum omnium 5.1-8, 9.4-12 (αἴσθησις) and 11.3-6 (πληροφορίᾳ) (BHG 1191r) ed. Wenger, pp. 231-232, 233 and 234; Vita Iuliani 4 (BHG 967) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.673:1-2; Vita martyrum omnium 3 (BHG 1188) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.711:39-712:2.

124. Vita Iuliani 4 (BHG 967) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.672:29-35: Τιμὴ γὰρ μαρτύρων οὐ τὸ παραγενέσθαι πρὸς αὐτοὺς μόνον, ἀλλὰ καὶ πρὸ τούτου τὸ ζηλῶσαι τὴν ἀνδρείαν αὐτῶν. Διὸ δεῖ πρῶτον εἰπεῖν τὸ πονηρὸν ἕνος· τοῦ γὰρ νοσήματος ἀγνοουμένου οὐδὲ ἰατρείαν προσάγειν ῥάδιον· διὰ τοῦτο ἀποκαλύπτω τὸ τραῦμα πρῶτον, καὶ τότε τὸ φάρμακον ἐπιτίθημι.

125. Vita martyrum omnium 3 (BHG 1186) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.649:50-651.13 (note that the context of this self-examination is Eucharistic) and Vita martyrum omnium 9.4-12 (BHG 1191r) ed. Wenger, p. 233 (confession to the martyrs).

126. Vita Iuliani 5 (BHG 967) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.674:7-676:19 and Vita Pelagiae 4 (BHG 1477) ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.583:9-32.

127. The context, especially in Vita Pelagiae 4, is one of exhortation. Chrysostom is trying to destroy lethargy in his listeners: "Οἶδα ὅτι καθαροὶ τῶν νοσημάτων τούτων ὑμεῖς, ἀλλ' οὐκ ἀρκεῖ τοῦτο εἰς ἀπολογίαν ὑμῖν." (PG 50.583:14-15).

128. Vita Philogonii 4 (BHG 1532) ed. Montfaucon, PG 48.755:8-756:18.

129. Vita Philogonii 4 (BHG 1532) ed. Montfaucon, PG 48.756:18-37, 753:1-21, 754:40-47.

130. For Asterius see now C. Datema, Asterius of Amasea. Homilies I-XIV. Text, Introduction and Notes, Leiden 1970, pp. xvii-xxxv and 109-111 (Phocas), 131-133 (Martyrs), 149-150 (Euphemia).

131. BHG 2; for the date (c. 400) see A. Harnack, Geschichte der altchristlichen Litteratur bis Eusebius, vol. 2, Leipzig 1904, pp. 183-184 with further references there. Delehaye does not reject this date but he is less sanguine about the possibility of being certain in such cases: "Bulletin des publications hagiographiques," AB 15(1896) 333, 23(1904) 477, 31 (1912) 471-472 (= C. Van de Vorst).

132. Vita Abercii 69 (reconciliation), 12 and 19 (penance/forgiveness) (BHG 2) ed. Nissen, pp. 49.2-4, 11.6-9 and 16.8-9.

133. Although Basil and Chrysostom were intimately involved with the monastic life, their own hagiographical writings do not have the monastic setting of the Pachomiana. Detailed discussion of penance in the Pachomian writings is found in K. Lehmann, "Die Entstehung der Freiheitsstrafe in den Klöstern des heiligen Pachomius," ZSSR/KA 37 (1951) 1-94 and more recently, A. Veilleux, La liturgie dans le coenobitisme pachômien au quatrième siècle, Rome 1968, pp. 340-365. The question of the primacy of the Greek or Coptic/Arabic texts cannot be settled here, but the doubts raised by Chitty, Peeters and de Vogüé against the conclusions of Lefort and Veilleux, as well as the admission of Veilleux himself (at least for the Vita Prima: cf. La liturgie..., p.35) justify using the Vita Prima, the Paralipomena and the Epistula Ammonis as late fourth and early fifth-century texts. Bibliography of the textual discussion in Veilleux, La liturgie..., pp. 17-35, to which should now be added: the review of Veilleux by Chitty in JTS NS 21(1970) 195-199; two important articles by A. de Vogüé, "La Vie arabe de saint Pachôme et ses deux sources présumées," AB 91(1973) 379-390 and "Saint Pachôme et son oeuvre d'après plusieurs études récentes," RHE 69(1974) 425-453 at pp. 426-428; J. Vergote, "La valeur des vies grecques et coptes de S. Pakhôme," OLP 8(1977) 175-186; P. Rousseau, Ascetics, Authority, and the Church in the Age of Jerome and Cassian, Oxford 1978, pp. 243-247.

134. Vita Pachomii 20 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, p. 13.10-15; cf. Didascalia Apostolorum 2.6.6-11, ed. Funk, vol. 1, p. 40.4-20 and Constitutiones Apostolicae 2.6.6-11, ed. Funk, vol. 1, p. 41.4-31.

135. Vita Pachomii 76 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, p. 51.15-23. The incident is rich in implications for the early idea of jurisdiction in matters of discipline. It presumes moreover that judgement was involved as a constitutive element of penance: "...ἄνθρωπος ἀπεστάλη πρὸς αὐτὸν ἐν αἰτίᾳ κλοπῆς ἑτέρας κρῖναι αὐτόν." Textual difficulties here are discussed by Chitty, "Pachomian Sources Reconsidered," JEH 5(1954) 38-77 at pp. 68-69.

136. Public confession: Vita Pachomii 70, 97, 106 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 48.4-11, 65.4-19, 69.35-70.14: confessions of murmuring, theft and the desire to rule others; cf. Epistula Ammonis 3, 20, 21, 26 (BHG 1397) ed. Halkin, pp. 98.9-15, 109.20-23, 110.17-22. Private confession: Vita Pachomii 92 (theft), p. 62.1-15; Epistula Ammonis 20, p. 109..34-36; Paralipomena 10-11 (BHG 1399) ed. Halkin, pp. 134.9-135.17 (idolatry).

137. See Epistula Ammonis 20 and 21 (BHG 1397) ed. Halkin, pp. 109.8-36 and 110.17-22; in the first of these cases especially, pastoral reasons for the discouragement of public confession are provided: οἵτινες, ἐπιχνόντες ὅπως αὐτῶν ἐφείσατο ὁ Θεός, σπεύδοντες πᾶσιν ἑαυτοὺς καταφανεῖς ποιῆσαι, ἐκωλύθησαν ὑπὸ Θεοδώρου λέγοντος μὴ δύνασθαι τοὺς πλείους τῶν ἀδελφῶν φέρειν τοιαύτας ἀκοάς, προστιθέντος ὅτι πρὸς τῷ τοὺς ἔτι νηπιάζοντας ἐν Χριστῷ βλάπτεσθαι, καί τισι τῶν ἀπαγγελλόντων ἐγχωρεῖ παγίδα γενέσθαι ὀνειδισμὸν ὑπό τινος τῶν μηδέπω παγίων προσεπενεχθέντα αὐτοῖς.

138. Confession of λογισμοί: Vita Pachomii 83, 96, 132 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 56.19-57.2, 64.12-65.3, 83.22-84.6 and Paralipomena 27 (BHG 1399) ed. Halkin, pp. 154.15-155.23. Responsibility of the spiritual father: Vita Pachomii 20, 99, 132, pp. 13.10-15, 66.33 - 67.3, 83.22-84.6. Paralipomena 2, p. 125.11-13 provides an early example of the use of ἀναδέχεσθαι to mean spiritual responsibility, in this case that of standing as surety before the hegumen for a repentant sinner: Πετρωνίου δέ τινος ἀναδεξαμένου αὐτὸν ἐφ' οἷς ὑπισχνεῖτο, συνεχώρησεν αὐτῷ ὁ μέγας.

139. Vita Pachomii 38, 66, 69, 95 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 23.17-24.6, 43.21-44.15, 46.1-47.17, 63.21-64.5; Paralipomena 27 (BHG 1399) ed. Halkin, p. 154.18-20 and Epistula Ammonis 17, 20, 23 (BHG 1397) ed. Halkin, pp. 106.1-25, 109.8-20, 110.36-112.22.

140. Vita Pachomii 45, 47, 132, 142 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 29.5-10, 30.8-21, 83.22-84.6, 88.39-40 and Paralipomena 6 (BHG 1399) ed. Halkin, pp. 129.26-130.2. Vita Pachomii 18 shows recognition of the distinction between λογισμός and sin (p. 11.22-23).

141. Vita Pachomii 107, 127 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 70.15-19, 80.38-81.3; cf. Paralipomena 2, 11 (BHG 1399) ed. Halkin, pp. 124.13-125.16, 135.4-28.

142. Vita Pachomii 85 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 57.22-58.9.

143. Vita Pachomii 76 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, p. 51.15-23 and compare the observation of N. Gidulianov that in the Pachomian texts the burden of responsibility in spiritual matters belonged to the hegumen not to the "starets": "Vopros' o taynoy ispovědi...," pp. 422-423.

144. Vita Pachomii 47 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, p. 30.8-21: the vision of Pachomius. Indeed, in the context of the Life this vision may be said to have empowered Pachomius to undertake his mission. Rousseau connects the "bringing of sinners to salvation" with the establishment of the Pachomian pattern of monastic life rather than with some further "activity" of the Pachomian monks in the wider world ("The Spiritual Authority...," p. 390). The revelation of God's pardon to Theodore is found in Epistula Ammonis 28-29 (BHG 1397) ed. Halkin, pp. 115.17-117.6. It should be noted that this pardon is a revealed act of God that is then proclaimed to Theodore and through him to the monks; it is not Theodore's own absolution. Moreover, the pardon applies only to the sins of monks, not to those of laymen, and none of the documents contains any evidence for monastic absolution of the sins of the laity. Ἄφεσις and συγχώρησις within the monastic community (as in Paralipomena 2 [BHG 1399] ed. Halkin, p. 125.8-16) connote "permission to remain" (a monk) as much as they mean the forgiveness of sin. See, for example, Vita Pachomii 100, p. 67.9-14 and Epistula Ammonis 23, 26, pp. 112.12-18, 114.28-33; the forgiveness of the hegumen was not the self-contained act of an isolated figure.

145. Monastic deference: Vita Pachomii 27, 135, 143-144 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 16.27-17.23, 85.20-35, 89.22-91.21; Epistula Ammonis 12 (BHG 1397) ed. Halkin, p. 103.33-34. Episcopal respect: Vita Pachomii 144, p. 90.18-20 (Athanasius to the monks: "Οὐκ ἐσμὲν ἡμεῖς πατέρες· ἰδοὺ οἱ πατέρες οἱ ἔχοντες ταπεινοφροσύνην καὶ ὑποταγὴν διὰ τὸν Θεόν." It would be mistaken to attempt to convert the language of this kind of contest of humility into canonical or jurisdictional terms.

146. BHG 1433-1434. References to the Historia Monachorum [= HM] are complicated by the fact that some, but only some, of the individual chapters have received numbers of their own in the BHG: 1. John of Lycopolis (BHG 2189) 10. Copres/Patermuthius (BHG 2083) 19. Philemon, Apollonius and companions (BHG 1513y) 21. Macarius (BHG 999y) 23, Macarius of Alexandria (BHG 999u) 24. Paul the Simple (BHG 1474q). That the Greek text is the original and that it already existed in several recensions by the beginning of the fifth century has been established by A.-J. Festugière, "Le problème littéraire de l'Historia Monachorum," Hermes 83(1955) 257-284.

147. Vita Ioannis Lycopolitani [= HM 1] 1.37-44 and 1.45-58 (BHG 2189) ed. Festugière, pp. 22-26 and 26-32.

148. HM 16.1-2 (BHG 1434) ed. Festugière, pp. 112-113. It should be noted, however, that this discipline is based on the miraculous charisma (διόρασις) of the priest.

149. Communion and sin: HM 8.56-57 and 16.1-2 (BHG 1434) ed. Festugière, pp. 69 and 112-113. Contrast Chrysostom in n. 109 above.

150. HM 20.1-2 and 25.1-2 (BHG 1434) ed. Festugière, pp. 118-119 and 134. Cf. J.-C. Guy, "Un dialogue monastique inédit περὶ λογισμῶν," RAM 33(1957) 171-188 at p. 181 (qq. 26-27).

151. HM 8.4, 8.16 (BHG 1434) ed. Festugière, pp. 48, 52 and Vita Philemonis, Apollonii et sociorum [= HM 19] 19.11 (BHG 1513y) ed. Festugière, p. 118; cf. n. 178 below.

152. Intercession for murder: HM 8.30-34 (BHG 1434) ed. Festugière, pp. 58-60. Securing a καιρὸς τῆς μετανοίας: Vita Copris et Patermuthii [= HM 10] 10.17-19 (BHG 2083) ed. Festugière, pp. 82-83. In this case it is made quite plain that the deathbed is not the appropriate place to do penance. Penance is not to be left to the last moment, and the power of the saint is used here not to reconcile the sinner authoritatively (absolution) - although Copres is both priest and hegumen - but to provide him with the further time necessary to effect his own conversion/μετάνοια (in this case three years). When the dying man is presumed to be just, hagiographical sources make no mention of any recourse to ecclesiastical penance or to any confession on the deathbed, even though the exact time of death may have been revealed beforehand; see the case of Ammon in HM 22.9, p. 130.

153. HM 13.10 (BHG 1434) ed. Festugière, pp. 100-101.

154. Examples in Vita Pachomii 61, 66 (BHG 1396) ed. Halkin, pp. 42.2-3, 44.12-15 and Paralipomena 36 (BHG 1399) ed. Halkin, pp. 160.35-161.3.

155. Vita Ioannis Lycopolitani [= HM 1] 1.61 (BHG 2189) ed. Festugière, p.33: καὶ πρωὶ ἐμπαίζοντες προσέπεσόν μοι λέγοντες· « Συγχώρησον ἡμῖν, ἀββᾶ, ὅτι κόπους σοὶ παρεσχήκαμεν ὅλην τὴν νύκτα ».

156. Historia Lausiaca [= HL] (BHG 1435-1438). Bibliography in B. Altaner/A. Stuiber, Patrologie, Freiburg 1966, 7th ed. rev., pp. 238-239, to which add a new edition and commentary by G.J.M. Bartelink with introduction by C. Mohrmann, Palladio, La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974 and D.F. Buck, "The Structure of the Lausiac History," Byzantion 46 (1976) 292-307. Here too some of the chapters have separate numbers in the BHG: 10. Pambo (BHG 2329) 12. Benjamin (BHG 2061) 18. Macarius of Alexandria (BHG 999v) 19. Moses the Robber (BHG 1309) 22. Paul the Simple (BHG 1474r) 23. Pachon (BHG 2327) 35. John of Lycopolis (BHG 2190) 37. Sarapion Sindonites (BHG 1617z).

157. One anecdote describes the confession/disclosure of thoughts by a monk as part of spiritual direction (Vita Pachonis [= HL 23.1-2] [BHG 2327] ed. Bartelink, p. 128); another the public confession of sin to the "fathers" by a lapsed monk (HL 26.5, p. 140); a third the confession of responsibility, in varying degrees, for the suicide of a fellow nun made by the other nuns of the convent to a visiting chaplain (HL 34.7, p. 167); a fourth, the acknowledgement of fornication, itself already a matter of public knowledge, by a priest to the monk Macarius (Vita Macarii Alexandrini [= HL 18.19] [BHG 999v] pp. 88/90; a fifth, the confession demanded from a lector by his bishop before a full ecclesiastical tribunal (HL 70.1-2, p.284); and the last, a confession of some young vandals made to the priest who discovers their crime (HL 44.5, p. 218).

158. There may also be some reflection of the practice of penance in the confession and promise of restitution made by the young men in HL 44.5 (BHG 1438) ed. Bartelink, p. 218: καὶ οὕτω προσπεσόντες αὐτῷ οἱ νεώτεροι ὡμολόγησαν οἱ σφάξαντες αὐτό, ἀπαιτηθέντες τὸ ἄξιον τίμημα. The elements of prostration, confession, restitution and the ἔλεγχος exercised by the priest all belong to the discipline of penance; the context, however, stresses the miraculous knowledge of the priest rather than the μετάνοια of the boys.

159. HL 70.1-2 (BHG 1438) ed. Bartelink, p. 284.

160. See Seriski, Poenae..., pp. 54-75, 92-103. Judgement (τὸ δικάζειν) is presumed to be part of the sacerdotal office even within a monastic context (HL 7.5 [BHG 1438] ed. Bartelink, p. 40), and the identification of excommunication with the bishop's office is so strong that it can serve as the basis of a joke: Vita Ioannis Lycopolitani (= HL 35.10) (BHG 2190) p. 174.

161. Contrast the way the system of the Bussstufen is usually related to the Canonical Letters of Basil.

162. See n. 159 above.

163. HL 33.4 (BHG 1438) ed. Bartelink, p. 162: Ἐλθόντι οὖν τῷ πρεσβυτέρῳ ἀνήγγειλαν τὸ πρᾶγμα αἱ λοιπαὶ ἀδελφαί· καὶ ἐκέλευσε τούτων μὲν μηδὲ μιᾶς προσφορὰν ἐπιτελεσθῆναι· τὰς δὲ μὴ εἰρηνευούσας αὐτάς, ὡς συνειδυίας τῇ συνοφαντησάσῃ καὶ πιστευούσας τοῖς εἰρημένοις, ἐπταετίαν ἀφώρισεν ἀκοινωνήτους ποιήσας. Cf. Bartelink's note on p. 362.

164. Scourges: HL 7.3 (BHG 1438) ed. Bartelink, p. 38. Fetters and imprisonment: HL 25.5 and 26.2, pp. 136 and 138/140.

165. Imposition of penances by the fathers: HL 25.2 (BHG 1438) ed. Bartelink, pp. 134. Voluntary choice of penance: HL 69.3, p. 282. Care for the sick as a penance becomes a topos in later writings, as,

for example, Vita Danielis Scetiotae 3-4 (BHG 2100) ed. Clugnet, pp. 72.10-73.3. In HL 44.2. p. 216, demonic possession is portrayed as a penance that both punishes sin (here, fornication) and prevents further sin.

166. Unworthy communion (more properly, unworthy celebration by a priest): Vita Macarii Alexandrini (= HL 18.21) (BHG 999v) ed. Bartelink, p. 90. Danger of abstention from communion: HL 17.9, 25.2-5, 26.2, 27.2, pp. 74, 134/136, 138, 142 and see n. 150 above.

167. Vita Moysi (= HL 19.9-10) (BHG 1309) ed. Bartelink, pp. 100/102. HL 71.2, p. 288, distinguishes between erotic dreams which occur with πόλεμος and those without, evidence of a growing casuistry attaching to the determination of worthiness in approaching communion.

168. Vita Moysi (= HL 19.10) (BHG 1309) ed. Bartelink, p. 102.

169. This role of the director is not expressly attested in the HL, and, more importantly, there is no application of it in any form to the laity. Compare however the use of διδάσκαλος in Vita Pachonis (= HL 23.1-2) (BHG 2327) ed. Bartelink, p. 128 and of πνευματικοί [αἱ], πνευματικός in HL 32.5, 34.6, pp. 154, 166 and in Vita Ioannis Lycopolitani (= HL 35.7) (BHG 2190) p. 172. Compare also the observations of A. Schmemann on the relationship between monasticism and Eucharistic piety in the Byzantine church: Introduction to Liturgical Theology, Crestwood 1975^2, pp. 109-110, 150-152.

170. The Life of Hilarion makes the same connexion between confession and healing noticed in the Vita Hypatii, pp. 37-38 above. Stubborn illness can be cured when hidden sins are confessed or criminal and unseemly activities renounced: Vita Hilarionis 22, 12, 16 (BHG 751z) ed. Oldfather, pp. 321.8-16, 316.14-16, 317.29-34.

171. Historia Religiosa [= HR] (BHG 1439-1440). Full discussion in the introduction to the new edition by P. Canivet and A. Leroy-Molinghen and in P. Canivet, Le monachisme syrien selon Théodoret de Cyr, Paris 1977. Each chapter of the HR has been given its own number in the BHG (listed in vol. 3, p. 192).

172. It may be seen that a very large percentage of the monks mentioned in the HR are also priests. The confessions: Vita Iacobi Nisibeni 8.15-23 (= HR 1) (BHG 769) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, pp. 174/176; Vita Maisymae 3 (= HR 14) (BHG 1013) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1413C; Vita Symeonis Ascetae 5.12-19 (= HR 6) (BHG 1674) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, pp. 352/354; Vita Acepsimae 1 (= HR 15) (BHG 14) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1416A-B; Vita Symeonis Stylitae 16 (= HR 26) (BHG 1678-1681) ed. Lietzmann, p. 13.5-12.

173. The Arab who broke his vow not to eat living food returns to Symeon Stylites not only to secure forgiveness through his intercession, but also to be cured from the miraculous curse of the bird-turned-stone inside him: Vita Symeonis Stylitae 16 (= HR 26)(BHG 1679) ed. Lietzmann, p. 13.5-12. The confession of the thieves to the bishop James and of the shepherd and the spy to the monk Acepsimas are as much examples of asking the pardon of an offended fellow man as of asking for forgiveness of sins from God: Vita Iacobi Nisibeni 8.15-23 (= HR 1) (BHG 769) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, pp. 174/176 and Vita Acepsimae 1 (= HR 15) (BHG 14) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1416A-B.

174. Language of loosing what is bound occurs in Vita Iacobi Nisibeni 9.9-14 (= HR 1) (BHG 769) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, p. 176;

Vita Symeonis Ascetae 5.12-19 (= HR 6) (BHG 1674) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, pp. 352/354; Vita Maisymae 3 (= HR 14) (BHG 1013) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1413C and Vita Symeonis Stylitae 16 (= HR 26) (BHG 1679) ed. Lietzmann, p. 13.5-12. The reference in Vita Iacobi Nisibeni 9.9-14 is the most important of these because it consciously compares the situation of James with that of Peter in the story of Ananias and Sapphira (Acts 5:1-11), and gives a strong hint that the use of the same apostolic power will change according to the pastoral needs of the age: Καὶ ὁ μὲν θεῖος ἀπόστολος οὐκ ἔλυσε τοῖς τεθνηκόσι τὴν συμφοράν· δέους γὰρ ἔχρηζε τοῦ σωτηρίου κηρύγματος τὰ προοίμια· ὁ δὲ τῆς ἀποστολικῆς ὑπάρχων ἀναπλέως χάριτος καὶ ἐκόλασεν εἰς καιρὸν καὶ ἔλυσε ταχέως τὴν κόλασιν· τούτῳ γὰρ ἤδει κερδαινούντας τοὺς πταίσαντας.

175. Vita Macedonii 4.6-9 (= HR 13) (BHG 1011) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, p. 480.

176. See nn. 158 and 159 above and also n. 143 above. Vita Abraamis 2 (= HR 17) (BHG 9) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1424B-C presumes that judgement and reconciliation were normal parts of a bishop's duties. The general descriptions of such duties in Vita Abraamis 3, PG 82.1421C-D and Vita Iacobi Monachi 2 (= HR 21) (BHG 771) ed. Sirmond, PG 82. 1433C-D seem to imply the active or threatened use of excommunication by the bishops; cf. Theodoret Epistula 77 in Y. Azéma, Théodoret de Cyr. Correspondance, vol. 2, Paris 1964, p. 174.5-20.

177. Vita Iacobi Nisibeni 7.9-13 (= HR 1) (BHG 769) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, p. 172 and Vita Macedonii 12.1-6 (= HR 13) (BHG 1011) p. 496. In the latter text, however, the ἔλεγχος is the activity of a monk not of a bishop. Further evidence that penance was primarily understood in medicinal terms: Vita Maronis 1 (= HR 16) (BHG 1173) ed. Sirmond, PG 82. 1417D and Vita Abraamis 2 (= HR 17) (BHG 9) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1424B-C.

178. Of James of Nisibis: Ἐντεῦθεν ἡ πρὸς τὸν θεὸν αὐτῷ παρρησία καὶ ἑκάστην ηὔξετο τὴν ἡμέραν καὶ, αἰτῶν ἃ τὸν θεὸν αἰτεῖν ἔδει, παραυτίκα ἐλάμβανεν. (Vita Iacobi Nisibeni 3.7-9 [= HR 1] [BHG 769] edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, p. 164). The theme of the holy man as θεῖος ἄνθρωπος/ἀνήρ runs throughout the HR: Vita Iuliani Sabae 7.23 (= HR 2) (BHG 969) p. 212; Vita Symeonis Ascetae 5.12-19 (= HR 6) (BHG 1674) pp. 352/354; Vita Petri Galatae 8.3-8 (= HR 9) (BHG 1507) p. 422. The intercessor is also portrayed in a different topos as being under no illusions about his personal power or worth: Vita Petri Galatae 7.3-7, p. 420 and Vita Iacobi Monachi 7 (= HR 21) (BHG 771) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1452A.

179. The holy man as προστάτης: Vita Abraamis 1 (= HR 17) (BHG 9) ed. Sirmond, PG 82.1421A: αἰτοῦσι μὲν ὑπὲρ τῶν τετολμημένων συγγνώμην, προστάτην δὲ αὐτὸν γενέσθαι παρακαλοῦσιν.

180. See n. 178 above, and compare Vita Iacobi Nisibeni 8.7-23 (= HR 1) (BHG 769) edd. Canivet/Leroy-Molinghen, pp. 174/176 and Vita Symeonis Stylitae 16 (= HR 26) (BHG 1679) ed. Lietzmann, p. 13.8-10: καὶ τοῦ πταίσματος ἐκ θεοῦ συγγνώμην αἰτούμενος καὶ τὸν ἅγιον εἰς ἐπικουρίαν καλῶν, ὡς ἂν ταῖς παντοδυνάμοις αὐτοῦ εὐχαῖς τῶν δεσμῶν αὐτὸν τῆς ἁμαρτίας ἐλκύσειε.

181. For Hesychius see now M. Aubineau, Les homélies festales d'Hésychius de Jérusalem, Brussels 1978, pp. xiii-xx. The encomium on Antony does however seem to presume that a certain pastoral ministry towards

sinners was exercised by monks: Vita Antonii 7.13-15 (BHG 141f) ed. Aubineau, p. 286.

182. The "confessions" described in the Vita Melaniae show the common pattern (prostration, "συγχώρησόν μοι" , statement of offence), but all are requests for personal forgiveness, not for ecclesiastical reconciliation: Vita Melaniae 7, 52 (BHG 1241) ed. Gorce, pp. 138.10-19, 228.2-28. Vita Melaniae 23, p. 176.3-8 probably refers to the disclosure/confession of λογισμοί within the group of nuns, but the emphasis is placed on Melania's own initiative in having the nuns reveal their thoughts to her. Melania acknowledges her own sinfulness on her deathbed, but in spite of the presence of her own domestic chaplain Gerontius (the source of the Vita according to Gorce, Vie de sainte Mélanie, Paris 1962, pp. 55-56), there is no allusion to ecclesiastical penance properly so called under any form: Vita Melaniae 64-68, pp. 254.18/268.6.

183. See the introduction to the French translation of the Life by L. Regnault, Vie de Sainte Synclétique, Bégrolles-en-Mauge 1972, pp. iii-xvii and also J.-M. Sauget, "Sincletica," BS 11.1209-1210. Rome 1968.

184. Vita Syncleticae 11 (BHG 1694) ed. Cotelier, PG 28.1492D mentions a priest who was summoned on the occasion of the tonsuring of Sincletica, but in the context she was still living at home. Possible reference to a kind of monastic "culp" or confession of faults before the community in Vita Syncleticae 38, PG 28.1509C-D, and perhaps to the ἔλεγχος of sinners within the community in Vita Syncleticae 62, PG 28.1524C.

185. See Vita Syncleticae 26 (BHG 1694) ed. Cotelier, PG. 28.1504A, a good statement of the idea that consent to thoughts (συγκατάθεσις) is the great victory of the devil in the monastic setting. Thus the true drama of sin and virtue takes place in the internal rather than the external dimension of life. For συγκατάθεσις and the vocabulary of the inner struggle see K.T. Ware, The Ascetic Writings of Mark the Hermit, Dissertation: Oxford 1965, pp. 262-273.

186. Vita Syncleticae 17, 31, 49, 65 (BHG 1694) ed. Cotelier, PG 28.1496A, 1505C-D, 1516C, 1525B-C; cf. Vita Syncleticae 52, 70, PG 28.1517D-1520A, 1528B-C.

187. Vita Syncleticae 52 (BHG 1694) ed. Cotelier, PG 28.1517D-1520A: Εἰ γὰρ ἀμελὴς καὶ νωθρὰ εὑρεθῇ ἡ ψυχὴ, ἔτι γε μὴν καὶ ὑπονάρκουσα εἰς τὴν τοῦ καλοῦ προκοπὴν, ἐπαινεῖν ταύτην προσήκει· καὶ εἰ μικρὸν ποιήσει τι χρηστὸν, θαυμάζειν καὶ μεγενοπαεῖν δέον αὐτήν. Καὶ τὰ σφόδρα καὶ ἀπάνθρωπα πλημμελήματα ὡς ἐλάχιστα καὶ οὐδαμινὰ λεκτέον· ὁ γὰρ διάβολος, βουλόμενος πάντα διακωλύειν, ἐπὶ μὲν τῶν σπουδαίων καὶ ἀσκητικῶν κρύπτειν πειρᾶται τὰ προγεγονότα ἁμαρτήματα· τὴν γὰρ ὑπερηφανίαν αὐξῆσαι βούλεται· ἐπὶ δὲ τῶν νεηλύδων καὶ ἀκροπαγῶν ψυχῶν, πάντα τὰ ἁμαρτήματα αὐτῶν πρὸ ὀφθαλμῶν τίθησιν. Ἐμβάλλει γὰρ αὐτῇ ὅτι, Σοὶ πορνεύσασῃ ποῦ ἔσται συγγνώμη; καὶ τῇ ἄλλῃ φησίν· Οὕτω σοῦ πλεονεκτησάσης, ἀδύνατόν σε σωτηρίας τυχεῖν. See also Vita Syncleticae 89, 109 and 26, PG 28. 1541C-D, 1553C-D and 1504A.

188. The monastic life was always understood to be a life of serious μετάνοια, and while such seriousness will not always have been present in all, it is presumed by the structure of the monastic regi-

men, including those institutions which contained an indisputable element of coercion such as corporal punishment and incarceration. Cf. Hörmann, Untersuchungen..., pp. 77-80 and Lehmann, "Die Entstehung...," pp. 84-85.

189. BHG 1516-1526; for dates see Hennecke, NT Apocrypha, vol. 2, p. 577. The other apocryphal Acta, mostly of the sixth century, are discussed as a group in Chapter Three, pp. 99-100 below.

190. Acta Philippi 86 [= Praxis 6.23] (BHG 1521) ed. Bonnet, p. 34.9

191. Acta Philippi 91 [= Praxis 7.5] (BHG 1522) ed. Bonnet, p. 35.25-26: Ὑμεῖς οὖν τέκνα δουλεύσατε αὐτῷ ἐν ὑποταγῇ, φανεροῦντες ἐνώπιον αὐτοῦ ὡς πατρὶ τοὺς λογισμούς. The episcopal role is put forward as pre-eminently pastoral (note the emphasis on πραότης). The passage may be an attempt to insist on this ideal in the face of the increasing involvement of bishops in public life during the fourth and fifth centuries. See n. 197 below.

192. Acta Philippi 4 (BHG 1516) ed. Bonnet, p. 3.13-16: the young man saw κρίτήρια and κολάσεις that passed all description.

193. Acta Philippi 131-138 [= Praxis 15.25-32] (BHG 1525) ed. Bonnet, pp. 60.8-72.6; cf. Acta Philippi 28 [= Praxis 2.23] (BHG 1517) ed. Bonnet, p. 15.12-14 for the direct effect of the apostle's κατάθεμα.

194. Acta Philippi 143, 147 [= Praxis 15.37, 41] (BHG 1525) ed. Bonnet, pp. 83.7-84.2, 88.6-9; the prayers are to continue for forty days and include προσφοραί. Another recension of Acta Philippi 147 (BHG 1526) ed. Bonnet, p. 88.14-15, specifies that prayers are to be offered twelve times a day.

195. See nn. 7, 8 and 176 above.

196. For the status quaestionis see J. Gribomont, "Les Apophtegmes du désert," RSLR 13(1977) 534-541 and on the genre itself see the remarks of J.-C. Guy, "Note sur l'évolution du genre apophtegmatique," RAM 32(1956)63-68.

197. For the changing role of the bishop see the article by Noethlichs cited in n. 11 above. To this may be added K.M. Girardet, Kaisergericht und Bischofsgericht, Bonn 1975, especially pp. 66-75 and 80-87.

198. See n. 10 above.

CHAPTER THREE: NOTES

1. For the canons see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 140-146, 422-425; E. Schwartz, "Die Kanonessammlung des Joannes Scholastikos," Sitzungsberichte der Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. Philosophisch-historische Abteilung, Munich 1933, N. 6, pp. 3-6; E. Honigmann, "Le Concile de Constantinople de 394 et les auteurs du 'Syntagma des XIV Titres"," in Trois mémoires..., pp. 1-83. Cf. also the works cited in Chapter Two, n. 9 above.

2. Text in Joannou, Discipline..., vol.1.1,120.14-125.9. For the Trullan Council see V. Laurent, "L'oeuvre canonique du concile in Trullo (691-692). Source primaire du droit de l'église orientale," REB 23(1965) 7-41 and T.D. Valdman, "Însemnătatea sinodului al VI-lea ecumenic pentru codificarea canoanelor," Studii Teologice NS 22(1970) 713-722. Cf. also the works on οἰκονομία cited in Chapter Two, n. 10 above.

3. The following documents in Grumel, Les régestes..., vol.1.1, Paris 1972², should be taken into account: NN. 140,143, 150, 151, [159], 172, 188, 195, 197, 199, 207a, 220-222, 224a, 237, 238, 241a, 242, 249-251, 256-258, 260b, 291a, 292, 294, 304, 306. Cf. also Hajjar, Le synode permanent..., pp. 94-95, 121-124, 155-156.

4. For the nomocanon see J. Gaudemet, "Nomokanon," in PW Supplementband 10, Stuttgart 1965, cc. 417-429. For Justinian see H. Alivisatos, Die kirchliche Gesetzgebung des Kaisers Justinian I, Berlin 1913, pp. 53-54, 73-84, 98-112, 122-128 and F. Goria, "La Nov. 134,10;12 di Giustiniano e l'assunzione coattiva dell'abito monastico," in Studi in onore di Giuseppe Grosso, vol. 6, Turin 1974, pp. 55-76 with further bibliography there.

5. See the works cited in Chapter One, n. 61 above. The treatise De peccatorum confessione attributed to Sophronius of Jerusalem (CPG 7672) must be considered a later composition.

6. Pseudo-Dionysius: H. Koch, "Zur Geschichte der Bussdisziplin und Bussgewalt in der orientalischen Kirche," Historisches Jahrbuch 21(1900) 58-78 and J. Stiglmayr, "Ein interessanter Brief aus dem kirchlichen Altertum," ZKT 24(1900) 657-671. Barsanuphius and John: there is no complete study of the penitential teaching of the Responsiones, but cf. Hörmann, Untersuchungen..., pp. 188-193 and F. Neyt, "Un type d'autorité charismatique," Byzantion 44(1974) 343-361. Climacus and the Sinaite school: W. Völker, Scala Paradisi. Eine Studie zu Johannes Climacus und zugleich eine Vorstudie zu Symeon dem Neuen Theologen, Wiesbaden 1968, pp. 61-189 and CPG 7745-7758, 7770-7781 for the Anastasiana (with references there).

7. Alivisatos, Die kirchliche Gesetzgebung..., pp. 53-54 and H.-G. Beck, "Die frühbyzantinische Kirche," in Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte, ed. H. Jedin, vol. 2.2, Freiburg 1975, pp. 1-92 at p. 68.

8. E. Wellesz, A History of Byzantine Music and Hymnography, Oxford 1961², pp. 157-204; K. Mitsakes, Βυζαντινὴ ὑμνογραφία , vol. 1, Thessalonica 1971, pp. 65-106, 357-530; J. Grosdidier de Matons, Romanos le Mélode et les origines de la poésie religieuse à Byzance, Paris 1977, pp. 278-284; Ligier, "Dimension personnelle...," pp. 164-187; V. Palachovsky, "La Pénitence dans le cycle diurne de la Liturgie byzantine," and G. Winkler, "L'aspect pénitentiel dans les Offices du soir en Orient et en Occident," in Pistoia/Triacca, Liturgie et rémission..., pp. 197-209 and 273-293.

9. T.F. Mathews, The Early Churches of Constantinople: Architecture and Liturgy, University Park and London 1971, pp. 125-127, has broached

the question of ecclesiastical penance from the limited perspective of its relation to church architecture, but much more remains to be done to chart patterns of movement in liturgical change and influence within the Byzantine church.

10. Consult the documents cited in n. 3 above, and for the disruption of ecclesiastical life by Monophysitism and Monothelitism see the following monographs: W.H.C. Frend, The Rise of the Monophysite Movement. Chapters in the History of the Church in the Fifth and Sixth Centuries, Cambridge 1972; J.L. van Dieten, Geschichte der Patriarchen von Sergios I bis Johannes VI (610-715), Amsterdam 1972; F.-X. Murphy/ P. Sherwood, Constantinople II et Constantinople III, Paris 1974.

11. For the problems of the seventh century see F. Winkelmann, "Kirche und Gesellschaft in Byzanz vom Ende des 6. bis zum Beginn des 8. Jahrhunderts," Klio 59(1977) 477-489 with H. Köpstein/F. Winkelmann, Studien zum 7. Jahrhundert in Byzanz, Berlin 1976 and H. Ditten/H. Köpstein/I. Rochow/F. Winkelmann, Byzanz im 7. Jahrhundert, Berlin 1978. See also n. 61 below.

12. See J. Mateos, "Prières syriennes d'absolution du VIIe-IXe siècles," OCP 34(1968) 252-280; Carr, "Penance among the Armenians...," pp. 65-69; C. Renoux, "Eucharistie et rémission des péchés dans les Anaphores Arméniennes," Didaskalia 3(1973) 201-214. For the Western penitentials see now C. Vogel, Les "Libri paenitentiales", Turnhout 1978 [= Typologie des sources du moyen âge occidental, fasc. 27]. Of particular interest for the comparison of Eastern and Western evidence for penance are two articles by L. Hertling in ZKT 55(1931): "Hagiographische Texte zur frühmittelalterlichen Bussgeschichte," (pp. 109-122) and "Hagiographische Texte zur Bussgeschichte des frühesten Mittelalters," (pp. 274-287).

13. Discussion in P. Franchi di Cavalieri, "Una pagina di storia bizantina del secolo IV. Il martirio dei santi notari," AB 64(1946) 132-175 at pp. 166-168; cf. Dagron, Naissance..., p. 434.

14. There is a vague reference to the anathema passed against Macedonius by an orthodox synod: Vita Marciani et Martyrii 4 (BHG 1028z) ed. Franchi di Cavalieri, p. 173.32-34. The orthodox bishop Paul is also referred to once as the πνευματικὸς πατήρ of the two clerics, but the term is unlikely to have the technical sense of "confessor" here: Vita Marciani et Martyrii 6, p. 175.27.

15. So Beck, Kirche..., p. 402. The editor suggests, however, that the Rabbulas section (chapters 9-23) may have been added sometime later in the sixth century: E. de Stoop, Vie d'Alexandre l'Acémète, Paris 1911, [= PO 6.5], pp. 654-655. For strained relations see Chapter Two, n. 18 above.

16. Vita Alexandri 40 (BHG 47) ed. de Stoop, p. 689.3-14.

17. Vita Alexandri 34 (BHG 47) ed. de Stoop, pp. 684.7-685.13.

18. Vita Alexandri 46 (BHG 47) ed. de Stoop, pp. 694.13-695.17. For theft of church goods compare Gregory of Nyssa, Epistula canonica ad Letoium 6, ed. Joannou, Discipline..., vol. 2, p. 222.6-17. The anecdote illustrates the διορατικὸν χάρισμα of the saint and the fact that penance (παιδεία) has no value in itself beyond the repentance it provokes.

19. The friction between Nestorius and the urban monks of Constantinople

should not be forgotten when describing the relationship between episcopal and monastic spheres of discipline at Constantinople; cf. Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.1, (Paris 1972²) N. 51a, p. 43 and Dagron, "Les moines...," pp. 262, 266-270.

20. The Life of Daniel is accepted by all commentators as a composition of the end of the fifth or the beginning of the sixth century, probably within the reign of Anastasius: N. Baynes, "The Vita S. Danielis Stylitae," EHR 40(1925) 397-402. Beck, however, (Kirche..., p. 411) assigns it to the end of the sixth or the beginning of the seventh century. This may be an inadvertence as he provides neither authority nor argument for such a date.

21. Vita Danielis Stylitae 20 (BHG 489) ed. Delehaye, p. 20.10-11: the procedure of ἀφορισμός is here presumed to be familiar to all. For the friction between monks and the local clergy see Vita Danielis Stylitae 90, pp. 84.13-85.21.

22. Vita Danielis Stylitae 59 (private citizen) and 84 (the emperor) (BHG 489) ed. Delehaye, pp. 57.20-58.26 and 79.1-23. In the case of the emperor there is no direct evidence for excommunication in the Life although in Vita Danielis Stylitae 76, pp. 73.23-74.18 Daniel rebuffs the emperor for his insincere contrition. See also D. Miller, "The Emperor and the Stylite. A Note on the Imperial Office," GOTR 15 (1970) 207-212.

23. Vita Danielis Stylitae 59 (BHG 489) ed. Delehaye, p. 58.19-26.

24. Vita Danielis Stylitae 16, 17, 20 (BHG 489) ed. Delehaye, pp. 16.11-17, 17.6-7, 21.10-17. Relations with nobles and the court: Vita Danielis Stylitae 23, 35, 49, 76, 89, pp. 25.14-21, 33.5-34.2, 48.1-9, 73.23-74.18, 84.2-5. In the last of these texts Daniel is asked to provide monks for a private εὐκτήριον, an excellent example of the penetration of monastic influence among the laity; cf. Chapter Two, n. 107 above.

25. Vita Danielis Stylitae 43 (BHG 489) ed. Delehaye, pp. 39.9-41.2. The anecdote lays much stress on the idea of direct ordination from God, but this need not be interpreted as even an indirect attack on the value of orders; see n. 116 below.

26. Vita Danielis Stylitae 70, 72, 90 (BHG 489) ed. Delehaye, pp. 67.18-23, 69.1-70.3, 84.13-85.21.

27. Vita Danielis Stylitae 59, 76 (BHG 489) ed. Delehaye, pp. 58.24-26, 73.27-74.3. The inscription on the votive icon (Vita 59, p. 58.24-25) witnesses to the close connexion between intercession and forgiveness in the mind of the laity: συχχώρησιν αἰτῆσαι ἡμῖν παρὰ Θεοῦ τῶν ἡμαρτημένων εἰς σέ, Πάτερ.

28. P. Peeters, Le tréfonds oriental de l'hagiographie byzantine, Brussels 1950, pp. 111-112; further discussion in D. Stiernon, "Simeone Stilita, l'Anziano, santo," BS 11.1116-1138, Rome 1968, at cc. 1136-1137. For the phenomenon of the stylites see now I. Peña/P. Castellana/R. Fernandez, Les stylites syriens, Milan 1975.

29. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 11 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, p. 34.11-14. The Latin text has all the monks, not the hegumen only, confess their sin to Symeon: Vita Symeonis Stylitae 4 (BHL 7957) ed. Rosweyde, PL 73.327D.

30. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 15, 20 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, pp. 40.1-13, 52.1-14.

31. P. Galtier, "Pénitents et 'convertis'. De la pénitence latine à la pénitence celtique," RHE 33(1937) 5-26, 277-305 at pp. 19-26, 277-283.

32. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 15 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, p. 40.11-13. According to the Greek text the men stay in the monastery for an undetermined length of time: ποιήσαντες χρόνον ἱκανὸν ἐν μετανοίᾳ. In the Latin text the time is more precise: et fecerunt ibi duos annos (Vita Symeonis Stylitae 12 [BHL 7957] ed. Rosweyde, PL 73.331A).

33. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 20 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, p. 52.1-14. The Latin text makes it clearer that the latro came to Symeon intending to do penance, not just seeking asylum: Vita Symeonis Stylitae 15 (BHL 7957) ed. Rosweyde, PL 73.331C.

34. Ibid. See also Chapter Two, n. 129 above.

35. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 23 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, p. 58.3-6, a classic instance of πληροφορία. The incident is not found, however, in the Latin text.

36. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 24 (two cases) and 26 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, pp. 58.18-20,25-28 and 60.19/62.5.

37. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 26 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, pp. 60.25/62.22. The passage illustrates a complex change of topoi as the Paphnutius theme ("a layman can equal the virtue of a holy monk": see K. T. Ware, "The Monk and the Married Christian: Some Comparisons in Early Monastic Sources," ECR 6[1974] 72-83) develops into the idea that there is only one virtuous layman alive in the city, an idea similar to another topos that each generation depends on the (hidden) intercession of a few holy men (as in Vita Pachomii 136 [BHG 1396] ed. Halkin, p. 86.3-9).

38. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 31 (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, pp. 74.14/76.4, especially the cry of the sinner at p. 76.2-4: Ἔχω σήμερον διὰ σοῦ ἐσώθην, δοῦλε τοῦ θεοῦ, ἀπολωλὼς γὰρ ἤμην τῇ ἁμαρτίᾳ. The anecdote recalls in many important ways the story of the necrophiliac in Acta Ioannis 70-76 (BHG 908) ed. Bonnet, pp. 185.7-189.13.

39. Vita Symeonis Stylitae 29 (bishop rebuked for presuming to disturb Symeon's relics) and 3 (monastic patterns of prayer as the only norm for the serious layman) (BHG 1682-1683) ed. Lietzmann, pp. 70.8-15 and 22.3-7.

40. See J. Pargoire, "Mont Saint-Auxence. Etude historique et topographique," ROC 8(1903) 15-31, 240-279, 426-458, 550-576 at pp. 15-16 and R. Janin, Les églises et les monastères des grands centres byzantins, Paris 1975, pp. 43-44.

41. Vita Auxentii 2 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114.1380B.

42. For the lifelong disabilities attaching to enrolment in the ordo paenitentium see Berrouard, "La pénitence publique..." pp. 119-120 and Mortimer, The Origins..., pp. 117-118, 147-152, 154-158. Contrast Galtier, "Pénitents et 'convertis'...," pp. 23-26.

43. Sin as obstacle to healing: Vita Auxentii 18 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG

114.1392B-D. The sceptic confounded: Vita Auxentii 14-17, PG 114. 1388B-1392B.

44. Opposition between Charisma and Amt should not be read lightly into these texts. It is the same Life that contains simultaneously language redolent of the views of Symeon the New Theologian (Vita Auxentii 17, 36 [BHG 199] ed. Migne, PG 114.1392A-B, 1405A-B) and a clear recognition of hierarchical authority (Vita Auxentii 23, 38, PG 114. 1396D, 1408A).

45. Vita Auxentii 34, 36, 37, 44, 55, 61 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114. 1404A-B, 1405B, 1405C-D, 1413C, 1416A, 1429C-1432B.

46. Vita Auxentii 45 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114.1413D-1416A: a rare description of the details of a visit to a hermit.

47. Vita Auxentii 46 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114.1416C. S. Petrides, "Le monastère des Spoudaei à Jérusalem et les Spoudaei de Constantinople," EO 4(1901) 224-231 at pp. 229-230 doubts that Auxentius himself was the author of troparia and ascribes their composition to Anthimus. See also Vita Auxentii 2, PG 114.1380B-C and Wellesz, A History..., pp. 174-178.

48. Vita Auxentii 46 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114.1416C.

49. For the date see F. Halkin, Euphémie de Chalcédoine. Légendes byzantines, Brussels 1965, p. 12.

50. See now G. Dagron, Vie et Miracles de Sainte Thècle, Brussels 1978. According to Dagron (pp. 13-19) the Acta and Miracula were composed over the course of a lifetime (430-470) and have a probable terminus ad quem of 476. Dagron also emphasizes that the levelling influence of the monastic genre of the narratio animae utilis has not yet affected the literary presentation of many of the miracles (pp. 101-108 especially at p. 102). For the Pseudo-Chrysostomic encomium of Thecla (BHG 1720) see M. Aubineau, "Le panégyrique de Thècle attribué à Jean Chrysostome (BHG 1720): la fin retrouvée d'un texte mutilé," AB 93 (1975) 349-362 at pp. 349-356.

51. Miracula Theclae 28.49-35.42 (BHG 1718) ed. Dagron, pp. 364/386.

52. Miracula Theclae 43. 13-19 (BHG 1718) ed. Dagron, p. 402. The anger of the saint is directly compared to the anger of Christ who judges and punishes - Miraculae Theclae 28.56-61, p. 364: Ἐπισταμένη γὰρ εὖ ποιεῖν ἡ μάρτυς τοὺς εὖ τι δρῶντας κατὰ τὸν βίον, ἐπίσταται καὶ κολάζειν τοὺς ἀσεβεῖς καὶ ἀνοσίᾳ τολμῶντας, τὸ τοῦ Χριστοῦ βασιλέως, οἶμαι, μιμουμένη, παρ' οὗ πολλά τε φιλανθρωπίας ἔργα καὶ ὀργῆς τεκμήρια εἰς ἀνθρώπους πάλαι τε γεγένηται, καὶ νῦν ἔστιν εὑρεῖν ἔτι γινόμενα. See also Miracula Theclae Protheoria 94-101, pp. 288/290. The object of anger in both cases is to provoke conversion and repentance (διόρθωσις), but where there is no change of heart the effect is clearly vindictive: Miracula Theclae 28.61-71, 33.1-66, pp. 364/366, 376/380. A more static understanding of sin as a falling away from the norm of virtue (and of grace as the mere "maintenance" of that virtue) lies behind these texts and may be contrasted with the monastic insistence on spiritual growth as the centre of Christian life; cf. n. 50 above.

53. Miracula Theclae 12. 41-102 (BHG 1718) ed. Dagron, pp. 316/322.

54. Miracula Theclae 12. 102-112 (BHG 1718) ed. Dagron, p. 322. A certain Thomas (ἀνὴρ ἅγιος καὶ Θεῷ φίλος, ὡς καὶ πτωχῶν πολλῶν ποιούμενος

λόγον : Miracula Theclae 12.76-77, p. 320) interceded on behalf of the author. Dagron has named him as a hegumen ("L'auteur des 'Actes' et des 'Miracles' de sainte Thècle," AB 92[1974] 5-11 at p. 9) but the man's influence might be as easily explained if he were a prominent noble or official. Nothing demands that the incident be taken as an example of the power of the "holy man" over the bishop in matters disciplinary. For the second excommunication see Miracula Theclae Peroratio 23-45, pp. 410/412 and cf. p. 16.

55. Dagron, Vie et Miracles..., pp. 15-19. Other elements of interest include a valuable exposition of the saints' intercession on behalf of the world (Miracula Theclae 4.14-52 [BHG 1718] ed. Dagron, pp. 294/296 and cf. pp. 95-100) and a reference to bishops as πατέρες πνευματικοί: Miracula Theclae 11.1-3, p. 312; cf. Miracula Theclae 6.27-29, p. 300 and also p. 126.

56. Theodore: introduction to the Life by H. Delehaye, AASS, November 4, Brussels 1925, pp. 17F-18B. Cosmas and Damian: L. Deubner, Kosmas und Damian. Texte und Einleitung, Leipzig 1907, pp. 82-83. Nicetas, Delehaye, "Saints de Thrace...," p. 286. Intercession: Vita Theodori 15, 28, 29 (BHG 1765c) ed. Delehaye, pp. 64E-65A, 72B, 72E.

57. Visio Diadochi: E. des Places, Diadoque de Photicé. Oeuvres spirituelles, Paris 1955, pp. 9, 26-28, 78-80. Hilarion: W.A. Oldfather, Studies in the Text Tradition of St. Jerome's Vitae Patrum, Urbana 1943, pp. 339-347. BHG 752 has a different text for the first five chapters but contains no further evidence for ecclesiastical penance (Oldfather, Studies..., pp. 335-339). Excommunication (ἀφορισθείς of an acquisitive monk): Vita Hilarionis 27:10-28.8 (BHG 753) edd. Strout/Steiner, pp. 373-374.

58. So Beck, Kirche..., p. 406 and literature cited there. The later Vita Theognii by Cyril of Scythopolis (BHG 1787) is an epitome of the Life by Paulus Helladicus and makes no reference to ecclesiastical penance. For the other Vitae by Cyril see n. 90 below.

59. Vita Theognii 6, 8, 18 (BHG 1786) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 83.11-14, 87.6-9, 100.9-10.

60. Vita Theognii 6 (BHG 1786) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 84.1-2 certainly shows that the revelation of thoughts was taken for granted by the monks themselves: καὶ δὴ προσδραμών ἑνὶ τῶν εὖ εἰδότων γερόντων λογισμοὺς διακρίνειν, τὰ κρυπτὰ ἐξεκάλυψε.

61. Vita Theognii 24 (BHG) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 109.4-7: a specific parallel is drawn between the present Christian people and the Egyptians who suffered from the plagues in Exod. 7-12. This pessimism is reflected also in Vita Theognii 23-25, pp. 106.13-113.9, which passes a severe judgement on the virtue and worth of contemporary monasticism - a useful corrective to idealized views of the early monks.

62. Vita Theognii 25 (BHG 1786) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 111.18-113.9; cf. Testamentum XL martyrum 2.2-3 (BHG 1203) ed. Musurillo, pp. 356.29/358.6. Contrast n. 371 below (= BHG 1318).

63. Beck, Kirche..., p. 406.

64. Vita Isaiae 1 (BHG 2207) ed. Nau, pp. 164.33-165.2. The mode of spiritual direction followed here (questions put to the γέρων through a disciple) recalls that of Barsanuphius and John. See also A. Guillaumont, "Une notice syriaque inédite sur la Vie de l'abbé Isaïe," AB 67

(1949) 350-360 and P. Devos, "Quand est mort l'abbé Isaïe de Scété?" AB 86(1968) 350.

65. Vita Theognii 23-25 (BHG 1786) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 106.13-113.9 gives a profoundly pessimistic view of the state of monasticism. This picture is contested by Auxentius in his refutation of the sceptic (Vita Auxentii 14-17 [BHG 199] ed. Migne, PG 114.1388B-1392B) but the incident itself shows that the monks were not universally received with enthusiasm. Cf. Chapter Two, n. 18 above.

66. Vita Auxentii 66 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114.1436B: the funeral cortege of Auxentius is made up of clerics and monks "σὺν τοῖς σπουδαιοτέροις τῶν κοσμικῶν." Petrides, "Le monastère des Spoudaei...," pp. 228-231 overlooks this reference in discussing the σπουδαῖοι. If it is relevant, it shows that the group was perhaps less strictly monastic than Petrides suggests; cf. Vita Iacobi 32 (BHG 770) edd. Trautmann/Klostermann, p. 292.17-18; Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 17 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, p. 179.18-19 [= F. Halkin, Douze récits byzantins sur saint Jean Chrysostome, Brussels 1977, p. 114] and J. Nesbitt/J. Wiita, "A Confraternity of the Comnenian Era," BZ 68(1975) 360-384 at p. 361.

67. In Vita Auxentii 7 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114.1384A Auxentius adopts a pattern of action based on a very conscious imitation of the Life of Sarapion: κατέλυσε τῇ ἑξῆς ἐν τῷ ἐργαστηρίῳ ἐκείνῳ, ἀλλάξας τὸ σχῆμα αὐτοῦ, κατὰ τὸν βίον Σεραπίονος. See Vita Sarapionis (= HL 37.2-4) (BHG 1617z) ed. Bartelink, pp. 182/184.

68. Cf. Vita Elizabeth 3, 4 (BHG 2121) ed. Halkin, pp. 253.1-11, 256.14-17 with p. 256 n. 4: texts from a slightly later period that demonstrate the impact made by the Vitae on Christian life, especially in the formation of patterns of piety.

69. See Chapter Two, pp. 55-56 above.

70. Miracula Theclae 28.61-71 (BHG 1718) ed. Dagron, pp. 364/366 is a very full expression of the reality of the anger of Christ directed against sinful men. Cf. Vita Theognii 24 (BHG 1786) ed. van den Gheyn, p.109. 4-7.

71. G. Dagron, "La Vie ancienne de saint Marcel l'Acémète," AB 86(1968) 271-321 at pp. 277-279.

72. Vita Marcelli 18 (BHG 1027z) ed. Dagron, p. 301. The official, a χρυσοφύλαξ, would almost certainly have been a cleric; see J. Darrouzès, Recherches sur les ὀφφίκια de l'Eglise byzantine, Paris 1970, pp. 16-17.

73. Vita Marcelli 19 (BHG 1027z) ed. Dagron, p. 302. The case is that of a Samaritan convert who frequently relapses into the practice of his ancestral religion, each time falling ill and each time being cured by Marcellus (καὶ δὶς καὶ τρὶς καὶ πολλάκις). The man's ultimate physical death must be interpreted within the framework of the story as a reflection of his spiritual death in apostasy. If the repeated physical cures by Marcellus are to be interpreted also as the repeated forgiveness of his sin of apostasy, this incident would be the first example in the Vitae of repeated reconciliation in the case of serious sin. The coincidence of sickness and sinfulness, however, confuses any such clear interpretation of the story.

74. Vita Marcelli 36 (BHG 1027z) ed. Dagron, p. 320: Εἰ δέ που μικρὸν

ὑπεξῆλθεν, πρῶτοι πρὸς αὐτὸν συνῆσαν οἱ ἐκ λογισμῶν ταραττόμενοι, καὶ τούτους ἐθεράπευεν ἔκ τε τῆς θείας γραφῆς, ἔκ τε τῆς ἑαυτοῦ συνέσεως, ἁρμόδιον ἑκάστῳ φάρμακον ἐπιτιθείς. The context strongly indicates that this was an habitual part of Marcellus' daily activity and suggests, though not explicitly, that οἱ ἐκ λογισμῶν ταραττόμενοι may have included laymen as well as monks.

75. Vita Marcelli 24 (BHG 1027z) ed. Dagron, p. 307. For the sinfulness of returning to the world see Vita Syncleticae 23 (BHG 1694) ed. Cotelier, PG 28.1501A and Vita Auxentii 63 (BHG 199) ed. Migne, PG 114. 1433B-C. The theme continues into the sixth century: Vita Eutychii 55 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2337C and Vita Eusebii 7 (BHG 635e) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.460B-461A.

76. Marcellus is likened to Moses for his πραότης (a topos), but such heroic standards cannot be expected of all (Vita Marcelli 24 [BHG 1027z] ed. Dagron, p. 307): Μὴ οὖν τὰ ἀσύγκριτα σύγκρινε, μηδὲ ἀξιοῦ με ποιεῖν ἃ ποιεῖ Μάρκελλος ὁ παραβαλλόμενος Μωϋσῇ. Even the normal policy of refusing to receive back lapsed monks is explained not as rigour, "ἀλλ' ὅτι κἀκείνους ἐζήτει σωφρονίσαι." (Ibid.).

77. For the date see Beck, Kirche..., p. 405 and H. Delehaye, "Vita Sanctae Olympiadis et Narratio Sergiae de eiusdem translatione," AB 15 (1896) 400-423 at pp. 402-405.

78. Vita Olympiadis 15 (BHG 1375) ed. Delehaye, p. 421:8-9: "ἁμαρτωλοὺς συμπενθοῦσα, πεπλανημένους ὁδηγοῦσα." The same phrase, however, is also found in the perhaps contemporary Life of another deaconness, Eusebia of Mylasa (Vita Eusebiae 11 [BHG 633] ed. Nissen, p. 112.12-13) and may already have become only a cliché to express general ascetic virtue.

79. See Beck, Kirche..., p. 406.

80. Vita Nicolai 8 (BHG 1349z) ed. Anrich, p. 70.7-17; Beck, Kirche..., p. 408.

81. Vita Nicolai 9 (BHG 1349z) ed. Anrich, pp. 70.17-71.2.

82. Vita Nicolai 9 (BHG 1349z) ed. Anrich, pp. 70.23-71.2: the forgiveness alluded to here (συνεχώρησε τῷ ἡγεμόνι τὸ πταῖσμα) need not be understood as episcopal absolution. Συγχώρησις in this context might also mean "to excuse" and refer here to the bishop's decision not to proceed against the official according to the sanctions in the canons, that is, to take no account of the πταῖσμα.

83. Beck, Kirche..., p. 406 with literature there to which add Festugière, Les moines d'Orient, 4. vols., Paris 1961-1965, vol. 3.3, Paris 1963. pp. 83-101. The Vita Theodosii by Cyril of Scythopolis (BHG 1777) is an epitome of the text of Theodore of Petrus and contains nothing relevant to ecclesiastical penance; for Cyril see n. 90 below.

84. Vita Theodosii 40, 42 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, pp. 70.25-71.2, 77.6-11; cf. Vita Theodosii 3 (BHG 1777) ed. Schwartz, p. 239.5, 10-11.

85. Vita Theodosii 11, 27 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, pp. 17.6-13, 47.19-48.2.

86. Vita Theodosii 34 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, p. 59.16-20. The same words are also found in Vita Sabae 57 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 157.8-10.

87. Vita Theodosii 23 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, p. 42.6-19. It is not clear

whether these separate facilities are to be identified with those provided for the ἀδελφοὶ δαιμονῶντες, a separate group within the Theodosian community and one also excluded from communion: Vita Theodosii 25, pp. 45.21-46.4.

88. Vita Theodosii 58 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, p. 88.10-16. The passage assimilates excommunication (ἀφορίσαι) to the ἐπιτίμησις/ἐπιτίμιον of monastic discipline from which a monk is "loosed" (λυθῆναι), but the intention is to bring the offender to his senses, not to exact satisfaction from him for his offence.

89. Vita Theodosii 60 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, pp. 91.12-92.7 and cf. Vita Theodosii 6 (BHG 1777) ed. Schwartz, pp. 240.28-241.7. This is one of the very early appearances in hagiography of the theme of "le répondant du péché" discussed by J. Gouillard, "Christianisme byzantin et slave," Ecole pratique des Hautes Etudes. Ve Section. Sciences Religieuses. Annuaire 82(1974) 213-219 at pp. 215-217. The incident certainly casts Theodosius in the role of the charismatic "holy man", but the Life as a whole suggests nothing to support a view of the monastic and episcopal spheres as competing authorities or jurisdictions. See Chapter Two, n. 138 above.

90. In addition to the epitome of the Vita Theognii (BHG 1787) and the Vita Theodosii (BHG 1777) mentioned above in nn. 58 and 83, the Cyrillan corpus includes five other Lives: Abraamius (BHG 12), Cyriacus (BHG 463), Euthymius (BHG 647-648), Sabas (BHG 1608) and John the Hesychast (BHG 897) composed while John was still alive. Bibliography in Beck, Kirche..., pp. 406, nn. 4-5 and 408-410 to which add Festugière, Les moines..., vol. 3.1, Paris 1962, pp. 9-26.

91. Vita Abraamii 5 (BHG 12) ed. Schwartz, p. 246.9-21. The canons in question are I Nicaea 5 and Apostolic Canon 32, ed. Joannou, Discipline ..., vol. 1.1, p. 27.1-28.10 and vol. 1.2, pp. 22.15-23.4 (with further parallels there). See also Chapter Two, n. 117 above.

92. Vita Sabae 32, 90 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 118.10-16, 199.11-17. See n. 86 above and Vita Sabae 56, p. 149.4 where the ἀνάθεμα of Sabas and his monks includes not only Severus the teacher of heresy, but his followers as well.

93. Vita Sabae 85 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 192.5-9.

94. Vita Sabae 41 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 131.22-132.1. Cf. I Nicaea 1 and Apostolic Canons 22 and 23, ed. Joannou, Discipline..., vol. 1.1, pp. 23.10-24.8 and vol. 1.2, p. 18.1-13.

95. Vita Sabae 41 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 132.1-19. Some details should be noticed: there is a recognized "penance" to be assigned in such cases ("δέξασθαι αὐτὸν μετὰ τῆς προσηκούσης ἐπιμίας", p. 132.3); the penitent remains in the monastery but is effectively isolated from its life (p. 132.4-8); reconciliation comes only after a protracted period of repentance (ἐπὶ συχνὸν χρόνον) and a divine sign that the penance has been accepted (p. 132.8-15). The reconciliation itself is understood as the loosing of a bond (λῦσον ... τὸν ἐπικείμενον... δεσμόν) and is effected by a public exchange of the kiss of peace (p. 132.14-19).

96. Vita Euthymii 29 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, p. 46.18-29. The phrase διὰ προσηκούσης μετανοίας (p. 46.28) clearly suggests a developed and familiar mode of dealing with the various faults and sins characteristic of monastic life; cf. n. 74 above.

97. Reconciliation of a group of heretics: Vita Sabae 86 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 193.1-12. Reconciliation of one heretic: Vita Ioannis Hesychastis 23 (BHG 897) ed. Schwartz, pp. 218.21-219.19.

98. Vita Sabae 86 (BHG 1608) ed. Scwartz, p. 193.1-12. The whole incident illustrates the fears expressed earlier by Sabas and his monks that Monophysites might be received back ἄνευ ἐνδέσμου καὶ κανονικῆς κρίσεως (Vita Sabae 57, p. 157.8-10).

99. Vita Ioannis Hesychastis 23 (BHG 897) ed. Schwartz, pp. 218.21-219.19. In both kinds of reconciliation πληροφορία is prominent, either as an assurance of amendment (Life of John the Hesychast) or as an assurance that in spite of the absence of all the canonical niceties the anathema has truly been lifted (Life of Sabas).

100. Vita Sabae 38, 55 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 126.8-16, 147.18-24.

101. Vita Sabae 90 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 199.11-17.

102. Vita Sabae 34 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 119.30-120.3.

103. Vita Sabae 59 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 160.24-27. The ἀπέλυσε that usually closes anecdotes of this kind refers to the dismissal not to the absolution of the sinners.

104. This may reflect a kind of double standard of discipline in which less was expected of the laity than of monks. Contrast the attitude mirrored in the fourth canon of Neocaesarea: Ἐὰν πρόσηται τις ἐπιθυμῆσαι γυναικὸς συγκαθευδῆσαι μετ' αὐτῆς, μὴ ἔλθῃ δὲ εἰς ἔργον αὐτοῦ ἡ ἐνθύμησις, φαίνεται ὅτι ὑπὸ τῆς χάριτος ἐρρύσθη (ed. Joannou, Discipline..., vol. 1.2, p. 77.1-7) with the teaching of Euthymius to his monks: οἱ γὰρ πειραζόμενοι ὑπὸ σωματικῶν ἡδονῶν καὶ μὴ πλησιάζοντες σώμασι κατὰ διάνοιαν ἐκπορνεύουσι (Vita Euthymii 24 [BHG 648] ed. Schwartz, p. 36.26-28).

105. Confessions of sin (including ἀπιστία, lust, disobedience and theft): Vita Euthymii 17, 18, 20, 48, 50 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, pp. 27.29-28.1, 29.10-26, 33.22-28, 70.7-12, 72.8-74.27; Vita Sabae 39, 44, 58 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 130.3-14, 134.8-135.28, 160.9-13; Vita Ioannis Hesychastis 8, 12 (BHG 897) ed. Schwartz, pp. 207.11-28, 211.9-14. Confession of λογισμοί: Vita Euthymii 9, p. 17.3-8 and Vita Ioannis Hesychastis 21, 22, pp. 217.25-218.1, 218.13-20. The last text is an early hagiographical example of the πόλεμος against blasphemy being relieved by confession to the saint; see also AP Poemen 93, PG 65.344C-345A with Chapter Two, n. 138 above and Chapter Four, nn. 100-101 below.

106. Vita Ioannis Hesychastis 8 (BHG 897) ed. Schwartz, p. 207.11-28.

107. The text does not imply the existence of any such institution or custom as a confession required of candidates for ordination, but it does presume a certain privacy attaching to the very act of confessing sins.

108. Vita Sabae 41, 44, 49 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 131.22-132.19, 134.8-135.28, 139.1-19.

109. In Vita Sabae 41, 44 (BHG 1608) the divine revelation of forgiveness does not eo ipso do away with the need to "loose" the sinner's bond (ed. Schwartz, pp. 132.15-19, 135.21-33). This would seem to imply a distinction between the invisible bond loosed by God and the visi-

ble one loosed by the hegumen.

110. Deaths of the principals: Vita Cyriaci 13 (BHG 463) ed. Schwartz, p. 235.18-19; Vita Euthymii 39 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, pp. 58.13-59.15; Vita Sabae (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 182.12-183.2. The times of the deaths of Euthymius and Sabas were known to them beforehand. John the Hesychast was still alive when Cyril wrote his Life and the conclusion of the Vita Abraamii is not extant in Greek. The perjurer: Vita Euthymii 58, pp. 80.2-81.26.

111. The deathbed is typically considered too late for penance (cf. Chapter Two, n. 152 above), but in Vita Euthymii 35 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, p. 54.8-10 the Empress Eudoxia, given an advance warning of four months, is able to die piously and well-prepared.

112. Vita Sabae 39 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 130.3-14. Eucharistic communion here is better understood as viaticum (traditionally available to all: I Nicaea 13, ed. Joannou, Discipline..., vol. 1.1, p. 35.1-19) than as the sign of the reconciliation of sinners, but in anecdotes of this kind the illness which had been the consequence of sin - in this case an illness of seven months' duration - may itself have been reckoned as a kind of penance; cf. Vita Ioannis Hesychastis 20 (BHG 897) ed. Schwartz, p. 217.1-10.

113. Vita Abraamii 3, 4 (BHG 12) ed. Schwartz, pp. 244.30-32, 245.23-25 and Vita Sabae 16, 51, 54 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 100.20-101.1, 142.20-143.15, 145.7-13. The last two of these texts have their setting in Constantinople among the nobility of the court.

114. Vita Euthymii 29 (BHG 468) ed. Schwartz, p. 46.21-29 in which the liturgical exclamation Τὰ ἅγια τοῖς ἁγίοις is interpreted ὡς ἂν εἴποι τις· ἐπειδήπερ ἐγώ, φησίν, ἄνθρωπός εἰμι ὁμοιοπαθὴς ὑμῶν ἀγνοῶν τὰ ἑκάστῳ πεπραγμένα τε καὶ μεμελετημένα, διὰ τοῦτο λέγω καὶ μαρτύρομαι ἐν κυρίῳ· εἴ τις ὑπὸ γαστριμαργίας ἢ συγκαταθέσεως αἰσχρῶν λογισμῶν βεβρώμωται, εἴ τις ὑπὸ μίσους ἢ μνησικακίας ἐκκέκωται, εἴ τις ὑπὸ φθόνου ἢ ὀργῆς τετόλωται, εἴ τις ὑπὸ ὑπερηφανείας ἢ ἀλαζονείας κεκράτηται, μὴ τολμήσῃ προσελθεῖν τούτῳ τῷ θείῳ καὶ ἀχράντῳ πυρὶ ἢ δίκῃ προσηκούσης μετανοίας ἀπονιψάμενος καθαρίσῃ ἑαυτὸν ἀπὸ παντὸς μολυσμοῦ σαρκὸς καὶ πνεύματος.

115. Archiepiscopal visitations: Vita Euthymii 16 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, pp. 26.17-27.2; Vita Sabae 19 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 103.8-104.25. Monastic recognition of episcopal jurisdiction and authority: Vita Euthymii 5, 43, pp. 13.16-27, 64.14-15; Vita Sabae 30, 35, 65, 69, pp. 114.23-26/115.15-26, 122.5-8, 166.17-26, 171.20-24. Monastic concern for the maintenance of the canons: Vita Euthymii 27, pp. 44.15-45.1; Vita Sabae 32, 41, 57, pp. 118.10-16, 131.22-132.1, 157.8-10. Against these very specific texts evidence that opposes Charisma and Amt is weak and very indirect, and cannot be presumed to have formed the general background against which more particular historical questions, such as the development of ecclesiastical penance, must be place Vita Euthymii 45, p. 67.4-6; Vita Sabae 18, p. 102.15-21; Vita Ioannis Hesychastis 3 (BHG 897) ed. Schwartz, p. 202.23-25.

116. Vita Sabae 19 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 104.16-18. There is no suggestion here or in Vita Euthymii 36 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, pp. 54.22-55.11 that the recognition of "charismatic" holiness renders the episcopal office or authority otiose. Although the picture is idealized, harmony rather than opposition between monk and bishop is the

deliberate teaching of the Lives.

117. The text is accepted by Anrich as dating from a time soon after Nicholas' death in 564: G. Anrich, Hagios Nikolaos. Der heilge Nikolaos in der griechischen Kirche, Leipzig/Berlin, 1917, vol. 2, pp. 216-220.

118. The one example of a confession of sin in the Life is perhaps better interpreted as an exorcism: Vita Nicolai 65 (BHG 1347) ed. Anrich, p. 49.1-7.

119. See Beck, Kirche..., p.407 and especially the critical discussion by I. Shahîd, The Martyrs of Najrân. New Documents, Brussels 1971, pp. 200-231. Shahîd thinks the Greek Life may have been written at Constantinople, but that there is every reason to believe that the Vita Arethae reflects the conditions of the geographical area in which it is set (pp. 202-207). See also M. van Esbroeck, "L'Ethiopie à l'époque de Justinien: S. Arethas de Neğrān et S. Athanase de Clysma," in IV Congresso Internazionale di Studi Etiopici (Roma 10-15 aprile 1972, I + II, Rome 1974, vol. 1, pp. 117-139 at pp. 133-135.

120. Vita Arethae 39 (BHG 166) ed. Carpentier, p. 758F and see R. Guilland, Etudes byzantines, Paris 1959, pp. 33-51 with I. Shahîd, "The Kebra Nagast in the Light of Recent Research," Le Muséon 89(1976) 133-178 at pp. 166-171.

121. Vita Cyriaci 11 (BHG 463) ed. Schwartz, p. 233.4-5; Vita Euthymii 19, 24 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, pp. 30.28-32.5, 36.30-37.29; and cf. Vita Theodosii 42 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, pp. 73.25-74.1.

122. Punishment in history: Vita Marcelli 31 (BHG 1027z) ed. Dagron, p. 314; Vita Theodosii 23 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, pp. 41.13-43.8; Vita Euthymii 25 (BHG 648) ed. Schwartz, p. 38.15-25; Vita Sabae 57 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, p. 155.1-2; Vita Arethae 15 (BHG 166) ed. Carpentier, p. 735A. See also n. 11 above.

123. Vita Menae 2 (BHG 1272) ed. Pien, p. 169C. Grumel considers the incident a simple rupture in communion rather than any formal act of excommunication: Les régestes..., vol. 1.1, Paris 1972^{2}, N. 242, pp. 175-176 and cf. Beck, Kirche..., p. 408.

124. See the introduction to the Life by G. Henskens in AASS, April 1, Antwerp 1675, pp. 548B-549F, to which add R. Janin, "Eutichio, patriarca di Costantinopoli, santo," BS 5.323-324, Rome 1964 with further bibliography.

125. Vita Eutychii 39 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2320D. The mutual excommunications of local hierarchs - and especially of successive patriarchs and their supporters - must have caused many more problems in the practical order of ecclesiastical discipline than the grander schisms of East and West.

126. Vita Eutychii 81 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2365C with reference to Nazianzen's Oratio 43 In laudem Basilii magni 40.1-4 (BHG 245) ed. Boulenger, pp. 142/144. Cf. Vita Eutychii 74, PG 86:2. 2360A and Chapter Four, n. 118 below.

127. Vita Eutychii 58 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2340C-2341A. The incident occurs during Eutychius' exile at Amasea in the period from 565 to 577, but Eutychius is portrayed as one who acts through-

out with episcopal authority.

128. Vita Eutychii 58 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2340C-2341A.

129. Vita Eutychii 58 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2341A. Forgiveness of sin comes through the intercession of Eutychius, itself understood as a charism: Ἐπειδὴ ὁ αὐτὸς συναμφότερον ἐπέκτητο χάρισμα ὁ θαυμάσιος, τὸ τῆς ἱάσεως φημι, καὶ τὸ λῦσαι τὸν δεδεμένον. The cure is effected by anointing and the man is dismissed without any mention of an ἐπιτίμιον; but cf. n. 112 above,

130. Vita Eutychii 55-56 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2337A-2340B. The story contains one of the early hagiographical uses of the term ἐξαγόρευσις and describes the prayer of Eutychius as "customary": ὅτε γοῦν γένοιτο ἡ ἐξαγόρευσις παρὰ τοῦ πάσχοντος, ἐποίησεν ἐπ' αὐτῷ τὴν συνήθη πάλιν εὐχὴν ὁ μέγας τοῦ Θεοῦ ἄνθρωπος. Cf. also Chapter Two, n. 51 above, and in this chapter n. 75 above.

131. Vita Eutychii 18 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2296A-B.

132. Vita Eutychii 45 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2328A and cf. Vita Eutychii 58, 85, PG 86:2.2341A, 2372B. Earlier in the Life allusion is made to an imposition of hands customary to Eutychius' grandfather (also a priest) in cases of healing and exorcism, but no such imposition (ἐπίθεσις τῶν χειρῶν) is attributed to Eutychius himself: Vita Eutychii 5, PG 86:2.2280B-C.

133. So, apparently, G. Downey, Constantinople in the Age of Justinian, Norman 1960, pp. 114, 122.

134. Vita Eutychii 78 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2364B-C and a similar scene at Easter of 582: Vita Eutychii 94, PG 86:2.2380B.

135. Vita Eutychii 74-78 (BHG 657) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 86:2.2357B-2364C.

136. R. Janin, "Matrona, badessa a Costantinopoli, santa," BS 9.104-105, Rome 1967, and the introduction to the Life by Delehaye, AASS, November 3, Brussels 1910, pp. 786B-790E. Spiritual direction, especially of noble ladies: Vita Matronae 32, 33 (BHG 1221) ed. Delehaye, pp. 805A-B, 805B-D.

137. Beck, Kirche..., p. 410 with references there and A.-J. Festugière, Sainte Thècle, Saints Côme et Damien, Saints Cyr et Jean (Extraits), Saint Georges. Collections grecques de miracles, Paris 1971, pp. 85-95. The collections are deliberately written to edify: πρὸς οἰκοδομὴν καὶ ὠφέλειαν τῶν ψυχῶν (Miracula Cosmae et Damiani Prologus 17-18 [BHG 385-386] ed. Deubner, p. 97), a fact well illustrated by the saints' opposition to blasphemy and heresy: Miracula Cosmae et Damiani 6.9-34, 17.42-57 (BHG 385-386, 387) ed. Deubner, pp. 110-111, 143. In the last text the saints are represented, provocatively, as hating the heretic himself and not just his error.

138. Miracula Cosmae et Damiani 12.1-130 (BHG 387) ed. Deubner, pp. 128-132. Martha cares for the sick as penance for her sin: Miracula 12.18-29, p.129 and cf. Chapter Two, n. 165 above.

139. See R. Janin, "Giovanni IV il Digiunatore, patriarca di Costantinopoli, santo," BS 6.935-937, Rome 1965 for biographical details.

140. The relationship of John to the Syntagma XIV Titulorum is discussed by Honigmann, Trois mémoires..., pp. 58-64 and cf. CPG 7555-7560 with further bibliography there.

141. Beck, Kirche..., pp. 410-411. Golinduch enters into communion with the orthodox, but no mention is made of any prior act of reconciliation or penance: Vita Golinduch 19 (BHG 700) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 167.13-17. Elsewhere a reference to priests as πνευματικοὶ ἄνδρες cautions against the presumption that "holy men" were necessarily always opposed to clerics in the popular mind: Vita Golinduch 2 (and cf. 6) (BHG 702b) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 352.13-15 (and cf. p. 355.15-17).

142. Albianus: Bardenhewer, Geschichte der altkirchlichen Literatur, 5 vols., Freiburg 1913-1932, vol. 4, p. 172 with F. Halkin, AB 84(1966) 265. Barlaam: Beck, Kirche..., p. 402 and A.Amore, "Barlaam, santo, martire di Antiochia," BS 2.786-787, Rome 1962. Cleonicius and companions: Beck, Kirche..., p. 405 and G. Gordini, "Cleonico, Eutropio e Basilisco, santi, martiri," BS 4.54-56, Rome 1964. Dometius: Beck, Kirche..., p. 402 and P. Peeters, "S. Dometios le martyr et S. Dometios le médecin," AB 57(1939) 72-104. Hermylus and Stratonicus: F. Halkin, "Trois textes inédits sur les saints Hermyle et Stratonice, martyrs à Singidunum (Belgrade)," AB 89(1971) 5-45 at p. 5. Mercurius: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 403-404 and J.-M. Sauget, "Mercurio, santo, martire di Cesarea di Cappadocia," BS 9.362-367, Rome 1967. Thallelaeus: H. Bröcker, Der hl. Thalelaios. Texte und Untersuchungen, Münster 1976, pp. 89, 153-170 and F. Halkin, "Saint Thalelée anachorète ou martyr?" AB 95(1977) 72.

143. Vita Dometii 12 (BHG 560) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 308.3-21. The theme of intercession is prominent in the Life: Vita Dometii 13, 23, pp. 309.4-14, 317.2-3.

144. Vita Dometii 12 (BHG 560) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 308.21 and see nn. 112 and 129 above. Although the Life of Dometius is grouped here with those of other martyrs, it perhaps belongs as much or more to the genre of the Vita monastica - hence the presence of penitential themes.

145. For the Life of Parthenius see J.-M. Sauget, "Partenio, vescovo di Lampsaco, santo," BS 10.341-342, Rome 1968 and F. Halkin, "Sainte Elisabeth d'Héraclée, abesse à Constantinople," AB 91(1973) 249-264 at pp. 249-250 and p. 253, n.4.

146. Vita Parthenii 11 (BHG 1422) ed. Malou, PG 114.1360C-1361A.

147. For the connexion between healing and forgiveness see Vita Parthenii 6 (BHG 1422) ed. Malou, PG 114.1353D-1356A, and Chapter two, n. 108 above. For the deathbed see n. 111 above and nn. 364-365 below.

148. Beck, Kirche..., p. 402; W. Telfer, "St. Peter of Alexandria and Arius," AB 67(1949) 117-130 at pp. 118-119 and J.-M. Sauget, "Pietro I, vescovo di Alessandria, santo, martire," BS 10.762-770, Rome 1968.

149. Vita Petri Alexandrini 2-3 (BHG 1502) ed. Viteau, pp. 69.18/71.12. Arius enlists other clergy to intercede for him with the bishop, but they cannot lift the excommunication by themselves.

150. Vita Petri Alexandrini 3 (BHG 1502) ed. Viteau, p. 71.8-10: Ἄρειος καὶ ἐν τῷ νῦν αἰῶνι καὶ ἐν τῷ μέλλοντι ἔσται κεχωρισμένος ἐκ τῆς δόξης Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ τοῦ υἱοῦ τοῦ Θεοῦ. Cf. Vita Petri Alexandrini

4-5 (BHG 1502a) ed. Devos, p. 165.

151. Vita Petri Alexandrini 3-5 (BHG 1502) ed. Viteau, p. 71.10/73.3.

152. Vita Petri Alexandrini 2, 5 (BHG 1502) ed. Viteau, pp. 69.18-22, 71.25-26. See n. 91 above.

153. The Orientalists F. Nau (in a review of the edition by H. Grégoire/M.-A. Kugener in ROC 27[1929-1930] 422-441) and J.-M. Sauget ("Porfirio, vescovo di Gaza, santo," BS 10.1039-1043, Rome 1968) defend a fifth-century date against the conclusions of the editors: Marc le Diacre. Vie de Porphyre, Paris 1930, pp. xxxiii-lxxxviii. Both Halkin (AB 49[1931] 155-160) and Beck (Kirche..., p. 404) seem content with a sixth-century date for the Life in its present form.

154. Vita Porphyrii 57.11-17 (BHG 1570) edd. Grégoire/Kugener, pp. 46-47.

155. Ibid. It is unlikely that ἀναστραγίζειν means "rebaptize" here as the PGL entry suggests; contrast the sense of στραγίζειν in Vita Porphyrii 31.6-10 (BHG 1570) edd. Grégoire/Kugener, p. 27. In fact, the ritual follows very closely the fifth-century rite for the reconciliation of heretics discussed in Chapter Two, p. 21 (with n. 13) above.

156. Vita Porphyrii 65.14-16 (BHG 1570) edd. Grégoire/Kugener, p. 52. Nau (ROC 27[1929-1930] p. 430) provides a further parallel for excommunication in similar circumstances; see also n. 171 below.

157. In Vita Porphyrii 35.1-20 (BHG 1570) edd. Grégoire/Kugener, pp. 29-30 monastic virtue - which includes the charismatic διορατικόν - deliberately yields to the episcopal office: Ὑμῖν πρέπει τοῖς ἱερεῦσιν τὸν ἔμπροσθεν τόπον ἔχειν, ἐμοὶ δὲ τῷ ταπεινῷ καὶ μηδὲ ἠξιωμένῳ χειροτονίας τὸν ὀπίσω (Vita Porphyrii 35.7-9, p. 30).

158. See W. Levison, "Konstantinische Schenkung und Silvester-Legende," in Miscellanea Francesco Ehrle, Rome 1924, vol. 2, pp. 159-247 at p. 227.

159. Vita Silvestri 8, 91 (BHG 1629) ed. Combefis, pp. 268.31-269.2, 335. 20-27.

160. Cf. Chapter Two, pp. 32, 52 above.

161. A critical edition and study of this text is badly needed. B. Outtier, "Saint Ephrem d'après ses biographies et ses oeuvres," Parole de l' Orient 4(1973) 11-33 at pp. 17, 27-28 provides a firm basis for dating the text to the sixth century. Earlier ascriptions of date range from the fifth to the eighth centuries but rest largely on subjective impressions. For ease of reference the separate sections listed under Roman numerals in the BHG 247-260 will be treated as continuous chapter numbers of a single Vita.

162. In laudem Basilii magni 40.1-4, 64.4, 72.4, 81.4 (BHG 245) ed. Boulenger, pp. 142/144, 194, 214, 228. Compare Gregory of Nyssa, Oratio in laudem Basilii 2, 10 (BHG 244) ed. Morel, PG 46.792B, 812B and contrast the cases in the Vita Basilii of the young man (BHG 253) and of the sinful rich woman (BHG 258) in which most of the drama of the conversion is over before either comes to meet the bishop.

163. Basil prays with the young man and for the forgiveness of the rich woman's sins: Vita Basilii 7 (BHG 253) ed. Radermacher, pp. 138.5-

10 and 140.9-11; Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, pp. 216D, 217A-C.

164. Vita Basilii 5 (BHG 251) ed. Combefis, p. 183A-B. The incident is a topos recounted also in the Lives of Epiphanius (BHG 596) and John Chrysostom (BHG 876m) and in Pratum spirituale 150 (BHG 1442).

165. Vita Basilii 5 (BHG 251) ed. Combefis, p. 183B-C.

166. Vita Basilii 7 (BHG 253) ed. Radermacher, pp. 136.2-140.12.

167. Vita Basilii 7 (BHG 253) ed. Radermacher, pp.140.12-146.12, 148.1-3.

168. Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, pp. 215A-216A.

169. Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, pp. 216A-217C.

170. Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, pp. 217C-220A.

171. The threat of excommunication that Basil makes in Vita Basilii 5 (BHG 251) seems to confirm this interpretation: διεστάλμενος ταῖς γυναιξίν, ὡς εἴ τις ἔξω τῶν βήλων ὀφθῇ διακύπτουσα, τῆς θείας λειτουργίας γινομένης, ἐξωτεῖσθαι τῆς ἐκκλησίας, καὶ ἀκοινώνητον μένειν (ed. Combefis, p. 183D). Excommunication is a severe penalty to invoke (even as a threat) in such a matter; cf. n. 156 above.

172. See Chapter Two, n. 129 above and in this chapter, n. 34.

173. The anxiety of the woman not to "leave anything out" from her confession may be remarked in passing: Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, p. 216 A-B. This, as much as the shame of revealing her sins, seems to be the point of a written confession as the reference to 1 Tim 2:4 makes clear. Cf. a similar notion in the Vita Antonii (BHG 140) in Chapter Two, p. 29 above.

174. The differences between the two models must not be exaggerated; cf. n. 350 below.

175. Forgiveness is conceived here as the expiation of one's sins and the reception of an assurance that one's penance has been accepted by God: πῶς δὲ καὶ πληροφορηθῶ, ὅτι μετανοοῦσαν δέχεταί με ὁ Θεός; The general assurance first given by Basil that all true conversion is followed by divine forgiveness is not adequate: Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, p. 218A-B.

176. Beck, Kirche..., p. 403.

177. Vita Abraham et Mariae (BHG 7) ed. Thwaites, p.ϖνα, c.1:25-c.2:5. Cf. Vita Abraham et Mariae 10 (BHG 6) ed. Assemani, p. 13A-E.

178. Vita Abraham et Mariae (BHG 7) ed. Thwaites, p.ϖνγ, c.1:48-c.2:1. Two distinct assurances are required, one that penance is accepted by God in certain cases of serious sin, and another that a particular penance has in fact been accepted by God. Corresponding to the miraculous sign of the second assurance (healings performed through Mary's prayers) is the extraordinary assurance of Abraham in the first instance that he will make himself responsible for Mary's sin on the day of judgement. Cf. n. 89 above, with Chapter Two, n. 138 above. Note also that Abraham the "répondant du péché" is a priest: Vita Abraham et Mariae 4 (BHG 6) ed. Assemani, p. 4C and Vita Abraham

et Mariae (BHG 7) ed. Thwaites, p. ννβ, c.2:39-51.

179. For the date see Beck, Kirche..., p. 403 and L. Radermacher, Griechische Quellen..., pp. 64-66. For the story of Cyprian see Chapter Two, p. 30 above.

180. Vita Mariae 3 (BHG 1045) ed. Radermacher, p. 269.8-27. A point is made of the fact that the actual confession is in private (κατ' ἰδίαν) and indeed the element of shame is prominent throughout the narrative. A special penitential garb (apart from the monastic σχῆμα) has not been encountered before in the Vitae.

181. Vita Mariae 3 (BHG 1045) ed. Radermacher, p. 269.28-270.15.

182. Vita Mariae 3 (BHG 1045) ed. Radermacher, p. 270.13-15...25-28. Anthemius' penance is in fact a lifelong conversion. The return of the written contract with the devil which was a feature of a similar story in Vita Basilii 7 (BHG 253) ed. Radermacher, pp. 146.3/148.3 is absent here.

183. The bishop is described as πάνυ θεοφιλὴς καὶ δοῦλον τοῦ Θεοῦ : Vita Mariae 3 (BHG 1045) ed. Radermacher, p. 269.9.

184. See n. 178 above.

185. For the date see K. Wessely, "Literarische Fragmente der Papyri aus El-Faijum," Wiener Studien 11(1889) 175-191 at pp. 189-191 and "Zu den griechischen Papyri des Louvre und der Bibliothèque nationale," in Fünfzehnter Jahresbericht des K.K. Staatsgymnasiums in Hernals, Vienna 1889, pp. 3-46 at p. 24.

186. Vita Theodorae (BHG 1727) ed. Wessely, pp. 26.13-27.13.

187. Vita Theodorae (BHG 1727) ed. Wessely, pp. 26.14-27.6 and 28.8-29.3.

188. Vita Theodorae (BHG 1727) ed. Wessely, pp. 35.15-36.6. For the topos of the woman in a male monastery see J. Anson, "The Female Transvestite in Early Monasticism. The Origin and Development of a Motif," Viator 5(1974) 1-32 and E. Patlagean, "L'histoire de la femme déguisée en moine et l'évolution de la sainteté féminine à Byzance," Studi Medievali Serie Terza 17(1976) 597-623.

189. Vita Theodorae (BHG 1727) ed. Wessely, pp. 36.4-6, 40.9-41.4. The severity with which Theodora is treated serves the dramatic purpose of heightening the impact of the ultimate "recognition" when her true identity is discovered. The details, especially enclosure within the ἐσώτερον κελλίον) may be compared with Paralipomena 11 (BHG 1399) ed. Halkin, p. 135.17-23 and Vita Sabae 41 (see n. 95 above) and contrasted with Vita Marcelli 24 (see n. 75 above).

190. Note the expression " ὁ τὴν καθημερινὴν ἄφεσιν ποιούμενος" in Vita Theodorae (BHG 1727) ed. Wessely, p. 39.12-13.

191. For the dates of these texts see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 403 (Theophanes and Pansemne), 405 (Conon), 409 (Gerasimus) and M.R. James, Apocrypha Anecdota, Cambridge 1893, p. 95 (Zosimus). Vita Theophanis et Pansemnae 15, 17 (BHG 2447) ed. de Stoop, pp. 326.25-28, 327.22-328.16 may perhaps be mentioned here for the important idea that penance is in some way a prolongation of baptism and that propitiation for pre-baptismal sin continued even after baptism in tears and ascesis. In this context baptism does not have the subjective value

of a fresh beginning with the past forgotten, and penance as a "baptism of tears" (so Vita Mariae Antiochenae 3 [BHG 1045] ed. Rademacher, p. 269.31-33) should perhaps be understood more as a lifelong activity than as a particular moment or event analogous to baptism by water.

192. The Armenian original ("Agathangelus") is normally placed in the late fifth century (Altaner/Stuiber, Patrologie, p. 352) and the Greek version now to the late sixth or early seventh: G. Lafontaine, La version grecque ancienne du livre arménien d'Agathange. Edition critique, Louvain-la-neuve 1973, pp. 33-39, 147. See also G. Garitte, "La Vie grecque inédite de saint Grégoire d'Arménie (Ms 4. d'Ochrida)," AB 83(1965) 233-290 at pp. 254-255. For the primacy of baptism in the context of penance in the Teaching of Gregory of Armenia (= Vita 259-715) which is absent from the Greek Life see R.W. Thomson, The Teaching of Saint Gregory. An Early Armenian Catechism, Cambridge, Mass. 1970, pp. 27-28, but contrast the evidence in Carr, "Penance among the Armenians...," pp. 65-68.

193. Vita Gregorii Illuminatoris 134.13-17, 137.11-14, 139.4-10 (BHG 712) ed. Lafontaine, pp. 303-304, 307, 309-310.

194. The impact of such a Vita on a Greek audience in the seventh century, not the historical testimony to fifth-century Armenian conditions, is the important factor to be remembered here.

195. Vita Leonis 6 (BHG 982) ed. van de Vorst, p. 407.16-17. There is no reference to the excommunication of the followers of the two leaders. For the text see Beck, Kirche..., p. 411.

196. Beck, Kirche..., p. 459.

197. Vita Gregorii Nazianzeni 18 (BHG 723) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35. 261D-264A.

198. Vita Gregorii Nazianzeni 40, 42 (BHG 723) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.288A-C, 289B. This authority included both public and private ἔλεγχος and ἐπιτίμησις and is characterized as medicinal: Vita 40, PG 35.288B: Τοὺς μὲν ἤλεγχε δημοσίᾳ, ὅσους αἰσχύνῃ πρὸς μετάμελον ἦγε· τοῖς δὲ ἰδίᾳ τὰ πταίσματα ἐνεφάνιζε· τοῖς δὲ ἐπετίμα, οἷς τοῦτο λυσιτελὲς εἶναι ᾠήθη· τοὺς δὲ κατορθοῦντας ἐπῄνει πατρικῶς τε καὶ κηδεμονικῶς and ὡς τις ἄριστος ἰατρὸς τῆς τῶν καμνόντων ἕξεως, κατάλληλον τὴν φαρμακείαν διανέμων ἑκάστῳ.

199. Vita Gregorii Nazianzeni 47 (BHG 723) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35. 293D-296B.

200. See Chapter Two, p. 34 above.

201. Carmen 11.1466-1471 (BHG 730a) ed. Jungck, p. 124:

Ταῦτ' εἶπεν· ἐκλάσθην δὲ τοῖς λόγοις ἐγὼ,
φωνὴν δ' ἀφῆκα τοῦ κακοῦ λυτήριον·
«νεός σε σῴζοι· τὸν σεσωσμένον δ' ἐμὲ
χρηστὸν φανῆναι τῷ σφαγεῖ οὐδὲν μέγα.
ἐμὸν πεποίηκεν δὲ τὸ θρέμμος· σκόπει,
ὅπως ἐμοί τε καὶ νεῷ χρένη πρέπων.»

Compare Vita Gregorii Nazianzeni 47 (BHG 723) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.296A-B: Νεανίας δέ τις, ὑπολειφθεὶς, καὶ ταῖς ἑαυτοῦ χερσὶ συμπιέσας αὐτοῦ τοὺς πόδας, ὀδυρμοῖς καὶ δάκρυσιν ἱκετεύε τὸν μακάριον συγχωνῶναι αὐτῷ τὸ πλημμέλημα. Τοῦ δὲ πυνθανομένου τί τὸ λεχόμενον εἴη, οὐδὲν ἀπεκρίνατο, πλὴν

τοῦ θρηνεῖν, καὶ συγγνώμην αἰτεῖν... Αὐτίκα δὲ ὁ Πατὴρ, οἷα πατὴρ, τάδε φησί· « Γένοιτο σοι Χριστὸς εὐμενὴς, ὦ φίλτατε, καὶ δώη σοι συγγνώμην αὐτὸς, ὁ κἀμὲ περισώσας. Μόνον εἰς ἀπολογίαν τῆς τόλμης ἐμὸς χενοῦ, τὴν αἵρεσιν βδελυξάμενος, Θεῷ τε πρόσελθε, καὶ δούλευε αὐτῷ δουλείαν εἰλικρινῆ καὶ ἑκούσιον.

202. So Beck, Kirche..., pp. 400-401 and F. Nau, "Sur diverses homélies pseudépigraphiques, sur les oeuvres attribuées à Eusèbe d'Alexandrie et sur un nouveau manuscrit de la chaîne contra Severianos," ROC 13 (1908) 406-435 at pp. 433-434. See also CPG 5510-5533 and J. Leroy (+)/F. Glorie,"'Eusèbe d'Alexandrie' source d' 'Eusèbe de Gaule'," Sacris Erudiri 19(1969-1970) 33-70 at p. 47. For ease of reference the twenty-three divisions listed in Halkin (BHG 635-635z) will be treated artificially as chapter numbers in a single and expanded "Vita" of Eusebius.

203. Vita Eusebii 1.2 (BHG 635) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.301D; Vita Eusebii 19 (BHG 635u) ed. Montfaucon, PG 61.735:66-736:40; Vita Eusebii 6.2-3 (BHG 635f) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.325B-D.

204. Vita Eusebii 6.2 (BHG 635f) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.325B: καὶ πάλιν λέγει αὐτῷ ὁ Ἀλέξανδρος· Πάτερ, ποία ἁμαρτία ἀνωτέρα ἐστιν;

205. Vita Eusebii 8.3 (BHG 635h) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.336A-B: καὶ τῶν ἐπιθυμιῶν ἁπάντων ἀπεχομένων, δῆλον ὅτι οὐδὲν ἄλλο μεριμνᾷ εἰ μὴ τοῦ θανάτου αὐτοῦ, καὶ προσβλέπων τὸν θάνατον μνημονεύει τὰ κακὰ καὶ τὰς ἁμαρτίας ἃς ἐποίησεν, καὶ κλαίει καὶ μετανοεῖ ἐπὶ ταῖς ἁμαρτίαις αὐτοῦ στενάζων, καὶ καταλιμπάνει τὰ ἴδια αὐτοῦ τῇ Ἐκκλησίᾳ, καὶ τοῖς μαρτυρίοις, καὶ τοῖς πένησιν, καὶ ἐξομολογεῖται τὰς ἁμαρτίας αὐτοῦ τοῖς πρεσβυτέροις καὶ κοινωνίας ἀξιοῦται, καὶ λύει τὰς ἁμαρτίας αὐτοῦ καὶ δικαιοῦται.

206. Vita Eusebii 8.3 (BHG 635h) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.336B-C.

207. Vita Eusebii 9.4-5 (BHG 635i) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.345C-348D. The context makes it clear that the pastor is a priest (Ταῦτα πάντα ὀφείλει εἰδέναι ὁ ἱερεύς... : Vita Eusebii 9.5, PG 86:1.348D), as indeed the whole sermon is presented as if delivered to the priest Alexander, the designated successor to Eusebius in the episcopacy: Vita Eusebii 1.3 (BHG 635) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.309A-B. However, another recension of the text suggests that ἱερεύς can be understood throughout as ἀρχιερεύς : Vita Eusebii 9 (BHG 635j) ed. Montfaucon, PG 61.785:16-17.

208. Vita Eusebii 9.5 (BHG 635i) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.348B-C.

209. Vita Eusebii 9.5 (BHG 635i) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.348C: Τὰ πρῶτα κακὰ συγχώρησον αὐτῷ· τῷ γὰρ ἀφέοντι, ἀφεθήσεται αὐτῷ. Καὶ πάλιν ὁ φιλάνθρωπος Κύριος ἔφη, ὅτε Εἰ ἑβδομήκοντα καὶ ἑπτὰ ἁμαρτήσει εἰς σὲ ὁ ἀδελφός σου, ἄφες αὐτῷ καὶ μηδέποτε ὀνειδίσῃς τὸ κεκαλυμμένον, μηδὲ παροργίσῃς τὸν ἐπιστρέφοντα. Cf. n. 82 above. The same text presumes that a deacon, in the absence of the ἱερεύς , can excommunicate (ἀφορίσαι), though it does not also say, and it is perhaps doubtful, whether a deacon could also loose from an excommunication on his own authority: Vita Eusebii 9.6, PG 86:1.348D-349A. Compare the principles behind the canons cited in n. 91 above, and cf. C. de Clercq, Les textes juridiques dans les Pandectes de Nicon de la Montagne Noire, Venice 1942, canon 55, pp. 59-60.

210. The Eusebian texts make it very plain that the sins of Christians, especially those which prevent them from approaching communion, can be forgiven by means of the private penitential exercises of the Christian life, including tears and alms, and apparently without any

recourse to the clergy: Vita Eusebii 4.2, 4.4 (BHG 635c) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.416C-417A, 420B-C; Vita Eusebii 4d.12 (BHG 635d) ed. Nau, p. 419.3-5; Vita Eusebii 6.4 (BHG 635f) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.328A-B; Vita Eusebii 10.4 (BHG 635k) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.352D-353B; Vita Eusebii 23.6 (BHG 635z) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.429C-432C. Though the corpus presumes the supremacy of monastic institutions (Vita Eusebii 2.1 [BHG 635a] ed. Mai, PG 86:1.316A), it also contains a direct rejection of the kind of Donatist sacramental theology sometimes ascribed to proponents of monastic control over the apostolic power to bind and loose: Vita Eusebii 9.2-4 (BHG 635i) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.344A-345D.

211. For date and provenance see P. van den Ven, La Vie ancienne de S. Syméon Stylite le Jeune (521-592), Brussels 1962, vol. 1, pp. 101*-108* and H. Delehaye, Les saints stylites, Brussels 1962[rp], p. lxxi.

212. Vita Symeonis 130.12-21, 116.1-13, 239.1-33 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 122-123, 95, 214-215. Magic and idolatry were taken very seriously both by the church (Vita Symeonis 221.1-44, 223.21-25, pp. 190-192, 193-194) and by the imperial authorities (Vita Symeonis 161.13-26, p. 144).

213. Especially Vita Symeonis 116.9-13 and 239.26-33 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 95, 215. Where the binding itself is unjust, the effects of it recoil upon the one who imposed it: Vita Symeonis 239.5-11, p. 215.

214. Vita Symeonis 103.15-25, 164.16-19 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 81, 146.

215. Cf. n. 31 above and the article by Goria cited in n. 4 above.

216. Vita Symeonis 14.9-28, 93.1-7, 101.14-41, 169.10-23, 175.1-7, 179.5-18, 188.12-190.26, 193.19-26, 212.10-17, 214.9-16, 215.4-18, 221.20-44, 222.9-28, 223.12-42, 233.8-16, 234.8-22, 239.15-33 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 12-13, 73, 78-79, 151-152, 155, 158-159, 166-169, 171, 181, 183, 185, 191-192, 192-193, 193-194, 210-211, 211, 215.

217. Sickness: Vita Symeonis 14.4-17, 212.10-12, 214.5-16, 215.4-18, 234.8-22, 239.6-22 and cf. 101.9-16 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 12-13, 181, 183, 184-185, 211, 214-215 and cf. pp. 78-79.. Demonic possession: Vita Symeonis 190.12-24, p. 169. Ἔλεγχος by Symeon: Vita Symeonis 93.2-7, 169.13-20, 175,3-7, 179.5-15, 215.7-14, 221.18-30, 222.18-24, 223.12-35 (by a demon), 233.8-14, 234.15-20, pp. 73, 151-152, 155, 158-159, 185, 191, 192-193, 193-194, 210, 211.

218. Opposition to the saint and his works : Vita Symeonis 193.11-14, 212.4-7, 214.1-7, 234.1-12 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 171, 161, 182-183, 211.

219. Vita Symeonis 221.30-34, 222.22-24, 223.30-34 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 191, 193, 194.

220. All three anecdotes illustrate the διορατικὸν χάρισμα of Symeon; all concern nobles or high officials compromised with idolatry and magical practices, and all - and only these anecdotes - allude to an ἐπιτίμιον imposed on the penitents by Symeon.

221. The Life does not make clear what made up the ἐπιτίμιον, only that it was temporary: ἄχρι καιροῦ τινος (Vita Symeonis 221.42, 222.26-27 [BHG 1689] ed. van den Ven, pp. 192, 193). Nor is it clear whether

an absolution preceded the ἐπιτίμιον or followed it at some future (and undetermined) date, or indeed whether there was any absolution at all, although Vita Symeonis 223.35-42 and perhaps also 221.34-43, pp. 194, 191-192 probably imply one. The language of binding and loosing, so prominent in cases of excommunication (see n. 213 above) is absent from these narratives.

222. Examples of ἔλεγχος in n. 217 above. The examples of "deathbed" confessions (Vita Symeonis 14.15-17, 116.3-13 [BHG 1689] ed. van den Ven, pp. 13, 95) are better interpreted as instances of the παρρησία of the saint who is able to command extraordinary resources in his attempts to bring sinners to conversion. In fact both confessions lead to a cure, not to death.

223. Vita Symeonis 14.9-15, 169.10-12, 188.13-22 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 12-13, 151, 166-167.

224. Vita Symeonis 188.16-22, 234.16-19, 239.20-21 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 166-167, 211, 215. Earlier in the Life it is said that Symeon wrote on the penance of the laity: συνέταξε δὲ λόγους ... περὶ μετανοίας λαικῶν (Vita Symeonis 32.20-21, p. 32), perhaps a sign that monks were aware of a certain responsibility devolving upon them in this matter, although the extant writings attributed to Symeon on this subject are of the most general character and have little to do with ecclesiastical penance: Sermones 7, 22, NPB 8:3, ed, Mai, Rome 1871, pp. 22.6-27.16, 111.6-118.7. For Symeon's literary activity see P. van den Ven, "Les écrits de S. Syméon Stylite le Jeune avec trois sermons inédits," Le Muséon 70(1957) 1-57. See also Vita Ephraem 27 (BHG 583) ed. Morel, PG 46.845B-C and Vita Symeonis 101.16-24, p. 79.

225. See Seriski, Poenae..., pp. 54-75, 92-103. Confessions of priests: Vita Symeonis 223.30-38, 239.13-22 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 194, 215. In the first text a priest is given an ἐπιτίμιον (Vita Symeonis 223.42, p.194) in the other text he is not. The Life makes no distinction between monks and lay people in describing the manner in which they made confession; see the references in n. 216 above.

226. Apparent immediate forgiveness: Vita Symeonis 14.21-28, 101.35-41 (where the connexion between physical and spiritual healing is explicit: 101.19-22), 179.16-18, 193.22-26, 212.12-17 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 13, 79, 159, 171, 181. No immediate forgiveness: Vita Symeonis 169.21-25, 188.19-22, pp. 152, 167 and see also n. 221 above.

227. Vita Symeonis 233.14-16 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 210-211. The explicit forgiveness accorded Epiphanius in Vita Symeonis 195. 14-17, p. 172 occurs in a dream and can scarcely be used as evidence here.

228. Vita Symeonis 239.28-30 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, p. 215: «Ἐν τῷ ὀνόματι τοῦ Κυρίου ἡμῶν Ἰησοῦ Χριστοῦ τοῦ υἱοῦ τοῦ Θεοῦ λέλυται ὁ δεσμός σου· ἀπελθὼν οὖν ἐν τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ σου ἀνάγνωθι τὰ ἅγια εὐαγγέλια καὶ ἐπιτέλεσον τὴν θείαν λειτουργείαν.»

229. Vita Symeonis 239.23-26 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, p. 215: «Πάτερ, κύριε τοῦ οὐρανοῦ καὶ τῆς γῆς, συγχώρησον τῷ πρεσβυτέρῳ τούτῳ τὴν ἁμαρτίαν ἣν ἐλάλησε κατὰ τοῦ δούλου σου καὶ λῦσον αὐτοῦ τὸν δεσμὸν καὶ ποίησον ἄξιον προσφέρειν σοι τὴν λογικὴν καὶ ἀναίμακτον θυσίαν.» In no sense can "absolution" be described as a theme of particular interest or emphasis in the Life. See n. 255 below.

230. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 310-319 and Hörmann, Untersuchungen..., pp. 183-203. More general discussion of the theme in H. von Campenhausen, Ecclesiastical Authority and Spiritual Power in the Church of the First Three Centuries, London 1969; A.M. Ritter, Charisma im Verständnis des Johannes Chrysostomus und seiner Zeit, Göttingen 1972; Rousseau, Ascetics, Authority..., Oxford 1978 and E. Kilmartin, "Office and Charism," TS 38(1977) 547-554 with further bibliography.

231. Monastic-sacerdotal friction: Vita Symeonis 92.12-17, 116.1-3, 130. 12-21, 239.1-6 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 72-73, 95, 122-123, 214. Criticism of monastic spiritual vision: Vita Symeonis 26.21-23, 125.40-48, pp. 22-23, 112. Charismatic holiness of Symeon: Vita Symeonis 19.1-10 (divine anointing), 32.1-20 (apostolic charism), 69.6-13 (guaranteed intercession for his devotees), 109.1-15 (guaranteed intercession for the dead), 133.1-15 (ordination from God), pp. 16, 31-32, 59-60, 88-89, 125-126. See also Vita Symeonis 71.15-23, 78.1-6, 129.1-9, pp. 61, 66-67, 116.

232. Vita Symeonis 34.1-11, 132.1-134.25 (BHG 1689) ed. van den Ven, pp. 33, 124-127. Note that people come expressly to receive communion from an acknowledged saint in order to be sure they are in communion with the orthodox and that the fact that Symeon is not a priest hinders the effectiveness of this ministry: Vita Symeonis 132.4-12, p. 124. For priestly mediation: Vita Symeonis 134.11-13, p. 126: ἄξιον γὰρ καὶ δίκαιον εὑρεθέντα σε χενόμενον ἀπὸ νηπίας ἡλικίας τῷ κοινῷ δεσπότῃ μεσιτεύειν αὐτῷ καὶ ἀνθρώποις διὰ τῆς ἱερωσύνης.

233. P. van den Ven, La Vie ancienne..., Brussels 1970, vol. 2, pp. 251-252.

234. Provoked confessions: Vita Marthae 43.10-14, 55.4-18, 72.3-22 (BHG 1174) ed. van den Ven, pp. 285, 299, 313-314.

235. Relics: Vita Marthae 35.8-36.20, 41.11-27, 43.1-27, 51.15-19, 54.1-56.22 (BHG 1174) ed. van den Ven, pp. 279-281, 284, 285-286, 295, 298-300.

236. Some of these anecdotes are listed separately as Vitae by Halkin. The full list includes: Anastasia* (BHG 79, 80 80e), Andronicus and Athanasia (BHG 121), Daniel of Scete (BHG 2100), Eulogius (BHG 618), Mark the Fool (BHG 2255) and Thomais (BHG 2453=2102b, 2453b) with the following narrationes: De virgine quae ebrietatem simulabat (BHG 2101), De coenobita ad iudicem delato (BHG 2101a), De mendico caeco* (BHG 2102), De monacho qui in monumento dormiebat* (BHG 2102a), De balneis* (BHG 2102c), De moniali in balneis (BHG 2102d) and De sorore Danielis (BHG 2102e = 1438h). Texts marked with an asterisk contain no evidence relevant to this study. See also Beck, Kirche..., pp. 396-397 with the references cited there.

237. Vita Danielis Scetiotae 1-2 (BHG 2100) ed. Clugnet, p. 71.2-13. Cf. Vita Mariae Antiochenae 3 (BHG 1045) ed. Radermacher, p. 269.8-12 and Vita Theodorae (BHG 1727) ed. Wessely, pp. 26.14-27.6.

238. Vita Danielis Scetiotae 2 (BHG 2100) ed. Clugnet p. 71.13-22.

239. Vita Danielis Scetiotae 2 (BHG 2100) ed. Clugnet, pp. 71.22-72.9. The scruples are not pathological; they are evidence of a more refined spiritual sensitivity than is displayed by either the civil or ecclesiastical authorities. For the pilgrimage to the patriarchs see also Narratio de diacono quem presbyter ligaverat 8-13 (BHG 1322ea)

ed. Canart, pp. 19-20.

240. Narratio de virgine quae ebrietatem simulabat 6 (BHG 2101) ed. Clugnet, p. 70.25-28. Cf. Historia Lausiaca 34.6-7 (BHG 1438) ed. Bartelink, p. 166 and Vita Thomaidis 1 (BHG 2453b) ed. Clugnet, p. 66.21-23: Ἐν μιᾷ τῶν ἡμερῶν ἀδελφὸς ἐπολεμήθη ἐν τῇ αὐτῇ Σκήτῃ ὑπὸ τοῦ δαίμονος τῆς πορνείας, καὶ ἐνοχλούμενος σφοδρῶς ἐλθὼν ἀνήγγειλεν τῷ γέροντι.

241. Vita Danielis Scetiotae 3 (BHG 2100) ed. Clugnet, p. 72.10-16 and see Chapter Two, n. 165 above.

242. Vita Marci 5 (BHG 2255) ed. Clugnet, p. 61.9-15. For penitential reparation lay Christians go to a monastery: Vita Andronici et Athanasiae 4 (BHG 121) ed. Clugnet, p. 372.21-36.

243. Narratio de sorore Danielis 1, 2 (BHG 2102e) ed. Nau, pp. 174.9-33, 174.34-175.2. Compare the story of Taisia, nn. 367, 368 below.

244. Narratio de coenobita ad iudicem delato 2 (BHG 2101a) ed. Clugnet, p. 388.21-26. Delation to the civil authorities was certainly possible, but here the details are more likely to reflect the imagination of the writer than the penitential practice of monastic communities.

245. Vita Danielis Scetiotae 2 (BHG 2100) ed. Clugnet, p. 71.13-22; cf. Vita Marci 5 (BHG 2255) ed. Clugnet, p. 61.17-21 and Narratio de sorore Danielis 2 (BHG 2102e) ed. Nau, pp. 174.34-175.2. The forgiveness implied in Narratio de virgine quae ebrietatem simulabat 6 (BHG 2101) ed. Clugnet, p. 70.27-30 is a literary echo of Historia Lausiaca 34.7 (BHG 1438) ed. Bartelink, p. 166 and the reconciliation described in Narratio de coenobita ad iudicem delato 4 (BHG 2101a) ed. Clugnet, p. 390.5-8 is more a "happy ending" than a reflection of penitential ritual.

246. Vita Eulogii 22 (BHG 618) ed. Clugnet, p. 259:24-31: Ἰδοὺ φωνή· Ἡ Αὐγοῦστα παρέρχεται. Καὶ ἰδὼν αὐτὴν ἔλαβον ὕπνος, καὶ λέγω αὐτῇ λεπτῇ φωνῇ· Ἐλέησόν με, Δέσποινα τοῦ κόσμου. Καὶ λέγει μοι· Τί πάλιν θέλεις;; Λέγω δὲ αὐτῇ· Περὶ τῆς ἐγγυήης Εὐλογίου κρέμαμαι. Καὶ λέγει μοι· Ἐγὼ παρακαλῶ ὑπὲρ σοῦ. Καὶ βλέπω ὅτι ἀπῆλθεν καταφιλῆσαι τοὺς πόδας τοῦ μακαρίου ἐκείνου. Καὶ λέγει μοι τὸ μειράκιον· Μηκέτι ποιήσῃς τὸ πρᾶγμα τοῦτο. Καὶ λέγω· Οὐχί, Δέσποτα, Ἐχὼ παρεκάλεσε ἵνα χρήσιμος γένηταί· ἥμαρτον· συγχώρησόν μοι. See also n. 178 above with references there.

247. Narratio de moniali in balneis 1 (BHG 2102d) ed. Mioni, pp. 92.33-93.2 and 93.16-23. Compare n. 91 above and note too that Daniel is described in at least one place as a priest: Vita Eulogii 1 (BHG 618) ed. Clugnet, p. 254.1-2.

248. The evidence for Byzantine σαλοί is set out by J. Grosdidier de Matons, "Les thèmes d'édification dans la Vie d'André Salos," Travaux et Mémoires 4(1970) 277-328 at pp. 279-302. See also A.-J. Festugière, Leontios de Neapolis: Vie de Syméon le Fou et Vie de Jean de Chypre, Paris 1974, pp. 15-30. For Alexius see Beck, Kirche ..., pp. 411-412 and C.E. Stebbins, "Les origines de la légende de Saint Alexis," Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire 51(1973) 497-507.

249. These include: Vita Heracleidis (BHG 743), Acta Ioannis (BHG 916), Acta Nerei et Achillei (BHG 1327), Acta Petri et Pauli (BHG 1490, 1491), Acta Pauli (BHG 1453, 1456, 1457, 1458, 1458b, 1459), Acta Petri et Andreae (BHG 1489), Acta Andreae (BHG 100, 109), Acta Thomae (BHG 1834), Acta Matthaei (BHG 1224, 1225), Acta Bartholomaei (BHG 227, 228), Acta Thaddaei (BHG 1702, 1703), Acta Barnabae (BHG 225) and Vita Ioannis Baptistae (BHG 834). See W. Schneemelcher and A. de Santos, "Later Acts of Apostles," in Hennecke, NT Apocrypha, vol. 2, pp. 571-578.

250. Cf. Chapter Two, n. 193 above for the sin of the apostle Philip.

251. Acta Andreae 33 (BHG 109) ed. Bonnet, pp. 115.6-116.8 and cf. Acta Andreae 48 (BHG 100) ed. Bonnet, p. 348.8-11; Acta Ioannis 1, 6 (BHG 916) ed. Zahn, pp. 6.1-7.4, 18.12-19.7; Acta Barnabae 6 (BHG 225) ed. Bonnet, p. 294.11-15; Vita Heracleidis 16 (BHG 743) ed. Halkin, pp. 163.1-165.10.

252. Vita Heracleidis 16 (BHG 743) ed. Halkin, pp. 164.12-165.10.

253. Acta Bartholomaei 1 (BHG 228) ed. Vasiliyev, pp. 21.32-22.15; cf. n. 204 above.

254. The contexts in which ἐπιτίμιον is used lend no support to anyone who wishes to interpret the institution as exclusively vindictive or exclusively therapeutic. It remains true, however, that ecclesiastical penance is normally likened in the Vitae to medicinal and surgical care, not to the administration of justice in the courts. See Vita Gregorii Nazianzeni 40 (BHG 723) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.288A-C. The evidence for deathbed confession as a "customary" Byzantine practice is usually presumed or exaggerated by modern authors as in G.K. Spyridakis, "Τὰ κατὰ τὴν τελευτὴν ἔθιμα τῶν Βυζαντινῶν ἐκ τῶν ἁγιολογικῶν πηγῶν," EEBΣ 20(1950) 74-171 at pp. 87-88 and in the other sources he cites there.

255. The impetratory form of absolution in the Greek liturgical tradition makes the distinction between absolution and a simple prayer of intercession difficult to grasp in many circumstances. Some claim to exercise the apostolic charism of binding and loosing must be present in a text, therefore, before a prayer can be positively identified as an instance of absolution by an unordained minister.

256. For the date see H. Delehaye, "Narratio Sergiae de translatione sanctae Olympiadis," AB 16(1897) 44-51 with "Vita sanctae Olympiadis et narratio Sergiae de eiusdem translatione," AB 15(1896) 400-423 at pp. 400-405.

257. Seven documents are taken here as Acta Maximi: BHG 1231, 1236e, 1232, 1233, 1233d, 1233m and Vita Martini (BHG 2261). Discussion of dates and texts in W. Lackner, "Zu Quellen und Datierung der Maximosvita (BHG^3 1234)," AB 85(1967) 285-316; C. Tsirpanlis, "Acta S. Maximi," Θεολογία 43(1972) 106-124; J. Garrigues, "Le martyre de saint Maxime le Confesseur," Revue thomiste 76(1976) 410-452. To these may be added S. Brock, "An Early Syriac Life of Maximus the Confessor," AB 91(1973) 299-346.

258. Maximus to Theodosius: Ἐγὼ γὰρ οὐδὲ τούτων γινομένων κοινωνῶ, ἀναφερομένων τῶν ἀναθεματισθέντων ἐπὶ τῆς ἁγίας ἀναφορᾶς. φοβοῦμαι γὰρ τὸ κατάκριμα τοῦ ἀναθέματος (Acta Maximi 17 [BHG 1233] ed. Combefis, PG 90.153C). Cf. Acta Maximi 33, PG 90.169C-D and n. 125 above. Individual heretics, especially outside their normal circum-

stances were reconciled formally (see nn. 154-155 above), but the Lives provide no evidence to illustrate the canonical situation of the lay people in an ordinary church or congregation whose bishop or priest fell under the ἀνάθεμα.

259. See Beck, Kirche..., p. 464 with references there, to which may be added J. Grosdidier de Matons, "Philologie byzantine," Ecole pratique des Hautes Etudes. IVe Section. Sciences Historiques et Philologiques. Annuaire 105(1972-1973) 349-352, at pp. 349-351.

260. For example, Miracula Artemii 5, 35 (BHG 173) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 6.5-6, 56.18-20. Cf. Chapter Two, n. 110 above.

261. Miracula Artemii 34 (BHG 173) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 55.1-3.

262. Miracula Artemii 37 (BHG 173) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 61.11-23. Here the sin is an offence against the saint; cf. nn. 51 and 218 above, and for relics see n. 235 above.

263. See Beck, Kirche..., pp. 463, 460 with the literature cited there. To this add F. Halkin, Douze récits byzantins sur saint Jean Chrysostome, Brussels 1977, pp. 7, 69-70 and E. Hansack, Die Vita des Johannes Chysostomos des Georgios von Alexandrien in kirchenslavischer Übersetzung, vol. 1, Würzburg 1975, pp. 11-15, 91-92. The text cited will be that of Mai in the PG. Corresponding passages in the two recensions published by Halkin will be added in square brackets: Douze récits..., pp. 7-44 = BHG 872b, pp. 45-68 = BHG 872d. The chapter numbers are the same in all recensions.

264. The editor A. Mai (citing Le Paige) thinks that the letters ascribed to Innocent I (402-417) are not later than the sixth century: NPB 6:2, Rome 1853, p. 264.

265. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 26 (BHG 872) ed. Mai, PG 47.lxxix-lxxx [= Halkin, pp. 32 and 62]: a term of three months for Honorius, six months for Arcadius and two years for Eudoxia.

266. Ibid. Thus it can be distinguished from the confirmed deposition and excommunication of Theophilus which was to stand until it had been ratified or lifted by a future synodal decision: Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 8, 26, 32 (BHG 872) ed. Mai, PG 47.lix, lxxx, lxxxiv-lxxxviii [= Halkin, pp. 14,32, 36-37 and 49, 62, 66].

267. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 26, 32 (BHG 872) ed. Mai, PG 47.lxxix-lxxx, lxxxiv-lxxxviii [= Halkin, pp. 32, 36-37 and 62, 66].

268. Trullan Council, canon 102, ed. Joannou, Discipline..., vol. 1.1, pp. 239.3 - 241.18.

269. Evidence for the relation of the texts of BHG 872 and 873 to one another and to the Dialogus of Palladius is conveniently set out by C. Baur, "'Georgius Alexandrinus'," BZ 27(1927) 1-16.

270. See n. 265 above.

271. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 4, 19 (BHG 873) ed, Savile, pp. 165.40-166.7, 182.9-25. In the new recension published by Halkin [= BHG 873bd] Douze récits..., pp. 86-87, 120-121.

272. Ibid. For the anathemas see n. 155 above.

273. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 16, 42 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, pp. 176.35-37, 217.27-43 [= Halkin, pp. 112-113, 197].

274. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 21 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, p. 186.14-29 [= Halkin, pp. 129-130]. This vision of the episcopal role is also connected with the power of the keys in Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 7, p. 169.35-37 [= Halkin, pp. 94-95]. Moreover the bishop's jurisdiction clearly extends over monks as is plain in Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 16, p. 178.1-2 [= Halkin, pp. 111-112].

275. These texts everywhere presume, however, that the Christian life is penitential of its very nature; cf. n. 191 above.

276. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 18 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, p. 180.15-39 [= Halkin, pp. 116-117].

277. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 21 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, p. 186.21-29 [= Halkin, p. 130]. The forgiveness accorded Arcadius and Eudoxia in Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 70, p. 251.8-14 [= Halkin, pp. 269-270] may be an illustration of this principle in practice.

278. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 6, 10 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, pp. 168.44-169.2, 173.10-16 [= Halkin, pp. 93, 101-102]. The texts show John as a "spiritual father" although the Greek πατὴρ πνευματικός has not yet reached the exclusively technical meaning of "confessor". Cf. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 74 Epilogus, p. 258.27-29 [= Halkin, p. 284].

279. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 14 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, p. 175.27-31 [= Halkin, pp. 106-107].

280. Dagron, "Les moines...," pp. 231 n. 11, 266-270 and Janin, Les églises..., p. 82.

281. Vita Dalmati 9 (BHG 482) ed. Banduri, p. 703B-C. The forgiveness of heresy is the forgiveness of a great sin: Vita Dalmati 15, p. 708D.

282. Vita Dalmati 3, 6 (BHG 482) ed. Banduri, pp. 699A, 700A. Even as an idealized picture of monastic-episcopal relations this account attests at least a later desire for harmony between the two groups.

283. Febronia: Beck, Kirche..., p. 460; P. Devos, "Sainte Anastasie la vierge et la source de sa Passion (BHG³ 76z)," AB 80 (1962) 33-51 at pp. 36-47; J.-M. Sauget, "Febronia, vergine, santa, martire in Persia," BS 5.508-509, Rome 1964. The martyrs: Aubineau, "Une homélie grecque...," pp. 617-618. Therapon: Beck, Kirche..., p. 466 and J.-M. Sauget, "Teraponte, vescovo a Cipro, santo, martire," BS 12. 368-369, Rome 1969. Cosmas and Damian: Beck, Kirche..., p. 410; Festugière, Sainte Thècle..., pp. 85-95 and H. Toole, "Τὰ ἰάματα τῶν Ἁγίων Ἀναργύρων," EEBΣ 42(1975-1976) 253-297.

284. Vita Febroniae 10, 41 (BHG 659) ed. van Papenbroek, pp. 21C, 34D-E may betray monastic animus against episcopal weakness. Vita martyrum 36 (BHG 1191) ed. Mai, PG 88.521A provides a further example of intercession for sinners by the martyrs at the moment of death.

285. Pseudo-Methodius: A. Lolos, Die Apokalypse des Ps-Methodius, Meisenheim-am-Glan 1976, pp. 20-22. Oracle of Baalbek: P.J. Alexander, The Oracle of Baalbek. The Tiburtine Sibyl in Greek Dress, Washington 1967, pp. 41-47.

286. Pessimism: Oracle of Baalbek 120-121, ed.Alexander, p. 16; Apocalypsis Ioannis 19 (BHG 922) ed. Tischendorf, p. 90.7-18; Apocalypsis Methodii 13.1 (BHG 2036) and 13 (BHG 2036a) ed. Lolos, p. 116 and p. 117 and cf. Chapter Five, n. 150 below. Anxiety about judgement: Apocalypsis Methodii 11.5,8,18 (BHG 2036) and 11.5 (BHG 2036a) pp. 98, 100, 110 and 99; Apocalypsis Ioannis 1 (BHG 922i) ed. Nau, p. 215.3-4; Apocalypsis Pauli 4 (BHG 1460) ed. Tischendorf, pp. 47.1-48.12.

287. For Moschus see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 412-413 with references there. To these add P. Pattenden, "The Text of the Pratum Spirituale," JTS NS 26(1975) 38-54 with H. Chadwick, "John Moschus and His Friend Sophronius the Sophist," JTS NS 25(1974) 41-74 and K. Rozemond, "Jean Mosch, patriarche de Jérusalem en exil (614-634)," VC 31(1977) 60-67. Reference to the text will use the numbers allotted to separate chapters in the BHG Auctarium, p. 293. I am grateful to Dr. Philip Pattenden for allowing me to consult the complete text of the Pratum which he is preparing for the Series Graeca of Corpus Christianorum. The additional materials in the critical text do not enlarge or change substantially the evidence for ecclesiastical penance discussed below on the basis of the PG text.

288. Pratum spirituale 43, 108, 150, 145 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.2897A, 2969D, 3013C-D, 3008C-3009B and cf. Pratum spirituale 192 (BHG 721b) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.3072A-C.

289. Pratum spirituale 140 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.3004B; cf. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 5 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, p. 11.3-16.

290. Pratum spirituale 26 [= BHG 1450zv], 36 [= BHG 1448za], 48, 49 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.2873A, 2885C, 2904B, 2904C-2905A.

291. Pratum spirituale 30, 31, 32, 78 [= BHG 1450i], 143 [= BHG 1445jb], 166, 218 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.2877B-C, 2880A-C, 2880C-2881B, 2936B, 3004D, 3032D-3033A, 3109A-B.

292. Λογισμοί: Pratum spirituale 26 [=BHG 1450zv], 129, 167 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.2872B, 2993B-C, 3033C. Actual sins: Pratum spirituale 39, 45 [= BHG 1444u], 47, 49, 78 [= BHG 1450i], 116, PG 87:3.2892C, 2900B-D (preaching the spiritual value of confession), 2901D, 2904C-D, 2932D-2933C, 2980D. ἐπιτίμια : Pratum spirituale 39, 192 [= BHG 721b], PG 87:3.2892C,3072B. Pratum spirituale 78 [= BHG 1450i] PG 87:3.2933A would be of special value for demonstrating that ἐπιτίμια varied according to the nature of the sinner, but Pattenden has established that βαθήματα not ἐπιτίμια is the correct reading. Pratum spirituale 184, PG 87:3.3057A-B attests the use of μετάνοιαι as a means of "commuting" a debt; cf. Miraculum Michaelis in Chonis 4 (BHG 1282) ed. Nau, p. 552.3 where μετάνοιαι are listed as good works, also Festugière, Les moines..., vol. 3.2, Paris 1962, p. 110, n. 253.

293. Pratum spirituale 101, 143 [= BHG 1445jb], 149 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.2960C, 3005B-D, 3013B-C.

294. Monastic-sacerdotal harmony: Pratum spirituale 1, 3 [= BHG 2080a], 27, 139, 176 [= BHG 1317k] (BHG 1442) edd. Duc /Cotelier, PG 87:3.2852C, 2853C, 2873B, 3004A, 3044D-3045A. If there is undeniable criticism of bishops in the Pratum (43, 44, PG 87:3.2897A-B, 2900A), there is equally trenchant criticism of the monks themselves (Pratum spirituale 162 [= BHG 1450zc], 168, PG 87:3.3029B-C, 3036A-B). It should also be noted that the Pratum mentions by name over 25 monks

who were also priests, a factor to be kept in mind when discussing the relationship between monastic Charisma and priestly Amt.

295. For date and authorship see H. Usener, Der heilige Tychon, Leipzig 1907, pp. 80-107; against John the Almsgiver as author see Festugière, Leontios..., p. 632.

296. Πάθη: Vita Tychonis 8.21-23 (BHG 1859) ed. Usener, p. 118. Binding and loosing: Vita Tychonis 4.27-28, p. 115. Despair: Vita Tychonis 34.10-12, p. 144.

297. H. Delehaye, "Les recueils antiques de miracles des saints," AB 43 (1925) 5-85, 305-325 at pp. 19-32 and the introduction to the new edition by N. Fernandez Marcos, Los Thaumata de Sofronio. Contribución al estudio de la Incubatio cristiana, Madrid 1975 at pp 1-22, 153-168. Cf. also Festugière, Sainte Thècle..., pp. 217-237; Dagron, Vie et Miracles..., pp. 101-139 and H.W.M. de Jong, "Demonic Diseases in Sophronios' 'Thaumata'," Janus 50(1961-1963) 1-8.

298. Miracula Cyri et Ioannis 37.7 (BHG 478) ed. Fernandez Marcos, pp. 331-332.

299. Πνευματικὸς πατήρ: Miracula Cyri et Ioannis 70.8 (BHG 479) ed. Fernandez Marcos, p. 396. Heretics: Miracula Cyri et Ioannis 12.13 (BHG 477) ed. Fernandez Marcos, pp. 267-268. Here too there is evidence that some who had been healed/forgiven stayed on at the shrine as "conversi": Miracula Cyri et Ioannis 40.3 (BHG 478) ed. Fernandez Marcos, p. 339 and cf. n. 353 below.

300. See Beck, Kirche..., p. 465 with bibliography, to which add V. Bešev-liev, "Randbemerkungen über die 'Miracula Sancti Demetrii'," Byzantina 2(1970) 285-300.

301. Miracula Demetrii 15.156 (BHG 516) ed. de Bye, PG 116.1321D-1324A. Note, however, the hope that sins which are beyond intercession may still not be beyond forgiveness (Miracula Demetrii 15.153, PG 116.1320D), and the distinction drawn between the forgiveness available to the great mass of simple people and the exacting standards demanded from the "wise": Miracula Demetrii 11.89 (BHG 510) ed. de Bye, PG 116.1269C.

302. Miracula Demetrii 1.14 (BHG 500), 2.28-29 (BHG 501), 3.38 (BHG 502) ed. de Bye, PG 116.1212C-D, 1224C-1225A, 1232C.

303. General punishment: Miracula Demetrii 13.115 (BHG 512), 14.133 (BHG 513), 15.156 (BHG 516) ed. de Bye, PG 116.1292A, 1305A, 1321D-1324A. Individual punishment: Miracula Demetrii 1.14 (BHG 500), 7.63-64 (BHG 506), 11.90-92 (BHG 510), PG 116.1212C-D, 1252A-B, 1269D-1272C. Theoretical reflections on the τιμωρίαι inflicted by the saints: Miracula Demetrii 11.88 (BHG 510), PG 116.1269B and n. 52 above.

304. Miracula Demetrii 11.92 (BHG 510) ed. de Bye, PG 116.1272D.

305. Miracula Demetrii 10.86 (BHG 509) ed. de Bye, PG 116.1268C-D.

306. Anastasius: Beck, Kirche..., p. 461; A Pertusi, "L'encomio di S. Anastasio martire persano," AB 76(1958) 5-63 at pp. 16-24; P. Sfair, "Anastasio Magundat, santo, martire," BS 1.1054-1056, Rome 1961. Sira: Beck, Kirche..., p. 460. George: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 461, 465 and D. Balboni, "Giorgio, santo, martire," BS 6.512-525 at cc. 512-513, Rome 1965. Procopius: J.-M. Sauget, "Procopio, santo, martire

di Cesarea di Palestina," BS 10.1159-1166, Rome 1968 with bibliography. Dasius: I. Rochow, "Die Passio des hl. Dasius (BHG 491) - Ein Zeugnis für die antiheidnische Polemik gegen Ende der frühbyzantinische Zeit," in Studia Byzantina II, Berlin 1973, edd. J. Irmscher/P. Nagel, pp. 235-247 at pp. 238-240. The account of the martyrdom of the 44 Sabaite monks by the seventh-century monk Antiochus (BHG 1215) contains nothing relevant to this study.

307. Intercession: Vita Georgii 5 (BHG 684), 24, 26 (BHG 672) ed. Krumbacher, pp. 80.26-81.2 and 50.7-10, 50.32-51.1; Vita Procopii 20 (BHG 1576) ed. Delehaye, p. 227.8-23. Cf. Chapter Two, n. 30 above.

308. Monastic themes include respect for the σχῆμα: Vita Anastasii 16 (BHG 86) ed. Pertusi, p. 49.18-19; Vita Anastasii 1 (BHG 88) ed. Usener, p. 126.23-24; and a claim for apostolic foundation of the "angelic" life: Vita Anastasii 1 (BHG 84) ed. Usener, p. 1a.26-27.

309. Vita Anastasii 4 (BHG 84) ed. Usener, pp. 4a.27-4b.7, 4b.13-34. Cf. Vita Anastasii 12, 13 (BHG 86) ed. Pertusi, pp. 42.1-13, 43.16-44.15.

310. See J. Leroy, "La vie quotidienne du moine studite," Irénikon 27 (1954) 21-50 at p. 33. George of Pisidia uses the term ἐξαγορεύσαι to describe the revelation of thoughts to the hegumen (Vita Anastasii 13 [BHG 86] ed. Pertusi, p. 43.29-31), but the word does not occur in the original Acta which he clearly used as a source: Pertusi, "L'encomio...," p. 28.

311. Vita Anastasii 4 (BHG 84) ed. Usener, p. 4a.35-4b.7 and Vita Anastasii 12, 13 (BHG 86) ed. Pertusi, pp. 42.9-10, 43.30.

312. Vita Anastasii 1 (BHG 84) ed. Usener, p. 2a.3-23. The passage differs subtly from the topos that God raises up great saints in every age (see n. 349 below), for here the context is more pessimistic: the saints represent a consolation for the faithful in the midst of their general sufferings rather than an ideal of holiness to which all may aspire.

313. Beck, Kirche..., p. 462 and J.-M. Sauget, "Giorgio il Chozibita, anacoreta, santo," BS 6.534-536, Rome 1965 with bibliography.

314. Vita Georgii Chozebitae 18 (BHG 669) ed. Houze, p. 118.6-12 may well allude to entry into a monastery as a kind of "penance" (lifelong) for the sin of magic, but it is difficult to distinguish penance as ἐπιτίμιον from penance as μετάνοια in such circumstances.

315. Vita Georgii Chozebitae 5 (BHG 669) ed. Houze, pp. 100.11-101.2: a γέρων whose hand has withered as he was about to strike George confesses his sin and asks forgiveness. Cf. Vita Georgii Chozebitae 14, pp. 111.11-114.4.

316. Vita Georgii Chozebitae 20 (BHG 699) ed. Houze, p. 119.12-16. For the spiritual director as healer and absorber of evil in those under his care see Vita Georgii Chozebitae 34, 35, 59, pp. 133.11-13, 133.14-19, 358.3-5.

317. Vita Georgii Chozebitae 39, 47-56 (especially 50) (BHG 669) ed. Houze, pp. 138.1-141.18, 340.7-355.16.

318. Vita Georgii Chozebitae 39, 32, 50 (BHG 669) ed. Houze, pp. 138.1-141.18, 130.14-131.1, 346.8-14. The weakness of the present generation of monks is presumed by the author: Vita Georgii Chozebitae 47,

48, 51, pp. 340.7-10, 342.6-10, 345.14-346.14 and cf. n. 294 above.

319. Delehaye, Les saints stylites, pp. lxxvi-lxxix. Note the conviction that the monastic life is the life of penance: Vita Alypii 16, 18 (BHG 65) ed. Delehaye, pp. 161.7-10, 162.15-17.

320. A.-J. Festugière, Vie de Théodore de Sykéon, Brussels 1970, vol. 1, pp. v-xxiv and see the observations of D. Baker, "Theodore of Sykeon and the Historians," in The Orthodox Churches and the West, Oxford 1976, ed. D. Baker, pp. 83-96 and the review of Festugière by J.D. Howard-Johnston, JTS NS 24(1973) 278-281. See also the use made of the Life by W.E. Kaegi, Jr. "Notes on Hagiographic Sources...," and "New Evidence on the Early Reign of Heraclius," BZ 66(1973) 308-330.

321. Vita Theodori 147.1-64 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 115.1-117.4.

322. Confession: Vita Theodori 147.1-2 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, p. 115. νουθεσία: Vita Theodori 147.5-29, pp. 115-116. In fact, ἔλεγχος practised by Theodore is a prominent theme of the Life: Vita Theodori 156.94-97 (κατ' ἰδίαν), 119.12-20 (in public), 159.28-37 (of the clergy), pp. 128, 95-96, 134.

323. Nor that it was frequent, as, for example, by way of preparation for communion. Descriptions of communion are frequent in the Life, but none makes any mention of previous penitential preparation involving confession or absolution: Vita Theodori 67.5-7, 85.13-14, 101.42-45, 125.35-46, 137.1-16, 154.38-48, 161.238-242 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 56, 72, 81, 101-102, 109, 125, 145.

324. Vita Theodori 147.3-5 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, p. 115: Καὶ τοῖς παραπεσοῦσιν ἐν διαφόροις πτώσμασι χρόνον τινὰ ὥρισεν πρὸς μετάνοιαν, ἐν νηστείαις προσευχαῖς τε καὶ ἐλεημοσύναις αὐτοὺς καθαίρων. The medicinal language used of penance in this chapter will find definitive canonical approval in canon 102 of the Trullan Council, ed. Joannou, Discipline..., vol. 1.1, pp. 239.3-241.18.

325. The χρόνον τινὰ... πρὸς μετάνοιαν referred to in n. 324 above is ambiguous. It might refer to a temporary excommunication, a fixed course of penitential exercises promoting διόρθωσις and consequent upon absolution, or a regimen independent of any absolution.

326. Vita Theodori 38.5-36, 61.22-36, 76.54-59, 148.36-43, 149.34-52, 155.17-19 and 69.15-28 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 33-34, 52, 64, 118, 119, 126 and 57. The ritual reflected in these confessions remains the same as that described in Chapter Two, p. 45 above, and in this chapter at n. 170 above.

327. Vita Theodori 89.1-37 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 73-74.

328. Vita Theodori 89.1-4 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, p. 73.

329. Vita Theodori 89.4-10 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 73-74. Theodore's manner of broaching the delicate subject (χαριέντως) may be compared with that enjoined upon the confessor in the later Penitential ascribed to John the Faster: μετὰ πάσης ἱλαρότητος καὶ προσηνείας (Poenitentiale 5, PG 88.1893A).

330. Cf. Vita Theodori 142.18-28, 61.22-36 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 112, 52.

331. Vita Theodori 33.10-12, 42.35-37, 77.12-15, 142.22-28 (BHG 1748) ed.

Festugière, pp. 30, 37, 65, 112. On the other hand, healing seems to imply forgiveness too (Vita Theodori 61, p. 52) and πληροφορία - in many senses - is a leit-motif of the Life: Vita Theodori 24.21-25, 78.21-22, 136.23-25, 159.28-37, pp. 21, 65, 109, 134.

332. Vita Theodori 90.12-17, 135.39-46, 168a.1-58 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 75, 108, 157-159. Anecdotes in which an apparently mortal illness provokes repentance (Vita Theodori 39.11-18, 69.1-28, pp. 35, 56-57) are better understood as healing-stories and do not attest the custom of deathbed confession/penance in the normal circumstances of the dying. Contrast n. 205 above.

333. Spiritual direction of the laity: Vita Theodori 4.1-3, 14.4-7, 89.1-8, 147.1-64, 154.9-13 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 4, 12, 73, 115-117, 124. Spiritual direction of clergy and monks: Vita Theodori 136.15-25, 155.9-19, pp. 108-109, 126. πατὴρ πνευματικός: Vita Theodori 151.36-62, 160.3-5, pp. 121, 176.

334. Vita Theodori 151.39-41 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, p. 121.

335. Vita Theodori 151.41-62 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, p. 121. Vita Theodori 78.10-21, 159.89-103, pp. 65, 136 show Theodore in the role of the "répondant du péché"; cf. Chapter Two, n. 138 above, and in this chapter nn. 89, 178, 246 and 316. For the relationship of spiritual father and son see Hausherr, Direction spirituelle..., pp. 124-151, 178-211.

336. Ordination of Theodore: Vita Theodori 21.12-14 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, p. 18 (ordination as charism). Respect for hierarchs: Vita Theodori 135.1-46, 136.1-25, pp. 107-108, 108-109.

337. Vita Theodori 127.1-20 (diminution of grace), 153.16-24 (Christian impenitence) (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 102-103, 124 and cf. n. 318 above.

338. The idea of such a school is suggested by H. Delehaye, "Saints de Chypre," AB 26(1907) 161-301 at p. 246 and cf. pp. 235-249. The notion is helpful for purposes of organizing the Vitae into larger groups, but should not be pressed too far.

339. Epiphanius: Delehaye, "Saints de Chypre," pp. 242-243 and H. Gelzer, Leontios' von Neapolis Leben des heiligen Johannes des Barmherzigen, Erzbischofs von Alexandrien, Freiburg 1893, pp. 38.5-40.16 and 138. Auxibius: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 466 and 199-200; A Papageorgiou, "Ὁ Ἅγιος Αὐξίβιος," Ἀπόστολος Βαρνάβας 29(1968) 3rd Series, 336-348 at pp. 347-348; J. Noret/S. Eyice, "S. Lucien, disciple de S. Lucien d'Antioche. A propos d'une inscription de Kirşehir (Turquie)," AB 91(1973) 363-377 at pp. 369-370. Spyridon: P. van den Ven, La légende de S. Spyridon, évêque de Trimithonte, Louvain 1953, pp. 86*-88*, 109*-111*; G. Garitte, "L'édition des Vies de saint Spyridon par M. van den Ven," RHE 50(1955) 125-140 at p. 137; Festugière, Leontios..., p. 1. Leontius of Neapolis: L. Rydén, Das Leben des heiligen Narren Symeon von Leontios von Neapolis, Stockholm 1963, pp. 17-27 (with earlier literature) and Festugière, Leontios..., pp. 1-30. Gelzer's text for the Life of John the Almsgiver will be cited with cross-reference to the "longer recension" published by Festugière. Neither the new material in Festugière (Vita 37, 56, pp. 386-387, 403) nor the many differences in detail (Leontios..., pp. 282-297) contain any evidence for ecclesiastical penance not already in Gelzer's text. Note that Leontius' authorship of the Life of Spyridon is not yet universally accepted: C. Laga, "Remarques sur l'emploi de

quelques particules dans l'oeuvre hagiographique de Léonce de Neapolis," OLP 6/7 (1975-1976) 341-353 at pp. 341-342, n. 2.

340. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 14 (BHG 896) ed. Gelzer, p.28.8-16 [= Festugière, Vita 12, p. 359]. Here excommunication is in the hands of the bishop alone.

341. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 14 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 28.20-29.4 [= Festugière, Vita 12, pp. 359-360 and 563]; cf. Vita Epiphanii 38 (BHG 596), 56, 60 (BHG 597) ed. Dindorf, pp. 44.13-45.3, 62.1-5, 67.6-25. The last text shows that inflexible adherence to the "term" of an excommunication was deemed wrong. All these cases pertain to clerics only.

342. Public ἔλεγχος : Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 17 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, p. 35.15-24 [= Festugière, Vita 15, pp. 363-364]; Vita Epiphanii 44-45 (BHG 597) ed. Dindorf, pp. 49.20-52.2; Vita Spyridonis 2, 5, 15 (BHG 1647) ed. van den Ven, pp. 14.4-13, 25.2-8, 69.3-12. Private ἔλεγχος : Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 40, pp. 78.13-79.11 [= Festugière, Vita 42, pp. 393-394]. Coercion: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 24, pp. 49.23-50.2 [= Festugière, Vita 23, p. 373: sinner is a monk] and cf. Vita Epiphanii 59, p. 66.15-23: use of the "secular arm" against heretics. The lost Life of John the Almsgiver by John Moschus and Sophronius (a source for Leontius) seems also to have contained a detailed description of the reconciliation of heretical clergy at Alexandria which included the submission of λιβέλλοι μετανοίας and the anathematizing of all heresies and heresiarchs: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 5 (BHG 887v) ed. Delehaye, p. 21.28-33 and Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 5 (BHG 887w) ed. Lappa-Zizicas, p. 275.5-15. The bishop continues to act as a public judge (Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 5, 13 [BHG 886] ed. Gelzer, pp. 11.3-16, 26.24-28.7 [= Festugière, Vita 4, 11, pp. 349, 358-359]) and has at his disposal officials (ἔκδικοι , ἐκκλησιέκδικοι) to execute his decisions: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 5, 36, pp. 11.3-16, 71.16-18 [= Festugière, Vita 4, 38, pp. 349, 388]; Vita Epiphanii 55, pp. 60.26-61.9. It is known that the ἔκδικοι were later to assume the duties of penitentiarii (at least at Constantinople: Darrouzès, Recherches..., pp. 323-332), but it may be presumed here that the bishop worked through such officials in rooting out public scandals, such as that of the sodomitic practices of the men of the lake region of Maria: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 8 (BHG 887v) pp. 22.33-23.2 [cf. BHG 887w, p. 276]. For the ἔκδικοι see also Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.1, Paris 1972², NN. 234-235, pp. 171-172; Festugiere, Leontios..., p. 540 and Diekamp,"Brief an einen Sünder...," pp. 49-50.

343. Vita Epiphanii 59 (heretics) (BHG 597) ed. Dindorf, p. 66.19-23; Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 11, 12, 46 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 22.23-23.2, 24.21-25.14, 95.13-97.7 [= Festugière, Vita 9, 10, 59, pp. 356, 357, 405-406]; Vita Spyridonis 7, 15 (BHG 1648a) ed. van den Ven, pp. 112.6-24, 123.31-124.16; Vita Spyridonis 5, 10, 15, 21 (BHG 1647) ed. van den Ven, pp. 25.2-26.13, 55.14-56.5, 69.3-70.1, 95.2-11.

344. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 46 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 95.11-99.18 [= Festugière, Vita 59, pp. 405-408]. The story presumes the practice of private confession to the bishop, at least in some cases:" Εἰ ἄρα πιστεύεις, ὦ γύναι, τῷ θεῷ, ὅτι διὰ τῆς παλαιπωρίας μου συγχωρῇ σοι τὸ ἔγκλημα, ὃ λέγεις, ἐξομολόγησαί μοι αὐτό."(Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 46, p. 96.10-12 [= Festugière, Vita 59, p. 406]). Cf. Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, pp. 215A-220A.

345. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 13, 17, 40, 46 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 27.5-10, 35.1-24, 78.13-79.11, 96.10-98.5 [= Festugière, Vita 11, 15, 42, 59, pp. 358, 363-364, 393-394, 406-407]. See also nn. 173, 180 above.

346. Direct absolution: Vita Spyridonis 7 (BHG 1648a) ed. van den Ven, p. 112.19-24; cf. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 46 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 95.21-96.12 [= Festugière, Vita 59, p. 406]. Absolution as intercession: Vita Spyridonis 14, p. 123.11-17; Vita Spyridonis 5, 14 (BHG 1647) ed. van den Ven, p. 27.5-7, 64.16-65.11; Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 12, 46, pp. 25.6-10, 99.5-14 [= Festugière, Vita 10, 59, pp. 357,407]. διόρθωσις as absolution: Vita Spyridonis 10 (BHG 1647) pp. 55.14-56.5; Vita Symeonis Sali 36 (BHG 1677) ed. Rydén, pp. 83.19-84.6. Entry into monastic life as remission of past sin: Vita Symeonis Sali 12, pp. 65.5-8 but cf. n. 191 above.

347. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 12 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, p. 25.8-10 [= Festugière, Vita 10, p. 357]: παρεκάλει αὐτὸν ὡς ἐξ ἑτέρων διαβλητόρων κινηθέντα, συγχώρησιν αὐτῷ παρὰ θεοῦ αἰτήσασθαι, πληροφορῶν αὐτὸν, ὡς καὶ ἐπιτίμιον, ἐὰν δώσῃ αὐτῷ, προθύμως τοῦτο δέξηται καὶ φυλάξῃ. ἐπιτίμιον is used in Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 14, p. 28.10 in a slightly different sense to refer to a measure (here = deposition/excommunication) which precedes rather than follows an acknowledgement of guilt [= Festugière, Vita 12, p. 359].

348. Confession of λογισμοί : Vita Symeonis Sali 23 (BHG 1677) ed. Rydén, p. 73.17-19. Medicinal penance and πάθη : Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 16, 40 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 34.1-6, 78.13-79.11 [= Festugière, Vita 14, 42, pp. 362-363, 393-394]; Vita Spyridonis 7, 11 (BHG 1648a) ed. van den Ven, pp. 112.6-24, 119.21-27; Vita Spyridonis Prologus (BHG 1647) ed. van den Ven, pp. 4.12-6.10; Vita Symeonis Sali 1, p. 55.18-20; Vita Auxibii 22 (BHG 204) ed. Papageorgiou, p. 21.17-27.

349. Activities of holy men: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 24, 36, 43 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 49.10-52.16, 72.1-74.19, 86.16-89.13 [= Festugière, Vita 33, 38, 50, pp. 373-375, 388-390, 399-401]; Vita Symeonis Sali 44, 45, 53 (BHG 1677) ed. Rydén, pp. 89.8-14, 90.1-2, 96.17-21. Respect for office: Vita Epiphanii 6, 11, 26, 29, 34 (BHG 596) 49, 51 (BHG 597) ed. Dindorf, pp. 8.31-9.2, 13.18-19, 30.28-31, 34.18-25, 39.15-17, 54.9-12, 56.14-15. It is one of the major emphases in Leontius that great holiness is possible in every age: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii Prologus, p. 1.4-3.4 [= Festugière, Vita Prologus, pp. 343-344]; Vita Symeonis Sali 2, p. 56.13-24. For this theme as a topos see Festugière, Leontios..., pp. 529-531. 627.

350. True of Epiphanius, Spyridon and John the Almsgiver; earlier examples are provided by Daniel the Stylite, Sabas, Dometius, Symeon Stylites the Younger and Theodore of Sykeon. These examples are raised to a question of principle in Vita monachorum in Sinai et Raithu 7 (BHG 1307) ed. Poussines, PG 79.692B-693A. Bishops as charismatic figures: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 1, 2 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 6.3-6, 7.19-8.1 [= Festugière, Vita Prologus, 1, pp. 346, 347]; Vita Spyridonis Prologus, 5, 15, 17 (BHG 1647) ed. van den Ven, pp. 6.6-10 and 8.6-9.2, 26.13-27.10, 70.1-18, 74.1-11; Vita Epiphanii 38 (BHG 596) ed. Dindorf, p. 44.5-23 and cf. Vita Epiphanii 25, p. 29.17-24 where it is precisely ordination as priest, not personal holiness or experience, that gives a man χάρισμα from God and makes him hegumen and spiritual father of a community.

351. Demetrius: see n. 300 above. Menas: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 460-461 and J.-M. Sauget, "Menna (Menas), santo, martire (?) in Egitto,"

BS 9.324-342, Rome 1967 at cc. 328-330 with bibliography. Michael: Beck, Kirche..., p. 466 with M. Mara/F. Spadafora, "Michele, arcangelo, santo," BS 9.410-446, Rome 1967 at c. 416 and W. von Rintelen, "Kult- und Legendenwanderung von Ost nach West im frühen Mittelalter," Saeculum 22(1971) 71-100.

352. There is one reference to a confession of sin made directly to the saint in his shrine: Miracula Menae 11 (BHG 1267) ed. Pomyalovsky, p. 87.13-20, and another to a public confession (of murder): Miracula Menae 1 (BHG 1257) p. 65.29-31. Neither is made voluntarily; each is provoked by the miraculous intervention of the saint.

353. Penitential pilgrimage: Miracula Menae 3 (BHG 1259), 6 (BHG 1262), 8 (BHG 1264) ed. Pomyalovsky, pp. 69.1-11, 75.14-15 [πολλοὶ γὰρ ἀπῆλθον ἐκεῖ καὶ ἔτυχον οὐ μόνον ἰάσεως, ἀλλὰ καὶ ἀφέσεως ἁμαρτιῶν.] 81.16-17. "Conversi": Miracula Menae 1 (BHG 1257), 3 (BHG 1259), 4 (BHG 1260), 6 (BHG 1262), 9 (BHG 1265), 13 (BHG 1269), pp. 66.1-3, 70.22-26, 73.20-25, 78.17-19, 86.1-6, 89.25-29. Cf. Chapter Two, n. 165 above, and in this Chapter, nn. 30, 31, 241, 242, 299 and 314 above.

354. Miracula Menae 1 (BHG 1257), 3 (BHG 1259), 4 (BHG 1260), 8 (BHG 1264), 9 (BHG 1265) ed. Pomyalovsky, pp. 65.2-4, 70.22-26, 73.20-25, 81.16-17, 86.1-6.

355. Alms: Miracula Menae 2 (BHG 1258), 3 (BHG 1259), 4 (BHG 1260) ed. Pomyalovsky, pp. 68.9-25, 69.1-8, 73.20-25. Money connected with ἐπιτίμια : Miracula Menae 1 (BHG 1257), 8 (BHG 1264), 11 (BHG 1267) pp. 64.31-65.2...26-29, 84.13-19, 87.13-26. Cf. n. 210 above with n. 358 below and see also Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 18, 28 (BHG 873) ed. Savile, pp. 180.21-36, 196.10-16 [= Halkin, Douze récits..., pp. 117-118, 150].

356. Miraculum Michaelis in Chonis 12 (BHG 1282) ed. Nau, p. 561.2-6. Cf. Vita Menae f. 13^{v}, ed. Drescher, p. 98 [= Egyptian interpolation] and n. 365 below.

357. Chariton: Beck, Kirche..., p. 467 and G. Garitte, "La Vie préméta-phrastique de S. Chariton," Bulletin de l'Institut Historique Belge de Rome 21(1940-1941) 5-50 at pp. 8-10. Ephraem: Outtier, "Saint Ephrem...," pp. 11-33. Dositheus: Beck, Kirche..., p. 407 and L. Regnault/J. de Préville, Dorothée de Gaza. Oeuvres spirituelles, Paris 1963, pp. 9-29, 33-35.

358. Vita Ephraem 27 (BHG 583) ed. Morel, PG 46.845B-C: Ὡς πρόδρομος ἐν ἐρήμῳ ηὐλίσθη· καὶ ῥῆμα Θεοῦ ἔλεγεν καὶ πρὸς τοῦτον, καὶ μετανοίας κήρυξ, ἐχρημάτισε, καὶ τὰς ἁμαρτίας ἐξομολογεῖσθαι τοὺς προσερχομένους ἐδίδαξεν. The comparison with the Baptist certainly reduces the value of this text as an historical description. Vita Dosithei 3.26-34 (BHG 2117) edd. Regnault/de Préville, p. 126 and Vita Charitonis 35 (BHG 300z) ed. Garitte, pp. 40.24-41.12 both suggest that lay people were normally expected to take the "easier" way in discharging their penitential obligations, as, for example, by giving alms instead of fasting or praying. Cf. nn. 104, 301, 355 above, and Vita Ioseph 4-5 [= Pratum spirituale] (BHG 2203) ed. Evergetinos, p. 42.1-20.

359. Vita Dosithei 6.10-34 (BHG 2117) edd. Regnault/de Préville, pp. 130/132. Monastic confession of λογισμοί: Vita Dosithei 7.1-2, 12.20-22, pp. 132, 142. Spiritual fatherhood as apostolic: Vita Charitonis

38 (BHG 300z) ed. Garitte, pp. 42.16-43.15. Note too that in the Dositheus text the forgiveness of sins is imparted by Dorotheus, and that spiritual responsibility in the monastery is shared between the hegumen, the γέρων and Dorotheus himself: Vita Dosithei 4.1-19, pp. 126/128.

360. Vita Charitonis 34 (BHG 300z) ed. Garitte, p. 34.12-23 and cf. Chapter Two, nn. 41, 122 above.

361. Apollinaria: G. Gordini, "Apollinaria, vergine in Egitto, santa," in BS 2.251, Rome 1962. Euphrosyna: P. Bertocchi, "Eufrosina (Smaragdo) di Alessandria, vergine, santa," BS 5.175-176, Rome 1964 with bibliography. Eupraxia: G. Quispel/J. Zandee, "A Coptic Fragment from the Life of Eupraxia," VC 13(1959) 193-203; F. Halkin, "Une nouvelle recension de la Vie de Ste. Eupraxie," AB 79(1961) 160; G. Lucchesi, "Euprasia, anacoreta in Tebaide, santa," BS 5.233-235, Rome 1964. Maria [Marinus]: M. Richard, "La Vie ancienne de Sainte Marie surnommée Marinos," in Corona Gratiarum, ed. D. Hoste, Bruges 1975, vol. 1, pp. 83-115 at pp. 108-112. For Apollinaria, Euphrosyna and Maria see Patlagean, "L'histoire de la femme...," pp. 600-607, 611-612. Mark: C.A. Williams, Oriental Affinities of the Legend of the Hairy Anchorite, Urbana 1926, Pt. 2, p. 64, n.7 and J.-M. Sauget, "Marco di Atene, eremita sul monte Tarmaqa, santo," BS 8.701-703, Rome 1967. Onuphrius: Williams, Oriental Affinities..., Pt. 2, pp. 81-82 and J.-M. Sauget, "Onofrio, eremita, santo," BS 9.1187-1197, Rome 1967.

362. The bishop is an absent figure, not a rejected one. Vita Marci 15 (BHG 1039) edd. Henskens/van Papenbroek, p. 42*C illustrates well a kind of monastic environment in which the hierarchical power is greatly venerated but also wholly absent from everyday life. Cf. Chapter Five, p. 177 (with n. 125) below.

363. Monastic penance: Vita Eupraxiae 20 (BHG 631) edd. Henskens/van Papenbroek, p. 731C-D; Vita Eugenii et Mariae [Marini] 11-12, 15-17 (BHG 615) ed. Richard, pp. 90-91, 91-92 and note the very precise penitential tariffs/remedies in use within the monastery in Vita Eupraxiae 14, p. 730A-B. Confession: Vita Eupraxiae 14, p. 730B (λογισμοί); Vita Eugenii et Mariae [Marini] 11, 12 (public), 19, pp. 90, 90-91, 93.

364. See nn. 205 and 206 above, but cf. also n. 332 above.

365. No deathbed repentance: Vita Eupraxiae 34-37 (BHG 631) edd. Henskens/van Papenbroek, pp. 734F-735E. Guaranteed intercession: Vita Eupraxiae 35, 36, p. 735B-C and Vita Onuphrii 14 (BHG 1378) ed. Janninck, p. 532D: Καὶ ἐάν τις προσφορὰν εἰς ὄνομά μου καὶ μνημόσυνον προσάγει Κυρίῳ τῷ Θεῷ ἡμῶν, συναριθμούμενος γενήσεται πάντων τῶν ἁγίων, καὶ λυτροῦται ἀπὸ παντὸς πειρασμοῦ. Ὃ ἐὰν σώσῃ αὐτῷ. Καὶ εἴ τις τρέφει ἀδελφὸν, ἢ πτωχὸν ἐν τῷ ἐμοῦ ὀνόματι, μνησθῶ κἀγὼ ἐνώπιον τοῦ Θεοῦ ἡμῶν, ἐν τῇ ἡμέρᾳ τῆς κρίσεως, καὶ τῆς αἰωνίου ζωῆς κληρονόμος γενήσεται.

366. These Lives may contain historical elements but the genre is plainly that of the διήγημα ψυχωφελές. The late seventh century is only a convenient terminus ad quem; many of these accounts may be earlier, but exact dating is impossible. Pelagia: H. Usener, Legenden der Pelagia, Bonn 1879, pp. v-xix; J.-M. Sauget, "Pelagia, penitente di Gerusalemme, santa," BS 10.432-437, Rome 1968; Z. Pavlovskis, "The Life of St. Pelagia the Harlot: Hagiographical Adaptation of Pagan Romance," Classical Folia 30(1976) 138-149. Thais: A. Amore, "Taisia (Tais, Taide), penitente, santa (?)," BS 12.97-99, Rome 1969. Mary:

J.-M. Sauget, "Maria Egiziaca, santa," BS 8.981-991, Rome 1967 with bibliography. Theophilus: Radermacher, Griechische Quellen..., pp. 153-162; R. Janin, "Teofilo di Cilicia detto il Penitente, santo," BS 12.340-343; G. Geenen, " 'Legenda Theophili'. Speculum historico-doctrinale de Mediatione Matris Dei in Alto Medio Aevo (a saec. VIIa ad XII)," Marianum 34(1972) 396-430 at pp. 397-400. James: J.-M. Sauget, "Giacomo, eremita in Palestina, santo," BS 6.414-418, Rome 1965.

367. Pastoral aim of the narrationes: Vita Taisiae 1 (BHG 1695) ed. Nau, p. 86.8-13: Καὶ τοῖς πεσοῦσι τῷ τῆς ἁμαρτίας βύσῳ καὶ θέλουσι μετανοῆσαι, ὠφέλιμος ὁ λόγος καὶ παρακλητικός, χεῖρα ὀρέγων καὶ διεγείρων τοῦ μὴ περιπίπτειν τοῖς διαβολικοῖς ἀπογνώσεως λογισμοῖς. Illustrations of despair in Vita Taisiae 9, pp. 106.18/108.10 and Vita Iacobi 19, 23 (BHG 770) edd. Trautmann/Klostermann, pp. 286.13-18, 288.16-32. Clear awareness of the "limiting case": Vita Iacobi 11, p. 283.7-10: ἀλλ' ὁ τοιοῦτος καὶ τηλικοῦτος, ὁ τοσοῦτος χάριτος ἀξιωθεὶς ἴσως καὶ ἑνάρετι τινι ἢ τύφῳ ληφθεὶς πτώματι συγχωρεῖται περιπεσεῖν καὶ πτώματι τῶν πάντων χαλεπωτάτῳ. Details of the operation of ecclesiastical penance: confession: Vita Theophili 3, 7 (BHG 1322) ed. Radermacher, p. 168.9-12, 176.8-15; Vita Iacobi 19, 21 (BHG 770) edd. Trautmann/Klostermann, pp. 286.27-28, 287.9-25. Confession as itself a possible occasion of sin: Vita Mariae Aegyptiacae 19, 27 (BHG 1042) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 87:3.3712B, 3716D. Spiritual direction (of laity and priests): Vita Iacobi 10, p. 283.4-7. Reconciliation: Vita Theophili 7, p. 176.15-27.

368. Vita Taisiae 8 (BHG 1695) ed. Nau, pp. 102.15-106.2; Vita Theophili 3, 4, 6 (BHG 1322) ed. Radermacher, pp. 170.4-6, 170.13-16, 174.16/176.8; Vita Iacobi 25-26, 29-32 (BHG 770) edd. Trautmann/Klostermann, pp. 289.17-290.16, 291.13-292.16; Vita Mariae Aegyptiacae 23-26 (BHG 1042) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 87:3.3713C-3716C.

369. For despair see nn. 177, 178 and 367 above. For the importance of shame as a factor inhibiting the confession of sin see nn. 173, 180 and 345 above.

370. Ammonius/Nilus: Beck, Kirche..., p. 413 with bibliography to which add V. Christides, "Once Again the 'Narrationes' of Nilus Sinaiticus," Byzantion 43(1973) 39-50 and P. Mayerson, "Observations on Nilus' Narrationes: Evidence for an Unknown Christian Sect?" Journal of the American Research Center in Egypt 12(1975) 51-74. Anastasius: F. Nau, "Le texte grec des récits utiles à l'ame d'Anastase (le Sinaïte)," Oriens Christianus 3(1903) 56-90 at pp. 56-60 and "Le texte grec des récits du moine Anastase sur les saints pères du Sinaï," Oriens Christianus 2(1902) 58-89 at pp. 59-60. Zosimas: K. Kunze, "Zosimo, monaci in Palestina, santi (?). 4)," BS 12.1498-1500 at c. 1499. Philentolus: F. Halkin, "La vision de Kaioumas et le sort éternel de Philentolos Olympiou," AB 63(1945) 56-64 at pp. 56-60 and "Entre ciel et enfer, Philentolus," AB 90(1972) 323-327 at pp. 323-324.

371. Narratio de taxeota seu milite redivivo 6 (BHG 1318) ed. Nau, p. 87. 4-13.

372. Narratio de expugnatione montis Sina 4 (BHG 1318s) ed. Nau, p. 89.7-29.

373. In the first case, however, the angel "answers for" the sincerity of the officer's repentance (Narratio de taxeota seu milite redivivo 5 [BHG 1318] ed. Nau, p. 86.16-21), and in the case of the murderer, it is doubtful perhaps whether the author himself considers the deed

to be sinful since it was done to preserve the Christian faith of the victims: Narratio de expugnatione montis Sina 2, 4 (BHG 1318s) ed. Nau, pp. 88.6-28, 89.7-14.

374. Narratio de taxeota seu milite redivivo 4 (BHG 1318) ed. Nau, p. 85.13-16; cf. nn. 184 and 346 above. It may be observed that the hagiographical sources have not so far produced any clear instance of the assuming of the monastic habit on the deathbed as a means of securing the forgiveness of sins.

375. The earliest references to the "customs houses" through which the soul passed after death are collected in PGL, p. 1387, s.vv. τελωνάρχης - τελώνιον, and cf. G. Every, "Toll Gates on the Air Way," ECR 8(1976) 139-151 at p. 140. See also Vita Theodori Syceotae 164. 69-94 (BHG 1748) ed. Festugière, pp. 151-152; Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 22, 41 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 41.18-42.15, 81.19-83.15 [= Festugière, Vita 20, 43, pp. 368-369, 395-397]; Symeon Stylites the Younger, Sermo 22.1,3,4,6 NPB 8:3.112.1-4, 113.1-12, 113.13-114.3, 115.16-116.3.

376. Narratio de philentolo fornicatore 4-5 (BHG 1322w) ed. Halkin, pp. 63-64 and cf. Anastasius Sinaita, Quaestiones et responsiones 83, PG 89.709D-712A. Behind this attitude lies the difference in standards that were applied to the saint and the common man: Zosimae Narrationes 14 (BHG 1448x) ed. Augoustinos, p. 100.6-26 [= PG 88. 1648D-1649B] and cf. Chapter Four, p. 135 below.

377. See n. 374 above and the article by Goria cited in n. 4 above.

378. Text in Joannou, Discipline..., vol. 1.1, pp. 239.3-241.18.

379. See Chapter Two, pp. 53-57 above.

380. Studies of the frequency of communion tend to neglect the East after the time of Chrysostom, as J. Duhr, "Communion fréquente," DSp 2. 1234-1288, Paris 1953.

381. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 314-317 and H. Karpp, "Busse: II Busswesen in den christlichen Kirchen," Evangelisches Kirchenlexicon 1.631-635 at cc. 632-633.

382. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 314-317. For the period until 692 Holl gives four examples of confessions made by laymen to monks: James of Nisibis, Symeon Stylites, John the Hesychast, and a "monk" in the Pratum spirituale. James of Nisibis and John the Hesychast were, however, both bishops. Symeon Stylites was not a priest but the confession in question was made publicly to him and to the crowd and the man sought the intercession of Symeon to obtain the cure of his affliction as well as the forgiveness of his sin. The monk in Pratum spirituale 78 was the hegumen of a monastery (not a hermit as Holl describes him) who provoked the confession not of a lay visitor to the monastery but of a man who had come to the monastery to become a monk. It cannot be known whether the hegumen was ordained or unordained, but cf. n. 294 above.

CHAPTER FOUR: NOTES

1. See Iconoclasm, edd. A. Bryer/J. Herrin, Birmingham, 1977 for a recent discussion of the many dimensions of Byzantine iconoclasm. For the materials of the wider social context see P.A. Yannopoulos, La société profane dans l'empire byzantin des VIIe, VIIIe et IXe siècles, Louvain 1975.

2. See Chapter One, n. 14 above and Ringrose, Saints, Holy Men..., pp. 82-97.

3. H.-G. Beck, "Die griechische Kirche im Zeitalter des Ikonoklasmus," in Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte, ed. H. Jedin, vol. 3.1, Freiburg 1966, pp. 31-61 at pp. 59-61; B. Kötting, "Die Stellung des Konfessors in der Alten Kirche," JAC 19(1976) 7-23 at p. 23, but cf. the valuable cautions of S. Gero, "Byzantine Iconoclasm and Monachomachy," JEH 28(1977) 241-248.

4. P.J. Alexander, The Patriarch Nicephorus of Constantinople. Ecclesiastical Policy and Image Worship in the Byzantine Empire, Oxford 1958, pp. 152-154, repeated in Ringrose, Saints, Holy Men..., p. 82 and p. 93, n. 1. Cf. n. 116 below.

5. H. Ahrweiler, "The Geography of the Iconoclast World," and C. Mango, "The Liquidation of Iconoclasm and the Patriarch Photios," in Iconoclasm, pp. 21-27 and 133-140, have made clear how many interesting ambiguities of practice and policy can still be made out between the lines of the later monastic sources for the period.

6. Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 116-119, 127-129 and A. Papadakis, "Hagiography in Relation to Iconoclasm," GOTR 14(1969) 159-180.

7. Herman, "Il più antico...," pp. 82-85.

8. Herman, "Il più antico...," pp. 96-120.

9. See the evidence for confession and ἐπιτίμια in Chapters Two and Three above, and Morin, Commentarius historicus..., Appendix, p. 108C.

10. Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.1, Paris 1972^{2}, NN. 269a, 319; vol. 1.2, Kadiköy 1936, NN. 363, 365, 368, 378, 379, 381, 387, 402, 412. Cf. Hajjar, Le synode permanent..., pp. 124-127.

11. The most serious of these concerns the canons attributed to Patriarch Nicephorus I of Constantinople. See Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.2, Kadiköy 1936, NN. 405-407, pp. 35-39.

12. Ligier, "Dimension personnelle...," pp. 164-167 and van de Paverd, "La pénitence...," pp. 194-195.

13. Wellesz, A History of Byzantine Music..., pp. 204-245; V. Iljine, "Le mystère de la Pénitence et le Grand Canon de Saint André de Crète," Messager de l'Exarchat du Patriarche Russe en Europe occidentale Nr. 6 (1951) 8-16; M. Richard, "Le commentaire du Grand Canon d'André de Crète par Acace le Sabaïte," EEBΣ 34(1965) 304-311. See also Chapter Three, n. 8 above.

14. There exists no systematic investigation of the evidence for penance in any of these writers, although such evidence is certainly to be found in, for example, the Sacra Parallela of John of Damascus or the correspondence of Theodore of Stoudion; cf. A. Guillou, "Le système de vie enseigné au VIIIe siècle dans le monde byzantin," in I problemi dell' Occidente nel secolo VIII. Spoleto 6-12 aprile 1972,

vol. 1, Spoleto 1973, pp. 343-381.

15. Compare, for example, information relevant to penance in the Vita Stephani Iunioris and in the Chronographia of Theophanes; see n. 40 below.

16. See H. Usener, Acta M. Anastasii Persae, Bonn 1894, pp. v-vi.

17. The date of the Life is discussed in W. Lackner, "Ein hagiographisches Zeugnis für den Antapodotikos des Patriarchen Germanos I von Konstantinopel," Byzantion 38(1968) 42-104 at pp. 72-78.

18. Anastasius: Usener, Acta M. Anastasii..., p. vi. David: R.-J. Loenertz, "Saint David de Thessalonique. Sa Vie, son culte, ses reliques, ses images," REB 11(1953) 205-222 at pp. 206-208. Dorotheus of Gaza: L. Regnault and J. de Préville, Dorothée de Gaza. Oeuvres spirituelles, Paris 1963, p. 34. Martin: P. Peeters, "Une Vie grecque du pape S. Martin I," AB 51(1933) 225-262 at pp. 252-253.

19. Anathemas: Vita Martini 1, 3, 8 (BHG 2259) ed. Peeters, pp. 254.6-10, 255.11-14, 259.15-16. There are references to monastic penance, including the spiritual direction of the laity by monks, in Vita Dorothei 5.5-6, 6.14-19 (BHG 2116z) edd. Regnault/de Préville, pp. 116, 118.

20. For Andrew of Crete see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 500-502 and F. Caraffa, "Andrea, vescovo di Gortina, santo," BS 1.1142, Rome 1961 with further bibliography. The Laudatio Panteleemonis (BHG 1416) sometimes attributed to Andrew will be discussed in the following chapter as part of the work of Nicetas the Paphlagonian. The encomium of Cosmas and Damian (BHG 384b) is only in part the work of Andrew; cf. CPG 8227.

21. Intercession of the martyrs on behalf of sinners: Vita X Martyrum 10.2 (BHG 1197d) ed. Laourdas, p. 115.11-15. Reconciliation of a heretical leader by the bishop: Vita Nicolai 7 (BHG 1362) ed. Anrich, pp. 425.18-426.4. Pedagogical value of the anger of God and the saints: Vita Therapontis 6.5-8, 23.1-16 (BHG 1798) ed. Deubner, pp. 123, 131.

22. Vita Patapii 6-9 (BHG 1428) ed. Combefis, PG 97.1244B-1249D. The story is set in Constantinople of the seventh or early eighth century; see P. Canart, "Le dossier hagiographique des SS. Baras, Patapios et Raboulas," AB 87(1969) 445-459 at pp. 448-452.

23. Vita Patapii 6 (BHG 1428) ed. Combefis, PG 97.1244C. The fact that the saint later intervenes miraculously to effect the cure and forgiveness of the girl (Vita Patapii 8, PG 97.1245C-1248B) should not be allowed to overshadow this more routine administration of penance reflected in the anecdote.

24. For the hagiographical writings of John Damascene see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 482-483 and J. M. Hoeck, "Stand und Aufgaben der Damaskenos-Forschung," OCP 17(1951) 5-60 at pp. 31-36. The monastic romance of Barlaam and Joasaph (BHG 224) can no longer be attributed to John (see Chapter Five, n. 207 below), nor the Passio Artemii (BHG 170) nor the Passio Parascevae (BHG 1420p). The Passion of Peter of Capitolias (see Hoeck, "Stand und Aufgaben...," p. 35, n. 4) is also of doubtful authenticity, but the résumé of the Georgian text suggests that it contains nothing relevant to penance in any case: P. Peeters, "La Passion de S. Pierre de Capitolias (+ 13 Janvier 715)," AB 57(1939) 299-333 at pp. 301-316.

25. Intercession of the martyrs for the forgiveness of sins: Vita Barbarae 18, 23 (BHG 217) ed. Le Quien, PG 96.805C, 813C. Chrysostom's excommunication of Eudoxia is interpreted as a therapeutic rather than a vindictive measure: Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 14-15 (BHG 879) ed. Le Quien, PG 96.777B-C.

26. Leo of Catania: G. Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Sicile et d'Italie méridionale aux VIIIe, IXe et Xe siècles," Byzantion 29/30 (1959/1960) 89-173 at pp. 89-95. Marcianus: A. Amore, San Marciano di Siracusa. Studio archeologico-agiografico, Vatican City 1958, pp. 27-29 and E. Patlagean, "Les moines grecs d'Italie et l'apologie des thèses pontificales (VIIIe- IXe siècles)," Studi Medievali Serie Terza 5.2 (1964) 579-602 at pp. 582, 588. Pancratius: Amore, San Marciano..., pp. 29-31; Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," pp. 581-582, 587-589; Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 113, n. 2.

27. Vita Leonis 13 (BHG 981) ed. Bolland, p. 225D and Vita Leonis 32 (BHG 981b) ed. Latyshev, p. 24.26-37.

28. Vita Leonis 14 (BHG 981) ed. Bolland, p. 225D-E and Vita Leonis 33-34 (BHG 981b) ed. Latyshev, p. 25.1-36. The public avowal of apostasy extracted from Heliodorus before his death is not so much a confession of sin as it is a part of his punishment (Vita Leonis 34, p. 25.23-25): παρετοκεύασεν αὐτὸν πρότερον ἐκπομπεῦσαι πᾶσαν τὴν στατωνικὴν αὐτοῦ μαθητείαν καὶ χοητείαν καὶ τίνι τρόπῳ καὶ πότε καὶ διὰ τί τὸν Χριστὸν ἐξωμόσατο.

29. Vita Pancratii (BHG 1410) Vaticanus gr. 1591, f. 9^{v} a.7-27: ἐὰν ἁμάρτῃ ὁ ἐπίσκοπος, οἱ ὑπ' αὐτοῦ διδάσκεσθαι μέλλοντες [πῶς ἂν ὠφελείαν σχῶσιν;] πῶς ὀρ[χῆς ἐπερχ]ομένης ἐξελεώσε[ται ὑπὲρ] τοῦ λαοῦ; ποίῳ [προσώπῳ] σταθήσε[ται ἐνώπιον τοῦ Θεοῦ] εἰ ὅλοι ἐν τῇ πό[λει ἁμ]αρτίαις συσχεθῶσιν; αὐτὸς ὑπὲρ πάντων αἰτεῖ συγχώρησιν, ὡς καὶ Μω[υ]σῆς ἔστη ἐν τῇ ῥαγάδι, τοῦ μὴ ἐξολοθρεῦσαι. δεῖ οὖν τὸν ἐπίσκοπον ἀγνείᾳ καὶ ἐγκρατείᾳ διαπρέποντα πάντα τὰ [χρῆϊα] ἐκφώνειν καὶ μόνῳ τῷ Θεῷ ἐντυγχάνειν, [ἵνα] ὅταν ὑπὲρ τῶν ἡμαρτηκότων στένωγμον ἀνενέγκῃ, κατενέγκῃ συγχώρησιν τῶν πλημμεληθέντων ὑπὲρ τοῦ λαοῦ." — the apostle Peter talking to Pancratius and Marcianus before the two leave on their mission to Italy. [Readings in square brackets are supplied from Cryptoferratensis B 5, ff. 20^{v} and 21^{r} which cover the lacunae in Vaticanus gr. 1591. The opportunity to consult both manuscripts I owe to the kindness of Prof. C. Mango.]

30. Vita Pancratii (BHG 1410) Vaticanus gr. 1591, f. 9^{v} b.21-31: κατὰ πρεσβυτέρων μὴ [μαρτυρίαν] προσδέχεσθαι. ἀλλ' εἰ καὶ προελήφθη ἐν παραπτώματι μὴ ἀϋδαιδῶς [προσέλθητε] αὐτῷ, ἀλλ' ἐπιεικῶς ἐλέγξατε, ἐπιτιμήσατε, παρακαλέσατε τοὺς ὑπουργοὺς τῆς ἐκκλησίας. δεῖ τὸν ἐπίσκοπον ἄρχοντα ἐν αὐτοῖς ἐγχειρῆσαι ἵνα αὐτὸς ἄρχῃ αὐτῶν. The problem of sinful priests and the attitude of the laity towards them is as old as I Tim 5:19 and continued to exercise Byzantine spiritual writers; see AP Marcus Aegyptus 1, PG 65.304 A-C; Vita Eusebii 9.1-3 (BHG 635i) ed. Mai, PG 86:1.341D-345B and the consideration of the question in the tradition of Anastasius of Sinai: M. Richard, "Les textes hagiographiques du codex Athos Philotheou 52," AB 93(1975) 147-156 at pp. 148-149, 154-155.

31. Ἐπιτίμιον: Vita Pancratii (BHG 1410) Vaticanus gr. 1591, f. 22^{v} b. 11-12: (of God's treatment of Adam and Eve) ἔδωκεν δὲ αὐτοῖς ἐπιτίμιον ἄξιον τῆς παρανομῆς αὐτῶν. ἐγγυητής: Vaticanus gr. 1591, f. 49^{v} a.15-19 (of new Christians returning home after communion): ἕκαστος τὸν ἴδιον ἐγγυητὴν παραλαβών· ἐγγυητὴν ἐγὼ τὸν τοῦ βαπτιζομένου ἀνάδοχον.

32. John Climacus: Beck, Kirche..., p. 466. Pancratius of Rome: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 464-465 and A. Rimoldi, "Pancrazio, santo, martire di Roma," BS 10.82-85, Rome 1968. Procopius: P. van den Ven, "La patristique et l'hagiographie au concile de Nicée de 787," Byzantion 25-27 (1955-1957) 325-362 at p. 358 and J.-M. Sauget, "Procopio, santo, martire di Cesarea di Palestina," BS 10.1159-1166, Rome 1968. Any of these Lives might have been composed earlier than the period 692-787, but the Council of Nicaea is a certain terminus ad quem for them all. The Passio of the sixty martyrs of Jerusalem may be a little later, but certainty is not possible and it will be treated here for the sake of convenience; cf. Hoeck, "Stand und Aufgaben...," p. 34, n. 4 and G. Huxley, "The Sixty Martyrs of Jerusalem," GRBS 18(1977) 369-374.

33. According to Beck, Kirche..., p. 465, the two Lives attributed to a Pamphilus of Jerusalem (Vita Pancratii [BHG 1409] and Vita Soteridis [BHG 1642]) may also be eighth-century compositions, although M.Richard in the printed brochure Corpus Christianorum.Series Graeca, Turnhout n.d., p. 8 - and Beck himself in another mood: Kirche..., p. 379 - wish to identify the author of these Lives with the sixth-century Pamphilus of Jerusalem. One passage in the Vita Soteridis deserves notice as it suggests that many Christians may have seen penance as a kind of safety net which could be used with an element of cold calculation, not to say cynicism: εἰπεῖν πρὸς τὸ παρὸν λόγον ἀρνήσεως καὶ ἀποδρᾶν τῶν χειρῶν αὐτοῦ, μετὰ ταῦτα δὲ μετανοίᾳ ἀναλαβεῖν εἰς μεταμέλον (Vita Soteridis 3 [BHG 1642] ed. Franchi di Cavalieri, p. 118.24-27 and cf. p. 119.8-13).

34. P. van den Ven, "La patristique...," pp. 336-345, 355-359.

35. For these texts see Delehaye, "Les saints de Thrace...," pp. 226, 234-235 and F. Halkin, "Une Passion de saint Mocius, martyr à Byzance," AB 83(1965) 5-22 at pp. 6-10.

36. See Dagron, "Les moines...," p. 231, n. 10 and R. Janin, "Isaaco, fondatore del monastero di Dalmazio a Costantinopoli, santo," BS 7. 920-921, Rome 1966.

37. Vita Isaacii 14 (BHG 956) ed. van Papenbroek, p. 256D.

38. See Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 115 with n. 15 and p. 116. To the bibliography there add G. Huxley, "On the Vita of St. Stephen the Younger," GRBS 18(1977) 97-108.

39. Πατὴρ πνευματικός: Vita Stephani Iunioris 19, 25 (BHG 1666) edd. Montfaucon/Loppin, PG 100.1093C-D, 1108A. Monastic life as penitential: Vita Stephani Iunioris 22, PG 100.1100D-1101A. Other familiar themes include the intercession of the saints for the forgiveness of sins: Vita Stephani Iunioris 46 (via icons), 69, PG 100.1152A, 1184D and 1185B-C.

40. Visits: Vita Stephani Iunioris 25 (BHG 1666) edd. Montfaucon/Loppin, PG 100.1104D-1105A. The oath: Vita Stephani Iunioris 27, PG 100.1112B. The curious wording of the oath (μήτε κοινωνῆσαι ἐξ Ἀββᾶ) may imply - though it need not - that significant numbers of monks were ordained and thus were able to give communion to the laity. What is not implied, however, is that monks (whether ordained or unordained) were also in control of the people as confessors; cf. Vita Stephani Iunioris 7, PG 100.1077C-D: a general communion of the laity with no hint of any prior confession required. Theophanes implies that confession of sins and the imposition of ἐπιτίμια were part of the visits to Stephen, but he does not refer explicitly to any absolution: Chrono-

graphia AM 6257, 6259, ed. de Boor, Leipzig 1883, vol. 1, pp. 436.26-437.9, 443.7-18.

41. Vita Stephani Iunioris 45(BHG 1666) edd. Montfaucon/Loppin, PG 100. 1148B-C: monastic animosity against the Iconoclast episcopacy. Pargoire, L'Eglise byzantine..., p. 348 implies that Stephen was a priest, but this precise information is not confirmed anywhere else.

42. Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 126. The Life is used here to illustrate the penitential practice of Constantinople rather than of Amnia because the only relevant evidence (chapters 49 and 50) comes from a period when the family lived in Constantinople and refers in particular to the local monastery of St. George; cf. R. Janin, La géographie ecclésiastique de l'empire byzantin, Pt. 1, vol. 3, Paris 1969², p. 76.

43. Vita Philareti 49, 50 (BHG 1511z) edd. Fourmy/Leroy, pp. 155.17-23, 157.1-3.

44. Vita Philareti 49,50 (BHG 1511z) edd. Fourmy/Leroy, pp. 155.23-31, 157.3-8.

45. Earlier references, as in Chapter Three, n. 205 above, allude to the idea of deathbed confession, not to actual cases of it. But cf. n. 48 below.

46. If these details are indeed "family history" recorded by the grandson of Philaretus (Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 126), it must be admitted at the same time that the circumstantial account of Philaretus' own death contains no mention of confession or deathbed penance: Vita Philareti 47-54 (BHG 1511z) edd. Fourmy/Leroy, pp. 153.1-159.37.

47. Vita Philareti 49 (BHG 1511z) edd. Fourmy/Leroy, p. 155.28-29: καὶ μετανοήσας τὸν ἐνιαυτὸν γνησίως ἐξομολογούμενος τὰ τῆς νεότητος ἀνδράσιν ἁγίοις ... ; Vita Philareti 50, p. 157.5-7: ἐξομολογησάμενος καὶ αὐτὸς πρὸ χρόνου ἁγίῳ γέροντι καὶ τυχὼν ἀφέσεως, ἐκοιμήθη ἐν εἰρήνῃ....

48. The later version of the Life of Philaretus (BHG 1512) understands these preparations for death by the young men as entry into the monastic life: καὶ διανείμας τὰ ὑπάρχοντα αὐτοῦ τοῖς δεομένοις, ἐν ἐξομολογήσει καὶ καλῇ πολιτείᾳ πρὸς Κύριον ἐξεδήμησε μονάδικον ἑλόμενος βίον (Vita Philareti 23 [BHG 1512] ed. Vasiliyev, p. 82.24-26). If this is the correct interpretation, the confessions themselves become less important as they would have been a normal part of any monastic life, however brief.

49. The texts used are of widely differing value. Some of the Catecheses in particular touch only briefly on the saints mentioned in their titles. The list includes: Arsenius (BHG 169), Basil (BHG 262k), John of Chalcedon (BHG 2185), John Chrysostom and Ephraem (BHG 592), Martyrs in Bulgaria (BHG 2264), Forty Martyrs of Sebaste (BHG 1208b). Michael of Synnada (BHG 2275), Patres omnes (BHG 1307g), Paul the Confessor (BHG 1473g), Plato (BHG 1553, 1553b, 1553c), Sancti omnes (BHG 1617kb), Thaddaeus (BHG 2414), Thaddaeus and Antony (BHG 2415), Theoctista (BHG 2422), Theodorus (BHG 1753n) and Theophanes (BHG 1792b). To these may be added the Testament of Theodore (BHG 1759) and the letter of Naucratius (BHG 1756). For the Life of Plato of Sakkoudion see G. Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople aux VIIIe, IXe et Xe siècles," Byzantion 24(1954) 179-263, 453-511 and

25/27(1955/1957) 783-852 at pp. 230-240 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography ...," p. 115 with n. 14. For Theodore's hagiography in general see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 492-494 with P. O'Connell, "The Letters and Catecheses of St. Theodore Studites," OCP 38(1972) 256-259.

50. See D. Stiernon, "Teodoro Studita, confessore, santo," BS 12.265-270, Rome 1969 with further literature cited there.

51. Monastic-priestly harmony: Vita Arsenii 32 (BHG 169) ed. Nissen, p. 262.18-19 and Vita Platonis 42 (BHG 1553) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 99. 845B.

52. Vita Platonis 7, 10-11 (BHG 1553) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 99.809A, 812C-813B; Vita Basilii 4 (BHG 262k) ed. Cozza-Luzi, p. 85.32-37; Vita Theoctistae 12 (BHG 2422) ed. Mai, PG 99.900B.

53. Πατὴρ πνευματικός : Vita Platonis 1 (BHG 1553c) ed. Cozza-Luzi, p. 80.18-35 and cf. Vita Theoctistae 12 (BHG 2422) ed. Mai, PG 99.900B where the natural relationship of mother and child yields to the spiritual relationship of father to child. Certain texts reflect the difficulties encountered by spiritual "children" when the father is absent or dying or dead: Vita Platonis 44 (BHG 1553) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 99.848C; Vita Theodori 2, 10 (BHG 1756) ed. Combefis, PG 99.1829C, 1844B; Vita Theoctistae 8, PG 99.893A; Testamentum Theodori Epilogus (BHG 1759) ed. Sirmond, PG 99.1824C-D. The relationship is analysed at length by Hausherr, Direction spirituelle..., pp. 124-151, 178-211.

54. Testamentum Theodori 2 Mandatum 3 (BHG 1759) ed. Sirmond, PG 99.1817D and cf. Vita Platonis 7 (BHG 1553) ed. van Papenbroek, PG 99.809A. The hegumen was never required by the canons to be a priest, but the normal presumption was that he should be: Testamentum Theodori 2 Regula 19, PG 99.1821A. Binding and loosing (Testamentum Theodori 2 Regula 22, PG 99.1821B): Οὐ κρατήσεις τόπον ἠσφαλισμένον καὶ τὴν οἰκονομικὴν φροντίδα· ἀλλ' ἔστω σοι κλεὶς, ἡ μεγίστη τῶν ψυχῶν φρουτὶς, τοῦ λύειν καὶ δεσμεῖν, κατὰ τὰ λόγια.

55. Vita Basilii 5 (BHG 262k) ed. Cozza-Luzi, pp. 85.38-86.19. Theodore does not make light of the sin of the returning monk Memnon, but he also seems to have to overcome a certain resistance among his hearers, and this may suggest that the taking back of monastic renegades was not common. Cf. Chapter Three, nn. 75 and 76 above.

56. Testamentum Theodori 2 (BHG 1759) ed. Sirmond, PG 99.1816C: συνομολογῶ δὲ πρὸς τούτοις καὶ τὸ μοναδικὸν σχῆμα ὑψηλόν τε εἶναι καὶ ἐπηρμένον, καὶ ἀγγελικὸν, καθαρτικόν τε πάσης ἁμαρτίας διὰ τελείας ἐπιβιώσεως.
The context is Theodore's confession of faith which certainly implies that he is making a claim on behalf of the σχῆμα but the phrase διὰ τελείας ἐπιβιώσεως seems to limit the sense in which the habit may be thought to be καθαρτικόν. Contrast Vita Symeonis Sali 12-14 (BHG 1677) ed. Rydén, pp. 65.5-66.24, where the continuous stress of day to day life in the κοινόβιον blunts the effects of receiving the habit. See also n. 105 below and Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 130, n. 1, 205-208, 321-322.

57. Vita Martyrum XIV 2 (BHG 2264) ed. Cozza-Luzi, p. 149.29-33: Ἐν τούτοις προσβολαὶ, παρακλήσεις ὑπὸ τοῦ λαοῦ εἶξαι τῇ ἀνάγκῃ, μὴ ἀποθανεῖν ἁπλῶς, καὶ πάλιν διὰ μετανοίας ἀνακληθῆναι· τοὺς δὲ οὐδέν.
Cf. Vita Soteridis 3 cited in n. 33 above.

58. Vita Theodori 10 (BHG 1756) ed. Combefis, PG 99.1844C. ξένοι is in-

terpreted here rightly as meaning "laity" and not simply monks from outside the Stoudion by the author of the later Vita Theodori 66 (BHG 1754) ed. Mai, PG 99.325A.

59. Vita Theodori 10 (BHG 1756) ed. Combefis, PG 99.1844C-1845A.

60. Ibid. and see also Chapter Three, n. 255 above. Here the συγχώρησις takes the form of reconciliation by means of a prayer, a triple blessing and the kiss of peace (PG 99.1844D-1845A).

61. See Beck, Kirche..., pp. 466-467; I. Croce, "Per la cronologia della vita di S. Gregorio Agrigentino," BBGG NS 4(1950) 189-207; 5(1951) 77-91; Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," pp. 583-585, 589-592; A. Amore, "Gregorio, vescovo di Agrigento, santo," BS 7.169-173, Rome 1966.

62. Vita Gregorii 53 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.641D-644A; cf. Vita Gregorii 83, PG 98.697A.

63. Vita Gregorii 67 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.669A and cf. Vita Gregorii 62, 71-74, 83, PG 98.660A-661A, 676A-681C, 697A. The "secular arm" alluded to in Vita Gregorii 67 is illustrated in Vita Gregorii 77, PG 98.685A-B.

64. Vita Gregorii 77-78 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.685A-689C.

65. Medicinal penance: Vita Gregorii 62, 75, 92 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.660B-661A, 681C, 712A-B. Punishment: Vita Gregorii 77, 78, 83, PG 98.688A-B, 689A-B, 697A.

66. Canons: Vita Gregorii 53, 86 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.641D-644A, 701B-C. Severity: Vita Gregorii 62 and cf. 77, PG 98.660B-661A and 685A-688B.

67. Vita Gregorii 35 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.612A: the synodal context makes it likely that the heretics in question were either heresiarchs or at least men of public position and reputation.

68. Vita Gregorii 92 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.712A-B: Οὕτως ὁ μακάριος Γρηγόριος, ὡς ἥμερται, τοῖς πνευματικοῖς χαριόμενον ἔν τε λόγῳ καὶ ἔργῳ ταῖς τῶν ἀνθρώπων καρδίαις τῷ τῆς πίστεως ἀκρότρῳ ἐγκαταστείρων, λεὼν περιούσιον τῷ Σωτῆρι τῶν ὅλων Θεῷ καθιέρωσεν, πᾶσαν λύμην αἱρέσεως ἐν ταῖς τῶν ποιμαινομένων ὑπ' αὐτοῦ διανοίαις τῷ τμητικῷ τοῦ Θεοῦ Πνεύματος ξίφει ἐκκόψας, τῷ νοστίμῳ τῆς θείκης γνώσεως ἄλατι ἀενναόως ἐπαρτύων, οὐ διελιμπάνετο.
The same description shows that τὰ περὶ μετανοίας was to be the burden of episcopal preaching: Vita Gregorii 92, PG 98.712A and cf. Vita Gregorii 14, PG 98.572B-573A. For episcopal νουθεσία: Vita Gregorii 51, 55, PG 98.637B, 645A-B.

69. Vita Gregorii 74-75 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.681B-C. For συγχωρεῖν in a less technical sense: Vita Gregorii 49, 64, 78, PG 98.636B-C, 664B, 688D.

70. Vita Gregorii 79 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.689C-692A. The penance is not imposed as an ἐπιτίμιον but is assumed at the girl's own request; it is overseen, however, by a deaconness. Note too that the sin had already been "punished" by two and one half years of demonic possession (Vita Gregorii 74, PG 98.681B and Chapter Three, n. 112 above), and that the one who forgives is the one offended.

71. Vita Gregorii 92 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.712B: Οἱ δὲ ὠφελείας χάριν πρὸς τὸν μακάριον παρεγένοντο, καὶ πάντες τὴν ῥῶσιν τῶν ψυχικῶν καὶ σωματικῶν ταῖς τοῦ ὁσίου εὐχαῖς οἴκαδε λαμβάνοντες ἐπορεύοντο.

72. The ritual of monastic forgiveness: Vita Gregorii 10, 24, 29 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.564B-C, 588D, 596C-597A. Note too that "συγχώρησον" is also often used as a normal expression of politeness: Vita Gregorii 33, 34, 43, PG 98.604B-C, 605A, 624B. πατὴρ πνευματικός : Vita Gregorii 3, 11, 39 (not in the technical sense of "confessor"), PG 98.553B, 565C, 617C. Monastic life as penitential: Vita Gregorii 17 (τὸν δρόμον τῆς μετανοίας), PG 98.577A.

73. Vita Gregorii 28, 30 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.596B, 600A.

74. Vita Gregorii 10, 57 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.564B-C, 648C. [The latter text with its deliberate overtones of Mt 27:25 (Γενηθήτωσαν ἐφ' ἡμᾶς αἱ ἁμαρτίαι σου, Πάτερ ἅγιε, καὶ ἐπὶ τὰ τέκνα ἡμῶν.) must have been intended to shock.] Compare Pancratius' words to Marcianus in Vita Pancratii (BHG 1410) Vaticanus gr. 1591, f. 87^{r} a.28-32: εἶθε, ἁγιώτατε Μαρκιανέ, τὰς ἀσθενείας σου ἡμεῖς οἱ μὴ δυνάμενοι στῆσαι τῶν παθῶν [τὰς ἀφορμὰς] εἴχομεν.

75. Vita Gregorii 30 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.600A.

76. The intercession of the saints in securing the forgiveness of sins is a topos in the Life: Vita Gregorii 30, 95 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.600A, 716A and forms part of this same general background to Byzantine penance.

77. Vita Gregorii 8 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.560D-561A. But note the topos in Vita Gregorii 75, PG 98.681C that only God, not man, forgives sins, a conviction which finds explicit expression even in the ἀκολουθία of ecclesiastical penance attributed to John the Faster: Poenitentiale 4, PG 88.1892A.

78. Deference: Vita Gregorii 9, 12 (where the hegumen of a monastery in Jerusalem teaches Gregory "τὰ σύμβολα τῆς μοναχικῆς τε καὶ ἱερατικῆς κατασταύσεως "), 20 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.564B-C, 568B, 581C-D. Episcopal χαρίσματα : Vita Gregorii 92, PG 98.712A-B and compare the implications of the judgement about χάρις in Vita Gregorii 66, PG 98.665B.

79. See Beck, Kirche..., p. 508 and J.-M. Sauget, "Stefano Sabaita, il Taumaturgo, santo," BS 12. 14-15, Rome 1969. Garitte's translation of the Arabic version containing the lost portions of the Greek original is accepted here as an adequate witness to the themes of the Greek text, although not to points of detail. See G. Garitte, "Le début de la Vie de S. Etienne le Sabaïte retrouvé en arabe au Sinaï," AB 77(1959) 332-369 at pp. 332-341.

80. For the political and historical circumstances with which the bishops were having to cope under their new Muslim rulers see C. Korolevskij, "Antioche," DHGE 3.563-703, Paris 1924 at cc. 589-600; L.E. Browne, Eclipse of Christianity in Asia, Cambridge 1933, pp. 44-63 and A.S. Atiya, A History of Eastern Christianity, London 1968, pp. 193-199.

81. Excommunication: Vita Stephani 49 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 551B. The expression "δικαίως καθυποβληθεὶς καταίραις καὶ ἀναθέμασι" may, however, be more rhetorical than canonical. Canonical ἀκρίβεια: Vita Stephani 111, p. 576F.

82. Vita Stephani 83-84 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 564E-565B. For the serious sinfulness of abandoning the monastery see Chapter Three, nn. 75, 76 above, to which add Vita Iacobi 19 (BHG 770) edd. Trautmann/Klostermann, p. 286.13-18 and in this chapter, nn. 22, 23 and 55.

83. Vita Stephani 84 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 565A: κλίνας τὰ γόνατα, παρὰ τοῦ Γέροντος ἠτήσατο συγχώρησιν, καὶ ἕνεκεν τῆς αὐτοῦ ὑπομονῆς ἐπικουρίαν καὶ ἔντευξιν.

84. Vita Stephani 84 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 565A-B: Ἐπευξάμενος οὖν αὐτῷ ἅμα καὶ εὐλογήσας, καὶ σωτηρίοις περιθραυστήσας παραινέσεσιν, ἕδρασον αὐτὸν καὶ τῇ μοναχικῇ πολιτείᾳ πάγιον ἀπέλυσεν.

85. The words "ἕδρασον αὐτὸν καὶ τῇ μοναχικῇ πολιτείᾳ πάγιον ἀπέλυσεν" suggest full reconciliation. Contrast the atmosphere in the case of the monk Memnon (n. 55 above) and in earlier examples such as Vita Sabae 41 and 44 (BHG 1608) ed. Schwartz, pp. 131.22-132.19, 134.8-135.28.

86. Vita Stephani 90, 115-122 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 568D-E, 578F-581B. The latter text alludes expressly to the locus classicus of this theme in the Narratio de Zenone monacho (BHG 1438t) for which see L. Regnault ed., Les sentences des pères du désert, nouveau receuil, Solesmes-sur-Sarthe 1970, N. 509, pp. 84-86.

87. Vita Stephani 73-74, 121-122, 156 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 560D-F, 580F-581B, 597A-B and compare the case of Palladius in Vita Pachonis 23.1 [= HL 23] (BHG 2327) ed. Bartelink, p. 128.

88. Vita Stephani 11, 90 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 533C-534D, 568D-E.

89. Shame: Vita Stephani 88-89, 121 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 567B-C, 580F-581A. Insincerity: Vita Stephani 73-74, p. 560D-F.

90. The anecdote of Stephen and the archdeacon in Vita Stephani 110-114 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 576D-578D provides an excellent example of the way the "sense of sin" of those living in the world is refined through contact with the monastic fathers; cf. nn. 74-76 above. For Stephen's deep sense of his own sinfulness see Vita Stephani 15, p. 536D-E.

91. Public ἔλεγχος: Vita Stephani 152, 154 (leading to private confession), 156 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 595B, 596D-F, 597A-B. Written ἔλεγχος: Vita Stephani 110, p. 576D-F.

92. Voluntary confessions: Vita Stephani 124, 128 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 582D-E, 584D. The confession in Vita Stephani 154, p. 596D-E is provoked. Descriptions of the deathbed do not refer to penance or confession: Vita Stephani 171, 180-183, pp. 604F-605B, 608E-610D.

93. Vita Stephani XIV.2 (BHG 1670) ed. Garitte, p. 360 and Vita Stephani 116-124 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 578F-582E. For συγκατάθεσις see Chapter Two, n. 185 above.

94. God's forgiveness: Vita Stephani 15, 128, 165 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 536D-E, 584D, 601C and compare nn. 69 and 77 above. Form of absolution: Vita Stephani 74, 113-114, 124, 128, pp. 560E-F, 577B-578D, 582D-E, 584D.

95. Vita Stephani 116-122 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 578F-581B.

96. Vita Stephani 124 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 582D-E. Elsewhere in the Life, Stephen also repeats a prophecy three times and the intent is clearly to lend solemnity and emphasis to what is said or done: Vita Stephani 136, p. 588E.

97. Vita Stephani 124 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 582E: Ἐπειδήπερ, τέκνον, ἡ ψυχή σου ἐπὶ τοῖς τοιούτοις λογισμοῖς ἀγωνιᾷ καὶ ἄχθεται, οὐκ ἔχεις ἁμαρτίαν. Here and in 582D Stephen shows himself aware of Leontius' scruples: ... τὴν ἁμαρτίαν ταύτην, ἣν ἐντεῦθεν προσκτήσασθαι νομίζεις, ἐπεὶ ἄκοντός σου καὶ ἀγωνιῶντος οἱ τοιοῦτοι δαιμονιώδεις λογισμοὶ ταῖς σαῖς ἐπισπείρονται διανοίαις (emphasis added).

98. Gouillard, "Christianisme byzantin...," pp. 215-217 and cf. Chapter Two, n. 138 above and Chapter Three, nn. 89, 316 and 335 above.

99. Gouillard,"Christianisme byzantin...," pp. 216-217.

100. Vita Stephani 124 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 582D: Οὐκ ἔστιν ἄλλως τοὺς τοιούτους ἀποδιώκειν λογισμούς, ἀλλ' ἢ τῇ αὐτῶν καταφρονήσει καὶ ταῖς ἐκτενέσι προσευχαῖς· ἀλλ' ἐπειδὴ ὁρῶ σὲ πρὸς τοιοῦτον ἀδυνατοῦντα πόλεμον, ἐγερθεὶς ἔπιδὲς τὴν χεῖρά σου τῷ ἐμῷ τραχήλῳ. For the πόλεμος against πορνεία compare Vita Ioannici 12 (BHG 935) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 343B-C: Ἔπιδές, ἔφη αὐτῇ, τὴν χεῖρά σου τῷ αὐχένι μου, τέκνον. Τοῦτο δὲ αὐτῆς τελεσθέντος, φησὶν αὐτῇ τρίτον οὕτως ὁ γέρων· Ἐπ' ἐμέ, ὦ παῖ, μετωβλήτω ὁ πόλεμός σου δυνάμει Χριστοῦ, τῆς κατά σου προσβολῆς ἀπελαυνομένος εἰς ἔτι. For the connexion between πορνεία and blasphemy see Vita Pachonis 23.4 [= HL 23] (BHG 2327) ed. Bartelink, p. 130; John Climacus, Scala Paradisi, Gradus 23, PG 88.976B-980C with Völker, Scala Paradisi..., pp. 148-153.

101. For the true nature of the πόλεμος of blasphemy see Vita Pachonis 23.1-6 [= HL 23] (BHG 2327) ed. Bartelink, pp. 128/132; Barsanuphius and John, Responsio 229, ed. Nicodemus Hagiorites, Thessalonica 1974[rp], pp. 142-142; the treatise Capita varia animaeque valde utilia et de blasphemia ascribed to Anastasius of Sinai in A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ, vol. 1, St. Petersburg 1891, pp. 400-404 [= CPG 7746 (5)].

102. Decline of holiness: Vita Stephani III.1-V.3 (BHG 1670) ed. Garitte, pp. 346-349 and Vita Stephani 173 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 605B. Intercessors: Vita Stephani V.4-6, pp. 349-350 and Vita Stephani 173, p. 605B and cf. Chapter Three, n. 36 above.

103. Vita Stephani 11 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 533C-534D. Note that the charism is received after Stephen's ordination as priest and while he is celebrating the Eucharist. This liturgical dimension of his extraordinary ministry is made explicit: Ἀπὸ τότε δὴ πάνυ, ἅπερ ἂν ἠτεῖτο, ἐλάμβανε, μάλιστα ἐν ταῖς τελεταρχικαῖς ἀναφοραῖς καὶ μυσταγωγικαῖς παραστάσεσι ... (534D). For Stephen's intercession see also Vita Stephani 15, 97, 113, pp. 536D-E, 571A-B, 577B-C.

104. Vita Stephani 11, 122 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 533C-534D, 581B.

105. Vita Stephani 150 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 594E-F and compare Vita Stephani 11, 15, 147, pp. 533C, 536D-E, 593A-B. For faith in the σχῆμα see Holl. Enthusiasmus..., pp. 130, n. 1, 321-322 and also 186-191; P. Oppenheim, Das Mönchskleid im christlichen Altertum, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1931, pp. 238-246.

106. Vita Stephani 150 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 594E-F: Ἔστι γάρ, ἔστιν, ὅτε καὶ ἐν ἀναξίοις ἐνεργεῖ καὶ πηγὴ ἡ θεία χάρις, οὐ δι' αὐτούς, ἀλλὰ δι' ὧν τὴν τῶν προστεμένων ὠφέλειαν (594F); cf. n. 30 above and Pratum spirituale 199 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.3088A-C. Hints that personal unworthiness makes the sacrament invalid are found in the hagiographical sources, but the position is only indirectly stated: Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 7 (BHG 871) ed. Mai, PG 47.xlviii (re: Atticus of Constantinople); Vita Symeonis Sali 60 (BHG 1677) ed. Rydén, p. 101.17-19; Pratum spirituale 96, PG 87:3.2953D-2956A.

107. Vita Stephani XI.1-11 (BHG 1670) ed. Garitte, pp. 355-356 and Vita Stephani 20, 54 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 538D, 552F-553A.

108. See Epistula de confessione 14, ed. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., p. 124. 15-21. By comparison with this view the awareness of the author of the Life of Stephen that both bad priests and bad monks existed has no doctrinal implications: Vita Stephani 44, 47 (priests), 80 (lay opposition to monks), 173 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 549B, 550F-551A, 563B-C, 605B. For Holl's view of Byzantine sacramental theology see Enthusiasmus..., pp. 205-214 and cf. Hörmann, Untersuchungen..., pp. 186-192, 251-270. Contrast van Rossum, "Priesthood and Confession...," pp. 221-228 and H. Graef, "The Spiritual Director in the Thought of Symeon the New Theologian," in Kyriakon. Festschrift Johannes Quasten, edd. P. Granfield/J.A. Jungmann, vol. 2, Münster 1970, pp. 608-614. Difficulties about the integrity of the corpus of works and ideas under Symeon's name are discussed by J. Gouillard, "Constantin Chrysomallos sous le masque de Syméon le Nouveau Théologien," Travaux et Mémoires 5(1973) 313-327 and "Quatre procès de mystiques à Byzance (vers 960-1143). Inspiration et autorité," REB 36(1978) 5-81 at pp. 24-39 with B. Englezakis,"A Note on Tradition and Personal Experience in Symeon the New Theologian," ECR 6(1974) 88-89.

109. Vita Stephani II.3-4, XVII.2 (BHG 1670) ed. Garitte, pp. 346, 365 and Vita Stephani 166 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, p. 602F.

110. See n. 105 above.

111. Medicinal language: Vita Stephani 90, 122 (BHG 1670) ed. Pien, pp. 568D-E, 581B. It is worth noting that the imagery of amputation used consistently in earlier documents to refer to the excommunication of diseased members from the ecclesial body (e.g., Vita Meletii 1 [BHG 1244] ed. Montfaucon, PG 50.516:34-40) is used in the Life of Stephen to describe the surgical dimension of spiritual direction within the individual soul: τὴν ἀνίαν τῶν ἀνιωμένων ἀπέτεμε τῇ πνευματικῇ μαχαίρᾳ, καὶ τὰς καρδίας αὐτῶν εὐφροσύνης ἐνεπίμπλα (Vita Stephani 186, p. 613A). Cf. Vita Gregorii Agrigentini 92 (BHG 707) ed. Morcelli, PG 98.712A-B and n. 123 below.

112. Nicephorus: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 510, 164. Elias: V. Grumel, "Elia il Giovane, martire a Damasco," BS 4.1046-1047, Rome 1964. Bacchus: J.-M. Sauget, "Bacco (Daḥḥāt) il Giovane, monaco santo, martire in Palestina," BS 2.688, Rome 1962. Sabaite martyrs: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 507-508 and J.-M. Sauget, "Sabaiti, XX martiri, santi," BS 11. 536-537, Rome 1968.

113. The Passion of the Sabaite martyrs makes the bold claim that to meet death in order not to fall away from the (moral) commands of Christ is even more praiseworthy than to die for the faith, a view not encountered before in the Lives and one which suggests a deliberate

effort to raise the moral consciousness of Christians: τὸ δὲ ὑπὲρ ἀρετῆς προκινδυνεῦσαι τῶν λίαν ἰσχυῶν καὶ ὑψηλῶν καὶ ἀνηγμένων ἐστὶ τὴν διάνοιαν (Vita XX Martyrum 38 [BHG 1200] ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 28.33-29.1). Cf. Vita Andreae Sali 59 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.700C.

114. Vita Euthymii 229^{v}-230^{r}, 230^{v} (BHG 2145) Gouillard, p. 38. For the Life see G.D. Gordini, "Eutimio, vescovo di Sardi, santo, martire," BS 5.334-335, Rome 1964 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 118 with n. 41. Gouillard's promised edition of the Vita Euthymii has never appeared.

115. Theophanes: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 497-498, 508 and D. Stiernon, "Teofane il Cronografo, confessore santo," BS 12.322-325, Rome 1969 with Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 118 and n. 41. Other hagiographical works by Methodius: Agatha (BHG 38), Cosmas and Damian (BHG 377a), Marina (BHG 1167m) and Nicolaus (BHG 1352z). Evidence for penance in these Lives is thin: bishop as penitentiary: Vita Nicolai 3, 13, 18 (BHG 1352z) ed. Anrich, pp. 155.3, 159.11, 161.16-18; intercession of saints to forgive sins: Vita Nicolai 42, 50, 54, 60, pp. 172.3-5, 176.10-11 and 179.1 (ἐχχυτῆς), 182.8. Theodorus Graptus: Beck, Kirche..., p. 511; D. Stiernon, "Teodoro e Teofane, fratelli 'Grapti', confessori santi," BS 12.284-285, Rome 1969; Ševčenko, "Hagiography ...," p. 119 with n. 44.

116. Vita Theodori Grapti 29 (BHG 1746) ed. Combefis, PG 116.677A-B: the expedient of communicating "just once" with the Iconoclasts recalls the libellatici of the Decian persecutions. Vita Theophanis 52-53 (BHG 1787z) ed. Latyshev, pp. 33.14-35.15: the intercession of saints and confessors in securing the forgiveness of sins.

117. Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 121-125; cf. Beck, Kirche..., p. 512 and Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople...," pp. 479-492.

118. Indeed the terms are largely borrowed from the Vita Athanasii by Gregory Nazianzen (BHG 186). Vita Georgii 39 (BHG 668) ed. Vasil'yevsky, p. 62.1-8 recalls Vita Athanasii 9 (BHG 186) edd. Caillau/Clémencet, PG 35.1092B. Compare Chapter Two, n. 55 above and for further use of Nazianzen in the Vita Georgii see Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 130-131 with Chapter Three, nn. 126 and 198 above.

119. Vita Georgii 30 (BHG 668) ed. Vasil'yevsky, pp. 48.3-49.4.

120. See Chapter Two, pp. 47-48 above. Note, however, that the literary expression of forgiveness asked and granted tends to be similar even where there can be no question of an ecclesiastical dimension to the act: Vita Georgii 5 (BHG 668) ed. Vasil'yevsky, p. 10.1-5.

121. Vita Georgii 22 (BHG 668) ed. Vasil'yevsky, p. 37.1-4.

122. Vita Georgii 16 (BHG 668) ed. Vasil'yevsky, p. 28.3-9 and cf. Vita Georgii 39, p. 62.1-8. The claim that George was a priest before he was ordained (Vita Georgii 9, 15, pp. 17.11-15, 27.2-8) is more rhetorical praise than theological "enthusiasm" because the same author makes clear that he considers ordination itself as a χάρισμα: Vita Georgii 6, pp. 10.10-12.7.

123. Vita Georgii 42 (BHG 668) ed. Vasil'yevsky, p. 65.12-15: here punishment (τιμωρία) is interpreted as παιδεία. Note too that the image of amputation (τομή) has come to mean a "cutting short or cutting off the time for repentance", that is, the moment of death. Cf. n. 111 above.

124. Vita Georgii 48 (BHG 668) ed. Vasil'yevsky, p. 72.13-14.

125. F. Halkin, "La Vie de saint Nicéphore fondateur de Médikion en Bithynie (+ 813)," AB 78(1960) 396-430 at pp. 398, 413 n. 3; R. Janin, "Niceforo, fondatore del monastero di Medikion in Bitinia, santo," BS 9.885, Rome 1967; Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 118 with n. 43.

126. Vita Nicephori 3.31-44, 17.21-24 (BHG 2297) ed. Halkin, pp. 404, 422.

127. Spiritual guide: Vita Nicephori 14.1-36 (BHG 2297) ed. Halkin, pp. 420-421. There is no indication that Nicephorus was ever ordained, although it is known that Nicetas his successor was a priest: Vita Nicephori 17.1-37, pp. 422-423. Certainly the Life shows no animus against the clergy: Vita Nicephori 3.1-17, 24.1-5, pp. 403, 427. Deathbed: Vita Nicephori 17.1-18.28, pp. 422-424.

128. Vita Nicephori 5.45-48 (BHG 2297) ed. Halkin, p. 407 and see p. 407, n. 4.

129. Beck, Kirche..., pp. 510-511; R. Janin, "Niceta, egumeno del monastero di Medikion in Bitinia, santo," BS 9.890-892, Rome 1967; Ševčenko, "Hagiography..." p. 118 with n. 42.

130. Vita Nicetae 16 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxvD. The deacon Athanasius is associated with Nicetas in overseeing the disciplinary and spiritual life of the community and together the two men deploy both severity and gentleness in the treatment of sin: Vita Nicetae 12-13, p. xxivC-D.

131. Vita Nicetae 21 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxviD-E: καὶ εἰ συνέβη δέ τινι πτώματι περιπεσεῖν (Ἀγγέλων γάρ ἐστιν τὸ μὴ πίπτειν) καὶ ἔγνω τοῦτον διὰ τῆς σκυθρωπωτητος καὶ τῆς τοῦ προσώπου ἀλλοιώσεως, προσκαλούμενος τοῦτον ἐν τῷ ἰδίῳ κελλίῳ κατιδιάν, διὰ τῆς ἐνθέου αὐτοῦ διδασκαλίας καὶ παρακλήσεως, πάντα ἐξείπειν τὰ καθ' ἑαυτὸν παρεσκεύαζεν....

132. Vita Nicetae 21 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxviE: ... καὶ εἰ ἑώρα τοῦτον πλεῖστον συντετριμμένον καὶ τεταπεινωμένον, οὐ δὲ τὰ εἰκότα ἐπετίμα, ἀλλὰ μετρίως κυρῶν τὴν εἰς αὐτὸν ἀγάπην, ἵνα μὴ τῇ περισσοτέρᾳ λύπῃ καταπονηθῇ ὁ τοιοῦτος.... The phrase τὰ εἰκότα ἐπετίμα can by now be taken to mean τὰ εἰκότα ἐπιτίμια διδόναι with reference to the kind of monastic ἐπιτίμια found under the name of Theodore of Stoudion: Poenae monasteriales, PG 99.1733B-1757A. Cf. Beck, Kirche..., p. 494.

133. Vita Nicetae 15 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, pp. xxivF-xxvA; cf. n. 123 above.

134. Vita Nicetae 26 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxviiF. This clear expression of teaching precedes by only a few years the Absolutio Theophili (BHG 1732-1734) which was to prove such an extraordinary exception to it; see Chapter Five, pp. 170-171 below.

135. Vita Nicetae 12-13 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxivC-D. For the earliest Greek penitentials see Herman, "Il più antico...," pp. 78-85.

136. The founder of the monastery and first hegumen, Nicephorus, seems not to have been ordained. See n. 127 above.

137. In Vita Nicetae 24 Nicetas becomes hegumen but details of his penitential activities within the monastery together with those of the deacon Athanasius (see n. 130 above) occur in the Life before Nicetas' appointment as hegumen. It is not possible to be certain, however, that the general descriptions of the saint's activities belong only to the particular periods of time into which they are inserted in the Life. It may very well be that activities proper to Nicetas as hegumen have been included in earlier general descriptions such as those of Vita Nicetae 12-13 (see n. 135 above).

138. Note that both the hegumen and the "priest of the monastery" are ordained by the Patriarch: Vita Nicetae 10, 24 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, pp. xxiiiF-xxivA, xxviiC. While it is true that extraordinary charisms regularly follow upon virtue regardless of office (a topos: Vita Nicetae 17, p. xxvF), it is equally a topos that the virtuous are precisely those who receive ordination: Vita Nicetae 9-10, pp. xxiiiD-xxivA. Cf. Chapter Three, nn. 116 and 350 above.

139. Vita Nicetae 37 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxxD.

140. Vita Nicetae 41 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxxiA. The argument for "economy" was firmly rejected by others; see nn. 113 and 116 above.

141. Vita Nicetae 42 (BHG 1341) ed. van Papenbroek, p. xxxiB-C.

142. Epiphanius: Beck, Kirche..., p. 513 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 113 with n. 2. Constantine: F. Winkelmann, "Ein Ordnungsversuch der griechischen hagiographischen Konstantinviten und ihrer Überlieferung," in Studia Byzantina II, edd. J. Irmscher/P. Nagel, Berlin 1973, pp. 264-284 at pp. 267-271. Methodius: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 497-498 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 125-126. Nicholas the soldier: Beck, Kirche..., p. 510 and J.-M. Sauget, "Nicola, soldato e monaco, santo," BS 9.911-912, Rome 1967. Vita Nicolai 20 (BHG 1352y) ed. Anrich, p. 148.35-149.2 provides an example of episcopal νουθεσία and Vita Nicolai 1 (BHG 2311) ed. Clugnet, p. 324.5-8 attests to the practice of abstaining from sin consciously before going into battle as a precaution against judgement. There is no direct reference to ecclesiastical penance, however, as part of such preparation.

142a. A group of eight hagiographical documents dealing with John Chrysostom and composed by Cosmas Vestitor (BHG 876m, 877v, 877y, 877z, 878, 878a, 880a, 880b) can also be included here although Cosmas may have flourished at the end of the eighth century; cf. CPG 8142-8163 and Beck, Kirche..., p. 502. The Lives portray Chrysostom frequently as the παρεγγυητής/ἐγγυητής/ἀντιφωνητής of penance who assures sinners that there is forgiveness as often as they turn from their sins: "Ὁσάκις γάρ, φησίν, πέσῃς, ἔχεις καὶ σωθῆναι. Τὸ γὰρ κεῖσθαί σε χαμαὶ πτῶμα δηλοῦται· εἰ δὲ πεσὼν ἐγερθῇς, οὐκέτι πτώματι συνέχῃ. Ἐγὼ τούτων παρεγγυητής." Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 9 (BHG 876m) ed. Halkin, p. 437.17-19 and cf. Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 2 (BHG 877y), 1 (BHG 877z), 2 (BHG 880a) ed. Dyobouniotes, pp. 64.28-32, 68.8-29, 155.23-24.

143. Beck, Kirche..., p. 507 and G. Caliò/J.-M. Sauget, "Giovanni Calibita, 'Possessore dell' Evangelo d'oro', santo," BS 6.640-643, Rome 1965.

144. Revelation of thoughts: Vita Ioannis Calybitae 9 (BHG 868) ed. Lampsides, pp. 267.26-277.9. Pilgrimage: Vita Ioannis Calybitae 3, p. 263.3-7. Note also John's intercessory prayer for the forgiveness

of his parents' sins: Vita Ioannis Calybitae 12, pp. 270.28-271.2.

145. H. Delehaye, "Une Vie inédite de saint Jean l'Aumônier," AB 45(1927) 5-74 at pp. 5-17.

146. E. Lappa-Zizicas, "Un épitomé inédit de la Vie de S. Jean l'Aumônier par Jean et Sophronius," AB 88(1970) 265-278 at pp. 265-274.

147. For Leontius see Chapter Three, n. 339 above. BHG 887w and the section of BHG 887v relevant to the lost Life by John Moschus and Sophronius are discussed in Chapter Three, n. 342 above.

148. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 44 (BHG 887v) ed. Delehaye, p. 65.16-17; cf. Vita 43 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, p. 89.1-2 [= Festugière, Vita 50, p. 401].

149. Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 45 (BHG 887v) ed. Delehaye, p. 66.9-15; cf. Vita 42 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, p. 84.8-13 [= Festugière, Vita 46, p. 395] and Chapter Three, n. 208 above.

150. As, for example, the amplification concerning spiritual direction in Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 18 (BHG 887v) ed. Delehaye, p. 27.1-2; cf. Vita 5 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, p. 11.9-11 [= Festugière, Vita 4, p. 349].

151. Beck, Kirche..., p. 509 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 119 with n. 46.

152. Vita Nicolai 19, 20, 40, 50 (BHG 1348) ed. Anrich, pp. 123.14-19, 123.20-22, 133.20-134.2, 138.15. Much is made also of the μεσιτεία of the bishop's office: Vita Nicolai 13, 29, 49, pp. 120.12-13, 128.10-13, 138.5-6.

153. Vita Nicolai 36 (BHG 1348) ed. Anrich, pp. 131.22-132.14. The episode of the sailors is older than the redaction of the Life by Methodius.

154. Beck, Kirche..., p. 507 and R. Janin, "Teodoro, egumeno a Costantinopoli, santo," BS 12.249-250, Rome 1969 with La géographie..., pp. 531-532.

155. Although Theodore himself seems not to have been ordained, the Chora monastery of only twelve members had two priests and three deacons: Vita Theodori 25 (BHG 1743) ed. Loparev, p. 11.19-23.

156. Vita Theodori 26, 30, 35 (BHG 1743) ed. Loparev, pp. 11.27-28, 12.34-13.3, 14.26-15.6.

157. Vita Theodori 32 (heretic), 34 (officials) (BHG 1743) ed. Loparev, pp. 13.18-14.10, 14.13-25.

158. Vita Theodori 35 (BHG 1743) ed. Loparev, pp. 14.32-15.15: the case of the deacon Theoplastus.

159. Beck, Kirche..., p. 512; G.D. Gordini, "Giovanni, vescovo dei Goti, santo," BS 6.814-815, Rome 1965; Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 115 with n. 14; G. Huxley, "On the Vita of St. John of Gotthia," GRBS 19(1978) 161-169.

160. Vita Ioannis Gotthiae 8 (BHG 891) ed. Janninck, pp. 193C-194D.

161. Beck, Kirche..., p. 511 and G.M. Fusconi, "Amorio, XLII Martiri di, santi," BS 1.1018-1020, Rome 1961.

162. Vita XLII Martyrum 17 (BHG 1212) edd. Vasil'yevsky/Nikitin, p. 20. 1-19 and Vita XLII Martyrum 36, 44 (μεσίτου) (BHG 1214) edd. Vasil'yevsky/Nikitin, pp. 75.19-30, 78.4. Compare for the neo-martyrs: Vita Eliae Iunioris 2, 3 (BHG 578) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 43.21-30 and 44.21-23.

163. Vita XLII Martyrum 37-38 (BHG 1214) edd. Vasil'yevsky/Nikitin, p. 76.3-18. It is clear to the martyrs that there can be no repentance after death: Vita XLII Martyrum 9 (BHG 1212) edd. Vasil'yevsky/Nikitin, p. 14.11 and cf. nn 123, 133, 134 above.

164. Vita XLII Martyrum 28 (BHG 1214) edd. Vasil'yevsky/Nikitin, p.72.9-12 and cf. nn. 33, 57, 116 and 140 above.

165. Martyrs of Lentini: G. Morabito, "Alfio, Filadefio, Cirino...santi, martiri di Lentini in Sicilia," BS 1.832-834, Rome 1961 and Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," pp. 582-583, 589. Gregentius: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 386, 407; Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," pp. 585-587, 592-594; R. Janin, "Gregenzio, vescovo di Tafar (o Tefra), santo," BS 7.167-168, Rome 1966; Shahîd, The Martyrs..., pp. 202-207, 230-231, 250 n. 1. Januarius of Rome: Beck, Kirche..., p. 514. Nicon: Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," pp. 595-596 and J.-M. Sauget, "Nicone, vescovo, e CIC Compagni, santi, martiri di Taormina," BS 9.985-987, Rome 1967. Phantinus: Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," p. 595 and G. Giovanelli, "Fantino, il Vecchio, detto il Taumaturgo, santo," BS 5.453-455, Rome 1964.

166. See Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," pp. 583-587, 589-594, 596-602. Patlagean considers that the Lives of Gregentius and Gregory of Agrigentum are contemporaneous, but a later date has been preferred for the Vita Gregentii because of some of the difficulties pointed out by Peeters, AB 31(1912) 108-109. Thus 843 is simply a conservative terminus ad quem.

167. The full text of the Vita Gregentii has not yet been published and some of the chapters listed by Vasiliyev (16, 21, 22, 30, 31, 36 [BHG 705] Vasiliyev, pp. 51, 54, 56) may well contain material relevant to ecclesiastical penance.

168. Vita Gregentii: Homeritarum Leges Prologus (BHG 706h) ed. Boissonade, PG 86:1.572C-573C.

169. Vita Gregentii: Homeritarum Leges 49 (BHG 706h) ed. Boissonade, PG 86:1.609A-B.

170. Vita Gregentii: Homeritarum Leges 3, 12, 21, 61 (BHG 706h) ed. Boissonade, PG 86:1.584A, 588A, 592B-C, 613C-616A. Compare also Leges 7, 585A-B where the mutilation of adulterers is expressly related to Mt 5:29-30 and see Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," p. 593 with n. 43.

171. Miracula Phantini 9 (BHG 1509) ed. Saletta, p. 61.791-797 and see n. 120 above.

172. Vita Alphii et sociorum 21, 41 (BHG 57) ed. van Papenbroek, pp. 779F, 786F-787A. πνευματικὸς πατήρ : Vita Alphii et sociorum 14 (BHG 57) ed. van Papenbroek, p. 777B. ἐξαγνιστής : Vita Alphii et sociorum 115

(BHG 60) Vaticanus gr. 1591, f. 181^{v} a.4-8: τέκνον Σερβιλιανέ, ἐπίστρεψον ἐπὶ τὴν ἀληθινὴν τῶν Χριστιανῶν πίστιν, κἀγώ σοι γίνομαι ἐγγυητὴς ὅτι ὁμολογῶν τὸν Χριστὸν σωθήσει. Compare n. 31 above.

173. For the Vita Nicetae see pp. 146-147 above, and for the Vita Syncleticae see Chapter Two, pp. 49-50 above.

174. Anti-episcopal feeling should not be predicated of the period or of the people without qualification. Here especially the Tendenz of the monastic sources must be taken into account, and cf. n. 5 above.

CHAPTER FIVE: NOTES

1. For the reflection of the tensions in the hagiography of the period see E. von Dobschütz, "Methodios und die Studiten," BZ 18(1909) 41-105, and for the troubled Photian period, F. Dvornik, The Photian Schism, Cambridge 1948 with H.-G. Beck, "Die byzantinische Kirche im Zeitalter des photianischen Schismas," and "Die Ostkirche vom Anfang des 10. Jahrhunderts bis Kerullarios," in Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte, ed. H. Jedin, vol. 3.1, Freiburg 1966, pp. 197-218, 462-484.

2. Dvornik, The Photian Schism, pp. 70-278 and "Photius, Nicholas I and Hadrian," Byzantinoslavica 34(1973) 33-50. The incident related of Theodore the protospatharius at the Council of 869-870 (see n. 127 below) represents a rare appearance of penance as a matter of discussion at Eastern-Western debates.

3. See the bibliography in n. 95 below. N.G.Itsines, Patriarch Nicholas Mysticus and the Fourth Marriage of Leo VI the Wise, Dissertation: Fordham University 1973 was not available in time to be used in this study.

4. In this respect the much-cited text of John of Antioch,(Oratio de disciplina monastica et de monasteriis laicis non tradendis 7, PG 132.1128B-C:"Ἐκτοτε οὖν καὶ μέχρι τῆς δεῦρο, τετρακοσίων ἤδη χρόνων παρωχηκότων, τοσοῦτον ὑπὸ πάντων τῶν πιστῶν ἐξενδεικέστο καὶ ἐτιμᾶτο τὸ τάγμα τῶν μοναχῶν, ὡς καὶ τὰς ἐξομολογήσεις καὶ ἐξαγγελίας τῶν ἁμαρτημάτων, καὶ τὰς ἐπ' αὐτοῖς ἐπιτιμίας καὶ ἀφορίσμους λύσεις, ἐπὶ τοὺς μοναχοὺς μετατεθῆναι.) has been given an exaggerated importance, a judgement with which Winkelmann ("Kirche und Gesellschaft...," pp. 480-481) is in agreement.

5. V.N. Beneševič, Kanonicheskiy sbornik' XIV titulov' so vtoroy chetverti VII veka do 883 g. k' drevněyshey istorii istochnikov' prava greko-vostochnoy tserkvi, [Syntagma canonum XIV Titulorum] Petrograd 1905 and cf. Gaudemet, "Nomokanon," cc. 424-425.

6. This applies to the canons and/or ἐπιτίμια ascribed to Chrysostom (CPG 4742), John the Faster, Sophronius, Nicephorus and Theodore of Stoudion.

7. Cf. Hajjar, Le synode permanent..., pp. 98-108, 128-135 and the following numbers in Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.2, Kadiköy 1936, NN. 325, 335, [337-340], 345, 346, 347, 354, 360-366, 368, 377-381, 383-384, 387, 393, 397, 400, 402, 405-407, 412, 413, 414-416, 422, 423, 425, 428-436, 438, 445, 447-450, 452, 454, 498, [506], 507, 457-460, 466-468, 482, 485, 489, 490, 492, 493, 495, 508, 520, 521, 530, 531, 533, 534, 539, 540, 542-545, 552-554, 557-564, 568-572, 574-575, 578, 579, 589, 595, 596, 611, 612, 623, 625, 626, 628-632, 635, 636, 641, 649, 656, 658, 660, 665, 669, 675, 697, 704, 706, 712, 716, 721, 731, 733, 740, 741, 747, 748, 762, 766, 767, 779, 784, 789, 790, 794, 797. For the ecclesiastical courts see A. Pavlov, "Grecheskaya zapis' o tserkovonom' sudě nad' ubiytsami, pribegayushchami pod' zashchitu tserkvi," VV 4(1897) 155-159.

8. Cf. Chapter One, n. 67 above. Antonius speaks of confession to the πνευματικοὶ πατέρες (of the Stoudion) as a necessity since all are guilty of sin, but reveals nothing about the actual practice: De confessione 3, 4, 5, ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 811.5-9, 812.12-16, 813.3-7.

9. Diekamp, "Brief an einen Sünder...," pp. 44.14-18, 44-48 and 45.65-79.

10. Cf. Chapter One, n. 51 above, especially the article by van de Paverd cited there.

11. Beck, Kirche..., p. 510 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 116. The account contains only a standard request for the saint's intercession on behalf of Christian sinners: Vita Theodori 15 (BHG 1756t) ed. van de Vorst, p. 60.28-29.

12. Ignatius: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 511-512 with bibliography; to this add Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 123-125 and J. Gouillard, "Christianisme byzantin et slave," Ecole pratique des Hautes Etudes. Ve Section. Sciences Religieuses. Annuaire, 83(1975) 259-263 at pp. 261-263.

13. Bishop as judge: Vita Gregorii Decapolitae 13 (BHG 711) ed. Dvornik, p. 58.6-12 and Vita Tarasii 43 (binding and loosing) (BHG 1698) ed. Heikel, p. 418.4-9. Excommunication and suspension: Vita Tarasii 26, p. 408.9-18 and Vita Nicephori 36, 65 (BHG 1335) ed. de Boor, pp. 166.1-26, 195.16-31. ἐπιτίμια: Vita Tarasii 26, 31, pp. 408.9-18, 410.23-25; Vita Nicephori 65, 91, pp. 195.21-30, 215.22-216.1 and cf. Vita Gregorii Decapolitae 16, p. 61.15-17. Reconciliation of heretics: Vita Tarasii 22 (clergy), pp. 405.33-406.7. Monastic disclosure of λογισμοί: Vita Gregorii Decapolitae 7, 31, pp. 51.26-52.8, 73.9-10 (to the relics of the saint). Assumption of σχῆμα in preparation for death: Vita Gregorii Decapolitae 23, p. 65.19-22.

14. Vita Nicephori 91 (BHG 1335) ed. de Boor, pp. 215.13-216.1.

15. Monastic profession as sacramental: Vita Nicephori 24 (BHG 1335) ed. de Boor, p. 157.14-22; cf. Vita Gregorii Decapolitae 23 (BHG 711) ed. Dvornik, p. 65.19-22. Priestly ordination as charismatic: Vita Tarasii 12 (BHG 1698) ed. Heikel, p. 401.13-19 and cf. Vita Nicephori 24, p. 157.14-22.

16. For the problem of Michael Syncellus and the other "Michaels" see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 503-504, 512 with Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 116, n. 19 and D. Stiernon, "Michele il Sincello, santo," BS 9.452-457, Rome 1967. A number of other texts are ascribed to "Michael" and perhaps also date from this period: Eustratius (BHG 646b), Ignatius (BHG 818), Isaacius (BHG 956d), Mocius (BHG 1298h) and Philip the Apostle (BHG 1530a). The Life of the patriarch Ignatius refers to his excommunication of Bardas for infringing the canons on marriage (Vita Ignatii 1 [BHG 818] ed. Mansi, p. 292E), but there is little else about penance in these works.

17. Original text in PG 3.1088B-1093B and cf. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 209-211. A strong case for denying the authenticity of the letter (but without necessarily changing the period of its composition) has been made by B. Brons, "Sekundäre Textpartien im Corpus Pseudo-Dionysiacum," Nachrichten der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen. Philologisch-Historische Klasse 1975/5, Göttingen 1975, pp. 101-140 at pp. 123-131, 139-140.

18. Vita Dionysii 18 (BHG 556) ed. Lanssel, PG 4.648D-649C.

19. Ἀνάθεμα: Vita Michaelis 60 (BHG 1296) ed. Schmitt, p. 251.19-31. πνευματικὸς πατήρ: Vita Michaelis 61, 64, pp. 252.14-20, 253.1-17. Ordination and the Spirit: Vita Michaelis 10, 13, pp. 230.9-19, 231.12-25. Co-operation of Joannicius and Methodius: Vita Michaelis 54, pp. 249.25-250.2. Michael as répondant du péché insisting on obedience to monastic authority: Vita Michaelis 78, p. 258.11-16.

20. For the date see D. Papachryssanthou, "Un confesseur du second iconoclasme. La Vie du patrice Nicétas (+ 836)," Travaux et Mémoires 3(1968) 309-351 at p. 312 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 117 with n. 26a.

21. Vita Nicetae 8 (BHG 1342b) ed. Papachryssanthou, pp. 331.33/333.8: the layman makes no distinction between sin and temptation (p. 333. 7-8): τὴν χαλεπήν μου ταύτην πυρεκίαν καὶ τὰ πεπυρωμένα τῆς ἁμαρτίας μου βέλη.

22. Vita Nicetae 8 (BHG 1342b) ed. Papachryssanthou, p. 333.10-17. The πόλεμος (lust) is stilled from the moment Nicetas prays over the man, but there is no suggestion that Nicetas takes the πόλεμος upon himself. Cf. Chapter Four, pp. 138-140 above.

23. Beck, Kirche..., p. 558 with Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 116, n. 22 and D. Stiernon, "Metodio I, il Confessore, patriarca di Costantinopoli, santo," BS 9.382-393, Rome 1967 at cc. 392-393.

24. Ἐπιτιμία imposed by the Patriarch: Vita Methodii 17 (BHG 1278) ed. Henskens, PG 100.1260A. For the dispute between Methodius and the Studites see Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.2, Kadiköy 1936, NN. 427, 429, 431-434, 436, pp. 54, 55, 57-62, especially pp. 60-62 and the literature cited there. Vita Methodii 16 is thought to refer to a kind of public confession made by former iconoclasts; cf. J. Gouillard, "Deux figures mal connues du second iconoclasme," Byzantion 31(1961) 371-401 at p. 373 with n. 1. [I am indebted to Prof. C. Mango for drawing this reference to my attention.]

25. Vita Methodii 15, 16, 18 (BHG 1278) ed. Henskens, PG 100.1257A-B, 1257C, 1260D-1261A.

26. Vita Methodii 18 (BHG 1278) ed. Henskens, PG 100.1261A: Τῷ ὄντι γὰρ παράνομοι οἱ τοιοῦτοι, ἐφευρεμένου σώματος ἀντίτυπον σῶμα, ψευδῶς εἰς θυσίαν παραλαμβάνοντες. For the state of sacramental theology in the Byzantine church, especially as touching the Eucharist, see: B. Neunheuser, "Eucharistielehre der mittelalterlichen Ostkirche," in Eucharistie in Mittelalter und Neuzeit, Freiburg 1963, pp. 1-11; S. Gero, "The Eucharistic Doctrine of the Byzantine Iconoclasts," BZ 68(1975) 4-22, especially pp. 12-22; cf. also G. Hofmann, "Textus byzantini de SS. Eucharistia," in XXXV Congreso Eucaristico Internacional 1952. La Eucaristia y la Paz. Sesiones de estudio, Barcelona 1953, vol. 2, pp. 704-712.

27. W. Lackner, "Zu Quellen...," p. 311 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 116.

28. Episcopal sphere: Vita Theodori 25 (imposition and loosing of χωρισμός on clergy) (BHG 1754) ed. Mai, PG 99.265C-D. Monastic sphere: Vita Theodori 13, 38, 46 (confession), PG 99.252A-B, 289C, 301A; Vita Theodori 13, 21, 41, 66 (ἐπιτίμια - ἐπιτιμάω), PG 99.252A-B, 261B, 295A, 325A. Forgiveness as prayer and reconciliation: Vita Theodori 38, 46, 66, PG 99. 289C, 301A-B, 325A-B.

29. Opposition of monks and hierarchs: Vita Theodori 25, 62 (BHG 1754) ed. Mai, PG 99.265C-D, 320C-D and n. 24 above; but cf. Vita Theodori 66, PG 99.325A. Monastic ἀκρίβεια vs. episcopal οἰκονομία: Vita Theodori 26, PG 99.268B-D.

30. And see the remarks of van Rossum about the prophetic character of the more difficult statements of Symeon the New Theologian in the

Epistula de confessione, "Priesthood and Confession...," pp. 224-225.

31. For Photius as hagiographer see Beck, Kirche..., pp. 524, 526 and the list compiled by Halkin (BHG vol. 3, p. 262, s.v. Photius Patr. CP). The texts in Photius' Bibliotheca (Athanasius, Metrophanes and Paul of Constantinople) are gathered here for the sake of convenience although they are older than the "Photian age".

32. Deposition of clerics: Vita Athanasii 4 (BHG 184) ed. Henry, p. 19 [= 477b.11-13] and Vita Metrophanis et Alexandri 9, 10 (BHG 1280) ed. Henry, pp. 218 [= 470b.19-22], 218 [= 470b.27-33]. Martyr's intercession for sins of Christians: Vita Theclae 9 (BHG 1721) ed. Gebhardt, p. 181.20-27.

33. Dorotheus, Andrew and Nicholas: Beck, Kirche..., p. 560. Nicetas Quaestor: Beck, Kirche..., p. 561; Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 113, n. 3 and p. 127, n. 105b; T. Detorakes, Οἱ ἅγιοι τῆς πρώτης Βυζαντίνης περιόδου τῆς Κρήτης καὶ ἡ σχετικὴ πρὸς αὐτοὺς φιλολογία, Athens 1970, pp. 160-163. Menas: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 560-561 and J.-M. Sauget, "Menna (Menas), santo, martire (?) in Egitto," BS 9. 324-342, Rome 1967.

34. Relics of saints as ἁμαρτημάτων καθάρσιον: Vita Menae 4 (BHG 1254m) ed. Delehaye, p. 147.22-26; cf. Vita Menae 6, pp. 148.27-149.16 and Vita sanctorum omnium 4 (BHG 1617) ed. Mingarelli, PG 105.856A-B. Sins forgiven by almsgiving: Vita Andreae Cretensis 7 (BHG 113) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 176.18-20. Bishop as spiritual director: Vita Andreae Cretensis 9, pp. 177.27-178.11.

35. Beck, Kirche..., p. 558 with J.-M. Sauget, "Giovanniccio, monaco in Bitinia, santo," BS 6.1065-1066, Rome 1965 and V. Laurent, La Vie merveilleuse de saint Pierre d'Atroa (+ 837), Brussels 1956, pp. 15-16.

36. Public influence: Vita Ioannicii 36, 70 (BHG 936) 47 (BHG 935) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 404C, 432A-C, 372B-374A. Private direction: Vita Ioannicii 38, 64, 66 (BHG 936) 28, 30, 39, 42, 51 (BHG 935) pp. 404C, 427B, 427C-428A, 357B, 360A-B, 366C, 368B, 379C.

37. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 316-317 and Hörmann, Untersuchungen..., pp. 252-254 who places Joannicius firmly in an "enthusiastic" line linking Stephen the Younger with Symeon the New Theologian; cf. n. 188 below.

38. Συγχώρησις: Vita Ioannicii 25 (monk spies on J. at prayer), 36 (rash judgement against J. = BHG 935, Vita 49), 52 (lack of faith in J.), 55 (putting J. to the test) (BHG 936) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 398B, 405B (= 378C), 414B-C, 421A.

39. For the ambiguity attached to sins committed against the confessor see Chapter Four, n. 70 above and also the distinction between forgiving sins committed against men and those committed against God: Diekamp, "Brief an einen Sünder...," p. 48.

40. Vita Ioannicii 27-28 (BHG 936 = BHG 935, Vita 22-23) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 398C-400B (= 353B-354B). In both texts it is made clear that the woman is guilty of sin in having yielded to the demon of fornication.

41. Vita Ioannicii 46-47 (BHG 936 = BHG 935, Vita 12) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 410B-411C (= 343B-344A). In the original text of Peter the young nun threatens suicide, a sure sign that the inner struggle turns as much on despair as on unchastity: Vita Ioannicii 46 (BHG 936), p. 411A and cf. Chapter Four, pp. 139-140 above.

42. The πόλεμος in these cases, however, is transferred to Joannicius himself who subdues the demon only with difficulty, a motif not normally found in the topos of the répondant du péché: Vita Ioannicii 28, 47 (BHG 936 = BHG 935, Vita 23, 12) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 400A-B, 411B-C = 354A-B, 343C-344A.

43. See Chapter Four, pp. 138-141 above.

44. See Vita Ioannicii 64, 66, 67, 72 (BHG 936) 28, 42, 51 (BHG 935) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 427B, 427C-428A, 428B, 434B, 358A, 368B, 379C.

45. See n. 71 below.

46. Note too that those who visit Joannicius do so because they have faith in him: Ἐώρα γὰρ πολλοὺς καθ' ἑκάστην σωματικῆς χάριν ἰάσεως καὶ ψυχικῆς ὠφελείας πρὸς τοῦτον πίστεως ἀνατρέχοντας (Vita Ioannicii 51 [BHG 935] ed. van den Gheyn, p. 379C). See also Chapter Four, n. 105 above, and in this chapter, n. 127 below.

47. Vita Ioannicii 66 (BHG 936) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 428A.

48. Vita Ioannicii 69-70 (BHG 936) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 430C-432C with Vita Ioannicii 47, 53 (BHG 935) pp. 372B-374A, 381C-382C and cf. n. 161 below. For prophecy see n. 72 below and for Joannicius' relations with Methodius see also P. Joannou, "Le sort des évêques hérétiques réconciliés. Un discours inédit de Nicétas de Serres contre Eustrate de Nicée," Byzantion 28(1958) 1-30 at pp. 4-5 and 20.24-24.25.

49. For the dates see V. Laurent, La Vita retractata et les Miracles posthumes de saint Pierre d'Atroa, Brussels 1958, pp. 22-30; I. Dujčev, "A propos de la Vie de saint Pierre d'Atroa," Byzantinoslavica 27(1966) 92-97; D. Stiernon, "Pietro d'Atroa, taumaturgo, santo," BS 10.668-670, Rome 1968 with literature cited there.

50. Confession: Vita Petri 10.26-33, 21.1-12, 24.38-55, 44.12-23, 47.20-33, 64.1-15, 70.25-32 (BHG 2364) and 89.11-29, 104.11-17 (BHG 2365) ed. Laurent, pp. 91/93, 115/117, 123, 159, 163, 189, 201 and pp. 137/139, 157. Absolution: Vita Petri 20.11-13, 47.20-33 (BHG 2364) pp. 113, 163. ἐπιτίμια: Vita Petri 10.12-16, 64.1-15 (BHG 2364) pp. 91, 189. Deathbed confession: Vita Petri 18.18-22, 47.9-12,20-33, 52.24-43 (BHG 2364) and 89.11-29 (BHG 2365) pp. 111, 163, 171/173 and 137/139 with Laurent, La Vita retractata..., p. 138, n. 1. Deathbed reception of habit: Vita Petri 18.18-22 (BHG 2364) p. 111. πνευματικὸς πατήρ: Vita Petri 47.9-33 (BHG 2364) p. 163. νουθεσία and ἔλεγχος: Vita Petri 21.1-12, 64.1-15, 70.13-25 (BHG 2364) pp. 115/117, 189, 199/201. Excommunication: Vita Petri 64.1-15 (BHG 2364) p. 189.

51. Vita Petri 64.1-10 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, p. 189. The same man appears earlier in the Life at Vita Petri 34.1-36.45, pp. 139/143 and cf. p. 138, nn. 1 and 2.

52. Vita Petri 64.10-15 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, p. 189: μετὰ δὲ τὴν τῆς φρικτῆς ἐκείνης καὶ ἱερᾶς θυσίας τελείωσιν τὸν ὑπατικὸν προσκαλεσάμενος ἐν τῷ κειμηλιαρχείῳ τὰ πρέποντα ἐνουθέτησεν· τοῦ δὲ τὸ σφάλμα ὁμολογήσαντος

καὶ διορθοῦσθαι συνδεμένου, δοὺς αὐτῷ ἐπιτίμια πρὸς μετάνοιαν, μεθ' ἡμέρας ἑπτὰ καὶ τῶν ἁγιασμάτων ἠξίωσεν. It is not impossible that the "ἁγιάσματα" here refers not to the Eucharist but to the holy water blessed at Epiphany (cf. Ioannes Ieiunator, Poenitentiale, PG 88. 1913A), but restoration to full communion seems much the more probable interpretation. For the use of the κειμηλιαρχεῖον for hearing confessions cf. Chapter Three, p. 109 (n. 310) above.

53. Vita Petri 64.7-10 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, p. 189: ὡς οὖν εἶδεν ὁ ἱερώτατος τὸν αὐτὸν ὑπακτικόν τινα προφανῶς ἀδικήσαντα καὶ τὸν Θεὸν λυπήσαντα, βαστάζων ἤδη τὸ ποτήριον, τοῦτον ἀφῆκεν ἀκοινώνητον, μὴ μεταδοὺς αὐτῷ τῶν ἁγιασμάτων. It is implied that the rest of the congregation receive (Vita Petri 64.4-5, p. 189): καὶ τοῖς ἐκεῖσε παροῦσιν τοῦ κυριακοῦ καὶ ζωοποιοῦ αἵματος μεταδιδοῦντος.

54. In the latter case the ἐπιτίμια would serve as a sign, and to some extent also as an experience, of the promised διόρθωσις. See also n. 71 below.

55. That is, no additional reference to episcopal authority is required. But for Peter's "patriarchal" jurisdiction see nn. 58-60 below.

56. Vita Petri 53.6-21, 47.20-33 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, pp. 173, 163. This is exactly the situation of the sinner Cosmas in the text published by Diekamp. "Brief an einen Sünder...," p. 45.65-79.

57. Vita Petri 28.1-38 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, pp. 131/133. The difference between this case and those cited in n. 56 above may rest on the differing gravity of the sins involved. Certainly the expression "ἀπαρνησάμενος ἐγγράφως" (Vita Petri 28.11, p. 131) recalls the truly mortal sins of those who renounce all allegiance to Christ: Vita Basilii 7 Titulus (BHG 253) ed. Radermacher, p. 122.1 (Περὶ τοῦ ἀρνησαμένου τὸν Χριστὸν ἐγγράφως) and Vita Theophili 3 (BHG 1322) ed. Radermacher, p. 168.2-4 (καὶ ποιήσας ἐγγράφως τὴν ἄρνησιν). For the questions of Geist and Amt see Laurent, La Vie merveilleuse..., pp. 130-131, n. 3. Laurent contrasts Peter's conduct with that of Theodore of Stoudion and interprets it as a charismatic rather than a canonical exercise of authority. A better contrast, however, might be between an immediate absolution granted by Peter (Vita Petri 53. 6-21, 47.20-33, pp. 173, 163) and the hesitancy of Peter to pronounce absolution without an explicit divine πληροφορία (Vita Petri 28.1-38, pp. 131/133). Vita Petri 53.6-13, p. 173 may also intimate a basis for a sacramental theology of absolution similar to the theological explanation of the relationship between the Eucharistic words of institution spoken by Christ once and for all in his own name, and the repeated ἐπικλήσεις of priests at the Eucharist through which the power of Christ's words is mediated. See Chrysostom, De proditione Iudae homilia 1.6, PG 49.380:31-47 and Nicholas Cabasilas, Sacrae Liturgiae interpretatio 29.1-22 (especially 1-8, 13, 20-22) edd. R. Bornert/J. Gouillard/P. Périchon, Paris 1967, pp. 178/190. In the Vita Petri the words of Christ in Jn 20:22 are taken as analogous to the words of Eucharistic institution: Ἡμεῖς μὲν ἁμαρτωλοὶ καὶ ταπεινοὶ κατὰ πάντα ὄντες, ὦ τέκνον, ἀφιέναι ἁμαρτίας ἐπὶ τῆς γῆς οὐκ ἰσχύομεν· διὰ δὲ τὴν θεόλεκτον καὶ πανσεβῆ φωνὴν ἐκείνην τὴν πρὸς τοὺς ἀποστόλους μετὰ τὴν ἀνάστασιν γενομένην καὶ μέχρι συντελείας συντηρουμένην τὴν λέγουσαν· Λάβετε Πνεῦμα ἅγιον· ἄν τινων ἀφῆτε τὰς ἁμαρτίας, ἀφίενται αὐτοῖς· ἂν τινων κρατεῖτε, κεκράτηνται, εἰς ἐκείνην θαρροῦντες γράφομεν· Ἀφέωνταί σου αἱ ἁμαρτίαι.

58. A general discussion by Laurent, La Vita retractata..., pp. 38-41 and compare P. L'Huillier, "Rapport entre pouvoirs d'ordre et de juridiction dans la tradition orientale," Revue de Droit Canonïque

23(1973) 281-289.

59. Vita Petri 6.10-13 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, p. 81 to which add Vita Petri 6[10].33-37 (BHG 2365) ed. Laurent, p. 87.

60. Vita Petri 6.13-16 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, p. 81 to which add Vita Petri 6[10].37-39 (BHG 2365) ed. Laurent, p. 87.

61. Contrast the later ἐντάλματα/ἐνταλτήρια/ἐνταλτηριώδη βρέμματα granting specific jurisdiction to act as confessor (πνευματικὸς πατήρ): J. Hergenroether, ...edito entalmate graeco patrum spiritualium officium describente additoque brevi de eodem commentario, Würzburg 1865 and J. Oudot, Patriarchatus Constantinopolitani Acta Selecta I, Vatican City 1941, pp. 104-106.

62. Beck, Kirche..., p. 209; P. Burchi, "Eustrazio il Taumaturgo, egumeno di Abgaro, santo," BS 5.313, Rome 1964; C. Mango, "The Monastery of St. Abercius at Kurşunlu (Elegmi) in Bithynia," DOP 22(1968) 169-176 plus 15 plates, at pp. 173, n. 14 and 175; Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 119, n. 47a.

63. Vita Eustratii 13, 18 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 376.21-22, 380.14-19; cf. Vita Eliae 34 (BHG 580) ed. Rossi-Taibbi, p. 50.672-682.

64. Vita Eustratii 16, 17, 26 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 379.2-23, 379.25-380.13, 385.23-386.6.

65. Vita Eustratii 17, 26 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 380.3-5 (Διαφόροις οὖν πατράσιν ἐπὶ ἁγιωσύνῃ βεβοημένοις προσελθόντες καὶ παρὰ πάντων ὡς βδελυκτοὶ ἐκδιωχθέντες) and 385.25-27: τοῖς ἐνταῦθα κατοικοῦσιν ἐξαγορεύοις πατράσιν καὶ σχεδὸν παρὰ πάντων ἐκδιωχθεὶς διὰ τὸ ὑπερβάλλον τοῦ σφάλματος. There can be no way of determining whether these other "fathers" were ordained or not, but the distressed sinners seem to have been attracted in the first instance by holiness not office: ἐπὶ ἁγιωσύνῃ βεβοημένοις.

66. Pargoire, "L'Eglise byzantine...," p. 348, says that Eustratius was a priest, but there is no reference to this in the Life. The reported description of Eustratius as μονάζοντος ἱερομένους (Vita Eustratii 30 [BHG 645] ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 388.10) is not specific enough to resolve the question. Janin, Les églises et les monastères..., pp. 132-134, speaks of Eustratius as a monk only.

67. Vita Eustratii 16, 17, 26 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 379.17-18, 380.7-9, 385.29-386.1.

68. Vita Eustratii 16 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 379.15-17.

69. Vita Eustratii 16, 17 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 379.20-23, 380.9-13. Where an ἐπιτίμιον is assigned, the author stresses Eustratius' lack of severity: ἐπιτιμίῳ συμπαθεστάτην διάκρισιν χέμοντι τούτων κατησφαλίσατο (Vita Eustratii 26, p. 386.2-3). Cf. Chapter Three, n. 329 above.

70. Vita Eustratii 26 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 386.4-6.

71. Joannou presents evidence from later Lives to support the idea that while monks may have prepared penitents and heard confessions, it was the priest who dispensed absolution: "Vie de S. Germaine l'Hagiorite par son contemporain le patriarche Philothée de Constantinople," AB

70(1952) 35-115 at p. 47, n. 9. However, the examples he adduces (Vita Germani 24 [BHG 2164] ed. Joannou, pp. 98.29-101.28 and Vita Maximi 29 [BHG 1237] edd. Kourilas/Halkin, p. 101.7-15 and 15-21) deal with the personal reconciliation of the sinner with the priest he has offended. More evidence is needed if the existence of such a pattern of monastic confession/ἐπιτίμια with subsequent sacerdotal absolution is to be established. Cf n. 54 above and Chapter Three, nn. 221, 226. Most of the evidence for a double absolution of this kind collected by Morin, Commentarius historicus..., VI. xxv. 2-19, Antwerp 1682, pp. 426a.A-430b.B, dates from a much later period.

72. Vita Eustratii 10 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 374.23-375.11. Joannicius himself was likened to a prophet by his first biographer: Vita Ioannicii 2 (BHG 936) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 385C (where, however, prophetic and "apostolic" charisms go together); cf. Vita Antonii Cauleae 21 (BHG 139) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 24.10-11 where the double portion of Elisha consists of ὁσιακὴ καὶ ἱερατικὴ χαρίσματα.

73. The ἔλεγχος of clergy by monks is not an attack on office as such, nor an arrogation of sacerdotal powers to the unordained: Vita Eustratii 41 (BHG 645) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 395.8-17.

74. Janin, Les églises et les monastères..., pp. 170-172 and Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 117 with nn. 30 and 31.

75. Vita Macarii 12 (BHG 1003) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 156.27-29.

76. Vita Macarii 12 (BHG 1003) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 156.30-31: τῆς ἱερωσύνης μὲν ἀπεῖρξε, τὴν δὲ προσήκουσαν τούτῳ ἀπένειμεν τάξιν. It is possible that this τάξις is such that the man remains among the lower clergy.

77. Vita Macarii 12 (BHG 1003) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 156.31-157.9. The communicants are sisters of the former priest and seem to have been implicated in the decision to celebrate unlawfully.

78. Vita Macarii 12 (BHG 1003) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 157.10-13: Τοῦτο τῆς τοῦ ἁγίου Πνεύματος δυνάμεως ἔργον ἦν, τῆς διὰ στόματος Μακαρίου τὰ παράδοξα ἐνεργούσης, τῆς τοὺς λόγους αὐτοῦ τοῖς πράγμασι βεβαιούσης, τῆς τὰ ὑπ' αὐτοῦ ἐντελλόμενα ἀπαραβάτως ἐπισφραγιζούσης.

79. Vita Macarii 12 (BHG 1003) ed. van den Gheyn, p. 157.13-24. The text relates the apostolic nature of such discipline not to the power of binding and loosing, but to the action of the Holy Spirit as reflected in texts such as Mk 3:15 and Acts 5:1-11 and to the similarly apostolic κατορθώματα of Macarius (Vita Macarii 12, p. 157.20-22): οὐ γὰρ δι' ὧν ἐνεργεῖσθαι μόνον οἱ ἅγιοι τὴν χάριν ἐμφαίνουσιν, ἀλλὰ καὶ δι' ὧν τιμωροῦνται τὴν αὐτὴν ὑποδεικνύουσι δύναμιν.

80. Demetrius: Beck, Kirche..., p. 559. George of Mytilene: J.-M. Sauget, "Giorgio di Mitilene, vescovo, santo," BS 6.538-540, Rome 1965; I.M. Phoundoules, Λεσβιακὸν Ἑορτολόγιον Α'. Οἱ Ἅγιοι Γεώργιοι ἀρχιεπίσκοποι Μυτιλήνης, Athens 1959, pp. 9-10; F. Halkin, "Y a-t-il trois saints Georges, évêques de Mytilène et 'confesseurs' sous les iconoclastes?" AB 77(1959) 464-469. The Slavonic originals of the Lives of Cyril(Constantine) and Methodius (French translation in F. Dvornik, Les légendes de Constantin et de Méthode vues de Byzance, Hattiesburg 1969, 2nd ed., pp. 349.1-393.9) make reference to the distinc-

tion between excommunication from the Eucharist and excommunication from the church: Vita Methodii 8, Dvornik p. 388.4-6 and cf. Vita Methodii 10, 12, Dvornik pp. 389.5-8, 390.25-28. Deathbed (?) reception of the habit: Vita Constantini 18, Dvornik p. 379.15-16.

81. Nicephorus (BHG 1336/1337): Beck, Kirche..., p. 561. Joseph the Hymnographer (BHG 944): Beck, Kirche..., p. 561 and D. Stiernon, "La Vie et l'oeuvre de S. Joseph l'Hymnographe. A propos d'une publication récente," REB 31(1973) 243-266. Theodora and the Absolutio Theophili (BHG 1731, 1732/1733, 1734, 1735): Beck, Kirche..., p. 562; Grumel, Les régestes..., vol. 1.2, Kadiköy 1936, NN. 414-415, pp. 42-44; D. Stiernon, "Teodora, imperatrice di Costantinopoli, santa," BS 12.222-224, Rome 1969. Euphemia (BHG 624): Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 113, n. 2 and 124, n. 87. Andrew ἐν Κρίσει (BHG 111): Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople...," pp. 214-216 and Detorakes, Οἱ ἅγιοι ..., pp. 197-199. Theophano (BHG 1794): Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople...," pp. 823-836. Martyres X CP (BHG 1195): Beck, Kirche..., p. 561. Arethas' Lives of Euthymius (BHG 652) and Gurias and companions (BHG 740). Antonius Cauleas (BHG 139): Beck, Kirche..., p. 563. Leo VI' Lives of Chrysostom (BHG 880), Nicholas (BHG 1363), Sancti omnes (BHG 1616) and Trypho and companions (BHG 1858). John of Hsicha (BHG 896): Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople...," pp. 256-263, but cf. Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 117 with nn. 27 and 28.

82. Ἐξαχόρευσις of λογισμοί and spiritual development: Vita Iosephi Hymnographi 4 (BHG 944) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 4.14-22. Evidence in the encomia of Leo VI is familiar: Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 7 (λογισμοί), 12 (ἔλεγχος), 20 and 26 (excommunication) (BHG 880) ed. Savile, PG 107.241A-B, 249D-252C, 268B-C, 284A; Vita sanctorum omnium 10 (relics of saints as freeing from sin) (BHG 1616) ed. Gretser, PG 107.192A. The suggestion in Vita Nicolai 7 (BHG 1363) ed. Poussines, PG 107.221C that Nicholas was a priest before ordination is less a reflection of charismatic theology than a rhetorical topos; see Chapter Four, n. 122 above.

83. Different interpretations of the historical basis of the "absolution" in W. Regel, Analecta Byzantino-Russica, St. Petersburg 1891, pp. xviii-xix and H. Grégoire, "Iconoclasm and Imperial Rule 717-842," in The Cambridge Medieval History, vol. 4, pt. 1, ed. J.M. Hussey, Cambridge 1966, pp. 61-104 at p. 104. See also Rai, "L'économie...," pp. 298-299.

84. Vita Theodorae [= Absolutio Theophili] 1 (BHG 1732/1733) ed. Regel, pp. 20a.22-21a.15, 30a.1-27.

85. Vita Theodorae [= Absolutio Theophili] 1 (BHG 1732/1733) ed. Regel, p. 30a.12-22. The same theological problem is broached in the Visio Mariae (BHG 1050), but even the intercession of the Virgin can secure only a temporary ἀνάπαυσις from punishment for damned Christians, not complete absolution: Visio Mariae 29 (BHG 1050) ed. James, p. 126. 22-27. An alternative practical solution in the hagiographical sources is to have the saint resurrect the petitioner in order to grant absolution: Vita Petri Atroensis 47.20-33 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, p. 163. The post-mortem absolution in Vita Gregorii Magni 1 (BHG 721f) ed. Muralt, PG 110.929C-932A resembles the case of Theophilus more clearly, but, like the example in the Life of Peter of Atroa, the narrative turns on the spiritual relationship of the one who binds and the one who is bound, an element absent from the story of Theophilus.

86. Vita Theodorae [= Absolutio Theophili] 1 (BHG 1732/1733) ed. Regel,

pp. 30a.24-31a.8 and 31a.18-32a.20.

87. Vita Theodorae [= Absolutio Theophili] 1 (BHG 1732/1733) ed. Regel, pp. 33a.17-35a.13. There are strong claims on behalf of the prophetic character of certain monks (Joannicius, Isaias): Vita Theodorae [= Absolutio Theophili] 9 (BHG 1734) ed. Combefis, p. 727D-E, but in Theodora's vision Christ lays emphasis on sacerdotal intercession: Vita Theodorae [= Absolutio Theophili] 1 (BHG 1732/1733) p. 35a.8-13: διὰ τὰ δάκρυά σου καὶ τὴν πίστιν σου ἔτι δὲ καὶ διὰ τὴν παράκλησιν καὶ ἱκεσίαν τῶν ἱερέων μου συζυγώμην δίδωμι Θεοφίλῳ τῷ ἀνδρί σου. The documents in general may be said to disguise or ignore the monastic-hierarchical tension known to have existed between Methodius and the Studites; cf. n. 1 above.

88. Vita Theodorae [= Absolutio Theophili] 1 (BHG 1732/1733) ed. Regel, pp. 36a.1-37a.6. The disappearance of the sin from a sealed paper is a topos: Vita Basilii 12 (BHG 258) ed. Combefis, p. 219C-D and Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 46 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, p. 99.5-14 [= Festugière, Vita 59, p. 407].

89. Nicetas the Paphlagonian: Beck, Kirche..., p. 548 and most recently, J.J. Rizzo, The Encomium of Gregory Nazianzen by Nicetas the Paphlagonian. Greek Text Edited and Translated, Brussels 1976, p. 7. The following texts are included: Anastasia (BHG 78), Diomedes (BHG 551), Eustathius and companions (BHG 643), Gregory of Agrigentum (BHG 708), Gregory Nazianzen (BHG 725), Hyacinth (BHG 757), John Chrysostom (BHG 881c), Panteleemon (BHG 1416), Procopius (BHG 1580), Thecla (BHG 1722) and Theodore (BHG 1753). Nicetas David: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 565-566. The texts include Ignatius of Constantinople (BHG 817) - to which BHG 818c, the Libellus Theognosti may be added here for the sake of convenience - and the encomium of the martyr George (BHG 675z). For the Vita Ignatii see also Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople...," pp. 461-478.

90. Ἔλεγχος: Vita Gregorii Agrigentini 18 (BHG 708) ed. Malou, PG 116. 212A-B; Vita Gregorii Nazianzeni 16.55-56 (BHG 725) ed. Rizzo, p. 50; Vita Ioannis Chrysostomi 2 (BHG 881c) ed. Dyobouniotes, p. 65.27-31. Confession: Vita Gregorii Agrigentini 51-52, PG 116.257A-260B. Forgiveness: Vita Gregorii Agrigentini 5, 18, 45, 52, 58, pp. 193D, 212A-B, 248D, 260A-B, 265C. ἐπιτίμιον: Vita Gregorii Agrigentini 18, p. 212A.

91. Excommunication: Vita Ignatii 16, 18, 19, 22, 28 (BHG 817) ed. Mansi, PG 105.513D, 520A-B, 521A, 525C-D, 537B. καθαίρεσις: Vita Ignatii 20, 22, 28, PG 105.521D, 525C-D, 537B. ἐπιτίμιον and reconciliation: Vita Ignatii 32, PG 105.545A-B. Vita Ignatii 33, PG 105.545D speaks of the synodal sentence against Photius (καθαιροῦσί τε τοῦτον καὶ ἀναθεματίζουσιν) being signed ἐν αὐτῷ τοῦ Σωτῆρος τῷ σήματι. The excommunication of Bardas is related from the Ignatian point of view: Vita Ignatii 11, PG 105.504A-D and Vita Ignatii 3 (BHG 818c) ed. Mansi, PG 105.857A and see n. 16 above. For a different point of view see F. Dvornik, "Patriarch Ignatius and Caesar Bardas," Byzantinoslavica 27(1966) 7-22.

92. Nicholas of Stoudion: Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople ...," pp. 794-812 and Detorakes, Οἱ ἅγιοι ..., pp. 219-228. Euthymius: Beck, Kirche..., p. 563 with literature cited there and R. Janin, "Eutimio, patriarca di Costantinopoli, santo," BS 5.327-328, Rome 1964; P. Karlin-Hayter, Vita Euthymii Patriarchae CP, Brussels 1970, pp. 6-10; D.Z. Sophianos, "Ὁ βίος τοῦ Εὐθυμίου (Vita Euthymii) Πατριάρχου Κ-λεως (+ 917) καὶ ὁ χρόνος συγγραφῆς αὐτοῦ," ΕΕΒΣ

38(1971) 289-296. Evaristus: Beck, Kirche..., p. 564 and V. Laurent, "Evaristo, abate a Costantinopoli, santo," BS 5.373-375, Rome 1964. Theodore of Stoudion: Lackner, "Zu Quellen...," p. 311.

93. Καθαίρεσις (Moechian controversy): Vita Theodori 25, 54 (BHG 1754) ed. Sirmond, PG 99.141C, 165A. ἔλεγχος : Vita Nicolai 37 (BHG 1365) ed. Combefis, PG 105.892A-C; Vita Theodori 20, PG 99.137C. ἐπιτίμια: Vita Theodori 128, 32, PG 99.229A-B, 149A. Absolution: Vita Theodori 85, 100, 128, PG 99.192C-D, 205A-B, 229A-B; Vita Evaristi 36 (BHG 2153) ed. van de Vorst, p. 318.28-29 (note the connexion made between συγγνώμη and the office of spiritual father: ὡς οἷα πατὴρ πνευματικὸς καὶ φιλόστοργος συγγνώμην αὐτοῖς ἐχαρίσατο). Spiritual direction of the laity: Vita Nicolai 50, PG 105.900B-C; Vita Evaristi 23, p. 314.3-10.

94. Vita Evaristi 41 (BHG 2153) ed. van de Vorst, p. 320.3-19. The two men meet after the night office for spiritual direction. For " τῶν ἐξαγγελθέντων ἀνεμίμνησκεν τοῦτον, καὶ ἠτεῖτο τὴν λύσιν " (p. 320. 16) cf. Vita Petri Atroensis 47.25-33 (BHG 2364) ed. Laurent, p. 163 and Vita Lucae Stylitae 27, 28 (BHG 2239) ed. Delehaye, pp. 223.7-9, 225.4-6.

95. Spiritual direction and the πατὴρ πνευματικός : Vita Euthymii 5, 9, 21 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, pp. 36.23-31, 62.15-35, 138.15-17. ἔλεγχος : Vita Euthymii 3, 7, pp. 20.21-25, 46.20-27. καθαίρεσις : Vita Euthymii 17, 22, pp. 114.28/116.1 and 118.13-26, 144.31/146.4. συγχώρησις: Vita Euthymii 6, 8, 11, 22, pp. 44.10-13, 56.7-12, 72. 30/74.1, 144.31/146.4. For the controversy touching the fourth marriage of Leo VI see now P. Karlin-Hayter, "Le Synode à Constantinople de 886 à 912 et le rôle de Nicolas le Mystique dans l'affaire de la tétragamie," JOBG 19(1970) 59-101 and J.L. Boojrama, "The Eastern Schism of 907 and the Affair of the Tetragamia," JEH 25(1974) 113-133.

96. Vita Euthymii 7, 8 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, pp. 48.12-14, 56.7-23.

97. Vita Euthymii 3, 4, 7, 15 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, pp. 18.8-10, 30.6-8, 48.12-14, 102.25-34.

98. Vita Euthymii 12, 13, 16 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, pp. 80.15/84.6, 92.19-20, 114.21-23.

99. Vita Euthymii 12, 13, 15, 16, 22 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, pp. 80.19/84.6, 92.19-20, 106.20-29, 114.21-23, 144.31/146.4.

100. Vita Euthymii 4 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, p. 32.8-13 describes a kind of public penance made by the Emperor on the advice of Euthymius. The circumstances remain too obscure for any confident interpretation of the incident, but the ἐξομολόγησις to which the author refers must certainly be understood as the public recitation of the hymn "Ὡς ἐνώπιον" which combines penitence and praise, not as a public listing of the imperial sins. For the unique position of the Emperor see S.N. Troianos, "Die Sonderstellung des Kaisers im früh- und mittelbyzantinischen kirchlichen Prozess," Byzantina 3(1971) 71-80.

101. Vita Euthymii 11 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, p. 78.11-15. The sense of ἐπιτίμιον here is like, but not the same as, the ἐπιτίμια or ἐντολαί given to sinners after confession to confirm their διόρθωσις and root out the πάθη ; cf. nn 47 and 54 above.

102. Vita Euthymii 15 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, p. 106.28-29: ἐπιτιμίοις ὑποπίπτοντι τῷ βασιλεῖ εἰσδεχθῆναι ἐν τῇ ἐκκλησίᾳ παρεκελεύοντο καὶ ἐγγράφως ἐξετίθεντο.

103. Vita Euthymii 17 (BHG 651) ed. Karlin-Hayter, p. 118.13-26. The text distinguishes between suspension and complete deposition: (p. 118.22-24) τοῦτον τὸν παρὰ κανόνα πράξαντα οὐκ ἐδέσμευσα, ἀλλὰ τέλεον ἐξέκοψα τοῦ ἱεροῦ καταλόγου, καὶ οὐκ ἔτι τὰ τῶν ἱερέων πράξει. The entire problem of οἰκονομία is exacerbated by the differing canonical approaches of the Greeks and the Latins. Compare Euthymius' view (Vita Euthymii 17, p. 114.29-30: οὐ γὰρ νόμον ἢ τύπον τὸ σφάλμα ἐποιήσαμεν, ἀλλὰ συμπάθειαν καὶ οἰκονομίαν) with the position of the Roman delegation in Vita Euthymii 15, p. 106.20-29.

104. Antonius Iunior: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 566-567 and N. Di Grigoli, "Antonio il Giovane, anacoreta sul monte Olimpo, santo," BS 2.147-149, Rome 1962. Basil the Younger: Beck, Kirche..., p. 565 and most recently Every,"Toll Gates...," pp. 140. 142-151. With Da Costa-Louillet ("Saints de Constantinople...," p. 494) the sections Περὶ τῆς τελευτῆς τῆς ἁγίας Θεοδώρας and Θεωρία Γρηγορίου are accepted as later additions to the text and will not be treated here. Blaise of Amorion: Beck, Kirche..., p. 565 with literature cited there and G.M. Fusconi, "Biagio d'Amorio, santo," BS 3.154-156, Rome 1963. Thomaïs: Beck, Kirche..., p. 566 and R. Janin, "Tomaide (gr. Θωμαΐς) di Lesbo, santa," BS 12.530, Rome 1969.

105. Πνευματικὸς πατήρ : Vita Antonii Iunioris 4, 25 (BHG 142) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 189.24-29, 205.3-6 and 17 (BHG 142) ed. Halkin, p. 221.11-13; Vita Basilii Iunioris 26-27 (NB - scarcity of true πνευματικοὶ πατέρες), 49, 53 (BHG 263) ed. Combefis, pp. *31A-B, *36E-F, *37D-E. Spiritual direction of laity: Vita Basilii Iunioris 20, p. *29C-D. Confession: Vita Antonii Iunioris 8, 11 (λογισμοί), pp. 214.12-215.11, 216.25-28 (ed. Halkin); Vita Blasii 18 (BHG 278) ed. Delehaye, p. 665C. Desire to receive monastic σχῆμα before death: Vita Antonii Iunioris 11, pp. 216.27-217.3 (ed. Halkin) and compare Vita Basilii Iunioris 2 (deathbed confession), p. *24E and 30 (θεία ἀνακένωσις comes from the σχῆμα), p. *32B. Forgiveness via διόρθωσις : Vita Thomaidis 13, 14 (BHG 2454) ed. Delehaye, pp. 238E, 238E-F.

106. Vita Basilii Iunioris 26, 22 (BHG 263) ed. Combefis, pp. *31A, *29F-*30A and cf. Diekamp, "Brief an einen Sünder...," p. 45.75-79. Observe also the reaction of Gregory when he encounters the διορατικὸν χάρισμα in Basil (Vita Basilii Iunioris 27, p. *31B): ἐξέστην κατεπλαγείς· οὐδὲ γὰρ ἐνέτυχον διορατικῷ ἀνδρὶ μέχρι τῆς ὥρας ἐκείνης, εἰ καὶ μόνον ἐν τοῖς Βίοις τῶν πάλαι Ἁγίων εὗρον εἶναι τοιούτους.

107. Vita Basilii Iunioris 49 (BHG 263) ed. Combefis, p. *36E-F.

108. Vita Basilii Iunioris 49 (BHG 263) ed. Combefis, p. *36F: Ὁρᾷς οἵαν δόξαν καὶ φαιδρότητα κέκτηται ὁ πνευματικός σου Πατήρ; Οὕτως εἷς τῶν μεγάλων φωστήρων ἐστί.

109. Constantine: Winkelmann, "Ein Ordnungsversuch...," pp. 270-271 and cf. pp. 267-268, 272. With BHG 365 two other Lives of Constantine (BHG 366, 369g) will also be considered here although they may have been composed a little earlier. Maximus: Lackner, "Zu Quellen...," pp. 310-316. Nicholas: Beck, Kirche..., p. 569. Constantine VII: Beck, Kirche..., p. 551.

110. Bishop as penitentiary: Vita Nicolai 35, 51 (BHG 1348c) ed. Anrich, pp. 224.22-27, 231.5-17. ἀνάθεμα: Vita Maximi 9, 11, 14, 34, 38 (BHG 1234) ed. Combefis, PG 90.77B-C, 80A, 84B, 104B, 108B and Vita Maximi 16A (BHG 1234) ed. Devreese, p. 18.16-23. Excommunication: Vita Maximi 16, PG 90.85B-C (the expression "τέλεον ἐκκόψαντες" in 85C recalls Vita Euthymii 17 in n. 103 above).

111. Vita Constantini 32 (BHG 365) ed. Opitz, pp. 563.19-564.2; cf. Socrates, HE 1.10.3-4, ed. Hussey, vol. 1, Oxford 1853, pp. 86-87.

112. Vita Constantini 32 (BHG 365) ed. Opitz, p. 564.1-2: καὶ δι' αὐτῶν παρὰ θεοῦ λαβεῖν ἐντελῆ τὴν συγχώρησιν ....

113. Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Constantinople...," pp. 179-214, especially pp. 179-184. To this add L. Rydén, "The Andreas Salos Apocalypse. Greek Text, Translation and Commentary," DOP 28(1974) 197-261 and "The Vision of the Virgin at Blachernae and the Feast of Pokrov," AB 94(1976) 63-82.

114. For example, in his Oxford class on Byzantine hagiography (1976-1977) Prof. C. Mango has drawn attention to a number of curiosities in the topography, coinage and other Realien in the Vita Andreae Sali which raise uncomfortable difficulties for the widely-accepted tenth-century date and which suggest at least the unlooked-for possibility that the time of composition of the Vita, or of parts of it, might be pushed several centuries farther back. The resolution of such difficulties and possibilities must wait upon the critical edition of the whole text by Rydén.

115. Vita Andreae Sali 58 (sodomy), 80-81 (habitual theft) (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.697D-700A, 720D-724A.

116. Vita Andreae Sali 187-189 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.832D-836B. The young man is presented as a limiting case of sinfulness (Vita 188, PG 111.833B-C): ἀλλὰ μήτε ἐκκλησίαν γνωρίζων, εἴτε κοινωνίαν, εἴτε εὐχὴν πώποτε δεξάμενος, ἀλλ' οὔτε τι τῶν πνευματικῶν ἠπίστατο, ἀλλὰ πάντα σαρκικὰ, πάντα δαιμονικά· πάντα γὰρ τὰ αὐτοῦ ἄοωτα, καὶ δεινὰ, καὶ θανατικὰ ἐχρημάτιζεν.

117. Vita Andreae Sali 189 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.836B-C. The passage is an excellent example of the author's ability to present the religious point of view of ordinary people at some length. His own point of view emerges in chapter 190 (PG 111.836C-837A) where he shows that the young man's previous conduct has made him insensible to an occasion of grace, and in chapter 151 (PG 111.797C-D) where unworthy communion has death as its recompense.

118. But cf. n. 106 above.

119. Vita Andreae Sali 134 (Epiphanius), 169 (John the Evangelist alive in the world), 190 (via the martyr Thyrsus) (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.781B-C, 817A-B, 836C-837A. For the belief that John the Evangelist was alive and at work in the world see also Vita Marthae Hegumenae 2 (BHG 1175) ed. Janninck, p. 432D. Struggle of angels and demons: Vita Andreae Sali 6, 138, 187, PG 111.636B-637A, 785C, 832D-833B and cf. Chapter Four, p. 139 above.

120. Vita Andreae Sali 106-113 (BHG 117) ed. Murray, pp. 93.1-106.6.

121. Vita Andreae Sali 106 (BHG 117) ed. Murray, p. 93.6-8: τινὲς δὲ

τῶν πολιτῶν ἐξαγορεύοντες τὰς ἁμαρτίας αὐτῶν παρεῖχον αὐτῷ ἱκανὴν χρυσίου ποσότητα τοῦ διανεῖμαι τοῖς πένησιν ὑπὲρ ψυχικῆς σωτηρίας αὐτῶν. Note that Murray excludes from her text the phrase χάριν τῆς ἐξαγορεύσεως found in PG 111.749C. The point of the story is simony not confession. Compare the words of the magician in Vita Andreae Sali 130: δὸς δέ μοι ἓν τριμήσιον τοῦ διανεῖμαι τοῖς πένησιν ὑπὲρ ψυχικῆς σου σωτηρίας (PG 111.777C) and the texts cited in Chapter Three, n. 355 above.

122. Elsewhere in the Life it is made abundantly clear that confession and intercession by others cannot replace sincere personal διόρθωσις : Vita Andreae Sali 117, 127, 150, 156, 206 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.764A-C, 773C-D, 797B, 804A, 852A.

123. The Life of Andrew has not been much exploited in this area. Holl makes no use of it at all and Hörmann cites it only once in a list of texts illustrating ἰδιοποιεῖσθαι : Untersuchungen..., p. 209. See also now J. Grosdidier de Matons, "Les thèmes d'édification...," pp. 307-309, 311-314 and 322-323.

124. Παρρησία : Vita Andreae Sali 204 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.849A. Intercession: Vita Andreae Sali 193, 202, 204 and cf. 169, PG 111. 840A-B, 848B (μεσίτης), 849A and 817A-B (for the theme of the Three Intercessors see also Vita Pachomii 136[BHG 1396] ed. Halkin, p. 86. 3-9). Répondant du péché: Vita Andreae Sali 76, PG 111.716C-717A: ἐγὼ ὑπὲρ τῶν τούτου πλημμελημάτων τίνω τὰς δίκας· ἐγὼ τὴν ψυχήν μου τίθημι ὑπὲρ τούτου, καὶ σὺ αὐτὸς ἐν τῷ τέως οὐχ ἕξεις μερίδα ἐπὶ τὴν ψυχὴν αὐτοῦ (716D).

125. When Andrew foresees that Epiphanius will be a future Patriarch of Constantinople the Life contains reflections on the ecclesiastical κατάστασις and on episcopal duties, but there is no reference in any of this to penance: Vita Andreae Sali 87-88 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.728D-732A; cf. Chapter Three, n. 362 above.

126. Κατάνυξις : Vita Andreae Sali 78 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111. 720A. Ἔλεγχος: Vita Andreae Sali 58-59, 63, 77, PG 111.697D-700B, 704B-C, 717A and Vita 109-112, ed. Murray, pp. 98.10-103.7. Cf. Grosdidier de Matons, "Les thèmes d'édification...," pp. 315-328.

127. Vita Andreae Sali 106 (BHG 117) ed. Murray, p. 93.1-8. Compare the much-cited case of Theodore the protospatharius at the Council of 869-870 who declared to the Roman legates that he had not inquired whether the holy monk who heard his confession was an ordained priest or not (Mansi 16.150B-151A): Theodorus dixit: Nescio, id tantum scio quia chartularius erat, et tonsus est, et fecit in columna quadraginta annos. Sanctissimi vicarii dixerunt: Sacerdos erat? Theodorus dixit: Nescio, abbas erat, et habebam fidem in hominem et nuntiavi ei (150E).

128. Πνευματικὸς πατήρ : Vita Andreae Sali 66, 87, 134, 203 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.705D, 728D-729A, 781B, 848D.

129. Vita Andreae Sali 152 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.800B; cf. Vita Macarii Pelecetis 12 (BHG 1003) ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 156.31-157.9 and n. 77 above.

130. Vita Andreae Sali 108 (BHG 117) ed. Murray, p. 98.1-10; cf. n. 57 above and the relevance of the understanding of absolution suggested there to the "absolution" accorded by the unordained monk.

131. See Chapter Four, n. 108 above.

132. The difficulty of establishing precise dates for the documents in this section commends a policy of grouping them in relative chronological sequence according to the geographical areas of their composition.

133. Euthymius of Sardis, Stephen of Sugdaia and Nicephorus of Sebaze: Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 116 with n. 21, 114 with n. 8, 118 with n. 40a. Theodore of Edessa: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 583, 588-589 with literature cited there, to which add F. Angarano, "Teodoro di Edessa, santo," BS 12.250, Rome 1969 and A. Moffatt, "Schooling...," p. 89, n. 32.

134. Deathbed penance too late: Vita Nicephori 4 (BHG 2300) ed. Halkin, p. 23.4-7. Bishop as penitentiary: Vita Euthymii Sardensis 8.10 (BHG 2146) ed. Papadakis, p. 73. Spiritual direction of laity and πνευματικὸς πατήρ : Vita Theodori Edesseni 17-18, 56, 85, 86, 100, 111 (BHG 1744) ed. Pomyalovsky, pp. 13.24-14.7, 54.22-24, 89.14-16, 92.22, 107.27, 116.18-19. διόρθωσις : Vita Theodori Edesseni 60, pp. 60.27-61.8. The Life also contains interesting references to the forced reconciliation of heretics (Vita Theodori Edesseni 75, p. 78.23-25) and to the idea that "charismatic" παρρησία on behalf of sinners is arranged by God as part of the divine scheme of cura pastoralis (Vita Theodori Edesseni 66, p. 68.12-15): καὶ ἰδοὺ δέδωταί σοι χάρις διορατικοῖς ὄμμασι καθορᾶν τοὺς δικαίους τε καὶ ἁμαρτωλούς, καὶ τοῖς μὲν ἐπαχθάλλεσθαι, τῶν δὲ ὑπερεύχεσθαι, ὅπως ἐπιστρέψωσι τῶν ἁμαρτιῶν καὶ βελτιωθῶσι τῇ μετανοίᾳ.

135. Theodora: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 563-564. Athanasia: Beck, Kirche..., p. 562. Demetrianus: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 562-563 and T. Becquet, "Demetriano, vescovo di Chytri, santo," BS 4.552, Rome 1964. Theoctista of Lesbos and Euthymius the Younger: Beck, Kirche..., pp. 563-564 and N.B. Tomadakes, "Περὶ τοῦ βίου καὶ τῆς ἑορτῆς τῆς ἁγίας Θεοκτίστας τῆς Λεσβίας καὶ ἡ εἰσαγωγὴ τῆς ἑορτῆς τῆς εἰς τὸ ἑορτολόγιον," Χαριστήριον εἰς Ἀναστάσιον Κ. Ὀρλάνδον, Athens 1965, vol. 1, pp. 108-116. Athanasius of Methone, Peter of Argos and Martha: G. Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Grèce aux VIIIe, IXe et Xe siècles," Byzantion 31(1961) 309-369 at pp. 313-315, 316-325 and 344-346. Miracula Demetrii: Beck, Kirche..., p. 465. Cretan martyrs: Beck, Kirche..., p. 568 and Detorakis, Οἱ ἅγιοι ..., pp. 53-60.

136. Bishop as penitentiary: Vita Petri Argivi 16 (BHG 1504) ed. Mai, pp. 11.34-12.2. Eucharist as ἄφεσις : Vita Theoctistae 18 (BHG 1723/1724) ed. Delehaye, p. 230A. Spiritual direction of laity: Vita Demetriani 2 (BHG 495) ed. Grégoire, p. 226.297-313. Monastic penance: Vita Theodorae 23 (confession), 30 (ἐπιτίμια), 36 (excommunication), 35 (forgiveness), 37 (πατὴρ πνευματικός) (BHG 1738) ed. Kurtz, pp. 14.1-3, 17.31-33, 20.33-35, 20.8-11, 21.8-14; Vita Euthymii Iunioris 9 (ἐπιτίμιον), 33 (confession and forgiveness) (BHG 655) ed. Petit, pp. 176.5-9 and 199.15-24.

137. Philip of Agira: Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," p. 594 and E. Follieri, "Problemi di agiografia bizantina: il contributo dell' innografia allo studio dei testi agiografici in prosa," BBGG NS 31(1977) 3-14. Stephen of Reggio: Patlagean, "Les moines grecs...," p. 580. Elias the Younger: G. Rossi-Taibbi, Vita di Sant' Elia il Giovane, Palermo 1962, p. xviii with the remarks of F. Halkin, AB 81(1963) 291-293 and Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Sicile...," pp. 95-109.

138. Vita Eliae Iunioris 34 (BHG 580) ed. Rossi-Taibbi, pp. 50.672/52. 685. The same text also stresses the importance of confession, for without it small sins become greater; cf. also Vita Eliae Iunioris 65, pp. 102.1409/104.1428.

139. Ἔλεγχος: Vita Eliae Iunioris 32, 47, 49, 65, 69 (BHG 580) ed. Rossi-Taibbi, pp. 48.631-634, 72.961-963, 74.1015/76.1045, 102.1409/104. 1428, 110.1512-1519. Διόρθωσις: Vita Eliae Iunioris 40, 46, 47, 49, pp. 60.814-825, 70.944-948, 72.961-973, 74.1015/76.1045. Spiritual direction of laity: Vita Eliae Iunioris 5, 44, pp. 8.89-90, 66.901-906. The one example of forgiveness in the Life (συγγνώμης τυχεῖν) must be interpreted as a personal pardon rather than as an absolution: Vita Eliae Iunioris 69, p. 112.1520-1523.

140. There is a curious reference to certain priests as "ἄξιοι τῆς τοῦ Θεοῦ λειτουργίας" (Vita Eliae Iunioris 16 [BHG 580] ed. Rossi-Taibbi, p. 24.303-305) which suggests perhaps a judgement against the rest. Another theme in the Life that is characteristic of the kind of enthusiastic theology associated with Symeon the New Theologian is the assertion that holiness is possible in every age, and is not reserved to some Golden Age of the Christian past: Vita Eliae Iunioris 63, p. 98.1333-1341 and cf. Vita Andreae Sali 121 (BHG 117) ed. Janninck, PG 111.768B-D.

141. Some of these texts may be as old as the sixth century but in the absence of any sure indication of date it has been thought wise not to intrude them arbitrarily into earlier chapters. Only a sample of the innumerable martyrs' Passiones has been provided, but no major monastic or episcopal Life has consciously been omitted.

142. In the various parts of this section bibliographical information about the Vitae will only be supplied in cases of particular interest or difficulty.

143. The use of the term ἐπιτίμια to describe tortures inflicted on Christians by pagan magistrates (Vita Lucilliani 6 [BHG 999a] ed. Halkin, p. 13.17-18) is a valuable reminder that the medicinal interpretation of penitential ἐπιτίμια was probably not universal; cf. n. 14 above. There is a further reference to the guaranteed intercession of the martyrs on behalf of their sinful clients in Vita Acacii 22 (BHG 13) ed. Henskens, PG 115.240B.

144. The Vita Germani is accepted as pre-Metaphrastic by Halkin in his review of Lamza's edition (AB 93[1975] 422-424 at p. 423) but Ševčenko is much more sceptical, "Hagiography...," pp. 113-114 with n. 4. See also the important review of Lamza by W. Lackner, BZ 71 (1978) 90-96.

145. Vita Germani 11 (BHG 697) ed. Lamza, p.214.205-211. As bishop Germanus is described as ἁμαρτωλῶν ἐχθυητής: Vita Germani 5, p. 206. 96.

146. Spiritual direction of laity: Vita Auxentii 23 (BHG 201) ed. Clugnet, p. 10.28-32; Vita Symeonis Stylitae Iunioris 21 (BHG 1691c) ed. Bompaire, p. 108.4-7. καθαίρεσις: Vita Danielis Stylitae 11 (BHG 490e) ed. Delehaye, p. 102.12-15. Synodal ἀνάθεμα: Vita Theophanis 5 (BHG 1789) ed. de Boor, p. 9.24-26. Confession: Vita Symeonis Stylitae Iunioris 7, 15 (BHG 1691b) ed. Bompaire, pp. 94.26-28, 101.15-16. Forgiveness: Vita Symeonis Stylitae Iunioris 13 (BHG 1691b), p. 98. 19-22. One of the Lives of Theophanes implies that the practice of submitting sealed written confessions was being combined with the

traditional belief in the intercession of the saints as a way of securing forgiveness. With regard to Theophanes' relics the author reports: καὶ χειρόγραφον δὲ ἡμαρτημένων τῇ θήκῃ τενὲν ἐσφραγισμένον ὑπό τινος ἀγράφου ὁ τεθεικὼς ἀποσφραγίσας εὗρεν. ἡ γὰρ ἀκένωτος πηγὴ τῶν χαρισμάτων ἅπασι τὴν ἴασιν μετεδίδου πλουσίως (Vita Theophanis 13 [BHG 1791] ed. Krumbacher, p. 398.13-17 and cf. n. 88 above).

147. Constantine: P. Gini, "Costantino, monaco in Bitinia, santo," BS 4.249, Rome 1964. Irene: Beck, Kirche..., p. 570 and R. Janin, "Irene, egumena del monastero di Chrysobalanton a Costantinopoli, santa," BS 7.885-886, Rome 1966.

148. Spiritual direction of the laity: Vita Irenes 35 (BHG 952) ed. Pien, 614F. πατὴρ πνευματικός: Vita Irenes 80, p. 635F; Vita Eustoliae et Sopatrae 3 (BHG 2141) ed. Delehaye, p. 218B-C. Confession: Vita Constantini 21 (λογισμοί), 25, 31, 43, 57 (λογισμοί), 71 (BHG 370) ed. Delehaye, pp. 634A-B, 635A-B, 636F, 640D-E, 644E-645A, 649E-650A; Vita Irenes 14 (λογισμοί), 32-33, 34 (coram Deo), pp. 607C-608D, 613C-614E, 614F. ἐπιτίμιον: Vita Constantini 25, p. 635A-B, Absolution: Vita Constantini 25, 31, pp. 635A-B, 636F; Vita Irenes 3-5 (= Absolutio Theophili), p. 603A-C. Forgiveness via διόρθωσις: Vita Theoduli 13, 18 (BHG 1785) ed. van Papenbroek, pp. 762E, 764F.

149. For the Visiones Danielis see the study by H. Schmoldt, Die Schrift 'vom jungen Daniel' und 'Daniels letzte Vision', Dissertation: Hamburg 1972, pp. 238-244, 250-257, 261-272. The dating of these texts is still not completely sure.

150. Visio Mariae 18 (BHG 1050) ed. James, p. 121.9-20 (monks and hierarchs together in hell). Chapters 3 to 23 (pp. 97.25-123.28) provide a detailed list of the kinds of sins which were thought to deserve eternal punishment. Pessimism about the holiness of the clergy: Visio Danielis 4.8 (BHG 1871) ed. Schmoldt, p. 228.20-23: καὶ ἀρθήσεται ἡ τιμὴ τῶν ἱερέων καὶ ἐκλείψει ἡ θυσία ἀπὸ τῶν ἐκκλησιῶν, καὶ πληρωθήσεται ἡ κακία ἐπὶ τοὺς ἀνθρώπους, καὶ γενήσονται ὁ λαὸς ὡς ἄγρια θηρία, καὶ ἔσονται <οἱ> ἱερεῖς ὡς ὁ κοινὸς λαός. To this add Visio Danielis 1.12-13 (BHG 1872) ed. Schmoldt, p. 202.20-23: ἐν ταῖς ἡμέραις ἐκείνοις λιμώξει ἡ θυσία ἀπὸ τῶν ἐκκλησιῶν καὶ καταφρονηθήσεται τὸ θεῖον, καὶ ἔσονται οἱ ἱερεῖς ὡς ὁ λαὸς καὶ ὁ λαὸς ὡσεὶ δαίμονες, ἕως οὗ πληρθῶσιν <αἱ> ἁμαρτίαι τῶν Ἰσραηλιτῶν. Cf. Chapter Three, n. 286 above.

151. The Lives sampled include: Artemius (BHG 170), Basileus (BHG 239, 240), Demetrius (BHG 496), Eustratius (BHG 646), George (BHG 687), Iacobus "Intercisus" (BHG 772, 772a, 772b), Longinus (BHG 988), Martyres omnes (BHG 1184), Paul (BHG 1471), Phocas (BHG 1535y, 1536), Sancti omnes (BHG 1617c), Theodore (BHG 1750, 1765f) and Tryphon (BHG 1856, 1856a). Vita Iacobi Intercisi 2-4, 9 (BHG 772) ed. Devos, pp. 179.4-180.16, 183.12-184.5 show that martyrdom was held to cancel the effects of all sins, even apostasy, and Vita Theodori 2, 4 (BHG 1765f) ed. Delehaye, pp. 62C-F, 65C-F provide examples of confessions made directly to the saint in his shrine.

152. Amphilochius: K. Holl, Amphilochius von Ikonium in seinem Verhältnis zu den grossen Kappadozern, Tübingen/Leipzig 1904, p. 6, n. 1. Maruthas: C.L. Sanspeur, "La préhistoire de la plus ancienne Vie grecque de S. Marouthas," OLP 9(1978) 159-165.

153. Vita Amphilochii 1-2 (BHG 73) ed. Combefis, PG 39.16B-17B. It is a

topos that the saint receives ordination from God, but this text goes much further in portraying the decision of a group of bishops not to proceed with the ceremony of ordination in the case of Amphilochius because he had already received ordination in a vision: ὃν ὁ Θεὸς ἐχειροτόνησε διὰ τῶν ἁγίων αὐτοῦ ἀγγέλων, ἡμεῖς χειροτονήσωμεν ἢ παρυβρίσωμεν οὐ δυνάμεθα (Vita Amphilochii 2, PG 39.17B). The text is relevant to the problem of the relationship between Geist and Amt. In his note on the passage Combefis points up the uniqueness of the case: Nullum apud antiquiores occurrit hujusce tam singularis ordinationis Amphilochii nostri monumentum (PG 39. 15D-17D, n.[c]). Vita Hypatii 11 (BHG 759a) ed. Ferri, pp. 83.12-84.2 presents a strong rejection of the Novatianist rigorism in penance and Vita Hypatii 24 (BHG 759c) ed. Ferri, p. 101.15-32 recalls the importance of the direct (and guaranteed) intercession of the saints in securing the forgiveness of sins. Vita Nicolai 5 (BHG 1351) ed. Anrich, p. 99.7-16: the bishop as source of ἄφεσις for sinners.

154. Theophylact: Beck, Kirche..., p. 563 puts the date for the Life ca. 900, but see Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," p. 118.

155. S. Salaville, "Agapet (Saint)," DHGE 1.883-885, Paris 1912 and G. Eldarov, "Agapeto, vescovo di Sinao o Sinnade in Frigia, santo," BS 1.305, Rome 1961.

156. See the remarks of A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, Varia Graeca Sacra, St. Petersburg 1909, pp. xiii-xix.

157. Ἔλεγχος: Vita Agapeti 17, 20, 22, 29, 52 (BHG 35) ed. Latyshev, pp. 98.2-10, 98.27-31, 98.37-99.4, 100.10-16, 104.19-26. Spiritual direction of the laity: Vita Agapeti 32, 34, pp. 100.29-101.2, 101. 14-19. Confession: Vita Agapeti 17, 18, 22, pp. 98.2-10, 98.16-22, 98.37-99.4. Absolution: Vita Agapeti 17, 18, 33 (repeated for the same sinner), 49, 52, pp. 98.2-10, 98.16-22, 101.4-13, 103.37-104. 10, 104.19-26. "Penances": Vita Agapeti 19, 31, 33, 52, pp. 98.23-26, 100.23-28, 101.4-13, 104.19-26.

158. Of these Lives the Vita Paisii and the Vita Niphontis are much the most interesting. H.G. Evelyn White, The Monasteries of the Wâdi'n Natrûn. Part II. The History of the Monasteries of Nitria and of Scetis, New York 1932, pp. 111-115 has written briefly about the Life of Paisius and seems to imply a seventh-century terminus ad quem (p. 111), but the Life as a whole deserves closer study than it has received. Niphon: R. Janin, "Nifone, vescovo di Costanziana (?), santo," BS 9.993-994, Rome 1967 and the review of Rystenko's edition by M. Weingart in Byzantinoslavica 2(1930) 442-447 and see nn. 165 and 167 below. It has not been possible to consult either the edition of the Life by Rystenko (BHG 1371z) or the shorter redaction published by Eustratiades (BHG 1372), but the Life has been read in manuscript: Ms. Holkham gr. 43, ff. $128^{r}.15$-$148^{r}.7$ (= BHG 1372b) and Ms. Coislinianus gr. 301, ff. $3^{r}.1$-$98^{r}.8$ (= BHG 1371z). The Vita Niphontis clearly had influence in some circles, for a question put to Patriarch Nicholas III (1084-1111) asked whether it should be read and "observed" along with the eight books of the Apostolic Constitutions. The responsio was: τοῦ ἁγίου Νήφοντος τὸν βίον οὐ παρελάβομεν ὡς μὴ παραδοθέντα (Oudot, Patriarchatus..., Quaestio 20, p. 24). With respect to the later recensions of the Life of Pachomius (BHG 1400, 1400c), only materials not already contained in earlier recensions have been examined here.

159. Πατὴρ πνευματικός: Vita Eusebiae 7, 8, 9, 12 (BHG 633) ed. Nissen, pp. 109.17-21, 109.26-32, 110.25-34, 112.28-35. Confession: Vita Arsenii 9 (by letter, but more a personal apology than a confession), 11 (dangers to chastity from hearing confessions) (BHG 168) ed. Phirippides, pp. 45.15-29, 48.4-10; Vita Gerasimi 7 (BHG 695) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, p. 127.25-28; Vita Paisii 59-62 (λογισμοί), 75 (BHG 1402/1403) ed. Pomyalovsky, pp. 38.23-41.23, 54.18-56.26. The Life of Niphon is remarkable for its emphasis on confession being made directly to God: Vita Niphontis 13, 27, 37, 45, 62, 121, 127, 139, 146 (BHG 1371z) and see n. 167 below.

160. Vita Paisii 20 (BHG 1402/1403) ed. Pomyalovsky, p. 14.1-23. The working of the charism is illustrated in three separate incidents: Vita Paisii 21-30 (the soul of a man already dead is saved by P.'s intercession), 53-57 (λύσις secured for a blasphemer), 64-67 (an apostate monk is saved by the saint's intercession), pp. 14.24-20. 15, 34.13-37.16, 43.7-47.4. For guaranteed intercession see Chapter Three, n. 365 above, and in this chapter nn. 134, 143 and 153. The theme also occurs in the Life of Niphon, chapter 64 where in return for prayers offered on behalf of Niphon's own sins the saint promises to each of his benefactors (Coislinianus gr. 301, f. 94^{v}.20-26): γνώσει ἐν τῇ ἐκλείψει τῆς ψυχῆς αὐτοῦ, τὴν μεγάλην βοήθειαν τοῦ θεοῦ· ἐπ'αὐτῷ ἐλλαλυλύια καὶ κωλύψει ὁ πατὴρ καὶ ὁ υἱὸς καὶ τὸ ἅγιον πνεῦμα· τὸ πλῆθος τῶν ἁμαρτιῶν αὐτοῦ. καὶ ἐμοὶ τῷ ἀνικάνῳ προσκολληθείη ἐν τῇ βασιλείᾳ τῶν οὐρανῶν· οὐ μὴ γὰρ ἐπιλάθομαι τοῦ τοιούτου ἐν τῇ καταπαύσει μου ποσὶ· ἕως ἂν ἐνέγκω αὐτὸν πρὸς ἐμαυτῷ· ἵνα ὅπου εἰμὶ ἐγὼ κἀκεῖνος ἔσται.

161. See n. 134 above. Compare the heresy of the monk Theoctistus upbraided by Theodore of Stoudion: Τέταρτον περὶ μοναχοῦ ἑνὸς, ὅτι δύναται τῆς κολάσεως ῥύσασθαι ἑκατὸν πεντήκοντα κρινομένους. (Epist. 2.166, PG 99.1528A). Another example of the intercession, not the absolution, offered a sinner by an unordained monk: Vita Ioannis in puteo 8.46-53 (BHG 894z) ed. Halkin, p. 276.

162. David, Symeon and George: I.M. Phoundoules, Ἁγιολογικὸν Ἑορτολόγιον Γ'. Οἱ ὅσιοι σύνταδελφοι Δαβὶδ, Συμεὼν καὶ Γεώργιος οἱ ὁμολογηταί, Athens 1961, pp. 5-7 but cf. Ševčenko, "Hagiography...," pp. 117-118.

163. Vita Davidis Symeonis et Georgii 25 (BHG 494) ed. Phoundoules, pp. 40.44-41.12. Cf. n. 88 above and note too that the author knows and uses the Absolutio Theophili (Vita Davidis Symeonis et Georgii 26-27, pp. 41.33-43.32), although he adds to Theodora's request the declaration that the power of binding and loosing extends beyond death: ἐξουσίαν γὰρ ἔχετε πρὸς Θεοῦ τοῦ δεσμεῖν τε καὶ λύειν ὅσα ἂν καὶ βούλεσθε, οὐ μόνον τῶν ἐν τῇ ζωῇ ταύτῃ ἐξεταζομένων τὰ ἁμαρτήματα, ἀλλὰ καὶ τῶν ἤδη προληφθέντων θανάτῳ, ὡς ἱερεῖς αὐτοῦ καὶ ἀκραιφνεῖς λατρευταὶ καὶ δεσπόντες. (Vita Davidis Symeonis et Georgii 27, pp. 42.46-43.2). The letter from Symeon in chapters 15 and 16 is more a πληροφορία than an absolution properly so called (Vita Davidis Symeonis et Georgii 15-16, pp. 31.7-32.20) nor is the returned letter an absolution: Vita 25, pp. 40.44-41.12.

164. Confession by laity to priests: Vita Davidis Symeonis et Georgii 17, 20 (BHG 494) ed. Phoundoules, pp. 33.10-17, 36.36-42. Note the link between confession and money (alms?) recalling similar connexions in the Life of Andrew the Fool (n. 121 above): πρὸς τὸν ἅγιον ἀδιστάκτως συνέτρεχον, τὰ πραχθέντα ἐξαγορεύοντες καὶ τὰ χρήματα ἀφθόνως προσφέροντες (Vita Davidis Symeonis et Georgii 20, p. 36.39-41). Forgiveness assured by unordained monk (not an absolution): Vita Martiniani

1 (BHG 1177) ed. Rabbow, pp. 282.26-283.21 and cf. Vita Ioannis Eremopolitae 4 (BHG 2187h) ed. Halkin, p. 19.27-29. Communion given only to the worthy: Vita Davidis Symeonis et Georgii 37, p. 53.30-41 and cf. Vita Ioannis Eremopolitae 3, p. 18.15-30.

165. Macarius: the Narrationes are ascribed to Macarius in the text published by Floss and reprinted in Migne (BHG 999n = PG 34.221A-229A), but the same stories also occur as part of the Life of Niphon and there the saint is often referred to simply as ὁ μακάριος (Vita Niphontis 51 [BHG 1371z] Coislinianus gr. 301, f. 24^{r}.6 and cf. Vita Niphontis [BHG 1372b] Holkham gr. 43, f. 146^{r} in margine inferiore and f. 145^{r}.18) with the result that the original character at the centre of these narrative traditions must remain uncertain. The Life of Niphon is certainly a cento of monastic διηγήματα, but there is some evidence which suggests that the text printed by Floss may reflect the hand of a later editor. See n. 167 below.

166. Worthy communion: Vita Philemonis 1 (BHG 2368) ed. Kallistos, p. 247. 13-20. The story of Galaction and Episteme contails two details worthy of note. Galaction is said to baptize his own fiancée because no priests were available: Ἡ ἱερωσύνη ἐξέλιπεν ἐκ τοῦ γένους τῶν χριστιανῶν (Vita Galactionis 7 [BHG 665] ed. Delehaye, p. 38A). The same passage in the Metaphrastic Life (BHG 666) ed. Delehaye. p. 43D reads: καὶ ἐπεὶ κατὰ τὸ νῦν ἔχον ἱερέων ἔστιν ἀπορία τῶν πρὸς τὸ βάπτισμα τεταγμένων ὑπηρετεῖν. Apart from the apocalyptic texts cited in n. 150 above, this text is one of the very rare hagiographical witnesses to the arrangements lay Christians would make with respect to sacramental practice in the absence of priests. Compare, however, the underlying ideas in Pratum spirituale 196 (BHG 1442) edd. Duc/Cotelier, PG 87:3.3080D-3084A. The same Life also regularly refers to an ordained monk simply as ὁ μοναχός (Vita Galactionis 4, 6 [BHG 665] pp. 36E, 37D), a salutary reminder of the difficulty of determining with precision whether monastic confessors in the hagiographical texts were ordained or unordained.

167. Vita Macarii 2 (BHG 999n) ed. Floss, PG 34.225A-B (penance at the end suffices), 225C (deathbed confession: καὶ ἐκάλεσεν ἐλθεῖν τὸν πρεσβύτερον τῆς ἐκκλησίας, καὶ κατὰ μόνας ἤρξατο θρηνεῖν καὶ δακρύειν καὶ ἐξομολογεῖσθαι πάσας τῷ Θεῷ τὰς ἁμαρτίας αὐτοῦ ἐνώπιον τοῦ ἱερέως), 228B (all "confessed" sins are forgiven: ὁ γὰρ φιλάνθρωπος κύριος ἐκεῖνα κρίνει, ἃ δι' ἐξαγορεύσεως εἰς φῶς οὐκ ἔλθουσιν. πᾶν γὰρ τὸ φανερούμενον φῶς ἐστιν· πάντα γάρ, ὅσα ἐξομολογήσονται οἱ ἄνθρωποι διὰ ἱερέων ἐν ταπεινώσει πολλῇ καὶ στεναγμῷ ἐξ ὅλης καρδίας αὐτῶν καὶ παύσονται τῶν πονηρῶν πράξεων, ὁ ἐλεήμων Θεὸς οὐ λογίζεται). The demons' sense of justice is outraged by this policy of the divine mercy and their reaction points up the extent of God's φιλανθρωπία: εἰ οὖν πρέπει τούτῳ σωτηρία, λάβετε καὶ τὸν κόσμον ὅλον, καὶ πάντας τοὺς ἁμαρτωλοὺς τῆς γῆς σώσατε δωρεάν· ἡμεῖς γὰρ εἰς μάτην κοπιῶμεν (Vita Macarii 2, PG 34.228A). It is important to observe that neither of the explicit references to priests involved in the confessions (PG 34.225C: καὶ ἐκάλεσεν... τοῦ ἱερέως and PG 34.228B: διὰ ἱερέων) is to be found in the version of the same stories that is part of the Life of Niphon: Vita Niphontis 121 (BHG 1371z) Ms. Coislinianus gr. 301, ff. 53^{v}.30-54^{r}.4 and 54^{v}.13-14 where for διὰ ἱερέων the text reads: μετὰ δακρύων τῷ θεῷ; cf. n. 159 above. Reference to priests is also missing from the corresponding passages in BHG 1372b, Ms. Holkham gr. 43, ff. 141^{v}.10-14 and 142^{r}.2-6.

168. Vita Macarii 2 (BHG 999n) ed. Floss, PG 34.228B-229A.

169. Details and bibliography in Beck, Kirche..., pp. 570-575.

170. Although the texts chosen will be only a sample of the Metaphrastic corpus, most of the Metaphrastic texts deal with martyrs and it may now reasonably be presumed that no important information about ecclesiastical penance is to be found in the formulaic genre of the Passio; cf. p. 27 above.

171. Reference to the cure of πάθη ἀνίατα in Vita Sampsonis 2 (BHG 1615) ed. Malou, PG 116.281A is medical only. The author of the Life makes no conscious allusions to spiritual "healing" as part of Sampson's ministry. ἔλεγχος : Vita Sampsonis 17, PG 116.300B-301A.

172. This is a selection of five Vitae only, but in fact represents half of the Metaphrastic Lives whose originals are known to contain references to penance. The sample is thus more representative than it might at first appear to be.

173. Symeon omits references to the ἐπιτίμιον in two places: Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 21, 25 (BHG 888) ed. Malou, PG 114.916A-B, 917D-920A [= Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 12, 14 (BHG 886) ed. Gelzer, pp. 25.8-10, 29.3-4/Festugière, Vita 10, 12, pp. 357, 360], but elsewhere ἐπιτίμιον simply becomes ἐπιτιμία [Vita Ioannis Eleemosynarii 25, PG 114.917D = Gelzer, Vita 14, p. 28.10/Festugière, Vita 12, p. 359] and the two terms have the same technical sense for Symeon: Vita Spyridonis 27 (BHG 1648) ed. Malou, PG 116.449B: μερίζει τὴν ἐπιτιμίαν ὁσιτείως.

174. Symeon adds a reference to the bishop as penitentiary in Vita Spyridonis 22 (BHG 1648) ed. Malou, PG 116.441C: τοῖς πταίουσι μὲν καὶ λελυπηκόσι συγγνωμονικόν τε καὶ ἵλεων. Elsewhere he adds the topos of the divine ordination which precedes the human one: Vita Spyridonis 18, PG 116.437D; cf. n. 153 above. In Vita Ioannicii 14 and 25 (BHG 937) ed. Malou, PG 116.48D and 60B Symeon's paraphrase confirms that when Joannicius functions as the répondant du péché (cf. Vita Ioannicii 27-28, 46-47 [BHG 936] ed. van den Gheyn, pp. 398C-400B, 410B-411C), it is the πόλεμος against the πάθη not the guilt for sin that he takes upon himself: ἀπαλλαχθῆναι μὲν ηὔχετο τὴν κόρην τοῦ ἐνοχλοῦντος κακοῦ, αὐτῷ δὲ τὸ δεινὸν ἐκεῖνο ἐπιπεσεῖν (p. 48D) and ἐπ' αὐτὸν δὲ τὸν πόλεμον μεταπεσεῖν, κἀκείνην τοῦ πάθους ἀπαλλαχθῆναι (p. 60B).

175. George: Beck, Kirche..., p. 577. Alexius: Beck, Kirche..., p. 577 and E. Josi, "Alessio, santo, confessore," BS 1.814-823, Rome 1961. Luke the Stylite: Beck, Kirche..., p. 576 and R. Janin, "Luca lo Stilita, santo," BS 8.225-226, Rome 1967.

176. Spiritual direction: Vita Lucae Stylitae 5, 14, 28, 31, 36 (BHG 2239) ed. Delehaye, pp. 200.19-25, 210.6-15, 224.9-15, 227.6-9, 231.29-232.4. Confession: Vita Lucae Stylitae 5 (λογισμοί), 14 (λογισμοί and sins), 27 (λογισμοί and sins), 28 and 33 (sins), pp. 200.23-24, 210.34-37, 222.33-223.9, 225.4-5 and 228.27-30. "Penances": Vita Lucae Stylitae 33, p. 228.30-31: ἑφ' ἑκάστῳ τούτων [sc. sins] φάρμακον ἐφαρμόζον τὸ διὰ μετανοίας καὶ νηστείας ὁρίσας καὶ δεδωκώς.

177. Earlier examples of absolutions in writing are miraculous (usually in the form of a divine "rescript"; cf. nn. 87, 88, 146 and 163 above but contrast Diekamp, "Brief an einen Sünder...," p. 43.3-11), whereas the absolutions here have been interpreted as an established custom. See Delehaye, Les saints stylites, p. civ.

178. Vita Lucae Stylitae 27, 28 (BHG 2239) ed. Delehaye, pp. 223.6-22, 224.34-225.9. Unlike the πληροφορία in the Life of David, Symeon and George cited in n. 163 above, these cases are understood explicitly as absolutions.

179. Vita Lucae Stylitae 27 (BHG 2239) ed. Delehaye, p. 222.32-35: πυκνότερόν πως πρὸς αὐτὸν παρέβαλλε, τὰ οἰκεῖα πάντα τούτῳ πάντοτε πιστῶς ἀνατιθέμενος καὶ τὰς τῶν ἰδίων λογισμῶν ἐννοίας δι' ἐξαγορεύσεως ἀνακαλύπτων. Vita Lucae Stylitae 28, p. 224.12-15: καὶ συνήθως ἐκ πίστεως πυκνότερον πρὸς αὐτὸν παραγινόμενος πάντα τε τὰ κατ' αὐτὸν αὐτῷ προσανατιθέμενος καὶ τῷ ἐκείνου κανόνι τυπούμενος ἐν πᾶσι καὶ στοιχειούμενος.

180. Euthymius: συγχώρησιν ἔγγραφον ἐξαποσταλῆναι αὐτῷ τῶν ἐξαγγελθέντων πάλαι σφαλμάτων (Vita Lucae Stylitae 27 [BHG 2239] ed. Delehaye, p. 223.8-9). Cyrus: τὴν συγχώρησιν σήμερον ὧν ἔπραξας καὶ ἐξηγόρευσας ἤδη κακῶν δίδωμι (Vita Lucae Stylitae 28, p. 225.4-5).

181. But compare nn. 53, 54, 71 and 106 above.

182. Nothing excludes the possibility, for example, that the first interpretation applies in one case and the second interpretation in the other.

183. The Life of John of Damascus (BHG 884) is included because of the uncertainty still attaching to its date; it may be a few years beyond the limit of 983. Cf. also nn. 207, 211 below.

184. Paul the Younger: Beck, Kirche..., p. 576 and R. Janin, "Paolo il Giovane (o lo Stilita), santo," BS 10.258-260, Rome 1968. Michael Maleinos: Beck, Kirche..., p. 576; R. Janin, "Michele Maleinos, fondatore della laura del Monte Kyminas, santo," BS 9.462-464, Rome 1967 and Les églises et les monastères..., pp. 115-118.

185. Spiritual direction of laity: Vita Pauli Iunioris 35 (BHG 1474) ed. Delehaye, p. 148.1-4; Vita Michaelis Maleini 6, 14 (BHG 1295) ed. Petit, pp. 553.1-5, 559.15-28. Confession: Vita Pauli Iunioris 17 (λογισμοί), 25, 32 (note here that λογισμοί means "sins"), 42, pp. 52.4-12, 67.9-11, 143.9-10, 159.3-5; Vita Michaelis Maleini 14, 17, 21, 22, pp. 559.18-22, 562.21-26, 565.1-2, 565.16-19. Forgiveness (monastic): Vita Pauli Iunioris 4, 6, 29, 33 (via monastic profession), 47, 49 (after death, through the intercession of the saint), pp. 24.12-13, 26.16-17, 138.11-15, 144.12-145.4, 174.19-175.6, 177.11-178.16; Vita Michaelis Maleini 21, p. 565.1-4. ἐπιτίμια: Vita Pauli Iunioris 12, 32, pp. 41.9-10, 143.10-12; Testamentum Pauli Iunioris 2 (BHG 1474h) ed. Lambros, p. 201.23-27.

186. Testamentum Pauli Iunioris 1 (BHG 1474h) ed. Lambros, p. 199.1-3: Οἴδατε, ἀδελφοί μου ἀγαπητοὶ καὶ πατέρες, ὅτι τὸ μοναδικὸν σχῆμα ὑψηλόν ἐστι καὶ ἐπηρμένον καὶ ἀγγελικὸν καθαρτικόν τε πάσης ἁμαρτίας διὰ τελείας ἐπιβιώσεως. Cf. Chapter Four, n. 56 above.

187. Vita Pauli Iunioris 32 (BHG 1474) ed. Delehaye, p. 142.12-14: μετὰ γὰρ τῶν ἄλλων, ὧν ἔμπλεως ὑπῆρχε χαρισμάτων ὁ μέγας, δὴ καὶ ἀποστολικῶν ἐτέλει χαρίτων καὶ τοῦ δεσμεῖν τε καὶ λύειν ἄμοιρος.

188. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., p. 317 and Hörmann, Untersuchungen..., pp. 257-259. Hörmann places Paul the Younger in the "enthusiastic line" linking Stephen the Younger with Symeon the New Theologian. Holl's

intimation that Vita Pauli Iunioris 32 is typical "einer sehr häufig vorkommenden Sache" cannot be sustained on the basis of the hagiographical evidence; see Chapter Three, n. 382 above.

189. The other Life in this group shows no sign of any strain between the monastic and sacerdotal orders: Vita Michaelis Maleini 16 (BHG 1295) ed. Petit, pp. 561.28-562.4.

190. Vita Pauli Iunioris 32 (BHG 1474) ed. Delehaye, p. 143.10-12. It is true that the sinner already feels himself "bound" by his sin before he visits Paul (Vita 32, p. 143.1-2); cf. Diekamp, "Brief an einen Sünder...," p. 44.14-22.

191. Vita Pauli Iunioris 32 (BHG 1474) ed. Delehaye, p. 143.3-5: Ἄνελθε πρὸς τὸ ὄρος, καὶ τῷ κυρῷ Παύλῳ περιτυχών, ὃ ἂν αὐτὸς ἐπιτρέψειε, πάσῃ φυλακῇ τηρεῖν μελέτω σοι· οὕτω γὰρ ποιοῦντι ἕψεται πάντως καὶ ἡ τῶν ἡμαρτημένων ἄνεσις.

192. Vita Paisii 20; cf. n. 160 above and the other references there and in n. 161. The Life of Paul the Younger also contains a guarantee of salvation to monks who persevere on Mt. Latros, a guarantee which also involves the theme of the répondant du péché: Vita Pauli Iunioris 43 (BHG 1474) ed. Delehaye, p. 161.12-16. The passage is a close parallel to Vita Theodosii 60 (BHG 1776) ed. Usener, pp. 91.12-92.7.

193. Holl, Enthusiasmus..., p. 317. Theological distinctions between absolution, πληροφορία and reconciliation were not current at this period; hence the ambiguity that clings to all hagiographical evidence for these realities. Vita Lucae Stylitae 28 (text in n. 180 above) comes as close to the Western declaratory form as it is possible to find in the Greek East, but is the "leave" to return to communion which Paul the Younger gives to the sinner Dometius (Vita Pauli Iunioris 32) identical with his "reception" to ecclesial communion, or is this latter a separate reality effected by the priest who actually accepts Dometius to the Eucharist? The hagiographical sources are canvassed in vain for answers to such (later) questions.

194. Vita Lucae Stylitae 28 (BHG 2239) ed. Delehaye, p. 225.4-5.

195. Note also the theme that every generation, including the present one, is capable of holiness and that the great charisms have not been exstinguished: Vita Pauli Iunioris 21 (BHG 1474) ed. Delehaye, pp. 59.15-60.17, and cf. n. 140 above. Related to this, however, is the saint's heightened sense of sin: Vita Pauli Iunioris 4, p. 24.8-15; compare Vita Nicephori 16 (BHG 1338) ed. Delehaye, p. 148.4-9 and Chapter Four, p. 135 above.

196. Luke the Younger: Da Costa-Louillet, "Saints de Grèce...," pp. 330-345 and R. Janin, "Luca il Giovane, fondatore del monastero di S. Luca in Focide, santo," BS 8.222-223, Rome 1967. Peter of Athos: D. Papachryssanthou, "La Vie ancienne de saint Pierre l'Athonite. Date, composition et valeur historique," AB 92(1974) 19-61. Theocletus of Sparta: Beck, Kirche..., p. 569 and R. Janin, "Teocleto, vescovo di Sparta, santo," BS 12.204-205, Rome 1969. Nicholas ἐν Βουναίνῃ: D.Z. Sophianos, Ἅγιος Νικολάος ὁ ἐν Βουναίνῃ. Ἀνέκδοτα ἁγιολογικὰ κείμενα. Ἱστορικαὶ εἰδήσεις περὶ τῆς μεσαιωνικῆς Θεσσαλίας (Ι' αἰών), Athens 1972, pp. 31-34. Theodore of Cythera: N.A. Oikonomides, "Ὁ βίος τοῦ ἁγίου Θεοδώρου Κυθήρων (10ος αἰ.)(12 Μαΐου - BHG^3, ἀρ. 2430)," in Πρακτικὰ Τρίτου Πανιονίου συνεδρίου 23-29 Σεπτεμβρίου 1965, Athens 1967, edd. P.K. Bouboulides/M.G. Nystazopoulos, vol. 1, pp. 264-291.

197. Ἐπιτίμιον in the sense of "punishment": Vita Petri Athoniti 2.1 (BHG 1505) ed. Lake, p. 22.17. Forgiveness through pietas to the saint's relics: Vita Petri Athoniti 7.3, p. 37.34-35.

198. Vita Lucae Iunioris 28 (BHG 944) ed. Martini, p. 96.24-25...29-33: καὶ πείθον ἀνακαλύψαι τὰ ἡμαρτημένα πρὸς σὲ καὶ συχνώμης φιλανθρώπως ἐπιτυχεῖν. ...μνήσθητι ὅτι προφητικὸν ἐπίταγμα ἀριαμβεύειν τὰ τῆς ἰσχύνης ἔργα καὶ δικαιοῦσθαι, καλὸς ἀκούσῃ καὶ ἐπὶ τούτῳ πάντως κεκίνηκεν ἡμᾶς ὁ σωθῆναι πάντας θέλων Θεός, ἵνα καρπὸν δικαιοσύνης τὴν ἡμῶν προξενήσῃ σοι σωτηρίαν.

199. Vita Lucae Iunioris 28 (BHG 944) ed. Martini, pp. 96.35-36...97.3-4: πείθεται μόλις, καὶ τὴν τῶν κρυφίων ἐξαγόρευσιν δέχεται. ... εἶθ' οὕτως ἐντυχοῦσι τῷ μακαρίῳ καὶ ἄφεσιν μὲν ὑπὲρ τῶν φθασάντων, ἀσφάλειαν δὲ λαβοῦσι καὶ πρὸς τὸ μέλλον, ἀπεύχοντο.

200. The sins were probably sexual in nature: καὶ τὸ βάρος τῆς συνεχούσης ἀλίτχεως μὴ παρόντι πῦρ καὶ ἐγκάρδιον, πῦρ ἀφανὲς τὸ φλέγον ἡμᾶς (Vita Lucae Iunioris 28 [BHG 944] ed. Martini, p. 96. 22-24). Luke's refusal to hear the women's confessions does not betray any canonical scruples about his unordained status; it stems rather from the dangers to chastity of hearing the confessions of women: Vita Lucae Iunioris 29, p. 97.5-8 and cf. n. 159 above; Chapter Two, n. 137; Chapter Three, n. 367 and also in the present chapter, n. 42 above.

201. It is important to notice that these confessions are voluntary, whereas so many of the hagiographical examples of confession before the ninth century had to be provoked in some manner by the confessors themselves.

202. Vita Lucae Iunioris 31 (BHG 994) ed. Combefis, PG 111.448C.

203. Vita Lucae Iunioris 31 (BHG 994) ed. Combefis, PG 111.448C-449B. The very act of confessing is expected by Luke to be of benefit to the sinner; cf. Chapter Four, n. 86 above.

204. Vita Lucae Iunioris 31 (BHG 994) ed. Combefis, PG 111.449A-B: Ὁ δὲ καὶ κανόσιν ἀσφαλίζεται τοῖς αὐτῷ φοιτοῖς.... Οὕτω παραγγείλας, ἀφίησιν οἴκαδε, καθαρὰν ἐπίγνωσιν αὐτῷ τοῦ καλοῦ καὶ τῆς ἁμαρτίας κατάγνωσιν ἐμβαλών, καὶ πολλὴν εἰσενεγκεῖν ἐπαγγειλάμενον τὴν μετάνοιαν.

205. The man's penance includes: weeping at the grave of the man he murdered; paying for the Liturgy to be celebrated πολυτελῶς on the third, ninth and fortieth days after death; doing three thousand metanies (if possible, at the grave site), and generally spending the rest of his life atoning for the sin. For the liturgical details (and the possibilities of abuse by venal clerics) compare D. Stiernon, "La Vision d'Isaïe de Nicomédie," REB 35 (1977) 5-42 at pp. 30-36.

206. Forgiveness: Vita Lucae Iunioris 32 (lay), 49 (monastic) (BHG 994) ed. Martini, pp. 98.24-27, 103.22-24 and Vita Lucae Iunioris 50, 65 (?) ed. Combefis, PG 111.460B-C, 473A. Ἐπιτίμιον: Vita Lucae Iunioris 51, ed. Martini, p. 104.3. The reference in Vita 24, ed. Combefis, PG 111.445C to the ἀποστολικὸν σχῆμα is not a claim for apostolic powers in the monastic σχῆμα so much as an expression of the common belief that the band of the apostles were the first to

live the monastic life. See, for example, Vita Anastasii 1 (BHG 84) ed. Usener, p. 1a.26-27: ἀγγελικὴν δὲ πολιτείαν ἐπὶ γῆς κατεφύτευσεν.

207. John of Damascus: Beck, Kirche..., p. 567 and J.-M. Sauget, "Giovanni Damasceno, santo," BS 6.732-739, Rome 1965, especially cc. 732-734. Barlaam et Joasaph: the most recent discussion with bibliography in B. Studer, "Le Roman de Barlaam et de Joasaph," DSp 8.464-466, Paris 1974 with CPG 8120.

208. Πατὴρ πνευματικός: Vita Ioannis Damasceni 28-32 (BHG 884) ed. Le Quien, PG 94.469A-473A; Vita Barlaam et Ioasaph 21.184, 37.345, 38.348, 39.350, 40.359 (BHG 224) edd. Woodward/Mattingly, pp. 308, 576, 580, 582, 598. Monastic forgiveness: Vita Barlaam et Ioasaph 40.361, p. 602. Desire for ἄφεσις before death: Vita Ioannis Damasceni 8, PG 94.441A: Τούτου προσέπιπτον τοῖς ποσὶν οἱ ἐλκόμενοι πρὸς σφαγὴν, ἐλιπάρουν ἵλεων αὐτοῖς τὸν Θεὸν ποιήσασθαι, καὶ ὑπὲρ ὧν ἡμαρτήκασιν, ἄφεσιν εὑρεῖν τῷ φιλανθρώπῳ ἐπεύχεσθαι.

209. Vita Barlaam et Ioasaph 11.93-99 (BHG 224) edd. Woodward/Mattingly, pp. 156-166. ἄφεσις is used of post-baptismal forgiveness in Vita Barlaam et Ioasaph 11.93, p. 156.

210. Vita Barlaam et Ioasaph 11.98-99 (BHG 224) edd. Woodward/Mattingly, p. 166.

211. Da Costa-Louillet: "Saints de Sicile...," pp. 113-124 and F. Russo, "Elia Speleota, da Reggio Calabria, monaco, santo," BS 4.1052-1053. The Lives of Christopher and Macarius (BHG 312) and of Sabas (BHG 1611) are ascribed to the period 991-1006 by Da Costa-Louillet ("Saints de Sicile...," pp. 132-133) and so will not be included here. The evidence for ecclesiastical penance in these Lives does not in any case change the historical picture already drawn to this point.

212. Confession: Vita Eliae Spelaeotis 41 (BHG 581) ed. Stiltingh, p. 864E-F: ἐξομολογεῖσθαι πρὸ πάντων τὰ ἐν γνώσει καὶ ἐν ἀγνοίᾳ πλημμελήματα, ὡς χωρὶς οὐδεὶς ἀφέσεως τεύξεται. Worthy communion: Εἴ τις ὑπομνήσει κακίας ἔοικωτι, εἴ τις ὑπὸ ἁρπαγῆς, ἢ πλεονεξίας κεκράτηται, εἴ τις ὑπὸ λαιβοῦ σαρκικοῦ καὶ πάσης ἀκαθαρσίας βεβορβόρωται, μὴ τολμήσει προσελθεῖν τῷ θείῳ τούτῳ πυρὶ, πρὶν ἢ διὰ προσηκούσης μετανοίας ἑαυτοῦ διορθώσῃ. (Vita Eliae Spelaeotis 17, p. 853B). The forgiveness of the woman in chapter 25 by the unordained Elias is not so much absolution as a πληροφορία (Vita Eliae Spelaeotis 25, pp. 857C/858D): Εἰ ὅλως ἀπὸ τοῦ νῦν σωφρόνως βιώσεις, καὶ πέρας ἐπέλθῃς τοῖς σφάλμασί σου, Κύριος ἀφελεῖ τὰ ἁμαρτήματά σου.

213. A curious incident in Vita Eliae Spelaeotis 51 (BHG 581) ed. Stiltingh, p. 868E may also imply that the ceremony of tonsure was thought to secure the forgiveness of sins, followed as it was by Eucharistic communion, but the text is too compressed to permit certainty. The principal passage in the Life relating to communion (Vita Eliae Spelaeotis 17, p. 853B-C) is based on the topos of the priest who perceives the spiritual condition of those who approach to receive communion (see Chapter Two, n. 148 above). The passage teaches plainly that the Eucharist forgives the sins of those who live sincerely and receive καθαρῶς... συνειδότι, but the Eucharist in no way functions as a source of automatic forgiveness.

214. For the genre and its problems see H. Delehaye, Synaxarium Ecclesiae Constantinopolitanae, Brussels 1902 (= AASS, Propylaeum Novembris), pp. i-vi, li-lxxvi and "Le synaxaire de Sirmond," AB 14(1895) 396-434. To these add J. Noret, "Ménologes, synaxaires, ménées. Essai de clarification d'une terminologie," AB 86(1968) 21-24.

215. Delehaye, Synaxarium..., pp. liii-lvii and cf. also Dobschütz, "Methodius...," pp. 104-105.

216. The list includes: Isaiah the Prophet and the Miracula Isaiae (BHG 958d, 958f), Anna (BHG 2027, 2028 - compare with Anthusa [BHG 2029h] and an unnumbered text, Anna of Leucadia, in Synaxarium..., pp. 837.1-840.3 - the relationship between all these texts remains to be established), Arsenius of Corfou (BHG 2044), Arsenius of Mt. Latro (BHG 2046), Copres (BHG 2081), Visio Cosmae (BHG 2086), Donale (BHG 2110), Donatus (BHG 2113), Eustathius of Kios (BHG 2138), Gregory of Akritas (BHG 2166), Hilarion (BHG 2177b), Horaeozele (BHG 2179, 2180), Ignatius (BHG 2183g), John of Kathara (BHG 2184n), Leo of Calabria (BHG 2233), Metrius (BHG 2272), Paulus hypotacticus (BHG 2363), Phantinus Iunior (BHG 2367), Phosterius (BHG 2373h), Rabbulas (BHG 2378m), Romanos (BHG 2380/2381), Sisoes (BHG 2404i), Sophia (BHG 2404n), Thomas Dephurcinus (BHG 2458), Zenon (BHG 2475n) and Zosimus (BHG 2478). The original Life of Phantinus Iunior (BHG 2366z) has been identified by E. Follieri, but her résumé of its contents suggests that it will contain little to interest the historian of penance: "La Vita inedita di S. Fantino il giovane nel codice Mosquensis 478," in Atti del 4° Congresso storico calabrese, Naples 1969, pp. 17-35. For John of Kathara see D. Stiernon, "Notice sur S. Jean, higoumène du monastère de Kathara [en Bithynie]," REB 28(1970) 111-127.

217. Twenty-nine of the thirty-two texts listed contain no evidence at all for penance. ἔλεγχος: Vita Hilarionis 1 (BHG 2177b) ed. Delehaye, p. 733/4.27, 47. Forgiveness via relics: Vita Arsenii Latrensis 5 (BHG 2046) ed. Delehaye, p. 172.11-13.

218. Vita Sophiae 1 (BHG 2404n) ed. Delehaye, p. 729/30.53-54: καὶ τελευταῖον ἀποκειραμένη πρὸς Κύριον ἐξεδήμησε. Compare Vita Antonii Iunioris 11 (BHG 142) ed. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, pp. 216.27-217.3 and nn. 13 and 105 above. The text here is so compressed, however, that it may simply refer to a late conversion to the monastic veil towards the end of Sophia's life rather than to a deathbed reception of the habit.

219. Cf. Hörmann, Untersuchungen..., pp. 271-281.

220. Hajjar, Le synode permanent..., pp. 130-131 (with references cited there) suggests that the teaching of Symeon the New Theologian about the relationship of Charisma and Amt contributed to the decision to exile him in 1009, but the sources he cites do not confirm this explicitly. For the later reaction see Holl, Enthusiasmus..., pp. 324-330.

CHAPTER SIX: NOTES

1. See Chapter Two, n. 2 above.

2. Socrates, HE 5.19, ed. Hussey, vol. 2, Oxford 1853, p. 615.15-16: συγχωρῆσαι δὲ ἕκαστον τῷ ἰδίῳ συνειδότι τῶν μυστηρίων μετέχειν.

3. ἱερομόναχος is not found in the PGL, nor has the word occurred in the Vitae examined in this study.

4. Practical considerations about the secrecy of confession to the married parish clergy, especially in the circumstances of life in villages and small towns, might have been as important in the early mediaeval period as today (cf. M. Rinvolucri, Anatomy of a Church. Greek Orthodoxy Today, London 1966, p. 28), but there is no trace of this problem in the hagiographical sources.

5. Intercessory prayer: B. Steidle, "Fürbitten in der frühen Christenheit und im ältesten Mönchtum," Erbe und Auftrag 48(1972) 448-460; Dassmann, Sündenvergebung..., pp. 153-182, 419-447.

6. The further sense of συγχώρησις as an "indulgence", that is, as a decision not to proceed with the prescribed canonical sanctions (cf., for example, Chapter Three, p. 93 with n.209 above), is relevant only in the case of ordained ministers actually in charge of the institutions of ecclesiastical penance. The dispute about the sacramental nature of penance in the Byzantine church is too complex a question to be resolved in a short space at the end of a study like the present one, but it is hoped that enough relevant evidence has been gathered in these pages to make a material contribution to a fresh examination of the question.

7. Halkin, "L'hagiographie byzantine...," p. 347.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

The bibliography is in four parts: A. Index Codicum; B. Index Vitarum; C. General Works and Works Relating to the History of Byzantine Penance; D. Works Relating to Byzantine Hagiography. The bibliography includes only the sources and works cited in the thesis. Notices of individual saints in the Bibliotheca Sanctorum have been omitted and the bibliography was closed in August of 1979. Transliteration of Russian follows the system of the Slavonic and East European Review.

A. INDEX CODICUM

Grottaferrata,	Cryptoferratensis B.β.5	(BHG 1371z)
Oxford,	Holkham gr. 43	(BHG 1372b, 2372)
Oxford,	Laudianus gr. 81	(BHG 186a, 384b)
Paris,	Coislinianus gr. 301	(BHG 1371z)
Rome,	Vaticanus gr. 1591	(BHG 58-62, 1410)

B. INDEX VITARUM

ABERCIUS

BHG 2 — T. Nissen, Sancti Abercii Vita, Leipzig 1912, pp. 3.1-55.19.

ABRAHAM ET MARIA

BHG 6 — J.S. Assemani, Sancti patris nostri Ephraem Syri opera omnia quae exstant Graece, Syriace, Latine, in sex tomos distributa, Rome 1743, vol. 2, pp. 1A-20F.

BHG 7 — E. Thwaites, Sanctus Ephraem Syrus, Oxford, 1709, pp. ٢٧.b.1-٢٧δ.a.29.

ABRAAMES

BHG 9 — J. Sirmond, PG 82. 1420B-1425B.

ABRAMIUS

BHG 12 — E. Schwartz, Kyrillos von Skythopolis, [=TU 49.2] Leipzig 1939, pp. 243.20-247.22.

ACACIUS

BHG 13 — G. Henskens, PG 115.217B-240B.

ACEPSIMAS

BHG 14 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1413D-1417B.

AGAPE IRENE ET CHIONE

BHG 34 — H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 280.1/292.14.

AGAPETUS

BHG 35 — B. Latyshev, Menologii anonymi byzantini saeculi X quae supersunt, St. Petersburg 1911, vol. 1, pp. 93.1-106.19.

AGATHA

BHG 38 — E. Mioni, AB 68(1950) 76.1-93.12.

AGATHONICUS

BHG 40 — G. van Hooff, AB 2(1883) 99.1-115.20.

ALBIANUS

BHG 2020 — P. Poussines, PG 79.696A-712A.

ALEXANDER ACOEMETA

BHG 47 — E. de Stoop, PO 6:5.658.1-701.12.

ALEXIUS

BHG 51 — F.M. Esteves Pereira, AB 19(1900) 243.1-253.22.

BHG 56c — M. Rösler, Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie 53(1933) 508.1-511.29.

ALPHIUS, PHILADELPHUS, CYRINUS ET SOCII

BHG 57 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS May 2, pp. 772A-788F.

BHG 58 — Ms. Vaticanus gr. 1591, ff. 147^{v} a.1-153^{v}a.16.

BHG 59 — Ms. Vaticanus gr. 1591, ff. 153^{v} a.17-165^{v}a.30.

BHG 60 — Ms. Vaticanus gr. 1591, ff. 165^{v} b.1-182^{r}b.20.

BHG 61 — Ms. Vaticanus gr. 1591, ff. 182^{r} b.21-204^{r}b.31.

BHG 62 — Ms. Vaticanus gr. 1591, ff. 204^{r} b.32-216^{v}b.18.

ALYPIUS

BHG 65 — H. Delehaye, Les saints stylites,

Brussels/Paris 1923, pp. 148.1-169.18.

BHG 66d — F. Halkin, Inédits byzantins d'Ochrida, Candie et Moscou, Brussels 1963, pp. 170-208.

AMPHILOCHIUS

BHG 73 — F. Combefis, PG 39.13C-25D.

ANASTASIA

BHG 78 — F. Combefis, PG 105.336B-372D.

BHG 79 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 51.3-53.29.

BHG 80 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 54.1-56.29.

BHG 80e — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 57.1-59.33.

ANASTASIUS

BHG 84 — H. Usener, Acta M. Anastasii Persae, Bonn 1894, pp. 1a.1-12b.16.

BHG 86 — A. Pertusi, AB 76(1958) 32.1-63.20.

BHG 88 — Usener, pp. 12a.17-14b.21.

BHG 89 — Usener, pp. 14a.23-20b.23.

BHG 90 — Usener, pp. 20a.24-28b.6.

ANATOLIUS

BHG 91 — J. Pien, AASS Jul. 1, pp. 659B-666E.

ANDREAS APOSTOLUS

BHG 95 — M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1898, vol. 2.1, pp. 38.1-45.33.

BHG 99 — M. Bonnet, AB 13(1894) 354.1-372.29.

BHG 100	M. Bonnet, AB 13(1894) 311.1-352.6.
BHG 102	A. Dressel, PG 120.216C-260B.

ANDREAS APOSTOLUS ET MATTHIAS

BHG 109	M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1898, vol. 2. 1, pp. 65.1-116.15.

ANDREAS IN CRISI

BHG 111	E. Carpentier, AASS Oct. 8, pp. 135B-142D.

ANDREAS CRETENSIS

BHG 113	A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 5:169.1-179.11, 422.28-424.3.

ANDREAS SALUS

BHG 117	C. Janninck, PG 111.627B-888D; S. Murray, A Study of the Life of Andreas the Fool for the Sake of Christ, Borna/Leipzig 1910, pp. 85.1-106.6; L. Rydén, DOP 28 (1974) 201-214.

ANDRONICUS ET ATHANASIA

BHG 121	L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 370.1-375.16, 384.6-387.19.

ANNA IUNIOR

BHG 2027	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 173/4.16, 175/6.11-57, 178. 43-46.

ANNA LEUCADIENSIS

	J. Pien, AASS Jul. 5, pp. 486F-487C.

ANNA MONIALIS

BHG 2028 — C. Bonner, Byzantion 16(1942-1943) 145.1-146.29.

ANTHUSA

BHG 2029h — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 847/8.54-58, 849/850.49-61, 851/2.53.

ANTONIUS EREMITA

BHG 139 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, Monumenta Graeca et Latina ad historiam Photii patriarchae pertinentia, St. Petersburg 1899, pp. 1.1-25.11.

BHG 140 — J. Loppin/B. de Montfaucon, PG 26.835A-976B.

ANTONIUS IUNIOR

BHG 142 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, PPS 19.3(1907) 186.1-216.25; F. Halkin, AB 62(1944) 210.1-223.15.

APHRAATES

BHG 147 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 372/404.

APOCALYPSIS METHODII

BHG 2036 — A. Lolos, Die Apokalypse des Ps-Methodios, Meisenheim-am-Glan 1976, pp. 46/140.

BHG 2036a — Lolos, pp. 47/141.

APOLLINARIA

BHG 148 — J. Drescher, Three Coptic Legends. Hilaria, Archellites, The Seven Sleepers, Cairo 1947, pp. 152.1-161.4.

APOLLONIUS

E. Schwartz, Eusebius Werke 2.1, [=GCS 9.1] Leipzig 1903, p. 486. 3-19.

APOSTOLI ET DISCIPULI DOMINI

BHG 151/152 — T. Schermann, Prophetarum vitae fabulosae. Indices apostolorum discipulorumque Domini Dorotheo, Epiphanio, Hippolyto aliisque vindicata, Leipzig 1907, pp. 132. 1-160.3.

APPHIANUS ET AEDESIUS

BHG 161 — H. Delehaye, AB 16(1897) 122.1-127.19.

ARCHIPPUS

BHG 2039 — F. Halkin, Kyriakon. Festschrift Johannes Quasten, [edd. P. Granfield/J.A. Jungmann] Münster 1970, vol. 2, pp. 578.1-579.15.

ARETHAS

BHG 166 — E. Carpentier, AASS Oct. 10, pp. 721C-759A.

ARSENIUS ANACHORETA

BHG 168 — N.S. Phirippides, Ἐκκλησιαστικὸς Φάρος 34(1935) 37.1-55.11, 189.8-201.35.

BHG 169 — T. Nissen, Byzantinisch-Neugriechische Jahrbücher 1(1920) 246.1-262.34.

ARSENIUS CORCYRAEUS

BHG 2044 — N. Boulgaris, Αἱ θεῖαι καὶ ἱεραὶ ἀκολουθίαι Σπυρίδωνος... καὶ Νήσου Κερκύρας, Venice 1674, pp. ιβ΄ - ιδ΄.

ARSENIUS LATRENSIS

BHG 2046 — H. Delehaye, Milet. Ergebnisse der Ausgrabungen und Untersuchungen seit dem Jahre 1899, [ed. T. Wiegand] Berlin 1913, vol. 3.1, pp. 171.12-172.15.

ARTEMIUS

BHG 170 — A. Mai, PG 96.1252A-1320A.

BHG 173 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, Varia Graeca Sacra, St. Petersburg 1909, pp. 1.1-75.19.

ASCLEPIUS

BHG 176 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1464B-1464D.

ATHANASIA

BHG 180 — J. Pien, AASS Aug. 3, pp. 170B-175B [Latin only].

ATHANASIUS ALEXANDRINUS

BHG 184 — E. Bekker, PG 104.132B-157A.

BHG 185 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 25.ccxxiiiC-ccxlviB.

BHG 186 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.1081A-1128C.

BHG 186a — Ms. Laudianus Graecus 81, ff.1^{r}-8^{v}.

ATHANASIUS METHONENSIS

BHG 196 — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:3.31.1-51.10.

AUTONOMUS

BHG 198 — J.-B. Malou, PG 115.692A-697C.

AUXENTIUS

BHG 199 — J.-B. Malou, PG 114.1377A-1436D.

BHG 201 — L. Clugnet, ROC 8(1903) 1.1-14.17.

AUXIBIUS

BHG 204 — A. Papageorgiou, Ἀπόστολος Βαρνάβας 30(1969) 13.1-24.2.

BABYLAS

BHG 207 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.527.1-534.21.

BHG 208 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.533.22-572.9.

BACCHUS

BHG 209 — F. Combefis, Christi martyrum lecta trias, Paris 1666, pp. 61.1-126.11.

BARADATUS

BHG 211 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1484C-1485D.

BARLAAM

BHG 221 — H. Delehaye, AB 22(1903) 139.1-145.18.

BHG 222 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.675.20-682.56.

BARLAAM ET IOASAPH

BHG 224 — J.F. Boissonade, [St. John Damascene] Barlaam and Ioasaph, [edd. G.R. Woodward/H. Mattingly/D.M. Lang] London 1967^2, pp. 2.1/610.9.

BARNABAS

BHG 225 — M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1903, vol. 1, pp. 292.1-302.8.

BARTHOLOMAEUS

BHG 227 — M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1898, vol. 2. 1, pp. 128.7-150.13.

BHG 228 — A. Vasiliyev, Anecdota Graeco-Byzantina I, Moscow 1893, pp. 10.24-22.30; A. Wilmart/E. Tisserant, Revue biblique NS 10 (1913) 185.1-190.5, 321.1-333.4.

BASILEUS

BHG 239 — G. Henskens, AASS Apr. 3, pp. 1C-1vD.

BHG 240 — G. Henskens, AASS Apr. 3, pp. 1viB-1xD.

BASILIUS IUNIOR

BHG 263 — G. Henskens/D. van Papenbroek, AASS Mar. 3, pp. *24A-*39C.

BASILIUS MAGNUS

BHG 244 — F. Morel/C. Morel, PG 46.788C-817D.

BHG 245 — F. Boulenger, Grégoire de Nazianze. Discours funèbres, Paris 1908, pp. 58.1/230.23.

BHG 245b — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 38.72A-75A.

BHG 247-247e — F. Combefis, Ss. Patrum Amphilochii Iconiensis, Methodii Patarensis et Andreae Cretensis opera omnia, quae reperiri potuerunt, Paris 1644, pp. 155A-177C.

BHG 248-252 — Combefis, pp. 177D-188A.

BHG 253 — L. Radermacher, Griechische Quellen zur Faustsage, [=SAWW/PHK 206.4] Vienna/Leipzig 1927, pp. 122.1/148.3.

BHG 254-259 — Combefis, pp. 197C-225D.

BHG 261 — Combefis, pp. 10A-22D.

BHG 262 — F. Combefis, PG 97.913A-932A.

BHG 262k — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.84.1-86.19.

BENIAMIN

BHG 2061 — G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 54/56.

BERNICA, PROSDOCA ET DOMNINA

BHG 274 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.629.1-640.65.

BHG 275 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.641.1-644.61.

BLASIUS AMORIENSIS

BHG 278 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 657C-669D.

CAESARIUS

BHG 286 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35. 756A-788D.

CARPUS ET SOCII

BHG 293 — H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 22.1/28.14.

CHARITON

BHG 300ż — G. Garitte, Bulletin de l' Institut historique belge de Rome 21(1940/1941) 16.1-46.15.

CHRISTOPHORUS ET MACARIUS

BHG 312 — G. Cozza-Luzi, Studi e documenti di storia e diritto 12(1892) 375a.1-400a.16.

CLEMENS ROMANUS

BHG 319-341 — B. Rehm/J. Irmscher, Die Pseudoklementinen. I Homilien, [=GCS 42] Berlin 1953, pp. 1.1-281.25.

CONON

BHG 2077 — R. Trautmann/R. Klostermann, Zeitschrift für slavische Philologie 11(1934) 299.25-320.30.

CONSTANTINUS IMPERATOR

BHG 361x — F. Winkelmann, Eusebius Werke 1.1. Uber das Leben des Kaisers Konstantin, [=GCS] Berlin 1975, pp. 1.1-151.8.

BHG 361y — I.A. Heikel, Eusebius Werke 1, [=GCS 6] Leipzig 1902, pp. 149.1-192.32.

BHG 361z — Heikel, pp. 193.1-259.32.

BHG 364 — M. Guidi, Rendiconti della Reale Accademia dei Lincei. Classe di scienze morali, storiche e filologiche, Serie 5, 16(1907) 306.1-340.8, 637.1-655.12.

BHG 365 — H.G. Opitz, Byzantion 9(1934) 545.1-590.28.

BHG 365n — F. Halkin, AB 77(1959) 73-105, 371-372.

BHG 366 — J. Gretser, De Cruce Christi, Ingolstadt 1600, vol. 2, pp. 547-548.

BHG 369g — N. Franco, Roma e l'Oriente 6 (1913) 44.1-48.40, 309.1-326.22.

CONSTANTINUS IUDAEUS

BHG 370 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 628B-656D.

COPRES

BHG 2081 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 75/6.41-57, 77/8.31-39.

COPRES ET PATERMUTHIUS

BHG 2083 — A.-J. Festugière, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Brussels 1961, pp. 75-89.

COSMAS

BHG 2086 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 107/8.49-56, 109/110.18-57, 111/2.18-56, 113/4.22-51.

COSMAS ET DAMIANUS

BHG 372 — L. Deubner, Kosmas und Damian. Texte und Einleitung, Leipzig/ Berlin 1907, pp. 87-96.

BHG 377a — Deubner, pp. 41.1-42.9.

BHG 384b — Ms. Laudianus gr. 81, ff. 126^{r}.1-132^{r}.23.

BHG 385/386 — Deubner, pp. 97-121.

BHG 387 — Deubner, pp. 122-153.

BHG 388 — Deubner, pp. 153-168.

CYPRIANUS

BHG 452 — L. Radermacher, Griechische Quellen zur Faustsage, [=SAWW/PHK 206.4] Vienna/Leipzig 1927, pp. 76.1-112.8.

BHG 453 — J. Clé, AASS Sept. 7, pp. 222D-241C.

BHG 455 — J. Clé, AASS Sept. 7, pp. 242F-245A.

BHG 457 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35. 1169A-1193C.

BHG 458/459 — A. Ludwich, Index Lectionum in Regia Academia Albertina per aestatem 1893 habendarum, Königsberg 1893, pp. 7-37.

CYRIACUS

BHG 463 — E. Schwartz, Kyrillos von Skythopolis,[=TU 49.2] Leipzig 1939, pp. 222.20-235.24.

CYRICUS ET IULITTA

BHG 314 — G. van Hooff, AB 1(1882) 194.1-200.13.

BHG 315 — G. van Hooff, AB 1(1882) 201.1-207.19.

CYRILLUS ALEXANDRINUS

BHG 2095 — Hippolytos (Archimandrite), Νέα Σιών 17(1922) 593.1-599.22.

CYRUS ET IOANNES

BHG 472-474 — A. Mai, PG 77.1100C-1105B.

BHG 475/476 — A. Mai, PG 87:3.3380A-3421C.

BHG 477-479 — N. Fernandez-Marcos, Los Thaumata de Sofronio. Contribución al Estudio de la Incubatio cristiana, Madrid 1975, pp. 243. 1-400. 13.

DALMATUS

BHG 482 — A. Banduri, Imperium orientale sive antiquitates Constantinopolitanae, Paris 1711, vol. 2, pp. 697A-710C.

DANIEL SCETIOTA

BHG 2100 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 71.1-73.7.

DANIEL STYLITA

BHG 489 — H. Delehaye, Les saints stylites, Brussels/Paris 1923, pp. 1.1-94. 5.

BHG 490e — Delehaye, pp. 95.1-103.29.

DASIUS

BHG 491 — F. Cumont, AB 16(1897) 11.1-15. 10.

DAVID THESSALONICENSIS

BHG 492y — Fronton de Duc/J.-B. Cotelier, PG 87:3.2921B-2924A.

BHG 493 — V. Rose, Leben des heiligen David von Thessalonike, Berlin 1887, pp. 3.1-15.18.

DAVID, SYMEON ET GEORGIUS

BHG 494 — I.M. Phoundoules, Λεσβιακὸν Ἑορτολόγιον Γ΄. Οἱ ὅσιοι ἀδελφοὶ Δαβὶδ Συμεὼν καὶ Γεώργιος οἱ ὁμολογηταί, Athens 1961, pp. 17.1-54.32.

DEMETRIANUS

BHG 495 — H. Grégoire, BZ 16(1907) 217-237.

DEMETRIUS

BHG 496 — H. Delehaye, Les légendes grecques des saints militaires, Paris 1909, pp. 259.1-263.5.

BHG 500-512 — C. de Bye, PG 116.1204A-1293C.

BHG 512 — A. Tougard, De l'histoire profane dans les Actes grecs des Bollandistes, Paris 1874, pp. 88-98.

BHG 513 — C. de Bye, PG 116.1293C-1316B; Tougard, pp. 98-116.

BHG 516 — C. de Bye, PG 116.1316C-1324C.

BHG 517-522 — C. de Bye, PG 116.1325A-1384B.

BHG 524-531 — C. de Bye, PG 116.1384C-1397C.

BHG 534 — T. Ioannou, Μνημεῖα Ἁγιολογικά, Venice 1884, pp. 40.1-53.29.

DIOMEDES

BHG 551 — L.G. Westerink, AB 84(1966) 167.1-177.21.

DIONYSIUS AREOPAGITA

BHG 556 — P. Lanssel, PG 4.617A-668D.

DOMETIUS

BHG 560 — J. van den Gheyn, AB 19(1900) 286.1-317.5.

DOMNICA

BHG 562 — T. Ioannou, Μνημεῖα Ἁγιολογικά, Venice 1884, pp. 268.14-284.13.

DOMNINA

BHG 563 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1492D-1496D.

DONATUS

BHG 2113 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, p. 643/4.1-36.

DOROTHEUS

BHG 2116z — L. Régnault/J. de Préville, Dorothée de Gaza. Oeuvres spirituelles, [=SC 92] Paris 1963, pp. 110/120.

DOSITHEUS

BHG 2117 — L. Régnault/J. de Préville, Dorothée de Gaza. Oeuvres spirituelles, [=SC 92] Paris 1963, pp. 122/144.

DROSIS

BHG 566 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.683.1-694.14.

ELIAS IUNIOR

BHG 578 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, PPS 19.3(1907) 42.1-45.8.

BHG 578/579 — F. Combefis, Christi martyrum lecta trias, Paris 1666, pp. 155.1-206.17.

ELIAS IUNIOR SICULUS

BHG 580 — G. Rossi-Taibbi, Vita di Sant' Elia il Giovane, Palermo 1962, pp. 2/122.

ELIAS SPELAEOTES

BHG 581 — J. Stiltingh, AASS Sept. 3, pp. 848E-887B.

ELISABETH

BHG 2121 — F. Halkin, AB 91(1973) 251.1-264.13.

EPHRAEM

BHG 583 — F. Morel/C. Morel, PG 46.820A-849D.

BHG 592 — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.101.23-103.32.

EPICHARIS

BHG 2123 — F. Halkin, Inédits byzantins d' Ochrida, Candie et Moscou, Brussels 1963, pp. 341-345.

EPIPHANIUS

BHG 596 — G. Dindorf, Epiphanii episcopi Constantiae opera, Leipzig 1859, vol. 1, pp. 3.1-45.3.

BHG 597/598 — Dindorf, pp. 45.4-78.12.

BHG 599 — Dindorf, pp. xxxi.26-xxxv.19.

EUDOCIMUS

BHG 607 — Kh. Loparev, Pamyatniki drevney pis´mennosti 96(1893) 1b.1-23b.12.

EUDOXIUS ET SOCII

BHG 1604 — J. van de Velde, PG 115.617C-633A.

EUGENIUS ET MARIA

BHG 615 — M. Richard, Corona Gratiarum. Miscellanea patristica, historica et liturgica Eligio Dekkers O.S.B. XII lustra complenti oblata, Bruges 1975, vol. 1, pp. 87-94.

BHG 615a — L. Clugnet, Vie et office de sainte Marine, Paris 1915, pp. 39. 1.-41.6.

BHG 615b — Clugnet, pp. 52.1-54.6.

EULOGIUS

BHG 618 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 254.1-261.22.

EUPHEMIA

BHG 619d — F. Halkin, Euphémie de Chalcédoine. Légendes byzantines, Brussels 1965, pp. 131-33.17.

BHG 623 — C. Datema, Asterius of Amasea. Homilies I-XIV. Text, Introduction and Notes, Leiden 1970, pp. 153. 1-155.17.

BHG 624 — Halkin, pp. 110.1-139.16.

EUPHROSYNA

BHG 625 — A. Boucherie, AB 2(1883) 196.1-205.13.

EUPRAXIA

BHG 631 — G. Henskens/D. van Papenbroek, AASS Mar. 2, 727C-735F.

EUSEBIA

BHG 633 — T. Nissen, AB 56(1938) 106.1-117.23.

EUSEBIUS ALEXANDRINUS

BHG 635 — A. Mai, PG 86:1.297B-309D.

BHG 635a — A. Mai, PG 86:1.313A-324D.

BHG 635b — B. de Montfaucon, PG 62.721.13-724.51.

BHG 635c — A. Mai, PG 86:1.413D-421C.

BHG 635d — F. Nau, ROC 13(1908) 415.7-420.5.

BHG 635e — A. Mai, PG 86:1.452C-461A.

BHG 635f — A. Mai, PG 86:1.324D-328B.

BHG 635g — A. Mai, PG 86:1.328C-332C.

BHG 635h — A. Mai, PG 86:1.332D-341C.

BHG 635i — A. Mai, PG 86:1.341D-349B.

BHG 635j — B. de Montfaucon, PG 61.783.26-786.31.

BHG 635k — A. Mai, PG 86:1.349B-353B.

BHG 635kb — A. Mai, PG 86:1.353B-357A.

BHG 635m — A. Mai, PG 86:1.357A-361D.

BHG 635n — A. Mai, PG 86:1.364A-365B.

BHG 635nb — A. Mai, PG 86:1.365B-372B.

BHG 635p — A. Mai, PG 86:1.372C-380A.

BHG 635q — A. Mai, PG 86:1.380A-384B.

BHG 635r — J. Augusti, PG 86:1.509A-525A.

BHG 635t — B. de Montfaucon, PG 64.45.14-48.21.

BHG 635u — B. de Montfaucon, PG 61.733.48-738.6.

BHG 635v — J. Augusti, PG 86:1.525A-536B.

BHG 635wa — A. Mai, PG 86:1.384C-405/6.

BHG 635y — B. de Montfaucon, PG 61.775.22-778.29.

BHG 635z — A. Mai, PG 86:1.424A-452C.

EUSEBIUS CORYPHENSIS

BHG 636 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 290/326.

EUSEBIUS SAMOSATENSIS

BHG 2133 — F. Halkin, AB 85(1967) 9.1-15.14.

EUSTATHIUS ANTIOCHENUS

BHG 644 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.597.1-606.17.

EUSTATHIUS CONFESSOR

BHG 2138 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, p. 569/570.30-37.

EUSTATHIUS ET SOCII

BHG 643 — F. Combefis, PG 105.376A-417B.

EUSTOLIA ET SOPATRA

BHG 2141 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 217B-219E.

EUSTRATIUS

BHG 645 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 4:367.1-400.28 and 5:408.16-410.18.

EUSTRATIUS ET SOCII

BHG 646 — J.-B. Malou, PG 116.468B-505D.

EUTHYMIUS ABBAS

BHG 647/648 — E. Schwartz, Kyrillos von Skythopolis, [=TU 49.2] Leipzig 1939, pp. 3.1-85.4.

BHG 649 — J.B. Cotelier, PG 114.596A-733C.

EUTHYMIUS IUNIOR

BHG 655 — L. Petit, ROC 8(1903) 168.1-205.4.

EUTHYMIUS PATRIARCHA

BHG 651 — P. Karlin-Hayter, Byzantion 25-27(1955-1957) 8.1/152.18.

BHG 652 — M. Jugie, PO 16:3.489.1-498.35.

EUTHYMIUS SARDENSIS

BHG 2145 — J. Gouillard, BZ 53(1960) 37-40.

BHG 2146 — A. Papadakis, Traditio 26(1970) 68-89.

EUTROPIUS, CLEONICUS ET BASILISCUS

BHG 656 — H. Delehaye, Les légendes grecques des saints militaires, Paris 1909, pp. 202.1-213.30.

EUTYCHIUS

BHG 657 — G. Henskens, PG 86:2.2273C-2389B.

EVARISTUS

BHG 2153 — C. van de Vorst, AB 41(1923) 295.1-325.22.

FEBRONIA

BHG 659 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS Jun. 5, pp. 17C-35A.

FLACILLA [PLACILLA]

BHG 1548 — A. Spira, Gregorii Nysseni Opera. Sermones Pars I, Leiden 1967, vol. 9, pp. 475.1-490.2.

GALACTION ET EPISTEME

BHG 665 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 3, pp. 35A-41D.

BHG 666 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 3, pp. 41C-45F.

GEORGIUS AMASTRENSIS

BHG 668 — V. Vasil'yevsky, Russko-Vizantiyskiya izsl'edovaniya vypusk' vtoroy zhitiya svyatago Georgiya Amastridskago i Stefana Surozhskago, St. Petersburg 1893, pp. 1.1-73.16.

GEORGIUS CHOZEBITA

BHG 669 — C. Houze, AB 7(1888) 97.1-144.10, 336.2-359.17.

GEORGIUS MARTYR

BHG 672 — K. Krumbacher, Der heilige Georg in der griechischen Überlieferung, [=AKBAW/PPHK 25.3] Munich 1911, pp. 41.1-51.12.

BHG 675z — Krumbacher, pp. 181.1-182.23.

BHG 676 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS Apr. 3, pp. ixA-xvD.

BHG 681 — F. Combefis, PG 97.1169C-1192C.

BHG 684 — Krumbacher, pp. 78.1-81.7.

BHG 684d — Krumbacher, pp. 81.8-83.38.

BHG 687 — J.B. Aufhauser, Das Drachenwunder

des heiligen Georg in der griechischen und lateinischen Überlieferung, Leipzig 1911, pp. 52.1-69.4.

GEORGIUS MYTILENENSIS

BHG 2163 — I.M. Phoundoules, Δεσβινικὸν Ἑορτολόγιον Α΄. Οἱ ἅγιοι Γεώργιοι ἀρχιεπίσκοποι Μυτιλήνης, Athens 1959, pp. 33.1-43.13.

GERASIMUS

BHG 693 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 4:175.1-184.15 and 5:396.12-33.

BHG 694 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, PPS 19.3(1907) 115.1-123.5.

BHG 695 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, PPS 19.3(1907) 124.1-135.4.

GERMANUS

BHG 697 — L. Lamza, Patriarch Germanos I von Konstantinopel (715-730). Versuch einer endgültigen chronologischen Fixierung des Lebens und Wirkens des Patriarchen, Würzburg 1975, pp. 200/240.

GOLINDUCH

BHG 700 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 4:149.1-174.6 and 5:392.20-395.17.

BHG 701 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 5:395.18-396.11.

BHG 702b — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 4:351.1-356.9 and 5:407.33-408.15.

GORDIUS

BHG 703 — J. Garnier, PG 31.489B-508A.

GORGONIA

BHG 704 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.

789A-817A.

GREGENTIUS

BHG 705 — A. Vasiliyev, VV 14(1907) 39-66.

BHG 706 — A. Gallandi, PG 86:1.621A-784B.

BHG 706h — J.-F. Boissonade, PG 86:1.568A-620C.

GREGORIUS ACRITENSIS

BHG 2166 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 372.22-31, 373.1-16, 374.1-16.

GREGORIUS AGRIGENTINUS

BHG 707 — A. Morcelli, PG 98.549A-716B.

BHG 708 — J.-B. Malou, PG 116.189A-269B.

GREGORIUS DECAPOLITES

BHG 711 — F. Dvornik, La Vie de saint Grégoire le Décapolite et les slaves macédoniens au IXe siècle, Paris 1926, pp. 45.1-75.10.

GREGORIUS ILLUMINATOR

BHG 712 — G. Lafontaine, La version grecque ancienne du livre arménien d'Agathange. Edition critique, Louvain-la-Neuve 1973, pp. 173-345.

GREGORIUS NAZIANZENUS

BHG 723 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.243A-304C.

BHG 725 — J.J. Rizzo, The Encomium of Gregory Nazianzen by Nicetas the Paphlagonian. Greek Text Edited and Translated, Brussels 1976, pp. 19-79.

BHG 727 — I. Sakkelion, Δέλτιον τῆς ἱστορικῆς καὶ ἐθνολογικῆς ἑταιρίας τῆς Ἑλλάδος

2(1885-1889) 264.1-265.16.

BHG 730 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 37.389A-396B.

BHG 730a — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 37.1029A-1166A.

BHG 730b — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 36.457A-492C.

BHG 730c — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.408A-513C.

BHG 730i — O. von Gebhardt, Hieronymus de viris inlustribus in griechischer Übersetzung (Der sogenannte Sophronius), [=TU 14.1b] Leipzig 1896, p. 58.4-20.

BHG 730t — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.828A-832B.

BHG 730u — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.820A-825D.

BHG 730v — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.844A-849C.

BHG 730x — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 36.265A-280D.

GREGORIUS NAZIANZENUS SENIOR

BHG 714 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.985A-1044A.

GREGORIUS NYSSENUS

BHG 716 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 35.832B-841B.

BHG 717 — W. Lackner, Byzantion 38(1968) 52-69.

GREGORIUS PAPA

BHG 721f — E. von Muralt, PG 110.929C-932B.

GREGORIUS THAUMATURGUS

BHG 715 — F. Morel/C. Morel, PG 46.893A-957D.

GURIAS, SAMONAS ET ABIBUS

BHG 740	O. von Gebhardt/E. von Dobschütz, Die Akten der edessenischen Bekenner Gurjas, Samonas und Abibos, [=TU 37.2] Leipzig 1911, pp. 210.1-222.8.

HERACLIDES

BHG 743	F. Halkin, AB 82(1964) 139.1-169.25.

HERMYLUS ET STRATONICUS

BHG 744z	F. Halkin, AB 89(1971) 10.1-20.6.

HILARION
CONSTANTINOPOLITANUS

BHG 2177b	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 731/2.47-58, 733/4.23-54.

HILARION MONACHUS

BHG 751z	R.F. Strout, Studies in the Text Tradition of St. Jerome's Vitae Patrum, [ed. W.A. Oldfather] Urbana 1943, pp. 312.1-332.18.
BHG 752	Strout, pp. 337.1-339.25.
BHG 753	Strout, pp. 347.1-394.10.

HISTORIA LAUSIACA

BHG 1435-1438	G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 4/292.

HISTORIA MONACHORUM
IN AEGYPTO

BHG 1433/1434	A.-J. Festugière, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Brussels 1961, pp. 5-138.

HISTORIA RELIGIOSA

BHG 1439/1440 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 124/508.

BHG 1440 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1412A-1496D.

HORAEOZELE

BHG 2179 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 843/4.51, 845/6.33-61, 847/8. 42.52.

BHG 2180 — F. Halkin, AB 66(1948) 30.19-31. 13.

HYACINTHUS

BHG 757 — F. Combefis, PG 105.417D-440D.

HYPATIUS GANGRENSIS

BHG 759a — S. Ferri, Studi bizantini e neoellenici 3(1931) 75.1-87.14.

BHG 759b — S. Ferri, Studi bizantini e neoellenici 3(1931) 75, 84-86 [in infimis pagellis].

BHG 759c — S. Ferri, Studi bizantini e neoellenici 3(1931) 87.15-102.13; F. Halkin, BZ 44(1951) 255.1-257.20.

HYPATIUS RUFINIANENSIS

BHG 760 — G.J.M. Bartelink, Vie d'Hypatios, [=SC 177] Paris 1971, pp. 62.1/298.14.

IACOBUS EREMITA

BHG 770 — R. Trautmann/R. Klostermann, Zeitschrift für slavische Philologie 12(1935) 278.20-292. 28.

IACOBUS INTERCISUS

BHG 772 — P. Devos, AB 71(1953)178.1-193.4.

BHG 772a	P. Devos, AB 71(1953) 193.5-210.7.
BHG 772b	P. Devos, AB 72(1954) 230.1-248.17.

IACOBUS MONACHUS

BHG 771	J. Sirmond, PG 82.1432A-1452C.

IACOBUS NISIBENUS

BHG 769	P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol.1, pp. 160/192.

IANUARIUS

BHG 773y	P. Franchi de'Cavalieri, Note agiografiche, [SeT 24] Rome 1912, 105.1-114.22.

IGNATIUS ABBAS

BHG 2183g	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 84.1-32, 85.1-13, 86.1-13.

IGNATIUS ANTIOCHENUS

BHG 816	B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.587.1-596.27.

IGNATIUS PATRIARCHA

BHG 817	G.D. Mansi, PG 105.488B-573D.
BHG 818	G.D. Mansi, Sacrorum conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio, Venice 1771, vol. 16, cc. 292A-293E.
BHG 818c	G.D. Mansi, PG 105.856C-861D.

IOANNES APOSTOLUS

BHG 900-911	M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum

Apocrypha, Leipzig 1898, vol. 2. 1, pp. 160.5-215.4.

BHG 916 — T. Zahn, Acta Joannis, Erlangen 1880, pp. 3.1-165.4.

BHG 918p — O. Stählin/L. Früchtel/U. Treu, Clemens Alexandrinus 3, [=GCS 17²] Berlin 1970, pp. 187.27-190. 19.

BHG 922 — C. Tischendorf, Apocalypses apocryphae Mosis, Esdrae, Pauli, Iohannis item Mariae Dormitio additis evangeliorum et actuum apocryphorum supplementis, Leipzig 1866, pp. 70.1-93.6.

BHG 922i — F. Nau, Revue biblique NS 11(1914) 215.1-221.16.

IOANNES ASCETA

BHG 830 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1456C-1457A.

IOANNES BAPTISTA

BHG 834 — F. Nau, PO 4:5.526.1-541.2.

IOANNES CALYBITA

BHG 868 — O. Lampsides, Πλάτων 16(1964) 262.1-272.30.

BHG 868f — O. Lampsides, Πλάτων 16(1964) 281.1-287.7.

IOANNES CHALCEDONENSIS

BHG 2185 — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.52.23-55.20.

IOANNES CHRYSOSTOMUS

BHG 870 — P.R. Coleman-Norton, Palladii Dialogus de Vita S. Joannis Chrysostomi, Cambridge 1928, pp. 3.1-147.35.

BHG 871 — A. Mai, PG 47.xliii.1-lii.5.

BHG 872 — A. Mai, PG 47.li-lxxxviii.

BHG 873 — H. Savile, S. Ioannis Chrysostomi opera graece, Eton 1612, vol. 8, pp. 157.25-265.40.

BHG 874 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 47.lxxxvii-lxxxviii.

BHG 878t-878x — E. Bekker, PG 104.229B-235A.

BHG 879 — M. Le Quien, PG 96.761D-781B.

BHG 880 — H. Savile, PG 107.228B-292D.

BHG 881c — K. Dyobouniotes, Θεολογία 12 (1934) 53.1-68.35.

IOANNES CLIMACUS

BHG 882 — M. Rader, PG 88.596A-608A.

BHG 882a — M. Rader, PG 88.629C-D.

BHG 882b — I. Hardt, Catalogus codicum manuscriptorum Graecorum Bibliothecae Regiae Bavaricae, Munich 1810, vol. 4, pp. 419-420.

BHG 882g — P.A. Revilla, Catálogo de los Codices Griegos de la Biblioteca de el Escorial, Madrid 1936, vol. 1, p. 385.1-17.

BHG 883 — M. Rader, PG 88.608A-609B.

BHG 883d — M. Rader, PG 88.624A-628C.

BHG 883h — J.P. Migne, PG 88.609C-612A.

IOANNES DAMASCENUS

BHG 884 — M. Le Quien, PG 94.429A-489B.

IOANNES ELEEMOSYNARIUS

BHG 886 — H. Gelzer, Leontios' von Neapolis Leben des heiligen Iohannes des barmherzigen Erzbischofs von Alexandrien, Freiburg/Leipzig 1893, pp. 1.1-103.7; L. Rydén, Leontius de Néapolis: Vie de Syméon le Fou et Vie de Jean de

Chypre, [ed. A.-J. Festugière] Paris 1974, pp. 343 - 409.

BHG 887v — H. Delehaye, AB 45(1927) 19.1-73.8.

BHG 887w — E. Lappa-Zizicas, AB 88(1970) 274.1-278.18.

BHG 888 — J.-B. Malou, PG 114.896A-965A.

IOANNES EPISCOPUS GOTTHIAE

BHG 891 — C. Janninck, AASS Jun. 5, pp. 190E-194E.

IOANNES EREMOPOLITA

BHG 2187h — F. Halkin, AB 86(1968) 16.1-20.15.

IOANNES IEIUNATOR

BHG 893 — G.D. Mansi, Sacrorum conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio, Florence 1767, vol. 13, cc. 80D-85C.

IOANNES LYCOPOLITANUS

BHG 2189 — A.-J. Festugière, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Brussels 1961, pp. 9-35.

BHG 2190 — G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 168/178.

IOANNES PSICHAITA

BHG 896 — P. van den Ven, Le Muséon NS 3 (1902) 103.1-123.28.

IOANNES SABAITA

BHG 897 — E. Schwartz, Kyrillos von Skythopolis, [=TU 49.2] Leipzig 1939, pp. 201.1-222.19.

IOANNICIUS

BHG 935 — J. van den Gheyn, AASS Nov. 2.1, pp. 332C-383B.

BHG 936 — J. van den Gheyn, AASS Nov. 2.1, pp. 384C-435F.

BHG 937 — J.-B. Malou, PG 116.36C-92D.

IOSEPHUS HYMNOGRAPHUS

BHG 944 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, Monumenta graeca et latina ad historiam Photii patriarchae pertinentia, St. Petersburg 1901, vol. 2, pp. 1.1-14.32.

IOSEPH MONACHUS

BHG 2203 — Paulus Evergetinus, Εὐεργετινὸς ἤτοι Συναγωγὴ τῶν θεοφθόγγων ῥημάτων καὶ διδασκαλιῶν τῶν θεοφόρων καὶ ἁγίων πατέρων, Athens 1966[6], vol. 4, pp. 40/42.

IRENE

BHG 952 — J. Pien, AASS Jul. 6, pp. 602E-634F.

ISAACIUS

BHG 956 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS May 7, pp. 247C-258E.

ISAIAS MONACHUS

BHG 2207 — F. Nau, PO 8:1.164.1-165.2.

ISAIAS PROPHETA

BHG 958d — H. Delehaye, AB 42(1924) 257.1-258.38.

BHG 958f — H. Delehaye, AB 42(1924) 259.1-265.31.

ISIDORUS

BHG 2209 — M. Smith, Τιμητικὸς Τόμος Ἀμιλκὰ Σ. Ἀλιβιζάτου, [ed. G.I. Konidares] Athens 1958, pp. 435.1-438.30.

IULIANUS ANAZARBENUS

BHG 967 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.665.22-676.19.

IULIANUS SABAS

BHG 968 — J.S. Assemani, Sancti patris nostri Ephraem Syri opera omnia quae exstant, Rome 1746, vol. 3, pp. 254D-260E.

BHG 969 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 194/244.

IULITTA

BHG 972 — J. Garnier, PG 31.237A-261A.

IUSTINUS ET SOCII

BHG 972z — H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 42.1/46.17.

IUVENTINUS

BHG 975 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.571.9-578.5.

LEO CALABER

BHG 2233 — E. Follieri, Byzantion 41(1971) 441-443.

LEO CATANENSIS

BHG 981 — G. Henskens, AASS Feb. 3, pp. 223E-225F.

BHG 981b — B. Latyshev, ZIAN Series 8, 12.2 (1914)12.1-28.11.

LEO PAPA

BHG 982 — C. van de Vorst, AB 29(1910) 405.1-408.10.

LONGINUS

BHG 988 — D. van Papenbroek, PG 93.1545A-1560B.

LUCAS IUNIOR

BHG 994 — F. Combefis, PG 111.441A-480B; E. Martini, AB 13(1894) 82.1-121.4.

LUCAS STYLITA

BHG 2239 — H. Delehaye, Les saints stylites, Brussels/Paris 1923, pp. 195.1-237.7.

LUCIANUS

BHG 998 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.519.32-526.26.

LUCILLIANUS ET SOCII

BHG 998y — H. Delehaye, AB 31(1912) 187.29-192.13.

BHG 999 — C. Janninck, AASS Jun. 1, pp. 276E-286D.

BHG 999a — F. Halkin, AB 84(1966) 8.1-18.25.

BHG 999b — F. Halkin, AB 84(1966) 19.1-28.24.

MACARIUS AEGYPTIUS

BHG 999g — A.-J. Festugière, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Brussels 1961, pp. 123-128.

BHG 999n — H.I. Floss, PG 34.221A-229A.

BHG 999t — H.I. Floss, PG 34.209C-216A.

MACARIUS ALEXANDRINUS

BHG 999u — A.-J. Festugière, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Brussels 1961, pp. 130-131.

BHG 999v — G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 78/96.

BHG 999w — H.I. Floss, PG 34.385A-392C.

MACARIUS PELECETES

BHG 1003 — J. van den Gheyn, AB 16(1897) 142.1-163.35.

MACEDONIUS

BHG 1011 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 474/508.

MACRINA

BHG 1012 — V.W. Callahan, Gregorii Nysseni Opera. Opera Ascetica, Leiden 1952, vol. 8.1, pp. 370.1-414.14.

MAISYMAS

BHG 1013 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1412A-1413C.

MAMAS

BHG 1020 — J. Garnier, PG 31.589B-600B.

BHG 1021 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 36.608A-621A.

MANUEL, SABAEL ET ISMAEL

BHG 1023 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS Jun. 3, pp. 290F-296D.

MARANA ET CYRA

BHG 1025 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1489B-1492C.

MARCELLUS

BHG 1027z — G. Dagron, AB 86(1968) 287.1-321.15.

MARCIANUS ASCETA

BHG 1031 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 246/288.

MARCIANUS CONSTANTINOPOLITANUS

BHG 1032 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 4:258.1-270.20 and 5:402.20-404.4.

MARCIANUS SYRACUSANUS

BHG 1030 — A. Amore, San Marciano di Siracusa. Studio archeologico-agiografico. Vatican City 1958, pp. 75a.1-91a.6.

MARCIANUS ET MARTYRIUS

BHG 1028y — P. Franchi de'Cavalieri, AB 64 (1946) 169.1-171.23.

BHG 1028z — P. Franchi de'Cavalieri, AB 64 (1946) 171.24-175.31.

MARCUS ATHENIENSIS

BHG 1039 — G. Henskens/D. van Papenbroek, AASS Mar. 3, pp. *40A-*43D.

MARCUS SALUS

BHG 2255 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 60.1-62.2.

MARIA AEGYPTIACA

BHG 1042 — D. van Papenbroeck, PG 87:3. 3697A-3725C.

MARIA ANTIOCHENA

BHG 1045 — L. Radermacher, Griechische Quellen zur Faustsage, [=SAWW/PHK 206.4] Vienna/Leipzig 1927, pp. 261.1-270.33.

MARIA DEIPARA

BHG 1049 — G.L. Mingarelli, PG 120.185A-216B.

MARIA DICTA MARINUS

BHG 1163 — L. Clugnet, Vie et office de sainte Marine, Paris 1905, pp. 36.1-38.29.

MARINA

BHG 1167m — H. Usener, Festschrift zür fünften Säcularfeier der Carl-Rupprechts-Universität zu Heidelberg, Bonn 1886, pp. 48.1-53.13.

MARINUS

E. Schwartz, Eusebius Werke 2.2, [=GCS 9.2] Leipzig 1908, pp. 668.11/670.9.

MARIS

BHG 1172 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1429A-1432A.

MARON

BHG 1173 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1417B-1420B.

MARTHA HEGUMENA

BHG 1175 — C. Janninck, AASS May 5, p. 432 A-E.

MARTHA SYMEONIS MATER

BHG 1174 — P. van den Ven, La Vie ancienne de S. Syméon stylite le jeune

(521-592), Brussels 1970, vol. 2, pp. 253-314.

MARTINIANUS

BHG 1177 — P. Rabbow, Wiener Studien 17 (1895) 277.1-293.19.

MARTINUS PAPA

BHG 2259 — P. Peeters, AB 51(1933) 253.1-262.36.

BHG 2261 — R. Devreesse, AB 53(1935) 66.1-80.13.

MARTYRES AEGYPTII

BHG 1192 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.693.17-698.32.

MARTYRES LUGDUNENSES

BHG 1573 — H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 62.1/84.16.

MARTYRES OMNES

BHG 1182 — J. Iriarte, PG 20.1520A-1533B.

BHG 1184 — J.S. Assemani, Sancti patris nostri Ephraem Syri opera omnia quae exstant, Rome 1746, vol. 3, pp. 248F-254C.

BHG 1185 — A.B. Caillau/C. Clémencet, PG 36. 257A-261D.

BHG 1186 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.645.1-654.14.

BHG 1187 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.661.43-666.21.

BHG 1188 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.705.30-712.40.

BHG 1190 — C. Datema, Asterius of Amasea. Homilies I-XIV. Text, Introduction and Notes, Leiden 1970, pp. 135.1-146.23.

BHG 1191 — A. Mai, PG 88.480A-528D.

BHG 1191n — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.441.18-452.22.

BHG 1191r — A. Wenger, Jean Chrysostome. Huit catéchèses baptismales inédites, [=SC 50] Paris 1957, pp. 228/246.

BHG 1191p — B. de Montfaucon, PG 63.467.35-472.51.

BHG 1191q — B. de Montfaucon, PG 63.473.1-478.19.

MARTYRES PALAESTINENSES

BHG 1193 — E. Schwartz, Eusebius Werke 2.2, [=GCS 9.2] Leipzig 1908, pp. 907.1-950.7.

MARTYRES SCILLITANI

BHG 1645 — J.A. Robinson, The Passion of St. Perpetua, [=TS 1.2] Cambridge 1891, pp. 113.1/117.30.

MARTYRES X (vel XIII)

BHG 1195 — J. Pien, AASS Aug. 2, pp. 434F-447B.

MARTYRES X CRETENSES

BHG 1196 — P. Franchi de'Cavalieri, Miscellanea Giovanni Mercati, [=S e T 125] Vatican City 1946, vol. 5, pp. 29.1-40.17.

BHG 1197b — E. Psalidakis, Κρητικὰ Χρονικά 2(1948) 570-574.

BHG 1197d — B. Laourdas, Κρητικὰ Χρονικά 3(1949) 101.1-117.19.

MARTYRES XX SABAITAE

BHG 1200 — A. Papdopoulos-Kerameus, PPS 19. 3(1907) 1.1-41.22.

MARTYRES XIV

BHG 2264	G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.149.1-151.41.

MARTYRES XL

BHG 1203	H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 354.1/360.19.
BHG 1205	J. Garnier, PG 31.508B-525A.
BHG 1206	F. Morel/C. Morel, PG 46.749A-756D.
BHG 1207	F. Morel/C. Morel, PG 46.757A-772C.
BHG 1208	F. Morel/C. Morel, PG 46.773A-788B.
BHG 1208b	G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.147.1-148.36.

MARTYRES XLII

BHG 1209	V. Vasil'yevsky/P. Nikitin, ZIAN Series 8, 7.2(1905) 38.1/56.4.
BHG 1212	V. Vasil'yevsky/P. Nikitin, ZIAN Series 8, 7.2.(1905) 8.1-21.29.
BHG 1213	V. Vasil'yevsky/P. Nikitin, ZIAN Series 8, 7.2.(1905) 22.1-36.26.
BHG 1214	V. Vasil'yevsky/P. Nikitin, ZIAN Series 8, 7.2(1905) 61.1-78.7.

MARTYRES LX

BHG 1217	A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, PPS 12.1(1892) 1.1-7.26.

MARUTHAS

BHG 2265	J. Noret, AB 91(1973) 80.1-90.10.

MATTHAEUS APOSTOLUS

BHG 1224/1225	M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum

Apocrypha, Leipzig 1898, vol. 2. 1, pp. 217.1-262.2.

MATRONA

BHG 1221 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 3, pp. 790B-813D.

BHG 1223 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 3, pp. 822B-823F.

MAXIMUS CONFESSOR

BHG 1231 — F. Combefis, PG 90.109A-129D.

BHG 1232 — F. Combefis, PG 90.132A-133A.

BHG 1233 — F. Combefis, PG 90.136D-172B.

BHG 1233d — R. Devreesse, AB 73(1955) 10.1-16.34.

BHG 1233m — S.L. Epifanovich, Materialy k´ izucheniyu zhizni i tvoreniy prepodobnago Maksima Ispovědnika, Kiev 1917, pp. 1.1-10.12.

BHG 1234 — F. Combefis, PG 90.68A-109B; R. Devreesse, AB 46(1928) 18.1-23.6.

BHG 1236e — F. Combefis, PG 90.201D-205A.

MELANIA

BHG 1241 — D. Gorce, Vie de sainte Mélanie, [=SC 90] Paris 1962, pp. 124.1/270.19.

MELETIUS

BHG 1243 — A. Spira, Gregorii Nysseni Opera. Sermones Pars I, Leiden 1967, vol. 9, pp. 441.1-457.9.

BHG 1244 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.515.1-520.31.

MENAS AEGYPTIUS

BHG 1254 — K. Krumbacher, Miscellen zu Romanos, [=AKABW/PPHK 24.3] Munich

1907, pp. 31.1-43.4.

BHG 1254m — H. Delehaye, AB 29(1910) 146.1-150.28.

BHG 1256-1259 — I. Pomyalovsky, Zhitie prepodobnago Paisiya velikago i Timofeya patriarkha Aleksandriyskago povĕstvovanie o chudesakh svyatago velikomuchenika Miny, St. Petersburg 1900, pp. 62.1-89.29.

J. Drescher, Apa Mena. A Selection of Coptic Texts Relating to St. Menas, Cairo 1946, pp. 97-104.

MENAS PATRIARCHA

BHG 1272 — J. Pien, AASS Aug. 5, pp. 169C-170F.

MENAS, HERMOGENES ET EUGRAPHUS

BHG 1271 — J.-B. Malou, PG 116.368B-416D.

MERCURIUS

BHG 1274 — H. Delehaye, Les légendes grecques des saints militaires, Paris 1909, pp. 243.1-258.29.

METHODIUS

BHG 1278 — G. Henskens, PG 100.1244D-1261C.

METRIUS

BHG 2272 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 721/2.24-49, 723/4.24-45.

METROPHANES ET ALEXANDER

BHG 1279 — M.I. Gedeon, Ἐκκλησιαστικὴ Ἀλήθεια 4(1883-1884) 287b.18-291a.25, 296a.13-300a.26, 306a.1-310b.4, 321a.32-326b.16.

BHG 1280 — F. Combefis, Historia haeresis

Monothelitarum..., Paris 1648, pp. 573B-592B.

MICHAEL ARCHANGELUS

BHG 1282 — F. Nau, PO 4:5.547.1-562.3; M. Bonnet, AB 8(1889) 289.1-307.10.

MICHAEL MALEINUS

BHG 1295 — L. Petit, ROC 7(1902) 549.1-568.34.

MICHAEL SYNCELLUS

BHG 1296 — T. Schmitt, Izveěstiya russkago arkheologicheskago instituta v Konstantinopolě, 11(1906) 227.1-259.14.

MICHAEL SYNNADENSIS

BHG 2275 — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.50.10-52.22.

MOCIUS

BHG 1298-1298c — H. Delehaye, AB 31(1912) 163.1-176.9.

BHG 1298d — F. Halkin, AB 83(1965) 10.1-22.22.

BHG 1298h — H. Delehaye, AB 31(1912) 176.10-187.26.

MONACHI IN SINA ET RAITHU

BHG 1300 — F. Combefis, Illustrium Christi martyrum lecti triumphi vetustis Graecorum monumentis consignati, Paris 1660, pp. 88.1-132.21.

BHG 1301-1307 — P. Poussines, PG 79.589A-693B.

BHG 1307g — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.97.1-99.14.

MOYSES

BHG 1309 — G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 96/102.

NARRATIO DE BALNEIS

BHG 2102c — F. Nau, ROC 8(1903) 99.1-16.

NARRATIO DE COENOBITA AD IUDICEM DELATO

BHG 2101a — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 387.1-391.3.

NARRATIO DE DIACONO QUEM PRESBYTER LIGAVERAT

BHG 1322ea — P. Canart, Byzantion 36(1966) 18-20.

NARRATIO DE EXPUGATIONE MONTIS SINA

BHG 1318s — F. Nau, Oriens Christianus 2(1902) 87.14-89.35.

NARRATIO DE MENDICO CAECO

BHG 2102 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 62.3-63.15.

NARRATIO DE MIRACULIS IN MONTE SION

BHG 1318t — F. Nau, Oriens Christianus 2(1902) 61.10-62.24.

NARRATIO DE MONIALI IN BALNEIS

BHG 2102d — E. Mioni, OCP 17(1951) 92.31-93.23.

NARRATIO DE PHILENTOLO FORNICATORE

BHG 1322w — F. Halkin, AB 63(1945) 62.1-64.23.

NARRATIO DE SORORE DANIELIS

BHG 2102e [=BHG 1438h] — F. Nau, ROC 12(1907) 174.9-175.2.

NARRATIO DE TAXEOTA SEU MILITE REDIVIVO

BHG 1318 — F. Nau, Oriens Christianus 2(1902) 83.17-87.13.

NARRATIO DE VIRGINE QUAE EBRIETATEM SIMULABAT

BHG 2101 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 67.14-70.30.

NEREUS ET ACHILLES

BHG 1327 — H. Achelis, Acta SS. Nerei et Achillei. Text und Untersuchung, [=TU 11.2] Leipzig 1893, pp. 1.1-23.21.

NICEPHORUS HEGUMENUS MEDICII

BHG 2297 — F. Halkin, AB 78(1960) 401.1-425.20.

NICHEPHORUS HEGUMENUS τῆς Σεβαζῆ

BHG 2300 — F. Halkin, Byzantion 23(1953) 18.1-30.32.

NICEPHORUS MARTYR

BHG 1334 — G. Henskens, AASS Feb. 2, pp. 285D-288D [Latin text only].

NICEPHORUS PATRIARCHA

BHG 1335 — C. de Boor, Nicephori archiepiscopi Constantinopolitani opuscula historica, Leipzig 1880, 139.1-217.36.

BHG 1336/1337 — T. Ioannou, Μνημεῖα Ἁγιολογικά Venice 1884, pp. 115.1-128.18.

NICETAS GOTHUS

BHG 1339 — H. Delehaye, AB 31(1912) 209.25-215.22.

NICETAS HEGUMENUS MEDICII

BHG 1341 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS Apr. 1, pp. xxiiA-xxxiiD.

BHG 1342b — D. Papachryssanthou, Travaux et Mémoires 3(1968) 329.1/351.17.

NICOLAUS BUNENIS

BHG 2309 — D.Z. Sophianos, Ἅγιος Νικολάος ὁ ἐν Βουνείνῃ. Ἀνέκδοτα ἁγιολογικὰ κείμενα. Ἱστορικαὶ εἰσηγήσεις περὶ τῆς μεσαιωνικῆς Θεσσαλίας (Ι΄ αἰών), Athens 1972, pp. 139-147.

NICOLAUS MILES

BHG 2311 — L. Clugnet, ROC 7(1902) 323.1-325.14.

NICOLAUS MYRENSIS

BHG 1347 — G. Anrich, Hagios Nikolaos. Der heilige Nikolaos in der griechischen Kirche. Texte und Untersuchungen, Leipzig/Berlin 1913, vol. 1, pp. 3.1-55.12.

BHG 1348 — Anrich, pp. 113.1-139.15.

BHG 1348c — Anrich, pp. 211.1-233.30.

BHG 1349z — Anrich, pp. 67.1-77.12.

BHG 1351 — Anrich, pp. 98.1-102.24.

BHG 1352 — Anrich, pp. 339.1-342.29.

BHG 1352v — D. Papachryssanthou, AB 92(1974) 54.1-61.34.

BHG 1352y — Anrich, pp. 140.1-150.20.

BHG 1352z — Anrich, pp. 153.1-182.27.

BHG 1353-1356 — Anrich, pp. 185.1-197.10.

BHG 1362 — Anrich, pp. 419.1-428.22.

BHG 1363 — P. Poussines, PG 107.204A-228A.

BHG 1364c — Anrich, pp. 429.1-433.5

NICOLAUS STUDITA

BHG 1365 — F. Combefis, PG 105.864A-925C.

NICON

BHG 1369 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS Mar. 3, pp. *18A-*22D.

NIPHON

BHG 1371z — F. Del Furia, Collezione d'Opuscoli Scientifici e Letterari ed estratti d'opere interessanti 17(1813) 90.1/96.20.

BHG 1372b — Ms. Holkham gr. 43, ff. 128^{r}.15-148^{r}.7.

OLYMPIAS

BHG 1375 — H. Delehaye, AB 15(1896) 409.1-423.20.

BHG 1376 — H. Delehaye, AB 16(1897) 44.1-51.35.

ONUPHRIUS

BHG 1378 — C. Janninck, AASS Jun. 2, pp. 527E-533E.

PACHOMIUS

BHG 1396 — F. Halkin, Sancti Pachomii Vitae Graecae, Brussels 1932, pp. 1.1-96.21.

BHG 1397/1398	Halkin, pp. 97.1-121.17.
BHG 1399	Halkin, pp. 122.1-165.10.
BHG 1400	Halkin, pp. 166.1-271.15.
BHG 1400c	Halkin, pp. 272.1-406.20.

PACHON

BHG 2327	G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 128/132.

PAISIUS

BHG 1402/1403	I. Pomyalovsky, Zhitie prepodobnago Paisiya velikago i Timofeya patriarkha Aleksandriyskago povĕstvovanie o chudesakh svyatago velikomuchenika Miny, St. Petersburg 1900, pp. 1.1-61.5.

PALLADIUS

BHG 1404	P. Canivet/A. Leroy Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 366/370.

PAMBO

BHG 2329	G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 46/50.

PAMPHILUS ET SOCII

BHG 1405/1406	E. Schwartz, Eusebius Werke 2.2, [=GCS 9.2] Leipzig 1908, pp. 931. 16-945.26.

PANCRATIUS ROMANUS

BHG 1408	P. Franchi de'Cavalieri, Hagiographica, [SeT 19] Rome 1908, pp. 109.1-112.26.
BHG 1409	F. Macler, Histoire de saint

Azazaïl, Paris 1902, pp. 16.1-20.26.

PANCRATIUS TAUROMENITANUS

BHG 1410 — Ms. Vaticanus gr. 1591, ff. 1^{r}-107^{v}; Ms. Cryptoferratensis B.β. 5, ff. 1-155v.

BHG 1410/1410a — A.N. Veselovsky, Sbornik' otděleniya russkago yazyka i slovesnosti imperatorskoy akademii nauk' 40.2(1886) 73-110.

PANTELEEMON

BHG 1416 — B. Latyshev, ZIAN Series 8, 12.2 (1914) 53.17-65.9.

PARTHENIUS

BHG 1422 — J.-B. Malou, PG 114.1348A-1365B.

PATAPIUS

BHG 1425 — F. Combefis, PG 97.1205C-1221B.

BHG 1426/1427 — F. Combefis, PG 97.1221B-1233B.

BHG 1428 — F. Combefis, PG 97.1233B-1253B.

PAULA

BHG 2361 — F. Halkin, Inédits byzantins d'Ochrida, Candie et Moscou, Brussels 1963, pp. 59-68.

PAULUS APOSTOLUS

BHG 1451/1452 — C. Schmidt, Πράξεις Παύλου. Acta Pauli, Glückstadt/Hamburg 1936, pp. 22-73.

BHG 1453 — H. von Soden, Die Schriften des Neuen Testaments, Berlin 1902, vol. 1.1, p. 650.1-12.

BHG 1456 — von Soden, pp. 650.13-652.19.

BHG 1457	von Soden, pp. 367.1-368.23.
BHG 1458/1458b/ 1459	von Soden, pp. 369-370.
BHG 1460	C. Tischendorf, Apocalypses apocryphae Mosis, Esdrae, Pauli, Iohannis item Mariae Dormitio additis evangeliorum et actuum apocryphorum supplementis, Leipzig 1866, pp. 34.1-69.10.

PAULUS APOSTOLUS ET THECLA

BHG 1710	R.A. Lipsius, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1891, vol. 1, pp. 235.1-269.7.

PAULUS CONFESSOR

BHG 1472	E. Bekker, PG 104.120C-132A.
BHG 1473g	G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.72.15-75.5.

PAULUS EREMITA

BHG 1466	K.T. Corey, Studies in the Text Tradition of St. Jerome's Vitae Patrum, [ed. W.A. Oldfather] Urbana 1943, pp. 158.1-172.9.

PAULUS IUNIOR

BHG 1474	H. Delehaye, AB 11(1892) 19.1-74.7, 136.1-181.13.
BHG 1474h	S. Lambros, Νέος Ἑλληνομνήμων 12(1915) 199.1-202.4.

PAULUS MARTYR

BHG 1471	A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 4:247.1-251.29 and 5:401.11-28.

PAULUS MONACHUS

BHG 2363	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 283/4.58, 285/6.29-54, 287/8. 41-53.

PAULUS SIMPLEX

BHG 1474q	A.-J. Festugière, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Brussels 1961, pp. 131-133.
BHG 1474r	G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 118/126.

PELAGIA

BHG 1477	B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.579.1-584.42.
BHG 1478	H. Usener, Legenden der Pelagia, Bonn 1879, pp. 3.1-16.5.
BHG 1479	J.-B. Malou, PG 116.908D-920C.

PERPETUA ET FELICITAS

BHG 1482	G.J.M.J. van Beek, Passio sanctarum Perpetuae et Felicitatis, Nijmegen 1936, vol. 1, pp. 5.1/53.18.

PETRUS ALEXANDRINUS

BHG 1502	J. Viteau, Passions des saints Ecaterine et Pierre d'Alexandrie Barbara et Anysia, Paris 1897, pp. 69.1/85.19.
BHG 1502a	P. Devos, AB 83(1965) 162.1-177.13.

PETRUS APOSTOLUS

BHG 1483/1484	R.A. Lipsius, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1891, vol. 1, pp. 78.1-102.9.
BHG 1487	A. Harnack, Bruchstücke des Evangeliums und der Apokalypse des Petrus, [=TU 9.2] Leipzig 1893, pp. 16.1-20.11.
BHG 1487b	M.R. James, JTS 12(1910-1911) 367-369 and JTS 32(1930-1931) 271, 278-279.

BHL 6656 — R.A. Lipsius, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1891, vol. 1, pp. 45.1-103.8.

PETRUS APOSTOLUS ET ANDREAS

BHG 1489 — M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1898, vol. 2.1, pp. 117.1-127.9.

PETRUS APOSTOLUS ET PAULUS

BHG 1490 — R.A. Lipsius, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1891, vol. 1, pp. 178.1-222.5.

BHG 1491 — R.A. Lipsius, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1891, vol. 1, pp. 118.1-176.6.

PETRUS ARGIVUS

BHG 1504 — A. Mai, NPB 9.3, pp. 1.1-17.11

PETRUS ATHONITA

BHG 1505 — K. Lake, The Early Days of Monasticism on Mount Athos, Oxford 1909, pp. 18.1-39.30.

PETRUS ATROENSIS

BHG 2364 — V. Laurent, La Vie merveilleuse de saint Pierre d'Atroa (†837), Brussels 1956, pp. 65 /225.

BHG 2365 — V. Laurent, La Vie retractata et les miracles posthumes de saint Pierre d'Atroa, Brussels 1958, pp. 76-132, 135/171.

PETRUS GALATA

BHG 1507 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol.1 pp. 406/434.

PHANTINUS ASCETA

BHG 1508 — V. Saletta, Vita S. Phantini Confessoris ex codice Vaticano Graeco N. 1989 (Basil. XXVIII), Rome 1963, pp. 39-51.

BHG 1509 — Saletta, pp. 51-75.

PHANTINUS IUNIOR

BHG 2367 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, p. 224.4-42.

PHILARETUS

BHG 1511z — M.-H. Fourmy/M. Leroy, Byzantion 9(1934) 115.1-167.6.

BHG 1512 — A. Vasilyev, Izveěstiya russkago arkheologicheskago instituta v Konstantinopolě, 5(1900) 64.1-86.5.

PHILEAS

BHG 1513k — H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 328.1/344.6.

Musurillo, pp. 320.1/324.6.

PHILEMON

BHG 2368 — Kallistos (Patriarch), Φιλοκαλία τῶν ἱερῶν νηπτικῶν συγγραμμάτων παρὰ τῶν ἁγίων καὶ θεοφόρων πατέρων ἡμῶν, Athens 1958, vol. 2, pp. 241.1-252.25.

PHILEMON, APOLLONIUS ET SOCII

BHG 1513y — A.-J. Festugière, Historia Monachorum in Aegypto, Brussels 1961, pp. 115-118.

PHILIPPUS AGYRENSIS

BHG 1531 — G. Henskens, AASS May 3, pp. *1A-*7B.

PHILIPPUS APOSTOLUS

BHG 1516-1526	M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1903, vol. 2.2, pp. 1.1-90.26.

PHILOGONIUS

BHG 1532	B. de Montfaucon, PG 48.747.17-756.42.

PHILOTHEUS

BHG 2372	Ms. Holkham gr. 43, ff. 445^{r}.1-450^{v}.4.

PHOCAS

BHG 1535y	C. van de Vorst, AB 30(1911) 272.1-279.28.
BHG 1536	W. Cuypers, AASS Jul. 3, pp. 639B-645B.
BHG 1537	B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.699.1-706.29.
BHG 1538-1540	C. Datema, Asterius of Amasea. Homilies I-XIV. Text, Introduction and Notes, Leiden 1970, pp. 115.1/127.28.

PHOSTERIUS

BHG 2373h	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 371/2.39-58, 373.4/31-41.

PIONIUS ET SOCII

BHG 1546	H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 136.1/166.5.

PLATO

BHG 1553	D. van Papenbroek, PG 99.804A-849A.
BHG 1553b	G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.162.21-164.31.

BHG 1553c — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.80.14-82.3.

POLYCARPUS

BHG 1556-1560 — K. Bihlmeyer/W. Schneemelcher, Die Apostolichen Väter, Tübingen 1956², pp. 120.16-132.6.

PORPHYRIUS

BHG 1570 — H. Grégoire/M.-A. Kugener, Marc le Diacre, Vie de Prophyre, évêque de Gaza, Paris 1930, pp. 1-79.

POTAMIAENA ET BASILIDES

E. Schwartz, Eusebius Werke 2.2, [=GCS 9.2] Leipzig 1908, pp. 530.9/532.28.

PRATUM SPIRITUALE

BHG 1440z — H. Usener, Der heilige Tychon, Leipzig/Berlin 1907, pp. 91.4-93.26.

BHG 1441/1442 — Fronton du Duc/J.-B. Cotelier, PG 87:3.2852A-3112B.

PROCOPIUS

BHG 1576 — H. Delehaye, Les légendes grecques des saints militaires, Paris 1909, pp. 214.1-227.32.

BHG 1577 — A. Papadopoulos-Kerameus, ΑΙΣ 5:1.1-27.13.

BHG 1580 — F. Halkin, AB 80(1962) 178.1-193.36.

BHG 1584 — H. Delehaye, AB 24(1905) 475.1-482.18.

PTOLEMAEUS ET LUCIUS

H. Musurillo, The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972, pp. 38.1/40.30.

PUBLIUS

BHG 1592 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 328/344.

PULCHERIA

CPG 3181 — A. Spira, Gregorii Nysseni Opera. Sermones Pars I, Leiden 1967, vol. 9, pp. 461.1-472.18.

RABULAS

BHG 2378k — P. Canart, AB 87(1969) 458.1-459.33.

BHG 2378m — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, p. 475/6.32-52.

ROMANUS ASCETA

BHG 1603 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 454/458.

ROMANUS MARTYR

BHG 1601 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.605.18-612.47.

ROMANUS MELODUS

BHG 2380/2381 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 95.18-23, 96.5-20, 95/6.37-42.

SABAS IUNIOR

BHG 1611 — G. Cozza-Luzi, Studi e documenti di storia e diritto 12(1891) 37.1-56.24, 135.1-168.26, 311.1-323.41.

SABAS MONACHUS

BHG 1608 — E. Schwartz, Kyrillos von Skythopolis, [=TU 49.2] Leipzig 1939, pp. 85.5-200.17.

SALAMANES

BHG 1614 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1428C-1429A.

SAMPSON

BHG 1615 — J.-B. Malou, PG 115.277C-308D.

SANCTI OMNES

BHG 1617kb — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.24.5-26.33.

SARAPION

BHG 1617z — G.J.M. Bartelink, Palladio. La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974, pp. 182/192.

SILVESTER

BHG 1628/1629/1629b — F. Combefis, Illustrium Christi martyrum lecti triumphi vetustis Graecorum monumentis consignati, Paris 1660, pp. 258.1-336.28.

BHG 1632e — W. Levison, Miscellanea Francesco Ehrle, [SeT 38] Rome 1924, vol. 2, pp. 231.1-232.5.

SIRA

BHG 1637 — P. Devos, AB 64(1946) 112.1-131.14.

SISINNIUS ET SISINNODORUS

BHG 2401 — L. Allatius, De templis Graecorum recentioribus, Cologne 1645, pp. 133-135.

BHG 2402 — Allatius, pp. 126-129.

BHG 2403 — K.N. Sathas, Μεσαιωνικὴ Βιβλιοθήκη ἢ συλλογὴ ἀνεκδότων μνημείων τῆς ἑλληνικῆς ἱστορίας, Paris 1876, vol. 5, pp. 573.9-575.25.

SISOES

BHG 2404i — F. Halkin, AB 66(1948) 89.1-90.20.

SOPHIA

BHG 2404n — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 727/8.54-58, 729/730.37-54.

SOTERIS

BHG 1642 — P. Franchi de'Cavalieri, Hagiographica, [SeT 19] Rome 1908, pp. 113.1-120.19.

SPYRIDON

BHG 1647 — P. van den Ven, La légende de S. Spyridon, évêque de Trimithonte, Louvain 1953, pp. 1.1-103.21.

BHG 1648 — J.-B. Malou, PG 116.417A-468A.

BHG 1648a — van den Ven, pp. 104.1-128.21.

STEPHANUS EPISCOPUS SUROZIAE

BHG 1671 — V. Vasil'yevsky, Russko-Vizantiyskiya izslědovaniya vypusk' vtoroy zhitiya svyatago Georgiya Amastridskago i Stefana Surozhskago, St. Petersburg 1893, pp. 74.1-79.5.

STEPHANUS IUNIOR

BHG 1666 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 100.1069A-1185D.

BHG 1666a — H. Delehaye, AB 21(1902) 388.40-389.10.

STEPHANUS PROTOMARTYR

BHG 1648y — N. Franco, Rome e l'Oriente 8(1914)

293.21-307.23.

STEPHANUS RHEGINENSIS

BHG 1668 — J.-B. Malou, PG 115.317A-D.

STEPHANUS SABAITA

BHG 1670 — J. Pien, AASS Jul. 3, pp. 531B-613C; G. Garitte, AB 77(1959) 344.1-369.9.

SYMEON ASCETA

BHG 1674 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 346/364.

SYMEON SALUS

BHG 1677 — L. Rydén, Léontius de Néapolis: Vie de Syméon le Fou et Vie de Jean de Chypre, [ed. A.-J. Festugière] Paris 1974, pp. 55-104.

SYMEON STYLITA

BHG 1678-1681 — H. Lietzmann, Das Leben des heiligen Symeon Stylites, [=TU 32.4] Leipzig 1908, pp. 1.1-18.2.

BHG 1682/1683 — Lietzmann, pp. 20.1/78.6.

SYMEON STYLITA IUNIOR

BHG 1689 — P. van den Ven, La Vie ancienne de S. Syméon stylite le jeune (521-592), Brussels 1962, vol. 1, pp. 1-224.

BHG 1691 — J. Bompaire, Ἑλληνικά 13(1954) 79.1-88.10.

BHG 1691b — J. Bompaire, Ἑλληνικά 13(1954) 90.1-102.22.

BHG 1691c — J. Bompaire, Ἑλληνικά 13(1954)

104.1-108.32.

SYNCLETICA

BHG 1694 — J.B. Cotelier, PG 28.1488A-1557B.

TAISIA

BHG 1695 — F. Nau, Annales du Musée Guimet 30.3(1903) 86a.1/112a.10.

BHG 1696 — F. Nau, Annales du Musée Guimet 30.3(1903) 87a.1/113a.7.

BHG 1697 — F. Nau, Annales du Musée Guimet 30.3(1903) 87b.1/113b.9.

BHG 1697e — F. Nau, Annales du Musée Guimet 30.3(1903) 80-82.

TARASIUS

BHG 1698 — I.A. Heikel, Acta Societatis Scientiarum Fennicae 17(1891) 395.1-423.32.

THADDAEUS APOSTOLUS

BHG 1702/1703 — R.A. Lipsius, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1891, vol. 1, pp. 273.1-278.15.

THADDAEUS STUDITA

BHG 2414 — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.70.1-72.14.

BHG 2415 — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.127.10-130.2.

THALASSIUS ET LIMNAEUS

BHG 1706 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1452D-1456C.

THALLELAEUS ASCETA

BHG 1709 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1488A-1489B.

THALLELAEUS MARTYR

BHG 1707 — H. Bröcker, Der hl. Thalelaios. Texte und Untersuchungen, Münster 1976, pp. 31.1-37.25.

BHG 1708 — Bröcker, pp. 38.1-55.2.

THECLA

BHG 1717 — P. Pantini, PG 85.478A-560D.

BHG 1718 — P. Pantini, PG 85.561A-617D.

BHG 1721 — O. von Gebhardt, Passio s. Theclae virginis. Die lateinischen Übersetzungen der Acta Pauli et Theclae, [=TU 22.2] Leipzig 1902, pp. 176.1-182.4.

BHG 1722 — F. Combefis, PG 105.301A-336B.

THEOCLETUS

BHG 2430 — A. Sgouritses, Θεολογία 27(1956) 572.1-593.17.

THEOCTISTA CONSTANTINOPOLITANA

BHG 2422 — A. Mai, PG 99.884A-901B.

THEOCTISTA LESBIA

BHG 1723/1724 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 224C-233D.

THEODORA ALEXANDRINA

BHG 1727-1729 — K. Wesseley, Fünfzehnter Jahresbericht des K.K. Staatsgymnasiums in Hernals, [ed. G. Kotek] Vienna 1889, pp. 25.1-44.27.

THEODORA IMPERATRIX

BHG 1731 — W. Regel, Analecta Byzantino-Russica, St. Petersburg/Leipzig 1891, pp. 1.1-19.6.

BHG 1732/1733 — Regel, pp. 19.7-39.29.

BHG 1734 — F. Combefis, Historia haeresis Monothelitarum..., Paris 1648, pp. 715-743.

BHG 1735 — Regel, pp. 40.1-43.19.

THEODORA MONIALIS

BHG 1738 — E. Kurtz, ZIAN Series 8, 6.1(1902) 1.1-36.8.

BHG 1739 — E. Kurtz, ZIAN Series 8, 6.1(1902) 37.1-49.26.

THEODORUS ASCETA

BHG 2430 — N.A. Oikonomides, Πρακτικὰ τρίτου Πανιονίου συνεδρίου 23-29 Σεπτεμβρίου 1965 [edd. P.K. Bouboulides/M.G. Nystazopoulos], Athens 1967, vol. 1, pp. 281-291.

THEODORUS CHORENSIS

BHG 1743 — Kh. Loparev, Zapiski klassicheskago otděleniya imperatorskago russkago arkheologicheskago obshchestva 1(1904) [Prilozheniye] 1.1-16.19.

THEODORUS EDESSENUS

BHG 1744 — I. Pomyalovsky, Zhitie izhe vo svyatykh´ ottsa nashego Feodora arkhiepiskopa Edesskago, St. Petersburg 1892, pp. 1.1-120.5.

THEODORUS GRAPTUS

BHG 1746 — F. Combefis, PG 116.653A-684A.

BHG 1746a — F. Combefis, PG 116.672B-680A.

THEODORUS STRATELATES

BHG 1750 — G. van Hooff, AB 2(1883) 359.1-367.24.

BHG 1753 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 83A-89F.

BHG 1753n — G. Cozza-Luzi, NPB 9:1.33.24-35.33.

THEODORUS STUDITA

BHG 1754 — A. Mai, PG 99.233A-328B.

BHG 1755 — J. Sirmond, PG 99.113A-232B.

BHG 1756 — F. Combefis, PG 99.1825A-1849B.

BHG 1756t — C. van de Vorst, AB 32(1913) 50.1-61.30.

BHG 1759 — J. Sirmond, PG 99.1813A-1824D.

THEODORUS SYCEOTA

BHG 1748 — A.-J. Festugière, Vie de Théodore de Sykéon, Brussels 1970, vol. 1, pp. 1-161

BHG 1749 — C. Kirch, AB 20(1901) 252.1-272.31.

THEODORUS TIRO

BHG 1760 — F. Morel/C. Morel, PG 46.736B-748D.

BHG 1765c — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 55B-72E.

BHG 1765f — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 60B-71F [in infimis pagellis].

THEODOSIA

BHG 1775 — H. Delehaye, AB 16(1897) 127.22-128.29.

THEODOSIUS ASCETA

BHG 1779 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 436/452.

THEODOSIUS COENOBIARCHA

BHG 1776 — H. Usener, Der heilige Theodosius. Schriften des Theodorus und

Kyrillos, Leipzig 1890, pp. 3.1-101.15.

BHG 1777 — E. Schwartz, Kyrillos von Skythopolis, [=TU 49.2] Leipzig 1939, pp. 235.25-241.7.

THEODOTA

BHG 1780 — H. Delehaye, AB 55(1937) 210.1-219.38.

BHG 1781 — H. Delehaye, AB 55(1937) 220.1-225.2.

THEODULUS

BHG 1785 — D. van Papenbroek, AASS May 6, pp. 756E-761B.

THEOGNIUS

BHG 1786 — J. van den Gheyn, AB 10(1892) 78.3-113.11.

BHG 1787 — E. Schwartz, Kyrillos von Skythopolis, [TU 49.2] Leipzig 1939, pp. 241.8-243.19.

THEOPHANES CONFESSOR

BHG 1787z — B. Latyshev, ZIAN Series 8, 13.4 (1918) 1.1-40.27.

BHG 1789 — C. de Boor, Theophanis Chronographia, Leipzig 1885, vol. 2, pp. 3.1-12.23.

BHG 1790 — de Boor, pp. 13.1-27.35.

BHG 1791 — K. Krumbacher, "Eine neue Vita des Theophanes Confessor," [=SKBAW/PPHK 1897.1] Münich 1897, pp. 389.1-399.26.

BHG 1792 — K. Krumbacher, "Ein Dithyrambus auf den Chronisten Theophanes," [=SKBAW/PPHK 1896.1] Munich 1896, pp. 608.1-618.9.

BHG 1792b — C. van de Vorst, AB 31(1912) 19.1-23.22.

THEOPHANES ET PANSEMNE

BHG 2447 — E. de Stoop, Le Musée belge 15 (1911) 320.1-329.18.

THEOPHANES MONEMBASIENSIS

BHG 2446 — S. Lambros, Νέος Ἑλληνομνήμων 12(1915) 279.22-33.

THEOPHANO IMPERATRIX

BHG 1794 — E. Kurtz, ZIAN Series 8, 3.2 (1898) 1.1-24.8.

THEOPHILUS

BHG 1319-1321 — L. Radermacher, Griechische Quellen zur Faustsage, [=SAWW/PHK 206.4] Vienna/Leipzig 1927, pp. 182.1-219.5.

BHG 1322 — Radermacher, pp. 164.1/176.29.

THEOPHYLACTUS

BHG 2451 — A. Vogt, AB 50(1932) 71.1-82.33.

THERAPON

BHG 1797 — L. Deubner, De Incubatione capita quattuor, Leipzig 1900, pp. 120-125.

BHG 1798 — Deubner, pp. 120-134.

THOMAIS

BHG 2453 — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 63.16-65.10.

BHG 2453b — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 66.21-67.14.

BHG 2454 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 234A-242D.

THOMAS APOSTOLUS

BHG 1800-1801c	M. Bonnet, Acta Apostolorum Apocrypha, Leipzig 1903, vol. 2.2, pp. 99.1-124.2.
BHG 1802-1807	Bonnet, pp. 124.3-146.20.
BHG 1808/1809	Bonnet, pp. 147.1-159.7.
BHG 1810-1812	Bonnet, pp. 159.8-185.3.
BHG 1813/1814	Bonnet, pp. 185.4-197.10.
BHG 1816-1818	Bonnet, pp. 197.11-229.4.
BHG 1819	Bonnet, pp. 229.5-240.16.
BHG 1820-1822	Bonnet, pp. 240.17-245.15.
BHG 1823-1825	Bonnet, pp. 245.16-269.7.
BHG 1826	Bonnet, pp. 269.8-288.2.
BHG 1834	M.R. James, Apocrypha Anecdota. Second Series, [=TS 5.1] Cambridge 1897, pp. 28.1-45.23.

THOMAS DEPHURCINUS

BHG 2458	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 293/4.39-55, 295/6.15-54, 297/8.15-55.

TRYPHON

BHG 1856	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 329C-336D.
BHG 1856a	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 336B-343E.
BHG 1858	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. 4, pp. 348C-352D.

TYCHON

BHG 1859	H. Usener, Der heilige Tychon, Leipzig/Berlin 1907, pp. 111.1-149.6.
BHG 1860	H. Delehaye, AB 26(1907) 229.1-232.29.

VISIO DANIELIS

BHG 1871 — H. Schmoldt, Die Schrift 'vom jungen Daniel' und 'Daniels letzte Vision', [Diss.] Hamburg 1972, pp. 220.1/236.7.

BHG 1872 — Schmoldt, pp. 202.1/218.2.

VISIO DIADOCHI

BHG 2470 — E. des Places, Diadoque de Photicé. Oeuvres spirituelles, [=SC 5bis] Paris 1955, pp. 169.1-179.26.

VISIO MARIAE

BHG 1050 — M.R. James, Apocrypha Anecdota. A Collection of Thirteen Apocryphal Books and Fragments, [=TS 2.3] Cambridge 1893, pp. 115.1-126.38.

XENOPHON ET SOCII

BHG 1879 — A. Galante, AB 22(1903) 383.1-394.12.

ZEBINAS ET POLYCHRONIUS

BHG 1882 — J. Sirmond, PG 82.1457B-1464A.

ZENON CYPRIUS

BHG 2475n — J.-M. Sauget, REB 25(1967) 151.1-152.4.

ZENON MONACHUS

BHG 1886 — P. Canivet/A. Leroy-Molinghen, Théodoret de Cyr. Histoire des moines de Syrie. "Histoire philothée" I-XIII, [=SC 234] Paris 1977, vol. 1, pp. 460/472.

ZOSIMAS

BHG 1448x — Augustines Iordanites, Νέα Σιών 12(1912) 697.1-701.28, 854.1-865.17 and Νέα Σιών 13(1913) 92.1-100.5.

ZOSIMUS MONACHUS

BHG 1889 — M.R. James, Apocrypha Anecdota. A Collection of Thirteen Apocryphal Books and Fragments, [=TS 2.3] Cambridge 1893, pp. 96.1-108.25.

ZOSIMUS SYRACUSANUS

BHG 2478 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, p. 567/8.43-47 and cf., 411.6-10, 412.1-6.

ADDENDA

ANTONIUS EREMITA

BHG 141f — M. Aubineau, Les homélies festales d'Hésychius de Jérusalem. Vol. I: Les homélies I-XV, Brussels 1978, pp. 280/288.

ATHANASIUS ALEXANDRINUS

BHG 184 — R. Henry, Photius. Bibliotheque. ("Codices" 257-280), Paris 1977, vol. 8, pp. 18-40 [477 b.21-485 b.7].

BARBARA

BHG 217 — M. LeQuien, PG 96. 781C-813D.

CYRILLUS ET METHODIUS

F. Dvornik, Les légendes de Constantin et de Méthode vues de Byzance, Hattiesburg 1969², pp. 349.1-380.37 and 381.1-393.9.

DONALE

BHG 2110 — H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 317/8.39-319/20.56.

EUSEBIUS ASICHENSIS

BHG 637 — J. Sirmond, PG 82. 1425B-1428B.

EUTHYMIUS PATRIARCHA

BHG 651 — P. Karlin-Hayter, Vita Euthymii Patriarchae CP., Brussels 1970, pp. 3.1/147.18.

GEORGIUS MARTYR

BHG 682	D. van Papenbroek, AASS Apr. 3, [Paris 1866], pp. xviC - xxF.

GERMANUS HAGIORITA

BHG 2164	P. Joannou, AB 70 (1952) 50.1-114.8

GREGORIUS NAZIANZENUS

BHG 730a	C. Jungck, Gregor von Nazianz De Vita Sua. Einleitung, Text, Übersetzung, Kommentar, Heidelberg 1974, pp. 54/148.

GREGORIUS PAPA

BHG 721f	E. Muralt, PG 110.929C-932B.

IOANNES ABBAS CATHARORUM

BHG 2184n	H. Delehaye, AASS Nov. Propylaeum, pp. 631/2.41-58, 633/4.27-38.

IOANNES CHRYSOSTOMUS

BHG 872b	F. Halkin, Douze récits byzantins sur saint Jean Chrysostome, Brussels 1977, pp. 8.1-44.25.
BHG 872d	Halkin, pp. 46.1-68.6.
BHG 873bd	Halkin, pp. 70.1-285.14.
BHG 876m	Halkin, pp. 429.1-442.28.
BHG 877v	K. Dyobouniotes, ΕΕΒΣ 2 (1925) 55.18-59.6.
BHG 877y	Dyobouniotes, pp. 59.8-65.16.
BHG 877z	Dyobouniotes, pp. 65.18-70.18.
BHG 878	Dyobouniotes, pp. 70.20-79.25.
BHG 878a	Dyobouniotes, pp. 79.27-83.26.
BHG 878t-878x	R. Henry, Photius. Bibliothèque. ("Codices" 257-280), Paris 1977, vol. 8, pp. 106-111 [507 b.15-509 a.33].
BHG 880a	K. Dyobouniotes, ΕΕΒΣ 16 (1940) 151.16-155.28.
BHG 880b	Dyobouniotes, pp. 149.12-150.7.

IOANNES IN PUTEO

BHG 894z — F. Halkin, Inédits byzantins d'Ochrida, Candie et Moscou, Brussels 1964, pp. 263-282.

MARTYRES OMNES

BHG 820 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 59.673.7-674.50.

BHG 1189 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 52.827.1-836.29

BHG 1191e — M. Aubineau, "Une homélie grecque inédite 'sur tous les martyres' attribuée à Jean Chrysostome (BHG 1191e)," in Forma Futuri. Studi in Onore del Cardinale Michele Pellegrino, Turin 1975, pp. 662/623.

BHG 1617c — G.A. Mingarelli, PG 10.1197A-1204B.

BHG 1617d — F.J. Leroy, L'homilétique de Proclus de Constantinople, [=SeT 247] Vatican City 1967, pp. 254.1-256.25.

MARTYRES XLIV SABAITAE

BHG 1215 — Fronton du Duc, PG 89.1421B-1428A.

MAXIMUS ATHONENSIS

BHG 1237 — E. Kourilas/F. Halkin, AB 54 (1936) 65.6-109.30.

METROPHANES ET ALEXANDER

BHG 1280 — R. Henry, Photius. Bibliothèque. ("Codices" 246-256), Paris 1974, vol. 7, pp. 215-228 [469b.12-474a.20].

NARRATIO DE MONACHO QUI IN MONUMENTO DORMIEBAT

BHG 2102a — L. Clugnet, ROC 5(1900) 50.1-51.2.

NIPHON

BHG 1371z — Ms. Coislinianus gr. 301, ff.3^{r}.1-98^{r}.8.

PARASCEVA

BHG 1420p — F. Halkin, in Polychronion. Festschrift Franz Dölger zum 75. Geburtstag, ed. P. Wirth, Heidelberg 1966, pp. 231.1-237.27.

PAULUS CONFESSOR

BHG 1472 — R. Henry, Photius. Bibliothèque. ("Codices 257-280), Paris 1977, vol. 8, pp. 8-18 [474a.22-477b.19].

PROCOPIUS

BHG 1584 — M. Aubineau, Les homélies festales d'Hésychius de Jérusalem. Vol. I: Les homélies I-XV, Brussels 1978, pp. 546/564.

SANCTI OMNES

BHG 1616 — J. Gretser, PG 107.172B-192B.

BHG 1616b — B. de Montfaucon, PG 56.271.1-280.4.

BHG 1617 — G.A. Mingarelli, PG 105.849A-856B.

BHG 1617j — M. Le Quien, PG 94.1164A-1180C.

BHG 1617v — B. de Montfaucon, PG 57.397.31-404.59.

BHG 1617w — B. de Montfaucon, PG 57.405.1-412.58.

BHG 1617x — B. de Montfaucon, PG 58.609.6-618.3.

BHG 1617y — B. de Montfaucon, PG 51.77.1-88.10.

SYMEON STYLITA

BHL 7957 — H. Rosweyde, PL 73.325B-334B.

THECLA

BHG 1717 — G. Dagron, Vie et Miracles de Sainte Thècle, Brussels 1978, pp. 167/282.

BHG 1718 — Dagron, pp. 284/412.

BHG 1718m — Dagron, pp. 416-421.

BHG 1720 — B. de Montfaucon, PG 50.745.6-748.42; M. Aubineau, AB 93 (1975) 351-352.

ZOTICUS

BHG 2479 — M. Aubineau, AB 93 (1975) 71-84.

C. GENERAL WORKS AND WORKS RELATING TO THE HISTORY OF BYZANTINE PENANCE

Ahrweiler, H. "The Geography of the Iconoclast World," in Iconoclasm, edd. A. Bryer/J. Herrin, Birmingham 1977, pp. 21-27.

Alberigo, J. et al.edd. Conciliorum Oecumenicorum Decreta, Bologna 1973³.

Alexander, P.J. The Patriarch Nicephorus of Constantinople. Policy and Image Worship in the Byzantine Empire, Oxford 1958.

Alexandre, N. Dissertatio de sacramentali confessione adversus Waldenses, Albigenses et Wickleffianos in Calvinistis redivivos, qua Joannis Dallaei Calviniani ministri libri quattuor refelluntur, Paris 1678.

Alivisatos, H.S. Die kirchliche Gesetzgebung des Kaisers Justinian I, Berlin 1913.

Allatius, L. De ecclesiae occidentalis atque orientalis perpetua consensione libri tres, Cologne [Antwerp?] 1648.

Almazov, A.I. Taynaya ispověd' v'pravoslavnoy vostochnoy tserkvi, [=ZINU 63-65] [Sacramental Confession in the Eastern Orthodox Church] 3 vols., Odessa 1894-1896.

Altaner, B./ Stuiber, A. Patrologie, Freiburg, 1966⁷ rev.

Arcudius, P. De concordia ecclesiae occidentalis et orientalis in septem sacramentorum administratione, Paris 1672.

Arnauld, A. La tradition de l'église sur le sujet de la pénitence et de la communion: representée dans les plus excellens ouvrages des ss. peres grecs et latins, et des auteurs celebres de ces derniers siecles, Paris 1644.

De la fréquente communion où les sentimens des pères, des papes et des conciles, touchant l'usage des sacremens de pénitence et d'eucharistie, sont fidelement exposez : pour servir d'adresse aux personnes qui pensent sérieusement a se convertir à Dieu; et aux pasteurs et confesseurs zelez pour le bien des ames, Paris 1643.

Atiya, A.S. — A History of Eastern Christianity, London 1968.

Aubespine, G. de l' — De veteribus ecclesiae ritibus observationum libri duo, Paris 1623.

Azéma, Y. — Théodoret de Cyr. Correspondance, vol. 2, Paris 1964.

Bacht, H. — "Die Rolle des orientalischen Mönchtums in den kirchenpolitischen Auseinandersetzung um Chalkedon," in Das Konzil von Chalkedon, edd. A. Grillmeier/H. Bacht, vol. 2, Würzburg 1953, pp. 431-519.

Bardenhewer, O. — Geschichte der altkirchlichen Literatur, 5 vols. Freiburg 1913-1932.

Batiffol, P. — "L'origine des prêtres pénitenciers," Revue du Clergé Français 42 (1905) 449-456.

Beck, H.-G. — "Die byzantinische Kirche im Zeitalter des photianischen Schismas," in Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte, ed. H. Jedin, vol.3.1, Freiburg 1966, pp. 197-218.

"Die griechische Kirche im Zeitalter des Ikonoklasmus," in Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte ed. H. Jedin, vol. 3.1, Freiburg 1966, pp. 31-61.

Kirche und theologische Literatur im byzantinischen Reich, Munich 1959.

"Die Ostkirche vom Anfang des 10. Jahrhunderts bis Kerullarios," in Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte, ed. H. Jedin, vol. 3.1, Freiburg 1966, pp. 462-484.

Bellarmino, R. — Disputationes de controversiis christianae fidei adversus huius temporis haereticos, 3 vols., Ingolstadt 1586-1593.

Beneševič, V.N. — "CR: A.I. Almazov, Taynaya ispověd' v' pravoslavnoy vostochnoy tserkvi," [Sacramental Confession in the Eastern Orthodox Church] ZMNP 353 (1904) 231-244, 397-425.

Ioannis Scholastici Synagoga L Titulorum, Munich 1937.

Kanonicheskiy sbornik' XIV titulov' so vtorov chetverti VII věka do 883 g., [The Canonical Collection in XIV Titles from the Second Quarter of the Seventh Century to 883 AD] Leipzig 1974 .

"Monumenta Vaticana ad Ius Canonicum Pertinentia," Studi Bizantini 2 (1927) 127-186.

Beneševič, V.N. (con't)

Syntagma canonum XIV Titulorum, Petrograd 1905.

Bernhard, J. "Excommunication et pénitence-sacrement aux premiers siècles de l'église," Revue de Droit Canonique 15 (1965) 265-281, 318-330; 16 (1966) 41-70.

Berrouard, M.-F. "La pénitence publique durant les six premiers siècles. Histoire et sociologie," La Maison-Dieu No 118 (1974) 92-130.

Binterim, A.J. Die vorzüglichsten Denkwürdigkeiten der Christ-Katholischen Kirche aus den ersten, mittlern und letzten Zeiten, 7 vols., Mainz 1825-1833.

Boileau, J. Historia confessionis auricularis ex antiquis scripturae, patrum, pontificum et conciliorum monumentis cum cura et fide expressa, Paris 1684

Boojamra, J.L. "The Eastern Schism of 907 and the Affair of the Tetragamia," JEH 25(1974) 113-133.

Bossy, J. "The Social History of Confession in the Age of the Reformation," Transactions of the Royal Historical Society 5th Series. 25(1975) 21-38.

Botte, B. "Les plus anciennes collections canoniques," L'Orient Syrien 5 (1960) 331-350.

Brons, B. "Sekundäre Textpartien im Corpus Pseudo-Dionysiacum," in Nachrichten der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen. Philologisch-Historische Klasse, 1975.5, Göttingen 1975, pp. 101-140.

Browne, L.E. Eclipse of Christianity in Asia, Cambridge 1933.

Bryer, A./Herrin, J. edd. Iconoclasm, Birmingham 1977.

Calvin, J. Institutions de la religion chrestienne, ed. J.-D. Benoit, 5 vols., Paris 1957-1963.

Campenhausen, H. von Ecclesiastical Authority and Spiritual Power in the Church of the First Three Centuries, London 1969.

Canivet, P. Le monachisme syrien selon Theodoret de Cyr, Paris 1977.

Carr, E. "Penance Among the Armenians: Notes on the History of its Practice and its Theology," Studia Liturgica 11 (1976) 65-100.

Chitty, D.J. "CR: A. Veilleux, La liturgie dans le coenobitisme pachômien au quatrième siècle," JTS NS 21 (1970) 195-199.

Chitty, D. (con't) — The Desert a City, Oxford 1966.

Clercq, C. de — Les textes juridiques dans les Pandectes de Nicon de la Montagne Noire, Venice 1942.

Dagron, G. — "Les moines et la ville. Le monachisme à Constantinople jusqu'au concile de Chalcédoine," Travaux et Mémoires 4 (1970) 229-276.

Naissance d'une capitale. Constantinople et ses institutions de 330 à 451, Paris 1974.

Daillé, J. — De sacramentali sive auriculari Latinorum confessione disputatio, Geneva 1661.

Darrouzès, J. — Recherches sur les ΟΦΦΙΚΙΑ de l'Eglise byzantine, Paris 1970.

Syméon le Nouveau Théologien. Chapitres théologiques, gnostiques et pratiques, Paris 1957.

Dassman, E. — Sündenvergebung durch Taufe, Busse und Martyrfürbitte, Münster 1973.

Diekamp, F. — "Brief an einen Sünder. Zur Geschichte des griechischen Busswesens," in Aus Ethik und Leben. Festschrift für Joseph Mausbach zur Vollendung des siebzigsten Lebenjahres (7. Februar 1931), edd. M. Meinertz/A. Donders, Münster 1931, pp. 43-54.

Dieten, J.L. van — Geschichte der Patriarchen von Sergios I bis Johannes VI (610-715), Amsterdam 1972.

Ditten, H. et al. edd. — Byzanz im 7. Jahrhundert, Berlin 1978.

Dmitrievsky, A. — "Taynaya ispověd' v' izsledovanii prof. A.I. Almazova (kriticheskii etyud')," [Sacramental Confession in the Researches of Prof. A.I. Almazov (A Critical Study)], Trudy kievskoy dukhovnoy Akademii (1897) t.3:11. 419-452 and 3:12. 623-638.

Dörries, H. — "The Place of Confession in Ancient Monasticism," in Studia Patristica 5, ed. F.L. Cross [=TU 80], Berlin 1962, pp. 284-311.

Douglas, M. — Purity and Danger: An Analysis of Concepts of Pollution and Taboo, London 1966.

Downey, G. — Constantinople in the Age of Justinian, Norman 1960.

Duhr, J. — "Communion fréquente," DSp vol. 2, Paris 1953, cc. 1234-1288.

Dvornik, F. — "Patriarch Ignatius and Caesar Bardas," Byzantino slavica 27 (1966) 7-22.

Dvornik, F. (con't) The Photian Schism. History and Legend, Cambridge 1948.

"Photius, Nicholas I and Hadrian II," Byzantinoslavica 34 (1973) 33-50.

Eck, J. von De poenitentia et confessione secreta semper in ecclesia Dei observata, contra Lutherum, libri duo, Ingolstadt 1522.

Englezakis, B. "A Note on Tradition and Personal Experience in Symeon the New Theologian," ECR 6 (1974) 88-89.

Ensslin, W. Die Religionspolitik des Kaisers Theodosius des Grossen, Munich 1953.

Ercole, G. d' "Foro interno e foro esterno nella penitenza delle origini cristiane," Apollinaris 32 (1959) 273-302.

Erickson, J.H. "Oikonomia in Byzantine Canon Law," in Law, Church and Society. Essays in Honor of Stephan Kuttner, [edd. K. Pennington/R. Somerville] University Park 1977, pp. 225-236.

"Penitential Discipline in the Orthodox Canonical Tradition," SVTQ 21 (1977) 191-206.

Ermoni, V. "La pénitence dans l'histoire à propos d'un ouvrage récent," Revue des Questions Historiques 67 (1900) 5-55.

Every, G. "Toll Gates on the Air Way," ECR 8 (1976) 139-151.

Filesac, J. "De confessionis secretae seu auricularis, ut vocant, usu et praxi apud Christianas gentes," in De origine paroeciarum, Paris 1615.

De poenitentia syntagma. In poenitentiam quasi fibulam, totius ecclesiae disciplina coarctatur, Paris 1633.

Forshaw, H.P. The Pastoral Ministry of the Priest-Confessor in the Early Middle Ages, 600-1100, Dissertation: University of London 1975.

Frank, K. Die Bussdisciplin des Kirche von den Apostelzeiten bis zum siebenten Jahrhundert, Mainz 1867.

"Die verhängnisvolle Beichte zu Konstantinopel unter der Regierung des Patriarchen Nektarius," Theologische Quartalschrift 49 (1867) 529-558.

Frend, W.H.C. — The Rise of the Monophysite Movement. Chapters in the History of the Church in the Fifth and Sixth Centuries, Cambridge 1972.

Galtier, P. — "Comment on écarte la pénitence privée," Gregorianum 21 (1940) 183-202.

L'Eglise et la rémission des péchés aux premiers siècles, Paris 1932.

"Pénitents et convertis. De la pénitence latine à la pénitence celtique," RHE 33 (1937) 5-26, 278-305.

"Saint Jean Chrysostome et la Confession," RcSR 1 (1910) 209-240, 313-350.

Gaudemet, J. — "Nomokanon," Paulys Realencyclopädie der Classischen Altertumswissenschaft, edd. G. Wissowa/W. Kroll/K. Mittelhaus, Supplementband 10. 417-429, Stuttgart 1965.

Gero, S. — "Byzantine Iconoclasm and Monachomachy," JEH 28 (1977) 241-248.

"The Eucharistic Doctrine of the Byzantine Iconoclasts," BZ 68 (1975) 4-22.

Gidulianov, P. — "Vopros' o taynoy' ispovědi i dukhovnikakh' vostochnoy tserkvi v' novějshey russkoy literatuře," [The Question of Sacramental Confession and Confessors of the Eastern Church in Recent Russian Literature] VV 14 (1907) 399-442.

Girardet, K.M. — Kaisergericht und Bischofsgericht, Bonn 1975.

Goria, F. — "La Nov. 134, 10;12 di Giustiniano e l'assunzione coattiva dell'abito monastico," in Studi in onore di Giuseppe Grosso, vol. 6, Turin 1974, pp. 55-76.

Gouillard, J. — "Constantin Chrysomallos sous le masque de Syméon le Nouveau Théologien," Travaux et Mémoires 5 (1973) 313-327.

"Deux figures mal connues du second iconoclasme," Byzantion 31 (1961) 371-401.

"Quatre procès de mystiques à Byzance (vers 960-1143). Inspiration et autorité," REB 36 (1978) 5-81.

Graef, H. "The Spiritual Director in the Thought of Symeon the New Theologian," in Kyriakon. Festschrift Johannes Quasten, edd. P. Granfield/J.A. Jungmann, vol. 2, Munster 1970, pp. 608-614.

Greenslade, S.L. "CR: J. Grotz, Die Entwicklung des Busstufenwesens in der vornicänischen Kirche," JTS NS 8 (1957) 330-333.

Grégoire, H. "Iconoclasm and Imperial Rule 717-842," in The Cambridge Medieval History, ed. J.M. Hussey, vol. 4.1, Cambridge 1966, pp. 61-104.

Grillmeier, A./ Bacht, H. edd. Das Konzil von Chalkedon, 3 vols., Würzburg 1951-1954.

Grosdidier de Matons, J. Romanos le mélode et les origines de la poésie religieuse à Byzance, Paris 1977.

Grotz, J. Die Entwicklung des Bussstufenwesens in der vornicänischen Kirche, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1955.

Grumel, V. Les régestes des actes du patriarcat de Constantinople. Vol. I. Les actes des patriarches, fasc. 1-2, Kadiköy-Paris 1932 [1972 2nd ed], 1936.

Guilland, R. Etudes byzantines, Paris 1959.

Guillou, A. "Le système de vie enseigné au VIIIe siècle dans le monde byzantin," in I problemi dell' Occidente nel secolo VIII. Spoleto 6-12 aprile 1972, vol. 1, Spoleto 1973, pp. 343-381.

Guy, J.-C. "Un dialogue monastique inédit περὶ λογισμῶν ," RAM 33 (1957) 171-188.

Hajjar, J. Le synode permanent (ΣΥΝΟΔΟΣ ΕΝΔΗΜΟΥΣΑ) dans l'église byzantine des origines au XIe siècle, Rome 1962.

Harnack, A. von Geschichte der altchristlichen Litteratur bis Eusebius, 2 vols., Leipzig 1893-1897.

Hausherr, I Direction spirituelle en Orient autrefois, Rome 1955.

"L'origine de la théorie orientale des huit péchés capitaux," Orientalia Christiana 30.3 (1933) 164-175.

Penthos. La doctrine de la componction dans l'Orient chrétien, Rome 1944.

Hergenroether, J. — De entalmate graeco patrum spiritualium officium describente additoque brevi de eodem commentario ... , Würzburg 1865.

Herman, E. — "Hat die byzantinische Kirche von selbst eintretende Strafen (poenae latae sententiae) gekannt?" BZ 44 (1951) 258-264.

"Il più antico penitenziale greco," OCP 19 (1953) 70-127.

Hörmann, J. — Untersuchungen zur griechischen Laienbeichte. Ein Beitrag zur allgemeinen Bussgeschichte, Donauwörth 1913.

Hofmann, G. — "Textus byzantini de SS. Eucharistia," in XXXV Congresso Eucaristico Internacional 1952. La Eucaristia y la Paz. Sesiones de estudio, vol. 2, Barcelona 1953, pp. 704-712.

Holl, K. — Enthusiasmus und Bussgewalt beim griechischen Mönchtum. Eine Studie zu Symeon dem Neuen Theologen, Leipzig 1898.

Honigmann, E. — Trois mémoires posthumes d'histoire et de géographie de l'orient chrétien, Brussels 1961.

Hussey, J.M. ed., — The Cambridge Medieval History, vol. 4, 2 parts, Cambridge 1966-1967[2].

Ibañez Ibañez, J./ Menoza Ruiz, F. — "La praxis penitencial y sus presupuestos teologicos en los historiadores griegos de la epoca constantiniana," in El sacramento de la penitencia. Otros estudios. XXX Semana española de teologia 14-18 sept.1970, Madrid 1972, pp. 197-221.

Iljine, V. — "Le mystère de la Pénitence et le Grand Canon de Saint André de Crète," Messager de l'Exarchat du Patriarche russe en Europe occidentale Nr. 6 (1951) 8-16.

Irmscher, J./ Nagel, P. edd. — Studia Byzantina II, Berlin 1973.

Itsines, N.G. — Patriarch Nicholas Mysticos and the Fourth Marriage of Leo VI the Wise, Dissertation: Fordham University 1973.

Janin, R. — Les églises et les monastères des grands centres byzantins, Paris 1975.

La géographie ecclésiastique de l'empire byzantin. Pt. I: Le siège de Constantinople et le patriarcat oecuménique. T.III Les églises et les monastères, Paris 1969 .

"Les novatiens orientaux," EO 28 (1929) 385-397.

Jedin, H. ed. — Handbuch der Kirchengeschichte, 6 vols., Freiburg 1965-1973.

Joannou, P.-P. — Discipline générale antique [IIe-IXe s.] 2 vols., Grottaferrata 1962-1963.

"Le sort des évêques hérétiques réconciliés. Un discours inédit de Nicétas de Serres contre Eustrate de Nicée," Byzantion 28 (1958/1959) 1-30.

Karlin-Hayter, P. — "Le synode à Constantinople de 886 à 912 et le rôle de Nicholas le Mystique dans l'affaire de la tétragamie," JÖBG 19 (1970) 59-101.

Karpp, H. — "Busse: II Busswesen in den christlichen Kirchen," Evangelisches Kirchenlexicon 1. 631-635, Göttingen 1956.

Keane, H. — "The Sacrament of Penance in St. John Chrysostom," Irish Theological Quarterly 14 (1919) 305-317.

Kilmartin, E. — "Office and Charism," TS 38 (1977) 547-554.

Koch, H. — "Zur Geschichte des Bussdisziplin und Bussgewalt in der orientalischen Kirche," Historisches Jahrbuch 21 (1900) 58-78.

Köpstein, H./ Winkelmann, F. edd. — Studien zum 7. Jahrhundert in Byzanz, Berlin 1976.

Kötting, B. — "Die Stellung des Konfessors in der Alten Kirche," JAC 19 (1976) 7-23.

Korbacher, J. — Ausserhalb der Kirche kein Heil? Eine dogmengeschichtliche Untersuchung über Kirche und Kirchenzugehörigkeit bei Johannes Chrysostomus, Munich 1963.

Korolevskij, C. — "Antioche," DHGE 3. 563-703, Paris 1924.

Labriolle, P. de — "Les débuts du monachisme," in Histoire de l'Eglise, edd. A. Fliche/V. Martin, vol. 3, Paris 1936, pp. 299-369.

Lagarde, A. [=J. Turmel] — "St. Jean Chrysostome a-t-il connu la confession?" RHLR NS 4 (1913) 540-559, 5 (1914) 26-62.

Laurent, V. — "L'oeuvre canonique du concile in Trullo (691-692). Source primaire du droit de l'église orientale," REB 23 (1965) 7-41.

Leduc, F. — "Péché et conversion chez S. Jean Chrysostome," Proche Orient Chrétien, 26 (1976) 34-58; 27 (1977) 15-42.

Lehmann, K. "Die Entstehung der Freiheitsstrafe in den Klöstern des heiligen Pachomius," ZSSR/KA 37 (1951) 1-94.

Leroy, J. "La vie quotidienne du moine studite," Irénikon 27 (1954) 21-50.

Lévi-Strauss, C. Structural Anthropology, London 1968.

L'Huillier, P. "Rapport entre pouvoirs d'ordre et de juridiction dans la tradition orientale," Revue de Droit Canonique 23 (1973) 281-289.

Ligier, L. "Dimension personnelle et dimension communautaire de la pénitence en Orient," La Maison-Dieu No 90 (1967) 155-188.

"Pénitence et Eucharistie en Orient. Théologie sur une interférence de prières et de rites," OCP 29 (1963) 5-78.

"Le sacrement de pénitence selon la tradition orientale," Nouvelle Revue Theologique 89 (1967) 940-967.

Luther, M. Werke [Weimarer Ausgabe] ed. J.C.F. Knaake et al., Weimar 1883 ff.

Mango, C. "The Liquidation of Iconoclasm and the Patriarch Photios," in Iconoclasm, edd. A. Bryer/J. Herrin, Birmingham 1977, pp. 133-140.

Mansi, G.D. Sacrorum conciliorum nova et amplissima collectio, 31 vols., Florence/Venice 1759-1798.

Mateos, J. "Prières syriennes d'absolution du VIIe - IXe siècles," OCP 34 (1968) 252-280.

Mathews, T.F. The Early Churches of Constantinople: Architecture and Liturgy, University Park/London 1971.

Meester, P. de Studi sui sacramenti amministrati secondo il rito bizantino, Rome 1947.

Meinhold, P. "Busswesen. II. In der christlichen Kirche," Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart 1. 1544-1554, edd. K. Galling et al., Tübingen 1957 .

Mitsakes, K. Βυζαντινὴ Ὑμνογραφία, vol. 1, Thessalonica 1971.

Morin, J. Commentarius historicus de disciplina in administratione sacramentali poenitentiae tredecim primis seculis in ecclesia occidentali, et huc usque in orientali observata, in decem libros distinctus, Antwerp 1682.

Mortimer, R.C. The Origins of Private Penance in the Western Church, Oxford 1939.

Mügge, M. — Reconciliatio cum ecclesia. Eine dogmengeschichtliche Untersuchung über den ekklesiologischen Aspekt des Busssakramentes, Dissertation: Münster Westfalen 1975.

Murphy, F.-X./ Sherwood, P. — Constantinople II et Constantinople III, Paris 1974.

Nesbitt, J./ Wiita, J. — "A Confraternity of the Comnenian Era," BZ 68 (1975) 360-384.

Neunheuser, B. — Eucharistie in Mittelalter und Neuzeit, Freiburg etc. 1963.

Neyt, F. — "Un type d'autorité charismatique," Byzantion 44 (1974) 343-361.

Noetlichs, K.L. — "Materialien zum Bischofsbild aus der spätantiken Rechtsquellen," JAC 16 (1973) 28-59.

Oppenheim, P. — Das Mönchskleid im christlichen Altertum, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1931.

Oudot, J. — Patriarchatus Constantinopolitani Acta Selecta I, Vatican City 1941.

Palachovsky, V. — "La pénitence dans le cycle divine de la Liturgie byzantine," in Liturgie et rémission des péchés, edd. A. Pistoia/A. Triacca, Rome 1975, pp. 197-210.

Palmer, P.F. — "Jean Morin and the Problem of Private Penance, TS 6 (1945) 317-357; 7 (1946) 281-308.

Palmieri, A. — "I padri spirituali nei monasteri d'Oriente e la storia della confessione sacramentale," Rivista storico-critica della scienze teologice 3 (1907) 121-133.

Papadopoulos-Kerameus, A. — "Ἀντώνιος Στουδίτης," Νέα Σιών 2 (1905) 807-815.

Pargoire, J. — L'Eglise byzantine de 527 à 847, Paris 1905.

"Mont Saint-Auxence. Etude historique et topographique," ROC 8 (1903) 15-31, 240-279, 426-458, 550-576.

Paverd, F. van de — "La pénitence dans le rite byzantin," Questions Liturgiques 54 (1973) 191-203.

"Die Quellen der kanonischen Briefe Basileios des Grossen," OCP 38 (1972) 5-63.

Paverd, F. van de (con't) — Zur Geschichte der Messliturgie in Antiocheia und Konstantinopel gegen Ende des vierten Jahrhunderts. (Analyse der Quellen bei Johannes Chrysostomus), Rome 1970.

Pavlov, A.S. — "Grecheskaya zapis' o tserkovnom' sudě nad' ubiyt$ami, pribĕgayushchimi pod' zashchitu tserkvi," [A Greek Record Concerning the Ecclesiastical Tribunal for Murderers Taking Refuge Under Church Asylum] VV 4 (1897) 155-159.

Petau, D. — De la pénitence publique et de la préparation à la communion, Paris 1645³.

Petrides, S. — "Le monastère des Spoudaei à Jerusalem et les Spoudaei de Constantinople," EO 4 (1901) 224-231.

Pistoia, A./ Triacca, A. edd. — Liturgie et rémission des péchés, Rome 1975.

Poschmann, B. — Busse und letzte Ölung, Freiburg 1951.

Paenitentia Secunda: Die kirchliche Busse im ältesten Christentum bis Cyprian und Origenes, Bonn 1940.

Penance and the Anointing of the Sick, Freiburg etc. 1964.

Quasten, J. — Patrology, 3 vols., Utrecht etc. 1950-1960.

Raes, A. — "Les formulaires grecs du rite de la pénitence," in Mélanges en l'honneur de Monseigneur Michel Andrieu, Strasbourg 1956, pp. 365-372.

Rahner, K. — Frühe Bussgeschichte in Einzeluntersuchungen. Schriften zur Theologie. Bd. XI, Zurich etc. 1973.

Rai, P. — "L'économie dans le droit canonique byzantin des origines jusqu'au XIe siècle," Istina 18 (1973) 260-326.

Rauschen, G. — Eucharistie und Busssakrament in den ersten sechs Jahrhunderten der Kirche, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1908.

Jahrbücher der christlichen Kirche unter dem Kaiser Theodosius dem Grossen, Freiburg-im-Breisgau 1897.

Renoux, C. — "Eucharistie et rémission des péchés dans les Anaphores Arméniennes," Didaskalia 3 (1973) 201-214.

Richard, M. "Le commentaire du Grand Canon d'André de Crète par Acace le Sabaïte," ΣΕΒΣ 34 (1965) 304-311.

"Le Traité de Georges hiéromoine sur les hérésies," REB 28 (1970) 239-269.

Rinvolucri, M. Anatomy of a Church. Greek Orthodoxy Today, London 1966.

Ritter, A.M. Charisma im Verständnis des Johannes Chrysostomus und seiner Zeit. Ein Beitrag zur Erforschung der griechisch-orientalischen Ekklesiologie in der Frühzeit der Reichskirche, Göttingen 1972.

Rossum, J. van "Priesthood and Confession in St. Symeon the New Theologian," St. Vladimir's Theological Quarterly 20 (1976) 220-228.

Rousseau, P. Ascetics, Authority, and the Church in the Age of Jerome and Cassian, Oxford 1978.

Schmemann, A. Introduction to Liturgical Theology, Crestwood, New York 1975 .

Schmid, H.-F. "Penitentiels byzantins et occidentaux," in Actes du VIe Congrès International d'Etudes Byzantines: Paris 27 juillet - 2 août 1948, vol. 1, Paris 1950, pp. 359-363.

Schwartz, E. "Die Kanonessammlungen der alten Reichskirche," ZSSR/KA 56 (1936) 1-114.

"Die Kanonessammlung des Joannes Scholastikos," Sitzungsberichte des Bayerischen Akademie der Wissenschaften. Philosophisch-historische Abteilung, Nr. 6, Munich 1933.

Selb, W. "Die Kanonessammlungen der orientalischen Kirche und das griechische corpus canonum der Reichskirche," in Speculum Iuris et Ecclesiarum [Festschrift W.M. Plöchl], Vienna 1967, pp. 371-383.

Seriski, P. Poenae in iure byzantino ecclesiastico ab initiis ad saeculum XI (1054), Rome 1941.

Sirmond, J. Historia paenitentiae publicae, Paris 1651.

Smirnov, S.I. Dukhovniy otets v' drevnei vostochnoy tserkvi, [The Spiritual Father in the Ancient Eastern Church] vol. 1, Sergiev Posad 1906.

Steidle, B. "Fürbitten in der frühen Christenheit und im ältesten Mönchtum," Erbe und Auftrag 48 (1972) 448-460.

Stiglmayr, J. "Ein interessanter Brief aus dem kirchlichen Altertum," ZKT 24 (1900) 657-671.

Suvorov, N. "CR: K. Holl, Enthusiasmus und Bussgewalt beim griechischen Mönchtum," VV 6 (1899) 475-524.

"K' istorii nravstvennago ucheniya v' vostochnoy tserkvi," [On the History of Moral Teaching in the Eastern Church] VV 10 (1903) 31-62.

K' voprosu o taynoy ispovědi i o dukhovnikakh' v' vostochnoy tserkvi, [On the Question of Sacramental Confession and of Confessors in the Eastern Church] Moscow 1906².

Ob'em' distsiplinarnago suda i yurisdiktsii tserkvi v' period' vselenskikh' soborov', [The Scope of the Disciplinary Tribunal and Ecclesiastical Jurisdiction in the Period of the Ecumenical Councils] Moscow 1906².

"Věroyatny sostav drevněyshago ispovědnago i pokayannago ustava v' vostochnoy tserkvi," [The Probable Composition of the Oldest Rule of Confession and Penance in the Eastern Church] VV 8 (1901) 357-434; 9 (1902) 378-417.

Tentler, T.N. Sin and Confession on the Eve of the Reformation, Princeton 1977.

Tillemont, L.S. Le Nain de Mémoires pour servir à l'histoire ecclésiastique des six premiers siècles ... , vol. 9, Paris 1714².

Timiades, E. Αἱ ἀρχαὶ τῆς μετανοίας , Athens 1967 [1966].

Troianos, S.N. "Die Sonderstellung des Kaisers im früh- und mittelbyzantinischen kirchlichen Prozess," Byzantina 3 (1971) 71-80.

Ueding, L. "Die Kanones von Chalkedon in ihrer Bedeutung für Mönchtum und Klerus," in Das Konzil von Chalkedon, edd. A. Grillmeier/H. Bacht, vol. 2, Wurzburg 1953, pp. 569-676.

Vacandard, E. "II. Confession du Ier au XIIIe siècle. IIe Période [IVe-XIIIe siècle]. Discipline de l'Eglise Grecque," DTC 3.1. 861-874, Paris 1906.

"L'origine des prêtres pénitenciers," Revue du Clergé Français 42 (1905) 361-386, 640-643.

Valdman, T.D. — "Însemnătatea sinodului al VI-lea ecumenic pentru codificarea canoanelor [The Significance of the Sixth Ecumenical Council for the Codification of the Canons]," Studii Teologice NS 22 (1970) 713-722.

Veilleux, A. — La liturgie dans le coenobitisme pachômien au quatrième siècle, Rome 1968.

Ven, P. van den — "Les écrits de S. Syméon Stylite le Jeune avec trois sermons inédits," Le Muséon 70 (1957) 1-57.

Victorius, Marianus [Reatinus] — De sacramento confessionis seu paenitentiae, historia, ex veteribus sanctis patribus collecta, per quam contra haereticos Lutheranos copiose ostenditur, sacramentalem confessionem ab ipso Christo institutam esse, et in Ecclesiae catholicae usu usque ad nostra tempora semper observatam, Rome 1562.

Völker, W. — Scala Paradisi. Eine Studie zu Johannes Climacus und zugleich eine Vorstudie zu Symeon dem Neuen Theologen, Wiesbaden 1968.

Vogel, C. — Les "Libri paenitentiales," [=Typologie des sources du moyen âge occidental, fascicule 27] Turnhout 1978.

Vogt, H.J. — Coetus Sanctorum. Der Kirchenbegriff des Novatian und die Geschichte seiner Sonderkirche, Bonn 1968.

Ware, K.T. — The Ascetic Writings of Mark the Hermit, Dissertation: Oxford University 1965.

"The Monk and the Married Christian: Some Comparisons in Early Monastic Sources," ECR 6 (1974) 72-83.

Wellesz, E. — A History of Byzantine Music and Hymnography, Oxford 1961 [2 rev].

Winkelmann, F. — "Kirche und Gesellschaft in Byzanz vom Ende des 6. bis zum Beginn des 8. Jahrhunderts," Klio 59 (1977) 477-489.

Winkler, G. — "L'aspect pénitentiel dans les Offices du soir en Orient et en Occident," in Liturgie et rémission des péchés, edd. A. Pistoia/A. Triacca, Rome 1975, pp. 273-293.

"Uber der Busscharakter der byzantinischen Missa Praesanctificatorum," Ephemerides Liturgicae 88 (1974) 117-123.

Xiberta, B.M. [J. Perarnau, ed.] — "Clavis Ecclesiae. De ordine absolutionis sacramentalis ad reconciliationem cum Ecclesia," Analecta Sacra Tarraconensia 45 (1972) 241-341.

Yannopoulos, P.A. — La société profane dans l'empire byzantin des VIIe, VIIIe et IXe siècles, Louvain 1975.

ADDENDUM

Stiernon, D. — "La Vision d'Isaïe de Nicomédie," REB 35 (1977) 5-42.

D. WORKS RELATING TO BYZANTINE HAGIOGRAPHY

Abrahamse, D.Z. de F. — Hagiographic Sources for Byzantine Cities. 500-900 AD, Dissertation: University of Michigan 1967.

Alexander, P.J. — The Oracle of Baalbek. The Tiburtine Sibyl in Greek Dress, Washington 1967.

Amore, A. — San Marciano di Siracusa. Studio archeologico-agiografico, Vatican City 1958.

Anrich, G. — Hagios Nikolaos. Der heilige Nikolaos in der griechischen Kirche. Texte und Untersuchungen, 2 vols., Leipzig/Berlin 1913-1917.

Anson, J. — "The Female Transvestite in Early Monasticism. The Origin and Development of a Motif," Viator 5 (1974) 1-32.

Aubineau, M. — "Une homelie grécque inédite 'sur tous les martyrs' attribuée à Jean Chrysostome (BHG 1191e)," in Forma Futuri. Studi in Onore del Cardinale Michele Pellegrino, Turin 1975, pp. 614-632.

Les homélies festales d'Hésychius de Jérusalem. Vol. I: Les homélies I-XV, Brussels 1978.

"Le panégyrique de Thècle attribué à Jean Chrysostome (BHG 1720): la fin retrouvée d'un texte mutilé," AB 93 (1975) 349-362.

"La Vie inédite de Chrysostome par Martyrios. Un nouveau témoin: Athos, Koutloumousiou 13," AB 94 (1976) 394.

Baker, D. — "Theodore of Sykeon and the Historians," in The Orthodox Churches and the West, ed. D. Baker, Oxford 1976, pp. 83-96.

Bartelink, G.J.M. — Callinicos, Vie d'Hypatios, Paris 1961.

Palladio, La Storia Lausiaca, Milan 1974.

Bartelink, G.J.M./ Mohrmann, C. — Vita di Antonio, Milan 1974.

Barnes, T.D. — "The Emperor Constantine's Good Friday Sermon," JTS NS 27 (1976) 414-423.

"Pre-Decian Acta Martyrum," JTS NS 19 (1968) 509-531.

"Two Speeches by Eusebius," GRBS 18 (1977) 341-345.

Baur, C. "'Georgius Alexandrinus'," BZ 27 (1927) 1-16.

Baynes, N. "The Vita S. Danielis Stylitae," EHR 40 (1925) 397-402.

Beševliev, V. "Randbemerkungen über die 'Miracula Sancti Demetrii," Byzantina 2 (1970) 285-300.

Bornert, R./ Gouillard, J./ Périchon, P./ Salaville, S. Nicolas Cabasilas. Explication de la divine liturgie, Paris 1967.

Brennan, B.R. "Dating Athanasius' Vita Antonii," VC 30 (1976) 52-54.

Brock, S. "An Early Syriac Life of Maximus the Confessor," AB 91 (1973) 299-346.

Bröcker, H. Der hl. Thalelaios. Texte und Untersuchungen. Münster 1976.

Brown, P.R.L. "A Dark-Age Crisis: Aspects of the Iconoclast Controversy," EHR 88 (1973) 1-34.

"The Rise and Function of the Holy Man in Late Antiquity," JRS 61 (1971) 80-101.

Buck, D.F. "The Structure of the Lausiac History," Byzantion 46 (1976) 292-307.

Canart, P. "Le dossier hagiographique des SS. Baras, Patapios et Raboulas," AB 87 (1969) 445-459.

Chadwick, H. "John Moschus and His Friend Sophronius the Sophist," JTS NS 25 (1974) 41-74.

Christides, V. "Once Again the 'Narrationes' of Nilus Sinaiticus," Byzantion 43 (1973) 39-50.

Croce, I. "Per la cronologia della vita di S. Gregorio Agrigentino," BBGG NS 4 (1950) 189-207; 5 (1951) 77-91.

Da Costa-Louillet, G. "Saints de Constantinople aux VIIIe, IXe et Xe siècles," Byzantion 24 (1954) 179-263, 453-511; 25-27 (1955-1957) 783-852.

"Saints de Grèce aux VIIIe, IXe et Xe siècles," Byzantion 31 (1961) 309-369.

"Saints de Sicile et d'Italie Méridionale aux VIIIe, IXe et Xe siècles," Byzantion 29/30 (1959/1960) 89-173.

Dagron, G. "L'auteur des 'Actes' et des 'Miracles' de sainte Thècle," AB 92 (1974) 5-11.

"La Vie ancienne de saint Marcel l'Acémète," AB 86 (1968) 271-321.

Vie et Miracles de Sainte Thècle, Brussels 1978.

Daniélou, J. "La chronologie des sermons de Grégoire de Nysse," RSR 29 (1955) 346-372.

Datema, C. Asterius of Amasea. Homilies I-XIV. Text, Introduction and Notes, Leiden 1970.

Delehaye, H. "Bulletin des publications hagiographiques," AB 15 (1896) 332-334; 23 (1904) 476-480.

Cinq leçons sur la méthode hagiographique, Brussels 1934.

"Cyprien d'Antioche et Cyprien de Carthage," AB 39 (1921) 314-332.

Les légendes hagiographiques, Brussels 1955⁴.

"Narratio Sergiae de translatione sanctae Olympiadis," AB 16 (1897) 44-51.

L'oeuvre des Bollandistes à travers trois siècles, 1615-1915, Brussels 1959².

Les origines du culte des martyrs, Brussels 1933²rev.

Les passions des martyrs et les genres littéraires, Brussels 1966²rev.

"Les recueils antiques de miracles des saints," AB 43 (1925) 5-85, 305-325.

"Saints de Chypre," AB 26 (1907) 161-301.

Les saints stylites, Brussels 1962²rp.

"Les saints de Thrace et de Mésie," AB 31 (1912) 161-300.

"Le synaxaire de Sirmond," AB 14 (1895) 396-434.

Synaxarium Ecclesiae Constantinopolitanae, Brussels 1902.

"Une Vie inédite de saint Jean l'Aumônier," AB 45 (1927) 5-74.

Delehaye, H. (con't) "Vita Sanctae Olympiadis et Narratio Sergiae de eiusdem translatione," AB 15 (1896) 400-423.

Detorakes, Th. Οἱ ἅγιοι τῆς πρώτης Βυζαντίνης Περιόδου τῆς Κρήτης καὶ ἡ σχετικὴ πρὸς αὐτοὺς φιλολογία, Athens 1970.

Deubner, L. Kosmas und Damian. Texte und Einleitung, Leipzig 1907.

Devos, P. "Quand est mort l'abbé S. Isaïe de Scété," AB 86 (1968) 350.

"Sainte Anastasie la vierge et la source de sa Passion (BHG 76z)," AB 80 (1962) 33-51.

Dobschütz, E. von "Methodios und die Studiten," BZ 18 (1909) 41-105.

Dörries, H. "Die Vita Antonii als Geschichtsquelle," in Nachrichten von der Akademie der Wissenschaften in Göttingen. Philologisch-Historische Klasse, 1949, Göttingen 1949, pp. 359-410.

Dujčev, I. "A propos de la Vie de saint Pierre d'Atroa," Byzantinoslavica 27 (1966) 92-97.

Durand, G.M. de "Evagre le Pontique et le Dialogue sur la Vie de Saint Jean Chrysostome," BLE 77 (1976) 191-206.

Dvornik, F. Les légendes de Constantin et de Méthode vues de Byzance, Hattiesburg 1969².

Erhard, A. Überlieferung und Bestand der hagiographischen und homiletischen Literatur der griechischen Kirche, 3 vols., Leipzig 1937-1952.

Esbroeck, M. van "L'Ethiopie à l'époque de Justinien: S. Arethas de Neǧrān et S. Athanase de Clysma," in IV Congresso Internazionale di Studi Etiopici. (Roma, 10-15 aprile 1972, I & II), Rome 1974, vol. 1, pp. 117-139.

Fernandez Marcos, N. Los Thaumata de Sofronio. Contribución al estudio de la Incubatio cristiana, Madrid 1975.

Festugière, A.-J. Leontios de Neapolis: Vie de Syméon le Fou et Vie de Jean de Chypre, Paris 1974.

Les moines d'Orient. 4 vols., Paris 1961-1965.

"Le problème littéraire de l'Historia Monachorum," Hermes 83 (1955) 257-284.

Festugière, A.-J. (con't) — Sainte Thècle, Saints Côme et Damien, Saints Cyr et Jean (Extraits), Saint Georges. Collections grecques de miracles, Paris 1971.

Vie de Théodore de Sykéon, 2 vols., Brussels 1970.

Follieri, E. — "Problemi di agiografica bizantina: il contributo dell'innografia allo studio dei testi agiografici in prosa," BBGG NS 31 (1977) 3-14.

"La Vita inedita di S. Fantino il giovane nel codice Mosquensis 478," in Atti del 4° Congresso storico calabrese, Naples 1969, pp. 17-35.

Franchi di Cavalieri, P. — "Una pagina di storia bizantina del secolo IV. Il martirio dei santi notari," AB 64 (1946) 132-175.

Gamillscheg, E. — "Historische Gegebenheiten im Spiegel hagiographischer Texte," JÖBG 25 (1975) 1-23.

Garitte, G. — "Le début de la Vie de S. Etienne le Sabaïte retrouvé en arabe au Sinaï," AB 77 (1959) 332-369.

"L'édition des Vies de saint Spyridon par M. van den Ven," RHE 50 (1955) 125-140.

"La Vie grecque inédite de saint Grégoire d'Arménie (Ms. 4 d'Ochrida)," AB 83 (1965) 233-290.

"La Vie prémétaphrastique de S. Chariton," Bulletin de l'"Institut Historique Belge de Rome 21 (1940/1941) 5-50.

Garrigues, J.-M. — "Le martyre de Saint Maxime le Confesseur," Revue Thomiste 54 (1976) 410-452.

Geenen, G. — "'Legenda Theophili'. Speculum historico-doctrinale de Mediatione Matris Dei in Alto Medio Ævo (a saec. VII ad XII)," Marianum 34 (1972) 396-430.

Gelzer, L. — Leontios' von Neapolis Leben des heiligen Johannes des Barmherzigen, Erzbischofs von Alexandrien, Freiburg 1893.

Gorce, D. — Vie de sainte Mélanie, Paris 1962.

Gouillard, J. — "Christianisme byzantin et slave," Ecole pratique des Hautes Etudes. Ve Section. Sciences Religieuses. Annuaire 82 (1974) 213-219; 83 (1975) 259-263.

Grégoire, H./ Kugener, M.-A. — Marc le Diacre. Vie de Porphyre, Paris 1930.

Gribomont, J. "Les Apophtegmes du désert," RSLR 13 (1977) 534-541.

Grosdidier de Matons, J. "Philologie byzantine," Ecole pratique des Hautes Etudes. IVe Section. Sciences Historiques et Philologiques. Annuaire 105 (1972/1973) 349-352.

"Les themes d'édification dans la Vie d'André Salos," Travaux et Mémoires 4 (1970) 277-328.

Guillaumont, A. "Une notice syriaque inédite sur la Vie de l'abbé Isaïe," AB 67 (1949) 350-360.

Guy, J.-C. "Note sur l'évolution du genre apophtegmatique," Revue d'Ascétique et de Mystique 32 (1956) 63-68.

Hagiographi Bollandiani/ Franchi de' Cavalieri, P. Catalogus codicum hagiographicorum graecorum bibliothecae Vaticanae, Brussels 1899.

Halkin, F. Auctarium Bibliothecae Hagiographicae Graecae, Brussels 1969.

Bibliotheca Hagiographica Graeca, 3 vols., Brussels 1957, 3rd ed. rev.

"CR: H. Grégoire/M.-A. Kugener, Marc le Diacre. Vie de Porphyre, évêque de Gaza," AB 49 (1931) 155-160.

"CR: L. Lamza, Patriarch Germanos I. von Konstantinopel (715-730)," AB 93 (1975) 422-424.

"CR: G. Rossi-Taibbi, Vita di Sant'Elia il Giovane," AB 81 (1963) 291-293.

Douze récits byzantins sur saint Jean Chrysostome, Brussels 1977.

"Entre ciel et enfer, Philentolus," AB 90 (1972) 323-327.

Euphémie de Chalcédoine. Légendes byzantines, Brussels 1965.

"L'hagiographie byzantine au service de l'histoire," in Proceedings of the XIIIth International Congress of Byzantine Studies, Oxford 5-10 Sept. 1966, edd. J.M. Hussey/D. Obolensky/ S. Runciman, London 1967, pp. 345-354.

Manuscrits grecs de Paris. Inventaire hagiographique, Brussels 1968.

Halkin, F. (con't) "Une nouvelle recension de la Vie de Ste. Eupraxie," AB 79 (1961) 160.

"Une passion de saint Mocius, martyr à Byzance," AB 83 (1965) 5-22.

"Saint Thaïlée anachorète ou martyr?" AB 95 (1977) 72.

"Sainte Elisabeth d'Héraclée, abesse à Constantinople," AB 91 (1973) 249-264.

"Trois textes inédits sur les saints Hermyle et Stratonice, martyrs à Singidunum (Belgrade)," AB 89 (1971) 5-45.

"La Vie de saint Nicéphore fondateur de Médikion en Bithynie (+813)," AB 78 (1960) 396-430.

"La vision de Kaioumas et le sort éternel de Philentolos Olympiou," AB 63 (1945) 56-64.

"Y a-t-il trois saints Georges, évêques de Mytilène et 'confesseurs' sous les iconoclastes?" AB 77 (1959) 464-469.

Hansack, E. Die Vita des Johannes Chrysostomos des Georgios von Alexandrien in kirchenslavischer Übersetzung, vol. 1, Würzburg 1975.

Hennecke, E. New Testament Apocrypha, ed. W. Schneemelcher, 2 vols., London 1973-1974.

Hertling, L. "Hagiographische Texte zur Bussgeschichte des frühesten Mittelalters," ZKT 55 (1931) 274-287.

"Hagiographische Texte zur frühmittelalterlichen Bussgeschichte," ZKT 55 (1931) 109-122.

Hoeck, J.M. "Stand und Aufgaben der Damaskenos-Forschung," OCP 17 (1951) 5-60.

Holl, K. Amphilochius von Ikonium in seinem Verhältnis zu den grossen Kappadozern, Tübingen/Leipzig 1904.

Howard-Johnston, J.D. "CR: A.-J. Festugière, Vie de Théodore de Sykéon," JTS NS 24 (1973) 278-281.

Huxley, G. "On the Vita of St. John of Gotthia," GRBS 19 (1978) 161-169.

"On the Vita pf St. Stephen the Younger," GRBS 18 (1977) 97-108.

"The Sixty Martyrs of Jerusalem," GRBS 18 (1977) 369-374.

Irmscher, J. — "The Pseudo-Clementines," in New Testament Apocrypha, edd. E. Hennecke/W. Schneemelcher, vol. 2, London 1974, pp. 532-570.

James, M.R. — Apocrypha Anecdota, Cambridge 1893.

Joannou, P.-P. — "Vie de S. Germain l'Hagiorite par son contemporain le Patriarche Philothée de Constantinople," AB 70 (1952) 35-115.

Jong, H.W.M. de — "Demonic Diseases in Sophronios' 'Thaumata'," Janus 50 (1961-1963) 1-8.

Kaegi, W.E. Jr. — "New Evidence on the Early Reign of Heraclius," BZ 66 (1973) 308-330.

"Notes on Hagiographic Sources for Some Institutional Changes and Continuities in the Early Seventh Century," Byzantina 7 (1975) 59-70.

Karlin-Hayter, P. — Vita Euthymii Patriarchae CP, Brussels 1970.

Lackner, W. — "CR: L. Lamza, Patriarch Germanos I. von Konstantinopel (715-730)," BZ 71 (1978) 90-96.

"Ein hagiographisches Zeugnis für den Antapodotikos des Patriarchen Germanos I. von Konstantinopel," Byzantion 38 (1938) 42-104.

"Zu Quellen und Datierung der Maximosvita (BHG^3 1234)," AB 85 (1967) 285-316.

Lafontaine, G. — La version grecque ancienne du livre arménien d'Agathange. Edition critique, Louvain-la-Neuve 1973.

Laga, C. — "Remarques sur l'emploi de quelques particules dans l'oeuvre hagiographique de Léonce de Neapolis, OLP 6/7 (1975-1976) 341-353.

Lappa-Zizicas, E. — "Un épitomé inédit de la Vie de S. Jean l'Aumônier par Jean et Sophronios," AB 88 (1970) 265-278.

Laurent, V. — La Vie merveilleuse de saint Pierre d'Atroa (+837), Brussels 1956.

La Vita retractata et les Miracles posthumes de saint Pierre d'Atroa, Brussels 1958.

Lazzati, G. — Gli sviluppi della letteratura sui martiri nei primi quattro secoli, Turin 1956.

Leroy, J. (+)/ Glorie, F. — "'Eusèbe d'Alexandrie' source d' 'Eusèbe de Gaule'," Sacris Erudiri 19 (1969-1970) 33-70.

Levison, W. — "Konstantinische Schenkung und Silvester-Legende," in Miscellanea Francesco Ehrle [=SeT 38] vol. 2, Rome 1924, pp. 159-247.

Linder, A. "The Myth of Constantine the Great in the West: Sources and Hagiographic Commemoration," Studi Medievali. Serie Terza 16, 1 (1975) 43-95.

Lo Cascio, F. La forma letteraria della Vita di Apollonio Tianeo, Palermo 1974.

Loenertz, R.-J. "Saint David de Thessalonique. Sa Vie, son culte, ses reliques, ses images," REB 11 (1953) 205-222.

Lolos, A. Die Apokalypse des Ps-Methodius, Meisenheim-am-Glan 1976.

Magoulias, H.J. "Bathhouse, Inn, Tavern, Prostitution and the Stage as Seen in the Lives of the Saints of the Sixth and Seventh Centuries," ΕΕΒΣ 38 (1971) 233-252.

"The Lives of Byzantine Saints as Sources of Data for the History of Magic in the VIth and VIIth Centuries: Sorcery, Relics, and Icons," Byzantion 37 (1967) 228-269.

"The Lives of the Saints as Sources of Data for the History of Byzantine Medicine in the Sixth and Seventh Centuries," BZ 57 (1964) 127-150.

"The Lives of the Saints as Sources of Data for the History of Commerce in the Byzantine Empire in the VIth and VIIth Centuries," Κληρονομία 3(1971) 303-330.

The Lives of the Saints as Sources of Data for Sixth and Seventh Century Byzantine Social and Economic History, Dissertation: Harvard 1962.

Mango, C. Byzantine Literature as a Distorting Mirror, Oxford 1975.

"The Monastery of St. Abercius at Kurşunlu (Elegmi) in Bithynia," DOP 22 (1968) 169-176 + 15 plates.

Mayerson, P. "Observations on 'Nilus' Narrationes: Evidence for an Unknown Christian Sect?" Journal of the American Research Center in Egypt 12 (1975) 51-74.

Meyer, L. Saint Jean Chrysostome, maître de perfection chrétienne, Paris 1933.

Miller, D. "The Emperor and the Stylite. A Note on the Imperial Office," GOTR 15 (1970) 207-212.

Moffatt, A. "Schooling in the Iconoclast Centuries," in Iconoclasm, edd. A. Bryer/J. Herrin, Birmingham 1977, pp. 85-92.

Mohrmann, C. "La 'Vita Antonii' di Sant'Atanasio," in Vita di Antonio, edd. G.J.M. Bartelink/C. Mohrmann, Milan 1974, pp. lxix-lxxxiii.

Mossay, J. "Gregor von Nazianz in Konstantinopel (379-381 AD)," Byzantion 47 (1977) 223-238.

Musurillo, H. The Acts of the Christian Martyrs, Oxford 1972.

Nau, F. "CR: H. Grégoire/M.-A. Kugener edd., Marc le Diacre. Vie de Porphyre," ROC 27 (1929/1930) 422-441.

"Sur diverses homélies pseudépigraphiques, sur les oeuvres attribuées à Eusèbe d'Alexandrie et sur un nouveau manuscrit de la chaîne contra Severianos," ROC 13 (1908) 406-435.

"Le texte grec des récits du moine Anastase sur les saints pères du Sinaï," Oriens Christianus 2 (1902) 58-89.

"Le texte grec des récits utiles à l'ame d'Anastase (le Sinaïte)," Oriens Christianus 3 (1903) 56-90.

-Nesbitt, J.W. "A Geographical and Chronological Guide to Greek Saint Lives," OCP 35 (1969) 443-489.

"The Life of St. Philaretos (702-792) and Its Significance for Byzantine Agriculture," GOTR 14 (1969) 150-158.

Noret, J. "Ménologes, synaxaires, ménées. Essai de clarification d'une terminologie," AB 86 (1968) 21-24.

Noret, J./ Eyice, S. "S. Lucien, disciple de S. Lucien d'Antioche. A propos d'une inscription de Kirşehir (Turquie)," AB 91 (1973) 363-377.

O'Connell, P. "The Letters and Catecheses of St. Theodore Studites," OCP 38 (1972) 256-259.

Oikonomides, N.A. "Ὁ βίος τοῦ ἁγίου Θεοδώρου Κυθήρων (10ος αἰ.) (12 Μαΐου -BHG^3, ἀρ. 2430)," in Πρακτικὰ τρίτου πανιονίου συνεδρίου 23-29 Σεπτεμβρίου 1965, edd. P.K. Bouboulides/M.G. Nystazopoulos, vol. 1, Athens 1967, pp. 264-291.

Oldfather, W.A. et al. Studies in the Text Tradition of St. Jerome's Vitae Patrum, Urbana 1943.

Ommeslaeghe, F. van — "La valeur historique de la Vie de S. Jean Chrysostome attribuée à Martyrius d'Antioche (BHG 781)," in Studia Patristica 12, ed. E. A. Livingstone [=TU 115], Berlin 1975, pp. 478-483.

Outtier, B. — "Saint Ephrem d'après ses biographies et ses oeuvres," Parole de l'Orient 4 (1973) 11-33.

Papachryssanthou, D. — "Un confesseur du second iconoclasme. La Vie du patrice Nicétas (+836)," Travaux et Mémoires 3 (1968) 309-351.

"La Vie ancienne de saint Pierre l'Athonite. Date, composition et valeur historique," AB 92 (1974) 19-61.

Papadakis, A. — "Hagiography in Relation to Iconoclasm," GOTR 14 (1969) 159-180.

Papadopoulos-Kerameus, A. — Varia Graeca Sacra, St. Petersburg 1909.

Papageorgiou, A. — "Ὁ Ἅγιος Αὐξίβιος," Ἀπόστολος Βαρνάβας 29 3rd series (1968) 336-348.

Patlagean, E. — "Ancienne hagiographie byzantine et histoire sociale," Annales. Economies, Sociétés, Civilisations 23 (1-2) (1968) 106-126.

"L'histoire de la femme déguisée en moine et l'évolution de la sainteté féminine à Byzance," Studi Medievali. Serie Terza 17 (1976) 597-623.

"Les moines grecs d'Italie et l'apologie des thèses pontificales (VIIIe-IXe siècles)," Studi Medievali. Serie Terza 5,2 (1964) 579-602.

Pattenden, P. — "The Text of the Pratum Spirituale," JTS NS 26 (1975) 38-54.

Pavlovskis, Z. — "The Life of St. Pelagia the Harlot: Hagiographical Adaptation of Pagan Romance," Classical Folia 30 (1976) 138-149.

Peeters, P. — "CR: A. Vasiliyev, 'Zhitie sv. Gregentiya, episkopa Omiritskago'," AB 31 (1912) 108-109.

Figures bollandiennes contemporaines, Brussels 1948.

"La Passion de S. Pierre de Capitolias (+ 13 Janvier 715)," AB 57 (1939) 299-333.

"S. Dometios le martyr et S. Dometios le médecin," AB 57 (1939) 72-104.

Peeters, P. (con't) — Le tréfonds oriental de l'hagiographie byzantine, Brussels 1950.

"Une Vie grecque du pape S. Martin I," AB 51 (1933) 225-262.

Peña, I./ Castellana, P./ Fernandez, R. — Les stylites syriens, Milan 1975.

Pertusi, A. — "L'encomio di S. Anastasio martire persano," AB 76 (1958) 5-63.

Phoundoules, I.M. — Λεσβιακὸν Ἑορτολόγιον Α΄. Οἱ Ἅγιοι Γεώργιοι ἀρχιεπίσκοποι Μυτιλήνης, Athens 1959.

Λεσβιακὸν Ἑορτολόγιον Γ΄. Οἱ ὅσιοι αὐτάδελφοι Δαβίδ, Συμεὼν καὶ Γεώργιος οἱ ὁμολογητεί, Athens 1961.

Places, E. des — Diadoque de Photicé. Oeuvres spirituelles, Paris 1966 .

Quispel, G./ Zandee, J. — "A Coptic Fragment from the Life of Eupraxia," VC 13 (1959) 193-203.

Radermacher, L. — Griechische Quellen zur Faustsage, Vienna/ Leipzig 1927.

Regel, W. — Analecta Byzantino-Russica, St. Petersburg 1891.

Regnault, L. ed. — Les sentences des pères du désert. Nouveau recueil, Sablé-sur-Sarthe 1970.

Regnault, L./ Bernard, O./ Bouvet, J. — Vie de Sainte Synclétique et Discours de salut à une vierge, Bégrolles-en-Mauge 1972.

Regnault, L./ Préville, J. de — Dorothée de Gaza. Oeuvres spirituelles, Paris 1963.

Reichmann, V. — Römische Literatur in griechischer Übersetzung, Leipzig 1943.

Richard, M. — "Corpus Christianorum. Series Graeca," in Corpus Christianorum. Series Graeca, Turnhout n.d., pp. 3-23.

"Les textes hagiographiques du codex Athos Philothéou 52," AB 93 (1975) 147-156.

"La Vie ancienne de Sainte Marie surnommée Marinos," in Corona Gratiarum, ed. D. Hoste, vol. 1, Bruges 1975, pp. 83-115.

Ringrose, K.M. — Saints, Holy Men and Byzantine Society, 726 to 843, Dissertation: Rutgers 1976.

Rintelen, W. von — "Kult- und Legendenwanderung von Ost nach West im frühen Mittelalter," Saeculum 22 (1971) 71-100.

Rizzo, J.J. — The Encomium of Gregory Nazianzen by Nicetas the Paphlagonian. Greek Text Edited and Translated, Brussels 1976.

Rochow, I. — "Die Passio des hl. Dasius (BHG 491) – Ein Zeugnis fur die antiheidnische Polemik gegen Ende der frühbyzantinische Zeit," in Studia Byzantina II, edd. J. Irmscher/P. Nagel, Berlin 1973, pp. 235-247.

Rossi-Taibbi, G. — Vita di Sant'Elia il Giovane, Palermo 1962.

Rousseau, P. — "The Spiritual Authority of the 'Monk-Bishop'. Eastern Elements in Some Western Hagiography of the Fourth and Fifth Centuries," JTS NS 22 (1971) 380-419.

Rozemond, K. — "Jean Mosch, patriarche de Jérusalem en exil (614-634)," VC 31 (1977) 60-67.

Rudakov, A.P. — Ocherki vizantijskoj kul'tury po dannym grecheskoj agiografii, London 1970 г.

Rydén, L. — "The Andreas Salos Apocalypse. Greek Text, Translation and Commentary." DOP 28 (1974) 197-261.

Das Leben des heiligen Narren Symeon von Leontios von Neapolis, Stockholm 1963.

"The Vision of the Virgin at Blachernae and the Feast of Pokrov," AB 94 (1976) 63-82.

Salaville, S. — "Agapet (Saint)," DHGE, vol. 1, Paris 1912, cc. 883-885.

Sanspeur, C.L. — "La préhistoire de la plus ancienne vie grecque de S. Marouthas," OLP 9 (1978) 159-165.

Schmidt, C. — "Studien zu den alten Petrusakten. II Die Komposition," Zeitschrift für Kirchengeschichte 45 NF 8 (1926) 481-513.

Schmoldt, H. — Die Schrift 'vom jungen Daniel' und 'Daniels letzte Vision', Dissertation: Hamburg 1972.

Schneemelcher, W./ Santos, A. de — "Later Acts of Apostles," in New Testament Apocrypha, edd. E. Hennecke/W. Schneemelcher, vol. 2, London 1974, pp. 571-578.

Schneemelcher, W./ Schäferdiek, K. — "Second and Third Century Acts of Apostles," in New Testament Apocrypha, edd. E. Hennecke/ W. Schneemelcher, vol. 2, London 1974, pp. 167-188.

Seiber, J. — The Urban Saint in Early Byzantine Social History, Oxford 1977.

Ševčenko, I. — "Hagiography of the Iconoclast Period," in Iconoclasm, edd. A. Bryer/J. Herrin, Birmingham 1977, pp. 113-131.

Shahîd, I. — "The Kebra Nagast in the Light of Recent Research," Le Muséon 89 (1976) 133-178.

The Martyrs of Najrân. New Documents, Brussels 1971.

Sinko, T. — De traditione orationum Gregorii Nazianzeni. Pars I, Cracow 1917.

Sophianos, D.Z. — Ἅγιος Νικολάος ὁ ἐν Βουναίνῃ. Ἀνέκδοτα ἁγιολογικὰ κείμενα. Ἱστορικαὶ εἰδήσεις περὶ τῆς μεσαιωνικῆς Θεσσαλίας (Ι'αἰών), Athens 1972.

"Ὁ βίος τοῦ Εὐθυμίου (Vita Euthymii) Πατριάρχου Κ-λεως (+917) καὶ ὁ χρόνος συγγραφῆς αὐτοῦ," ΕΕΒΣ 38 (1971) 289-296.

Spyridakis, G.K. — "Τὰ κατὰ τὴν τελευτὴν ἔθιμα τῶν Βυζαντινῶν ἐκ τῶν ἁγιολογικῶν πηγῶν," ΕΕΒΣ 20 (1950) 74-171.

Stebbins, C.E. — "Les origines de la légende de Saint Alexis," Revue Belge de Philologie et d'Histoire 51 (1973) 497-507.

Stiernon, D. — "Notice sur S. Jean, higoumène du monastère de Kathara [en Bithynie]," REB 28 (1970) 111-127.

"La vie et l'oeuvre de S. Joseph l'Hymnographe. A propos d'une publication récente," REB 31 (1973) 243-266.

Stoop, E. de — Vie d'Alexandre l'Acémète, Paris 1911.

Studer, B. — "Le Roman de Barlaam et de Joasaph," DSp, vol. 8, Paris 1974, cc. 464-466.

Telfer, W. — "St. Peter of Alexandria and Arius," AB 67 (1949) 117-130.

Thomspn, R.W. — The Teaching of Saint Gregory. An Early Armenian Catechism, Cambridge, Mass. 1970.

Tomadakes, N. "Περὶ τοῦ βίου καὶ τῆς ἑορτῆς τῆς ἁγίας Θεοκτίστας τῆς Λεσβίας καὶ ἡ εἰσαγωγὴ τῆς ἑορτῆς τῆς εἰς τὸ ἑορτολόγιον," in Χαριστήριον εἰς Ἀναστάσιον Κ. Ὀρλάνδον, vol. 1, Athens 1965, pp. 108-116.

Toole, H. "Τὰ ἰάματα τῶν Ἁγίων Ἀναργύρων," ΕΕΒΣ 42 (1975/1976) 253-297.

Tsirpanlis, C.N. "Acta S. Maximi," Θεολογία 43 (1972) 106-124.

Usener, H. Acta M. Anastasii Persae, Bonn 1894.

Der heilige Tychon, Leipzig 1907.

Legenden der Pelagia, Bonn 1879.

Ven, P. van den La légende de S. Spyridon, évêque de Trimithonte, Louvain 1953.

"La patristique et l'hagiographie au concile de Nicée de 787," Byzantion 25-27 (1955-1957) 325-362.

La Vie ancienne de S. Syméon Stylite le Jeune (521-592), 2 vols., Brussels 1962-1970.

Vergote, J. "La valeur des vies grecques et coptes de Pakhôme," OLP 8 (1977) 175-186.

Vogue, A. de "Saint Pachôme et son oeuvre d'après plusieurs études récentes," RHE 69 (1974) 425-453.

"La Vie arabe de saint Pachôme et ses deux sources présumées," AB 91 (1973) 379-390.

Vorst, C. van de "Bulletin des publications hagiographiques," AB 31 (1912) 471-472.

Vorst, C. van de/ Delehaye, H. Catalogus codicum hagiographicorum graecorum Germaniae Belgii Angliae, Brussels 1913.

Weingart, M. "CR: A.V. Rystenko, Materiyaly z istorii vizantiis'ko-slovyanskoï literatury ta movi," [Materials from the History of Byzantino-Slavonic Literature and Language] Byzantinoslavica 2 (1930) 442-447.

Wessely, K. "Literarische Fragmente der Papyri aus El-Faijum," Wiener Studien 11 (1889) 175-191.

"Zu den griechischen Papyri des Louvre und der Bibliothèque nationale," in Fünfzehnter Jahresbericht des K.K. Staatsgymnasiums in Hernals, Vienna 1889, pp. 3-46.

White, H.G.E. — The Monasteries of the Wadi'n Natrûn. Part II The History of the Monasteries of Nitria and of Scetis, New York 1932.

Williams, C.A. — Oriental Affinities of the Legend of the Hairy Anchorite, 2 vols., Urbana 1925/1926.

Winkelmann, F. — "Die Beurteilung des Eusebius von Cäsarea und seiner Vita Constantini im griechischen Osten," in Byzantinische Beiträge, ed. J. Irmscher, Berlin 1964, pp. 91-119.

"Ein Ordnungsversuch der griechischen hagiographischen Konstantinviten und ihrer Überlieferung," in Studia Byzantina II, edd. J. Irmscher/P. Nagel, Berlin 1973, pp. 267-284.

Wortley, J. — "The Vita Sancti Andreae Sali as a Source of Byzantine Social History," Societas 4 (1974) 1-20.

ADDENDUM

Chitty, D.J. — "Pachomian Sources Reconsidered," JEH 5 (1954) 38-77.