The Mass-Produced Miniature Score and the Classical Chamber Canon

REUBEN PHILLIPS

Today, a listener who attends a concert of chamber music and sits following small scores throughout the performance might be viewed as something of an eccentric. Such individuals are assuredly to be found—perhaps lurking at the back of London's Wigmore Hall or on the balcony of the Brahms-Saal in Vienna's Musikverein—but they are unusual enough for their presence to be conspicuous. The level of musical literacy among today's concert attendees varies, but score-following is not feasible for many listeners; a program note that presupposed listeners' ability to read music notation would no doubt be deemed elitist and exclusionary. Perhaps more significantly, there is likely to be a feeling among performers, musicologists, and many listeners that a score-follower at a concert is someone attending to the "wrong" thing. To bury one's eyes in a score is, after all, to fail to see what is happening onstage—to miss the communicative gestures of the performers, their embodied engagement with the music, and therefore much of the dramatic intensity of a live concert experience.

In the late nineteenth century, however, the practice of score-following during concerts of chamber music seems to have been surprisingly popular among the expanded audiences for this repertoire in Germany, Austria, and Britain. In 1886 the Leipzig publishing house Albert Payne launched its *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* or "Small Score Edition," a range of inexpensive miniature scores for canonical works of chamber music. Payne's scores were positively received: in London and Vienna their use was recommended for attendees of the cities' established public chamber music concerts, and in Germany they came to be sold in various prominent concert halls, such as the Leipzig Gewandhaus and the Singakademie in Berlin where the Joachim Quartet gave its acclaimed performances. Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* survived into the twentieth century, the name of the series being retained even after it was sold in 1892 to another Leipzig publisher, Ernst Eulenburg. In 1926 the musicologist Alfred Einstein drew a suggestive parallel between these inexpensive scores and the successful series of German paperback books known as Reclam's *Universal-Bibliothek*, proclaiming that Payne's scores "had contributed more to the immersion in our masterworks than a dozen conservatoires."[1]

[1]My thanks to Robert Eshbach for reading a draft of this article and to the *Journal*'s three anonymous reviewers for their insightful criticism.

Payne's scores represent an important but understudied form of musical print media and are revealing of the nature of audiences' engagement with the classical chamber canon in the final decades of the nineteenth century. At first glance these small scores are unassuming objects—cheaply printed on low-quality paper—and it is perhaps for this reason that earlier writers on small-format music editions have taken little interest in them.[2] For music lovers today the mass-produced miniature score serves as a good example of what Mark Katz has termed an "invisible technology."[3] In contrast to later and more obviously visible technologies associated with radio broadcasting, recording, and internet streaming, the technological advances that facilitated mass production of the miniature score, particularly its reliance on newly developed printing processes, are today all too easily overlooked. The use of miniature scores by listeners in the final decades of the nineteenth century was, of course, only one aspect of the developing listening culture surrounding chamber music. Also significant was the institution of a number of long-running public chamber music series by professional ensembles,[4] the construction of purpose-built smaller halls suitable for chamber music,[5] and the stabilization of a classical chamber canon achieved through repeated performances of a core repertoire.[6] But while these

---

Alfred Einstein, *Das neue Musiklexikon* (Berlin: Max Hesse, 1926), 482: "Ein musikalischer 'Reclam,' der zur Vertiefung in unsere Meisterwerke mehr beigetragen hat als ein Dutzend Konservatorien."

[2] See Cecil Hopkinson, "The Earliest Miniature Scores," *Music Review* 33 (1972): 138–44, and Hans Lenneberg, "Revising the History of the Miniature Score," *Notes* 45 (1988): 258–61. Hopkinson's essay focuses on early nineteenth-century miniature scores and therefore makes no mention of the Payne scores; the series receives only a passing mention in Lenneberg's article.

[3] Mark Katz, *Music and Technology: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2022), 2.

[4] Especially transformative were the series of concerts given by the Hellmesberger Quartet in Vienna (from 1849) and the Joachim Quartet in Berlin (from 1869), as well as the Popular Concerts at St James's Hall in London (from 1859) and the chamber music concerts of the Frankfurt Museumsgesellschaft (from 1870).

[5] Prominent examples include the Musikverein in Vienna (opened in 1870) and the new Leipzig Gewandhaus (opened in 1884).

[6] Beethoven's music was particularly predominant within this canon (including the composer's late works), as evidenced by the first 150 concerts given by the Hellmesberger Quartet in Vienna.

other phenomena are familiar enough to us today, the notion of small scores being sold in concert halls and used by ordinary concert attendees is less so, and therefore invites further reflection and historical inquiry.

This article takes an object-driven approach to the study of miniature scores, considering the production, reception, and use of Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*. Underlying the investigation is an understanding of scores as part of music's material culture, an idea that has been explored previously in studies of nineteenth-century publications such as the musical album,[7] but that has received less attention in relation to concert hall listening practices oriented around full multimovement musical works. The first portion of the article focuses on the production and marketing of Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, comparing this publishing venture to earlier small-format scores for chamber music and situating the edition within the print media landscape of the late nineteenth century. Subsequent sections respond to recent interdisciplinary scholarship on print media that has stressed its often overlooked role in shaping engagements with live performances and on the ways in which readers and listeners interacted with printed objects through practices of collecting, inscription, and annotation.[8] Drawing on extant source materials, I discuss the critical reception of Payne's scores in German-language newspapers, and examine a rare surviving personal collection of these items assembled by the British musician and scholar Donald Francis Tovey (1875–1940) in his early teenage years. These later sections of the article reflect on the kinds of aesthetic engagement with chamber music that were afforded by miniature scores and excavate some of the historical musical behaviors in which these small volumes were implicated.

In these programs, as reported by Hanslick, Beethoven's works appeared 139 times. Also frequently heard were Mozart, Haydn, Mendelssohn, Schumann, Schubert, and Spohr, each of whom featured between 20 and 50 times over the equivalent period. See Eduard Hanslick, *Geschichte des Concertwesens in Wien* (Vienna: Wilhelm Braumüller, 1869), 402–3n1.

[7] For an influential example, see James Davies, "Julia's Gift: The Social Life of Scores, *c*.1830," *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 131, no. 2 (2006): 287–309.

[8] One prominent example of such a study is Multigraph Collective, *Interacting with Print: Elements of Reading in the Era of Print Saturation* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2018). Despite its interdisciplinary ambition, this stimulating multi-author investigation contains notably little consideration of musical print media.

Miniature Scores as Musical Print Media

The first twelve volumes of Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* were published in the summer of 1886.[9] By the end of that calendar year sixty-nine volumes had appeared, presenting chamber works by Beethoven, Haydn, Mozart, Mendelssohn, Schubert, and Cherubini, in scores measuring 7¼ x 5 inches with a uniform cover design (see fig. 1). Although described on these front covers as a "Musikverlag," the firm of Payne was otherwise largely known in Leipzig as an art publisher.[10] Early assessments of the scores in English- and German-language newspapers welcomed the volumes, stressing their low cost and small size and the admirable clarity of the music engraving. In January 1887 *The Athenaeum* in London issued the following commendation:

> HERR ALBERT PAYNE, of Leipzig, has recently published a beautiful small edition in score of the principal quartets, quintets, &c., of the great masters. . . . The works are printed in duo-decimo size; the type, though small, is remarkably clear; and the text of the specimen numbers we have seen is extremely correct. When we add that the average price for a quartet is about sixpence, we surely need say no more to recommend this edition to the notice of amateurs.[11]

A couple of months earlier a brief notice in the *Berliner Tageblatt und Handels-Zeitung* had lauded Payne's edition as a "praiseworthy endeavor" and drawn attention to the "amazingly low price," noting that the individual volumes cost between just 40 and 70 Pfennig (roughly equivalent to between €3.50 and €6 today).[12] In Vienna the *Neue Freie Presse* emphasized the convenient size of the scores: "Because these volumes are as easy to put in one's pocket as an opera or oratorio

---

[9] See *Musikalisch-literarischer Monatsbericht* (Leipzig: Friedrich Hofmeister), July 1886, 190. This source, referred to hereafter as the "Hofmeister *Monatsberichte*," provided monthly lists of new music publications. Hofmeister XIX, https://hofmeister.rhul.ac.uk/2008/index.html (accessed March 1, 2025).

[10] Albert Payne, who was responsible for the series, was the son of the English-born engraver Albert Henry Payne, who had been based in Leipzig since the end of the 1830s. According to Riemann's *Musik-Lexikon*, Albert Payne the younger studied as a violinist at the Leipzig Conservatoire before joining the family publishing business in 1862. Hugo Riemann, *Musik-Lexikon*, 8th ed. (Berlin: Max Hesse, 1916), 831.

[11] *The Athenaeum*, January 22, 1887, 137.

libretto, they are particularly well suited for reading along during chamber music performances."[13] The *Deutsche Kunst- und Musik-Zeitung* assumed a similar use for the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* and likened the Payne volumes to scripts or librettos, going on to praise the edition for its "exceptional inexpensiveness."[14]

<insert figure 1 near here>

Although these reviews treated Payne's edition as a novelty, by the 1880s the idea of publishing works of chamber music as scores was not in itself new. In 1802 Haydn's biographer Georg August Griesinger described an "elegant pocket edition" of the composer's string quartets that had just been issued by the Parisian publisher Pleyel. Griesinger recorded that "amateurs and knowledgeable musicians" employed these volumes to "read along during concerts."[15] Pleyel's scores measured 8¼ x 5 inches and in total presented thirty of Haydn's quartets, with three works per volume.[16] In the early nineteenth century the listening practice outlined by Griesinger would probably have been quite unusual. Tellingly, the entry on "Partitur" in

---

[12] *Berliner Tageblatt und Handels-Zeitung, Morgen-Ausgabe*, October 19, 1886, 3: "Dieser hat sich die lobenswerthe Aufgabe gestellt, alle klassischen Quartette in Partitur um einen erstaunlich billigen Preis—40 bis 70 Pfennig—herzustellen." Monetary values have been provided in accordance with the conversion tables of the Deutsche Bundesbank (as of 2024). These should nevertheless be understood as indications rather absolute equivalents.

[13] "Payne's kleine Partitur-Ausgabe," *Neue Freie Presse*, December 5, 1886, 7: "Da diese Hefte so leicht in die Tasche zu stecken sind, wie ein Opern- oder Oratorien-Textbuch, eignen sie sich ganz besonders zum Nachlesen bei Kammermusik-Aufführungen." The verb "nachlesen" is used frequently in German-language discussions of miniature scores and has been translated here according to context as "read along" or "follow." This usage relates to a historic definition found in the nineteenth-century Grimm Wörterbuch: "einem vorlesenden still mitlesend folgen" (to follow someone reading aloud, silently reading along). www.woerterbuchnetz.de/DWB/nachlesen (accessed March 1, 2025).

[14] *Deutsche Kunst- und Musik-Zeitung*, October 28, 1886, 372: "Diese kleine Partitur-Ausgabe ist also gewissermaßen ein Textbuch, das den größeren Partitur-Ausgaben gegenüber den Vorzug ungemeiner Billigkeit hat."

[15] Otto Biba, ed., *"Eben komme ich von Haydn . . .": Georg August Griesingers Korrespondenz mit Joseph Haydns Verleger Breitkopf und Härtel 1799–1819* (Zurich: Atlantis Musikbuch-Verlag, 1987), 169: "Die Dilettanten und Kenner steken sie zu sich und lesen in den Concerten nach."

Heinrich Christoph Koch's contemporaneous *Musikalisches Lexikon* associated scores solely with performers and composers.[17] John M. Gingerich has drawn attention to the fact that Beethoven's late quartets were issued in parts and scores almost simultaneously in the 1820s—a new phenomenon that, in conjunction with the contemporaneous institution of public chamber concerts, leads him to identify a new listening culture.[18] It is worth noting, however, that reviewers of these publications described the synoptic view that the scores afforded as being of value predominantly for those trying to play Beethoven's music, rather than for members of the audience to follow.[19]

While issuing new chamber works simultaneously in score and in parts had become fairly common by the 1880s, as shown by the examples of string chamber music by Brahms and Dvořák published by Simrock, the most direct models for Payne's publishing venture are likely to have been examples of mid-nineteenth-century miniature scores.[20] A range of small scores for chamber music had been issued by the firms of Heckel (in Mannheim), Ewer (in London), and Guidi (in Florence) between the mid-1840s and the early 1870s.[21] Measuring just under 5½ inches in height, these volumes would have been well suited for reading along during concerts. The Heckel and Ewer scores were devoted to chamber works of the Viennese classical composers, predominantly string quartets, and were issued between 1843 and 1861.[22] The volumes

---

[16] Pleyel's series of scores, known as the *Bibliothèque musicale*, had in fact begun with four Haydn symphonies, though it was predominantly devoted to chamber works and ran until 1830. For an account of the series, see Rita Benton, "Pleyel's *Bibliothèque musicale*," *Music Review* 36 (1975): 1–4.

[17] Heinrich Christoph Koch, *Musikalisches Lexikon* (Frankfurt am Main: August Hermann der Jüngere, 1802), 1137–39.

[18] John M. Gingerich, "Ignaz Schuppanzigh and Beethoven's Late Quartets," *Musical Quarterly* 93, nos. 3–4 (2010): 450–513, at 452.

[19] See, for example, Robin Wallace, *The Critical Reception of Beethoven's Compositions by His German Contemporaries, Op. 126 to WoO 140* (Boston, MA: Center for Beethoven Research, Boston University, 2018), 24, 43, 58.

[20] The categories of "performer" and "listener" are of course not mutually exclusive.

[21] Basic information about these publications is provided in Hopkinson, "Earliest Miniature Scores," 141–44.

[22] As detailed in the Hofmeister *Monatsberichte*.

published by Guidi related to the music performed in the concerts of the Società del Quartetto di Firenze and offered a wider range of repertoire: Mozart, Haydn, Beethoven, Cherubini, Boccherini, Spohr, and Hummel, as well as a small number of works by contemporary composers who had had success in the society's composition competition. As Cecil Hopkinson noted, foreign agents played a role in distributing these mid-nineteenth-century miniature scores: imprints and stamps suggest that small scores published by Guidi and Heckel were offered for sale through various music publishers in Moscow, Paris, London, Vienna, Leipzig, and Mainz.[23]

A notable feature of the Heckel, Ewer, and Guidi scores is that they can be linked to the activities of mid-nineteenth-century chamber music societies and the attempts of these organizations to cultivate attentive listening habits.[24] The first batch of chamber music scores issued by Guidi in Florence in the early 1860s comprised Beethoven's opus 18 quartets and opus 20 septet. Following the publication of the quartet scores a series of analytical essays appeared in the journal of the Società del Quartetto di Firenze.[25] These analyses helped listeners to navigate Beethoven's music by describing the form and distinctive musical features of the six opus 18 works, identifying passages through references to page numbers in a given score. Christina Bashford has noted that Heckel and Ewer miniature scores appear to have been used by attendees of both the Musical Union and the Beethoven Quartett Society concerts in London

[23] Hopkinson, "Earliest Miniature Scores," 141–43.

[24] These efforts can be understood as part of a broader turn toward more attentive auditory engagement during public musical performances. In a study of audience behavior in London, Berlin, and Vienna focused on large-scale musical genres Sven Oliver Müller dates the "invention of silence" ("die Erfindung des Schweigens") in public concert halls and opera houses to the mid-nineteenth century. Sven Oliver Müller, *Das Publikum macht die Musik: Musikleben in Berlin, London und Wien im 19. Jahrhundert* (Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2014), 217–58.

[25] "Studi sopra Beethoven," *Boccherini: Giornale musicale per la Società del Quartetto*, April 30, 1862. The analyses ran in issues of the journal until July 1863. Their likely author was Abramo Basevi, who later published analyses of the quartets in book form. See Aaron Singer Allen, "Beethoven's Music in Nineteenth-Century Italy: A Critical Review of Its Reception through the Early 1860s" (PhD diss., Harvard University, 2006), 151–52.

during the 1840s and 1850s.[26] As she observes, one visitor to a Beethoven Quartett Society performance in 1852 was Hector Berlioz, who commented on having seen numerous listeners following little scores. Probably in reaction to the solemn and reverential attitude that prevailed at these events, Berlioz could not resist sniping at the musical literacy of audiences: after glancing over the shoulder of one listener, he mercilessly remarked, "I discovered that his eyes were glued to page four though the players were already at page six."[27] A different perspective on the behavior of London chamber music audiences was offered by John Ella, founder of the Musical Union. Ella recorded that small scores were used by both male and female listeners, noting the astonishment of foreign visitors to the concerts on witnessing "ladies sharing with professors an equal amount of gratification, in listening to music of the severest order with score in hand."[28]

In contrast to these elegant miniature scores used by members of elite chamber music societies, Payne's mass-produced *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* was geared toward the larger, more economically diverse audiences of the late nineteenth century.[29] The Payne scores were taller and wider than those issued by Heckel, Ewer, and Guidi; more significantly, they were printed on cheap paper and were sold stapled rather than bound, conceived as a more ephemeral form of print media. Inside the cover of each Payne score was a thematic index that, for easy reference, listed the other volumes in the series (see fig. 2). By contrast, the publishing strategy of Heckel and Ewer had been to group the works of a particular composer together to encourage

---

[26] Christina Bashford, "Learning to Listen: Audiences for Chamber Music in Early-Victorian London," *Journal of Victorian Culture* 4 (1999): 25–51, at 39. Particularly in the context of the mid-nineteenth century it is important to note that the categories of "performer" and "listener" were not mutually exclusive; the members of the aforementioned societies would have developed their ability to read music notation as amateur musicians.

[27] Hector Berlioz, *Evenings with the Orchestra*, trans. Jacques Barzun (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1973), 244.

[28] John Ella, *Musical Sketches, Abroad, and At Home* (London, 1869), 75.

[29] An illustration of the expanded audience is provided by chamber concerts held in Vienna. Gingerich estimates that the Abendunterhaltungen of the Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde in which Ignaz Schuppanzigh participated would have had an audience of up to 150 listeners. Gingerich, "Ignaz Schuppanzigh," 456. Half a century later, the small hall in the new Musikverein used for chamber performance from 1870 could seat around 600.

purchasers to invest in a complete series of chamber works. Copies of these scores now held in research libraries and private collections often survive in attractive leather bindings commissioned by their original nineteenth-century owners.[30] The small chamber music scores produced by Guidi were also sold individually, but bear the traces of a slow and labor-intensive production process: printed on thick Florentine paper, the pages show the impression of metal printing plates. Much of the engraving for the Guidi scores was carried out by the publisher's daughters, Marianna and Amalia, who added their names and the date of the engraving at the foot of each final page of music.

<insert figure 2 near here>

Important for the low-cost production of the Payne scores were recent developments in music publishing in Germany relating to printing technology and copyright law. Although Payne was listed as the publisher of the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, an examination of the early volumes reveals that the music engraving and printing was in fact carried out by the firm of C. G. Röder.[31] The Röder printing works had been active in Leipzig from 1846, but entered a new era in the early 1860s with the adaptation of high-speed lithographic printing processes. Carl Röder had experimented with such processes in 1861–62, using printing presses developed by Georg Sigl in Berlin and Vienna, and by 1863 he had succeeded in using the new method for music.[32] The printing process still began in the traditional way, but the musical text engraved on the metal plates was then transferred to limestone, which was used in high-speed presses. This

[30] Examples are to be found in the Musiksammlung of the Austrian National Library and at the Royal College of Music.

[31] Indications of Röder's role in printing the Payne volumes are given at the foot of the first pages of Mendelssohn's String Quintet in B-flat, op. 87 (Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, no. 67), and Schumann's Quartet in A, op. 41, no. 3 (Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, no. 76). Röder had previously been involved in the production of the Heckel and Ewer scores (along with two other printing and engraving firms, Carl Paez and F. W. Garbricht), though this would have been before the important developments to his printing works described below.

[32] The history of the firm and information about the printing processes are given in a fiftieth-anniversary publication: *Festschrift zur 50 jährigen Jubelfeier des Bestehens der Firma C. G. Röder: Mit einem Anhang: Notenschrift und Notendruck, bibliographisch-typographische Studie von Dr. Hugo Riemann* (Leipzig: C. G. Röder, 1896), 3–16.

process required less pressure, enabling the use of new kinds of cheap paper.[33] The Röder printing works expanded rapidly in the decades following this innovation and took on engraving and printing work for a variety of music publishing houses. A glimpse of the factory around the time it was involved with the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* is provided by a feature article on Röder in a book published in 1893 celebrating large-scale industry in Saxony. At this point the printing works employed a staff of around 800, a quarter of whom were music engravers.[34] An accompanying illustration provided twenty-five views of different parts of the factory, revealing how the various stages of the music printing process were divided up among departments. The entire printing works was shown to be powered by both a multitude of insect-like human figures and an enormous steam engine.

The development of these industrialized music printing processes coincided with a change in copyright law that would have further reduced publishing costs for firms like Payne. In German lands, from November 9, 1867, the copyright on musical or literary works now expired thirty years after a composer's or author's death. The Röder printing works benefitted from this new law early on, as they were commissioned to print cheap editions of classic works for Edition Peters. At the end of 1867 Peters issued an edition of Beethoven's complete piano sonatas at the low price of 1 Reichstaler 15 Neugroschen (ca. €47).[35] The collection proved popular and soon led to similar offerings, such as an album of Schubert lieder and volumes of instrumental and vocal works by Bach, Handel, Haydn, Gluck, Mozart, and Weber.[36] In 1873 Peters issued scores for classical string chamber music, including Beethoven's complete string quartets in four substantial volumes. These large-format scores reflected a demand for cheap

---

[33] The cheap, low-quality paper used in the Payne scores would have been made from wood pulp. On materials found in the composition of nineteenth-century paper, see Daven Christopher Chamberlain, "Paper," in *The Book: A Global History*, ed. Michael F. Suarez and H. R. Woudhuysen (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2013), 116–29, at 127.

[34] See *Die Groß-Industrie des Königreichs Sachsen in Wort und Bild*, vol. 2 (Leipzig: Eckert & Pflug, 1893), unpaginated.

[35] The Beethoven sonatas are listed in the Hofmeister *Monatsberichte* for December 1867; another edition of the sonatas issued by Breitkopf & Härtel that appeared in the same month cost 3 Reichstaler 15 Neugroschen.

[36] See *Katalog der Edition Peters* (Leipzig: C. F. Peters, 1900), v–vi.

editions of classical chamber works and would also have provided another model for the Payne series.

Significant if slightly less obvious precedents for the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* included piano duet arrangements, analytical program notes, and paperback books. As mass-produced forms of print media all of these publications contributed to processes of cultural canonization by widening access to musical and literary works. In all three cases, low production costs can be attributed to the kinds of mechanized printing processes, cheap paper, and changes in copyright law that made Payne's miniature scores viable. Like Payne's scores, many of the piano duet arrangements published in the later decades of the nineteenth century can in fact be traced back to the Röder printing works. Transcriptions of canonical instrumental music for piano four-hands, including both orchestral and chamber works, became extremely popular during this period, partly as a result of the prevalence of pianos within the homes of the burgeoning middle classes.[37] As Thomas Christensen has noted, keyboard arrangements of symphonic works by prominent composers such as Mendelssohn, Schumann, Tchaikovsky, Brahms, and Grieg were issued as a matter of course.[38] By the 1880s, piano duet transcriptions of classical string quartets were also widespread and were frequently listed in Hofmeister's music catalogs. The critic Theodor Helm, in an 1885 study of Beethoven's string quartets, encouraged the use of such arrangements (either with or instead of score study) in preparation for hearing works in concert.[39] Christensen has drawn attention to the way in which this practice effectively transported to domestic spaces musical works that might otherwise have been encountered only in the public concert hall.[40] Thus, as duet arrangements might have helped bring chamber music back into the home, the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* ensured that scores were equally available in live performance settings. Both kinds of publication offered music lovers a way of "handling"

---

[37] For a social history of the piano in the nineteenth century, see Cyril Ehrlich, *The Piano: A History* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1990).

[38] Thomas Christensen, "Four-Hand Piano Transcription and Geographies of Nineteenth-Century Musical Reception," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 52 (1999): 255–98, at 267.

[39] Theodor Helm, *Beethoven's Streichquartette: Versuch einer technischen Analyse dieser Werke im Zusammenhange mit ihrem geistigen Gehalt* (Leipzig: E. W. Fritzsch, 1885), iv.

[40] Christensen, "Four-Hand Piano Transcription," 288.

musical works, facilitating contact with the notated text in and outside of the real time of a professional concert.

Analytical program notes started to be widely used in German concert halls only in the final decades of the nineteenth century, though they had already been popular in Britain for several decades.[41] From 1859 the long-running series of Popular Concerts in London's St James's Hall developed an audience for classical chamber music by presenting mixed programs of instrumental and vocal works.[42] These events were accompanied by lengthy program booklets offering analytical overviews of the chamber works to be performed. Musical examples printed in the programs illustrated the principal themes of a given work, normally on a keyboard staff so that they might be played at the piano. Building on a remark by Eduard Hanslick, Christian Thorau has drawn parallels between such publications and the nineteenth-century travel guides issued by firms such as John Murray and Baedeker.[43] Whereas guidebooks to European cities facilitated cultural tourism, indicating the main sights to be appreciated by British travelers abroad, Thorau suggests that program notes helped to structure audience members' encounters with musical works, guiding their ears and stipulating what should be listened for. Extending this metaphor to Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, one might compare miniature scores to uninterpreted maps. In contrast to the ordinary analytical program note, these publications would appeal to listeners who were more confident of their ability to navigate a work of chamber music by themselves.

As already noted, Alfred Einstein made a direct comparison between Payne's scores and the paperback book—a link both obvious and pertinent because of the low cost, small size, and wide distribution of these forms of print media. On the same day in 1867 on which Edition Peters issued the collected Beethoven piano sonatas, Leipzig publishing house Anton Philipp Reclam launched its *Universal-Bibliothek* with a series of classic literary works that were also now

---

[41] See Christina Bashford, "Concert Listening the British Way? Program Notes and Victorian Culture," in *The Oxford Handbook of Music Listening in the 19th and 20th Centuries*, ed. Christian Thorau and Hansjakob Ziemer (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2019), 187–206, at 189.

[42] See Therese Ellsworth, "'*Caviare* to the Multitude': Instrumental Music at the Monday Popular Concerts, London," in *Instrumental Music and the Industrial Revolution*, ed. Roberto Illiano and Luca Lévi Sala (Bologna: Ut Orpheus, 2010), 121–42.

[43] Christian Thorau, "'What Ought to Be Heard': Touristic Listening and the Guided Ear," in *Oxford Handbook of Music Listening*, 207–27.

suddenly out of copyright. The first forty volumes in the series were dedicated principally to works of German literature by authors such as Goethe, Schiller, Lessing, and Kleist; also prominent were Shakespeare plays in German translation.[44] Like Payne's scores, these small volumes were cheaply produced through mass production. Important for the Reclam volumes was the use of stereotype printing, a process by which casts were taken of the forme (the assembled type), enabling individual pieces of type to be broken down and reused. As Hans Schmoller noted, the popular small volumes printed in this way gave readers in the German-speaking world the opportunity to own an established canon of literary texts for very little money.[45] The series flourished and expanded rapidly to include works of poetry, plays, and opera librettos. Around 1890 the libretto for an individual Wagner opera appears to have cost 20 Pfennig (ca. €1.60). The pocket-sized Reclam volumes were each given a number and (like Payne's scores two decades later) for ease of ordering could be purchased through reference to these numbers, without the need to specify a full title.

Comparisons with a long-running series of analytical program notes, widely used piano duet arrangements, and Reclam's popular paperbacks might imply that Payne's scores also enjoyed commercial success from the outset. While the decision to sell the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* to the music publisher Eulenburg could be seen as evidence against this, the absence of archival records in Leipzig makes it hard to establish the reason for the sale with any certainty; it is also possible that the Payne firm simply wished to consolidate its interests as an art publisher.[46] Eulenburg retained the title of "Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*," at first simply pasting strips of paper bearing its own name over that of Payne at the bottom of the front covers. Through the acquisition of a series of miniature orchestral scores originally published by the London-based firm Ernest Donajowski, Eulenburg expanded further. By 1909 its pocket chamber music scores

---

[44] See Gerd Schulz, "Das Klassikerjahr 1867 und die Gründung von Reclams Universal-Bibliothek," in *Reclam, 125 Jahre Universal-Bibliothek: 1867–1992*, ed. Dietrich Bode (Stuttgart: Reclam, 1992), 11–28.

[45] Hans Schmoller, *The Paperback Revolution: An Essay* (Chippenham: Penguin Collectors Society, 2016), 294–95.

[46] The last batch of scores attributed to Payne in the Hofmeister *Monatsberichte* appeared in October 1890. While some sources suggest that the takeover took place in 1891, Wilhelm Altmann gives the precise date as November 1, 1892, in his *40 Jahre Eulenburgs kleine Partitur-Ausgabe, 1892–1932* (Leipzig: Ernst Eulenburg, 1932), 3.

were still listed as "Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*" in the Eulenburg catalog, by which point there were 292 volumes in the series, including works by composers still in copyright, such as Brahms.[47]

Listening with Miniature Scores in Leipzig and Berlin

Some early critical assessments of the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* stressed the likely appeal of the edition for professional musicians and students. A report in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* in Leipzig in July 1886, for example, emphasized the potential use of Payne's scores by young composers:

> Score study is the training ground of the composer. Painters and sculptors must carry out anatomical studies specifically in order to get to know human body parts in their proportions; the creative musician, by contrast, has to analyze the masterworks of the great composers, to dissect their construction anatomically, to study phrase and period structure along with modulations, in order to be capable of creative work of his own.[48]

In light of such requirements, the Payne volumes were regarded by this writer as useful because, like other cheap score editions that had appeared in recent decades, they would be accessible to those of limited financial means.

Reviews of the Payne scores that focused on a specific educational use were, however, greatly outnumbered by those that considered their more general appeal to musical listeners. The report in the *Neue Freie Presse* in December 1886 (mentioned above) drew attention to the value of the scores for attendees of concert series given by Vienna's two most important quartet

---

[47] *Verzeichnis des Musikalien-Verlages von Ernst Eulenburg* (Leipzig: Röder, 1909), 219. As Altmann noted, publishing later repertoire required the agreement of the original publishers. Altmann, *40 Jahre Eulenburgs kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, 3.

[48] *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik*, July 23, 1886, 335: "Das Partiturenstudium ist die höhere Schule des Tondichters. Maler und Bildhauer müssen anatomische Studien machen, um die Körpertheile des Menschen in ihren Proportionen speciell kennen zu lernen; der Componist hat dagegen die Meisterwerke der großen Tondichter zu analysiren, ihre Construction anatomisch zu zerlegen, Satz- und Periodenbau sowie die Modulation gründlich zu studiren, um zu eignem Schaffen befähigt zu werden."

ensembles—the Hellmesberger and Rosé quartets.[49] And a notice in *The Athenaeum* closed with the observation that Payne's edition would be "invaluable" to regular visitors to the Popular Concerts at London's St James's Hall.[50] Sales of the scores in concert halls in Germany appear to have been relatively widespread. In November 1887 a supplement to the *Frankfurter Zeitung* contained a review of the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, noting that the publisher of the series had arranged for them to be sold at the box office (*Abendkasse*) "at all venues where chamber music is cultivated."[51]

The best-documented examples of the sale and use of Payne's scores occur in relation to the chamber music concerts held in the small hall of the Leipzig Gewandhaus and the Joachim Quartet performances in Berlin's Singakademie. The Joachim "Quartet Evenings" had taken place in Berlin since 1869.[52] After the introduction of the Payne scores a note was included in the regular programs making clear the availability of these items at the box office. This note was printed in small type, below a stern warning to attendees: "During the performance the doors will remain closed."[53] Information about the sale of scores is also to be found on Leipzig concert programs of the same period. In October 1887, for example, the program for a dedicated Beethoven evening given in the small hall of the new Gewandhaus included a note with prices for the Payne scores of the individual works—the String Quartet, op. 135, the Piano Trio, op. 70, no. 2, and the String Quintet, op. 29—together with the information that these could be purchased either at the entrance to the building or from attendants inside (see fig. 3).

<insert figure 3 near here>

[49] "Payne's kleine Partitur-Ausgabe," *Neue Freie Presse*, 7.

[50] *The Athenaeum*, January 22, 1887, 137. In Britain the Payne scores were distributed by the music publisher E. Donajowski.

[51] "Payne's kleine Partitur-Ausgabe," *Beilage zur Frankfurter Zeitung*, November 20, 1887, 1: "an allen Orten, wo Kammermusik gepflegt wird."

[52] For documentation of Joachim Quartet activities in Berlin, including details of concert programs, see Sanna Pederson's online resource: https://sannapederson.oucreate.com (accessed March 1, 2025).

[53] Program of November 1, 1887, featuring musical works by Schumann, Beethoven, and Woldemar Bargiel (of which the Bargiel was not available in score): "Während der Musik bleiben die Thüren geschlossen."

Press reactions to the sale of small scores in Leipzig and Berlin varied. From the outset the *Leipziger Tageblatt und Anzeiger* had been positive about Payne's publishing venture. A report from July 1886 suggested that students and amateurs could "significantly increase their enjoyment" by using the scores to prepare for concerts or by reading along during the performance itself.[54] In October 1886, ahead of the start of the new season of chamber music concerts at the Gewandhaus, the paper provided information about the availability of the scores at the concert hall and in music shops around the city. Here it was also stressed that the edition had been recognized by various "luminaries of the musical world," including Joseph Joachim, Carl Reinecke, and Hans von Bülow.[55] By contrast, the presence of the scores in Berlin at the first Joachim Quartet concert of the season provoked a negative reaction in the influential *Vossische Zeitung*. While praising the group's performance of works by Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven for its "masterly perfection," the reviewer treated the sale of scores as an unwelcome distraction. Noting that score-reading required proficiency in different musical clefs (which not all listeners would possess), the author suggested that following the musical text would be of use only if it ultimately led to enhanced auditory attention without the score: "What it comes down to, however, is listening—sharp, attentive, and precise listening, and the emotional impression that arises from it. A public that accustoms itself to following the notated music as it listens we would not see as an improvement."[56]

That the opinion of this critic did not prevail can be gauged from the extended discussion of the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* in the *Allgemeine Musik-Zeitung* by the Berlin-based critic Otto Lessmann that appeared just a couple of months later.[57] Here Lessmann remarked on the uptake of the Payne scores among audiences of the Joachim Quartet in Berlin and the

[54] *Leipziger Tageblatt und Anzeiger*, July 16, 1886, 4077: "Für Studirende sowie Dilettanten ist durch diese billige Einzel-Ausgabe, Gelegenheit geboten, sich mit sehr geringen Ausgaben auf die Quartett-Abende vorzubereiten oder durch Nachlesen in der Aufführung selbst den Genuß um ein Bedeutendes zu erhöhen."

[55] *Leipziger Tageblatt und Anzeiger*, October 15, 1886, 5877: "der Koryphäen der musikalischen Welt."

[56] "Theater, Musik, Konzerte &c.," *Vossische Zeitung*, October 18, 1886: "Aber eben auf das Hören, auf das scharfe, aufmerksame und genaue Hören und auf den Empfindungseindruck, der daraus hervorgeht, kommt es an; ein Publikum, das sich gewöhnt, die Noten nachzulesen, während es hört, würden wir für keine Verbesserung halten."

Hellmesberger Quartet in Vienna. He situated the scores in the context of changing listening practices and drew analogies with other small printed booklets used during musical performances, such as program notes and leitmotif guides. Of considerable interest are Lessmann's comments underlining the value of the scores for those listeners who were unable to make out the form of a composition such as a string quartet by listening alone: "The eye can help the ear to recognize clearly the artful working in the unity of the four parts, to disentangle unravel the contrapuntal fabric, and in the most natural way the listener eventually achieves the goal not only of enjoying an artwork but also of understanding it."[58] The review continued with a summary of the works available (seventy-eight in total at that point) and lamented the absence to date of a score for Beethoven's *Große Fuge*. After praising the edition for its clear engraving and its conveniently portable size, Lessmann concluded by expressing a hope that the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* might help to win a new and larger audience for chamber music: "I believe that the new, small, inexpensive, and practical Payne edition of chamber music scores will do its bit to encourage voyages of discovery in the most noble regions of chamber music for many a music lover for whom this has hitherto been *terra incognita*."[59]

A similarly high-minded discussion of the Payne scores appeared in the *Leipziger Tageblatt und Anzeiger* that same month under the title "On the Benefit of Score-Following at Chamber Music Performances."[60] Here the author deemed it a significant advance in musical culture that at concerts and opera performances a large portion of the public now concerned itself with the notated content (and the sung text) of musical works. This group of listeners did

---

[57] Otto Lessmann, "Payne's kleine Partitur-Ausgabe von Kammermusik," *Allgemeine Musik-Zeitung*, no. 4 (January 1887): 39–40.

[58] Lessmann, "Payne's kleine Partitur-Ausgabe," 40: "Das Auge kann dem Ohre helfen, die kunstvolle Arbeit in der Viereinheit klar zu erkennen, das kontrapunktische Gewebe zu entwirren, und auf dem allernatürlichsten Wege kommt der Zuhörer schliesslich an das Ziel, ein Kunstwerk nicht nur zu geniessen, sondern auch zu verstehen."

[59] Lessmann, "Payne's kleine Partitur-Ausgabe," 40: "Ich glaube, dass die neue, kleine, billige und praktische Payne'sche Ausgabe der Kammermusik-Partituren ihr Theil dazu beitragen wird, auf dem vornehmsten Gebiete der Instrumentalmusik manchen Musikfreund, dem dasselbe bisher terra incognita geblieben, zu Entdeckungsreisen zu veranlassen."

[60] "Uber den Nutzen des Partiturnachlesens bei Kammermusikaufführungen," *Leipziger Tageblatt und Anzeiger*, January 28, 1887, 526–27.

not wish just to be "easily entertained" but rather to "penetrate the organism and unique character of a given artwork."[61] The author referred to the "excellent custom" of using printed program notes and thematic guides that was common among audiences in England, noting that similar trends were taking root in Germany. Among the examples cited was a recent series of historical piano recitals given by Anton Rubinstein that featured a program booklet by musical writer and composer Wilhelm Tappert. For concert hall use, however, the author touted Payne's small scores as superior to other print media aids:

> While reading a text during oratorio and opera performances brings with it many a disadvantage, as the listener is thereby easily distracted from an uninterrupted following of the action or from the musical content itself, the score-reader in the concert hall on the other hand can engross himself all the more profoundly and powerfully in the artwork at hand. Score-reading of orchestral works, however, requires prior knowledge that normally lies only in the domain of the professional musician, and the use of bulky and expensive scores in the concert hall is bound up with many inconveniences. Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*, which is now available in over seventy individual volumes, renders all of these misgivings irrelevant.[62]

Whereas the review in the *Vossische Zeitung* in Berlin had raised concerns about the level of musical literacy required of listeners in order to benefit from the Payne scores, this assessment

---

[61] "Uber den Nutzen des Partiturnachlesens," 526: "nicht allein mühelos unterhalten sein will, sondern auch das Bestreben an den Tag legt, in den Organismus und die Eigenart des gegebenen Kunstwerks einzudringen."

[62] "Uber den Nutzen des Partiturnachlesens," 526: "Hat nun das Nachlesen des Textes während Oratorien- und Opernaufführungen manchen Nachtheil im Gefolge, als dadurch der Hörer von dem ununterbrochenen Verfolgen der greifbaren Handlung oder auch des musikalischen Theils leicht abgezogen wird, so kann sich hingegen der Partiturleser im Concertsaal um so inniger und eindringlicher in das bezügliche Kunstobject vertiefen. Es verlangt aber das Partiturlesen von Orchesterwerken Vorkenntnisse, wie sie gewöhnlich nur in der Domäne der Fachmusiker zu liegen pflegen, und ist die Benutzung dickleibiger und theuerer Partituren im Concertsaal mit allerlei Unbequemlichkeit verknüpft. Alle diese Bedenken macht Payne's Kleine Partitur-Ausgabe, welche in über 70 Einzelnummern bis jetzt vor uns liegt, hinfällig."

took the view that the volumes were likely to be of some use for the vast majority of chamber music lovers:

> Attendees of chamber music concerts are in the large part musically educated such that if they are perhaps unable to make sense of the complete score in its full sonority straightaway they can at least follow the main voice and thereby gain an insight into the construction and form of an artwork; they will trace the lines of beauty that run through such works with admiration, and how differently the various themes will remain stuck in heart and memory if the same are represented to the listener through graphic symbols.[63]

This reviewer's comments, along with those of Lessmann, articulate the general belief that a listener's aesthetic encounter with a work of chamber music might be deepened by attending closely to the score before or during a performance. In the mid-nineteenth century this notion had taken hold in relation to Beethoven's difficult late works, as outlined in Nancy November's recent reception study of the Quartet in C-sharp Minor, op. 131.[64] Certainly by the 1880s, when the late quartets had become firmly embedded in the repertoires of groups such as the Joachim and Hellmesberger quartets, the advantages of readily available scores were felt by commentators. In his book on Beethoven's string quartets Helm acknowledged the particular challenges posed by the composer's late works for the layperson's ear (*Laienohr*).[65] To facilitate attentive engagement with the repertoire Helm strongly advocated the use of musical print

[63] "Uber den Nutzen des Partiturnachlesens," 526–27: "Besucher von Kammermusiken sind zum allergrößten Theil in der Weise musikalisch gebildet, daß, wenn sie vielleicht die ganze Partitur in ihrem Zusammenklang nicht sogleich zu verbinden im Stande sind, sie immerhin die Principalstimme nachlesen können und somit einen Einblick gewinnen in den Bau und die Structur eines Kunstwerkes; sie werden den Schönheitslinien, welche ein solches durchzieht, bewundernd folgen, und wie anders werden die verschiedenen Themen in dem Gedächtnisse und in dem Herzen haften bleiben, wenn sich dieselben dem Hörer in bildlichen Zeichen dargestellt haben."

[64] Nancy November, *Beethoven's String Quartet in C-Sharp Minor, Op. 131* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2021), 112–14.

[65] Helm, *Beethoven's Streichquartette*, 163.

media: "Nothing helps more than repeated listening with the score in one's hand, or the study of a score prior to the performance."[66]

It is worth contemplating the ways in which score-following during a concert might have reoriented the listening experience of chamber works, especially of those that were frequently heard in late nineteenth-century concert halls. In the case of Beethoven's late music, a combination of score study and repeated exposure to the work in performance would probably have helped to accustom listeners (at least those with some degree of musical literacy) to the composer's formal innovations and idiosyncratic approach to thematic presentation. The obvious challenge posed by opus 131 would have been the work's unconventional form: seven movements played *attacca*. Here the act of score-following might have helped listeners to find their way through this unusual structure—to track the slow unfolding of the opening fugue, and to attend more closely to the thematic integration and tonal plan of the work as a whole. The four-movement Quartet in F, op. 135, one of the pieces heard in Leipzig in October 1887, would at first seem to pose fewer difficulties. Directly before the finale, however, is Beethoven's famous question and answer motto underlaid with the text "Muss es sein?—Es muss sein" ("Must it be?—It must be"). These enigmatic words would not be uttered in a performance, but a listener with a Payne score to hand could at least read them (see fig. 4). Lessmann's regret about the lack of a score for Beethoven's *Große Fuge* in the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* was soon remedied. (It appeared as no. 98 in the series.) For listeners grappling with this knotty contrapuntal composition, access to the musical text would have been especially helpful. Right at the very start of the *Große Fuge* the versions of the theme, which provide the basic material for the ensuing work, are heard in rapid succession, probably too fast for even the most focused audience member to absorb in the real time of a performance, and arguably more meaningful when one has studied the score beforehand.[67]

<insert figure 4 near here>

[66] Helm, *Beethoven's Streichquartette*, 164: "Letztere zu erleichtern, hilft nun Nichts besser, als ein wiederholtes Hören mit der Partitur in der Hand oder auch Studium der Partitur vor der Aufführung." Helm also goes on to suggest the value of duet arrangements for pianists with sufficient proficiency.

[67] Even among writers who were positive about Beethoven's late music this composition was often viewed with suspicion, Helm dismissing it as "music for the eyes" (*Augenmusik*). Helm, *Beethoven's Streichquartette*, 164.

By contrast, for the late eighteenth-century chamber works that appeared in the Payne series a listening experience oriented around the activity of score-following seems curiously at odds with the qualities that today's scholars celebrate in this repertoire. Forty-four compositions by Mozart and Haydn featured among the first one hundred volumes in the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe*. More obviously than Beethoven's middle and late quartets, these works originated in a culture of chamber music associated with amateur musicians. Writers such as W. Dean Sutcliffe and Gretchen Wheelock have nevertheless convincingly argued that an innovation of music of the late eighteenth century was a new kind of "listener-directed" aesthetic crafted to engage and entertain audiences who were well versed in the conventions of contemporary musical style.[68] A work like Haydn's "Joke" Quartet, op. 33, no. 2, might be understood as an example of this new aesthetic, with its outlandish portamenti in the central trio section of the Scherzo, its novel manipulations of texture and sonority in the slow movement, and—of course—Haydn's play with listener expectations in the much-analyzed finale. But what would the work's implied listener gain from following a score? In Payne's edition of the quartet, the fingering directions that give rise to the striking portamenti were omitted—perhaps a reflection of the contemporary performance style or an indication of the belief that such details were incidental to the true musical content of the composition.[69] And when it comes to the finale, diligent score-followers would surely have had less fun: for them there could be no doubt whatsoever as to when the movement was going to end (see fig. 5).

<insert figure 5 near here>

It is notable that such concerns were not raised in commentaries on Payne's scores in either the Leipzig or the Berlin newspapers. We might ascribe this to a lack of interest in the lighter elements of chamber music performance (the humor and wit so central to Haydn, for instance), in favor of a more solemn aesthetic. Certainly in the case of the long-running Joachim Quartet concerts, Robert Eshbach has emphasized a reverential attitude on the part of listeners,

[68] W. Dean Sutcliffe, *Instrumental Music in an Age of Sociability: Haydn, Mozart and Friends* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2020), 2; Gretchen A. Wheelock, *Haydn's Ingenious Jesting with Art: Contexts of Musical Wit and Humor* (New York: Schirmer Books, 1992).

[69] Haydn's fingerings were, however, included in the first score editions of the works. See Mary Hunter, "Haydn's String Quartet Fingerings: Communications to Performer and Audience," in *Engaging Haydn: Culture, Context, Criticism*, ed. Mary Hunter and Richard Will (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012), 281–301, at 297.

which played itself out in the ritualized repetition of a small body of recognized masterworks.[70] First-hand accounts of the concerts cited by Eshbach, such as those of Edith Stargardt-Wolff and the Scottish violinist Marion Bruce Ranken, drew on religious imagery, describing Joachim and his colleagues as "priestlike" and the audience as a "congregation."[71] The physical arrangement of the quartet and audience in the Singakademie may have enhanced this effect: listeners were grouped around a podium on which the quartet performed, with players and audience all facing inwards. Beatrix Borchard has shown how writings about the Joachim Quartet relate to wider discourse about music as *Kunstreligion*, with a tendency to privilege the spiritual message of a composition over the physical presence or personality of the performer.[72] In such a context the spectacle of listeners buried in their scores, concentrating on the notated text of a work rather than the four quartet players themselves, would hardly have seemed problematic. Such a scenario suggests a comparison between the score and Scripture, which is all the more pertinent in a German Protestant setting given the central role of biblical readings within Lutheran worship.[73]

It is evident from surviving concert programs that the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* remained a fixture at concerts in Leipzig and Berlin in the late 1880s and (after the takeover of the series by Ernst Eulenburg) the 1890s. The Joachim Quartet concerts at the Berlin Singakademie continued until Joachim's death in 1907, and advertisements for miniature scores can be found on programs for the chamber music concerts at the Leipzig Gewandhaus as late as 1914. The popularity of such scores in Berlin by around 1900 can be gauged from a complaint in the *Tageblatt und Handels-Zeitung*, where the critic Leopold Schmidt bemoaned excessive use of the

---

[70] Robert W. Eshbach, "The Joachim Quartet Concerts at the Berlin Singakademie: Mendelssohnian *Geselligkeit* in Wilhelmine Germany," in *Brahms in the Home and the Concert Hall: Between Private and Public Performance*, ed. Katy Hamilton and Natasha Loges (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 22–42.

[71] Eshbach, "Joachim Quartet Concerts," 22–24.

[72] As Borchard notes, the members of the Joachim Quartet were regarded as mediators (*Vermittler*) of the musical works being performed. Beatrix Borchard, *Stimme und Geige: Amalie und Joseph Joachim: Biographie und Interpretationsgeschichte* (Vienna: Boehlau, 2005), 525.

[73] For an exploration of this idea in relation to the performing activities of Hans von Bülow, see Karen Leistra-Jones, "Hans von Bülow and the Confessionalization of *Kunstreligion*," *Journal of Musicology* 35, no. 1 (2018): 42–75, at 67.

kleine Partitur-Ausgabe at one of the Joachim Quartet's concerts: "It was striking how many of those present were absorbed in small scores. While reading along can certainly be instructive and enjoyable for the musician, it can distract the layperson, even the informed listener, from the main event."[74] Schmidt's language elsewhere in the review is redolent of the religious rhetoric noted by Eshbach (listeners are variously described as a "devout audience" and a "congregation"), and what seems to have motivated his critique was a feeling that the use of scores was part of a trend, rather than the result of a desire for spiritual enlightenment: "The Joachim Concerts were themselves once a fashionable affair; now it is the small scores. Maybe they too will disappear again much as the affected listeners disappeared from the concert hall, in which they had nothing to seek, and into which they had been led only by vanity and an instinct for imitation."[75] From further newspaper reports we learn that the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* continued to be taken up in other German cities and was, for the most part, very warmly received. In the *Dresdner Journal* the availability of the small scores at a local music shop was highlighted in October 1890 ahead of an upcoming chamber music concert that was to include a Beethoven piano trio and Robert Schumann's piano quintet.[76] A notice in the Aachen newspaper *Echo der Gegenwart* from 1900 announced the sale of small scores at an upcoming chamber concert as a new development.[77] Here the presence of the volumes was cited as already being very much established ("sehr eingebürgert") in other cities. This critic described the new availability of scores as a favorable development and opined that following along during performances might be "interesting and stimulating" for many a listener.[78]

---

[74] Leopold Schmidt, "Konzertbericht," *Berliner Tageblatt und Handels-Zeitung*, *Abend-Ausgabe*, October 12, 1900. "Es war auffällig, wie Viele der Anwesenden in kleine Partituren vertieft waren. So gewiß das Nachlesen für den Musiker lehr- und genußreich sein kann, so sehr kann es den Laien, auch den musikkundigen, von der Hauptsache ablenken."

[75] Schmidt, "Konzertbericht": "Einst waren die Joachim-Abende selbst eine Modesache, jetzt sind es die kleinen Partituren. Vielleicht verschwinden auch sie wieder, wie die affektirten Besucher aus dem Saal verschwanden, in dem sie nichts zu suchen hatten, und in den nur Eitelkeit und Nachahmungstrieb sie geführt hatten."

[76] *Dresdner Journal*, October 7, 1890, 1561.

[77] "Musikalische Gesellschaft," *Echo der Gegenwart*, December 5, 1900.

[78] "Musikalische Gesellschaft," *Echo der Gegenwart*: "Das Mitlesen dürfte manchem Zuhörer interessant und anregend sein."

Collecting Miniature Scores: Tovey at Twelve

While Payne's scores had been assessed positively in *The Athenaeum* in January 1887, the context for their sale and use in Britain was somewhat different from that in Germany and Austria. In London the Popular Concerts at St James's Hall played a similar role to the Joachim Quartet concerts in Berlin. Joachim himself had appeared regularly at St James's Hall since the first season of the Popular Concerts in 1859, and the series was influential in establishing a canon of chamber works within public concert life. However, whereas the Berlin concerts were enjoyed predominantly by a cultural elite, the Popular Concerts appealed, as Therese Ellsworth has outlined, to a larger, more socially mixed audience.[79] Seating up to two thousand, St James's Hall had a capacity approximately three times that of venues such as Berlin's Singakademie and the smaller hall of the Leipzig Gewandhaus. The pianist, composer, and scholar Donald Francis Tovey, who attended some of the concerts as a teenager, recalled that the Payne scores began to be sold at these events in the late 1880s: "Not only did they become infinitely more valuable records of the treat than the analytical programmes, which merely infuriated me, but, apart from concerts, these scores were within at least fortnightly reach of a boy's pocket-money of sixpence a week."[80] Although he was writing almost five decades after the fact, Tovey's claim is certainly credible, although his interest in Payne's scores was not shared by all; indeed, the sale of small scores in London does not seem to have stimulated the extensive newspaper discussion it had in Germany and Austria.

Small scores were nevertheless meaningful for some chamber music lovers in London, as the archival materials relating to Tovey's teenage years make abundantly clear. A biography of Tovey written by his pupil Mary Grierson stressed his precocious gifts for silent score-reading, and the young musician's letters to his teacher Sophie Weisse reveal his enthusiasm for score collecting.[81] Tovey received a number of orchestral scores from Weisse as gifts, but it is the series

[79] Ellsworth, "'*Caviare* to the Multitude.'"

[80] Donald Francis Tovey, "The Training of the Musical Imagination," *Music and Letters* 17, no. 4 (1936): 337–56, at 344–45.

[81] Mary Grierson, *Donald Francis Tovey: A Biography Based on Letters* (London: Oxford University Press, 1952), 1. Tovey was Reid Professor of Music at the University of Edinburgh from 1914 until his death in 1940, and the Tovey Collection, which includes letters, scores, and manuscripts, is today part of the Special Collections in the University of Edinburgh Library.

of chamber music scores issued by Payne that crop up most frequently in his surviving correspondence. In a letter to his teacher from December 1887 the twelve-year-old Tovey expressed his thanks for a copy of Beethoven's *Pastoral* Symphony and then outlined his plans for disposing of gifts of money he had received at Christmas:

> There is a Serenade for Wind Instruments in B [*recte*: B-flat] by Mozart in these Payne's miniature scores, which I guess I shall get some time or other. . . . It looks vast for it is two shillings; the number is 100. . . . Nearly all the Haydn's [*sic*] are only 6d. I'll also tell you something else. In the list on the back of the Schumann Quintet <u>all</u> the Haydn's have opus numbers, up to Op. 76! . . . I've got five shillings for a Christmas present! . . . I shall soon have to ask them to publish more! At present I want No. 100, No. 3 and No. 10.[82]

From the index of Payne's scores it can be ascertained that in addition to Mozart's Serenade (K. 361), the particular Haydn quartets Tovey wished to acquire were op. 76, nos. 2 and 3.

The specific use Tovey made of his scores was sometimes discussed in letters to Weisse and it is evident that the volumes were of value to him not only for following musical performances in a concert hall. Weisse arranged a well-rounded education for her prodigy, whose teenage correspondence provides rich details of his studies and compositional endeavors as well as reports on more mundane activities (such as enjoying jam sandwiches for tea).[83] Tovey's work on compositional projects sometimes led him to request scores as a means of help with specific creative problems. One undated letter, for example, describes his progress—or lack thereof—on a quintet and contains a long list of works by Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, and Cherubini that he felt in need of, including many quartets, all of which were identified by their number in the Payne series:

> Please send the 12 [scores]; remember it's the quintet who wants them, not I myself. And I promise you again solemnly & faithfully not to pore over them. I want them all urgently; the Mozarts and Cherubinis for the 1st movement and adagio and finale; the

[82] University of Edinburgh Centre for Research Collections (CRC), Coll-411/1/1/L343.

[83] In addition to piano lessons, which Weisse herself conducted, from the age of nine Tovey was sent to Walter Parratt, organist at St George's Chapel, Windsor, to study harmony and counterpoint; in his teenage years he also received lessons in composition from Hubert Parry.

> Cherubinis and Schuberts for the adagio and scherzo and the Beethoven for the least posthumous scherzo.[84]

Elsewhere Tovey's letters conveyed his delight in score study as an activity in its own right. A long letter about Beethoven's *Eroica* Symphony written when he was around the age of thirteen closed with the remark that the symphony "takes an hour to peruse without repeats."[85]

A seller's stamp on some of Tovey's copies of the Payne scores reveals that they were bought at the "Dyson & Sons Pianoforte & Music Warehouse" in Windsor; the handwritten markings on several others tie them to his visits to St James's Hall, where they might also have been purchased. Characteristic of what might be called Tovey's "inscriptive practices" are annotations that connect the scores to particular musical performances.[86] Such markings are good examples of a phenomenon that has been explored by Fabio Morabito—the practice of annotation serving as a way for owners to make musical textual objects part of their lives.[87] To be found on the first page of some of Tovey's Payne scores are records of when he first heard a given work and who played it. A score for Mozart's String Quintet in D, K. 593, is thus inscribed, "Heard this for the first time with Miss Weisse. St Jame's [*sic*] Hall. March 9. 1889," with the five string players listed as Joachim, Ries, Holländer, Gibson, and Piatti (see fig. 6).[88] Another score in Tovey's collection that bears the same date is for Mendelssohn's Andante, Scherzo, Capriccio, and Fugue, op. 81, performed by four of the same five musicians. The Mozart and the first two movements of the Mendelssohn were heard on a Saturday afternoon at the thirty-first season of Popular Concerts at St James's Hall. Other music that featured on the program was by Grieg: the

[84] University of Edinburgh CRC, Coll-411/1/1/L354.

[85] University of Edinburgh CRC, Coll-411/1/1/L344.

[86] Like many handwritten markings of ownership in books, Tovey's inscriptions follow a repeating pattern. See Multigraph Collective, *Interacting with Print*, 210–11.

[87] Fabio Morabito, "Views of the Annotator," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 78, no. 3 (forthcoming).

[88] University of Edinburgh CRC, Mus.s.704. Joachim's collaborators were Louis Ries, Gustav Holländer, Ludwig Straus, Alfredo Piatti, and Alfred Gibson. (Holländer's name was typically spelled without the umlaut in the St James's Hall concert programs.)

G minor violin sonata, which was played by Joachim with the composer at the piano, two groups of songs (sung by "Madame Grieg"), and a solo piano version of the Holberg Suite.[89]

<insert figure 6 near here>

Given that not all of Tovey's Payne scores survive, it is impossible to establish exactly when he started using them at concerts at St James's Hall. Extant copies confirm his attendance at various performances by Joseph Joachim and the members of his London-based string quartet. Joachim was known to Sophie Weisse and it seems likely that she would have taken her pupil to the great violinist's London performances. From annotations it emerges that Beethoven's Serenade for String Trio, op. 8, was heard by Tovey at St James's Hall on February 26, 1887 (played by Joachim, Holländer, and Piatti); two years later, on March 16, 1889, he witnessed Beethoven's Quartet in C Minor, op. 18, no. 4, played by the full Joachim Quartet. Other scores reveal that in December 1888 Tovey attended two performances given by Joachim's colleagues: a concert on December 8 included Mendelssohn's Quartet in A Minor, op. 12, played by Straus, Ries, Holländer, and Piatti; and on December 15 he attended a concert featuring Mozart's String Quartet in D Minor, K. 421. Tovey's Payne score for the latter work is dated and next to the first violin part he has simply written "Neruda." This surely refers to Wilma Neruda, later known as Lady Hallé, another highly acclaimed performer at St James's Hall, who gave concerts with Ries, Holländer, and Piatti, particularly when Joachim was not in London.

By the early 1890s, when Eulenburg took over the *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* from Payne, Tovey had acquired a substantial music library. In an undated letter to Weisse, probably from the late 1880s, he reported on a recent gift of new scores from his father, offered as recompense for an aborted concert trip. These prompted a description of his collection *in toto* as it then stood, as well as an account of plans to have some of his scores bound together:

> So now I've got all Beethoven published, that I want, all published of Haydn, all ditto of Mozart and all Schumann that I want. I've now got enough for 3 volumes, viz Beethoven, String trios & Serenade, op 87 for 2 oboes & Engl Horn, & serenade for flute, violin & viola. Vol 2 will be Mozart 6 quartets, & vol 3 Schumann quartets, quartet E<flat> piano & strings, & quintett. I now have 84; 26 of Beethoven, 30 of Haydn, 20 of Mozart, 5 of Schumann, one of Mendelssohn, one of Cherubini, & 1 of Dittersdorf. Isn't this grand. Do you know they've got the Beethoven piano-trios op 1 in that edition, & the piano

[89] St James's Hall, Regent Street and Piccadilly. Saturday Popular Concerts. Thirty-first Season. Programme and Analytical Remarks for Saturday Afternoon, March 9, 1889.

quartet which Lily played, & even the Kreutzer Sonate. That's scarcely a score, I think[.] Then there's a quintet of Boccherini, which looks tempting, & two quartets which are the smallest in that edition, and they're actually by Schubert! The two are in one book & together cost 9d, so they are shorter than any Haydn, and the themes are really exquisitte [*sic*]! I think I shall get them, for they can't possibly be long. [musical example follows] The last 2 bars are my guess; but isn't that a beautiful theme! I'm sure it must be worth getting. Oh! Dear! I must finish

Your affectionate

Donald Francis Tovey

Mother sends you her love[90]

The Schubert theme quoted in this letter (with Tovey's conjectured continuation) is recognizable as that which begins the String Quartet in D, D. 94 (see fig. 7). The work was sold in the Payne series together with the C minor Quartet Movement, D. 703.

<insert figure 7 near here>

Tovey's copies of the Payne scores for Haydn and Schubert string quartets are no longer to be found, but two of the three planned bound volumes outlined in this letter survive and contain some of the aforementioned annotations. The Beethoven volume described in the letter came to contain seven trios for string and wind instruments, while the projected Mozart volume ended up as two volumes comprising the composer's last ten string quartets.[91] Two other similar volumes survive for Mozart and Beethoven, alongside volumes of Mendelssohn's chamber works and a volume of Schumann's piano trios.[92] Whereas in the majority of cases these materials were subsequently rebound by the university library, the bindings of three of Tovey's volumes—the Schumann and one each of Mendelssohn and Beethoven—are original. The Schumann and Mendelssohn bindings additionally carry Tovey's initials "D.F.T.," which appear regularly on the other sheet music and scores in his collection. The Mendelssohn volume was

[90] University of Edinburgh CRC, Coll-411/1/1/L353. The individual by the name of "Lily" who had played Beethoven's piano quartet has not been identified, but was probably another of Sophie Weisse's pupils.

[91] University of Edinburgh CRC, Tov. 222 (Beethoven) and Tov. 1059 (Mozart). The two Mozart volumes were subsequently bound together as one by the university library.

[92] University of Edinburgh CRC, Tov. 1060 and Mus.s.704 (Mozart), Mus.s.691 and Mus.s.703 (Beethoven), Tov. 1695 (Schumann) Tov. 877 and Mus.s.702 (Mendelssohn)

additionally stamped with the date "1890," suggesting that the string chamber works contained within were acquired (or at least bound together) when Tovey was fifteen (see fig. 8).

<insert figure 8 near here>

Like the annotations detailing when and where a given work was heard, Tovey's grouping of works together in bound volumes can be seen as an important aspect of his interaction with musical print media. The significance of musicians arranging and binding together chosen scores in an earlier nineteenth-century context has been emphasized by Candace Bailey.[93] For Tovey, providing a more robust binding for the Payne scores would have been a way of prolonging the life of the flimsy and cheaply produced publications, turning these piles of ephemeral paper scores into durable reference volumes. In this regard it is noteworthy that some of the later pencil markings in his scores, such as measure numbers and corrections to the musical text, suggest an expectation of repeated consultation and long-term use. Binding together the small Payne scores also facilitated the ordering of the collection, enabling the works of an individual composer to be arranged by genre and date of composition—Tovey was thus both generating and organizing his own personal canon of treasured chamber works. The large number of compositions issued by Payne gave him and other serious music lovers in Britain and mainland Europe in the 1880s and 1890s the opportunity to get their heads and hands around a remarkably large swathe of Austro-German chamber music. As Tovey made the scores in the Payne series his own through annotation and study, and by arranging and binding them, his musical and aesthetic sensibilities were being molded by this form of musical print media.

* * *

The stories that music historians are able to tell about late nineteenth-century print media objects such as Payne's *kleine Partitur-Ausgabe* are inevitably limited by the survival and accessibility of source materials. While the use of Payne's scores in concert halls occasioned fairly extensive discussion in the German-language press, an equivalent discourse seems to be lacking in relation to their reception in Britain. Whether this was because the established use of

[93] Candace Bailey's studies have dealt with binder's volumes—a rich source in women's musical culture in the southern states of America before the Civil War. See her "Binder's Volumes as Musical Commonplace Books: The Transmission of Cultural Codes in the Antebellum South," *Journal of the Society for American Music* 10, no. 4 (2016): 446–69.

analytical programs rendered the Payne scores less novel in Britain, or simply because there was less uptake of the small volumes, is hard to say. That some of the miniature scores collected by the young Tovey can still be studied today is a function of his subsequent renown as a performing musician, composer, and scholar. Scores owned by less illustrious figures were less likely to have been retained by libraries and archives, especially if they carried signs of use by a former owner. Examples of Payne's scores can be found in antiquarian bookshops in Germany and Austria, but the survival rate of these cheaply produced volumes with their now fragile and yellowed paper is increasingly low. The copy of the Haydn quartet score shown in figure 1 in fact fell apart while the digital scan was being made.

Despite their partial disappearance, the Payne editions discussed in this study provide intriguing clues about the ways in which late nineteenth-century listeners and musicians made use of small scores, including some of the musical behaviors they supported and stimulated. At the same time, these modest examples of musical print media provoke reflection on the later dissemination and public consumption of classical chamber music. From a twenty-first-century perspective, the sources discussed here are striking for the high levels of musical literacy they imply among concert attendees. German-language newspaper commentaries on these mass-produced scores deepen our understanding of the nature of late nineteenth-century listeners' engagement with chamber music in the concert hall, and prompt us to consider how the experience of individual musical works might have been subtly reoriented by the act of score-following. While the young Tovey cannot be regarded as an average British musical listener, his annotated and bound scores offer a valuable instance of human interaction with these print objects and are suggestive of the distinctive material connection with the classical chamber canon that the *kleine Paritur-Ausgabe* afforded. Tovey's example variously illustrates the collecting impulses to which Payne's scores might give rise, the role these scores might have in memorializing concert hall listening experiences, and also their potential pedagogical value, enabling contact with and knowledge of acclaimed works of chamber music.

By the 1930s, when Tovey came to reflect on the value of score-reading within musical education, radio broadcasts and sound recordings had provided new audiences for miniature scores, giving listeners the opportunity to follow musical works in the comfort of their own homes. Today, at a time when writers tend to avoid using music notation in texts directed at nonspecialists, the listener who collects scores might appear a mere historical curiosity. But while the use of physical scores by listeners at chamber music concerts has clearly declined, in

other contexts the activity of score-following is witnessing a resurgence. Through YouTube videos some of the very same scores that were issued in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries currently enjoy a digital afterlife. A quick YouTube search for "Haydn quartet score" will yield recordings of numerous works synchronized to engraved musical texts that were originally prepared for the firm of Eulenburg. As part of an increasingly distant musical culture, the frequent use of miniature scores in the nineteenth-century concert hall serves to exercise our historical imagination, but it would seem that these mass-produced small scores are still playing some role in the classical chamber canon's ongoing remediations.