Elisabeth Bolorinos Allard, Visualizing "Moorish" traces within Spain: Orientalism and Medievalist Nostalgia in Spanish Colonial Photojournalism 1909-1933

Abstract: During the Spanish colonization of Morocco (1912-1956), Spanish cultural discourses represented Morocco as a civilization with significant ties to Spain and explored the influences of Spain's Islamic medieval past on Spanish culture and society. Because the colonial campaigns coincided with the development of photojournalism in Spain, the discourse of a Spanish-Moroccan fraternity was expressed in visual form in the press in a plethora of photographs, which evoked the "Moorish trace" in Spain. This essay examines photographs of women and urban spaces in Morocco and Spain as key subjects chosen to represent this trace in photojournalism. It focuses on a number of widely-read photographic magazines between 1909 and 1933, including *La Esfera*, *Mundo gráfico*, *Nuevo mundo*, *Estampa*, and *Ahora*, and the colonial military publication *Revista de tropas coloniales*. The essay argues that photographs of urban spaces in Morocco and Spain served to evoke the memory of Islamic civilization, while images of women served to embody its ethnic and cultural legacy within Spain. It shows how colonial photography was used to recreate a medieval Muslim Iberian past that had long vanished, acting as a vehicle for the medievalist nostalgia that permeated Spanish culture during this period. Ultimately it reveals that Spanish colonial photojournalism orientalized not only North African culture but also Spain itself.

Keywords: colonial photojournalism, Orientalism, Spanish colonialism, Morocco, twentieth-century Spain

Visualizing "Moorish" traces within Spain: Orientalism and Medievalist Nostalgia in Spanish Colonial Photojournalism 1909-1933

by Elisabeth Bolorinos Allard (University of Oxford)

Spanish colonialism in Morocco and the discourse of "Hispano-Moroccan brotherhood"

Photographs of women and architecture functioned as key visual representations of Spain's Islamic heritage in photojournalism during the Spanish colonial campaigns in Morocco between 1909 and 1936. Drawing on photographs published in the metropolitan magazines *La Esfera*, *Mundo gráfico*, *Nuevo mundo*, *Estampa*, *Ahora*, and the colonial military publication *Revista de tropas coloniales*, and engaging with the textual discourses that accompany the images, this article contends that representations of urban spaces in Morocco and Spain serve to evoke the memory of Islamic Spain, while representations of Spanish women serve to embody the ethnic and cultural legacy of Islamic civilization within Spain. The examples selected for discussion are representative of a discourse more widely found in conservative publications during this period.[1] The relationship between urban spaces, female bodies, and cultural identity in this context provides a fascinating case for analysis of the instability of cultural boundaries between Spain and Morocco that was perceived by Spanish writers and photographers during the colonial period, even as Spain attempted to assert cultural dominance over its Moroccan Protectorate (1912-1956).

During Spanish colonial rule in Morocco, which was internationally recognized as part of a shared French and Spanish Protectorate of Morocco from 1912 until 1956, Spanish cultural discourses represented Morocco as a society with significant racial, cultural, and "spiritual" ties to the Iberian Peninsula. The basis for these ties was Spain's own Islamic past, which spanned across eight centuries from the arrival of the first Muslim forces from North Africa in the Iberian Peninsula in 711 and their defeat of the armies of the Visigoth king Rodrigo to the conquest of Granada by the Catholic Monarchs in 1492. These historical ties with Islamic civilization and North African culture in particular came to the forefront during Spain's colonial incursions in Morocco in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Spain had launched a series of military expeditions in Morocco in the nineteenth century (the Hispano-Moroccan War, 1859-69; the Melilla War, 1893-94), and the international Algeciras Treaty

of 1906 granted France and Spain separate 'spheres of influence' in Morocco. In 1909 Spain began to further consolidate its influence in the Rif area of northern Morocco, driven in particular by the potential for mining iron ore and copper, which had also attracted the interest of German and French industrialists.[2] An attack on Spanish railway workers in July 1909 by local tribes in the area outside Melilla, which led to the Battle of Barranco del Lobo, sanctioned further penetration of the Spanish military in the area and eventually led to the international (primarily European) recognition in 1912 of the Spanish and French Protectorates in Morocco. The Spanish Protectorate consisted of approximately one-fifth of the territory of Morocco—the northern region dominated by the Rif Mountains and inhabited primarily by Berber tribes—while the rest of Morocco remained under French control.[3]

Since the late eighteenth century, Spanish intellectuals, politicians, and artists reflected on the significance of Spain's multicultural medieval past in their search for a national identity in the present.[4] The nineteenth century saw the development of Arabic and Hebrew scholarship, which was primarily concerned with the study of Muslim and Jewish influences on Spanish arts and literature, the translation of medieval Arabic and Hebrew texts, and the revision of the history of al-Andalus with the aim of re-assessing its rich cultural legacy.[5] Arabist scholars like José Antonio Conde, Pascual de Gayangos y Arce, Francisco Fernández y González, and José Amador de los Ríos devoted their work to bringing the cultural accomplishments of Islamic Iberian civilization to light. In terms of architecture and the decorative arts, the recognition of the impact of Spain's Islamic past on its architectural heritage was reflected notably in the restoration of the Alhambra by Rafael Contreras beginning in 1847 and the integration of al-Andalus in displays at the Museo Arqueológico Nacional in Madrid under the directorship of José Amador de los Ríos from 1867 onwards. Amador de los Ríos' speech to the Real Academia de Bellas Artes de San Fernando in 1859 on *mudéjar* architecture led to its revival as *neo-mudéjar* in Spain, as

exemplified in its adoption as a dominant pan-Hispanic style in the Ibero-American exhibition in Seville in 1929.[6] However, as Antonio Urquízar Herrera has noted, the interest of Amador de los Ríos and other prominent Arabists in recovering the cultural legacy of Islamic Iberia was tied up with a liberal nationalist ideology that emphasized the hybridisation of Christian and Muslim cultures in the Iberian Peninsula between the thirteenth and fifteenth centuries.[7] As a result, the use of the terms *mudéjar, hispano-árabe, islámico-español,* or even *islámico* by Spanish intellectuals in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries is problematic, because it is less concerned with acknowledging and conceptualising the diversity of architectural and artistic styles that al-Andalus produced than with attempting to integrate Spain's Islamic heritage into narratives of her national history.

Apart from its importance in constructs of Spain's national identity, the memory of Islamic Iberian civilization was also invoked by advocates of colonial expansion to argue that Spain had a colonial claim over North Africa that no other European nation could contest. Early twentieth-century writers, who attempted to construct an image of Spain's economic and cultural superiority over Morocco, described the relationship between the two countries in fraternal terms, portraying Morocco as a "younger brother," a once-great civilization with Iberian roots, now in decay and in need of the help and guidance of the stronger, more advanced civilization of Spain.[8] In a speech given at the first Centro Hispano-Marroquí in 1907, an institution established to celebrate the links between the two cultures, the Arabist scholar and architect Eduardo de Saavedra declared of Spain's colonial ambitions:

> Our purpose is to establish a peaceful colonial venture in Morocco, the civilization of our brothers, our neighbours, whom we desire to protect and lift out of backwardness.[9]

The assertion of power underlying this discourse is clear in the description of al-Andalus provided by Tomás García Figueras, a colonial administrator and historian who was instrumental in articulating this discourse of fraternity throughout Spanish colonial rule in Morocco: "that coexistence of Africans and Andalusians that was so fruitful […] has endowed us with an unparalleled qualification to act as spiritual leaders of the Moroccan people."[10] This appropriation and oversimplification of the legacy of al-Andalus is reflected in the terms used by writers in the period under study, who described Islamic Iberian culture as ¨Hispano-marroquí" or "islámico-español", both of which are anachronistic and culturally possessive, or using the term *moro* or "Moorish" , which fails to take account of the exchange and sharing of styles and cultures across societies and religions within al-Andalus. The term *moro,* from the Latin *mauri* or *maurusci*, the Roman word for the Berbers of North Africa,[11] was used throughout the colonial period to refer to Moroccans as well as to Spain's medieval Muslims, which is why I use it to paraphrase the sources I cite in this article, despite the fact that it now carries strongly negative connotations.

Spain's political and cultural interests in Morocco during the colonial campaigns in the early twentieth century coincided with the development of photojournalism in Spain, with the creation from the turn of the century onwards of new photographic magazines like *Nuevo Mundo* (Madrid 1894), *Mundo gráfico* (Madrid, 1911), and *La Esfera* (Madrid, 1914), all of which formed part of a large press corporation, Prensa Gráfica.[12] Established newspapers from a range of ideological perspectives, such as *ABC*, *La Libertad,* and *El Imparcial*, also began to include photographs alongside their articles in this period. In the first decades of the century, nearly all of the photographers that rose to prominence in Spain forged their careers as photojournalists in the Rif for the aforementioned newspapers and magazines as well as those established later in the 1920s like *Estampa* (Madrid, 1928) and *Ahora* (Madrid, 1930).[13] As a result, the concept of a "Hispano-Moroccan brotherhood" was

articulated visually as well as textually in publications that implicitly or explicitly propagated ideologies that supported the colonial venture. Scholars from a range of disciplines have explored how Spanish writers during this period engaged with the Islamic world in their narratives of Spanish cultural identity, including Juan Goytisolo (1982) and more recently Susan Martín-Márquez (2008) and Patricia Hertel (2015).[14] Visual constructs of this identity, particularly in photojournalism, have hitherto received less attention, although Martín-Márquez has discussed the work of the photographer José Ortiz Echagüe (1886-1980) and how it exposes the astonishing similarities between lifestyle and culture on either sides of the Strait,[15] and Jordana Mendelson (2005) has commented on the importance of documentary photography in the construction of national identity, in terms of taking stock of heritage and providing evidence for cultural, linguistic, and geographic differences and similarities between Spain and North Africa.[16]

Ali Behdad and Luke Gartlan have recently asserted that colonial photography played a key role in forming and upholding a distinctively Orientalist view of the Middle East and North Africa,[17] based on Edward Said's definition of Orientalism as a Western style of thought, imagery, and language used to represent the "Orient" for European audiences and to legitimize Western power in colonial relationships throughout the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.[18] Behdad argues that the photograph provided a substitute for the Orientalist travelogue,[19] offering a visual experience of exotic cultures that had hitherto been unavailable for most people and serving to nurture the desire for the "Orient" while affirming notions of Western cultural superiority. However, in the case of Spain, which had itself been orientalized by other European cultures since the sixteenth century,[20] the gaze of the photographer was turned inwards towards Spain as well as outwards towards the Protectorate of Morocco in order to represent the cultural ties between Spain and North Africa. This article argues that as a result, visual narratives of Spanish colonialism serve simultaneously to

foster a desire for the "Orient", mystify Spain's Islamic heritage, and nurture a nostalgia for the medieval Iberian past. This past would become a key feature of the nationalist ideologies that took shape in Spain in the decades before the Spanish Civil War (1936-39). In this aspect, although Spain orientalizes and indeed colonizes Morocco, it also orientalizes its own culture and history. This article explores this process of self-othering in a selection of publications that supported the colonial campaigns and articulated the colonialist ideology of "Hispano-Moroccan brotherhood", focusing on photographs of women and architecture as key visual representations of Spain's Muslim heritage, often described by contemporary commentators as the "traza mora" or "Moorish imprint" within Spain.[21]

Urban spaces as traces of Islamic Iberia

The discourse of "Hispano-Moroccan brotherhood" is manifested in its visual form in the press in a plethora of photographs of medieval architecture in Spain and Morocco. The architecture of the main cities in the Spanish Protectorate, such as Tetuan, which became the capital of the Spanish Protectorate in 1912, and Chefchaouen, which was captured by Spanish troops in 1920, showed the influence of architectural styles from Spain, the legacy of the Jewish and Muslim refugees from the Iberian Peninsula who had settled there in large numbers in the fifteenth and sixteenth centuries. Both Tetuan and Chefchaoun had an Andalusi quarter and a Jewish quarter that had been constructed by these refugee communities.[22] Photojournalism explored the architectural similarities between these cities and other Spanish cities with a significant Islamic heritage, such as Seville, Granada, Córdoba, and Toledo. The mouthpiece of the colonial administration *Revista de tropas coloniales* (entitled *África* from 1926 onwards)—founded in 1924 by General Gonzalo Queipo de Llano and a then little-known Lieutenant Colonel Francisco Franco, provides an

example of this visual discourse. The journal was unique among the colonial publications in its wealth of graphic material, including the work of well-known photographers such as Bartolomé Ros, and artists like Mariano Bertuchi, who became a key figure in visualizing the Protectorate for Spanish audiences. It also featured regular contributions by military figures who would later become leaders in the Spanish Civil War: Emilio Mola, Gonzalo Queipo de Llano, and of course Francisco Franco. It contained a photographic section entitled *La España musulmana* of Islamic art and architecture throughout Spain (Figure 1) and another entitled *Marruecos artístico,* which offered the reader "picturesque" scenes of Morocco, including images of various Islamic architectural styles without any accompanying text other than a basic caption identifying the building, often only generically. As an example, the photograph of a building published in *Revista de tropas coloniales* in September 1925 (figure 2) is identified as a "medarsa" (a corruption of the Arabic *madrassa* or school) in Fez. This vague identification reflects the Spanish colonial administration's lack of knowledge of Moroccan history and culture and their use of architectural imagery in Morocco in order to construct a romantic narrative of the Spanish past rather than to comment on the nuanced relationship between Spanish and Moroccan architectural styles. There were a few officers who demonstrated an interest in the languages and cultures of Morocco, such as General Jordana, General Berenguer, and General Castro Girona, who sometimes contributed to the pages of *África*, but these "enlightened" Arabists were a minority.[23]

In his iconic description of the *punctum* of a photograph, "the element that rises from the scene […] and pierces me," Roland Barthes suggested that photographs should inspire a longing or a disturbance.[24] In the case of the photographs of Moroccan cityscapes in *África,* this longing can be interpreted within the framework of Orientalism and the role of colonial photojournalism in mystifying the East with the effect of realism.[25] Photographs of buildings, such as the 'medarsa' (fig. 2) published in the journal in 1927, showing dark windows, spaces

shrouded in shadow, and hooded figures, nurture an Orientalist image of a mysterious North Africa, inspiring a longing in the viewer to peer into its intimate, inaccessible spaces. Photojournalism during this period also mystifies spaces within Spain, and does so in order to provide an imaginative reconstitution of the medieval past shared between Spain and North Africa. A photograph of a long-abandoned patio of the Alhambra (as in fig. 1) might inspire a desire in the viewer to see the palace inhabited once again by the great civilization of the Nasrids, a longing to see these spaces as they were, not as they are, and, in a sense, to inhabit the past. Photographic reports, such as the one of Tetuan published in *La Esfera* in 1922 (figure 3), were intended to prompt an imaginative reconstitution not only of medieval North Africa, but also of the medieval appearance of urban spaces in Spain. The caption to the photographs, which is the only text featured in the article, reads:

> As we contemplate these narrow and crooked streets, where the Moors of Granada took refuge after having been cast out of their last stronghold by the Catholic monarchs, the image evokes in all its fullness the picture of that rich Muslim life that pulsed for centuries in Seville, in Granada, in Córdoba, in Toledo.[26]

La Esfera was aimed at an elite, politically conservative audience and thus presented a positive view of the Spanish colonial ventures in Morocco,[27] which were largely supported by bourgeois elites with commercial interests in North Africa and by devout Catholics, who saw in them the chance to revive Spain's imperial Christian 'civilizing' mission.[28] As a journal that was created in 1924 to articulate the ideology of the Africanist military, the *Revista de tropas coloniales* (which became *África* in 1926) was largely aimed at the colonial officer class, although, once it was printed in Madrid from 1926 onwards, it was also accessible to a metropolitan audience with an interest in "Hispano-African" cultural studies.[29] By celebrating Spain's Islamic past, the articles published in magazines like these reaffirm the imperialist vision of Morocco as a weaker younger brother. Likewise, there is a clear hierarchy of belonging underlying the celebration of cultural ties that is not immediately

evident in the photographs themselves. In colonial discourse, "Hispano-Arab" Moroccan culture is distinguished from Moroccan culture in general. [30] A dichotomy is established between urban spaces, which are associated with the history of al-Andalus and portrayed as inhabited by tolerant and refined Moroccan descendants of Iberian Muslim exiles, and rural spaces, which are represented as inhabited by primitive and fanatical Berber tribes. For example, an article discussing the 'races' of the Rif, published in *La Esfera* in 1921, claims that the Arabs or "Moors" of Morocco are civilized and "cultured" city dwellers who have little in common with the *kabileños* (a term used to describe Berber tribes) that Spain was attempting to "pacify" in the Rif.[31] In this process of cultural identification, only the admirable aspects of Moroccan culture are linked to Spain. The colonialist discourse of brotherhood asserts that every significant contribution to North African culture derives from Islamic Iberian civilization, as the Andalusian nationalist and Arabist scholar Gil Benomar writes in *África* in 1926, "everything of worth in Moroccan culture, from religious mysticism, to decorative art, literature, and music, was imported from Muslim Spain."[32] In this aspect, images of urban spaces are used to reinforce the racial and cultural hierarchy that Spanish colonial writers establish within Moroccan society between the "Andalusian Arabs" of the cities and the "primitive Moors" of the rural areas of the Rif.

Early observers of the photographic medium marveled at its ability to preserve the past in palpable authenticity, and photography has often been interpreted as an attempt to conserve a vanishing history.[33] In this case, however, photography represented an attempt to recreate a past that has already vanished or a past that never existed. This past is not a colonial past, but a 'national' past. Writers in photographic magazines during the colonial campaigns emphasize the evocative power of the photograph. *Mundo gráfico*— which had a politically conservative but broader readership than *La Esfera* and *África*—introduces a photographic report on Granada (figure 4), which states that "these images have the power to

evoke, upon their contemplation, that ancient legend and fantasy that we have of Moorish Granada."[34] Commenting on photographs of the medieval Jewish quarter in Toledo, published in *La Esfera* in 1927, the journalist writes: "the influence of the photographic medium is such that the ardor of our imaginations causes us to hear the names of Cuellar and Samuel, of Lasarte and David echoing through the dark and narrow streets."[35] The article was written by Rodolfo Gil Fernández, a medievalist scholar, art historian, politician, and a journalist who wrote prolifically in the 1920s on Iberian Islamic and Jewish cultures. Here he uses the photographs as the starting point for a discussion of the multicultural society of medieval Segovia and its cultural achievements. In addition to mentioning the above generic Jewish names, he describes the *judería* or Jewish quarter as the place where the twelfth-century Cordoban philosopher Maimonides and the physician, poet, and philosopher Judah Halevi wrote and "philosophized." The images of these urban spaces were intended to evoke a vividly sensory memory of an imagined past community.

Cities are palimpsests, spaces that are altered over time yet bear visible traces of their earlier form. In his *Arcades Project* (1927-1940), which traces the relationship between cultural identity and architecture in the urban spaces of early twentieth-century Paris, Walter Benjamin suggested that "the shell of a building bears the impression of its occupant."[36] The writers and photographers in Spanish journals like *La Esfera, África,* etc. pursued such impressions and mystified them by portraying cities like Granada and Toledo as repositories of an intangible spirit of their past inhabitants. In the above article, Gil Fernández suggested that the traces of the medieval Jews and Muslims of Segovia remain imprinted on the foundations of the Cathedral of Segovia, on the cobblestones of its streets, on old windows and balconies in the old Jewish quarter that have been barred or walled up, and on the faded engravings above doors.[37] Similarly, an article in *África* (1927) described the "Moorish streets" of Granada as a refuge for the spirit of the "brilliant race" of the Arabs.[38] *Mundo*

gráfico (1916) depicted them as haunted by exiled kings of al-Andalus, "where the tormented and melancholic shadows of the souls of the *khalifas* still wander."[39] *Nuevo mundo* (1918) asserted that the cities of Andalusia still retain the mysterious spirit of the Moors, and that their buildings are "human documents, upon which the souls of those who built them and dwelled within them are eternally etched."[40] In these endeavors to uncover the traces of the medieval past and recreate them visually and textually to readers, there is an underlying longing to return to a pre-modern past that would become associated with Spanish nationalist movements in the 1930s.

Scholars across disciplines have given critical attention to the relationship between place and memory, and to the importance of sites of memory in the formation of collective identities.[41] Svetlana Boym provides a particularly useful definition of nostalgia (from the Greek nostos- return home, and algia-longing) as "a longing for a home that no longer exists or never existed […] a sentiment of loss and displacement, but also a romance with one's own fantasy."[42] Nostalgia, she argues, superimposes visions of the imaginary and the real, the familiar and the foreign, the past and the present. It involves a longing for another time and place, but often also a dissatisfaction and anxiety concerning identity in the present. In supplying the "token presence" of that which is lost or absent,[43] the photograph is essentially nostalgic. Photographs can be interpreted as fetish objects, created to defend the subject against a perceived loss, or of compensating the subject or viewer for an imagined loss.[44] In photojournalism, this token presence is replicated and distributed to readers across the nation. Thus, the contemplation of photographs of cities in Morocco and Spain enable a collective nostalgic lingering on the medieval past, or rather on a mythologized medieval past. Such nostalgic viewing modes were embraced by the readership of the journals discussed here, namely the military in colonial Morocco and the conservative elites in Spain.

Although the origins of Spanish nationalism can be traced back to the eighteenth century,[45] its ideological expression in the twentieth century, which was ultimately consolidated in the form of Francoism during the Spanish Civil War (1936-1939), emerged from three contexts: the literary response of a generation of fin-de-siècle writers to the loss of Spain's last American colonies in the war of 1898, the imperialist subculture of the Spanish colonial military in Morocco, and Catholic nationalist political groups, which grew in strength under the Spanish Republic (1931-1936).[46] The movement was born out of the anxieties of these cultural groups about the impact of modernity upon contemporary society, in particular secularism, rationalism, materialism, and foreign influences. It sought to achieve national regeneration by uncovering and returning to the essential marks of "Castilian" cultural identity.[47] As a result, for nostalgic traditionalist writers and their audiences, urban spaces in Spain that bore the imprint of the Islamic and Jewish cultures of medieval Iberia—such as Granada, Seville, Toledo, and Cordoba—were not only regarded as representative of Spain's cultural hybridity but also as preserving a cultural authenticity the traditionalists felt was lost in modern society. In 1918, for example, *Nuevo mundo* laments the fact that the streets of Andalusia were now disguised by modernity and foreignness.[48] The cities are personified in a lament,

> Streets of Toledo, of Seville, of Granada, of Córdoba, who still maintain your Moorish trace, defend yourselves from the destructive axes of our irreverent age! It won't be long before our cities regret having lost what constituted their very spirit and anatomy.[49]

This lament reveals resentment towards the present, which is another facet of nostalgia. Longing for another time is often born out of dissatisfaction with the present. Spanish visual and textual press discourses reflect the nostalgic medievalism that would come to characterize Spanish nationalism. However, it is notable that the references to the cultural authenticity and

spiritual "essence" of Spain in these examples are to its "Moorish," not its Christian, European cultural legacy. This demonstrates the extent to which Africanist and later Francoist ideology embraced the multicultural Iberian medieval past as part of Spain's "national" legacy and their imperialist vision.

Spanish women as a 'trace' of Islamic Iberia

In Spanish language discussions of Spanish and Moroccan architecture, cities are often feminized and given names such as *Granada la mora, Tetuán la blanca,* or *Xauén la misteriosa*. The personification of a nation, region, or city as a woman is longstanding and can be traced back to Mesopotamian traditions that depicted a city-state as a larger-than-life goddess, sometimes as the wife of a deity, sometimes as a more independent maternal figure.[50] It is also a key allegory in monotheistic texts, such as the Old Testament portrayals of Zion as a virgin or harlot; in Greek mythology (in the portrayal of Athena as the patron warrior goddess of Athens); and later on in modern representations of the nation, such as the iconography of Marianne as a symbol of France.[51] As the subordinate gender in conservative patriarchal Spanish society, women were associated with the preservation of culture; as mothers they were key agents of cultural transmission, and therefore were seen as providing a form of scaffolding for national identity. They were also associated, as the following examples show, with the preservation of the ethnic traits of the nation.

In press narratives of Spanish identity and Hispano-Moroccan fraternity, the traces of Islamic Iberia are inscribed on women as well as architecture. If photographs of urban spaces in Spain are used to evoke the memory of al-Andalus, photographs of Spanish women serve to embody a perceived ethnic as well as cultural "Moorish" legacy within Spain. For

example, the photographic report on Granada in *Mundo gráfico* described above employs images of the palace of the Alhambra and of local gypsies to evoke the "ancient legends" of "Moorish" Spain to its readers (figure 4).[52] *África* presents a photograph of a Rifian girl, *una mocita rifeña*, alongside a photograph of the Antequerela, the district of Granada below the Alhambra in Granada (figure 5) and on the following page an image of two local gypsy women or *gitanillas* as a visible sign of the ethnic ties between North Africa and Spain. Although it displays an image of gypsy women in particular, the article declares that the Spanish peasant woman in general ("la mujer pueblerina") stands out as a

> traditional repository of the lovely features of the race of her ancestors […] who left upon her the unmistakable trace of their extraordinary beauty, characterized by those immense and expressive eyes which, like windows that allow us a glimpse into the passionate and dreamy soul that gives them life […] which constitutes the essence of the Moorish spirit of Granada.[53]

The Romani community has long been "orientalised" within Spain and has often served as a stand-in for the 'Moors' in European discourses on Spain.[54] What is interesting here is the fact that Spanish writers and photographers embrace this topos to represent the ethnic closeness between Spain and the culture over which it aims to assert colonial authority. European colonial discourses relied on "grammars of difference" – categories of ethnicity, gender, class, and religion – to define the superiority and the authority of the colonising culture, [55] but here, Spanish writers favor "proximity" in order to establish their authority.

Likewise, the inscription of the "Moorish trace" onto the bodies of women is not restricted to the Romani people or to Andalusia. For example, the graphic magazines *Estampa* and *Ahora* document other regions of Spain where women were said to have maintained the "Moorish" custom of wearing a veil since the sixteenth century.[56] *Estampa*,

describes a village in Castile where an authentic "Arab trace" remains "in the dark eyes of these Moorish women, peering out from beneath their strange, authentically Arab garb."[57] (Figure 6). The veiling of women was in fact common in Jewish, Christian, and Muslim societies in medieval Spain, and the practice continued in early modern Spain, but the article does not acknowledge this complex history. There is a nostalgic tinge to the journalist's proclamation: "Moors in Castile! Despite the passing of time, the distance between us, our struggles against them, and our differences in character." [58] Although the text emphasizes the influence of "Moorish" culture on other aspects of the village, such as its whitewashed houses with small windows and the colorful textiles in the market place, the visual manifestation of this imprint is displayed in the images of veiled women.

Articles of this kind orientalize Islamic culture according to Said's definition of Orientalism as a style of thought based upon ontological and epistemological distinctions made between the East and the West.[59] However, the Orientalist gaze is not turned on colonial Morocco but rather on Spain, and specifically on Spanish women, who are exoticized in images that are reproduced and circulated to be viewed throughout the nation. In Western visual conceptualizations of Muslim cultures, the veiled woman is a recurrent trope that has long fostered male, colonialist fantasies of penetrating the secretive space of the Orient.[60] In Spain, photographers employ this trope to mystify Spain itself. They choose feminine subjects with veils or "exotic" ethnic features to embody the "mysterious Moorish spirit" of Spanish culture.[61] At the same time, urban photographers orientalize *rural* subjects, which adds a social dimension to the process of representation. By imprinting the Moorish trace on rural women, they are able to exalt Spain's Islamic heritage while limiting it to an Other within the national self.

Conclusion

As these examples illustrate, Spanish colonial photojournalism is not limited to nurturing a desire for an exotic Morocco, it also serves to nurture a nostalgia for the medieval Iberian past. For the Spanish observer in the early twentieth century, the urban landscapes of North Africa were neither culturally nor geographically distant, rather they contain traces of Spain's own cultural origins and therefore provide what Jay Winter has called "everyday frameworks of cultural memory" shared by the cultures on both sides of the Strait.[62] The ideological inclination of the publications and their audiences was not only imperialist, seeking to justify Spain's colonial presence in Morocco by emphasizing the ties between the two cultures, it was also traditionalist, searching in Spain's past for "essential" cultural elements that could counter the corrosive effects of modernity. These essential elements include aspects of the cultural legacy of Islamic and Jewish Iberia. This selective process of self-orientalization facilitates the construction of a narrative of Spain's "national" past that both celebrates its Muslim and Jewish influences, in this case the architecture and cultural achievements of al-Andalus, and justifies Spain's colonial presence in North Africa. Ultimately, however, this nostalgic lingering on a distant past rather than the present, and on the bodies of women rather than men, allows Spanish writers and photographers to romanticize the ties between Spain and North Africa and to idealize the Islamic Iberian past while keeping its heritage at arm's length.

Note on Contributor:

Elisabeth Bolorinos Allard is a lecturer in Spanish at Balliol College, Oxford (B.A. UC Berkeley 2008, MSc. University of Edinburgh 2012, DPhil Trinity College, Oxford 2017) Her current research explores Spanish constructions of Moroccan Muslim and Jewish culture

in relation to constructions of Spanish identity during the colonial campaigns in Morocco (1909-1927) and the Spanish Civil War. More broadly she is interested in the connectivities of ethnicity, religion, and culture in definitions of identity in Spanish nationalism. Contact: Elisabeth.bolorinosallard@mod-langs.ox.ac.uk .

Captions:

Figure 1: *España Musulmana: Granada, Patio de las dos hermanas (Muslim Spain: Patio of the Two Sisters*), digitized copy of *Revista de tropas coloniales*, September 1925, 17, © Biblioteca Nacional de España.

Figure 2: *Marruecos artístico: Fez, patio de una medarsa' (Artistic Morocco: Fez, patio of a Medarsa)*, digitized copy of *Revista de tropas coloniales*, September 1925, 11, © Biblioteca Nacional de España.

Figure 3: Díaz, *El protectorado español en Marruecos: Notas gráficas tetuaníes (The Spanish protectorate of Morocco: Photographic notes on* Tetuan*)*, digitized copy of *La Esfera*,11 November 1922, 22. © Biblioteca Nacional de España.

Figure 4: Torres Molina, *Tipos y costumbres de Granada (Customs and typical inhabitants of Granada)*, digitized copy of *Mundo gráfico*, 17 May 1916, 20. © Biblioteca Nacional de España.

Figure 5: Lázaro, *a) Una mocita rifeña (Rifian girl)*, digitized copy of *África*, June 1927, 19**.** © Biblioteca Nacional de España. [TO BE SUPPLIED]

Figure 6: Gallardo, *Las mujeres de Santa María del Campo en nada se diferencian, en tocado, de las moras (In their garb, these women of Santa María del campo are no different from Moorish women)*, digitized copy of *Ahora*, in García Figueras, *Miscelanea. Prensa Gráfica, 1930-1936* (106-109). © Biblioteca Nacional de España.

---

[1] In addition to the publications examined in this article, see *El Telegrama del Rif* (Melilla, 1902) and *ABC* (Madrid, 1905)
[2] Sebastian Balfour, *Deadly Embrace: Morocco and the Road to the Spanish Civil War* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2002), 4.
[3] Balfour, *Deadly Embrace*, 4.
[4] Susan Martín-Márquez, *Disorientations: Spanish Colonialism in Africa and the Performance of Identity* (New Haven, Yale University Press, 2008), 4.
[5] For a discussion of the nineteenth-century revival of Spanish "Oriental" studies, see Aurora Rivière Gómez, *Orientalismo y Nacionalismo Español: Estudios árabes y hebreos en la Universidad de Madrid* (1843-1868) (Madrid, Universidad Carlos III de Madrid, 2000).
[6] See the article by Anna McSweeney published in this volume, "Mudéjar and the Alhambresque : Spanish Pavilions at the Universal Expositions and the Invention of a National Style."
[7] Antonio Urquízar Herrera, La caracterización política del concepto mudéjar en España durante el siglo XIX', *Espacio, Tiempo y Forma*, Serie VII, 22-23, 2009-2010, 201-216.

[8] See examples of this discourse in Ángel Rodríguez del Barrio, "Divagaciones sobre Marruecos," *RTC*, March 1924, 10, writes of the "hermandad étnica entre españoles y berberiscos"; Gil Benomar, 'El andalucismo', *RTC*, May 1926, 9, writes of the "fraternidad" between the two cultures; Miguel Álvarez Salamanca, "Granada la mora," *África*, June 1927, 10, describes North Africans as "nuestros hermanos de las orillas africanas."

[9] "Nuestros propósitos han sido la penetración pacífica en Marruecos, la civilización de nuestros hermanos, de nuestros vecinos […] lo que hemos querido ha sido protegerles, simplemente ayudarles a salir de su estado de atraso." Cited in Josep Lluís Mateo Dieste's monograph on the discourse of fraternity: *La 'hermandad' hispani-marroquí: política y religión bajo el protectorado español en Marruecos (1912-1956)* (Barcelona, Ediciones Bellatierra, 2005). The translation of this and subsequent quotations are by the author, unless otherwise indicated.

[10] "Aquella convivencia de africanos y andaluces tan fructífera … [que nos otorga] una capacitación especial no igualada por pueblo alguno para mostrarnos verdaderos conductores espirituales de los marroquíes.' Tomás García Figueras, 'Recuerdos de la campaña', *África*, noviembre 1928, 20.

[11] Carr, *Blood and Faith*, 8.

[12] María Cruz Seoane y María Dolores Sáiz, *Historia del periodismo en España. El Siglo XX: 1898-1936* (Madrid, Alianza editorial, 1996), 69.

[13] A. Sebastián Hernández Gutiérrez, 'Fotoperiodismo en la guerra del Rif', *Vegueta* no. 12 , 2012, Anuario de la Facultad de Geografía e Historia, Universidad de Las Palmas de Gran Canaria, 52.

[14] Juan Goytisolo, *Crónicas sarracinas* (Barcelona, Ruedo Ibérico, 1982); Martín-Márquez, *Disorientations*; Patricia Hertel, The Crescent Remembered. Islam and Nationalism on the Iberian Peninsula (Eastborne: Sussex Academic Press, 2015),

[15] Martín-Márquez, *Disorientations*, 237-238.

[16] See Jordana Mendelson *Documenting Spain: Artists, Exhibition Culture, and the Modern Nation, 1929–1939* (Pennsylvania, Pennsylvania State University Press, 2005),

[17] Ali Behdad and Luke Gartlan, eds. *Photograpy's Orientalism: New Essays on Colonial representation* (Los Angeles, Getty Research Institute, 2013), 1.

[18] Edward Said, *Orientalism* (Harmondsworth, Penguin, 1978).

[19] Ali Behdad, "The Orientalist Photograph," *Photograpy's Orientalism: New Essays on Colonial representation* (Los Angeles, Getty Research Institute, 2013), 19.

[20] For a detailed discussion of Spain's Orientalization within Europe, see Barbara Fuchs, *Exotic Nation: Maurophilia and the Construction of Early Modern Spain* (Philadelphia, University of Pennsylvania Press, 2009).

[21] See for example Mínimo Español, "Andalucía en modernidad: las calles musulmanas," *Nuevo mundo*, August 23, 1918, 8.

[22] Although there was already a sizeable Arab Jewish population in North Africa by the fifteenth century, the first Jewish community from the Iberian Peninsula established itself in Tetuan in 1489 and was well received by the ruling sultan at the time. After the 1492 expulsion many more joined (Jacobo Israel Garzón, *Los judíos de Tetuán* (Madrid, Hebraica Ediciones, 2005), 18.

[23] Balfour, *Deadly Embrace*, 161.

[24] Roland Barthes, *Camera Lucida: Reflections on photography*, trans. Richard Howard (London, Jonathan Cape Ltd, 1982), 27.

[25] Linda Nochlin, "The Imaginary Orient," in *The Politics of Vision: Essays on Nineteenth-century Art and Society* (New York, Harper Row, 1989), 42.

[26] "Contemplando esas estrechas y tortuosas calles… a las que se acogieron los moros granadinos al ser arrojados de su postrer baluarte por los reyes católicos, se evoca en toda su plenitud el cuadro de aquella intense vida muslímica que durante siete centurias latió en Sevilla, en Granda, en Córdoba, en Toledo." "Notas gráficas Tetuaníes", *La Esfera*, November 11, 1922, 22.

[27] 'La Esfera', Hemeroteca de la biblioteca nacional de españa
(http://hemerotecadigital.bne.es/details.vm?q=id:0002069525&lang=en)
For an in-depth study of this magazine, see Juan Miguel Sánchez Vigil, *La Esfera: Ilustración mundial (1914-1931)* (Madrid, Libris, 2003).

[28] Josep Lluis Mateo Dieste, *El moro entre los primitivos: el caso del protectorado español en Marruecos* (Barcelona, Fundación "La Caixa", 1997), 86.

[29] For a discussion of the political inclination and readership of *Revista de tropas coloniales*, see Rocío Velasco de Castro, "De periodistas improvisados a golpistas consumados: el ideario militar africanista de la *Revista de Tropas Coloniales* (1924-1936)," *El Argonauta Español* 10 (2013): 1-30.

[30] This dichotomy was also fundamental to the practices of categorisation and representation of French anthropologists in North Africa (see James McDougall, 'Myth and Counter-Myth: "The Berber" as National Signifier in Algerian Historiographies," *Radical History Review* 86 (2003): 66-88). For a study of the Spanish articulation of this racial-cultural hierarchy, see Mateo Dieste, *El moro entre los primitivos.*

[31] "Habitan en las ciudades, y siendo los más cultos y civilizados, llevan la dirección de los negocios públicos, y muy poco tienen de común con los kabileños a quienes España habrá de someter en las tierras del Rif." Emilio Dugi, "Las razas del Rif," *La Esfera*, November 12, 1921, 9

[32] "Todo lo que vale de Marruecos, desde el misticismo, al arte decorativo y del idioma árabe a la música, es de importación islámico-española." Gil Benomar, "La vida marroquí en la península," *África*, August 1926, 24. Benomar was the son of Rodolfo Gil Fernández, the writer mentioned further ahead in this article.

[33] Anne Teresa Demo and Vivian Bradford (eds.), *Rhetoric, Remembrance, and Visual Form: Sighting Memory* (New York, Routledge, 2012) 4.

[34] "Estas imágenes tienen el poder de sugerirnos ante su contemplación esa vieja leyenda […] de la ensoñada Granada la mora." "Tipos y costumbres de Granada", *Mundo gráfico*, May 17, 1916, 20.

[35] "Y es tal la influencia del medio en vuestro espíritu, que, al calor de una reconstitución imaginativa… repercutirán en las callejuelas sombrías y retorcidas los nombres de los Cuellar y Samuel." Rodolfo Gil, "La judería segoviana y sus huellas," *La Esfera*, June 11, 1927, 35.

[36] Walter Benjamin, *The Arcades Project*, trans. Howard Eiland and Kevin Mc Laughlin (Boston, Harvard University Press, 1999), 9.

[37] "En los cimientos de la Catedral […] en las rejas embutidas, en los balcones tapiados […] en signos y trazas de sus portadas […]," in Gil, "La judería segoviana y sus huellas."

[38] Miguel Álvarez Salamanca, "Granada la mora," *África*, June 1927, 10.

[39] "Calles por las que vagan atormentadas y melancólicas las sombras de las almas de los Kalifas." "Tipos y costumbres de Granada," *Mundo gráfico*, May 17, 1916, 20.

[40] "Documentos humanos donde quedó perenne el alma de quienes las trazaron y las construyeron." Mínimo español, "Andalucía en modernidad: las calles musulmanas," *Nuevo Mundo*, August 23, 1918, 8.

[41] See Jay Winter (2007), Erll and Nünning (2008), and Demo and Bradford (2012).

[42] Svetlana Boym, *The Future of Nostalgia* (New York, Basic Books, 2001), xiii.

[43] Susan Sontag, *On Photography* (London, Allen Lane, 1977), 9.

[44] Sarah Kember, "The Shadow of the Object': Photography and Realism," in Liz Wells, ed., *The Photography Reader* (Abingdon, Routledge, 2007), 210.

[45] For a study of the origins of national identity and nationalism in Spain in the nineteenth century, see José Álvarez Junco, *Mater Dolorosa: La idea de España en el siglo XIX* (Madrid, Tauros Historia, 2001).

[46] For a discussion of the development of Spanish fascism alongside traditionalism, see Stanley G. Payne, *Fascism in Spain, 1923-1977* (Madison, University of Wisconsin Press, 1999).

[47] Christopher Britt-Arrendondo, *Quixotism: The Imaginative Denial of Spain's Loss of Empire* (Albany, State University of New York Press, 2005), 18.

[48] Mínimo español, "Andalucía en modernidad," 8.

[49] Mínimo español, "Calles de Toledo, de Sevilla, de Granada, de Córdoba, que aun conserváis la traza mora, ¡defendéos de la loca piqueta de nuestra Edad irreverente! No tardarán mucho en que nuestras ciudades se arrepientan de haber perdido lo que constituía su espíritu y su fisonomía misma." Mínimo español, "Andalucía en modernidad," 8.

[50] See Cornelius Clarkson Vermeule, *The Goddess Roma in the Art of the Roman Empire* (London, Spink and Son, 1974) and Sarah J. Dille, *Mixing Metaphors: God as Mother and Father in Deutero-Isaiah* (London, Clark, 2004).

[51] For a discussion of the allegorical and metaphorical uses of the female body in representations of the nation, see Marina Warner, *Monuments and Maidens: The Allegory of the Female Form* (London, Vintage, 1996).

[52] Anonymous, "Tipos y costumbres de Granada," *Mundo gráfico*, May 17, 1916, 20.

[53] "Destaca la mujer pueblerina, depositaria tradicional de aquel bello rostro de la raza que la engendrara, en la que dejó el sello inconfundible de su extraordinaria hermosura, animada por los expresivos e inmensos ojos que cual sendos ventanales, dejan asomar a ellos el alma soñadora y apasionada que les da vida y expresión, formándose así en tan admirable conjunción el espíritu moro de Granada." Miguel Álvarez Salamanca, "Granada la mora," *África*, June 1927, 10.

[54] See for example Washington Irving's *The Alhambra: Tales of a Traveller* (New York, Library of America, 1991 [first published in 1824 by John Murray]) and John Frederick Lewis' watercolours of the Alhambra in the 1830s.

[55] Frederick Cooper and Laura Ann Stoler, eds, *Tensions of Empire: Colonial Cultures in a Bourgeois World* (Berkeley, University of California Press, 1997).

[56] For example, Pedro Arenas, "Las misteriosas mujeres de Tarifa; Una ciudad poblada de fantasmas," *Estampa*, February 9, 1935, 1-4, and Eduardo de Ontañon, "Santa maría del campo, el pueblo moro dentro de Castilla," *Ahora* (1932-1936) in Tomás García Figueras, *Miscelanea: Prensa gráfica (Biblioteca García Figueras,* 1930-1936), 106-109.

[57] "En los ojos negros de las moras, que asoman por la rendija del extraño tostado, de árabes auténticas, con que se cubren la cabeza." Eduardo de Ontañon, "Santa maría del campo, el pueblo moro dentro de Castilla," *Ahora,* in Tomás García Figueras, *Miscelanea: Prensa Gráfica,* 106-109.

[58] "Moros sobre castilla! A pesar del tiempo, y la distancia, y las luchas, y la personalidad." Ibid.

[59] Said, *Orientalism*, 10.

[60] For a seminal study of this trope, see Malek Alloula, *Colonial Harem* (Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1986).

[61] Miguel Álvarez Salamanca, "Granada la mora," 10.

[62] J.M. Winter, "The Practices of Metropolitan Life in Wartime," J. M. Winter, and Jean-Louis Robert, eds, *Capital Cities at War: Paris, London, Berlin, 1914-1919,* vol. 2 (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2007), 15.