

## BOOK REVIEWS

---

JACK GOODY, *The Power of the Written Tradition*, Washington, DC: Smithsonian Institution Press 2000. viii, 192 pp., Bibliography, Index. \$45.00/\$18.95.

*The Power of the Written Tradition* by Jack Goody is yet another contribution to his long-standing scholarly interest in the interface between the written word and oral discourse. The argument engages with intellectual discourse on the subject and is organized and presented in nine chapters. Goody argues that writing is a transformative act. For him the shift to the written word was basic to the emergence of modernity, and he argues against the post-modernists, who downplay the differences between the oral and the written tradition.

Goody does not deny the continuing prevalence and existence of oral discourses in contemporary society. But in his view writing has had a fundamental impact on history and on the historical development of societies. He defines oral traditions as cultures without writing that are dependent on memory for transmission. His discussion clearly distinguishes between societies with and without writing or other literate techniques; between written and oral traditions within a society with writing; and between individuals in a society, who may be literate, non-literate, or illiterate.

His argument, which is based on comparative ethnographic examples from Asia and Africa, emphasizes two aspects of the written tradition. First, it permits the accumulation and development of knowledge. The book is the ultimate vehicle in the evolution of the textual tradition. Secondly, the power that text gives to cultures that possess writing enables them to dominate oral cultures.

Goody argues that contemporary civilization is based on the power of the written text. He describes writing as a 'technology of the intellect' that increases our capacities, a prerequisite for the development of the technologies with which our intellect engages and which it uses to understand and manipulate the world (p. 151). He admits that the production of a written text involves selection, transforming an event or performance, inscribing it in memory, making it available for transmission, and permitting the accumulation of knowledge. He discusses how writing crystallizes or fixes the particular instance of an oral into a general representative form, using the example of the inscription of the Bagre myth among the Lo Dagaa of northern Ghana. He admits that a text is a continuing interpretation that can conflict with current versions. Writing is a transformative process, and the recording and transmission of a myth or ritual changes it at the level of content, structure, and language. The central element of both oral and written discourse is temporality, which for the latter implies both space and time. In Goody's own words, 'if we start at one end with the written message it may be differently interpreted along the way but the text itself is likely to reach the end of the line as it began its journey unless it is torn up or altered or deliberated. If it is difficult to reproduce a short oral text exactly without taking special measures how much more difficult it is to transmit verbatim a very long recitation such as the Bagre...?' (p. 117).

Hence myths are in a perpetual state of transformation, and variations are bound to exist.

Goody further argues that writing enables history. As he states, 'the relative absence of history of and within oral cultures is not at all a matter of their "childlike" nature. It is rather a question of a lack of means and also a lack of interest' (p. 82). I accept his argument that the written archive cannot compare with the oral methods of transmission and storage. However, I am not persuaded by Goody's modernist approach in understanding history or his emphasis on the archive for historical inscription and the organization of ideas. I agree and acknowledge the importance of the archive for the acquisition and accumulation of knowledge. This is not equally possible in the oral tradition that is based on personal memory, selective re-call and transmission. Goody acknowledges that myths are an important component of history and historical interpretation, and even writing creates and perpetuates collective stories. History and the recording of historical events cannot be restricted to archival resources. The category of historical facts has been deconstructed in debates about what constitutes history and archives by Foucault, among others.

The book persuasively argues that the written tradition is an important instrument of power between individuals in a society, and between societies. Control over writing gave people power, a process that was historically restricted to the religious domain: the earliest texts were often on religion. Writing enabled a wider impersonal audience compared to the particular immediacy of oral discourse. As Goody explains, 'Ashante religion or Ojibway religion is what a particular group practices at a particular place and time. Written religions on the other hand are defined in relation to a text. While not all are religions of the book they all have texts to which reference is made. Consequently we define religion in non-ethnic terms; religion is capable of crossing tribal and national boundaries and hence of recruiting adherents on a non-tribal basis' (p. 100). Goody sensitively acknowledges that the history of writing is also the history of censorship. Writing is an exercise in hegemonic discourse, and oral traditions have often worked towards de-centring and destabilizing this hegemony. I agree with Goody that historical records are élitist and selective exercises in hegemonic power and that subversive voices may not find expression or space in writing cultures but have to resort to the oral tradition. Counterworks are often expressed and transmitted in myths, stories, material culture, dance forms, and music. But this does not imply that the written tradition has not been used for counter-revolutionary or critical purposes. Goody acknowledges the need to recognize the existence of subversive voices in the written tradition, despite the dominant tendency of canonization inherent in the process of writing.

Goody admits that the history of writing is also about domination over those who were denied this privilege, especially women and the colonized. The extension of political domination by the colonial powers in Asia and Africa was associated with the extension of the written word and the establishment of archives, schools, and libraries. Colonialism also led to loss of cultural heritage that existed in the oral tradition and established a supremacy over indigenous written traditions. He further states, 'What writing and the book do is to make the implicit explicit and to create the continuing tradition, not only of dominant ideologies but also of critical numbers. Literacy and ideas communicated through the book are an important influence for the struggle in

and against colonialism in Africa and Asia' (p. 164). An entire chapter is devoted to a discussion of a revolt by African slaves in Bahia between 1807 and 1835. In this example Goody demonstrates the linkages between the use of writing, the power of the written word (here drawn from the Koran) and the ideological backing and power it gave to African slaves planning and participating in the Bahia rising. The emphasis on literacy movements in many developing contexts does substantiate the importance of reading and writing skills for empowerment. The linkages between the women's movement and literacy drives are explicit in the case of India. Goody rightly points out that the emergence of the institution of public libraries has enabled a process of democratization and of making knowledge accessible to the general public.

This book is a powerful exposition of the power of the written tradition and is argued in a clear and precise style. It draws on both rigorous scholarship and the rich ethnographic experience of the author. However, his arguments attempt to reinforce a hierarchy between oral and written discourse that is becoming dated and blurred, given the contemporary impact of audio-visual media and hypertext on the Internet. Goody himself acknowledges that oral communication has continued to play a fundamental role since the advent of writing, just as writing continues to be fundamental to the advent of electronic media (p. 110). The author disagrees with French post-structuralists such as Derrida, who have downplayed the distinction between the written and the spoken. While Derrida has argued that even speech is a form of writing and of inscription in collective memory, Goody regards them as ahistorical. I would argue, with Derrida, for a greater recognition of the role and impact of oral discourse in social life and on events. The written and oral traditions complement each other: we should not ignore either but use them creatively in making sense of the ethnographic reality.

VIBHA ARORA

BETTINA E. SCHMIDT and INGO W. SCHRÖDER (eds), *Anthropology of Violence and Conflict*, London and New York: Routledge 2001. x, 229 pp., Index, References, Figures. £16.99.

In recent years, there has been a strong resurgence of anthropological interest in the topic of conflict and violence. Starting from the classical work of George Simmel, which transcended the well-trodden path of evolutionist analyses of conflict, there have been many anthropological works on conflict and warfare. However, most of these studies fail to provide a unified anthropological theory of conflict and violence. This is what, in my view, the present edited volume promises to do. It offers a perspective on violence that is at once imagined and performed, and argues that such a dialectic is crucial in understanding warfare and violence. In doing so, the volume suggests that violence is a vantage point from which a society and its social networks can best be understood. The major emphasis is on the importance of viewing violent conflicts as based on long, antagonistic, reflexive processes; they are not a sudden outburst by the people. This has to be viewed, the volume suggests, from the different points of view of the players in the conflict—the perpetrator, the victim, and the observer; the

winners and losers—which should be studied by means of different theoretical traditions of enquiry. The basic thesis of the book is that violence must be seen as both a practice and an imaginary that help form identities and are useful in obtaining other material advantages, as well as managing crises.

There are ten contributions, including an introductory piece by the editors, which discuss a wide variety of conflicts and violence in Venezuela, the Caribbean, Albania, Ethiopia, West Apache, Somalia, Sri Lanka, and Sarajevo. At the outset the editors set out the theoretical framework for the entire volume, which the other contributors by and large follow in one sense or another, although their regional focus has influenced their approaches, which are affected by the concrete contexts of conflict and war. In addition, Glenn Bowman's contribution, which considers violence as having a quality for constructing identity, gives an additional theoretical framework for understanding conflict and war, although this is also implicit in the introductory paper.

The framework may be explained in the following way. Violence must be seen in the dialectical terms of practice and imaginary. In looking at violence as a practice, the editors argue that it is 'never completely idiosyncratic', 'not completely meaningless to the actor', and 'not a totally isolated act' (p. 3). Instead, violence manifests a social network in which a society is organized as daily practice. In some way it is an instrument for achieving a goal and, in that sense, acts of violence are not isolated but related to a long historical process. This becomes more meaningful when violence has a performative quality; violence performed in public acquires legitimacy. The other end of the dialectic is that violence must be imagined in order that the act can be carried out as a social practice. In conflicts, actors must imagine and construct narratives, conduct performances, and write inscriptions in the cultural world of their 'internal solidarity and outside hostility' (p. 11). Nationalism, ethnicity and so on, the editors consider, are examples of violent imaginaries.

The editors are quick to note that violent imaginaries do not necessarily create a violent practice and that this varies from place to place and from time to time. The question of from whose point of view—that of the perpetrator, the victim, or the observer—one must judge violent acts further complicates the relation in dialectical terms. What appears to the perpetrators as justified and meaningful action is not so for the victims, and observers may have a totally different opinion again. This is where the authors struggle to find a definite way forward; they suggest that we should rather take a balanced view, trying to integrate both the *emic* and the *etic* points of view. But they fail to answer the question of what we should do when points of view are totally opposed to one another, and indeed, they are silent on this. Instead they go on quietly to suggest that the anthropologists who conduct research into conflicts should adopt a neutral position in order to 'demystify' the narratives of the triangle of views of violence. I do not think that this is in fact possible. Researchers will adopt a view arising from their own personal bias, if they do not side with one of the three. Going beyond the dialectic, Bowman's paper focuses on the constructive quality of violence in conflict and war that adds another important dimension to the framework. Reviewing different literature on violence and conflict, Bowman views violence as a source for the formation and defence of cultural boundaries and identities. Both the introductory paper by the editors and Bowman's piece provide readers with a sort of guide map as to how they should approach the whole book.

Although the dialectic of practice and imaginary serves as the framework for the entire volume, the violent conflicts in Venezuela, the Caribbean, and Albania specifically privilege this dialectic as a desired view that may explain the conflicts. Violence, the contributors of the three papers stress, is at once practice and imaginary in the self-definition of the groups involved culturally, and in some cases violence is merely a way of obtaining material advantage. Among the Yukpa of Venezuela, Ernst Halbmayer explains, violence in the form of cannibalism remains an integral element in defining their own identity. In the situation of conflict between the Yu'pa and the Yuko, the Yukpa create social imaginaries to identify with and not to be associated with. For instance, the Yu'pa create an imaginary of the moon to identify with themselves and the sun to identify with the outsiders, the Yuka (pp. 55–7). The imaginaries are, Halbmayer argues, very helpful in both identity formation and difference formation simultaneously. A very insightful point that Halbmayer introduces is that all the imaginaries arise from the socio-cosmological world that the people themselves have created, based on myths of their origin. The myths remain as the justifying and legitimizing force in conflicts between the groups. In a more or less similar vein, Bettina E. Schmidt sees the cannibalism of the Caribbean as having a symbolic value in respect of self-definitions against the colonial imagination of peoples of the Caribbean as savages. Sharing the fundamentals of the above two cases, Albanians use conflicts, according to Stephanie Schwandner-Sievers, as a traditional cultural mode in both forming their own social identity and achieving material advantage.

The rest of the volume looks beyond the everyday practices and imaginaries of violence and conflict to the evolutionary causes of violent behaviour, in the sense that violent means are used to overcome and survive crisis situations. More specifically, the contributions by Francesca Declich, Peter Kloos, and Ivana Maček look at war conditions in Somalia, Sri Lanka, and Bosnia as a means of constructing historical trajectories that help enhance group cohesiveness and gain meaning in refugee camps. In the discussion of these cases, the underlying factor that the authors perceptively stress is that war is always a reflexive phenomenon designed by an élite few who manipulate the majority to adhere to the design, thus helping to produce violent imaginaries of the other and to mobilize the people at the battle lines.

As the editors advocate, this book suggests that we should consider violence in conflict and war using a multi-dimensional approach. The editors claim that there is a triad of existing traditions of theoretical approaches: operational, cognitive, and experiential. Operationally, violence is seen as social adaptation to material conditions; cognitively, it is a cultural construct of the groups in conflict; and violence provides individual subjectivities that determine how violent events are viewed. That said, the volume is careful to suggest that no one single approach of the three should be used alone in studying conflicts; the three taken together should remain as the foci of analysis. In this regard, the dialectical perspective (practice/imaginary) that the book recommends is a useful analytical framework.

Although the concepts and concerns the book discusses are not entirely new, they are certainly timely and topical. These essays provide an important addition to the growing anthropological research on conflict, war, and violence. In particular, this book provides us with ways in which we can explain and understand conflicts and violence. The strength of the volume is that theoretically it is balanced in considering a

wide variety of approaches, while at the same time being empirically rich in examining a diverse set of cases of well-known conflicts from America to Asia. Anyone concerned with the study of violence and conflict should examine it before embarking on their research.

C. JOE ARUN

VEENA DAS, ARTHUR KLEINMAN, MARGARET LOCK, MAMPHELA RAMPHELE, and PAMELA REYNOLDS (eds), *Remaking the World: Violence, Social Suffering and Recovery*, Berkeley and London: University of California Press 2001. viii, 294 pp., References, Index. £33.50/£12.95/\$50.00/\$19.95.

*Remaking the World* completes a triptych of volumes on violence, social suffering, and recovery. This last volume documents and celebrates the resilience and creativity of human cultures, and the diverse ways in which communities and individuals cope with, endure, suffer, and try to transcend their traumas. The volume underscores the importance of the everyday life that we take for granted and argues that the recovery of everyday life is crucial for those who have been traumatized by violence and conflict.

The book is organized in the form of an explanatory introduction by Veena Das and Arthur Kleinman, which establishes a continuing thread of dialogue between the six essays on the theme of social trauma, healing, and the remaking of everyday life in diverse ethnographic contexts. The editors argue, 'while everyday life may be seen as a site of the ordinary, this ordinariness is itself received in the face of the most recalcitrant of tragedies: it is the site of many buried memories and experiences...the projects to redefine their places in the political community are a matter of finding a voice. Finding of one's voice in the making of one's own history, the remaking of a world, though, is also a matter of being able to recontextualise the narratives of devastation and generate new contexts through which everyday life becomes possible' (p. 4).

The six essays are not an exposition of our abilities to inflict suffering but a celebration of our abilities to remake our shattered lives and go on with our everyday life, sometimes by forgetting, sometimes through silence, sometimes by leaving places, and sometimes by telling stories. The ethnographies on the Cree in Canada, the Kui in Thailand, and Black women in South Africa focus our attention on the historic processes of suffering that certain communities have endured. Naomi Adelson's study discusses the manner in which indigenous Canadian communities are reimagining aboriginality to recover historically from about two centuries of colonization, neglectful government policies, and social and personal traumas. The revival of indigenous healing practices, the assertion of original occupancy of land, and the reintroduction of summer gatherings are creative and transformative ways whereby Indians are reconstituting and reaffirming their social identities. Komatra Chuengsatiansup's chapter focuses on the discourses of marginality and suffering of the Kui in Thailand, while Sasanka Perera's discusses how spirit possession and narratives of terror become mechanisms of coping with trauma resulting from extensive political violence in Sri Lanka. Fiona C. Ross's study is based on women's narratives regarding their physical

experiences of violation as told during the public hearings of the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission. Her ethnography acknowledges how silences are meaningful, mark particular kinds of knowing, and are gendered.

The other ethnographies draw attention to the sudden cataclysmic trauma inflicted by an event such as a dropping of an atom bomb in Japan or a communal riot in India. Maya Todeschini's study focuses on the Japanese women who suffered and became sterile as a consequence of the dropping of atomic bombs on Hiroshima and Nagasaki in 1945. The dangerously infected bodies of these women emerged as potent signifiers for atomic suffering and a threat to future generations. She discusses how these women have been quite successful in carving out a prominent role in the storyteller movement and transmitting collective memories of the atom bomb. Deepak Mehta and Roma Chatterjee's chapter is based on the narratives of the communal riots that occurred in 1992–3 in Bombay, India. They situate their study historically and argue that the possibility of further communal riots is an alterity that co-exists with everyday life, given the contradictions and unresolved areas of conflict. Recovery of the everyday means coming to terms with the fragility of the everyday and the refashioning of collective life through the reconstitution of communities both physically and symbolically. The authors argue that narratives of the relief work serve as a bridge between the social trauma (the communal riots of 1992–3) and the reformulation of everyday life.

The book is very positive in its approach and discusses the recalcitrance of tragedy and the subsequent healing that is necessary for the resilience of everyday life. These ethnographies sensitively acknowledge and focus on the subversive counterworks that exist in these communities alongside the official discourse. Varied forms such as stories, myths, folk tales, rituals, healing practices, and spirit possession challenge the official memory and description of the events and constitute the collective memories of those who have experienced social trauma. Mehta and Chatterjee's comment that the altered everyday is marked by knowledge and a memory of that loss, and that this is the practical wisdom in the negotiation of their loss, is quite pertinent. Constructing collective memories is a process of social catharsis, a way in which the survivors naturalize and normalize their suffering, and remake their worlds.

Although culture can be used to inflict and justify violence, counter public discourses persist. The reimagining of aboriginality by the indigenous Indians is an attempt to make their own history. These subversive narratives also countered the soft knife of official responses or state policies that have denied them a legitimate space and a voice. The ethnographies also demonstrate that healing is a gradual process that takes place both through public institutions and in collective memories, sometimes in an erasure of that suffering.

The book is topical, forceful, and extremely sensitive to the suffering and dignity of the 'victims' and the respect they are entitled to in enduring and recovering from these experiences. As Chatterjee and Mehta comment, 'the present reality is shaped for us through zones of silence, the censorship they impose on memory and therefore on recounting aspects of everyday life that emerge after the danger. Silences point to the breach the *danga* [communal riot] creates in everyday life' (p. 228). As Perera acknowledges, 'the narratives of anthropologists and sociologists describing the human experience of suffering will always have gaps, in terms of experience, perception and

the nature of pain itself' (p. 160). Human suffering will have a voice: it may be given in silence or absences if we are prepared to understand what is being conveyed!

*Remaking the World* recognizes the question of the need and necessity of recovery of the everyday by the creation of alternate public spheres, and the articulation of collective hurt for social healing. The difficulties the authors must have faced in collecting such ethnographic data and in dealing with the narratives of suffering and the traumas of the process of fieldwork need to be acknowledged and deserve comment. Conflict, violence, and war lead to so much suffering, to recognized and explicit suffering, yet we continually justify it and inflict it on others and ourselves. The protest rally organized in London on 15 February 2003 against the war in Iraq was the biggest demonstration since the Second World War. Similar demonstrations were held in other parts of the world. The people gathered in these were not just protesting against war with Iraq but symbolically raising their voice against the human suffering that conflict generates. These essays underscore a need to review our policies and our capacities to address conflict and question them, issues that have implications for our common future.

VIBHA ARORA

JOAN F. BURKE, *These Catholic Sisters are all Mamas: Towards the Inculturation of the Sisterhood in Africa—An Ethnographic Study*, Leiden etc.: Brill 2001. viii, 259 pp., Index, Bibliography, Appendixes, Plates. No price given.

This is a valuable study because of its appeal to a variety of professional readers, apart from those interested in the roles of religiously committed Congolese women in the colonial and post-colonial life of an African state. It is an expansion of the author's *JASO* article entitled 'Research in a Post-Missionary Situation among Zairean Sisters of Notre Dame de Namur' (Vol. XXIII, no. 2 (Trinity 1991), pp. 157–68).

Who is this work most likely to appeal to? Among them are surely committed Christians brought up in a European religious tradition and inheriting a benign view of European post-colonial benevolence, as well as—and more particularly—Congolese Christians committed to a communal religious life under conditions requiring radical adjustments from what they had earlier been trained to see as appropriate and yet was clearly inappropriate in their present social and political environment. These Kongo sisters saw their lives in matrifocal terms, to which they adjusted by making their celibacy socially understandable within the metaphor of matrilineality, as mothers for all the people with whom they worked, in contrast to the metaphor of sisterhood that is common in Europe. They were also able to work out for themselves a new system of religious authority in line with Kongo unstructured models for social relationships, particularly the 'talking out' rather than 'through' of problems, and the dynamics of the group's continual integration with, or rejection of, different organizational possibilities in terms of their lived experiences.

Social scientists, who, perhaps from a detached and agnostic viewpoint, might be interested in how particular religious ideas adjust to or are adjusted by new political

and social environments, would also be interested in this work, as might those anthropologists who are interested in how theoretically alien Roman Catholic religious ideas can be interrelated with more specific tribal cultural realities. There are also important methodological issues in this work, showing that it is possible to do valuable social-scientific work while at the same time being a genuine participant as well as an observer. Finally, this work can be seen as an interesting and human story of how a Roman Catholic nun was able to live through and participate in changes that must have been stressful in relation to the ideas to which she had earlier committed herself. Overall, however, the importance of this book must lie in showing how a group of Kongo nuns retained their identity as religious sisters within a European order, while changing their style of religious life and work in an African society.

R. E. S. TANNER

ROBERT A. SEGAL, *Hero Myths: A Reader*, Oxford: Blackwell 2000. ix, 216 pp., Index. £50.00/£15.59/\$62.95/\$29.95.

One does not turn to a reader expecting to find original theories but rather to broaden, deepen, and systematize one's knowledge of a field. The aspiration to breadth is catered for here in the sense that the twenty-two readings spread themselves fairly widely across the ancient and modern world, but depth and system are another matter. Someone interested, for instance, in epic heroes will scarcely emerge from this book with clearer ideas on how to conceptualize heroes in general—more likely the reverse.

After a few pages devoted to Carlyle's book on heroes and historical greatness, and to the 'blurry' connection between myth and history, the introduction concentrates on four figures who have tried to analyse hero myths: Otto Rank, the psychoanalyst, the widely read Joseph Campbell, Lord Raglan (more or less Frazerian), and René Girard, the theorist of scapegoats. The figures are compared with one another much as in Segal's book published two years previously (*Theorizing about Myth* (Amherst, Mass., 1998), reviewed by me in these pages (*JASO*, Vol. XXX, no. 2 (Trinity 1999), pp. 198–200)). As there, the emphasis is on how one author's views differ from those of another, and little attempt is made to evaluate their contributions or to reach any general conclusions. Dumézil is again ignored. Moreover—and this reinforces the generally miscellaneous character of the book—the one-page introductions to individual readings practically never refer back to the introduction, much of which was originally drafted for another publication. A more satisfactory introduction to the older literature on heroes can be found in Benjamin Preciado-Solis's *The Krsna Cycle in the Puranas: Themes and Motifs in a Heroic Saga* (Delhi, 1984).

The principles, if any, that governed the choice and ordering of the readings are not made explicit, and one is tempted to look to the contents page for clues. For each reading the title consists of a name, cultural origin (in brackets), and minimal characterization for instance, 'Robin Hood (English): class hero'. Three of the names are female (Penthesilea, Eve, and Joan of Arc), and as the examples show, characters from epic and myth are juxtaposed with those from history, not to mention genres such as

the novel (*Don Quixote*) or folklore (John Henry the navvy, who 'died with his hammer in his hand'; Davy Crockett). The males who can be regarded as historical are the Duke of Wellington, George Washington, Columbus, Galileo, and Elvis Presley, in that order. As for cultural origins, America (i.e. the USA) heads the list with four straightforward entries and two very brief marginal ones: Coyote (culture hero), reported by Kroeber from the Californian Karok; and Maui (hero as trickster) from Hawaii. Apart from Arjuna (Indian), the reluctant hero, and Gilgamesh (Sumerian), the failed hero, all the rest belong to the Euro-American tradition. An intriguing title is 'Penthesilea (Amazonian), a female hero as male'. Is the association of the ancient Greek figure with South America a slip of the pen, a subtle joke, or a test of the reader's critical alertness?

It is apparently the characterizations that have determined the ordering of the list. Thus one notes the juxtaposition of the three who are labelled national, of the two who are defiant, and of the two who are tragic, as well as sequences such as reluctant, failed, and absurd heroes, and the hero as madman. But whether the implicit classification is intended as anything more than an editorial convenience is left undiscussed.

Naturally, many of the readings are extracted from translations, for instance from the Bible (Eve, Job), or from plays (Sophocles on Oedipus, a tragic hero; Brecht on Galileo, an intellectual hero). Others come from retellings for non-scholarly audiences (Finn, Arjuna, Robin Hood) or from ethnographers (Coyote, Maui). The rest are mostly extracted from discussions by historians, folklorists, or the like. The best seemed to me Camus on Sisyphus (ancient Greek) as the absurd hero.

This curiously unambitious collection left me feeling rather as one might after reading through a newspaper or periodical, namely in possession of just a little more general knowledge than before; but perhaps that is all one should expect.

N. J. ALLEN

DEREK FREEMAN, *The Fateful Hoaxing of Margaret Mead: A Historical Analysis of her Samoan Research*, Boulder, Colorado: Westview 1999. xi, 279 pp., References, Illustrations, Index. £16.50/\$24.00.

A considerable amount of academic effort has gone into this work, and as a piece of scholarly research it has much merit. None the less, I find it distasteful for several reasons. First, the theoretical background of the social sciences has always been in processes of change, in which the 'nature versus nurture' debate has featured often enough in one form or another to be an almost perennial issue. Unless one is studying the history of social anthropology, what is the point of proving in such detail that Margaret Mead had been hoaxed on her first field trip? As such, her *Coming of Age in Samoa* is an interesting read and no more than a stage in her and her readers' scholarly development. Secondly, most if not all anthropologists, including myself, make fools of themselves several times in their careers, and most frequently of all on their first field trips.

Perhaps one should accept that anthropology, with its dependence on researcher-informant relationships—a stop-go process—is particularly prone to these types of accidents. Informants clutch at opportunities as readily as any other type of person when relative poverty meets relative affluence. Surely Freeman must have expected hostile reactions to his attack on Mead—as this is what it is—and was ambitious in thinking that the personal and professional can be kept separate. It would presumably be feasible to make similar studies of Evans-Pritchard and his interpreters of Nuer ideas, Malinowski and local women, and so on for any number of the great and good, whose published work has stimulated so many others to look for their own truths in the behaviour of others. The present book has the substance of an article, since its basic facts have been known for many years, or perhaps it might be seen as part of a larger work on researcher-informant relationships and the nature of anthropological truth. At all events, I recall that some of Mead's long-term contacts in Manus wept at news of her death.

R. E. S. TANNER

LEO HOWE, *Hinduism and Hierarchy in Bali*, Oxford: James Currey / Santa Fe: School of American Research Press 2001. xii, 228 pp., Map, Plates, References, Index. No price given.

This careful study is based on three field trips to Bali undertaken between 1978 and 1999, in which work was concentrated on commoners, Brahmans, and new religious movements. Howe concludes that the socio-religious situation here is more complex than a century ago because of the new state-supported form of Hinduism, devised to fit in with the national policy of *pancasila*, the influence of Indian Hinduism, and the growth of several new religious movements, of which he examines in detail the Hare Krishna and Sai Baba sects. The changes in both Balinese Hinduism and its hierarchy were occasioned by the mass killings of 1965–6, with which are correlated the over-polarization of society deriving from land-ownership, wealth, caste, and political power, economic changes from infrastructural development, and pervasive attempts to raise status through wealth, education and prestigious occupations.

Howe details the conflict between hierarchy and equality, in which tradition and modernity are difficult to disentangle, as each in part assumes the forms of the other. Ranking in Bali has never been stable, with today's priests declining in status and autonomous domains of religious practice emerging. There now also exist a large number of religious movements forming part of Indonesian Hinduism, ones that are not specifically Balinese, but which provide new kinds of identity and represent a grassroots development for the middle classes and intelligentsia of the towns. Howe points out that while the Sai Baba movement provides an important counterweight to Balinese inequality, the Hare Krishna movement separates its members from society, which is seen in oppositional terms. He concludes that clamping down on politics has led to religion assuming greater political importance, though at the same time the individual's religious devotion will continue to be based on ritual rather than spirituality.

Howe also stresses that the state's interest in promoting tourism creates official support for Balinese public ritualism.

It is a pity that the importance of this thorough study is somewhat reduced by the poor definition of the illustrations, from which outsiders could have gained additional information.

R. E. S. TANNER

DOROTHY HOLLAND and JEAN LAVE (eds), *History in Person: Enduring Struggles, Contentious Practice, Intimate Identities*, Oxford: James Currey / Santa Fe: School of American Research 2001. ix, 389 pp., Maps, Figures, References, Index. £40.00/£16.95.

This collection of nine studies is the result of a seminar on how individuals endeavour to create new, or at least acceptable, identities for themselves in difficult and enduring situations. Although the editors provide a theoretical introduction knitting these very different fieldwork results together, it is the studies themselves that will interest particular readers. Part 1, 'Struggles in Transformation', covers the strip-searching of Republican women prisoners in Northern Ireland, the organization of anti-racism in Guatemala, and women in the Pro-Democracy Movement in Nepal. Part 2, 'Practices of Identity in Enduring Struggles', contains studies of Black class-formation, industrial rites of passage in English factories, and the identity changes of the Brazilian anthropologist Eduardo Mori. Part 3, 'Futures in Context', has chapters on Mexican reactions to domination in California, Portuguese 'port' families trying to maintain their British cultural connections, and finally a study of exile and the re-ordering of history. The quality of the different sections may well draw readers in to consider the wider theoretical aspects of identity transformation, but it is the topics that are covered that make exciting reading for less specialized readers.

R. E. S. TANNER

## PUBLICATIONS RECEIVED

AHMED, SARA, CLAUDIA CASTEÑEDA, ANNE-MARIE FORTIER, and MIMI SELLER (eds), *Uprootings/Groundings: Questions of Home and Migration*, Oxford and New York: Berg 2003. xiv, 304 pp., Index, Plates. £55.00/£17.99.

*Cambridge Anthropology*, Vol. XXIII, no. 3 (2003).

CLIFFORD, JAMES, *On the Edges of Anthropology (Interviews)*, Chicago, Ill.: Prickly Paradigm Press 2004. iii, 121 pp., Further Reading. US\$10.00/£7.00.

COHEN, ABNER, *Custom and Politics in Urban Africa* (new edn), London and New York: Routledge 2004. xxviii, 252 pp., Index, Bibliography, Tables, Map. £20.00.

COLE, SALLY, *Ruth Landes: A Life in Anthropology*, Lincoln and London: University of Nebraska Press 2003. xvi, 299 pp., Index, Bibliography, Plates. £41.95.

*Critique of Anthropology*, Vol. XXIII, no. 4 (December 2003).

ELKIN, JAMES, *What Happened to Art Criticism?*, Chicago, Ill.: Prickly Paradigm Press 2004. 87 pp., US\$10.00/£7.00.

*Ethnos*, Vol. LXVIII, nos 3-4 (2003).

FISKESJÖ, MAGNUS, *The Thanksgiving Turkey Pardon, the Death of Teddy's Bear, and the Sovereign Exception of Guantánamo*, Chicago, Ill.: Prickly Paradigm Press 2004. 75 pp., Some Further Readings. US\$10.00/£7.00.

GARSTEN, CHRISTINA, and HELENA WULFF (eds), *New Technologies at Work: People, Screens and Social Virtuality*, Oxford and New York: Berg 2003. xii, 250 pp., Index. £50.00/£15.99.

GOTTLIEB, ALMA, *The Afterlife is Where We Come From: The Culture of Infancy in West Africa*, Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press 2004. xxiv, 404 pp., Illustrations, Notes, References, Index. US\$25.00.

HOHNEN, PERNILLE, *A Market out of Place? Remaking Economic, Social and Symbolic Boundaries in Post-Communist Lithuania*, Oxford: Clarendon Press 2003. xi, 164 pp., Bibliography, Appendix, Index, Figures, Plate. No price given.

JAMES, WENDY, *The Ceremonial Animal: A New Portrait of Anthropology*, Oxford: Oxford University Press 2003. xxiii, 384 pp., Illustrations, Notes, Select Bibliography, Index. No price given.

*Journal of Asian and African Studies*, Vol. LXVI (September 2003).

KABERRY, PHYLLIS M., *Aboriginal Women: Sacred and Profane* (new edn), London and New York: Routledge 2004. xli, 294 pp., Index, Bibliography, Plates. £20.00.

KABERRY, PHYLLIS M., *Women of the Grassfields* (new edn), London and New York: Routledge 2004. xxiv, 220 pp., Index, Appendices, Plates, Tables. £20.00.

KIRTSOGLU, ELISABETH, *For the Love of Women: Gender, Identity and Same-sex Relations in a Greek Provincial Town*, London and New York: Routledge 2004. vii, 192 pp., Index, Bibliography. £14.99.

LEWIS, E. D., *Timothy Asch and Ethnographic Film*, London and New York: Routledge 2004. xxiv, 297 pp., Index, Appendix, Plates, Figures. £60.00.

LLOBERA, JOSEP R., *An Invitation to Anthropology: The Structure, Evolution and Cultural Identity of Human Societies*, Oxford and New York: Berghahn Books 2003. vi, 262 pp., Bibliography, Index. No price given.

## 366 Publications Received

- MOSER, CAROLINE O. N., and CATHY MCILWAINE, *Encounters with Violence in Latin America: Urban Poor Perceptions from Colombia and Guatemala*, London and New York: Routledge 2004. xvi, 272 pp., Appendices, Notes, Bibliography, Index. £19.99.
- NAYAK, ANOOP, *Race, Place and Globalization: Youth Cultures in a Changing World*, Oxford and New York: Berg 2003. ix, 208 pp., Index. £50.00/£15.99.
- OLWIG, KAREN FOG, and EVA GULLØV, *Children's Places: Cross-Cultural Perspectives*, London and New York: Routledge 2003. viii, 255 pp., Index. £18.99.
- PATTERSON, THOMAS C., *Marx's Ghost: Conversations with Archaeologists*, Oxford and New York: Berg 2003. xvi, 204 pp., Index, Bibliography. £50.00/£16.99.
- PRICE, RICHARD, and SALLY PRICE, *The Root of Roots or How Afro-American Anthropology Got its Start*, Chicago, Ill.: Prickly Paradigm Press 2004. 89 pp., Recommended Readings. US\$10.00/£7.00.
- RICHARDS, AUDREY I., *Hunger and Work in a Savage Tribe: A Functional Study of Nutrition among the Southern Bantu* (new edn), London and New York: Routledge 2004. xxvi, 238 pp., Index, Bibliography. £20.00.
- SAHLINS, MARSHALL, *Stone Age Economics* (new edn), London and New York: Routledge 2004. xx, 348 pp., Index, Bibliography, Tables, Figures, Maps. £20.00.
- SCHNEIDER, JANE, and IDA SUSSEY (eds), *Wounded Cities*, Oxford and New York: Berg 2003. xv, 317 pp., Figures. £50.00/£15.99.
- SPENCER, PAUL, *The Maasai of Matapato* (new edn), London and New York: Routledge 2004. xxii, 297 pp., Indexes, References, Tables, Figures. £20.00.
- SPENCER, PAUL, *Time, Space, and the Unknown: Maasai Configurations of Power and Providence*, London and New York: Routledge 2003. xv, 287 pp., Index, References, Figures, Tables, Maps. £55.00.
- SPENCER, PAUL, *The Samburu* (new edn), London and New York: Routledge 2004. xxxiii, 341 pp., Index, Bibliography, Appendix, Plates, Figures. £20.00.
- TURNER, LUCIEN M., *Ethnology of the Ungava District, Hudson Bay Territory*, Washington and London: Smithsonian Institution Press 2001. xxxii, 192 pp. Figures, Plates. £22.95.
- URTON, GARY, *Signs of the Inka Khipu: Binary Coding in the Andean Knotted-String Records*, Austin: University of Texas Press 2003. xi, 202 pp., Index, Bibliography, Appendix, Plates, Figures, Tables. £15.50.
- WADE, PETER, *Race, Nature and Culture: An Anthropological Perspective*, London and Sterling, Va: Pluto Press 2002. vi, 150 pp. Index, References. £13.99.
- WEINER, JAMES F., *Tree Leaf Talk: A Heideggerian Anthropology*, Oxford and New York: Berg 2001. xv, 190 pp. Index, References, Plates. £42.99.
- WYLIE, ALISON, *Thinking from Things: Essays in the Philosophy of Archaeology*, Berkeley etc.: University of California Press 2002. xviii, 339 pp., Indexes, References. £55.00/£27.95//\$80.00/\$39.95.