



*Interpreting the Expressive Worlds
of Schubert's Late Instrumental Works*

Joe Davies

**St Hugh's College
University of Oxford**

Submitted in fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Musicology

ABSTRACT

Interpreting the Expressive Worlds of Schubert's Late Instrumental Works

Joe Davies
St Hugh's College
DPhil in Musicology

This thesis offers a contextual framework for interpreting the expressive worlds of the instrumental works Schubert composed in the last six years of his life (1822–1828), focusing on notions of the gothic, the sublime, and the grotesque. These interrelated categories are examined from both semiotic and hermeneutic perspectives, with attention devoted to their musical signifiers, notably in terms of topical content, as well as their associations with trends in literature and the visual arts. Areas of investigation include excess and transgression; death, ghostliness, and evocations of the past; emotional distress and the fear of the unknown; and an emphasis on fantasy, the sublime, and the grotesque. Case-studies are drawn from selected impromptus and sonatas for piano solo, as well as chamber and orchestral works, including the 'Unfinished' Symphony, D 759, and the String Quintet, D 956. Ultimately what emerges across the course of the study is a view of the composer's late instrumental style as one that exhibits myriad forms of aesthetic strangeness, drawing us into the psychological dimension of this extraordinary music.

Table of Contents

List of Music Examples

List of Figures

Acknowledgements

Prologue [1]

1. Schubert and Lateness [4]

**The Hermeneutics of (Schubert's) Late Style
Analytical and Critical Approaches to Schubert
New Avenues**

2. Schubert's Gothic Music [31]

**Ghostly Revenants and Strange Doubles
Excess and Transgression
Hearing Fantasy**

3. 'Too Vast and Significant, Too Strange and Wonderful': The Poetics of the Schubertian Sublime [91]

**Conceptions of the Sublime
The Sublime in the Musicological Imagination
Tropes of the Schubertian Sublime**

4. Stylistic Disjuncture and Grotesquerie in Schubert's Last Instrumental Works [129]

**Setting the Scene
From Dream to Nightmare: Schubert's Adagio (D 956)
From Eerie Lyricism to Distorted Fantasia: Schubert's Andantino (D 959)
Shared Concerns
Grotesquerie**

Epilogue [190]

Bibliography [198]

List of Music Examples

- 2.1 Schubert, Piano Sonata in B flat major, D 960, I, bars 1–9
- 2.2 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 1–17
- 2.3 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A minor, D 784, I, bars 1–22
- 2.4 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A minor, D 845, I, bars 1–10
- 2.5 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 95–119
- 2.6 Schubert, ‘Death and the Maiden’ Quartet, I, bars 1–6
- 2.7 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 33–51
- 2.8 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 55–60
- 2.9 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 124–129
- 2.10 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 138–143
- 2.11 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 193–204
- 2.12 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, II, bars 1–21
- 2.13 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, II, bars 41–44
- 2.14 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, II, bars 67–84
- 2.15 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, IV, bars 273–286
- 2.16 Schubert, *Quartettsatz* in C minor, D 703, I, bars 1–10
- 2.17 Schubert, *Quartettsatz* in C minor, D 703, I, bars 61–65
- 2.18 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, I, bars 1–24
- 2.19 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, I, bars 278–282
- 2.20 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, I, bars 437–444
- 2.21 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, I, bars 1–8
- 2.22 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, I, bars 48–57
- 2.23 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, II, bars 121–132

- 2.24** Schubert, *Grande Marche Funèbre*, D 859, bars 15–21
- 2.25** Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, II, bars 133–137
- 2.26** Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, III, bars 164–179
- 2.27** Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, III, bars 273–294
- 2.28** Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, IV, bars 474–481
- 2.29** Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, IV, bars 556–570
- 3.1** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 1–8
- 3.2** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 9–12
- 3.3** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 13–21
- 3.4** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 36–42
- 3.5** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 44–53
- 3.6** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 62–71
- 3.7** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 142–149
- 3.8** Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 353–368
- 3.9** Schubert, ‘Great’ Symphony in C major, D 944, I, bars 1–8
- 3.10** Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, I, bars 1–12
- 3.11** Schubert, ‘Great’ Symphony in C major, D 944, I, bars 661–685
- 4.1** Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 1–4
- 4.2** Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 28–31
- 4.3** Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 35–38
- 4.4a** Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 57–62
- 4.4b** Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 64–67
- 4.5** Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 89–94
- 4.6a** Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 1–8
- 4.6b** Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 19–27

- 4.7a** Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 69–84
- 4.7b** Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 85–122
- 4.8** Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 123–158
- 4.9** Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 159–166
- 4.10** Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, bars 1–8
- 4.11** Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, bars 31–58
- 4.12** Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, bars 79–87
- 4.13** Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 1–9
- 4.14** Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 40–62
- 4.15** Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 166–174
- 4.16** Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 223–228

List of Figures

- 2.1 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, overview
- 2.2 Schubert, *Quartettsatz* in C minor, D 703, I, overview
- 2.3 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, overview
- 4.1 Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, overview
- 4.2 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, overview
- 4.3 Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, overview
- 4.4 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, overview
- 4.5 Henry Fuseli, 'The Nightmare' (1781)
- 4.6 'Der Atlas', text and translation
- 4.7 'Der Doppelgänger', Stanzas 2 and 3

Acknowledgements

It is a pleasure to thank the individuals who have accompanied me on my exploration of the expressive worlds of Schubert's late music.

Heartfelt gratitude is extended to Professor Susan Wollenberg. I consider it one of life's privileges to have worked under the guidance of such a generous and supportive mentor. Susan's influential approach has instilled in me a deep sense of the intricacies of late Schubert, while more generally providing a model of scholarship that fuses rigorous analytical investigation with poetic criticism. The friendship we have developed in the service of Schubertian hermeneutics inspires my research in ways that resonate beyond the boundaries of what can be expressed here.

Warmest thanks are due to my co-supervisor, Professor Laura Tunbridge, for her continued support and encouragement. Many of the arguments presented in this thesis have benefitted in no small measure from Laura's insights and probing feedback.

I fondly acknowledge the formative input of Professor Matthew Head, whose gentle yet robust advice during my undergraduate days at King's College London has given me the confidence to follow my research ambitions to the highest level.

It is an honour to thank the Arts and Humanities Research Council for providing the scholarship that enabled me to pursue this doctoral project, as well as the institutions that have generously supported my participation in overseas conferences (most recently the 2017 Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society). These include the Oxford Faculty of Music, St Hugh's College, and The Royal Musical Association.

While writing this thesis I have had the joy of co-editing a volume of essays, *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert*, with my stimulating colleague Dr James Sobaskie. His willingness to share ideas, together with his enthusiasm for Schubert's music, has served as a valuable source of inspiration throughout my doctoral research.

As I pen these acknowledgements, I am delighted to express gratitude to the many Schubertians who have shared their insights with me. Among them are Dr Anne Hyland and Professors Robert Hatten, Marjorie Hirsch, and Richard Kramer. I am especially appreciative of Professor Susan Youens's kind words of encouragement (both at conferences and via email correspondence) over the last few years.

Beyond Schubert studies, friends and colleagues at Lady Margaret Hall have provided invaluable motivation throughout the project's gestation. I am indebted to Dr Gascia Ouzounian, with whom I share teaching duties at LMH, for her friendship and infectious levels of collegiality. I am grateful also to Dr Benjamin Skipp for our convivial lunchtime conversations concerning all things musicological.

Sincere thanks are offered to Robin Hagues for his efficiency and professionalism in processing the music examples that appear in the chapters assembled here.

My parents and family deserve special mention. Without their love and support, this project would not have been possible. A number of close friends, notably Pamela Michaelidou, Wei Tan, and Beverley Vong, have similarly provided good cheer at all stages of my research.

My final thanks are reserved for Min Sern Teh, whose inspiration – at once intellectual and pragmatic – has enabled me to reach the finishing line.

*I dedicate this thesis to the fond memory of my grandfather (1935–2018).
His kindness, keen interest, and profound sense of humanity have left a lasting
impression on my scholarly outlook and understanding of the world. For this, I shall
be forever grateful.*

Prologue

Scholarly interest in the music Schubert composed between 1822 and 1828 has recently reached new peaks, fuelled in part by the international conference ‘Thanatos as Muse? Schubert and Concepts of Late Style’ held at Maynooth University in 2011, and consolidated by the two volumes which emerged from that gathering: *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style*,¹ and *Rethinking Schubert*.² What shines through in these studies is the way in which Schubert’s music continually invites new modes of critical and emotional engagement.³ In short, their findings demonstrate that there will always be more to learn about the aesthetic contexts and cultural history of Schubertian lateness. It is in this spirit of enquiry that the present study is conceived.

Opening up new avenues of hermeneutic enquiry apropos the expressive worlds of Schubert’s late instrumental works, this thesis constructs a contextual framework for understanding those strange moments that have long confounded interpreters. Among the examples examined here are the abrupt modal shifts in the opening bars of the String Quartet in G major, D 887, the disturbing breakthrough in the first movement of the ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, and the disjuncture between eerie lyricism and fantasy in the slow movement of the Piano Sonata in A major, D 959. Markers of strangeness in these examples range from underlying structural fractures, through harmonic dislocations, to disorientating shifts between expressive scenes and gestural intrusions

¹ See Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (eds), *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016).

² See Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (eds), *Rethinking Schubert* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016).

³ For further discussion of these issues, see my review of *Schubert’s Late Music, Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (forthcoming [available online: <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409817000696>]). See also ‘Analytical and Critical Approaches to Schubert’ in chapter 1 of this thesis.

from elsewhere – in all cases, which resist straightforward analytical systematization, we are invited to find meaning in the music’s internal worlds.

How might we contextualize such strangeness? And what are its implications for our understanding of Schubert’s late style? Over the course of the thesis, I propose that the gothic – an aesthetic category that is ripe for further exploration in Schubert studies – provides a lens through which to interpret the strange qualities of Schubert’s late instrumental works, and to account for their psychological effects. The study is framed in terms of the following tropes: excess and transgression; death, ghostliness, and evocations of the past; emotional distress and the fear of the unknown; and an emphasis on fantasy, the sublime, and the grotesque – all of which are interconnected at multiple levels in the music under consideration.

Behind the individual chapters lies a desire to develop a methodology that captures the complexities of Schubert’s artistic vision and the *Zeitgeist* embedded in the circles in which he moved. To this end, my exegesis is constructed within a ‘hermeneutical theatre’,⁴ a framework in which semiotic analysis of the topical profiles of Schubert’s instrumental works is coupled with hermeneutic reflection on their aesthetic qualities,⁵ notably in connection with trends in literature and the visual arts. In pursuing this

⁴ The term ‘hermeneutical theatre’ is taken from Richard Kramer, ‘Against the grain: the Sonata in G (D. 894) and a hermeneutics of late style’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 111–33: here Kramer explores the ways in which the first movement of the G major Piano Sonata, D 894, and Schubert’s setting of Franz Bruchmann’s ‘Schwestergruß’, D 762, might be said ‘to speak to one another’ through a ‘shared lexicon of tropes and figures’. This thesis adopts a similar intertextual approach to the instrumental music Schubert composed between 1822 and 1828. My critical approach also takes inspiration from Lawrence Kramer’s theory of musical hermeneutics. See *Musical as Cultural Practice, 1800–1900* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), chapter 1, ‘Tropes and Windows: An Outline of Musical Hermeneutics’; and his *Interpreting Music* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2011), chapter 1, ‘Hermeneutics’, pp. 1–19.

⁵ My readings are intended to broaden the topical discourse on Schubert’s late music. Important studies in this area (discussed further in chapter 1) include Robert Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004); and Hatten, ‘Schubert’s Alchemy: Transformative Surfaces, Transfiguring Depths’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 91–111.

interdisciplinary approach, the thesis aims not only to offer fresh perspectives on Schubert's compositional idiom, but also to situate his late style in a broader cultural landscape.

Schubert and Lateness

When discussing Schubert's "late" works it is worth remembering that we are referring to a composer in his late twenties. Why then, do we ascribe the classification "late"? And in what sense do we mean "late"? Is there not, in all Schubert's "late music", simply an experienced composer's calm and confident grasp of the tools of his trade? Or did Schubert's knowledge that he was dying propel an early flowering of a "late" style? If so, then how can we define this style as distinct from maturity? While Schubert scholars generally agree that the composer's style changes, there is a distinct division in how we approach such questions, the contentious issue being whether it is even viable to speak of late style in a composer who died so young. [...] But is "lateness" always an indication of life, or can it emerge through a recognition that the end is near?¹

Lorraine Byrne Bodley's incisive remarks encapsulate the complex issues surrounding the study of late Schubert.² These range from practical matters, notably the challenges involved in the identification of what constitutes 'late' music in Schubert's oeuvre, to the philosophical conundrum regarding the relationship between the composer's awareness of mortality and the development of his compositional creativity. In this thesis, I take up Byrne Bodley's invitation to reflect afresh on the nature of lateness in Schubert's oeuvre, using the category of late style as a critical lens through which to

¹ Lorraine Byrne Bodley, 'Introduction: Schubert's Late Style and Current Musical Scholarship', in *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), p. 1.

² For further discussion of late style, see Maynard Solomon, *Late Beethoven: Music, Thought, Imagination* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003); Michael Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy: Adorno and Beethoven's Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2006); Stephen Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon: Political Romanticism in the Late Works* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004); Laura Tunbridge, *Schumann's Late Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007); Marianne Wheeldon, *Debussy's Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009); Margaret Anne Notley, *Lateness and Brahms: Music and Culture in the Twilight of Viennese Liberalism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007); Simon Keefe, *Mozart in Vienna: The Final Decade* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017); and Andrew Davis, *Il Trittico, Turandot, and Puccini's Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010).

conceptualize the shared aesthetic qualities of the instrumental works he composed in the last six years of his life, 1822–1828.³

The Hermeneutics of (Schubert's) Late Style

Reading Schubert's personal correspondence from 1822 onwards⁴ – the watershed year in which he contracted what is generally agreed to have been syphilis⁵ – affords an opportunity to observe the existential tensions that governed his personal and musical outlook in the final years of his life. His oft-quoted letter to Leopold Kupelwieser of 31 March 1824 constitutes a particularly revealing example. Its opening sections fluctuate between the style of a personal reflection on physical discomfort and a literary aphorism on the melancholic condition:

I feel myself to be the most unhappy and wretched creature in the world. Imagine a man whose health will never be right again, and who in sheer despair over this ever makes things worse and worse, instead of better; imagine a man, I say, whose most brilliant hopes have perished, for whom the felicity of love and friendship have nothing to offer but at best pain, whose enthusiasm (at least of the stimulating kind) for all things beautiful threatens to forsake him, and I ask you, is he not a miserable, unhappy being? – “*My peace is gone, my heart is sore, I shall find it never and nevermore*”, I may well sing every day now, for each night, on retiring to bed, I hope I may not wake again, and each morning but recalls yesterday's grief. Thus, joyless and friendless, I should pass my days, did not Schwind visit me now and again and turn on me a ray of those sweet days of the past.⁶

³ On the chronology of Schubert's late music see pp. 7–9 below.

⁴ Otto Erich Deutsch, *Schubert: A Documentary Biography*, trans. Eric Blom (London: Dent, 1946), pp. 205–850.

⁵ On Schubert's illness see Elizabeth McKay, *Franz Schubert: A Biography* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996), chapter 7; and Eric Sams, 'Schubert's Illness Re-examined', *The Musical Times* 121 (1980), pp. 15–22; John O'Shea, *Music and Medicine: Medical Profiles of Great Composers* (London: J.M. Dent, 1990), pp. 109–17; Peter Gilroy Bevan, 'Adversity: Schubert's illnesses and their background', in *Schubert Studies*, ed. Brian Newbould (Farnham: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 244–66; Anton Neumayr, *Musik und Medizin: am Beispiel der Wiener Klassik* (Vienna: Edition Wien, 1987), pp. 189–226; Deborah Hayden, *Pox: Genius, Madness, and the Mysteries of Syphilis* (New York: Basic Books, 2003), chapter 9 'Franz Schubert, 1797–1828'; and Joseph N. Straus, *Extraordinary Measures: Disability in Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), chapter 3, 'Musical Narratives of Disability Accommodated: Schubert'.

⁶ Schubert, letter to Leopold Kupelwieser, 31 March 1824, in *A Documentary Biography*, p. 339. The quotation, taken of course from 'Gretchen am Spinnrade' (D 118), further emphasizes Schubert's sense of despair. For further discussion of this letter – an important, uncensored entrée into Schubert's psychological world – see Lorraine Byrne Bodley, *Franz Schubert: A Musical Wayfarer* (New Haven: Yale University Press, forthcoming).

While the despairing tone of this excerpt vividly conveys a sense of Schubert's self-absorption in the harsh realities of his situation, the closing passage of the letter presents a rather different perspective. Here Schubert moves from the personal to the professional realm, outlining his future ambitions:

Of songs, I have written many new ones, but I have tried my hand at several instrumental works, for I wrote two Quartets for violins, viola and violoncello and an Octet, and I want to write another quartet, in fact I intend to pave my way towards a grand symphony in that manner. The latest in Vienna is that Beethoven is to give a concert at which he is to produce his new symphony, three movements from the new Mass and a new Overture. God willing, I too am thinking of giving a similar concert next year. I will close now, so as not to use too much paper, and kiss you 1,000 times. If you were to write to me about your present enthusiastic mood and about your life in general, nothing could more greatly please.⁷

Schubert's letter to his brother Ferdinand dated July 1824 offers further insights into his compositional productivity, while more broadly highlighting the power of his creative imagination to transport him 'to a better world':⁸

True, it is no longer that happy time during which each object seems to us to be surrounded by a youthful gloriole, but a period of fateful recognition of a miserable reality, which I endeavour to beautify as far as possible by my imagination. [...] I am better able now to find happiness and peace in myself than I was then – a grand sonata and variations on a theme of my own, both for 4 hands, which I have already written, shall serve you as proof of this.⁹

A similar sense of longing for a former period of happiness, tinged with the realization that misery prevails, is expressed in a letter Schubert wrote to his friend Schober on 21 September 1824:

And what ever should we do with happiness, misery being the only stimulant left to us? If only we were together, you, Schwind, Kuppel [Kuppelwieser] and I, and misfortune would seem to be but a light matter; but here we are, separated, each in a different corner, and that is what makes my wretchedness. I want to exclaim with Goethe: "Who will bring me back just an hour of that sweet time!" ["Ach! Wer bringt nur eine Stunde jener holden Zeit zurück!"] That time when we sat so snugly together and each disclosed the children of his

⁷ Ibid, pp. 339–340.

⁸ I quote this phrase from Schubert's 'An die Musik', D 547.

⁹ Schubert, letter to Ferdinand, 18 July 1824, in *A Documentary Biography*, p. 363. That Schubert found solace in his imagination is further highlighted by an entry in his private notebook (29 March 1824): 'O imagination! thou greatest treasure of man, thou inexhaustible wellspring from which artists as well as savants drink! O remain with us still, by however few thou art acknowledged and revered, to preserve us from that so-called enlightenment, that hideous skeleton without flesh and blood!' Ibid., p. 337.

art to the others with motherly shyness, not without dread expecting the judgment to be pronounced by affection and truth; that time when one inspired the other and thus united striving after the highest beauty enlivened us all.¹⁰

The image of Schubert which emerges from these excerpts is that of a composer ‘who stands in the place where extremes meet – extremes of behaviour, of intuited obligation, of artistic expression’, to borrow Byrne Bodley’s description.¹¹ What completes the picture is Schubert’s demonstration of extraordinary resilience in the face of adversity, together with his fierce commitment to his professional vision. This sense of urgency amid extremity provides the philosophical vantage point from which to consider the perplexities of Schubert’s late style.

Lateness takes many forms.¹² In the broadest sense, it functions as a chronological marker to denote music produced in the last phase of a composer’s life: famously, Beethoven ranks high among the composers whose final works have been construed in terms of possessing a distinctive late style.¹³ In other instances, the term carries with it the traces of a composer’s sense of authorial belatedness within his or her historical epoch, as in the case of Johannes Brahms.¹⁴ Beyond chronological considerations, lateness can be seen to represent a philosophical condition that is intricately connected with a composer’s proximity to and awareness of mortality: here emphasis is placed on the idea of reaching beyond the finite boundaries of existence.

¹⁰ Ibid., p. 498. For discussion of Schubert’s settings of ‘Erster Verlust’ (the text from which the Goethe reference is drawn), see Lorraine Byrne Bodley ‘In Pursuit of a Single Flame? On Schubert’s Settings of Goethe’s Poems’, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 13/1 (2016), pp. 11–33, in response to Robert Hatten, ‘A Surfeit of Musics: What Goethe’s Lyrics Concede when set to Schubert’s Music’, *Nineteenth-Century Music* 5/2 (2008), pp. 7–18.

¹¹ Lorraine Byrne Bodley, ‘A Place at the Edge: Reflections on Schubert’s Late Style’, *Oxford German Studies* 44/1 (2015), pp. 18–29, here p. 26.

¹² An informative overview of the multifaceted nature of late style is provided in Michael Bell, ‘Perceptions of Lateness’, in *Late Style and its Discontents: Essays in Art, Literature, and Music*, ed. Gordon McMullan and Sam Smiles (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), chapter 8.

¹³ See for example Martin Cooper, *Beethoven: The Last Decade, 1817–1827* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1970).

¹⁴ See Margaret Notley, *Lateness and Brahms*, chapter 2: ‘Brahms and the Problem of Late Style’.

Scholarship on Schubert's late style is poised between these chronological and ontological conceptions of lateness.¹⁵ At the heart of the debate is the question of whether Schubert's compositional style developed after 1822 through a confrontation with his own mortality, as part of a natural stylistic evolution, or a combination of the two.¹⁶ Ian Bostridge asserts that 'everything Schubert wrote after 1823, when he was diagnosed with syphilis and faced the prospect of insanity and death, constitutes late work'.¹⁷ For Benjamin Korstvedt, 'in its broadest sense, "late Schubert" refers to the works he wrote in the final years of his short life, starting in 1823 or 1824'.¹⁸ Korstvedt proceeds to note that 'when it concerns Schubert's last [three] piano sonatas [...], the term carries a distinct psycho-biographical charge, particularly since these works feel, often uncannily so, as if they were written under the star of looming mortality'.¹⁹ Other writers have adopted a more cautious stance. Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen, for example, has questioned the appropriateness of referring to lateness in Schubert's oeuvre, claiming that his style was already in a state of development before the period of illness, and that his final years represent a 'euphoric departure on a journey which was broken off in mid-flight'.²⁰ 'The entire complex of Schubert's last works', Hinrichsen writes, 'is very difficult to bring under a uniform concept of "late works":

¹⁵ For a recent survey of the various definitions of late Schubert, see Laura Tunbridge, 'Saving Schubert', in *Late Style and its Discontents*, chapter 7.

¹⁶ For broader discussion of these issues, see Werner Aderhold, Walther Dürr and Walburga Litschauer (eds), *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823, Arnold Feil zum 60. Geburtstag* (Kassel and Basle: Bärenreiter, 1985), pp. 57–71. An early contribution to the discourse on Schubertian lateness is Peter Gülke's 'Zum Bilde des späten Schubert: Vorwiegend analytische Betrachtungen zum Streichquintett, Op. 163', *Musik-Konzepte*, ed. Heinz-Klaus Metzger and Rainer Riehm (Munich: Edition Text+Kritik, 1979), pp. 5–58.

¹⁷ Ian Bostridge, *A Singer's Notebook* (London: Faber and Faber, 2011), p. 69. For further discussion of Bostridge's claim, see Tunbridge, 'Saving Schubert', p. 122; and Tunbridge, 'Singing against Late Style: the Problem of Performance History', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 426–41.

¹⁸ Benjamin Korstvedt, "'The prerogative of Schubert's late style': thoughts on the expressive world of Schubert's late works", in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 404–425, here p. 412–13.

¹⁹ Korstvedt, "'The prerogative of Schubert's late style'", p. 413.

²⁰ Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen, 'Is there a Late Style in Schubert's Oeuvre?', in *Rethinking Schubert* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 17–28, here p. 26.

But there are, in this body of work, overarching stylistic traits which are characteristic of Schubert in 1828 and which had been prepared in the works since 1824 – even if these are not “late style” in the presence of death, but rather mark a mature middle style corresponding to the personal circumstances of a composer, which only through the biographical chance of the sudden early death has been imbued with the aura of “lateness”.²¹

Hinrichsen concludes that ‘it is probably much more appropriate, therefore, to speak less of a “late” style than of a “new” style’.²² Walter Dürr has also detected ‘new directions’ in Schubert’s compositional development, notably in the works he composed between 1826 and 1828: these include ‘an increased interest in contrapuntal techniques’, ‘[further] attention to thematic, especially motivic and submotivic relationships’, and ‘a new kind of sonority’.²³ While it is not easy to resolve such tensions, my aim in this thesis is to show that it is possible to conceive of a late style in Schubert’s oeuvre (whose traces can be detected in his instrumental works from 1822 onwards) on both aesthetic and philosophical grounds.

One of the landmarks in musicological discussions of lateness is Adorno’s essay fragment ‘Spätstil Beethovens’.²⁴ In this text, which navigates an esoteric path between analytical commentary and cultural criticism, the author’s understanding of the essence of late style is apostrophised in a series of pithy statements:

²¹ Hinrichsen, ‘Is there a Late Style in Schubert’s Oeuvre?’, p. 25.

²² Ibid., p. 26.

²³ Walther Dürr, ‘Compositional Strategies in Schubert’s Late Music’, in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 29–40. See also William Kinderman, ‘Franz Schubert’s “New Style” and the Legacy of Beethoven’, in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 41–60.

²⁴ Adorno’s original essay ‘Spätstil Beethovens’ (1937) was reprinted in *Moments musicaux* (1964) and *Essays on Beethoven* (1993) and translated as ‘Beethoven’s Late Style’, in *Beethoven: The Philosophy of Music: Fragments and Texts*, ed. Rolf Tiedemann, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1998), pp. 123–138. An alternative translation is provided by Susan H. Gillespie in Theodor W. Adorno, *Essays on Music*, ed. Richard Leppert (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), pp. 564–583.

The maturity of the late works of important artists is not like the ripeness of fruit. As a rule, these works are not well rounded, but wrinkled, even fissured. They are apt to lack sweetness, fending off with prickly tartness those interested merely in sampling them. They lack all that harmony which the classicist aesthetic is accustomed to demand from the work of art. [...] The accepted explanation is that they are products of a subjectivity or, still better, of a “personality” ruthlessly proclaiming itself, which breaks through the roundedness of form for the sake of expression.

[...] The force of subjectivity in late works is the irascible gesture with which it leaves them. It bursts them asunder, not in order to express itself, but, expressionlessly, to cast off the illusion of art. Of the works it leaves only fragments behind, communicating itself, as if in ciphers, only through the spaces it has violently vacated.

[...] The fragmented landscape is objective, while the light in which alone it glows is subjective. He [Beethoven] does not bring about their harmonious synthesis. As a dissociative force he tears them apart in time, perhaps in order to preserve them for the eternal. In the history of art, late works are the catastrophes.²⁵

From the Adornian perspective, late works are thorny, perplexing, obscure and recalcitrant, their fractured surfaces portraying only a faint semblance of comprehensibility.²⁶ Negating reconciliation, they belong to a realm premised on the dissociation between the objective and the subjective.²⁷

Yet late style is not exclusively about intransigence.²⁸ At the opposite end of the spectrum are pieces that disclose utterances of a direct and intimate kind – among them

²⁵ Quoted in ‘Beethoven’s Late Style’, *The Philosophy of Music*, pp. 123, 125, and 126 respectively.

²⁶ On Adorno’s conception of late Beethoven see Rose Rosengard Subotnik, ‘Adorno’s Diagnosis of Beethoven’s Late Style: Early Symptom of a Fatal Condition’, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 29/1 (1976), pp. 242–75; Michael Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy: Adorno and Beethoven’s Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2006); and Jeffrey Swinkin, ‘The Middle Style/Late Style Dialectic: Problematizing Adorno’s Theory of Beethoven’, *Journal of Musicology* 30/3 (2013), pp. 282–329.

²⁷ In Beethoven’s late instrumental music, this sense of dissociation stems in part from the distortion of the conventional associations of stylistic topics and formal processes, creating the impression of ‘music about music’: one much-discussed example of this meta-compositional approach can be found in the first movement of the String Quartet in A minor, Op. 132, notably its openings pages. For contrasting critical readings of this movement, see Kofi Agawu, *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991), pp. 110–127; Susan McClary, *Conventional Wisdom: The Content of Musical Form* (California: California University Press, 2000), pp. 119–138; Daniel Chua, *The Galitzin Quartets of Beethoven: Opp. 127, 132, 130* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2014), chapter 4; and Robert Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004), pp. 267–278.

²⁸ For an overview of the expressive breadth of late style, see Joseph N. Straus, ‘Disability and “Late Style” in Music’, *Journal of Musicology* 25/1 (2008), pp. 3–45. Straus notes that late style tends to be described using language from the following adjectival categories: *introspective* (which includes such descriptors as ‘alienated, estranged, and withdrawn’), *austere* (‘bare, elemental, stripped down’), *difficult* (‘complex, technically advanced’), *compressed* (‘compact and concise’), *fragmentary* (‘episodic,

are the ‘Heiliger Dankgesang’ of Beethoven’s String Quartet in A minor, Op. 132, and the ‘Cavatina’ from his Op. 130 Quartet²⁹ – together with others whose gestural vocabulary emphasizes simplicity and sentimentality (as in Schumann’s *Gesänge der Frühe*, Op. 133)³⁰ or nostalgic introspection (such as that found in Brahms’s Intermezzo in A major, Op. 118, no. 2).³¹ In other instances, lateness is distinguished by a preoccupation with the past, as in the case of Mozart, who became intrigued by fugal writing and Baroque styles in his final years after discovering the works of J.S. Bach and Handel at Baron van Swieten’s musical gatherings: such influences are readily perceivable in the fugal finale of the ‘Jupiter’ Symphony, K 551,³² and in the contrapuntal archaism that permeates the A minor Rondo, K 511.³³ Just as some late works take inspiration from the past, so others are said to move beyond the finite boundaries of time and place, reaching transcendence – in short, becoming what Laura Tunbridge called ‘untimely meditations’:³⁴ a poignant example is the *Arietta* of Beethoven’s C minor Piano Sonata, Op. 111, whose long stretches of trilled notes,

fissured, heterogeneous’), and *retrospective* (‘archaic, lucid, sere, and translucent’). See ‘TABLE 2: six metaphorical clusters of late-style characteristics’ (p. 12).

²⁹ See Richard Kramer, ‘Between Cavatina and Overture: Opus 130 and the Voices of Narrative’, in *Beethoven Forum* 1, ed. Lewis Lockwood and James Webster (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1992), pp. 165–189.

³⁰ On the topic of ‘simplicity’ in Schumann’s late piano music see Laura Tunbridge, *Schumann’s Late Style*, chapter 6, ‘In Search of Diotima’.

³¹ For discussion of introspection in Brahms’s music, see Notley, *Lateness and Brahms*, chapter 2, ‘Brahms and the Problem of Late Style’, and chapter 6, ‘Adagios in Brahms’s Chamber Music: Genre Aesthetics and Cultural Critique’.

³² See Elaine Sisman, *Mozart: The ‘Jupiter’ Symphony* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), pp. 68–80.

³³ For a revealing discussion of ‘Mozart’s Bachian Music’, see Matthew Head, ‘Mozart’s Gothic: Feelings for History in Mozart’s Rondo in A minor, K. 511 (1787)’, *Keyboard Perspectives: The Yearbook of the Westfield Center for Historical Keyboard Studies* 4 (2011), pp. 69–114.

³⁴ Tunbridge, *Schumann’s Late Style*, p. 5. For broader discussion of ‘untimeliness’, see Scott Burnham, ‘Late Styles’, in *Rethinking Schumann*, ed. Roe-Min Kok and Laura Tunbridge (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2011), 411–430.

simultaneously triggering rhythmic motion and suspending temporal flow, impart to the work's ending a sense of ethereal timelessness.³⁵

Such features appear too (in a variety of guises) in the works Schubert composed between 1822 and 1828.³⁶ The product of his 'striving after the highest in art',³⁷ this corpus of music, which includes the 'Wanderer' Fantasy, D 760, the 'Unfinished' Symphony, D 759, the three last String Quartets in A minor, D 804, D minor, D 810, and G major, D 887, the Piano Trios in B flat major D 898, and E flat major D 929, together with the String Quintet, D 956, and the final three piano sonatas, D 958–960, forms a constellation around the hallmarks of aesthetic 'lateness'. Above all, what unites these works and distinguishes them from Schubert's earlier compositions is their new level of individuality and expressive intensity: brimming with contradictory elements, they resist expressive synthesis and reside in a 'place at the edge'.³⁸

Christopher Gibbs has argued that Schubert's late style is defined by:

a new seriousness, subjectivity, and rigorous self-examination that go well beyond the pleasure principle of cozy Schubertiades. The integrity he attained suggests that he no longer wrote music solely for the delight of companions, the profit of publishers, or the entertainment of the public. [...] He was now writing essentially for himself – and for the future.³⁹

The origins of this approach can be located in the 'Wanderer' Fantasy, D 760 (1822), a piece that not only redefines the boundaries of the fantasia genre through its complex

³⁵ See Benedict Taylor, 'Time and Transcendence in Beethoven's Late Piano Sonatas', in *The Melody of Time: Music and Temporality in the Romantic Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), chapter 1.

³⁶ In viewing 1822 as the 'threshold' to Schubert's late style, I do not wish to suggest that everything he composed after this date exhibits the same degree of 'lateness'; rather, I am using this year as a pivot point from which to explore the emergence of expressive traits that become increasingly pervasive in the works composed from that time onwards.

³⁷ Quoted from Schubert's letter of 21 February 1828 to Schott, in *A Documentary Biography*, p. 739.

³⁸ Quoted from Byrne Bodley, 'A Place at the Edge'.

³⁹ Christopher Gibbs, *The Life of Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p. 156.

multi-movement structure,⁴⁰ but also explores idiosyncratic expressive territory, especially in the second movement, whose variations (based on ‘Der Wanderer’, D 489) become increasingly dissociated from the poetic ethos of the song source, as if entering into the depths of an internal labyrinth.

Members of Schubert’s circle were receptive to the new gravitas of his late works, notably in connection with *Winterreise*, D 911 (1827).⁴¹ Comparing the latter to the earlier cycle, *Die schöne Müllerin* of 1823, Johann Mayrhofer observed that:

[*Die schöne Müllerin*] opens with a joyous song of roaming, the “Müllerlieder” songs depict love in its awakening, its deceptions and hopes, its delights and sorrows. [...] Not so with *Winterreise*, the very choice of which shows how much more serious the composer became. He had been long and seriously ill, had gone through disheartening experiences, and life for him had shed its rosy colour; winter had come for him.⁴²

Joseph von Spaun penned similar remarks after hearing a performance of *Winterreise* given by Schubert:

For a time Schubert’s mood became more gloomy and he seemed upset. When I asked him what was the matter he merely said to me “Well, you will soon hear it and understand”. One day he said to me, “Come over to Schober’s, and I will sing you a cycle of horrifying [*schauerlicher*] songs. I am anxious to know what you will say about them. They have cost me more effort than any of my other songs”. So, in a voice wrought with emotion, he sang the whole of *Winterreise* through to us. We were utterly dumbfounded by the gloomy mood of these songs, and Schober said that only one of them, “Der Lindenbaum”, had appealed to him. To which Schubert replied, “I like these songs more than all the rest, and you will come to like them too”.⁴³

At the core of *Winterreise* lies a poignant exploration of the dichotomies that define Schubert’s late style: its expressive imagery revolves around the juxtaposition of life

⁴⁰ On the genre of fantasia see *inter alia* Annette Richards, *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), esp. chapter 1; and Barbara Strahan, ‘(De)Constructing Paradigms of Genre: Aesthetics, Identity and Form in Franz Schubert’s Four-Hand Fantasias’ (PhD dissertation, Maynooth University, 2013).

⁴¹ For two recent discussions of *Winterreise* (the former from a Schenkerian perspective, the latter focusing on cultural context), see Lauri Suurpää, *Death in Winterreise: Music-Poetic Associations in Schubert’s Song Cycle* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014); and Ian Bostridge, *Schubert’s Winter Journey: Anatomy of an Obsession* (London: Faber & Faber, 2015).

⁴² Quoted in Otto Erich Deutsch (ed.), *Schubert: Die Erinnerungen seiner Freunde* (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1957, repr. 1983), 20, trans. Rosamond Levy and John Nowell as *Schubert: Memories by His Friends* (London: Adam and Charles Black, 1958), p. 15.

⁴³ Quoted in Deutsch (ed.), *Schubert: Memoirs by his Friends*, pp. 137–138.

and death, hope and despair, without reaching a point of resolution. And true to the paradoxes of late Schubert, the cycle suggests an inextricable connection between the composer's life and art (as both Spaun and Mayrhofer observed) while simultaneously resisting a straightforward biographical reading; the protagonist belongs ultimately to a realm that is divorced from reality. At the end of the cycle, in the spirit of a romantic fragment,⁴⁴ the music resists closure; the Leiermann's uncanny sounds continue to reverberate beyond the boundaries of that which is graspable. As Byrne Bodley noted, 'it is in this tension between what is articulated and what is not articulated, between the articulate and silent gestures of the music, [...] that we grasp the difficulty of what cannot be apprehended'.⁴⁵ Therein lies the essence of late Schubert.

Of the music Schubert composed in his final year, 1828, the Adagio of the String Quintet, D 956, and Andantino of the Piano Sonata in A major, D 959,⁴⁶ represent explicit manifestations of what Edward Said described as the 'prerogative of late style': 'the power to render disenchantment and pleasure without resolving the contradiction between them'.⁴⁷ In the Quintet's Adagio, this takes the form of an abrupt disjuncture between the serene style of the opening material and the nightmarish music of the central section, while the Andantino of D 959 oscillates between eerie lyricism (conjuring echoes of 'Der Leiermann') and the world of distorted fantasia – the latter representing, in Robert Winter's characterization, 'an episode which comes as close to

⁴⁴ For a recent study of *Winterreise* in connection with notions of the 'fragment', see Deborah Stein, 'The End of the Road in Schubert's *Winterreise*: The Contradiction of Coherence and Fragmentation', in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 355–382; for wider reference see John Daverio, *Nineteenth-Century Music and the German Romantic Ideology* (New York: Schirmer, 1993); and Beate Julia Perrey, *Schumann's 'Dichterliebe' and Early Romantic Poetics: Fragmentation of Desire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002).

⁴⁵ Byrne Bodley, 'A Place at the Edge', p. 28.

⁴⁶ Chapter four of this thesis, 'Stylistic Disjuncture and Grotesquerie in Schubert's Last Instrumental Works', offers a contextual reading of these movements.

⁴⁷ Edward Said, *On Late Style: Literature and Music Against the Grain* (London: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2006), p. 148.

a nervous breakdown as anything in Schubert's output'.⁴⁸ Within the central sections of their ternary structures, both movements unleash disturbing music that pushes artistic expression and human subjectivity to unprecedented extremes: in this way, as with *Winterreise* and also the Heine settings in *Schwanengesang*, they encourage us to confront the prerogative of Schubert's late style, to find meaning in its contradictions.

Analytical and Critical Approaches to Schubert

Over the last few decades, propelled by the paradoxes of Schubert's life and art, musicologists have made significant strides towards bringing the composer from the peripheries into a central position in the discipline. This paradigm shift is the result of a collective endeavour on the one hand to dispel the aura of 'Beethoven's shadow' that clouded the general perception of Schubert's music for much of the twentieth century,⁴⁹ and on the other to establish a critical frame of reference for understanding his unique compositional style.⁵⁰ These aims have been pursued with integrity of purpose across

⁴⁸ Robert Winter, 'Schubert' in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, p. 683.

⁴⁹ On the history of this unfortunate trend see Suzannah Clark, 'Rossini and Beethoven in the reception of Schubert', in *The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism*, ed. Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 96–120. Among the studies that have perpetuated the view of Schubert's music as being inferior to that of Beethoven we find Philip Radcliffe's bold assertions that 'Schubert's piano writing, even at its best, is less varied in texture than Beethoven's and he accepted the sonata form with far less intellectual curiosity. [...] His general effects are usually less cumulative than Beethoven's, and it is the individual beauties rather than the whole design that remain in the memory.' See Phillip Radcliffe, 'Piano Music', in *The New Oxford History of Music*, Vol. VIII: The Age of Beethoven, 1790–1830, ed. Gerald Abraham (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982), p. 374. For a more nuanced approach to the Schubert-Beethoven nexus, see John Gingerich, *Schubert's Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014); and Kristina Muxfeldt, *Vanishing Sensibilities: Schubert, Beethoven, Schumann* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).

⁵⁰ The collegial approach to Schubert has been cultivated at conferences devoted to the composer and through a number of volumes. See for example Christopher H. Gibbs (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997); Brian Newbould (ed.), *Schubert the Progressive: History, Performance Practice, Analysis* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2003); Xavier Hascher (ed.), *Le style instrumental de Schubert: Sources, analyse, évolution* (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2007); and Barbara M. Reul and Lorraine Byrne Bodley (eds), *The Unknown Schubert* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2008).

all areas of musicological enquiry: contributions in the fields of archival research and reception studies have flourished alongside continuous waves of analytical, theoretical, and hermeneutic engagement with Schubert's music.⁵¹ In what follows, by way of setting the scene for the ensuing chapters, I review the recent trends in Schubert criticism, with close attention devoted to studies that have focused on the aesthetic and expressive qualities of his late works.⁵²

At the centre of developments in Schubert studies has been the uncovering of a wealth of textual sources and historical data pertaining to the composer's life. In this regard, Schubertians owe a debt of gratitude to the biographical and documentary studies by Otto Erich Deutsch,⁵³ Maurice Brown,⁵⁴ Elizabeth McKay,⁵⁵ Brian Newbould,⁵⁶ Walburga Litschauer,⁵⁷ Till Gerrit Waidelich,⁵⁸ and Christopher Gibbs,⁵⁹

⁵¹ Schubert scholarship shows no signs of abating: some of the work due to appear in the coming years includes a new biography by Lorraine Byrne Bodley, *Franz Schubert: A Musical Wayfarer* (Yale University Press) and *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert*, ed. Joe Davies and James Sobaskie (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, forthcoming February 2019). Bringing together the work of leading scholars from over 7 countries, this book re-evaluates the reception history of Schubert's stage works, offering fresh perspectives on their musical content, as well as demonstrating previously unsuspected locations of dramatic innovation in his Lieder and instrumental music. The inspiration for this volume came from the international conference 'Schubert as Dramatist', which took place under the auspices of the 2014 Oxford Lieder Festival ('The Schubert Project'). I am grateful to Sholto Kynoch for the opportunity to organise the conference.

⁵² The literature review offered here is intended to complement those found in Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton, 'Introduction', *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 1–4; and Lorraine Byrne Bodley and James William Sobaskie, 'Introduction', 'Schubert Familiar and Unfamiliar: Continuing Conversations', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 13/1 (2016), pp. 3–9.

⁵³ Otto Erich Deutsch, *Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964, repr. 1980 and 1996); trans. Eric Blom as *Schubert: A Documentary Biography* (London: J. M. Dent & Sons, 1947); and *The Schubert Reader: A Life of Franz Schubert in Letters and Documents*, trans. Eric Blom (New York: W. W. Norton & Co., 1949).

⁵⁴ Maurice J.E. Brown, *Schubert: A Critical Biography* (London: Macmillan, 1966).

⁵⁵ Elizabeth Norman McKay, *Franz Schubert: A Biography* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996).

⁵⁶ Brian Newbould, *Schubert* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1997).

⁵⁷ Walburga Litschauer (ed.), *Neue Dokumente zum Schubert-Kreis: Aus Briefen und Tagebüchern seiner Freunde* (Vienna: Musikwissenschaftlicher Verlag, 1986).

⁵⁸ Till Gerrit Waidelich (ed.), *Franz Schubert: Dokumente, 1817–1830* Vol. 1: *Texte, Programme, Rezensionen, Anzeigen, Nekrologe, Musikbeilagen und andere gedruckte Quellen* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider Verlag, 1993). See also Ernst Hilmar and Werner Bodendorff, *Franz Schubert: Dokumente 1801–1830* Vol. 1: *Texte, Programme, Rezensionen, Anzeigen, Nekrologe, Musikbeilagen und andere gedruckte Quellen, Addenda und Kommentar* (Tutzing: Veröffentlichungen des IFSI, 2003).

⁵⁹ Christopher H. Gibbs, *The Life of Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).

as well as to Robert Winter's survey of Schubert's life and works in *The New Grove*,⁶⁰ and more generally to the scholarly efforts invested in the *Neue Schubert Ausgabe*.⁶¹ The revised image of Schubert that comes to light in this scholarship has been supplemented by several contextual studies, notably those of Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen,⁶² David Gramit,⁶³ and Scott Messing.⁶⁴ Their writings offer insights into Schubert's cultural milieu and the artistic activities of his circle, while also (particularly in the case of Messing) identifying prominent trends in the composer's reception history.⁶⁵

In song studies, Susan Youens has added further nuance to the evolving image of Schubert's musical and personal outlook. Across the course of numerous monographs, articles, and book chapters,⁶⁶ Youens presents a compelling view that Schubert's songs – characterized by their multiple layers of poetic and musical meaning – represent the fruits of a composer who was deeply invested in the psychological subtleties of the

⁶⁰ Robert Winter et al., 'Schubert, Franz (Peter)', *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd rev. edn (29 vols, London: Macmillan, 2001 and *Grove Music Online*), pp. 655–729.

⁶¹ *Franz Schubert: Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke* [NSA], ed. Walther Dürr, Arnold Feil, Christa Landon et al. (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964–). See also Dürr, Feil, and Landon (eds), *Franz Schubert: Thematisches Verzeichnis seiner Werke in chronologischer Folge von Otto Erich Deutsch, NSA, VIII/4* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1978).

⁶² Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen, *Franz Schubert* (Munich: C.H. Beck, 2011); and Hinrichsen, 'Der weg zur grossen Symphonie', in *Schubert: Perspektiven* 10/1 (2010), pp. 106–112.

⁶³ David Gramit, 'The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert's Circle' (PhD dissertation, Duke University, 1987); and Gramit, "'The Passion for Friendship': Music, Cultivation, and Identity in Schubert's Circle', *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 56–71.

⁶⁴ Scott Messing, *Schubert in the European Imagination*, Eastman Studies in Music (2 vols, Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2006).

⁶⁵ Further insights into Schubert's cultural context have been provided by the following volumes: Ernst Hilmar, *Franz Schubert in seiner Zeit* (Vienna: Hermann Böhlaus Nachf., 1985), trans. Reinhard G. Pauly as *Franz Schubert in his Time* (Portland, Oregon: Amadeus Press, 1988); Raymond Erickson (ed.), *Schubert's Vienna* (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1997); and C. Gibbs and Morten Solvik (eds), *Franz Schubert and his World* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press 2014).

⁶⁶ See for example Susan Youens, *Franz Schubert: Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992); *Schubert's Poets and the Making of Lieder* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996); *Schubert, Müller, and Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997); *Schubert's Late Lieder: Beyond the Song Cycles* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002); and 'In the Beginning: Schubert and Heine', in *Heinrich Heine and the Lied* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 1–88.

human condition. Similarly, studies by Byrne Bodley,⁶⁷ Lisa Feurzeig,⁶⁸ Marjorie Hirsch,⁶⁹ Richard Kramer,⁷⁰ and Lawrence Kramer,⁷¹ together with the work of Graham Johnson⁷² and Ian Bostridge,⁷³ have done much in their various ways to bolster the image of Schubert as an intellectual artist, while also establishing productive dialogues between performance and scholarship.

Just as the literature on Schubert's songs has contributed to an enhanced view of his compositional approach, so too have recent studies in the fields of theory and analysis. Particularly notable here are the numerous analytical investigations of the formal architecture of Schubert's instrumental music that have emerged in recent years: these range from close readings of individual pieces, such as those offered by James Sobaskie⁷⁴ and the recent journal issue featuring essays on the String Quintet, D 956,⁷⁵

⁶⁷ Lorraine Byrne Bodley, *Schubert's Goethe Settings* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2003); Byrne Bodley, 'In Pursuit of a Single Flame? On Schubert's Settings of Goethe's Poems', *Nineteenth Century Music Review* 13/2 (2016), pp.11–33; and Byrne Bodley, 'Challenging the Context: Reception and Transformation in Schubert's "Der Musensohn", D 764, Op. 91, no. 1', in *Rethinking Schubert*, chapter 21.

⁶⁸ Lisa Feurzeig, *Schubert's Lieder and the Philosophy of Early German Romanticism* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014).

⁶⁹ Marjorie Hirsch, 'Schubert's Greek Revival', in *Romantic Lieder and the Search for Lost Paradise* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), chapter 1.

⁷⁰ Richard Kramer, *Distant Cycles: Schubert and the Conceiving of Song* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).

⁷¹ Lawrence Kramer, *Franz Schubert: Sexuality, Subjectivity, Song* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).

⁷² Graham Johnson, *Franz Schubert: The Complete Songs* (3 vols, New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2014). The significance of Johnson's endeavour is highlighted in James William Sobaskie's review in 'Schubert Familiar and Unfamiliar: Continuing Conversations', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 13/1 (2016), pp. 142–154.

⁷³ Ian Bostridge, *Schubert's Winter Journey*. For discussion of Bostridge's approach, see Blake Howe, 'Whose *Winterreise*?', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 13/1 (2016), pp. 113–122.

⁷⁴ James William Sobaskie, 'Tonal Implication and the Gestural Dialectic in Schubert's A Minor String Quartet', in *Schubert the Progressive*, ed. Brian Newbould (Farnham: Ashgate, 2003), pp. 53–79; 'The "Problem" of Schubert's String Quintet', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 2/1 (2005), pp. 57–92; and 'A Balance Struck: Gesture, Form, and Drama in Schubert's E flat Major Piano Trio', in *Le style instrumental de Schubert: sources, analyse, contexte, évolution*, ed. Xavier Hascher (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2007), pp. 115–46.

⁷⁵ See John Martin and Steven Vande Moortele, 'Formal Functions and Retrospective Reinterpretation in the First Movement of Schubert's String Quintet', pp. 130–55; Scott Burnham, 'Thresholds Between, Worlds Apart', pp. 156–67; John Koslovsky, 'Timeless Reflections: Form, Cadence and Tonal Structure in the Scherzo and Finale of Schubert's String Quintet', pp. 168–93; and Julian Horton, 'Stasis and Continuity in Schubert's String Quintet: Responses to Nathan Martin, Steven

to book-length studies that chart the ways in which Schubert broadened the boundaries of sonata form beyond that of his predecessors.⁷⁶

Besides playing a significant role in the development of contemporary *Formenlehre*, where the latest research has focused on ‘form as process’ and the juxtaposition of hypotaxis and parataxis,⁷⁷ Schubert’s music has also encouraged re-appraisals of theoretical approaches to tonality: together with Richard Cohn’s work on ‘hexatonic cycles’,⁷⁸ David Damschroder’s *Harmony in Schubert* and Suzannah Clark’s *Analyzing Schubert* are among the latest studies that have broadened the discourse on Schubertian tonality.⁷⁹

Alongside these theoretical approaches, our understanding of Schubert’s instrumental music has been enriched by the work of Susan Wollenberg.⁸⁰ In her recent

Vande Moortele, Scott Burnham and John Koslovsky’, pp. 194–213, in ‘Special Issue: Schubert’s String Quintet’, ed. William Drabkin, *Music Analysis* 33/2 (2014).

⁷⁶ Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen, *Untersuchungen zur Entwicklung der Sonatenform in der Instrumentalmusik Franz Schuberts* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1994); Hinrichsen, ‘Die Sonatenform im Spätwerk Franz Schuberts’, in *Schubert: Perspektiven* 4 (2004), pp. 16–49; and Xavier Hascher, *Schubert, la forme sonate et son évolution* (Bern: Peter Lang, 1996).

⁷⁷ See Janet Schmalfeldt, *In the Process of Becoming: Analytical and Philosophical Perspectives on Form in Early Nineteenth-Century Music*, Oxford Studies in Music Theory (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), chapters 5 and 6; Julian Horton, ‘The first movement of Schubert’s Piano Sonata D. 959 and the performance of analysis’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, chapter 9; Anne Hyland, ‘The “Tightened Bow”: Analysing the Juxtaposition of Drama and Lyricism in Schubert’s Paratactic Sonata-Form Movements’, in *Irish Musical Analysis: Irish Musical Studies* 11, ed. Julian Horton and Gareth Cox (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2014), pp. 17–40; and Hyland, ‘In Search of Liberated Time, or Schubert’s Quartet in G Major, D. 887: Once More Between Sonata and Variation’, *Music Theory Spectrum* 38/1 (2016), pp. 85–108.

⁷⁸ Richard Cohn, ‘“As Wonderful as Star Clusters”: Instruments for Gazing at Tonality in Schubert’, *19th-Century Music* 22 (1998), pp. 9–40; and Cohn, *Audacious Euphony: Chromaticism and the Triad’s Second Nature* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2012).

⁷⁹ David Damschroder, *Harmony in Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010); and Suzannah Clark, *Analyzing Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011). Fruitful insights into their approaches are offered in Xavier Hascher, review of *Analyzing Schubert*, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 10/1 (2013), pp. 169–173; and Gordon Sly, review of *Harmony in Schubert*, *Music Theory Online* 18/2 (2012).

⁸⁰ See Susan Wollenberg, ‘Schubert and the Dream’, *Studi musicali* 9 (1980), pp. 135–50; ‘Schubert’s Transitions’, in Brian Newbould (ed.), *Schubert Studies* (Farnham: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 16–61; ‘The C major String Quintet D 956: Schubert’s “Dissonance” Quintet?’, *Brille* 28 (2002), pp. 45–55; ‘“Dort, wo du nicht bist, dort ist das Glück”: Reflections on Schubert’s Second Themes’, *Brille* 30 (2003), pp. 91–100; ‘Schubert’s Poetic Transitions’, in *Le style instrumental de Schubert*, pp. 261–77; and ‘From Song to Instrumental Style: Some Schubert Fingerprints’, in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 61–76.

monograph, Wollenberg illuminates the ways in which Schubert took inspiration from his predecessors, particularly Mozart, while simultaneously crafting his own distinct idiom based on such stylistic ‘fingerprints’ as major-minor inflections, poetic transitions, threefold constructions, and violent outbursts.⁸¹ Examining these fingerprints in their myriad guises enables Wollenberg to posit a view of the composer’s instrumental style as one that is shaped above all by the musical and poetic worlds of song.⁸² The following excerpt from the chapter on modal mixture provides revealing insights into her approach:

In two of Schubert’s most experimental chamber works, the String Quartet in G major, D 887, and the String Quintet in C major, D 956, he sets out from the very beginning the essence of his view of major and minor. In both D 887 and D 956, the introductory bars present an intensely compressed version of the “divided character” type. Famously, in D 887-i the duality expressed in the opening of the movement is distilled even further when it is recalled at the end, to the point where major and minor almost coalesce. It’s as if the opening bars put a proposition which is explored in different ways in the course of the movement, including the role reversal at the start of the recapitulation. In both works, the choice of keys for Theme II responds to the major-minor ambivalence presented at the start.⁸³

Embedded within this commentary is the suggestion that Schubert’s chamber works, in a similar manner to his songs, convey ‘psychological dramas’ (notably in terms of the ‘divided character’ trope) at a variety of structural levels.⁸⁴ Throughout her monograph Wollenberg invites the reader to enter the internal worlds of Schubert’s instrumental

⁸¹ Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints: Studies in the Instrumental Works* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011). Wollenberg’s study is underpinned by a revisionist agenda that supplants received ideas about the redundancy of Schubert’s ‘heavenly lengths’ and the ‘looseness’ of his forms with a compelling view that emphasizes the structural integrity of his music: see especially chapter 9 for discussion of these issues.

⁸² Lisa Fuerzeig has offered an instructive gloss on *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, noting that ‘Wollenberg persuasively argues that Schubert’s music takes its essence from the combination of poetic sensibility and rational structure’. See Fuerzeig, review of *Schubert’s Fingerprints: Studies in the Instrumental Works*, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 10/2 (2013), pp. 349–352.

⁸³ Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, pp. 30–31.

⁸⁴ The songs that Wollenberg discusses in connection with the ‘divided character’ archetype include ‘Der Wanderer’ (chapter 4), together with ‘Der Lindenbaum’ and ‘Frühlingstraum’ from *Winterreise*, D 911 (chapters 2 and 6).

works,⁸⁵ demonstrating that their content – intricately conceived and imbued with layers of meaning – is the product of ‘an instrumental poet’.⁸⁶

Equally valuable are Robert Hatten’s semiotic studies of the topical universe of Schubert’s late instrumental works. In particular, Hatten has drawn attention to the interplay of topics and gestures in such works as the G major Piano Sonata, D 894, and the two Piano Sonatas in A minor, D 784 and D 845, highlighting the expressive implications of their topical discourse within the context of the pastoral.⁸⁷ In contrast to much late eighteenth-century music, where dramatic action is conveyed at the surface level through the swift succession of contrasting topics,⁸⁸ Schubert’s treatment of topical material involves a degree of poetic introspection. As Hatten noted, Schubert’s late music ‘turns away from traditional communicative signs to more ineffable symbols of interiority’: ‘it is through these highly configured musical passages that Schubert’s late style touches us most directly and deeply – even as we struggle to explain just how’.⁸⁹ Hatten’s work represents a discerning response to this challenge, providing a model for further study of the topical signs that enrich the late Schubertian scenery.

Beyond the analytical and theoretical areas outlined above, Schubert’s late works have also inspired innovative hermeneutic approaches to broader issues of musical

⁸⁵ The psychological dimension of Schubert’s instrumental music is explored further in Davies and Sobaskie (eds), *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert* (forthcoming). See Laura Tunbridge, ‘Introduction: Internal Dramas’.

⁸⁶ See Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 295.

⁸⁷ Robert Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004).

⁸⁸ Consider the first movement of Mozart’s F major Keyboard Sonata, K 332, the *locus classicus* of eighteenth-century topical discourse: here stylistic references to dance, the stage, the outdoors, and the learned style are juxtaposed in kaleidoscopic fashion, creating the impression of what Wye Allanbrook memorably referred to as ‘a miniature theater of gestures and styles’. See Wye Allanbrook, ‘Two Threads through the Labyrinth: Topic and Process in the First Movements of K. 332 and K. 333’, in *Convention in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Music: Essays in Honor of Leonard G. Ratner*, ed. Wye J. Allanbrook, Janet M. Levy, and William P. Mahrt (Stuyvesant: Pendragon Press, 1992), pp. 125–171, esp. pp. 130–131.

⁸⁹ Robert Hatten, ‘Schubert’s Alchemy: Transformative Surfaces, Transfiguring Depths’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 91–111 (110).

meaning and the representation of subjectivity in nineteenth-century culture. Much of this scholarship bespeaks the ethos of poetic criticism – evocative language and metaphorical imagery are its *modus operandi*.

Of the critical tropes discussed in connection with Schubert’s music, that of landscape has come to represent a prominent *leitmotif* in the literature. Its origins can be traced back to Adorno, who, in his 1928 essay on Schubert, asserted:

When it comes to Schubert’s music we speak of landscape. [...] The ex-centric construction of that landscape, in which every point is equally close to the centre, reveals itself to the wanderer walking round it with no actual progress. [...] Those themes know of no history, but only shifts in perspective: the only way they change is through a change of light.⁹⁰

Taking Adorno’s remarks as a point of departure, several musicologists have drawn on spatial and topographical metaphors as a way of conceptualizing the expansive proportions of Schubert’s music. Scott Burnham, reiterating the essence of Adorno’s views, finds that Schubert ‘gives us time to take in his themes, as if they were works of visual art we could inspect at our leisure, or landscapes through which we could wander’.⁹¹ For Su Yin Mak, ‘Schubert’s paratactic repetitions continually revisit the same subject from different perspectives’, most notably in the E flat major Piano Trio, D 929, and the B flat major Piano Sonata, D 960: such an approach, she argues, imbues Schubert’s music with an inherently lyric sensibility.⁹²

As with the metaphor of landscape, so the tropes of memory and nostalgia have acquired a similarly enduring position in Schubert criticism.⁹³ Behind the discourse in

⁹⁰ Theodor W. Adorno, ‘Schubert (1928)’, trans. Jonathan Dunsby and Beate Perrey, *19th-Century Music* 29/1 (2005), pp. 3–14, here p. 10.

⁹¹ Scott Burnham, ‘The “Heavenly Length” of Schubert’s Music’, *Ideas* 6/1 (1999), <<http://nationalhumanitiescenter.org/ideasv61/burnham.htm>>, accessed 1 October 2014.

⁹² Su Yin Mak, ‘Schubert’s Sonata Forms and the Poetics of the Lyric’, *Journal of Musicology* 23/2 (2006), pp. 263–306, here p. 303. See also Mak, *Schubert’s Lyricism Reconsidered. Structure, Design and Rhetoric* (Saarbrücken: Lambert, 2010).

⁹³ Research in this area was fuelled by the essays of Walter Frisch, John Daverio, John Gingerich, Charles Fisk, and Scott Burnham in the special issue ‘Music and Culture’ of *The Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000).

this area lies the premise that time passes in a unique way in late Schubert: rather than pursuing explicitly teleological trajectories, his music prioritizes digressions, flashbacks, and moments of retrospection. To quote Burnham, ‘because [Schubert’s music] is vivid with inwardly concentrated energy, because its motion through time is not part of some larger agenda (as in more explicitly teleological music), because it concedes nothing to the future [...], the Schubertian surface is instinct with transience’.⁹⁴ Notions of memory have been invoked to account for passages in Schubert’s music that ‘even on their first appearance [...] are imbued with the quality of reminiscence’ – what John Daverio termed the ‘temporality of pastness’⁹⁵ – as well as providing a context in which to understand the ‘modified repetition of ideas in which the [harmonic] backdrop or emotive connotation is changed’ (as in the transformation of the opening theme from minor to major in the first movement of the A minor String Quartet, D 804),⁹⁶ those moments in which time seems to loop back on itself. Further insights can be gleaned from Xavier Hascher’s analysis of the first movement of the Piano Sonata in A major, D 959 – a movement in which ‘temporal depth [is created] by means of distinct tonal layers: as the music moves on, though tentatively, we feel paradoxically taken back’.⁹⁷ Its second theme, in Hascher’s view, is ‘really the metaphor of a theme; it has the contour of one, but its content is replaced by an allusion to something other, to which it relates by analogy’.⁹⁸ In this way, the music, Hascher

⁹⁴ Scott Burnham, ‘Schubert and the Sound of Memory’, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), p. 663.

⁹⁵ John Daverio, ‘“One More Beautiful Memory of Schubert”: Schumann’s Critique of the Impromptus, D. 935’, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 604–18.

⁹⁶ Benedict Taylor, ‘Schubert and the Construction of Memory: The String Quartet in A Minor, D. 804 (“Rosamunde”)', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/1 (2014), p. 64.

⁹⁷ Xavier Hascher, ‘Music as Poetry: An Analysis of the First Movement of Schubert’s Piano Sonata in A Major, D. 959’, in *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert*, ed. Davies and Sobaskie (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, forthcoming 2019), p. 261.

⁹⁸ Hascher, ‘Music as Poetry’, p. 262.

suggests, ‘becomes introspective; it becomes its own focus. The process is deeply and intrinsically poetic’.⁹⁹

Closely associated with representations of memory in Schubert’s music are depictions of ethereal dreamworlds, as noted in Benedict Taylor’s discussion of the A minor String Quartet, D 804, and the G major Piano Sonata, D 894: the beginning of the former work, in Taylor’s words, ‘offers a dreamlike way into experience, the fainter echo of a beautiful world already lost’, while ‘the Arcadian tone’ of the main theme in D 894-i is ‘marked as distanced, past or dreamlike – in other words, not real’.¹⁰⁰ For John Gingerich, the ‘most extreme illustration’ in Schubert’s oeuvre of a ‘utopian’ or ‘static dream tableau’ is found in the opening section of the String Quintet’s slow movement, D 956 – music which projects ‘an air of unreality’, containing the ‘fatal seed of knowledge that such happiness is attainable only in dreams’.¹⁰¹ Hascher has detected similar qualities in the lapidary cello duet in the Quintet’s first movement, suggesting that it represents ‘a paradox, a form of impossibility. It is at once tangible and insubstantial; it hovers in and out of reality, as if gliding through a perspectival space between dreaming and waking’.¹⁰² With this characterization Hascher captures the ethereal quality that suffuses all Schubertian dream imagery.¹⁰³

At the opposite end of the expressive spectrum to those enchanting dreamworlds are manifestations of what Hugh Macdonald described as Schubert’s ‘volcanic

⁹⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰⁰ Taylor, ‘Schubert and the Construction of Memory’, pp. 63 and 60 respectively.

¹⁰¹ John Gingerich, ‘Remembrance and Consciousness in Schubert’s C-Major String Quintet, D. 956’, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), p. 621.

¹⁰² Xavier Hascher, ‘Detours, Wrong Tracks, and Dead Ends: the Wanderer in the Labyrinth of Schubert’s Instrumental Music’, p. 278.

¹⁰³ For wider reference see Brian Black, ‘Remembering a Dream: The Tragedy of Romantic Memory in the Modulatory Processes of Schubert’s Sonata Forms’, *Intersections* 25/1–2 (2005), pp. 202–28.

temper'.¹⁰⁴ What distinguishes Schubertian outbursts is the way in which they break through the surface with force, shattering the music's stability, in a manner that suggests an intrusion from beyond the discourse. Among Macdonald's concluding propositions is the idea that in Schubert's music 'the volcanic temper constantly interrupts the lyrical voice; the lyrical voice has constantly to rescue and repress the volcanic temper'.¹⁰⁵ In other words, despite being disconnected in terms of surface effect, violence and lyricism form an interconnected relationship at a deeper level in the musical fabric, the implications of which are explored further in the present study.

Since Macdonald's discussion of 'volcanism', and in light of Maynard Solomon's discovery that Schubert might have been homosexual,¹⁰⁶ there has been a proliferation of studies devoted to Schubertian 'Otherness'.¹⁰⁷ Deserving of mention here is Susan McClary's discussion of the ways in which the 'Unfinished' Symphony constructs an

¹⁰⁴ Hugh Macdonald, 'Schubert's Volcanic Temper', *The Musical Times* 119 (1978), pp. 949–52. Examples of Schubert's 'volcanic temper' include the early String Quartet in B flat major, D 36, the G major String Quartet, D 887-ii, and the slow movement of the "Great" C major Symphony, D 944, the 'most violent of all passages in Schubert'. For further discussion of the violent aspects of Schubert's music, see Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, chapter 6; and Michael Spitzer, 'Mapping the Human Heart: A Holistic Analysis of Fear in Schubert', *Music Analysis* 29/1–3 (2010), pp. 149–213.

¹⁰⁵ Macdonald, 'Schubert's Volcanic Temper', p. 952.

¹⁰⁶ Maynard Solomon, 'Franz Schubert and the Peacocks of Benvenuto Cellini', *19th-Century Music* 13/3 (1989), pp. 193–206. Solomon's claims have formed the site of much scholarly debate, prompting a particularly hostile reaction from Rita Steblin: 'to put it bluntly, there is no evidence that Schubert or the members of his circle were homosexuals. Solomon has mistranslated several key documents, quoted selected passages out of context, and misrepresented the cultural and artistic context of society in Biedermeier Vienna. It does not speak well of our critical faculties that we are blind to the deficiencies of his argument. Schubert deserves better'. See Steblin, 'The Peacock's Tale: Schubert's Sexuality Reconsidered', in 'Schubert: Music, Sexuality, Culture', *19th-Century Music* 17/1 (1993), pp. 5–33, here p. 27. In viewing Solomon's observations from this perspective, Steblin was quick to dismiss the broader implications of his contribution, specifically the way in which it established a place for discussion of representations of sexuality within Schubert studies – a topic that had not previously received scholarly attention. More sympathetic responses can be found in the essays of James Webster ('Music, Pathology, Sexuality, Beethoven, Schubert', pp. 89–93), Robert Winter ('Whose Schubert?', pp. 94–101), and Susan McClary ('Music and Sexuality: On the Steblin/Solomon Debate', pp. 83–88) also in 'Schubert: Music, Sexuality, Culture', *19th-Century Music*.

¹⁰⁷ Notable examples include Philip Brett, 'Piano Four-Hands: Schubert and the Performance of Gay Male Desire', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 149–76; and Jeffrey Kallberg, 'Sex, Sexuality, and Schubert's Piano Music', in *Historical Musicology: Sources, Methods, Interpretations*, ed. Stephen Crist and Roberta Marvin (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2004), pp. 219–233.

alternative, perhaps queer version of masculinity that deviates from the ‘heroic’, goal-orientated paradigm promulgated by Beethoven’s music.¹⁰⁸ Her argument is grounded in close engagement with the piece’s idiosyncratic tonal procedures, particularly the preponderance of third relations in the slow movement. For McClary, its opening passage ‘becomes a pretext for deflection and exploration’: the music meanders through ‘pleasurable [harmonic] pivots’, avoiding ‘more standard’ ways of establishing a tonal centre, ‘[inviting] us to forgo the security of a centered, stable tonality and, instead, to experience – and even enjoy – a flexible sense of self’.¹⁰⁹ It is through such means, McClary suggests, that the ‘Unfinished’ can be seen as articulating a mode of subjectivity that celebrates ‘difference’.

Another form of Schubertian ‘Otherness’ pertains to the romantic wanderer archetype. Here the critical frames of reference revolve around notions of exile and estrangement, together with perspectival shifts between the inner world of imagination and the external world of harsh reality.¹¹⁰ To connect with Schubert’s wanderers involves stepping into the ‘existential wilderness’;¹¹¹ their psychological journeys, like that of the *Winterreise* protagonist, follow an alienated and alienating pathway. Charles Fisk has offered a particularly thought-provoking exploration of Schubert’s treatment of the wanderer trope in the late piano music, focusing closely on the two sets of Impromptus (D 899 and D 935) and the final three Piano Sonatas (D 958–960).¹¹² These

¹⁰⁸ Susan McClary, ‘Constructions of Subjectivity in Schubert’s Music’, in *Queering the Pitch: The New Gay and Lesbian Musicology*, ed. Philip Brett, Gary Thomas, and Elizabeth Wood (New York and London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 205–33. A contextual study of the ‘heroic’ paradigm is offered by Scott Burnham, *Beethoven Hero* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1995).

¹⁰⁹ McClary, ‘Constructions of Subjectivity’, p. 215.

¹¹⁰ See for example William Kinderman, ‘Wandering Archetypes in Schubert’s Instrumental Music’, *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 208–22; see also Kinderman, ‘Schubert’s Tragic Perspective’, in Walter Frisch (ed.), *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, pp. 65–83.

¹¹¹ I borrow this turn of phrase from Tunbridge, ‘Saving Schubert’, p. 126.

¹¹² Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert’s Impromptus and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001).

‘*Winterreise*-haunted’ pieces, he argues, present metaphorical narratives in which an estranged protagonist gradually regains ‘continuity and integration’, qualities that are absent from the song cycle.¹¹³ In his words, ‘their beginnings often suggest searching or wandering, but ultimately these compositions fulfill their quest and restore to their wanderer a sense of self-possession and belonging’.¹¹⁴ Thus for Fisk the late works form an intertextual network of ‘returning cycles’ – or, in Harald Krebs’s words, ‘an artistic *Wanderschaft* that culminates in a kind of homecoming’.¹¹⁵

As these studies demonstrate, Schubert’s late music, with its remarkably broad spectrum of expressive scenery and psychological nuance, simultaneously resists straightforward analytical systematization and invites multiple readings. Burnham epitomized the elusive nature of the late Schubertian landscape as follows: ‘these are not just spaces, they are subjectivized spaces, imaginary spaces’.¹¹⁶ It is in the spirit of these enquiries that the arguments of the present study are offered.

New Avenues

In this thesis, I explore afresh the strange, disjunctive moments that take centre stage in Schubert’s late instrumental works, situating them within the aesthetic contexts of the gothic, the sublime, and the grotesque. These interconnected categories are explored from both semiotic and hermeneutic perspectives, with attention devoted to their musical ‘signs’ (notably in terms of topical content) as well as their cultural

¹¹³ Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, p. 12.

¹¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 6.

¹¹⁵ Harald Krebs, review of *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert’s Impromptus and Last Sonatas*, *Music Theory Spectrum* 25/2 (2003), pp. 388–400, here p. 388. For an alternative reading devoted to the way in which Schubert renders ‘home’ (here in terms of tonality) ‘unhomely’ (*unheimlich*) in the B flat major Piano Sonata, D 960, see Nicholas Marston, ‘Schubert’s Homecoming’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 125/2 (2000), pp. 248–270.

¹¹⁶ Burnham, ‘The “Heavenly Length” of Schubert’s Music’.

associations.¹¹⁷ Questions under consideration include: what are the aesthetic implications of violent outbursts in Schubert's music? How might we contextualize death imagery, instances of formal dissociation, and uncanny voices from the past? In what ways might moments of extreme stylistic disjuncture be seen to challenge notions of beauty in Schubert's oeuvre?¹¹⁸ And ultimately what impact do these questions have on our understanding of the composer's late style? Collectively the chapters assembled here establish a cross-disciplinary framework for contextualizing Schubertian strangeness in its numerous forms, while more generally contributing to the ongoing collegial endeavour to shed new light on the composer's musical and artistic vision.

Chapter two examines tropes of gothic expression in Schubert's late piano and chamber works, with reference to both musical and literary perspectives. Its focal points range from discussion of architectural discontinuities (as in the opening movement of the G major String Quartet, D 887), through engagement with Schubert's 'antique' music (such as that found in the slow movement of the Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940), to the identification of funereal elements and signs of musical haunting (notably in the Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1). My aim in examining these elements is to carve out critical territory for hearing the 'gothic' as a key component of late Schubert.

Drawing on the writings of Edmund Burke, Immanuel Kant, and Christian Michaelis, chapter three explores the poetics of the Schubertian sublime, with examples

¹¹⁷ For a useful overview of nineteenth-century topical discourse, see Julian Horton, 'Listening to Topics in the Nineteenth Century', in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. Danuta Mirka (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), chapter 25; Kofi Agawu, *Music as Discourse: Semiotic Adventures in Romantic Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), chapter 2; and Janice Dickensheets, 'The Topical Vocabulary of the Nineteenth Century', *Journal of Musicology* 31/2 (2012), pp. 97–137.

¹¹⁸ Here I take the opportunity to offer an alternative view to Arthur Hutchings's pejorative assertion that 'Schubert gives us nothing but beauty'. See A.J.B. Hutchings, *Schubert* (London: J.M. Dent, 1945/repr. 1956), p. 110.

taken from his ‘Unfinished’, D 759, and the ‘Great’ C major Symphony, D 944. Behind the discussion lies a desire not only to establish a contextual backdrop against which to re-evaluate the psychological effects of violent dislocations and structural expansiveness in Schubert’s music,¹¹⁹ but also to open up discussion of the dramaturgical strategies of the composer’s late symphonic style (an area that has tended to attract less scholarly attention than the late chamber and piano music).

Close readings of the stylistic disjuncture embodied in the Adagio of Schubert’s String Quintet, D 956, and the Andantino of the A major Piano Sonata, D 959, form the basis of the fourth chapter. At the heart of the discussion lies the view that these movements can be seen to break out of the boundaries of musical beauty, entering the distorted world of the grotesque – a world in which the fusion of stylistic opposites takes centre stage.¹²⁰ Interpreting Schubert’s late music through the lens of the grotesque enables us to understand its moments of eccentricity as part of a broader aesthetic discourse that dominated the literary and visual imagination in the early decades of the nineteenth century.

In the Epilogue, consideration is given to the implications of the readings offered in the preceding chapters for our understanding of Schubert’s late style and the evolving image of his artistic persona. Ultimately what emerges across the course of the thesis is a view that Schubert’s late instrumental style (in a similar manner to the songs)

¹¹⁹ In so doing, I offer a response to Macdonald’s suggestion that the violent outbursts in Schubert’s music would have been viewed in the nineteenth century ‘not as evidence of dark and threatening forces but as the expression of them, in an artful literary way’. Macdonald, ‘Schubert’s volcanic temper’, p. 951.

¹²⁰ In establishing an intertextual framework for defining Schubertian grotesquerie, reference is made to the writings of Friedrich Schlegel and E.T.A. Hoffmann, as well as to theoretical discussions by Frances Connelly and Geoffrey Harpham, among others. See Frances S. Connelly, *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture: The Image at Play* (Cambridge, 2012); and Geoffrey G. Harpham, *On the Grotesque: Strategies of Contradiction in Art and Literature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982).

exhibits a personalized mode of intellectualism,¹²¹ drawing us into the ‘subjectivized spaces’ of the music and probing the depths of human psychology.

¹²¹ This view is intended to build on the image of Schubert that emerges from the recent scholarship on song outlined on pp. 13–14.

Schubert's Gothic Music

Gothic is to be defined according to the realms of psychological depth from which it is supposed to originate (dream, fantasy) or the psychological responses it is believed to provoke (fear, terror, horror).¹

The gothic dominated the late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century European imagination, in a period that bred a fascination with all things strange and macabre. Key features of gothic expression include the arousal of extreme emotions; excess and destabilization; blurred temporal boundaries (involving the returning past); and an emphasis on the fantastic, the uncanny, and the sublime.²

Schubert displayed an interest in gothic horror throughout his compositional career.³ His early essays in this genre range from ‘Der Leichenfantasie’, D 7, and ‘Der Vaternörderer’, D 10, through ‘Szene aus Faust’, D 126, and ‘Die Nonne’, D 208, to ‘Der Erlkönig’, D 328,⁴ and ‘Gruppe aus dem Tartarus’, D 583.⁵ Among

¹ Chris Baldick and Robert Mighall, ‘Gothic Criticism’, in *A New Companion to the Gothic*, ed. David Punter (West Sussex: Blackwell Publishing, 2012), p. 274.

² For an overview of the gothic, see David Punter, ‘Introductory: dimensions of Gothic’, in *The Literature of Terror: A History of Gothic Fictions from 1765 to the Present Day* (New York: Longman Group, 1980), pp. 1–21; Fred Botting, ‘Introduction: Negative Aesthetics’, in *Gothic* (New York: Routledge, 2014), pp. 1–19; Jerrold E. Hogle, ‘Introduction: the Gothic in Western Culture’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Gothic Fiction*, ed. Hogle (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 1–20; Michael Gamer, ‘Gothic and its Contexts’, in *Romanticism and the Gothic: Genre, Reception, and Canon Formation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), pp. 48–89; William Hughes et al. (eds), *The Encyclopaedia of the Gothic*, 2 vols (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 2015); and Marie Mulvey-Roberts, *The Handbook of the Gothic* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009).

³ See Clive McClelland, ‘Death and the Composer: The Context of Schubert’s Supernatural Lieder’, in *Schubert and the Progressive: History, Performance Practice, Analysis*, ed. Brian Newbould (Farnham: Ashgate, 2003), pp. 21–3; and Marjorie Hirsch, *Schubert’s Dramatic Lieder* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993).

⁴ On the expressive idiom of ‘Erlkönig’ see Christopher Gibbs, “‘Komm geh mit mir’”: Schubert’s Uncanny “Erlkönig”, *19th-Century Music* 19/2 (1995), pp. 115–135.

⁵ See Susan Youens, ‘Reentering Mozart’s Hell: Schubert’s ‘Gruppe aus dem Tartarus, D. 538’, in *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert*, ed. Joe Davies and James Sobaskie (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, forthcoming 2019), pp. 171–204.

Schubert's mature *Schauerballaden* we find such specimens as 'Der Zwerg', D 771 (1822), a song that explores the dark, irrational side of sexual desire and death. Its musical idiom is premised on the language of terror: bare octaves, diminished fifths, augmented fourths, and repeated tremolo patterns all combine to create, in the words of Susan Youens, 'a constant vibratory thrumming of dread'.⁶ As Graham Johnson noted, 'all Schubert's work on gruesome Gothic ballads in his youth finds its final and most refined expression in this subtle apotheosis of the horror genre'.⁷

If song constitutes the most obvious territory for Schubert's engagement with the gothic, it should not surprise us, in light of the widely acknowledged generic crossover in his oeuvre, to find similar topical flavours and aesthetic effects being deployed in his instrumental works – an area of Schubert studies that is ripe for further exploration.⁸ An important contribution to the discourse is Marjorie Hirsch's recent essay on the Andantino from Schubert's A major Piano Sonata, D 959⁹ – a movement which she argues displays a confrontation between lyricism and a gothic fantasy.¹⁰ Hirsch, in her commentary on the movement's disturbing central section,

⁶ Susan Youens, 'Of Dwarves, Perversion, and Patriotism: Schubert's "Der Zwerg", D. 771', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 177–207, here p.202.

⁷ Graham Johnson, *Franz Schubert: The Complete Songs Volume 3* (Yale University Press, 2014), p. 772.

⁸ In recent years there has been a flurry of interest in 'gothic'. See for example Matthew Head, 'Mozart's Gothic: Feelings for History in the Rondo in A minor, K. 511', *Keyboard Perspectives: The Yearbook of the Westfield Center for Historical Keyboard* 4 (USA, 2012), pp. 69–114; Laura Protano-Biggs, 'Bellini's Gothic Voices: Bellini, "Un grido io sento" (Alaide), *La straniera*, Act I', *Cambridge Opera Journal* 28 (2016), pp. 149–54; Isabella van Elfrén, *Gothic Music: The Sounds of the Uncanny* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2012); Melina Esse, 'Donizetti's Gothic Resurrections', *19th-Century Music* 33 (2009), pp. 81–109; Anatole Leikin, 'Chopin and the Gothic', in *Chopin and his World*, ed. Jonathan D. Bellman and Halina Goldberg (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2017), pp. 85–102; and Jessie Fillerup, 'Lucia's Ghosts: Sonic, Gothic and Postmodern', *Cambridge Opera Journal* 28/3 (2016), pp. 313–345.

⁹ For further discussion of Schubert's D 959-ii, see chapter four of this thesis.

¹⁰ Marjorie Hirsch, 'Schubert's reconciliation of classical and gothic influences', in *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 149–170. Hirsch's study appeared in print while research for the present chapter was underway. I am grateful to Professor Hirsch for sharing a pre-publication version of her chapter with me.

situates its topical idiom in a constellation of gothic impulses, tracing parallels with the vocabulary of Schubert's *Schauerballaden* and more broadly with the work of such figures as Henry Fuseli, Francisco Goya, and Ludwig Tieck.

In this chapter, building on Hirsch's study, I demonstrate that, beyond Schubert's D 959 and his *Schauerballaden*, the gothic forms an integral aspect of his late style. Among the gothic tropes examined here are those of excess and transgression, death, musical haunting, and uncanniness – all of which intersect in intriguing ways in Schubert's late instrumental works. Of particular concern in the commentary that follows is the way in which the pieces under consideration transgress tonal and formal boundaries, presenting thematic material that is at once suggestive of the real and the imaginary.

Ghostly Revenants and Strange Doubles

A revenant is a specter, a ghost, a phantom, one who haunts, who returns, who walks again. Such visitants may be ghastly, of course, but they may also be genial, beguiling, seductive; the only things they all have in common are an aura of ambivalence and an attraction to lack. [...] Tropes or spirits of the dormer glass, revenants are peculiar mixtures: both elusive and insistent, misplaced in time and right on time, inevitable creatures of chance.¹¹

At the heart of the gothic lies an emphasis on spectral presences. Echoes, strange sounds, disembodied voices: these all feature prominently in gothic novels, as illustrated in the following excerpt from Horace Walpole's *The Castle of Otranto* (1764):

At that instant the portrait of his grandfather, which hung over the bench where they had been sitting, uttered a deep sigh and heaved its breast. Isabella, whose back was turned to the picture, saw not the motion, nor knew whence the sound came, but started and said, Hark my lord! What sound was that? And at the same time made towards the door. Manfred, distracted between the flight of Isabella, who had now reached the stairs, and his inability to keep his eyes from the picture, which began to move, had however advanced some steps after her, still looking backwards on the portrait, when he saw it

¹¹ Lawrence Kramer 'Ghost Stories', in *Musical Meaning: Toward a Critical History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), p. 203.

quit its panel, and descend on the floor with a grace and melancholy air. Do I dream? cried Manfred returning, or are the devils themselves in a league against me? Speak, infernal spectre!¹²

Later in the scene, while wandering through the ‘secret passage’ in the vaults of the castle, Isabella is taunted by ghostly sighs that suggest both presence and absence:

The lower part of the castle was hollowed into several intricate cloisters; and it was not easy for one under so much anxiety to find the door that opened into the cavern. An awful silence reigned throughout those subterraneous regions, except now and then some blasts of wind that shook the doors she had passd [sic.], and which grating on the rusty hinges were re-echoed through that long labyrinth of darkness. Every murmur struck her with new terror; [...] She trod as softly as impatience would give her leave – yet frequently stopped and listened to hear if she was followed. In one of those moments she thought she heard a sigh. She shuddered, and recoiled a few paces. In a moment she thought she heard the step of some person. Her blood curdled.¹³

Characters in Anne Radcliffe’s novels experience similar supernatural occurrences.

One such example is Vivaldi’s encounters with Nicola in *The Italian* (1797):

The conduct of the mysterious being, who now stood before him [...] passed like a vision over his memory. His mind resembled the glass of a magician, on which the apparitions of long-buried events arise, and as they fleet away, point portentously to shapes half-hid in the duskiess of futurity. An unusual dread seized upon him; and a superstition, such as he had never before admitted in an equal degree, usurped his judgement. He looked up to the shadowy countenance of the stranger; and almost believed he beheld an inhabitant of the world of spirits.¹⁴

In Radcliffe’s *The Mysteries of Udolpho* (1794) both the main characters, Emily and Annette, envision ghostly presences:

On the following morning, as Emily sat in the parlour adjoining the library, reflecting on the scene of the preceding night, Annette rushed wildly into the room, and without speaking, sunk breathless into a chair. It was some time before she could answer the anxious enquiries of Emily, as to the occasion of her emotion, but at length she exclaimed, “I have seen his ghost, madam, I have seen his ghost!”¹⁵

In *Udolpho*, music plays an equally unsettling role in conjuring supernatural

¹² Horace Walpole, *The Castle of Otranto*, Oxford World’s Classics (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982), 26.

¹³ *Ibid.*, pp. 27–28.

¹⁴ Anne Ward Radcliffe, *The Mysteries of Udolpho: And a Sicilian Romance* (London: J. Limbird, 1826), p. 146

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 308.

atmospheres, notably when its physical source is concealed or altogether absent:¹⁶

Who touches that guitar so tastefully? Are there two instruments, or is it an echo I hear? [...] That guitar is often heard at night, when all is still, but nobody knows who touches it; and it is sometimes accompanied by a voice so sweet, and so sad, that one would almost think the woods were haunted. [...] I have never heard any music like it. [...] I have sometimes got up to the window to look if I could see anybody; but [...] all was hushed, and nobody to be seen: and I have listened, and listened, till I have been so timorous that even the trembling of the leaves in the breeze has made me start. They say it often comes to warn people of their death.¹⁷

Common to all the examples presented here is the impression that those strange sounds and spectral emanations enter from beyond the frame of that which is readily graspable, representing sites of literary ‘haunting’;¹⁸ they are at once elusive and insistent, strangely real yet unreal.¹⁹

So too are the intimations of revenants and ghostliness in Schubert’s music. In the realm of Lied, beyond the case of ‘Der Doppelgänger’ from *Schwanengesang*, D 957/13,²⁰ Schubert demonstrated a continued interest in ghostly music: memorable examples include his early ‘Geistertanz’, D 116, the two settings of Schiller’s Thekla ‘Eine Geisterstimme’, D 73 and D 595, the closing lines of ‘Der Wanderer’, D 489, where a ghostly voice pronounces the wanderer’s fate, and his setting of Franz Bruchmann’s ‘Schwestergruß’, D 762, a particularly spine-chilling essay in musical haunting.²¹

¹⁶ See Noelle Chao, ‘Musical Listening in the Mysteries of Udolpho’, in *Words and Notes in the Long Nineteenth Century*, ed. Phyllis Weliver and Katharine Ellis (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2013), pp. 85–102.

¹⁷ Radcliffe, *The Mysteries of Udolpho*, pp. 83–84.

¹⁸ On gothic haunting see Andrew Smith, ‘Hauntings’, in *The Routledge Companion to Gothic*, ed. Catherine Spooner and Emma McEvoy (New York: Routledge, 2007), pp. 147–154.

¹⁹ For further discussion, see Terry Castle, ‘The Spectralization of the Other in the Mysteries of Udolpho’, in *The Female Thermometer: Eighteenth-Century Culture and the Invention of the Uncanny* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), pp. 120–139.

²⁰ See chapter four in this thesis for discussion of ‘Der Doppelgänger’.

²¹ For a revealing discussion of ‘Schwestergruß’, see Richard Kramer, ‘Against the Grain: the Sonata in G (D. 894) and a Hermeneutics of late style’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 117–121. Kramer captures its aesthetic thus (p. 118): ‘Muted grief, this is. An opening *pianissimo*, sustained for thirty-eight bars, recedes to a triple piano for the fourteen bars of an interior strophe in which this spectral vision speaks to the poet in *Geisterhauch* – in ghostly tones’.

Ghostly revenants also form an integral part of Schubert's late instrumental music. Prominent in this regard are those pieces which incorporate variations based on pre-existing song material, such as the 'Wanderer' Fantasy, D 760 (1822), and the 'Death and the Maiden' Quartet, D 810 (1824).²² In the slow movement of the latter work, while the theme – a revenant of the music associated with death in its song source – is initially presented in a whispered chordal texture, the subsequent variations introduce increasing turbulence. The third variation, for example, presents the dactylic pattern in an obsessive homorhythmic manner in all four instrumental parts, emphasized by *sforzando* markings on every downbeat, before profiling volatile exchanges between the cello and first violin in the second half of its binary construction. In so doing, this variation unleashes the disturbing side of the eeriness that suffuses the borrowed theme from the outset.

An equally troubling signifier of musical haunting is the ominous trill that appears in low register in bar 9 of Schubert's last Piano Sonata in B flat, D 960 (1828). 'From wherever the theme may come', Charles Fisk asserts, 'the trill comes from somewhere else';²³ in other readings it has been described as a 'ghostly, distant thunder',²⁴ a 'stranger',²⁵ and a 'cryptic Romantic gesture'.²⁶ Rather than forming

²² Signs of death can be detected throughout all movements of D 810, notably in the *Danse macabre* that forms the finale. See Christoph Wolff, 'Schubert's "Der Tod und das Mädchen": analytical and explanatory notes on the song D 531 and the Quartet D 810', in *Schubert Studies: Problem of Style and Chronology*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), pp. 143–171.

²³ Charles Fisk, 'What Schubert's Last Sonata Might Hold', in *Music and Meaning*, ed. Jenefer Robinson (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1997), p. 179.

²⁴ Donald Francis Tovey, 'Franz Schubert (1797–1828)', in *The Mainstream of Music and Other Essays* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1949), p. 119.

²⁵ Pesic, Peter, 'Schubert's Dream', *19th-Century Music* 23/2 (1999), p. 139.

²⁶ Joseph Kerman, 'A Romantic Detail in Schubert's *Schwanengesang*', in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1986), pp. 48–64, here p. 59.

an obvious connection with the preceding material,²⁷ the trill emerges *ex nihilo* in the manner of a disembodied voice, bringing the music to a standstill then dissipating into silence (Example 2.1). Not confined to the opening bars, its disruptive presence haunts subsequent junctures in the movement, notably the retransitional passage (bars 203–15), where the gesture becomes, as Nicholas Marston has demonstrated, implicated in the process of rendering the tonic unfamiliar.²⁸

Example 2.1 Schubert, Piano Sonata in B flat major, D 960, I, bars 1–9

The image displays a musical score for the first nine bars of Schubert's Piano Sonata in B-flat major, D. 960, I. The tempo is marked 'Molto moderato'. The score is written for piano and includes a trill in the right hand. The first system shows the beginning of the piece with a piano (pp) and legato marking. The second system shows the continuation of the piece, ending with a trill (tr) in the right hand.

In what follows, branching out from these widely recognised examples, I suggest that the hermeneutics of musical haunting can provide a context in which to interpret the intimations of revenants, death, and uncanniness that are discernible within Schubert's C minor Impromptu, D 899/1 (1827).²⁹ Combining the musical with the

²⁷ Suzannah Clark has suggested that, while the trill is disconnected from its surroundings at the surface level, from a technical perspective, the chromatic pitch might be said to 'prepare the later appearance of G flat major and F sharp minor, in the manner of a "promissory note" (Cone) or "Romantic detail" (Kerman)'. See Clark, 'Music Theory and the Musicological Imagination: Perceptions of Schubert's Sonata Form', in *Analyzing Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), p. 147. For more on these concepts, see Edward T. Cone, 'Schubert's Promissory Note: An Exercise in Musical Hermeneutics', in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, pp. 13–30; and Kerman, 'A Romantic Detail', pp. 48–64.

²⁸ Nicholas Marston, 'Schubert's Homecoming', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 125/2 (2000), pp. 248–270.

²⁹ To my knowledge D 899/1 has not previously been read within this hermeneutic context. Existing analyses of the piece have focused on tonal procedures, the wanderer figure, and harmonic structure. See Susan McClary, 'Pitches, Expression, Ideology: An Exercise in Mediation', *Enclitic* 7

literary, my reading attends closely to the topical signs and thematic processes embedded within the piece, while taking inspiration from Andrew Webber's theory of 'double visions' in German literature.³⁰ Of relevance to my investigation is Webber's suggestion that 'the *Doppelgänger* returns compulsively both within its host texts and intertextually from one to the other. Its performances repeat both its host subject and its own previous appearances'.³¹ It is from this perspective that the Schubertian revenants under consideration here are best understood.³²

In contrast to the three other pieces in the D 889 set of impromptus, all of which follow a ternary format,³³ the C minor Impromptu presents a distinct fusion of formal structures.³⁴ Within its five-part framework, ABA'B'A'',³⁵ the piece displays clearly perceptible elements of a sonata-form trajectory, notably in terms of its two contrasting themes, while simultaneously subverting such influences, especially in the recapitulation section, where Theme II undergoes transformation,

(1983), pp. 76–86; repr. in *Reading Music: Selected Essays* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2007), pp. 3–14; Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert's Impromptus and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), chapter 1; and David Damschroder, *Harmony in Schubert* (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 2010), pp. 201–211.

³⁰ Andrew Webber, *The Doppelgänger: Double Visions in German Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996).

³¹ Webber, *The Doppelgänger*, p. 5.

³² My reading aims to broaden the framework for discussing the 'ghostly' in nineteenth-century music. Existing studies include: Lawrence Kramer, 'Ghost Stories: Cultural Memory, Mourning, and the Myth of Originality', in *Musical Meaning*, pp. 258–87; Wayne C. Petty, 'Chopin and the Ghost of Beethoven', *19th-Century Music* 22 (1999), pp. 281–99; and Ewelina Boczkowska, 'Chopin's Ghosts', *19th-Century Music* 35/3 (2012), pp. 204–223.

³³ The E flat Impromptu, D 899/2, stands out among the set for its strange tonal events. While the piece begins effervescently in *moto perpetuo* style in the major mode, digressing through B minor in the 'B' section, in its closing bars the initial mood is forcefully negated by a turn to the tonic minor. In the words of Susan Wollenberg, 'perhaps never before in an episodic movement of this type had the main sections been pitted against each other so audibly and with such force, stretching the limits of the still-evolving piano "miniature" form'. Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, p. 185. For discussion of the narrative implications of the piece's tonal procedures, see Susan McClary, 'The Impromptu that Trod on a Loaf', *Narrative* 5/1 (1997), pp. 20–35.

³⁴ The formal hybridity of D 899/1 has escaped the attention of those who have offered analytical readings of this piece. Fisk for instance reads the piece exclusively in terms of rondo form. See Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, p. 124.

³⁵ Five-part structures are to be found in a number of Schubert's late instrumental works, as in the slow movements of the Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, and the String Quartet in G major, D 887, both discussed in chapter four of this thesis.

returning in the dominant minor.³⁶ Its hybrid nature is reflected also in the relationship between the individual themes, whereby the boundaries between the two become increasingly blurred across the course of the piece. Figure 2.1 provides an overview of the piece's layout.

Figure 2.1 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, overview

Sections	Main Tonal Regions	Topical Features
(exposition)		
Theme I A (1–33)	C minor / relative major	Funeral march <i>Revenant</i>
Transition (34–41)	=> A flat major	
Theme II B (42–82)	A flat major	<i>‘Lied ohne Worte’</i> Evocation of a lost world
Retransition (83–95)	=> C minor	

³⁶ The hybrid structure of Schubert's D 899/1 bears some similarity to that of Schubert's Impromptu in F minor, D 935/1, which similarly presents elements of sonata form within an episodic framework, though here the blurring of formal divisions is spread across three tonal and thematic areas: F minor, A flat major, and A flat minor. On the formal properties of D 935/1 see John Daverio, 'The Gestus of Remembering: Schumann's Critique of Schubert's Impromptus, D. 935', in *Crossing Paths: Schubert, Schumann, and Brahms* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), pp. 42–62, esp. pp. 50–58.

(recapitulation)

Theme I A' (96–124)	C minor	<i>Doppelgänger</i> of original theme
Theme II B' (125–60)	G minor	Song stripped of its earlier expressive qualities
<i>Retransition</i> (160–68)	=> C minor	
Theme I A'' (169–204)	C minor => C major	Funeral procession returns in new guise

The opening theme of D 899/1 shown in Example 2.2 conjures an eerie atmosphere from the outset. The unaccompanied line of the initial four-bar phrase, its confined melodic contours, forming an arc shape around the tonic note in the manner of an elaborated turn figure, and its funereal dotted rhythms:³⁷ these elements suggest a style of music which belongs not primarily to the world of the living, but rather to the undead – bringing to mind those spectral sounds found in the gothic novels mentioned above. That the theme emerges in the shadows of the forcefully struck, indefinitely held double octave unison figure further underlines its curious status,³⁸ preventing it from acquiring a fully tangible presence. Charles Fisk has noted that ‘the abruptness and the gestural isolation of the opening G suggest

³⁷ The piece’s C minor tonality, in conjunction with its topical allusion to a funeral march, is reminiscent of the slow movement of Beethoven’s ‘Eroica’ Symphony, Op. 55. Further examples of funeral marches in Schubert’s late music include his *Trauermarsch* (D 819) and the *Grande Marche Funèbre* (D 859).

³⁸ Cf. the bare octave unisons at the beginning of the slow movement of the G major String Quartet, D 887 (discussed in chapter four), and the final movement of the B flat Piano Sonata, D 960. In both contexts, as with D 899/1, the rhetorical gesture injects drama at the local level, while also representing the locus of subsequent disruptions.

something other than a simple beginning: the G commands attention, like a symbolic call to whose meaning the ensuing melody provides the first clues; it invokes a setting from which that melody is heard as an emanation'.³⁹ Collectively these features create the impression of a musical revenant, a voice from the past haunting the present.⁴⁰

Example 2.2 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 1–17⁴¹

Allegro molto moderato

In the ‘A’ section the main theme appears four times in total, with each occurrence introducing subtle shifts in perspective. When the material is first restated in bar 9, its darkly-hued edges merge with a glimmer of light (implied through the tentative suggestion of the relative major) that assumes only a temporary presence in the discourse: in bar 12 the original minor-mode pitches resurface,

³⁹ Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, p. 25.

⁴⁰ András Schiff’s recording of D 899/1 highlights the spectral qualities of the piece’s opening section: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LL0FaQi8JYE> (accessed on 9 October 2018).

⁴¹ The excerpts from D 899/1 are based on the Bärenreiter Urtext Edition. Copyright (2011) Bärenreiter-Verlag, Kassel.

negating cadential confirmation of the major mode and leading to a perfect authentic cadence in the tonic minor in bar 17.⁴² These blurred tonal boundaries reinforce the impression of a musical subject that hovers between expressive realms.

The eerie style of the music revisits that of the opening movements of Schubert's two Piano Sonatas in A minor, D 784 (1823), and D 845 (1825/26).⁴³ As shown in Example 2.3, the opening phrase of D 784-i, like that of D 899/1, lacks direct presence, its skeletal contours, rising by a fifth then fall back to its starting point, suggesting an echo of an absent voice. From bar 9 onwards, the music's association with the undead is made more explicit by the remnants of a morbid funeral march topic that sound from the depths of the left-hand accompaniment. Similar features are detectable in the first movement of D 845, whose opening phrase can be viewed in gothic fashion as an intertextual rewriting of the main theme of D 784-i: here the rising fifth with which the main theme of the earlier piece begins is embedded within a phrase that initially oscillates around the mediant and supertonic in the form of an eerie embellished figure (see bar 1 of Example 2.4). In both cases, as with D 899/1, the whispered dynamic markings and sparse textures contribute to the sense of ghostly absence conveyed by the music.

⁴² For wider discussion of modal mixture in Schubert's music, see Susan Wollenberg, 'His Favourite Device': Schubert's Major–Minor Nuances', *Schubert's Fingerprints*, pp. 15–46; and Blake Howe, review of Lauri Suurpää, *Death in Winterreise: Musico-Poetic Associations in Schubert's Song Cycle* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014), *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (2017) <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409817000726>.

⁴³ For alternative readings of these pieces, see Robert Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004), pp. 187–200.

Example 2.3 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A minor, D 784, I, bars 1–22⁴⁴

Allegro giusto

pp

9

pp

16

cresc.

f

p

pp

Example 2.4 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A minor, D 845, I, bars 1–10

Moderato

pp

un poco ritard.

mf

a tempo

pp

6

un poco ritard.

mf

a tempo

In the Impromptu, when Theme I returns in the A' section (signalling the start of the recapitulation of the sonata-form trajectory) it undergoes a series of expressive transformations that intensify the impression of a revenant haunting the discourse.

⁴⁴ The excerpts from D 784 and D 845 are based on the G. Henle Urtext Edition. Copyright (1978).

As shown in Example 2.5, at bar 95 the theme resurfaces in a doubly distorted guise,⁴⁵ now adorned with recurrent iterations of the dominant (G) in the bass and a dissonant voice in the inner part of the texture. Leaving a disruptive imprint on the musical surface, the tremolo bass line can be heard as a displacement of the rhetorical gesture with which the piece begins: while in the opening bar it serves to suspend the music's forward momentum, in its later manifestation it is rhythmically fractured (returning in the form of repeated triplets) and surrounded by agitation. From bar 100 onwards, the pattern splits into two strands, the lower of which outlines descending chromatic fourth motifs (falling chromatically from G–D, then C–G) in the style of a distorted lament bass. Here the music not only represents a strange double of its identity in the opening section, but also projects intertextual echoes of the main theme of the *Quartettsatz*, D 703 (cf. Example 2.16), which similarly outlines a lament bass topic in tremolo; it also reconfigures the triplet rhythm found in the opening bars of the 'Death and the Maiden' Quartet in D Minor, D 810 (Example 2.6).

⁴⁵ Disturbed reprises become increasingly pervasive in Schubert's instrumental works from his final year, notably in the slow movements of the String Quintet, D 956, and the A major Piano Sonata, D 959, both of which are discussed in chapter four of this thesis.

Example 2.5 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 95–119

[Allegro molto moderato]

95 *p* *pp*

99 *cresc.* *f* *cresc.* *ff*

103 *pp*

107 *cresc.* *f* *cresc.* *ff*

111 *ff*

115

119

Example 2.6 Schubert, ‘Death and the Maiden’ Quartet, I, bars 1–6

Within this haunted space, *ombra* characteristics take centre stage.⁴⁶ A glance at Example 2.5 reveals a fusion of the main ingredients of this topical reference: angular melodic lines involving pervasive use of dissonance and chromaticism are coupled with disjunct bass movement, repeated pedal points, and tremolo figurations – elements that bespeak the language of horror. Parallels can be drawn here with the expressive worlds of Schubert’s *Schauerballaden*, especially ‘Gruppe aus dem Tartarus’, D 583, whose invocation of *ombra* music and ominous chromatic passages portray a vivid depiction, in Marjorie Hirsch’s words, of the ‘torments suffered by damned souls in hell’.⁴⁷ Also lurking in the shadows are echoes of the obsessive accompaniment and pounding rhythms of ‘Der Zwerg’, D 771. A further intertextual reference is suggested through the theme’s newly added inner RH voice

⁴⁶ Cf. the stylistic idiom of the Finale of Schubert’s Octet, D 803, which profiles, in John Gingerich’s words, ‘a full-fledged operatic *ombra* scene, of an eerie, gothic cast, replete with continuous tremolo in the strings’. See John Gingerich, ‘The *Ombra* Scene and its Return’, in *Schubert’s Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), p. 165. See also Amanda Lalonde, ‘Flowers over the Abyss: A Musical Uncanny in Nineteenth-Century Criticism’, *19th-Century Music* 41/2 (2017), pp. 109–118. For wider discussion of *ombra* music, see Birgitte Moyer, ‘Ombra and Fantasia in Late Eighteenth-Century Theory and Practice’, in *Convention in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Music: Essays in Honor of Leonard G. Ratner*, ed. Wye J. Allanbrook, Janet M. Levy, and William P. Mahrt (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1992), pp. 283–306; and Clive McClelland, ‘Ombra After Mozart’, in *Ombra: Supernatural Music in the Eighteenth Century* (UK: Lexington Books, 2013), pp. 215–225.

⁴⁷ Marjorie Hirsch, ‘Schubert’s reconciliation of gothic and classical influences’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, p. 159.

whose A flat clashes with the G in the bass, first as a significant presence in bar 96, then subsequently via a troubling embellishment, recalling the music that accompanies the boy's terrified cries in 'Erlkönig', D 328.⁴⁸ These allusions to the vocabulary of Schubert's *Schauerballaden* infuse the piece with the generic hybridity that defines gothic expression.

Across the course of the Impromptu's A' section the music becomes increasingly destructive, notably in bars 111–119. Here the ghostly right-hand theme is displaced by thickly gripped chords in high register, which, in conjunction with the repeated triplets in the left-hand accompaniment, create an atmosphere of impending dread. The disturbing qualities that have been latent in the theme from the outset are now unleashed in a visceral manner – a transformation that provides a powerful contrast to its earlier appearances. The way in which the funeral march has been twisted into something disturbing suggests a move towards the decontextualization of this topical frame of reference. Its usual expressive associations are inverted, with order and regularity giving way to the impression of disorder and irregularity.

Because of the displacement the thematic material undergoes, the A' section invites interpretation not purely in terms of a 'standard' recapitulation, but rather as an instance of an uncanny return: the music is simultaneously familiar (from a thematic perspective) and unfamiliar (owing to its expressive reconfiguration). The effect conveyed here foreshadows Freud's formulation of uncanniness as 'that class of the frightening which leads back to what is known of old and long familiar: it arises when something familiar undergoes repression, and returns in a strangely

⁴⁸ I am grateful to Susan Wollenberg for drawing my attention to this intertextual association.

unfamiliar guise'.⁴⁹ 'An uncanny effect', Freud wrote, 'is often and easily produced when the distinction between imagination and reality is effaced, as when something that we have hitherto regarded as imaginary appears before us in reality'.⁵⁰ This process can be detected across the constituent sections of D 899/1: the opening theme is presented initially in a spectral guise, then suppressed by a contrasting theme (discussed below), returning subsequently in a defamiliarized context. Terry Castle's observation that the uncanny is connected to 'the morbid, the excessive, [and] the strange' is apposite here.⁵¹ In Schubert's construction of the uncanny return, the music's association with death becomes ever more prominent, its ghostly utterances inducing a feeling of horror.

Just as the main theme undergoes uncanny transformations across its constituent sections, so too does the contrasting secondary theme. In its original manifestation, shown in Example 2.7, the material displaces the character of the funereal music with a topical reference to a 'Lied ohne Worte'.⁵² Its profile is comprised of an

⁴⁹ Sigmund Freud, 'The 'Uncanny'', in *An Infantile Neurosis and Other Works*, ed. James Strachey, *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud* (London: Hogarth, 1955), vol. 17 (1917–1919), p. 220. For broader discussion of uncanny effects in Schubert's music, see Gibbs, "'Komm, geh' mit mir'", pp. 115–35; Nicholas Marston, 'Schubert's Homecoming', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 125/2 (2000), pp. 248–70; David Schwarz, 'Music and the Gaze: Schubert's "Der Doppelgänger" and "Ihr Bild"', in *Listening Subjects: Music, Psychoanalysis, Culture* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1997), pp. 64–86; and Michael L. Klein, 'Bloom, Freud, and Riffaterre: Influence and Intertext as Signs of the Uncanny', in *Intertextuality in Western Art Music* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2004), pp. 77–107. What emerges from these studies is a view that the musical uncanny is simultaneously disorientating, horrifying, eerie, eccentric, mechanical, otherworldly, strangely new yet also familiar.

⁵⁰ Freud, 'The Uncanny', p. 244. In Freud's view, E. T. A. Hoffmann, who drew heavily on the traditions of fantasy and gothic horror, was the first and 'unrivalled master' of the uncanny – the 'writer who succeeded in producing uncanny effects better than anyone else', most notably in his novel 'Der Sandman' (discussed later in the chapter), which incorporates estrangement, automata, and conflicts between hallucinations and reality.

⁵¹ Terry Castle, *The Female Thermometer*, p. 6. Castle notes (p. 7) that 'the Freudian uncanny is itself a sort of phantom, looming up out of darkness: an archaic fantasy or fear, long ago exiled to the unconscious, that nonetheless "returns to view" – intrudes on ordinary life – but in a form so distorted and disguised by repression that we fail to recognize its psychological source'.

⁵² The reference to song is used here to denote, in Christopher Gibbs's basic formulation, an 'approach to melody, phrasing, and figuration, rather than the real transferral of a musical line originally bound to a specific literary text'. Christopher Gibbs, 'Beyond song: instrumental transformations and adaptations of the Lied from Schubert to Mahler', in *The Cambridge Companion*

intricately layered texture – a characteristic Schubertian figuration⁵³ – with each part injecting a distinctive element into the musical frame: the right hand presents a cantabile melody at the top of the texture, while the left hand provides the harmonic backbone in the form of *moto perpetuo* arpeggiated figurations together with an inner countermelody that mirrors the contours of the theme.

While it is clear that the new theme introduces a change in stylistic register, we might pause to reflect further on what this transformation could represent in the context of the reading offered here.⁵⁴ On the one hand, the material can be viewed in terms of the contrasting episodes customarily inserted within funeral marches, as in the two most famous examples, the slow movement of Beethoven's 'Eroica' Symphony, Op. 55, and the third movement of Chopin's B flat minor Piano Sonata, Op. 35.⁵⁵ Yet in Schubert's piece there appears to be more at stake. As Charles Fisk observed:

The music digresses through a kind of echo into a contrasting episode in Ab major ... but only with such contrasts of rhythm, texture, harmony, and phrase structure as to embody an escape into a different order of experience from the opening theme. This music evokes a dream, or perhaps only the memory of a time when dreaming was still possible, in relation to the opening's bleak reality.⁵⁶

to the Lied, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), p. 224. A parallel can be drawn with the textural idiom of Schubert's Impromptu in G flat Major, D 899/3. On the latter work see James William Sobaskie, 'Schubert's Self-Elegies', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 5/2 (2008), pp. 71–105.

⁵³ Other memorable examples include the opening movement of the A Minor ('Rosamunde') Quartet, D 804, and the slow movement of the String Quintet in C Major, D 956. For informative commentary on the former movement see John Gingerich, *Schubert's Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), pp. 111–121. On the textural framework of the Quintet's slow movement see chapter 4 in this thesis.

⁵⁴ Although from a topical perspective the secondary theme is set apart from the opening theme, closer examination reveals that the material exhibits motivic and rhythmic integration with its surroundings. That the dotted rhythms are carried forward, together with hints of the minor mode (see for example bar 48), serves to blur the boundaries between their respective expressive worlds.

⁵⁵ See Lawrence Kramer, 'Chopin at the Funeral: Episodes in the History of Modern Death', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 54/1 (2001), pp. 97–125.

⁵⁶ Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, p. 27.

The A flat major music, when seen as withdrawing from the present, conjures the world of memories, as if posing the question ‘Schöne Welt, wo bist du?’, in a manner that recalls the ethos of ‘Die Götter Griechenlands’ (D 677) to which those words belong.⁵⁷ As in that Lied, so with the secondary theme of the Impromptu, the ‘beautiful world’ is evoked as a distant object.

The sense of distance is created on the one hand through the theme’s placement in the submediant⁵⁸ – a tonal region which, as Susan McClary observed, ‘radiates escape or nostalgia for a lost arcadia’⁵⁹ – and on the other hand through the music’s veiled appearance, prefiguring the character of the A flat theme in the F minor Impromptu, D 935/1.⁶⁰ While at times there is a liberating quality to the theme in D 899/1, notably when the melody reaches beyond the repeated dominant pitches to the submediant, in other places it is rendered increasingly elusive, as when it enters the upper registers in bars 55–59 (Example 2.8). In its higher registral guise the music (infused with echoes of the piano accompaniment of ‘Die Krähe’ from

⁵⁷ On the expressive qualities of Schubert’s setting of ‘Die Götter Griechenlands’ see Su Yin Mak, ‘Schubert as Schiller’s Sentimental Poet’, *Eighteenth-Century Music* 4/2 (2007), pp. 251–263. ‘Schubert’s cantabile themes signal the lyric’, she argues, ‘not only because they are sentimental and beautiful, but also because they are so often deliberately set apart from the hypotactic norms of the Classical sonata style’. Mak, ‘Schubert’s Sonata Forms and the Poetics of the Lyric’, *Journal of Musicology* 23/2 (2006), p. 294.

⁵⁸ The way in which the submediant is approached affirms the sense of withdrawal from the present (see bars 34–41 of Example 2.7): A flat major is intimated first in a quasi-deceptive cadence (bar 34), pulled back to the tonic minor in the following bars (playing out the tonal ambivalence foreshadowed in the primary theme in relation to the relative major), then confirmed via a Neapolitan inflection leading to the perfect authentic cadence in A flat in bar 41. It is significant that the Neapolitan (as in the *Quartettsatz*, D 703) frames the key that unlocks the desired modulation and releases the music from its tonic, acting as iv of vi. For revealing commentary on the expressive implications of Schubert’s transitional strategies, see Susan Wollenberg, ‘Schubert’s Transitions’, in *Schubert Studies*, ed. Brian Newbould (Farnham: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 16–61; and Wollenberg, ‘Poetic Transitions’, in *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, pp. 47–97.

⁵⁹ Susan McClary, *Conventional Wisdom: The Content of Musical Form* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, California: University of California Press, 2000), p. 123.

⁶⁰ On the expressive idiom of the A flat theme in D 935/1 see John Daverio, *Crossing Paths*, pp. 60–75.

Winterreise, D 911/15) evokes the sounds of a sinister musical box, blurring the boundaries between the lyrical and the mechanical, the natural and the artificial.

Example 2.7 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 33–51

[Allegro molto moderato]

33 *fz* *fz* *P* *pp*

40 *P*

44 *pp* *mf*

48 *decreasc* *pp*

Example 2.8 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 55–60

[Allegro molto moderato]

55

59 *pp* *mf*

When the secondary theme returns in the B' section – now in the dominant (G) minor – it is no longer set apart from its surroundings, but drawn into the expressive web of the funereal theme. In contrast to its previous appearance in the submediant major, the music unfolds in a perturbed manner, with the bass line's nervous offbeat utterances betraying the influence of the repeated pedal point in the A' section (see Example 2.9). Its earlier expressive connotations are further undermined from bar 138 onwards when the theme loses its lyrical character and appears terrifyingly in octaves in the left hand, surrounded by disjunctive and dissonant chordal fragments in the right hand and elements of 'antique' style (notably in terms of the sequential bassline and use of suspensions) – the past intruding on the present (Example 2.10).

What can be identified here is a further instance of an uncanny return: the 'song without words' undergoes a process of expressive defamiliarization and returns in a context that is haunted by the ghostly tones of the main theme. Emily Dolan's suggestion that 'if we think of Schubert's lyricism through the lens of the uncanny, then the violent outbursts reflect the pain and recoil inherent in the unsettling presence of song that does not belong' is particularly pertinent here.⁶¹ The way in which Theme II returns in this unsettled context reaffirms that its earlier incarnation was but a fleeting vision. Lyrical repose ultimately has no lasting status in the piece.

⁶¹ Emily Dolan, 'Mozart, song, and the pre-uncanny', in *Mozart Studies 2*, ed. Simon Keefe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), p. 248.

Example 2.9 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 124–129

[Allegro molto moderato]

124 *pp*

127

Example 2.10 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 138–143

[Allegro molto moderato]

138 *f*

141

While much of the piece revolves around ghostly presences and strange doubles, its final section introduces a revelatory perspective. In the closing bars of the piece – which have the character of a poetic postlude – the main theme moves beyond its earlier appearances, merging with its original octave signal, and now passed between the hands in a dialogic manner (Example 2.11). Yet even here an element of ambivalence remains: the fluctuations between the tonic minor and parallel major, with the latter gaining acceptance only moments before the end, undermine a sense

of affirmative reconciliation and impart an air of equivocation to the ending.⁶² In this way, the music closes in a space poised at the boundaries of presence and absence, life and death, its haunting sounds resonating into the distance through the echoing chain of cadences.⁶³

Example 2.11 Schubert, Impromptu in C minor, D 899/1, bars 193–204

⁶² The technique employed here of moving between minor and major is borrowed from the realm of song: a poignant example is ‘Tränenregen’ from *Die schöne Müllerin*, D 795/10.

⁶³ An alternative reading of the coda has been offered by Fisk: ‘even here, at the end of the impromptu, the major never regains a complete phrase of its own. Instead, it emerges these last times from the minor, like the image of a freedom or fulfilment never achieved, or of a love that can still be born only of pain’. Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, p. 133.

*Like all ghosts, [the Doppelgänger] is at once an historical figure, representing past times, and a profoundly anti-historical phenomenon, resisting temporal change by stepping out of time and then stepping back in as a revenant.*⁶⁴

Stylistic parallels can be drawn between the C minor Impromptu and the slow movement of Schubert's Piano Trio in E flat, D 929 (1827). Their intertextual associations range from tonal features (most obviously sharing their tonic key of C minor), through topical vocabulary (drawing on funereal references), to broader structural elements (both being underpinned by a five-part episodic framework which incorporates aspects of a sonata-form trajectory).

As with the Impromptu, so the opening section of the Trio's slow movement conveys a haunting ambience. Its main theme – in Lawrence Kramer's words, a 'pre-incarnate revenant from the outset'⁶⁵ – hovers uneasily within a restricted melodic compass, lingering initially around tonic and dominant pitches, while the processional style of the piano accompaniment generates morbid inevitability.⁶⁶ The music's associations with death and loss are further emphasized by the allusion to motivic elements from the Swedish folksong 'Se solen junker', most notably the

⁶⁴ Webber, *The Doppelgänger*, p. 10.

⁶⁵ Kramer, *Franz Schubert: Sexuality, Subjectivity, Song* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998), p. 159.

⁶⁶ Of relevance here is Benedict Taylor's observation that 'Schubert's trudging figures give the sense of an unrelenting movement towards a preordained goal, inevitable and implacable – eliding physical motion with a fatalistic temporal sense'. Taylor, 'Schubert and the Construction of Memory: The String Quartet in A Minor, D. 804 ("Rosamunde")', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/1 (2014), pp. 74–75. The music's processional qualities are foregrounded to chilling effect by the Beaux Arts Trio: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dAv2ipq4VzE> (accessed on 9 October 2018).

falling octave leaps (which in the song are set to the words ‘Farewell, Farewell’).⁶⁷ Example 2.12 illustrates the theme’s initial presentation.

Example 2.12 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, II, bars 1–21⁶⁸

Andante con moto

At bar 41, following a restatement of the opening theme in the violin part, the music dissolves into a contrasting episode in E flat major (see Example 2.13). Here the processional style gives way to a *moto perpetuo* song-like accompaniment and a lyrical theme in the violin part, whose contours echo the downward swoops of the

⁶⁷ Christopher Gibbs has suggested that the Trio’s slow movement might be read as Schubert’s memorial to Beethoven, noting that ‘the prominent “farewell” motive reveals a further part of Schubert’s encrypted message to celebrate the memory of a great man’. See Christopher Gibbs, ‘Schubert’s Tombeau de Beethoven: Decrypting the Piano Trio in E-flat Major, Op. 100’, in *Franz Schubert and His World*, ed. Gibbs and Morten Solvik (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2014), pp. 241–299.

⁶⁸ The excerpts from D 929 are based on the Bärenreiter Urtext Edition. Copyright (2012) Bärenreiter-Verlag, Kassel.

opening theme. If the ‘B’ section initially projects, in the words of James Sobaskie, the ‘quality of an optimistic air’,⁶⁹ such an impression is undermined by events that follow later in the section. As shown in Example 2.14, from bar 67 onwards, the lyrical theme is made to sound unfamiliar, appearing as angular fragments passed between the violin and piano parts. The surge of rhythmic activity (conveyed through the sextuplet patterns in the right hand of the piano part), the digressive harmonic trajectory (foregrounding diminished sevenths in a fantastical style), and the sudden twists and turns: these elements overthrow the balance of the music, giving voice to disequilibrium. Strangely, after displacing the lyrical theme, and with a bar’s silence intervening, the outburst disintegrates into *pianissimo* harp-like spread chords in the piano part and ghostly trilled notes in the registral depths of the cello part.⁷⁰ Crossing over into the territory of the ‘A’ section, this mysterious retransition imparts in retrospect to what was initially an optimistic theme the quality of an absent voice, in a comparable manner to the treatment of Theme II in D 899/1.

Example 2.13 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, II, bars 41–44

The musical score for Example 2.13 consists of three staves: Violin I, Piano, and Violin II. The key signature is E-flat major (three flats) and the time signature is 3/4. The tempo is marked "[Andante con moto]". The score begins at bar 41. The Violin I part starts with a dynamic marking of *pp* and features a melodic line with some slurs. The Piano part starts with a dynamic marking of *pp* and features a complex rhythmic pattern of sextuplets in the right hand. The Violin II part starts with a dynamic marking of *ppp* and features a melodic line with some slurs. The score ends at bar 44.

⁶⁹ James Sobaskie, ‘A Balance Struck: Gesture, Form, and Drama in Schubert’s E-flat Major Piano Trio’, in *Le style instrumental de Schubert: Sources, analyse, évolution*, ed. Xavier Hascher (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2007), p. 124.

⁷⁰ The trills have a similarly disorientating effect to the trill that disrupts the flow of the opening theme in D 960, first movement.

Example 2.14 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, II, bars 67–84

[Andante con moto]

67

73

78

The process of expressive defamiliarization is not exclusive to the ‘B’ material of D 929-ii; the opening theme similarly undergoes transformation of this kind in the A’ section. From bar 105 onwards the music’s tonal trajectory is derailed,

passing through such distant regions as F sharp minor (bar 110) and B minor (bar 115); and the processional accompaniment is developed into a destabilizing tremolando figuration in the piano part, while the string parts unleash an outpouring of agitated passagework and harsh sonorities. These elements render the theme familiar yet unfamiliar – suggesting an intertextual affiliation with the uncanny return of the funereal theme in the A' section of D 899/1.

Behind the discussion here has been the idea that Schubertian revenants return in unexpected places, their haunting presence resonating beyond the context in which they first appear. The Trio's finale offers an even more explicit manifestation of such an approach. Here the slow movement's main theme returns twice in curious locations, first at bar 279 in the tonal context of B minor (see Example 2.15), then subsequently at bar 795 (moments before the end of the work), now in E flat minor.⁷¹ No longer underpinned by the processional accompaniment, the theme resurfaces in the midst of a texture based on pizzicato chordal interjections in the violin part and an etude-like figuration in the piano part. In both cases, the dislocated return of the thematic material not only generates the psychological disorientation characteristic of the uncanny,⁷² but also suggests an obsessive fixation on a lost object. Its presence extends beyond its original context to that of the whole piece.

⁷¹ The reappearances of the slow movement's theme in the finale prompted evocative commentary from Gottfried Wilhelm Fink in his review of the piece for the *Allgemeine musikalische Zeitung*: 'in a wondrously moving way, the lamenting Romance [*klagende Romanze*] of the second movement often enters into the wild bustle of pain and pleasure, and now and then we perceive the various voices of remembrance, whose echo is quickly drowned out by the restlessness of the present which, with its veiling mist, spreads over the otherwise amiable morning of the future. One sees that this work presents us with a very remarkable picture of the soul'. Quoted in Gibbs, 'Schubert's Tombeau de Beethoven', pp. 241–42. For detailed discussion of the 'cuts' that were made to the finale of D 929, see Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, pp. 245–59.

⁷² My reading differs in orientation to that posited by Lawrence Kramer. He argues (but does not offer supporting evidence for the view) that the second occurrence provides 'resolution and closure'. Kramer, *Sexuality, Subjectivity, Song*, p. 157.

Example 2.15 Schubert, Piano Trio in E flat major, D 929, IV, bars 273–286

273 [Allegro moderato]

pp *pizz.* *pp*

277

pp

282

tr

Exploring Schubert's C minor Impromptu and the slow movement of his E flat Trio from a comparative perspective raises questions about the broader hermeneutic implications of their intertextual connections. Beyond their points of topical overlap, these pieces can be viewed as speaking to one another – and indeed about each other – through their joint participation in the poetics of death music.⁷³ Their intimations of uncanniness, their ghostly presences, and their resistance to closure are elements that reveal a mode of subjectivity which above all bears the imprint of ambivalence. In the end, we are left to find meaning in the elusive fusion of presence and absence that lingers in the music. Therein lies the essence of Schubertian haunting.

Excess and Transgression

Alongside its emphasis on strange doubles and spectral presences, other tropes of the gothic include those of excess and transgression. We might recall here Goethe's reaction to the gothic design of Strasbourg Cathedral:

The first time I went to the [Strasbourg] Minster, my head was full of the common notions of good taste. From hearsay I respected the harmony of mass, the purity of forms, and I was the sworn enemy of the confused caprices of Gothic ornament. [...] Under the term Gothic, like the article in a dictionary, I threw together all the synonymous misunderstandings, such as undefined, disorganized, unnatural, patched-together, tacked-on. No less foolish than the people who call the whole of the foreign world barbaric, for me everything was Gothic that did not fit into my system, from the lathe-turned gaudy dolls and paintings with which our *bourgeois gentilshommes* decorate their homes to the sober remains of early German architecture, on which, on the pretext of one or two daring curlicues, I joined in the general chorus: "Quite smothered with ornament!" And so I shuddered as I went, as if at the prospect of some misshapen, curly-bristled monster. How surprised I was when I was confronted by it! The impression which filled my soul was whole and large, and of a sort that (since it

⁷³ The reading offered here illustrates a further dimension to Schubert's musical depictions of the undead beyond those explored in recent studies. See for example Lorraine Byrne Bodley, 'A Place at the Edge: Reflections on Schubert's Late Style', *Oxford German Studies* 44/1 (2015), pp. 18–29; John Gingerich, 'Songs of death and the chamber music of 1828', in *Schubert's Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), pp. 85–105; and James Sobaskie, 'Schubert's Self-Elegies', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 5/2 (2008), pp. 71–105.

was composed of a thousand harmonizing details) I could relish and enjoy, but by no means identify and explain.⁷⁴

With this reappraisal, Goethe helped usher in a new appreciation of gothic designs; those traits of ornate intricacy and formal excess that had once been understood as ‘undefined’ and ‘disorganized’ were reconfigured as sources of aesthetic value.

Recent studies of the gothic have paid close attention to its transgressive nature. Isabella van Elferen has posited a convincing view that the ‘work of Gothic is enabled by the crossing of boundaries, the exploration of limits. Gothic is located in a perpetual and self-perpetuating in-between. It inhabits a radicalized liminality characterized by the destabilizing force of pervasive ambivalence’.⁷⁵ Fred Botting defines the gothic as ‘the writing of excess’. ‘Gothic texts’, he argues, ‘operate ambivalently’: ‘the dynamic inter-relation of limit and transgression, prohibition and desire, suggests that limits, boundaries, and foundations are neither natural nor fixed’.⁷⁶ In Elizabeth Napier’s theory, the gothic is distinguished by its conflation of contrasting structural modes: ‘with its characteristic pattern of alternating static [...] passages with scenes of often hectic action’, she writes, ‘[the gothic] seems to demand an activity of consolidating on the part of its readership that its own design subverts. The result is fundamentally unstable, both in theory and in practice’.⁷⁷

Boundary crossing and the subversion of architectural designs are processes that can be found in numerous guises in Schubert’s late instrumental music. A formative example in this regard is the *Quartettsatz*, D 703 (1820), whose structural

⁷⁴ Johann Wolfgang von Goethe, ‘On German Architecture’, in *Goethe on Art*, ed. and trans. John Gage (London: Scholar Press, 1980), pp. 106–107. For further discussion of Goethe’s account of the gothic, see Matthew Head, ‘Mozart’s Gothic’, pp. 69–114.

⁷⁵ Isabella van Elferen, *Gothic Music: The Sounds of the Uncanny* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2012), p. 18.

⁷⁶ Botting, *Gothic*, p. 9.

⁷⁷ Elizabeth R. Napier, *The Failure of Gothic: Problems of Disjunction in an Eighteenth-Century Literary Form* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987), p. 44.

irregularities have attracted a range of analytical interpretations,⁷⁸ with Brian Black noting that it constitutes ‘one of Schubert’s most unusual sonata forms’.⁷⁹ For Barbara Barry, the movement represents an ‘essay in deconstruction’: ‘its subversive dialectics reference the fundamental choreography of sonata form [...] while, at the same time, undermining their premises of order’.⁸⁰ Despite some jarring analytical observations, such as the identification of a recapitulation starting in bar 257,⁸¹ Barry’s analysis makes important efforts towards capturing the transgressive nature of the music.

While elements of a sonata-form template can be detected within the framework of D 703, involving three thematic and tonal areas (C minor, A flat major, and G major), notions of formal proportion are constantly called into question; what prevails at the surface level is the impression of discontinuity and irregularity. Part of this stems from the displaced recapitulation of Theme I, where it returns in the form of a coda (bar 305) rather than at the onset of the recapitulation.⁸² The tonal trajectory also contains exploratory elements, ranging from the disruptive use of Neapolitan inflections (discussed below) to extended passages in remote regions,

⁷⁸ See for example Su Yin Mak, ‘Et in Arcadia Ego: The Elegiac Structure of Schubert’s *Quartettsatz* in C Minor (D. 703)’, in *The Unknown Schubert*, ed. Barbara Reul and Lorraine Byrne Bodley (Farnham: Ashgate, 2008), pp. 145–153; Hali Fieldman, ‘Schubert’s *Quartettsatz* and Sonata Form’s new way’, *Journal of Musicological Research* 12/1–2 (2002), pp. 99–146; and Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, pp. 36–40, 56–57, and 207–208.

⁷⁹ Brian Black, ‘Remembering a Dream: The Tragedy of Romantic Memory in the Modulatory Processes of Schubert’s Sonata Forms’, *Intersections* 25/1–2 (2005), p. 217.

⁸⁰ Barbara Barry, ‘Schubert’s *Quartettsatz*: a case study in confrontation’, *The Musical Times* 155 (2014), p. 33.

⁸¹ Barry, ‘Schubert’s *Quartettsatz*’, pp. 38–39.

⁸² For commentary on the tonal implications of the movement’s ending, see Fieldman, ‘Schubert’s *Quartettsatz*’, pp. 140–141. Fieldman notes that ‘the compositional value in this concluding section may lie in the imbalance itself; in our discomfort with it, we must again take conscious account of the particular forces at work in the movement and the peculiarities of their evolution. [...] Ultimately the sense that prevails is of c minor as irrevocably altered by the events of the piece, far different upon our return to it than it was to begin’.

notably Bb flat major at the start of the recapitulation.⁸³ Figure 2.2 tabulates an interpretation of the movement's layout.

Figure 2.2 Schubert, *Quartettsatz* in C minor, D 703, I, overview

Exposition (bars 1–140)	Development (bars 141–182)	Recapitulation (bars 195–304)
Theme I in C minor (bars 1–12)	False retransition prepares g minor (bars 183–194)	Theme II in B flat / E flat major (bars 195–228)
Transition I (bars 13–26)		Transition II E min => C major (bars 229–254)
Theme II in A flat major (bars 27–60)		Theme III in C major (bars 255–304)
Transition II A flat major => G major (bars 61–92)		Coda (bars 305–315) Theme I in C minor
Theme III in G major (bars 91–140)		

Viewing D 703-i through the lens of the gothic not only provides a context in which to appreciate the movement's formal hybridity, but also offers a fresh angle from which to view its expressive content, especially that of its opening theme (Example 2.16). The music conveys instability from the outset, implied through the descending tetrachord that weaves its way through the texture in a tremolo figuration, undermining the movement's tonal centre while simultaneously delineating it with its progression from C to G.⁸⁴ This pattern, initially oscillating

⁸³ While on the surface B flat major sounds remote in the context of the preceding tonal trajectory, at a deeper structural level B flat can be read as a core component of the descending tetrachord, C, B flat, A flat, G, that spans the entire movement. See David Beach, 'Harmony and Voice-Leading in Schubert's Music', *Journal of Music Theory* 38 (1994), pp. 13–17.

⁸⁴ Su Yin Mak has suggested that the tetrachord functions 'both as a motivic resource and at the background level of musical structure'. Its presence can be traced at a number of levels across the course of the movement, particularly in the context of Theme II, where it resurfaces in a varied topical guise in A flat major. See Su Yin Mak, *Schubert's Lyricism Reconsidered: Structure, Design and Rhetoric* (Saarbrücken: LAP Lambert Academic Publishing, 2010), pp. 102–104. For broader commentary on the history of the chromatic fourth, see Peter Williams, *The Chromatic Fourth During Four Centuries of Music* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997).

around the tonic and leading note, then winding chromatically to the lower dominant, possesses the character of a gothic curlicue (as in Goethe's description of Strasbourg cathedral), leaving a distinctly archaic imprint on the musical surface.

Example 2.16 Schubert, *Quartettsatz* in C minor, D 703, I, bars 1–10

The image displays a musical score for Schubert's Quartet in C minor, first movement, bars 1-10. The score is written for four staves: Violin I, Violin II, Cello, and Bass. The tempo is marked 'Allegro assai'. The key signature is C minor (three flats) and the time signature is 6/8. The score is divided into three systems. The first system (bars 1-3) shows the Violin I part with a *pp* dynamic. The second system (bars 4-6) shows the Violin I and II parts with *cresc.* markings, and the Cello and Bass parts with *pp* and *cresc.* markings. The third system (bars 7-10) shows the Violin I and II parts with *f* dynamics, and the Cello and Bass parts with *f* and *cresc.* markings. The score concludes with a *ffz* dynamic in the Violin I and Cello parts, and a *fp* dynamic in the Violin II part.

The movement's sudden outbursts and moments of disequilibrium can also be understood as belonging to the world of gothic expression. One notable example is

the forceful Neapolitan intrusion which breaks through the surface in bar 9,⁸⁵ silencing the preceding exploration of the curlicue figure.⁸⁶ Another instance of tonal and stylistic imbalance can be found in the second transitional passage (an excerpt of which is illustrated in Example 2.17): here the lyrical secondary theme is displaced by the return of the repeated tremolo figure (now surrounded by intense rhythmic agitation and fantastical scalar passages in the first violin),⁸⁷ and its major key denied by the resolution into A flat minor at bar 61. In this passage, as well as in its equivalent in the recapitulation (bars 231–256), the boundaries between the discrete sections of the music are breached in a manner suggestive of the expressive ambivalence that defines the gothic.

Example 2.17 Schubert, *Quartettsatz* in C minor, D 703, I, bars 61–65

The musical score for Example 2.17 shows Schubert's Quartet in C minor, D 703, I, bars 61–65. The score is in 6/8 time and C minor. It features four staves: Violin I, Violin II, Viola, and Cello/Double Bass. A large slur covers the first violin part from bar 61 to 65. Dynamics include fortissimo (fz), piano (p), and crescendo (cresc.).

⁸⁵ As the movement unfolds, the Neapolitan, initially representing an intrusion from elsewhere, becomes deeply embedded in the proceedings, playing a key role (as in the C minor Impromptu, D 899/1) in unlocking the modulation to the submediant for Theme II.

⁸⁶ The Alban Berg Quartet captures the explosive quality of bar 9: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kExE2br0jM> (accessed on 9 October 2018).

⁸⁷ Despite being connected at a motivic level, notably in terms of the reconfigured appearance of the tetrachord, the secondary theme of D 703, is set apart from its expressive surroundings; the modulation to A flat major, as with Theme II in D 899/1, suggests an escape to an alternative realm. For further discussion of the relationship between surface features and background structure in D 703, see Mak, *Schubert's Lyricism Reconsidered*, pp. 105–107.

The gothic tropes that can be detected in D 703 are taken to further extremes in the first movement of Schubert's G major String Quartet, D 887, composed in 1826.

Anne Hyland has offered revealing insights into the movement's formal structure:

Its amalgamation of variation techniques and sonata form is exceptional, even among Schubert's sonatas: not only does the first group present a series of variations (*Veränderungen*) and the second group a theme and variation with intervening episodic material – thus, displaying two distinctive variation conventions – but the variation impulse permeates the entire movement more subtly. Virtually every section of this movement is subject to variation on some level: the moment of recapitulation is a clear example. [...] Moreover, the familiar signposts of sonata form (cadences, thematic recall, tonal polarity) are either absent or undermined by the resultant ambiguity that permeates the form. Understood in this way, the extent of the amalgamation of sonata and variation impulses in the movement goes far beyond simple hybridization: indeed, it is conceivable that variation rather than the sonata informs the compositional process and dictates formal syntax. At the very least, these features complicate the notion of sonata as the host form and variation as the *corpus alienum*.⁸⁸

It is within these transgressive structural boundaries that the music's affinity with the gothic comes to light. Just as gothic designs contain overlapping formal segments, so the first movement of Schubert's Quartet inverts the relationship between the central and the marginal through its fusion of formal influences.

A similar blurring of boundaries characterizes the movement's tonal landscape, with its tonic major and parallel minor coalescing in hybrid fashion at the main structural junctures. From the outset, the boundaries between the two keys are not entirely fixed (Example 2.18): when the opening bars expand from a soft homophonic utterance in the tonic major to a peremptory eruption in the parallel minor, the identity of the former key merges uneasily with that of the latter.

⁸⁸ Anne Hyland, 'In Search of Liberated Time, or Schubert's Quartet in G Major, D. 887: Once More Between Sonata and Variation', *Music Theory Spectrum* 38/1 (2016), p. 89. For wider reference see Carl Dahlhaus, 'Sonata Form in Schubert: The First Movement of the G-Major String Quartet, Op. 161 (D. 887)', in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch and trans. Thilo Reinhard (Lincoln, NB: University of Nebraska Press, 1986), pp. 1–12; and Scott Burnham, 'Landscape as Music, Landscape as Truth: Schubert and the Burden of Repetition', *19th-Century Music* 29 (2005), pp. 31–41.

Example 2.18 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, I, bars 1–24

Allegro molto moderato

The musical score is presented in three systems. The first system (bars 1-8) features a dynamic progression from *p* to *ff* with a *cresc.* marking. The second system (bars 9-16) shows a dynamic shift to *pp* with a *decresc.* marking. The third system (bars 17-24) shows a return to *p* dynamics. The score includes various musical notations such as slurs, accents, and dynamic markings.

Not an isolated instance, the opening gesture of tonal destabilization runs through the movement in the manner of a *leitmotif*,⁸⁹ its implications seen nowhere more explicitly than in the recapitulation. At bar 278 (Example 2.19) the opening gesture returns in a reconfigured guise, with the tonic minor giving way to the parallel major, the dynamic level no longer erupting into fortissimo, but moving from *pianissimo* to

⁸⁹ On thematic and rhetorical gestures, see Robert Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures*, p. 177, here defined thus: ‘thematic gestures are those that play a significant role in the drama of a work, as subjects for musical discourse’.

piano.⁹⁰ Neither major nor minor dominates; instead there is a strange sense of blurred boundaries between the two modes.

Example 2.19 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, I, bars 278–282

The musical score for Example 2.19 shows four staves of music. The top staff (Violin I) begins with a rest, followed by a pizzicato note in bar 278, and then arco notes in bars 279 and 280. The second staff (Violin II) has arco notes throughout. The third staff (Viola) also has arco notes. The bottom staff (Cello/Double Bass) has a (pizz.) note in bar 278 and arco notes in bars 279 and 280. Dynamics range from *p* to *pp*. The tempo is *Allegro molto moderato*.

Equally ambivalent are the movement’s closing bars (Example 2.20). Here the opening gesture undergoes further displacement, resurfacing in the form of two abrupt shifts from minor to major tonic chords. In light of the tonal fluctuation that pervades the movement, the final cadence in G major acquires an aura of artificiality, drawing attention to the self-conscious nature of its withheld tierce de Picardie. In gothic fashion, the music’s tonal palette acquires the character of being ‘in-between’; its meaning resides not only in the material sounds, but also in the gaps,

⁹⁰ The tonal and thematic processes of D 887-i have figured prominently in the discourse on Schubertian memory. Walter Frisch, for example, has noted that ‘the transformation of the first theme is so far-reaching that it is insufficient to speak of a “modified” recapitulation (as one might of the rest of the recapitulation, beginning after the fermata in m. 291, where the changes are more ornamental). [...] The theme is being remembered in an idealized fashion. It is as if, not wishing or being able to recapture the rage that characterized the theme at the beginning, the “rememberer” has resorted to a kind of nostalgia, an act of memory that alters the theme’. See Walter Frisch, “‘You Must Remember This’: Memory and Structure in Schubert’s String Quartet in G Major, D. 887”, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 582–603, here p. 588. See also Benedict Taylor, ‘Schubert and the Construction of Memory: The String Quartet in A Minor, D. 804 (“Rosamunde”)’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/1 (2014), pp. 63–65.

in those sudden shifts from major to minor.

Example 2.20 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, I, bars 437–444

The musical score consists of two systems. The first system covers bars 437 to 440. It begins with a tempo marking of [Allegro molto moderato]. The first staff (Violin I) starts with a *mf* dynamic and a half note G. The second staff (Violin II) has a *mf* dynamic and a half note G. The third staff (Viola) has a *mf* dynamic and a half note G. The fourth staff (Cello/Double Bass) has a *mf* dynamic and a half note G. The score then moves to a *ffz* dynamic for the next two bars. The second system covers bars 441 to 444. It begins with a *ffz* dynamic and a half note G. The first staff (Violin I) has a *ffz* dynamic and a half note G. The second staff (Violin II) has a *ffz* dynamic and a half note G. The third staff (Viola) has a *ffz* dynamic and a half note G. The fourth staff (Cello/Double Bass) has a *ffz* dynamic and a half note G. The key signature changes from G major to G minor at bar 441.

Another way in which the movement evokes the gothic is through its distorted topical language and numerous textural permutations, the latter creating the impression of an idiom that bristles with ornate detail. One such example can be seen in the thematic material that enters in *medias res* at bar 15: here a variant of the thematic fragment from bar 3 returns to form the first theme proper above a texture based on repeated tremolos,⁹¹ a classic signifier of destabilization in Schubert's

⁹¹ Susan Wollenberg has traced the numerous variations of this thematic fragment throughout the movement, highlighting its role as both a surface gesture and a motivic component that is deeply embedded in the movement's textural fabric. See Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, pp. 235–240.

music (as in the opening of D 703). Scott Burnham has suggested that the motif in the first violin represents a ‘distinctive voice: small, intimate, vulnerable, as though newborn – yet carrying the imperious dotted rhythms just heard into its dawning reality’.⁹² I would suggest that, in this guise, the theme can be heard not so much as a new beginning, but rather as a quivering echo of the preceding material.

What distinguishes the theme’s topical profile is its antique flavour, implied through the allusion to the language of the French overture,⁹³ though its usual ceremonial associations are absent, replaced instead by a sense of angst. The reference to a lament bass topos in the cello part further underlines the antique nature of the music, suggesting a rewriting of the opening part of Schubert’s D 703,⁹⁴ while the repeated tremolo figure in the lower parts generates sonic and textural excess.

Techniques of destabilization and interruption also loom large in the treatment of Theme II. Because of the way in which the music stops abruptly with a forceful F sharp major chord in bar 63, when the new theme enters in the key of D major the following bar it is made to sound tonally remote, marked as unstable from its first harmony. In terms of the theme’s compositional design, its fixation on the pitches G and F sharp creates an element of circularity, as if the music is constantly looping back on itself. In the first variation, the music’s obsessional character is intensified through the nervously repeated triplets in the first violin’s countertheme – a textural

⁹² Scott Burnham, ‘Beethoven, Schubert, and the Movement of Phenomena’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, p. 41.

⁹³ Walter Frisch notes this topical reference but does not discuss the implications of its distorted appearance. See Frisch, ‘Memory and Structure in Schubert’s String Quartet in G Major, D. 887’, p. 582.

⁹⁴ As in D 703-i, the descending tetrachord functions as the rhetorical and structural basis of D 887-i. For discussion of the latter, see Mak, *Schubert’s Lyricism Reconsidered*, pp. 113–126. Picking up on further allusions to the past, Wollenberg detects in this movement the influence of the ‘North German “empfindsam” style’: ‘the dotted-rhythm figures and long appoggiaturas of the violin 1 line (growing from the introductory bars) that Schubert places over his chromatic fourth bass [...] recall C.P.E. Bach’s thematic vocabulary’. Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 236.

variation that destabilizes the surface and hints at the nature of the subsequent episode.⁹⁵ Entering abruptly, the first episodic interpolation (bars 90–110) reconfigures both the dotted rhythmic profile of Theme I and the triplets from the preceding variation into a hectic outburst that distorts the identity of Theme II. The way in which the music becomes increasingly disruptive in this passage recalls the variation processes of the slow movement of Schubert's 'Death and the Maiden Quartet', D 810, whereby the theme follows a trajectory that moves from stability to obsessive instability, especially in variation 3. Such transformations bring to mind the crossing of temporal and stylistic boundaries that is intrinsic to gothic expression.

Interpreting the first movements of Schubert's D 887 and D 703 through the lens of the gothic not only provides a springboard for contextualizing their shared compositional elements (notably textural excess and the distortion of archaic topical zones), but also enables us to situate their expressive effects within a broader aesthetic framework. In these instances of the Schubertian gothic, we find evidence of the composer cultivating new ways of drawing attention to the hybrid, intricately conceived nature of his musical surfaces, a process that is developed further in the music discussed in the section that follows.

Hearing Fantasy

Closely connected to the gothic tropes discussed in the previous sections is the theme of fantasy. Here emphasis is placed on perspectival shifts between the realistic and the fictional, the animate and the inanimate, such as those memorably depicted in the tales and novellas of E.T.A. Hoffmann. At the core of Hoffmann's depictions of

⁹⁵ Similar instances of disequilibrium can be found within the 'B' sections in the slow movement of D 887, discussed in chapter 4 of this thesis.

fantasy are strange objects (*The Golden Pot*, 1814), distorted fairy tales (*The Nutcracker and the Mouse King*, 1816), and automata (*Die Automate*, 1814, and *Der Sandman*, 1816) – objects which conjure a fantastical dimension through their curious ontological status.⁹⁶

In musical discourse, the genre of fantasia has long been the predominant locale in which all manner of strange contrasts and formal discontinuities are profiled, as noted in the following extracts from the writings of Johann Mattheson and Heinrich Christoph Koch:

For the style [of the fantasy] is altogether the most free and unconstrained manner of composing, singing and playing, that one could even imagine; for one comes first upon this idea, then upon that idea, and one is bound neither by words nor melody (although by harmony). [...] Here can be engendered all kinds of otherwise unaccustomed passages, obscure ornaments, and ingenious turns and embellishments, without any real observation of meter and tonality, [...] without proper primary and secondary ideas, without introducing theme and subject – first rushing then hesitating, first with one voice then with many, then even for a short time according to meter, then [without] measured sounds – but not without intent to please, to overcome, and to transport into a state of wonderment. These are the essential features of the fantasy.⁹⁷

In music the word Fantasy means [...] an extempore piece which is bound neither by a particular tempo nor by a particular metre in its sections; neither by a regular ordering [of its ideas], nor by a considered realisation; neither by a particular form, nor a strictly maintained character. Rather it is one in which the composer arranges the images of his imagination without an evident plan, or with a certain level of freedom, and thus sometimes in connected, at other times loosely ordered phrases, and sometimes with particular broken chords.⁹⁸

C.P.E. Bach, the fantasist *par excellence*, offered similar remarks in his *Versuch über die wahre Art das Clavier zu spielen* (1753). ‘A fantasia’, he wrote, ‘consists of varied harmonic progressions which can be exposed in all manner of figuration

⁹⁶ On Hoffmann’s literary style see Birgit Röder, *A Study of the Major Novellas of E.T.A. Hoffmann* (Woodbridge: Camden House, 2003); Andrew J. Webber, ‘Hoffmann’s Chronic Dualisms’, in *The Doppelgänger: Double Visions in German Literature* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996), pp. 113–194; and John MacAuslan, *Schumann’s Music and E.T.A. Hoffmann’s Fiction* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016).

⁹⁷ Johann Mattheson (1739) quoted in Bellamy Hosler, *Changing Aesthetic Views of Instrumental Music in 18th-Century Germany* (Michigan: UMI Research Press, 1981), p. 27.

⁹⁸ Heinrich Christoph Koch, quoted in Timothy Jones, *Beethoven: the Moonlight and Other Sonatas, Op. 27 and Op. 31* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999), p. 57.

and motives’:⁹⁹ ‘it is especially in fantasias [...] that the keyboardist more than any other executant can practice the declamatory style, and move audaciously from one affect to another’.¹⁰⁰

Across the course of the eighteenth century, there was a gradual move away from the ‘unconstrained’ style of fantasy described by Mattheson to an approach that foregrounded surface-level contrast within a framework premised on latent formal cohesion. As Annette Richards has noted, ‘composed fantasias, especially those of C.P.E. Bach, may in fact be highly crafted with a carefully planned underlying logic – and yet such music threatens a drastic subversion of notions of progress and return through various means, including digression, incongruous local effects, [and] surprising moments’.¹⁰¹ One such example is Bach’s Fantasia in B flat major, H 289, which, as Richards observed, ‘paradigmatically exploits the freedom of the genre, with its hesitations and licence, and its manipulation of formal convention, while being [...] constructed around the tonal architecture and patterns of thematic return of sonata form’.¹⁰² Such an approach is evident also in Mozart’s fantasias, especially K 475 in C minor, where a series of contrasting episodes is presented within a tightly unified structure framed by statements of the work’s main theme.¹⁰³

⁹⁹ C. P. E. Bach, *Essay on the True Art of Playing Keyboard Instruments*, ed. and trans. William J. Mitchell (New York: Norton, 1949), pp. 430.

¹⁰⁰ C. P. E. Bach, *Essay*, pp. 152–53.

¹⁰¹ Annette Richards, *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), pp. 17–18. Richards has interpreted the fantasias (and fantastical style more broadly) of C.P.E. Bach, Mozart, Haydn, and Beethoven within the context of the picturesque – a category that, in her words, ‘allows for a re-evaluation of the disordered and (apparently) irrational and offers a new way of looking at – and listening to – the complexities of the fantastical in late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century music’ (p. 7). For further discussion of the genre of fantasia see Peter Schleuning, *Die freie Fantasie: ein Beitrag zur Erforschung der klassischen Klaviermusik* (Göppingen: Kümmerle, 1973); and Matthew Head, ‘Fantasy in the Instrumental Music of C. P. E. Bach’ (PhD dissertation, Yale University, 1995).

¹⁰² Richards, *The Free Fantasia*, p. 20.

¹⁰³ On K 475 see William Kinderman, *Mozart’s Piano Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006), pp. 57–60.

The fusion of fantasy and sonata principles reached its heyday in the early decades of the nineteenth century, most notably in Beethoven's Op. 27 Piano Sonatas *quasi una fantasia* – pieces in which, to borrow Timothy Jones's summary, 'the dialectic between the expressive immediacy of fantasy style and the structural coherence of sonata style reached an unprecedented level of synthesis'.¹⁰⁴ Jeffrey Perrey has detected similar strategies in Schubert's music:

The tension between *Das Wandern* and *Die Reise* – between fantasia and sonata form – lies at the heart of Schubert's music. Taken together, the two modes of travel present a paradox central to Schubert's sensibility: without distance, there can be no return. Expression of this paradox becomes virtually a constructive principle of Schubert's music, particularly in those works that straddle the genres of Lied and instrumental music.¹⁰⁵

These traits, while apparent in much of Schubert's late instrumental music,¹⁰⁶ are especially prominent in his fantasias. In the 'Wanderer' Fantasy, D 760, as well as the Fantasie for Piano and Violin, D 934, and the F minor Piano Duet Fantasy, D 940, Schubert reconfigures the genre's boundaries beyond that of single-movement pieces to multi-movement works which incorporate elements of sonata form, together with numerous tonal and thematic interrelationships.¹⁰⁷

Besides these formal developments, Schubert also expanded the expressive parameters of the fantasy genre, notably in D 940, which brings together the whole gamut of gothic tropes discussed throughout this chapter:¹⁰⁸ strange contrasts,

¹⁰⁴ Timothy Jones, *Beethoven: the Moonlight and Other Sonatas*, p. 61. A concise overview of fantasy and sonata characteristics is provided on p. 58.

¹⁰⁵ Jeffrey Perrey, 'The Wanderer's Many Returns: Schubert's Variations Reconsidered', *Journal of Musicology* 19/2 (2002), p. 375.

¹⁰⁶ One memorable example is the G major Piano Sonata, D 894, which was first published by Tobias Haslinger under the title 'Fantasie oder Sonate'. See Richard Kramer, 'Against the grain: the Sonata in G (D. 894) and a hermeneutics of late style', in *Schubert's Late Music*, p.114, note 7.

¹⁰⁷ For further discussion of the formal aspects of Schubert's fantasias, see Patrick McCreless, 'A Candidate for the Canon? A New Look at Schubert's Fantasie in C major for Violin and Piano', *19th-Century Music* 20 (1997), pp. 205–230; and Su Yin Mak, 'Formal Ambiguity and Generic Reinterpretation in the Late Instrumental Music', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 282–306.

¹⁰⁸ For contrasting readings of D 940, see Philip Brett, 'Piano Four-Hands: Schubert and the Performance of Gay Male Desire', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 149–76; Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, pp. 19–23; Nicholas Rast, 'Une déclaration d'amour en code? La Fantaisie

evocations of the past, disjointedness and disequilibrium are all elements that can be detected across the course of the piece. Figure 2.3 provides an overview of its layout.

Figure 2.3 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, overview

Section	Tonality	Topical Features
1. Allegro molto moderato		
	Theme Ia F minor	Processional style
	Theme II A flat major (bars 23–37)	
	Theme Ia F major (bars 38–47)	Aria
	Theme Ib F minor (bars 48–71)	March topos (evoking a funereal style)
	Theme Ia D flat minor (bars 66–73)	
	Theme Ib A minor (bars 74–90)	
	Theme Ia F minor (bars 91–101)	
	Theme Ib F major	<i>Religioso</i> style (hymn-like texture)
2. Largo		
A (bars 121–133)	F sharp minor	Distorted French overture topic
B (bars 133–148)	F sharp major	Lyrical duet, furnished with operatic embellishments
A' (bars 149–163)	F sharp minor	Return of the 'A' material
3. [Scherzo] Allegro vivace		
A (bars 164–272)	F sharp minor	<i>Dance</i>
B [Trio] (bars 272–312)	D major	Musical-box topic / <i>automaton</i>

en *fa* mineur D940 de Schubert et la comtesse Caroline Esterházy', *Cahiers Franz Schubert* 13 (1998); and Robert Samuels, 'Schubert's Instrumental Voice: Vocality in Melodic Construction in the Late Works', in *On Voice*, ed. Walter Bernhart and Lawrence Kramer (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2014), pp. 161–178.

A' (bars 312–435)

F sharp minor

4. Tempo I

Theme Ia
(bars 438–474)

F minor => F major

Return of processional style

Central section
(bars 474–552)

Fugue (based on Theme Ib of 1.)

Coda
(bars 555–569)

F minor

Return of opening theme/*religioso*
cadence

The main theme of the Fantasy (Example 2.21) is suffused with an aura of gothic gloom. Its frequent sighing figures and fixation on the pitches C and F, in conjunction with the processional accompaniment in the secondo part, create an eerie atmosphere that parallels that of the opening portions of the C minor Impromptu and the E flat Trio's slow movement.

Example 2.21 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, I, bars 1–8¹⁰⁹

Allegro molto moderato

Primo

Secondo *p*

5

¹⁰⁹ The excerpts from D 940 are based on the G. Henle Urtext Edition Copyright (1976).

At bar 37, when the theme is presented in the parallel major, overstepping its initially restricted melodic compass and opening out into the style of bel canto aria,¹¹⁰ there is a suggestion of an alternative reality, but one that is ultimately marked as transient. In bar 48, without transitional preparation, the tonic minor is harshly reinstated and the lyrical material is displaced by a distorted march-like theme in the secondo part, together with forceful chordal textures and disruptive passagework in the primo part (Example 2.22). William Kinderman has interpreted the rhythmic profile of this theme – which is ‘utterly opposed to the opening theme in affective character’ – as a ‘related but more energetic form’ of the dactylic pattern associated with death in the song ‘Der Tod und das Mädchen’, D 531.¹¹¹ Beyond being energetic, there is a destructive quality to the material: it breaks through the surface with force, reconfiguring the lyrical theme’s dotted rhythms – initially soft and introspective – into an obsessive depiction of death. This transformation overthrows the movement’s sense of balance in favour of foregrounded irregularity.

Unexpectedly, at bar 66 the main theme returns in the distant region of the minor submediant. In this context, its haunting nature is intensified by the *pianissimo* dynamic marking and its placement in the upper registers of the primo part. Moments later it gives way to a further restatement of Theme Ib, this time in the remote key of the mediant minor. Juxtaposition of this kind governs the remaining part of the first movement. When the main theme returns again in the tonic key at

¹¹⁰ Wollenberg notes in this transformation the allusion to an aria topic (*Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 21). A parallel can be drawn with Haydn’s F minor Variations, a piece which, in Nancy November’s words, juxtaposes a main theme based on a ‘pervasive funereal dotted-note motive’ in the minor mode with a ‘more lyrical, thematically and rhythmically freer theme in the tonic major’. See Nancy November, ‘Haydn’s Melancholy Voice: Lost Dialectics in his Late Chamber Music and English Songs’, *Eighteenth-Century Music* 4/1 (2007), p. 100.

¹¹¹ Kinderman, ‘Schubert’s Piano Music: Probing the Human Condition’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), p. 171.

bar 91, it is followed in bar 102 by a variation of Theme Ib in F major, at which point it loses the destructive qualities of its previous occurrences and enters more lyrical territory, imbued with a hymn-like aura. Its forceful dotted rhythms abate and the melody unfolds smoothly in the bass line of the secondo part (stripped of its earlier angular contours). In these transformations, the delineation of the themes by their expressive zones becomes increasingly blurred, their identities merging in a hybrid manner that evokes the gothic.

Example 2.22 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, I, bars 48–57

[Allegro molto moderato]

The musical score is presented in three systems, each with a Primo (treble) and Secondo (bass) part. The key signature is F minor (three flats) and the time signature is 3/4. The tempo is marked [Allegro molto moderato].

- System 1 (Bars 48-51):** The Primo part consists of chords with some eighth-note movement. The Secondo part features a rhythmic pattern of eighth notes and dotted rhythms. Dynamics include *f* and *fz*.
- System 2 (Bars 52-54):** The Primo part introduces triplets. The Secondo part continues with a similar rhythmic pattern. Dynamics include *fz*.
- System 3 (Bars 55-57):** The Primo part has a more melodic line. The Secondo part features triplets. Dynamics include *fz*.

Further stylistic conflicts are profiled in the slow movement of D 940, whose outer sections not only inhabit the remote tonal territory of F sharp minor (introduced by four abrupt *sforzando* chords at the end of the opening movement), but also present a bizarre stylistic idiom – one that appears ‘indefinite, unnatural, and overladen’, to borrow words from Goethe’s description of Strasbourg Cathedral. Overrun with ornamentation, and replete with double and triple-dotted rhythms, the ‘A’ theme, shown in Example 2.23, harks back to the Baroque, specifically to the stylistic world of the French overture.¹¹² Yet here the usual ceremonial associations of this topical configuration are distorted by the dense chordal textures, jagged bass lines in the secondo part, frequent pauses, and angular melodic lines (marked by extreme registral distance between the parts). The impression (both aural and visual) left by the music is that of a misshapen manifestation of an archaic style.¹¹³

¹¹² A precedent for the stylistic idiom of D 940-ii can be found in the opening of Mozart’s *Fantasia in F Minor for clockwork organ*, K 608, which similarly evokes a sense of the past through its use of a French overture topic. For a contextual reading of K 608, see Annette Richards, ‘Automatic Genius: Mozart and the Mechanical Sublime’, *Music & Letters* 80/3 (1999), pp. 336–389.

¹¹³ Malcom Bilson and Robert Levin emphasize the music’s gothic qualities, particularly its disjointedness: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LF3TCwoEprA> (accessed on 9 October 2018).

Example 2.23 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, II, bars 121–132

Largo

121 Primo
ben marcato
tr

Secondo
ff
tr

124

127 *sf*

130 *sf*

A parallel can be drawn here with the stylistic idiom of Schubert's neglected *Grande Marche Funèbre*, composed in 1825. Its opening theme displays a similar combination of the minor mode, double dotted rhythms (in overture style), angular melodic lines, overlapping entries in the primo and secondo parts, and a prolonged use of trills. Example 2.24 illustrates the music's disjunctive and irregular thematic profile. In a similar way to the outer sections of the slow movement of D 940, this piece gives voice to a distorted version of an archaic compositional style.

Example 2.24 Schubert, *Grande Marche Funèbre*, D 859, bars 15–21

[Andante sostenuto]

15

19

ff

f (*cresc.*)

f (*cresc.*)

fff

p

fff

p

fff

fff

In the Largo of D 940, against the strange backdrop of the ‘A’ section, the lyrical theme that emerges at bar 134 in Italianate style, furnished with what Wollenberg has identified as ‘Rossinian embellishments’,¹¹⁴ appears oddly out of place (Example 2.25). Its smooth melodic contours, *pianissimo* dynamic marking, and conjunct motion contribute to a poised character that is worlds apart from the disjunctive style of the Baroque-influenced ‘A’ sections. In this way, the movement can be seen to embody the temporal and stylistic conflict that lies at the heart of the gothic: it yokes together music of surpassing difference, juxtaposing the archaic and the modern, the vocal and the instrumental, without bridging the gap between the two. The resultant hybridity constitutes the music’s *raison d’être*.

Example 2.25 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, II, bars 133–137

¹¹⁴ Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, p. 22. Italianate references have wider currency in Schubert's late music, as demonstrated by Lorraine Byrne Bodley in her paper 'A New and Surprising Schubert' at 'Analytical and Critical Reflections on Music of the Long Eighteenth Century: A Conference in Honour of Professor Susan Wollenberg' (September 2016).

Stylistic conflicts also form the core of the scherzo-like third movement,¹¹⁵ here in the form of abrupt shifts between the playful and the demonic. At first, its outer sections (which comprise their own micro ABA structure within the overarching ternary construction) convey for the first time in the piece a sense of energetic exuberance (see Example 2.26). As the movement unfolds, the mood darkens, notably in bar 214 when the dance style gives way to an outpouring of bold octaves in the secondo part and ‘murky style’ split octaves in the primo part. Becoming increasingly disruptive, the section culminates in bars 239–245 with repeated chords that fracture the movement’s dance-like idiom.

Example 2.26 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, III, bars 164–179

Allegro vivace

¹¹⁵ For more on Schubert’s scherzo movements, see Ryan McClelland, ‘Tonal Recollection in Schubert’s Late Instrumental Music’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 241–262.

A similar trajectory is present in the central ‘trio’. As shown in Example 2.27, at the start of this section a modulation to D major – conveying a greater impression of tonal brightness than previously explored in the piece – is coupled with the emergence of music that evokes the artificial sounds of a musical-box topic, suggested in part through the use of high register and *con delicatezza* instruction.

Example 2.27 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, III, bars 273–294

[Allegro vivace]

273 Primo
pp con delicatezza

279
fp

285
f

290
cresc.
ff

There is a sense that this passage withdraws from the present into a space that is framed as ‘ephemeral and dreamlike’, to borrow Burnham’s characterization of the

otherworldly trio in D 887.¹¹⁶ However, as is so often the case with Schubertian dreamworlds, its illusory qualities are subsequently transformed into something sinister, shattered from bar 287 onwards by an outpouring of forceful unison octaves and dissonant chordal interjections.

In this transformation, the music conveys a mechanical quality that brings to mind the world of automata – a world in which the ‘animate’ cannot be clearly distinguished from the ‘inanimate’,¹¹⁷ as is the case with the doll Olympia in Hoffmann’s *Der Sandman*. Her deceptive beauty and charming music initially attracts the unfortunate Nathanael:

Olympia played the piano with great talent and also skillfully sang a *bravura* aria in a voice that was high pitched, bell-like, almost shrill. Nathanael was completely enchanted; he was standing in the back row and could not precisely distinguish Olympia’s features in the dazzling candlelight. Surreptitiously, he took Coppola’s glass from his pocket and looked at her. Oh! Then he perceived the yearning glance with which she looked at him, and he saw how every note achieved absolute purity in the loving glance that scorched him to his very soul. Her skillful roulades appeared to him to be the heavenly exaltations of a soul transfigured by love; and, finally, when the cadenza was concluded, the long trill echoed shrilly through the hall and he felt as if he were suddenly embraced by burning arms. No longer able to contain himself, rapture and pain mingling within him, he cried: “Olympia!”¹¹⁸

But later in the tale Olympia becomes the source of Nathanael’s madness when her status as a waxwork doll is unveiled:

Nathanael stood transfixed; he had only too clearly seen that in the deathly pale waxen face of Olympia there were no eyes, but merely black holes. She was a lifeless doll.¹¹⁹

¹¹⁶ Burnham, ‘Landscape as Music, Landscape as Truth’, p. 36. Musical-box imagery occurs elsewhere in Schubert’s late instrumental works, typically leaving a nostalgic imprint on their surfaces. Further examples include the trio section of the G major Piano Sonata, D 894, and the secondary theme of the A minor Piano Duet (‘Lebensstürme’), D 947. On the former see Frisch, ‘Memory and Structure in Schubert’s String Quartet in G Major, D. 887’, p. 593.

¹¹⁷ For wider discussion of musical automata, see Carolyn Abbate, ‘Outside Ravel’s Tomb’, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 52/3 (1999), pp. 465–530. Abbate notes perceptively (p. 481) that ‘one *topos oblige* of musical works written to mimic mechanical music and automata is a musical hint that the machine has gone awry. This moment of failure may be sensed as wit or as horror. One sees a familiar form in the third movement of Mahler’s Symphony No. 2 (the *perpetuum mobile*), where the dance-machine is halted under pressure from a highly subjective voice that screams out its *ennui*’.

¹¹⁸ *Tales of E.T.A. Hoffmann*, ed. and trans. Leonard J. Kent and Elizabeth C. Knight (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1972), p. 114.

¹¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 120.

Just as Olympia is marked by a curious blend of the real and the unreal, so Schubert's music in the Trio of D 940 straddles the boundaries between the natural and the artificial, in a manner that is simultaneously beguiling and disturbing. Such tensions, as with those in the movement's outer sections, suggest the imaginary excess and stylistic imbalance of gothic expression.

Further stylistic defamiliarization is profiled in the finale of D 940. Here, following restatements of the work's opening theme in its minor and major-mode incarnations (reflecting the tonal layout of the first movement), the march-like theme forms the foundations of a fugue¹²⁰ – another marker of Schubert's engagement with the past. Example 2.28 illustrates the first iteration of the subject and countersubject, which enter simultaneously, adding an extra layer of intensity to the music.

Example 2.28 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, IV, bars 474–481

[Allegro molto moderato]

¹²⁰ A precedent for this fugal finale can be found in the final movement of Schubert's 'Wanderer' Fantasy, D 760.

After proceeding with unrelenting rigour, the fugue begins to disintegrate from bar 513 onwards, giving way in the primo part to the return of the split octave pattern that has played a disruptive role throughout the piece, together with obscure passagework in the secondo part. What is at stake here (in a similar manner to the work's slow movement) is the decontextualization of an archaic style: the fugal writing functions not so much as a marker of the learned style, but rather as a distorted remnant of the past that haunts the present.

In the aftermath of the fugue, which breaks off abruptly at bar 553 into two bars of silence, the haunting opening theme re-emerges in the primo part, as if the music has looped back to its starting point, retracing its pathway, but now tinged with the memories of the unnerving elements profiled within its central parts (Example 2.29). As Kinderman observed, 'in context, directly following the forceful, almost orchestral impact of the fugue, the lyrical opening theme sounds fragile, insubstantial'.¹²¹ To put it another way, the final statement of the main theme can be heard as bearing the hallmarks of an uncanny return (similar to those discussed in connection with D 899/1 and D 929-ii): it is at once familiar (in light of its thematic configuration) and unfamiliar (owing to its new expressive placement). Its voice is further displaced by the traces of the march-like theme that resurface in bars 563–66, leading to the 'wrenching dissonance' in bar 567.¹²² Although the piece does proceed to a perfect cadence in the tonic minor, the preceding dissonance can be read as a resistance to closure. We are left to find meaning in the echoes of the haunting music that reverberate in the ensuing silence.¹²³

¹²¹ Kinderman, 'Schubert's Tragic Perspective', p. 79.

¹²² Both Christopher Gibbs and Peter Pesic characterize the dissonance in this way. See Gibbs, *The Life of Schubert*, p. 155; and Pesic, 'Schubert's Dream', *19th-Century Music* 23/2 (1999), p. 138.

¹²³ The interpretation offered here takes inspiration from Wollenberg's view that 'whatever we interpret those final bars of D 940 as representing – death, resignation, grandeur, or sorrow [...] –

Example 2.29 Schubert, Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, IV, bars 556–570

[Allegro molto moderato]

556 Primo *p*

559 *cresc.* *fp*

562 *ff* *cresc.* *ff* *cresc.*

566 *p* *cresc.* *fffz* *p*

they, together with the closing passage as a whole, speak with a largeness of spirit and depth of experience which we could view as essentially the product, in instrumental terms, of a composer steeped in poetic expression throughout his creative life'. Wollenberg, 'From Song to Instrumental Style: Some Schubert Fingerprints', in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 71–72.

What emerges from this chapter is a view that the music under discussion here can be seen as belonging to a network of shared tropes. These range from themes of excess and transgression, through ghostly revenants and uncanny returns, to distorted manifestations of archaic elements and intimations of automata. Situating these elements within the well-established context of gothic provides a fresh angle from which to understand their expressive qualities, as well as offering a platform for exploring their broader aesthetic implications, notably in connection with contemporaneous trends in literature and the visual arts. Implicit in much of the discussion has been the suggestion that a key feature of Schubert's gothic music is its psychological dimension: it draws us into its internal worlds and conveys effects ranging from temporal disorientation (as in the juxtaposition of archaic and modern elements in D 940) to terror and horror (notably in those uncanny returns illustrated in D 899/1 and D 929-ii). It is in this spirit of enquiry that I turn in the ensuing chapter to an exploration of the Schubertian sublime.

**‘Too Vast and Significant, Too Strange and Wonderful’:
The Poetics of the Schubertian Sublime**

The disruptive forces that feature in much of Schubert’s late instrumental music have provoked extensive commentary. Notable here is Hugh Macdonald’s notion of Schubert’s ‘volcanic temper’: ‘the distinctive character of Schubert’s volcanism’, Macdonald argues, ‘is the sense of it being uncontrolled and partly uncontrollable; it breaks through the surface with irresistible force’.¹ Building on Macdonald’s article, Susan Wollenberg has suggested that ‘violence’ constitutes a significant stylistic ‘fingerprint’ in Schubert’s music, ‘one that above all seems to be at the heart of his individual way of writing’.²

In this chapter, I re-evaluate the ‘violent’ qualities of Schubert’s late music and their psychological effects within the context of the sublime – an aesthetic category that has not yet received sustained attention in Schubert criticism. The discussion begins with reflections on eighteenth- and nineteenth-century conceptions of sublimity, followed by an examination of critical responses to the sublime. Against this backdrop, I construct a framework for interpreting the Schubertian sublime, focusing on the following tropes: the dialectical representation of pain and pleasure, *Durchbruch*, and depictions of vastness and immeasurability.

¹ Hugh Macdonald, ‘Schubert’s Volcanic Temper’, *The Musical Times* 119 (1978), pp. 949–952.

² Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints: Studies in the Instrumental Works* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011), chapter 6. Studies that have offered further analytical insights into this aspect of Schubert’s musical idiom include Susan McClary, ‘The Impromptu that Trod on a Loaf: Or How Music Tells Stories’, *Narrative* 5/1 (1997), pp. 20–35; Elizabeth McKay, *Schubert: The Piano and Dark Keys* (Tutzing: Schneider, 2009); and Michael Spitzer, ‘Mapping the Human Heart: A Holistic Analysis of Fear in Schubert’, *Music Analysis* 29/1–3 (2010), pp. 149–213.

Conceptions of the Sublime

The sublime has long been the site of extensive philosophical deliberation.³ In his influential treatise, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful* (1757), Edmund Burke set in motion a new conception of the sublime characterized by its emphasis on all that is dark and terrifying:⁴

For sublime objects are vast in their dimensions, beautiful ones comparatively small; beauty should be smooth, and polished; the great, rugged and negligent; [...] beauty should not be obscure; the great ought to be dark and gloomy; beauty should be light and delicate; the great ought to be solid, even massive.

Whatever is fitted in any sort to excite the ideas of pain, and danger, that is to say, whatever is in any sort terrible, or is conversant about terrible objects, or operates in a manner analogous to terror, is a source of the sublime; that is, it is productive of the strongest emotion that the mind is capable of feeling.⁵

For Burke, the feeling of terror was enhanced by ‘obscurity’:

To make anything very terrible, obscurity seems in general to be necessary. Everyone will be sensible of this, who considers how greatly night adds to our dread. [In Milton’s] description of Death in the second book [of *Paradise Lost*] all is dark, uncertain, confused, terrible, and sublime to the last degree.⁶

Among the other elements that Burke listed as sources of the sublime are power, privation, vastness, infinity, magnitude, difficulty, and magnificence. While Burke offered no specific commentary on the relationship between music and the sublime, he did include a revealing section on ‘sound and loudness’:

The eye is not the only organ of sensation by which a sublime passion may be produced. Sounds have a great power in these as in most other passions. [...] Excessive loudness alone is sufficient to overpower the soul, to suspend its action, and to fill it with terror.

³ For an informative historical overview, see Philip Shaw, *The Sublime* (New York: Routledge, 2006), esp. chapters 1, 2, and 5, ‘Before (and After) Longinus’ and ‘Sublimity in the Eighteenth Century’, and ‘The Romantic Sublime’.

⁴ As Emily Brady observed, Burke carved out a ‘new direction for the sublime as a fully-fledged philosophical and psychological study in aesthetics which begins with a strong emphasis on our emotions and the physical effects of the sublime’. See Emily Brady, ‘The Romantic Sublime’, in *The Sublime in modern Philosophy: Aesthetics, Ethics, and Nature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), p. 24.

⁵ Edmund Burke, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, ed. Adam Phillips (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), pp. 113 and 36 respectively.

⁶ Burke, *A Philosophical Enquiry*, pp. 54–55.

The noise of vast cataracts, raging storms, thunder, or artillery, awakes a great and awful sensation in the mind.

[...] A sudden beginning, or sudden cessation of sound of any considerable force, has the same power. [...] In everything sudden and unexpected, we are apt to start; that is, we have a perception of danger.

[...] A low, tremulous, intermitting sound, though it seems in some respects opposite to that just mentioned, is productive of the sublime. [...] Low, confused, uncertain sounds, leave us in the same fearful anxiety concerning their causes.⁷

At the core of Burke's theory of the sublime lies an emphasis on the dialectical representation of pain and pleasure: 'when danger or pain press too nearly', Burke wrote, 'they are incapable of giving any delight, and are simply terrible but at certain distances, and with certain modifications, they are delightful'.⁸ In other words, the Burkean sublime, which, in Philip Shaw's words, shifts the discourse 'towards the mind of the spectator',⁹ is characterized by the intermingling of contradictory feelings and a sense of being unable to comprehend its psychological complexities.

Like Burke, Immanuel Kant foregrounded the dynamic qualities of the sublime. Whereas beauty 'concerns the form of the object', the sublime, he argued, 'may be discerned even in a formless object in so far as it has or evokes the idea of limitlessness'.¹⁰ Kant distinguished between two types of sublimity: the 'mathematical' and the 'dynamical'. He defined the former as 'that which makes everything else seem small in comparison with it' or 'that which indicates some capacity to transcend all empirical standards merely by thinking of it'.¹¹ The

⁷ Burke, *A Philosophical Enquiry*, pp. 75–77.

⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 36.

⁹ Philip Shaw, *The Sublime*, p. 92.

¹⁰ Immanuel Kant, quoted in James Day and Peter Le Huray (eds), *Music and Aesthetics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981), p. 223. Kant's original text is published in 'Analytic of the Sublime' (1790), in *Kritik der Urteilskraft*, ed. Gerhard Lehmann (Stuttgart, 1966), Part 1, Book 2.

¹¹ Kant, quoted in *Music and Aesthetics*, pp. 224–225.

dynamical sublime, on the other hand, is associated with power or force and the fear of nature:

Prominent, overhanging, menacing cliffs, towering storm clouds from which come lightning flashes and thunderclaps as they roll by, volcanoes in all their destructive violence, hurricanes leaving devastation in their trail, the boundless, raging ocean, a lofty waterfall on some mighty river, all render our capacity to resist insignificantly small in comparison to their power. But their aspect becomes ever more attractive the safer we feel ourselves to be; and we are happy to call such objects sublime because they elevate powers of our soul above their normal state, causing us to discover within ourselves a capacity to resist, of quite another order, giving us the courage to measure ourselves against the apparent omnipotence of nature.¹²

Kant concluded that ‘sublimity is contained, not in any natural object, but in ourselves in so far as we become aware of nature and thus of our superiority over nature’.¹³ As Frances Ferguson observed, Kant’s ‘dynamical sublime is, like Burke’s sublime, one in which the representation of the power of an object can seem overwhelming until we recognize that we are not threatened’.¹⁴ In short, the Kantian sublime exceeds the bounds of what the imagination can readily integrate; it is limitless and immeasurable, pushing at the boundaries of comprehensibility.

Alongside the development of philosophical treatises on the sublime, discussions of the musical sublime proliferated in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries in both Anglophone and German-speaking lands. In the early 1770s, J.A.P. Schulz, writing for Johann Sulzer’s *Allgemeine Theorie der schönen Künste* (*General Theory of the Fine Arts*), established an influential connection between the sublime and the genre of the symphony:

The symphony is excellently suited for the expression of the grand, the festive, the sublime. [...] The allegros of the best chamber symphonies contain great and bold ideas, free handling of composition, seeming disorder in the melody and harmony, strongly

¹² Ibid., p. 227.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Frances Ferguson, ‘Reflections on Burke, Kant, and Solitude and the Sublime’, *European Romantic Review* 23/3 (2012), p. 316; see also Ferguson, ‘Burke to Kant: A Judgement Outside Comparison’, in *Solitude and the Sublime: Romanticism and the Aesthetics of Individuation* (New York: Routledge, 1992), pp. 55–96.

marked rhythms of different kinds, powerful bass melodies and unisons, [...] sudden transitions and digressions from one key to another [...] Such an allegro is to the symphony what a Pindaric ode is to poetry. Like the ode, it lifts and stirs the soul of the listener and requires the same spirit, the same sublime power of imagination.¹⁵

Sulzer too spoke of the sublime along similarly elevated lines (though not in connection with a specific musical genre): '[it is] the highest thing that there is in art; it should be resorted to only when the psyche is to be attacked with hammer-blows, when admiration, awe, powerful longing, high courage, or even fear or terror are to be aroused'.¹⁶ In a similar vein, William Crotch observed that 'the sublime is founded on principles of vastness and incomprehensibility. The word sublime originally signifies high, lofty, elevated; and this style accordingly never descends to anything small, delicate, light, pretty, playful or comic'.¹⁷

It was the German aesthete Christian Friedrich Michaelis, in an article published in the *Berlinische musikalische Zeitung* (1805), who established one of the first extensive theories of musical sublimity, framed in distinctly Kantian terms:

The feeling of sublimity in music is aroused when the imagination is elevated to the plane of the limitless, the immeasurable, the unconquerable. This happens when such emotions are aroused as either completely to prevent the integration of one's impressions into a coherent whole, or when [...] they make it very difficult.¹⁸

The composer [...] expresses sublimity through the use of the marvelous. This is achieved by the use of unconventional, surprising, powerfully startling, or striking harmonic progressions or rhythmic patterns. Supposing [...] the established tonality suddenly veers in an unexpected direction, supposing a chord is resolved in a quite unconventional manner, supposing the longed-for calm is delayed by a series of stormy passages, then astonishment and awe result and in this mood the spirit is profoundly moved and sublime ideas are stimulated or sustained.¹⁹

¹⁵ Schulz, quoted in Elaine Sisman, *Mozart: The 'Jupiter' Symphony* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), pp. 9–10.

¹⁶ Sulzer, quoted in *Music and Aesthetics*, p. 138.

¹⁷ William Crotch, *Substance of Several Lectures on Music* (London 1831), quoted in *Music and Aesthetics*, p. 431.

¹⁸ Christian Friedrich Michaelis, quoted in *Music and Aesthetics*, p. 290. The original is printed in the *Berlinische musikalische Zeitung* (1805), vol. I, no. 46.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 289.

Michaelis observed that the difficulty and immeasurability associated with the musical sublime could be generated in two distinct ways, either ‘by uniformity so great that it almost excludes variety’ or ‘by too much diversity’:

as when innumerable impressions succeed one another too rapidly and the mind being too abruptly hurled into the thundering torrent of sounds, or when [...] the themes are developed together in so complex a manner that the imagination cannot easily and calmly integrate the diverse ideas into a coherent whole without strain.²⁰

Thus in music, Michaelis concluded, ‘the sublime can only be that which seems too vast and significant, too strange and wonderful, to be easily assimilated’.²¹

Characterizations of the sublime can also be found in critical writings on nineteenth-century music, as in E.T.A. Hoffmann’s oft-quoted review of Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony:

Beethoven’s instrumental music unveils before us the realm of the mighty and the immeasurable. Here shining rays of light shoot through the darkness of night, and we become aware of giant shadows swaying back and forth, moving ever closer around us and destroying within us all feeling but the pain of infinite yearning, in which every desire, leaping up in sounds of exultation, sinks back and disappears. Only in this pain, in which love, hope, and joy are consumed without being destroyed, which threatens to burst our hearts with a full-chorused cry of all the passions, do we live on as ecstatic visionaries. [...] Beethoven’s music sets in motion the machinery of awe, of fear, of terror, of pain, and awakens that infinite yearning which is the essence of romanticism.²²

Embedded within this excerpt is a collection of tropes that are closely associated with the sublime:²³ these include nocturnal settings, the fusion of pleasure and pain, and a

²⁰ Ibid., p. 290.

²¹ Ibid.

²² E.T.A. Hoffmann, quoted in *E.T.A. Hoffmann’s Musical Writings: Kreisleriana, The Poet and the Composer*, ed. David Charlton and trans. Martyn Clarke (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), p. 238. For further discussion of Hoffmann’s review, see Mark Evan Bonds, *Music as Thought: Listening to the Symphony in the Age of Beethoven* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006), chapter 1; and Abigail Chantler, *E.T.A. Hoffmann’s Musical Aesthetics* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2006), esp. chapter 3, ‘Hoffmann’s Musical Hermeneutics Revisited’.

²³ The rhetoric of the sublime is closely bound up with the development of the symphony. As Mark Evan Bonds has noted, ‘by virtue of its size, volume, timbral variety and textural complexity, the symphony was perceived as the sublime musical genre *par excellence*. It accorded perfectly with Edmund Burke’s oft-quoted definition of sublime objects as “vast in their dimensions”’. Mark Evan Bonds, ‘Beethoven’s shadow: the nineteenth century’, in *The Cambridge Companion to the Symphony*, ed. Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), p. 332.

yearning for the infinite (*‘Sehnsucht’*) – that pervasive desire among philosophers, artists, and composers in the early nineteenth century to reach beyond the boundaries of finite existence.²⁴

The Sublime in the Musicological Imagination

The sublime has garnered significant musicological attention in connection with late eighteenth- and nineteenth-century Austro-German music.²⁵ Important in this regard is Elaine Sisman’s interpretation of the learned style as a source of sublimity in Mozart’s ‘Jupiter’ Symphony, K 551. Apropos the work’s fugal finale, Sisman observes that the writing (notably after the onset of the recapitulation) is not only ‘disordered and obscure, massive and repetitious’, but the dissonances ‘increase exponentially to the point of not being aurally comprehensible’,²⁶ leading to a coda that reveals ‘vistas of contrapuntal infinity’.²⁷ In this way, she argues, it creates a

²⁴ See for example Kiene Brillenburg Wurth, ‘Sehnsucht, Music, and the Sublime’ in *Musically Sublime: Indeterminacy, Infinity, Irresolvability* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2012), chapter 2.

²⁵ An informative overview of the musical sublime is provided by Stephen Downes, ‘Beautiful and Sublime’, in *Aesthetics of Music: Musicological Perspectives*, ed. Downes (New York: Routledge, 2014), pp. 84–110. See in addition to the studies discussed below Keith Chapin, ‘Sublime experience and ironic action: E.T.A. Hoffmann and the use of music for life’, in *Musical Meaning and Human Values*, ed. Chapin and Lawrence Kramer (New York: Fordham University Press, 2009), pp. 32–58; A. Peter Brown, ‘The Sublime, the Beautiful, and the Ornamental: English Aesthetic Currents and Haydn’s London Symphonies’, in *Studies in Music History: Presented to H. C. Robbins Landon on His Seventieth Birthday*, ed. Otto Biba and David Wyn Jones (London: Thames and Hudson, 1996), pp. 44–71; Matthew Head, “‘Like Beauty Spots on the Face of a Man’: Gender in Eighteenth-Century North-German Discourse on Genre”, *Journal of Musicology* 13 (1995), pp. 143–167; Sarah Hibberd, ‘Cherubini and the Revolutionary Sublime’, *Cambridge Opera Journal* 24/3 (2012), pp. 293–318; Lawrence Kramer, ‘Subjectivity Unbound: Music, Language, Culture’, in *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, ed. Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton (New York: Routledge, 2012), pp. 395–406; Judith L. Schwartz, ‘Periodicity and Passion in the First movement of Haydn’s “Farewell” Symphony’, in *Studies in Musical Sources and Style: Essays in Honor of Jan La Rue*, ed. Eugene K. Wolf and Edward H. Roesner (Madison: A-R Editions, 1990), pp. 293–338; and Ellen T. Harris, ‘Silence as Sound: Handel’s Sublime Pauses’, *Journal of Musicology* 22/4 (2005), pp. 521–55.

²⁶ Sisman, *The ‘Jupiter’ Symphony*, pp. 76–77.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 79.

‘cognitive exhaustion born of sheer magnitude’ and thus offers an experience of the ‘mathematical sublime’.²⁸ In a different context, Annette Richards has argued that Mozart’s F minor Fantasie for mechanical organ (K 608), ‘with its strettos and inversions, piling up subject and countersubject’, makes ‘vivid the mathematical sublime’.²⁹ ‘With the music-making device out of sight’, she writes, ‘the invisible mechanism produces a truly abstract music in which the mind of the listener is set free to experience endless astonishment. The disembodied work of art becomes an object of repeated contemplation, a lavishly cumulative experience of the sublime’.³⁰

Haydn’s music too contains its share of sublime moments, as discussed in the work of James Webster.³¹ One such example is the ‘Drum Roll’ Symphony in E flat major. In Webster’s view, ‘the drum roll is nothing if not astonishing; [...] it overtly invokes a thunderbolt. The ensuing bass theme, with its mysterious low, bare octaves, [...] illustrates Michaelis’s notion of long, slow, even notes creating an atmosphere of [sublime] mystery and foreboding’.³² Among other invocations of the sublime in Haydn’s music is the ‘Representation of Chaos’ in *The Creation*, together with its concluding transformation of darkness into light, which represents, in Webster’s

²⁸ Ibid.

²⁹ Annette Richards, ‘Automatic Genius: Mozart and the Mechanical Sublime’, *Music & Letters* 80/3 (1999), pp. 366–389, p. 387. Richards has also read C.P.E. Bach’s choral music, particularly his ‘Heilig’, H 778, through the lens of the sublime, a category that, in her words, ‘offered Bach’s listeners an aesthetic framework for their experience of his music, and a language with which to describe the profoundly moving effect of its moments of amazing grandeur as well as those of baffling artistic license’. See Richards, ‘An Enduring Moment: C.P.E. Bach and the Musical Sublime’, in *C. P. E. Bach Studies*, ed. Richards (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006), pp. 149–172, here pp. 151–152.

³⁰ Richards, ‘Mozart and the Mechanical Sublime’, pp. 387–88.

³¹ Webster, ‘The Creation, Haydn’s Late Vocal Music, and the Musical Sublime’, in *Haydn and his World*, ed. Elaine Sisman (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998), pp. 57–102; ‘The Sublime and the Pastoral in *The Creation* and *The Seasons*’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn*, ed. Caryl Clark (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. 150–63; *Haydn’s ‘Farewell’ Symphony and the Idea of Classical Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), pp. 162–163, 230–231, 247–248; and ‘Between Enlightenment and Romanticism in Music History: “First Viennese Modernism” and the Delayed Nineteenth Century’, *19th-Century Music* 25/2–3 (2001), pp. 108–126.

³² Webster, ‘The Creation, Haydn’s Late Vocal Music, and the Musical Sublime’, p. 72.

words, a progression from ‘paradoxical disorder to triumphant order’.³³ Webster adds the important disclaimer that ‘the Creation of Light is overwhelming not in its own right, but because it resolves the disjunction and mystery of the entire Chaos music, as it resolves an unstable C minor into the radiant purity of C major’.³⁴

These studies by Sisman, Richards, and Webster carry salient implications not only for our understanding of the expressive modes of the music of Mozart and Haydn, but also in terms of the composers’ reception history. To understand Mozart’s music in connection with the sublime is to challenge the stereotypical image of his music as being purely ‘playful and naïve, childlike and dainty’,³⁵ while in the case of Haydn, the sublime aspects of his music form a serious contrast to those humorous elements that have largely defined his compositional persona.³⁶

Yet their scholarly efforts have occasionally been met with resistance. For instance, the late Wye Allanbrook – whose scholarship has enriched the discourse on topical hermeneutics³⁷ – lamented what she called ‘the regressive search for the sublime’ in eighteenth-century music, noting that ‘there isn’t all that much evidence for the musical sublime in this period’.³⁸ As Allanbrook’s argument unfolds, it

³³ Webster, ‘The Sublime and the Pastoral’, p. 155. For an alternative reading see Lawrence Kramer, ‘Recalling the Sublime: The Creation in Haydn’s *Creation*’, *Eighteenth-Century Music* 6/1 (2009), pp. 41–57. Kramer suggests in his abstract (without acknowledging Webster’s earlier contribution) that after its opening ‘forays’ into the musical sublime, the work displays a process of ‘recalling the sublime, in the double sense of rescinding the sublime and of making it a matter of memory rather than of practice’.

³⁴ Webster, ‘The Sublime and the Pastoral’, pp. 154–55.

³⁵ Quoted from W. Dean Sutcliffe, ‘The Keyboard Music’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Mozart*, ed. Simon Keefe (Cambridge: University of Cambridge, 2003), p. 74.

³⁶ On humorous Haydn see for example Gretchen Wheelock, *Haydn’s Ingenious Jesting with Art: Contexts of Musical Wit and Humor* (New York: Schirmer, 1992).

³⁷ See Wye Jamison Allanbrook, *Rhythmic Gesture in Mozart: Le Nozze di Figaro and Don Giovanni* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983).

³⁸ Wye Jamison Allanbrook, ‘Is the Sublime a Musical Topos?’, *Eighteenth-Century Music* 7/2 (2010), pp. 263–279, here pp. 267 and 263 respectively. While it is true that music does not play a central role in Burke’s or Kant’s formulations of the sublime, Allanbrook’s dismissal of the possibility of cross-fertilization between musical discourse and the history of ideas represents a restrictive approach to the ongoing endeavour to understand music as part of a broader cultural paradigm.

becomes clear that her unease stemmed from a belief that ‘efforts to pin down characteristics that might translate [...] views of the sublime into recognizable musical topoi have not been particularly fruitful’.³⁹ Here Allanbrook seemed to overlook the broader methodological implications of the scholarship under critique in her article. Ultimately, the sublime (as Sisman and others have noted)⁴⁰ resists being packaged into a topical category in the Ratnerian sense of a ‘subject to be incorporated in a [musical] discourse’;⁴¹ instead it serves as an aesthetic framework in which to contextualize musical procedures (topical, textural, tonal) that overwhelm the senses and defy straightforward comprehension.

Much of the scholarly literature on the musical sublime has crystallized around Beethoven’s instrumental works, fuelled in part by Hoffmann’s review of his Fifth Symphony. Besides the much-discussed examples of the symphonic sublime in Beethoven’s oeuvre – which have been illuminated in the writings of Carl Dahlhaus,⁴² Mark Evan Bonds,⁴³ and Alexander Rehding⁴⁴ – Stephen Rumph has demonstrated that the composer’s vocal music also ‘contains intriguing clues to [his] conception of the sublime’, notably the neglected *Sechs Gellert-Lieder*, Op. 48.⁴⁵ In Rumph’s words,

³⁹ Allanbrook, ‘Is the Sublime a Musical Topos?’, p. 266.

⁴⁰ Sisman asserts that ‘the sublime in Mozart’s music cannot be [...] easily pigeonholed’. Sisman, *The ‘Jupiter’ Symphony*, p. 76.

⁴¹ See Leonard G. Ratner, ‘Topical Content in Mozart’s Keyboard Sonatas’, *Early Music* 19/4 (1991), pp. 615–619, here p. 615; see also Ratner, *Classic Music: Expression, Form, and Style* (New York: Schirmer, 1980), chapter 2. For a recent survey of issues in the field of topic theory, see Danuta Mirka, ‘Introduction’, in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. Mirka (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), pp. 1–57.

⁴² See Carl Dahlhaus, ‘E.T.A. Hoffmanns Beethoven-Kritik und die Ästhetik des Erhabenen’, *Archiv für Musikwissenschaft* 39 (1981), pp. 72–92; and Dahlhaus, *Ludwig van Beethoven: Approaches to his Music*, trans. Mary Whittall (New York: Oxford University Press, 1991), chapter 4, ‘The Symphonic Style’.

⁴³ Mark Evan Bonds, *Listening to the Symphony*, esp. chapter 3, ‘Listening to Truth: Beethoven’s Fifth Symphony’.

⁴⁴ Alexander Rehding, *Music and Monumentality: Commemoration and Wonderment in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).

⁴⁵ Stephen Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon: Political Romanticism in the Late Works* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2004), p. 36.

‘the pervasive *alla breve* meter, the hymnlike melodies, the piano textures recalling the Lutheran chorale prelude, and the splashes of Handelian counterpoint all draw upon [the] elevated style that Elaine Sisman has traced in eighteenth-century descriptions of the musical sublime’.⁴⁶ For William Kinderman, Friedrich Schiller’s concept of the sublime – which he argues is ‘bound up with the *irreconcilability* of reason and sensibility’ – constitutes a general principle in much of Beethoven’s music, especially the late works.⁴⁷ Kinderman’s examples range from the ‘serene world of eternal harmonies’ in the fugue of the ‘Hammerklavier’ Sonata, Op. 106,⁴⁸ to the ‘sublime lyricism’ of the finale of the E major Piano Sonata, Op. 109.⁴⁹

Beyond Beethoven, Alexander Stefaniak has recently explored the ‘rhetoric of the sublime’ as part of an analytical and cultural-historical project on notions of virtuosity in Robert Schumann’s music.⁵⁰ Within this rhetorical landscape, he identifies ‘intense virtuosic catastrophes’, together with passages in the finale of Schumann’s *Concert sans Orchestre* that ‘give the impression of playing at the limit of human capability’, as well as ‘more allusive’ invocations of the sublime in the *Études symphoniques*.⁵¹ In Bruckner scholarship, Benjamin Korstvedt has demonstrated the ways in which his Eighth Symphony – ‘with its staggering climaxes, its dazzling harmonic shifts, its mysteriously fractured form, and its abrupt juxtapositions of violent upheaval and

⁴⁶ Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon*, p. 37. On Handelian influences in Beethoven’s conception of the sublime see also Nicholas Mathew, ‘Beethoven’s Political Music, the Handelian Sublime, and the Aesthetics of Prostration’, *19th-Century Music* 33/2 (2009), pp. 110–150.

⁴⁷ William Kinderman, *Beethoven* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), p. 8.

⁴⁸ Kinderman, *Beethoven*, p. 209.

⁴⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 223.

⁵⁰ Alexander Stefaniak, *Schumann’s Virtuosity: Criticism, Composition, and Performance in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2016), chapter 4, ‘Virtuosity and the Rhetoric of the Sublime’; see also Stefaniak, ‘Robert Schumann, Serious Virtuosity, and the Rhetoric of the Sublime’, *Journal of Musicology* 33/4 (2016), pp. 433–482.

⁵¹ Stefaniak, *Schumann’s Virtuosity*, pp. 138, 134, and 145 respectively.

uncanny stillness’ – can be seen to articulate a ‘sublime plot’ which reflects Kant’s notion of the mathematical sublime.⁵²

Absent from the musicological discourse on the sublime is any sustained discussion of the music of Franz Schubert.⁵³ Yet the characteristic features of the sublime – including vastness, immeasurability, and obscurity – are pervasive in his late instrumental works. In what follows, with a view to bringing Schubert into a more central position in discussions of sublimity, I explore the ways in which the ‘Unfinished’, D 759, can be seen as an essay in the poetics of the sublime.

Tropes of the Schubertian Sublime

Schubert’s ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, has long been surrounded by myths,⁵⁴ fuelled in part by a letter that Schubert supposedly wrote to the Styrian *Musikverein* in September 1823, outlining his plans to send a copy of the work to the Society as a token of gratitude for his honorary membership:

Worshipful Music Society [Löblicher Musikverein]

I am very greatly obliged by the diploma of honorary membership you so kindly sent me, and which, owing to my prolonged absence from Vienna, I received only a few days ago. May it be the reward of my devotion to the art of music to some day become wholly

⁵² Benjamin Korstvedt, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p. 64.

⁵³ A reference to the sublime features in Marjorie Hirsch’s recent essay on the Andantino of Schubert’s D 959, in which she concludes as follows: ‘channelling volcanic energy through a stable structure produces music of extraordinary emotionality, an expressive language that fuses the pain and danger of the sublime with the solace of lyricism’. Hirsch, ‘Schubert’s reconciliation of gothic and classical influences’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, p. 170. See also Spitzer, ‘Mapping the Human Heart’, pp. 183–186, where there is a brief discussion of the sublime from a phenomenological perspective. Further contextual discussion of the Schubertian sublime can be found in Lorraine Byrne Bodley, *Franz Schubert: A Musical Wayfarer* (New Haven: Yale University Press, forthcoming), chapter 10, ‘Art borne of Sorrow: 1822–1824’, and chapter 11 ‘After the Crisis: The Spirit of Beauty and its Fate’.

⁵⁴ See, *inter alia*, John Gingerich, ‘Unfinished Considerations: Schubert’s “Unfinished” Symphony in the Context of his Beethoven Project’, *19th-Century Music* 31/2 (2007), pp. 99–112; Andrea Lindmayr-Brandl, ‘The Myth of the “Unfinished” and the Film *Das Dreimäderlhaus* (1958)’, in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 111–126; Hans-Joachim Hinrichsen, ‘“Unvollendet” oder abgebrochen? Werkstatus und Manuskripttypologie bei Franz Schubert’, in *Schubert: Perspektiven 5* (2005), pp. 183–203; and Renate Bozic, ‘Franz Schubert, die “Unvollendete” und der Steiermärkische Musikverein’, in *175 Jahre Musikverein für Steiermark*, ed. Erika Kaufmann (Graz, 1997), pp. 31–43.

worthy of such a distinction. In order to give musical expression to my sincere gratitude as well, I shall take the liberty as soon as possible of presenting your worshipful Society with one of my symphonies in full score.

With the highest regards, I remain, the most grateful, devoted and obedient servant of a worshipful Society.⁵⁵

Opinion is divided on the authorship of this *Dankschreiben*.⁵⁶ Alois Chalus has suggested that it was forged by Josef Hüttenbrenner;⁵⁷ Werner Aderhold, writing in the NSA Critical Report on D 759, maintains that it incorporates ‘so many clear characteristics of Schubert’s handwriting that the authenticity of the original cannot be doubted’,⁵⁸ while David Montgomery reaches the conclusion that the letter was forged by Anselm Hüttenbrenner, Josef’s brother.⁵⁹ Details of the work’s afterlife are equally hazy: there is no correspondence from the *Gesellschaft* to acknowledge receipt of the score, and no record of the work ever being performed during the composer’s lifetime; nor is there concrete evidence as to why the Hüttenbrenner brothers remained silent about the work’s existence until its premiere at the *Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde* in 1865, under the baton of Johann Herbeck.

Additionally there is the issue of the work’s ‘Unfinished’ status.⁶⁰ As Christopher Gibbs has noted, its nickname serves as a ‘metaphor, a recurring reminder of

⁵⁵ Schubert, letter of 20 September 1823 to the Styrian Musikverein, in Deutsch, *A Documentary Biography*, pp. 289–90.

⁵⁶ For extended discussion of the controversies surrounding the letter, see Byrne Bodley, *Franz Schubert* (forthcoming), chapter 10, ‘Art borne of Sorrow: 1822–1828’.

⁵⁷ Alois A. Chalus, ‘Franz Schubert, der Musiker des Biedermeiers’, *Der Kollege* 5/6 (1963), pp. 6–8.

⁵⁸ Werner Aderhold, *Sinfonie Nr. 7 in h-Moll* (D 759), *Kritischer Bericht, Neue Schubert-Ausgabe: Kritischer Bericht*, Vol. 3, (1996 [rev. ed. 2008]).

⁵⁹ See David Montgomery, *Unfinished History: A New Account of Franz Schubert’s Symphony in B minor* (Florida: Brown Walker Press, 2017), chapter 1, ‘Scripts and Handwriting’.

⁶⁰ Performance practice plays a key role in generating different perceptions of D 759 as either a unified whole or an incomplete work. The Vienna Philharmonic Orchestra, conducted by Carlos Kleiber, emphasizes the former approach, conveying an overarching teleological musical trajectory: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dB5gEzLqTlg>. By contrast, the Orchestra of the Age of Enlightenment, conducted by Charles Mackerras, draws attention to the work’s ‘unfinished’ status: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=W3CivR0NsGw>, with speculative completions of movements 3 and 4: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=v_w9Tpcbm0 (both accessed on 9 October 2018).

unfulfilled promise – the theme sounded by [Franz] Grillparzer’s epitaph’: ‘The art of music here entombed a rich possession, but even far fairer hopes’.⁶¹ Schubert’s personal circumstances at the time – specifically his contraction of what is generally taken to be the venereal disease that would plague the final six years of his life – have figured prominently in the speculations that have been proffered regarding the ‘incomplete’ nature of the Symphony.⁶² Thus we find Eric Sams, in his reconsideration of Schubert’s illness, asserting that ‘it may be that the sexual act which caused the disease occurred when Schubert was working on the symphony, and that he subsequently associated the unfinished work with events he preferred to forget, and thus chose not to return to it’.⁶³ In a similar vein, Barbara Barry observed that ‘the B minor symphony is intimately connected with the fateful disease because he was composing it at exactly the time he contracted syphilis; so the symphony must, in some way in his mind, have been associated with the presence of death’.⁶⁴ Bold claims concerning compositional intentionality sit uneasily within the critical discourse on

⁶¹ Christopher H. Gibbs, “‘Poor Schubert’”: Images and Legends of the Composer’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), p. 44; and Gibbs, *The Life of Schubert*, p. 173.

⁶² Glossing the discourse on D 759, Gingerich notes that ‘while the identification of the truncated symphony with the truncated life is no longer literal, some notion of a correlation between the symphony’s unfinished state and Schubert’s otherness persists, or of Schubert as rebel and wounded sufferer. The ties between the “Unfinished” Symphony and Schubert’s biography remain as strong as ever; only now, in concurrence with his changing reception, the ties are with a life frustrated and incomplete more for its circumstances than for its brevity’. See Gingerich, ‘Unfinished Considerations’, p. 101.

⁶³ Eric Sams, ‘Schubert’s Illness Re-examined’, *The Musical Times* 121 (1980), pp. 15–22, here pp. 15–16.

⁶⁴ Barbara Barry, ‘A shouting silence: further thoughts about Schubert’s “Unfinished”’, *The Musical Times* 151 (2010), pp. 39–52, here p. 42. Maynard Solomon has offered an alternative approach to the conundrum of the work’s ‘incomplete’ nature: ‘It may be hypothesized’, he argued, ‘that [Schubert] actually set out to write a two-movement symphony, intending to create an unusual symphonic form, analogous to, inspired by, or in competition with Beethoven, whose innovative Piano Sonatas in E, op. 109, in A flat, op. 110, and in C minor, op. 111, the last of which is a two-movement sonata, were completed by mid-1822. In this improbable – but not entirely excludable – scenario, Schubert temporarily drew back from the implications of so risky a prospect and tried to compose a conventional scherzo with the purpose of adapting the unusual opening movements to the requirements of a four-movement cycle’. See Maynard Solomon, ‘Schubert’s “Unfinished” Symphony’, *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 111–133, here p. 112.

the composer's late style. As noted in chapter one of this thesis, Schubert's late music, while carrying traces of biographical connections, ultimately resists being read as a textual documentary on his personal circumstances.

Beyond these questions concerning the gestation and afterlife of D 759, the expressive and structural properties of the work are surrounded by an aura of strangeness. Its first movement – the focal point of the commentary that follows here – contains several formal perplexities within its sonata-form framework. Among them is the opening eight-bar phrase, which blurs the boundaries between an introduction and that of a primary theme. It emerges as if from nowhere, imparting a mysterious tone to the movement, but is then absent from the rest of the exposition, subsequently resurfacing with greater force in the development section. Equally curious is the treatment of what turns out to be Theme I: its first incarnation appearing in the horns and oboes at bar 13 incorporates in its closing bars a cadence in the relative (D) major, whereas its counterstatement beginning in bar 22 ends with a firm return – scored as *tutti sforzando* chordal interjections – to the tonic. In this way, the customary tonal layout of a sonata-form exposition is inverted, with affirmation of the tonic occurring after cadential confirmation of a subsidiary key. Also called into question is the relationship between thematic and transitional material. Susan Wollenberg has referred to the second statement of the theme as a 'quasi-transition' on account of the way in which it remains in the tonic.⁶⁵ Another possibility is that the genuine transition is compressed into the four-bar segment (38–41) which follows the two statements of the theme, whereby the music shifts to the submediant via a held pitch (D) in the bassoons and horns. In addition to these formal enigmas, the music is replete with

⁶⁵ Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, pp. 61–62.

strange outbursts that defy syntactical logic, such as that which firmly displaces Theme II at bar 63, suspending the music's temporal flow and setting in motion a series of further dislocations, as discussed below.

The strange proceedings of the first movement of the 'Unfinished' have attracted critical attention from the perspective of narrativity. Susan McClary, for example, has identified a 'victim' narrative, 'in which a sinister affective realm sets the stage for the vulnerable lyrical second subject, which is doomed to be quashed'.⁶⁶ She argues that the movement 'invite[s] the listener to identify with a subject that stands in the subordinate position, rather than with the opening complex'.⁶⁷ While on the one hand it is true that its secondary theme is 'quashed', on the other, given that the opening material also becomes implicated in the music's disturbing events, the movement can be seen to resist falling neatly into the 'victim' paradigm that McClary detected. More recently, Xavier Hascher has proposed, with reference to Freud's theory of dreams, that the narrative dislocations in D 759-i can be interpreted as a dichotomy between two levels of discourse, the 'latent' and the 'manifest':

It is in the back and forth between the levels, between the latent and the manifest, that we find the locus of the movement's distinctive character. Behind the apparent unfolding of the sonata's narrative trajectory is something permanent and immobile. If there is indeed a trajectory, we can only trace its outline on the surface, a surface beneath which lies a dark, subterranean and limitless expanse, like an underground lake that remains the same wherever one attempts to fathom its depth. Sometimes this layer is concealed, whilst at other times it rises to the surface and permeates it; and sometimes something uncontrollable gushes out from it forcefully: these are the moments of crisis.⁶⁸

⁶⁶ Susan McClary, 'Constructions of Subjectivity in Schubert's Music', in *Queering the Pitch*, p. 225.

⁶⁷ McClary, 'Constructions of Subjectivity', p. 225.

⁶⁸ Xavier Hascher, 'Narrative Dislocations in the First Movement of Schubert's "Unfinished" Symphony', in *Rethinking Schubert*, p. 137.

Hascher demonstrates that the movement's crises, while disconnected from their surroundings at the surface level, can be viewed as manifestations of the 'obsessional' features that are latent in the music from the outset.

Read differently, the movement's sense-defying moments, together with its formal dislocations, can be understood as markers of the sublime. Obscurity, vastness, and the dialectical representation of pain and pleasure – traits of the sublime that feature prominently in the theories of Burke, Kant, and Michaelis – are discernible at multiple levels in this music.

The opening eight-bar phrase of D 759-i, shown in Example 3.1, has something obscure and unsettling about the material it presents. Sounding from the lower range of the cellos and double basses, the theme hovers at the boundaries of audibility, its shadowy presence suggesting a nocturnal frame of reference⁶⁹ – the *locus classicus* of encounters with the sublime. What can be detected within this phrase is the process of 'calling forth of a voice', to borrow a phrase from Julian Johnson's work on Mahler's symphonic music.⁷⁰ Its initial ascent from the tonic to the mediant suggests a gradual emergence from mysterious depths, yet the process is halted as the music subsequently descends below its starting point, coming to rest on the lower dominant. In a manner akin to the eerie themes discussed in the previous chapter,⁷¹ the music simultaneously suggests absence and presence, residing in the gap between the articulate and inarticulate.

⁶⁹ Hascher detects a sense of the nocturnal in the primary theme (rather than the opening, as suggested above), noting that 'the topic to which it belongs could be of a sylvan and nocturnal nature, something mysterious or unreal'. See Hascher, 'Narrative Dislocations', p. 131.

⁷⁰ See Julian Johnson, *Mahler's Voices: Expression and Irony in the Songs and Symphonies* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), chapter 2, 'Calling Forth a Voice'.

⁷¹ A parallel can be drawn here with the three-note ascent, rising there from tonic to mediant in the context of C minor, at the start of the primary theme in the C minor Impromptu, D 899/1.

Example 3.1 Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 1–8



At bar 9 the opening phrase recedes further into the distance when a new accompanimental pattern enters in *medias res* in the string instruments: see Example 3.2. Here rhythmic rigidity, with the repeated three-note figure in the lower parts conjuring a foreboding atmosphere,⁷² is combined with surface-level instability: the chromatic pattern in the violin parts recalls the trembling texture of the opening theme in the *Quartettsatz* (cf. chapter two, Example 2.16, p. 65). As shown in Example 3.3, against this accompanimental backdrop, the primary theme, entering at bar 13 in the oboes and clarinets, unfolds in a similar space to that of the opening eight-bar phrase. Its hushed dynamic marking, together with its circular contours, hovering at first around the tonic and dominant pitches, suggests not an affirmative beginning, but a gradual sense of coming into being.⁷³

After the second statement of the primary theme cadences in the tonic at bar 38, there follows a modulation to the submediant, achieved via a pivot point (D) in the

⁷² Schubert used a similar repeated rhythmic ostinato in the viola and cello parts in the opening of his String Quartet in A minor, D 804. See Benedict Taylor, ‘Schubert and the Construction of Memory: The String Quartet in A Minor, D. 804 (“Rosamunde”)', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/1 (2014), pp. 41–88.

⁷³ For broader discussion of the formal implications of such processes in Schubert’s music, see Janet Schmalfeldt, *In the Process of Becoming: Analytical and Philosophical Perspectives on Form in Early Nineteenth-Century Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), chapters 5 and 6: ‘On Performance, Analysis, and Schubert’, and ‘Music That Turns Inward: New Roles for Interior Movements and Secondary Themes’. See also Julian Horton, ‘The first movement of Schubert’s Piano Sonata D. 959 and the performance of analysis’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 171–190.

horns and bassoons, as shown in Example 3.4. Rather than working through an intensive transitional process, the music displays an instance of tonal metamorphosis, moving subtly from one region to another.⁷⁴ Set apart from its surroundings, Theme II⁷⁵ – entering in the cellos at bar 44 in the brighter and potentially rustic key of G major – dispels the atmosphere created by the opening material (Example 3.5).⁷⁶ As the section unfolds, the lyrical theme is passed among the parts in dialogic fashion, notably in bar 53 where it moves from the cellos to the upper strings, creating a sense of convivial textural interaction.

Example 3.2 Schubert, ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759, I, bars 9–12

The musical score for Example 3.2 shows the first four bars of the first movement of Schubert's 'Unfinished' Symphony. The tempo is marked [Allegro moderato]. The score is in 3/4 time and G major. It consists of five staves: Violin I, Violin II, Cello, Double Bass, and a second Double Bass staff. The Violin I and II parts play a rhythmic eighth-note pattern. The Cello and Double Bass parts play a similar pattern, with the Double Bass parts marked (pp) and pizz. (pizzicato).

⁷⁴ On the one hand, the poetic shift to G major conveys the impression of entering a new realm that is divorced from the preceding material, while on the other hand simultaneously displaying deeper tonal connections with its surroundings, notably bar 13, where theme I closes in D major, planting the seeds for subsequent events in the movement's trajectory. For broader discussion of tonal metamorphosis in late Schubert, see Xavier Hascher, 'Music as Poetry: An Analysis of the First Movement of Schubert's Piano Sonata in A Major, D. 959', in *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert*, ed. Davies and Sobaskie (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, forthcoming 2019), pp. 257–282.

⁷⁵ For further discussion of Schubert's 'songful, almost otherworldly' second subjects, see James Webster, 'Schubert's Sonata Form and Brahms's First Maturity', *19th-Century Music* 2 (1978), 294–98. Webster's examples include the first movements of the 'Unfinished Symphony', D 759, the Piano Trio in B flat Major, D 898, the 'Lebensstürme' Piano Duet, D 947, the String Quintet in C Major, D 956, and the Piano Sonata in A Major, D 959.

⁷⁶ Yet even here, despite the contrast at the surface, there is a sinister tone lurking in the shadows of the material. As Wollenberg observed, 'it transpires that an obsessive patterning formed of tiny fragments [the falling fourth and the upward step] is the basis of the thematic construction'. See Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, p. 125.

Example 3.3 Schubert, 'Unfinished' Symphony, D 759, I, bars 13–21

[Allegro moderato]

13

1. *pp*

1. *pp*

17

fz *p*

fz *p*

fz

fz *pizz.* *p*

fz *pizz.* *p*

fz *pizz.* *p*

Example 3.5 Schubert, 'Unfinished' Symphony, D 759, I, bars 44–53

[Allegro moderato]

44

(pp)

pp

(pizz.)

(pp)

49

pp

pp

pp

At bar 62, however, in one of the movement's many enigmatic moments, the music is stopped in its tracks. The lyrical theme breaks off abruptly mid-phrase into a bar of silence, so that the music's temporal flow is suddenly halted. What follows is equally unexpected. Out of nowhere, a sustained C minor chord erupts in all parts of the ensemble, its disruptive character underlined by the *ffz* marking and the return of the tremolo texture in the strings.⁷⁷ The chordal interruption – in Glen Stanley's description, a 'catastrophe'⁷⁸ – bears the hallmarks of a *Durchbruch*.⁷⁹ It represents an intrusion from beyond the boundaries of the lyrical theme, rupturing the music at a local level, while also leaving a disruptive imprint on the overarching formal architecture of the movement.⁸⁰ Not an isolated instance, the breakthrough is subsequently recalled at bar 65, there as a second-inversion G minor chord, then again in bar 67, this time as an E flat major chord; the latter leads to repeated hammer blows

⁷⁷ The sheer force of the breakthrough in bar 63 is highlighted by the Chicago Symphony Orchestra, conducted by Georg Solti: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1-p58OSYhG0>; and the Philharmonia Orchestra, under the direction of Herbert von Karajan, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=X9UEYDeTE0>, both of which capture the gravitas of the music more generally (accessed on 9 October 2018).

⁷⁸ Glenn Stanley, 'Schubert Hearing Don Giovanni: Mozartian Death Music in the "Unfinished" Symphony', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 193–218. Stanley argues that traces of 'death' suffuse the first movement's topical and structural fabric, notably in the development section, where he identifies allusions to the second-act finale of Mozart's *Don Giovanni*, a scene in which the death of the Don is staged, and a stylistic idiom that recalls the *ombra* topic (see especially pp. 205–8), the *lingua franca* of operatic supernaturalism.

⁷⁹ To my knowledge there has not yet been sustained critical discussion of the aesthetic category of *Durchbruch* in connection with Schubert's music. For an introduction to Schubertian *Durchbruch*, see Peter Gülke, 'Zum Bilde des späten Schubert: Vorwiegend analytische Betrachtungen zum Streichquintett, Op. 163', *Musik-Konzepte*, ed. Heinz-Klaus Metzger and Rainer Riehm (Munich: Edition Text+Kritik, 1979), pp. 5–58. For wider reference see Adorno, *Mahler: A Musical Physiognomy*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1992), esp. chapter 3; James Buhler, "'Breakthrough" as Critique of Form: The Finale of Mahler's First Symphony', *19th-Century Music* 20/2 (1996), pp. 125–43; and John J. Sheinbaum, 'Adorno's Mahler and the Timbral Outsider', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 131/1 (2006), pp. 38–82.

⁸⁰ Further instances of *Durchbruch* can be found in Schubert's G major Piano Sonata, D 894, notably at the point of recapitulation, where the primary theme – initially presented in serene guise – breaks through the surface with force in the parallel minor; and in the slow movement of the String Quintet, D 956, discussed in chapter 4 of this thesis.

outlining a German augmented sixth on E flat in high register in the wind instruments, underpinned by an upward leaping figuration in the violin parts (see Example 3.6).

‘Too vast and significant, too strange and wonderful’ (taken from Michaelis’s theory of the sublime) are words that might be uttered when looking at or listening to the music shown in Example 3.6. Its sonic force and expansiveness, in conjunction with its sudden entrance, serve to overwhelm the senses, defying logical explanation. Further disorientation is generated by the subsequent chordal intrusions in bars 65 and 67, their cumulative power articulating a mode of sublimity that is complex and awe-inspiring. If the lyrical theme initially represents a source of pleasure, then the ensuing ruptures blur the boundaries between the pleasurable and the painful:⁸¹ it is in this intermingling of contradictory impulses that the music’s invocation of the sublime comes to the fore. That the lyrical theme returns in bar 96, now carrying the burden of the previous moments of terror, further cements the dialectical relationship between the contrasting elements in the music.

⁸¹ Schubert’s acute awareness of the dialectics of pain and pleasure can be gleaned from his private writings. One such example comes from an entry in his notebook dated 25 March 1824: ‘pain sharpens the understanding and strengthens the mind’, he wrote, ‘whereas joy seldom troubles about the former and softens the latter or makes it frivolous’. Quoted in Deutsch, *A Documentary Biography*, p. 336. He expressed similar sentiments in ‘Mein Traum’. At the core of this literary text lies the following disclosure: ‘Lieder sang ich nun lange lange Jahre. Wollte ich Liebe singen, ward sie mir zum Schmerz. Und wollte ich wieder Schmerz nur singen, war er mir zur Liebe’ (‘For many a year I sang songs. Whenever I attempted to sing of love, it turned to pain. And again, when I tried to sing of pain, it turned to love’). A translation of ‘Mein Traum’ can be found in Deutsch, *A Documentary Biography*, pp. 226–228. In turning to ‘Mein Traum’ here, my intention is not to establish a literal connection between the text and the ‘Unfinished’ (as has been explored in the work of Albert Schering and Charles Fisk), but rather to highlight Schubert’s broader artistic understanding of expressive dualities. See Albert Schering, *Franz Schuberts Symphonie in H-Moll (‘Unvollendete’) und ihr Geheimnis* (Würzburg: Konrad Triltsch Verlag, 1938); and Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, chapter 4, esp. pp. 110–111.

Example 3.6 Schubert, 'Unfinished' Symphony, D 759, I, bars 62–71

62 [Allegro moderato]

The score is in 3/4 time and consists of three systems of staves. The first system has four staves (Violin I, Violin II, Viola, and Cello/Double Bass). The second system has four staves (Flute, Clarinet, Bassoon, and Cello/Double Bass). The third system has four staves (Violin I, Violin II, Viola, and Cello/Double Bass). The music features a crescendo from fortissimo (ff) to fortissimo (ff) and back to fortissimo (ff). Dynamics include ff, f, and cresc. The tempo is marked Allegro moderato.

In his study of listening practices during the German Enlightenment, Matthew Riley observes that by the end of the eighteenth century two distinct types of ‘attention’ had been established: the first known as ‘arbitrary’, the second as ‘compulsory’.⁸² For Johann Sulzer, ‘compulsive’ attention was characterized by a feeling of astonishment:

[Attention] is elicited on two grounds; one is the particular strength with which certain ideas move us and the other is distinctness. The first ground elicits a compulsive, unthinking attention mixed with astonishment; the other a voluntary attention accompanied by reflection. We experience the effects of compulsive attention when an object moves us so strongly that our soul begins to stir, as during pain and during the sensation of an urgent necessity.⁸³

With its series of powerful ruptures, the first movement of Schubert’s ‘Unfinished’ Symphony takes the notion of ‘compulsive’ listening to unprecedented extremes. Each dislocation carries with it renewed capacity to engender astonishment.

The development section of D 759-i profiles yet more disruptions, all of which intensify the music’s invocation of the sublime. The passage shown in Example 3.7 exhibits what can be characterised as a thundering torrent of sounds: it builds inexorably to the suspended C sharp minor chord at bar 146, whose rhythmic identity reconfigures that of the three-note ascent of the opening eight-bar phrase. Burke’s observation that ‘excessive loudness alone is sufficient to overpower the soul, to suspend its action, and to fill it with terror’ is apposite here.⁸⁴ In this context, the music’s overpowering effect is heightened by the coupling of loudness with registral extremity and tonal remoteness. As the section unfolds, further dislocations occur in bars 154 and 162, both of which outline diminished seventh sonorities that emphasis

⁸² Matthew Riley, *Musical Listening in the German Enlightenment: Attention, Wonder and Astonishment* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2004), p. 29.

⁸³ Johann Georg Sulzer, quoted in Riley, *Musical Listening*, p. 29.

⁸⁴ Burke, *A Philosophical Enquiry*, p. 75.

the music's instability. Rather than forming part of a logical progression, each rupture represents an isolated gesture – a jab of pain – that is disconnected from its surroundings. Together they tear apart the framework of the music, creating moments of suspension that cannot be easily apprehended. In this way, the music can be seen to offer a vivid depiction of Kant's notion of the mathematical sublime.

Another source of sublime horror in the development section pertains to the treatment of the opening eight-bar phrase. When it returns in bar 114 – sounding as before in the lower registers of the cellos and double basses – it displays a connection with the expressive ethos of its original incarnation. However, at bar 170, in the aftermath of the chordal disruptions, the theme is utterly transformed, now appearing forcefully in unison in all parts of the orchestra and doubled at the octave in the first violins, trombones, clarinets, and flutes. As Janet Levy observed, 'the most pervasive quality of a unison passage is its aura of authoritarian control':

It does not appear to occur in nature, to happen naturally. It must, in some sense, be organized, preordained – imposed. On the one hand, it is an authority given by human ritual or ceremony – as in the intoning of chant, patriotic and work songs, heraldic fanfares. On the other hand, it is an authority that seems to rest in compulsions that inhabit the deepest reaches of the psyche *or* in forces outside man's nature (the demonic, the supernatural).⁸⁵

It is the latter category that is most relevant to the material under consideration here. In contrast to its original guise, this altered version of the opening theme in D 759-i is marked by its imposing stature, suggesting an utterance from beyond the boundaries of what is natural.

⁸⁵ Janet Levy, 'Texture as a Sign in Classic and Early Romantic Music', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 35/3 (1982), p. 507.

The movement's recapitulation offers little respite from the previous sections: rather than introducing thematic transformation of a consoling kind, it replays the events of the exposition and intensifies the movement's sublime qualities. When the breakthrough of bar 63 is recalled at the equivalent place in the recapitulation (bar 281), now as a chord of E minor, its effect is just as overwhelming: it comes once again as a shock, a rupture that lacks integration with its surroundings. The effect of this passage captures the essence of Michaelis's observation that the musical sublime prevents the 'integration of one's impressions into a coherent whole' through the use of strange, unpredictable progressions.⁸⁶ Not even the movement's closing bars offer a mollifying perspective (Example 3.8): juxtaposed with the whispered opening motif, the final four chords – outlining a I-V⁷-I progression in B minor, marked *fortissimo* throughout (the last with tremolo strings and accentuated dynamic marking) – distil the essence of the sublime moments that have taken centre stage throughout the movement.

⁸⁶ Michaelis, quoted in *Music and Aesthetics*, p 290.

Example 3.8 Schubert, 'Unfinished' Symphony, D 759, I, bars 353–368

353

The musical score is presented in three systems, each containing four staves. The first system (bars 353-360) features dynamics of *mf* and *ff*. The second system (bars 361-368) features dynamics of *mf*, *pp*, and *ff*. The third system (bars 369-376) features dynamics of *mf* and *ff*. The score includes various musical notations such as slurs, accents, and dynamic markings.

The Schubertian sublime is not exclusively dark and terrifying, however. Other invocations of sublimity in late Schubert are characterized by a sense of poetic longing and structural expansiveness, as in the ‘Great’ C major Symphony, D 944 – the product of Schubert’s ambition to ‘pave [his] way towards a grand symphony’.⁸⁷ Famously, Schumann expressed unrestrained enthusiasm for the piece’s expressive content in a review for the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* (1840), praising in particular what he referred to as Schubert’s ‘heavenly lengths’:

The composer himself may have had nothing else in mind than to get down the best music that was in him. But one likes to believe that the outside world, bright today, dark tomorrow, often penetrates to the spiritual recesses of the poet and musician, and to hear such a symphony as this is to concede that it carries hidden away within it more than mere lovely song, more than mere joy and sorrow expressed in conventional musical terms. It is to concede that it guides us to a new realm. Here, beside sheer musical mastery of the technique of composition is life in every fibre, colour in the finest shadings, meaning everywhere, the acutest etching of detail, and all flooded with a romanticism which we have encountered elsewhere in Franz Schubert. And this heavenly length, like a fat novel in four volumes by Jean Paul – never-ending, and if only that the reader may go on creating in the same vein afterwards. [...] The brilliance and novelty of the instrumentation, the breadth and expanse of the form, the striking changes of mood, the whole new world into which we are transported – all this may be confusing to the listener, like any initial view of the unfamiliar. But there remains a lovely aftertaste, like that which we experience at the conclusion of a play about fairies or magic.⁸⁸

Besides admiring the structural breadth of Schubert’s music, Schumann provided important clues to the expressive implications of D 944, situating the work within a poetic sphere, a world beyond the boundaries of the finite. One way of re-contextualizing the structural breadth that Schumann admired in D 944 is to view it

⁸⁷ Schubert, letter to Leopold Kupelwieser, 31 March 1824, Deutsch, *A Documentary Biography*, trans. Eric Blom, p. 339. Schubert embarked on this symphonic project in 1825, sending the score with a dedication to the *Gesellschaft der Musikfreunde* in the following year in the hope of securing performance commissions. Yet the work’s public acclaim came only after Schubert’s lifetime when Robert Schumann discovered the score in 1838.

⁸⁸ *Schumann on Music: A Selection from the Writings*, trans. and ed. Henry Pleasants (London: Dover, 1965), pp. 165–166.

as a signifier of the sublime: from this perspective, the sheer length of the piece constitutes not a source of structural looseness or redundant repetition,⁸⁹ but rather an opportunity to experience that which is ultimately limitless and immeasurable. Weighing in at 685 bars, the first movement alone – one of Schubert’s longest essays – bears the imprint of a sublime monument.⁹⁰

The work’s introduction begins ‘wie aus der ferne’:⁹¹ its isolated opening phrase in the horns conjures temporal and spatial breadth, as if sounding from beyond the framework of the orchestra (Example 3.9).⁹² The scene evoked is that of a pastoral landscape, within which the theme represents a distant vision.⁹³ Robert Hatten has defined the pastoral mode in nineteenth-century music in terms of the following four conditions:

(1) an individual retreating from a complex and less euphoric reality (2) in an attempt to regain lost simplicity, innocence, happiness, or the sublime – or to imagine a similarly euphoric present or future idealized state (3) by inhabiting an idealized space of reflection or serenity that emulates those envisioned qualities, (4) and that may also evoke the monumentality of a landscape, with its poignant juxtapositions of geological time, historical time, and individual memory.⁹⁴

⁸⁹ For further re-evaluation of the expansive proportions of Schubert’s late music, see Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, chapter 9, ‘Heavenly Length’.

⁹⁰ For wider discussion of D 944, see Mark DeVoto, *Schubert’s Great C Major: Biography of a Symphony* (Woodbridge: Pendragon Press, 2011); Brian Newbould, *Schubert and the Symphony: A New Perspective* (London: Toccata Press, 1992), chapter 13, ‘Greatness Accomplished: The Ninth Symphony’, pp. 208–247; and John Gingerich, *Schubert’s Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), chapter 8, ‘Schubert’s Heroic Symphony’, esp. pp. 216–235.

⁹¹ On the trope of ‘distance’ see Charles Rosen, *The Romantic Generation* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1995), chapter 3, ‘Mountains and Song Cycles’; and Thomas Peattie, *Gustav Mahler’s Symphonic Landscapes* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), chapter 2 ‘Distant Music’, pp. 47–80.

⁹² Mark DeVoto observes that ‘the slow introduction is longer than in any other Schubert work, a confident announcement that the entire symphony will be of comparable spaciousness. [...] Likewise the beginning, a single melodic line for two unison horns, is unique among Schubert’s introductions, which more typically begin with an assertive long note, heavily accented, often an open octave (Symphonies 1, 3, 4, 6); or with a fermata (3, 4)’. See DeVoto, *Schubert’s Great C Major*, pp. 41–42.

⁹³ Of the opening theme, Gingerich writes: ‘it functions as a herald, a summons: something momentous is about to occur’. Gingerich, *Schubert’s Beethoven Project*, p. 216.

⁹⁴ Robert Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004), pp. 55–56.

A distinct fusion of these qualities underpins the opening passage of D 944: the main theme, with its conjunct scalar motion, repeated rhythmic pattern, and restricted dynamic range, conjures an idealized realm infused with purposeful simplicity.

Example 3.9 Schubert, 'Great' Symphony in C major, D 944, I, bars 1–10

The musical score is presented in three systems. The first system consists of four staves (treble, two inner, and bass clefs) in C major, 4/4 time. It begins with a piano (p) dynamic. The second system features a melodic line in the first staff with accents and a piano-piano (pp) dynamic. The third system includes triplets and pizzicato (pizz.) markings in the first and second staves, with a piano (p) dynamic.

Parallels can be drawn here with the first movements of the Piano Sonatas in G major, D 894, and B flat major, D 960. As shown in Example 3.10, the main theme of D 894 is similarly marked as if in the distance: its drawn-out lyricism, presented in a hushed manner, suggests a longing for the infinite. So too does the opening passage of D 960-i (see Example 2.1, p. 37), whose textural breadth and poised character recall that of the G major Sonata. In both cases, as with the opening of D 944, the music conveys a poeticized form of the sublime that is real and elusive in equal measure.

Example 3.10 Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, I, bars 1–12

Molto moderato e cantabile

In D 944-i, hidden depths are unveiled through the leisurely unfolding of the opening theme,⁹⁵ which is first transferred to the oboe, clarinet, and bassoon parts at bar 9, before appearing in the string parts in bar 29. In the latter context, where the

⁹⁵ The theme's expansive proportions are underpinned by close-knit motivic working, as noted by Susan Wollenberg: 'among the manifold functions of the horn theme in this atmospheric introduction', she writes, 'is that of generating motivic kernels towards the material of the movements that follow; this motivic material tends to be re-shaped rather than reproduced exactly, yet it preserves a sense of belonging with the contours of the opening theme'. Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, p. 277.

theme is presented in *fortissimo* unisons, it acquires an aura of the monumental, intensifying the impression of longing for something beyond the music's immediate framework.⁹⁶ Similar sentiments are expressed in the movement's lengthy coda (an excerpt of which is shown in Example 3.11), which, together with the extended introduction, provides a spacious framework within which the music unfolds. Here, when the opening horn call returns, it is no longer in the distance, but acquires a prominent position in the music's textural configuration, surrounded by repeated notes in the strings and sustained chords in the wind instruments.⁹⁷ This passage, which displays textural plenitude,⁹⁸ further underlines the expansive nature of the movement, while also suggesting immeasurability.

In contrast to the 'Unfinished' Symphony, which emphasizes the dark, disturbing qualities of the sublime,⁹⁹ the first movement of D 944 can be seen to articulate a spiritual mode of sublimity imbued with a sense of serenity.¹⁰⁰ Its spaciousness

⁹⁶ For discussion of monumentality in connection with the development of the nineteenth-century symphony, see Alexander Rehding, *Music and Monumentality*, esp. chapter 1.

⁹⁷ The way in which the opening theme is transformed across the course of the movement contributes to an overarching symphonic trajectory, while more generally demonstrating the integrity of Schubert's structural planning.

⁹⁸ See Hatten, 'Schubert's Alchemy: Transformative Surfaces, Transfiguring Depths', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 94–95, where he notes that 'the sonic saturation of texture may convey plenitude, fulfilment, or even transcendent bliss'. See also Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes*, pp. 43–52.

⁹⁹ Such qualities are not entirely absent from D 944. Its slow movement, for example, whose main theme displays a parallel with the uncanny music of the 'A' sections in the C minor Impromptu and Trio in E flat, contains in bars 248–249 a *Durchbruch* (outlining a diminished seventh chord on D sharp) that recalls the spirit of the ruptures in the first movement of D 759. Laura Suurpää has argued that D944-ii presents a narrative based on the topical opposition between march (with funereal associations) and pastoral; the latter, he notes, appears to be ephemeral, ultimately rendered 'an unobtainable illusion' within the overarching 'tragic' trajectory (p. 235). See Suurpää, 'Longing for the Unattainable: the Second Movement of the "Great" C major Symphony', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 219–240.

¹⁰⁰ I thank Lorraine Byrne Bodley for drawing my attention (in a private correspondence) to the spiritualism of D 944. See Byrne Bodley, *Franz Schubert: A Musical Wayfarer* (forthcoming), chapter 11, 'After the Crisis: The Spirit of Beauty and its Fate', where there is discussion of the biographical implications of Schubert and the sublime, particularly in connection with the fourth movement of D 944. For wider discussion of Schubert's religious and philosophical inclinations, see Leo Black, *Franz Schubert: Music and Belief* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2003); Glenn Stanley, 'Schubert's Religious and Choral Music: Toward a Statement of Faith', in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed.

suggests an attempt to reach beyond finite existence, a longing for that which is ultimately unattainable. Such qualities imbue the work with an intrinsically poetic character, drawing us into the music's temporal and structural depths, and inviting introspective contemplation.

Example 3.11 Schubert, 'Great' Symphony in C major, D 944, I, bars 661–685

The musical score for Example 3.11 consists of three systems of staves. The first system (bars 661-665) includes four staves: Violin I, Violin II, Viola, and Cello/Double Bass. The second system (bars 666-670) includes three staves: Violin I, Piano, and Cello/Double Bass. The third system (bars 671-675) includes three staves: Violin I, Piano, and Cello/Double Bass. The score includes various musical notations such as 'ben marcato', 'ff', 'fz', and 'a 2'. The piano part includes triplets and a '2' marking.

Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 207–223; and James William Sobaskie, 'The Dramatic Monologue of Schubert's Mass in A flat Major', in *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert*, ed. Davies and Sobaskie (forthcoming), pp. 51–84.

075

076

077

078

079

080

As demonstrated by the preceding discussion, the Schubertian sublime encompasses a wide expressive spectrum. While in some instances it is characterized by obscurity and disturbing ruptures, as in the 'Unfinished' Symphony, in other cases, notably the 'Great' C major, it acquires a poeticized dimension, conjuring a world that is poised at the boundaries of finite existence. Reading Schubert's music within the context of the sublime serves a dual purpose: on the one hand, it provides a vocabulary for interpreting the expressive implications of his late compositional style, and on the other it enables us to connect his music with the history of ideas. The manifestations of the sublime discussed here provide evidence of Schubert broadening the boundaries of his music beyond notions of the beautiful, a process that is taken to even greater extremes in the case-studies under consideration in the ensuing chapter.

Stylistic Disjuncture and Grotesquerie in Schubert's Last Instrumental Works

Setting the Scene

The works Schubert composed in the final months of his life are replete with strange, disjunctive moments that ‘go against the grain’,¹ pushing the boundaries of musical expression to new extremes. Striking in this regard are the slow movements of the A major Piano Sonata, D 959, and the String Quintet in C major, D 956, both of which open the door to expressive worlds that parallel the profoundly disturbing scenes conveyed in the texts and music of *Schwanengesang*, D 957.² As John Gingerich noted:

What Schubert wrought in the last months of his life seems miraculous not only for the quantity of his creations, but for the range of emotion and depth of feeling he expressed in the *Schwanengesang* songs and the four instrumental works. The Heine settings in particular, along with the affective centers of [...] the slow movements of the Quintet and of the Piano Sonata in A major, contain music extreme in its sheer strangeness, in its outbursts of rage, and in its temporal and psychological qualities. They bespeak Schubert in extremity. And in spite of the different works to which these slow

* Preliminary material for this chapter was presented at the 18th Biennial International Conference on Nineteenth-Century Music (June 2014); ‘Analytical and Critical Reflections on Music of the Long Eighteenth Century: A Conference in Honour of Professor Susan Wollenberg’ (September 2016); and the 2017 Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society (November 2017). I am grateful to Matthew Head, Annette Richards, and Susan Youens for their helpful responses and suggestions on these occasions. An abridged version of this chapter is due to appear in Davies and Sobaskie (eds), *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert* (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, forthcoming 2019).

¹ For a general discussion of this trope, see Edward Said, *On Late Style: Music and Literature Against the Grain* (London: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2006), chapter 1.

² On the expressive qualities of *Schwanengesang* see (among others) Xavier Hascher, “‘In dunklen Träumen’’: Schubert’s Heine-Lieder through the Psychoanalytical Prism’, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 5/2 (2008), pp. 43–70; Richard Kramer, ‘Schubert’s Heine’, *19th-Century Music* 8/3 (1985), 213–25; and Susan Youens, *Heinrich Heine and the Lied* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), chapter 1.

movements form the core, the very extremity of the need for expression of which they are the miraculous result seems to demand that they be heard together.³

In this chapter I take up Gingerich's invitation to explore the slow movements of the Quintet and A major Piano Sonata from an intertextual perspective, offering a critical contextualization of their shared strangeness.⁴ In regard to the latter, I argue that the category of the grotesque provides a lens through which to re-evaluate the strangeness of this music and to situate it within its broader cultural context.⁵ Close attention is devoted to the musical signs of Schubertian grotesquerie – including stylistic disjuncture and ruptured boundaries – as well as to their implications in terms of the portrayal of fractured subjectivity, here with reference to the poetic ethos of the Heine settings in *Schwanengesang*, D 957.

The grotesque is a slippery concept. In the words of Maria Parrino, it is 'a protean form that joins tragic, trivial, and serious elements in such a way that it can be monstrous, absurd, humorous, and contradictory'.⁶ Literary scholars have demonstrated that the grotesque functions not so much as a fixed phenomenon, but rather as an existential experience.⁷ Its distinguishing tropes include doubleness,

³ John Gingerich, *Schubert's Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), p. 308.

⁴ For an overview of expressive contrast in late Schubert, see Benjamin Korstvedt, "'The prerogative of late style': thoughts on the expressive world of Schubert's late works", in *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 404–25, esp. p. 424: 'Schubert's late music is in its own way often most interested in creating the impression of disjunction, of disruptive contrasts of all sorts – whether visionary, consoling, tragic, uncanny or occasionally even bathetic'. Such a view is especially pertinent apropos the movements under consideration in the present chapter.

⁵ While references to the grotesque can be found within the discourse on Schubert's Lieder, to my knowledge his late instrumental music has not previously been read in connection with this aesthetic category. On the former see Susan Youens, 'Of Dwarves, Perversion, and Patriotism: Schubert's "Der Zwerg", D. 771', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 177–207.

⁶ Maria Parrino, 'The Grotesque', in *The Encyclopaedia of the Gothic*, ed. William Hughes, David Punter, and Andrew Smith, 2 vols (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 2015), p. 307.

⁷ See especially Rémi Astruc, *Le Renouveau du grotesque dans le roman du XXe siècle: Essai d'anthropologie littéraire* (Paris: Classiques Garnier, 2010); and Geoffrey G. Harpham, *On the Grotesque: Strategies of Contradiction in Art and Literature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982). A fuller exegesis of the grotesque is provided in the final section of this chapter.

hybridity, and metamorphosis; an emphasis on the subversion of beauty; and the juxtaposition of opposite modes of expression. Collectively these elements conjure a world that is divorced from reality, opening up an exilic realm that cannot be easily rationalised. As Leonard Kent and Elizabeth Knight put it, ‘the grotesque is assigned a reality which contradicts reality as we know it, while at the same time being seen as a true reality, a higher reality, even perhaps *the* reality’.⁸ Distorted realities of this kind take centre stage in the music under consideration in this chapter.

From Dream to Nightmare: Schubert’s Adagio (D 956)

What can be detected in the ternary framework of the Adagio of Schubert’s String Quintet, D 956, is a distinctive structural trope involving the dramatization of irreconcilable contrasts, followed by a disturbed reprise.⁹ Figure 4.1 provides an overview of the movement’s expressive topography.¹⁰

⁸ Leonard J. Kent and Elizabeth C. Knight (eds), *Tales of E.T.A. Hoffmann* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1972), p. xvii.

⁹ For more on ‘structural tropes’, see Lawrence Kramer, *Music as Cultural Practice, 1800–1900* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990), chapter 1. ‘Structural Tropes’, Kramer argues, ‘are recurrent formal configurations that carry a distinctive expressive potential in music and that are understood rhetorically and figuratively in literary or speculative texts. They are best thought of, perhaps, as miniature genres, typical structural patterns that normally apply on a limited scale – to brief works, to fragments, or to episodes in larger wholes’.

¹⁰ On the harmonic and structural properties of the movement see James William Sobaskie, ‘The “Problem” of Schubert’s String Quintet’, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 2/1 (2005), pp. 76–79; and Lauri Suurpää, ‘The Path from Tonic to Dominant in the Second Movement of Schubert’s String Quintet and in Chopin’s Fourth Ballade’, *Journal of Music Theory* 44/2 (2000), pp. 455–65. For recent analytical approaches to the Quintet more broadly, see the essays by Scott Burnham, Julian Horton, John Koslovsky, and Nathan John Martin and Steven Vande Moortele in the special issue of *Music Analysis*, ed. William Drabkin, ‘Schubert’s String Quintet in C major, D. 956’, 33/2 (2014).

Figure 4.1 Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, overview

Section	Tonal regions	Topical Zones
A 1–28	E major with forays into F sharp major (bar 5) and A major (bar 13), returning subsequently to E major	Lyrical dreamworld
(28)	E major => F minor	<i>Durchbruch</i> Distorted trilled gesture
B 29–63	<i>In flux</i> C minor breakthrough (bar 38)	Nightmarish music
A' 64–91	E major, F sharp major (bar 69), and A major (bar 76), E major	Disturbed dreamworld: original 'A' material resurfaces in dislocated guise with ghostly voices in violin 1 and second cello
Coda 91–94	Neapolitan (f) intrusion, followed by a final cadence in E major	Remnant of the initial <i>Durchbruch</i>

Example 4.1 Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 1–4¹¹

Adagio

The musical score consists of five staves. The top staff is Violin I, followed by Violin II, Viola, Cello, and Double Bass. The key signature is one sharp (F#) and the time signature is 3/8. The tempo is marked 'Adagio'. The dynamics are 'pp' (pianissimo) and 'espressivo'. The first system shows the initial trilled gesture in the violin parts. The second system continues the melodic development.

¹¹ The excerpts from D 956-ii are based on the Bärenreiter Study Score, Urtext Edition. Copyright (1971) Bärenreiter-Verlag, Kassel.

In the ‘A’ section the music withdraws from a sense of the present reality into a space suffused with transience,¹² evoking in Gingerich’s words a ‘static dream tableau’,¹³ while simultaneously pointing to an infinite realm beyond its reach. As seen in Example 4.1, the second violin, viola, and first cello present a spacious mode of lyricism that negates an overtly teleological trajectory and draws attention inward to the sensuous surface. Beneath the inner trio, the second cello provides a plucked harmonic backdrop, its fragile utterances lacking firm grounding, while at the top of the texture the first violin speaks in a recitative-like style, suggesting a lyrical voice in the process of formation.¹⁴ In spite of its layered texture, the opening material places emphasis on introspective interiority rather than projecting a sense of dialogic discourse among the parts. At times the music assumes greater urgency, notably in bar 7 with the expansion in register and dynamic gradation; at other moments, such as bar 15, it appears increasingly transient, conveyed in part through the contraction to triple *piano*. These subtle shifts suggest perspectival fluctuations in the dreamworld, hinting at disruptive undercurrents beneath its beguiling surface.

If the ‘A’ section appears ‘too good, too pure, to be true’, the musical events that follow in its pathway cast a shadow over its idyllic aura.¹⁵ As seen in Example 4.2,

¹² An earlier example of this fusion of dream-like fragility with visionary breadth is found in the ‘A’ sections of Schubert’s Notturmo in E flat major for piano trio, D 897 – a piece that distills the essence of Schubertian beauty within its compact framework.

¹³ Gingerich, *Schubert’s Beethoven Project*, p. 318; see also Gingerich, ‘Remembrance and Consciousness in Schubert’s C-Major String Quintet, D. 956’, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 619–34.

¹⁴ For alternative readings of the ‘A’ material, see Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints: Studies in the Instrumental Works* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011), pp. 168–70; Xavier Hascher, ‘Eine “traumhafte” *barcarola funebre*: Fragmente zu einer Deutung des langsamen Satzes des Streichquintetts D 956’, in *Schubert und das Biedermeier, Beiträge zur Musik des frühen 19. Jahrhunderts: Festschrift für Walther Dürr zum 70. Geburtstag*, ed. Michael Kube (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2002), pp. 127–38; and Peter Gülke, ‘In what Respect a Quintet? On the Disposition of Instruments in the String Quintet D 956’, in *Schubert Studies*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), pp. 173–85.

¹⁵ The phrase quoted is from Benedict Taylor’s characterization of the similarly tranquil opening theme of Schubert’s Piano Sonata in G major, D 894. Benedict Taylor, ‘Schubert and the

bar 28 establishes a dialectical tension between sectional closure and narrative disruption: the peaceful cadential confirmation of E major is undermined by an abrupt shift to the Neapolitan (f) minor,¹⁶ triggered by trilled unisons in all parts.

Example 4.2 Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 28–31

Forgoing syntactical connections with the surrounding scenery, these trilled notes shatter the prevailing stillness with an outburst of harsh instrumental sonority.¹⁷ A

Construction of Memory: The String Quartet in A Minor, D. 804 (“Rosamunde”), *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/1 (2014), p. 60: ‘In the Piano Sonata in G, D.894, the limpid simplicity and purity of the opening creates a sense of wholeness and beauty, a stage of grace and innocence, which somehow is too good, too pure, to be true’.

¹⁶ F minor represents Schubert’s subversive choice as alternative to the ‘normative’ major Neapolitan.

¹⁷ A parallel can be drawn with the effect of the sudden onset of the march-like theme in the first movement of the Piano Duet Fantasy in F minor, D 940, bar 48, with similarly extreme dynamic contrast: see Example 2.22 in this thesis.

sudden surge of rhythmic motion is combined with extreme dynamic and textural intensification, the peaceful tonic becoming a tension-filled leading note within the space of one beat. In this context, divorced from its usual function as a marker of graceful embellishment, the trill represents a strategy of disjuncture, serving to collapse the boundaries of the ‘A’ material into the onset of the ‘B’ section.¹⁸

Imbued with multiple layers of meaning, the disruptive content of bar 28 invites a range of hermeneutic readings. In Scott Burnham’s view, it functions as a ‘threshold’, one that represents ‘an astonishing transformation’ of thematic material rather than ‘a willed process of development’,¹⁹ while Lorraine Byrne Bodley detects the ‘rapid oscillation between Paradise and Inferno [that] is central to Schubert’s vision, whereby the irreconcilable opposites are deliberately collapsed into each other, threatening absolute tranquillity’.²⁰ In light of its forceful entry and lasting impact, the passage might also be interpreted as an instance of *Durchbruch* – an explosive intrusion that ruptures the music’s flow and determines its subsequent course of action.²¹ That all aspects of the music (rhythm, dynamics, texture, style, and tonality) are bound up in the procedure emphasizes its shocking impact. Beyond its effect at the local level of fracturing the musical surface, the breakthrough triggers a lasting shift in the level of discourse. As Robert Hatten observed apropos such writing, ‘if the disruption involves sufficient contrast in style, or sufficient differentiation along other dimensions, it may suggest not only a shift in temporal experiencing, but also a shift in the discourse itself, generally to a higher level that

¹⁸ The ‘B’ section retains from the outset a recurrent memory of the rupture in bar 28 (see for example the lingering leading notes in bars 29 and 38, second cello).

¹⁹ Burnham, ‘Thresholds Between, Worlds Apart’, p. 159.

²⁰ Lorraine Byrne Bodley, ‘A Place at the Edge: Reflections on Schubert’s Late Style’, *Oxford German Studies* 44/1 (2015): pp.18–29, here p. 28.

²¹ For further discussion of *Durchbruch* in late Schubert, see chapter 3 in this thesis.

comments on or reacts to the ongoing, unmarked discourse of piece time'.²² Here the topical shift serves to deconstruct the foundations of the lyrical dreamworld, distorting its peaceful imagery, and giving voice to a nightmarish reality.²³

Further stylistic dislocations together with expressive use of *Durchbruch* are foregrounded within the movement's 'B' section, notably in bar 30 where the music breaks out into a dramatic duet between the first violin and first cello, underpinned by restless utterances in the second cello and angular interjections in the second violin and viola (Example 4.2).²⁴ As Gingerich put it, 'the breathlessness of the melody, combined with the continuously febrile accompaniment, gives the whole B section a tinge of desperation, of hysteria even'.²⁵ Such qualities represent a dramatic foil to the drawn-out lyricism of the 'A' material; the visionary qualities of the dreamworld recede into the distance, as if constituting only a fading memory.

Amid the strange proceedings of the 'B' section there are a number of detours and flashbacks to earlier parts of the movement: the boundaries between the music's distinct scenes become increasingly blurred. One such example can be seen in bar 35 (Example 4.3). Here the dynamic marking drops suddenly to *piano*, and a series of trilled notes transpires in the upper registers of the first violin and first cello. The

²² Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes*, p. 269.

²³ The juxtaposition of dreamworld and nightmare is felt strongly in the recording by the Pražák String Quartet: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mLY_Ww8r7Sw (accessed on 9 October 2018). My reading of this material takes as one of its points of departure Julian Johnson's elucidation of expressive ruptures in Mahler's music. Johnson suggests that 'the effect of Mahler's structural ruptures and stylistic disjunctions is that his works take on a metatextual aspect; that is, they reflect on their own conditions as a kind of "writing". They do so through self-conscious intrusions and interpolations.' See Julian Johnson, *Mahler's Voices: Expression and Irony in the Songs and Symphonies* (Oxford, 2009), pp. 216–227. For broader discussion of musical 'ruptures', see Michael Spitzer, *Music as Philosophy: Adorno and Beethoven's Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2006), chapter 4.

²⁴ The dramatic nature of the 'B' section – an instrumental equivalent to a climactic vocal ensemble – reminds us that Schubert had deeply rooted aspirations as a composer for the stage.

²⁵ Gingerich, *Schubert's Beethoven Project*, p. 324.

emphasis on the trill as a rhetorical gesture recalls the disruptive *Durchbruch* of bar 28, creating the effect of an internal time warp.²⁶ Rising in pitch and volume, the trilled notes lead to a secondary breakthrough in bar 38,²⁷ at which point the duet between the first violin and first cello resumes its course, now in C minor.

Example 4.3 Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 35–38

The musical score for Example 4.3 consists of two systems of five staves each. The first system covers bars 35-36, and the second system covers bars 37-38. The tempo is marked [Adagio]. The score begins in bar 35 with a piano (*p*) dynamic. The first violin part features a trill. The first cello part has a chromatic line. The score progresses through bar 36, where the dynamic remains piano. In bar 37, the dynamic increases to fortissimo (*ff*). The first violin part has a trill. The first cello part has a chromatic line. The score concludes in bar 38 with a decrescendo (*decresc.*) marking.

²⁶ While moments of recollection and reminiscence in Schubert's late music have been much discussed as elements that stand apart from the unfolding action, the central section of D 956-ii demonstrates an alternative compositional approach. Here dramatic effect is conveyed through the way in which evocations of the past appear within a dynamic context. For an overview of critical approaches to Schubertian memory, see the essays by Walter Frisch, John Daverio, John Gingerich, Charles Fisk, and Scott Burnham in the special issue 'Music and Culture' of *The Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000).

²⁷ Beneath the trilled notes, the second cello part carries traces (with octave dislocation) of an inverted version of the chromatic line that, when descending, evokes lament and death (the pattern is presented as follows: F sharp in bar 35, G followed by G sharp in bar 36, A Bb, and B in bar 37, leading to C in bar 38).

From bar 38 onwards the music follows a digressive pathway, incorporating a further flashback in bars 51–54 (not shown), the climactic high point of the ‘B’ section. At this point the first violin and first cello present what Burnham calls ‘a shuddering *Zerrbild* – a distorted, grimacing caricature’ of the turn-like contour of the material from the opening bars of the movement.²⁸ Whereas the gesture is initially quiet and virtually motionless, in its later manifestation it is surrounded by forceful rhythmic agitation – this thematic transformation intensifies the sense of extreme disjuncture between the ‘A’ and ‘B’ material.

While the ‘B’ section is initiated disruptively, its closing bars (shown in Example 4.4a) are imbued with the quality of suspended time, presenting a weightless profile.²⁹ The dynamic marking drops to triple *piano*; the intense rhythmic agitation from the preceding material subsides; and all parts inject fragile sigh-like figurations into the texture. Underpinning this passage is a process of gradual disintegration, implied not only through the suspension of motion, but also through the dissolving nature of the thematic material: each thematic fragment is punctuated by silence. Against this eerie backdrop, the return of the ‘A’ material (bars 64–92) introduces further thematic displacement, here in the form of a disturbed reprise.³⁰ Stripped of its original expressive connotations, the opening material resurfaces with a reconfigured profile (see Example 4.4b), the dreamworld now tinged with a distorted reality. Though lyrical expression is retained in the central three-part unit, the outer parts creep uneasily around the contours of the main theme, parsing the temporal

²⁸ Burnham, ‘Thresholds Apart, Worlds Between’, p. 159.

²⁹ On the subject of temporal suspensions see Barbara Barry, ‘In Search of an Ending: Reframing Mahler’s Contexts of Closure’, *Journal of Musicological Research* 26/1 (2007), pp. 55–68.

³⁰ The notion of a ‘disturbed’ reprise is discussed in Lawrence Kramer, ‘Romantic Meaning in Chopin’s Prelude in A Minor’, *19th-Century Music* 9/2 (1985), pp. 145–55.

framework into a series of disjointed units; their ghostly scaled-based interjections subvert the original (albeit rather fragile) tranquillity. In particular, the demisemiquaver figuration in the second cello part (which retains a memory of the semitonal transition in bar 28) suggests an obsessive subdivision of time, clouding the theme with a restless aura. The impression left by this final section is that of ‘brokenness’,³¹ the music is unable to sustain its original identity.

Example 4.4a Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 57–62

The musical score for Example 4.4a consists of two systems of five staves each. The first system begins at bar 57, marked [Adagio] in 12/8 time. The staves are Violin I, Violin II, Viola, Cello I, and Cello II. The Cello II part features a prominent demisemiquaver (eighth note) figuration. The second system begins at bar 60 and concludes at bar 62, where the key signature changes to three sharps (F# major). The music is marked ppp throughout.

³¹ For wider discussion of brokenness in nineteenth-century music, see Laura Tunbridge, *Schumann's Late Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007), pp. 135–187.

Example 4.4b Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 64–67

The musical score for Example 4.4b consists of two systems of five staves each. The first system covers bars 64 and 65, and the second system covers bars 66 and 67. The music is in 3/8 time and E major. The Violin I part (top staff) has a dynamic of *pp* and features a melodic line with slurs and ties. The Violin II part (second staff) has a dynamic of *ff* and features a melodic line with slurs and ties. The Viola part (third staff) has a dynamic of *ff* and features a melodic line with slurs and ties. The Cello part (fourth staff) has a dynamic of *ff* and features a melodic line with slurs and ties. The Double Bass part (bottom staff) has a dynamic of *pp* and features a melodic line with slurs and ties. The score includes various musical notations such as slurs, ties, and dynamic markings.

Further subversion of the ‘A’ material occurs just moments before the end of the movement when the disturbed dreamworld comes into direct contact with the gestural language of the central section. As shown in Example 3.5, at bar 91 a remnant of the initial *Durchbruch* of bar 28 resurfaces in the first violin, leading to a similarly forceful Neapolitan-inflected interjection. The implications of this gesture are two-fold: it not only reinforces the sense of a disturbed reprise, but also portrays resistance to closure, undermining the possibility of overt reconciliation between the opposing expressive styles of the movement. Although cadential confirmation of E major is provided in the final two bars, the flashback in bar 91 to the moment of transition to the central disruption infuses the ending with

a disjunctive tone:³² the possibility of complete rapprochement is negated and an image of unresolved conflict prevails.³³

Example 4.5 Schubert, String Quintet in C major, D 956, II, bars 89–94

The musical score consists of two systems of five staves each. The first system (bars 89-90) is marked [Adagio] and ppp. The second system (bars 91-94) includes dynamics such as cresc., f, p, and pp, along with trills (tr) and arco markings. The score is in E major (one sharp) and 12/8 time.

³² Stylistic disjuncture similarly pervades the third movement of D 956. In the words of Burnham, ‘both the Adagio and the Scherzo create special thresholds between contrasting worlds a semitone away. In the Scherzo, bluff C major gives way to that lamenting, valedictory underworld in D flat. In the Adagio, dreamlike, visionary E major gives way to churning, melodramatic F minor. Burnham, ‘Thresholds Between, Worlds Apart’, p. 11. For further discussion of tonal interrelationships in the second and third movements of D 956, see Ryan McClelland, ‘Tonal recollection in Schubert’s late instrumental music’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 243–47. That the closing bars of the finale recall the disruptive ending of the second movement – injecting, in Taylor’s words, a ‘dark Neapolitan twist that spreads an uncanny shadow over the conclusion of [the] work’ – further substantiates the view that D 956 is an essay in unreconciled contrast. Taylor, ‘Schubert and the Construction of Memory’, p. 56.

³³ In a private communication Susan Wollenberg noted that ‘an alternative or maybe somehow compatible view is that the horrors of the central section are recalled at a distance and come to terms with finally, now understood in the context of the E major material (whereby V^7/f becomes augmented 6th of E, a recognizable cadential preparation) – peaceful tonic closure is achieved successfully thereafter’. These two readings pay testament to the way in which Schubert’s late instrumental works continually invite contrasting modes of emotional and critical engagement.

From Eerie Lyricism to Distorted Fantasia: Schubert's Andantino (D 959)

As with the Quintet's Adagio, so the Andantino of the A major Piano Sonata, D 959, has been widely acknowledged as presenting extreme stylistic contrast within its ternary structure.³⁴ Though both movements share a structural trope premised on stylistic disjuncture, differences can be detected in terms of their approach to the central disturbance and overarching expressive idiom. In the Andantino there are no traces of an idealised dreamworld; the music strikes a disturbed tone from the outset. Figure 4.2 offers an overview of its structural, tonal, and topical properties.

Figure 4.2 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, overview

Section	Tonal regions	Topical Zones
A (1–68)	F sharp minor, with intimations of the relative major in bars 19–26, 51–58	Eerie lyrical style, accompanied by a haunting pedal point
Transition (69–84)	=> C minor via a series of diminished sevenths	<i>Fantasia</i>
B (85–122)	C minor, C sharp minor, E minor, F minor, F sharp minor, C sharp minor	Distorted <i>Fantasia</i>
Retransition (123–158)	C sharp minor / D major / F sharp minor	Dialectic between recitative and fantasia
A' (159–195)	F sharp minor / A major	'A' theme in dislocated guise with additional ghostly layers
Coda (196–202)	F sharp minor	Disembodied spread chords sounding from the depths of the keyboard

³⁴ Cf. Robert Hatten, 'Schubert's Alchemy: Transformative Surfaces, Transfiguring Depths', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 91–93; Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert's Impromptus and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), chapter 8; William Kinderman, 'Wandering Archetypes in Schubert's Instrumental Music', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 208–222; Leon Plantinga, 'Schubert, Social Music and Melancholy', in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 243–50; and Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, chapter 6.

In keeping with its enigmatic nature, the ‘A’ section of this movement has attracted a range of contrasting characterizations. For Lawrence Kramer, the material has a ‘plaintive’ character;³⁵ Hatten detects qualities of a ‘lament’;³⁶ and Charles Fisk suggests that the theme ‘sounds not merely poignant but desolate’.³⁷ While such observations are not without musical evidence (as discussed below), they paint only half the picture, leaving aside the eerie implications of the music. Attuned to its ‘otherworldly character’, Susan Wollenberg has offered the most precise commentary to date, noting that the ‘A’ material ‘acquires a rather sinister aura’.³⁸

In contrast to the familiar lyricism in Schubert’s oeuvre that exudes wholeness and illusory beauty (such as we find in the ‘A’ section of D 956-ii), the ‘A’ theme of D 959-ii shown in Example 4.6a is distinguished by its obsessional character. Its contours rise and fall within restricted parameters, looping around the interval of a fourth above and third below its starting point, while the accompanimental figure hovers on an isolated C sharp pedal point in the manner of an *idée fixe*: these features intensify the haunting materiality of the discourse.³⁹ Aside from occasional dynamic swells and *sforzando* outbursts foreshadowing the disruptions to come, the music is

³⁵ Lawrence Kramer, *Music as Cultural Practice*, p. 94.

³⁶ Robert Hatten, ‘Schubert the Progressive: The Role of Resonance and Gesture in the Piano Sonata in A, D. 959’, *Intégral* 7 (1993), p. 67.

³⁷ Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert’s Impromptus and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), p. 218.

³⁸ Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 167.

³⁹ A parallel can be drawn here with the ‘A’ section of the slow movement of Schubert’s Piano Sonata in B flat, D 960, which similarly presents an eerie lyrical theme unfolding within confined melodic and harmonic parameters, its accompanimental backdrop (repeated C sharps split across four octaves) suggesting obsessive fixation on a lost object. For discussion of this movement, see Eric Wen, ‘Schubert’s *Wiegenlied*: the Andante sostenuto from the Piano Sonata in B flat, D. 960’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 134–148; and James William Sobaskie, ‘Schubert’s Self-Elegies’, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 5/2 (2008), pp. 71–105. In the words of Sobaskie, the theme ‘introduces not just a desolate ambience, but also a burdened, dispirited presence’ (p. 93). Eric Wen detects similar expressive resonances: ‘the recurrent pattern in the accompaniment gives the movement the character of a lullaby’, he writes, ‘but the mood of this movement is far from comforting. The character of its opening theme is bleak and despondent’ (p. 135).

drained of life, its scenery barren and dejected.

Thematic repetition (a characteristic feature of Schubert's late instrumental music in general) is deployed to unprecedented extremes in this movement.⁴⁰ In the 'A' section the main theme appears ten times in a paratactic manner, whereby syntactical connections are downplayed in favour of a chain-like unfolding of thematic material.⁴¹ Time appears to be frozen in a void; the music constantly retraces its pathway. Adorno's commentary on the nature of late Schubertian landscapes is apposite here:

The ex-centric construction of [the] landscape, in which every point is equally close to the centre, reveals itself to the wanderer walking around it with no actual progress: all development is antimatter, the first step as close to death as the last, and the scattered features of the landscape are scanned in rotation by the wanderer, who cannot let go of them...[Schubert's] themes know of no history, but only shifts in perspective: the only way they change is through a change of light, and this explains Schubert's inclination to use the same theme two or three times in different works, and different ways.⁴²

Rotating around a fixed thematic point, and blurring the boundaries between the centre and the margins of the landscape, the music enters an exilic realm comparable to that of 'Der Leiermann' from *Winterreise*, D 911.⁴³ With each repetition of the theme, the atmosphere of obsession is intensified, creating a world in which the

⁴⁰ For wider discussion of Schubertian repetition, see Scott Burnham, 'Landscape as Music, Landscape as Truth: Schubert and the Burden of Repetition', *19th-Century Music* 29/1, pp. 31–41; and Anne Hyland, 'In Search of Liberated Time, or Schubert's Quartet in G Major, D. 887: Once More Between Sonata and Variation', *Music Theory Spectrum* 38/1 (2016), pp. 85–108.

⁴¹ On Schubertian parataxis see Su Yin Mak, 'Schubert's Sonata Forms and the Poetics of the Lyric', *Journal of Musicology* 23/2 (2006), pp. 263–306; and Mak, *Schubert's Lyricism Reconsidered: Structure, Design and Rhetoric* (Saarbrücken: LAP Lambert Academic Publishing, 2010), pp. 24–56. Mak argues that a key feature of Schubert's late instrumental works is their paratactic approach to thematic construction where 'syntactical connections' are replaced with an emphasis on 'repetition and juxtaposition'. Although Mak focuses primarily on the effects of parataxis within sonata-form contexts, the late slow movements discussed here similarly display such structural properties.

⁴² Theodor Adorno, 'Schubert (1928)', trans. Jonathan Dunsby and Beate Perrey, *19th-Century Music* 2/1 (2005), p. 12.

⁴³ For discussion of the expressive qualities of 'Der Leiermann', see Lorraine Byrne Bodley, 'Music of the orphaned self? Schubert and the concepts of late style', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 331–56; and Susan Youens, *Retracing a Winter's Journey: Schubert's Winterreise* (Cornell: Cornell University Press, 1991), pp. 298–307.

lyrical verges on the mechanical: the music, like that of ‘Der Leiermann’, simultaneously reveals and removes vestiges of human presence.

While modal fluctuations in Schubert’s music have been much discussed as representing contrasting expressive realms (with major tonality reserved for fantasies and dreams, minor for harsh reality),⁴⁴ in D 959-ii they resist such categorization. The two forays into the relative major within the ‘A’ section do little to dispel the prevailing eeriness. The major mode is denied its own individual identity, appearing entwined in the expressive fabric of the tonic minor. As shown in Example 4.6b, the first glimpse of A major enters in a tentative manner, an impression that is heightened by the lack of cadential affirmation of this key: a possible modulation to A major is withdrawn and the phrase moves gradually back to F sharp minor, confined to the tonic key. The final statement of the theme in bars 51–58 (not shown) follows a similar path, opening with a suggestion of A major before returning to the tonic minor. Leon Plantinga has noted that ‘these sections are fleeting, their tenuousness underscored by tonic sounds only in second inversion; and as early as the consequent phrase even this disappears’,⁴⁵ while for Fisk ‘the key of A major comes as a memory: not as a goal achieved but ... as a source lost and suddenly remembered’.⁴⁶ That these phrases are marked *pianissimo* (the quietest level of the ‘A’ section) further highlights the transience of the relative major: both its appearances here represent distant visions in the landscape. As the opening

⁴⁴ Kinderman has noted apropos Schubert’s late works that ‘the contrast between major and minor may represent one aspect of a more profound thematic juxtaposition suggesting the dichotomy of inward imagination and external perception’. In D 959-ii the situation is less clearly defined: ‘inward imagination and external perception’ are presented simultaneously. See Kinderman, ‘Schubert’s Tragic Perspective’, in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln and London; University of Nebraska Press, 1986), pp. 70–5.

⁴⁵ Leon Plantinga, ‘Schubert, Social Music and Melancholy’, in *Rethinking Schubert*, p. 246.

⁴⁶ Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, p. 221.

section draws to a close, with alternating tonic and subdominant chords sounding in low register – a ghostly reference to the chordal progression that opened the whole work – the lyrical theme moves further into the distance.

Example 4.6a Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 1–8⁴⁷

Example 4.6b Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 19–27

Set apart from the ‘A’ section, the ensuing transitional passage (bars 69–84) initiates a process of topical metamorphosis. As seen in Example 4.7a, the lyrical voice gives way initially to a monophonic arabesque-like figuration, subsequently dissolving into the language of fantasia, evoking the spirit of C.P.E. Bach, an echo of the distant past intruding into the present.⁴⁸ I use the term fantasia here to refer not only to a topical configuration⁴⁹ – implied through the improvisatory right-hand

⁴⁷ The excerpts from D 959-ii are based on the G. Henle Verlag Urtext edition. Copyright (1961/89) G. Henle Verlag, Munich.

⁴⁸ The harmonic progression underpinning the fantasia resonates with C.P.E. Bach’s observation that ‘as a means of reaching the most distant keys more quickly and with agreeable suddenness, no chord is more convenient and fruitful than the seventh chord with a diminished seventh and fifth.’ Quoted in Susan Wollenberg, “‘Es lebe die Ordnung und Betriebsamkeit! Was hilft das beste Herz ohne jene!’” A New Look at Fantasia Elements in the Keyboard Sonatas of C.P.E. Bach’, *Eighteenth-Century Music* 4/1 (2007), p. 124.

⁴⁹ On the stylistic characteristics of the fantasia topic see Leonard Ratner, *Classic Music: Form, Expression, Style* (NY: Schirmer, 1980), p. 24; and Matthew Head, ‘Fantasia and Sensibility’, in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. Danuta Mirka (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014),

figurations and the profusion of diminished seventh harmonies – but also to a broader aesthetic that, as Annette Richards has demonstrated, functions as an agent of destabilization.⁵⁰ Here the restless rhythmic activity of the right-hand material disturbs the prevailing impression of stasis; and its chromatic language undermines the music’s tonal centre, creating a sense of entering the unknown. In other words, the transition introduces marked duality into the music. While at first the threshold between fantasy and lyricism is clearly delineated, the relationship between these two stylistic zones becomes increasingly antagonistic as the movement unfolds.

Example 4.7a Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 69–84

[Andantino]

pp. 259–78. Ratner argued that the fantasia topic is defined by ‘one or more of the following features – elaborate figuration, shifting harmonies, chromatic conjunct bass lines, sudden contrasts, full textures or disembodied melodic figures – in short, a sense of improvisation, and loose structural links between figures and phrases.’ Head (p. 261), critiquing Ratner’s characterization, posits a fruitful definition of the fantasia topic ‘in the more limited sense of a distinctive type of material at home in improvisatory keyboard works and recognizable in other contexts’: he notes that ‘fantasias [are] distinctive in their use of passages of generic figuration (arpeggiations, scales, broken chords) ... and typically involve abrupt, remote, and evaded modulations, achieved through chromaticism, enharmony, and the diminished seventh chord’.

⁵⁰ See Annette Richards, *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001), esp. chapter 1.

What is unleashed in the central part of the movement (Example 4.7b) is a bizarre compositional idiom.⁵¹ Its thematic profile constantly changes, with one idea merging into another, the impression of ordered discourse slipping out of reach. Derailing the confined tonal trajectory of the preceding section, the music progresses through a remote harmonic labyrinth in which clearly articulated cadential progressions are avoided – areas of C minor (bar 85), C sharp minor (bar 92), E minor (bar 94), F minor (bar 100), and F sharp minor (bar 103) are juxtaposed in quick succession. This digressive tonal language underpins an equally disruptive stylistic vocabulary, in a synchronous relationship between topical mode and harmonic structure.⁵² Improvisatory rhetoric takes centre stage,⁵³ suggesting an intertextual connection with the slow movement of the ‘Wanderer’ Fantasy in C major, D 760: the music spirals out of control as it roams the fantastical landscape.⁵⁴

⁵¹ Andreas Staier (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=jPeJHIj7ZFE>) and Mitsuko Uchida (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=AZBLXxa4T E>) are among the performers who emphasise the disturbing qualities of the movement’s central section (both accessed on 9 October 2018).

⁵² For an overview of the relationship between ‘introversive’ and ‘extroversive’ semiosis, see Kofi Agawu, *Music as Discourse: Semiotic Adventures in Romantic Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008), chapter 2.

⁵³ I borrow the concept of ‘improvisatory rhetoric’ from James Webster, ‘The Rhetoric of Improvisation in Haydn’s Keyboard Music’, in *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, ed. Tom Beghin and Sander M. Goldberg (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), p. 176. Webster notes that ‘improvisatory rhetoric encompasses ‘the impression of excessive freedom, unmotivated contrast, or insufficient coherence; seeming to “lose one’s way”; [and] the unexpected subversion of an apparently stable formal type’. Such elements are foregrounded in the central section of Schubert’s Andantino with disturbing effect.

⁵⁴ This intertextual association is suggested through the use of a shared stylistic vocabulary involving frenzied gestural figurations. On the stylistic idiom of D 760-ii see Jonathan Dunsby, ‘Adorno’s Image of Schubert’s “Wanderer” Fantasy Multiplied by Ten’, *19th-Century Music* 29/1 (2005), pp. 209–36.

Example 4.7b Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 85–122

[Andantino]

85 *mf*

92 *cresc.* *mf*

97 *cresc.*

102 *f* *cresc.* *ff*

107 *ffz* *fz*

111 *cresc.* *fz*

115 *ffz*

118 *cresc.* *ff* *ffz*

Part of the strangeness of the ‘B’ section stems from the way in which familiar compositional styles are transplanted to new contexts, detached from their usual expressive associations. If, as Marjorie Hirsch has pointed out, the imitative scale-based entries in bars 85–98 of Example 4.7b recall a style associated with eighteenth-century keyboard inventions, then the material’s disjointed phrase structure and abrupt tonal shifts serve to defamiliarize this topical frame of reference.⁵⁵ The long stretches of trills, which also are employed beyond their conventional usage, add to the music’s strangeness, functioning not in an indexical manner to highlight syntactical elements but rather as sonic oscillations that distort the musical surface. Collectively these features convey an image of topical displacement, a grotesque representation of an archaic contrapuntal style.

Just as musical topics and ornamental devices are placed in strange contexts, so too is thematic material from the ‘A’ section, thus accentuating all the more the extreme dissonance between the expressive scenes of the movement. A key element in this transformation is the pedal point figure fixated from the start on the note C sharp. Originally an element that conjures eerie stasis, it returns obsessively in the midst of the central section with a disfigured rhythmic identity, reinforcing while distorting its status as the movement’s *idée fixe*. Examples include the repeated semiquaver G sharps in bars 92–93, split between an upper and lower octave; the oscillating C sharps in bars 101–104, leading to the first highpoint in the form of a

⁵⁵ Marjorie Hirsch detects an allusion to the ‘archaic severity of a two-part invention’ but does not discuss the process of expressive distortion. Hirsch, ‘Schubert’s Reconciliation of Classical and Gothic Influences’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, p. 157. The theme of topical displacement (where the usual expressive associations of topics are distorted) has broader resonance in Schubert’s late works, with further examples found in the first movement of the G Major String Quartet, D 887, and the slow movement of the F Minor Fantasy, D 940 (both of which present a misshapen version of a French overture topic). For discussion of topical distortion see chapter 2, ‘Schubert’s Gothic Music’.

ferocious four-octave scalar descent;⁵⁶ and the demisemi-quaver pedal point that emerges in low register at bar 116, propelling the section to a dramatic climax in bar 122. Despite being closely related to the movement's overall tonic, the climactic C sharp minor chords sound remote in light of the preceding harmonic eccentricities:⁵⁷ the music reaches an expressive apex that is dissociated from its surroundings, subsequently falling away into eerie silence that hints at complete dissolution of the musical discourse.⁵⁸

As the music resurfaces, the retransitional passage shown in Example 4.8 presents further stylistic conflict, here in the form of a dramatic 'breaking of the voice'.⁵⁹ The process begins in bar 123 when a fragment of the opening theme (specifically its characteristic turn-like figure) emerges in a quasi-recitative guise. Prevented from developing into lyricism, the murmuring figure is shattered almost immediately by a chordal outburst (C sharp minor) that represents a remnant of the B section's destructive climax. Two subsequent recitative fragments are similarly silenced by chordal interruptions: the second of these in bar 128 erupts from a scalar gesture reminiscent of the central fantasy, shifting to D major in an abrupt manner characteristic of Schubert's Neapolitan-inflected intrusions.⁶⁰

⁵⁶ A remnant of this scalar passage resurfaces in bars 34–36 of the ensuing Scherzo movement; its disruptive presence continues to haunt the music's expressive trajectory. For further discussion of these intermovemental connections, see Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, chapter 8, esp. pp. 225–227.

⁵⁷ Fisk has noted that Schubert frequently dramatizes the key of C sharp minor, the 'Wanderer key', in alienating ways in his late instrumental works. An example of such alienation can be heard in the slow movement of the 'Wanderer' Fantasy, D 760, with its intrusion of C sharp minor in the context of C major (and recalling the key of the song 'Der Wanderer', D 489, whose thematic material and mood it also reflects). See Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, pp. 64–78.

⁵⁸ For a discussion of 'dissolution' (Auflösung) in relation to Schubert's late Lieder, see Blake Howe, 'The Allure of Dissolution: Bodies, Forces, and Cyclicity in Schubert's Final Mayrhofer Settings', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 62/2 (2009), pp. 271–322.

⁵⁹ See Julian Johnson, 'The Breaking of the Voice', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 8/2, special issue: 'Mahler: Centenary Commentaries on Musical Meaning' (2011), pp. 179–95.

⁶⁰ Examples elsewhere include the forceful entry of the Neapolitan (D flat) major in the opening bars of the *Quartettsatz*, D 703, and the sudden intrusion of the Neapolitan (F) minor in the slow movement of the String Quintet, D 956.

Example 4.8 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 123–158

The way in which these contrasting styles are presented in a dialectical relationship plays out the return to the ‘A’ material in notably dramatic mode.⁶¹ From a semiotic perspective, this fusion can be interpreted as an instance of topical troping, a procedure defined by Hatten as ‘the synthesis of otherwise contradictory topics that are juxtaposed in a single functional location or rhetorical moment’.⁶² The effect is extremely disturbing: the lyrical acquires a ‘broken’ identity, unable to retain wholeness. If the music appears to find solace from bar 147 onwards, emerging with

⁶¹ Wollenberg has compared this material to the scene from Gluck’s *Orfeo* where Orpheus pleads with the chorus of Furies, drawing attention to its dramatic character. Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 166.

⁶² Hatten, *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes*, pp. 68–89.

smoother contours in the parallel major, and banishing at this point the spectre of the frenzied ‘B’ material, the impression of a broken voice is not lost. In bar 152 a trill in low register fractures the musical surface once again, setting an eerie scene for the return of the ‘A’ theme.⁶³

As in D 956-ii, the final section (bars 159–202) of D 959-ii subjects the original ‘A’ material to further thematic displacement, intensifying its obsessional qualities. Example 4.9 illustrates this fractured return. Here the dynamic palette barely rises above *pianissimo*, suggesting physical suppression, while the thematic material resurfaces with a doubly fractured identity, haunted by recurrent C sharp iterations – a ‘rhythmic shudder’⁶⁴ – in the upper voice, coupled with an additional inner voice in the accompanimental figuration. After conjuring eerie stasis in the opening section, then becoming implicated in the destructive central section, the repeated C sharps appear finally in the guise of a revenant, suffusing the music with restlessness.

Example 4.9 Schubert, Piano Sonata in A major, D 959, II, bars 159–166

The musical score for Example 4.9 consists of two systems of music. The first system covers bars 159 to 162, and the second system covers bars 163 to 166. The music is in 3/8 time and A major. It is marked [Andantino] and begins at bar 159 with a pianissimo (pp) dynamic. The upper voice features a trill on C sharp, and the lower voice has a rhythmic pattern of eighth notes. The score continues to bar 166, showing the thematic material resurfacing with a doubly fractured identity.

⁶³ Comparable retransitional procedures (involving destabilization via eerie trilled notes) can be found in the first movement of the Piano Sonata in B flat Major, D 960 (bars 203–215), and the Impromptu in G flat Major, D 899/3. On the former work see Nicholas Marston, ‘Schubert’s Homecoming’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 125/2 (2000), pp. 251–55; on the latter see James Sobaskie, ‘Schubert’s Self-Elegies’, pp. 71–92.

⁶⁴ Hirsch, ‘Schubert’s reconciliation of gothic and classical influences’, p. 166.

Wollenberg has noted that the pedal point acquires on its return ‘an extra layer (almost a ghostly *Doppelgänger*)’: ‘what was originally expressed in a sustained, hypnotic rhythm’, she writes, ‘has become nervous and fragmented under the influence of the material of the “B” section, and the “A” theme effectively displaced’.⁶⁵ Indeed, beyond the pedal point, in its newly reconfigured guise the entire thematic profile strongly evokes a *Doppelgänger* of the original ‘A’ material, its multiple textural strands conveying the impression of a divided subject.⁶⁶ Despite attempting to retain its identity, the theme is ultimately displaced in bar 187 by forceful right-hand chords in triplet rhythm – material that recalls the idiom of the central section. Negating the opportunity for stylistic reconciliation or redemptive transfiguration,⁶⁷ the coda (bars 196–202) completes the process of disintegration initiated throughout the preceding sections.⁶⁸ The spread chords in the closing bars leave traces of a disembodied voice, their gradual descent into the registral depths suggesting withdrawal to a remote region of the musical landscape.

⁶⁵ Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 166.

⁶⁶ For broader commentary on the ‘ghostly’ in Schubert’s late music, see chapter 2 in this thesis.

⁶⁷ Its bleak ending differs significantly to that of the slow movement of D 960, where there is, in Eric Wen’s words, ‘an incandescent metamorphosis’ from minor to tonic major, representing a moment of transcendence. See Eric Wen, ‘Schubert’s *Wiegenlied*’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, p. 148.

⁶⁸ My reading of the closing section differs in critical orientation to two recent interpretations by Gingerich and Hirsch. For Gingerich, the final section presents ‘gestures of consolation’, offering a form of ‘gently redemptive benediction’, while in Hirsch’s view the movement presents an overarching ‘reconciliation of diverse compositional influences’, resolving the conflict between ‘classical’ and ‘gothic’ styles. Though the central disturbance does gradually subside, the way in which the main theme returns in a distorted guise undermines a sense of affirmative reconciliation between the opposing voices that speak in the movement: an image of displacement prevails. See Gingerich, *Schubert’s Beethoven Project*, pp. 308–13; and Hirsch, ‘Schubert’s reconciliation of gothic and classical influences’, pp. 149–70. For further discussion of the latter, see my review of *Schubert’s Late Music*, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (2017): <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409817000696>.

Shared Concerns

Commentators have, not surprisingly, pointed to D 959-ii as something of an anomaly in Schubert's late music. Robert Winter views its central section as 'an episode which comes as close to a nervous breakdown as anything in Schubert's output';⁶⁹ in William Kinderman's words, it 'unleashes not just turbulence and foreboding, but chaotic violence';⁷⁰ Charles Fisk characterizes the outburst as a 'disordering, sense-defying experience';⁷¹ Alfred Brendel detects a tone of 'feverish paroxysm';⁷² Elizabeth McKay argues that the idiom is 'brutal and despairing, its message cruelly expressed in harsh, ugly sounds';⁷³ Kiene Wurth hears 'a provocation of shock through the sonorous staging of unbridgeable gaps and irreconcilable frictions';⁷⁴ and Marjorie Hirsch asserts that the music 'seems caught up in an unexpected emotional maelstrom, overwhelming any sense of predictability, stability or security'.⁷⁵ What distinguishes this music is its sheer extremity: it moves beyond the remit of a temporary outburst and represents a

⁶⁹ Robert Winter, 'Schubert' in *The New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, p. 683.

⁷⁰ Kinderman, 'Wandering Archetypes in Schubert's Instrumental Music', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), p. 218.

⁷¹ Fisk, *Returning Cycles*, pp. 222–223.

⁷² Alfred Brendel, 'Schubert's Piano Sonatas, 1822–1828', in *Musical Thoughts and Afterthoughts* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1976), p. 67.

⁷³ Elizabeth McKay, *Schubert: The Piano and Dark Keys* (Tutzing: Schneider, 2009), p. 120. Among the scholars who have interpreted this music through a biographical lens, McKay argues that the 'disturbing changes of key, including frequent repetitions of unmelodic musical figurations across the entire keyboard, the harsh dynamics and relentless momentum, together suggest that, when he wrote it, the composer was in a state of hellish depression': 'the passage, climaxing in bar 122, might be used as evidence that Schubert's mental health had now, in 1828, deteriorated, in parallel with his physical health, from the milder cyclothymia from which he had almost certainly suffered over the past six years, into the far more serious full-blown manic depression'. Rather than viewing the music as a direct representation of Schubert's personal circumstances, I would suggest (as discussed below) that the strangeness of D 959-ii represents a broader aesthetic and cultural phenomenon.

⁷⁴ Kiene Brillenburg Wurth, *Musically Sublime: Indeterminacy, Infinity, Irresolvability* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2011), p. 153.

⁷⁵ Hirsch, 'Schubert's reconciliation of gothic and classical influences', in *Schubert's Late Music*, p. 152.

significant structural disruption to the movement, projecting damaging implications for the material that follows.

Not entirely *sui generis*, the strangeness of Schubert's Andantino in D 959, as well as that of the Adagio of D 956, can be traced back to the Andantes of the G major Piano Sonata, D 894, and the G major String Quartet, D 887, both of which unfold across a more expansive five-part framework, incorporating bizarre outbursts in their 'B' sections together with the destructive treatment of lyricism. Figures 4.3 and 4.4 provide an overview of their topical and formal properties.

Figure 4.3 Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, overview

Section	Tonal regions	Topical Zones
A (1–30)	D major	Lyrical style with pastoral inflections, evoking qualities of a lullaby
B (31–78)	B minor, passing through F sharp minor (bar 39), then via a Neapolitan inflection to G major (bar 40), C major (bar 59)	Disruptive fantasia with temporary tranquil episodes
A' (79–109)	D major	Embellished version of lyrical theme
B' (110–157)	D minor, passing through B flat major (bar 119)	Replays the topical scenario of the B section
A'' (158–180)	D major	Lyrical theme returns in its original guise, leading to reconciled closure

Figure 4.4 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, overview

Section	Tonal regions	Topical Zones
A (1–39)	E minor	Lamenting aria (plus march topic)
B (40–80)	<i>In flux</i> Passing through G minor (bars 43–44) and F sharp minor (bars 63–64)	Processional style Distorted French overture Fantasia
A' (81–118)	B minor	Aria returns with new textural arrangement
B' (119–166)	<i>In flux</i> Passing through D minor (bars 122–123) then D major (bar 140 onwards)	Replays topical scenario of B section, followed by fragments of the 'A' theme, notably of bars 19–20.
A'' (167–228)	E minor => E major	Lyrical theme returns with disturbed identity

Like the opening movement of D 894, the 'A' theme of its slow movement conjures peaceful tranquillity: see Example 4.10. The topical flavour evoked through the theme's gently undulating contours is that of a cantabile lullaby; its purposeful simplicity (notably in terms of its predominantly diatonic language) conveys an aura of nostalgic purity. The periodic phrase structure enhances the retrospective quality of the 'A' section, harking back to Mozartian models.⁷⁶ Such features suggest not only retrospection but also restraint: the music unfolds within confined melodic, textural, and tonal parameters.

⁷⁶ On the Schubert-Mozart nexus see Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints*, chapter 5.

Example 4.10 Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, bars 1–8⁷⁷

The musical score for Example 4.10 is presented in two systems. The first system contains bars 1 through 5, and the second system contains bars 6 through 8. The music is in G major (one sharp) and 3/8 time. The tempo is marked 'Andante'. The first system begins with a piano (*p*) dynamic marking. The notation includes treble and bass staves with various musical symbols such as slurs, accents, and dynamic markings.

The ‘B’ section, however, shatters the prevailing tranquillity, initiating a series of discursive shifts in the music’s topical trajectory (Example 4.11). At bar 31 forceful unison octaves (marked *fortissimo*) break through the surface, unleashing a series of dense chordal interjections and fantasia-like writing. With its abrupt shift to the relative minor, the start of the ‘B’ section recalls the subversive appearance of B minor in bar 10 of the first movement (shrouded there in a mysterious dominant pedal point in low register),⁷⁸ as if representing the release of tensions accumulated across the two movements.

⁷⁷ The excerpts of D 894-ii are based on the G. Henle Verlag Urtext Edition. Copyright (1971) G. Henle Verlag, Munich.

⁷⁸ Apropos the tonal shift in bar 10 of the first movement, Richard Kramer recently noted that ‘there is something otherworldly about this phrase: the deep octave F sharp that accrues a touch of its own tonicity; the quickened pace of the diction; the triple piano – *pianissimo* – in which this music is cast, as though in further retreat from the quiet of the opening music into a whispered, ghostly silence’. See Kramer, ‘Against the grain’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, p. 116.

Example 4.11 Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, bars 31–58

30 [Andante]

ff *fz* *fz* *fz* *fz*

35

38 *tr* *pp*

42

45 *ppp*

48 *ff* *ff*

In the midst of this fantastical outburst the music makes a further unexpected detour: in bar 40, following an abrupt cadence in F sharp minor, a sudden shift to the Neapolitan G major is coupled with the emergence of a sighing melody that recalls the ethos of the ‘A’ theme. There is a sense that this music lacks direct presence, conveyed in part by the reduction in dynamic gradation to *pianissimo*, followed by triple piano in bar 47. That the strange outbursts are set up against these internal counter-ideas suggests a multi-layered approach to the stylistic disjuncture found within the ‘B’ section, adding an extra level of intricacy to the topical discourse.⁷⁹

When the main theme returns in bar 79 following the first episode, it does so in an embellished form, its melodic contours now adorned with scale-based figurations doubled at the octave (Example 4.12).

⁷⁹ Wollenberg has offered revealing insights into the layered approach of the movement, noting that ‘its form is intricately constructed so that everything that happens is enclosed within larger-scale versions of itself. There are dialogues within dialogues ... and forms are reflected within forms. [...] Overlaid onto all this constructive detail is the equally intricate application of variation at many different levels of the form’. Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 292; further discussion can be found on pp. 195–200.

Example 4.12 Schubert, Piano Sonata in G major, D 894, II, bars 79–87

The newly animated surface of the A' material, an uplifting transfiguration of its original incarnation, suggests that the music is reaching new expressive heights. In the A'' section, the theme appears similarly unaffected by the events of the 'B' sections, returning here essentially to its original thematic guise, while incorporating graceful embellishment within its original expressive zone, an approach that imparts to the music the qualities of a cyclical narrative: the peaceful mood is restored as the movement closes. The sense of reconciled closure is heightened through the registral grounding of the final perfect authentic cadence in D major.

With its overarching restoration of tranquillity in the aftermath of stylistic disturbance, the slow movement of D 894 harks back to and develops an expressive paradigm that was cultivated as a key component of eighteenth-century keyboard culture. As Maynard Solomon suggested, in several of Mozart's Adagios and Andantes 'a calm, contemplative, or ecstatic condition gives way to a troubled state – is penetrated by hints of storm, dissonance, anguish, anxiety, danger – and this in

turn is succeeded by a restoration of the *status quo ante*, now suffused with and transformed by the memory of the turbulent interlude'.⁸⁰ Solomon categorized this 'adagio/andante archetype' according to two 'main modes of representation': the 'narrative' and the 'dialectical'. In the former, the contrasting scenes 'succeed each other in time'; in the latter, they 'occur at the same time, achieving the effect of simultaneity by chromaticism, rhythmic shifts, modulations, registral contrasts, and a host of other compositional procedures that imply affective juxtapositions'.⁸¹

One of the most explicit manifestations of the 'narrative archetype' can be found in the Andante of Mozart's A minor Keyboard Sonata, K 310 (composed in 1778).⁸² Within the movement's sonata-form framework, two entirely contrasting expressive worlds are placed in direct juxtaposition: the idyllic lyrical scene established in the exposition is shattered in the development by an outpouring of intense rhythmic agitation, abrupt modulations, and disruptive trills in low register – elements which evoke a fantastical style.⁸³ As is characteristic of Mozart's approach to stylistic contrast, the disruptive outburst gradually subsides, giving way to a recapitulatory space in which the opening tranquillity is reinstated. In this way, the boundaries of

⁸⁰ Maynard Solomon, *Mozart: A Life* (London: Harper Perennial, 1995), p. 187.

⁸¹ Solomon, *Mozart*, pp. 202–203.

⁸² Other examples include the slow movements of the Keyboard Sonatas in F Major, K 533, D Major, K 576, and the String Quintet in G Minor, K 516.

⁸³ For further discussion of the central section of K 310-ii, see Dean Sutcliffe, 'The Keyboard Music', in *The Cambridge Companion to Mozart*, ed. Simon P. Keefe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), p. 75; Mario R. Mercado, *The Evolution of Mozart's Pianistic Style* (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1992); Robert Levin, 'Mozart's Solo Keyboard Music', in *Eighteenth-Century Keyboard Music*, ed. Robert L. Marshall (New York: Routledge, 2003), p. 318; and William Kinderman, *Mozart's Piano Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009), chapter 4. Matthew Head offered a revealing exploration of the movement's reception history and broader aesthetic contexts in his keynote lecture entitled 'Living with Ghosts: Mozart's Sonata in A minor, K 310 and the Biographical Fallacy' at 'Analytical and Critical Reflections on Music of the Long Eighteenth Century: A Conference in Honour of Professor Susan Wollenberg' (Lady Margaret Hall, 2 September 2016).

musical beauty, though temporarily called into question, are not entirely transgressed; the movement reaches a final point of reconciliation.⁸⁴

If D 894-ii can be said to retain the essence of the Mozartian slow-movement archetype identified by Solomon – presenting disruption followed by resolution – then the Andante of D 887 offers an increasingly idiosyncratic approach that is moving closer in spirit towards the slow movements of D 956 and D 959. As Example 4.13 shows, in D 887-ii stylistic disjuncture is suggested from the outset: bold unison octaves, an authoritative call to attention, are juxtaposed with a tentative turn-like figure in the first violin, the latter assuming the role of an isolated lyrical voice. An example of *multum in parvo*, this opening gesture, which establishes a dichotomy between lyricism and drama, presents in compressed fashion the essence of the conflicts that pervade the subsequent sections of the music.⁸⁵

Taking its topical cue from the turn-like figure of bar 1, the main theme, sounding in the upper registers of the cello, projects the ethos of a lamenting aria, underpinned by a processional style. The first and second violin parts intensify the plaintive character of the music with their speech-like utterances based on elements of the main melody, notably its dotted rhythms and *Seufzer* figures. As is often the case in late Schubert, surface details provide important clues to the expressive ethos of the music. One such example occurs when the theme is revisited in bars 10–18

⁸⁴ For a critical account of Mozartian beauty, see Scott Burnham, *Mozart's Grace* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013), especially chapter 3, 'Thresholds'.

⁸⁵ In recent years, scholars have recognised the juxtaposition of drama and lyricism as a key feature of Schubert's instrumental works, broadening the Dahlhausian 'lyric-epic' paradigm. For discussion of these issues, see Anne Hyland, 'The "tightened bow": Analysing the Juxtaposition of Drama and Lyricism in Schubert's Paratactic Sonata-form Movements', in *Irish Musical Analysis: Irish Musical Studies*, Vol. 11, ed. Gareth Cox and Julian Horton (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2014); and Hyland, '"Zumsteeg Ballads without Words": Inter-Generic Dialogue and Schubert's Projection of Drama through Form', in *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert*, ed. Davies and Sobaskie (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, forthcoming 2019), pp. 205–232.

(not shown): here the sudden reduction in dynamic marking to *pianissimo* enhances the fragile aura of the discourse, creating a sense that the texture could rupture at any moment.⁸⁶

Example 4.13 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 1–9

Andante un poco moto

The musical score is presented in two systems. The first system covers bars 1 to 4, and the second system covers bars 5 to 9. The tempo is marked 'Andante un poco moto'. The score is in G major and 4/4 time. The first system shows dynamics of *fz* (fortissimo) transitioning to *p* (piano) in the first three staves, and *fz* to *p* in the fourth. The second system shows dynamics of *p* in all four staves, with *cresc.* (crescendo) markings in the first three staves and *pizz.* (pizzicato) markings in the first two staves of the second system.

In the ‘B’ section, the signs of disruption which were intimated in the opening material are profiled more explicitly in an idiom that draws on a diverse range of topical signposts. At bars 40–43 it is as if an excerpt from a different solemn

⁸⁶ For an intensive analysis of the texture of D 887-I, see Anna A. Abert, ‘Rhythmus und Klang in Schuberts Streichquintett’, in *Festschrift Karl Gustav Fellerer zum sechzigsten Geburtstag*, ed. H. Hüschen (Regensburg: Gustav Bosse Verlag, 1962), pp. 1–11.

procession has entered the proceedings (Example 4.14).⁸⁷ Marked off from its surroundings, this interpolation represents a threshold between the lyrical ‘A’ theme and the events that follow. Initiating a further *Durchbruch*, bars 43–48 introduce angular fragments whose dotted rhythmic profile and key (G minor) recall the distorted French overture topic from the opening bars of the Quartet’s first movement.⁸⁸ As the ‘B’ section unfolds, the stylistic idiom becomes increasingly strange, notably in bars 49–53 where the music makes a further digression, this time into the topical world of fantasia: quasi-improvisatory figurations are combined with extreme tonal, rhythmic, and dynamic flux. Equally subversive is the content of bars 53–60. Here all traces of melody are undermined by a tremolo-based texture that draws attention to the instability of the surface, recalling bars 15–24 of the Quartet’s first movement.⁸⁹ In the second half of the ‘B’ section, each of these three topical zones is revisited, creating the impression of the music looping back on itself: the processional style resurfaces (bars 60–63), followed by snippets of the distorted French overture now in F sharp minor (bars 63–68), leading to snatches of fantasia (bars 69–72). These changes in topical mode undermine the music’s linearity, placing emphasis instead on digressions and intrusions from elsewhere.⁹⁰

⁸⁷ Wollenberg has noted that ‘with its march topic and repeated chords, the transition in D 887-ii is one among the many “*Winterreise* moments” in Schubert’s instrumental works; its measured tread evokes “Gute Nacht” (D 911/1). Among Schubert’s transitions in the instrumental music, it is perhaps in the episodic transitions of the slow movements (and single piano pieces) that the song connection most readily presents itself’. Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 76.

⁸⁸ For discussion of the first movement’s evocation of the French overture topic, see Walter Frisch, “‘You Must Remember This’: Memory and Structure in Schubert’s String Quartet in G Major, D. 887”, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 582–603.

⁸⁹ On the textural effects of the first movement, see Scott Burnham, ‘Beethoven, Schubert and the movement of phenomena’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 38–41.

⁹⁰ The jabbing figures in the first violin at a disconnected angle to the harmony from bar 53 onwards have been seen as bordering on atonal thinking: see for example Maurice J. E. Brown, *Schubert: A Critical Biography* (London: Macmillan, 1958), pp. 271–4.

Example 4.14 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 40–62

[Andante un poco moto]

40

pp *dim.* *ff*

44

fz *fz* *fz*

48

ff *f* *fz* *ff* *ff* *ff*

3 3 6 6 6 6

51

Musical score for measures 51-52. The score is in G major and 3/4 time. It features four staves: Treble, Treble, Bass, and Bass. Measures 51-52 are marked with a dynamic of *fz* (forzando). The first staff has a melodic line with a slur and a fermata. The second and third staves have chords with triplets (marked '3') and sixteenth-note runs (marked '6'). The fourth staff has a bass line with a slur and a fermata.

53

Musical score for measures 53-57. The score is in G major and 3/4 time. It features four staves: Treble, Treble, Bass, and Bass. The dynamics alternate between *p* (piano) and *ff* (fortissimo) forzando. The first staff has a melodic line with a slur and a fermata. The second and third staves have chords with triplets (marked '3') and sixteenth-note runs (marked '6'). The fourth staff has a bass line with a slur and a fermata.

58

Musical score for measures 58-62. The score is in G major and 3/4 time. It features four staves: Treble, Treble, Bass, and Bass. The dynamics are *ff* (fortissimo) for measures 58-59, *decresc.* (decrescendo) for measures 60-61, and *pp* (pianissimo) for measures 62-63. The first staff has a melodic line with a slur and a fermata. The second and third staves have chords with triplets (marked '3') and sixteenth-note runs (marked '6'). The fourth staff has a bass line with a slur and a fermata.

Whereas the slow movement of D 894 shows no explicit signs of the varied reprise of the main theme bearing the influence of the ‘B’ material, in the A’’ section of D 887-ii (see Figure 4.4) traces of a disturbed thematic return can be detected, foreshadowing those found in the closing sections of D 956-ii and D 959-ii. In particular, the theme in the cello part enters into a new textural relationship with the surrounding voices (Example 4.15); the rhythmic diminution of the countermelody in the first and second violin parts creates restlessness that was not present during the original manifestation of the material (cf. Example 4.13). Intensifying this effect are the repeated triplet figures in the viola’s accompanimental pedal point, a remnant of the rhythmic pattern in bars 49 and 51. Such features create a dialectical relationship between the ‘A’ and ‘B’ material, whereby elements of the latter shape the new character of the former – yet in this context (unlike D 956-ii and D 959-ii) not preventing the music from achieving reconciled closure. In the closing bars of the movement, shown in Example 4.16, the music’s unexpected shift to the parallel major temporarily resolves the minor-major conflict that has permeated the work from the outset, closing in a realm that stands apart from the preceding conflicts.⁹¹

⁹¹ For revealing commentary on the tonal conflicts embodied in D 887, see Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, chapter 2, ‘His Favourite Device: Schubert’s Major–Minor Usage and its Nuances’.

Example 4.15 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 166–174

[Andante un poco moto]

166

pp

pp

pp

pp

169

cresc.

cresc.

cresc.

172

dim.

p dolce

dim.

dim.

p

dim.

dim.

Example 4.16 Schubert, String Quartet in G major, D 887, II, bars 223–228

[Andante un poco moto] **ritard.**

223 *decresc.* *pp* *cresc.*

decresc. *pp* *cresc.*

decresc. *pp* *cresc.*

decresc. *pp* *cresc.*

226 *p* *pp*

p *pp*

p *pp*

p *pp*

The comparative discussion of the Andantes of D 894 and D 887 offered here provides a locus in which to trace the development of stylistic disjuncture in Schubert's late slow movements. While D 894-ii looks back to classical models of dramatic conflict and resolution, containing its strangeness as temporary episodes, D 887-ii parts company with such influences, presenting uncontained outbursts together with a disturbed reprise. There is a sense that these movements paved the way for the Adagio of D 956 and Andantino of D 959, establishing expressive imagery that is taken to the heights of strangeness in the later works.

Examining D 956-ii and D 959-ii within the ‘hermeneutical theatre’ raises questions about their broader aesthetic concerns. Put simply, how might we contextualize their shared strangeness? In a welcome critique of Arthur Hutchings’s view that Schubert ‘gives us nothing but beauty’,⁹² Wollenberg suggested that:

there are numerous instrumental movements in Schubert’s oeuvre where beauty is allowed to flourish relatively untroubled: the slow movement of the B flat Piano Trio, D 898, is an example. Elsewhere, though, beauty is created alongside and in relation to those darker moods that colour it indelibly, thereby lending it an even greater profundity.⁹³

To Wollenberg’s observations I would add that the Adagio of D 956 and the Andantino of D 959 can be viewed as movements that shatter the boundaries of beauty entirely,⁹⁴ entering the distorted world of the grotesque, and exploring new contexts for musical meaning.

⁹² Framing his observation in terms of a comparison, Hutchings observed that ‘whereas with Beethoven the quartet reached a mystical world, at once the farthest and the innermost region attained by any musician, Schubert gives us nothing but beauty’. See A.J.B. Hutchings, *Schubert* (London: J.M. Dent, 1945/repr. 1956), p. 110. For a critical reappraisal of Schubertian beauty – a topic that remains ripe for further hermeneutic exploration – see among others Scott Burnham ‘Schubert and the Sound of Memory’, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 655–63.

⁹³ Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, 189. Similarly, Kinderman has noted that ‘the unleashing of disruptive and apparently chaotic forces protects Schubert from any suspicion of overindulgence in sensuous beauty’. See Kinderman, ‘Wandering Archetypes in Schubert’s Instrumental Music’, *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), p. 218.

⁹⁴ Such an approach distinguishes Schubert’s late works from the music of his predecessors, especially Mozart, where dramatic contrasts and disruptions (arising primarily through topical juxtaposition) are only temporary, ultimately giving way to reconciliation.

Grotesquerie

*Like a minotaur, a mermaid, or a cyborg, the grotesque is not quite one thing or the other, and this boundary creature roams the borderlands of all that is familiar and conventional.*⁹⁵

The grotesque occupied a central position in late eighteenth and early nineteenth-century aesthetics.⁹⁶ Among the influential German treatises on the grotesque are Justus Möser's *Harlekin, oder Vertheidigung des Groteske-Komischen* (1761); Karl Flögel's *Geschichte des Groteske-komischen* (1788); C. L. Stieglitz's *Über den Gebrauch des Grotesken und Arabesken* (1790); and J. D. Fiorillo's *Über die Groteske* (1791).⁹⁷ Whereas Möser and Flögel emphasized the comical aspects of the grotesque, Fiorillo identified its darker, subversive qualities, associating it with feelings of 'Schrecken' (terror) and 'Grausen' (horror). For Fiorillo, Henry Fuseli's paintings – in which he detected 'eine Neigung zu Grausen erregenden Gegenständen' (a tendency towards horror-inducing objects) – epitomized the grotesque style: such an approach is especially apparent in Fuseli's 'The Nightmare' (shown in Figure 4.5 and discussed below).⁹⁸ Challenging previous views of the grotesque as merely a branch of humour, Fiorillo helped usher in a multilayered understanding of this aesthetic category that takes into consideration its profoundly

⁹⁵ Frances S. Connelly, *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture: The Image at Play* (Cambridge, 2012), p. 1.

⁹⁶ The term 'grotesque' derives from the Italian word *grotta* (meaning 'cave') and was originally used to describe an ornamental style of painting discovered during fifteenth-century excavations in Rome and other parts of Italy. Such paintings tend to be unnatural in shape and appearance, containing incongruous fusions of plants, animals, and human figures. For a general overview of the history of the grotesque, see Justin D. Edwards and Rune Graulund, *Grotesque: The New Critical Idiom* (New York: Routledge, 2013); and Karlheinz Barack et al. (eds), 'Grotesk', in *Ästhetische Grundbegriffe: Band 2 Dekadent bis Grotesk* (Stuttgart: J.B. Metzler Verlag, 2001), pp. 880–898.

⁹⁷ On the development of the grotesque in nineteenth-century French discourse (a topic beyond the scope of the present study) see Francesca Brittan, 'Berlioz, Hoffmann, and the French *Fantastique* in French Romanticism' (PhD dissertation, Cornell University, 2007), chapter 3; and Brittan, *Music and Fantasy in the Age of Berlioz* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017).

⁹⁸ Quoted in Frederick Burwick, *The Haunted Eye: Perception and the Grotesque in English and German Romanticism* (Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag, 1987), p. 70, translation mine.

disturbing implications.

Further insights into the nature of the grotesque can be gleaned from Friedrich Schlegel's writings, as demonstrated in the following excerpts from the 1798

Athenaeum:

Just as the naïve plays with the contradictions between theory and practice, so the grotesque plays with the wonderful permutations of form and matter, loves the illusion of the random and the strange and, as it were, coquettes with infinite arbitrariness.⁹⁹

If every purely arbitrary or purely random connection of form and matter is grotesque, then philosophy has its grotesques as well as poetry.¹⁰⁰

The French Revolution may be regarded as the greatest and most remarkable phenomenon in the history of states, as an almost universal earthquake, an immeasurable flood in the political world; or as a proto-type of revolutions, as the absolute revolution per se. These are the usual points of view. But one can also see it as the center and apex of the French national character, where all its paradoxes are thrust together; as the most frightful grotesque of the age, where the most profound prejudices and their most brutal punishments are mixed up in a fearful chaos and woven as bizarrely as possible into a monstrous human tragicomedy.¹⁰¹

What emerges from Schlegel's fragments is a view that the grotesque is an intrinsically paradoxical mode of expression premised on the fusion of stylistic opposites and an underlying incompatibility between form and content.¹⁰² It is above all an aesthetic category that transgresses the borders of everything that is familiar, slipping into the territory of the frightful and the monstrous.

Like Schlegel, E.T.A. Hoffmann contributed imaginative insights to the

⁹⁹ Fragment 305, quoted in Friedrich Schlegel, *Philosophical Fragments*, trans. Peter Firchow (Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press, 1991), p. 60. For broader discussion of Schlegel's aesthetic theory, see Frederick Burwick, 'The Grotesque in the Romantic Movement', in *European Romanticism: Literary Cross-currents, Modes, and Models*, ed. Gerhart Hoffmeister (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1989), pp. 45–46; Burwick, 'Grotesque "Bilderwitz": Friedrich Schlegel', in *The Haunted Eye*, 72–92; and in connection with music, see John Daverio, 'Schumann's "Im Legendenton" and Friedrich Schlegel's "Arabeske"', *19th-Century Music* 11/2 (1987), pp. 150–63.

¹⁰⁰ Fragment 389, quoted in *Philosophical Fragments*, trans. Firchow, p. 79.

¹⁰¹ Fragment 424, quoted in *ibid.*, p. 86.

¹⁰² Jean Paul's discussion of 'die vernichtende Idee des Humors' ('the annihilating idea of humour') in his *Vorschule der Ästhetik* (1804) resonates with Schlegel's view of the grotesque as a 'monstrous human tragicomedy': here he defines a kind of humour that is dark, terrible, painful and awe-inspiring – a product of 'inverse sublimity'. See Kathleen Wheeler (ed.), 'Jean Paul Richter, From School for Aesthetics', in *German Aesthetic and Literary Criticism: The Romantic Ironists and Goethe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), pp. 162–198.

discourse surrounding the grotesque. One such example can be found in his short essay on the drawings and etchings of Jacques Callot:

Why can I not see enough of your strange and fantastic pages, most daring of artists! Why can I not get your figures, often suggested merely by a few bold strokes, out of my mind? When I look long at your compositions which overflow with the most heterogeneous elements, then the thousands of figures come to life, and – often from the furthest background, where at first they are hard even to descry – each of them strides powerfully forth in the most natural colour.

No master has known so well as Callot how to assemble together in a small space such an abundance of motifs, emerging beside each other, even within each other, yet without confusing the eye, so that individual elements are seen as such, but still blend with the whole. ... His art really goes beyond the rules of painting; or rather his drawings are but reflexes of all the fantastic apparitions called up by the magic of his exuberant fantasy. ... Callot's grotesque forms, created out of animal and man, reveal to the serious, deeper-seeing observer all the hidden meanings that lie beneath the cloak of absurdity.¹⁰³

Here Hoffmann declared unrestrained enthusiasm for the strange, intricately conceived style of Callot's work, establishing a connection between grotesquerie and 'exuberant fantasy', a realm in which the defiance of 'rules' takes centre stage. The 'hidden meanings' of his artwork, like all grotesque images and objects, demand interpretation, overwhelming the eye with a profusion of strange figures and unrelated ideas.

Grotesque imagery of the kind Hoffmann admired in Callot's work assumes an equally prominent position in his own novels and short tales.¹⁰⁴ As an example, the bizarre dream of the main character, Elis Fröbom, in Hoffmann's celebrated tale *The Mines of Falun* (*Die Bergwerke zu Falun*, 1819) requires quoting at some length to convey its effect:

Tired and weary as he was, he had scarcely stretched out on his bed when a dream touched him with her wings. It seemed to him that he was drifting in a beautiful ship in

¹⁰³ See *E.T.A. Hoffmann's Musical Writings: Kreisleriana, The Poet and the Composer, Music Criticism*, ed. David Charlton and trans. Martyn Clarke (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989), pp. 76–78.

¹⁰⁴ See especially Hoffmann's *Fantasiestücke in Callots Manier* (1814), *Die Elixiere des Teufels* (1815), and his *Nachtstücke* (1817) which includes the eccentric *Der Sandmann*.

full sail on a crystal clear sea, a heaven of dark clouds arching above him. But when he looked down into the waves, he realized that what he had thought was the sea was a solid, transparent, sparkling mass in the shimmer of which the whole ship dissolved in a marvellous manner so that he was standing on a crystal floor; and above him he saw a dome of darkly gleaming minerals, which he had at first thought were clouds in the sky. Driven by an unknown power, he strode on; but at that moment everything around him began to stir and, like curling waves, there shot up all around him marvellous flowers and plants of glittering metal, the blossoms and leaves of which curled upward from the Depths and became intertwined in a most pleasing manner. The ground was so transparent that Elis could clearly see the roots of the plants; but when he looked down deeper and deeper, he saw in the depths innumerable charming female forms who held each other locked in embrace with white, gleaming arms, and from their hearts there sprouted forth those roots and flowers and plants; when the maidens smiled, sweet harmony echoed through the dome, and the wondrous metal flowers thrust ever higher and became ever more gay. An indescribable feeling of pain and rapture seized the youth. A world of love, of desire, and of passionate longing expanded within him. “Down – down to you!” he cried, and he threw himself down with outspread arms onto the crystal ground. But it dissolved beneath him and he hovered in the shimmering air.¹⁰⁵

In this excerpt, Hoffmann invites the reader to enter what Holly Watkins has called a ‘grotesque underworld’.¹⁰⁶ At the core of this subterranean space lies a strangely distorted reality: its fusion of the animate (maidens) and inanimate (plants and flowers) creates a sense of hybridity that defies all logical explanation.

Awkward, ambiguous, strange and subversive, the grotesque resists neat theoretical categorization. Wolfgang Kayser, in his influential monograph on the grotesque, captured these qualities as follows:

[The grotesque] is not only something playfully gay and carelessly fantastic, but also something ominous and sinister in the face of a world totally different from the familiar one – a world in which the realm of inanimate things is no longer separate from those of plants, animals, and human beings, and where the laws of statics, symmetry, and proportion are no longer valid.¹⁰⁷

¹⁰⁵ *Tales of E.T.A. Hoffmann*, ed. and trans. Leonard J. Kent and Elizabeth C. Knight, p. 155.

¹⁰⁶ Holly Watkins, *Metaphors of Depth in German Musical Thought: From E.T.A. Hoffmann to Arnold Schoenberg* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), p. 48.

¹⁰⁷ Wolfgang Kayser, *The Grottesque in Art and Literature*, trans. Ulrich Weisstein (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957), p. 21.

In light of these elements, Kayser defined the grotesque as a ‘structure of estrangement’.¹⁰⁸ ‘Suddenness and surprise’, he argued, ‘are essential elements in this estrangement’: ‘the familiar and commonplace must be suddenly subverted or undermined by the uncanny or alien’.¹⁰⁹

In Geoffrey Harpham’s theoretical formulation, ‘the perception of the grotesque is never a fixed or stable thing, but always a process, a progression’:¹¹⁰

All images split, assuming incongruous double functions, and everything is thrown into doubt. These designs are called grotesques not only because of certain formal characteristics, but because they throw the reader/viewer into that intertextual “interval”. [...] The interval of the grotesque is the one in which, although we have recognized a number of different forms in the object, we have not yet developed a clear sense of the dominant principle that defines it and organizes its various elements. [...] Looking for unity between center and margin, the interpreter must, whether he finds it or not, pass through the grotesque.¹¹¹

From this perspective, the grotesque represents a dynamic experience that demands visceral engagement; it actively draws the interpreter into its contradictory world, as is the case in the excerpt quoted above from Hoffmann’s ‘The Mines of Falun’.

The art historian Frances Connelly has offered further perspectives on the dynamic qualities of the grotesque. A key feature of its ontology, she argues, is the sense of its being constantly in ‘flux’: ‘it always represents a state of change, breaking open what we know and merging it with the unknown’.¹¹² In this respect, the grotesque behaves in the manner of a ‘boundary creature, existing only in the tension between distinct realities’, or as a ‘catalyst’ that opens ‘the boundaries of two disparate entities, and [sets] a reaction in motion’.¹¹³ It forces the interpreter into

¹⁰⁸ Kayser, *The Grottesque in Art and Literature*, p. 21.

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid.*

¹¹⁰ Geoffrey Harpham, *On the Grottesque*, p. 17.

¹¹¹ *Ibid.*, pp. 17–19.

¹¹² Frances Connelly, *The Grottesque in Western Art and Culture*, p. 5.

¹¹³ *Ibid.*, p. 8.

‘an in-between, unresolved space’,¹¹⁴ eliciting ‘contradictory and conflicting’ responses.

Connelly identifies three modes of grotesquerie: the ‘improvisational’, which ‘interrogates the forms and conventions of visual and literary representation, testing the limits of art’; the ‘subversive’, which ‘puts social roles and hierarchies as well as cultural conventions into play, challenging the limits of propriety’; and the ‘traumatic’, which ‘threatens the limits of our identity, rupturing the boundaries between self and oblivion through the monstrous, the uncanny, or the abject’.¹¹⁵ Central to all manifestations of the grotesque, Connelly suggests, is the notion of ‘the image at play’: ‘whatever the rules or conventions, the grotesque subverts them, creating a *Spielraum* full of conflict and new possibilities’.¹¹⁶

In musicological discourse, the grotesque has served as a category for contextualizing strangeness, with examples ranging from eighteenth-century music to twentieth-century repertoire.¹¹⁷ Esti Sheinberg, in her theoretical study of

¹¹⁴ Ibid., p. 12.

¹¹⁵ Ibid., p. 14.

¹¹⁶ Ibid., pp. 14–15.

¹¹⁷ Studies of musical grotesquerie include: Martin Čurda, “‘From the Monkey Mountains: The Body, the Grotesque and Carnival in the Music of Pavel Haas’”, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 141/1 (2016), pp. 61–112; Robert Hatten, ‘Interpreting the Grotesque in Music’, *Semiotics* (2011), pp. 419–426; Yayoi Uno Everett, ‘Signification of Parody and the Grotesque in György Ligeti’s Le Grand Macabre’, *Music Theory Spectrum* 31/1 (2009), pp. 26–56; Julie Brown, *Bartók and the Grotesque: Studies in Modernity, the Body and Contradiction in Music* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2007); Elizabeth Le Guin, “‘One Says That One Weeps, but One Does Not Weep’”: *Sensible, Grotesque, and Mechanical Embodiments in Boccherini’s Chamber Music*’, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 55/2 (2002), pp. 207–54; Annette Richards, ‘Haydn’s London Trios and the Rhetoric of the Grotesque’, in *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, ed. Tom Beghin and Sander M. Goldberg (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), pp. 251–80; Esti Sheinberg, *Irony, Satire, Parody and the Grotesque in the Music of Shostakovich: A Theory of Musical Incongruities* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2000); Jessie Fillerup, ‘Purloined Poetics: The Grotesque in the Music of Maurice Ravel’ (PhD dissertation, University of Kansas, 2009); and Patricia Pinson, ‘The Shattered

incongruity in the music of Shostakovich, explores the grotesque (evoked through such features as timbral extremity, excessive trills, extreme rhythmic proportions, and topical references to *danse macabre*) in relation to satire, irony, and parody.¹¹⁸ Whereas irony involves negation, she argues, the grotesque is ‘the result of an additive process, in which all meanings are accepted and accumulated’; ‘the result of a systematic admission of contradictions’.¹¹⁹ She notes that the ‘grotesque’s imports are always exaggerated’: ‘a grotesque object is thus never comic, but rather ludicrous, never just unpleasant, but rather repellent or horrifying’.¹²⁰

Julie Brown has identified comparable instances of grotesque contradictions and exaggerations in Bartók’s music, situating such effects within the broader context of the composer’s modernist tendencies.¹²¹ Brown’s typology of the grotesque includes the conflation of the comic and the horrific; the use of ‘rough sonorities’ that draw attention to the ‘physical side of high art music’; rhythmically excessive ‘barbaro’ styles; unidiomatic instrumental writing; and bizarre rhythms, phrasing, and dynamics. Examples of such techniques can be found in works ranging from *The Wooden Prince*, through *The Miraculous Mandarin*, to the Third String Quartet, a piece Brown described as ‘avowedly fractured in stylistic and formal terms’.¹²²

Among the accounts of musical grotesquerie that address a composer closer in time to Schubert is Annette Richards’s reading of the Allegretto from Haydn’s E major Piano Trio, Hob. XV: 28 (1787). As Richards suggests, ‘haunting and self-

Frame: A Study of the Grotesque in Nineteenth Century Literature and Music’ (PhD dissertation, Ohio University, 1971).

¹¹⁸ Esti Sheinberg, *Irony, Satire, Parody and the Grotesque in the Music of Shostakovich: A Theory of Musical Incongruities* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2000).

¹¹⁹ Sheinberg, *A Theory of Incongruities*, p. 209.

¹²⁰ *Ibid.*

¹²¹ Julie Brown, *Bartók and the Grotesque*.

¹²² *Ibid.*, p. 139.

consciously odd, this movement has a numinous quality to it, yet in terms of late eighteenth-century aesthetics it is far from beautiful – too odd, too highly decorated, too lacking in formal regularity, too ambiguous – in a word, too baroque'.¹²³ Richards presents a compelling view that the grotesque 'allows us to reconfigure the seeming strangeness of the movement', while also explaining the 'troubled modern reception (or neglect) of Haydn's late trios' more generally.¹²⁴ These pieces, she observes, are 'full of odd moments, strange outbursts, changes of direction, and elaborate performative gestures', displaying 'the excesses of the imaginary that mark the grotesque'.¹²⁵

Elizabeth Le Guin has identified timbral extremity and strange sonorities as markers of grotesquerie in Boccherini's instrumental music, notably the Sonata for cello and basso in B flat, G 565.¹²⁶ Le Guin concludes that 'such moments are not common in Boccherini's work, but they are memorable: they exceed any reasonable expectation. They also exceed the capacity of the instrument to sound beautiful, and in this respect, they answer to a Goya-like concept of the grotesque, in which beauty is deliberately perverted as an aesthetic standard'.¹²⁷

Together with the music of the composers referred to above, Schubert's late works invite the application of the grotesque as a lens through which to interpret their strangeness and ruptured stylistic boundaries. Although it would be a stretch to suggest that Schubert was well versed in contemporaneous theories of the grotesque,

¹²³ Annette Richards, 'Haydn's London Trios and the Rhetoric of the Grotesque', p. 252.

¹²⁴ Ibid., p. 276.

¹²⁵ Ibid., p. 277.

¹²⁶ Elizabeth Le Guin, 'Sensible, Grotesque, and Mechanical Embodiments in Boccherini's Chamber Music', p. 239; see also Le Guin, *Boccherini's Body: An Essay in Carnal Musicology* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2006).

¹²⁷ Le Guin, 'Sensible, Grotesque, and Mechanical Embodiments', p. 239.

there is nevertheless a sense that he was aware of the expressive potential of its characteristic stylistic hybridity.¹²⁸ In a diary entry dated 16 June 1816, while under the influence of his teacher Antonio Salieri, Schubert wrote:

It must be beautiful and refreshing for an artist [Salieri] to see all his students gathered around ... and to hear in [their] compositions the expression of mere nature, free from all the bizarre elements which are common among composers nowadays and owed almost entirely to one of our greatest German artists [Beethoven]; that eccentricity which joins and confuses the tragic with the comic, the agreeable with the repulsive, heroism with howlings and the holiest with harlequinades, without distinction, so as to goad people to madness.¹²⁹

In Schubert's final years, the strange fusions that he decried there gradually become absorbed into his compositional idiom, assuming a particularly prominent position in the Adagio of D 956 and Andantino of D 959. Besides their shared eccentricity, these movements evoke the grotesque in distinct and revealing ways: distortion and contradiction are foregrounded as key features of their identity. If Haydn's grotesquerie is characteristically fused with humorous elements,¹³⁰ the Schubertian grotesque unleashes its more sinister qualities, as discussed in what follows.

The grotesquerie of the Quintet's slow movement revolves around the fusion of dreams and nightmares. While such contrasts feature prominently in Schubert's

¹²⁸ It is not improbable that Schubert would have encountered notions of the grotesque (as part of a broader aesthetic *Zeitgeist*) within his circle of poets and visual artists. For wider discussion of Schubert's cultural milieu, see David Gramit, 'The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert's Circle: Their Development and Their Influence on His Music' (PhD dissertation, Duke University, 1987); John Gingerich, "'Those of us who found our life in art': The Second-Generation Romanticism of the Schubert-Schober Circle, 1820–25", in *Franz Schubert and his World*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs and Morten Solvik (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press 2014), pp. 67–114; and Raymond Erickson (ed.), *Schubert's Vienna* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997).

¹²⁹ Otto Erich Deutsch (ed.), trans. Eric Blom, *The Schubert Reader: A Life of Franz Schubert in Letters and Documents* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1949), p. 64. Marjorie Hirsch and William Kinderman have used this diary entry as a point of departure for exploring Schubert's changing attitude towards the music of Beethoven in his final years. See Hirsch, 'Schubert's reconciliation of gothic and classical influences', in *Schubert's Late Music*, pp. 167–168; and William Kinderman, 'Franz Schubert's "New Style" and the Legacy of Beethoven', in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 43–44.

¹³⁰ On the humorous dimension of Haydn's music see Richards, 'Haydn's London Trios'; Scott Burnham, 'Haydn's Humor', in *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn*, ed. Caryl Clark (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. 59–76; and Gretchen Wheelock, *Haydn's Ingenious Jestings with Art: Contexts of Musical Wit and Humor* (New York: Schirmer, 1992).

late oeuvre,¹³¹ the trope reaches a new level of extremity in D 956-ii, involving blurred ontological boundaries between the two worlds. In defining the grotesque, Connelly has suggested that its ‘deeper workings’ are revealed ‘through its changes, in the interstitial moments when the familiar turns strange or shifts unexpectedly into something else’.¹³² The trilled unisons in bar 28 provide compelling musical evidence of such a view. Appearing both embodied and disembodied, the gesture distorts the beauty of the opening section with an outburst of harsh sonority, giving the impression, as Thomas Werner put it, of ‘an organized chaos on the verge of catastrophe’.¹³³ In this moment, two opposing expressive worlds collide unexpectedly, the dreamworld becoming directly entangled with nightmarish music that gazes into a void. This passage brings to mind Henry Fuseli’s ‘The Nightmare’ (Figure 4.5).¹³⁴ Like Schubert’s Adagio, this painting fuses a dreamworld with the content of a nightmare, inducing feelings of horror tinged with a sense of aesthetic pleasure, in a manner that evokes the grotesque.¹³⁵

¹³¹ A notable example among the vocal works is ‘Frühlingstraum’ from *Winterreise*, D 911/11, whose musical setting includes stylistic contrasts as striking as the psychological twists and turns embedded in the poetic text: here the initial dreamworld, depicted in a lyrical, otherworldly dancelike idiom, is harshly juxtaposed with a fragmentary style of music in the minor mode when the protagonist’s thoughts are jerked back to reality. As Susan Youens put it, “‘Frühlingstraum’” is a study in contrasts and disjunctions, the silences between sections dramatizing the shocking changes of tempo, voicing, motion, tonal direction, and mood’. See Youens, *Retracing a Winter’s Journey*, p. 211. Susan Wollenberg (in *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, pp. 171–4) has suggested that ‘Frühlingstraum’ offers a poetic context in which to understand the expressive content of the late instrumental movements cast in similarly episodic form.

¹³² Connelly, *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture*, p. 3.

¹³³ Werner Thomas quoted in Kinderman, ‘Wandering Archetypes’, p. 211; see also Thomas “‘Die fast verlorene Zeit: Zum Adagio Schuberts Streichquintett in C’”, in *Schubert-Studien* (Frankfurt, 1990), pp. 137–58.

¹³⁴ For contextual readings of Fuseli’s ‘The Nightmare’, see Martin Myron, ‘Henry Fuseli and Gothic Spectacle’, *Huntington Library Quarterly* 70/2 (2007), pp. 289–310; and John Moffitt, ‘A Pictorial Counterpart to “Gothick” Literature: Fuseli’s The Nightmare’, *Mosaic: An Interdisciplinary Critical Journal* 25/1, special issue: Haunting II (March 2002), pp. 173–196.

¹³⁵ I am not the first to draw parallels between Schubert’s late works and the visual arts. Scott Burnham has suggested that there is an affinity between the opening of D 956-ii and Caspar David Friedrich’s *The Monk by the Sea*, both of which ‘possess the bearing of a vision’, while William Kinderman detects a resemblance between the slow movement of D 959 and Goya’s *Third of May*

Figure 4.5 Henry Fuseli, ‘The Nightmare’ (1781)¹³⁶



In contrast to D 956-ii, which moves abruptly between the dreamlike and the nightmarish, the Andantino of D 959 creates the effect of being gradually drawn into a ‘structure of estrangement’.¹³⁷ Central to this process is the way in which the transitional passage (Example 4.7a) opens up a gap in the narrative where the juncture between lyricism and fantasy is slowly ruptured; the familiar is rendered unfamiliar. That the music of the transition bears no topical resemblance to its surrounding context serves to enhance its alienating effect.

(1808). See Burnham, ‘Thresholds Between, Worlds Apart’, p. 156; and Kinderman, ‘Wandering Archetypes in Schubert’s Instrumental Music’, p. 219.

¹³⁶ Accessed on 26 February 2018 via Bridgeman Images (bridgemaneducation.com). I am grateful to Silvija Aurylaite for her assistance.

¹³⁷ Quoted from Kayser, *The Grotesque in Art and Literature*, p. 21.

If, as Burnham suggests, Schubert's late works convey 'subjectivized spaces', then the central section of D 959-ii profiles a grotesque space replete with contradictory features.¹³⁸ There is a powerful sense of this music being in flux. Robert Schumann's observation that 'apart from Schubert's music, none exists that is so psychologically unusual in the course and connection of its ideas' finds particular resonance here.¹³⁹ In a manner akin to the prose style of Jean Paul and Friedrich Schlegel,¹⁴⁰ where linear narratives are disrupted by plot twists and extended parentheses,¹⁴¹ the music in the 'B' section of D 959-ii digresses from one region to another, problematizing the distinction between what is central and what is marginal: all frames of topical reference are subjected to defamiliarization. Its frenzied passagework, dense chordal interjections, and long stretches of right-hand trills work together to distort the discourse, producing incessant sound that escalates from *mf* in bar 85 to *ffz* at the climax in bar 122.

Despite their initially contrasting approaches to stylistic disjuncture, these slow movements in D 956 and D 959 overlap in a number of ways, entering an intertextual

¹³⁸ Burnham briefly addresses the spatial qualities of Schubert's instrumental music in 'Landscape as Music, Landscape as Truth', pp. 31–41, esp. p. 36. The present discussion is intended to expand the framework for discussing Schubertian spaces, exploring those that emphasize disturbing qualities.

¹³⁹ Quoted from John Daverio, *Crossing Paths: Schubert, Schumann, and Brahms* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002), p. 14.

¹⁴⁰ For broader context, we might recall here Schumann's evocative accounts of the literary implications of Schubert's music. An aphoristic diary entry from August 1828 is especially revealing: 'Schubert expresses Jean Paul, Novalis, and E.T.A. Hoffmann in tones'. In the following year, Schumann disclosed in a letter to his piano teacher Friedrich Wieck that 'when I play Schubert, it's as if I were reading a novel composed by Jean Paul'. The excerpts are quoted from Daverio, *Crossing Paths*, p. 14. Schumann reiterated the parallel between Schubert and Jean Paul in his review of the 'Great' C major Symphony, D 944. 'Consider also the heavenly length of the symphony, like a thick novel in four volumes by Jean Paul, who was also incapable of coming to an end, and to be sure for the best of reasons: to allow the reader, at a later point, to recreate it for himself'. Quoted from Daverio, *Crossing Paths*, p. 17; the original text is provided in Note 26 on p. 255. The full review appears in the *Neue Zeitschrift für Musik* 12 (1840), p. 82.

¹⁴¹ For a useful overview of the literary style of Jean Paul and Friedrich Schlegel, see Anthony Phelan, 'Prose Fiction of the German Romantics', in *The Cambridge Companion to German Romanticism*, ed. Nicholas Saul (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), pp. 41–66.

world of grotesquerie. Among the defining features of the grotesque, as Connelly notes, is the way it ‘reaches down deep into visceral experience: it counters the disembodied abstraction of the sublime with a power that is felt and expressed through the body’.¹⁴² The ‘B’ sections of D 956-ii and D 959-ii behave in such a manner, giving voice to monstrous music that demands intense visceral engagement – music that exhibits registral, dynamic, and timbral extremity.

A further point of intersection between these movements is formed by the disturbed thematic reprises in their A’ sections, both of which present eerie *Doppelgängers* of the original material, overlapping the boundaries between the familiar and the unfamiliar, the past and the present. In his study of the phenomenon of double vision in German literary culture, Andrew Webber observes perceptively that ‘the *Doppelgänger* returns compulsively both within its host texts and intertextually from one to the other. Its performances repeat both its host subject and its own previous appearances’.¹⁴³ Viewed within this intertextual field, the *Doppelgänger* that emerges in the final section of D 959-ii can be heard not only to displace its original identity, but also to portray echoes of the haunted return in the slow movement of D 956. Because of the way in which the themes return in a fractured state, the overarching impression left by both movements is that of displacement; the music closes in a state of estrangement.

Such qualities suggest a further intertextual connection with Schubert’s Heine settings in D 957, particularly ‘Der Atlas’ and ‘Der Doppelgänger’.¹⁴⁴ As Lorraine

¹⁴² Connelly, *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture*, p. 115.

¹⁴³ Andrew Webber, *The Doppelgänger: Double Visions in German Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996), p. 5. See chapter two in this thesis for further discussion of Schubertian doubles.

¹⁴⁴ For general discussion of these songs (and their poetic sources), see Graham Johnson, *Franz Schubert: The Complete Songs Volume 3* (Yale University Press, 2014), pp. 39–42 and 59–64.

Byrne Bodley observed, in these two songs Schubert ‘not only dared to humanize what was distant and nonhuman but he imparted a human logic to mythical figures who otherwise remained outside time and beyond place’.¹⁴⁵ In ‘Der Atlas’, having bargained for eternal happiness, the protagonist is faced with eternal wretchedness, a scenario that is infused with monstrous qualities. Its text is presented in Figure 4.6 for reference:

Figure 4.6 ‘Der Atlas’, text and translation¹⁴⁶

Ich unglücksel’ger Atlas! eine Welt, Die ganze Welt der Schmerzen muss ich tragen. Ich trage Unerträgliches, und brechen Will mir das Herz im Leibe.	I, unhappy Atlas, must bear a world, The whole world of sorrows. I bear the unbearable, and my heart Would break within my body.
Du stolzes Herz! Du hast es ja gewollt, Du wolltest glücklich sein, unendlich glücklich Oder unendlich elend, stolzes Herz, Und jetzo bist du elend.	Proud heart, you wished it so! You wished to be happy, endlessly happy, Or endlessly wretched, proud heart! And now you are wretched!

This desperate existential condition is mirrored musically in an idiom that draws on harsh timbres, harmonic eccentricities (with diminished sevenths taking centre stage), extreme dynamic contrasts (ranging from *p* to *fff*), and jarring accompanimental figurations involving the constant use of tremolo (echoing the gestural patterns found in D 959-ii), ‘a long-established Schubertian symbol for a mind in turmoil’, to borrow Susan Youens’s description.¹⁴⁷

Equally unsettling is the way in which ‘Der Doppelgänger’ portrays a musical world that glares with horror into the abyss: see Example 4.17. From the outset, we

¹⁴⁵ Byrne Bodley, ‘A Place at the Edge’, p. 27.

¹⁴⁶ Translation taken from Graham Johnson, *Franz Schubert: The Complete Songs*, Volume 3, p. 39.

¹⁴⁷ Susan Youens, *Heinrich Heine and the Lied*, p. 18. For a recent discussion of ‘Der Atlas’ see David Ferris, ‘Dissociation and Declamation in Schubert’s Heine Songs’, in *Rethinking Schubert*, pp. 383–403.

bear witness to the protagonist's disturbed psychological mindset: he stands alone at the house where his beloved once lived, with only the moon (and his alter ego) as potential companions. Reality is strangely displaced and simultaneously close to hand, in a similar way to 'Der Leiermann', the final song of *Winterreise*. Schubert's musical setting notably enhances the obsessional qualities of the poetic text: the piano part subjects a sparsely textured passacaglia to extensive repetition, representing a voice from the past haunting the present, while the vocal line hovers within restricted means in the manner of an eerie recitation.¹⁴⁸

¹⁴⁸ Christopher Gibbs hears in this motif an echo of the subject of the C sharp minor fugue from Book 1 of Bach's *Well-Tempered Clavier*. See Gibbs, *The Life of Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), p. 165.

Example 4.17 'Der Doppelgänger' from *Schwanengesang*, D 957/13

Sehr langsam

Still ist die Nacht, es ru-hen die Gas-sen, in die - sem_ Hau - se

11
wohn - te mein Schatz; sie hat schon längst die Stadt ver - las-sen, doch steht noch das Haus

21
auf dem sel - ben Platz. Da steht auch ein Mensch, und starrt in die Hö - he, und ringt die Hän-de

31
vor Schmer - zens-ge-walt; — mir — graut es, wenn ich sein Antlitz se - he, der Mond zeigt mir mei-ne eig' - ne Ge-

41
- stalt. — Du Dop-pel-gän-ger, du bleicher Ge-sel-le! was äffst du nach mein Lie-beslied, das mich gequält auf die-ser

50
Stel-le so man - che Nacht, in al - - ter Zeit?

pp

cresc. *poco a poco*

ff *decresc.* *p* *cresc.* *ff*

ff *decresc.* *p* *accelerando* *cresc.* *ff* *ff*

ff *ff* *p* *pp* *ppp*

At the heart of the song is the protagonist's encounter with his double,¹⁴⁹ a classic sign of the uncanny and of impending death:¹⁵⁰ see Figure 4.7.

Figure 4.7 'Der Doppelgänger', Stanzas 2 and 3¹⁵¹

<p>Da Steht auch ein Mensch und starrt in die Höhe, Und ringt die Hände vor Schmerzengewalt; Mir graust es, wenn ich sein Antlitz sehe, – Der Mond zeigt mir meine eigne Gestalt.</p>	<p>A man stands there too, staring up, And wringing his hands in anguish, I shudder when I see his face – The moon shows me my own form!</p>
<p>Du Doppelgänger! du bleicher Geselle! Was äffst du nach mein Liebesleid, Das mich gequält auf dieser Stelle, So manche Nacht, in alter Zeit?</p>	<p>You wraith, pallid companion, Why do you ape the pain of my love Which tormented me on this very spot So many a night, in days long past?</p>

Here (bars 40–41) the antiquated Baroque style gives way to what Jürgen Thym refers to as a 'shriek of horror':¹⁵² extreme dissonance is coupled with dynamic intensification and registral expansion – markers of ruptured boundaries.¹⁵³ In this song, as with 'Der Atlas', the grotesque materializes in both its 'subversive' and 'traumatic' forms, the former conveyed through the violation of musical decorum, the latter through the dark, abject subject matter of the poetic texts.

¹⁴⁹ This disturbing passage has unsurprisingly garnered significant attention in the literature. See (among others) Benjamin Binder, 'Disability, Self-Critique, and Failure in Schubert's "Der Doppelgänger"', in *Rethinking Schubert*, chapter 20; Richard Kurth, 'Music and Poetry, A Wilderness of Doubles: Heine–Nietzsche–Schubert–Derrida', *19th-Century Music* 21/1 (1997), pp. 3–37; David Code, 'Listening for Schubert's "Doppelgängers"', *Music Theory Online* 1.4 (1995), pp. 218–228; David Bretherton, 'In Search of Schubert's Doppelgänger', *The Musical Times* 144 (2003), pp. 45–50; and Robert Samuels, 'The Double Articulation of Schubert: Reflections on Der Doppelgänger', *The Musical Quarterly*, 93/1 (2010), pp. 192–233.

¹⁵⁰ For wider reference see Webber, *The Doppelgänger*, chapter 1, 'Theories and Practices of the Doppelgänger'.

¹⁵¹ Translation taken from Graham Johnson, *Franz Schubert: The Complete Songs*, Volume 3, p. 59.

¹⁵² Jürgen Thym, 'Invocations of memory in the last songs', in *Schubert's Late Music*, p. 402.

¹⁵³ Hirsch suggests that this outburst (which is triggered by the 'confrontation between the protagonist and the horrifying vision of his former self') displays an affinity with the musical vocabulary of the central section of D 959-ii. Hirsch, 'Schubert's Reconciliation of Gothic and Classical Influences', *Schubert's Late Music*, p. 157. My reading traces a broader intertextual association in terms of the trope of fractured subjectivity.

That the grotesque can be detected across a number of works Schubert composed in his final year suggests that it represents a key component of his late style, one which disturbs and entices in equal measure. As Adorno famously put it, ‘in the history of art, late works are the “catastrophes”’.¹⁵⁴ there is a strong sense that the grotesquerie of the Adagio (D 956) and Andantino (D 959) incorporates catastrophic qualities, probing the depths of both musical expression and the existential condition. Beyond their engagement with the grotesque, these movements, in a similar manner to ‘Der Atlas’ and ‘Der Doppelgänger’, present variations on the theme of fractured subjectivity.¹⁵⁵ The music’s obsessional elements, its temporal dislocations between past and present, and the extreme stylistic distortion are all elements that bespeak the ethos of a fractured musical language: ultimately what prevails is an image of a subject that is unable to return to a past state or to form a new mode of totality.¹⁵⁶

¹⁵⁴ Adorno, ‘The Late Style (I)’, in *Beethoven: The Philosophy of Music*, ed. Rolf Tiedemann and trans. Edmund Jephcott (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1998), p. 126.

¹⁵⁵ For contrasting readings of subjectivity in connection with late Schubert, see Susan McClary, ‘Constructions of Subjectivity in Schubert’s Music’, in *Queering the Pitch: The New Gay and Lesbian Musicology* (New York: Routledge, 1994), pp. 205–33.

¹⁵⁶ While a parallel might be drawn between the expressive worlds of this music and what Byrne Bodley calls the ‘darkening landscape’ of the composer’s life, these final works move beyond the biographical realm, representing a mode of divided consciousness that was taking hold as a broader philosophical and psychological phenomenon in the early decades of the nineteenth century. See Lorraine Byrne Bodley, ‘Introduction: Schubert’s Late Style’, in *Schubert’s Late Music*, pp. 1–16, for a recent approach to interpreting Schubert’s personal circumstances in his final years.

Epilogue

By way of conclusion, I draw together in what follows the threads of the previous chapters and reflect on their implications for our understanding of the questions posed at the outset of the study: on what grounds can we speak of a ‘late style’ in Schubert’s music? And what are its aesthetic and expressive qualities?

In terms of the former question, what has emerged across the course of this thesis is a view that lateness in Schubert’s music is distinguished above all by its emphasis on expressive extremity and engagement with notions of strangeness. While the onset of his late style was inevitably propelled by his personal circumstances, particularly his awareness of looming mortality, it is possible, as the preceding chapters have demonstrated, to disentangle the works he wrote in the last six years of his life from biographical lateness, understanding them instead as his response to the aesthetics of his cultural milieu. In the spirit of Schubert’s ‘striving after the highest in art’, they can be viewed as belonging to his project to explore previously uncharted depths of poetic expression and to make a lasting contribution to the development of nineteenth-century music.¹ The results of his endeavour can be seen not only in the expansion of formal and tonal parameters, notably in sonata-form movements, but also in terms of the shared strangeness of the music he composed after 1822; all of those works carry traces of his late style.

¹ Schubert’s awareness of his musical heritage and position in history is demonstrated by his oft-cited disclosure: ‘Heimlich im Stillen hoffe ich wohl selbst etwas aus mir machen zu können, aber wer vermag nach Beethoven noch etwas zu machen?’ Schubert, quoted in O.E. Deutsch, *Schubert: Die Erinnerungen seiner Freunde* (Leipzig, 1966), p. 150; trans. Rosamund Ley and John Nowell as *Schubert: Memoirs by his Friends* (London: Adam and Charles Black, 1958), p. 128: ‘Secretly, in my heart of hearts, I still hope to be able to make something out of myself, but who can do anything after Beethoven?’.

Of the tropes which have been illuminated here, that of self-conscious archaism represents a side of late Schubert that has tended to elude sustained critical attention. His approach in this area is distinguished by the way in which he distorts the usual expressive associations of Baroque styles: striking in this regard are the misshapen manifestations of the French overture topic in the slow movement of the F minor Fantasy, D 940, and the *Grande Marche Funèbre*, D 859, as well as the distorted use of fugue in the finale of D 940, discussed in chapter two. Taken together, these examples provide evidence of Schubert creating new contexts for musical meaning through critical engagement with historical styles.² Although not as prevalent as the traces of the past found, for example, in Beethoven's late works,³ they nevertheless offer a glimpse of Schubert's self-investment in musical historicism, subtly bolstering the image of a composer who was keenly aware of his position in history.

Implicit across much of the thesis has been the suggestion that the language of horror – in both gothic and sublime fashion – forms an integral component of Schubert's late instrumental style. On the eerie side of this phenomenon are those spectral emanations discussed in chapter two in connection with the C minor Impromptu, D 899/1, and the Andante of the Piano Trio in E flat, D 929: these pieces draw us into their worlds of musical haunting, their effect of gothic horror arising

² In his late years, Schubert's became acquainted with the music of Bach and Handel through Raphael Kiesewetter's salons. For wider discussion of Schubert's engagement with the past, see Walther Dürr, 'Über Schuberts Verhältnis zu Bach', in *Johann Sebastian Bach: Beiträge zur Wirkungsgeschichte* (Vienna: Kongressbericht Wien, 1992), pp. 69–79; Michael Kube, 'Zur Satztechnik in Schuberts Sonate für Klavier, Violine und violoncello, B-Dur D 28 (Triosatz)', in *Bach und Schubert: Beiträge zur Musikforschung* (Munich: Katzschler [Jahrbuch der Bachwochen Dill], 1999), pp. 15–22; and Lorraine Byrne Bodley, *Franz Schubert: A Musical Wayfarer* (New Haven: Yale University Press, forthcoming), chapter 7, where there is discussion of Pergolesi's and Bach's influence in Schubert's Stabat Mater in F minor, D 383, aria no. 6, 'Ach, was hätten wir empfunden'.

³ See *inter alia* Stephen Rumph, *Beethoven after Napoleon: Political Romanticism in the Late Works* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004), chapters 5 and 6, 'Contrapunctus I: Prelude and Fugue' and 'Contrapunctus II: Double Fugue'.

through such processes as expressive defamiliarization and uncanny returns. At the opposite of the spectrum are those intensely visceral instances of sublime rapture, as noted apropos the *Durchbruch* amid the secondary theme in the first movement of the ‘Unfinished’ Symphony, D 759. All three cases mentioned here are marked by extremity. In the former examples, the music’s expressive world is poised between life and death, the ghostly themes suggesting voices from beyond the realm of the living, while the intense outbursts in D 759 represent a physical shattering of the boundaries of coherence, pushing at the limits of comprehensibility.

At the heart of Schubert’s late style lies the trope of stylistic disjuncture. As chapter four illustrates, new modes of grotesque expression are achieved in his late episodic movements through the dramatization of irreconcilable contrasts,⁴ such as the abrupt shift between the worlds of dream and nightmare in the Adagio of D 956, and the strange oscillation between eerie lyricism and distorted fantasia in the Andantino of D 959. In giving voice to the grotesque, these movements can be seen to exhibit the essence of what Edward Said referred to as going ‘against the grain’: ‘the experience of late style that involves a nonharmonious, nonserene tension, and above all, a sort of deliberately unproductive productiveness going *against*’.⁵ In both cases, the ‘nonserene tension’ is created through the way in which Schubert brings together passages of music that bear no outward resemblance to one another, leaving us to find meaning in the unsettling shifts between expressive worlds.⁶

⁴ Equally remarkable is the way in which Schubert channels such expressive intensity into compact ternary structures: while their surfaces are distorted, the overarching formal framework remains intact.

⁵ Edward Said, *On Late Style: Music and Literature Against the Grain* (London: Bloomsbury, 2006), p. 7.

⁶ In these movements, which profile extremity on all compositional fronts, Schubert broadens the boundaries of expression beyond the notion of local-level contrast within overarching unity that governs much of the music of his predecessors, notably Mozart.

Closely linked to the theme of disjuncture in Schubert's late style is the idea of resistance to closure.⁷ Just as the final song in *Winterreise*, 'Der Leiermann', withholds affirmation of resolution, so the late instrumental works subvert patterns of closure in a number of ways. In some cases, this is suggested through the dissolution of musical material, as in the slow movement of D 959, where the final spread chords in low register suggest not so much an ending, but rather the gradual withdrawal of presence. In other instances, closure is undermined through flashbacks and interpolations, such as the second return of the slow movement's haunting main theme moments before the end of the E flat Trio, D 929-iv. Schubert's strategies for negating closure are felt nowhere more explicitly than in the String Quintet, D 956. Not only does the slow movement contain in its closing bars a remnant of the disruptive gesture that initiated its central section, suggesting that the disturbance has not been fully overcome, but the finale too incorporates a memory of these events in its final five bars, whereby a Neapolitan inflection breaks through the surface now in the context of C major, casting, in the words of Benedict Taylor, 'an uncanny shadow' over the work's ending.⁸ These instances of resistance to closure can be interpreted as another marker of extremity in Schubert's late works. Without closure, there can be no conclusion: the music continues to reverberate beyond its sonic parameters, beyond that which is readily graspable.

A recurring theme in recent scholarship on late Schubert has been that of intertextuality. Charles Fisk has shown that Schubert's late music can be seen as

⁷ In this respect, Schubert's late music can be seen to have foreshadowed a trope that becomes increasingly prevalent in later music. See Barbara Barry, 'In Search of an Ending: Reframing Mahler's Contexts of Closure', *Journal of Musicological Research* 26/1 (2007), pp. 55–68.

⁸ Benedict Taylor, 'Schubert and the Construction of Memory: The String Quartet in A Minor, D. 804 ("Rosamunde")', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/1 (2014), p. 56.

revolving around the pervasive portrayal of the wanderer figure and the associated narrative patterns of exile and homecoming, underpinned by the use of such keys (remote in their contexts) as C sharp minor across a number of works (notably D 760-ii and D 959-ii).⁹ In defining the ‘fingerprints’ of Schubert’s compositional style, Susan Wollenberg has demonstrated that his instrumental works can be viewed as forming ‘networks of shared elements’,¹⁰ which range from motivic patterns (the chromatic fourth), through tonal features (Neapolitan inflections), to broader structural processes such as threefold constructions.

In light of the findings presented here, I would add to these existing interpretations that a defining feature of Schubert’s late instrumental style is the way in which the works he composed between 1822 and 1828 draw on a shared vocabulary of expressive tropes associated with strangeness. The myriad manifestations of ghostly doubles, uncanny returns, and grotesque distortions in these works all suggest a compositional language that is grounded in the aesthetics of the strange and the eccentric. Within this network of intertextual allusions, there is a sense that the boundaries between the gothic, the sublime, and the grotesque in late Schubert are fluid and permeable, to the extent that music which might be construed as gothic in one moment could easily slip into the territory of the grotesque at a later stage. A poignant example of such interplay can be found in the Adagio of D 956: while the initial disjuncture between the beauty of the opening material and the nightmarish music of the central section strongly brings to mind the world of the grotesque, the disturbed reprise, whereby the A’ material returns in a dislocated guise, can be viewed

⁹ Fisk, *Returning Cycles*.

¹⁰ Wollenberg, *Schubert’s Fingerprints*, p. 292

in terms of those uncanny returns that lie at the heart of gothic expression. Overlap of this kind adds a further layer of complexity to the intertextual resonances among Schubert's late instrumental works.

In exploring the expressive worlds of late Schubert from interdisciplinary perspectives, my aim has been to situate the strange qualities of the instrumental works within their broader cultural context. The approach cultivated here of moving freely between music and the history of ideas has the advantage of capturing the *Zeitgeist* embedded in Schubert's artistic approach, emphasising his musical and literary aspirations, as well as that of the circles in which he moved.

Over the centuries, Schubert has acquired a multi-dimensional identity. On the one hand, there are those – now generally discredited – images of Schubert as a 'clairvoyant',¹¹ spinning out endless melodies, and a 'sleepwalker',¹² composing as if in a perpetual state of liminal consciousness. Then there is the Schubert that has been passed down to us through the influential writings of Robert Schumann. In this regard, we might recall Schumann's characterization of Schubert as the 'feminine' counterpart to Beethoven: 'compared to Beethoven, Schubert is a feminine character, much more voluble, softer and broader; or a guideless child romping among giants'.¹³ Recent scholarship has done much to revise the view of Schubert as a happy-go-lucky composer, substituting this with a series of images that capture the complexities of his

¹¹ On the history of this trend see Suzannah Clark, *Analyzing Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), chapter 1, 'Singing Schubert's Praises: the voice of Vogl in Schubert's early History'.

¹² I am referring here to Alfred Brendel's assertion that 'Beethoven composes like an architect, Schubert like a sleepwalker'. See Brendel, 'Form and Psychology in Beethoven's Piano Sonatas', in *Musical Thoughts and Afterthoughts* (London: Robson Books, 1976), pp. 41–42.

¹³ *Schumann on Music: A Selection from the Writings*, trans. and ed. Henry Pleasants (London: Dover, 1965), p. 142. For detailed discussion of Schumann's image of Schubert, see Scott Messing *Schubert in the European Imagination* (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2006), esp. chapter 1 in volume one, 'Robert Schumann's Schubert: Inventing a Mädchencharakter'.

musical and artistic outlook. Fisk's Schubert, for instance, is the wanderer who resides in an exilic realm.¹⁴ Susan McClary, propelled in part by Maynard Solomon's claims about the composer's potential homosexual inclinations, has painted a portrait of the composer as one who was consciously articulating alternative modes of masculinity in his music.¹⁵ John Gingerich's version of Schubert is that of a pragmatic composer who was actively embarking on a compositional project to establish a public profile (specifically in the realm of instrumental music) that was 'synonymous with Beethoven's name and fame'.¹⁶ For Wollenberg, Schubert stands out as a composer whose instrumental music bears the psychological imprint of the poetic worlds of song. As these contrasting readings demonstrate, Schubert has gradually emerged from the cosy confines of *Schubertiade* settings and is now viewed as a complex figure in the history of nineteenth-century music.

In addition to constructing a new semiotic and hermeneutic framework for contextualizing strangeness in Schubert's late music, this thesis carries implications for our understanding of the composer's artistic persona, offering a view that supplements the approaches outlined above. The image of Schubert that has been portrayed here is that of an intellectual artist who was cultivating an instrumental

¹⁴ Fisk reads Schubert's late piano works from both biographical and *autobiographical* perspectives, relating their depictions of the 'wanderer' trope to Schubert's potential identification as a 'Fremdling', as well as revealing, to quote Burnham, 'his own therapeutic engagement with Schubert's music in an unusually self-disclosing afterword'. See Scott Burnham's review of *Returning Cycles*, 'Music Therapy', *19th-Century Music* 26/2 (2002), pp. 178–191, here p. 191. In the final pages of the book, Fisk, after disclosing that Schubert's music enabled him to come to terms with his own experience of 'feeling like a "Fremdling"' on account of his homosexuality, concludes on a highly personal note: 'in a sense, the writing of this book is an act of gratitude, an attempt to repay this music for what it has afforded me'.

¹⁵ See Susan McClary, 'Constructions of Subjectivity in Schubert's Music', in *Queering the Pitch: The New Gay and Lesbian Musicology*, ed. Philip Brett, Gary Thomas, and Elizabeth Wood (New York and London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 205–233. Chapter one in this thesis offers further discussion of McClary's approach.

¹⁶ John Gingerich, "'Classical" Music and the Viennese Resistance to Schubert's Beethoven Project', in *Schubert's Late Music*, p. 31; for extensive discussion of these issues see Gingerich, *Schubert's Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014).

idiom which probes the depths of musical expression and the human condition. Whether we focus on the intimations of the sublime, the grotesque distortions, or his essays in musical haunting, what remains central to his late style is its emphasis on contradictory elements that resist straightforward characterization, requiring us to find meaning in the music's internal worlds.

In bringing this study to a close, I quote the editors of a recent Schubert issue published by *Nineteenth-Century Music Review*: 'a definitive version of Schubert must remain a phantom possibility; there always will be new readings, new ways of listening to that definitive sound ringing in the ear'.¹⁷ In this spirit, it is my hope that the interpretations offered here have added a fresh dimension to the ever-evolving conception of the expressive worlds of Schubert's late instrumental music.

¹⁷ Lorraine Byrne Bodley and James William Sobaskie, 'Introduction', special issue 'Schubert Familiar and Unfamiliar: Continuing Conversations', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 13/1 (2016), p. 9.

Bibliography

- Abert, A.A., 'Rhythmus und Klang in Schuberts Streichquintett', in *Festschrift Karl Gustav Fellerer zum sechzigsten Geburtstag*, ed. H. Hüschen (Regensburg: Gustav Bosse Verlag, 1962), pp. 1–11.
- Aderhold, Werner, *Sinfonie Nr. 7 in h-Moll (D 759)*, Kritischer Bericht, *Neue Schubert-Ausgabe: Kritischer Bericht*, Vol. 3, (1996 [rev. ed. 2008]).
- Adorno, Theodor W., 'Schubert (1928)', trans. Jonathan Dunsby and Beate Perrey, *19th-Century Music* 29/1 (2005), pp. 3–14.
- _____, *Mahler: A Musical Physiognomy*, trans. Edmund Jephcott (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1991).
- _____, *Beethoven: The Philosophy of Music. Fragments and Texts*, ed. Rolf Tiedemann and trans. Edmund Jephcott (Cambridge: Polity, 1998; first published in German, 1993).
- Agawu, Kofi, *Music as Discourse: Semiotic Adventures in Romantic Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2008).
- _____, *Playing with Signs: A Semiotic Interpretation of Classic Music* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991).
- Allanbrook, Wye Jamison, 'Two Threads through the Labyrinth: Topic and Process in the First Movements of K. 332 and K. 333', in *Convention in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Music: Essays in Honor of Leonard G. Ratner*, ed. Wye J. Allanbrook, Janet M. Levy, and William P. Mahrt (Stuyvesant: Pendragon Press, 1992), pp. 125–171.
- _____, 'Is the Sublime a Musical Topos?' *Eighteenth-Century Music* 7/2 (2010), pp. 263–279.
- Badura-Skoda, Eva and Peter Branscombe (eds), *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982).
- Barack, Karlheinz et al. (eds), 'Grotesk', in *Ästhetische Grundbegriffe: Band 2 Dekadent bis Grotesk* (Stuttgart: J.B. Metzler Verlag, 2001), pp. 880–898.
- Barry, Barbara, 'A shouting silence: further thoughts about Schubert's "Unfinished"', *The Musical Times* 151 (2010), pp. 39–52.
- _____, 'Schubert's Quartettsatz: a case study in confrontation', *The Musical Times* 155 (2014), pp. 31–49.
- _____, 'In Search of an Ending: Reframing Mahler's Contexts of Closure', *Journal of Musicological Research* 26/1 (2007), pp. 55–68.
- _____, '"Sensucht" and Melancholy: Explorations of Time and Structure in Schubert's *Winterreise*', in *The Philosopher's Stone: Essays in*

- the Transformation of Music Structure* (Hillsdale, NY: Pendragon Press, 2000), pp. 181–202.
- Battersby, Christine, *The Sublime: Terror and Human Difference* (New York: Routledge, 2007).
- Beach, David, ‘Schubert’s Experiments with Sonata Form’, *Music Theory Spectrum* 15/1 (1993), pp. 1–18.
- _____, *Schubert’s Mature Instrumental Music: A Theorist’s Perspective* (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2017).
- Binder, Benjamin, ‘Disability, Self-Critique, and Failure in Schubert’s “Der Doppelgänger”’, in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 418–436.
- Black, Brian, ‘Remembering a Dream: The Tragedy of Romantic Memory in the Modulatory Processes of Schubert’s Sonata Forms’, *Intersections* 25/1–2 (2005), pp. 202–228.
- Black, Leo, *Franz Schubert: Music and Belief* (Woodbridge: Boydell Press, 2003).
- Boczkowska, Ewelina, ‘Chopin’s Ghosts’, *19th-Century Music* 35/3 (2012), pp. 204–223.
- Bonds, Mark Evan, *Music as Thought: Listening to the Symphony in the Age of Beethoven* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2006).
- _____, ‘Beethoven’s shadow: the nineteenth century’, *The Cambridge Companion to the Symphony*, ed. Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 329–343.
- Bostridge, Ian, *Schubert’s Winter Journey: Anatomy of an Obsession* (London: Faber & Faber, 2015).
- Botstein, Leon, ‘Realism Transformed: Franz Schubert and Vienna’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1997), pp. 13–35.
- Botting, Fred and Catherine Spooner (ed.), *Monstrous Media / Spectral Subjects: Imaging Gothic from the Nineteenth Century to the Present* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2015).
- Brady, Emily, ‘The Romantic Sublime’, in *The Sublime in Modern Philosophy: Aesthetics, Ethics, and Nature* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 90 – 114.
- Brendel, Alfred, ‘Schubert’s Last Sonatas’, in *Music Sounded Out: Essays, Lectures, Interviews, Afterthoughts* (London: Robson, 1990), pp. 72–141.
- Bretherton, David, ‘In Search of Schubert’s Doppelgänger’, *The Musical Times* 144 (2003), pp. 45–50.
- _____, ‘The Poetics of Schubert’s Song-Forms’ (DPhil dissertation, University of Oxford, 2008).
- Brett, Philip, ‘Piano Four-Hands: Schubert and the Performance of Gay Male Desire’, *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 149–76.

- Brittan, Francesca, *Music and Fantasy in the Age of Berlioz* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017).
- Brown, Julie, *Bartók and the Grotesque: Studies in Modernity, the Body and Contradiction in Music* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2007).
- Brown, Marshall, *The Shape of German Romanticism* (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1979).
- Brown, Maurice J.E., *Schubert: A Critical Biography* (London: Macmillan, 1958).
- Buch, David, *Magic Flutes & Enchanted Forests: The Supernatural in Eighteenth-Century Musical Theater* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2008).
- Buhler, James, “Breakthrough” as Critique of Form: The Finale of Mahler’s First Symphony’, *19th-Century Music* 20/2 (1996), pp. 125–143.
- Burnham, Scott, *Beethoven Hero* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1995).
- _____, ‘Schubert and the Sound of Memory’, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 655–663.
- _____, ‘Landscape as Music, Landscape as Truth: Schubert and the Burden of Repetition’, *19th-Century Music* 29 (2005), pp. 31–41.
- _____, *Mozart’s Grace* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013).
- _____, ‘Thresholds Between, Worlds Apart’, *Music Analysis* 33/2, special issue: ‘Schubert’s String Quintet in C major, D. 956’, ed. William Drabkin (2014), pp. 156–167.
- _____, ‘Beethoven, Schubert and the movement of phenomena’, in *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 35–51.
- _____, ‘The “Heavenly Length” of Schubert’s Music’, *Ideas* 6/1 (1999).
- _____, review of Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert’s Impromptus and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), ‘Music Therapy’, *19th-Century Music* 26/2 (2002), pp. 178–191.
- Burke, Edmund, *On the Sublime and Beautiful* (London: R. and J. Dodsky, 1757).
- _____, *A Philosophical Enquiry into the Origin of Our Ideas of the Sublime and Beautiful*, ed. Adam Phillips (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990).
- Burstein, Poundie, ‘Lyricism, Structure, and Gender in Schubert’s G Major String Quartet’, *The Musical Quarterly* 18/1 (1997), pp. 51–63.
- _____, ‘Devil’s Castles and Schubert’s Strange Tonic Allusions’, *Theory and Practice* 27 (2002), pp. 69–84.
- Burwick, Frederick, *The Haunted Eye: Perception and the Grotesque in English and German Romanticism* (Heidelberg: Carl Winter Universitätsverlag, 1987).
- _____, ‘The Grotesque in the Romantic Movement’, in *European Romanticism: Literary Cross-currents, Modes, and Models*, ed. Gerhart Hoffmeister (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1989), pp. 37–57.

- Byrne Bodley, Lorraine, *Franz Schubert: A Musical Wayfarer* (New Haven: Yale University Press, forthcoming).
- _____, *Schubert's Goethe Settings* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2003).
- _____, 'A Place at the Edge: Reflections on Schubert's Late Style', *Oxford German Studies* 44/1 (2015), pp. 18–29.
- _____, 'In Pursuit of a Single Flame? On Schubert's Settings of Goethe's Poems', *Nineteenth Century Music Review* 13/2 (2016), pp. 11–33.
- Byrne Bodley, Lorraine and Julian Horton (eds), *Rethinking Schubert* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016).
- _____, (ed.), *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016).
- _____, 'Music of the orphaned self? Schubert and Concepts of Late Style', in *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 331–356.
- Caplin, William, *Classical Form: A Theory of Formal Functions for the Music of Haydn, Mozart, and Beethoven* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1998).
- Capell, Richard, *Schubert's Songs* (London: Ernest Benn, 1928).
- Castle, Terry, *The Female Thermometer: Eighteenth-Century Culture and the Invention of the Uncanny* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995).
- Chalus, Alois A., 'Franz Schubert, der Musikus des Biedermeiers', *Der Kollege* 5/6 (1963), pp. 6–8.
- Chao, Noelle, 'Musical Listening in the Mysteries of Udolpho', in *Words and Notes in the Long Nineteenth Century*, ed. Phyllis Weliver and Katharine Ellis (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2013), pp. 85–102.
- Chapin, Keith, 'Sublime experience and ironic action: E.T.A. Hoffmann and the use of music for life', in *Musical Meaning and Human Values*, ed. Chapin and Lawrence Kramer (New York: Fordham University Press, 2009), pp. 32–58.
- Charlton, David (ed.), *E.T.A. Hoffmann's Musical Writings: Kreisleriana, The Poet, and the Composer*, trans. Martyn Clarke (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989).
- Chua, Daniel, 'Beethoven's Other Humanism', *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 62 (2009), pp. 571–645.
- _____, *The Galitzin Quartets of Beethoven: Opp. 127, 132, 130* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2014).
- Chusid, Martin, 'Schubert's Chamber Music: Before and After Beethoven', in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 174–192.
- Clark, Caryl (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005).

- Clark, Suzannah, *Analyzing Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011).
- _____, ‘Rossini and Beethoven in the reception of Schubert’, in *The Invention of Beethoven and Rossini: Historiography, Analysis, Criticism*, ed. Nicholas Mathew and Benjamin Walton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 96–120.
- Clive, Peter, *Schubert and his World: A Biographical Dictionary* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1997).
- Code, David. ‘Listening for Schubert’s “Doppelgängers”’, *Music Theory Online* 1.4 (1995), pp. 218–228.
- Cohn, Richard L., ‘As Wonderful as Star Clusters: Instruments for Gazing at Tonality in Schubert’, *19th-Century Music* 22 (1999), pp. 213–232.
- Cone, Edward T., *A Composer’s Voice* (Berkeley, Los Angeles, London: University of California Press, 1974).
- _____, ‘Schubert’s Promissory Note: An Exercise in Musical Hermeneutics’, *Nineteenth-Century Music* 5/3 (1982), pp. 233–241.
- Connelly, Frances S., *The Grotesque in Western Art and Culture: The Image at Play* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2012).
- Crowther, Paul, *The Kantian Sublime: From Morality to Art* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1991).
- Čurda, Martin, ‘“From the Monkey Mountains: The Body, the Grotesque and Carnival in the Music of Pavel Haas’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 141/1 (2016), pp. 61–112.
- Dahlhaus, Carl, ‘Sonata Form in Schubert: The First Movement of the G-Major String Quartet, Op. 161 (D. 887)’, in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch and trans. Thilo Reinhard (Lincoln, NB: University of Nebraska Press, 1986), pp. 1–12.
- Damschroder, David, *Harmony in Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010).
- Darcy, Warren, ‘Rotational Form, Teleological Genesis, and Fantasy-Projection in the Slow Movement of Mahler’s Sixth Symphony’, *19th-Century Music* 25/1 (2001), pp. 49–74.
- Daverio, John, ‘“One More Beautiful Memory of Schubert”: Schumann’s Critique of the Impromptus, D. 935’, *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 604–618.
- _____, *Crossing Paths: Schubert, Schumann, and Brahms* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2002).
- _____, Daverio, ‘Schumann’s “Im Legendenton” and Friedrich Schlegel’s “Arabeske”’, *19th-Century Music* 11/2 (1987), pp. 150–163.
- _____, *Nineteenth-Century Music and the German Romantic Ideology* (New York: Schirmer, 1989).

- Davies, Joe, review of *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (2017): <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409817000696>.
- Davies, Joe and James William Sobaskie (eds), *Drama in the Music of Franz Schubert* (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, forthcoming February 2019).
- Davies, Stephen, *Musical Meaning and Expression* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1994).
- Davis, Andrew, *Il Trittico, Turandot, and Puccini's Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2010).
- Davison, Carol Margaret, *Gothic Literature 1764–1824* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2009).
- Deutsch, Otto Eric, *Schubert: Die Dokumente seines Lebens* (Kassel: Bärenreiter Verlag, 1964, reprint 1980 and 1996); trans. Eric Blom, *Schubert: A Documentary Biography* (London: J.M. Dent & Sons, 1947); and *The Schubert Reader: A Life of Franz Schubert in Letters and Documents*, trans. Eric Blom (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1949).
- _____, *Schubert. Die Erinnerungen seiner Freunde* (Wiesbaden: Breitkopf & Härtel, 1957, repr. 1983), trans. Rosamund Ley and John Nowell, *Schubert: Memoirs by his Friends* (London: Adam and Charles Black, 1958).
- DeVoto, Mark, *Schubert's Great C Major: Biography of a Symphony* (Woodbridge: Pendragon Press, 2011).
- Dickensheets, Janice, 'The Topical Vocabulary of the Nineteenth Century', *Journal of Musicology* 31/2 (2012), pp. 97–137.
- Dolan, Emily, 'Mozart, song and the pre-uncanny', in *Mozart Studies 2*, ed. Simon Keefe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015), pp. 195–228.
- Downes, Stephen, 'Beautiful and Sublime', in *Aesthetics of Music: Musicological Perspectives*, ed. Downes (New York: Routledge, 2014), pp. 84–110.
- Dreyfus, Lawrence, 'The Hermeneutics of Lament: A Neglected Paradigm in a Mozartian "Trauermusik"', *Music Analysis* 10/3 (1991), pp. 329–342.
- Dunsby, Johnathan, 'Adorno's Image of Schubert's "Wanderer" Fantasy Multiplied by Ten', *19th-Century Music* 29/1 (2005), pp. 209–236.
- Dürr, Walter, Arnold Feil, Christa Landon et al. (eds), *Franz Schubert: Neue Ausgabe sämtlicher Werke [NSA]* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1964–).
- _____, *Franz Schubert: Thematisches Verzeichnis seiner Werke in chronologischer Folge von Otto Erich Deutsch, NSA, VIII/4* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1978).
- _____, 'Wer vermag nach Beethoven noch etwas zu Mache[n]? Gedanken über die Beziehungen Schuberts zu Beethoven', *Beethoven-Jahrbuch* (1973–77), pp. 47–67.

- _____, 'Über Schuberts Verhältnis zu Bach', in *Johann Sebastian Bach: Beiträge zur Wirkungsgeschichte* (Vienna: Kongressbericht Wien, 1992), pp. 69–79.
- _____, and Andreas Krause (eds), *Schubert Handbuch* (London: Panther Books, 1971; orig. publ. Cassell & Co., 1951).
- Einstein, Alfred, *Schubert*, trans. D. Ascoli (London: Panther Books, 1971; orig. publ. Cassell & Co., 1951).
- Elfren, Isabella van, *Gothic Music: The Sounds of the Uncanny* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2012).
- Erickson, Raymond (ed.), *Schubert's Vienna* (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997).
- Esse, Melina, 'Donizetti's Gothic Resurrections', *19th-Century Music* 33 (2009), pp. 81–109.
- Ferguson, Frances, *Solitude and the Sublime* (London: Routledge, 1992).
- Ferguson, Frances, 'Reflections on Burke, Kant, and *Solitude and the Sublime*', *European Romantic Review* 23/3 (2012), pp. 313–317.
- Ferris, David, 'Dissociation and Declamation in Schubert's Heine Songs', in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 383–403.
- Feurzeig, Lisa, *Schubert's Lieder and the Philosophy of Early German Romanticism* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2014).
- _____, review of Susan Wollenberg, *Schubert's Fingerprints: Studies in the Instrumental Works* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011), *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 10/2 (2013), pp. 349–352.
- Fieldman, Hali, 'Schubert's Quartettsatz and sonata form's new way', *Journal of Musicological Research* 12/1–2 (2002), pp. 99–146.
- Fillerup, Jessie, 'Lucia's Ghosts: Sonic, Gothic and Postmodern', *Cambridge Opera Journal* 28/3 (2016), pp. 313–345.
- _____, 'Purloined Poetics: The Grotesque in the Music of Maurice Ravel' (PhD dissertation, University of Kansas, 2009).
- Fiorillo, Johann Dominik, *Über die Groteske* (Göttingen: Rosenbusch, 1791).
- Fisk, Charles, 'Schubert Recollects Himself: The Piano Sonata in C Minor, D. 958', *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 635–54.
- _____, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert's Impromptus and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001).
- _____, 'What Schubert's Last Sonata Might Hold', in *Music and Meaning*, ed. Jenefer Robinson (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1997), pp. 179–200.

- _____, 'Edward T. Cone's "The Composer's Voice": Questions about the Persona of Schubert's "Wanderer" Fantasy', *College Music Symposium* 29 (1989), pp. 19–30.
- Freud, Sigmund, 'The "Uncanny"', in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, ed. James Strachey (London: Hogarth, 1955), vol. 17 (1917–1919).
- Frisch, Walter, "'You Must Remember This": Memory and Structure in Schubert's String Quartet in G Major, D. 887', *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 582–603.
- Frisch, Walter (ed.), *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies* (London: University of Nebraska Press, 1986).
- Gamer, Michael, *Romanticism and the Gothic: Genre, Reception, and Canon Formation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).
- Gibbs, Christopher, "'Komm geh mit mir": Schubert's Uncanny "Erlkönig"', *19th-Century Music* 19/2 (1995), pp. 115–135.
- _____, (ed.), *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).
- _____, *The Life of Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).
- _____, 'Beyond song: instrumental transformations and adaptations of the Lied from Schubert to Mahler', in *The Cambridge Companion to the Lied*, ed. James Parsons (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), pp. 223–242.
- _____, 'Schubert's Tombeau de Beethoven: Decrypting the Piano Trio in E-flat Major, Op. 100', in *Franz Schubert and His World*, ed. Christopher Gibbs and Morten Solvik (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2014), pp. 241–299.
- Gibbs, Christopher and Solvik, Morten (eds), *Franz Schubert and His World* (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press 2014).
- Gingerich, John, 'Remembrance and Consciousness in Schubert's C-Major String Quintet, D. 956', *Musical Quarterly* 84/4 (2000), pp. 619–634.
- _____, *Schubert's Beethoven Project* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014).
- _____, "'Those of us who found our life in art": The Second-Generation Romanticism of the Schubert-Schober Circle, 1820–25', in *Franz Schubert and his World*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs and Morten Solvik (Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press 2014), pp. 67–114.
- _____, 'Unfinished Considerations: Schubert's "Unfinished" Symphony in the Context of his Beethoven Project', *19th-Century Music* 31/2 (2007), pp. 99–112.

- Gibson, Matthew, *The Fantastic and European Gothic* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2013).
- Gramit, David, 'The Intellectual and Aesthetic Tenets of Franz Schubert's Circle' (PhD dissertation, Duke University, 1987).
- _____, "'The Passion for friendship"; music, cultivation, and identity in Schubert's circle', *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 56–71.
- Gülke, Peter, *Schubert und seine Zeit* (Laaber: Laaber-Verlag, 1991).
- _____, 'In what Respect a Quintet? On the Disposition of Instruments in the String Quintet D 956', in *Schubert Studies*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), pp. 173–185.
- _____, 'Zum Bilde des späten Schubert', in *Franz Schubert: Musik-Konzepte Sonderband*, ed. Heinz-Klaus Metzger and Rainer Riehn (Munich: Edition Text + Kritik, 1979), pp. 107–166.
- Hafer, Edward Michael, 'The Wanderer Archetype in the Music of Franz Schubert and the Paintings of Caspar David Friedrich' (PhD dissertation, University of Illinois, 2006).
- Hallmark, Rufus, 'The Literary and Musical Rhetoric of Apostrophe in *Winterreise*', *19th-Century Music* 35/1 (2011), pp. 3–33.
- Harris, Ellen T., 'Silence as Sound: Handel's Sublime Pauses', *Journal of Musicology* 22 (2005), pp. 521–58.
- Harpham, Geoffrey G, *On the Grotesque: Strategies of Contradiction in Art and Literature* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1982).
- Hascher, Xavier, *Schubert, la forme sonate et son évolution* (Bern: Peter Lang, 1996).
- _____, 'Eine "traumhafte" *barcarola funebre*: Fragmente zu einer Deutung des langsamen Satzes des Streichquintetts D 956', in *Schubert und das Biedermeier, Beiträge zur Musik des frühen 19. Jahrhunderts (Festschrift für Walther Dürr zum 70. Geburtstag)*, ed. Michael Kube (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2002), pp. 127–138.
- _____, "'In dunklen Träumen": Schubert's Heine-Lieder through the Psychoanalytical Prism', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 5/2 (2008), pp. 43–70.
- _____, (ed.), *Cahiers Franz Schubert: Revue de musique classique et romantique* 1–17 (1992–2009).
- _____, (ed.), *Le style instrumental de Schubert: Sources, analyse, évolution* (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2007).
- _____, 'Narrative Dislocations in the First Movement of Schubert's "Unfinished" Symphony', in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 127–146.

- _____, review of Suzannah Clark, *Analyzing Schubert* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011), *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 10/1 (2013), pp. 169–173.
- Hatten, Robert S., *Interpreting Musical Gestures, Topics, and Tropes: Mozart, Beethoven, and Schubert* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004).
- _____, *Musical Meaning in Beethoven: Markedness, Correlation, and Interpretation* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1994).
- _____, Robert Hatten, ‘Schubert’s Alchemy: Transformative Surfaces, Transfiguring Depths’, in *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 91–110.
- _____, ‘Schubert the Progressive: The Role of Resonance and Gesture in the Piano Sonata in A, D. 959’, *Intégral* 7 (1993), pp. 38–91.
- _____, ‘Interpreting the Grotesque in Music’, *Semiotics* (2011), pp. 419–426.
- Hayden, Deborah, *Pox: Genius, Madness, and the Mysteries of Syphilis* (New York: Basic Books, 2003).
- Head, Matthew, ‘Fantasia and Sensibility’, in *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. Danuta Mirka (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), pp. 259–278.
- _____, ‘Mozart’s Gothic: Feelings for History in the Rondo in A minor, K. 511’, *Keyboard Perspectives: The Yearbook of the Westfield Center for Historical Keyboard* 4 (USA, 2012), pp. 69–114.
- _____, ‘C.P.E. Bach “In Tormentis”: Gout Pain and Body Language in the Fantasia in A major, H278 (1782)’, *Eighteenth-Century Music* 13/2 (2016), pp. 211–234.
- _____, ‘Fantasy in the Instrumental Music of C.P.E. Bach’ (PhD dissertation, Yale University, 1995).
- _____, ‘“Like Beauty Spots on the Face of a Man”: Gender in Eighteenth-Century North-German Discourse on Genre’, *Journal of Musicology* 13 (1995), pp. 143–167.
- Hefling, Stephen E., ‘The Austro-Germanic Quartet Tradition in the Nineteenth Century’, in *The Cambridge Companion to the String Quartet*, ed. Robin Stowell (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 228–249.
- _____, and David S. Tartakoff, ‘Schubert’s Chamber Music’, in *Nineteenth-Century Chamber Music*, ed. Stephen E. Hefling (New York and London: Routledge, 2004), pp. 39–139.
- Hepokoski, James and Warren Darcy, *Elements of Sonata Theory: Norms, Types, and Deformations in the Late-Eighteenth-Century Sonata* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006).
- Hibberd, Sarah, ‘Cherubini and the Revolutionary Sublime’, *Cambridge Opera Journal* 24/3 (2012), pp. 293–318.

- Hilmar, Ernst, *Franz Schubert in seiner Zeit* (Vienna: Hermann Böhlaus Nachf., 1985), trans. Reinhard G. Pauly as *Franz Schubert in his Time* (Portland, Oregon: Amadeus Press, 1988).
- _____, and Margaret Jestremski (ed.), *Schubert Lexikon* (Graz: Akademische Druck- und Verlagsanstalt, 1997).
- _____ and Werner Bodendorff, *Franz Schubert: Dokumente 1801–1830* Vol. 1: *Texte, Programme, Rezensionen, Anzeigen, Nekrologe, Musikbeilagen und andere gedruckte Quellen, Addenda und Kommentar* (Tutzing: Veröffentlichungen des IFSI, 2003).
- Hinrichsen, Hans-Joachim, ‘Is there a Late Style in Schubert?’, trans. Lorraine Byrne Bodley, in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 17–28.
- _____, *Franz Schubert* (Munich: C.H. Beck, 2011).
- _____, ‘Der weg zur grossen Symphonie’, in *Schubert: Perspektiven* 10/1 (2010), pp. 106–112.
- _____, ‘“Unvollendet” oder abgebrochen? Werkstatus und Manuskripttypologie bei Franz Schubert’, in *Schubert: Perspektiven* 5 (2005), pp. 183–203.
- _____, ‘Die Sonatenform im Spätwerk Franz Schuberts’, in *Schubert: Perspektiven* 4 (2004), pp. 16–49.
- _____, *Untersuchungen zur Entwicklung der Sonatenform in der Instrumentalmusik Franz Schuberts* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 1994).
- Hirsch, Marjorie Wing, *Schubert’s Dramatic Lieder* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993).
- _____, *Romantic Lieder and the Search for Lost Paradise* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- _____, ‘Schubert’s Reconciliation of Classical and Gothic Influences’, in *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 149–170.
- Hoffmann, E.T.A., *E.T.A. Hoffmann’s Musical Writings: Kreisleriana, The Poet and the Composer, Music Criticism*, ed. David Charlton and trans. Martyn Clarke (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989).
- _____, *Tales of E.T.A. Hoffmann*, ed. and trans. Leonard J. Kent and Elizabeth C. Knight (Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1972).
- Howe, Blake, ‘Bounded finitude and boundless infinitude: Schubert’s contradictions at the “final barrier”’, in *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 357–382.

- _____, 'The Allure of Dissolution: Bodies, Forces, and Cyclicity in Schubert's Final Mayrhofer Settings', *Journal of the American Musicological Society*, 62/2 (2009), pp. 271–322.
- _____, 'Whose *Winterreise*?', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 13/1 (2016), pp. 113–122.
- _____, review of Lauri Suurpää, *Death in Winterreise: Musico-Poetic Associations in Schubert's Song Cycle* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014), *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* (2017) <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1479409817000726>.
- Hughes, William et al. (eds), *The Encyclopaedia of the Gothic*, 2 vols (New York: John Wiley & Sons, 2015).
- Hutchings, Arthur, *Schubert* (London: J.M. Dent, 1945/repr. 1956).
- Hyland, Anne M., 'The "Tightened Bow": Analysing the Juxtaposition of Drama and Lyricism in Schubert's Paratactic Sonata-Form Movements', in *Irish Musical Analysis: Irish Musical Studies* 11, ed. Julian Horton and Gareth Cox (Dublin: Four Courts Press, 2014), pp. 17–40.
- _____, 'In Search of Liberated Time, or Schubert's Quartet in G Major, D. 887: Once More Between Sonata and Variation', *Music Theory Spectrum* 38/1 (2016), pp. 85–108.
- _____, 'In What Respect Monumental? Schubert's *Quartettsatz* and the Dialectics of Private and Public', in *The String Quartet from the Private to the Public Sphere*, ed. Christian Speck (Turnhout: Brepols, 2016).
- Johnson, Graham, *Franz Schubert: The Complete Songs*, 3 volumes (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 2014).
- Johnson, Julian, *Out of Time: Music and the Making of Modernity* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015).
- _____, 'The Breaking of the Voice', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 8/2, special issue: 'Mahler: Centenary Commentaries on Musical Meaning' (November 2011), pp. 179–195.
- _____, *Mahler's Voices: Expression and Irony in the Songs and Symphonies* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).
- _____, 'The Status of the Subject in Mahler's Ninth Symphony', *19th-Century Music* 18/2 (1994), pp. 108–120.
- Kallberg, Jeffrey, 'Sex, Sexuality, and Schubert's Piano Music', in *Historical Musicology: Sources, Methods, Interpretations*, ed. Stephen Crist et al. (Rochester: University of Rochester Press, 2004), pp. 219–233.
- Kangas, Ryan R., 'Mourning, Remembrance, and Mahler's "Resurrection"', *19th-Century Music* 36/1 (Summer 2012), pp. 58–83.
- Kayser, Wolfgang, *The Grottesque in Art and Literature*, trans. Ulrich Weisstein (New York: Columbia University Press, 1957).

- Keefe, Simon, *Mozart in Vienna: The Final Decade* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017).
- Kerman, Joseph, 'Beethoven's Opus 131 and the Uncanny', *19th-Century Music* 25/2–3 (2001), pp. 155–64
- Kirkby, F.E., 'The Germanic Symphony of the Nineteenth Century: Genre, Form, Instrumentation, Expression', *Journal of Musicological Research* 14/2 (2008), pp. 193–221.
- Kinderman, William, 'Wandering Archetypes in Schubert's Instrumental Music', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 208–22.
- _____, 'Schubert's Tragic Perspective', in *Schubert: Critical and Analytical Studies*, ed. Walter Frisch (Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press, 1986), pp. 65–83.
- _____, 'Schubert's Piano Music: Probing the Human Condition', in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 155–173.
- _____, 'Franz Schubert's "New Style" and the Legacy of Beethoven', in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 43–44.
- _____, *Beethoven* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).
- _____, *Mozart's Piano Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2006).
- Klein, Michael L., 'Bloom, Freud, and Riffaterre: Influence and Intertext as Signs of the Uncanny', in *Intertextuality in Western Art Music* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 2004), pp. 77–107.
- _____, 'Chopin's Fourth Ballade as Musical Narrative', *Music Theory Spectrum* 26/1 (2004), pp. 23–56.
- _____, *Symphonic Metamorphoses: Subjectivity and Alienation in Mahler's Re-Cycled Songs* (Middletown: Wesleyan University Press, 2003).
- Kok, Roe-Min and Laura Tunbridge (eds), *Rethinking Schumann* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).
- Korstvedt, Benjamin K., "'The prerogative of late style": thoughts on the expressive world of Schubert's late works', in *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 2016), pp. 404–425.
- _____, *Bruckner: Symphony No. 8* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000).
- Kramer, Lawrence, *Music as Cultural Practice, 1800–1900* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990).

- _____, *Franz Schubert: Sexuality, Subjectivity, Song* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1998).
- _____, 'Ghost Stories: Cultural Memory, Mourning, and the Myth of Originality', in *Musical Meaning: Toward a Critical History* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), pp. 258–287.
- _____, 'Romantic Meaning in Chopin's Prelude in A Minor', *19th-Century Music* 9/2 (1985), pp. 145–155.
- _____, *Interpreting Music* (California: University of California Press, 2011).
- _____, 'Subjectivity Unbound: Music, Language, Culture', in *The Cultural Study of Music: A Critical Introduction*, ed. Martin Clayton, Trevor Herbert, and Richard Middleton (New York: Routledge, 2012), pp. 395–406.
- _____, 'Recalling the Sublime: The Logic of Creation in Haydn's *Creation*', *Eighteenth-Century Music* 6/1 (2009), pp. 41–57.
- Kramer, Richard, *Distant Cycles: Schubert and the Conceiving of Song* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1994).
- _____, 'Schubert's Heine', *19th-Century Music* 8/3 (1985), pp. 213–225.
- _____, 'Against the Grain: The Sonata in G (D. 894) and a hermeneutics of late style', in *Schubert's Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 111–133.
- _____, 'Gradus ad Parnassum: Beethoven, Schubert, and the Romance of Counterpoint', *19th-Century Music* 11/2 (1987), pp. 107–120.
- Krause, Andreas, *Die Klaviersonaten Franz Schuberts: Form, Gattung, Ästhetik* (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1992).
- Krebs, Harald, review of Charles Fisk, *Returning Cycles: Contexts for the Interpretation of Schubert's Impromptus and Last Sonatas* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2001), *Music Theory Spectrum* 25/2 (2003), pp. 388–400.
- Kube, Michael, 'Zur Satztechnik in Schuberts Sonate für Klavier, Violine und Violoncello, B-Dur D 28 (Triosatz)', in *Bach und Schubert: Beiträge zur Musikforschung* (Munich: Katzbichler [Jahrbuch der Bachwochen Dill], 1999), pp. 15–22.
- Kurth, Richard, 'On the Subject of Schubert's "Unfinished" Symphony: *Was bedeutet die Bewegung?*', *Nineteenth-Century Music* 23/1 (1999), pp. 3–32.
- _____, 'Music and Poetry, A Wilderness of Doubles: Heine–Nietzsche–Schubert–Derrida', *19th-Century Music* 21/1 (1997), pp. 3–37.
- Lambert, John, 'Franz Schubert and the Sea of Eternity', *Journal of Musicology* 21/1 (2004), pp. 241–66.

- Lee, Sherry, “‘Ein seltsam Spielen’: Narrative, Performance, and Impossible Voice in Mahler’s *Das klagende Lied*”, *19th-Century Music* 35/1 (2011), pp. 72–89.
- Le Guin, Elizabeth, “‘One Says That One Weeps, but One Does Not Weep’: *Sensible, Grotesque, and Mechanical Embodiments in Boccherini’s Chamber Music*”, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 55/2 (Summer 2002), pp. 207–254.
- _____, *Boccherini’s Body: An Essay in Carnal Musicology* (California: University of California Press, 2005).
- Le Huray, Peter and James Day (eds), *Music and Aesthetics in the Eighteenth and Early Nineteenth Centuries* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1981).
- Leppert, Richard, ‘On Reading Adorno Hearing Schubert’, *19th-Century Music* 29/1 (2005), pp. 56–63.
- Levin, Robert, ‘Mozart’s Solo Keyboard Music’, in *Eighteenth-Century Keyboard Music*, ed. Robert L. Marshall (New York: Routledge, 2003), pp. 282–319.
- Levy, Janet, ‘Texture as a Sign in Classic and Early Romantic Music’, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 35/3 (1982), pp. 482–531.
- Liddle, Jamie, ‘The Sublime as a Topic in Beethoven’s Late Piano Sonatas’, in *Music, Analysis, Experience: New Perspectives in Musical Semiotics*, ed. Costantino Maeder and Mark Reybrouck (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2015), pp. 301–314.
- Link, Dorothea and Judith Nagley (eds), *Words about Mozart: Essays in honour of Stanley Sadie*. (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2005).
- Litschauer, Walburga (ed.), *Neue Dokumente zum Schubert-Kreis: Aus Briefen und Tagebüchern seiner Freunde* (Vienna: Musikwissenschaftlicher Verlag, 1986).
- Lochhead, Judy, ‘The Sublime, the Ineffable, and Other Dangerous Aesthetics’, *Women and Music: A Journal of Gender and Culture* 12 (2008), pp. 63–74.
- Lynch, Deidre Shauna, ‘Gothic Fiction’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Fiction in the Romantic Period*, ed. Richard Maxwell (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), pp. 47–64.
- Macdonald, Hugh, ‘Schubert’s Volcanic Temper’, *The Musical Times* 119 (1978), pp. 949–52.
- Mahoney, Dennis (ed.), *The Literature of German Romanticism* (Woodbridge: Boydell & Brewer, 2004).
- McClary, Susan, ‘Constructions of Subjectivity in Schubert’s Music’, in *Queering the Pitch: The New Gay and Lesbian Musicology*, ed. Philip Brett, Gary Thomas, and Elizabeth Wood (New York and London: Routledge, 1994), pp. 205–233.
- _____, *Conventional Wisdom: The Content of Musical Form* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, California: University of California Press, 2000).
- _____, ‘The Impromptu that Trod on a Loaf: Or How Music Tells Stories’, *Narrative* 5/1 (1997), pp. 20–35.

- Mak, Su Yin, 'Schubert's Sonata Forms and the Poetics of the Lyric', *Journal of Musicology* 23/2 (2006), pp. 263–306.
- _____, 'Schubert as Schiller's Sentimental Poet', *Eighteenth-Century Music* 4/2 (2007), pp. 251–263.
- _____, 'Et in Arcadia Ego: The Elegiac Structure of Schubert's *Quartettsatz* in C Minor (D. 703)', in *The Unknown Schubert*, ed. Barbara Reul and Lorraine Byrne Bodley (Farnham: Ashgate, 2008), pp. 145–153.
- _____, *Schubert's Lyricism Reconsidered. Structure, Design and Rhetoric* (Saarbrücken: Lambert, 2010).
- Marston, Nicholas, 'Schubert's Homecoming', *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 125/2 (2000), pp. 248–270.
- Marston, Nicholas, *Schumann: Fantasie, op. 17* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992).
- Mathew, Nicholas, 'Beethoven's Political Music, the Handelian Sublime, and the Aesthetics of Prostration', *19th-Century Music* 33/2 (2009), pp. 110–150.
- McClelland, Clive, 'Death and the Composer: The Context of Schubert's Supernatural Lieder' in *Schubert the Progressive: History, Performance Practice, Analysis*, ed. Brian Newbould (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003), pp. 21–35.
- _____, *Ombra: Supernatural Music in the Eighteenth Century* (Lexington: Lanham, 2012).
- _____, 'Ombra and Tempesta', *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory*, ed. Danuta Mirka (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), pp. 279–300.
- McKay Elizabeth N., *Franz Schubert: A Biography* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996).
- _____, *Schubert: The Piano and Dark Keys* (Tutzing: Schneider, 2009).
- McMullan, Gordon and Sam Smiles (eds), *Late Style and its Discontents: Essays in Art, Literature, and Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016).
- _____, *Schubert: The Piano and Dark Keys* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider, 2009).
- Messing, Scott, *Schubert in the European Imagination*, 2 volumes (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2006).
- Mirka, Danuta (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Topic Theory* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014).
- Mishra, Vijay, *The Gothic Sublime* (Albany, NY: State University of New York Press, 1994).
- Monelle, Raymond, *The Sense of Music: Semiotic Essays* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2000).
- _____, *The Musical Topic: Hunt, Military and Pastoral* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press).

- Monitz, Karl Philipp, *Launen und Phantasien* (Berlin: Ernst Felisch, 1796).
- Montgomery, David, *Unfinished History: A New Account of Franz Schubert's Symphony in B minor* (Florida: Brown Walker Press, 2017).
- Moyer, Birgitte, 'Ombra and Fantasia in Late Eighteenth-Century Theory and Practice', in *Convention in Eighteenth- and Nineteenth-Century Music: Essays in Honor of Leonard G. Ratner*, ed. Wye J. Allanbrook, Janet M. Levy, and William P. Mahrt (Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press 1992), pp. 283–306.
- Mulvey-Roberts, Marie, *The Handbook of the Gothic* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009).
- Muxfeldt, Kristina, 'Schubert's Songs: The transformation of a genre', in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 121–137.
- _____, *Vanishing Sensibilities: Schubert, Beethoven, Schumann* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).
- Myron, Martin, 'Henry Fuseli and Gothic Spectacle', *Huntington Library Quarterly* 70/2 (2007), pp. 289–310.
- Napier, Elizabeth R., *The Failure of Gothic: Problems of Disjunction in an Eighteenth-Century Literary Form* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1987).
- Neumayr, Anton, *Musik und Medizin: am Beispiel der Wiener Klassik* (Vienna: Edition Wien, 1987).
- Newbould, Brian, *Schubert* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1997).
- _____, (ed.), *Schubert the Progressive: History, Performance Practice, Analysis* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2003).
- _____, *Schubert and the Symphony: A New Perspective* (London: Toccata Press, 1992).
- Newcomb, Anthony, 'Once More Between Absolute and Program Music: Schumann's Second Symphony', *19th-Century Music* 7/3 (1984), pp. 233–250.
- _____, 'Schumann and Late Eighteenth-Century Narrative Strategies', *Nineteenth-Century Music* XI/2 (1987), pp. 164–174.
- Notley, Margaret, *Lateness and Brahms: Music and Culture in the Twilight of Viennese Liberalism* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2007).
- _____, 'Schubert's Social Music: The "Forgotten Genres"', in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 138–154.
- November, Nancy, 'Haydn's Melancholy Voice: Lost Dialectics in his Late Chamber Music and English Songs', *Eighteenth-Century Music* 4/1 (2007), pp. 71–106.
- O'Shea, John, *Music and Medicine: Medical Profiles of Great Composers* (London: J.M. Dent, 1990).

- Paddison, Max, 'Reading History in the Ruins of Nature: Images of Truth, Mortality and Reconciliation in Adorno's Schubert Interpretation', in *Expression, Truth, and Authenticity: On Adorno's Theory of Music and Musical Performance*, ed. Mário Vieira de Carvalho (Lisbon: Edições Colibri, 2009), pp. 41–58.
- Painter, Karen and Thomas Crow (eds), *Late Thoughts: Reflections on Artists and Composers at Work* (Los Angeles: Getty Research Institute, 2006).
- Peattie, Thomas, 'In Search of Lost Time: Mahler's Broken Pastoral' in *Mahler and his World*, ed. Karen Painter (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2002), pp. 185–98.
- _____, *Gustav Mahler's Symphonic Landscapes* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015).
- Perrey, Beate, 'Exposed: Adorno and Schubert in 1928', *19th-Century Music* 29/1 (2005), pp. 15–24.
- _____, *Schumann's 'Dichterliebe' and Early Romantic Poetics: Fragmentation of Desire* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002).
- Perry, Jeffrey, 'The Wanderer's Many Returns: Schubert's Variations Reconsidered', *Journal of Musicology* 19/2 (2002), pp. 374–416.
- Pesic, Peter, 'Schubert's Dream', *19th-Century Music* 23/2 (1999), pp. 136–144.
- Petty, Wayne, 'Chopin and the Ghost of Beethoven', *19th-Century Music* 22 (1999), pp. 281–299.
- Phelan, Anthony, 'Prose Fiction of the German Romantics', in *The Cambridge Companion to German Romanticism*, ed. Nicholas Saul (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009), pp. 41–66.
- Pinson, Patricia, 'The Shattered Frame: A Study of the Grotesque in Nineteenth-Century Literature and Music' (PhD dissertation, Ohio University, 1971).
- Plantinga, Leon, 'Schubert, Social Music and Melancholy', in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 237–250.
- Pleasants, Henry (ed.), *Schumann on Music: A Selection from the Writings* (New York: Dover, 1988).
- Protano-Biggs, Laura, 'Bellini's Gothic Voices: Bellini, "Un grido io sento" (Alaide), *La straniera*, Act I', *Cambridge Opera Journal* 28 (2016), pp. 149–54.
- Punter, David, *The Literature of Terror: A History of Gothic Terror From 1765 to the Present Day* 2nd edn, 2 vols (London and New York: Routledge, 1996).
- _____, *The Gothic Condition: Terror, History and the Psyche* (Cardiff: University of Wales Press, 2016).
- Rast, Nicholas, 'Une déclaration d'amour en code? La Fantaisie en *fa* mineur D940 de Schubert et la comtesse Caroline Esterházy', *Cahiers Franz Schubert* 13 (October 1998), pp. 5–16.
- _____, "'Schöne Welt wo bist du?" Motive and Form in Schubert's A-Minor String Quartet', in *Schubert the Progressive: History, Performance*

- Practice, Analysis*, ed. Brian Newbould (Farnham: Ashgate, 2003), pp. 81–88.
- Ratner, Leonard, *Classic Music: Form, Expression, Style* (NY: Schirmer, 1980).
- _____, *Romantic Music: Sound and Syntax* (New York: Schirmer, 1992).
- Rayner, Alice, *Ghosts: Death's Double and the Phenomena of Theatre* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2006).
- Reddy, William, *The Navigation of Feeling: A Framework for the History of Emotions* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).
- Reed, John, *The Schubert Song Companion* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1985).
- _____, *Schubert, Master Musicians* (London: J.M. Dent, 1987).
- Rehding, Alexander, *Music and Monumentality: Commemoration and Wonderment in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2009).
- Reul, Barbara M. and Lorraine Byrne Bodley (eds), *The Unknown Schubert* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2008).
- Reynolds, Christopher A., *Motives for Allusion: Context and Content in Nineteenth-Century Music* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2003).
- Richards, Annette, *The Free Fantasia and the Musical Picturesque* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001).
- _____, 'Haydn's London Trios and the Rhetoric of the Grotesque', in *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, ed. Tom Beghin and Sander M. Goldberg (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), pp. 251–280.
- _____, 'Automatic Genius: Mozart and the Mechanical Sublime', *Music & Letters* 80/3 (1999), pp. 336–389.
- Riley, Matthew, *Musical Listening in the German Enlightenment: Attention, Wonder and Astonishment* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2004).
- Rosen, Charles, *The Romantic Generation* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1998).
- Rumph, Stephen, *Beethoven after Napoleon: Political Romanticism in the Late Works* (Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 2004).
- _____, *Mozart and Enlightenment Semiotics* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012).
- _____, "'A Kingdom Not of This World": The Political Content of E.T.A. Hoffmann's Beethoven Criticism', *19th-Century Music* 19 (1995), pp. 50–67.
- Rushton, Julian, 'Schubert, the Tarantella, and the Quartettsatz, D. 703', in *Variations on the Canon: Essays on Music from Bach to Boulez in Honor of Charles Rosen on his Eightieth Birthday*, ed. Robert Curry, David Gable, and Robert

- L. Marshall (Rochester, NY: University of Rochester Press, 2008), pp. 163–171.
- Said, Edward, *On Late Style: Music and Literature Against the Grain* (London: Bloomsbury Publishing, 2006).
- Samuels, Robert, ‘Schubert’s Instrumental Voice: Vocality in Melodic Construction in the Late Works’, in *On Voice Word and Music Studies* 13, ed. Walter Bernhart and Lawrence Kramer (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2014), pp. 161–178.
- _____, ‘The Double Articulation of Schubert: Reflections on Der Doppelgänger’, *The Musical Quarterly* 93/1 (2010), pp. 192–233.
- _____, *Mahler’s Sixth Symphony: A Study in Musical Semiotics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1995).
- Shaw, Philip, *The Sublime* (London, New York: Routledge, 2006).
- Schering, Albert, *Franz Schuberts Symphonie in H-Moll (‘Unvollendete’) und ihr Geheimnis* (Würzburg: Konrad Tritsch Verlag, 1938).
- Schlegel, Friedrich, *Philosophical Fragments*, trans. Peter Firchow (Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press, 1991).
- Schmalfeldt, Janet, *In the Process of Becoming: Analytical and Philosophical Perspectives on Form in Early Nineteenth-Century Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).
- Schwarz, David, ‘Music and the Gaze: Schubert’s “Der Doppelgänger” and “Ihr Bild”’, in *Listening Subjects: Music, Psychoanalysis, Culture* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1997), pp. 64–86.
- Sheinbaum, John J., ‘Adorno’s Mahler and the Timbral Outsider’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 131/1 (2006), pp. 38–82.
- Sheinberg, Esti, *Irony, Satire, Parody and the Grotesque in the Music of Shostakovich: A Theory of Musical Incongruities* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2000).
- Sisman, Elaine, *Haydn and the Classical Variation* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993).
- _____, *Mozart: The ‘Jupiter’ Symphony* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993).
- _____, ‘Learned Style and the Rhetoric of the Sublime in the “Jupiter” Symphony’, in *Wolfgang Amadé Mozart: Essays on His Life and Music*, ed. Stanley Sadie (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996), pp. 213–238.
- Sly, Gordon (ed.), *Keys to the Drama: Nine Perspectives on Sonata Forms* (Farnham, Surrey and Burlington, VT: Ashgate, 2009).
- _____, ‘Schubert’s Innovations in Sonata Form: Compositional Logic and Structural Interpretation’, *Journal of Music Theory* 45/1 (2001), pp. 130–134.
- Smith, Andrew, *Gothic Death 1740–1914: A Literary History* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2016).

- Sobaskie, James William, 'Tonal Implication and the Gestural Dialectic in Schubert's A Minor String Quartet', in *Schubert the Progressive: History, Performance, Practice, Analysis*, ed. Brian Newbould (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2003), pp. 53–79.
- _____, 'The "Problem" of Schubert's String Quintet', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 2/1 (2005), pp. 57–92.
- _____, 'A Balance Struck: Gesture, Form, and Drama in Schubert's E flat Major Piano Trio', in *Le style instrumental de Schubert: sources, analyse, contexte, évolution*, ed. Xavier Hascher (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2007), pp. 115–146.
- _____, 'Schubert's Self-Elegies', *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 5/2 (2008), pp. 71–105.
- Solomon, Maynard, 'Franz Schubert and the Peacocks of Benvenuto Cellini', *19th-Century Music* 13/3 (1989), pp. 193–206.
- _____, 'Schubert's "Unfinished" Symphony', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 111–133.
- _____, 'Franz Schubert's "My Dream"', *American Imago* 38/2 (1981), pp. 137–154.
- _____, *Late Beethoven: Music, Thought, Imagination* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2003).
- _____, *Mozart: A Life* (London: Harper Perennial, 1995).
- Spitzer, Michael, 'Mapping the Human Heart: A Holistic Analysis of Fear in Schubert', *Music Analysis* 29/1–3 (2010), pp. 149–213.
- _____, *Music as Philosophy: Adorno and Beethoven's Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2006).
- Stanley, Glen, 'Schubert Hearing Don Giovanni: Mozartian Death Music in the "Unfinished" Symphony', in *Schubert's Late Music: History: Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 193–218.
- Stefaniak, Alexander, 'Robert Schumann, Serious Virtuosity, and the Rhetoric of the Sublime', *Journal of Musicology* 33/4 (2016), pp. 433–482.
- _____, *Schumann's Virtuosity: Criticism, Composition, and Performance in Nineteenth-Century Germany* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2016).
- Strahan, Barbara, '(De)Constructing Paradigms of Genre: Aesthetics, Identity and Form in Franz Schubert's Four-Hand Fantasias' (PhD dissertation, Maynooth University, 2013).
- Straus, Joseph N., *Extraordinary Measures: Disability in Music* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011).
- _____, 'Disability and "Late Style" in Music', *Journal of Musicology* 25/1 (2008), pp. 3–45.

- Steblin, Rita, *Die Unsinnsgesellschaft: Franz Schubert, Leopold Kupelwieser und ihr Freundeskreis* (Wien: Böhlau, 1998).
- _____, ‘The Peacock’s Tale: Schubert’s Sexuality Reconsidered’, *19th-Century Music* 17/1 (1993), pp. 5–33.
- Subotnik, Rose R., ‘Adorno’s Diagnosis of Beethoven’s Late Style: Early Symptom of a Fatal Condition’, *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 29/1 (1976), pp. 242–75.
- Sumner-Lott, Marie, *The Social Worlds of Nineteenth-Century Chamber Music: Composers, Consumers, Communities* (Urbana, Chicago and Springfield: University of Illinois Press, 2015).
- Sutcliffe, Dean, ‘The Keyboard Music’, in *The Cambridge Companion to Mozart*, ed. Simon P. Keefe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003), pp. 61–77.
- Suurpää, Lauri, ‘The Path from Tonic to Dominant in the Second Movement of Schubert’s String Quintet and in Chopin’s Fourth Ballade’, *Journal of Music Theory* 44/2 (2000), pp. 451–485.
- _____, *Death in Winterreise: Music-Poetic Associations in Schubert’s Song Cycle* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2014).
- _____, ‘Longing for the Unattainable: The Second movement of the “Great” C major Symphony’, in *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 219–240.
- Swinkin, Jeffrey, ‘The Middle Style/Late Style Dialectic: Problematizing Adorno’s Theory of Beethoven’, *Journal of Musicology* 30/3 (2013), pp. 282–329.
- Taylor, Benedict, ‘Schubert and the Construction of Memory: The String Quartet in A Minor, D. 804 (“Rosamunde”)’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 139/1 (2014), pp. 41–88.
- _____, *Mendelssohn, Time and Memory* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2011).
- _____, *The Melody of Time: Music and Temporality in the Romantic Era* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2015).
- Thym, Jürgen, ‘Invocations of Memory in the Last Songs’, in *Schubert’s Late Music: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 383–404.
- Todd, Larry (ed.), *Nineteenth-Century Piano Music* (New York: Schirmer, 1990).
- Townshend, Dale and Angela Wright (eds), *Ann Radcliffe, Romanticism and the Gothic* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014).
- Tunbridge, Laura, *Schumann’s Late Style* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).
- _____, ‘Saving Schubert: The Evasions of Late Style’, in *Late Style and its Discontents: Essays in Art, Literature, and Music*, ed. Gordon McMullan and Sam Smiles (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016).

- Waidelich, Till Gerrit (ed.), *Franz Schubert: Dokumente, 1817–1830* Vol. 1: *Texte, Programme, Rezensionen, Anzeigen, Nekrologe, Musikbeilagen und andere gedruckte Quellen* (Tutzing: Hans Schneider Verlag, 1993).
- Webber, Andrew, *The Doppelgänger: Double Visions in German Literature* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996).
- Webster, James, 'Schubert's Sonata Form and Brahms' First Maturity, part I' *19th-Century Music* 2 (July 1978), pp. 18–35.
- _____, 'The Rhetoric of Improvisation in Haydn's Keyboard Music', in *Haydn and the Performance of Rhetoric*, ed. Tom Beghin and Sander M. Goldberg (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2007), pp. 172–212.
- _____, 'The Creation, Haydn's Late Vocal Music, and the Musical Sublime', in *Haydn and his World*, ed. Elaine Sisman (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1997), pp. 57–102.
- _____, 'The Sublime and the Pastoral in *The Creation* and *The Seasons*', in *The Cambridge Companion to Haydn*, ed. Caryl Clark (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005), pp. 150–63.
- Wen, Eric, 'Schubert's *Wiegenlied*: The Andante sostenuto from the Piano Sonata in B flat, D. 960', in *Schubert's Late Style: History, Theory, Style*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2016), pp. 134–148.
- Werner Aderhold, Walther Dürr and Walburga Litschauer (ed.), *Franz Schubert: Jahre der Krise 1818–1823, Arnold Feil zum 60. Geburtstag* (Kassel and Basle: Bärenreiter, 1985).
- Wheeldon, Marianne, *Debussy's Late Style* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2009).
- Wheelock, Gretchen, *Haydn's Ingenious Jesting with Art: Contexts of Musical Wit and Humor* (New York: Schirmer, 1992).
- Wheeler, Kathleen (ed.), *German Aesthetic and Literary Criticism: The Romantic Ironists and Goethe* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).
- Winter, Robert, 'Whose Schubert?', *19th-Century Music* 17/1 (1993), pp. 94–101.
- _____, et al., 'Schubert, Franz (Peter)', in *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*, 2nd rev. edn vol. 22 (29 vols, London: Macmillan, 2001 and *Grove Music Online*), pp. 655–729.
- Wittmann, Anna M., 'Gothic Trivialliteratur: From Popular Gothicism to Romanticism', in *European Romanticism: Literary Cross-Currents, Modes, and Models*, ed. Gerhart Hoffmeister (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1990), pp. 59–75.
- Wolff, Christoph, 'Schubert's "Der Tod und das Mädchen": analytical and explanatory notes on the song D 531 and the quartet D 810', in *Schubert Studies: Problems of Style and Chronology*, ed. Eva Badura-Skoda and Peter Branscombe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1982), pp. 143–171.

- Wolff, Janet, *The Aesthetics of Uncertainty* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2008).
- Wurth, Brillenburg Kiene, *Musically Sublime: Indeterminacy, Infinity, Irresolvability* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2012).
- Wollenberg, Susan, 'Schubert and the Dream', *Studi musicali* 9 (1980), pp. 135–150.
- _____, 'Schubert's Transitions', in *Schubert Studies*, ed. Brian Newbould (Farnham: Ashgate, 1998), pp. 16–61.
- _____, 'The C major String Quintet D 956: Schubert's "Dissonance" Quintet?', *Schubert durch die Brille* 28 (2002), pp. 45–55.
- _____, "'Dort, wo du nicht bist, dort ist das Glück": Reflections on Schubert's Second Themes', *Schubert durch die Brille* 30 (2003), pp. 91–100.
- _____, 'Schubert's Poetic Transitions', in *Le style instrumental de Schubert: Sources, analyse, évolution*, ed. Xavier Hascher (Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2007), pp. 261–277.
- _____, "'Es lebe die Ordnung und Betriebsamkeit! Was hilft das beste Herz ohne jene!'" A New Look at Fantasia Elements in the Keyboard Sonatas of C.P.E. Bach', *Eighteenth-Century Music* 4/1 (2007), pp. 119–128.
- _____, *Schubert's Fingerprints: Studies in the Instrumental Works* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2011).
- _____, 'From Song to Instrumental Style: Some Schubert Fingerprints', in *Rethinking Schubert*, ed. Lorraine Byrne Bodley and Julian Horton (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016), pp. 61–76.
- Youens, Susan, *Retracing a Winter's Journey: Schubert's Winterreise* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1991).
- _____, *Franz Schubert: Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge University Press, 1992).
- _____, *Schubert's Poets and the Making of Lieder* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996).
- _____, *Schubert, Müller, and Die schöne Müllerin* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).
- _____, 'Schubert and his Poets: issues and conundrums', in *The Cambridge Companion to Schubert*, ed. Christopher H. Gibbs (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), pp. 99–117.
- _____, 'Of Dwarves, Perversion, and Patriotism: Schubert's "Der Zwerg", D. 771', *19th-Century Music* 21/2 (1997), pp. 177–207.
- _____, *Schubert's Late Lieder: Beyond the Song Cycles* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002).
- _____, *Heinrich Heine and the Lied* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2007).

_____, 'Swan Songs: Schubert's "Auf dem Wasser zu singen"',
Nineteenth-Century Music Review 5/2 (2008), pp. 19–42.