

Visions of Order and Apocalypse:  
Text and Image in thirteenth-  
century Vercelli



Volume 1, Text

Jennifer Shurville, St. Cross College

A thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in  
History of Art at the University of Oxford,  
Michaelmas 2018

## Short Abstract

In this thesis, I present seven large thirteenth-century single-sheet and roll manuscripts (the Rotoli figurati) held at the Archivio Capitolare of the cathedral of S. Eusebio in Vercelli. In the process of presenting these documents, and arguments for their dating and provenance in the city of Vercelli, I contend that they should be examined as a group because of their distinctive shared qualities, particularly their unusual format, and their communication of complex forms of knowledge through ordered systems of image and text. Understood broadly, the thematic content of most of these manuscripts relates to the ordered representation of knowledge and the shape of salvific history including the (imminent) Apocalypse. Further motifs emerge which concern the role of the Church within past, present, and future history. In two of the manuscripts, Rotoli figurati 4 and 7, these themes converge in the works of monastic exegete Joachim of Fiore (d. 1202). The diagram of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) is known from one other version, but with significant differences relating to its incorporation of Joachim's thought. Rotoli figurati 7 contains five new testimonies of Joachim's work, including two diagrammatic figures.

To critically engage with their function, these documents are historicized in an examination of the active religious and intellectual centres in Vercelli, 1150–1300, a city marked by its political significance to both papacy and empire. Furthermore, I expand the significance of the Rotoli figurati by contextualising them within known complex visualisations of knowledge in medieval visual culture. While some of the Rotoli figurati can be compared to other sources, others demonstrate an innovative use of the diagrammatic mode. Considered together, their shared motifs directly reflect their use and function in the cathedral chapter of S. Eusebio, with its dynamic intellectual community and strong links to the papacy. In this thesis I argue for the significance of complex images as a means of communicating innovative theological thought and papal ideology in the period 1185–1307, reflected in the distinctive composition of the Rotoli figurati at Vercelli.

## Long Abstract

In this thesis, I examine an understudied corpus of seven manuscripts held at the chapter library of the cathedral of S. Eusebio in Vercelli. The source material comprises five large single leaf manuscripts, and two multi-leaf rolls, the majority of which were previously unknown to scholarship. On the basis of palaeographic and contextual evidence, I have proposed that the provenance of these extraordinary documents is Vercelli (and the cathedral chapter of S. Eusebio), that their content should be dated to the late twelfth century, and (broadly in agreement with the very recent research by Mirella Ferrari) that the Rotoli figurati were copied in the period 1250–1276. This analysis allows a historical and art-historical exploration of the particular religious and political cultures which existed in Vercelli and more broadly northern Italy at this time, and which gave life and meaning to the manuscripts in question. The intellectual culture of Vercelli in the late twelfth and thirteenth century was rich and diverse, a node for cultural and intellectual exchange, with links beyond the Alps to France and England. In restoring the social and political context of these manuscripts' striking combinations of text and image, I have been able to perceive insights into the character of contemporary thought. Intellectuals sought to respond to conflicts arising from contests over the sources of authority, including the papal-imperial struggle; issues of heresy, orthodoxy, and apocalypticism; and new challenges to established habits of theological thought. In using these manuscripts to address these issues, we can better understand the dynamic of cultural development in northern Italy and more broadly in western Europe at this time.

The Rotoli figurati include a *mappamundi*, an allegorical depiction of the hierarchical constitution of the Church, apocalyptic writings, moral treatises on the vices and virtues in graphic form, and a record of the murals of S. Eusebio cathedral. The understanding of these documents as a group allows us to explore the circumstances of seven unusually large format documents from the same period being found at the same cathedral archive. Examination of the paleography and style suggests relationships between the Rotoli figurati. Several of these manuscripts also make use of diagrams, functioning through a coherent integration of text and image which depends on careful visual layout to create meaning. These manuscripts also share thematic

concerns, some broad, some specific: the visualisation of knowledge through images, frameworks for understanding past, present, and future history, a concern with universal order and social hierarchy, and the collation of diverse sources into encyclopaedic images. The knowledge presupposed by the manuscripts, as well as the information directly communicated by their content, allows us to reconstruct something of the intellectual life of their intended audience.

The manuscripts draw visual cues from diverse iconographic and diagrammatic sources and influence from a wide range of authoritative medieval texts, including elements of twelfth-century theological thought derived from Hugh of Saint Victor and Joachim of Fiore. Medieval maps and diagrams cannot be understood without examining the intellectual practices of the clerics and monks who created the images, their approaches to dealing with images and texts, and contemporary interpretations of classical encyclopaedic works. Mapping and diagram making require for their study an interdisciplinary approach crossing political and social history, the history of visual art, the history of ideas, the history of cultural practices and the history of science. These approaches are reflected in several ways throughout the discussion of the *Rotoli figurati*.

The range of authors described above not only suggests a learned and educational context, but also indicates distinctive theological interests: in ecclesiology, eschatology, and consequently in definitions of religious orthodoxy. Joachim's historical theology, his exegesis, and his novel interpretations of pattern and meaning in salvific history in the form of concordance, gave him the reputation of an important, divinely gifted, exegete in the late twelfth century, and the broader reputation of a prophet after his death in the first half of the thirteenth. His understanding that a new order of contemplative and preaching monks would arise at the end of the period he considered the sixth age, to preach against the antichrist, provided an apocalyptic interpretation to the role of the new mendicant orders in salvation history. Both orders claimed this role, although Joachim's influence is more commonly associated with the Franciscans. The conviction that a prophet and exegete had determined that these orders were to play a great part in the drama of the end times had an impact upon their self-definition and development in the first half of the thirteenth century, and more broadly upon the nature of the popular support of the mendicant movement, and conversely, drew criticism from the secular clergy. Further, in the mid-thirteenth century, apocalyptic

elements of his thought became associated with radical apocalyptic movements, condemned mendicant groups which were particularly active close to Vercelli at the end of the century. Their activity directly affected the contemporary reception of the *Rotoli figurati*, as a note warning of one of the manuscript's heterodox material suggests.

More broadly, anxieties surrounding religious orthodoxy were prevalent in the climate of social and religious change which characterised the thirteenth century. Such challenges may have driven the community at Vercelli to seek to stabilise knowledge and fix images of social and religious order (particularly visible in the *Ecclesia* diagram). Furthermore, in the methods by which they compile, invent, and organise knowledge visually, condensing and compiling diverse sources, several of the *Rotoli figurati* record the still understudied format of the diagrammatic mode. In paying attention to the features of these documents, together with their social and religious context in contemporary Vercelli, we can arrive at unique insights into the broader development of later medieval intellectual culture. Vercelli's allegiance was important both to empire and papacy, and this broader struggle is reflected in the conflict of authority which is documented within the city. Uberto Crivelli, bishop of Vercelli 1183–84, became pope Urban III, and his political manoeuvring in the city and surrounding region during his papacy are representative of the influences the papal-imperial conflict could have on the development of intellectual and religious culture in the city. Vercelli's history during the thirteenth century therefore offers in microcosm a perspective on the wider social conflicts and intellectual controversies in the Italian peninsula and which dominated much of western Europe at the time.

## Acknowledgements

To begin with, I wish to thank my supervisors, Gervase Rosser and Martin Kauffmann. This thesis could not have been completed without their insightful criticism, kindness, and unfailing support.

This study has also relied upon the good will of everyone at the Fondazione Museo del Tesoro de Duomo e Archivio Capitolare in Vercelli. I benefited there from the expertise and generosity of Anna Cerutti Garlanda, who sadly died in April 2018, Timoty Leonardi (and Marta Barberis), Sara Minelli, and Silvia Faccin, among others. Timoty and Anna allowed me countless hours with the manuscripts in their care. Their kindness and shared knowledge give this thesis its grounding in the city of Vercelli. I would also like to thank the members of the Società Storica Vercellese and their president Giovanni Ferraris for their assistance, and for publishing the earliest results of my research on the Rotoli figurati. For giving me the opportunity to visit Vercelli for the first time, I would also like to thank my friend Winfried Rudolf.

The support of various institutions enabled me to carry out the research for this thesis: I am grateful to the AHRC for a doctoral studentship and research grants, and to St. Cross College for travel grants. An initial library research grant from the Fondazione Museo del Tesoro del Duomo e Archivio Capitolare in honour of Mons. Giuseppe Ferraris in Vercelli allowed me to begin research in 2012. An Isaiah Berlin Fund Scholarship through the History of Art Department allowed me to conduct archival research in northern Italy. A visiting ERASMUS+ studentship at the Università degli studi di Padova enabled me to undertake further archival research and gave me access to the welcoming community of scholars in Padua. A TORCH Humanities Grant for research at the Fondazione Giorgio Cini gave me a month to examine related diagrams in early printed books in Venice. The final stages of research and writing were undertaken during a short-term Frances A. Yates Fellowship at the Warburg Institute in London. I am grateful to all of these institutions and the people I met there for their support and kindnesses.

At Oxford, I particularly want to thank Lisandra Costiner and Sarah Griffin for their enduring support and many energising conversations. James Norrie read and commented upon innumerable drafts of these chapters and travelled widely in Italy with me as I visited archives and churches on the hunt for images. Discussions and generous exchanges with friends, colleagues, and academics who have shared their knowledge, and their time, with me, have been fundamental to this project, and here I want to sincerely thank: Marco Rainini, Alexander Patschovsky, Gian-Luca Potestà, Giorgio Tibaldeschi, Mirella Ferrari, David d'Avray, Julia Walworth, Craig Clunas, Jeffrey Hamburger, Irene Ceccherini, Laura Cleaver, Matthew Walker, Christina La Rocca and Stefano Gasparri, Anne, Oxana and Ralph Cleminson, Karl Whittington, Eckart Conrad Lutz, Francis Leneghan, Julian Gardner, Martina Schilling, Gustav Zamore, Ang Li, Stefanie Lenk, Karl Kinsella, John Sabapathy, Francis Herbert, Johannes Wolf, Emily Corran, Sara Gordon, Véronique Rouchon Mouilleron, Alessandro Scafì, and Charles Burnett.

Finally, I could not have completed this thesis without the love and encouragement of my family, Gill, Ian, and Ali, or my partner Luke, who helped me to finally see the wood for the trees.

# Table of Contents

## Volume 1

|                                                                                                          |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| Acknowledgements                                                                                         | i   |
| Abbreviations                                                                                            | iii |
| Introduction                                                                                             | 1   |
| 1 The manuscript sources                                                                                 | 28  |
| 2 Vercelli, the city and its culture                                                                     | 94  |
| 3 Visualising knowledge, c. 1150–1300                                                                    | 137 |
| 4 The body of the Church: reading the <i>Ecclesia</i> diagram                                            | 181 |
| 5 Ecclesiology and eschatology at the end of the twelfth century                                         | 229 |
| 6 Joachim of Fiore and Dolcino of Novara: the changing reception of the Rotoli figurati, c. 1187 to 1307 | 251 |
| Conclusion                                                                                               | 285 |
| Appendix 1: ACVC, Rotoli figurati 4 ( <i>Ecclesia</i> ): Text                                            | 293 |
| Appendix 2: ACVC Rotoli figurati 4 ( <i>Ecclesia</i> ): Legends and Rubrics                              | 298 |
| Appendix 3: ACVC, Rotoli figurati 4 ( <i>Ecclesia</i> ): Translation                                     | 300 |
| Appendix 4: ACVC, Rotoli figurati 4 and 7: Textual comparison                                            | 305 |

## Volume 2

|                       |     |
|-----------------------|-----|
| List of illustrations | 308 |
| Bibliography          | 313 |
| Images                | 340 |

# Abbreviations

Abbreviations used after first citation. Full references are found in the bibliography.

|                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|-------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| ACVC                    | Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| BAV                     | Vatican City, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| BCVC                    | Vercelli, Biblioteca Capitolare                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| BL                      | London, British Library                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| BN                      | Paris, Bibliothèque Nationale de France                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| Bodl.                   | Oxford, Bodleian Library                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| BSSS                    | <i>Biblioteca della società storica subalpina</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| CCCC                    | Cambridge, Corpus Christi College                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| CUL                     | Cambridge University Library                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| CCCM                    | Corpus Christianorum, continuatio medievalis                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| CCSL                    | Corpus Christianorum, series latina                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| DA                      | <i>Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters</i>                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| <i>Decretum</i>         | <i>Decretum magistri Gratiani</i> , ed. E. Friedberg, Corpus iuris canonici, 2 vols (repr. Graz, 1879)                                                                                                                                                |
| DBI                     | <i>Dizionario biografico degli italiani</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| eBLJ                    | <i>electronic British Library Journal</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| JEH                     | <i>Journal of Ecclesiastical History</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| JWCI                    | <i>Journal of the Warburg and Courtauld Institutes</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| MGH                     | Monumenta Germaniae Historica                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| PL                      | <i>Patrologia latina</i> [ <i>Patrologiae cursus completus ... series latina</i> ], ed. J.-P. Migne. 221 volumes. Paris, 1844–1864. Cited by volume and column number.                                                                                |
| PMLA                    | <i>Proceedings of the Modern Language Association</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| RIS                     | <i>Rerum italicarum scriptores</i> , ed. L. A. Muratori. Città di Castello, 1900–Cited by series number and volume.                                                                                                                                   |
| RTAM                    | <i>Recherches de théologie ancienne et médiévale</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| <i>Scripta breviora</i> | Joachim of Fiore, <i>Ioachim Abbas Florentis. Opera omnia IV. Opera minora 6: Scripta breviora</i> , ed. L. Braca, A. Patschovsky, G.-L. Potestà, M. Kaup, and K.-V. Selge, Fonti per la storia dell'Italia medievale. Antiquitates, 40 (Rome, 2014). |



## Introduction

In 2011, I visited the Fondazione Museo del Tesoro del Duomo e Archivio Capitolare among a group of graduate students, ostensibly to view the Vercelli Book and the other treasures of the cathedral of S. Eusebio in Vercelli. Dr Timoty Leonardi, the curator of the collections, told me then about a puzzling and esoteric roll which had not been given any attention by scholars. The large and unwieldy document he took off the shelves and unrolled across the tables in the reading room was the *Ecclesia* manuscript, which is now known as Rotoli figurati 4, one of the seven remarkable manuscripts — collectively, the Rotoli figurati— which form the basis for this thesis.

The *Ecclesia* is an arresting document nearly a metre in length, dominated by a seated figure with the face of Christ and a body compartmentalised into numerous smaller scenes, lists, and hierarchies. At that point, I had never seen anything quite like it; and more significantly, as I sent images and pleas for assistance to academics, neither had anyone else. An initial grant for foreign students sponsored by the Fondazione and under the expert guidance of Dr Anna Cerutti and Dr Leonardi enabled me to begin initial research on the *Ecclesia* roll. The city of Vercelli is commonly associated with the Vercelli Book, the codex of Anglo-Saxon prose and verse which has in the autumn of 2018 returned to England, to the British Library, for the first time since the middle ages. Scholarship investigating the problematic issue of how that manuscript came to be in Vercelli has built up an image of the city's importance as a powerful religious and intellectual centre from the early days of the Church, a city with broad horizons thanks in part to its position on road networks (and the main pilgrimage route to Rome from across the Alps), connecting the Italian peninsula with cities across the mountains. As a religious centre the city's history is dominated by the cathedral chapter of S. Eusebio, named for the first bishop of the city, and the school and scriptorium which were established around it.<sup>1</sup> The canons of S. Eusebio lived in common, sharing duties and

---

<sup>1</sup> Important studies on the early history of Vercelli and S. Eusebio are unsurprisingly from Vercelli historians: C. F. Savio, *Gli antichi vescovi d'Italia dalle origini al 1300 descritti per regioni: il Piemonte*, ed. P. Tacchi Venturi, *Gli antichi vescovi d'Italia dalle origini al 1300 descritti per regioni*, 4 vols (Florence, 1898), 1, pp. 403–94; R. Pastè, 'Dall'antica *Schola S. Eusebii* all'erezione del nostro seminario', *Archivio della Società Vercellese di Storia e d'Arte*, 8 (1921), pp. 193–98; E.

revenues across the city's many other churches.<sup>2</sup> Important early medieval bishops of Vercelli such as Atto (d. before 958) and Leo (d. 1026) left records of their impressive manuscript collections in book lists and inventories, often composed of donations from bishops across Europe.<sup>3</sup> Modern scholarship has established that many of those manuscripts can be identified with those still held in the Biblioteca Capitolare Eusebiana.<sup>4</sup>

### *The main claims of this thesis*

The seven manuscripts of the Rotoli figurati are single- or multi-leaf roll manuscripts comprising complex drawings and texts. Throughout the thesis, I have used the descriptive titles for the Rotoli figurati as they were designated by the Biblioteca Capitolare. During my research, Rotoli figurati 4 became known as the *Ecclesia* diagram and this title was also adopted by the chapter library. I considered it important to maintain the nomenclature as it would be used in the only recent publications on the Rotoli figurati, in order to be consistent with this emerging body of research.

---

Arborio-Mella, 'L'antica basilica Eusebiana, indagini e studi', *Archivio della Società Vercellese di Storia e d'Arte*, 5 (1913), pp. 725–52, 6 (1914), 1–16. See also P. Levine, 'Historical Evidence for Calligraphic Activity in Vercelli from St. Eusebius to Atto', *Speculum*, 30/4 (1955), pp. 561–81.

<sup>2</sup> R. Orsenigo, *Vercelli sacra: brevissimi cenni sulla diocesi e sue parrocchie, stato delle parrocchie e del clero*, repr. (Novara, 1995), p. 60; V. Mandelli, *Il comune di Vercelli nel medio evo*, 3 vols (1857), vol. IV, p. 28ff; M. Halsall, 'Vercelli and the Vercelli Book', *PMLA*, 84/6 (1969), pp. 1545–50; G. G. Merlo, 'I canonici dei capitoli cattedrali', in *Vercelli nel secolo XII. Atti del IV Congresso storico vercellese, 2002* (Vercelli, 2006), pp. 23–36.

<sup>3</sup> Important early work on the collections and their relation to the possessions of former bishops was undertaken by the former archivist and curator of the collections Mons. Giuseppe Ferraris, in his unpublished notebooks. See also the work of G. Vignodelli, 'I palinsesti del codice CLXXI della Biblioteca Capitolare Eusebiana', *Bollettino Storico Vercellese*, 86 (2016), pp. 5–35; G. Vignodelli, 'The Making of a Tenth-Century Self-Commentary: The Glosses to Atto of Vercelli's *Perpendiculum* and Their Sources', in *The Annotated Book in the Early Middle Ages* (Leiden, 2017), pp. 157–96.

<sup>4</sup> G. Ferraris, *Le chiese stazionali delle rogazioni minori a Vercelli dal sec. X al sec. XIV*, ed. G. Tibaldeschi (Vercelli, 1995); M. A. Casagrande Mazzoli, 'Per un'indagine sui manoscritti della Biblioteca Capitolare di Vercelli', in *L'Università di Vercelli nel medioevo. Il Congresso storico vercellese, Vercelli 23–25 ottobre 1992* (Vercelli, 1994), pp. 293–310; S. Gavinelli, 'Leone di Vercelli postillatore di codici', *Aevum*, 75 (2001), pp. 233–62; W. Rudolf, 'A Tenth-Century Booklist in the Biblioteca Capitolare of Vercelli', *Manuscripta*, 62/2 (2018), pp. 249–77; S. Gavinelli, 'Transiti di manoscritti attraverso le Alpi occidentali in epoca carolingia: gli episcopati di Ivrea e Vercelli', in *Le Alpi porta d'Europa. Scitture, uomini, idee da Giustiniano al Barbarossa*, ed. L. Pani and G. Scaloni (Spoleto, 2009), pp. 381–414.

Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*) contains proofs from books I–IV of Euclid’s *Elements*, uniquely found unaccompanied by any continuous text (figure I). Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*) contains a wheel diagram which depicts the use of the tenets of the Paternoster as a means to combat vice (figure II–III). Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), is a true roll manuscript, over two metres long, containing the *Compendium historiae in genealogia Christi*, a work composed in Paris by Peter of Poitiers (d. 1205) between 1170–1180 (figures IV and V). In Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*), we find a composite theological diagram of Christ enthroned, bordered by eight roundels of the vices and virtues (figure VI–VIII). Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*), is a roll manuscript depicting episodes from the Acts of the Apostles, mainly drawn from the lives of saints Peter and Paul, purportedly representing a pictorial programme from the cathedral of S. Eusebio (figures IX–XI). Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*), is a large circular world map, of a similar type to the monumental Hereford *mappa mundi* (c. 1300; figure XII). Five works of the Calabrian abbot Joachim of Fiore (d. 1202) are found on Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), inscribed on the dorse with an early-fourteenth-century note which comments on the content of the manuscript (figures XIII and XIV).

One strand of this thesis elucidates each of the manuscripts of the Rotoli figurati in turn and illustrates for the first time the relationships between these manuscripts, which call for them to be considered as a group. Based on paleographical, stylistic, and archival evidence, this thesis argues that the Rotoli figurati were made in Vercelli in the third quarter of the thirteenth century. In turn, this thesis presents an argument that Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore) may have originated from late twelfth-century exemplars which were also made in the city of Vercelli. Of the Rotoli figurati, 5, 6, and 7 have been addressed in previous studies. The *Atti degli apostoli* roll provides important evidence of Italian manuscript transmission of the Byzantine tradition of illustration of the Acts of the Apostles.<sup>5</sup> The *Mappamondo* has been incorporated into broader examinations of medieval *mappae mundi*, but the damage to

---

<sup>5</sup> L. Eleen, ‘Acts Illustration in Italy and Byzantium’, *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, 31 (1977), pp. 253–278.

the manuscript has limited critical engagement with the text.<sup>6</sup> Two of the examples of Joachim's works on Rotoli figurati 7 have been edited as part of the recent edition of Joachim's minor works.<sup>7</sup> However, the Rotoli figurati have not yet been subject to a sustained and historicised interpretation: this thesis therefore offers an historicised interpretation of these documents in the context of the powerful religious and intellectual centre of Vercelli, from the late twelfth to the early fourteenth century. Beyond offering this account, this thesis explores the visual qualities and use the diagrammatic mode which is shared among some—but not all, as we shall see—of the Rotoli figurati.<sup>8</sup> This modern art-historical term describes a principal form of medieval visual thinking, as we shall discuss further below.

In examining these themes, this study delves deeper into the most complex image of the group, the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4). The investigation into this manuscript shows how this image reflects the concerns of the Church at the end of the twelfth century, and responds directly to the historical context of Vercelli as an important ecclesiastical centre. Furthermore, this manuscript incorporates contemporary theology, in the form of elements of figurative theology drawn from the works of Hugh of Saint Victor and the eschatological thought of Joachim of Fiore. Through this examination, the thesis builds a case study of how these kinds of complex diagrams did not simply reproduce static forms, but in their composite nature reflect intellectual attempts to synthesise different forms of knowledge. This thesis thereby furthers the argument that diagrams had a significant role in medieval visual culture in generating and advancing knowledge, particularly in the realm of theology.<sup>9</sup>

Through the historicised account of these manuscripts' origins, copying, and use from the late twelfth to the early fourteenth century, this thesis is also able to offer a

---

<sup>6</sup> A.-D. von den Brincken, 'Monumental Legends on Medieval Manuscript Maps. Notes on Designed Capital Letters on Maps of Large Size (Demonstrated from the Problem of Dating the Vercelli Map, Thirteenth Century)', *Imago Mundi*, 42 (1990), pp. 9–25.

<sup>7</sup> Joachim of Fiore, *Joachim Abbas Florentis. Opera omnia IV. Opera minora 6: Scripta breviora*, ed. A. Patschovsky and others, *Fonti per la storia dell'Italia medievale. Antiquitates*, 40 (Rome, 2014).

<sup>8</sup> J. F. Hamburger, 'Haec Figura Demonstrat: Diagrams in an Early-Thirteenth Century Copy of Lothar de Segni's *De Missarum Mysteriis*', *History of Art and Architecture*, 58 (2009), pp. 7–78.

<sup>9</sup> J. F. Hamburger and A. M. Bouché, eds., *The Mind's Eye: Art and Theological Argument in the Middle Ages* (Princeton, N.J., 2006). This important collection is discussed further below.

commentary on their changing reception over time. This part of the study focuses on the interpretation of the presence of the works and thought of Joachim of Fiore in two of the Rotoli figurati. The engagement with Joachim's work throughout this period offers a new insight into the use of the abbot's theology in the thirteenth century, beyond the expected location of mendicant contexts. This thesis shows how Rotoli figurati 4 and 7 provide evidence that Joachim's thought was more broadly relevant and continued to be studied, even within conservative ecclesiastical centres, well beyond the late twelfth century and what is generally considered to be the period when Joachim was considered an orthodox authority. Furthermore, this thesis observes that the note on the back of Rotoli figurati 7, dated to 1307, ties the manuscripts to Vercelli in the early fourteenth century, and argues that the note records a direct response to events related to the activities of the heterodox social and religious group called the Order of the Apostles.<sup>10</sup> This community was active in and around Vercelli in the late thirteenth century, and their leader was executed in the city in 1307. The note on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7 warns potential readers of the vanity of seeking knowledge about the imminent end of the world in the works of Joachim of Fiore found in that manuscript. This evocative note is shown to offer an exceptional insight into how Joachim's works were perceived in the early fourteenth century, and furthermore, that the radical apocalyptic expectation propounded by the Order of the Apostles was associated at the time with the authentic works of the abbot.

### *The format of the manuscripts*

The earliest archival record of these seven manuscripts might date from 1426, in an inventory from the archive of S. Eusebio, which notes: 'Item carte septem depicte variis et diversis modis et cum aliquibus figuris.'<sup>11</sup> This fifteenth-century inventory uses the term 'carta' to indicate the size and format of the seven documents, but also remarks upon the diverse themes and images (*figuris*) they contain. The identification of their common use of figures is an important shared feature. A functioning diagram depends

---

<sup>10</sup> R. Orioli, *Venit perfidus heresiarcha: il movimento apostolico-dolciniano dal 1260 al 1307* (Rome, 1988).

<sup>11</sup> Ferraris, *Le chiese stazionali*, at p. 232, n. 366.

on a body of shared knowledge (between maker and user), which is reorganised and conveyed in the depiction. Diagrams also depend on visual rhetoric, a system of order, which gives them the potential to elucidate visually complex subjects or theories.<sup>12</sup> Beyond the broader claims I make about the kinds of medieval image making which are evident in the Rotoli figurati, in the first chapter I will demonstrate that the hands of different copyists, and not least the works contained within, bind these manuscripts together as a group deserving of collective analysis. Each manuscript will be considered in a separate section in the next chapter, following the numerical order of the shelfmarks which have now been assigned by the chapter library.

The remarkable survival of seven large rolls is reviewed through the kind of damage each manuscript has sustained, which tends to be concentrated at the edges, exposed when the roll was stored on a shelf, or upright in a box.<sup>13</sup> Five of the Rotoli figurati are single leaves of parchment; two are multi-leaf rolls. Although the roll format was common during the medieval period for certain types of document, for others it is a markedly unusual choice. Charters and other items of documentary culture might commonly be stored on rolls of varying sizes, often small scraps of parchment, and indeed many like this are still stored in chests at the chapter library and the seminary library attached to the cathedral of S. Eusebio. Smaller rolls than these were practical; they could be transported easily. Later in the middle ages, large sheets of paper covered in prayers or protective charms could be rolled tightly and worn in a pouch around the neck as an amulet.<sup>14</sup> Some longer non-documentary rolls might also be used for genealogies, for aristocratic families, or for biblical histories. Roughly drawn, or at least, less richly decorated, rolls containing texts or figures are also known to have been used didactically in school or university contexts, displayed on walls, or laid out on tables as

---

<sup>12</sup> S. Bogen and F. Thürlemann, 'Jenseits der Opposition von Text und Bild: Überlegungen zu einer Theorie des Diagramms und des Diagrammatischen', in *Die Bildwelt der Diagramme Joachims von Fiore: zur Medialität religiös-politischer Programme im Mittelalter*, ed. A. Patschovsky (Ostfildern, 2003), pp. 1–22, at p. 9.

<sup>13</sup> The condition of each manuscript will be discussed in more detail in the corresponding sections in chapter one. Since 2018, all seven of these manuscripts have undergone conservation and are now stored flat under protective conditions.

<sup>14</sup> D. C. Skemer, *Binding Words: Textual Amulets in the Middle Ages* (University Park, Pa., 2006).

visual aids to instruction.<sup>15</sup> The normality of displaying such rolls or single-sheet images on walls has perhaps been overstated. One thirteenth-century description, from the Bolognese master of grammar and rhetoric, Buoncompagno da Signa, comments that lecture halls should be free of images or pictures unless they were symbolic images that enhanced memorisation and learning.<sup>16</sup> Perhaps the most famous example of this is the world map described within the twelfth-century work of Hugh of Saint Victor known as *De Sacramentis legis naturalis et scriptae dialogus*. The dialogue between a student and teacher seems to describe a *mappamondo*, visible to both.<sup>17</sup> In ecclesiastical institutions one might expect also to find liturgical rolls, which can often be large and richly decorated. In southern Italy, at Benevento, the ‘Exultet’ rolls are well-known.<sup>18</sup> These large rolls were used during liturgical processions or displayed over the pulpit to the congregation and had specific ritual functions. It is important to stress, however, that it is exceptionally rare to find such a large number of non-documentary, non-liturgical medieval rolls held at a single institution as those at Vercelli. Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia*) is the only work for which a multi-leaf roll might be the most ordinary form of presentation. For rolls 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*) and 6 (*Mappamondo*), a single leaf format is also found in other instances. In the case of Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*), and 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*), no other exemplars are known as a roll. The single other known version of 4 (*Ecclesia*) is conserved in a multi-leaf roll. For Rotoli figurati 7

---

<sup>15</sup> See F. Saxl, ‘A Spiritual Encyclopaedia of the Later Middle Ages’, *JWCI*, 5 (1942), 82–142. For evidence that some roll manuscripts were hung on walls see, W. H. Monroe, ‘13th and Early 14th Century Illustrated Genealogical Manuscripts in Roll and Codex: Peter of Poitiers’ *Compendium, Universal Histories and Chronicles of the Kings of England*’ (unpublished PhD Thesis, Courtauld Institute, 1990), p. 43.

<sup>16</sup> ‘... nec sint in ea [*domo scholastica discipline*] imagines aliquae vel picture, nisi forte ille que per imaginarias formas et figuras notabiles reductiones faciant ad memoriam super scientiis, in quibus ingenia exercentur.’ Buoncompagno da Signa, ‘Rhetorica Novissima’, in *Scripta Anecdota Glossatorum*, ed. A. Gaudenzi, J. B. Palmerio, and F. Patetta, Bibliotheca Iuridica Medii Aevi, 3 vols (1888), 2 (1892), pp. 249–297, at p. 279. The text is cited by Monroe, ‘Illustrated Genealogical Manuscripts’, p. 43.

<sup>17</sup> Hugh of Saint Victor, ‘De sacramentis legis naturalis et scriptae dialogus’, in *PL*, CLXXVI, 17–42. Cited in D. Terkla, ‘Hugh of St Victor (1096–1141) and Anglo-French Cartography’, *Imago Mundi*, 65/2 (2013), pp. 161–79, at p. 161. An edition of the ‘Descriptio’ can be found in: P. Gautier Dalché, *La ‘Descriptio mappe mundi’ de Hugues de Saint-Victor* (Paris, 1988).

<sup>18</sup> G. Cavallo, ‘Exultet’, *Enciclopedia dell’arte medievale*, 6 (Rome, 1995), pp. 60–68.

(Gioacchino da Fiore), a collection of certain diagrams and texts by Joachim of Fiore (d. 1202), a single leaf rather than codex format is, as far as I know, unique.

### *Current Scholarship on the Rotoli figurati*

This study is informed by a large body of scholarship on the city of Vercelli and the established importance of the cathedral of S. Eusebio as a religious and intellectual centre. It is important to note here that when this study began there was, on the other hand, no scholarship which addressed the Rotoli figurati collectively and none had official shelfmarks; studies existed on the *Atti degli apostoli* roll (Rotoli figurati 5) and the *Mappamundo* (Rotoli figurati 6). Giuseppe Ferraris had very briefly described each of the rolls in the notebooks which were to form the basis of a catalogue.<sup>19</sup> In 2012, the Fondazione Museo del Tesoro del Duomo e Archivio Capitolare organised a public campaign entitled ‘Adotta una pergamena’, to raise funding for the conservation of four of the Rotoli figurati which were the most fragile.<sup>20</sup> This included a public event to display the manuscripts, with several talks to explain their importance.<sup>21</sup> I published the results of initial research on the *Ecclesia* manuscript (Rotoli figurati 4) and Rotoli figurati 7, as ‘The ‘Ecclesia’ roll and the Seven Seals: two recently discovered theological diagrams in Vercelli’ in the *Bollettino Storico Vercellese* in 2013.<sup>22</sup> The identification of new testimonies of work of Joachim of Fiore in Rotoli figurati 7 in the *Bollettino* article of 2013 led to the series editor, Alexander Patschovsky, being able to include these in an edition of Joachim’s minor works as part of Joachim’s *Opera omnia*, published under the *Centro internazionale di studi Gioachimiti* in 2014.<sup>23</sup> In 2015, Marco Rainini incorporated Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*) into his study of symbolic representations of

---

<sup>19</sup> These are noted in the individual sections for each manuscript in chapter one below.

<sup>20</sup> See a brief overview at: <<http://tesorodelduomovc.it/adotta-una-pergamena/>>.

<sup>21</sup> The conference included the following talks: T. Leonardi, ‘Adotta una pergamena: origine, ragioni e speranze’; W. Rudolf and J. Shurville, ‘I contenuti del Rotolo genealogico-didattico dell’Archivio Capitolare’; A. Barbero, ‘Genealogie bibliche, genealogie nobiliari: famiglia, lignaggio, antenati nel medioevo’.

<sup>22</sup> J. Shurville, ‘The *Ecclesia* roll and the Seven Seals: Two recently discovered theological diagrams in Vercelli’, *Bollettino Storico Vercellese*, 41/2 (2013), pp. 59–84.

<sup>23</sup> Joachim of Fiore, *Joachim Abbas Florentis. Opera omnia IV. Opera minora 6: Scripta breviora*, ed. L. Braca, A. Patschovsky, G.-L. Potestà, M. Kaup, and K.-V. Selge, *Fonti per la storia dell’Italia medievale, Antiquitates*, 40 (Rome, 2014).



the Lord's prayer.<sup>24</sup> The most important recent development has been the international conference held in Vercelli in October 2017, entitled 'Ordinare il mondo. Diagrammi e simboli nelle pergamene di Vercelli'. This conference addressed the themes of the Rotoli figurati manuscripts for the first time, and brought together twenty speakers (including myself). This conference was contributed to by the Arcidiocesi di Vercelli and an APICES J. M. M. Hermans Grant, in collaboration with the Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore (Milan) and the research project 'Crisi dell'eurocentrismo e futuro dell'umanesimo europeo'. The proceedings for this conference are forthcoming as *Ordinare il mondo. Diagrammi e simboli nelle pergamene di Vercelli*.<sup>25</sup> I contributed to this volume: 'The Ecclesia diagram and late twelfth-century Vercelli: Church and Apocalypse'.<sup>26</sup> This article is based on ideas which are treated fully in chapter five of this study. The contributions to *Ordinare il mondo* include work on the dating and paleography of the Rotoli figurati by Mirella Ferrari. Professor Ferrari was kind enough to share her article with me prior to publication, and I have incorporated her convincing assessment of the manuscript's dating, and in particular, her expertise in the analysis of different hands at work across the group, into my descriptions of the manuscripts in chapter one.<sup>27</sup> The forthcoming volume will be a significant development in bringing the Rotoli figurati to a wider audience. This thesis is broadly in agreement with Ferrari's paleographical assessment of the Rotoli figurati which dates the manuscripts to the third quarter of the thirteenth century.

---

<sup>24</sup> M. Rainini, 'Symbolic Representations and Diagrams of the Lord's Prayer in the Twelfth Century', in *Le Pater noster au XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle: lectures et usages*, ed. F. Siri (Turnhout, 2015), pp. 157–86.

<sup>25</sup> M. Rainini and T. Leonardi, eds., *Ordinare il mondo: Diagrammi e simboli nelle pergamene di Vercelli* (Milan, 2018).

<sup>26</sup> J. Shurville, 'The Ecclesia diagram and late twelfth-century Vercelli: Church and Apocalypse', *Ordinare il mondo*, pp. 183–209.

<sup>27</sup> M. Ferrari, 'I Rotoli figurati di Vercelli: aspetti bibliologici e paleografici', *Ordinare il mondo*, pp. 125–143.

## *Current Scholarship on Diagrams*

Moving on from the initial descriptions of the Rotoli figurati manuscripts which form the fundamental basis for this study, the broader questions I address are informed by the manuscripts' form and their wider significance to medieval visual culture. Each manuscript has its own distinctive visual quality, representing matters which concern the Church. Most of these manuscripts, Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*), 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*), 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), 4 (*Ecclesia*), 6 (*Mappamondo*), and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore) contain figures which can usefully be described as diagrams. Diagrams as a form of visual thinking and way of interpreting complex ideas have a history reaching back to antiquity, emerging in didactic contexts and established in the middle ages through the Carolingian schools.<sup>28</sup> They are schematic representations which can range from the simple to the complex, but generally rely on a fundamental geometric structure, pattern, or shape.<sup>29</sup> Within these images, it is often the case that each element—whether that is a line, a colour, a picture, a rubric, or short passages of text—gains special meaning through its positioning and arrangement in relation to other elements.<sup>30</sup> In more complex diagrams, these elements can be increasingly figurative or symbolic, drawing elements from iconography and pictorial art forms, as can the governing, or dominant, shape. In contrast to narrative art which focuses on human actions in time and space, as Jeffrey Hamburger has observed, diagrams lend themselves to representations of greater eternal and cosmic truths.<sup>31</sup> Indeed, Hamburger considers the diagrammatic mode as 'one of the most important defining features of the

---

<sup>28</sup> H. Bober, 'An Illustrated Medieval School-Book of Bede's *De Natura Rerum*', *The Journal of the Walters Art Gallery*, 19/20 (1956), pp. 64–97.

<sup>29</sup> A full discussion of broader scholarship on the diagrammatic mode, and how this study is orientated within that scholarship, is offered in the introduction to chapter three.

<sup>30</sup> My definition of 'diagram' and the 'diagrammatic mode' follows the important work by Bogen and Thürlemann. This differs from the modern understanding of a diagram, which is generally to simplify an idea and make it more easily understandable. Rather, diagrams are a tool for understanding and interpreting complex ideas: Bogen and Thürlemann, 'Jenseits der Opposition von Text und Bild', pp. 1–22.

<sup>31</sup> I have drawn from Hamburger's excellent summary in: J. F. Hamburger, 'Haec Figura Demonstrat: Diagrams in an Early-Thirteenth Century Copy of Lothar de Segni's *De Missarum Mysteriis*', *History of Art and Architecture*, 58 (2009), 7–9.

religious art of the Middle Ages'.<sup>32</sup> Moreover, the diagrammatic mode underwent a particular flourishing from the mid-twelfth to the thirteenth century in advanced centres of learning in monastic and, later, university settings.<sup>33</sup> It is this context which is immediately relevant to the diagrammatic content of some of the *Rotoli figurati*. In representations of theological truths, diagrams and complex images generate and exemplify patterns of thought.

Through examining the work of Richard of Saint Victor (d. 1173), Madeline Caviness argued that certain perceptions of reality and methods of thinking coalesce in the distinctive order of the diagrammatic mode.<sup>34</sup> In Richard's commentary on the Apocalypse of St. John, he describes a four-fold system of vision, which as Caviness observes, was analogous to the twelfth-century currency of four levels of scriptural exegesis. This system was not unique to Richard or to Victorine intellectual concerns, but as a distinct framework used in different media across visual culture, it became common in the twelfth century. Caviness acknowledges that these modes of seeing were not clearly defined, and that complex works of art, like complex passages of scripture, could be interpreted at all four levels. However, in Richard's commentary on the visions of St. John, he identifies the apocalyptic revelation as the third mode of seeing, internal and spiritual, but using corporeal forms to access the spiritual; discovering the 'truth of hidden things ... by means of forms and figures and the similitudes of things'.<sup>35</sup> This is the level of the symbol, the collection of visible forms which demonstrates the invisible, which stops short before the fourth level of anagogy, where the mind is elevated and may approach supernatural contemplation.<sup>36</sup> It is the third mode of seeing which is commonly located in the diagrammatic mode. The

---

<sup>32</sup> Hamburger understands the diagrammatic mode as a 'constant through the High Middle Ages'. Hamburger, '*Haec Figura Demonstrat*', at p. 7.

<sup>33</sup> J.-C. Schmitt, 'Les images classificatrices', *Bibliothèque de l'École des chartes*, 147/1 (1989), at p. 312.

<sup>34</sup> Richard was a canon regular at Saint Victor in Paris, teaching there from c. 1160. His account of *visio* is discussed more fully in chapter three.

<sup>35</sup> Translated by Caviness from Richard of Saint Victor, *In apocalypsim Joannis Libri Septem*, ed. J.-P. Migne, PL, 196: 638–888, cols. 686, 687–88. M. H. Caviness, 'Images of Divine Order and the Third Mode of Seeing', *Gesta*, 22/2 (1983), at pp. 115–6.

<sup>36</sup> Translated by Caviness, from Richard of Saint Victor, *In apocalypsim Joannis*, PL, 196, col. 687. 'Symbolum est collectio formarum visibilium ad invisibilium demonstrationem.'

fourth way of seeing —not requiring visible forms— is expressed in medieval art through the use of semi-abstracted forms; Caviness compares this to Dante’s famous description of the similitude of the Trinity in *Paradiso* XXXIII, imagery which is now frequently linked in scholarship to the influence of Joachim of Fiore’s *figurae*.<sup>37</sup> Caviness also references these forms within the structure of the figurative diagrams of the fourteenth-century cleric Opicinus de Canistris (1296–c.1352), in particular the Palatinus manuscript (figure 1).<sup>38</sup> In complex diagrams, the invisible realm of divinity is obscured by the ‘symbolic forms and figures’ of the third mode of seeing, but some evocation of the divinely ordered universe can be seen in the symmetry and structure of the diagrammatic third mode. Caviness recognises the subtle articulation of different interpretive modes of seeing in Opicinus’s fourteenth-century works. In this study, I follow Caviness’s recognition of the role of the diagrammatic mode in medieval art as articulating modes of seeing. Moreover, I contend that the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4), offers a previously unknown representation of the third and fourth modes of seeing in a complex diagrammatic form which can be placed in useful relation to the abstract figures of Joachim of Fiore and to later diagrams such as those of Opicinus. This complements arguments put forward in the recent doctoral thesis of Sarah Griffin, which has recognised the importance of some of the Rotoli figurati, alongside Joachim’s *figurae*, as potential sources of influence for Opicinus’s image-making.<sup>39</sup>

Caviness’s influential article thereby addressed the presence of multiple levels of meaning. Diagrams condense information, and it is the responsibility of the viewer to unpack that information appropriately: the potential ways of expanding the significance of a diagram rely on the ability of the audience. A viewer can choose between various levels of interpretation found within the organisation of the image. As we shall see, text found within a diagram often directly advises the reader how to approach and begin to

---

<sup>37</sup> M. Reeves and B. Hirsch-Reich, *The Figurae of Joachim of Fiore* (Oxford, 1972), pp. 317–29; M. Reeves, L. Tondelli and B. Hirsch-Reich, eds., *Il libro delle figure dell’abate Gioachino da Fiore*, 2 vols (Turin, 1953), I, pp. 221–30.

<sup>38</sup> High quality images of this manuscript are digitised and accessible online at: <[https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS\\_Pal.lat.1993](https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Pal.lat.1993)>.

<sup>39</sup> S. Griffin, ‘Diagram and Dimension: Visualising Time in the Drawings of Opicinus de Canistris (1296–c. 1352)’ (unpublished DPhil thesis, University of Oxford, 2018), pp. 233–5.

interpret the diagram.<sup>40</sup> It has been long observed how diagrams rely on an underlying perception of order, and that order functions only in opposition to disorder.<sup>41</sup> This introduces an innate polemical dimension to medieval diagrams which aim to represent an ordered vision of reality, which means for the scholar that the full comprehension of complex diagrams can only be obtained by examining them in their historical context. In this study, the Rotoli figurati will be considered in what will be argued was their historical context of Vercelli, in the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries. Furthermore, the Rotoli figurati are compared to other visual and diagrammatic sources to demonstrate their significance within the broader study of medieval visual culture.

Within the historiography of medieval diagrams, Mary Carruthers' *Book of Memory* has been a defining and influential work.<sup>42</sup> Her study focuses on diagrams as means to shape memory: the pedagogical, the contemplative, and the creative functions of diagrams. Carruthers' work understood many diagrams as a reflection of cognitive models or techniques, and focused especially on diagrams as mnemonic and pedagogical devices for the study of scripture, history, and theological doctrine in the middle ages. For Carruthers, the spatial arrangement of elements and the repeated use of certain visual metaphors were designed as a system for the memorisation of texts and ideas, which were 'placed' at ordered points within a structure. The familiarity of the symbolic structure was fundamental to the ease with which it could be used as a mental image for memorisation and a tool for future composition. Diagrams which included architectural aspects were in her view commonly used for this purpose, and increased complexity in diagrams demonstrated advanced use of these cognitive modes. However, in this respect Karl Kinsella has recently argued that architectural representation in textual and visual sources, particularly in twelfth-century didactic texts, had a distinctive pedagogical role which often goes beyond a mnemonic function.<sup>43</sup> One aspect of Carruthers' argument

---

<sup>40</sup> M. Rainini, 'Gli alberi di Gioacchino da Fiore fra diagramma e simbolo', in *Le monde végétal. Médecine, botanique, symbolique*, ed. A. Paravicini Bagliani (Florence, 2009), at pp. 408–14.

<sup>41</sup> M. Camille, *Image on the Edge: The Margins of Medieval Art* (Cambridge, MA, 1992).

<sup>42</sup> M. J. Carruthers, *The Book of Memory: A Study of Memory in Medieval Culture*, 2nd edn (Cambridge, 2008), pp. 208–50, and passim; 'How to Make a Composition: Memory-Craft in Antiquity and the Middle Ages', in *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates*, ed. S. Radstone and W. Schwartz (2010), pp. 15–29. Carruthers' arguments are addressed in more detail in chapter three.

<sup>43</sup> K. Kinsella, 'Richard of St Victor's Solutions to Problems of Architectural Representation in

which I respond to through this study is her assessment that complex diagrams often solely functioned on an imaginative and pedagogical level. This seems to stop short of the generative and responsive form of knowledge which I contend is present in the Rotoli figurati.

One well-known aspect of the diagrammatic mode which does not appear in the Rotoli figurati of Vercelli is that of computation. *Computus* manuscripts, containing astronomy, astrology, and calendrical and mathematical calculations —technical methods of time-reckoning— are important to the history of diagrams for their sometimes innovative techniques for the transmission of knowledge in the middle ages. Well-known early medieval *computus* manuscripts, such as that compiled by Byrhtferth of Ramsey who lived at the turn of the tenth and eleventh centuries, contain astronomical and cosmological tables and diagrams which allow for the computation of moveable feasts in the liturgical calendar in any year. A famous diagram from this collection is the *annus-mundus-homo*, found in Oxford, St John's College MS 17, a manuscript dating to 1110, at fol. 7v. This diagram demonstrates the ordered correlation between the quadripartite systems of the zodiac, the elements, the ages of man, the seasons, and the cardinal points (figure 2).<sup>44</sup> The governing structure of this diagram is non-figural; quadrilateral lozenges are demarcated within two interlocking circles, with smaller circles arrayed at the points of the lozenge. Madeline Caviness traced the influence of the harmonising geometrical structure of Byrhtferth's diagram, as an example of 'principles of order and symmetry' which can be traced throughout the middle ages, not just in computistical images.<sup>45</sup>

In scholarship on *computus* images from the thirteenth and fourteenth century, attention is often focused on the diagrams of Ramon Llull (d. 1316). Llull experienced a divine intervention which gave him a technique for bringing together his own philosophy and theology into a single whole, his 'Art'. As Anthony Bonner has stressed,

---

the Twelfth Century', *Architectural History*, 59 (2016), pp. 3–24; 'Edifice and Education: Structuring Thought in Twelfth-Century Europe' (unpublished DPhil Thesis, University of Oxford, 2015).

<sup>44</sup> A. C. Esmeijer, *Divina Quaternitas: A Preliminary Study in the Method and Application of Visual Exegesis* (Assen, 1978), pp. 30–1, and fig. 53.

<sup>45</sup> Caviness, 'Images of Divine Order', pp. 99–120.

this was not a doctrine, but a practical method.<sup>46</sup> Llull created highly technical systems which incorporated diagrams and ‘volvelles’, diagrams which incorporated overlaid disks, the meaning of which was activated by movement.<sup>47</sup> Frances Yates’s research on Llull’s sources traced the influence of the Christian philosophy of the ninth-century John Scotus Erigena’s *De divisione naturae*, transmitted through the twelfth-century diagrammatic works of Hugh and Richard of Saint Victor, and Honorius Augustodunensis’s *Clavis physicae*. Yates’s work established the theological influence of these visual ways of thinking through Llull’s works and thought into the fourteenth century.<sup>48</sup> Sarah Griffin’s recent thesis on Opicinus de Canistris has considered the influence of Llull, among others, upon the creation of Opicinus’s complex diagrams, and observed that technical diagrams like these functioned as tools —Griffin has coined the rich and useful term ‘image-instruments’— which required the advanced knowledge of a viewer for their function.<sup>49</sup> Although profoundly connected with the ordered Christian perception of the universe, the highly technical quality of early medieval cosmological diagrams is not present in the Rotoli figurati. The ‘image-instruments’ of Ramon Llull and Opicinus de Canistris are part of a broader chapter in the history of science which cannot be fully considered as part of this thesis, although comparison in this area could be a fruitful path for future scholarly enquiry. However, what is shared between these other slightly later works and the Rotoli figurati is a concern with the comprehensive representation of history and knowledge, and above all, the visualisation of time as a method of understanding the past, present, and future of the Church. In this respect, this study engages directly with Sarah Griffin’s work on Opicinus’s distinct perception of time and history in the fourteenth-century context of the Avignon papacy; indeed, this study in some respects ends where Griffin’s thesis begins.

---

<sup>46</sup> A. Bonner, *The Art and Logic of Ramon Llull: A User’s Guide* (Leiden, 2007), at p. 3.

<sup>47</sup> Llull’s diagrammatic works were predominantly produced in the last quarter of the 13<sup>th</sup> century, Frances Yates’s important assessment of the dynamism in his ‘Art’, argues that his devices were innovative in how they physically represented the movement in the mind created through using his visual tools. F. A. Yates, *The Art of Memory* (London, 1966), p. 177.

<sup>48</sup> F. A. Yates, ‘The Art of Ramon Lull: An Approach to It through Lull’s Theory of the Elements’, *JWCI*, 17/1/2 (1954), pp. 115–73; ead., *The Art of Memory*, p. ix.

<sup>49</sup> Griffin, ‘Diagram and Dimension’, pp. 16–7, and passim.

In recent years, studies in art history and medieval visual culture have considered the use of complex images and diagrams as important methods of visual thinking. In the area of theology, an important collection is that edited by Jeffrey Hamburger and Anne-Marie Bouché, *The Mind's Eye*.<sup>50</sup> The contention of the editors that medieval art should be considered a visual language for communicating theology is fundamental to the present study. At the beginning of chapter three, I evaluate existing scholarship on diagrams, orientating this study within a broader framework and elucidating what is meant by describing an image as a diagram. Driven by the essential work by Frances Yates and later by Mary Carruthers on the arts of memory, and the function of images in memorisation and pedagogy, recent collections have worked on the role of images in medieval thought. and particularly the importance of diagrams in medieval theology.<sup>51</sup> Building on the early work of Anna C. Esmeijer, and the coining of the term 'visual exegesis' in relation to the theology of the twelfth century in particular, academics have broadened their understanding of the centrality of images to systems of thought which had previously been limited to text.<sup>52</sup> Studies in medieval monumental art, in particular the vast and complex fresco cycles at Anagni and the recently discovered fresco cycle at Santi Quattro Coronati in Rome, have established how visual culture and works of art in the thirteenth century could function as innovative heuristic tools, responding to the concerns of their historical context, to accommodate new kinds of knowledge within existing models crossing different mediums.<sup>53</sup>

Diagrams and other complex images are often considered under the cultural heading of 'encyclopedism', which is widely observed in the summary compilations of knowledge of the twelfth and thirteenth century, the *imago* and *speculum*.<sup>54</sup> The

---

<sup>50</sup> J.F. Hamburger and A. M. Bouché, eds., *The Mind's Eye: Art and Theological Argument in the Middle Ages* (Princeton, N.J., 2006).

<sup>51</sup> Yates, *The Art of Memory*; Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*.

<sup>52</sup> Esmeijer, *Divina Quaternitas*, p. ix.

<sup>53</sup> See L. Cappelletti, *Gli affreschi della cripta anagnina, iconologia* (Rome, 2002); G. Giammaria, ed., *Un universo di simboli: gli affreschi della cripta nella cattedrale di Anagni* (Rome, 2001); M. Q. Smith, 'Anagni: An Example of Medieval Typological Decoration', *Papers of the British School at Rome*, 33 (1965), pp. 1–47; M. B. Hauknes, 'The Image of the World in Thirteenth-Century Rome' (unpublished Ph.D., Princeton University, 2014); M. B. Hauknes, 'The Painting of Knowledge in Thirteenth-Century Rome', *Gesta*, 55/1 (2016), pp. 19–47.

<sup>54</sup> L. F. Sandler, 'Enciclopedia', *Enciclopedia dell'arte medievale*, v (Rome, 1995), pp. 799–810.



terminology used for these knowledge summaries reflects their spiritual objective, to hold a mirror to, or create an image of, God's creation. This objective was necessarily incomplete, deliberately recalling the metaphor of St. Paul: 'Now we see only puzzling reflections in a mirror, but then we shall see face to face. My knowledge now is partial; then it will be whole, like God's knowledge of me'.<sup>55</sup> It is also a visual metaphor, and the forms this 'encyclopedism' takes are most commonly visual. The reasoning behind this surge in the desire to gather and systemise universal knowledge in the middle ages has often been associated with cultural anxieties, and sometimes with eschatological fears.<sup>56</sup> Marcia Kupfer's work on medieval *mappae mundi* has offered a further consideration of the gathering and ordering of knowledge. Her examination of the function of different forms of medieval maps (from monumental church decoration to manuscript illustrations) demonstrated how these complex images were both instruments of learning and articulations of power, and highlighted their multivalent function, and complicated representations of time. Kupfer's approach foregrounds the importance of 'interpretative frames', which is taken forward in this study as a valuable approach to the Rotoli figurati individually and as a coherent group.<sup>57</sup>

Further research has demonstrated how complicated medieval visual representations of knowledge were used and transformed in the later middle ages, and remain relevant to our understanding of forms of visual thinking in the Renaissance and the early modern periods. Susanna Berger's recent work on philosophical visual thinking in the early modern era has, for example, examined how the famous frontispiece of Hobbes's *Leviathan* makes a deliberate and rhetorical invocation of medieval visual systems of representation in its configuration of state authority.<sup>58</sup> Lina

---

<sup>55</sup> 1 Cor. 13: 12. See H. L. Kessler, 'Speculum', *Speculum*, 86 (2011), pp. 1–41.

<sup>56</sup> F. Saxl, 'A Spiritual Encyclopaedia of the Later Middle Ages', *JWCI*, 5 (1942), 82–142; J. Le Goff, 'Pourquoi le XIII<sup>e</sup> siècle a-t-il été plus particulièrement un siècle d'encyclopédisme?', in *L'encyclopedismo medievale*, ed. M. Picone (Ravenna, 1994), pp. 23–40.

<sup>57</sup> M. Kupfer, 'Medieval World Maps: Embedded Images, Interpretive Frames', *Word & Image*, 10/3 (1994), pp. 262–88; ead. 'Mappaemundi: Image, Artefact, Social Practice', in *The Hereford World Map: Medieval World Maps and Their Context*, ed. P. D. A. Harvey (London, 2006), 253–67.

<sup>58</sup> S. Berger, *The Art of Philosophy: Visual Thinking in Europe from the Late Renaissance to the Early Enlightenment* (Princeton, 2017).

Bolzoni's *Web of Images* offered an important invitation to reconsider how visual schema were reused across centuries in diverse contexts, in forms such as manuscripts, sculpture, wall painting, stained glass, and monumental art. She writes that 'the relationship that is established between texts and visual schemas is remarkably open; it is not generally one of correspondence or mirroring but rather of diffraction, combination or multiplication, a kind of spiral relationship capable of generating new combinations'.<sup>59</sup> This is a convincing approach for understanding the sometimes confusing dissemination of medieval diagrams, and to check how we prioritise images with accompanying texts, or images circulating independently. Bolzoni's examination of how images took on different functions in different contexts drew connections from the eleventh and twelfth centuries to complex allegories of the fourteenth and fifteenth, and forward again to composite texts of memory, spiritual meditation and preaching found in sixteenth-century works such as Ignatius of Loyola's *Spiritual Exercises* (1522–24), and Matteo Ricci's *Occidental Method of Memory* (*Xiguo Jifa*) (1596).<sup>60</sup> Studies like this have demonstrated how analysing the use of complex medieval images within their historical context does not limit their importance to that context. Instead, these studies have illuminated how the radical and innovative developments in image use in the transmission and generation of knowledge of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries had a long influence stretching well into the early modern period.

Such approaches to medieval visual culture have allowed a complete transformation of the understanding of figural works which may have previously been considered esoteric. I refer here to the historiography on Joachim of Fiore. Following the publication of Gian Luca Potestà's *Il tempo dell'Apocalisse* in 2004, scholars have reappraised the dating and developmental stages of Joachim's work, and the centrality of the abbot's use of diagrammatic images (*figurae*).<sup>61</sup> In 2006, Marco Rainini's *Disegni dei tempi* contextualised Joachim's complex figures—in this work focusing on the *Liber*

---

<sup>59</sup> L. Bolzoni, *The Web of Images: Vernacular Preaching from Its Origins to Saint Bernardino of Siena* (Aldershot, 2004), pp. 7–9.

<sup>60</sup> Bolzoni, *The Web of Images*, Ch. 1.

<sup>61</sup> Mathias Riedl's edited volume is an important starting point for recent scholarship on Joachim. See M. Riedl, ed., *A Companion to Joachim of Fiore* (Leiden, 2017); G.-L. Potestà, *Il tempo dell'Apocalisse: vita di Gioacchino da Fiore* (Rome, 2004).

*figurarum*—within broader twelfth-century developments in visual exegesis, identified by Rainini as figurative theology.<sup>62</sup> Rainini has demonstrated that Joachim probably drew influence from contemporary theological sources, such as Hugh of Saint Victor. Although Joachim's figures are often extraordinarily complex, and might appear esoteric, they are the product of an intellectual engaging with authoritative works, along with contemporary textual and visual resources. Recent research by Matthias Riedl and Alexander Patschovsky has vindicated Joachim's significance as a political thinker, building on the abbot's close contact with the papal curia and with secular leaders. Riedl's work has demonstrated that the strands of Joachim's thought which foresaw the restitution of the Church to its former dignity—a divinely instituted structural transformation which would bring about a purified, monastic Church—participates directly in late twelfth-century ideological conflict between concepts of sacral kingship and the Gregorian ideal of papal hierarchy. As Riedl has highlighted, the relevance of Joachim's thought, and thirteenth-century interpretations of it, lies in the manner in which it addresses the question, 'Who is true vicar of Christ on Earth?'<sup>63</sup> Through examining the works of figurative theology in the Rotoli figurati, I have cause to return frequently to the groundwork established by Rainini and Riedl. This thesis will show how in the collection of the Rotoli figurati, we have evidence of the significance of Joachim's figurative theology to intellectual centres with close links to papal ideology. I also show how scholars active in the late twelfth century used the diagrammatic form to compose meaningful images from multiple visual sources. Building on Rainini's examination of Hugh of Saint Victor's influence on Joachim, this thesis further argues that the *Ecclesia* diagram is a composite image which functions in the same visual language as Hugh's diagrammatic *De arca Noe*, the description of which was circulated as a text, *Libellus de formatione arche*, c. 1125–30.<sup>64</sup> The nature of the

---

<sup>62</sup> M. Rainini, *Disegni dei tempi: il Liber figurarum e la teologia figurativa di Gioacchino da Fiore* (Rome, 2006).

<sup>63</sup> M. Riedl, 'Joachim of Fiore as Political Thinker', in *Joachim of Fiore and the Influence of Inspiration: Essays in Memory of Marjorie E. Reeves (1905–2003)*, ed. J. E. Wannenmacher (Farnham, 2013), pp. 53–74. See also W. Ullmann, *The Growth of Papal Government in the Middle Ages*, 3rd ed. (London, 1970), p. 264.

<sup>64</sup> Hugh of Saint Victor, *Libellus de formatione arche*, ed. by P. Sicard, CCSL, 176 A (Turnhout, 2001).

*Ecclesia* diagram may be an example of how this fantastically complex diagram, recently reconstructed by Conrad Rudolph, was more commonly known as a visual resource by late-twelfth-century scholars.<sup>65</sup> This study further suggests that the *Ecclesia* diagram demonstrates a contemporary link between the figurative theology of Hugh of Saint Victor and Joachim of Fiore, furthering the contention put forward by Rainini.

This thesis also argues that the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4) provides an earlier point of comparison for certain of the complex cosmological diagrams of the Pavian cleric Opicinus de Canistris.<sup>66</sup> The doctoral thesis of Sarah Griffin has for the first time demonstrated, through an in-depth contextual study, that Opicinus's complicated schematic diagrams are a reflection of the innovative use of diagrams in the environment of the papal court at Avignon, and therefore a product of the intellectual programme established under John XXII's pontificate to 're-examine the place of the Roman Church in the cosmos'.<sup>67</sup> This recent work on Opicinus has demonstrated more broadly how the history of technology — new ideas about the representation of time and space in the first half of the fourteenth century — generated innovation in image-making and in the function of diagrams in medieval visual culture. Moreover, Griffin's identification of certain works at the papal court at Avignon, where Opicinus was active, confirms the influence of both Joachim of Fiore and Hugh of Saint Victor, and identifies similarities between the composition of Opicinus's diagrams and the Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*) and 4 (*Ecclesia*). It is the contention of this thesis that the Rotoli figurati represent a similar ecclesiastical concern with ordering and visualising history, society, and universal knowledge, an intellectual programme which was under the direct influence of papal prerogative. In this sense, the thesis hopes to contribute to an ultimately more inclusive examination of the significance of these

---

<sup>65</sup> C. Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark: Hugh of Saint Victor, Art, and Thought in the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge, 2014)

<sup>66</sup> The important recent studies on Opicinus de Canistris which have moved away from this approach are: K. Whittington, *Body-Worlds: Opicinus de Canistris and the Medieval Cartographic Imagination* (Toronto, 2014); C. Harding, 'Opening to God: The Cosmographical Diagrams of Opicinus de Canistris', *Zeitschrift für Kunstgeschichte*, 61 (1998), pp. 18–39, and V. Morse, 'A Complex Terrain: Church, Society, and the Individual in the Works of Opicino de Canistris (1296–ca.1354)' (unpublished Ph.D thesis, University of California, Berkeley, 1996).

<sup>67</sup> Griffin, 'Diagram and Dimension', pp. 229–51.

kinds of all-encompassing images to the generation of authoritative bodies of knowledge —established and contemporary— for the medieval Church.

### *Chronological context*

The intellectual context in which this thesis considers the Rotoli figurati is, narrowly, that of the institutions and centres of learning active in the city of Vercelli in the late twelfth century, to the material evidence for their continued reception in the first decade of the fourteenth century. In the late twelfth century, this study presents the chapter of S. Eusebio as an exceptionally advanced centre for theological learning and intellectual activity in Vercelli. In the first half of the thirteenth century, the foundation of the abbey of S. Andrea saw canons from Saint Victor in Paris established in the city from 1219. From as early as 1230 mendicant communities were present in the city, and the schools of the Order of Preachers developed an integral role in teaching in Vercelli. In 1228, a *studium generale* was ratified in agreement with the commune, and witnessed by canons of the cathedral of S. Eusebio. This transfer of a *universitas scholarium* from Padua brought hundreds of students to the city, who also participated within the other centres of learning active in the city. This flourishing cultural activity continued through the thirteenth century, and is documented well into the fourteenth.<sup>68</sup> Paulo Rosso's important account of Vercelli's intellectual history in this period synthesises a wealth of existing scholarship and documentary evidence from the city. Rosso's study presents the centres of learning in Vercelli in this period highlighting their revolution around the chapter of S. Eusebio, and moreover the flexibility and exchange —of people and knowledge— between these different ecclesiastical and civic centres. Furthermore, his history of the *studium generale* shows how its institutional dynamics were affected by the confrontation between various kinds of political authority, between diocese and commune, and on a grander level between pope and emperor.<sup>69</sup> Rosso's nuanced approach to the cultural and intellectual history of Vercelli underlies the historicised account of the Rotoli figurati offered here.

---

<sup>68</sup> P. Rosso, *Studio e poteri: Università, istituzioni e cultura a Vercelli fra 13. e 14. secolo* (Turin, 2010).

<sup>69</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 17–39, 179–85, 185–89.

A parallel strand of change relevant to the contextual interpretation of the Rotoli figurati in the period from around 1150 to 1307 is the development of secular educational institutions, the early universities, of which the Vercelli *studium generale*, as we shall see, is an important example.<sup>70</sup> Stephen Jaeger has demonstrated how educational methods in the twelfth century underwent a transformation, moving towards the more extensive use of texts.<sup>71</sup> This in turn encouraged the creation of new kinds of pedagogical works, examples of which we find in the Rotoli figurati. Patrice Sicard has suggested that diagrams could be conceived of as playing a role comparable to that of the charismatic teacher in cathedral schools.<sup>72</sup>

The significant changes to the structure of Vercelli in this period were witnesses to broader changes occurring across western Europe, rooted in what has been called the ‘twelfth-century renaissance’ or the ‘long twelfth century’, a period of sweeping change and reform in western Church and society from the great reformer Pope Gregory VII in the last quarter of the eleventh century to the end of the pontificate of Innocent III in the early thirteenth.<sup>73</sup> The papacy in this period developed into a powerful political institution, establishing its leadership and authority in lengthy conflict and negotiation with the dominant secular power of the German emperors. The efforts of the reform papacy to extend and consolidate its jurisdiction, and to articulate its power, extended into military campaigns for conquest and colonisation in Muslim territories in Sicily, Spain, and the Holy Land: what Bernard McGinn has called the papacy’s ‘foreign

---

<sup>70</sup> For the history of universities, see A. B. Cobban, *Universities in the Middle Ages* (Liverpool, 1990); G. Leff, *Paris and Oxford Universities in the Thirteenth and Fourteenth Centuries: An Institutional and Intellectual History* (London, 1968); P. Kibre, *Scholarly Privileges in the Middle Ages: The Rights, Privileges and Immunities of Scholars and Universities at Bologna, Padua, Paris, and Oxford* (London, 1961); O. Pedersen, *The First Universities: Studium Generale and the Origins of University Education in Europe* (Cambridge, 1997).

<sup>71</sup> C. S. Jaeger, *The Envy of Angels: Cathedral Schools and Social Ideals in Medieval Europe, 950–1200* (Philadelphia, 1994).

<sup>72</sup> P. Sicard, *Diagrammes médiévaux et exégèse visuelle: le Libellus de formatione arche de Hugues de Saint-Victor* (Paris, 1993), pp. 100–2.

<sup>73</sup> The description originates with Charles Homer Haskins in: C. H. Haskins, *The Renaissance of the Twelfth Century* (London, 1927). See also R. L. Benson, G. Constable and C. D. Lanham, eds., *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century* (Oxford, 1999). In that volume, see G. B. Ladner, ‘Terms and Ideas of Renewal’, pp. 1–36.

policy'.<sup>74</sup> In the Italian peninsula, the papacy negotiated networks of support across different factions and powers through its cities and regions, the pope himself being frequently ousted from Rome. The institutional reform of the papacy occurred in the systematisation of canon law and ecclesiastical jurisdiction, and in attempts to intellectualise the role of the Roman Church as the supreme judge for Christendom. Works of ecclesiology increase in the twelfth century, which can be seen as a reflection of attempts to formally lay down authoritative conceptions of the Church as a spiritual institution, another aspect of these broader attempts to instil order in society.<sup>75</sup>

These broader developments were matched by social and cultural changes particularly in the realm of religious structures and practice. Reform is seen in the revival of monastic institutions and in the success of the Cistercian order, and in the parallel resurgence of canonical communities.<sup>76</sup> Further ideals of spiritual practice were seen in the *vita apostolica*, a model way of life which embraced poverty and mendicant preaching: ideals which reached their apogee in the thirteenth century in the Franciscan and Dominican orders. The popularity of the *vita apostolica* as an ideal for religious life was also linked to accusations of heresy in the period. Religious practices outside institutional boundaries identified corruption in the hierarchy and practice of the clergy, and criticised the accrued wealth of monasteries and other religious institutions. Above all, this was a period in which the papacy was concerned to articulate its authority, born from — but not always reflecting the same conceptions as — Pope Gregory VII's radical reframing of papal monarchy as a superior power by virtue of its divine foundation. The tension between Gelasian dualism, a navigation of balance in governance and authority

---

<sup>74</sup> Bernard McGinn's examination of Joachim of Fiore's influence in relation to the reform and change in this period has been influential on my approach. For a useful summary of McGinn's thought, see B. McGinn, 'Joachim of Fiore and the Twelfth-Century Papacy', in *Joachim of Fiore and the Influence of Inspiration: Essays in Memory of Marjorie E. Reeves (1905–2003)*, ed. J. E. Wannenmacher (Farnham, 2013), pp. 15–34.

<sup>75</sup> The influential evaluations of twelfth-century theology by Marie-Dominique Chenu, O. P., are collected in M.-D. Chenu, *Nature, Man and Society in the Twelfth Century: Essays on New Theological Perspectives in the Latin West*, ed. J. Taylor (London, 1997). See also G. Leff, 'The Making of the Myth of a True Church in the Later Middle Ages', *Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies*, 1 (1971), pp. 1–25; S. H. Hendrix, 'In Quest of the *Vera Ecclesia*: The Crises of Late Medieval Ecclesiology', *Viator*, 7 (1976), pp. 347–78.

<sup>76</sup> Benson, Constable and Lanham, *Renaissance and Renewal*.

between the two powers, and the Gregorian conception of papal supremacy, continued throughout the period, articulated in different forms in the various ecclesiological works produced at this time.<sup>77</sup>

This thesis argues that the contents of the Rotoli figurati reflect the concerns of the late-twelfth-century church, and their survival allows us insight into the intellectual interests of an important urban intellectual centre through to the early fourteenth century. Any perception of the twelfth century as a period of ‘renaissance’ must be critically tempered by a more nuanced understanding that authoritative attempts to conceptualise and insist on ideals of order existed in tension with reality.<sup>78</sup> Caroline Walker Bynum’s analysis of the emergence in the twelfth century of new vocabularies for examining individual spiritual interiority showed how this was directly related to the increase in ‘model’ ways of life like the *vita apostolica*. Religious writings which articulated and defined ideal models, ideal hierarchies, and particular groups within the Church encouraged individuals to choose, define and measure themselves against those patterns and within those broader frameworks.<sup>79</sup> As we shall see, this theme of balance between interior self and broader social exterior recurs in the Rotoli figurati. John D. Cotts offers an evaluation of the ‘cultural energy’ of the long twelfth century as best understood through a climate of anxiety, a product of constantly ‘shifting political, cultural, spiritual, and economic realities’.<sup>80</sup> These evocations of the period inform not only the approach of this thesis to the historicised interpretation of the Rotoli figurati, but to the consideration of the tensions revealed by the constructions and representation of order found in their visual content.

---

<sup>77</sup> B. Tierney, *Origins of Papal Infallibility, 1150–1350: A Study on the Concepts of Infallibility, Sovereignty and Tradition in the Middle Ages* (Leiden, 1988); Ullmann, *The Growth of Papal Government*; J. A. Watt, ‘The Theory of Papal Monarchy in the Thirteenth Century: The Contribution of the Canonists’, *Traditio*, 20 (1964), pp. 179–317; J. B. Russell, *Dissent and Order in the Middle Ages: The Search for Legitimate Authority* (Oxford, 1992).

<sup>78</sup> R. I. Moore, *The Formation of a Persecuting Society: Authority and Deviance in Western Europe, 950–1250*, 2nd ed. (Oxford, 1987).

<sup>79</sup> Initially in: C. Walker Bynum, ‘Did the Twelfth Century Discover the Individual?’, *JEH*, 31/1 (1980), pp. 1–17. See further *The Resurrection of the Body in Western Christianity, 200–1336* (New York, 1995), pp. 115–99.

<sup>80</sup> J. D. Cotts, *Europe’s Long Twelfth Century: Order, Anxiety and Adaptation, 1095–1229* (Basingstoke, 2012).



## *The shape of the thesis*

The first chapter begins with an introduction detailing the archival history of the documents, their physical format, and arguments for their dating and provenance. In each case, other known versions will be recognised, and where available, other known scholarship. In the first chapter, I argue that the manuscripts were copied in the third quarter of the thirteenth century, but that there is plausible evidence for versions of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore) having been in Vercelli in the late twelfth century. The paleographic and stylistic features of the manuscripts suggest a northern Italian provenance, while their format and relatively good condition argues that they have not been moved far from their place of production. I conclude that an ecclesiastical centre in Vercelli is the most plausible site for the copying of the Rotoli figurati.

In the second chapter, I explore the centre of religious life in Vercelli in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries: the cathedral chapter of S. Eusebio. In examining the historical cultural prestige of Vercelli, and the important network of intellectual and religious communities active in the city in this period, I consider how this may have affected Vercelli's role in the broader concerns of northern Italy, particularly regarding the Investiture Contest. My argument in chapter two also considers the prominent figures who drove intellectual life in the city in the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries, and notes the important political role Vercelli played in relationships with secular rulers—in particular, the Hohenstaufen emperors—and the papacy.

Building on this contextual understanding, my study then returns to engage with the Rotoli figurati. As we have seen, the common use of diagrams in these large format manuscripts is a rare survival, and understanding the detail of the manuscripts, and their function and use in the cathedral chapter of S. Eusebio, requires a sustained focus on their visual nature. Chapter three addresses the visual nature of the Rotoli figurati within the broader environment of twelfth- and thirteenth-century visual culture. In the introduction to this chapter I argue that the visual organisation of several of the Rotoli figurati operates within the diagrammatic mode. The chapter engages with modern scholarship on medieval vision, and with the function of what I call 'diagrams' in medieval contexts, and it contextualises the manuscript group within

known visual traditions. In doing so, I identify themes and concerns for further analysis. Rotoli figurati 4 and 7 (*Ecclesia*, and Gioacchino da Fiore) contain specific and striking references to themes of church authority and eschatology, drawing from and transforming the historical theology of the Calabrian abbot Joachim of Fiore. These were not traditional or uncontroversial themes, and they are examined in more detail in chapter four.

Chapters one and three establish that in Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) we find a unique document, known partially only through one other manuscript version. It is also a dense and rich image, containing many intricate details and components. Therefore, in chapter four I unpack the *Ecclesia* diagram as a case study, using the historical and art-historical contextual knowledge laid out in the previous chapters. Following the governing shape and metaphor of the body, I recognise a synthesis of multiple ecclesiological themes in this image, which are found in the figurative theology of the late twelfth century. These themes, ecclesiology and eschatology, were of concern to the late twelfth-century papacy as it asserted its authority as supreme spiritual power. This concern returns my study, in chapter five, to Vercelli, and its strong strategic relationships with the papacy in this period. The historical theology of Joachim of Fiore, as found in his early works testimonied in Rotoli figurati 7, offered a novel theology which placed the papacy at the heart of the imminent events of the end times. Chapter five offers an interpretation of the Rotoli figurati in this politicised context in Vercelli towards the end of the thirteenth century, and explores the significant connections between Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore).

In chapter six, I look forward to the period in which the Rotoli figurati were copied in the third quarter of the thirteenth century, through the focal point of a note left on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7 and dated to 1307. This note records the changing reception of these documents, a changing reception which is significant, not only because of the fluctuating reputation of Joachim of Fiore amid the broad and tumultuous religious and social developments of the thirteenth century, but also because of specific connected events which occurred in the city of Vercelli. This chapter develops my argument from chapter five, by demonstrating a sustained interest in the use of complex images and in the currency of Joachim of Fiore's thought and works in an ecclesiastical — and, significantly, a non-Franciscan — context. Further, I set out the

evidence that the early fourteenth-century note refers to the events surrounding the military campaign, capture, and execution of Dolcino of Novara and the Order of the Apostles. These events took place in regions very close to Vercelli from the year 1300 and ended, horrifyingly, in the city itself in 1307. Beyond this immediate connection of the Rotoli figurati to the important and dramatic events pertaining to orthodoxy and ecclesiastical authority, I also argue that the Rotoli figurati, their creation, copying, and use in Vercelli, reflect the persistent interest of the Church in complex visual works which collated and innovatively transmitted contemporary knowledge of the world, of time and order and spiritual concerns, in visual form. My study concludes by looking forward to later examples of papal intellectual interests. Reflection on these supports my contention that the Rotoli figurati offer a previously unrecognised testimony of the use of complex images as a means for the Church to innovatively record, systematise, and transmit new developments in contemporary knowledge. As I argue the Rotoli figurati demonstrate, diagrams offered a specific visual method with the potential to be used in the exploration and conceptualisation of universal theories concerning the Church. In the Rotoli figurati, we can gain further insight into how this kind of image-making was applied to difficult and persistent theological questions that were nonetheless affected by new historical developments. Such images, we shall see, were means to meaningfully frame the spiritual lives of individuals within an ever-broadening sphere of knowledge and in turn to place new forms of knowledge within these existing structures, to envisage historical time, to imagine a unified Christian society, and to justify the Church's central role and governance as history proceeded into the time of the imminent Apocalypse. These visual forms encouraged the creation of meaningful order out of multiple or composite bodies of knowledge. Further, I will argue that diagrams like those found in the Rotoli figurati were sometimes chosen for their very flexibility, since they allow for the generation of new meaning by the precise visual arrangements of shape and line, of image and text.

# 1 The manuscript sources

The main images of the Rotoli figurati in the image volume are referred to by the figures numbering below. High quality, zoomable images of the Rotoli figurati can be viewed online at: <<https://www.dropbox.com/sh/0mxo9n1qc7q7wse/AAD-3K3BGMSvALUVcRqUFcada?dl=0>>

- I. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 1 (*Disegni geometrici*)
- II. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*)
- III. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*); line drawing.
- IV. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 3 (*Genealogia Christi*); section 1
- V. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 3 (*Genealogia Christi*); section 2
- VI. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 4 (*Ecclesia*)
- VII. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 4 (*Ecclesia*); numbered rubrics, section 1.
- VIII. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 4 (*Ecclesia*); numbered rubrics, section 2.
- IX. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*); section 1
- X. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*); section 2
- XI. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*); section 3
- XII. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 6 (*Mappamondo*)
- XIII. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore); front
- XIV. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore); dorse

## 1.1 Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 1 (*Disegni geometrici*)

This sheet contains short descriptive phrases and geometrical figures arranged horizontally in ten rows across an entire sheep or goatskin parchment measuring roughly 90 by 62 cm (figure 1). An eighteenth-century archival note on the dorse reads as follows: *Disegno della quadratura del circolo d'Alberto Duro*.<sup>1</sup> A sixteenth-century hand has added a descriptive note in the lower margins of the document which reads, in a formal bold gothic script: 'Alberti Dureri Circuli quadratura a Canonico Heredia hic descripta'. Giuseppe Ferraris identified this canon as Dionigi Heredia, with no narrower dating given beyond the sixteenth century.<sup>2</sup> This is accompanied by an extract in a cursive hand describing the method of calculating the area of a circle from a sixteenth-century Latin printed edition of Dürer's *Institutiones geometricae*.<sup>3</sup> Until very recently, no sustained scholarly work on this manuscript had been undertaken. Mirella Ferrari offers a physical and paleographical assessment of it in 'I Rotoli figurati di Vercelli: aspetti bibliologici e paleografici', and has generously shared her further research on this manuscript prior to publication.<sup>4</sup> The description of the manuscript which follows is based on my own initial research undertaken in 2011–2017, supplemented by additional material from this new research and duly indicated in the footnotes.

Dürer's *On Measurement* included a textbook on geometry, which was published shortly after his death, in 1528. It was published originally in German, but the extract from Dürer's work that is excerpted on the Vercelli manuscript is in Latin, and from a later Latin edition. The diagram which has been added by the sixteenth-century hand is a more accurate construction for calculating the area of a circle, a problem that the

---

<sup>1</sup> Albrecht Dürer.

<sup>2</sup> This inscription was recorded in the notebooks of the Vercelli chapter library archivist Giuseppe Ferraris, published as: Ferraris, *Le chiese stazionali*, at p. 232, n. 366. Ferraris wrote: '1. Rotolo di figure geometriche ... con disegno della quadratura del circolo di Albrecht Dürer, aggiunto nel secolo XVI dal canonico Dionigi Heredia'.

<sup>3</sup> Albrecht Dürer, *Institutiones geometricae*, trans. Joachim Camerarius the Elder (1500–1574) (Paris, 1532).

<sup>4</sup> M. Ferrari, 'I Rotoli figurati di Vercelli', pp. 125–43. I am grateful to Professor Ferrari for material shared in personal communication in 2018.

medieval copyist also represented in the lower half of the text field. The later note has been placed on the manuscript using extant ruling, and in the appropriate place in the sequence of diagrams.

The long edges of the parchment are more damaged than the short, indicating that it was rolled from left to right and stored in that manner for a lengthy period. Text has been lost because of the damage to the top edge. There is no physical evidence that the parchment was ever attached to a frame or nailed to a board or wall for display; indeed, it is possible to see the undamaged natural shape of the manuscript towards the lower left and lower right corners. There are eighteen horizontal rows ruled across, alternating between a narrow band for the text, which is mostly limited to titles and captions, and a wider band for over a hundred geometric figures. Most of the first two rows are lost, apart from the upper right corner. Both text and line drawings are completed in a sepia ink, and the text is written in majuscule throughout. The mixture of gothic features in the majuscule dates the document to the second half of the thirteenth century; Ferrari has observed a close relationship with the majuscule used on *Rotoli figurati 5 (Atti degli apostoli)*.<sup>5</sup> In some cases, Latin letters are added to mark angles, particularly in the second row of first and second rows of diagrams. Some of the circles have been drawn using a compass, in which case a compass point puncture is visible, while other shapes have been drawn using a ruler. Most of the figures have been drawn freehand, which means that they are very approximate. Nonetheless, the figures and rubrication are recognisably drawn from the *Elements* of Euclid (c.325–c.256 BC), Books 1 to 4.<sup>6</sup> The text identifies broader divisions from Euclid, and some figures are named.

From left to right and downwards, the text reads: *figure theorematum, diametrus, semicirculus, portio circuli maior, alia minor; incipiunt figure elementorum in quadrangulis; figure theorematum; gnomos; quadratura trianguli; figure elementorum in circulis; quadratura circuli; tropi pographi*. The first group appears to agree with the definitions of lines, surfaces, rectilinear angles, and the division of the circular plane from Book I of Euclid.

---

<sup>5</sup> See discussion and references in section 5, below.

<sup>6</sup> I am grateful to Professor Charles Burnett for his insights into this document's place in the medieval Euclidean tradition.

*Incipiunt figure elementorum in quadrangulis* represents Book 2, and *figure elementorum in circulis*, Book 3. The last are erroneous transliterations from the Greek, and refer to book IV of Euclid's *Elements*.<sup>7</sup> This mathematical treatise formed a comprehensive system of basic geometrical knowledge and was an integral part of the *quadrivium*. It has a complicated history of transmission in the middle ages. The first four of thirteen books, from the Greek original, were circulated through their inclusion as a work of Boethius. However, the Pseudo-Boethian *Geometries* were not transmitted with diagrams.<sup>8</sup> From the twelfth century, versions of the full text became accessible in medieval Europe, by means of Latin translations from Arabic versions.<sup>9</sup> In *Rotoli figurati* 1, the descriptive term for the figure demonstrating the Pythagorean theorem reads *vulcarnaim*, which Charles Burnett has suggested is a Latin transliteration of the Arabic name for this figure: *dhu al-qarnayn*. This means 'the possessor of two horns', in reference to the two squares of the figure's upper hypotenuse, which can indeed look like two horns.<sup>10</sup> The appearance of a transliteration from Arabic suggests that the copyist had access to a version of the *Elements* from the late twelfth-century tradition, compilations circulating after Adelard of Bath's Arabic-Latin translation.<sup>11</sup> Adelard's translation was crucial to the swift spread of this basic geometry text across the learned West, and the diagrams were usually integrated into the work. In the Vercelli manuscript, the captions *quadratura trianguli* and *quadratura circuli* are indications that the copyist was working from a

---

<sup>7</sup> W. M. Stevens, 'Fields and Streams: Language and Practice of Arithmetic and Geometry in Early Medieval Schools', in *Word, Image, Number: Communication in the Middle Ages*, ed. J. J. Contreni and S. Casciani (Turnhout, 2002), pp. 113–204; W. M. Stevens, 'Euclidean Geometry in the Middle Ages: A Preliminary Reassessment', in *Villard's Legacy: Studies in Medieval Technology, Science, and Art in Memory of Jean Gimpel*, ed. M.-T. Zenner (Aldershot, 2004), pp. 229–263, at p. 89.

<sup>8</sup> G. R. Evans, 'Boethius' *Geometry* and the Four Ways', *Centaurus*, 25/2 (1981), pp. 161–5, at pp. 161–2.

<sup>9</sup> A concise description of the complexities in the Arabic tradition can be found in: G. de Young, 'Diagrams in the Arabic Euclidean Tradition: A Preliminary Assessment', *Historia Mathematica*, 32/2 (2005), pp. 129–79.

<sup>10</sup> C. Burnett, 'The Translation of Illustrations and Diagrams from Arabic into Latin', in *Arab Painting: Text and Image in Illustrated Arabic Manuscripts*, ed. A. Contadini (Boston, 2007), pp. 161–76, at p. 169. This has been independently observed by M. Ferrari in 'I *Rotoli figurati* di Vercelli: aspetti bibliologici e paleografici', pp. 127–8.

<sup>11</sup> M. Clagett, 'The Medieval Latin Translations from the Arabic of the *Elements* of Euclid, with Special Emphasis on the Versions of Adelard of Bath', *Isis*, 44/1/2 (1953), pp. 16–42.

thirteenth-century redaction of the *Elements*, from versions containing elements drawn from other works. While *quadratura trianguli* loosely corresponds to proposition 14 of Book II of Euclid's *Elements*, *quadratura circuli*, or the problem of 'squaring' the circle, does not correspond to any part of Euclid's book. It is a mathematical problem that nonetheless prompted the interest of the late-fifteenth- or early sixteenth-century commentator who added Dürer's elegant solution to the medieval figures.

One of the most widely circulated thirteenth-century redactions of the *Elements* has an important local connection to the Vercelli manuscript. Campanus (c.1220–1296), a mathematician and astronomer to the papal court, came from the city of Novara, less than 25 km north-east of Vercelli. In documentary sources he is commonly referred to as *magister*, probably indicating that he taught at a university level.<sup>12</sup> Campanus's version of Euclid's elements drew upon different sources, but his style of compilation, and his own editions, contributed to his redaction coming to dominate the western manuscript tradition until the sixteenth century. It is known from 131 manuscript versions.<sup>13</sup> Ferrari has suggested that some of the figures present in the Vercelli manuscript reflect innovations found in Campanus's work, but acknowledges that these do not include some of the most distinctive changes and additions made by this thirteenth-century authority, and thus these features may have already been present in other versions of the *Elements* circulating in the period.<sup>14</sup> Given the close links between the activity of Campanus and the dating and content of the Vercelli manuscript, it may be necessary to re-examine H. L. L. Busard's assertion that a tract on the squaring of the circle, *De quadratura circuli*, previously associated with Campanus, was too 'elementary and trivial' to have been a genuine work.<sup>15</sup>

---

<sup>12</sup> G. J. Toomer and F. S. Benjamin, eds., *Campanus of Novara and Medieval Planetary Theory: Theorica Planetarum* (Madison, 1971), pp. 20–4.

<sup>13</sup> For a list of these manuscripts, see: M. Folkerts, *Euclid in Medieval Europe* (Winnepeg, WI, 1989), at pp. 38–43. The Vercelli manuscript is not included here, or in the list in H. L. L. Busard, *Campanus of Novara and Euclid's elements* (Stuttgart, 2005).

<sup>14</sup> This observation by Ferrari shared in 'I Rotoli figurati', will be explored further in a forthcoming article (M. Ferrari, personal communication, 2018).

<sup>15</sup> H. L. L. Busard, 'Campanus de Novara', in *Medieval Science, Technology, and Medicine: An Encyclopedia*, ed. S. J. Livesey, F. Wallis, and T. F. Glick (London, 2005), pp. 112–14.



It is, as far as I am aware, unique in the western European Euclidean manuscript tradition to find these figures circulating independently of the text, certainly in a large roll format. This strongly suggests that the Vercelli version was used for didactic purposes, with a teacher using the manuscript to accompany a verbal description of the figures.<sup>16</sup>

---

<sup>16</sup> I am grateful to Professor Charles Burnett for this observation on the exceptional nature of the Vercelli version. See also C. Burnett, 'The Latin and Arabic Influences on the Vocabulary Concerning Demonstrative Argument in the Versions of Euclid's *Elements* Associated with Adelard of Bath', in *Aux origines du lexique philosophique européen: l'influence de la Latinitas: actes du colloque international organisé à Rome par la F.I.D.E.M. (Academia Belgica, 23-25 mai 1996)*, ed. J. Hamesse (Louvain-la-Neuve, 1997), pp. 175–201.

## 1.2. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*)

This manuscript is the most well preserved of the group, surviving with no severe damage to the parchment (figure II). Measuring 62 by 49 cm, it is also the smallest (figures II-III). The eighteenth-century note left by an archivist on the dorse of the document records it as: *Arbor virtutum et vitiorum*. This anonymous diagram is now more commonly known as the *Septenarium pictum* (or ‘Wheel of Sevens’), but it circulated in an early printed edition under the title *Rota Dominice orationis et quatuor temporum declaratio clarissima*, and this is the title under which the text of the diagram was first edited by Ulrich Rehm in 1994.<sup>17</sup> Rehm edited the *Rota Dominice orationis* as part of a broader study of schematic representations of the Lord’s Prayer.<sup>18</sup> The diagram circulated widely through Italy, France, and England from the late twelfth through the thirteenth century, and is known from fourteen manuscript versions, in roll, single leaf, and book format. In half of the known cases of the *Rota*, it is found alongside the *Compendium historiae in Genealogia Christi* [*Genealogia Christi*] of Peter of Poitiers (c. 1130–1205).<sup>19</sup> This work is also found in the Vercelli group as Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), which is described below. The two works are also associated with Peter Comestor’s *Historia scholastica* in the earliest known manuscript of the *Rota*, now in Naples but originating in Paris, which dates from the year 1200 (figure 2).<sup>20</sup> It is

---

<sup>17</sup> The edition can be found in: U. Rehm, ed., *Dominicae orationis et quatuor temporum declaratio*, in *Bebilderte Vaterunser-Erklärungen des Mittelalters* (Baden-Baden, 1994), pp. 272–87.

<sup>18</sup> U. Rehm, *Bebilderte Vaterunser-Erklärungen des Mittelalters* (Baden-Baden, 1994), pp. 62–106.

<sup>19</sup> Rehm used the eight manuscripts of the *Rota dominice orationis* then known for the edition, and the list has now increased to fourteen, including Rotoli figurati 2: Lyon, Bibliothèque Municipale, MS 863 (multi-leaf roll, with *Genealogia Christi*); Paris, École Nationale Supérieure des Beaux-Arts, MS Maz. 71; Saint-Omer, Bibliothèque d’Agglomération de Saint-Omer, MS 193; Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale, MS VIII C 3 (multi-leaf roll, with *Genealogia Christi*); London, BL, Add. MS 60628A (multi-leaf roll, with *Genealogia Christi*); BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12; BL Royal MS 14. B. IX (multi-leaf roll, with *Genealogia Christi*); Oxford, Bodl., MS Lat. Th. C. 2; Bodl. MS Lyell 84 (single leaf); Harvard University, Houghton Library, MS Typ. 584 (single leaf); New York, Morgan Library, MS M. 628; Philadelphia, Free Library, Lewis E M 66:16a (single leaf); Philadelphia, Free Library, Lewis E 249.

<sup>20</sup> Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale, MS VIII C 3, fol. 5v–6r. This manuscript contains the *Rota dominice orationis* after Peter of Poitiers’ *Genealogia Christi*, as noted by Monroe, ‘Illustrated

generally agreed that the diagrams' frequent association with Peter of Poitiers and Peter Comestor is indicative of their circulation in the milieu of the Paris schools at the turn of the thirteenth century. Indeed, Marco Rainini has recently argued convincingly that Peter of Poitiers composed the diagram.<sup>21</sup> The *Rota* is also linked to Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) by the testimony of the only other known version of that image found in a thirteenth-century English roll manuscript (BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12, figure 3).<sup>22</sup> In this long roll, the *Ecclesia* diagram appears on the dorse, and the *Rota dominice orationis* is found on the front, along with other wheel diagrams and genealogies (although not of the Peter of Poitiers type) (figure 3). The existence within the Rotoli figurati of a version of the *Rota dominice orationis*, a *Genealogia Christi*, and another schematic summary in the form of the *Ecclesia* image, further suggests that these complex images were perceived in the thirteenth century as connected; it is evident from the testimony of the *Rota* diagrams and the *Genealogia Christi* that these connections were more widely recognised.<sup>23</sup>

The Vercelli *Rota* is composed of six concentric circles divided into seven segments, set within a rectangular frame (figure III). Labelled medallions are placed around the perimeter of the outer circle, and at the intersections of the circles and segments. Smaller medallions are linked to these with freehand lines. Partial ruling was executed for the longer passages of text in three columns above the circular diagram. All the circles and most of the smaller roundels in the diagram have been drawn with a compass, and a puncture in the parchment remains in the very centre as evidence of this. Its structure is completed in red ink, and a ruler has clearly been used to divide the segments, although some connecting lines have been drawn free hand. All the text in this manuscript is written in a dark brown ink in a single highly professional hand, composed in a neat northern Italian *textualis* script that is not found in any of the other manuscripts of the Rotuli figurati group.<sup>24</sup>

---

Genealogical Manuscripts', pp. 136–7.

<sup>21</sup> See Rainini, 'Symbolic Representations', pp. 157–86.

<sup>22</sup> L. Cleaver, 'Past, Present and Future for Thirteenth-Century Wales: Two Diagrams in British Library, Cotton Roll XIV.12', *EBLJ*, 2013, pp. 1–26.

<sup>23</sup> See further discussion of these connections in chapter three below.

<sup>24</sup> As has also been observed by M. Ferrari, 'I rotoli figurati' (forthcoming).

The structure of the diagram derives from the *De quinque septenis* of Hugh of Saint Victor (d. 1141), a derivation that gives us some sense of the practical function of the diagram.<sup>25</sup> The essay on ‘the five septets’ is part of a group of short, spiritual works often circulating together in the manuscript tradition which are concerned with tropological lessons of scripture. These texts foreground an individual contemplation, or meditation, on one’s spiritual life, as it is reflected in thoughts, intentions, and deeds.<sup>26</sup> *De quinque septenis* draws correlations between the seven vices, the seven Petitions of the Lord’s Prayer, the seven gifts of the Holy Spirit, the seven virtues, and the seven Beatitudes. The vices are treated as wounds or ailments in a patient, which are treated by God through the application of antidotes and remedies in the form of the blessings and gifts.<sup>27</sup> This medical analogy is repeated in Hugh’s major work, *De sacramentis Christianae fidei*.<sup>28</sup> On Rotoli figurati 2, the relevant passage reads:

[Est] homo egrotus, deus medicus, vitia langores, petitiones egroti plantus et postulationes, dona antidota, virtutes sanitates, beatitudines felicitatis gaudia.<sup>29</sup>

Strong affinities have also been observed between the text and the liturgical treatise *De missarum mysteriis*, written by Lothar of Segni between 1195 and 1197 (prior to becoming Pope Innocent III), although the *Rota* presents a much simplified version.<sup>30</sup> As Marco Rainini has identified, these correspondences can be found in the twelfth-

---

<sup>25</sup> Hamburger, ‘Haec Figura Demonstrat’, pp. 7–78, at p. 38.

<sup>26</sup> P. Rorem, *Hugh of Saint Victor* (Oxford, 2009), pp. 126–7.

<sup>27</sup> This passage from the *De Quinque Septenis* reads: ‘Hec ita primo loco distingue, ut intelligas ipsa vitia quasi quosdam esse anime languores siue uulnera interioris hominis; ipsum uero hominem quasi egrotum; medicum, Deum; dona sancti Spiritus, antidotum; uirtutes, sanitatem; beatitudines, felicitatis gaudium.’ Hugh of Saint Victor, *Six opuscles spirituels*, ed. R. Baron, Sources chrétiennes, 155 (Paris, 1969), pp. 100–119.

<sup>28</sup> ‘Homo igitur in peccatis iacens aegrotus est, vitia sunt vulnera, Deus medicus, dona Spiritus sancti antidota, virtutes sanitates, beatitudines gaudia, per dona enim Spiritus sancti vitia sanantur.’ Hugh of Saint Victor, ‘De sacramentis christianae fidei’, in *PL*, CLXXVI, col. 527A. For the metaphor in Hugh’s works see: F. Siri, ‘En quête d’ordre: Hugues de Saint-Victor commentateur du *Notre père*’, in *Le Pater noster au XIIIe siècle: Lectures et usages*, ed. F. Siri (Turnhout, 2015), pp. 75–92.

<sup>29</sup> Rehm, ‘*Rota dominice orationis*’, at p. 284.

<sup>30</sup> The similarity was first observed by Rehm, *Bebilderte Vaterunser-Erklärungen*, pp. 283–87. The *De missarum mysteriis* is edited by D. F. Wright, ‘A Medieval Commentary on the Mass: Particulae 2–3 and 5–6 of the *De Missarum Mysteriis* (ca.1195) of Cardinal Lothar of Segni (Innocent III)’ (unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Notre Dame, 1977).

century *Gemma animae*, by Honorius Augustodunensis, and in the diagram of the *Mysterium ecclesiae* which circulated with the *Liber figurarum* of Joachim of Fiore at the turn of the thirteenth century.<sup>31</sup> Strong similarities are also found in the mid-twelfth-century Parisian text, the *Summa de ecclesiasticis officiis* of John Beleth (1160–64).<sup>32</sup> These are the probable twelfth-century sources for the different elements of the text and diagram, which was drawn together in a scholastic environment at the turn of the thirteenth century. It belongs to a broader tradition of writing on the vices, and a visual trope of the ‘battle’ between the vices and the virtues for the individual human soul.

The text of the Vercelli *rota* is very close to others known from the genre. The rings begin on the outer circle with the vices, moving inwards through the petitions of the Lord’s Prayer, the gifts of the Holy Spirit, the virtues, and the Beatitudes. Moving anti-clockwise from *Superbia* at the top of the outermost ring, the vices are *luxuria, gula, avaritia, accidia, invidia, ira*, and *inanis gloria*. In this system, all seven chief vices are understood as the daughters of pride. Between each vice there are small circles listing the *filiae vitiorum*, the further subdivisions of each cardinal vice. Subcategories of vices were part of the tradition of medieval writing on the vices and virtues, transmitted from John Cassian and in this case in a tradition derived from Gregory the Great.<sup>33</sup> The connections between each beatitude, virtue, gift, petition of the Lord’s prayer, and a respective vice, are laid out in the table below (Table 1). The group found in the Vercelli *Rota* uses the Gregorian version in which there are seven vices, under pride, common in the thirteenth century. However, the structure of the diagram means that the particular order of vices is perhaps less relevant to comprehension of the diagram: there were multiple systems of ordering and subdividing the vices.<sup>34</sup> Further, it is

---

<sup>31</sup> For an image of the *Mysterium ecclesiae* see *Il libro delle figure dell’Abate Gioacchino da Fiore*, ed. L. Tondelli, 2 vols (Turin, 1953), II, pl. XIX.

<sup>32</sup> Rainini, ‘Symbolic Representations’, pp. 157–86; ‘Il ritmo della storia. L’interpretazione simbolica dell’anno liturgico nei diagrammi del XII secolo’, *Iconographica*, 13 (2014), pp. 27–31; Iohannes Beleth, *Summa de ecclesiasticis officiis*, ed. H. Douteil, CCCM, 41–41A (Turnhout, 1976), pp. 96–103.

<sup>33</sup> C. Straw, ‘Gregory, Cassian, and the Cardinal Vices’, in *In the Garden of Evil: The Vices and Culture in the Middle Ages*, ed. R. Newhauser (Toronto, 2005), pp. 35–58.

<sup>34</sup> A. Watson, ‘*Saligia*’, *JWCI*, 10 (1947), pp. 148–50; M. Evans, ‘An Illustrated Fragment of Peraldus’s *Summa* of Vice: Harleian MS 3244’, *JWCI*, 45 (1982), pp. 14–68, at pp. 15–16.

probable that the utility of this diagram relied on a kind of flexible use, with a reader's eye able to move around the paths created within the circle. The moral-theological content of the diagram could be used for teaching the important correlations between the five sevens. However, the derivation from Hugh of Saint Victor's tropological essay suggests that the complex visual layout is also part of its meditative function.<sup>35</sup>

Table 1: Relationships within the *Rota dominice orationis*

| Vices                | Petitions                            | Gifts              | Virtues                   | Beatitudes                     |
|----------------------|--------------------------------------|--------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------|
| <i>inanis gloria</i> | <i>libera nos a malo</i>             | <i>timor</i>       | <i>paupertas spiritus</i> | <i>regnum coelorum</i>         |
| <i>ira</i>           | <i>ne nos inducas in tentationem</i> | <i>pietas</i>      | <i>mansuetudo</i>         | <i>possessio terre</i>         |
| <i>invidia</i>       | <i>dimitte nobis debita etc</i>      | <i>scientia</i>    | <i>Luctus</i>             | <i>consolatio</i>              |
| <i>accidia</i>       | <i>panem nostrum quotidianum</i>     | <i>fortitudo</i>   | <i>esuries iustitie</i>   | <i>saturitas</i>               |
| <i>avaricia</i>      | <i>fiat voluntas tua</i>             | <i>consilium</i>   | <i>misericordia</i>       | <i>misericordie consecutio</i> |
| <i>gula</i>          | <i>adveniat regnum tuum</i>          | <i>intellectus</i> | <i>mundicia cordis</i>    | <i>visio Dei</i>               |
| <i>luxuria</i>       | <i>sanctificetur nomen tuum</i>      | <i>sapientia</i>   | <i>pax</i>                | <i>filiatio Dei</i>            |

As comparison of the table with the diagram (figure II) shows, the *Rota dominice orationis* diagram inverts the order of the Lord's Prayer if read clockwise, as well as the gifts of the Holy Spirit listed in Isaiah (11:2).<sup>36</sup> The central circle usually features a portrait of Christ or of God, as in the thirteenth-century French example from Saint-Omer (figure 3). In this case, it is left blank. It is likely that the diagram is unfinished, as a large framed space has also been left for an illustration of *Superbia* at the top and centre of the outer circle. Small guide letters indicate that larger coloured initials were planned, while the empty large roundels in the outer rectangular frame would have been filled in with illustrations of Adam and Eve, Moses, the infant Christ and the Virgin, the

<sup>35</sup> See further discussion in chapter three, below.

<sup>36</sup> There is a useful list of medieval septenaries for comparison, arranged in tables, in: Rainini, 'Symbolic Representations', pp. 183–6.

resurrected Christ, and Christ the Judge. This unfinished state, in combination with its good state of preservation, suggests that it did not move from Vercelli once it had arrived there.

An important and distinctive feature of this diagram is the rectangular border (*quadratum*) which frames the circle in the centre (figure III). The frame creates correspondences between four periods of salvific history and the life of Christ, with divisions in the liturgical calendar. This temporal framework begins with the creation in the second roundel in the upper left corner (R1, represented by the roundel which would have featured Adam and Eve), and continues to the Apocalypse, represented by the roundel containing *Christus iudicans* adjacent to that of Adam and Eve (R5). The framework is therefore a path, leading around the diagram clockwise. Rubrication indicating historical time is shown on the upper register of the frame, with the corresponding liturgical phase indicated in the lower. We should understand this frame as the universal backdrop for the moral journey played out by each Christian, as they navigate the path of virtue as a struggle to combat vice.<sup>37</sup> The first line, from Adam and Eve, to the roundel labelled *Moses* in the upper right corner, has three registers drawing equivalence between the ‘time of deviation, from Adam to Moses’, and the period of Septuagesima (the ninth Sunday before Easter) up to the Passion, and the seven Ages of the World (figure III).<sup>38</sup> From Moses to Christ marks the next side, the *tempus revocationis*. This is incorrectly labelled ‘tempus resurrectionis’, and corresponds with the liturgical period of Advent.<sup>39</sup> Continuing along the base of the diagram, the period from Christmas to Septuagesima (reading from right to left) corresponds to two historical *tempora*, the *tempus reconciliationis* of the members, and the *tempus*

---

<sup>37</sup> ‘Linee iste quatuor exteriores que faciunt quadratum quattuor nobis tempora represe[n]tant que fluunt ab initio mundi usque ad finem, in quibus hec vitia nobis impugnant et beneficia donorum virtutum contra hec expugnanda nobis necessaria sunt.’

<sup>38</sup> ‘Tempus deviationis [MS devotionis] ab Adam usque ad Moysen. Prima etas, secunda etas, tertia etas, quarta etas, quinta etas, sexta etas, septima etas. Septuagesima. Sexagesima. Quinquagesima. Quadragesima Dominica vacans. Oculi mei. Letare Ierusalem. Passio domini. Dominica secunda passionis dominice in ramis palmarum.’

<sup>39</sup> ‘Tempus resurrectionis Moyse usque ad Christum. Prima dominica adventus Domini, secunda dominica adventus domini, tertia dominica adventus domini, quarta dominica adventus domini.’

*peregrinationis* of Christ.<sup>40</sup> The roundel in the lower right is labelled *Christus natus* and *Maria pos[t]partum* (R3), that of the lower left *Christus resurgens* (R4). On the left side of the diagram the frame is erroneously labelled ‘tempus resurrectionis ecclesie’.<sup>41</sup> In other examples of this diagram, this part of the frame is divided into two. For example, in BL, Royal MS 14 B IX, the ‘tempus reconciliationis’ corresponds with ‘resurrectio, ascensio, spiritus sancti missio, and dominica trinitate’ (figure 5). The first part is labelled *tempus reconciliationis ecclesiae*, corresponding to the liturgical period from Easter to Pentecost. The second part of this frame is more commonly labelled *tempus peregrinationis ecclesie* (corresponding to the period from Pentecost to Advent), ending with the coming of Antichrist and forty-five days of calm before the Last Judgement. The copyist of the Vercelli *Rota* has instead made the ‘tempus resurrectionis ecclesie’ the sole element of the upper register on the left side, so that the lower register reads:

Resurrectio, ascensio, spiritus sancti missio, dominica de sancta trinitate, sequitur  
xxxiii<sup>42</sup> dominice de sancte ecclesie peregrinatione, antichristus, xlv dies  
penitentiae, conversio reliquiarum, dies iudicii.

The copyist of the diagram has made various errors which affect the meaning of the image, and perhaps resulted in the manuscript remaining incomplete. However, we are still able to understand how the diagram balances the struggle of the individual soul against vice with a broader historical framework, giving a sense of the progress of time from the creation, and from the life of Christ, to the second coming and the Day of Judgement. These themes occur elsewhere in the *Rotoli figurati*, and we will return to these shared connections in chapter three.

---

<sup>40</sup> ‘Tempus peregrinationis quantum ad Christum, tempus reconciliationis quantum ad membra. Dominica ante septuagesimam, epiphania domini, ypapanti domini, circumcisio domini, nativitas domini.’

<sup>41</sup> ‘Tempus resurrectionis Ecclesie.’

<sup>42</sup> The manuscript reads ‘xxiii’.



### 1.3. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 3 (*Genealogia Christi*)

Rotoli figurati 3 is a copy of the *Compendium Historiae in Genealogia Christi* (*Genealogia Christi*) by Peter of Poitiers (c. 1130–1205) (figures IV–V).<sup>43</sup> The version of this text held at Vercelli is a roll manuscript composed of four separate trimmed sheets of thick goat or sheep parchment glued together across their short edges. Measuring 214 x 43 cm, this is a large and unwieldy document. Although it is damaged along its lateral edges, and has lost some marginal text, it is remarkably well preserved. The colours of rubrics and capitals remain bright and the text is legible apart from some wear at the very top of the roll, and a lost corner that has been repaired. There are no illustrations on this document, nor any space indicating they were planned, apart from a large and idiosyncratic depiction of Adam and Eve in front of the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil, with Satan as a (rather lifelike) serpent coiled about the trunk. This illustration is a pen and ink drawing with colour washes in shades of tan, russet, green and pale blue at the top (figure 6). Eve is drawn in the act of holding the small berry-like fruit before her open mouth, her gaze directed at Adam. Unfortunately, Adam's face has been obliterated by the parchment and glue repair to the lost corner. The repair is now glued, but there is evidence, in prick marks along the join, that it was originally stitched.<sup>44</sup> Although this illustration is strikingly different from the other forms of decoration in

---

<sup>43</sup> Peter of Poitiers was by 1167 a master at Notre Dame in Paris, and taught theology during his lifetime. The chronology of his life and works is complicated, and it is important to note that previously accepted biographical information offered in Philip S. Moore's *The Works of Peter of Poitiers* has recently been questioned. See Moore, *The Works of Peter of Poitiers*, pp. 29–41. A critical overview of the evidence is provided in: C. I. Beckwith, *Warriors of the Cloisters* (Princeton, 2012), pp. 171–7. The *Genealogia Christi* is known from a huge number of manuscripts, originally listed by Monroe in: 'Illustrated Genealogical Manuscripts'. Monroe identified sixty manuscript versions of the *Genealogia Christi*, and twenty-seven roll versions. However, more recently an exhaustive online list has been created by Jean-Baptiste Piggin, which contains more than 200 items ranging from the very beginning of the thirteenth century to the sixteenth. See: J.-B Piggin, 'Peter's Stemma', at <<http://www.piggin.net/stemmahist/petercatalog.htm#>> [Accessed July 2018].

<sup>44</sup> This method of repair is similar to that seen on the upper right corner of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*).

the document, in style, ink, and colour, and it is likely that it was added to the manuscript at a later stage, it occurs next to the roundels for Adam and Eve. It is not uncommon to find such illustrations of Adam and Eve at this position of the *Genealogia Christi*.<sup>45</sup> Other colours found on the manuscript are red and blue, the former used for rubrics and individual names, and both used for initial capitals which highlight biographical and historical passages. The rest of the text is written in dark sepia ink. For the most part, this is an upright, regular hand, suggestive of a professional copyist working in northern Italy in the third quarter of the thirteenth century. The hand is not found elsewhere in the *Rotoli figurati*, but its professional aspect has led Mirella Ferrari to speculate that it may have been made in a workshop active in Vercelli in conjunction with the activities of the university *studium*.<sup>46</sup> Additionally, there are annotations by another late thirteenth century hand, distinctively spiky and untidy, that has made emendations in various places on the roll (figure 7). These additions to the genealogy make marital connections clear, and contribute clarifying text and other scriptural references. They indicate that the roll had an extended period of use, and was updated to reflect whatever the annotator considered important for those examining the roll, perhaps taking detail from other sources. There is no physical evidence on the Vercelli roll of nail marks, or other means by which the document could have been hung on a wall. However, it is important to note that this is one of the few large diagrammatic texts known, in other cases, to have been displayed on the walls of classrooms. William H. Monroe identified five roll-manuscripts of the *Genealogia Christi* which have vertical rows of holes with rust stains, suggesting that they had been fixed to a support for display.<sup>47</sup> Given the size of the Vercelli roll, and indeed most of the other known roll-manuscript versions of this text, a method of use involving unrolling the document on a

---

<sup>45</sup> See for example, BL, Additional MS 60628/1, an English roll manuscript dating to the third quarter of the 13<sup>th</sup> century. This manuscript is digitised and can be viewed at: <http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/illuminatedmanuscripts/record.asp?MSID=3&CollID=27&NStart=60628>.

<sup>46</sup> Ferrari, 'I *Rotoli figurati*', pp. 137–8.

<sup>47</sup> W. H. Monroe, 'A Roll-Manuscript of Peter of Poitiers' *Compendium*', *Bulletin of the Cleveland Museum of Art*, 65/3 (1978), pp. 92–107. These manuscripts are: Cambridge, Emmanuel College Library, MS 232; Nancy, Bibl. Mun., MS 491 (237); Paris, École des Beaux Arts, MS Maz. 71; Harvard, Houghton Library, MS Typ 216; New York, Morgan Library. MS M. 628.

table would be a more practical method for instruction than hanging. The *Genealogia Christi* is a condensed diagrammatic overview of biblical history, presenting the descent of Christ (*linea Christi*) from Adam in the framework of the six historical stages demarcating salvific history.<sup>48</sup> The genealogies are based on those of the Old and New Testaments, beginning with Adam and extending to Christ's death. The form from Adam to Christ is essentially in descending order.<sup>49</sup> This differs from those that follow the Old Testament progenitors, proceeding upwards to Christ. Each descendent or individual has their own double bordered sepia roundel, with the first nine direct descendants of Adam in roundels of red. Direct descendants are placed vertically in columns in the same sepia ink, traced out with plummet lines which have also been used to rule each area of text. Other descendants branch out in clusters to the left and right, connected by unruled lines to the main column, each grouping and section accompanied by a passage of text. In parallel to this, there are lines of the Old Testament patriarchs, the tribes of Judah and Israel, judges, prophets and priests, and genealogies of pagan kings of Syria, Assyria, Babylon, Persia and Greece, together with Roman emperors from Julius Caesar to Tiberius.<sup>50</sup> The passages of text alongside the genealogies give short biographical accounts which, as noted by Monroe, conform to the criteria of things important to the study of history as defined by Hugh of Saint Victor: 'For these are the four things which are especially to be sought for in history —

---

<sup>48</sup> S. Panayotova, 'Peter of Poitiers's *Compendium in Genealogia Christi*: The Early English Copies', in *Belief and Culture in the Middle Ages: Studies Presented to Henry Mayr-Harting*, ed. R. Gameson and H. Leyser (Oxford, 2001), pp. 327–41. There is no edition, but recent important work on the different versions of the text elaborated by Panayotova has been supplemented by further scholarly attention to the diagrammatic nature of the text. See the earliest discussions of these aspects of the work in Monroe, 'A Roll-Manuscript of Peter of Poitiers' *Compendium*', pp. 92–107. See also H.-E. Hilpert, 'Geistliche Bildung und Laienbildung: Zur Überlieferung der Schulschrift *Compendium historiae in genealogia Christi* (*Compendium veteris testamenti*) des Petrus von Poitiers (d. 1205) in England', *Journal of Medieval History*, 11 (1985), pp. 315–31; A. Worm, 'Ista est Jerusalem. Intertextuality and Visual Exegesis in Peter of Poitiers' *Compendium historiae in genealogia Christi* and Werner Rolevinck's *Fasciculus temporum*', in *Imagining Jerusalem in the Medieval West*, ed. L. Donkin and H. Vorholt (Oxford, 2012), pp. 123–62; ead. 'Arbor Autem Humanum Genus Significat: Trees of Genealogy and Sacred History in the Twelfth Century', in *The Tree*, ed. P. Salonijs and A. Worm (Turnhout, 2014), pp. 35–67.

<sup>49</sup> A. Watson, *The Early Iconography of the Tree of Jesse* (Oxford, 1934), p. 43.

<sup>50</sup> Monroe, 'Illustrated Genealogical Manuscripts', p. 21.

the person, the business done, the time, and the place.<sup>51</sup> This text was extraordinarily popular, and was considered a crucial teaching aid for students; indeed this is the explicit reason that the text was conceived. The prologue to the *Compendium* summarises the work:

Considering how voluminous Holy Scripture is, and the difficulties encountered by scholars who study it, especially those who have neglected its historical foundation, and also those who for a lack of books seek a remedy for their limited expertise, wishing to retain in the memory the historical narratives as it were in a little sack, I have attempted to reduce into one work the sequence of the holy fathers, from whom through the priestly and royal tribe Christ took his origin, along with their works. It is recommended for those put off by the scale of the subject, so that they might keep it in their memory, and will be of use to all readers. I have undertaken this difficult task with the utmost assiduity and vigilance, and with brevity according to the given form. Therefore I have taken care to skip over nothing of the historical truth, but beginning with Adam, I have proceeded through the patriarchs, judges, kings, prophets and priests of their time ending with Christ.<sup>52</sup>

The attribution of this text to Peter of Poitiers is supported by some contemporary evidence. Beryl Smalley noted that Stephen Langton was a colleague of Peter of Poitiers, and knew him as the author of the *Genealogia Christi: sicut evidenter patet in Genealogia magistri Petri Pictaviensis*.<sup>53</sup> The text was probably composed around 1170–1180, and one of the earliest known manuscripts (Cambridge, Corpus Christ College, MS 29) is from the last decades of the twelfth century.<sup>54</sup> Alberic de Trois-Fontaines (d.

---

<sup>51</sup> 'Haec enim quattuor praecipue in historia requirenda sunt, persona, negotium, tempus et locus.' From Hugh of Saint Victor, *Hugonis de Sancto Victore Didascalicon de studio legendi*, ed. C. H. Buttner (Washington, DC, 1939), 6.3, at p. 113. Translation from *The Didascalicon of Hugh of St. Victor: A Medieval Guide to the Arts*, trans. J. Taylor (London, 1961), Book VI, at p. 135.

<sup>52</sup> Translated by Monroe, 'Illustrated Genealogical Manuscripts', p. 87. The full passage reads: 'Considerans scripture sacre prolixitatem, necnon et difficultatem scolarium quoque circa studium sacre lectionis, maxime illius que in historie fundamento versatur negligentiam, quorundam quoque ex inopia librorum imperitie sue solatium querentium, volentibus, quasi in sacculo quodam memoriter tenere narrationis hystoriarum, temptavi seriem sanctorum patrum a quibus per leviticam et ragalem tribum Christus originem habuit, cum eorum operibus, in unum opusculum redigere.' The text is cited in P. S. Moore, *The Works of Peter of Poitiers*, p. 99.

<sup>53</sup> B. Smalley, *The Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages*, repr. (Oxford, 1983), 214, n. 3.

<sup>54</sup> The earliest securely dated version of the text is incorporated within London, BL, Cotton MS Faustina B VII, and dated between 1208–1216.

1251) famously described Peter of Poitiers as having ‘painted’ the texts on skins—‘trees of the histories of the Old and New Testament’— ‘for the sake of poor clerics’.<sup>55</sup>

Nearly all the known copies of the *Genealogia Christi* contain a set of four diagrams and one table, which must be considered part of the original work. These generally begin with two cross-sectional diagrams of Noah’s Ark, which are not found on Rotoli figurati 3. They are followed by a table depicting the *mansiones* or encampments of the Israelites, found on the roll between the third and fourth ages of the world. It appears to the right of the central column, and in its arrangement of arcaded columns with decorative finials, is reminiscent of ecclesiastical canon tables (figure 8). Above, there is the rubric: *Hec sunt xlii mansiones Israelitici populi per tres annos*. Each column represents a year spent wandering in the Wilderness, with the central grid containing the names of the stopping places: the first from Rameses to the Sinai, the second from the ‘Graves of Greed’ to Kadesh, and the third from Mount Hor to the plains of Moab. Directly below this is the second diagram, a precisely arranged knot of interconnected circles marked with cardinal points: south at the top, west to the right, north below and east to the left (figure 9). This represents two scriptural events: the Tribes of Israel arrayed around the Tabernacle in the wilderness, based on Numbers 1 and 2, and the settling of forty-eight towns in the promised land by Levite families after the Exodus (Joshua 21). The four larger circles represent the Levites, with lines connecting each to the Twelve Tribes of Israel signified by smaller circles around the edge of the diagram. This arrangement of the diagram is thought to have been devised by Peter of Poitiers, and it became the standard representation of the theme from the thirteenth century onwards.<sup>56</sup> Lastly, left of the central column, there is a circular diagram representing a plan of Jerusalem and its gates (figure 10). Represented by three compass-drawn concentric circles, with six arched gateways set into the outer edge and interspersed with decorative palmette inserts, the sections formed by each circle signify hierarchically distinguished dwelling areas. The innermost is reserved for the king and

---

<sup>55</sup> ‘Obiit Petrus Pictaviensis [...] qui pauperibus clericis consulens excogitavit arbores historiarum Veteris et Novi Testamenti in pellibus depingere, et de vitiis et virtutibus similiter compendiose disponere.’ Albericus Monachus Trium Fontium, *Chronica*, ed. P. Scheffer Boichorst, MGH Scriptores (Hannover, 1877), pp. 631–950, at p. 886. This is cited in Worm, ‘Trees of Genealogy’, at p. 22.

<sup>56</sup> Worm, ‘*Ista est Jerusalem*’, at p. 125.

priests (*habitatio regis et sacerdotum*), the middle for nobility and prophets (*habitatio nobilium et prophetarum*), and the outermost for the rest of the population (*habitatio vulgi*). Each gate is named, but differs from the scripture; the names are instead derived from Peter Comestor's chapter *De reaedificatione Jerusalem* from the *Historia Scholastica*. This is the final diagram on the roll-manuscript.

It was suggested by Monroe in his important early analysis of the *Genealogia Christi* manuscripts that the addition of a pictorial programme is a feature of a later stage in the development of the *Compendium* text. The English roll manuscript BL, Royal 14 B IX, dates to the second half of the thirteenth century and contains elaborate decoration in the form of tinted figural drawings in roundels, illustrating particular scenes or figures.<sup>57</sup> In Rotoli figurati 3, the roundels are small enough to only contain names or brief tituli. The lack of illustrations in the Vercelli *Genealogia Christi*, therefore might suggest it represents an early phase of this work, bearing in mind that, as Monroe acknowledged, the roll format came later than folio copies.<sup>58</sup> Although this was a widely circulated pedagogical text, there is a danger in viewing the *Genealogia Christi* as a mnemonic diagram to teach biblical history, as this would encourage us to see the diagram, improbably, as a simplification for students. Instead this diagram manipulates its source materials in an act of reconfiguration, clarification and supplementation, and creates a physical object which represents history in a meaningful visual manner. Unrolling this document enables the user to perceive history as a continuous narrative. Roll manuscripts of the *Genealogia Christi* are often found alongside other diagrammatic works, including the *Rota dominice orationis*. Indeed, the *Rota dominice orationis* is perhaps what Alberic de Trois-Fontaines, writing of the death of Peter of Poitiers, referred to as 'de vitiis et virtutibus similiter compendiose disponere'.<sup>59</sup> Another diagrammatic image, of the seven-branched candelabrum of Ex. 25: 31–40, or the 'Allegorical Menorah', is also found associated with the *Genealogia*

---

<sup>57</sup> This manuscript is partially digitised and can be viewed at: <<http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/illuminatedmanuscripts/record.asp?MSID=18450&CollID=16&NStart=140209>>

<sup>58</sup> Monroe, 'Illustrated Genealogical Manuscripts', pp. 138–45, at p. 145.

<sup>59</sup> Alberic de Trois-Fontaines, *Chronica*, ed. P. Scheffer *MGH Scriptores*, XXIII (Hannover, 1874), p. 886.

*Christi*, in manuscript and roll form.<sup>60</sup> One very early thirteenth-century manuscript contains the *Genealogia Christi*, the *Rota dominice orationis* and the Allegorical Menorah.<sup>61</sup> The seven-branched candelabrum also appears before Peter Comestor's *Historia scholastica*, after two Trees of Consanguinity and Affinity, in BAV, Vat. Lat. 1972, fol. 1v (figure 11). A thirteenth-century Italian manuscript, BAV, Pal. Lat. 1723, includes a version of the *Genealogia* which is carefully designed to maintain the clarity of layout of a roll in codex form (figure 12). This manuscript also includes the seven-branched candelabrum, and an unusual diagram which presents the content of the *Rota* in linear form.<sup>62</sup> In the Vercelli collection of Rotoli figurati, we have the *Genealogia Christi* (a roll manuscript) and the *Rota dominice orationis* (a single leaf), both written in a professional hand that is not found in the other documents. In the thirteenth-century roll manuscript, BL Cotton Roll XIV. 12, we find a variant English form of the *Genealogia Christi*, the *Rota dominice orationis*, and a version of the *Ecclesia* diagram. These repeated connections mean that their presence together within the Rotoli figurati in Vercelli cannot be a coincidence; these kinds of visual representations, or diagrammatic works, were considered to be related, and collected together for specific pedagogical or intellectual purposes. Further discussion of the relationship between these kinds of documents, and of the linear format of the *Genealogia Christi* in particular, is undertaken in chapter three below.

---

<sup>60</sup> For example in the late thirteenth century Vatican roll-manuscript, BAV, Vat Lat. 3872. See L. Alidori, 'Il Plut. 20.56 della Laurenziana: appunti sull'iconografia dei manoscritti della *Genealogia* di Petrus Pictaviensis', *Rivisti di storia della miniatura*, 6–7 (2002), at p. 166.

<sup>61</sup> See W. Cahn, 'The Allegorical Menorah', in *Tributes in Honor of James H. Marrow: Studies in Painting and Manuscript Illumination of the Late Middle Ages and Northern Renaissance*, ed. J. F. Hamburger and A. S. Korteweg (London, 2006), pp. 117–26. R. Quinto has argued that the Allegorical Menorah diagram and text is a work by Peter of Poitiers, or at least a version of his known work, *Allegoriae super tabernaculum*, see: R. Quinto, 'Teologia allegorica e teologia scolastica in alcuni commenti all'*Historia scholastica* di Pietro Comestore', *Archæ verbi*, 6 (2009), pp. 67–101. The seven-branched candelabra, the *Rota dominice orationis*, and the *Genealogia Christi*, occur together in Naples, Biblioteca Nazionale, MS VIII C. 3, fol. 1r.

<sup>62</sup> I intend to return to the diagrams of BAV, Pal. Lat. 1723 in a future study.

#### 1.4. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 4 (*Ecclesia*)

This large manuscript measures 95 x 54 cm and is composed of an entire piece of parchment, the natural curvature of the animal skin remaining visible in the upper left and lower right corners (figures VI–VIII).<sup>63</sup> Until 2015, this manuscript continued to be stored—as it probably had been for centuries—as a roll.<sup>64</sup> More severe damage is seen in the upper right and lower right corners: a section measuring approximately 23 x 12 cm has been torn from the upper right, roughly 10 cm x 3.5 cm from the lower. Closer inspection of the edge of the upper tear reveals a series of pin prick marks, which suggests a historic repair, since lost. The upper and lower left corners remain intact, and have no evidence of marking or holes, which suggests that this document was not fixed to a support or nailed to a wall, but was rather unrolled on a table for use. On the dorse a seventeenth century hand has left a note, describing the manuscript: *Disegno concernente l'università delle cose del mondo*.

The manuscript is dominated by an enthroned figure holding a sword vertically, which impales the monstrous head of Satan beneath its feet. The skill of the artist can be described as competent but not sophisticated, although the large size and complex layout of text and image undoubtedly required significant ability to draft. Initial impressions register this figure as an enthroned Apocalyptic Christ, the imperious frontal gaze, crown and tiered nimbus giving the diagram the iconographic resonance of a *maiestas domini*. Closer examination reveals the sword to be a genealogical tree of salvific history, reaching upward from Adam to Christ, to the end of the world. Four roundels within this tree/sword pick out certain figures: Adam, Jacob, Ozias, and Christ. From Christ's medallion, eleven tendrils emerge, five on the left and six on the right. Other small drawings illustrate certain significant historical events: Noah's ark appears between Adam and Jacob, Samuel and Saul on the left above Jacob's roundel, Moses and Aaron on the right. These last two pairs represent the separation of kingship and priesthood. Beneath Christ's roundel and on the left is a bust of the Roman emperor

---

<sup>63</sup> Analysis, undertaken by the Università del Piemonte Orientale in 2018, has determined that the manuscript is sheep parchment.

<sup>64</sup> A conservation project to 'relax' the parchment was undertaken in 2015, so that the roll can now be stored flat in protected conditions.



Tiberius (ruling during Christ's ministry) opposite the ship of St. Peter (*navicula Petri*). A rubric at this point adds, 'imperium Romanum hic incipit'. Two further pairings of 'kings' and priests illustrate the part of the tree between Christ and the end of the world, marked with a rectangular frame inscribed *quadraginta dies penitencie*. The first is the emperor Constantine, crowned and handing a swathe of fabric, probably a cloak, to Pope Sylvester, who reaches out from the other side. This scene's accompanying rubric makes it clear that it represents the eighth- or ninth-century legend of the Donation of Constantine: 'Constantinus dat omnia Silvestro'. This document, widely accepted as authoritative until the fifteenth century, understood the emperor to have conferred on Pope Sylvester and his successors primacy and temporal dominion in the west, and to have transferred the imperial government from Constantinople to Rome; by the eleventh century this document was being used as evidence that the papacy was endowed with imperial power.<sup>65</sup>

Above this pairing, and above the shoots or tendrils reaching from Christ's roundel, we see another king reaching forward to receive a sword. This pairing reads: 'Karolus accipet gladium Azaria'. The initial A, in red ink, has been added later, and it is possible that this scribe guessed the letter. In the text to the right of the diagram, there is further information which allows us to describe these figures more accurately:

The ship of Peter is compared to the ark of Noah, because outside of it, nobody will be saved. Silvester is compared to Melchisedec, because both are kings and priests. Zacharias although he succeeded Silvester in both, separated it [i.e. priesthood and kingship], when he summoned Charles to the part [i.e. of kingship]. What is depicted is the anointment of the king Saul and the priest Aaron.<sup>66</sup>

This text confirms the distinction between kingship and priesthood indicated by these figures, and further identifies the puzzling rubric of 'Azaria' as Zacharias, who summoned *Karolus* to kingship. Pope Zacharias (741–752) had a significant role in the transfer of the imperial crown to the Frankish kings and the Carolingian dynasty. *Karolus* here, unless there has been an error, cannot refer to Charlemagne, but more

---

<sup>65</sup> I. Robinson, 'Church and Papacy', in *The Cambridge History of Medieval Political Thought c.350–c.1450*, ed. J. H. Burns (Cambridge, 1988), pp. 252–305, at p. 281. The text of the Donation, the *Constitutum Constantini*, is that of Horst Fuhrmann, ed., *Das Constitutum Constantini*, MGH Fontes Iuris, 10 (Hannover, 1968).

<sup>66</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 119–22.

probably indicates Charles Martell (d. 741). Zacharias oversaw the anointing of Charles Martell's son Pepin III as king of the Franks. As we shall discuss in more detail below, this idiosyncratic pairing can be explained by the relationship between this manuscript, and Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). The rest of the figure's body is divided into sections containing further drawings and rubrication relating to the institutional hierarchies of the Church and canon law. Nearly every figure or scene has a caption, and the tree of salvific history has several passages of rubrication that are not associated with an image, instead explaining certain periods in history (*regnum Persarum*; *regnum Grecorum*) or the beginning of the New Testament.<sup>67</sup>

Outside the main figure, down each long side of the manuscript, are roundels containing personifications of the vices and virtues, which have been drawn with a compass. The positioning of these is guided by lead ruling, in four vertical lines on each side, patchily visible. On the left are the virtues, descending from *caritas*, *spes*, *fides*, *sapientia*, *prudentia*, *fortitudo* and *iusticia*, to *temperantia*. Apart from *fides* and *temperantia*, each roundel is accompanied by a short passage of text which lists the petition of the *Pater noster*, the Gift of the Holy Spirit, and the Beatitude related to this virtue. On the right the damage to the upper corner means we have lost one roundel, although the lower part remains. Its size indicates that this roundel contained a representation of *superbia*. The remaining seven roundels contain: *vana gloria*, *invidia*, *ira*, *tristitia*, *avaricia*, *gula*, and *luxuria*. Passages of text next to each roundel list the *filiae vitiorum*, the subdivisions and characteristics associated with the vice. The small drawings within the roundels for the vices and virtues are very faded, but illumination with ultraviolet light reveals them to be detailed and accomplished. The virtues are drawn as crowned women, and each holds a shield but carries a different significant object. For the vices, the artist had more freedom, and shows each personification surrounded by symbolic objects or scene. *Gula*, for example, is seated at a laden table, while *luxuria* examines her face in a looking glass (see figures 13 and 14).

Most of this figure has been drawn confidently, free hand, in a brown ink that is now somewhat faded. Underdrawings in the same ink, providing the main divisions, can be seen in the lower half of the figure, although the artist has not always followed

---

<sup>67</sup> The full scheme of rubrication is listed in Appendix 2, corresponding to figures VII and VIII.

these boundaries. A compass was used to draw the nimbus around the figure's head, as a pin prick can be seen directly between the eyes. Other decoration includes the multiple small circles found on either side of the central sword/tree in the lower half of the main figure, drawn in vivid red ink (there are 195 of these circles in total, 84 on the left, and 111 on the right). Many of these have pin pricks in the centre indicating that they were drawn with a compass. Five small decorative diamond shapes have been added between some of these red circles on the left side, in a corroded green ink which is also found on Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*). It is possible that this area may have been intended to form the basis of an *arbor consanguinitatis*, a canon law diagram representing degrees of blood kinship.<sup>68</sup> These diagrams were commonly associated with introductory treatises on canon law, such as that known as *Quia tractare intendimus* and associated with the canonist Ramon de Penyafort, circulating from around 1235.<sup>69</sup> They generally have an arrow-shaped aspect, roughly indicated on the Vercelli *Ecclesia* (see figure VI, and figure 15).<sup>70</sup> As it stands, this part of the image is incomplete, and the lack of precision with which it was drawn means that the strictly formal nature of the *arbor consanguinitatis* would not have fitted within the outlines drawn. Red ink is also used to pick out details in the head at the base of the image, and elsewhere for decorative highlights, outlines, boundary lines, initial letters of rubrics, and the titles of the vices and virtues. A golden yellow tint is used to pick out the roundel borders for *Caritas*, *Fides*, and *Iusticia*, and the smaller roundel of Christ within the central sword/tree.

The passages of text on the left explain the contents of the diagram, and elaborate on themes relating to the universal authority of the Church and aspects of ecclesiastical jurisdiction. On the right, the text contains extracts of Apocalypse commentary, with a focus on the tribulations of the Church, and the opening of the Seven Seals. There seem to be four different hands at work on this manuscript (A, B, C,

---

<sup>68</sup> A full version of this kind of diagram appears on the only other known example of this image, found in the thirteenth-century English roll manuscript, London, BL, Cotton Roll XIV.12. See further discussion in chapters 3 and 4 below.

<sup>69</sup> S. Worby, *Law and Kinship in Thirteenth-Century England* (London, 2010), pp. 11–17.

<sup>70</sup> This manuscript and the consanguinity diagrams within are described in: H. Schadt, *Die Darstellungen der Arbores Consanguinitatis und der Arbores Affinitatis: Bildschemata in juristischen Handschriften* (Tübingen, 1982), pp. 208, 238, 243, 251.

and D), each using a different ink, noticeable for a variation in fading. Hand A is elegant, and has stylistic flourishes which clearly distinguish it from the others. It is this hand that has completed the core rubrication found within the body of the main figure, and the list of names in the central tree/sword. It is also responsible for the lettering and text of the figure's crown (*diadema regni*), and the crown of Satan, below (*Capud reproborum; Rex filiorum superbie; nomen illi mors*).<sup>71</sup> Hand B, which has a more professional aspect, is found in the passages of text next to the virtues on the left margin, in the rubrics for each vice and virtue, for the rubric accompanying the small figures and the comments on each side of the sword/tree, and in the four roundels and the illustration of the *Archa Noe*.

Mirella Ferrari has observed that Hand B is responsible for the first three paragraphs of text on the left side of the figure, except for the last six lines of the third paragraph, which are completed by a third hand, C. Hand B has left space or initial letters at the beginning of the second and third passages of text. Hand C is slightly more cursive than A and B, and is responsible for the rest of the text on the left side of the diagram. This copyist (C) uses paragraph marks, and has not left space for initial lettering. On the right side of the manuscript, between the outline of the main figure and the virtues containing the vices, there are three main blocks of text, all of which are written by Hand C. The most inconsistent and least professional of the hands, D, has completed the lists that accompany the roundels of the vices on the right side of the manuscript. This includes the passage beneath the large roundel, now lost, of *Superbia* at the upper right, and to the left of *Luxuria* in the lower right. The positioning of the passage listing the subdivisions of *Luxuria*, to the left, rather than beneath the relevant roundel, might suggest that this passage was added after some portion of the lower edge of the manuscript had been torn or damaged. Hand D is probably the last to have worked on the manuscript. As Hand A is integral to much of the structure and labelling of the image, it is probably the first. Hand C seems to have corrected one of the rubrics completed by B on the sword/tree, erasing and replacing it (Rubric 48). Hand C also appears to be responsible for the rubric *maxilla perforata* within the mouth of *Mors* at the base of the diagram, indicating that these additions took place after the work of Hand B.

---

<sup>71</sup> MS reprobrobum.

Overall, however, these different hands were all collaborating within a relatively brief time frame, certainly within the same generation, on this unfinished manuscript. All these hands use a small script that could be broadly described as a relatively low-grade Gothic bookhand, not distinctly angular or compressed, datable to the third quarter of the thirteenth century.<sup>72</sup> This manuscript is highly likely to have been copied in northern Italy, in the third quarter of the thirteenth century. Certain aspects of the manuscripts content, which will be discussed in more detail below, suggest that parts of the image may have derived from late twelfth century exemplars, created after 1187. Ferrari has argued further that Hands A and B (the earliest hands at work on the *Ecclesia*) are also present in Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*), and Hand C in Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). Given the strong stylistic similarities observed between Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*), Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*), and the *Ecclesia*, it is highly likely that these manuscripts were produced at the same centre, in Vercelli, in the third quarter of the thirteenth century.

Textual evidence supports the impression that the manuscript's texts were selected and copied from an exemplar or even a range of exemplars: the text switches abruptly from subject to subject, creating a kind of 'bullet-point' effect that suggests a condensation of a more elaborate text. There are also examples of dittography, for example in the nonsense *facie ad facie ad faciem* found in the first long passage of text on the left. This accidental repetition would typically appear because of the copying process, and would have no doubt been amplified when copying into this unusual format, without full ruling or any other guidelines for copyists. The range of content — theological, legal, political— may indicate that this document was compiled from various textual and artistic sources. The long passage of text on the left contains several scriptural references and refers to papal decretals and the Gregory the Great's *Moralia* on the book of Job. Many of the ideas contained here are familiar motifs, for example the Pauline metaphor of the Christian faithful forming the body and members of the Church, with Christ as its head. The first paragraph on the right side of the parchment,

---

<sup>72</sup> I am very grateful to Mirella Ferrari for sharing her palaeographical expertise in determining how the different hands are distributed across the document, and for her generosity in sharing her work on these hands with me prior to publication in *Ordinare il mondo*.

probably completed by Hand C, begins with an abbreviated rendering of Apocalypse 12, 1 and 6, with the ‘woman clothed with the sun’ read as the Church, who must ‘remain in solitude for 1260 days’.<sup>73</sup> These days are read as the years in which the earthly Church will exist, ‘from Christ until the death of the antichrist’.<sup>74</sup> We read that of these 1260 years, 1187 have elapsed.<sup>75</sup> The use of the exegetical year-day principle here provides us with a possible dating for the source text, which must have been composed in the year 1187, looking forward to an apocalyptic year some seventy years away. This text demonstrates a concern with eschatological time.

Not only do we find Hand C on both Rotoli figurati 4 and Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), but these manuscripts share text and a similar eschatological concern, as we shall see. These close paraphrases and repetition are tabulated in Appendix 4. The principal connections on the *Ecclesia* are with the *Figura arboris* associated with the late twelfth-century *Genealogia* of Joachim of Fiore.<sup>76</sup> In nearly every case of shared text, the *Ecclesia* manuscript contains a more heavily abbreviated version, indicating that the text on this manuscript was being drawn from another source. The version of the text on Rotoli figurati 7 can in some cases be compared with only minor changes to edited versions of the *Genealogia*, so it is plausible that Hand C drew on this text while completing text on the *Ecclesia*. However, multiple questions regarding the content and function of Rotoli figurati 4 arise from the existence of these shared passages:

- 1) The *Ecclesia* diagram presented itself to ‘Hand C’ as an image which could be interpreted according to the Joachimist thought of Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore).
- 2) The *Ecclesia* diagram’s meaning was amended according to contemporary thought (contained within Rotoli figurati 7), either because it was unclear,

---

<sup>73</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 78–9.

<sup>74</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 79–80.

<sup>75</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 81–2.

<sup>76</sup> Joachim of Fiore, ‘*Figura arboris*’, in *Die Genealogia*, ed. G.-L. Potestà, pp. 97–101; Joachim of Fiore, ‘*Figura arboris*’, pp. 97–101.

or because it needed to be ‘brought up to date’, or perhaps rendered orthodox.

- 3) The *Ecclesia* diagram is an example of a previously unknown work of Joachim of Fiore, which shares strong similarities with his early work (composed around 1176 and revised in 1186–7), the *Genealogia*.

These questions will form the background for the discussion of chapters 5 and 6, but the shared text alone significantly strengthens the relationship between these two manuscripts and plausibly suggests that ‘Hand C’ was an individual with an interest in the work of Joachim of Fiore.

Furthermore, other passages of text on the *Ecclesia*, also written by Hand C, more loosely paraphrase or describe themes also addressed in other known works of Joachim of Fiore. These are dealt with in more detail in chapter five below. The dominant theme in much of the shared text is Joachim of Fiore’s principle of concordance: that salvific history can be broadly divided into two periods, with Christ as its hinge. These reached from Adam until the incarnation, and from Christ until the end of time, and the events of the Old Testament corresponded to and prefigured the events of the New Testament. This centred around seven persecutions, mirrored in each period, against the Hebrews and against the Church. One of these sections describes the ‘1260’ years of the Church, which are expounded through forty-two thirty-year spans from Christ until the end of time, ‘just as’ there are forty-two generations from Jacob to Christ. This even division of generations between the Old and New Testaments is found in Joachim’s *Liber de concordia* [*Concordia*]. The concern with apocalyptic time reflects the fact that future time is incorporated within Joachim’s principle of concordance. Above, we observed a distinctive and puzzling pairing of figures, *Karolus* and *Azaria*. The identification of these figures with Charles Martell and Pope Zacharias is plausibly derived from the *Concordia*.<sup>77</sup> For Joachim, the opening of the fifth seal of

---

<sup>77</sup> Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de concordia Novi ac Veteris Testamenti*, ed. E. R. Daniel, Transactions of the American Philosophical Society, 73 (Philadelphia, 1983), bk. 3.2.4, pp. 296–99. See B. E. Whalen, ‘Joachim of Theorist of History and Society’, in *A Companion to Joachim of Fiore*, ed. M. Riedl (Leiden, 2017), pp. 88–108; J. E. Wannenmacher, *Hermeneutik der Heilgeschichte*: De

Apocalypse signified, in another highly individualised system of typology, an event prefigured by the persecution of the Greeks under the fourth seal: ‘their pride was humbled ... their Churches were given over into the hands of foreigners.’<sup>78</sup> This is explained in the opening of the fifth seal, when the power of empire was transferred to Charles Martel, the ruler of the Franks, and his successors, under the popes Gregory III and Zacharias.<sup>79</sup> This pairing is a further indication that some of the content of Rotoli figurati 4 is derived from a Joachimist exemplar.

The parallel seven persecutions developed from an exegesis of the Seven Seals of Apocalypse 6–8, which emerged in the late eleventh century. The basic structure of this exegesis was as follows: the first seal stood for the age of the Primitive Church, oppressed by the Jews; the second was the Church of the martyrs and its persecution by the pagans; the third the post-Constantinian Church, fragmented by heresy; the fourth the contemporary Church and the struggle with false Christians; the fifth to seventh seals anticipated the tribulation of the faithful under the antichrist, and the eventual triumph of the saints.<sup>80</sup> This exegesis, by the mid-twelfth century, had become standard enough to be included within the *Glossa ordinaria*. In addition to Joachim of Fiore, two further important twelfth-century apocalyptic thinkers who presented innovative interpretations using this exegesis of the seven seals were Rupert of Deutz (d. 1129), and Honorius Augustodunensis. These individuals were part of a broader reformist movement, concerned with seeking meaning for the contemporary trials of the Church, and using these exegetical techniques for creating coherent systems of order in Christian society. In Rotoli figurati 4, the exegesis of the seven seals of Apocalypse is present alongside texts that anticipate the imminent reign of Antichrist and afterwards the days of Judgement.<sup>81</sup> There is one other known version of the *Ecclesia* diagram, in a mid-thirteenth-century English roll manuscript, British Library, Cotton Roll XIV. 12. The fundamental structure is the same, but there are significant differences (figure 16).

---

septem sigillis und die sieben Siegel im werk Joachims von Fiore (Leiden, 2005), pp. 141–2.

<sup>78</sup> Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de Concordia*, bk. 3.2.4, p. 298.

<sup>79</sup> ‘Circa quorum tempora inchoata est apertio quinti sigilli, ablato a Constantinopolitanis augustis Romane patrocinaus ecclesie et collato Karulo, Francorum principi, et successoribus eius.’ Joachim of Fiore, ‘*Concordia*’, bk. 3.2.4, p. 296.

<sup>80</sup> B. E. Whalen offers a useful summary of these developments, in: B. E. Whalen, *Dominion of God: Christendom and Apocalypse in the Middle Ages* (London, 2009), pp. 76–83.

<sup>81</sup> In particular, Appendix 1, Text, ll. 77–98.



The Cotton Roll contains a consanguinity table, and it is lacking any texts or reference to Joachim of Fiore. These differences are explored in chapter four. In the chapters which follow we will examine in more detail the possible sources, exegetical themes, and writers who made use of the themes present — as both text and image — in *Rotoli figurati* 4, in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, through the process of unpacking the meaning of this complex, multi-layered document.

### 1.5. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*)

This large parchment roll has received more scholarly attention than many of the Rotoli figurati, illustrating thirty-four episodes drawn from the Acts of the Apostles, purportedly copied from a now lost monumental series of wall paintings in a medieval *templum* (figures IX–XI).<sup>82</sup> The roll is on permanent display in the Museo del Tesoro del Duomo in Vercelli. Composed of three unequal pieces of parchment glued together, the manuscript measures 180 cm in length and 59 cm in height. Unlike the other Rotoli figurati, this manuscript unrolls and is read horizontally, rather than vertically. The first two pieces are approximately 74 cm in length, while the third piece is only 35 cm long. The smaller piece is visibly composed of a different and finer kind of parchment than the two larger pieces, and it has consequently sustained more damage. The manuscript contains eighteen scenes arranged head to head in mostly even rectangular frames. At some point, the central parchment piece was fixed in upside down, disrupting the sequence of the events from the lives of saints Peter and Paul (Acts of the Apostles, 2–22). The drawings are in brown ink, with decorative elements in red and green. On the

---

<sup>82</sup> Most recently see S. Uggè, 'Rotolo in pergamena con scene degli *Atti degli Apostoli*', in *Et verbum caro factum est. La Bibbia oggi e la sua trasmissione nei secoli*, ed. S. Uggè and G. Ferraris (Vercelli, 2005), pp. 77–80. Uggè's article also edits the manuscript for the first time and gives Italian translations. See also R. Oertel, 'Wandmalerei und Zeichnung in Italien. Die Anfänge der Entwurfszeichnung und ihre monumentalen Vorstufen', *Mitteilungen des Kunsthistorischen Institutes in Florenz*, 5/5 (1940), pp. 217–314. Other studies include: V. Viale, *Opere d'arte preromanica e romanica nel Duomo di Vercelli* (Vercelli, 1967), pp. 12–13, 28–9; A. M. Brizio, ed., *Catalogo delle cose d'arte e di antichità d'Italia: Vercelli* (Rome, 1935), pp. 107–8; C. Cipolla, 'La pergamena rappresentante le antiche pitture della Basilica di S. Eusebio in Vercelli', *Miscellanea di Storia Italiana*, 37 (1901), pp. 3–12; P. Toesca, *La pittura e la miniatura nella Lombardia: dai più antichi monumenti alla meta del Quattrocento* (Milan, 1912), 46; L. Eleen, 'Acts Illustration in Italy and Byzantium', *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, 31 (1977), pp. 253–78; S. Castronovo and A. Quazza, 'Biblioteche e libri miniati in Piemonte tra la fine del XII e il primo terzo del XIV secolo: alcuni percorsi possibili', in *Gotico in Piemonte*, ed. G. Romano, *Arte in Piemonte*, 6 (Turin, 1992), pp. 16–18; S. Castronovo, 'Manoscritti romanici nella Biblioteca Capitolare di Vercelli', in *Piemonte romanico*, ed. G. Romano (Turin, 1994), pp. 316–33; R. W. Scheller, *Exemplum: Model-Book Drawings and the Practice of Artistic Transmission in the Middle Ages (ca. 900–ca. 1470)*, ed. M. Hoyle (Amsterdam, 1995), pp. 155–60; S. Baiocco, S. Castronovo and E. Pagella, eds., *Il gotico* (Turin, 2003), pp. 480–3; C. Segre Montel, 'Pittura del duecento in Piemonte', in *La Pittura in Italia. Il Duecento e il Trecento*, ed. E. Castelnuovo (Milan, 1986), pp. 41–48.

smallest section of parchment, the drawings are in brown ink only. Each framed scene is explained by a Latin couplet, written in majuscule at the top and bottom edge. Couplets written at each end of the roll, along the height of the frame at right angles to the rest of the document, are in Leonine hexameters and read as follows, on the left and on the right:

hoc notat exemplum media testudine templum  
ut renovet novitas quod delet longa vetustas

hic est descriptum media testudine pictum  
ecclesie signans ibi que sunt atque figurans

Robert Scheller translates: 'This model reproduces that which is painted in the middle of the *testudo* of the church, in order that the new may restore what age has destroyed. Here is shown what is painted in the middle of the *testudo* of the church, delineating and reproducing that which can be seen there'.<sup>83</sup> Scheller includes this roll in his compilation of medieval model-book drawings, as an example of a document prepared for the specific purpose of preserving a decorative programme in case the original was damaged, in this case a cycle of wall-paintings. This act of preservation could also have been performed so that the images could serve as a guide for repair, or for preparing further monumental works. Certainly, the content, format and text in this manuscript suggests that it was copied with care.

An eighteenth-century note on the dorse is an early indication of how the manuscript's function was understood: *Disegni de' quadri dipinti nela volta della Nave Maggiore della Chiesa di S. Eusebio*. It is still broadly accepted that the roll records a now lost iconographic scheme, painted in the eleventh or twelfth century, that once formed part of the monumental interior decoration of S. Eusebio.<sup>84</sup> The medieval nave of this building was destroyed in the first half of the eighteenth century, and little of the ancient structure remains apart from the thirteenth-century campanile. Although there is some evidence of an iconographic scheme from the ninth-century church, what we know of the structure of the cathedral from the eleventh to the thirteenth centuries is

---

<sup>83</sup> Scheller, *Exemplum*, pp. 155–60.

<sup>84</sup> Uggè, 'Rotolo in pergamena', p. 80; Castronovo, 'Manoscritti romanici', pp. 331–2.

exiguous.<sup>85</sup> The manuscript only states that the grid of images is a record of a damaged artistic programme, perhaps made before a new phase of decoration or renovation was begun. The word *testudo* translates as vault, or roof, rather than nave.<sup>86</sup> A ground plan of S. Eusebio demonstrates that it had arcades with nine arches, and it has been suggested, for example by Cipolla, that the strip between the two rows of images on the roll may represent the ceiling with the images extending from the two sides of the nave into the choir bay.<sup>87</sup> A certain amount of awkwardness in the spacing and arrangement of each scene, which seems stretched to fill out a vertical space, might also indicate the translation of a monumental design in a manuscript context. The spatial formality of the scenes, which use detailed and three-dimensional architectural backgrounds —towers, rooftops, open doors, rooms and archways— to create a background for the pictorial narrative, has become in some instances jumbled and cramped on the parchment. In some cases, it appears that the architectural detail of the design made use of the features of the church space, for example where the pillars that frame the events of the scene take the place of the otherwise plainly drawn borders of the image ground (figure 17).

The argument that this roll was made at a centre in Vercelli has been supported by stylistic similarities observed between its illustrations and others found in codices with known connections to the scriptorium of S. Eusebio (and held in the Biblioteca Capitolare Eusebiana).<sup>88</sup> These are Codex C, the *Evangelistario*, famous for its splendid eleventh-century silver cover, Codex XLII, a sacramentary written for S. Eusebio.<sup>89</sup> In its paleographical features, the majuscule script used in the rubrics of the Acts roll (Rotoli figurati 5) perhaps shows uneven transition from monumental to miniature form, as the confidence of its execution is quite variable. At some points, the scribe evidently experienced some difficulties with space and was forced to decrease the size of the lettering to fit the text into the image space. In others, the lettering does not stick to a rigid base line despite the ruling, giving an overall uncertain aspect. The other

---

<sup>85</sup> R. Pastè, 'Le iscrizioni ai quadri dipinti sull'antica volta del Duomo di Vercelli', *Archivio della Società Vercellese di storia e di arte*, 12 (1920), pp. 135–40.

<sup>86</sup> Scheller, *Exemplum*, at p. 160.

<sup>87</sup> Cipolla, 'La pergamena rappresentante le antiche pitture', pp. 3–12, at pp. 8–9.

<sup>88</sup> Segre Montel, 'Pittura del Duecento', pp. 41–48, at p. 42.

<sup>89</sup> Brizio, *Catalogo delle cose d'arte e di antichità d'Italia: Vercelli*, pp. 107–8.

manuscript to use significant majuscule, Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*) uses a mixture of majuscule and miniscule letters, particularly an enlarged miniscule ‘h’, in its rubrics. The Acts roll (Rotoli figurati 5) uses majuscule and sometimes uncial majuscule forms in its rubrication, but does not use enlarged minuscule letters except in the distichs which describe the overall content of the roll.<sup>90</sup> Further, there are some stylistic similarities between the details of the Acts roll and others in the Vercelli group, in particular the *Mappamondo* and the *Ecclesia* (Rotoli figurati 6 and 4). These are the only documents in the group to contain multiple figural drawings at a large enough scale for any sustained stylistic comparisons to be drawn. Rooftops and buildings have a similar aspect to those in the *Ecclesia* and the *Mappamondo*, however, those on the latter are perhaps decorative symbols for cities and habitation rather than descriptive representations of architectural types. The *Mappamondo*, as we shall discuss in the next section, contains similar majuscule lettering in its legends and rubrication.

Uncertainty remains as to the subject of the roll. We cannot know whether it records the cathedral of S. Eusebio. And yet, its large format and state of preservation plausibly suggests that it has not travelled far from its place of production. In terms of dating, Cipolla’s work on the roll in the early twentieth century gave us a palaeographic dating of the first half of the thirteenth century, which is still broadly accepted.<sup>91</sup> Uggè and others date the roll to the late twelfth or beginning of the thirteenth century.<sup>92</sup> Very recently, Mirella Ferarri has acknowledged the difficulty in dating this document based on stylistic analysis. However, in the paleographical examination of the Rotoli figurati, Ferrari has observed stylistic similarities in the majuscule lettering used in Rotoli figurati 5 and 1. Furthermore, her research also links the particular preparation and quality of the parchment of Rotoli figurati 5 to that of 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 6 (*Mappamondo*). These shared qualities lead to the conclusion that these manuscripts were plausibly made at the same centre, within the same generation, introducing a new dating for the Acts roll of the third quarter of the thirteenth century.<sup>93</sup>

---

<sup>90</sup> The difficulties of dating and identifying majuscule lettering are also discussed in the section on Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*), below.

<sup>91</sup> Cipolla, ‘La pergamena rappresentante le antiche pitture’, pp. 3–12.

<sup>92</sup> Uggè, ‘Rotolo in pergamena’, pp. 77–80.

<sup>93</sup> Ferrari, ‘I Rotoli figurati di Vercelli’, pp. 129–30, and p. 136.

Despite the evident uncertainty regarding what this manuscript depicts, it has a broadly accepted connection to the cathedral of S. Eusebio and the city of Vercelli. We cannot know whether these frescoes record an artistic programme from the old cathedral of S. Eusebio; the intention of the roll may have been to preserve a record of images found elsewhere.

The observation of shared stylistic and paleographical features link the manuscript to some of the other Rotoli figurati, supporting at least in the most basic terms the inclusion of the roll within this thesis's treatment of the manuscripts as a group. Yet the striking difference of content remains. It is important to note here that this is not a diagrammatic manuscript, and its content stands out from the broad shared themes found elsewhere within the Rotoli figurati. Its inclusion within the treatment of the Rotoli figurati in this thesis relies upon its circumstantial links to the city of Vercelli, its multi-leaf roll format, and the recent stylistic, material, and paleographical features established by Ferrari which it shares with Rotoli figurati 1, 4 and 6. More speculatively, Uggè's observation that the predominance of scenes on the Acts roll depicting saints Peter and Paul would have represented an interesting visual programme for the cathedral of S. Eusebio in Vercelli, recalling thematically similar medieval pictorial cycles from the basilica of Saint Peter in Rome.<sup>94</sup> These saints, symbolising and evoking the foundation of the Roman Church, are a powerful statement of papal authority. The motivation behind such a programme in Vercelli —bearing in mind that we cannot be certain Rotoli figurati 5 does in fact represent any pictorial cycle, real or imagined, for S. Eusebio— could have been to strategically echo the authority of the the church of Rome, or to demonstrate the prestigious links this cathedral possessed to the Petrine See. As we shall see in chapter two, the history of the diocese of Vercelli and the powerful ecclesiastical figures active in the city demonstrates remarkable links to the papacy. Bearing in mind the uncertainty around this manuscript's subject, and its demonstrable dissimilarities to the other Rotoli figurati, Uggè's observation allows us to understand this manuscript as a potential insight into how the ecclesiastical community at Vercelli chose to represent itself in monumental art. Such an interpretation, as we shall see, can

---

<sup>94</sup> Uggè, 'Rotolo in pergamena', pp. 77–80; E. Pagella, *Gotico sulle vie di Francia: opere dal Museo Civico di Torino* (Siena, 2002), at p. 483.

be fruitfully brought to bear on other thematic content in the Rotoli figurati, particularly in the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4).

## 1.6. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 6 (*Mappamondo*)

The Vercelli *Mappamondo* forms part of the small known group of twelfth- to thirteenth-century circular world maps of English, French or Italian origin (figure XII).<sup>95</sup> Alongside Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*), it is one of the few manuscripts of the Vercelli group to have received significant scholarly attention.<sup>96</sup> As it exists today, it is 65 cm wide and 84 cm in height; given the extent of the damage to the sides, and the lower edge in particular, it was perhaps originally 1 metre in height, and roughly square in shape, similar to the Hereford *mappa mundi* (c. 1300, figure 18). The lower third of the parchment is almost completely illegible because of a botched conservation attempt in the 1970s, and the rest is also very badly faded. In 2014, a group now based at the University of Rochester began a digitisation project of the *Mappamondo*.<sup>97</sup> The project uses multispectral imaging and filtering techniques to produce digital facsimiles of damaged or at-risk manuscripts, aiming to restore their legibility. This project is still in progress, but the images have in some cases completely restored legibility even where the text was nearly invisible to the naked eye, happily meaning that study of the text on this manuscript will be possible for future scholars.<sup>98</sup> There are two useable editions

---

<sup>95</sup> The other maps in this group are: the Munich Isidore; the Sawley Map (Cambridge, Corpus Christi College, MS 66, p. 2); Duchy of Cornwall (Duchy of Cornwall Office, London); the Psalter map (BL, Add. MS 28681, fol. 9v); the Hereford Map (today on display at Hereford Cathedral); and the Ebstorf Map.

<sup>96</sup> The earliest publication on the map after its rediscovery in 1908 was C. Errera, 'Un mappamondo sconosciuto nell'Archivio Capitolare di Vercelli', *Atti Accademia di Scienze Torino*, 46 (1910), pp. 8–11. This was followed by Y. Kamal, *Monumenta Cartographica Africae et Aegypti*, 5 vols (Cairo, 1926), III, at pl. 997; Brizio, *Catalogo delle cose d'arte e di antichità d'Italia: Vercelli*, pp. 9–10. An important edition which included the first attempt at transcribing the text is that of C. F. Capello, *Il Mappamondo medioevale di Vercelli (1191-1218?)*, *Memorie e studi geografici*, X (Turin, 1976). More recent secondary literature on the map which has tackled dating, and the Vercelli map in relation to other known medieval maps, can be found in A.-D. von den Brincken, 'Monumental Legends on Medieval Manuscript Maps. Notes on Designed Capital Letters on Maps of Large Size (Demonstrated from the Problem of Dating the Vercelli Map, Thirteenth Century)', *Imago Mundi*, 42 (1990), pp. 9–25; L. S. Chekin, *Northern Eurasia in Medieval Cartography: Inventory, Text, Translation, and Commentary* (Turnhout, 2006); Terkla, 'Anglo-French Cartography', pp. 161–79.

<sup>97</sup> Information on the project is available online at:

<<http://www.lazarusprojectimaging.com/previous-projects/vercelli-mappamundi>>.

<sup>98</sup> Unfortunately I was only able to gain partial access to these images of the *Mappamondo*. The



containing images and black and white drawings made before the manuscript deteriorated to its current extent and prior to the damage inflicted in the 1970s. These are by Yusuf Kamal (1935), and Carlo F. Capello in his edition of 1976.<sup>99</sup>

In the eighteenth century, the manuscript was summarised by an archivist in an inscription on the dorse as: *Disegno antico rappresentante un quadro sinotico*. This almost circular map is orientated with east at the top, west at the base: Asia is represented in the upper section, Africa to the lower right, Europe at the lower left. Although badly faded, it is possible to see that sepia and deep brown ink was used for both drawing and text. Black ink was used for toponyms, legends, and captions. Red and green tints were used decoratively, with rivers and seas in green (the red sea is outlined in red ink). The Vercelli map does not have the head, hands and feet of God or Christ, which sometimes appear at the top, the sides and the base of *mappae mundi*, to visually indicate the divine creation of the world, and the direction of the winds.<sup>100</sup> The visual concatenation of landmass, seas, rivers and mountains, real and imagined places and creatures, flora and fauna, text and illustration, creates a characteristically dense pictorial programme, and details reveal themselves after close study. The world appears as a collection of cities and towns signified by line drawings of walled fortresses or monuments. The lower storeys of these city symbols contain in each case the label for the place, in minuscule script.<sup>101</sup> This particular style of drawing buildings is common across Europe until the fourteenth century and can be found on diverse manuscripts: for example, the itinerary Map of the Route to Jerusalem by Matthew Paris (figure 19).<sup>102</sup> Although some cities are larger than others according to their historical importance, these architectural depictions should be seen as ideographic, and not useful for dating. Country names are written in a mixture

---

digital facsimile of the Vercelli *Mappamondo* is being produced as part of the doctoral thesis of Helen Davies, at the Faculty of English, University of Rochester.

<sup>99</sup> Kamal, *Monumenta Cartographica*, III; Capello, *Il Mappamondo medioevale di Vercelli*.

<sup>100</sup> These can be seen on the Ebstorf Map, for example.

<sup>101</sup> One damaged example of a map consisting of a collection of towns is the northern Italian 'Codex Alfieri' (c.1292), Turin, Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria MS F.II.9 (which also exists in a fourteenth century copy). See M. Kupfer, 'The Lost Wheel Map of Ambrogio Lorenzetti', *Art Bulletin*, 78/2 (1996), pp. 286–310. For further discussion of this kind of map: P. D. A. Harvey, 'Local and Regional Cartography in Medieval Europe', in *Cartography in Prehistoric, Ancient, and Medieval Europe and the Mediterranean*, ed. J. B. Harley and D. Woodward (Chicago, 1987), I, pp. 464–501. An edition of the late thirteenth century city-state map of Asti is: R. Almagià, 'Un'antica carta del territorio di Asti', *Rivista Geografica Italiana*, 58 (1951), pp. 43–44.

<sup>102</sup> London, BL, Royal MS 14 C VII, fol. 5r.

of majuscule and elongated minuscule lettering. There is a large amount of text on this document, most of which has never previously been studied, although Capello included transcriptions in his 1976 edition.

Mirella Ferrari has recently identified multiple hands collaborating on this document, with the bulk of the legible text in the upper part of the map completed by the main hand (A), and additional text and rubrication completed by a second (B). Hand B was at work in the lower left part of the *Mappamondo*, in the region of Europe and Italy. However, this is the part of the map that is least legible, even with use of the multispectral images shared by the Lazarus Project. Hand A has a distinctive kind of elongated script used for country names, combined with majuscule capitals (figure 20). It is the main hand which uses the distinctive mixed form of majuscule capitals and gothic lettering for toponym lettering. Ferrari compares this lettering style to that of Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*) and Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*), and argues that the same hand (A) is also at work in Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*).<sup>103</sup> These similarities would place the dating for this map in the same period, the third quarter of the thirteenth century. The size and content of the Vercelli *Mappamondo* make it exceptional and link this manuscript to the small group of other large *mappaemundi* of the thirteenth century, those of Ebstorf (c.1300; destroyed) and Hereford (c. 1300) in particular. Anna-Dorothee von den Brincken made a compelling argument for the dating of the manuscript to shortly after the year 1270, in agreement with the stylistic and paleographic features which we have discussed above. Others, following Capello (1976), argue for an early thirteenth-century date. The most convincing of these made by Alessandro Scafi.<sup>104</sup> I am inclined to support the dating of von den Brincken to the second half of the thirteenth century around 1270, a dating that is also supported by Ferrari, and by Marcia Kupfer.

Certain strong stylistic similarities are shared between the *Mappamondo* and the *Ecclesia*, particularly in the drawing of figures and facial features, and the use of certain

---

<sup>103</sup> M. Ferrari, 'I Rotoli figurati' (Milan, forthcoming); the text of this article was shared generously prior to publication. For further distinction of the characteristics of these hands see section 4 above.

<sup>104</sup> A. Scafi, *Mapping Paradise: A History of Heaven and Earth* (London, 2006); Capello, *Il Mappamondo medioevale di Vercelli*; von den Brincken, 'Monumental Legends', pp. 9–25, at p. 12.

decorative patterns. We can examine some examples here which seem markedly similar. These can be seen if we compare the depiction of facial features in the knife-wielding siren of the *Mappamondo* (figure 21) with some of the figures alongside the central genealogical tree in the *Ecclesia* (figure 22). I also point to the depiction of the elephant on the *Mappamondo* and that of the elephant on the shield of the virtue *Temperantia* of the *Ecclesia* (figure 23). The elephant of the *Mappamondo* is larger and much more easily visible, but it is possible to see that several key features are shared between the two representations. Both have a distinctive knot in the trunk, prominent tusks, a defined border to the large ears, and a large crenelated saddle structure for the creature's rider. These are notably lifelike elephants, and do not possess the monstrous features usually attributed to them in the bestiary tradition.<sup>105</sup> It is tempting to equate these unusual depictions of elephants with the travelling menageries of Emperor Frederick II (1194–1250), who is known to have brought his exotic collections of animals with him on campaigns in northern Italy, including an African elephant.<sup>106</sup> The famous account in Matthew Paris's *Chronica majora* describes this elephant's presence at the reception celebration granted to Richard of Cornwall, brother to King Henry III of England, in honour of his crusading triumphs, by Frederick II in Cremona in 1241. The *Chronica majora* account suggests a degree of familiarity—even through hearsay—with these animals in thirteenth-century northern Italy.<sup>107</sup>

Even if local elephant legends had no influence on the realism of these manuscript illustrations, the similarity between the two depictions in the Rotoli figurati is clear. The distinctive 'punctus elevatus'-like mark, used as a decoration on the coats of several large, cat-like beasts in the *Mappamondo* (figure 24), is also found on the clothing of the acolyte and Saint Stephen on the *Ecclesia* (figure 25). The strong paleographical and stylistic similarities of these elements of the *Mappamondo* and the *Ecclesia* support

---

<sup>105</sup> Evans, 'An Illustrated Fragment', pp. 14–68, at pp. 41–2; G. Druce, 'The Elephant in Medieval Legend and Art', *Archaeological Journal*, 76 (1919), pp. 1–73.

<sup>106</sup> D. Abulafia, *Frederick II: A Medieval Emperor* (London, 1988), at p. 54.

<sup>107</sup> S. Lewis, *The Art of Matthew Paris in the Chronica Majora* (Aldershot, 1987), at pp. 280–1, fig. 177. Another famous elephant, Abul Abaz, given to Charlemagne by the Abbāsid caliph Harun al-Rashid, is reported by the royal Frankish annals to have been overwintered in Vercelli in 809. See L. Brubaker, 'The Elephant and the Ark: Cultural and Material Interchange across the Mediterranean in the Eighth and Ninth Centuries', *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, 58 (2004), at p. 176.

the argument that these manuscripts were at least in part worked on by the same copyist.

The content of the Vercelli *Mappamondo* has also been instrumental in some key arguments for the dating and provenance of the document. Medieval world maps are often described as visual encyclopaedias, drawing together subjects, images, and tropes from medieval and classical learning, from biblical history, and from contemporary sources of geographical and political knowledge. This gathering together results in what von den Brincken has called an ‘effacement of chronological relations’, an important aspect to bear in mind when considering the *Mappamondo* as a whole.<sup>108</sup> Historical and contemporary cities are presented without differentiation, but in this case, the presence of contemporary cities provides a useful *terminus post quem*: in particular, the Lombard city of Alessandria, founded in 1167 and named for Pope Alexander III.<sup>109</sup> The increased number of cities and towns depicted for the regions of Italy and Spain was taken by Capello as an indicator of local interest and knowledge by the map’s creator, and therefore as an indication of the map’s provenance in Vercelli.

The representation of bodies of water is another striking feature of the map, as oceans and rivers alike appear as narrow threads across the surface. This effect is caused by the magnified depiction of islands, which expand to fill the oceans and seas in which they are found: this particularly distorts the appearance of the Mediterranean. As Capello noted, the *Mappamondo* is the only world map of the thirteenth century to place Paris on an island, which may indicate that the compiler knew of the existence of the two famous Parisian islands and considered this one of the characteristic features of the city. Other geographical and historical sites divide the landmasses: in the map’s north east, the Caucasus Mountains are a curved line ornamented with regular, wave-like forms — much like those on the Munich Isidore — with the legendary monumental Gates of Alexander (figure 26). These gates take a shape like the representative city-monuments, but have a crenelated roof and tall curved doors with carefully drawn

---

<sup>108</sup> von den Brincken, ‘Monumental Legends’, at p. 12.

<sup>109</sup> As noted by Capello, *Il Mappamondo medioevale di Vercelli*, at p. 118. By the late thirteenth century, maps were being produced of leading city-states in Northern Italy which share the early Vercelli *mappamundi*’s ideographic tradition of representing the world as a collection of towns. See Kupfer, ‘Lost Wheel Map’, pp. 286–310.

hinges. Close to the gates, there are other important sites from scripture: the resting place of Noah's Ark and the sepulchre of Saint Bartholomew at the site of his martyrdom (complete with a bell tower), in Armenia. Exotic animals and birds, scenes and strange peoples of the East are drawn with great energy and in some instances a remarkable closeness to life. One arresting scene to the right of Paradise shows a highly stylised tree, with a sun and crescent moon on either side (figure 27). Under the sun, three bearded priests gesture toward a kneeling king under the moon. This is the story of the oracular 'Tree of the Sun and Moon', and the king is Alexander the Great. Again, the flourishes and points used to add patterns and decoration to the figures' robes are distinctive and found throughout the diagram.

One scene which has been crucial for the dating of the manuscript to the third quarter of the thirteenth century is that of the 'ostrich rider' on Mount Atlas. On this peak in the lower part of the map, there is a large bird with a crowned rider, labelled *Philippus rex Francie* (figure 28).<sup>110</sup> The bird, like many of the creatures depicted on the map, had a moral interpretation according to the medieval bestiary tradition. This representation is more reminiscent of a duck: it has a long neck, short stocky legs, a substantial body with plumage decorated with horizontal rows of dots, two small horns or ears, and large cloven hooves. This body shape is taken from the textual tradition of the *Physiologus*.<sup>111</sup> It holds a horseshoe in its beak, identifying the bird as an ostrich. This image probably derives from the tradition that ostriches eat iron; the earliest image of the ostrich as an iron-eater can be found in an English manuscript from c. 1170.<sup>112</sup> The *Physiologus* does not mention iron eating, but this attribute is nonetheless widely known, as ostriches with iron horseshoes in their beaks can be seen in twelfth-century bestiaries, and the habit is described in Alexander Neckam's early thirteenth-century *De naturis rerum*. One widely circulated text describing the moral nature and eating habits of ostriches is Hugh of Fouillois's moral treatise on birds, *De Avibus*, which was composed between 1132–1152. As he was prior at the house of St.-Nicolas-de-Regny at

---

<sup>110</sup> See Capello, *Il Mappamondo medioevale di Vercelli*, at p. 110.

<sup>111</sup> W. B. Clark, *The Medieval Book of Birds: Hugh of Fouillois's Aviarium [De Avibus]* (Binghamton, NY, 1992), at p. 39.

<sup>112</sup> London, BL, Add. MS 11283, which can be viewed online at: [http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/Viewer.aspx?ref=add\\_ms\\_11283\\_fs001r](http://www.bl.uk/manuscripts/Viewer.aspx?ref=add_ms_11283_fs001r) [Accessed July 2018].

this time, it was probably directed to an audience of Augustinian canons. It was popular, surviving in nearly one hundred extant manuscripts. It is likely to have been accessible at some Victorine houses such as that of S. Andrea in Vercelli, which was active from the 1220s and will be discussed in the next chapter. The chapter on the ostrich, *De Strutio*, refers to Job 39:13; the remainder of the chapter is extracted directly from Gregory's *Moralia in Iob*.<sup>113</sup> The *Moralia* provided the root moral association of the ostrich with hypocrites: its wings are formed for flight, but flightless, and thus 'in its action does one thing, in its appearance displays another' (*quae in opere aliud exercuit, et in colore aliud ostendit*), like hypocrites who 'imitate a holy appearance, yet do not possess the truth of holy action'.<sup>114</sup> This association is probably a negative critique of the ostrich's rider. An ostrich (minus the rider), is found on both the Ebstorf and Hereford Map, as noted by von den Brincken.<sup>115</sup> The equivocal moral quality of ostriches perhaps reflects unfavourably on the perception of the *Phillipus rex Francie* depicted on the Vercelli *Mappamondo*. Further, any depiction of a rider on an animal that is not a horse is generally one indicating humiliation or wrongdoing of some kind. However, I am not aware of any other manuscript depiction of a king riding a bird that is so clearly identified with the bestiary tradition of the ostrich. A similar image of a figure riding a bird (in this case, a duck) is found in the English Macclesfield Psalter (c. 1320–1340) at folio 55r.<sup>116</sup> Stella Panayotova has commented on the image as a representation of a 'hobby-horse', a comedic inversion of the knight on horseback, suggesting a fool.<sup>117</sup> The three-strand object depicted in the Psalter suggests that the object held by the ostrich-rider of the *Mappamondo* is a conventional representation of a riding whip.<sup>118</sup> The ostrich rider of the Vercelli *Mappamondo* is found in a different location to that of the ostriches of the Hereford and Ebstorf maps, where it is found in northern Europe.

---

<sup>113</sup> Gregory the Great, *Moralia in Iob*, ed. M. Adriaen, CCSL (Turnhout, 1985), 143B, bk. 31. Selecting from chapters 9. 11–14; 10.15; 11.16; 12.17, 18, 19; 15. 27–28.

<sup>114</sup> 'Ita sunt nimirum omnes hypocritae qui dum bonorum vitam simulant, imitationem sanctae visionis habet, sed veritatem sanctae actionis non habent.' Translation from Hugh of Fouilloy, 'De Avibus', in *The Medieval Book of Birds: Hugh of Fouilloy's Aviarium [De Avibus]*, ed. W. B. Clark (Binghamton, NY, 1992), at pp. 189–99.

<sup>115</sup> Von den Brincken, 'Monumental Legends', p. 15.

<sup>116</sup> Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Museum, MS 1–2005, fol. 55r. See S. Panayotova, *The Macclesfield Psalter* (London, 2008), at p. 26.

<sup>117</sup> Stella Panayotova, *The Macclesfield Psalter* (London, 2008), p. 65.

<sup>118</sup> The object was one of confusion for von den Brincken in her earlier evaluation.

Its location on Mount Atlas could therefore have some specific meaning, identifying the figure with King Philip III of France ('the Bold', r. 1270–85). Leonid Chekin favours the interpretation of the ostrich figure as a representation of Philip III, because he was the only one of the three thirteenth-century kings of France to have been to Africa, although this was not a significant connection during Philip's reign. Von den Brincken's cautious assessment of this evidence presents a convincing identification of the figure. Philip III became de facto king in 1270, in Tunis, when his father and older brother, Louis IX, died of dysentery during the Eighth Crusade. Whether this identification is a commentary on contemporary attitudes towards King Philip III is difficult to determine. However, to identify the ostrich rider with Philip III would agree with the paleographic and stylistic dating of the manuscript to this period.

The sheer scale and density of information represented on the *Mappamondo* transmits to the viewer an authoritative, encyclopedic, and unified depiction of knowledge of the known world. From other thirteenth- and fourteenth-century *mappae mundi*, and demonstrated on the Hereford Map, it is evident that there is a clear correlation drawn between a visual statement of universal knowledge, and divine power and justice. A representation of the Last Judgement crowns the Hereford map, and the fragmentary Evesham map.<sup>119</sup> As Marcia Kupfer has pointed out, this resonates with Psalm 97: 7–8, in which the earth resounds at the Last Judgement: the sea, the world, the rivers, and the mountains. The symbolic resonance of *mappaemundi* can therefore be seen to function within a cosmological-eschatological framework. Monumental maps are striking art objects, but their complicated function in medieval visual and intellectual culture has been eloquently and definitively described by Kupfer in her canonical re-examination of scholarly approaches to these documents. Medieval world maps are 'elements subsumed within greater pictorial ensembles, architectural settings or intellectual projects'.<sup>120</sup> These interpretative frameworks are found elsewhere in the Vercelli Rotoli figurati, and other monumental, diagrammatic world maps will be further discussed in chapter three, below.

---

<sup>119</sup> E. Edson, 'The World View of the *Mappamundi* in the 13th Century', in *The World Map, 1300–1492: The Persistence of Tradition and Transformation* (Baltimore, 2007), at pp. 21–2.

<sup>120</sup> Kupfer, 'Medieval World Maps', at p. 264. See below, in chapter three.

## 1.7. Vercelli, Archivio Capitolare, Rotoli figurati, 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore)

This small single leaf parchment manuscript measures approximately 48 x 75 cm, and is unusually used both front and dorse (figures XIII–XIV). A large section is missing from the upper left corner, measuring nearly 15 x 20 cm, and a strip from the upper edge has been torn. There is also a clear hole through the parchment just below the damaged section, resulting in a significant amount of lost text. The entire upper half of the parchment has suffered staining from water damage, and this has particularly affected the legibility of the text on the dorse (the hair side of the parchment). Another series of holes across the width of the document in the lower third have thankfully only resulted in a few missing words. A vertical tear has occurred from the lower right edge. The conservation project completed in 2016 for this manuscript has flattened the document from its shape as a roll, and given a modern support which has also restored the rectangular shape of the sheet. Overall, the natural curvature of the animal skin is still visible, particularly on the right lateral and lower edges, suggesting that the parchment was not trimmed (similar to Rotoli figurati 1, and 4). The recto of the manuscript contains a mixture of texts and ‘tree’ type diagrams, broadly divided into two columns, the diagrams and their accompanying rubrics and inscriptions taking up the lower left and the entire right columns. Vertical and horizontal ruling guides the positioning of the diagrams, and the longer passages of text, indicating that the combination of content contained in this manuscript was planned to be presented as a coherent whole. A single scribe has completed the text and diagrams of the recto of this manuscript, all the work of Hand C, also found on Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*). However, there is a variation in the ink used, and the first long passage of text on the left is written in a much darker brown than the rest. This manuscript, like the *Ecclesia*, is therefore datable to the third quarter of the thirteenth century. The same hand has been responsible for the use of red ink, used to highlight certain points on the diagrams, or to decorate initial letters with infill or line colouring, to mark capital letters, paragraph marks, and for some simple decorative flourishes. The latter can be seen in the crown-like decoration added to the red roundel for *Christus iudex*, found at the top of the tree diagram on the



right side of the manuscript, and on the decorative marks added to the bell-shaped extension to the roundel for Adam, which extends at a right-angle from the roundel for *Iacob* approximately half way up the sheet and into the right margin (figure 29). These decorative aspects are limited, which would be natural for a scribe who was more used to completing text. This aptitude might explain the strangeness of the two rough figural drawings found at the base of the double lists on the lower left column (figure 30). Both appear to have heads, and wings, that have been formed by drawing outlines around the shape created by the lists of names of patriarchs, from the Old Testament (on the left), and the New (on the right). At the foot of each figure is the root of these generations: *ADAM ET EVA* on the left, and *AARON* on the right, written in poorly formed majuscules, and decorated with smudged red ink.

On the dorse, only the upper half of the parchment is used. The bulk of the text here is arranged into two horizontal registers, divided into seven columns. However, the final two columns of the upper register have been entirely lost to water or mould damage. A single hand is responsible for all the text in these two registers, written in a somewhat faded dark brown ink; this hand does not use paragraph marks, and there is no red ink used for detail within the text. This hand is unlikely to be the same as that on the recto of the manuscript, although it cannot be much later in date.<sup>121</sup> Below these two upper registers and close to the left lateral edge is an isolated note written in a late gothic hand. For the first three lines the annotator apparently attempted to write in verse (a caesura is marked in the centre of the line), but by the fourth has returned to prose. Altogether, the manuscript collects together several authentic works of the Calabrian abbot and exegete Joachim of Fiore: the *Genealogia sanctorum antiquorum patrum* [*Genealogia*] (1176),<sup>122</sup> *Epistola ad abbatem A. Veldonensis Monasterii* [*Epistola*]

---

<sup>121</sup> Mirella Ferrari has argued that the hand on the dorse of this manuscript is different from that found on the front, and further that this hand is not found elsewhere in the Rotoli figurati.

<sup>122</sup> The *Genealogia* is edited by G.-L. Potestà, including descriptions of the known manuscripts, in Joachim of Fiore, 'Genealogia' *Scripta Breviora*, at pp. 2-28. This most recent edition includes the testimony of the *Genealogia* on Rotoli figurati 7. It is known in the following manuscript versions, described in Potestà's edition: BAV, Vat. lat. 3822; BN, Lat. 3595; BN, Lat. 11864; Zwettl, Stiftsbibliothek Cod. 326, fol. 8v-9v.

(c.1170–7),<sup>123</sup> the diagram known as the *Trees of Ascending Generations*,<sup>124</sup> and another tree diagram often associated with the *Genealogia*, the *Figura arboris* (c.1187),<sup>125</sup> and on the dorse, *De septem sigillis*.<sup>126</sup> It is significant for our understanding of this document that this particular group of texts is also found in a small number of other known manuscripts of Joachim's work (this list does not include all the texts contained within these manuscripts):

1. BAV, Vat. lat. 3822, late 13<sup>th</sup>/early 14<sup>th</sup> century, Italian.<sup>127</sup> *De septem sigillis*, fol. 1vb–2rb; *Trees of Ascending Generations*, fol. 2va–3rb; *Genealogia*, fol. 3va–4ra; *Epistola*, fol. 4ra–b; *Figura arboris*, fol. 4v, 7r.

---

<sup>123</sup> The *Epistola* is edited by A. Patschovsky in the *Scripta breviora*, including description and references to the known manuscript versions: Joachim of Fiore, 'Epistola ad abbatem A. Veldonensis monasterii', in *Scripta breviora*, ed. A. Patschovsky (Rome, 2014), pp. 325–34. These are: BN, Lat. 3595, fol. 34r–35r; BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822, fol. 4ra–b; Wrocław, Biblioteka Uniwersytecka, Rehd. 280 fol. 13r–v.

<sup>124</sup> These are two parallel tree diagrams demonstrating the concordance of the Old and New Testament. They are found in: BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822, fol. 2v–3r; BN, Lat. 3595 fol. 22r–25r; BN, Lat. 11864, fol. 151v; Bruxelles, Bibliothèque Royale, MS II 924, fol. 3r. They are also found in the *Liber figurarum*: Oxford, Corpus Christi College, MS 255 A, ff. 5v–6r. The manuscript versions were described by Marjorie Reeves and Beatrice Hirsch-Reich, in *The Figurae of Joachim of Fiore*.

<sup>125</sup> The only edition of the *Figura arboris* is included within Potestà's earlier edition of the text and description of the known manuscript versions, this does not include the testimony of Rotoli figurati 7, but I will refer to it for reference while indicating any differences from Vercelli text: G.-L. Potestà, 'Die *Genealogia*: Ein frühes Werk Joachims von Fiore und die Anfänge seines Geschichtsbildes', *Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters*, 56 (2000), at pp. 97–101. The manuscripts containing the *Figura arboris*, not including Rotoli figurati 7, are: BN, Lat. 3595, fol. 29v–30v and BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822, fol. 4v, 7r. Elaborated versions of the *Figura arboris*, with much of the captions removed, are known from the *Liber figurarum*, as in Oxford, CCC 255A, fol. 9v–10r. See descriptions in Marjorie Reeves, 'The *Arbores* of Joachim of Fiore', *Papers of the British School at Rome*, 24 (1956), pp. 124–36; Reeves and Hirsch-Reich, *Figurae*.

<sup>126</sup> The *De septem sigillis* is edited from twelve manuscript versions (including BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822, fol. 1va, 2rb; BN, lat. 3595, fol. 25v–28r; BN, lat. 11864, fol. 152r) by Wannenmacher, *De septem sigillis*, pp. 336–55. It is also found in Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS II 924, fol. 1r–2v, alongside the *Trees of Ascending Generations*. For the latter reference I am grateful to Alexander Patschovsky for sharing his knowledge of this manuscript in personal communication (2016). The Brussels manuscript is described in T. Falmagne identified the text of *De septem sigillis* in this manuscript in 2001, and describes the manuscript in: *Un texte en contexte: les Flores paradisi et le milieu culturel de Villers-en-Brabant dans la première moitié du 13e siècle* (Turnhout, 2001), pp. 497–99. An older description is available in J. van den Gheyn, ed., *Catalogue des manuscrits de la Bibliothèque Royale de Belgique*, 2 vols (1902), II, pp. 56–7, no. 986. See also M. Rainini, 'I rotoli dei diagrammi di Vercelli fra Gioacchino da Fiore e Dolcino da Novara', in *Ordinare il mondo*, pp. 233–258.

<sup>127</sup> For a comprehensive description of the manuscript see J. Bignami Odier, J., 'Notes sur deux

2. BN, Lat. 3595, 14<sup>th</sup> century, French or Italian.<sup>128</sup> *Trees of Ascending Generations*, fol. 22r-25ra; *De septem sigillis*, fol. 25r-28ra; *Genealogia*, fol. 28r-29r; *Figura arboris*, fol. 29v-30v.

And partially in:

3. BN, Lat. 11864, late 12<sup>th</sup>/early 13<sup>th</sup> century, northern France.<sup>129</sup> *Trees of Ascending Generations*, fol. 151v; *Genealogia*, fol. 151v-152va; *De septem sigillis*, fol. 152r.
4. Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, II 924, late 12<sup>th</sup>/early 13<sup>th</sup> century.<sup>130</sup> *De septem sigillis*, *Trees of Ascending Generations*, fol. 1r-2v.

These manuscripts will form the basis for the main points of comparison for the texts of Rotoli figurati 7.

## *Genealogia*

Although partially damaged, the text that once filled the upper left column of the parchment down to the first rubric is the *Genealogia*.<sup>131</sup> This is Joachim's earliest surviving work, in which he first explores his understanding of salvation history as two great overarching periods, that of the Old Testament and the New, and is already using diagrams to articulate that understanding. Joachim's innovation was to demonstrate how

---

manuscripts de la bibliothèque du Vatican contenant des traités inédits de Joachim de Flore', *Mélanges d'archéologie et d'histoire*, 54/1 (1937), pp. 211-41, at pp. 215-6, 219-35. I have consulted this manuscript in person, and it is now digitised at: <[https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS\\_Vat.lat.3822](https://digi.vatlib.it/view/MSS_Vat.lat.3822)>

<sup>128</sup> Description in Wannenmacher, *De septem sigillis*, pp. 281-5. This manuscript is digitised and available at: <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b90809619>>.

<sup>129</sup> Description in Wannenmacher, *De septem sigillis*, p. 285. This manuscript is digitised and available at: <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b9065867f>>

<sup>130</sup> Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS II 924, fol. 1v-2r. I have not consulted this manuscript in person or seen images of the page, and was alerted to the shared layout of the *De septem sigillis* with Rotoli figurati 7 by Alexander Patschovsky in personal communication.

<sup>131</sup> The edited text of the *Genealogia* is divided into four sections; on Rotoli figurati 7 only sections 3 and 4 are legible. G.-L. Potestà has observed minor differences: Joachim of Fiore, 'Genealogia sanctorum antiquorum patrum', in *Scripta breviora*, ed. G.-L. Potestà (Rome, 2014), pp. 2-28, at p. 10.

the events of the Old Testament, in particular the tribulations of the people of Israel, provided a prefiguration for the persecutions of the Church from the time of the New Testament, the tribulations and persecutions being further signified by the seven seals, and their openings, of Apocalypse 6: 1–17, 8:1. Joachim's theme of concordance are developed to their fullest extent in his major late work, the *Liber de concordia*.<sup>132</sup> The particular way the content of the *Genealogia* appears elsewhere in his corpus has recently led to this shorter work being described as a 'text-container'.<sup>133</sup> This phrase is used to describe those works of Joachim's which synthesise materials which may have pre-existed and transmitted independently. The complexity of dating Joachim's works, containing ideas that he continuously returned to and refined over his lifetime, led to Valeria De Fraja coining this descriptive, if inelegant, phrase to identify those shorter works of the abbot which synthesise diverse material from different periods.<sup>134</sup>

The text is divided into four sections, of which only the last two are visible here. However, Potestà's edition demonstrates that there are only minor changes from the other known manuscript versions.<sup>135</sup> This work of Joachim's begins with an explanation of a double tree figure which grows from Adam to the Second Coming.<sup>136</sup> Joachim describes how this tree ascends from Adam, to Jacob, to Ozia, and then to Christ. The New Testament history begins in the time of the biblical king Ozia, contemporary with Isaiah, whom Joachim considered a protoevangelist.<sup>137</sup> The growth of this bipartite tree allows a precise calculation and representation of the generations of history, which

---

<sup>132</sup> The authenticity of this work was doubted for a long time, until Kurt-Victor Selge established clear connections with Joachim's later *Praefatio super Apocalypsim*: K.-V. Selge, 'Eine Einführung Joachims von Fiore in die Johannesapokalypse', *Deutsches Archiv für Erforschung des Mittelalters*, 46 (1990), pp. 102–131. See also S. E. Wessley, 'A New Writing of Joachim of Fiore: Preliminary Observations', in *Prophecy and Eschatology*, ed. M. Wilks (Oxford, 1994), pp. 15–28.

<sup>133</sup> 'Testo-contenitore', see the introduction by G.-L. Potestà, *Genealogia*, pp. 3–4.

<sup>134</sup> V. De Fraja, 'Percorso storico e significato del monachesimo benedettino nell'*Expositio vite et regule beati Benedicti* di Gioacchino da Fiore', *Cristianesimo nella storia*, 22 (2001), pp. 381–435.

<sup>135</sup> These are Paris, BN, Lat. 3595 (14<sup>th</sup> century, France or Italy); BN, Lat. 11864 (late 12<sup>th</sup>/early 13<sup>th</sup> century, Corbie); BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822 (late 13<sup>th</sup>/early 14<sup>th</sup> century, uncertain provenance, likely to be Cistercian or Franciscan); Zwettl, Stiftsbibliothek, Cod. 326 (late 12<sup>th</sup>/early 13<sup>th</sup> century, provenance Burgundy). These manuscripts are described in the edition of Potestà, pp. 9–12.

<sup>136</sup> The tree described by the text of the *Genealogia*, is confusingly not the same as the *Figura arboris*. Instead it is a double-tree; discussed under the *Figura arboris* section below.

<sup>137</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 18, ll. 3–6. See discussion in the introduction to the *Genealogia*, pp. 5–7.

proceed from the worldly (*carnalis*) to the spiritual. The phase of time between Ozia and Christ is both worldly and spiritual, a period of transition. Further, the abbot writes that at the time he composed the text, in the year 1176 when he was abbot at Corazzo, only two generations remained in which what has been said about Antichrist and the end of time will occur.<sup>138</sup> He also introduces the space of time of forty-five days after the defeat of Antichrist, taken from Daniel, a theme which he drew from other commentators.<sup>139</sup> In this text we see how the abbot's method of interpreting the concordance between the two testaments allowed calculations to be made about the number of generations within the entirety of salvific history, until the end of the world. There are two branches of the genealogy, of which the first comprises sixty-three generations beginning with Adam and continuing through the patriarchs, before coming to fruition in Christ. The second of the two ages and the second phase of sixty-three generations continued from the advent of Christ until the end of time.<sup>140</sup> Further, the text designates forty-two 'worldly' generations in the name of the fathers before Christ; from Christ the forty-two 'spiritual' generations are indicated by thirty-year spans.<sup>141</sup> Joachim writes that there is the same number of 'worldly' generations of the *Sinagoga* as there are spiritual generations of the Church.<sup>142</sup>

In the second section, Joachim describes the division of the world into six ages, the sixth beginning with Christ. The first is from Adam to Noah, the second ends in Abraham, the third in David, the fourth in the transmigration of Babylon, the fifth in the Incarnation, and the sixth in the Judgement.<sup>143</sup> The sixth age is divided into six smaller ages.<sup>144</sup> The tribulations suffered by the twelve tribes of Israel are placed in parallel concordance with the persecutions endured by the Church. The third section, which we can read on Rotoli figurati 7, explains in more detail how the seven tribulations of the tribes of Israel are signs which are fulfilled in the persecutions of the Church. The first set of tribulations are the closed seals of the Apocalypse; the openings

---

<sup>138</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 19–20, ll. 14–15, 1–3.

<sup>139</sup> W. Kamlah, *Apokalypse und Geschichtstheologie: die mittelalterliche Auslegung der Apokalypse vor Joachim von Fiore* (Berlin, 1935), 21.

<sup>140</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 19, ll. 5–9.

<sup>141</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 19, ll. 11–12.

<sup>142</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 19, ll. 12–13.

<sup>143</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 23, ll. 1–6.

<sup>144</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 23, ll. 16–7.

of the seals are the second set, the persecutions of the Church. In this section the persecutors of the Church, the last of which will be the Antichrist, are named.

The fourth, very brief, section of the *Genealogia* departs from the explanation of the double series of tribulations, but continues with further exegesis of the book of the Apocalypse. Here, Joachim divides the Apocalypse into seven parts, a method which Potestà notes is derived from Bede, and labels the groups of people who are the protagonists of the conflict (*bello*) at each phase of the history of the Church.<sup>145</sup> This section, to a more extreme degree than the others, highlights how this ‘text-container’ summarises different schematic points of Joachim’s understanding of salvation history. We should also note that this early stage of Joachim’s historical theology is still working to a binary model; he has not yet begun to develop the Trinitarian structure which would characterise his later works. The change in focus within the *Genealogia* explains Stephen E. Wessley’s description of the text as ‘instructional writing’, with its summarising schematic style reflecting how it was designed to be read in support of a diagram.<sup>146</sup> Understanding the work as a ‘text-container’ also enables us to better appreciate the function of this unusual summary style, and how the multiple texts of Rotoli figurati 7 refer to and complement one another. The shorter passages of text accompanying the *Figura arboris* and the *Trees of Ascending Generations* refer to Joachim’s explanation of salvific history as expanded upon in the *Genealogia*.

## *Epistola*

The other text on the recto of Rotoli figurati 7 begins just below the end of the *Genealogia* text on the left, indicated by the rubric ‘Epistola Ioachim’. This text is only twenty-two lines long, some of it lost to a hole in the parchment. It continues the apocalyptic themes found in the *Genealogia*, but includes them in the form of a warning addressed to the abbot of a monastery of ‘Veldona’ (*Veldonensis*). The text of the Vercelli manuscript was included in the most recent edition, edited by Alexander Patschovsky.<sup>147</sup>

---

<sup>145</sup> *Genealogia*, p. 6.

<sup>146</sup> Wessley, ‘A New Writing’, at p. 47. See also Potestà, *Genealogia*, p. 9.

<sup>147</sup> Joachim of Fiore, ‘*Epistola ad abbatem A. Veldonensis monasterii*’, pp. 325–34. I am indebted to

Research recently undertaken by Patschovsky has argued that the version of the *Epistola* in Rotoli figurati 7 is the oldest testimony of this letter of Joachim's, and takes an independent transmission history from the three other known manuscript versions.<sup>148</sup> Dated by Patschovsky to between 1170 and 1177, this work is roughly contemporary to the *Genealogia*.<sup>149</sup> The Vercelli testimony adds several details to the content of the letter which might prove to be significant, including the name of the monastery as 'Veldona' rather than the 'Vuldona' or 'Valdona' supplied by other versions. The first letter (A) of the name of the monastery's abbot is supplied, along with the name of the messenger who delivers the letter: *Aluaudus*. Although the monastery of 'Veldona' has yet to be identified with any certainty, the Cistercian house of Barona close to Pavia, founded c.1187, is a plausible suggestion.<sup>150</sup> The content of this letter is eschatological, warning the recipient of the imminent apocalypse.

### *Trees of Ascending Generations*

The first two diagrams which ascend from the two figures on the lower left of Rotoli figurati 7 demonstrate the parallel generations of the Old and New Testaments, to the first and second Advents (figure 30). The first begins in Adam and Eve at the base of the figure, whose wings spread into the tribes of Israel, with Abraham, Isaac and Jacob listed

---

Professor Alexander Patschovsky for his kindness during our discussions of this manuscript, and his generosity in sharing his work with me prior to publication. Previously, the text has been edited, from the version in the Vatican manuscript (BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822), by J. Bignami-Odier: 'Notes sur deux manuscrits', pp. 211–41.

<sup>148</sup> Joachim of Fiore, '*Epistola ad abbatem A. Veldonensis monasterii*', at pp. 315–24.

<sup>149</sup> I am grateful to Professor Patschovsky for sharing his thoughts on the dating of this text in personal communication.

<sup>150</sup> A. Patschovsky summarised the difficulties in identifying the abbot and the monastery in Joachim of Fiore, '*Epistola ad abbatem A. Veldonensis monasterii*', pp. 320–22. He observes that the formal greetings in the letter suggest that a long journey has been undertaken by the messenger who has delivered the letter, and further notes that the name of the messenger—*Aluaudus*— is Germanic in origin. Bignami-Odier notes the variants of *Valdonensi* or *Vuldonensi*, and refers to the Cistercian abbey of Barona near Pavia (Bignami Odier, 'Notes sur deux manuscrits', 226, n. 2.). The abbey is described in L. Janauschek, *Originum Cisterciensium* (Vienna, 1877), I, 216. Janauschek observed variant names for Barona: 'Vardona, Valdona', 'Sardona', 'Bardone, Sardone'. This identification of the abbey is also followed by B. McGinn in B. McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality: Treatises and Letters of Lactantius, Adso of Montier-En-Der, Joachim of Fiore, the Franciscan Spirituals, Savonarola* (London, 1980), 291. The latter volume contains a translation of the letter in English (at pp. 118–9), again from Vat. Lat. 3822 but supplemented from Paris, BN, Lat. 3595.

within the head. The ascending forty-two generations are in parallel from *Ioseph* and *Iudas* to the conclusion of the Old Testament at the top, with *Iohannes Batista* and the *primus adventus Christi*. In parallel, and on the right, the winged figure contains the names of Aaron, Zacharias, John the Baptist, Christ, and the Apostles. Above, a list of popes –one for each thirty-year generation– ascends from Peter to Alexander III. Spaces are left next to the years 1200, 1230, and 1260. Above this a rubric indicates the *secundus adventus Christi*, and the end of the New Testament. Their layout on the sheet is quite cramped; the copyist has at points struggled to find space for the longer captions, especially where the diagram encroaches on the *Figura arboris*. More highly decorated and clearly laid out versions of these diagrams are incorporated within the *Liber figurarum*. For example, in the earliest of the *Liber figurarum* manuscripts (Oxford, CCC, MS 255 A, fols. 5v–6r; figures 31 and 32), we can how the short passages of text are precisely aligned to particular points on the ascending generations.

These tree figures are also found in the Vatican manuscript (BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822, fols. 2v–3r, figure 33), arranged across facing folios. The copyist of this late thirteenth-century manuscript has made extensive use of red ink to guide the reader in how the text and figures relate across the densely packed pages. One example of how these inked lines guide the reader is in the instance of a short passage of text found outlined in red between the two figures at the bottom left of Rotoli figurati 7 beginning ‘Concordia veteris testamenti et novi...’ (for this text on Rotoli figurati 7, see figure 30). In the Vatican manuscript Vat. Lat. 3822, this text is split into two boxes, each sentence broken across the page boundaries, with the halves linked by red lines (figure 33). This choice strongly suggests that the copyist was working from an exemplar with a layout which he struggled to adjust to the page in front of him. The importance of maintaining the parallel layout of the Trees of Ascending Generations further indicates that their placement is meaningful, and was designed to visually convey Joachim’s concept of concordance.

Similar strategies for maintaining a complex visual layout in codex form can be seen in an earlier, late twelfth-century Paris manuscript, BN Lat. 11864. Here, the two trees are arranged on a single folio, the double tree of the Old and Testaments beside the list of popes, recorded from the time of Christ to the second Advent (fol. 151v, figure 34). The careful ruling on these pages includes division into columns, which



overall presents a much clearer arrangement of the figures and their associated captions. Unlike the Vatican manuscript, the presentation of the Tribes of Israel from Jacob, and the apostles around Christ, are arranged in parallel lists which in part explain the wing-like arrangement of these names in Rotoli figurati 7. The text beginning ‘Concordia veteris testamenti...’ is here arranged across the base of the page. Below this, in the final six lines of the folio and arranged in two columns, is the *Genealogia*. The text here is read across the bottom of folio 151v, and continues linked by pen lines, read across to the final five ruled lines of folio 152r. On folio 152v, the *Genealogia* then continues in earnest in the first column, followed by Joachim’s letter *Universis Christi fidelibus*. On folio 152r, the *Genealogia* text is found underneath the *De Septem Sigillis*, which here is arranged in four columns, each seal opposite its opening, read down and across the page. This complex layout suggests again that the copyist was working from an exemplar where these texts were arranged in a layout larger than a typical codex page.

The evidence that copyists have had to adapt their strategies to fit these figures on to a manuscript page, to divide certain passages of text cross over page boundaries, and in some cases to confuse the meaning of the figure by haphazard rearrangement, strongly suggests that the copyists of the Vatican and Paris (BN, Lat. 11864) manuscripts have attempted to translate the texts from an original layout on a large parchment into a smaller manuscript. The arrangement of tree figures from these manuscript exemplars suggests that the archetype of the tree figures of the ascending generations, and the *Figura arboris*, was composed and transmitted as a single leaf parchment. What we see in Rotoli figurati 7 can therefore be plausibly understood as closer to the earliest form in which these works might have been disseminated in the late twelfth century, a form which privileged the clarity and layout of the diagrams.<sup>151</sup>

---

<sup>151</sup> This has also been observed independently by Marco Rainini, now published as ‘I rotoli dei diagrammi di Vercelli fra Gioacchino da Fiore e Dolcino da Novara’, in *Ordinare il mondo*, pp. 233–258.

## *Figura arboris*

The tree diagram described by the *Genealogia* is not considered the same as the *Figura arboris* with which it is associated in the manuscript tradition.<sup>152</sup> The *Genealogia* dates to the time of Pope Alexander III (1159–1181), but in the *Figura arboris* of BN, Lat. 3595, BAV, Lat. 3822 and here in Rotoli figurati 7, the diagram has added the names of Lucius III (1181–1185), and Urban III (1185–1187). Recent studies have generally agreed that Joachim amended the diagram associated the *Genealogia*, without amending the text, during the pontificate of Urban III.<sup>153</sup>

Potestà and Rainini have both observed that the diagram described by the *Genealogia* must be closer in type to the generational tree diagrams transmitted in the *Liber figurarum*.<sup>154</sup> This collection of Joachim's diagrams was perceived as a coherent authentic work by its earliest editors, Leone Tondelli, Marjorie Reeves, and Beatrice Hirsch-Reich.<sup>155</sup> Any isolated diagrams (like those found in BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822), were understood as fragments of the *Liber figurarum*.

However, it is important for our understanding of the figures on Rotoli figurati 7 to emphasise that recent research by Rainini has convincingly demonstrated that the *Liber figurarum* should also be considered a 'text-container', as the diagrams contained within it represent distinct stages of development in Joachim's thought. These diagrams had independent functions and uses and circulated independently or as support to written works: the *Liber figurarum* as a consolidated collection of visual representations of Joachim's thought did not crystallise until decades after the abbot's death.<sup>156</sup> The diagrams of the *Liber figurarum* closest to that described in the *Genealogia* text are the 'Trees of the Two Advents of Christ', as found in the early thirteenth-century

---

<sup>152</sup> The discrepancies between the diagram as described in the text of the *Genealogia* and that found associated with it in the manuscript versions are discussed in detail by Rainini, *Disegni dei tempi*, pp. 41–3. The 14<sup>th</sup>-century French or Italian manuscript (BN Lat. 3595, fols. 29v–30v) contains a simplified version of the tree-figure. The late 13th century witness in BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822 also contains tree-figures, on fol. 4v and 7r.

<sup>153</sup> See discussion in Potestà, *Genealogia*, p. 8, and Rainini, *Disegni dei tempi*, p. 41.

<sup>154</sup> Potestà, *Il tempo dell'Apocalisse*, pp. 27–8; Rainini, *Disegni dei tempi*.

<sup>155</sup> Reeves and Hirsch-Reich, *Figurae*; Reeves, Tondelli and Hirsch-Reich, *Il libro delle figure*.

<sup>156</sup> M. Rainini, 'Il *Liber figurarum* come problema storiografico', *Florentia*, 18/19 (2004), pp. 213–44; *Disegni dei tempi*; 'Gli alberi di Gioacchino da Fiore', pp. 403–32.

manuscript at Oxford, Corpus Christi College, MS 255A, fol. 10v (figure 35).<sup>157</sup> The *Figura arboris* in the fourteenth-century BAV Vat. Lat. 3822, on fol. 7r, is drawn with the same distinctive kink in the tree: the section from Adam to Jacob extends at right angles from the main part of the tree (figure 36). This indicates a link between the two manuscripts that is not yet explained; as these diagrams continue to be studied as an important aspect of Joachim's corpus, rather than as a visual addendum, the relationship between the manuscripts which include testimonies of these works will be further elucidated.

### *De septem sigillis*

Joachim's systems of concordance between the seven seals of the Apocalypse and the double series of seven tribulations suffered by the Jewish and Christian peoples is also the theme of the text on the dorse, the *De septem sigillis*.<sup>158</sup> Although part of this text is lost as a result of the damage to the upper part of the manuscript, it is possible to see that the work was laid out in a grid of eight columns, with two rows, the seals above their respective openings (figure XIV). The concordance system means that the sufferings still to come for the Church are listed under the sixth and seventh seals: the final persecutor of the Church will be *Gog* (Ezekiel 38–48), rather than Antichrist as in the *Genealogia* and the *Figura arboris*. The dating of this work of Joachim's is uncertain. On the basis that the *De septem sigillis* fully expresses the themes of the double series of tribulation explored elsewhere, it has often been argued to be a later work of Joachim's.<sup>159</sup> Bernard McGinn has argued for an early dating, based on the way the text

---

<sup>157</sup> As observed by Potestà, *Genealogia*, p. 8, and Rainini, *Disegni dei tempi*, pp. 41–3.

<sup>158</sup> This will be edited as part of the critical edition of Joachim's works being published as part of the *Fonti per la storia dell'Italia medievale antiquitatis* series in Rome, edited by A. Patschovsky, R. E. Lerner, G.-L. Potestà, R. Rusconi, and K.-V. Selge. The current edition is Joachim of Fiore, 'De septem sigillis', in *Hermeneutik der Heilgeschichte: De septem sigillis und die sieben Siegel im werk Joachims von Fiore*, ed. J. E. Wannenmacher (Leiden, 2005), pp. 336–55.

<sup>159</sup> J. E. Wannenmacher believes it to be one of the latest, written around 1200. A. Gatto has more recently argued for a late dating (1196–8) based on the role of the Antichrist in the opening of the last two seals. See B. McGinn, *The Calabrian Abbot: Joachim of Fiore in the History of Western Thought* (New York, 1985), pp. 34–6; Wannenmacher, *De septem sigillis*, pp. 248–51; A. Gatto, 'A Proposal for a Dating of *De Septem Sigillis* of Joachim of Fiore', *Inicijal*, 2 (2014), pp. 117–36.

summarises the double persecutions of the Old and New Testaments prefigured in the Seven Seals on a binary pattern of concord between the two testaments. Joachim's theology later evolved into a Trinitarian hermeneutic theory, with salvific history divided into three stages: the age of the Father under Mosaic law, the age of the Son under the Gospel, and finally a coming age of the Spirit. This tertiary division of history is not found in the *De septem sigillis*. Marjorie Reeves also noted that the text makes use only of the pattern of twos, and cautiously observed similarities with the historical figures which might place it close to the *Liber figurarum* in date, which Reeves understood as representing the latest stages of Joachim's thinking.<sup>160</sup> However, Alexander Patschovsky places the dating in the 1190s, closer in agreement to the recent work of Gatto.<sup>161</sup> The version of the *De Septem Sigillis* on Rotoli figurati 7 is not derived from a San Giovanni in Fiore exemplar, but probably from a later collection of Joachimist materials.<sup>162</sup>

In the manuscript tradition, this work of Joachim's is frequently laid out as a grid. It is included at the beginning of the early thirteenth-century Oxford *Liber figurarum* (CCC 255A, fol. 4vab, figure 37), where the seals and their openings are arranged side by side, read down each column. The manner of presenting the seals and their openings on Rotoli figurati 7, as a vertical arrangement is only known from one other extant manuscript version of the *De septem sigillis*, that in Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS II 924. The mode of presenting the *De septem sigillis* alongside the other texts on a single leaf is unique in the known manuscript tradition of this text; other versions are bound into a codex.<sup>163</sup> Unusually, however, the text consistently refers to

---

<sup>160</sup> M. Reeves and B. Hirsch-Reich, 'The Seven Seals in the Writings of Joachim of Fiore: With Special Reference to the Tract *De Septem Sigillis*', *RTAM*, 1954, pp. 212–47.

<sup>161</sup> A. Patschovsky, in personal communication with the author, 2014.

<sup>162</sup> The abbey church at San Giovanni in Fiore (Calabria) was the seat of the Florentian order founded by Joachim during his lifetime, instrumental in copying and disseminating Joachim's works after his death. For an overview of the development of the Florentian order, see: V. De Fraja, *Oltre Cîteaux: Gioacchino da Fiore e l'ordine fiorense* (Rome, 2006).

<sup>163</sup> The *De septem sigillis* is found in thirteen manuscripts including the Vercelli witness: Padua, Biblioteca Antoniana, MS 322, fol. 166; BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822, fol. 1va–2vb; Milan, Bibl. Ambros., H 15 inf., fol. 64ra–vb; Bruges, Stedelijke Openbare Bibl., MS 86, fol. 100r–101r; Oxford, Corpus Christi College Library, MS 255A, fol. 4; I have consulted the Padua, Vatican, Milan, Oxford, and Bruges manuscripts personally. The two manuscripts from the BN: Lat. 11864, fol. 152 (mid-thirteenth century), and Lat. 3595, fol. 25–28 (14<sup>th</sup> century), are digitised and available

itself as a ‘carta’ (*qui videntur notati in hac carta simpliciter attendendi*). This word is maintained even in the codex versions, which might indicate that the Vercelli manuscript retains the format and arrangement of an earlier kind of transmission.<sup>164</sup>

Certainly, the *Genealogia* (with *Figura arboris*), the *Epistola*, and the *De septem sigillis* are found together in two other thirteenth-century manuscripts: BAV, Vat. Lat. 3822 and BN, Lat. 3595. The Brussels manuscript mentioned above contains the *De septem sigillis* and two tree diagrams, and in another Parisian manuscript (BN, Lat. 1864, fol. 152), we find the *Genealogia* (without *Figura arboris*) and *De septem sigillis*. This agrees with Marco Rainini’s suggestion that the copyist of the Brussels manuscript had access to a version of the *De Septem Sigillis* and *Figura arboris* collated together in the same format, and therefore that the concept for the collation of these texts seen on Vercelli Rotoli figurati 7 was drawn from an early thirteenth-century Joachimist source.<sup>165</sup>

### *Liber figurarum*

The *De septem sigillis*, the *Trees of Ascending Generations*, and a tree diagram of the two advents which is like the *Figura arboris* are also included in perhaps the most well-known example of Joachim’s symbolic theology, the *Liber figurarum*. This collection of diagrams is known through an edited version based on three important codices, the first of which was discovered by Leone Tondelli in 1936 in Reggio Emilia. The earliest manuscript, dating from 1200–1230, and probably originating from San Giovanni in Fiore, is Oxford, Corpus Christi College MS 255A.<sup>166</sup> The images within the *Liber figurarum* represent different stages of development in the abbot’s thought, including the

---

online. For the remaining manuscripts I have relied upon the descriptions in Wannenmacher’s edition. This recent edition of the *De septem sigillis* incorporates the testimony of twelve known manuscript, not including Vercelli.

<sup>164</sup> For example, BN, Lat. 3595, fol. 27, *carta*; Bruges, Stedelijke Openbare Bibl., MS 86, fol. 100v, *quarta*.

<sup>165</sup> M. Rainini, ‘I rotoli dei diagrammi di Vercelli fra Gioacchino da Fiore e Dolcino da Novara’, *Ordinare il mondo*, pp. 235–6.

<sup>166</sup> Reeves, Tondelli and Hirsch-Reich, *Il libro delle figure*. This edition refers to three manuscripts of the *Liber figurarum*: Reggio Emilia, Biblioteca del Seminario Vescovile, R1, fol. 1r–20v (c. 1220–1240); Oxford, CCC MS 255A, fol. 5r–17r; Dresden, Sächsische Landesbibliothek, A 121, fol. 87r–96v (mid-13<sup>th</sup> century).

earliest visualisation of his system of concordance in the *Figura arboris* but also compositions which reflect his later Trinitarian readings of salvific history.<sup>167</sup> It is important to note here that recent work by Marco Rainini has convincingly argued that the *Liber figurarum* is a collection of Joachim's authentic diagrams which was gathered together shortly after his death by the monks of San Giovanni in Fiore, perhaps to prevent them being lost. Rainini understands the diagrams in this collection to have had their own history of circulation and transmission, either alone or supporting other written works, prior to being understood after the abbot's death as part of a coherent figure collection.<sup>168</sup> As we have seen from the discussion of the *Figura arboris*, the *Liber figurarum* should be considered another 'text-container', in the sense that it incorporates image-heavy works by Joachim developed at different stages and containing ideas which visually develop and draw from other known works.

### *Arrangement of Texts*

In describing the works of Joachim of Fiore found on Rotoli figurati 7, we have observed that this collection of texts is found together in several manuscript versions: Vat. lat. 3822, BN, Lat. 3595, partially in BN Lat. 11864, and Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, MS II. 924. The repeated presentation of the *Genealogia*, the *Figura arboris*, the *Trees of Ascending Generations*, and the *De Septem Sigillis* together suggests there may have been an archetype which assembled these texts. In examining the other manuscript versions, we have observed distinctive idiosyncrasies of layout, particularly in the arrangement of the *Figura arboris* and *Trees of Ascending Generations*. We have also noted that the order in which these works are found varies. Comparing these texts with their layout in a single leaf on Rotoli figurati 7, and where they are found in the larger format of the Oxford *Liber figurarum*, we have been able to see how the manuscript copyists have often made adaptations to incorporate these works into a codex format: arranging the *De septem sigillis* into a grid, or allowing text to be read in sections across

---

<sup>167</sup> For an overview of Joachim's Trinitarian doctrine, see: P. Gemeinhardt, 'Joachim the Theologian: Trinitarian Speculation and Doctrinal Debate', in *A Companion to Joachim of Fiore*, pp. 41–87.

<sup>168</sup> Rainini, *Disegni dei tempi*, p. 65.

multiple pages underneath facing page parallels of the tree figures, dividing passages (even vertically across sentences) to be read across pages, with the reader guided by connecting lines of red ink.

These adaptive strategies strongly suggest that copyists were working from exemplars arranged in a single-sheet format. The peculiarities of layout observed reflect the difficulties of translating these texts from roll to codex, while the flexibility of order further suggests that copyists had a choice in how they placed the works in succession. Although the layout of works on Rotoli figurati 7 is unlikely to represent the archetype, it is significant that the Vercelli testimonies of the *Epistola*, the *Figura arboris*, and the *Genealogia* have been demonstrated to be early versions of these works.<sup>169</sup> It is therefore probable that the arrangement of texts and figures in the single leaf format of Rotoli figurati 7 is the only known example of an early, accurate, and highly visual format in which Joachim's works circulated from an early date.

Furthermore, in captions accompanying the *Trees of Ascending Generations*, and in a passage within the *De septem sigillis*, the author uses the descriptive term 'carta'. In the *De septem sigillis*, under the opening of the fifth seal, the text reads: 'termini qui videntur notati in hac carta simpliciter attendendi'.<sup>170</sup> In the tree diagram, in a reference to the *Horologium Achaz*, the text reads: 'Quos videlicet gradus in hac carta diligenter notavimus et misterii huius oscuritatem qualicumque ostensione designare curavimus' (my emphasis). This terminology is maintained even where the manuscript is copied into a codex, although sometimes the copyist changes *carta* to *liber*, as in Padua, Biblioteca Antoniana, MS 322. The use of the term *carta* —meaning a sheet or page— in the earliest known testimonies of these works strongly suggests that Joachim of Fiore used this term to refer to the format in which these works were originally designed to be circulated. In the early testimonies of these works on Rotoli figurati 7, the word 'carta' is maintained. These crucial details, in combination with the evidence observed

---

<sup>169</sup> A. Patschovsky understands the text of the *Epistola* on Rotoli figurati 7 to be the earliest known testimony of this letter. M. Rainini has argued that the Vercelli *Genealogia* and the *Figura arboris* are also early testimonies of these works. Joachim of Fiore, '*Epistola ad abbatem A. Veldonensis monasterii*', pp. 325–34; Rainini, 'Fra Gioacchino da Fiore e Dolcino da Novara'.

<sup>170</sup> Joachim of Fiore, '*De septem sigillis*', at pp. 347–8. Wannenmacher discusses the implications of the terminology for the use of the text at pp. 217–25 in the same volume.

from discussion of the individual works above, make it plausible to infer that Rotoli figurati 7 represents a visual exemplar for how these early works of Joachim might originally have been circulated<sup>171</sup>

### *The note of 1307*

The remaining text on the manuscript dorse is an extraordinary note in an early fourteenth-century hand which issues a warning to the reader, that the contents of the manuscript should not be used for ‘seeking out the end of the world’:

Noli vexari finem hic querere mundi.  
Fantasia ista vana est atque falsa.  
Namque si vera foret iam dudum mundus abesset.

Quia anno Domini MCCLXo completa debent esse  
omnia que dicuntur de Antichristo et de consumatione seculi  
secundum Iohacistas, ut patet in descriptione, cum tamen modo  
currat annus domini MCCCVII. q.

Do not trouble yourself with seeking out the end of the world here. This fantasy is vain and also false. For if this were true, then already, some little time ago, the world would be gone. Because in the year of the Lord 1260 should have been completed all things which are said about the Antichrist and about the finishing of the world according to the Joachists, as is laid clear in this diagram, when however just now it is the year of our Lord 1307. q.<sup>172</sup>

The hand of this short passage corroborates the internal dating of 1307. In combination with the warning against *Iohacistas* [Joachists], this date is highly suggestive, as this was the very year in which the leaders of a heterodox religious group called the Order of the Apostles were captured, and executed in Vercelli. Their charismatic leader, Dolcino of Novara, believed himself to be a prophet, co-opting elements of thirteenth-century interpretations of Joachim of Fiore. As we shall explore in more detail in chapters 5 and 6 below, this note draws a remarkable connection between the Rotoli figurati manuscripts and tragic events in Vercelli related to the ecclesiastical persecution of a radical religious group associated with the thought of Joachim of Fiore. The note is also highly significant testimony to the reception of Joachim of Fiore’s works in the early

---

<sup>171</sup> This has been independently observed by Rainini, in: Rainini, ‘Fra Gioacchino da Fiore e Dolcino da Novara’ (forthcoming).

<sup>172</sup> The *q* that remains after the year might perhaps be the initial of the annotator.



fourteenth century. The implications of these connections will be the focus of discussion in chapter six. It is unlikely, given the most plausible provenance of this manuscript, that the individual who wrote this note was unaware of these events, and of the widespread association of Dolcino with heretical 'Joachist' apocalyptic speculation. Instead, this note serves as a direct commentary on the changing reception of Joachim of Fiore's works in northern Italy; the broader implications of this extraordinary note are the focus of chapter six below.

## Conclusion

Through the descriptions of the seven Rotoli figurati in this chapter, we have established that there are grounds for treating these manuscripts as a group in the broadest sense. It is plausible to infer from the listing in the 1426 inventory of the archives of S. Eusebio of ‘Item carte septem depicte variis et diversis modis et cum aliquibus figuris’, that these ‘carte’ are the Rotoli figurati. This inventory detail would then indicate that in the fifteenth-century, these documents were listed as a group, based on their shared physical form (*carte*, not *codices*), and use of figures. To summarise, the Rotoli figurati are single or multi-leaf roll manuscripts; it is highly unusual to find several manuscripts in this uncommon format in a single archive. All are in a relatively good state of preservation that suggests they are unlikely to have travelled much from where they were made. An examination of their paleography and style, corroborated by the recent research of Mirella Ferrari, has established that the Rotoli figurati were copied in the third quarter of the thirteenth century in a northern Italian centre, most plausibly in Vercelli. Recognising and treating the Rotoli figurati together based on these same descriptive criteria as the fifteenth-century inventory, further supported by paleographical and stylistic analysis for their dating, should not be taken as an attempt to elide the difficulties about what we can and cannot know about these manuscripts and how they were made.

Strong paleographical evidence has suggested that several of the Rotoli figurati were made within a short time frame, at the same centre, with the same hands contributing variously to Rotoli 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7. For Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*), Ferrari identified four hands (A, B, C, and D) at work within the same short time period — within a generation. Hand A, which completed the labelling and text within the main body of the image and was likely the earliest hand at work on this manuscript, and Hand B, which added captions to the central genealogical tree are also seen in the passages of text on Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*).

Two manuscripts only feature majuscule text, which provides its own problems with paleographical analysis. These are Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*) and 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*). These two manuscripts are further distinguished from the other Rotoli figurati by the fact that they are read horizontally, rather than vertically. For these

manuscripts, Ferrari has observed a close relationship between the majuscule used to label the groups of figures in the sheet of geometrical proofs, and that used for the distichs which 'bookend' the images of Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*). This majuscule lettering may in fact be that of Hand A, the earliest hand of the *Ecclesia* manuscript, who also appears to have completed the lettering used for toponyms on Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*). The plausible presence of Hand A on these three Rotoli figurati strongly suggests that they were made in the same centre in a short time frame.

Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*) and 3 (*Genealogia Christi*) are both completed in highly professional hands which are not found elsewhere in the Rotoli figurati. The contents of these two manuscripts are works associated with Peter of Poitiers, which had a very wide dissemination from the late twelfth and throughout the thirteenth century. Their use in early university contexts, as we have seen, is well attested. It would be plausible to infer from the professional scribe at work on these manuscripts that they were produced in some connection to the *studium* in Vercelli (active from 1228), but there is no evidence for a university scriptorium.

Furthermore, stylistic similarities in the depiction of faces, human and animal figures, and pattern-making, strongly suggests that the same copyist drew these details on Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 6 (*Mappamondo*). Representations of buildings and architecture on Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*) and 6 (*Mappamondo*) also share similarities, but these are less strong than those connections observed between Rotoli figurati 4 and 6. This stylistic connection suggests that the *Ecclesia* and the *Mappamondo* were also made in the same centre, perhaps by the same artist. It is however very difficult to ascertain whether there was a separate artist, or whether the scribe (perhaps Hand A, on the *Ecclesia* manuscript), also drew the figure.

The passages of text on the right side of the *Ecclesia* diagram were completed by Hand C. This text, as we have seen, is an abbreviated but richly symbolic work that draws from the thought of Joachim of Fiore. It is significant, therefore, that Hand C also completed the entire front side of Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). We can plausibly infer from the appearance of Hand C on the two Rotoli figurati with Joachite content an individual with a particular interest in the work of Joachim of Fiore. The strength of the shared thematic content between these two of the Rotoli figurati means it is probable that these manuscripts were produced in conjunction with each other.

We can infer from the multiple connections between Rotoli figurati 1, 4, 5, 6 and 7 that these manuscripts were copied in the same centre in Vercelli in the third quarter of the thirteenth century. It is probable, as we shall explore in the next chapter, that this centre was the chapter of S. Eusebio. Rotoli figurati 2 and 3 were possibly copied in Vercelli too, but potentially at a different centre within the city, for use at the cathedral school or *studium*.

In Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore) there is strong evidence not only that these manuscripts were made in the same centre, but that they were made in conjunction with each other. As we shall explore in depth in chapters 4 and 5, the copyist of these manuscripts may have added Joachite content to the *Ecclesia* diagram. It is possible that the *Ecclesia* diagram is a version of a twelfth-century image, augmented according to the interests of the a thirteenth copyist. Rotoli figurati 4 and 7 also contain remarkable testimony of authentic works of the twelfth-century exegete Joachim of Fiore. Rotoli figurati 7 appears to be the first known exemplar of an early form of transmission of Joachim's figural works. Rotoli figurati 4 may contain an unknown work of the abbot, or an extracted version authored by someone with a detailed knowledge of the works of the abbot. These are exceptional survivals, and the manuscript's presence and probable production in Vercelli indicates a previously unknown ecclesiastical interest in the abbot in a northern Italian cathedral city, which was evidently sustained from the late twelfth to the third quarter of the thirteenth century, and indeed into the early fourteenth. Furthermore, the proposed dating for these in the period 1250–75, which has significance for the Joachimist texts. In this selection of works, the apocalyptic year 1260 is repeatedly mentioned: in the text of the *Ecclesia* diagram and in the works of Rotoli figurati 7. Indeed, this sense of apocalyptic expectation, of the end of the New Testament and the second coming of Christ, are embedded throughout these manuscripts. This therefore suggests that these manuscripts were copied before the year 1260, as after this date—as we see from the early fourteenth century note on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7—the prophetic materials would no longer have made any sense. An interest in Joachim's work is in no way typical of the kind of material and erudition typically taught during this period at cathedral schools. The material of Rotoli figurati 4 and 7 therefore demonstrates that engagement with Joachim's Apocalyptic expectation was very much alive in Vercelli in the mid-

thirteenth century. Further augmentation, in the form of the note from 1307 given on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7, appears to have strong links to events occurring in Vercelli that year. This date provides a lens through which to focus on the potential changing reception of the contents of Rotoli figurati 4 and 7, which shall be explored in full in chapter six.

Aside from the interrelationships found between several manuscripts of the Rotoli figurati, in a broad overview these documents are connected through their use of drawings to represent complex subject matter. The survival of a series of such drawings in an unusual format, from the same period of time, and plausibly the same city, potentially reflects learned communities which not only valued images, but understood complex images as an important tool for thought.

The content of the Rotoli figurati overall plausibly reflect the interests of advanced scholarship within a learned community, and an overarching concern with issues relating to the Church and the transmission of knowledge. To understand how these manuscripts may have been used in thirteenth-century Vercelli —and particularly the striking presence of Joachim of Fiore’s works— we must necessarily defer closer attention to these remarkable documents, and first examine the religious and educational institutions of the city, beginning with the school and scriptorium at the cathedral of S. Eusebio in the late twelfth century. As we shall see, this city had far-reaching horizons, and a reputation for its culture and learning that spread as far as England. This broader attention will provide a historicised view of the manuscripts which will assist our critical understanding of their complex images. We will return to the exceptional diagrammatic content of these manuscripts in chapter three, informed by the background laid out in the next chapter.

## 2 Vercelli, the city and its culture

The image of the Rotoli figurati which has emerged from the first chapter is the exceptional survival of seven unusual manuscripts, most plausibly copied in Vercelli in the third quarter of the thirteenth century. The style and content of some of the manuscripts, particularly Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*), and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), suggest that they may originate from late twelfth-century exemplars. It is plausible to seek the making and use of all of these manuscripts in an educated ecclesiastical context, with connections to intellectual and religious centres in the Italian peninsula and beyond the Alps, particularly to the schools at Paris. Furthermore, one of the overarching motifs which transpires from the content of these manuscripts is a concern with order in the world. This motif can be observed in the macrocosmic and chronological framing devices used in several of the manuscripts, and in the privilege given to geometric or linear systems of representation, which provide a backdrop and governing principle for the organisation of knowledge. Within this motif, a particular concern for the role of the Church within this ordered universe emerges. The time from the second half of the twelfth century through the thirteenth was punctuated by recurrent ideological conflict between the papacy and the empire, and questions of how to justify authority within the divinely ordered world affected all of Christendom. However, the city of Vercelli, as I will go on to show in this chapter, was cast by its geography and its history in a significant role within these conflicts. The history of the city and its religious institutions has an extensive historiography; this study draws from this scholarship. Building upon previous work on the intellectual life of Vercelli c.1150–1300, this chapter will focus on the individuals and institutions which are directly relevant to our critical understanding of the Rotoli figurati. This chapter begins by offering a summary of the geography and history of Vercelli, demonstrating the circumstances which contributed to the creation of a powerful political urban centre from the early middle ages. In the first chapter, we observed that the manuscripts of the Rotoli figurati contain texts of late twelfth-century origin. The second section of this chapter therefore discusses the intellectual life of the canons at the cathedral of S. Eusebio, its manuscript collections and most importantly the attached school, its activity

and reputation in the late twelfth century, here examined through the activities of its powerful bishops. This chapter then examines the influence of Guala Bicchieri in the early thirteenth century, and his role in the foundation of the abbey of S. Andrea with its Victorine canons, and his vision for the city. The next relevant event in the history of the city's intellectual institutions is the foundation of the *studium* in Vercelli in 1228, a development owed to the city's prestigious reputation, and to the presence in the city of individuals of sufficient intellectual repute to attract students. Finally, the chapter examines the continuation of the *studium* in the third quarter of the century and the community at S. Eusebio, in the period when the Rotoli figurati manuscripts were copied. The chapter draws throughout from Paolo Rosso's important recent study, which contends that Vercelli possessed an unusual network of exchange within its intellectual communities.<sup>1</sup> It will be argued here that the copying of the Rotoli figurati in the thirteenth century depended upon the multifaceted intellectual interests sustained by the dynamic atmosphere of Vercelli's intellectual environment from the late twelfth century.

### *Vercelli: history and geography*

Since the ninth century, Vercelli had been an important strategic centre linking the western Po Valley with both transalpine routes and the peninsula, making it a key node in networks of cultural as well as political and economic exchange, and giving the city strategic significance within papal-imperial conflict during the eleventh to thirteenth centuries.<sup>2</sup> Medieval travellers from England and Francia crossing the Alps via the Great St Bernard Pass would have typically followed the *via Francigena*, one of the most important transalpine routes running between northern Europe and Rome,

---

<sup>1</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 11–16.

<sup>2</sup> Neighbouring regions are Ivrea to the west, the Val Sesia to the north, and Novara to the east across the river. Other lands to the east of the Sesia, including Casaleggio, Biandrate, Casalbeltrame, and Vicolungo were at various points subject to the Vercelli episcopate. South of the Po, the diocese extended to Casale Monferrato towards the cities and dioceses of Asti and Alessandria. This is a very rough historical sketch of the diocesan boundaries in this period drawn from Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, 'Diocesi di Vercelli', pp. 584–6. P. Levine offers an overview of the problem with these early sources for Vercelli's history in: Levine, 'Historical Evidence', pp. 561–81.

encountering Vercelli after they had descended through the Val d'Aosta, and passed through Ivrea and Santhiá as they approached the River Po.<sup>3</sup> This location on an important transalpine route heightened the city's significance for both the papacy and the empire, and its local history in our period became a crucible for, among other things, the conflict between those powers. Relationships with pope and emperor shaped the history of Vercelli and had an impact, directly and indirectly, on the development of the institutional and educational networks which gave the city a remarkably rich intellectual and cultural milieu. In Vercelli, as elsewhere on the route, religious communities provided services and support to pilgrims and the poor in the form of hospitals.<sup>4</sup> The presence of travellers also provided commercial possibilities for religious houses, towns and cities along these routes to profit and expand, while the passage of people on this route and their contact with communities in Vercelli would have provided a natural occasion for the exchange and circulation of intellectual ideas.<sup>5</sup> The route is likely to have encouraged the city's status as a site for cultural exchange and knowledge transfer; indeed, a plausible argument explaining the presence of the tenth-century Anglo-Saxon codex known as the 'Vercelli Book' in the chapter library is that it was brought to the city by a pilgrim on the *via Francigena*.<sup>6</sup> It is within this rich history and geography that the Rotoli figurati must be contextualised.

The re-establishment of a Christian Roman empire, first under Charlemagne in 800 and again under Otto I in 962, which incorporated the kingdom of Italy, had earlier transformed Vercelli from a city at the margins of the old Lombard kingdom to a

---

<sup>3</sup> D. Webb, *Medieval European Pilgrimage, c.700–c.1500* (Basingstoke, 2002), pp. 128–9. An account of the return journey, also passing through Vercelli, exists from Archbishop Sigeric of Canterbury in the late 10<sup>th</sup> century. V. Ortenberg, 'Archbishop Sigeric's Pilgrimage to Rome in 990', *Anglo-Saxon England*, 19 (1990), pp. 197–246; D. Webb, *Pilgrims and Pilgrimage in the Medieval West* (London, 1999), pp. 18–19, 33–4.

<sup>4</sup> As early as the tenth century, there was a hospice of Sant'Orso, and from the twelfth century, S. Brigida, with an attached hospital. G. B. Parks, *The English Traveller to Italy. The Middle Ages (to 1525)* (Rome, 1954), at p. 53. Guala dei Bondoni, bishop of Vercelli from 1170–1182, approved statutes proposed by the chapter of S. Eusebio for a hospice for pilgrims from the British Isles, then called 'S. Brigida' and later assimilated with the other major hospices in the city. Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, at p. 488. See also R. Stopani, *La via Francigena in Toscana: storia di una strada medievale* (Florence, 1984).

<sup>5</sup> Webb, *Medieval Pilgrimage*, pp. 114–5.

<sup>6</sup> Halsall, 'Vercelli and the Vercelli Book', pp. 1545–50.



pivotal centre for the potential integration of peninsular and imperial politics and culture.<sup>7</sup> From the tenth century, it was an increasingly populous urban centre, commercially and culturally rich, and one of a number of cities in Lombardy to prosper from proximity to regional and international travel routes.<sup>8</sup> Following the research of Rinaldo Comba and Giuseppe Gullino, Francesco Panero has constructed a population estimate for Vercelli in the thirteenth century of 10–11,000.<sup>9</sup> This was significantly larger than its close neighbour and long-standing rival, Novara, across the Sesia, and indicates that the city was one of the three largest in the region of Piemonte.<sup>10</sup> With regard to population and growth, it is important to bear in mind that in either 1162 or 1164, Vercelli underwent a great expansion, signified by the construction of new city walls.<sup>11</sup> This new civic architecture marked a radical change in the nature of the city, its scale indicated by the fact that the new walls were not completed until the mid-thirteenth century.<sup>12</sup> The new walls almost doubled the habitable space within the city,

---

<sup>7</sup> On this earlier period, C. Wickham, *Early Medieval Italy: Central Power and Local Society, 400–1000* (Ann Arbor, MI, 1981); G. Sergi, 'The Kingdom of Italy', in *The New Cambridge Medieval History. Volume III, c.900–c.1024*, ed. T. Reuter and R. McKitterick, The New Cambridge Medieval History (Cambridge, 1999), pp. 346–71, at p. 356.

<sup>8</sup> Vercelli is close to Milan, which became a more important city than Pavia, then capital, by the early eleventh century. See P. J. Jones, *The Italian City-State: From Commune to Signoria* (Oxford, 1997), at pp. 97–100.

<sup>9</sup> There are no sources for population estimates early than the late twelfth century. These estimates were constructed by F. Panero, 'L'inurbamento delle popolazioni rurali e la politica territoriale e demografica dei comuni piemontesi nei secoli XII e XIII', in *Demografia e società nell'Italia medievale: secoli IX–XIV*, ed. R. Comba and I. Naso (Cuneo, 1994), pp. 401–40, at p. 421. For Vercelli: R. Comba, *La popolazione in Piemonte sul finire del Medioevo: ricerche di demografia storica* (Turin, 1977); R. Comba, 'Testimonianze sull'uso dell'incolto, sul dissodamento e sul popolamento nel Piemonte meridionale (XIII–XIV sec.)', *Bollettino storico-bibliografico subalpino*, 68 (1970), 415–53.

<sup>10</sup> Novara's population from the end of the twelfth to the beginning of the fourteenth century was 8–10,000. Only Alessandria (15–16,000) and Asti (10–12,000) are likely to have been larger. Panero, 'L'inurbamento delle popolazioni rurali', at p. 421. Vercelli saw a dramatic increase in population in the period 1179 to 1250, as is explored in the fundamental study by Comba. On Vercelli, see: Comba, 'Testimonianze sull'uso dell'incolto', 415–53. See also G. Gullino, *Uomini e spazio urbano. L'evoluzione topografica di Vercelli tra X e XIII secolo* (Vercelli, 1987), at pp. 9–18; id., 'Inurbamenti ed espansione urbana a Vercelli tra XII e XIII secolo', in *Vercelli nel secolo XIII. Atti del primo congresso storico Vercellese, Vercelli, 1982*, ed. R. Ordano, Società storico vercellese (Vercelli, 1982), pp. 279–325, at p. 298.

<sup>11</sup> Gullino, *Uomini e spazio urbano*, pp. 43–67; R. Rao, *I beni del comune di Vercelli. Dalla rivendicazione all'alienazione (1183–1254)* (Vercelli, 2005), pp. 124–5.

<sup>12</sup> Gullino cites a document of 1263 on the conclusion of the road around the internal perimeter

and must be considered in concert with the communal policy, in evidence from 1179 onwards, of encouraging urbanisation. At this stage, the city's commune was manifested in the form of powerful networks of lay individuals, commonly of families with close connections to the church.<sup>13</sup> A growth in population as a consequence of this policy is verified by a concurrent increase in records of oaths of residency and citizenship.<sup>14</sup> The increased levels of migration at the end of the twelfth and during first half of the thirteenth centuries coincided with the growing independence of the commune. In 1190, the commune purchased houses to be used for the communal palace, which was expanded again between 1203 and 1210.<sup>15</sup> The economic and political prosperity of Vercelli which doubtless contributed to the population increase and potential for expansion in the late twelfth and early thirteenth century was not an isolated success. Rather, it was related to the city's integration into the broader developments, conflicts and fortunes of Italy and western Europe.<sup>16</sup>

Bouts of conflict between papacy and empire in the eleventh and twelfth centuries increasingly pitched ecclesiastical and secular authorities into hostile relations, a framework from which the Italy of the communes would gradually emerge<sup>17</sup> The

---

of the city. Gullino, 'Inurbamenti ed espansione urbana a Vercelli tra XII e XIII secolo', pp. 279–325, at pp. 293–4.

<sup>13</sup> Panero, 'L'inurbamento delle popolazioni rurali', pp. 401–40, at pp. 412–3.

<sup>14</sup> Gullino argues that urbanization was also influenced by the political reorganisation of the territory in the broader period between 1179 and 1268, which encouraged people who had lived under independent lordships or ecclesiastical protection in the region to take oaths of citizenship and residence in the city, thereby entering under communal jurisdiction. The commune in this period was also extending its wider territory. One means of achieving this was through the creation of *borghi* and fortifications. Gullino, 'Inurbamenti ed espansione urbana a Vercelli tra XII e XIII secolo', at pp. 290–3. In the 1180s, the commune began to register those who moved from the surrounding countryside into the city. See G. C. Faccio, ed., *Il libro dei 'Pacta et conventiones' del Comune di Vercelli*, Biblioteca della Società storica subalpina, 97 (Novara, 1926).

<sup>15</sup> Rao, *I beni del comune di Vercelli*, at pp. 107–8. Rao cites documents 120–122 in, G. C. Faccio and M. Cesare Ranno, *I Biscioni (Cartario Vercellese)*, BSSS, 155–156, 3 vols (Turin, 1939), II, at pp. 61–5.

<sup>16</sup> Rao, *I beni del comune di Vercelli*, at pp. 87–8; D. Nicholas, *The Growth of the Medieval City: From Late Antiquity to the Early Fourteenth Century* (London, 1997), at pp. 75–6.

<sup>17</sup> See Jones, *The Italian City-State*. and the recent argument for the origins of the commune in, C. Wickham, *Sleepwalking into a New World: The Emergence of Italian City Communes in the Twelfth Century* (Princeton, N.J., 2015). *Guelph* and *Ghibelline* were particularly ambiguous terms at this point, until their adoption by contemporaries to mean 'supporters of the Church' and 'supporters of the Empire' in the very different political and social world of the late thirteenth

formation of local political factions and their relationships to wider alliances depended on shifting local contexts. At different points in the twelfth century, as Chris Wickham writes, communes came into being through ‘conscious urban collectivity’, emerging in different ways in different places as largely autonomous city governments formed by independent local associations of laymen possessing (not uncontested) jurisdiction in the city and its *contado*. Although their authority was in theory limited by higher public authority, they were nevertheless able to increase it by mutual agreements in warfare and justice, and enlarge their jurisdiction through legislation, independent taxation, and negotiating beneficial relationships with other communes.<sup>18</sup> The historical narrative of the diocese of Vercelli has shown us that in the first half of the thirteenth century, the city’s commune negotiated the enlargement of its jurisdiction with considerable perspicacity and resourcefulness.

From the mid-eleventh through to the thirteenth centuries, the political drama that characterised the region was played out in territorial conflict. One thread in this complex mesh of shifting alliances, which forms a background to the later reception of the Rotoli figurati, is the enmity between communal leaders of Vercelli and Novara, and the rural nobility, in particular the counts of Biandrate, north east of Vercelli across the Sesia.<sup>19</sup> Although the events of this conflict and their relationship to the contents of some of the manuscripts of the Rotoli figurati will be detailed more fully in chapter six, it is useful to lay out the shape of this conflict here. The subjugation of towns and villages in the Valsesia by the Biandrate was particularly oppressive in the northern Alta Valsesia, a much poorer region further up the river valley which was remote, inaccessible and mountainous. In 1170, the Lombard League’s defeat of Frederick I Barbarossa’s imperial forces at Legnano led to the Biandrate losing much of their power:

---

century, therefore I will avoid using them. See G. Raccagni, *The Lombard League: 1167–1225* (Oxford, 2010), pp. 182–3; L. Martines, ‘Political Conflict in the Italian City States’, *Government and Opposition*, 3/1 (1968), 69–91.

<sup>18</sup> Production and ratification of law codes was an important marker of practical autonomy, and Pisa in the 1150s is one of the earliest examples of this. In Milan, Padua, Piacenza, Verona, Cremona and Lucca, the consolidation of a communal regime is generally considered to have occurred by the 1130s. Wickham, *Sleepwalking into a New World*, at pp. 15–18.

<sup>19</sup> F. Cognasso, *Storia di Novara* (Novara, 1992), at pp. 123–5; P. Guglielmotti, *Comunità e territorio. Villaggi del Piemonte medievale* (Rome, 2001), at pp 182–91.

they were forced to cede many possessions to the commune of Vercelli, pushing them to place even heavier taxation on the poorer communities in the upper reaches of the Sesia valley.<sup>20</sup> An agreement between the Biandrate and the commune was reached in 1217, which allowed the counts to maintain their fortifications in order to perform administrative and enforcement duties under the jurisdiction of the Vercelli commune.<sup>21</sup> The commune required the counts to maintain some control, as periodically throughout the thirteenth century until 1307, the people of Valsesia agitated against the new alliance between commune and feudal power and began to coordinate collectively for independence. In remote locations these issues were common throughout the wider region, and made it difficult for peace to be maintained.

In turn, these tensions opened further risks to the stability of Vercelli's control of its territory. In the second half of the thirteenth century, the growing strength of the rebelling communities was reflected in the formation of a Valsesian *universitas*, a political collective.<sup>22</sup> In 1254, Vercelli reached a temporary peace with Novara, and the neighbouring city withdrew its support of the Alta Valsesi in favour of the Biandrate, paving the way for consensus once again that gave the latter greater power to subjugate the Valsesians. This alliance was formalised in a pact of 1260 which granted further power to the former counts. What this heavy-handed attempt at jurisdiction and management of a remote area created was twenty years of near-constant, unmanageable warfare and rebellion. The commune of Vercelli during this later period was also engaged in another serious conflict against a powerful alliance between the Visconti family in Milan and Novara, supported by the empire, and could not support the Biandrate in their endeavours. Unable to maintain control, Vercelli ceded jurisdiction to Novara, which later granted the Valsesians independent legal jurisdiction and autonomy in 1275.<sup>23</sup> This independence was maintained for the rest of the century, until the

---

<sup>20</sup> H. Dey, 'From Street to Piazza: Urban Politics, Public Ceremony, and the Redefinition of *Platea* in Communal Italy and Beyond', *Speculum*, 91/4 (2016), 919–44, at 935–6.

<sup>21</sup> J. B. Pierce, 'Autonomy, Dissent, and the Crusade Against Fra Dolcino in Fourteenth-Century Valsesia', in *Religion, Power, and Resistance from the Eleventh to the Sixteenth Centuries*, ed. K. Bollermann, T. M. Izbicki, and C. J. Nederman (Basingstoke, 2014), pp. 195–213, at pp. 199–201. See also chapter six below.

<sup>22</sup> C. Mornese, *Eresia dolciniana e resistenza montanara* (Rome, 2002), at pp. 58–60.

<sup>23</sup> For an overview, see Mornese, *Eresia dolciniana*, at pp. 54–57, with full references.

violent events of 1303 in which the bishop of Vercelli (of a noble seigniorial family), with papal military support, regained control and fought to re-establish the city's territorial rights over the region. This period of social upheaval is of considerable importance to the region's history of religious controversy, and provides a dramatic context to the reception and copying of the Rotoli figurati in the thirteenth century to their reception in the early fourteenth.<sup>24</sup>

### *The diocese of Vercelli*

Vercelli's strategic importance, particularly after the foundation of the transalpine empires of the Carolingians and Ottonians, can be demonstrated by the leading political roles long played by the bishops of the diocese, under whom the city often became a site of conflict. In exploring the background to the Rotoli figurati, it is highly significant that Vercelli, from the tenth century, was home to a series of bishops who were vocal proponents of church reform. The prominence of the episcopate of Vercelli was reflected in the customary dignity it received within the metropolitan province of Milan. A twelfth-century liturgical calendar used in Milan known as the *Beroldo Vecchio* records the tradition that the seat to the right of the Milanese archbishop was granted to the bishop of Vercelli, conferring the duty to preside over the provincial council if the Milanese see was vacant. This was the right of the Vercelli episcopate as successor of the fourth-century Saint Eusebius, the first bishop of Vercelli.<sup>25</sup>

From 924 to 961, the bishop appointed to the see by Berengario I (r. 887–924) was Atto of Vercelli (d. before 958), an advocate for church reform. Atto served through the reigns of Ugo (926–47), Lotario (945–50) and Berengario II (950–61). He had well-documented intellectual interests, was an expert in canon law and had studied at the

---

<sup>24</sup> Discussed fully in chapters 5 and 6 below.

<sup>25</sup> This right continued until 1269, when the calendar was emended on the basis of a false story to grant the bishop of Brescia (who had traditionally held the position on the left) the privileged right-hand seat. G. Andenna, 'The Lombard Church in the Late Middle Ages', in *A Companion to Late Medieval and Early Modern Milan: The Distinctive Features of an Italian State*, ed. A. Gamberini (Leiden, 2014), pp. 69–92, at pp. 69–70. On the issues dating surrounding this manuscript, see M. Ferrari, 'Valutazione palaeografica del codice ambrosiano di Beroldo', in *Il Duomo, cuore e simbolo di Milano: IV centenario della dedizione (1577–1977)*, Archivio ambrosiano, 32 (Milan, 1977), pp. 302–7.

cathedral school in Milan.<sup>26</sup> Two of his influential works on clerical reform survive, the polemical tracts, *Polipticum* and *De pressuris ecclesiasticis*.<sup>27</sup> The concern of these texts with the relationship between temporal and spiritual power was far from unique in the period. Nevertheless, these works criticised the currently prevalent idea which understood that the emperor, when anointed, entered the *corpus* of the Church.<sup>28</sup> Instead, Atto drew a strict distinction between the hierarchical *corpus* of the Church, with the bishop at its head, and the *corpus* of the king.<sup>29</sup> In expressing the view that the bishop represented Christ on earth as a model of morality for communities, Atto was highly critical of priests who had wives or concubines, and attempted to enforce moral reform in his diocese. As R. G. Witt has observed, Atto's views on spiritual power essentially followed the late Carolingian ecclesiastical tradition, which recognised that while kings and bishops owed their authority and power to God, that of the bishops was inherently superior to that of kings.<sup>30</sup> Atto's attitude was that the church should in no way be subject to the control or jurisdiction of secular powers. Although involved in royal politics, and according to Susan Wemple working as *consiliarius* under the Italian King Lotario, Atto did not have a positive outlook on secular politics.<sup>31</sup> This was in marked contrast to his successors Pietro, and Leo of Vercelli, who demonstrated the importance of the bishopric of Vercelli under the Ottonians, and of the theory and practice of the 'imperial bishop'.<sup>32</sup> Calls for church reform gathered momentum during the eleventh and twelfth centuries, with polemical texts emerging from centres such as Milan, and further afield in Burgundy and Provence.

---

<sup>26</sup> S. F. Wemple, *Atto of Vercelli: Church State and Christian Society in Tenth Century Italy* (Rome, 1979), at p. 9.

<sup>27</sup> Wemple, *Atto of Vercelli*, at pp. 28–30.

<sup>28</sup> G. Tellenbach, *The Church in Western Europe from the Tenth to the Early Twelfth Century*, trans. T. Reuter (Cambridge, 1993), at p. 176. See also W. Ullmann, *The Carolingian Renaissance and the Idea of Kingship* (London, 1969), at pp. 1118–9.

<sup>29</sup> E. H. Kantorowicz, *The King's Two Bodies: A Study in Mediaeval Political Theology* (Princeton, 1957).

<sup>30</sup> R. G. Witt, *The Two Latin Cultures and the Foundation of Renaissance Humanism in Medieval Italy* (Cambridge, 2012), at pp. 84–7.

<sup>31</sup> Wemple, *Atto of Vercelli*, at pp. 123–4.

<sup>32</sup> H. Bloch, 'Beiträge zur Geschichte des Bischofs Leo von Vercelli und seiner Zeit', *Neues Archiv*, 22 (1897), pp. 11–136; Gavinelli, 'Leone di Vercelli', 233–62.

Pietro, bishop of Vercelli from 978–997, was a powerful figure within the wider region of northern Italy, partially as a result of his close relationship with the emperor Otto II before his death in 983, but also through his strategy of reclaiming ecclesiastical properties that had been lost by his predecessor Ingone to local families in the surrounding areas.<sup>33</sup> His own success in augmenting the diocese's wealth and power precipitated serious conflict with Arduin of Ivrea, the marquis who had rebelled against the Emperor Henry II, and who had gained interregional support as emperor elect and king of Italy (1002–14). Arduin had initially launched a bid to re-establish the authority of the march of Ivrea, and negative reactions to Bishop Pietro's policy from the local secular aristocracy meant that the situation became violent.<sup>34</sup> Arduin's followers attacked Vercelli, burning the cathedral, before murdering the bishop and, reportedly, publicly burning Pietro's corpse.<sup>35</sup> The spectacular violence of this conflict reflects Vercelli's political importance, and the high stakes involved for those seeking to control it.

Vercelli's relationship with the empire in the eleventh century is further demonstrated through the episcopate of Leo of Vercelli (999–1024), a staunchly pro-imperial figure appointed to the see in 999 by Otto III.<sup>36</sup> Leo's episcopate is an important reminder of the authority and influence of Vercelli's bishops in the imperial court, Leo being a figure striking for his intellectual abilities and contributions to political thought, particularly his understanding of the relationship between the respective powers of pope and emperor, and the role of the episcopate in the

---

<sup>33</sup> Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, at pp. 455–7, 457–60. Witt, *The Two Latin Cultures and the Foundation of Renaissance Humanism in Medieval Italy*, pp. 96–100.

<sup>34</sup> Bishop from 978 to c. 997. Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, p. 458–61, at p. 60. The necrology of S. Eusebio lists his death on 17 March 997, see G. Colombo, 'I necrologi eusebiani', *Bollettino storico-bibliografico subalpino*, 2 (1897), at p. 460. Arduin's culpability for Pietro's death at the hands of his followers is documented in a diploma of Otto III in 999, which notes that Arduin was publicly accused of responsibility for the death of Pietro. Savio proposes that the burning of the bishop and the burning of the cathedral occurred on different dates Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, at pp. 460–1.

<sup>35</sup> Arduin was later forced to make reparation for this killing to Pope Sylvester II. At this council, Arduin was excommunicated along with his accomplices, and his extensive properties around Vercelli were granted to the church of Vercelli. See Sergi, 'The Kingdom of Italy', at pp. 364–5.

<sup>36</sup> Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, p. 463–5. Witt has reviewed the historiography of Leo's biography, acknowledging that most scholars consider Leo to have been Italian, although there is a possibility that he was German. See Witt, *The Two Latin Cultures and the Foundation of Renaissance Humanism in Medieval Italy*, at p. 96n.

governance of temporal affairs.<sup>37</sup> Leo's importance as a bishop of the empire gives us insight into the broader conflict over investiture which dominated political theology in this period, and should inform our understanding of Vercelli as a city where these kinds of important intellectual questions were grappled with. Prior to being appointed to the see, Leo had been archdeacon and judge at the imperial court, and he was deeply involved in the political and military struggles required to secure the kingdom under imperial rule. In the same year in which he was appointed bishop, Leo was made *logotheta* — imperial chancellor. It is striking that Otto appointed an Italian both as imperial chancellor and bishop, and was perhaps a sign of recognition that Vercelli was a city of strategic importance to the empire. Certainly, the emperor's regard for Leo's knowledge of Italian politics is documented in a series of letters written to Otto's successor Henry II c. 1015–18, which includes a list of the possessions of the Vercelli diocese that had been lost in the conflict with Arduin of Ivrea.<sup>38</sup> It was Leo who pursued revenge for his murdered predecessor, bringing the case against Arduin — perhaps one of Leo's 'enemies' — to the papal-imperial court of Pope Sylvester II and Otto III at Rome in October 999, shortly after he had been made bishop. Throughout the civil war in the region, Vercelli had been a key site of violent conflict between supporters of Arduin and followers of the emperor. Through Leo's continued allegiance to the empire, and the support this offered him, the diocese eventually regained the lands and rights it had lost to Arduin.<sup>39</sup>

Leo's allegiance to the empire is also reflected in his perception of the relationship between temporal and spiritual powers, which were widely influential and are documented through his surviving works. In a poetic address to Pope Gregory V in 998, Leo recorded his belief that partnership between pope and emperor would renew the empire of the Romans, and restore the Roman Church to her former glory.<sup>40</sup> Leo's

---

<sup>37</sup> The imagery of Leo's poems in relation to Ottonian art and material culture is discussed in relation to the Vercelli manuscripts in the following chapter. See H. Mayr-Harting, *Ottonian Book Illumination: An Historical Study*, 2nd ed., 2 vols (London, 1999).

<sup>38</sup> Leo's authorship of these letters was argued by Bloch, 'Beiträge zur Geschichte des Bischofs Leo von Vercelli und seiner Zeit', pp. 11–136.

<sup>39</sup> Sergi, 'The Kingdom of Italy', pp. 346–371 at pp. 368–9; Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, at p. 464.

<sup>40</sup> Robinson, 'Church and Papacy', at pp. 291–3.



Ottonian conception of the role of the bishop embraces both military and jurisdictional authority — a kingly priesthood (*regale sacerdotium*) — invested in their authority by the king, not the pope.<sup>41</sup> In this period of church reform, Ottonian definitions of spiritual and temporal power were accused of departing from the Gelasian ideal of a unified Christian society governed by two powers with defined and separate roles. The sentence of the letter of Pope Gelasius I to Anastasius I in 494, *Duo sunt*, still dominated medieval conceptions of the nature of the two powers.<sup>42</sup> The *auctoritas pontificum* and *regalis potestas* were a duality of governance, but with distinct and separate offices and dignities. The increased role in temporal affairs apparent in the conduct of Ottonian bishops such as Leo led them to be criticised by eleventh-century reformers aiming for the *libertas ecclesiae*. However, the Gelasian model could be interpreted as either a demonstration of ecclesiastical independence which recognised ecclesiastical superiority in the spiritual realm, or as a governance of harmony and cooperation between the two powers.<sup>43</sup> While the comparisons to ancient Rome had propaganda value, as Witt has observed, the renovation of the Roman Church under this partnership of powers was also in part an assertion of Italian importance and identity: in this case animated by Leo's own interest in the growth of the Italian church in connection with imperial power. The immediate authority for Leo was the emperor, rather than the pope. The development of Italian civic identity which grew in confidence and assertiveness through the eleventh century can be located in the fierce political interests which underpinned Leo's imperial loyalty.<sup>44</sup> In the early eleventh century, this trend for renovation did not manifest itself in a desire for unification, but rather through progressive particularism, which can be seen in the history of Vercelli's further conflicts between competing factions and units. The political theology of Ottonian bishops such as Leo offered a conception of imperial authority which rejected the Donation of

---

<sup>41</sup> For source references to the writings of Leo see Robinson, 'Church and Papacy', at p. 291.

<sup>42</sup> 'The world is chiefly governed by these two: the sacred authority of bishops and the royal power. Of these the burden of the priests is greater in so far as they will answer to the Lord for the kings of men themselves at the divine judgement.' The relevant passage from the letter is cited and translated in: Robinson, 'Church and Papacy', pp. 288–9.

<sup>43</sup> W. Ullmann, *Principles of Government and Politics in the Middle Ages*, 4th ed. (London, 1978).

<sup>44</sup> 'Italian' in the sense of northern Italy, and as an aggregation of different peoples. Jones, *The Italian City-State*, at pp. 125–6.

Constantine.<sup>45</sup> It was Leo who drafted the diploma issued in 1001 by Otto III to Pope Sylvester II, which describe a pope who had been ‘ordained and created’ by the imperial protectorate.<sup>46</sup> This is not the first time that we can observe in Vercelli’s history an important role in the broader ideological questions which shaped this period of history.

Further, the presence of such powerful bishops had a direct impact upon intellectual history in the marks they have left upon the manuscripts and codices in the collections of S. Eusebio. Indeed, the earliest known references to book collections in Vercelli are found under the Ottonian bishops, first in the metrical note of dedication in BCVC, MS XV, written by Bishop Atto.<sup>47</sup> This note refers to three manuscripts still in possession of the library of S. Eusebio, identified by the repetition of the metrical note.<sup>48</sup>

Winfried Rudolf recently published research on a mid-tenth-century fragmentary booklist which provides new information on the collections of S. Eusebio between the early tenth and twelfth centuries.<sup>49</sup> This list (BSVC, MS Fragment 50) was part of the binding material of BCVC, MS CXXXVIII, a schoolbook containing Boethius’s Latin translation of Porphyry’s *Isagoge*, his *De institutione arithmetica*, and the paraphrase of Aristotle’s *Categories* attributed to Augustine from the eighth century, *De decem categoriis*.<sup>50</sup> Tentative identification between items on the booklist and codices still

---

<sup>45</sup> For a history of the Donation of Constantine, see Johannes Fried, *Donation of Constantine and Constitutum Constantini: the misinterpretation of a fiction and its original meaning* (Berlin, 2007).

<sup>46</sup> Robinson, ‘Church and Papacy’, at p. 297, with further references to the *Diplomata Ottonis III* 389.

<sup>47</sup> Atto’s note reads: ‘I, Atto the prelate, donate books to you, threefold. Eusebius, martyr, I pray, receive my dedication. The first contains glosses, the second deals with the psalms, the third spreads the entire office of the fathers [...]’. See Rudolf, ‘A Tenth-Century Booklist’, pp. x–xx; K. Strecker, ed., *Die lateinischen Dichter des Deutschen Mittelalters: Die Ottonenzeit*, MGH, Poetae Latini Medii Aevi, 5.2 (Leipzig, 1939), p. 410.

<sup>48</sup> BCVC, MS 1, a late 9<sup>th</sup> century *vocabularium*; MS XV, 9<sup>th</sup>/early 10<sup>th</sup> century *Collectio Anselmo dedicata*; MS XXXVIII, an early 9<sup>th</sup> century copy of Cassiodorus’ *Expositiones psalmorum*. See M. Huglo, ‘Les arts libéraux dans le *Liber glossarum*’, *Scriptorium*, 55 (2001), pp. 3–33; I. Scaravelli, ‘La collezione canonica *Anselmo dedicata*: Lo status quaestionis nella prospettiva di un’edizione critica’, in *Le storie e la memoria*, ed. R. Delle Donne (Florence, 2002), pp. 33–52; P. Stoppacci, *Cassiodoro Expositio Psalmorum: tradizione manoscritta, fortuna, edizione critica* (Florence, 2012), pp. 108–10.

<sup>49</sup> W. Rudolf, ‘A Tenth-Century Booklist in the Biblioteca Capitolare of Vercelli’, *Manuscripta*, 62/2 (2018), pp. 249–277. I am grateful to Prof. Rudolf for sharing his research with me prior to publication. This booklist was first observed by Giuseppe Ferraris, the former librarian of the chapter library (G. Ferraris, *Notebooks* (BCVC), vol. 12, p. 7).

<sup>50</sup> For a discussion of the addition of the flyleaves to this manuscript see: G. Vignodelli, *Il filo a*

present at S. Eusebio has been possible. This provides us with further information of the kind of body of knowledge which might have been accessible to canons at the cathedral in the late twelfth century. The works of the booklist include biblical commentaries, monastic regulation, works of the Fathers, and homiletic collections, for example: *Regula pastoralis* of Gregory the Great (BCVC, MS CCLX), John Cassian's *De institutis coenobiorum et de octo principalibus vitiis*, Bede's *Commentary on the Apocalypse* and *De temporibus*, Isidore's *De ecclesiasticis officiis* (BCVC, MS CCXLVI), and a mysterious *Descriptio mundi* in a single volume. This latter volume has not been identified in an extant manuscript of the collection, but Rudolf has cautiously suggested that the text may be a copy of the *Cosmographia* of Pseudo-Aethicus, a work composed between the fifth and eighth centuries. Natalia Lovovsky demonstrated how Roman learned geographical texts were important to medieval imperial ideology, and has identified other ninth- to eleventh-century manuscripts containing the *Cosmographica* which make these rhetorical connections clear.<sup>51</sup>

From this list we see early evidence of an interest in the broader accumulation of knowledge beyond what might be expected as the essential study materials of canons at S. Eusebio, and we also see the ideological influence of Vercelli's Ottonian bishops.<sup>52</sup> Rudolf's work on the multiple hands at work on Fragment 50 has identified their presence in other manuscripts of the collections of S. Eusebio, presenting a convincing argument that the booklist was the work of a scribe or scribes active at the productive scriptorium of S. Eusebio under Bishop Atto in the mid-tenth century. Rudolf has identified two individuals, a deacon Vercellinus and sub-deacon Tetbert: individuals known from a colophon on BCVC, MS XXXIX, which furthermore indicates that they worked at the direct behest of Bishop Atto. These scribes have left their mark on a number of manuscripts from this period still held in the collections of S. Eusebio.<sup>53</sup> This

---

*piombo: Il Perpendiculum di Attone di Vercelli e la storia politica del regno Italico* (Spoleto, 2011).

<sup>51</sup> N. Lozovsky, 'Maps and Panegyrics: Roman Geo-Ethnographical Rhetoric and the Middle Ages', in *Cartography in Antiquity and the Middle Ages: Fresh Perspectives, New Methods*, ed. R. J. A. Talbert and R. W. Unger (Leiden, 2008), at pp. 180-1.

<sup>52</sup> Rudolf, 'A Tenth-Century Booklist', Table 3 'Inventory of Books from Vercelli, Biblioteca capitolare, MS Fragment 50a', pp. 263-7.

<sup>53</sup> Rudolf, 'A Tenth-Century Booklist', pp. 256-9; Levine, 'Historical Evidence', at pp. 578-81. Early work on the activity of one of the hands present on what is now Fragment 50 was

recent codicological study of fly-leaves, fragments, and paste downs in early medieval manuscripts in the Vercelli collections has further established strong evidence that during Bishop Leo's episcopate in the early eleventh century, the collections of S. Eusebio underwent an important reorganisation, in which many manuscripts were destroyed and their parchment used to bind newly arrived volumes.<sup>54</sup> Furthermore, Simona Gavinelli has established that a large number of northern European codices were likely to have been part of Leo's episcopal library, which through donations and other additions expanded and transformed the collections at Vercelli, and has proposed identifications with a number of specific manuscripts in the Biblioteca Capitolare.<sup>55</sup> The evidence of recent research on the fragments and booklists of Ottonian bishops in the collections of S. Eusebio has established the direct involvement bishops had over the creation, selection, preservation and restriction of manuscripts within the cathedral chapter and diocese.<sup>56</sup> This involvement means that a consideration of the interests and activity of the bishops of Vercelli in the late twelfth century is critical for our understanding of the reception and use of the *Rotoli figurati*.

### *Pope Urban III*

In the late twelfth century, members of the upper echelons of the Vercelli church continued to play important roles in the broader conflict between popes and emperors. The presence of late twelfth-century forms of figurative theology and diagrams which emerged in the Paris schools of this period within the *Rotoli figurati* means that it is relevant to examine an important episode in the history of the city, when bishop Uberto Crivelli (1183–4), was elected Pope Urban III (1185 to October 1187). As pope, he

---

undertaken by Bernhard Bischoff in 'Die älteste europäische Falkenmedizin (Mitte des zehnten Jahrhunderts)', in *Anecdota novissima: Texte des vierten bis sechzehnten Jahrhunderts*, Quellen und Untersuchungen zur lateinischen Philologie des Mittelalters 7 (Stuttgart, 1984), no. XIV, pp. 171–82 at p. 173, no. 14.

<sup>54</sup> Rudolf, 'A Tenth-Century Booklist', pp. 249–77.

<sup>55</sup> Gavinelli, 'Transiti di manoscritti attraverso le Alpi occidentali in epoca carolingia: gli episcopati di Ivrea e Vercelli', at pp. 402–6; 'Leone di Vercelli', 233–62. The manuscripts include ninth-century manuscripts of Isidore's *Etymologiae* (Cod. CII), a tenth-century Sacramentary from Fulda (Cod. CLXXXI), and a late ninth-century Bavarian gospel book (Cod. CXXXIV).

<sup>56</sup> Rudolf, 'A Tenth-Century Booklist'.

influenced the fortunes and political alignment of his former diocese.<sup>57</sup> His episcopate in Vercelli followed that of three bishops who had ceded ecclesiastical rights and possessions to local families, decimating the jurisdictional power of the diocese. This had longstanding consequences. Aware of these circumstances, Urban offered assistance to his episcopal successor Alberto, another non-native of Vercelli, who would hold the seat from 1185 to 1205.<sup>58</sup> In a bull of 9 August 1186, Uberto, now Urban III, delegitimised his three predecessors in the diocese of Vercelli.<sup>59</sup> This papal intervention allowed Alberto the immediate authority to reclaim the possessions lost by Gisolfo, Uguccione and Guala.<sup>60</sup> These three bishops all had strong familial connections with Vercelli's ruling families, and it was to their long-term advantage to weaken ecclesiastical possessions in and around Vercelli. In the summer of 1187, the pope issued a bull that further protected the Vercelli church, recognising its lands and possessions.<sup>61</sup> The episcopates of Uberto and Alberto, and those who followed him continued to consolidate the city as a prestigious intellectual centre. The bishops who followed Alberto included the distinguished jurists Lotario da Cremona (1205–8), and Ugolino da Sesso (1214–1235), who both oversaw a period of intense institutional conflict between the commune and diocese. Moreover, Lotario was a native of Cremona, who had been studied in Bologna in the late 1180s, there encountering Lothar of Segni (later Pope Innocent III). This early relationship with Innocent III led to the pope supporting

---

<sup>57</sup> Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, 485.

<sup>58</sup> Alberto was bishop of Vercelli from 1185 to either the end of 1204 or the beginning of 1205. L. Minghetti, 'L'episcopato Vercellese di Alberto durante i primi anni del XIII secolo', in *Vercelli nel secolo XIII. Atti del primo congresso storico Vercellese, Vercelli, 2–3 Ottobre 1982.*, ed. R. Ordano (Vercelli, 1982), 91–112.

<sup>59</sup> J. von Pflugk-Harttung, ed., *Acta pontificum Romanorum inedita. Urkunden der Päpste vom Jahre c. 97 bis zum Jahre 1197*, 3 vols (Tübingen, 1880), II, at p. 341.

<sup>60</sup> Gisolfo Avogadro 1133–1151, Uguccione 1151–1170 and Guala dei Bondoni 1170–1182. The Bondoni, the Avogadro, the Caviglià, Guidalardi, the Bicchieri, dal Pozzo and de Benedetti, to all extents and purposes controlled the commune from the late twelfth to the mid-thirteenth century. C. D. Fonseca, 'Ricerche sulla famiglia Bicchieri e la società vercellese dei secoli XII e XIII', in *Contributi dell'Istituto di storia medioevale, I: Raccolta di studi in onore di Giovanni Soranzo*, 3 vols (Milan, 1968), I, pp. 207–62, at pp. 210, 229.

<sup>61</sup> Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, at p. 485.

his nomination as bishop of Vercelli, reflecting a strategic papal intervention in the region which continued in the early thirteenth century.<sup>62</sup>

Selecting non-native bishops to the see was an important papal strategy in attempting to stabilise ecclesiastical power in the Po Valley. These appointments in Vercelli therefore reflect both the fractured state of the city's politics, and a sustained papal policy that resisted a general trend in northern Italy in which the consolidation of communal power was driven by the ascendancy of bishops with close social ties to the commune.<sup>63</sup> This is also suggested by other privileges granted by Urban III to religious institutions in the region, including three monasteries that had previously shown support to Alexander III (1159–1181).<sup>64</sup> This approach, as Annamaria Ambrosioni has demonstrated, shows that Urban was attempting to construct and maintain a support network to destabilise imperial alliances, particularly privileging Cistercians and communities of regular canons. These institutions held important sources of political assistance through their close ties with local aristocratic families, while support among these institutions and their dependencies in other regions would also have allowed the pope to secure transalpine routes of communication, offering further access to potential allies.<sup>65</sup> Urban had an antagonistic relationship with the emperor Frederick I Barbarossa (d. 1190) and was exiled in Verona in part as a result of his refusal to crown Frederick's son Henry (later Henry VI) as co-emperor, and also for his election of a candidate

---

<sup>62</sup> M. P. Alberzoni, 'Innocenzo III e la riforma della Chiesa in Lombardia. Prime indagini sui visitatores et provisores', *Quellen und Forschungen aus italienischen Archiven und Bibliotheken*, 73 (1993), pp. 122–78.

<sup>63</sup> E. Coleman, 'Bishop and Commune in Twelfth-Century Cremona: the Interface of Secular and Ecclesiastical Power', in *Churchmen and Urban Government in Late Medieval Italy, c.1200–c.1450: Cases and Contexts*, ed. F. Andrews and M. A. Pincelli (Cambridge, 2013), pp. 25–41, at pp. 32–3; G. Tabacco, *The Struggle for Power in Medieval Italy: Structures of Political Rule* (Cambridge, 1989).

<sup>64</sup> The Cistercian house of Lucedio, and the canons regular of S. Evasio di Casale Monferrato and San Bartolomeo 'de Caritate' at Vercelli; the Cistercian presence in Vercelli is discussed further below. See F. Andrews, 'Innocent III and Evangelical Enthusiasts: The Route to Approval', in *Pope Innocent III and His World*, ed. J. C. Moore and others (Aldershot, 1999), pp. 229–41.

<sup>65</sup> A. Ambrosioni, 'Monasteri e canoniche nella politica di Urbano III. Prime ricerche per la Lombardia', in *Istituzioni monastiche e istituzioni canonicali in Occidente (1123–1215). Atti della settima Settimana interna-zionale di studio. Mendola, 28 agosto–3 settembre 1977 – Milano (1980)*, Pubblicazioni della Università Cattolica del Sacro Cuore. Scienze storiche, 9 (Milan, 1980), pp. 601–630, at pp. 618–19. Reprinted as: A. Ambrosioni, 'Monasteri e canoniche nella politica di Urbano III. Prime ricerche per la Lombardia', in *Milano, papato e impero in età medievale*, ed. M. P. Alberzoni and A. Lucioni (Milan, 2003), pp. 337–72.

opposed by Frederick as archbishop of Trier. These events in 1186 marked a breakdown in relations between pope and emperor, and at Frederick's orders Henry occupied and invaded papal territories, trapping the pope at Verona. Urban's attitude toward Vercelli is further suggestive of the city's strategic importance. In addition to reflecting his loyalty to the diocese, Urban was motivated by the demands of wider papal political strategy, which was made vulnerable by the pope's isolation in Verona.

Although Urban died in exile, rejected by the civic authorities in Verona for his plans to excommunicate Frederick, his role in shaping Vercelli's intellectual history was long-lasting and will be discussed in full in chapter six below. The bishop who succeeded Uberto until 1205, was Alberto. As we shall see below, Alberto is the figure responsible for the elevation of theological learning at the school of S. Eusebio.

### *The cathedral of S. Eusebio in the late twelfth century*

The intellectual life of Vercelli was centred upon the ecclesiastical school at the cathedral of S. Eusebio, found just inside the northern boundary of the city wall by the porta Aralda.<sup>66</sup> As we have seen, the city of Vercelli had since the early middle ages a reputation as a great intellectual centre of international cultural exchange, a reputation which continued to be deserved throughout the thirteenth century and beyond. By the late eighth century, it had a scriptorium producing texts in an individual non-Caroline miniscule script, and through Bishop Liutward (880–899) the city had a connection with St Gall.<sup>67</sup> The cultural activity of the city was renewed from the time of Atto's episcopate (d. before 958), after the brutal disruptions of Hun invasions and Arian warfare at the end of the ninth and beginning of the tenth century. As we have seen above, Atto's reforming approach meant that from the tenth century, the cathedral was furnished by a growing library and scriptorium.<sup>68</sup> By the last quarter of the twelfth

---

<sup>66</sup> F. Panero, 'Istituzioni e società a Vercelli dalle origini dei commune alla costituzione dello studio (1228)', in *L'Università di Vercelli nel Medioevo: Atti del secondo Congresso Storico Vercellese (Vercelli, Salone Dugentesco, 23–25 ottobre 1992)* (Vercelli, 1994), pp. 77–165, at p. 85.

<sup>67</sup> P. Levine has demonstrated that marginal entries from an early catalogue of St Gall indicate that Bishop Liutward borrowed books, presumably selected to make copies, from its library. Levine, 'Historical Evidence', pp. 561–81, at pp. 576–7.

<sup>68</sup> Vignodelli, 'I palinsesti del codice CLXXI', pp. 5–35.

century therefore, the chapter's intellectual reputation was long-standing, and the city had an established history as a centre for learning in the subjects of theology and canon law.<sup>69</sup> Sources for the intellectual environment of the cathedral can be found in donations and inventories of books to the chapter library. Another early book list survives from twelfth-century Vercelli, detailing the 'libri thesauri sancti Eusebii'.<sup>70</sup> As Pastè observed in the first publication of the list, it seems to accurately reflect the reading matter of the canons of S. Eusebio.<sup>71</sup> Further, the works on the list are described in so much detail that it has been possible to match them to pre-twelfth-century manuscripts preserved in the collections today. The list includes works by Augustine (*The City of God*, *On the Greatness of the Soul*, the commentary on John, *On Heresies*)<sup>72</sup>, Jerome (commentaries on Isaiah, Jeremiah, and *Against Iovinian*)<sup>73</sup>, Isidore (*Etymologies*, *Sententiae*)<sup>74</sup>, Cassiodorus (commentary on the Psalms)<sup>75</sup>, and Bede (*Commentary on Acts of the Apostles*, *Commentary on the Seven Catholic Epistles*, and *Commentary on the Apocalypse*).<sup>76</sup> This treasury must have been only a very partial record of the collections providing for the canons of the cathedral, given the growth of the city in the late twelfth century, the collections at this time are likely to have been in turn more extensive. It is to the probable influence of Bishop Alberto on the intellectual culture of Vercelli in the late twelfth century to which we shall now turn.

Alberto was a native of Parma who had been briefly elected to the episcopal seat of Bobbio prior to Vercelli, and would ultimately take the Patriarchate of Jerusalem.<sup>77</sup>

---

<sup>69</sup> From the eleventh to thirteenth centuries, cathedral schools remained open to citizens desiring education, alongside teaching the secular clergy. Grammar teaching at monastic schools was open to all, but high-level theological training was generally only offered to their own members. See A. Petrucci, 'Per una storia della cultura scritta nell'alto medioevo', in *'Scriptores in urbibus': alfabetismo e cultura scritta nell'Italia altomedievale*, ed. A. Petrucci and C. Romeo (Bologna, 1992), pp. 237–45.

<sup>70</sup> This list is preserved in BCVC, MS XV, fol. 1vb. R. Pastè, 'Un catalogo di *Libri thesauri sci eusebi*', *Archivio della Società Vercellese di storia e di arte*, 9 (1917), pp. 449–60, at pp. 449–50; Casagrande Mazzoli, 'Per un'indagine sui manoscritti', pp. 293–310, at p. 307, n. 30.

<sup>71</sup> Pastè, 'Un catalogo di *Libri thesauri sci eusebi*', 450.

<sup>72</sup> BCVC, MSS CIV, LXXI, CLXXXIII, XLVI.

<sup>73</sup> BCVC, MSS CIX, XXXVI, CIII.

<sup>74</sup> BCVC, MS CII.

<sup>75</sup> BSVC, MS XXXVIII.

<sup>76</sup> BSVC, MS LXXXIII.

<sup>77</sup> Alberto held the patriarchate from 1204/5, until he was murdered in 1214 in Acre.



After the death of Pope Urban III, it was perhaps partly in the interest of long-term stability that Alberto adopted important roles for the emperor Henry VI (1190–1197). In contrast to the anti-imperial attitude of his predecessor, Alberto provided important administrative services to the imperial court. As bishop he witnessed all major acts of Henry VI and was recorded as present at councils held by the emperor in Italy, even accompanying him on journeys throughout the peninsula as far as Sicily. He is recorded in January 1197 as a primary member of a legation sent by Henry VI to Pope Celestine III to negotiate the emperor's request for feudal homage from Sicily.<sup>78</sup> Here we have evidence that as bishop of an importance diocese, Alberto played a crucial role in negotiations between pope and emperor. Henry's death at Messina on 28 September 1197 was followed by an interregnum as a result of disputed imperial succession. This had far-reaching consequences and profoundly degraded the ideology of a universal emperor; the disintegration of the imperial political programme was a strategic opportunity for Pope Innocent III (d. 1216), elected in 1198. Henry's death ended Alberto's close relationship with the empire and instead a strong bond with Innocent emerged as early as 1199. Alberto seems to have been appointed by the Holy See as a judge in several important ecclesiastical cases. His appointment was perhaps part of Innocent III's policy to establish the role of bishops as ecclesiastical mediators.<sup>79</sup> Such roles continued to be conferred upon Alberto's successors, including Lotario (1205–1208), who was later to become elected Archbishop of Pisa and Patriarch of Jerusalem. Two further cases confirm the pro-papal stance of the bishop in this period: on 31 May 1206, several decrees issued by the commune on 31 May 1206 were annulled, and on 7 October of the same year the bishop was tasked with overseeing the obedience of

---

<sup>78</sup> L. Minghetti, 'Alberto Vescovo di Vercelli (1185–1205). Contributo per una biografia', *Aevum*, 59/2 (1985), pp. 267–304, at pp. 276–7. Minghetti's article is a fundamental overview of the extant sources on Alberto.

<sup>79</sup> Alberto was one of two judges appointed to oversee resolution in a conflict between the separate communities of monks and canons dwelling at the Basilica of Sant'Ambrogio in Milan, as of 24 May 1199 (*PL*, 214, col. 859, manuscript: Milan, Archivio di S. Ambrogio, perg. sec. XIII, 234, 353, 354), not resolved until confirmation by Innocent on 20 September 1202. Earlier in 1199, Alberto was charged with the resolution of a dispute between Parma and Piacenza over the possession of Borgo San Donnino, not resolved until 1203 alongside the then archdeacon of Vercelli, Guala Bicchieri.

Piacenza to the Holy See. The authority conferred on the bishops of Vercelli by the pope during this period meant that the head of the church in Vercelli was passing definitive judgement on suffragans of the archbishop of Milan.<sup>80</sup>

We can augment our understanding of theological study at the chapter through another booklist, in this case the donation of an impressive library by one of the canons of S. Eusebio under Alberto, known only by his family name: Cotta.<sup>81</sup> His testament of 1194, transmitted in the chapter necrology, contains an inventory of the books contained in the donation, which form an almost complete collection for use in teaching scripture.<sup>82</sup> Many of these books are still held at the chapter library: all are datable to the last quarter of the twelfth century, and are of French provenance. We also learn from Cotta's testament that Bishop Alberto instituted a doctor *in theologia* at the chapter in this early period, assigning Cotta responsibility for the position. Alberto, bishop from 1185 to 1205, was instrumental in strengthening the political power of the Vercelli diocese.<sup>83</sup> His behaviour as bishop was pragmatic, acknowledging obligations to both pope and emperor in the interests of his diocese.<sup>84</sup> Alberto's close relationship with the emperor possibly resulted in the attainment of imperial privileges protecting the rights and authority of S. Eusebio. The necrology records not only cantors and lectors but also experts in law, theology and medicine, while charters and wills of the chapter witness *scolares*.<sup>85</sup> It is likely that the prestigious reputation of theology teaching at the school was the reason for the chapter's later formal role in the election of teachers in that discipline at the *studium*, the foundation of which will be described below. Many

---

<sup>80</sup> Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, at p. 487.

<sup>81</sup> C. Frova, 'Teologia a Vercelli alla fine del secolo XII: i libri del canonico Cotta', in *L'Università di Vercelli nel Medioevo: atti del secondo Congresso Storico Vercellese (Vercelli, Salone Dugentesco, 23-25 ottobre 1992)*, Biblioteca della Società Storica Vercellese (Vercelli, 1994), at pp. 311-333.

<sup>82</sup> The *Necrologi Eusebiani* are preserved in BCVC, Cod. XXXIII and LXII, and were edited in series by G. Colombo, and later R. Pastè, in *Bollettino storico-bibliografico subalpino* (1897-1923). See Arnoldi, *Le carte dell'Archivio Capitolare di Vercelli*, D. Arnoldi and others, eds., *Le carte dell'archivio capitolare di Vercelli*, BSSS, 70-71, 2 vols (Pinerolo, 1912), vol. 2, pp. 320-1, at no. 564.

<sup>83</sup> Frova, 'Teologia a Vercelli', at p. 323.

<sup>84</sup> G. Colombo, 'I necrologi eusebiani', *Bollettino storico-bibliografico subalpino*, 4 (1899), pp. 349-64, at p. 7.

<sup>85</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at p. 99; V. Mandelli, *Il comune di Vercelli nel medio evo. Studi storici*, 4 vols (Vercelli, 1857), vol. III (1858), at p. 8.

clergy using the title of magister are also known through the cathedral's necrology, which suggests that these clerics had a higher level of learning and had received the license to teach; the use of this title in contemporary documents also indicates that education conferred particular social prestige in Vercelli.<sup>86</sup>

The networks of political allegiance in the region in this period were complex, shifting and conflicted in nature. Vercelli was a major actor in the broader institutional and political climate of the Italian peninsula thanks to the activities of its powerful bishops. These aspects of Vercelli's historical narrative are not peculiar, but they are reflective of broader processes and conflict. Vercelli's location and accumulated historical importance, however, focuses points of conflict and intellectual exchange. These provide a crucial context in which to interpret the history of the complex images of the Rotoli figurati and the thematic concerns of the learned communities in Vercelli that they may represent. Vercelli's status and location made it a centre for political rivalry and activity, but also a centre for cultural and intellectual exchange. In order to elucidate the environment in which our manuscripts were produced, we have considered the local and regional political conflicts which characterised the city in the thirteenth century, and we now move on to assess the individuals, religious institutions and communities that played an important role in city life, before analysing the creation and existence of the *studium generale* and other seats of learning in Vercelli. As we turn to these institutions, it is necessary to introduce the figure of Guala Bicchieri. Guala's far-reaching influence in the theological and intellectual culture of the city is most evident in his foundation and development of the Abbey of S. Andrea.

### *Guala Bicchieri and the foundation of the abbey of S. Andrea*

Guala was a native of Vercelli, belonging to the prominent local Bicchieri family. The Bicchieri were a powerful family in Vercelli from the 1120s, and both Guala's father and uncle, as major property holders, regularly served as consuls of the commune of Vercelli between 1167–97 and as members of the councils of the Lombard League.<sup>87</sup> Little is

---

<sup>86</sup> J. Barrow, *The Clergy in the Medieval World* (Cambridge, 2015), pp. 231–2.

<sup>87</sup> N. Vincent, ed., *The Letters and Charters of Cardinal Guala Bicchieri, Papal Legate in England, 1216–1218*, Canterbury and York Society, 83 (Woodbridge, 1996), at pp. 30–5.

known of his youth, but it is generally accepted that he studied at the canonical school attached to the cathedral of S. Eusebio, as on 5 December 1187 he was elected as a canon of that church.<sup>88</sup> Pastè, one of Guala's important early biographers, argued convincingly that prior to entering the church he was taught by another important canon —'magister Cotta'— described in the *Necrologi Eusebiani* as 'in utroque iure peritus', and that Guala also studied law at the university in Bologna, and undertook theological studies at Paris at Saint Victor.<sup>89</sup> It is likely that at Bologna he came into contact with Lothar of Segni, the future Innocent III. The election of a north Italian cardinal deacon among a cardinal college at that time entirely composed of Romans lends credence to the idea that Guala had had contact with Innocent III in Bologna.<sup>90</sup> He was certainly learned in civil and canon law and a skilled negotiator, and his career reflects this. In 1205, he was made cardinal deacon of Santa Maria in Portico in Naples, by Innocent III, and in the subsequent year he was found in England negotiating a legal case on behalf of the pope at Evesham Abbey. After a period as papal legate in northern Italy, Guala was made legate *a latere* at Anagni in 1208, and granted the broad task of church reform in France for which Innocent issued the well-known instructions from Jeremiah, 1:10: Guala was, 'to root up and to destroy, and to build and to plant'.<sup>91</sup> Privileges were introduced by Innocent III through Guala to legitimise ecclesiastical military force and encourage the French king to support crusades and the church in the Holy Land, and to take military action against Albigensian heretics around Toulouse and Narbonne, in what would become known as the Albigensian Crusade.<sup>92</sup> While in

---

<sup>88</sup> The evidence for his entry into the church as canon comes from a deposition of 1225, see C. D. Fonseca, 'Bicchieri, Guala', ed. A. M. Ghisalberti and M. Pavan, *DBI* (Rome, 1968).

<sup>89</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 101–2.

<sup>90</sup> J. E. Sayers, *Innocent III: Leader of Europe 1198–1216* (London, 1994), at p. 40; Fonseca, 'Ricerche sulla famiglia Bicchieri', I, pp. 207–62.

<sup>91</sup> J. C. Moore, *Pope Innocent III (1160/61 – 1216): To Root up and to Plant* (Leiden, 2003), at pp. 183–4. The relevant register of Innocent III, cited by Moore, is edited at PL 215: 1403.

<sup>92</sup> There has been some speculation as to whether or not Guala himself participated in this crusade. He certainly had familial and professional experience with crusades and crusading: Guala's father (Guala I Bicchieri) was a ruling member of the commune in Vercelli and died a Templar knight at the siege of Acre, having sailed with the third crusade in 1189. It is certain that his father's affiliation with Templars and the Holy Land continued, as Guala made a legacy to the local Templar house in Vercelli (San Giacomo d'Albareto). See A. Paravicini Bagliani, *I testamenti dei cardinali del Duecento* (Rome, 1980), at pp. 4–6, 110–20; E. Bellomo, *The Templar*

Paris during his legation, Guala issued jurisdictional regulations for educational reform that built upon those issued by Pope Alexander III. As Paolo Nardi observes, Innocent's laws also established the relations between students and teachers at episcopal schools, particularly those at Bologna and Paris. His decrees formulated the legal rights under *ius commune* of the corporations of teachers and teachers, collated in two later decretal collections.<sup>93</sup> In particular, in 1208, Guala disseminated the method by which ecclesiastical authorities and masters of the Paris schools had jurisdictional power over scholars, formulating the process of a tribunal court.<sup>94</sup> The implementation of these regulations in 1208–9 was integral to Innocent III's efforts to promulgate and enforce higher education for the clergy.<sup>95</sup> This decree legitimised clerics studying at higher centres of learning to continue drawing income from their benefices during their absences. All of this activity laid the groundwork for the confirmation at the Fourth Lateran Council of a decree ordering that all cathedral churches must open schools accessible to poor men and priests, staffed by accredited masters (who were paid for by the provision of the 1207 decretal *Tuae fraternitas*), and required all metropolitan dioceses to additionally provide a high level theological training.<sup>96</sup> These reform policies, and Guala's role in carrying them out in legal terms, had a profound effect on higher education in general, and provide an important context to such development in Vercelli, with which the cardinal was closely involved.

In 1211 Guala was promoted as cardinal priest of Santi Martino e Silvestro ai Monti, a position he would hold until his death, and it was shortly after this in 1215 that Guala first began to acquire land in Vercelli with the intent to build a monastery there. A document of 22 March 1215 records the bishop of Vercelli, Ugo da Sesso, granting

---

*Order in North-West Italy (1142–c.1330)* (Leiden, 2008), at pp. 22, 27, 134.

<sup>93</sup> *Compilatio III* (1210) and *Compilatio IV* (1215–16), Guala's work in particular formed the foundation for Innocent's decretal *Quia in causis* (1210–13). See P. Nardi, 'Relations with Authority', in *Universities in the Middle Ages*, ed. H. de Ridder-Symoens, A History of the University in Europe, 4 vols (Cambridge, 1992), I, pp. 77–107, at pp. 82–3..

<sup>94</sup> G. Post, 'Parisian Masters as a Corporation, 1200–1246', in *Studies in Medieval Legal Thought: Public Law and the State, 1100–1322* (Princeton, 1964), pp. 27–60, at pp. 44–6.

<sup>95</sup> These reforms were based on rules implemented by Pope Alexander III for episcopal schools in Paris and Bologna, which formalised the status of teachers and students. Post, 'Parisian Masters', at pp. 43–44.

<sup>96</sup> Nardi, 'Relations with Authority', I, pp. 77–107, at pp. 82–4.

Guala's representatives' permission to establish a monastery of regular canons and clerics. This is the beginning of the foundation of S. Andrea, which would not be completed until 1219. Commissioning the construction of the Abbey of S. Andrea and its associated hospital was crucial in Guala's career and it seems that he had a vision for the city, perhaps to recreate the intellectual atmosphere that he valued at Paris in Saint-Victor through the religious and intellectual community of regular canons at Vercelli.<sup>97</sup> It was clear from the start that he wished the abbey to be inhabited by regular canons, with the founding members taken from the Victorine congregation at Saint Victor in Paris.

These links to Paris, together with Guala's relationship with Innocent III, also a theologian and expert in canon law, suggest another prism through which to examine the cultural framework of Vercelli. Innocent III, too, had studied in Paris, in addition to Bologna, and was described as learned in philosophy and theology, as well as law.<sup>98</sup> Although there is limited evidence for Guala's schooling in Paris, his studies in the city may have taken a similar shape to those of Lothar of Segni less than a decade earlier. Certainly, the list of his books compiled after his death in 1227 indicates that Guala's library had many more theology texts than legal ones.<sup>99</sup> After leaving England, Guala stayed in Paris, at the Abbey of Saint-Victor, for a month in December 1218, and here gathered the first group of canons and the scholar, Thomas Gallus, to take to Vercelli.<sup>100</sup> Given his choice of regular canons from the abbey of Saint-Victor to form the community at S. Andrea, he should be considered more aligned in his outlook with the theology taught by the masters at the abbey of Saint-Victor. A similar alignment is visible in the works of Innocent III as Lothar of Segni, where the imprint of Parisian

---

<sup>97</sup> J. Gardner, *The Roman Crucible: The Artistic Patronage of the Papacy 1198-1304* (Munich, 2013), at pp. 355-58.

<sup>98</sup> J. M. Powell, *The Deeds of Pope Innocent III* (Washington, D.C., 2004), pp. 3-4.

<sup>99</sup> C. Segre Montel, *I manoscritti miniati della Biblioteca nazionale di Torino: I manoscritti latini dal VII alla metà del XIII secolo*, 2 vols (Turin, 1980), I, at pp. 165-71. For an overview of the sources relating to the books owned by Guala Bicchieri see: Castronovo and Quazza, 'Biblioteche e libri miniati in Piemonte tra la fine del XII e il primo terzo del XIV secolo: alcuni percorsi possibili', at pp. 256-67.

<sup>100</sup> Vincent, *The Letters and Charters of Cardinal Guala Bicchieri, Papal Legate in England, 1216-1218*, xxxvi, n. 32.

theological learning and the desire to preach left its mark in the spiritual and allegorical method of his scriptural and liturgical analysis: his works are characteristic of contemporary speculative theology.<sup>101</sup> His more well-known work, *De miseria humanae conditionis* (1194–5), expansively details the frailty of humankind, but themes that emerge from two of his early works, *The Four Kinds of Marriage*, and *De missarum mysteriis*, are striking testaments to Lothar's concepts of ecclesiastical right. The former sets out his idea of what a ruler should be, using the paradigm of Christ as bridegroom and king as an example of justice for secular and ecclesiastical rulers. In the latter, written in Rome between 1195 and 1197 — which may have been revised after he became pope — he develops a theology of government based on a commentary on the mass.<sup>102</sup> What is of interest here is the chapter on the 'primacy of the Roman pontiff'. He draws from scripture pertaining to St Peter to demonstrate that the 'supreme pontiff is called to the plenitude of power'.<sup>103</sup> As John Moore observed, Innocent's assertion of the primary power of the papacy conveniently leaves out Peter's denials, and also fails to allude to any current difficulties such as the conflict between Church and State, or heresy, that would characterise his papacy. Instead of indicating a lack of accuracy, this perhaps emphasises the political expediency of Lothar's argument, which would carry through to his behaviour and strategies as Pope: this may be an elevated concept, but one that expresses more clearly the grandeur of his visions for the Holy See. As Moore puts it, '[t]hey were works of the mountain, not of the camp.'<sup>104</sup> While we will return later to an examination of these qualities of Lothar's works in relation to the Rotoli figurati manuscripts, at this point an insight into Innocent III's intellectual attitudes to papal authority provides context for Guala's activities as legate *a latere* in England.

---

<sup>101</sup> C. Morris, *The Papal Monarchy: The Western Church from 1050 to 1250* (Oxford, 1991), at pp. 418–9. For full references to the known manuscripts and the diagrams accompanying Innocent's works, see Hamburger, 'Haec Figura Demonstrat', p. 7–78, at p. 9, n.12.

<sup>102</sup> Moore believes that the revisions were slight, indicating that the majority of the work reflects his stage of life as a cardinal. The work is edited in: Wright, 'A Medieval Commentary on the Mass', at pp. 91–276.

<sup>103</sup> Moore, *To Root Up and to Plant*, at p. 23.

<sup>104</sup> See Moore, *To Root Up and to Plant*, at pp. 18–23.

## *Canon Cotta and the Cathedral of S. Eusebio*

Guala Bicchieri's important influence on Vercelli's cultural activity in the early thirteenth century built, to some extent, on the impact of the elusive twelfth-century figure of Cotta, a canon and magister at the cathedral of S. Eusebio. The historical background of S. Andrea's establishment, orchestrated by Guala Bicchieri, was ultimately an English conflict of ecclesiastical rights and privileges stemming to some extent from the Becket controversy and its ramifications. This period also followed the Third Lateran Council of 1179, which issued decrees focusing on ecclesiastical education, and required that schools and colleges be established at every chapter. At its core this was an argument about the power and jurisdiction of the Church in the secular realm. This context provides an illuminating introduction to the intellectual culture of the city in which I argue the documents at the centre of this study were created.

Although there was a school within the cloisters of S. Eusebio in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, the canons of S. Eusebio also participated and occupied positions in other religious communities. Alberto, at the turn of the century, enabled the institution of the school of theology at the already existing cathedral school and entrusted its organisation and teaching to canon Cotta.<sup>105</sup> Although scant documentary evidence survives of Cotta's life, this churchman played a vitally important role in the development of theological culture among men of the church in Vercelli, and in broadening the city's international horizons at the end of the twelfth century.<sup>106</sup> His death is recorded in the *Necrologi Eusebiani* on 15 March 1194, his will being ratified by Bishop Alberto and the chapter of S. Eusebio on 4 April.<sup>107</sup> The cathedral's necrology, begun in the 1130s and continued until the eighteenth century, lists the details of the lives as well as the deaths of the individuals attached to the cathedral chapter.<sup>108</sup> It is considered one of the most reliable sources available for the scant details of Cotta's

---

<sup>105</sup> Minghetti, 'L'episcopato Vercellese di Alberto', pp. 99–112.

<sup>106</sup> Frova, 'Teologia a Vercelli', pp. 311–33.

<sup>107</sup> Colombo, 'I necrologi eusebiani', BSBS, II (1897) pp. 383–94, at pp. 385–6, nr. 181.

<sup>108</sup> The cathedral necrology is preserved in BCVC, MS XXXIII and LXII. It was edited by G. Colombo in series from 1897–1902 in the BSBS, and by R. Pastè in the same journal in 1923. See bibliography for full details.



existence. His epitaph, which is recorded in a fourteenth-century manuscript of the Archivio Capitolare (ACVC, MS 53, fol. 80v), reads: *Ad sepulcrum quondam domini Cotte de Tronzano canonici cardinalis ecclesie Vercellensis, sacre theologie professoris*.<sup>109</sup> The terminology is important, as *professoris* indicates that Cotta was not simply remembered as a graduate of theology, but as a teacher.<sup>110</sup> As other canons from the same period as Cotta are also named as *magistri*, this suggests a density of teaching activity at S. Eusebio. Cotta left his library to the canons of S. Eusebio, specifying that the books be used in common, *ad communem utilitatem*; this testament is included in an inventory of his library.<sup>111</sup> Paolo Rosso makes the important point that the bulk of the library was put together while Cotta was in Paris, during which time he was in contact with Peter Lombard, and individuals close to Thomas Becket.<sup>112</sup> Although the existence of a rich environment of theological learning in Vercelli under Cotta and others in the late twelfth-century appears to be maintained through to the flourishing of the community of S. Andrea and the establishment of the *studium* in 1228, Frova and others have pointed out that these institutions have separate foundations and histories, and we should not view them as continuous. The vibrant theological activity of Vercelli from the late twelfth century onwards is nonetheless critically important for our appreciation of the originality of some manuscripts of the Rotoli figurati, particularly the *Ecclesia* diagram.

### *The abbey of S. Andrea*

Guala began to accumulate land for this project as early as 1215, when the diocese of Vercelli granted him the rights of the parish church of S. Andrea.<sup>113</sup> The abbey was built south of this parish church, near S. Eusebio, the public square, and townhouses in that

---

<sup>109</sup> R. Pastè, 'Di alcuni epitaffi del Duomo antico', *Archivio della Società Vercellese di Storia e d'Arte*, 5 (1913), pp. 693–707, at p. 698.

<sup>110</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 100–1.

<sup>111</sup> Frova, 'Teologia a Vercelli', pp. 311–33. The library included biblical texts and commentaries on rhetoric, grammar, and theology including the *Sentences* of Peter Lombard.

<sup>112</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at p. 101.

<sup>113</sup> R. Pastè and E. Arborio-Mella, *L'abbazia di S. Andrea di Vercelli* (Vercelli, 1907), at pp. 179–84.

quarter of the city.<sup>114</sup> In 1217, Guala was granted the income from the rectory and benefice of the church of St. Andrew at Chesterton, in the diocese of Ely. The development of S. Andrea as an institution is part of the legacy of Guala's exceptionally successful career in the papal curia.<sup>115</sup> By 1219, the abbey's first prior had been chosen, a regular canon from the congregation of Santa Croce di Mortara, near Pavia: *frater Iacopus de Priano*.<sup>116</sup> This was a long established convent of regular canons, the same community to which Bishop Alberto (d. 1214) had belonged to as prior (c. 1180).<sup>117</sup> Passing through Paris on his return from England in 1218, Guala recruited the first members of S. Andrea's congregation from among the regular canons of Saint Victor in Paris.<sup>118</sup> Among this group was the theologian Thomas Gallus.<sup>119</sup> A canon of S. Eusebio, acting as proxy for Bishop Ugolino, laid the foundation stone on 19 February 1219. The church was consecrated in 1224, and received abbatial status between November and December of 1225, when Gallus is first referred to as its first abbot.<sup>120</sup>

Gallus was a prominent theologian, who maintained the school of Saint Victor's reputation of speculative theology and mysticism through his translations of and

---

<sup>114</sup> The parish church of S. Andrea coexisted with the new abbey for ten years, and it is referred to as destroyed by 1240. San Luca, a new parish church, was founded in 1235 on a different site. See M. Schilling, 'The Thirteenth-Century Abbey of Sant'Andrea in Vercelli: the Gothic Architecture and its Historical Context' (unpublished PhD Thesis, University of Warwick, 2001), pp. 14–18; Schilling, 'The Thirteenth-Century Abbey of Sant'Andrea in Vercelli', 115–30, at p. 115.

<sup>115</sup> Gregory IX exempted the abbey from episcopal control, granting the abbot disposition on its rule. Papal interventions in its constitutions continued throughout the thirteenth century, with Urban IV ratifying reforms made by Cardinal Hugh de Saint-Cher in 1261. Paravicini Bagliani, *I testamenti*, pp. 110–120.

<sup>116</sup> Guala left a donation to Santa Croce di Mortara in his will. See C. Andenna, *Mortariensis Ecclesia. Una congregazione di canonici regolari in Italia settentrionale tra XI e XII secolo* (Münster, 2007), at p. 455; G. A. Frova, *Gualae Bicherii presbyteri cardinalis S. Martini in Montibus vita et gesta collecta a Philadelpho Libico* (Milan, 1767), pp. 110–12.

<sup>117</sup> L. Gulli, 'Alberto da Vercelli, santo', *DBI* (Rome, 1960); Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, at pp. 171, 484–487.

<sup>118</sup> Guala's contacts with the Victorine abbey in Paris are discussed above but were established from the first part of his legation in France in 1208. See G. Ferraris, 'Ex priore abbas fuit primus. Contributo alla biografia di Tommaso Gallo', *Bollettino Storico Vercellese*, 25 (1996), pp. 5–31.

<sup>119</sup> The appellation 'Gallus' was not used in his lifetime, contemporary documents refer to him as *Thomas abbas Vercellensis* or prior to this *Thomas Parisiensis* when he was canon at Saint Victor. Mario Capellino, *Tommaso di S. Vittore, abate vercellese* (Vercelli, 1978).

<sup>120</sup> Ferraris, 'Ex priore abbas fuit primus', pp. 19–24. The relevant charters are found in: Frova, *Gualae Bicherii*, at pp. 102, 135–44, and 156.

commentaries on the corpus of pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite. He influenced methods of exegesis, tending towards novel and unusual interpretations of the Gospels.<sup>121</sup> None of his works survive in the library of S. Eusebio, but the presence of Gallus at S. Andrea lends credence to a milieu of advanced theological study in the first half of the thirteenth century.<sup>122</sup> It is likely that the reputation Gallus accrued in Paris would have conferred some of the intellectual prestige of the school of Saint Victor to the abbey in Vercelli. Alongside his role as abbot, Gallus would almost certainly have undertaken a teaching role at the abbey. Indeed, he is commemorated as a teacher in a fourteenth-century funerary monument, still in S. Andrea today (figure 38).<sup>123</sup> Guala's choice of regular canons to make up the abbey's first congregation certainly suggests that he had a reason to favour this group. Further, his immediate endowment of a large and significant library to the abbey suggests Guala had a particular interest in maintaining the tradition of intellectual activity that the community at the abbey of Saint Victor were known for.<sup>124</sup> This initial endowment of thirty-three texts was made by 1224, when the abbey's construction was completed, and enriched by a further ninety-eight codices in Guala's bequest of 1227.<sup>125</sup> The contents of these donations indicate intellectual interests in theology, and provided texts for the teaching of the sacred page.

Martina Schilling proposed that the layout and arrangement of S. Andrea should be seen as a distinct example of Victorine architecture, designed in response to the needs of that specific community.<sup>126</sup> Following the work of Margot Fassler, Schilling has

---

<sup>121</sup> P. Gabriel Théry, 'Thomas Gallus. Aperçu Biographique', *Archives d'histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Âge*, 12 (1939), pp. 141–208.

<sup>122</sup> However, one of his works, the *Commentary on the Song of Songs* is found in a manuscript at Turin, Biblioteca Nazionale Universitaria, MS E. IV. 21. This manuscript may have been part of the library of S. Andrea, dispersed after the abbey's suppression. See Segre Montel, *I manoscritti miniati*, I, at p. 166.

<sup>123</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, p. 102.

<sup>124</sup> Vincent, *The Letters and Charters of Cardinal Guala Bicchieri, Papal Legate in England, 1216–1218*, xliii.

<sup>125</sup> See S. Castronovo, 'Il tesoro e la biblioteca di Guala Bicchieri: il gotico settentrionale a Vercelli', in *Arti figurative a Biella e a Vercelli. Il Duecento e il Trecento*, ed. V. Natale (Biella, 2007), pp. 25–42. G. Tibaldeschi, 'La biblioteca di S. Andrea di Vercelli nel 1467', *Bollettino Storico Vercellese*, 30/1 (1988), pp. 61–106.

<sup>126</sup> M. Schilling, 'Victorine Liturgy and Its Architectural Setting at the Church of Sant'Andrea in

convincingly proposed that the form of S. Andrea was not only designed to suit practically the needs of liturgical practice, but also to have a symbolic resonance, reflecting the focus on hierarchies within Victorine spirituality and indeed within Thomas Gallus's commentaries on Pseudo-Dionysius.<sup>127</sup> We know that Guala had spent time at the university of Paris, and his choice, therefore, to choose a congregation of Victorine canons to fill his new abbey in Vercelli indicates that he favoured some aspect of their way of life. It is plausible that Guala, intended to enrich his hometown's intellectual prestige further by establishing in Vercelli a community renowned for their learning and teaching.<sup>128</sup> Gallus was already celebrated for his teaching, at the school of Saint Victor. The teaching methods of Hugh of Saint Victor, and his use of monumental images, perhaps reflect the pedagogical inheritance of the abbey at Saint Victor, and so to have been transmitted through the intellectual and educational approaches of the regular canons —originally of Saint Victor— at S. Andrea.<sup>129</sup>

### *Monastic and mendicant communities in and around Vercelli*

We have seen how in the late twelfth and early thirteenth century, Vercelli was a politically significant and growing urban centre, with an established reputation as a place of advanced learning. The cultural and intellectual activity at the schools of S. Eusebio, and from 1225 at S. Andrea, had a prestigious reputation and attracted students from far afield. It is therefore unsurprising that the nascent mendicant orders established early houses in Vercelli; before 1228 for the Friars Minor, and c. 1230 for the Order of Preachers.<sup>130</sup> The Friars Minor had a convent at the church of San Matteo, outside the

---

Vercelli', *Gesta*, 42/2 (2003), 115–30.

<sup>127</sup> Schilling, 'Victorine Liturgy', pp. 115–130, at pp. 125, 127–8; M. Fassler, *Gothic Song: Victorine Sequences and Augustinian Reform in Twelfth-Century Paris* (Cambridge, 1993).

<sup>128</sup> Vincent, *The Letters and Charters of Cardinal Guala Bicchieri, Papal Legate in England, 1216–1218*, xliii.

<sup>129</sup> C. Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark: Hugh of Saint Victor, Art, and Thought in the Twelfth Century* (Cambridge, 2014), at pp. 49–50.

<sup>130</sup> The Franciscan community was established at the convent of S. Matteo, just outside the walls in the south of the city. By 1270s they had relocated to S. Salvatore in Mercatello within the walls, which was expanded and dedicated to S. Francesco. The Order of Preachers were initially hosted at S. Pietro della Ferla and S. Paolo al Cervo by the porta Aralda. Orsenigo, *Vercelli sacra*, 123.

city walls.<sup>131</sup> The presence of mendicant communities in Vercelli is particularly relevant for our interpretation of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), as these groups are associated with the circulation of Joachim's ideas after the mid-thirteenth century. We should recall, however, that the texts of Rotoli figurati 4 and 7 are the only known examples of the thought of Joachim of Fiore in Vercelli, and that before the mid-thirteenth century the main environments for the transmission of Joachim's thought were Benedictine and Cistercian communities, prior to the adoption of Joachimist theology by the mendicant orders after Pope Honorius III's 'rehabilitation' of the theologian in 1220.<sup>132</sup> As Paolo Rosso has recently demonstrated, the Dominican order played a significant role in Vercelli's intellectual culture in the thirteenth century. We shall see that documentary evidence shows that important donations of books were designated for the use by both the Franciscan and Dominican communities, with some bequests issuing from the canons and bishops of S. Eusebio.<sup>133</sup> Their concerns may have influenced the kinds of texts produced and used in the city's schools and centres of learning during this period. Moreover, there are several references to individuals influential in the early development of the orders present in the city early in the century. Antony of Padua, who was canonised by Gregory IX in 1232, preached in Vercelli as part of his journey through the university centres of Bologna, Padua, Montpellier, and Toulouse from 1227 prior to his death in 1231.<sup>134</sup> His late thirteenth-century *vita* reports that Francis himself sent Anthony to Vercelli, to study mystical theology with Abbot Thomas Gallus, at the abbey of S. Andrea.<sup>135</sup> Although the origins of this command are obscure, Gallus records Anthony's preaching in an autobiographic

---

<sup>131</sup> G. G. Merlo, 'La prima diffusione dei frati minori in Piemonte', in *Tra eremo e città: studi su Francesco d'Assisi e sul francescanesimo medievale* (Assisi, 1991), pp. 391–409, at pp. 395–396. See also an overview of book donations made to the convent in the later middle ages, in Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 137–9.

<sup>132</sup> E. R. Daniel, 'A Re-Examination of the Origins of Franciscan Joachitism', *Speculum*, 43/4 (1968), pp. 671–76. See also M. Reeves, *The Influence of Prophecy in the Later Middle Ages: A Study in Joachimism* (Oxford, 1969), 32; Joachim of Fiore, *Scripta Breviora*, p. 321n.

<sup>133</sup> Rosso describes a monetary bequest to the convent of San Matteo left by Giacomo Carnario, a canon of S. Eusebio at the time, later bishop of Vercelli. Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, p. 138..

<sup>134</sup> His preaching is recorded in G. Colombo, 'I necrologi eusebiani', *Bollettino storico-bibliografico subalpino*, 3 (1898), at p. 285, n. 430.

<sup>135</sup> This episode is reported by Mandelli, *Il comune di Vercelli*, vol. III (1858), at p. 8.

passage found in his *Explanatio in hierarchiam ecclesiasticam Dionysii* of 1244.<sup>136</sup> Jean Châtillon has argued that Anthony had a direct relationship with the Victorine theologian.<sup>137</sup> The second figure is Elias of Cortona, one of the earliest general ministers, and first vicar of the order from 1221 to 1227, who was present in Vercelli as a guest of Bishop Ugolino da Sesso between 1224 and 1227.<sup>138</sup> Purportedly, he was made the order's first *lector* in theology by Francis, and his academic training reformed the Franciscan approach to preaching and was responsible for organising their method of combating heresy. Elias implemented early initiatives to educate literate members of the order by creating study houses in suitable convents; even Salimbene da Adam allowed that he strengthened theological studies in the order despite his otherwise consistent and vitriolic treatment of the man.<sup>139</sup> Although Elias was a controversial figure in the order at this time, he maintained good relations with Pope Gregory IX and was an influential figure in the order at a time when it was negotiating its political power with difficulty.<sup>140</sup> It is therefore significant that he was a guest of Bishop Ugolino at a time when the city was in close and active collaboration with the papacy, as Grado Merlo has observed.<sup>141</sup>

Jordan of Saxony, the second Dominican master general, wrote of a 'body of able students' that could be found in Vercelli in 1229. The letter in which this accolade is found was written in the summer of 1229, and Jordan wrote of his pleasure at recruiting to the order notable students and masters from the Vercelli scholarly community, including two lecturers from the cathedral school of S. Eusebio.<sup>142</sup> These

---

<sup>136</sup> See J. Châtillon, 'Saint Antoine de Padoue et les victorins', in Jean Châtillon, *Le mouvement canonial au Moyen Âge*, ed. P. Sicard, Bibliotheca Victorina, 3 (Paris, 1992), pp. 255–92. at pp. 266–7; Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 102–3, 137.

<sup>137</sup> Châtillon, 'Saint Antoine de Padoue et les victorins', pp. 180–186.

<sup>138</sup> Elias's stay as a guest of the bishop is recorded in a note of possession found on the guard sheet of a ninth-century gospel book, ACVC, MS CXXXIV, which reads: *Liber fratris Elye, qui stat cum episcopo Vercellensi*. The friar is also present in three acts of the chapter, in 1224, 1225, and 1227. See D. Arnoldi, ed., *Le carte dello archivio arcivescovile di Vercelli*, Biblioteca della società storica subalpina, 85 (Pinerolo, 1917), at p. 224. See Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 137–8.

<sup>139</sup> R. B. Brooke, *Early Franciscan Government: Elias to Bonaventure* (Cambridge, 1959), pp. 45–6.

<sup>140</sup> D. Burr, *The Spiritual Franciscans: From Protest to Persecution in the Century after Saint Francis* (University Park, PA, 2001), pp. 16–7.

<sup>141</sup> Merlo, 'La prima diffusione dei frati minori in Piemonte', at p. 395.

<sup>142</sup> M. M. Mulchahey, 'First the Bow Is Bent in Study': *Dominican Education before 1350* (Toronto, 1998), at pp. 68–9; Jordan of Saxony, *Beati Iordani de Saxonia Epistulae*, ed. A. Walz, Monumenta Ordinis Fratrum Praedicatorum historica, 23 (Rome, 1951), no. 49, at pp. 56–58.

instances should further evoke a sense of the significance of Vercelli as an intellectual centre for the Order of Preachers in their foundation years. Leading figures from both these ambitious orders sought to establish relationships with the city's bishops, and to establish permanent communities in the city early in their development.

This evidence attests to an elevated level of cultural activity at the Vercelli convent witnessed by the documents pertaining to the library. It seems that the intellectual activity of the Friars Minor was occurring elsewhere in the city, as part of a thriving connection in the 1230s between Franciscan theologians and the Victorine regular canons of S. Andrea. The convent of San Matteo may not have possessed its own centre of theological teaching, but friars who passed through Vercelli clearly participated in the centres of learning available elsewhere in the city. The events described above demonstrate a close cultural tie between the friars and the teaching facilities available at S. Andrea. Further, Bert Roest has argued convincingly in his recent reassessment of the Franciscan school system that by 1219 or 1220, the Friars Minor were not so far behind the Order of Preachers in terms of a systematic approach to education and theological teaching. It is important that we hold this in mind when considering the presence of Franciscan thinkers and their influence in Vercelli.<sup>143</sup>

Dominican intellectual history has long established the importance of convent schools in the development of structures of learning in the thirteenth century.<sup>144</sup> The order's early establishment of advanced teaching in addition to the basic education offered by their convent schools means they were soon in contact with the earliest universities. In Vercelli, it is for the Order of Preachers that we have by far the largest amount of evidence for their role in theological culture and scriptural teaching, although at the *studium*, not the convent school. They arrived between 1230 and 1233, staying first at San Pietro della Ferla, and then at San Paolo al Cervo, before being established in the 1250s at the church of San Paolo within the city walls.<sup>145</sup> In a mid-thirteenth century manuscript (BCVC, Codex LXXXV, at fol. 187v), there is a note

---

<sup>143</sup> B. Roest, 'The Franciscan School System: Re-Assessing the Early Evidence (ca. 1220-1260)', in *Franciscan Organisation in the Mendicant Context: Formal and Informal Structures of the Friars' Lives and Ministry in the Middle Ages*, ed. M. Robson and J. Röhrkasten (Berlin, 2010), pp. 253-280.

<sup>144</sup> Mulchahey, *First the Bow Is Bent in Study*, pp. x-xiii.

<sup>145</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at pp. 114-20.

recording members of the order who passed through the convent at the Church of San Pietro della Ferla in the early 1230s. Paolo Rosso has identified many of this list of brothers, and nearly all of them are of the highest levels of the order: *magister Clarus*, for example, was the Provincial Master for Rome. Moneta of Cremona was to become a learned doctor of theology at Bologna in the 1240s, and wrote an anti-heretical tract against the Cathars and Waldensians. Others were also provincial masters or had accompanied papal legates outside of Italy.<sup>146</sup> The presence in the city of such eminent members of the Order of Preachers and the early establishment of the convent means we can infer that the Order valued and made use of the centres of advanced theological learning available at Vercelli. Certainly there is later evidence, from the case of bequests and donations made by *magister Syon* of Vercelli to his students among the mendicant orders in the 1270s and 80s, that Dominicans studied at the *Studium*.<sup>147</sup> Their activity within the *studium* perhaps explains the lack of evidence for high-level teaching in theology at the convent school until after 1260. Furthermore, this would reflect a broader tendency in the order at this time for learned individuals to be active within available schools outside the convent, particularly in disciplines like theology.<sup>148</sup>

We know that the ability and authority of the Order of Preachers in this area was recognised within the city. Giacomo Carnario, bishop of Vercelli (1236–1241), donated his entire collection of theological tracts to the order at San Paolo in his testament of 1234.<sup>149</sup> The conditions of the donation mark out its contents as suitable for the study and teaching of theology: no part of the collection was to be loaned or dispersed, except to the canons of S. Eusebio, the *magister* of theological teaching at the active university *studium*, and a *socius* of the bishop.<sup>150</sup> Carnario left a remarkably rich collection. Of particular note are copies of the *Decretum* and *Decretales*, two works of Tancred of Bologna on marriage, the *Summa super cantica cantorum* of Thomas Gallus, and a copy of the *Summa quaestionis* of *magister Praepositinus*, chancellor of the

---

<sup>146</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 116–20, with the list transcribed at p. 116.

<sup>147</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 124–5; G. Colombo, ‘Il testamento di maestro Syon, dottore in grammatica, Vercellese’, BSBS, I (1896), pp. 41–57, at p. 49.

<sup>148</sup> Mulchahey, ‘*First the Bow Is Bent in Study*’, pp. 55–60.

<sup>149</sup> Savio, *Antichi vescovi*, I, 491.

<sup>150</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, 123, n. 134.



university of Paris from 1206–1210.<sup>151</sup> Connections between the intellectual milieu of the university of Paris and the school of Saint Victor and Vercelli are suggested by the presence of Gallus. Tancred of Bologna's work influenced the production of works on canon law in the thirteenth century, and further demonstrates that such modern texts on theology and canon law were owned and studied by the bishops of Vercelli at S. Eusebio.

The engagement of the Order with current intellectual trends is also reflected in their role in Vercelli as promoters and protagonists in the foundation process of the *studium* in 1228, which we will turn to shortly. This is clear in the figure of Filippo de Carisio. Filippo's life is important not only as a witness to Dominican involvement in the foundation of the *studium*, but also because his career saw him occupy the role of canon and chaplain to the bishop at S. Eusebio, to a member of the Order of Preachers, and a teacher and student of canon law, educated at Padua. His connections to the *studium* at Padua are perhaps what led to his influential role in negotiating the contract between students there and the commune of Vercelli. Filippo's career as a chaplain to bishop Ugolino da Sesso is witnessed in a chapter act of 1214.<sup>152</sup>

There were several large and prosperous Cistercian houses established across the Po valley in the twelfth century. Within the diocese of Vercelli were the important Cistercian houses of S. Maria at Lucedio (1124), supported by donations from the Marquis of Monferrato and a daughter house of La Ferté and Staffarda (1135).<sup>153</sup> From Staffarda, southwest of Turin, survives a twelfth-century inventory of sixty volumes. In addition, Morimondo, southwest of Milan and founded in 1134, possessed an active scriptorium whose large collections have been traced and listed by Mirella Ferrari.<sup>154</sup> Of

---

<sup>151</sup> Cited in Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at p. 128, n. 135.

<sup>152</sup> He is described as *magister Phylippus capellanus domini episcopi*, indicating as P. Rosso has noted, that Filippo was a highly educated individual. Records from his entry into the Order, in Bologna in 1219, describes him as *Philippus de Carisio Vercellensis iuris canonici doctor*. See Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at p. 23.

<sup>153</sup> G. Giordano, 'L'abbazia di Lucedio e le sue grange', *Bollettino Storico Vercellese*, 8 (1978), pp. 73–98.

<sup>154</sup> M. Ferrari, 'Lo scriptorium di Morimondo', in *Un'abbazia lombarda. Morimondo, la sua storia e il suo messaggio*, 1998, pp. 103–12. See also the earlier work of Jean Leclercq: J. Leclercq, 'Textes et manuscrits cisterciens dans les bibliothèques des Etats-Unis', *Traditio*, 17 (1961), pp. 176–81.

the Cistercian houses in Piemonte, such as Rivalta Scrivia (1181) Casanova (founded in 1150), Casalvolone (1169), and Barona (1189), there is very little or no extant evidence for the activity of scriptoria.<sup>155</sup> The house of Barona, as was noted in chapter one, has been identified by Bernard McGinn as the abbey of 'Veldona', whom Joachim addressed his *Epistola*.<sup>156</sup>

Benedictine communities in Vercelli were acknowledged in bequests by Guala Bicchieri in the early thirteenth century, S. Stefano della Cittadella situated outside the Porta S. Stefano of Vercelli (of an unknown foundation date, possibly pre-1000),<sup>157</sup> and the abbey of Mulecchio [Muleggio], founded in the first half of the twelfth century and situated about two miles outside the city walls. Scant information is available about the libraries of these convents in Vercelli. Within the city, the Humiliati held the church of S. Cristoforo from 1144, and there is one small but significant piece of evidence regarding their possible input into Vercelli's cultural activity. Paolo Rosso has identified a thirteenth-century codex of Richard of Saint-Victor's *De contemplatione*, now held at the Biblioteca Universitaria of Pavia. This manuscript contains an inscription indicating that it belonged to a member of the Humiliati named Antonio de Bagnasco, who was a member of S. Cristoforo. As Rosso argues, this single codex might indicate the kind of intellectual concerns displayed by this order in the first half of the thirteenth century, suggesting a programme of texts similar to that of the abbey of Saint-Victor in Paris.<sup>158</sup> More broadly however, wealthy Cistercian houses such as those active in the Po valley in the late twelfth century would have possessed manuscript collections, and the largest, with active scriptoria, would have produced manuscripts which disseminated styles and ideas within regional networks of houses.<sup>159</sup> Abbots of these Cistercian houses often

---

<sup>155</sup> M. Ferrari, 'Dopo Bernardo: biblioteche e *scriptoria* cisterciensi dell'Italia settentrionale nel XII secolo', in *San Bernardo e l'Italia: atti del convegno di studi, Milano, 24-26 maggio 1990*, ed. P. Zerbi (Milan, 1993), at p. 254.

<sup>156</sup> See chapter one, section 7. The abbey is described in Janauschek, *Originum Cisterciensium*, I, 216. Janauschek observed variant names for Barona: 'Vardona, Valdona', 'Sardona', 'Bardone, Sardone'. This identification of the abbey is also followed by B. McGinn in McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality*, 291.

<sup>157</sup> Mandelli, *Il comune di Vercelli nel medio evo*, pp. 143–151.

<sup>158</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 141–2.

<sup>159</sup> See broadly, chapters 5 and 7 in: E. Jamrozik, *The Cistercian Order in Medieval Europe, 1090–1500* (Abingdon, 2013).

worked alongside the bishop of Vercelli to arbitrate juridical disputes. One of the most influential figures in this area was Peter, abbot of Lucedio, who frequently collaborated with Bishop Alberto on behalf of Pope Innocent III in the protracted process of the re-acceptance of the Humiliati order into the Church, and disputes involving the military orders.<sup>160</sup> The repeated delegation of sensitive tasks to Vercelli abbots, bishops, and ecclesiastical leaders by popes like Innocent is evidence that knowledgeable local figures with established authority were instrumental in carrying through papal directives.<sup>161</sup>

The possession of examples of Joachim's works at the cathedral chapter in Vercelli at the end of the twelfth century would make the diocese an exceptional and early vector for Joachim's thought, during a period when the abbot was a highly political thinker, invited to the papal court and conducting interviews with secular rulers. However, we have shown that the Po Valley was the site of several important Cistercian and Benedictine houses in this period, with documentary evidence demonstrating that bishops of Vercelli, and senior canons of the chapter maintained good rapport with leaders from these houses. In the mid-thirteenth century and onwards, the presence of the Friars Minor and the Order of Preachers in the city and active in its centres of learning provide another source for sustained interest in Joachim's thought in Vercelli which lead to the works of Joachim being copied in the cathedral chapter. However, in the late twelfth century, the close links between S. Eusebio and major local Cistercian and Benedictine sources provides a potential source for an early transmission of the works and thought of Joachim of Fiore; these interests could corroborate a late twelfth-century exemplar already in existence in Vercelli at this time. The sustained interest which led to Rotoli figurati 7, for example, being copied and conserved prior to the year 1260, should moreover be seen as a product of the unique history of urban intellectual culture of Vercelli.

---

<sup>160</sup> See F. Andrews, *The Early Humiliati* (Cambridge, 1999), 86; Bellomo, *The Templar Order in North-West Italy (1142-c.1330)*, 155; J. C. Moore, 'Peter of Lucedio (Cistercian Patriarch of Antioch) and Pope Innocent III', *Römisches historische Mitteilungen*, 29 (1987), pp. 221–49.

<sup>161</sup> Alberzoni, 'Innocenzo III e la riforma della Chiesa in Lombardia', pp. 122–78.

## *The establishment of the studium in 1228*

On 4 April 1228 in Padua, a contract was drafted between two parties: delegates of the Vercelli commune and representatives of the corporation of Paduan students prepared a document, the *Carta studii*.<sup>162</sup> The commune of Vercelli made the proposal, and pledged to bear the financial costs of transferring what the document refers to as *universum Studium Padue* from Padua to Vercelli. It made provisions for the foundation and support of a university *studium* in Vercelli for an eight-year period; support was immediately written into the city's statutes, and the podestà and his successors were pledged to respect the conditions of the contract.<sup>163</sup> All practical matters were considered. Accommodation was provided in the form of five hundred rooms, offered at a fixed rent. Students were guaranteed freedom of movement, exemption from toll fees, a consistent supply of food, and loans at preferential rates. The commune also accepted responsibility for paying the stipends of fourteen teachers: three professors of civil law, four of canon law (two decretists and two decretalists), four to teach the *artes liberales* (two dialecticians and two grammarians), two teachers of medicine, and one theologian. Two canons of S. Eusebio, Bongiovanni de Bondonis and Martino Avogadro, along with the aforementioned Dominican friar and former chaplain Filippo de Carisio, witnessed the *Carta studii* on behalf of the city. The central role of the commune in the foundation of a *studium* can also be seen in similar arrangements in Siena, Piacenza, Perugia, and Treviso. As Paulo Rosso has observed, a *studium* at Modena, founded at almost the same time as Vercelli, was also supported by communal finances. For the commune, the proposition of the *Carta* would offer the potential not only for the economic advantage of having a thousand more wealthy individuals present in the city, but also the long-term benefits of increasing Vercelli's prestige as a centre of learning.

---

<sup>162</sup> The charter is edited by G. Casiraghi as 'La 'Carta Studii' di Vercelli', in G. Casiraghi, 'La Carta Studii di Vercelli: 4 Aprile 1228. Note di paleografia e diplomatica', *Bollettino storico-bibliografico subalpino*, 104 (2006), pp. 579–98. See also I Naso, 'Lo Studium di Vercelli nel Medioevo', in *Università in Europa. Le istituzioni universitarie dal Medio Evo ai nostri giorni strutture, organizzazione, funzionamento. Atti del Convegno Internazionale di Studi, Milazzo 28 settembre - 2 ottobre 1993*, ed. A. Romano (Catanzaro, 1995), 227–38.

<sup>163</sup> R. Ordano, 'L'istituzione dello Studio di Vercelli', in *L'Università di Vercelli nel medioevo. Il Congresso storico vercellese, Vercelli 23-25 ottobre 1992*, ed. G. G. Merlo and R. Ordano, Biblioteca della Società storica Vercellese (Vercelli, 1994), pp. 167–204, at pp. 179–80.

Although the commune initiated the foundation of the *studium*, this does not preclude the influence of the cultural interests of the diocese. Indeed, the presence of the two canons of S. Eusebio indirectly suggests the approval and involvement of Ugo da Sesso, bishop of the city from 1213–1235. The presence of Filippo also demonstrates the close relations between the Church and the Order of Preachers in the city. The composition of the Vercelli commune was mainly those aristocratic families with closest relationships to bishops and canons of S. Eusebio, and particularly to the congregation at S.

Andrea.<sup>164</sup>

Although the document is clear in its practical arrangements, it leaves the organisational details of teaching obscure. One aspect of the structure of the *studium* that remains clear is the groups formed by the students, called *nationes*. As Manlio Bellomo describes, these associations gathered together students from different regions, giving them a means to satisfy their everyday needs and requirements for study.<sup>165</sup> In Vercelli, the divisions of the *nationes* are given to us in the part of the *Carta* that describes how professors were to be elected. This is particularly revealing, as it demonstrates that the position of chair of theology was elected by a different procedure. The rectors of the four nations, of the *Francigenarum*, *Ytalicorum*, *Theotonicorum* and *Provincialium* were sworn to elect the best professors they could find to the vacant positions, but if no agreement could be reached on their votes, they were to add the vote of the master of theology. This leaves the question of the election of masters of theology.<sup>166</sup> It is important to note here that the provision for a chair of theology in the *Carta studii* is the first in any Italian university context. Some form of continuity with the chair of theology established by bishop Alberto at the cathedral of S. Eusebio is therefore likely, particularly in the early years of the *studium*.

The *studium* also provided education in theology and in canon law for monks from across the diocese. Monastic houses outside the city walls were far more vulnerable

---

<sup>164</sup> See Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 19–20.

<sup>165</sup> M. Bellomo, *The Common Legal Past of Europe, 1000–1800*, Studies in Medieval and Early Modern Canon Law, 4 (Washington, DC, 1995), pp. 120–2.

<sup>166</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 97–8.. S. Lomartire and G. Cantino Wataghin, eds., *Carta Studii et scolarium commorantium in Studio Vercellarum. 4 aprile 1228. Intorno al primo documento della Università medievale di Vercelli* (Vercelli, 2005), at p. 28.

to the political instability of the period: libraries were ransacked or subject to theft, and houses were sometimes temporarily abandoned for reasons of safety. Nonetheless, it is clear that where possible Benedictine houses would send elite members to study theology in Vercelli, as in the case of *Gaufredus*, prior of the Benedictine house of S. Maiolo of Pavia, who is recorded in the city in 1263.<sup>167</sup> Although there is limited further evidence from our period, the faculty for teaching theology continued to be used by Cluniac houses throughout the fourteenth century.<sup>168</sup>

The work of Paolo Rosso, and earlier Carla Frova, has reframed the relationship between the educational and intellectual culture of the cathedral and the chapter school and that of the *studium*. Frova stresses, as does more recent historiography on this aspect of thirteenth-century Vercelli, that the development of the universities should not be analysed as a rigid linear development from cathedral school to university. The university was to some extent an innovation, and it required the commune to take a financial risk, and negotiate with the diocese. However, there was not a rigid separation between it and existing intellectual communities in the cathedral chapter, the abbey of S. Andrea and mendicant schools in the city environment. It is highly likely that the commune was attempting to profit (in many ways) from an already established network of student movement from Bologna and east through the Po Valley, and Rosso has argued convincingly that part of the intention behind the foundation of the *studium* was to manipulate this migration, and establish the city as a new ‘headquarters’ for this attractive contemporary arrangement of teaching.<sup>169</sup> Certain connections may have already existed between the culture developed around the Vercelli church and the ‘cultura universitaria’, but they were highly flexible, and other relationships developed at the same time: the divisions between the *studium* and other centres of learning in Vercelli were permeable.<sup>170</sup>

---

<sup>167</sup> The charter of San Maiolo from 24 December 1263 records *Gaufredus: in scholis theologie apud Vercelas*. See: G. G. Merlo, ‘L’Università di Vercelli nel Medioevo: A proposito di un recente volume’, *Bollettino storico vercellese*, 1994, pp. 5–6.

<sup>168</sup> P. Rosso gathered information mainly from the priories of San Valeriano di Robbio and San Pietro di Castelletto Monastero. Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at pp. 140–1.

<sup>169</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at pp. 29–31.

<sup>170</sup> Frova, ‘Teologia a Vercelli’, at p. 312.

## Conclusion

Examining the centres for learning in Vercelli allows us to see the Rotoli figurati as objects of use within this environment. The content of these documents should be seen in the light of the intellectual, and indeed ideological, interests of those who used them — the educated canons and senior prelates of S. Eusebio, and perhaps later the students who came to learn from them. Evidence from the medieval collections of S. Eusebio and S. Andrea helps us to critically engage with the Rotoli figurati, their sources and influences. Further, our understanding of this intellectual environment is in turn enriched by our understanding of the Rotoli figurati. We have seen that Vercelli had demonstrable cultural connections to other intellectual centres in Europe, particularly in France and England, as well as centres of learning elsewhere in Italy. Furthermore, the permeable divisions between the different centres of learning in the city, combined with the influence from the theological backgrounds and prerogatives of those active within these centres, created a milieu in which innovative thought could thrive. The cultural influence of the mendicant orders in the thirteenth century is often seen as crucial for the dissemination and discussion of the works and ideas of Joachim of Fiore. The interrelation of the Apocalyptic aspects of Joachimist thought with the political activities of the Church, contemporary theology, and the ideology of the social role of the mendicant orders, is an important thematic backdrop to the creation and reception of the manuscripts in Vercelli.

While this overview has demonstrated the calibre and unusual permeability of theological learning in Vercelli, in the late twelfth century centred on the cathedral of S. Eusebio, and later in the activity of the *studium*, we still require a clearer picture of how the remarkable quality of the Rotoli figurati — their visual nature — fits into (or does not fit into) this intellectual context. What could be considered a creative or renovating use of these materials? What was normal, and what could be considered exceptional? Examining the inventories and contemporary testaments relating to the collections of these communities has told us of their intellectual interests through the available books, and the kind of tools upon which they based their teaching and study. But how does this information relate to the content of the diagrammatic manuscripts of the chapter library? Given what we know of the cultural exchange and influence occurring from

within the city and from further field, do these manuscripts reflect the city's intellectual horizons? Do they simply reflect broader trends of cultural innovation, or are they testimony to the debates, the instability and the ideological conflicts of the period? To answer these questions, and thus gain a better understanding of why these manuscripts came to be created and used in the learned context of thirteenth-century Vercelli, what is now required is to place the *Rotoli figurati* within the broader context of medieval visual culture. The function of these exceptional manuscripts within the thriving intellectual communities of Vercelli can thereby be better understood.



### 3 Visualising knowledge, c. 1150–1300

Each of the Rotoli figurati can arguably be described as a diagram, if a diagram is a mode of representation which also interprets its subject. Every document within the group features distinctive forms of imagery, and depends on an existing, established body of knowledge in order to be understood. This is evidently true for Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*), which contains diagrams in the specific geometrical sense: figures serving to illustrate definitions and proofs of Euclidean geometry (Figure I). The others are also complex, and describing them as diagrams without further clarification cannot hope to do justice to the differences within the group. To reiterate the findings of chapter one, two of these manuscripts contain versions of relatively common images (Rotoli figurati 2, *Rota dominice orationis*, and 3 *Genealogia Christi*), two are known only from the manuscript testimonies in Vercelli (5, *Atti degli apostoli*, and 1 *Disegni geometrici*), two are from a small corpus of similar images (4 *Ecclesia*, and 6 *Mappamondo*), and one contains texts which are unique in the single-sheet format (7 Gioacchino da Fiore).

In this chapter I will address what is distinctive of the images of the Rotoli figurati by situating them within known visual traditions. I will concurrently explore how these kinds of images might have been used in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries in the intellectual contexts which have been laid out in chapter two. The previous chapter established the kinds of audiences which were likely to have been interacting with these documents; it is most likely that these were learned members of religious and intellectual communities, made up of individuals who had received or were in the process of receiving university levels of education. Overall, this chapter aims to examine how the manuscripts of the Rotoli figurati relate to other known visual traditions of representing knowledge, and what they tell us about the wide-ranging changes in the use of the such complex images in the period 1150–1300. The first part of the chapter will give a brief orientation in medieval ideas of vision and theories of seeing, including modes of representation. This will consider cultural attitudes toward memory and will complicate the modern perception of diagrams as simplification mechanisms, or mere

*aides mémoire*. Rather, the chapter will explore diagrams as a nuanced medium of communication that relies on an integration of meaning in text and image.

In the second part, we will interrogate what is useful about examining the source manuscripts as ‘diagrams’, and in turn, what is meant by the term ‘diagram’ in relation to this mode of image-making in the central middle ages, c. 1150–1300. I will address the formal features of each of the Rotoli figurati, contextualising them within known visual traditions by indicating comparisons and potential sources of these images. Doing so will draw out the character and distinctiveness of the manuscript images, while exploring the integration of form and content within the diagrammatic medium. However, the organising concept for the second part of this chapter will be shape. This will include spatial and other metaphors found within the source group: lines, trees, wheels, the world *orbs* or *mundus*, and bodies. In examining these ways of ordering information into communicative devices, we will encounter points of comparison with diverse manifestations of medieval visual culture including other manuscript images and monumental art. Through sustained attention and comparison with the Rotoli figurati, the chapter will also highlight aspects of content which will be elaborated on in subsequent chapters: biblical knowledge, eschatology and time-reckoning, history, memory, and thought. Through this, I hope to illuminate how these modes of complex image-making were a fundamental tool in communicating knowledge and ideology, and how the Rotoli figurati offer diverse and complex examples of these modes, from a known historical context.

## The Visualisation of Knowledge

We have seen in the previous chapter how Vercelli had a significant role during the long period of fluctuating conflict between temporal and ecclesiastical powers following the Investiture Contest, and how the manifold intellectual communities active in the city participated in broader intellectual exchanges of knowledge and ideas. We have established how in the late twelfth century a great centre of theological learning emerged in the city, lead by powerful and learned clerics with authoritative relationships to the Petrine See. This dynamic cultural climate persisted into the thirteenth century. One striking attribute which is repeated in diverse forms within the *Rotoli figurati*, is the use of diagrams, from a worksheet of Euclidean geometry, to representations of macrocosmic order in the *Ecclesia* and *Rota dominice orationis* and the *Mappamondo*: each of these manuscripts makes use of elements of the diagrammatic mode. This visual mode flourished in the second half of the twelfth century, and the sustained use of the diagrammatic mode is distinctive, particularly in the case of *Rotoli figurati* 4 (*Ecclesia*). In *Rotoli figurati* 5 (*Atti degli Apostoli*), the manuscript which is strikingly different in content from the other *Rotoli figurati*, we find a series of drawings which deliberately records for posterity a pictorial cycle within a church. This is an uncommon subject, and we can infer from its preservation that this visual programme was considered important and valuable to the diocese.

Asking questions like these of medieval images requires a brief orientation in theories of vision, and to determine what is meant by a medieval ‘diagram’. Two theoretical frameworks are important: the concepts of ‘visual exegesis’, and the ‘diagrammatic mode’. Anna C. Esmeijer’s early analysis of diagrams in medieval theology coined the term ‘visual exegesis’ to express how the innate order of this kind of image was perceived to have the potential to illuminate theological understanding. For Esmeijer, visual exegesis reverses the function of words and images; the representation supplies the exegesis through its dense visual form, while the text is limited to an

abbreviated explanation, or even just an inscription.<sup>1</sup> Nearly forty years ago, Michael Evans offered another enquiry into medieval didactic figures in his article ‘The Geometry of the Mind’.<sup>2</sup> Evans gave these *figurae* rough groupings and divided them according to their perceived function, which was often to present information economically with a pedagogical and didactic purpose. Although not the first to observe that medieval diagrams should be considered equally as meaningful and significant as the texts they appeared alongside or replaced, Evans offered a stimulating argument, that medieval diagrams offered a ‘valuable commentary on the way medieval thinkers approached some of the problems most important to them, furnishing an insight into thought-processes in the Middle Ages’.<sup>3</sup> This insight is still stimulating, and has been taken forward in the past generation of research in the subject of medieval diagrams and schematic representation.<sup>4</sup> Madeline Caviness’s important article, ‘Images of Divine Order and the Third Mode of Seeing’, argued that medieval diagrams presented not only patterns of ordered thought, but in turn, means of understanding reality. Caviness related the formal order and underlying structure of twelfth-century diagrams to the allegorical ‘third mode of seeing’ as presented by the theologian Richard of Saint Victor (d. 1173). This was an internal, spiritual form of perception which nonetheless made use of diagrams (‘forms and figures and the similitude of things’) in the pursuit of theological truth.<sup>5</sup> Meanwhile, the association of diagrams with scientific disciplines

---

<sup>1</sup> Esmeijer defines visual exegesis as: ‘a kind of exposition of Holy Scripture in which the customary roles of word and image have been reversed, so that the representation or programme provides the Scriptural exegesis in very compressed picture form and the text itself is either completely omitted or else limited to explanatory inscriptions, tituli, or a very short commentary.’ See *Divina Quaternitas*, p. ix. Esmeijer’s important study focuses on the theological significance of fourfold patterning.

<sup>2</sup> M. Evans, ‘The Geometry of the Mind’, *Architectural Association Quarterly*, 12/4 (1980), pp. 32–55.

<sup>3</sup> Evans, ‘Geometry of the Mind’, at p. 33.

<sup>4</sup> For fundamental earlier, and more recent, work on the significance of medieval diagrammatic representation, see: H. Bober, ‘In Principio: Creation before Time’, in *De Artibus Opuscula. Essays in Honour of Erwin Panofsky*, 2 vols (New York, 1961), I, pp. 13–28; Caviness, ‘Images of Divine Order’, pp. 99–120; Sicard, *Diagrammes médiévaux*; Hamburger, ‘Haec Figura Demonstrat’, pp. 7–78. See also the forthcoming volume: *The Visualization of Knowledge in the Medieval and Early Modern Periods*, ed. Y. Chajes, A. Cohen, M. Kupfer, A. Worm. A fundamental collection of essays, referred to individually below, are those contained in: Hamburger and Bouché, *The Mind’s Eye* (2006).

<sup>5</sup> Caviness, ‘Images of Divine Order’, at p. 115. Caviness cites Richard of Saint Victor, *In*

such as computistics, geometry, cosmology, and astronomy, as well as logic and grammar, goes back to late antiquity but is most clearly seen in monastic schools from the eighth century.<sup>6</sup> Jean-Claude Schmitt's perception of *la raison graphique* as characteristic of thirteenth-century monastic and university contexts formed the basis for Jeffrey Hamburger's more recent recognition of a 'diagrammatic mode' as a constant in the high middle ages.<sup>7</sup> It is certain that diagrams had an elucidatory quality in their visual order which facilitated the transmission of authoritative knowledge, often scientific or scholastic.<sup>8</sup> Bianca Kühnel's analysis of *maiestas domini* images in the period c. 800–1000 is another work which traces how intellectual culture in the earlier middle ages frequently expressed ideologies in visual forms. Her study examined the correspondences and differences between diagrams from this period and similar visual forms in other works traditionally categorised as 'art', in this way demonstrating the distinctive and valuable resource provided by diagrams as an art-historical category. Kühnel perceived a mutual intersection and 'renewal' in the Carolingian period between advanced study of the science and computistic diagrams on the one hand, and the new formal arrangement of the iconographic *maiestas domini* illustration on the other. Her argument that this resurgence of interest was a reflection of and response to heightened cultural anxieties surrounding the Apocalypse and the reckoning of time illuminates the potential for diagrams to act as powerful rhetorical instruments in their own right.<sup>9</sup> More recently, Marius Hauknes has developed our understanding of the multiple visual forms of the diagrammatic mode in an examination of the rhetorical and encyclopaedic qualities of the monumental thirteenth-century fresco cycles at SS. Quattro Coronati in Rome.<sup>10</sup> The shapes and forms that diagrams took in the high

---

*Apocalypsim Joannis*, cols 686–7. Richard of St. Victor's *In Apocalypsim Joannis* (PL, CXCVI, cols. 686–7) in translation from B. Nolan, *The Gothic Visionary Perspective* (Princeton, N.J., 1977), at pp. 36–8.

<sup>6</sup> Bober, 'An Illustrated Medieval School-Book', pp. 64–97.

<sup>7</sup> Hamburger, 'Haec Figura Demonstrat', at p. 9. See also Schmitt, 'Les images classificatrices', pp. 311–41, at p. 312.

<sup>8</sup> See Kathrin Müller on the development of cosmological diagrams in response to Aristotelian cosmology in the thirteenth century: K. Müller, *Visuelle Weltaneignung: astronomische und kosmologische Diagramme in Handschriften des Mittelalters* (Göttingen, 2008).

<sup>9</sup> B. Kühnel, *The End of Time in the Order of Things: Science and Eschatology in Early Medieval Art* (Regensburg, 2003).

<sup>10</sup> Hauknes, 'Painting Knowledge', pp. 19–47.

middle ages were diverse, and in Vercelli, we have representatives of many different kinds of diagrammatic order: true geometric diagrams, wheels, linear genealogical and tree schemata, bodies, representative drawings, and a *mappa mundi*. In this chapter, we will consider how the Rotoli figurati relate to other known versions, and what these relationships tell us about the importance of form and order in this distinctive medieval visual tradition.

### *Conceptions of Vision and Theories of Sight*

As Cynthia Hahn stated in her important article on medieval visuality, a clear grasp of dominant visual theories and how they changed is crucial to a full understanding of both image-making and image reception.<sup>11</sup> If we wish to consider how the Rotoli figurati manuscripts, with their complex combinations of image and text, were seen and used in the thirteenth century, it will be necessary to briefly consider medieval theories of vision.<sup>12</sup> Saint Augustine's treatise on the book of Genesis, *De genesi ad litteram* (*On the Literal Meaning of Genesis*), is fundamental to most medieval theological conceptions of vision in the sense of visionary experience.<sup>13</sup> In this text Augustine discusses the visions of Saint Paul from 2 Cor. 12, explaining that there are three essential modes of vision: corporeal, spiritual, and intellectual; divine knowledge is only conceivably encountered in the third level of 'intellectual' vision. Corporeal vision is what one may see bodily, using one's eyes. Spiritual vision is seen with the eyes of the soul, images that might occur in a state of spiritual ecstasy, in dreams, or the imagination; it in part relies on the memories and imprints of corporeal vision. Intellectual vision, the most elevated mode, does not rely on corporeal vision at all. In this realm of seeing: '... the clearness of the divine will be seen, not in a meaningful vision, be it a corporeal vision as on Mount Sinai (Exodus 19:18), be it a spiritual vision, as perceived by Isaiah (Isaiah, 6:1), or by

---

<sup>11</sup> C. Hahn, 'Visio Dei: Changes in Medieval Visuality', in *Visuality before and beyond the Renaissance: Seeing as Others Saw*, ed. R. S. Nelson (Cambridge, 2000), pp. 169–96

<sup>12</sup> Crucial sources on medieval vision and visuality are: H. L. Kessler, *Spiritual Seeing: Picturing God's Invisibility in Medieval Art* (Philadelphia, PA, 2000); Caviness, 'Images of Divine Order', pp. 99–120.

<sup>13</sup> M. Miles, 'Vision: The Eye of the Body and the Eye of the Mind in Saint Augustine's *De Trinitate* and *Confessions*', *Journal of Religion*, 63/2 (1983), pp. 125–42.

Saint John in the Apocalypse: it will be a vision not in enigmas, but in essence, as far as the human intellect can grasp it, by grace of the elevating God.’<sup>14</sup> This three-tier hierarchical theory underpinned most theological and encyclopaedic works through the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries.<sup>15</sup>

### *Theories of sight and optics*

The scientific discourse of optics (known as *perspectiva*) in the middle ages explored the theory of sight, and in turn concepts of vision, representation, and the understanding of reality. Sight requires a functioning eye, a source of light, and an external visual object.<sup>16</sup> Two primary theories, of extramission and intromission, developed from the eleventh through to the fourteenth centuries. These two theories were divided by questioning how the eye encountered the visual object. Extramission theory understood that the eye emitted a visual ray which was strengthened by light. The visual ray hit the object looked at, retained the imprint of that object, and returned to the eye. This active theory of the eye followed an Augustinian tradition, which has been understood by David C. Lindberg as an ‘epistemology of light’, and was also found in Plato, Galen, and Euclid.<sup>17</sup> The Aristotelian intromission theory was developed by the eleventh-century Arab mathematician Al-Hazen and transmitted to western European scholarship through the translated works of Avicenna and Averroes. Intromission theory

---

<sup>14</sup> ‘Ibi uidetur claritas domini non per uisionem significantem siue corporalem, sicut uisa est in monte sina, siue spiritalem, sicut uidit esaiaes uel iohannes in apocalypsi, sed per speciem non per aenigmata, quantum eam capere humana mens potest, secundum adsummentis dei gratiam.’ From Augustine, *De Genesi ad litteram libri XII*, ed. J. Zycha, CSEL, 28 (Prague, 1894), XII, 26, pp. 387–435, at p. 420. Translated in P. K. Klein, ‘From the Heavenly to the Trivial: Vision and Visual Perception in Early and High Medieval Apocalypse Illustration’, in *The Holy Face and the Paradox of Representation*, ed. H. L. Kessler and G. Wolf (Bologna, 1998), pp. 247–78, at pp. 249–50.

<sup>15</sup> S. F. Kruger, *Dreaming in the Middle Ages* (Cambridge, 1992), 37ff, 61f. See also C. Hahn, ‘Vision’, in *A Companion to Medieval Art: Romanesque and Gothic in Northern Europe*, ed. C. Rudolph (Oxford, 2006), pp. 44–64, at pp. 45–6. Jeffrey Hamburger explores how Augustine’s principles of visions can be applied to art in the middle ages, in: J. F. Hamburger, *The Rothschild Canticles: Art and Mysticism in Flanders and the Rhineland circa 1300* (London, 1990).

<sup>16</sup> B. Newman, ‘What Did It Mean to Say “I Saw”? The Clash between Theory and Practice in Medieval Visionary Culture’, *Speculum*, 80/1 (2005), pp. 1–43.

<sup>17</sup> D. C. Lindberg, *Theories of Vision from Al-Kindi to Kepler* (London, 1976); S. C. Akbari, *Seeing through the Veil: Optical Theory and Medieval Allegory* (Toronto, 2004).

understood objects to be the emitters of rays, which were transmitted to the eye through the medium of air. In the thirteenth century scholars such as Robert Grosseteste and Roger Bacon in England were engaged in attempts to reconcile these two understandings, with theories that incorporated active emanations from both eye and object.<sup>18</sup> As argued by Cynthia Hahn, the divine origin of light is integral to both optical theories, linking them to the theological ‘presumption’ of vision as a means of knowing. Hahn’s understanding of this shift in the optical theory of sight in the later middle ages correlates with the later development of the prolonged contemplative gaze as essential to the perception of divine truth.<sup>19</sup> This idea of the contemplative gaze is crucial to how complex theological images were understood, as material objects for communicating knowledge, or as objects of devotion, or —as is more likely the case given the integration of epistemology and theology in the middle ages— as both.

### *Image theory and the Church*

The content of the Rotoli figurati is diverse, but broadly represent concerns relevant to the Church, whether in the case of pedagogy pertinent to the cathedral school (for example in Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*)), or in the record of ecclesiastical art (Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*)). From chapter two, we have established that the most plausible context for the copying of the group in thirteenth-century Vercelli was a scriptorium associated with the advanced schools around the cathedral chapter of S. Eusebio. In examining what medieval viewers and users of these manuscripts thought about them, and what they were for, it is crucial to balance our understanding of medieval visual theory with the positions which churchmen took on images. While the medieval Christian concern about the power and limitations of visual representation mostly refers to religious art, to iconography, and monumental images and their role in religious practice, the theological and religious content of the Rotoli figurati means that these concerns are relevant here too. In the text of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*), we find a reference to one of the most important texts for the medieval theology of images. This passage describes what is meant by the head of Christ in the diagram:

---

<sup>18</sup> D. C. Lindberg, ‘The Science of Optics’, in *Science in the Middle Ages*, ed. D. C. Lindberg (London, 1978), pp. 338–68.

<sup>19</sup> Hahn, “Visio Dei”, pp. 169–96.



Videntes deum *facie ad faciem* sicuti est, et quem misit Iesum Christum, in quem desiderant angeli conspicerere, quod est vita eterna. Ista sanctorum colectio celestis Ierusalem dicitur, quia in celis visione pacis perfruitur.

Seeing God face to face as he is and Jesus Christ, whom he sent, whom the angels desire to see, which is eternal life. This gathering of the saints is said to be the heavenly Jerusalem since in the heavens the vision of peace is brought fully to fruition.<sup>20</sup>

This passage draws from several scriptural sources, but the implication that God may be seen *face to face* only in the hereafter, the eternal life in the heavenly Jerusalem, is drawn from 1 Cor. 13:12, and Saint Paul's prophecy of true visual knowledge of the divine being gained by the faithful after death:

For now we see through a glass darkly; but then face to face. Now I know in part; but then I shall know even as I am known.

It is only possible to see an unmediated vision of the divine in heaven, at the beatific vision. The eternal states of peace and fruition are encountered after death, in the presence of God, and generated through *vision*, and *seeing*. The sight of the divine—the beatific vision—is the paradigmatic form of complete knowledge and union.<sup>21</sup> As this text indicates, the drawing of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) depicts the face of Christ, and turns the faithful viewer's attention to the future state of grace, in seeing Christ face to face and attaining true knowledge. This is complicated: how can this drawing function? It is not an icon, a religious image, but it certainly contains iconographic elements. A diagram containing a representation of the face of Christ—an image containing Christ's mediated but frontal gaze—retains, surely, a devotional aspect. In describing the diagram, the text acknowledges the inadequacies of corporeal vision and the visual representation. Any understanding of the divine requires the interior seeing of prayer, the eyes of the mind.<sup>22</sup>

The Church's qualified support for representational images has often been traced to Pope Gregory the Great (r. 590–604). It was often said in defence of representation

---

<sup>20</sup> See Appendix 1 for the transcription of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*): Appendix 1, ll. 13–16, and translation Appendix 3, ll. 17–19); John 17:3, 1 Peter 1:12.

<sup>21</sup> J. Burton Russell, *A History of Heaven: The Singing Silence* (Princeton, N.J., 1997), at pp. 9–15. This part of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) is returned to below, in chapter four.

<sup>22</sup> Kessler, *Spiritual Seeing*, Ch. 6, at p. 133.

that fundamental religious truths, essential for any Christian to know, could be communicated through images. The most well-known authority for this stance was a letter of Pope Gregory to Serenus of Marseille which addressed the pedagogical use of images as a means for the illiterate to 'read'.<sup>23</sup> More relevant to our purposes in examining complex medieval images was Gregory's acknowledgement of the power of images to transform and improve the soul, as long as the soul had laid the groundwork for this transformation through acts of faith, and prolonged prayer.<sup>24</sup> This perception of art images in the high middle ages, as Herbert Kessler summarised, 'distinguished pictures seen by physical sight from the mental images they were intended to evoke'.<sup>25</sup>

The potential of images to communicate complex and serious theological concepts was acknowledged by twelfth-century writers, such as Hugh of Saint Victor, Richard of Saint Victor, Rupert of Deutz, and Joachim of Fiore, among others.<sup>26</sup> Could carefully crafted and evocative religious images fulfil a reflexive role in the relationship between sight and knowledge? Work by Mary Carruthers on the complex images of Hugh of Saint Victor's *De Archa Noe* has acknowledged visualisation as an important part of twelfth-century theological thought, while stopping short of the arguments of Jeffrey Hamburger, among others, that art itself provided a language for communicating theology in the high middle ages.<sup>27</sup> Twelfth-century interest in the writings of Pseudo-Dionysius the Areopagite focused on anagogy; Richard of Saint

---

<sup>23</sup> Hahn, 'Vision', pp. 50–3. The letter is edited and translated in C. Davis-Weyer, *Early Medieval Art, 300–1150: Sources and Documents* (London, 1986), pp. 47–49. From Gregory the Great, 'Sancti Gregorii Magni Epistolarum', in *PL*, ed. J.-P. Migne, 221 vols (Paris, 1844), LXXVII, Lib. XI, Epist. 13, cols. 1128–30. For an important evaluation of the impact and influence of the letter, see: J.-C. Schmitt, 'Écriture et image: Les avatars médiévaux de modèle grégorien', in *Théories et pratiques de l'écriture au Moyen Age*, ed. E. Baumgartner (Paris, 1988), pp. 119–53; C. M. Chazelle, 'Pictures, Books, and the Illiterate: Pope Gregory I's Letters to Serenus of Marseilles', *Word & Image*, 6/2 (1990), pp. 138–53.

<sup>24</sup> Kessler, *Spiritual Seeing*, pp. 118–25.

<sup>25</sup> H. L. Kessler, 'Turning a Blind Eye: Medieval Art and the Dynamics of Contemplation', in *The Mind's Eye: Art and Theological Argument in the Middle Ages*, ed. J. F. Hamburger and A. M. Bouché (Princeton, N.J., 2006), pp. 413–40, at p. 413.

<sup>26</sup> See chapter four below.

<sup>27</sup> Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, at pp. 53–55, and elsewhere. See also J. F. Hamburger, 'The Place of Theology in Medieval Art History: Problems, Positions, Possibilities', in *The Mind's Eye: Art and Theological Argument in the Middle Ages*, ed. J. F. Hamburger and A. M. Bouché (Princeton, N.J., 2006), pp. 11–31.

Victor understood this to be the fourth mode of seeing, ‘the ascent or elevation of the mind for supernatural contemplation’.<sup>28</sup> Yet this ascension, as Barbara Nolan observed, is obtained through other modes of vision, and thus accessed through use, and understanding of, complex imagery.<sup>29</sup> The importance of this mode of anagogical interpretation to new readings (and images) of the vision of St John in the Apocalypse will be discussed below in chapter four. Rupert of Deutz acknowledged the fraught interpretative potential of images but believed that as God gave images to the prophets (as in the vision of Ezekiel), so those who took time to study complex images would find they could transmit understanding of divine truths.<sup>30</sup> Medieval diagrammatic images, such as Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*), demonstrate a reflexive potential to embody and communicate ideas within multiple discursive frameworks. We can therefore view the Rotoli figurati within a broader sense of a contemporary theological understanding of the serious epistemological potential of complex diagrammatic images.

In the cases where the Rotoli figurati communicate theological knowledge, it is also important to consider the broader impact of the pastoral reform movement instigated by the canons of the Fourth Lateran Council of 1215. Aden Kumler's recent work on religious images in the later middle ages called for a fuller appreciation of how the implementation of reform transformed what was required for individual participation in Christian religious life. The surge in scholarship in the past twenty years examining the ever-widening popular engagement with religious images in practical, intimate, forms of affective piety acknowledges how the kind of religious knowledge required by pious Christians changed dramatically in the thirteenth century. Broadly, the new kinds of texts and images designed for pious viewers reflected new epistemological requirements for individual Christians; the Church's evangelical project in this period ‘redefined the knowledge necessary for salvation’.<sup>31</sup> In turn, the Council of 1215 required clerics to know and to be able to transmit an extensive, defined body

---

<sup>28</sup> Caviness, ‘Images of Divine Order’, at p. 115. Caviness quotes from: Richard of Saint Victor, *In Apocalypsim Joannis*, cols 686–7, at 687.

<sup>29</sup> Nolan, *Gothic Visionary Perspective*, at p. 34.

<sup>30</sup> Nolan, *Gothic Visionary Perspective*, at pp. 17–19.

<sup>31</sup> A. Kumler, *Translating Truth: Ambitious Images and Religious Knowledge in Late Medieval France and England* (London, 2011), at pp. 3–4, and see Ch. 1.

of religious knowledge, and to be able to convey this, through diverse pastoral techniques, to the public. For Kumler, the conciliar decrees embody a pre-existing broader objective, of translating the paradigmatic ideals of an institutionally, spiritually, and morally reformed *Ecclesia romana* into the quotidian reality of a practical, instructive body of religious truth.<sup>32</sup> Considering the images of the Rotoli figurati within this cultural context should allow us to gain a clearer sense of their value. Images like Rotoli figurati 2–4 and 6 (*Rota dominice orationis*, *Genealogia Christi*, *Ecclesia*, *Mappamondo*) draw from existing textual sources, but they have a substantive value. Although as relatively low-status material objects, that by their plainness defy traditional art-historical categories of religious images, their likely context of production means they should be understood in relation to these socio-historical changes within the visual culture of their period. As complex mixtures of image and text, as diagrams, they construct meaning within a framework of order; as images they translate tenets of salvific truth, biblical history, and contemporary papal precepts, into a new visible form. In the next part of this chapter, we will consider the sources and function of the Rotoli figurati more closely, in relation to these broader changes in religious images.

---

<sup>32</sup> Kumler, *Translating Truth*, at pp. 4–6. Kumler builds on the important work of R. Copeland: R. Copeland, *Rhetoric, Hermeneutics and Translation in the Middle Ages: Academic Traditions and Vernacular Texts* (Cambridge, 1991).

## Order and Form: the Shape of Knowledge

The practice of medieval diagrammatic representation encompasses a diverse array of works.<sup>33</sup> This diversity is reflected within the Rotoli figurati at Vercelli, which contain diagrams ranging from the systematic arrangement of Euclidean geometrical proofs (Rotoli figurati 1, *Disegni geometrici*), to the arresting, enigmatic complexity of the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4). All but Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*) and 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*) rely upon an integration of image and text for their meaning to be properly comprehended.<sup>34</sup> The period of reference for the elucidation of visual sources and analogues for these manuscripts will extend from c.1150 to 1300, thereby incorporating the potential for the reworking and compilation of these works in the process of their copying in the thirteenth century. This chapter will aim to furnish the reader with a sense of the exceptionality of the Vercelli Rotoli figurati, against the background of the exploration of the function of images and the nature of sight in the middle ages which was considered in the previous section. These drawings use a symbolic and figural vocabulary to convey information within an existing framework of order. I aim to reciprocally highlight the distinctiveness of the Rotoli figurati manuscripts, and the vitality and relevance of the diagrammatic mode as an innovative expression of knowledge in the late twelfth and thirteenth century.

A diagram is commonly understood as a simplified schematic representation; an abstract representation of information that is instructive or clarifying, which can take an infinite number of forms. Geometrical diagrams, such as in the proofs of Euclid's *Elements* (Rotoli figurati 1, *Disegni geometrici*), depict an abstract truth, but are also broadly understood to have an often integral role in the process of visual thinking and the attainment of knowledge.<sup>35</sup> Presented without accompanying theorems, as they are in Vercelli Rotoli figurati 1, these diagrams required an intermediary such as a teacher,

---

<sup>33</sup> Evans, 'Geometry of the Mind', 32–55.

<sup>34</sup> Rotoli figurati 5 (*Atti degli apostoli*) is discussed in chapter one, section 5. This manuscript, which records the images and inscriptions of the Romanesque wall paintings at the cathedral of S. Eusebio in Vercelli, is accompanied by text explaining the content of the image, but it is not a diagram.

<sup>35</sup> See, for example, the use of Euclidean diagrams in the examination of diagrammatic reasoning: J. Norman, *After Euclid: Visual Reasoning and the Epistemology of Diagrams* (Stanford, CA, 2006).

or another text, to be understood. Treatises on particular kinds of knowledge, for example on scientific, astronomical, or musical instruments, might be accompanied by various schematic diagrams explaining the physical functioning and the operational techniques of those instruments. For example, in one mid-twelfth-century miscellany we find texts and diagrams relating to geometry, mathematics, and astronomy (London, BL, Royal MS 15 B IX).<sup>36</sup> Appended to the final section in this miscellany, after extracts from the *Geometria* of Gerbert of Aurillac (d. 1003), we find two illustrations of an astrolabe (figure 39). The diagram on the upper half is a representation of the functioning of a moveable quadrant; two bolts emphasise that this is a representation of a physical object. In the lower half of the page is another figure, which offers an interpretation of the Arabic words on the face of an astrolabe. This again refers to a physical object, that requires an intermediary diagram before it can be used by a non-Arabic speaker. I take this single manuscript image as an example because it demonstrates how diagrams that fit a modern definition of a simplifying diagram depend upon an existing body of knowledge, and it further explicates the integral link between image and ‘text’ (either present, or implied) which seems characteristic of the diagrammatic mode. Illustrated hand books such as Royal MS 15 B IX perhaps reflect the intellectual tendency for new forms of classification and categorisation which has been assigned to the twelfth century.<sup>37</sup> Accompanying diagrams are not just found in scientific collections but also illuminate medical herbals and bestiaries, or add innovative illustrations to earlier medieval textual traditions in the sciences, from Bede, or Isidore of Seville.<sup>38</sup> Natural science diagrams were derived from Carolingian exemplars which in turn relied on visual traditions going back to antiquity, incorporating sets of knowledge like the planets and constellations, the four winds, or the seven planets. These might in turn be mapped onto moralising Christian themes, such as the four ages of man, or classifications of education such as the seven liberal arts.<sup>39</sup> These traditions make use of

---

<sup>36</sup> London, BL, Royal MS 15 B IX, *De institutione musica*, at f. 71r. I have not examined the manuscript first hand, and this manuscript, and the text and image discussed here are described in: C. Burnett, *The Introduction of Arabic Learning into England* (London, 1997), p. 17, figs. 7–10. The manuscript is digitised through the BL Catalogue of Illuminated Manuscripts: <<http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/illuminatedmanuscripts/record.asp?MSID=7522>>

<sup>37</sup> In particular, see Ladner, ‘Terms and Ideas of Renewal’, pp. 1–36.

<sup>38</sup> Bober, ‘An Illustrated Medieval School-Book’, pp. 64–97.

<sup>39</sup> B. Obrist, ‘Wind Diagrams and Medieval Cosmology’, *Speculum*, 72/1 (1997), pp. 33–84.

an existing rhetorical framework of visual order, to make meaning relevant to different contexts of production: in monastic communities, or in early scholastic environments. The Christian cosmological concepts of microcosm and macrocosm can be reflected in ordered constructions that draw harmonious relational parallels within the divinely created universe. Form and shape, therefore, have their own iconography within the medieval history of the diagrammatic mode; compartmentalisation, hierarchy, symmetry, and balance are as integral to meaning as text.<sup>40</sup> The importance of how images relate to one another, whether in diagrams, or in miscellanies, is reflected in both traditions in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. The rest of this chapter will use form—line, tree, circle, world, and body—as a guiding structure to examine these shapes as they are found within the Rotoli figurati at Vercelli. Through these categories, I will examine the juxtaposition of diverse kinds of knowledge within each diagram, and the demands placed on both image-maker and audience. By focusing on potential analogues to the images of the Rotoli figurati, an understanding of the sources and traditions from which these images are drawn will emerge, as will a sense of their distinctiveness. Moreover, in comparing the contexts where we find visual analogues being used and produced, it will become clear whether the intellectual communities and institutions active in Vercelli in thirteenth century provide a plausible milieu for the use of the complex images of the Rotoli figurati.

### *Lines and Trees*

Of the seven Rotoli figurati, the form of the line is integral to Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*) and 7 (*Gioacchino da Fiore*). This kind of figure is also included in the central genealogy of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and in the rectangular frame of Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*). The *Genealogia Christi* depicts a genealogical line of descent from Adam to Christ (figure IV-V). In Rotoli figurati 7, these augmented *linea Christi* are part of Joachim of Fiore's representation of salvation history, from Adam to Christ and beyond to the end of history (figure XIII). The multiple frames of the *Rota dominice orationis* draw together parallel timelines of the life of Christ, with the ages of the Church, and the liturgical calendar (figures II-III). Line diagrams

---

<sup>40</sup> Caviness, 'Images of Divine Order', pp. 99–120, at p. 103.

are particularly suited to presentation on roll manuscripts, as they are found in Rotoli figurati 3. The work depicted on this roll is the *Compendium historiae genealogia Christi* of Peter of Poitiers (c. 1130–1205), which uses a line and circle design to represent a genealogy of Christ, within which is incorporated biblical history, and several further diagrams. This manuscript is commonly found on large rolls, although it is also found in codex format.<sup>41</sup> As Olivier de Laborderie has indicated in relation to royal genealogical rolls, line diagrams presented in this format have the advantage of being able to be ‘indefinitely extended’.<sup>42</sup> This could evoke a sense of perpetuity and projected future authority, as seen for example in English genealogical rolls which trace the pedigree of English kings back to Anglo-Saxon forebears.<sup>43</sup> The association of the roll with legal documentation might also imbue this format with a sense of authority and a connection with the exercise of power, although this is highly contextualised and dependent on local cultural practices.

In each of these examples, the line diagram is a representation of time. The line is perhaps the simplest form of diagrammatic abstraction and the basic graphic spatial metaphor; it is also a crucial device for both representing and conceiving of time, a cognitive and visual metaphor. Eusebius of Caesarea (d. 339/40) is often credited as the historical source of the ‘time line’.<sup>44</sup> His *Chronicle*, lost but transmitted to the Latin tradition by Jerome in the fifth century, offers a chronology of events from the birth of Abraham to the beginning of the fourth century. Figure 40 shows two folios from a mid-fifth century example of Jerome's translation and extensions of the *Chronicle* of Eusebius.<sup>45</sup> The linear expression of the chronology is expressed in a tabular format, read

---

<sup>41</sup> See chapter one, section 3 for a full description of Rotoli figurati 2 (*Genealogia Christi*).

<sup>42</sup> O. de Laborderie, ‘The First Manuals of English History: Two Late Thirteenth-Century Genealogical Rolls of the Kings of England in the Royal Collection’, *EBLJ*, 2014, pp. 1–25, at pp. 3–4. See also D. C. Skemer, ‘From Archives to the Book Trade: Private Statute Rolls in England, 1285–1307’, *Journal of the Society of Archivists*, 16 (2009), pp. 193–206.

<sup>43</sup> P. Robinson, ‘The Format of Books: Books, Booklets and Rolls’, in *The Cambridge History of the Book in Britain. Volume II: 1100–1400*, ed. N. J. Morgan, The Cambridge History of the Book in Britain, 6 vols (Cambridge, 2008), II, pp. 39–54, at p. 42.

<sup>44</sup> An historical overview of the dominance of the line as a chronological metaphor is given in: D. Rosenberg and A. Grafton, *Cartographies of Time* (New York, 2010), chap. 2. See also C. Ginzburg, ‘Family Resemblances and Family Trees: Two Cognitive Metaphors’, *Critical Inquiry*, 30/3 (2004), pp. 537–56.

<sup>45</sup> Oxford, Bodl., MS Auct. T. 2. 26, pt. 2, fols. 51v–52r (mid-5<sup>th</sup> century). This manuscript is



left to right across the pages in multiple columns.<sup>46</sup> The work records the dynasties of multiple kingdoms (Assyria, Hebrew-Judea, Hebrew-Israel, Athens, on the left), governed in the left-hand margin by Eusebius's universal chronological apparatus, the years from the birth of Abraham. Briefly described events are added between the columns, and later annotations are found in the space on the manuscript page. This tabulated line-system of representing time and history, as Daniel McCarthy has observed, 'strongly influenced virtually all of Christian chronology'.<sup>47</sup> Moreover, annotations found in several versions of Eusebius's later *Ecclesiastical History* (c. 313) demonstrate an explicit conception of reckoning Christian history from the birth of Christ.<sup>48</sup> Line diagrams were also used to express temporal and kinship relationships, in the form of genealogical trees, as we see in Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia*), 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (*Gioacchino da Fiore*). However, these genealogies are predominantly concerned with the representation of history. There are precedents for the connection of diagrams of human relationships with broader visual schemes of salvific history, as we shall see.

### *Linea Christi*

In Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), as we have seen, the chronology of Christian history begins with the roundels for Adam and Eve, accompanied by a large and vivid illustration of Adam and Eve beside the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil. Both cover themselves, and have their hands raised toward their mouths; the viewer should therefore recognise that the Fall has already occurred. The serpent, depicted with great

---

digitised and available at: <<https://digital.bodleian.ox.ac.uk/inquire/p/ca6a0231-8342-47a1-811d-90fe5def1e85>>. A. G. Watson, *Catalogue of Dated and Datable Manuscripts c.435-1600 in Oxford Libraries*, 2 vols (Oxford, 1984), no. 64.

<sup>46</sup> Tabulation in this case places lists in parallel and delineates correspondences in the lists through how they relate to the chronological line. See Evans, 'Geometry of the Mind', section 4.1 'Tabulation'.

<sup>47</sup> D. P. McCarthy, 'The Emergence of *Anno Domini*', in *Time and Eternity: The Medieval Discourse*, ed. G. Jaritz and G. Moreno-Riaño (Turnhout, 2003), pp. 31–53.

<sup>48</sup> McCarthy, 'Anno Domini', pp. 43–44. The reference from Book 7 of Eusebius's *Ecclesiastical History* is cited in translation by McCarthy: 'In these books I have dealt fully with the subject of the successions from our Saviour's birth to the destruction of our places of worship, a story covering 305 years.' From: Eusebius of Caesarea, *The History of the Church from Christ to Constantine*, ed. A. Louth, trans. G. A. Williamson (London, 1989), 255.

movement coiled around the trunk of the Tree, holds some of the fruit in its mouth. Proceeding from Adam and Eve, the diagram descends through a complex pattern of lines and circles to the beginning of the sixth age of the world, to *Christus Passus*. This diagram visualises time in the form of biblical history through the depiction of Christ's genealogy as derived from the Gospels of Matthew and Luke.<sup>49</sup> The physical advantage of a complex linear format for a diagram of time and history is that it allows for the simultaneous diachronic and synchronic presentation of events. Medieval genealogical figures that make use of a linear system have been called 'diagrammatic chronicles', including the *Compendium* within the genre.<sup>50</sup> This useful term resonates with the way these kinds of line diagrams incorporate the chronological system from the tradition established by Eusebius, and use the graphic system of lines to clarify both temporal and genealogical relationships. The use of small medallions for individuals, and connecting lines to define relationships, descending chronologically, allows identifying biographical and historical details to be added at relevant points. The work of Peter of Poitiers is simultaneously a genealogy of Christ and the patriarchs of Israel, and a world chronicle; this influential work synthesises biblical history into a single monumental work and by virtue of its diagrammatic form, gives history a meaningful teleological structure.<sup>51</sup> The introductory paragraph that accompanies most versions of the *Compendium* explicitly states that the work is designed to help those scholars struggling to study the Bible, and 'wishing to retain the memory the historical narratives as it were in a little sack'.<sup>52</sup> The line diagram is organised around the central line, with branches emerging from it; history is thereby arranged as generations, but events are still placed at the appropriate

---

<sup>49</sup> Alidori, 'Il Plut. 20.56', pp. 157–70. The list of manuscripts drawn up by Alidori is at pp. 166–8. Another related genealogical diagram derived from the *Liber generationis* of Matthew 1. 1–16 is the Tree of Jesse, which occupies what is generally seen to be a separate iconographic tradition. See Watson, *The Early Iconography of the Tree of Jesse*; P. Salonijs and A. Worm, eds., *The Tree: Symbol, Allegory, and Mnemonic Device in Medieval Art and Thought* (Turnhout, 2014).

<sup>50</sup> See A. Worm, 'Diagrammatic Chronicles', in *Encyclopedia of the Medieval Chronicle*, ed. R. G. Dunphy, 2 vols (Leiden, 2010), 1, pp. 522–32.

<sup>51</sup> Worm, 'Ista est Jerusalem', at p. 157.

<sup>52</sup> This image is borrowed from Hugh of Saint Victor's *De tribus maximis circumstantiis gestorum*, and as Mary Carruthers has described, refers to a divided coin pouch that enabled coins to be found quickly. This was a common term for how memories were stored. See Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, at pp. 45–6.

point. Other historical or genealogical information drawn from the biblical narratives are thereby synchronised with the central axis of Christ. Dynastic information about Greek, Syrian, Babylonian and Persian ruling families, about Jewish high priests, and judges, and later Roman emperors, is interpolated at appropriate points and distinguished by rubrication, by borders, or lines of varied colours.<sup>53</sup>

We have established that the line and circle system used in the *Compendium* has an explicit mnemonic function, and this is further amplified by the additional diagrams set within it.<sup>54</sup> As Michael Evans, among others, has observed, the structure of a linear diagram is analogous to organic growth. The nodes of individuals divide and ramify from a central trunk, like branches on a tree.<sup>55</sup> The diagrammatic representation of history through genealogy often takes the form of a tree, and this tradition predated the use of the form in the late twelfth century.<sup>56</sup>

The earliest known medieval genealogical diagrams which make use of the line and circle system are from the mid-tenth century in Spain, in copies of Beatus of Liébana's commentary on the Apocalypse.<sup>57</sup> In the Beatus manuscripts, the genealogical tables are part of the prefatory material, prior to the main Apocalypse commentary. These genealogical stemmata detail the ancestry of Christ and are read left to right across multiple folios. As can be seen in the mid-eleventh-century example in figure 41, the 'central line' of the patriarchs runs across the top of the page in a continuous band, with further relations, individuals, and very brief excerpts of biographical text added in

---

<sup>53</sup> Worm, 'Ista est Jerusalem', at pp. 123–5.

<sup>54</sup> These are described in detail in chapter one, section 3. See also Worm, 'Ista est Jerusalem', pp. 123–62.

<sup>55</sup> Evans, 'Geometry of the Mind', pp. 32–55.

<sup>56</sup> Two important studies on the history of the genealogical tree are: C. Klapisch-Zuber, 'The Genesis of the Family Tree', *I Tatti Studies: Essays in the Renaissance*, 4 (1991), 105–29.; and Ladner, 'Terms and Ideas of Renewal', 1–36. More recently, see Worm, 'Trees of Genealogy', pp. 35–67. The latter has an extensive bibliography on this subject.

<sup>57</sup> One of the earliest examples is Pierpont Morgan Library, MS M.644 (c. 940–945), with the genealogical tables of Christ found at fols. 4v–6r. The Morgan Beatus manuscript is described in J. Williams, *Visions of the End in Medieval Spain: Catalogue of Illustrated Beatus Commentaries on the Apocalypse and Study of the Geneva Beatus*, ed. T. Martin (Amsterdam, 2017), pp. 69–72. The linking of genealogical material like this to an apocalypse commentary will be discussed in chapter four below in relation to Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*).

connected medallions and frames below.<sup>58</sup> Like the Vercelli *Genealogia Christi* (Rotoli figurati 3), the Spanish genealogical diagrams often begin with the added pictorial element of an illustration of Adam and Eve.<sup>59</sup> However, the detailed explanatory text found in Peter of Poitiers' work is lacking in these early examples.

The *Chronicon* of Hugh of Saint Victor (c. 1097–1141) includes a table that makes use of the successive linear listing of names and dates to visualise and coordinate periods of time and methods of dividing that time (see figure 42).<sup>60</sup> However, Peter of Poitiers' *Compendium* is a definitive diagrammatic visualisation of Christian history; it is the earliest genealogical *and* historical synopsis to make use of a linear tree structure. It uses the *linea Christi* as a central axis, against which other biblical dynasties are mapped. In the thirteenth century the work expanded to a universal chronicle, and as Andrea Worm describes, the line of popes replaced the central position of the *linea Christi*.<sup>61</sup> An early example of this can be dated to as early as 1208–1215 (London, BL, Cotton MS Faustina B. VIII). The *Compendium* was used as a model for several later medieval diagrammatic chronicles in roll formats and was influential until the early modern period.<sup>62</sup> The extensive textual information found in the *Compendium* is mostly drawn from the *Historia scholastica* of Peter Comestor (c. 1100–78). Peter of Poitiers had studied under Peter Lombard (ca. 1100–1160), at the Paris schools, and he later succeeded Comestor to the chair in theology from 1169. Peter of Poitiers probably compiled the *Compendium* whilst working on his extension of Comestor's *Historia*

---

<sup>58</sup> Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional de España, MS Vitrina 14-2, fols. 1-5, 'The Vitrina 14-2 Fragment' (c. 1047). These genealogical tables are appended to the 'Facundus Beatus', both originating from the royal scriptorium at León. See Williams, *Visions of the End in Medieval Spain*, pp. 86–6 (Vitrina 14-2 Fragment, no. 7), and pp. 96–99 (Facundus Beatus, no. 45).

<sup>59</sup> A. Worm observed that early Bible manuscripts containing genealogical stemmata do not contain pictorial elements, which are frequently found in the early examples contained in the Beatus manuscripts. See Worm, 'Trees of Genealogy', pp. 35–67, at p. 43.

<sup>60</sup> A. Worm, 'Visualizing the Order of History: Hugh of Saint Victor's *Chronicon* and Peter of Poitiers' *Compendium Historiae*', in *Romanesque and the Past*, ed. R. Plant and J. McNeill (Leeds, 2013), pp. 243–63. The text of the *Chronicon* is edited in W. M. Green, 'Hugo of St. Victor: *De Tribus Maximis Circumstantiis Gestorum*', *Speculum*, 18/4 (1943), pp. 484–93.

<sup>61</sup> Worm, 'Visualizing the Order of History', pp. 243–63, at p. 263.

<sup>62</sup> For references to later medieval manuscript traditions incorporating this linear content, see: Worm, 'Diagrammatic Chronicles', I, pp. 522–32.

*scholastica* summarising the Acts of the Apostles, around 1180 to 1185.<sup>63</sup> The *Compendium* abridges the exhaustive historical commentary of the *Historia scholastica*, employing a vertical diagrammatic format to clarify and summarise the information, creating a graphical mnemonic device from the text.<sup>64</sup>

The format chosen also tells us something about the perception of history in this period. Although genealogies are often known as ‘family-trees’, and the branching graphic representation fits the metaphor, manuscript versions of the *Compendium* do not often contain any figural detail that alludes to the organic analogy. Unlike the descending succession of Peter of Poitiers’ *Compendium*, as represented on Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), the linear diagrams on Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) ascend from Adam and can contain graphic details of stumps and twigs that suggest a deliberate tree diagram. The so-called *figurae arbores* of Joachim of Fiore’s *Genealogia* (c. 1185–7), and found on Rotoli figurati 7 (*Gioacchino da Fiore*), also often take this arboreal form, which is tied to the important theme of fructification in Joachim’s work. The organic features of the *linea Christi* in the *Ecclesia* diagram might therefore reference the themes of fructification found in Joachim’s thought. Other genealogical diagrams, frequently found associated with both manuscript and roll forms of the *Compendium*, also sometimes take a branching, tree-like form. These are diagrams known as *arbores consanguinitatis* and *arbores affinitatis*, abstract schemata which illustrate relationships of kinship, used to determine inheritance claims or work out prohibited and non-prohibited degrees of marriage.<sup>65</sup> These diagrams have a long history and are in the thirteenth century more commonly found in legal manuscripts and canon law collections. They are first described as consanguinity trees in the eighth century, but they are sometimes arrow-shaped, or set within a building; alternative metaphors were

---

<sup>63</sup> This dating for the *Compendium* is suggested by A. Worm: Worm, ‘*Ista est Jerusalem*’, pp. 123–61, at p. 127.

<sup>64</sup> Monroe, ‘A Roll-Manuscript of Peter of Poitiers’ *Compendium*’, pp. 92–107. See also Klapisch-Zuber, ‘Genesis of the Family Tree’, pp. 116–17.

<sup>65</sup> C. Klapisch-Zuber summarises the early history of these diagrams in the Roman juridical tradition, and the description of *stemmata* in Isidore of Seville’s *Etymologiae*. She suggests that the use of the term *ramusculi* to describe the interconnecting lines between individuals in inheritance calculations is the potential ‘root’ of the eventual vegetal decoration of these diagrams in the middle ages. See: Klapisch-Zuber, ‘Genesis of the Family Tree’, pp. 113–15.

also used, as we shall see shortly.<sup>66</sup> Christine Klapisch-Zuber's important early work on tree diagrams has described the category of trees of virtue or vice. These take the same flourishing, ramifying principle of the arboreal metaphor, and use it to represent the progress or the categorical divisions within, for example a cardinal, theological or monastic virtue or, conversely, a vice.<sup>67</sup> During the twelfth century these kinds of symbolic tree diagrams become increasingly common, and are often associated with lavish, expensive manuscript books. One of the most important and influential twelfth-century collections on this subject is the *Speculum virginum*, attributed to the German Benedictine Conrad of Hirsau (c. 1080–1150/60), and produced in the 1140s.<sup>68</sup>

Within consanguinity and affinity diagrams, the areas designated for 'pater' and 'mater' are the starting point.<sup>69</sup> Descending on either side from the self are seven degrees of kinship from sons and daughters, to great-great-great grandchildren. Above, on each side of the triangular 'crown' of the tree-diagram, emerging horizontally with branching tendrils, the paternal relatives on the left and the maternal on the right represent the six degrees of familial relationships within which marriage was forbidden. This early example of a consanguinity tree is from a manuscript of Isidore of Seville's *De natura rerum* (c. 1134), produced by Benedictine nuns in the in the abbey of Munsterbilsen (now Belgium, figure 43). The text to the left and right of the trunk is drawn from Isidore and describes the function of the tree in demonstrating the degrees of forbidden relationships, but also relates these degrees of consanguinity to the concept of the six ages of the world, and the six ages of man. Moreover, Andrea Worm has found an extended correlation in the text accompanying Trees of Consanguinity in three unusual twelfth-century bible manuscripts: the Foigny (late twelfth-century),<sup>70</sup>

---

<sup>66</sup> Schadt, *Arbores Consanguinitatis und der Arbores Affinitatis*, p. 15, p. 67.

<sup>67</sup> Klapisch-Zuber, 'Genesis of the Family Tree', at p. 119.

<sup>68</sup> Rainini, 'Symbolic Representations', pp. 157–86.

<sup>69</sup> London, BL, Harley MS 3099, fol. 77r (c. 1134).

<sup>70</sup> The Foigny Bible is Paris, BN, MS Lat. 15177–80, and is described in W. Cahn, *Romanesque Bible Illumination* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1982), at p. 279, no. 96. The manuscript was made at the Cistercian monastery of Sainte Marie in Foigny, in the diocese of Laon. The Tree of Consanguinity is found at fol. 2r, followed by eighteen genealogical tables (fols. 2v–11r).

Parc (c. 1148),<sup>71</sup> and Floreffe (c. 1155/60) bibles.<sup>72</sup> In these cases, the Tree of Consanguinity is used to point to the concepts of microcosm and macrocosm and reveal underlying divine order. It is further demonstrated that these three bible manuscripts contain innovative textual additions to the Isidorian text, which associated the Tree of Consanguinity with the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil. The fall of man instigated the history of mankind — as we see in the moment depicted at the beginning of the *Compendium* of Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), through the knowledge of procreation. Further, the way that the degrees of affinity conclude at six and are linked to the six ages of the world adds an eschatological dimension. The enumeration of Christ's genealogy is therefore connected to calculations of apocalyptic time. The Augustinian tradition interpreted the genealogies in the Gospels of Matthew and Luke in terms of generational spans. The generations in Matthew 1: 2–17 gave forty-two of Christ's ancestors, divided into three groups of fourteen, from Abraham to Joseph. Luke 3: 23–38 lists another twenty generations from Adam to Abraham. Augustine divided the time before the incarnation into five: two generations of ten, followed by three of fourteen. This Augustinian division into *etates* is marked on Christ's genealogy in Rotolo figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), just below the medallion marked *Christus natus* a rubric indicates that here the fifth *etas* ends. The sixth *etas* would last from the incarnation to the end of the world. Familial relationships conclude at the end of the world, as the prelapsarian state of mankind will be restored. Worm's work on the significance of the appearance of these consanguinity trees and genealogical diagrams as prefatory material in three twelfth-century bible manuscripts establishes a broader cultural context for the kinds of material we see within the Rotoli figurati.<sup>73</sup> Forms of

---

<sup>71</sup> The Parc Bible is London, BL, Add MSS 14788–89, and is edited in Watson, *Dated and Datable Manuscripts*, vol. 1, p. 39, no. 109. The Tree of Consanguinity is found in vol. 1, fol. 198r and is followed by 18 folios of genealogical tables (198v–207r).

<sup>72</sup> The Floreffe Bible is London, BL, Add. MSS 17737–38. It was likely made at the Premonstratensian Abbey of Floreffe in Namur. The manuscript is described in Cahn, *Romanesque Bible Illumination*, pp. 198, p. 208, and p. 265, no. 46. The Tree of Consanguinity is found at fol. 24r.

<sup>73</sup> Worm, 'Trees of Genealogy', at pp. 49–51.

historical and genealogical knowledge organised into complex diagrams are, indeed, often found grouped together.<sup>74</sup>

### *The Wheel or Rota*

The circle is the form of the earliest known diagrams in the Middle Ages, and this shape should be seen as a fundamental conceptual device.<sup>75</sup> Circles are predominantly found in utilitarian computistic manuscripts, scientific compendiums accounting for natural phenomena, which could also be used to compute Easter and the liturgical calendar. These manuscripts are often excerpted from the works of Isidore, bishop of Seville (c. 560–636), Bede (c. 672–735), and the later Benedictine abbot Abbo of Fleury (c. 940–1004), in turn drawing from traditions going back to antiquity.<sup>76</sup> Carolingian reform movements encouraged an increase in the circulation and copying of computus manuscripts.<sup>77</sup> In subject matter, the diagrams associated with these compendiums include information on the movement of the planets, the sun and moon (equinoxes and lunar cycles) and the zodiac, in addition to maps of the world and zonal maps of climate and habitability, the winds and the seasons; some illustrate ideas of microcosm and macrocosm through the relationships between the world, the year, and the ages of man. These might be further supplemented by other cosmological and astronomical images. The use of the circle for the elucidation of moralistic or theological concepts, such as that contained in *Rotoli figurati* 2, the *Rota dominice orationis*, developed from and alongside these traditions. To demonstrate the diverse visual traditions of circular

---

<sup>74</sup> Worm, 'Trees of Genealogy', pp. 35–67.

<sup>75</sup> N. Reed Kline, *Maps of Medieval Thought: The Hereford Paradigm* (Woodbridge, 2001), Pt. 1, 'The Circle as a Conceptual Device'.

<sup>76</sup> Many computus manuscripts historically were catalogued as containing works of Bede or Isidore; there is now a broader consensus on the variety of excerpts, texts, and sources for computus miscellanies. See P. Gautier Dalché, 'De la glose à la contemplation: place et fonction de la carte dans des manuscrits du haut moyen âge', in *Testo e immagine nell'alto medioevo: 15-21 Aprile 1993*, Settimane di studio del centro italiano di studi sull'alto medioevo, 41 (Spoleto, 1994), pp. 693–771. Abbo of Fleury's compendium was excerpted predominantly from the *De natura rerum* of Bede.

<sup>77</sup> Bruce Eastwood has examined the sources for Carolingian computistic manuscripts, from Macrobius, Pliny, Capella and Calcidius, and demonstrated invented or manipulated diagrams could revise or replace a text or extend its currency. see: B. Eastwood, *Ordering the Heavens: Roman Astronomy and Cosmology in the Carolingian Renaissance* (Leiden, 2007), Ch. 6.



diagrams, we will look first at the relatively stable set of early medieval computistic diagrams, before turning to the emergence of diagrams used for conveying more complex moral-theological knowledge. However, it is important to bear in mind that early medieval computistic diagrams—in western Europe, at least— were overwhelmingly circulated within monastic contexts. The knowledge of the world represented is here set within a Christian framework, expressing divinely ordered systems.

Some of the earliest medieval collections of circular diagrams used as didactic devices are associated with Isidore of Seville, in particular his early schoolbook the *De Natura rerum* (612–15), and the later encyclopaedic *Etymologiae* (622–33).<sup>78</sup> A set of diagrams associated with these works from as early as the eighth century comprises influential *rotae* used to explain natural systems of divine order and cosmology. H. Bober's examination of one computus manuscript (Baltimore, Walters Gallery, MS W. 73) demonstrated how these Isidorian *rotae* were transmitted alongside other excerpted works into twelfth-century didactic use through monastic copying, via the works of Bede, and through the innovation of the monastic school at Fleury, and the Abbot Abbo.<sup>79</sup> The forms of these circular diagrams provide the fundamental structure for many later medieval didactic and moralistic diagrams including, as we shall see, the *Rota Dominice orationis* type of *Rotoli figurati* 2 (figure II).

The *De natura rerum* contains seven circular diagrams representing the world, the zones of the earth, the months of the year, the seasons, the planets, the winds, and the microcosmic-macrocosmic harmonic system of the universe. The 'zones of the earth' diagram represents the earth's regions arrayed as petals round the centre (figure

---

<sup>78</sup> M. M. Gorman, 'The Diagrams in the Oldest Manuscripts of Isidore's *De Natura Rerum* with a Note on the Manuscript Tradition of Isidore's *De Natura Rerum*', *Studi Medievali*, 2 (2001), 529–45. Some *rota* diagrams seem to have been integrated within chapters in Isidore's original works, others may have been synthesised from diverse sources and associated with the texts later. The way diagrams are often grouped together at the end of a text, rather than integrated within, seems to suggest later associations. See also B. Bischoff, 'Die europäische Verbreitung der Werke Isidors von Sevilla', in *Mittelalterliche Studien*, 1 (Stuttgart, 1966), pp. 171–94.

<sup>79</sup> Bober, 'An Illustrated Medieval School-Book', at pp. 74–7. For a description of this manuscript see the entry in: M. Holcomb, ed., *Pen and Parchment: Drawing in the Middle Ages* (New York, 2009), at pp. 108–110.

44).<sup>80</sup> The four cardinal points and Latin names for each zone frame the wheel, while labels on the petals describes the character of each zone, and the transliterated Greek name. The diagram of the months (*rota mensium*) shows the number of days in each month, the date of the first of each month of the Roman calendar; it is designed to reconcile the Roman and Egyptian calendars.<sup>81</sup> In the diagram of the seasons, or the year, the relational quality of the circle is used to collate different sets of information: the seasons are matched to the winds, east with spring, west with autumn, north with winter, and south with summer.<sup>82</sup> The climatic characteristics are shared by adjacent seasons, and each season is represented opposite its contrary. Concentric circles around *terra* in the centre show the orbits of the planets (from *Saturnus* to *Luna*), with radial sections adding the timing of the orbits for each.<sup>83</sup> The diagram of the winds that circulated with the *De natura rerum* takes two types, one simple, one complex.<sup>84</sup> The simplest divides the circle into twelve sections with a head in profile at the centre, each section listing the names of the winds. The more complex version again takes advantage of the multiple relationships that the form allows (figure 45). There the central medallion indicates the direction of the winds (*kocmoc*, vertically; *mundus*, horizontally), and the names of the winds are then again arrayed around the centre, with an additional circular line dividing the Latin names from the Greek. An early example from Fleury is particularly notable, as Barbara Obrist has observed, for the figure in the central medallion; this nimbed frontal bust represents an authoritative allegory of the cosmos and is a feature that disappeared in later versions of the image.<sup>85</sup> The diagram of microcosm-macrocosm correlates *mundus-annus-homo* (world, year, and man), repeating the information from the seasonal diagram and adding the four humors of the

---

<sup>80</sup> Paris, BN, MS Lat. 6649, fol. 8v, Isidore, *De natura rerum*.

<sup>81</sup> J. E. Murdoch, *Album of Science: Antiquity and the Middle Ages* (New York, 1984), pp. 52–55, 340–45. The manuscript image is from Paris, BN, MS Lat. 4860, fol. 99v (10<sup>th</sup> century).

<sup>82</sup> Paris, BN, MS Lat. 4860, fol. 100r.

<sup>83</sup> Paris, BN, MS Lat. 4860, fol. 103v.

<sup>84</sup> Paris, BN, MS Lat. 6413, fol. 27v (8<sup>th</sup> century), digitised version available at: <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b10527898d/f62.item>>, and Paris. BN MS Lat. 6400G, fol. 142v (c. 700), available at: <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b105154335/f291.item>>; Obrist, 'Wind Diagrams', pp. 33–84 at pp. 45–9.

<sup>85</sup> Obrist, 'Wind Diagrams', at p. 46.

body (figure 46).<sup>86</sup> The use of the circular form is one way of depicting the microcosm-macrocosm; another form, the body-container, is also used and will be returned to below in relation to that form and its use in Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*).

In computistic diagrams, form is the aspect of the device which facilitates memorisation, as the rubrication and text clarifies meaning; these two aspects together, in combination with an existing framework of knowledge, aim to convey truth. Recognisable types of computus diagrams, changing in form relatively little even as they were widely circulated, provided an integrated resource for conveying authoritative bodies of knowledge. However, in the course of teaching or learning from these diagrams, and of using them alongside texts, there is necessarily a process of interaction and synthesis.<sup>87</sup> Copying complex diagrams introduces human error which might be corrected; teaching with a diagram might invite stimulating commentary or criticism. Critical analysis in these forms instigates invention, and this we see in the transformation and development over time of certain types of early medieval diagrams.

The *Rota dominice orationis* of Rotoli figurati 2 takes a superficially similar form to the radial *rotae* of early medieval computistic diagrams. Six concentric circles form five bands around a small central circle; seven radial lines from centre to edge create seven sectors. At each point where the radiating lines cross the concentric bands, there is a small roundel, sometimes with smaller roundels joined to it by branching lines. The outermost circle has small circles arrayed around the circumference, those marking the ends of the radial sections being distinguished by a double outline. The circle as a whole is set within a rectangular frame composed of two or three bands, with four roundels at each corner and one extra, in the upper left corner (see figure III). The content of this diagram is moral-theological, and elucidates the relationships between the vices, the petitions of the paternoster, the gifts of the Holy Spirit, the virtues, and the moral precepts of the Beatitudes. As discussed in chapter one, the *Rota dominice orationis*

---

<sup>86</sup> Paris, BN, MS Lat. 6413, fol. 5v. This manuscript has been digitised, and can be viewed online at: <<https://gallica.bnf.fr/ark:/12148/btv1b10527898d/f18.item>>

<sup>87</sup> H. Bober demonstrated this process of synthesis in monastic diagram collections in his important examination of the late twelfth-century manuscript of Bede's *De natura rerum* (Baltimore, Walters Art Gallery, W. 73): Bober, 'An Illustrated Medieval School-Book', at pp. 85–86.

diagram circulated in scholastic contexts in Paris at the end of the twelfth century and most likely originated there, and has been convincingly dated to c.1195 on the basis of its association with the works of Peter of Poitiers.<sup>88</sup> Like the *rotae* of computistic diagrams derived from Isidore of Seville, the form of the *Rota dominice orationis* is relatively rigid: there is little diversification in the known versions of the diagram. The Vercelli *Rota dominice orationis*, although it is unfinished, repeats what we see in other extant versions.

This diagram-type draws central tenets from scripture, in the use of Lord's Prayer, the gifts of the Holy Spirit, and the Beatitudes. However, it reconfigures them in a systematic, symbolic, arrangement that is not solely drawn from scripture; for example, in the order of the petitions of the Lord's Prayer, and the reduction of the number of Beatitudes to seven.<sup>89</sup> The interconnected lines of the wheel hold the elements in an ordered hierarchy of position and opposition; the form dictates the meaning of the image.<sup>90</sup> As the diagram breaks down vices into their constituent 'sub'-vices and shows further attributes of the petitions of the Lord's prayer, the gifts, and the virtues, supplemented by shorter passages of text, it clarifies the meaning and relationship between these tenets. This makes the image an object for study, and an instrument with which to learn. However, this rigid form belies the dynamism with which the diagram can function for the viewer. The circle, as we have discussed above, is a symbol of divine perfection. Concentric circles recall astronomical diagrams representing the movements of heavenly bodies. The circle gives a sense of continuity, or infinity, within an ordered system of divine perfection. In the *Rota dominice orationis*, the centre of the circle is sometimes a depiction of the face of Christ, within the innermost ring of the Beatitudes, with the outermost ring governed by the vices. An individual can move through this diagram, away from the vices through prayer to obtain the gifts of the Holy Spirit, which eventually brings virtue, and through this

---

<sup>88</sup> See Rainini, 'Symbolic Representations', pp. 157–86.

<sup>89</sup> M. L. Colish, 'Systematic Theology and Theological Renewal in the Twelfth Century', *Journal of Medieval and Renaissance Studies*, 18 (1988), pp. 135–56. There are nine Beatitudes in Matt. 5:3–11.

<sup>90</sup> See Bogen and Thürlemann, 'Jenseits der Opposition von Text und Bild', pp. 1–22.

process may reach beatitude and thereby greater proximity to God.<sup>91</sup> Therefore it is undoubtedly also an object which demands spiritual contemplation, a tool for the individual Christian on their journey towards a better spiritual life. In this sense, the paths laid out within the circles offer the potential for new connections to be perceived, rewards for close meditative study.

Further, the frame of the *Rota dominice orationis* is a linear register which interacts with the circles at the centre in a way that suggests the complex ways this diagram functions. We have seen above how computistic diagrams used the concept of macrocosm-microcosm to illustrate how the individual body could relate to universal systems. The frame of the *Rota* provides a universal, chronological context to the individual spiritual journey (from vice, to God) which takes place in the wheel at its centre. The four outer lines, the *quadratum*, represent four periods of time from the creation to the end of the world, the macrocosmic background against which the individual's struggle against sin is carried out, with the help of the virtues.<sup>92</sup> This frame juxtaposes the four periods of salvific history with the liturgical calendar, introducing an eschatological framework.

### *The Body Metaphor*

We have discussed consanguinity trees in the section on line diagrams above, but the arboreal elements that defined the examples above can also be found in the form of a body-container. There is only one other known visual analogue for the Vercelli *Ecclesia* (Rotoli figurati 4): this is an English roll-manuscript (London, BL, Cotton Ch. XIV. 12), dated to the mid-thirteenth century.<sup>93</sup> Recent work by Laura Cleaver has

---

<sup>91</sup> This is explained in the diagram: 'Et fit adaptatio petitionum quibus petuntur dona, et virtutum que optinentur donis, et beatitudinum, que acquiruntur virtutibus, et hoc totum contra septem vitia, et attenditur progressus in hiis omnibus petitionibus sive donis, sive virtutibus, sive beatitudinibus.' ACVC, Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*).

<sup>92</sup> As described in the diagram, in the first large paragraph of text above the central circles: '[L]inee iste quatuor exteriores, que faciunt quadratum, quatuor nobis tempora represe[n]tant, que fluunt ab initio mundi usque ad finem, in quibus hec vitia [nos] impugnant, et beneficia donorum virtutum contra hec expugnanda nobis necessaria sunt.' ACVC, Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*).

<sup>93</sup> See chapter one, section four, for a brief outline of this manuscript, and full discussion below in chapter four. I am preparing an article exploring the relationship between the two manuscript

convincingly established a plausible English provenance for the roll.<sup>94</sup> The Cotton ‘Ecclesia’ is drawn on the dorse of the roll, across the join between the first and second parchment, and historical damage means that a substantial section of the figure is lost, including the arms, hands, and much of the torso. Nonetheless, it is evident that this diagram is of the same model as the Vercelli *Ecclesia*; the outline of the drawing is a body-container, trampling a monstrous figure under its feet, the whole dense with rubrication and short passages of text. To the left and right are smaller circles with allegorical figures of the vices and virtues. In the head of the figure, the unity of the Trinity is conveyed by the face of Christ, the Holy Spirit in the form of a dove emerging from Christ’s mouth, and the head and shoulders of another Christ-like figure with a halo in the central section of the tripartite crown. This small figure is labelled the ‘Ancient of Days’ (*antiquus dierum*) in the Vercelli *Ecclesia*; the enthroned judge from the apocalyptic vision of Daniel (7:9, 13, 22). In this setting, it is likely that the figure represents God, to complete a representation of the Trinity (figure 47). In the Cotton Roll, we also see the complex symbolic arrangement of dove, scales, and key. On each side a group of figures gestures toward the key; on the main figure’s left shoulder we see the pope, identified by his papal tiara, with three ‘cardinales’ lined up behind. On the right, St Peter and St Paul are identified by nimbus outlines: Peter is tonsured, while Paul has long hair; three bishops are grouped behind. Cotton Roll XIV. 12 contains so many similarities of form to the version of the diagram in Vercelli that it is highly likely that we are dealing with a tradition that was active in England as well as in the Italian peninsula. We will return to the implications of this similarity in chapter four below, but for the purposes of this chapter our interest lies in the differences which distinguish these two diagrams, even as they both operate within the shape and metaphorical implications of the body-container.

---

versions of the *Ecclesia* diagram.

<sup>94</sup> L. Cleaver, *Education in Twelfth-Century Art and Architecture: Images of Learning in Europe, c.1100–1220* (Martlesham, 2016), pp. 189–94. S. Worby listed BL, Cotton Roll, XIV. 12 among unpublished primary sources containing texts relating to the *arbor consanguinitatis* in: Worby, *Law and Kinship in Thirteenth-Century England*, at p. 183.

One of the distinctive differences between the Vercelli and the Cotton Roll *Ecclesia* diagrams is that the latter is missing some of the internal diagrams present on the former. Where we have a sword and a genealogical tree within the lower half of the body outline on the Vercelli *Ecclesia*, in the same place on the London drawing there are instead two tabular diagrams, one above the other (figure 48). These are two tree-fundamental diagrams of kinship, *arbores consanguinitatis* and *affinitatis*.<sup>95</sup> Consanguinity tables often take the form of a central human figure holding the diagram up to the viewer. G. B. Ladner has observed that the nature of the figure holding the tables varies in type. For example, where the diagram is found illustrating degrees of familial relationships governing the right to inherit, in Roman law contexts, the figure holding the table might take the form of an emperor or king. In canon law contexts, the figure is often represented as an 'Adam' type, or as Christ. In later fourteenth-century examples, this figure is sometimes explicitly represented as a pope, which perhaps reflects the growing importance of the priesthood in the governance of marriage and kin relationships. The presentation figure, of any type, became common in consanguinity and affinity diagrams from the twelfth century, and the kind of figure used must take advantage of the connotations of power and authority associated with a priest, a king or emperor, or with Christ.<sup>96</sup>

Following the Fourth Lateran Council of 1215, the proscriptions had been reduced to four generations. The Cotton roll depicts four degrees of kinship, which suggests that it is working from a post-Lateran exemplar. Later, these tables are often found incorporated in the *Decretals* of Gregory IX (r. 1227–1241). One evidently unfinished aspect of the *Ecclesia* manuscript (Rotoli figurati 4) are the numerous small empty red circles found to either side of the central genealogy; these circles are not referred to in the accompanying text. They have been carefully drawn with a compass, and some have been given a partial border, also compass drawn. Their number does not appear to be significant. It is hard to comprehend how their irregularity of alignment might be meaningful. Yet, given what is drawn in the corresponding area on the

---

<sup>95</sup> H. Schadt, *Arbores Consanguinitatis und der Arbores Affinitatis*, pp. xx–xx.

<sup>96</sup> G. B. Ladner, 'Medieval and Modern Understanding of Symbolism: A Comparison', in *Images and Ideas in the Middle Ages: Selected Studies in History and Art* (Rome, 1983), pp. 239–82, at pp. 267–9.

Cotton Roll, we find a useful point of comparison: this image was perhaps designed from a similar exemplar which included two tree diagrams of consanguinity and affinity. Further, there are a series of skilfully drawn and ornately decorated tables of consanguinity and affinity held at the chapter library in Vercelli which also use the body-container metaphor rather than the tree. These are found in a lavishly decorated copy of Gratian's *Decretum*, MS XXV (118), which dates to c. 1180.<sup>97</sup> The table of consanguinity and affinity depicted here share stylistic similarities with other manuscripts produced in workshops in Bologna. The tree of consanguinity in this manuscript takes the body-container form, the degrees being arrayed in an arrow shape, 'held' by the bearded royal figure whose deep blue cloak frames them (BCVC, MS XXV (118)).<sup>98</sup>

Some late twelfth- and early thirteenth-century roll manuscripts combine sets of complex diagrams, including the basic forms of lines, *rotae* and body-containers, that are not computistic in nature. The single visual analogue for the Vercelli *Ecclesia* (Rotoli figurati 4) is an example of this kind of compilation.<sup>99</sup> In addition to the central genealogy of Christ, the genealogical diagram on the Cotton roll includes a line of popes from St. Peter, and lines of Anglo-Saxon, Frankish and Carolingian kings and emperors. It is therefore closer to historical-genealogical rolls of monarchs, common in England from the thirteenth to fourteenth centuries.

### *Mappae mundi*

The world map at Vercelli (Rotoli figurati 6, *Mappamondo*; see figure XII), is an example of one kind of depiction of the world. It is a large encyclopaedic *mappamundi*, representative of a genre of which few examples survive. This kind of medieval map was not designed for technical geographic orientation; rather, it offers the viewer a

---

<sup>97</sup> For a discussion of the activity of students and teachers of law in Vercelli in the late twelfth and thirteenth century, see chapter two above. See also: V. Piergiovanni, 'Tracce della cultura canonistica a Vercelli', in *L'Università di Vercelli nel Medioevo: Atti del secondo Congresso Storico Vercellese (Vercelli, Salone Dugentesco, 23-25 ottobre 1992)* (Vercelli, 1994), pp. 243–54.

<sup>98</sup> The consanguinity table can be seen in Schadt, *Arbores Consanguinitatis und der Arbores Affinitatis*, p. 60.

<sup>99</sup> de Laborderie, 'The First Manuals of English History', pp. 1–25.



spiritual and intellectual orientation within time and history.<sup>100</sup> These large and complex representations grew from a tradition originating in the much simpler and more common form of the 'T-O' map (figure 49). This is a simple circular diagram of the earth with classical origins, but the earliest images of it are found in manuscripts of the work of Isidore of Seville (d. 636). His *De natura rerum* (612–15), a work produced in seventh-century Visigothic Spain, contains a chapter, 'De partibus terrae', which describes a *rota terrarum* or *orbis terrae* depicting the three known continents (Asia, Africa, and Europe). As we have discussed above, both the *De natura rerum* and his later *Etymologiae sive origines* [*Etymologiae*] use circular diagrams or *rotae* to explain aspects of cosmology, and in this case, geology. The name 'T-O' describes the layout: the 'O' surrounds the known land masses and they are divided into three by the 'T' of the oceans separating each continent. Although no seventh-century example is known, early manuscript images of the *rota terrarum* T-O map survive. The example of this map seen in figure 49 is found at the end of a copy of the *De natura rerum* made at the convent of Chelle, east of Paris, shortly after 800.<sup>101</sup> Four concentric circles circumscribe the limits of the oceans and the edges of the land masses, and a simple band delineates the 'Great Sea'. East is at the top, and Asia the largest continent. It is not a map in the sense of an accurate geographical representation of an area, but rather a symbolic collation representing various kinds of knowledge about different regions, drawn from multiple sources.<sup>102</sup> The focus of this kind of large world map is moral-historical, rather than practically geographical. The study of medieval world maps has an extensive

---

<sup>100</sup> For a bibliography and summary of historiography see: D. Woodward, 'Medieval *Mappaemundi*', in *The History of Cartography Volume One: Cartography in Prehistoric, Ancient, and Medieval Europe and the Mediterranean*, ed. J. B. Harley and D. Woodward (Chicago, 1987), I, 286–370.

<sup>101</sup> St. Gallen, Stiftsbibliothek, Cod. Sang. 240, fol. 189r. The manuscript is digitised, and available at: <<https://www.e-codices.ch/en/list/one/csg/0240>>.

<sup>102</sup> The image type of the *mappamundi* is separate within the history of cartography from practical maritime navigation maps (known as 'Portolan' maps), which began to be developed in the early thirteenth century in Italy. As this tradition is not represented within the Vercelli *Mappamondo*, I will not discuss utilitarian cartographic images here; however it is important to know that the history of technological development in map-making had a direct impact upon complex image-making, as can be seen in the diagrams of Opicinus de Canistris. On this theme, see: Griffin, 'Diagram and Dimension'; Whittington, *Body-Worlds*, pp. 25–37.

independent scholarship, which emphasises that the density of information contained within *mappae mundi* gives them an encyclopaedic aspect.

*Mappae mundi* also form elements of composite monumental works such as wall paintings and figurative floor mosaics. Michael Evans asserted that medieval schematic illustrations provided subject matter for monumental art. He listed three important examples of such works: the Cosmati pavement in the sanctuary of Westminster Abbey, the paintings in the crypt of the cathedral at Anagni, and the fresco of the cosmos in the Campo Santo at Pisa.<sup>103</sup> The cosmographical fresco at Pisa is of an image-type called the *thema mundi* —memorably described by Kristen Lippincott as the ‘birthday of the universe’— which depicts the astrology of Creation and is predominantly found in fourteenth-century Italian wall paintings (figure 50).<sup>104</sup> In the monumental example at Pisa, painted by Pietro di Pucci da Orvieto (1389–91), God holds a circular cosmos, the whole set within a square frame. Two figures stand below the universe, Augustine on the left, and Thomas Aquinas on the right. At the centre of the cosmological disk is a T-O map containing the three continents, surrounded by elemental rings (water, fire, the planets, the fixed constellations, and heaven); these are surrounded by a further nine coloured rings representing the nine angelic hierarchies.<sup>105</sup> These images, as Lippincott has described, depict a specific horoscope, as part of a tradition dictating that the creation of the world happened under the zodiac sign of Aries. The feast of the Annunciation also came under Aries, and the image-type thereby evokes both the creation and the incarnation.<sup>106</sup> Another example includes the creation of the world fresco in the baptistery at Padua, completed by Giusto de’Menabuoi in 1376–8 (figure 51). These images make innovative theological use of established diagrammatic traditions, which in the case of the astrological and element sections are drawn from computistic manuscripts. The figures of Augustine and Aquinas in the Pisan cosmographical fresco are designed to supply doctrinal authority to this representation

---

<sup>103</sup> Evans, ‘Geometry of the Mind’, pp. 32–55.

<sup>104</sup> K. Lippincott, ‘Giovanni di Paolo’s *Creation of the World* and the Tradition of the *Thema Mundi* in Late Medieval and Renaissance Art’, *The Burlington Magazine*, 132 (1990), pp. 460–8, with a schematic rendering at p. 467.

<sup>105</sup> See J. E. Barclay Lloyd, ‘The Trinity Amid the Hierarchies of Angels: A Lost Fresco from S. Clemente in Rome and an Iconographic Tradition of the Angelic Choirs’, *Arte Cristiana*, 73 (1985), pp. 167–80.

<sup>106</sup> Lippincott, ‘The Tradition of the *Thema Mundi*’, pp. 460–8.

of Creation, which transposes the angelic spheres and the zodiac system into a single unified image of Creation. Each holds a quotation, from Augustine's *De civitate Dei* on the genesis of angels, and from the *Summa theologiae*. As Lippincott argued, the fourteenth-century monumental evidence of this innovative image is ideologically rooted in the Fourth Lateran Council's doctrinal position on the status of angels as part of God's simultaneous creation of all things 'spiritual and corporeal... angelic and mundane'.<sup>107</sup> These fourteenth-century authoritative images certainly have earlier medieval prototypes and they demonstrate further a relationship between complex theological manuscript diagrams and monumental figures.

Complex floor mosaics, of which the Cosmati pavement at Westminster is an example, were common forms of monumental art in the eleventh, twelfth and early thirteenth centuries. In northern Italy mosaic pavements often incorporated cartographical and geographical imagery. Two significant examples from medieval Piemonte also feature detailed inscriptions.<sup>108</sup> These are the mosaic floor at S. Salvatore in Turin, and the pavement of the presbytery at the cathedral of Asti, only 55 km south of Vercelli across the river Po.<sup>109</sup> The floor at S. Salvatore dates to the end of the twelfth century, and includes a central 'wheel of fortune' surrounded by the enclosing ocean, and at each corner three medallions depicting the personifications of the twelve winds.<sup>110</sup> Lucy Donkin has observed that the form and the use of inscription to add detail in the Turin mosaic has notable affinities with large-scale *mappae mundi*, like those of Hereford, and Ebstorf, and here we may add that of Rotoli figurati 6. The cartographic elements of the Turin pavement frame a non-cartographic centre, and as Donkin has observed, this device of using the map as a frame is also found in

---

<sup>107</sup> This part of the conciliar decree is cited in translation in: Lippincott, 'The Tradition of the *Thema Mundi*', at p. 468. Lippincott's article, 'The Tradition of the *Thema mundi*', at p. 468. Taken from: G. Alberigo, P. Joannou and C. Leonardi, eds., *Conciliorum Oecumenicorum Decreta* (Bologna, 1973), at p. 230.

<sup>108</sup> L. Donkin, 'Usque ad ultimum terrae: Mapping the ends of the earth in two medieval floor mosaics', in *Cartography in antiquity and the Middle Ages: fresh perspectives, new methods*, ed. R. J. A. Talbert and R. W. Unger (Leiden, 2008), pp. 189–217.

<sup>109</sup> Donkin, 'Usque ad ultimum terrae', pp. 189–217.

<sup>110</sup> Donkin, 'Usque ad ultimum terrae', at p. 190; E. Pianea, 'I mosaici pavimentali', in *Piemonte Romanico*, ed. G. Romano (Turin, 1994), at pp. 413–6. This mosaic became widely known to scholarship through the influential article by Kitzinger: E. Kitzinger, 'World Map and Fortune's Wheel: A Medieval Mosaic Floor in Turin', *Proceedings of the American Philosophical Society*, 117/5 (1973), pp. 344–73.

illuminated manuscripts of Beatus of Liébana's Apocalypse commentary, particularly in the illustration to Apocalypse chapter 7, where four angels restrain the winds at each corner of the earth. Donkin demonstrates an affinity with the mid-eleventh-century Beatus manuscript of Saint-Sever. In this illustration the angels are positioned at each corner of a circular mass labelled *terra*, and the separate ocean border is indicated by waves and swimming fish; the importance of inscription, symbols (of the winds), and spatial relations means this illustration should be described as diagrammatic. The composite elements drawn from *mappae mundi* relate the ends of the earth in geographical terms, to the ends of the earth in the sense of the extent of divine power and salvation represented by the four angels, or the twelve winds: this is the kingdom which the messiah 'rules from sea to sea, from the river to the ends of the earth' (Ps. 7: 8). The representation of the ends of the earth was perceived to have an apocalyptic dimension which provided a redemptive conceptual framework for the dominant depiction of Fortune turning her wheel.<sup>111</sup> Here, I would draw a comparison with the similar moral-theological frame used in Rotoli figurati 2, the *Rota dominice orationis*, which coordinates the life of Christ, the ages of the Church and the liturgical calendar. In both these works the framing device serves to juxtapose the microcosmic sense of human time, in which individuals suffer the vagaries of fortune, and struggle in the battle against vice, with the macrocosmic chronology of salvific history. Such examples of a clear correspondence between complex monumental mosaics and manuscript drawings indicates that the shared basis is the use of the diagrammatic mode, used to effectively communicate complicated moral-theological themes in multiple contexts of use.

It is also important here to consider the issue of perspective for *mappae mundi*, which has been raised by Patrick Gautier Dalché.<sup>112</sup> The issue with monumental floor mosaics is that they were virtually impossible to view in their entirety: only partial glimpses could be attained even from elevated positions within a church. The all-encompassing vision of creation evoked by images like *mappae mundi*, or works like the

---

<sup>111</sup> Paris, BN, MS lat. 8878, fol. 119r (mid 11<sup>th</sup> century). See Williams, *The Illustrated Beatus*, vol. 3 (London, 1994), pp. 44-57, fig. 406. Donkin, 'Usque ad ultimum terrae', at pp. 199-202.

<sup>112</sup> Gautier Dalché, 'De la glose à la contemplation', pp. 693-771, at pp. 752-64.

S. Salvatore floor mosaic which Donkin has examined, is like a glimpse of the vision of God's kingdom which might be received through divine grace.<sup>113</sup> The positioning of church mosaic floors within areas confined to clerics further suggests that these images had a contemplative purpose which highlighted the fragmentary attainment of divine knowledge which could be glimpsed on earth through grace. Further, the indication is that medieval representations of earth's finite boundaries — whether in a floor mosaic, a *mappa mundi* or a composite diagram — evoked both a sense of the all-encompassing nature of divine vision, and the idea of an ordered universe. Maps like Rotoli figurati 6, or those images which incorporate map-like elements, do not simply repeat standard visual formulae or information taken from biblical or classical sources. As we have seen, like other diagrams they are a means for communicating ideas which is by no means fixed. As representations, they could be adapted and augmented according to the individual needs of the creator or intended audience, relying on the connotations evoked by certain elements; an understanding of the map's broader social and cultural setting is therefore vital to the comprehension of its meaning. In Rotoli figurati 6, a small medallion inscribed with an equilateral cross indicates Jerusalem at the centre, a feature which has been seen to respond to the increasing importance of the city in the time of the crusades, particularly after the loss of the city to Saladin in 1187.<sup>114</sup> These complicated images were shaped by individuals and in addition responded to historical context.<sup>115</sup> As we shall see below, maps, like other complex moral-theological diagrams of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, were the sites of creativity and originality for medieval image-makers, and often display a resourcefulness that allows insight into how individuals and communities responded to change.<sup>116</sup>

---

<sup>113</sup> Donkin, 'Usque ad ultimum terrae', at p. 194.

<sup>114</sup> S. Conklin Akbari, A. S. Mittman, 'Seeing Jerusalem: schematic views of the Holy City, 1100–1300', in *Aspects of Knowledge: Preserving and Reinventing Traditions of Learning in the Middle Ages*, ed. M. Cesario and H. Magennis (Manchester, 2018), pp. 116–141. See also, A. S. Mittman, 'Reexamining the Vercelli Map', *Ordinare il mondo*, pp. 159–182, at pp. 174–5.

<sup>115</sup> V. Morse, 'The Role of Maps in Later Medieval Society: Twelfth to Fourteenth Century', in *The History of Cartography. 3: Cartography in the European Renaissance*, ed. D. Woodward, 2 vols (London, 2009), I, pp. 25–52, at p. 26.

<sup>116</sup> P. Gautier Dalché, 'Sur l'originalité' de la 'géographie' médiévale', in *Auctor and Auctoritas: Invention et conformisme dans l'écriture médiévale*, ed. M. Zimmermann (Paris, 2001), pp. 131–43.

## *Diagrammatic Representations of History*

One theme which we have seen persists in the Rotoli figurati is the visual representation of past, present, and future time; that is, a complete representation of Christian salvation history. These depictions expose conceptions of how time is structured, and how time interacts with human lives and with the universe. We see this in the framing device used in Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*), in the teleological linear format of Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), and in the tree figures and genealogical lists of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). The *Mappamondo* (Rotoli figurati 6) represents events, people, and stories from across history. These images are representations of the immense scope of biblical and salvific history, given order in different ways. The *Genealogia Christi* of Peter of Poitiers uses the *linea Christi* to give the synopsis of biblical history a meaningful, logical structure. Both the *Ecclesia* and the Gioacchino da Fiore manuscripts rely on genealogical trees to reflect a theological sense of fructification and evolution which is evoked by the organic metaphor of the tree format.<sup>117</sup> In Joachim of Fiore's *Figura arboris* these trees ascend into countable generations of historical and future time, from Christ until the Second Coming. In the central sword/tree of the *Ecclesia*, as we saw in chapter one, a *linea Christi* ascends from Adam, and continues from Christ until the *quadraginta dies penitentiae*. Some of these diagrams juxtapose this universal historical scope against a human dimension, embodied by the succession of generations. The central wheel of the *Rota dominice orationis* can be said to map the potential virtuous pathways of an individual and interior, spiritual life dependent upon the mind of the reader. These are contrasted with the life of Christ, the liturgical calendar, and the ages of the world, ending again in the *dies iudicii*. The *Genealogia Christi* and the Trees of Ascending Generations of Joachim of Fiore (Rotoli figurati 7) incorporate lists of monarchs, leaders, and popes; the papal lists in Joachim of Fiore's diagrams are often updated to include the contemporary pontiff. In Rotoli figurati 7, as we have seen, the last pope mentioned is Urban III; the spaces for the popes of the final generation until 1260 are left blank. Medallions of the virtues and vices, on the left and right respectively of the enthroned figure of Christ/the Church in the

---

<sup>117</sup> Worm, 'Trees of Genealogy', pp. 35–67, at p. 57.

*Ecclesia* manuscript, give a moral —and therefore human— counterpoint to the entirety of Christian society, and past and future history, depicted within the diagram.

Examining these diagrams in the light of other examples and in the context of medieval visual culture, as we have done in chapters 1 and 3, has allowed us in some cases to make comparisons with their appearance elsewhere. For example, the *Rota dominice orationis* and the *Genealogia Christi* are commonly found together in roll-manuscripts, often accompanied by diagrammatic Trees of Consanguinity and Affinity. These diagrams, as we have seen, depict human bonds and familial relationships through time; they are therefore another precise evocation of the human dimension of history. The other known version of the *Ecclesia* diagram (BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12) is found on a roll-manuscript which contains a version of the *Genealogia* and a *Rota dominice orationis*, while the *Ecclesia* itself contains within its body a Tree of Consanguinity and a tree of Affinity, and the texts related to these tables. These diagrams do not appear completed in the Vercelli *Ecclesia*: there, the densely arranged medallions are found empty. The fact that the copyist of the Vercelli *Ecclesia* did not complete the planned consanguinity and affinity diagrams is part of the tension betrayed by this diagram. The *Ecclesia* in Vercelli includes a central *linea Christi*, and texts drawn from the early work of Joachim of Fiore; this content *does not* appear in BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12. These differences, and their significance, will be discussed in the following chapters.

Returning to the human dimension evoked by the diagrams of Consanguinity and Affinity, Andrea Worm has observed how frequently they appear in association with medieval encyclopedic and legal texts, and with Peter of Poitiers' *Compendium*. Her contention is that this association is based on the complexity of the arboreal metaphor: consanguinity trees evoke the beginning of history as a progressive concept. In the Vercelli *Genealogia Christi*, Eve eating the forbidden fruit beside the Tree of Life is given unusual space and prominence, emphasising the importance of this moment when sexual procreation began, and thus when the static concept of time in Paradise changed, not to be restored until the end of history. The correlation between the six degrees of consanguinity and the six ages of the world was drawn by Isidore of Seville, so the temporal and eschatological dimension given to these diagrams of human

relationships was widely known.<sup>118</sup> In the five Rotoli figurati discussed above, these complementary dimensions of time are repeatedly depicted and emphasised, drawing thematic connections within the group which are also repeated in other known instances of the *Genealogia Christi*, the *Rota dominice orationis*, *mappae mundi*, and the *Ecclesia* diagrams. Such comprehensive diagrammatic representations allow the simultaneous perception of past and future, a perspective which is both diachronic and synchronic.<sup>119</sup> In the *Rota dominice orationis*, the *Ecclesia* and Gioacchino da Fiore manuscripts we find the whole of history represented, from creation, through salvation, to the final judgement. Of Joachim of Fiore, Marjorie Reeves observed how his diagrams display a consummate mastery of ‘mythologies of pattern and shape’ in representing history; in the *Figura arboris* and the Trees of Ascending Generations present in Rotoli figurati 7, we see the fundamental structure of many of his representations of time in a human scale.<sup>120</sup> We have considered the broader context of diagrams in medieval visual culture, and have observed how in the earliest medieval diagrams disseminated by Isidore and Bede, spatial and numerical arrangements within the framework of a shape allowed knowledge to be transmitted with multiple layers of symbolic meaning.<sup>121</sup> Beryl Smalley observed of much of twelfth-century educational writing that the usual interpretational mode of examining text and then image was reversed in this context: ‘You begin with your picture...’.<sup>122</sup> Further, we have seen how works which aimed to represent the entirety of human knowledge emerged in this period.

So far, this study has not addressed the work of Hugh of Saint Victor (d. 1141), whose understanding of man’s relationship to God relied upon a complex conception of

---

<sup>118</sup> Worm, ‘Trees of Genealogy’, at pp. 57, 60.

<sup>119</sup> G. Melville, ‘Geschichte in graphischer Gestalt: Untersuchungen zu einem spätmittelalterlichen Darstellungsprinzip’, in *Geschichtsschreibung und Geschichtsbewusstsein im späten Mittelalter*, ed. H. Patze (Sigmaringen, 1987), pp. 57–154. See also Worm, ‘*Ista est Jerusalem*’, pp. 127–30.

<sup>120</sup> Reeves, *Influence*, p. 505. See also Reeves, ‘The *Arbores* of Joachim of Fiore’, pp. 124–36.

<sup>121</sup> Esmeijer, *Divina Quaternitas*, p. 33 and passim.

<sup>122</sup> Smalley, *The Study of the Bible*, pp. 95–6. Cited by Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, p. 447, n. 42.



time and history which he frequently described through diagrams.<sup>123</sup> In 1133, Hugh was master at the school at the abbey of Saint Victor in Paris, a scholar and teacher who was renowned as a great theologian across western Europe.<sup>124</sup> For Victorine authors, history was the foundation of knowledge: it provided the literal sense and the starting point for any interpretation of scripture. A thorough grounding in the historical reality of scripture was a fundamental aspect of learning at the abbey of Saint Victor.<sup>125</sup> It was also influential beyond Victorine contexts in the schools of Paris, as David Luscombe's work on Peter Comestor's response to Victorine conceptions of history has shown.<sup>126</sup> In chapter two we established the intellectual horizons of Vercelli's cathedral school at the end of the twelfth century, with connections to the Paris schools. We also observed how Guala Bicchieri (d. 1227) selected canons from the abbey of Saint Victor to form the community at the abbey of S. Andrea from 1219. Guala's activity and influence in centres of learning in Vercelli is well-documented, and his choice of Victorine canons for S. Andrea probably indicates his affinity for Victorine intellectual interests. Our image of Vercelli as a dynamic intellectual urban centre throughout this period allows us to speculate that the Victorine influence would have been felt at the school of S. Eusebio in the late twelfth century. Hugh's *The Mystic Ark* was an exceptionally popular text, swiftly disseminated through learned contexts in the twelfth century. As Conrad Rudolph has described, works produced at Saint Victor by figures like Hugh were transmitted through a network of learned individuals, and through related monastic and canonical culture. Chapter two of this study established the strong contact with the political and intellectual culture of Paris found at Vercelli in the late twelfth century (under Bishop Alberto, 1185–1205), and sustained through the regular canons from Saint Victor who were members of the abbey of S. Andrea from 1219. It is also

---

<sup>123</sup> Chenu, *Nature, Man and Society*, p. 199.

<sup>124</sup> C. Rudolph, 'First, I Find the Center Point: Reading the Text of Hugh of Saint Victor's *The Mystic Ark*', *Transactions of the American Philosophical Society*, 94/4 (2004), 1–110, at p. 1; P. Sicard, *Hugues de Saint-Victor et son école* (Turnhout, 1991).

<sup>125</sup> See the important collection: R. Berndt, ed., *Bibel und Exegese in der Abtei Saint-Victor zu Paris: Form und Funktion eines Grundtextes im europäischen Rahmen*, Corpus Victorinum. Instrumenta., 3 (Münster, 2009).

<sup>126</sup> D. E. Luscombe, 'The Place of Peter Comestor in the History of Medieval Theology', in *Pierre le Mangeur ou Pierre de Troyes, maître du XIIIe siècle*, ed. G. Dahan (Turnhout, 2013), pp. 27–45.

important to reiterate here the vitality and reciprocity of the contexts of learning in Vercelli during this period. We have seen how bishops and canons stipulated manuscripts to be circulated between schools and convents, indicating shared resources, and how important ecclesiastical and intellectual figures were present as scholars and teachers in the city. As Paolo Rosso has demonstrated, Vercelli had a uniquely 'open' intellectual environment in the thirteenth century. Under Bishop Alberto in the late twelfth century, the city's cathedral chapter, as a site for theological learning, was perhaps the most advanced in the Italian peninsula.

## Conclusion

In Rotoli figurati 1 (*Disegni geometrici*), we find a sheet of roughly executed diagrams grouped according to their order as demonstrations of proofs in Euclid's *Elements*. Computistic diagrams provide an example of how, as devices for teaching, these images could function without a text. A student might have constructed these diagrams under the guidance of a teacher, or a teacher might have referred to the images on the manuscripts as they elucidated the principles with the assistance of the text. Rotoli figurati 1 is an example of the diagram as an active instrument that completes the function of the text. We have more broadly discussed vision in the middle ages, and the use of the diagrammatic mode. Visual thinking was integral not only to devotion and interaction with religious images and the forms of religious practice (both individual and institutional), but to pedagogy, to learning and the transmission of knowledge. In the group of diagrammatic manuscripts at Vercelli, we see the use of different forms.

In Rotoli figurati 3 (*Genealogia Christi*), we have an example of history represented through the multiple unfurling lines of biblical genealogy. In Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*) we see the petitions of the Lord's Prayer as a means to combat vice through the attainment of virtue arrayed in the order of a circle: a coherent and memorable pattern. This circle concerns the individual Christian's struggle with sin and morality, but the diagram gives this an eternal framework in the form of a rectangle that equates the stages of the life of Christ with the phases of the liturgical year and the ages of the world, from Adam to the day of Judgement. Rotoli figurati 6, a *Mappamondo*, uses a similar framing device, placing salvific history and an encyclopaedic knowledge of the world within a religious and moral framework. The forms of diagram which we

have discussed in this chapter are complex and operate at multiple levels of interpretation. The apparently separate themes encompassed by the genealogical lines and trees, and wheels of vice and virtue, the densely packed information of the world map, and the salvific chronologies of Joachim of Fiore have an overarching theme: the representation of Christian time and past and future history, juxtaposed with the elucidation of the individual Christian journey through earthly life. In the next chapter, we will move on to a fuller discussion of the themes arising from our examination of the body metaphor in the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4). This rich image combines, as we have seen, multiple thematic strands, combining iconographic visual elements from many of the diagrammatic forms discussed here.

Images were integral to the transmission and understanding of theological insight in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. These kinds of images do not function as adjuncts to a text; rather, through study they elicit a specific response of understanding from the viewer. This particular response is a form of theological truth. The impression or sense of divine mysteries granted through the impact of a carefully crafted image upon the eye was a method of transmitting knowledge particularly favoured during this period. This is a method that prioritised the mind's eye, as we have seen, and the mind's ability to conceive at once — rather than through the accumulation of sense through reading — multiple, interrelated, and complex ideas to gain an impression of divine insight. In the *Ecclesia* diagram, for example, we see how familiar iconographic symbols are carefully ordered and combined to create a striking image.

Exploring the body as a fundamental Christian metaphor, and as a physical framing device in the diagrammatic mode, as we have observed in how the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4), in its entirety, is *unlike* other known body-metaphor diagrams. The Vercelli *Ecclesia* is an intricate diagram which unites and incorporates correspondences drawn from a diverse range of sources. In doing so, the image makes specific assertions about subjects that had an immediate social and cultural relevance to the institutions and communities in Vercelli which, as we established in chapter two, probably produced and made use of the Rotoli figurati. The *Ecclesia* makes emphatic statements about ecclesiastical jurisdiction, the primacy of papal government, the shape of the Roman Church hierarchy, the form of the universal Christian community, and about the ability to see and know God and to imagine the salvific history of

humankind. These areas were fraught with controversy, and more so in the dynamic historical context of the cathedral of S. Eusebio and the environs of Vercelli.

## 4 The body of the Church: reading the *Ecclesia* diagram

The *Ecclesia* (Rotoli figurati 4), is a striking and complicated image, with only a single other known version to provide a direct comparison (BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12).

Chapter one offered a description of this diagram's complex layout, establishing that four hands were at work on the manuscript which connect it to the copyists of Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). In chapter three, we examined other visualisations of knowledge which offered insight into sources and correspondences for the various details and elements of the *Ecclesia* diagram. Through examining these details, however, it is too easy to lose sight of the immediate impression of the image, which is a dramatic and violent representation of Christ impaling Satan with a sword. This is a powerful, militant Christ — the 'Church complete', or the Church and Christ as one— victorious in the battle.<sup>1</sup> Every detail of the image must be understood in the terms of this crucial visual statement, but this demands scrutiny. What is meant by 'the Church' in this image? Where does the power or might of the Church come from? What constitutes its strength, and its weakness? What does it mean to belong to the body of the Church? What relationship between Christ and the Church is evoked here? How has this image been constructed, where do these motifs originate, and why have they been chosen?

The density of the source material and the decisions behind such thematic selections make the *Ecclesia* diagram an extraordinarily valuable lens onto how these diverse subjects were perceived in the last quarter of the twelfth century, when the archetype of the text was probably created, and onwards to the third quarter of the thirteenth century, when this manuscript was copied. It also offers new insight into how important images were to both the understanding and the transmission of ideas in the late twelfth-century. Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) therefore merits a principal place in the longer discussion of these broader themes. To present them in further detail, this chapter is dedicated to a sustained discussion of this diagram. It will describe — member

---

<sup>1</sup> '... que totaliter Ecclesia Christus integer appellatur'. Appendix 1, l. 2.

by member, head to foot — the elements of the diagram, to familiarise the reader with its contents. By doing so, we will draw out further many of the rich visual themes which have concerned us in chapter three.

In the previous chapter, we examined the different modes of seeing evoked by medieval diagrammatic representations. In the interpretation of the *Ecclesia* diagram, we will follow the symbolism of the metaphor of the body and its parts (head, shoulders, torso, and so on) to describe and explain the material. This aims to maintain the diagram's visual logic and symbolic resonance. It is important to recognise that the image is not exclusively understandable under the headings which follow, indeed some aspects could be considered under multiple headings, and the chapter offers only one method of organising and interpreting the *Ecclesia* diagram. This organisational schema is adapted to explain a complex medieval image, but it is also designed to evoke the means by which the diagram was intended to be read and interpreted. However, in doing so, I am attentive to the risk of imposing categories onto the material. A method like this makes us less aware of, or even likely to ignore, the elements which do not fit these categories. We have described in the first chapter certain inconsistencies: the unfinished, awkward inclusion of parts of a consanguinity tree, and the serious discrepancies between text and image which are only partially explained by reference to the other known version (BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12). Borrowing the diagram's own logic risks blinding us to the fissures and gaps, the 'blurred edges, mistakes, and anomalies' which do not fit.<sup>2</sup> The justification for following the diagram's way of thinking is that progressing through the image attentively will expose the interpretative potential of these discrepancies, of the cracks, the problematising tensions, which in turn enrich our understanding of this image. Alongside the examination of visual and textual detail, this chapter will draw on contextual information which will give us the foundation for attempting to answer one of the broader questions arising from the *Ecclesia* diagram: what this representation of the Church meant in the late twelfth century, when this image was probably created, and how this might have been received in the thirteenth century, when evidence suggests that this manuscript was copied.

---

<sup>2</sup> Ginzburg, 'Family Resemblances and Family Trees', pp. 537–56, at p. 556.

These important ecclesiological questions will be highlighted as they arise in the description, and a focused analysis of their implications takes place in chapter five.

## The head: the eternal Church

### *The Face of Christ*

With almond-shaped eyes and a gaze fixed outward upon the viewer, the head of Christ forms the arresting centre of the ‘Ecclesia’ diagram (Figure 52). From Christ’s mouth emerges the dove of the Holy Spirit, which holds in its beak a set of scales. The dove and scales in turn form the handle of a key. As the text informs us, the figure represents the Church as a man whose head is Christ, and this is the Christ of Apocalypse: ‘one like to the son of man, whose hair is white as wool.’<sup>3</sup> The text of the *Ecclesia* tells us that the tiered nimbus depicts a vision of the ‘heavenly Jerusalem’. The twenty-four Elders are arrayed in the outer circle, in the middle are ‘three hierarchies of angels’, and in the interior circle the ‘souls of the saints are gathered’.<sup>4</sup> Here, the ‘elders will judge, the angels attend them, and the souls are crowned in the judgement’. Heaven is defined as one’s presence before God, seeing Him face to face, and as a vision of peace bought to fruition.<sup>5</sup>

There are complex symbolic components here. Christ’s nimbus has three layers, and his head is surmounted by an ornate tripartite crown labelled *diadema regni* (Figure 7; Appendix 2, no. 2). A short passage on the lower left side of the diagram describing the significance of the colours used in the image explains that gold is used in the head, ‘for the higher divinity’.<sup>6</sup> This higher divinity could refer to the persons of the Trinity, which appear to be represented in the head of the figure, through the face of Christ, the dove of the Holy Spirit, and the ‘Ancient of Days’ who is depicted in the centre of the crown. This image of the Trinity is rich with potential significance: the *diadema regni*

---

<sup>3</sup> Apoc. 1: 13–4. ‘Imago hec representat Ecclesiam que figuraliter homini comparatur, cuius caput est Christus’ (1 Cor. 11:3). Appendix 1, ll. 1–2. ‘Caput quidem Christum significat, qui in Apocalipsi legitur: *simili filio homini, cuius capilli sunt candidi tamquam lana.*’ Appendix 1, ll. 4–5.

<sup>4</sup> Appendix 3, ll. 1–2; ll. 5–6.

<sup>5</sup> Appendix 3, ll. 13–9; Appendix, ll. 10–6.

<sup>6</sup> Appendix 3, ll. 70–1. The colour symbolism described in the text is not always followed through in the image: for example, some yellow ochre coloured tinting is found in the illustrations in the head.

refers to Isaiah 62:3. The witness foresees the restoration of Jerusalem: ‘And you shall be a crown of glory in the hand of the Lord, and a royal diadem in the hand of your God.’ This clearly refers to the representation of the heavenly Jerusalem in the head. However, in light of the presence of the thought of Joachim of Fiore found on this manuscript, the Trinitarian motif is significant. Joachim’s *Psalterium decem chordarum*, completed around 1186–87, is a three volume treatise on the Trinity. The titular psalter is a musical instrument in the shape of which Joachim found an analogy for the mystery of Trinity, divinely inspired by a vision.<sup>7</sup> Joachim’s text participated within late twelfth-century debates on the nature of the Trinity (to which we shall return in chapter six), and one broad aspect of his Trinitarian thought was that it made use of symbols and images, rather than the discursive argument of scholastic theologians such as Peter Lombard, as in the image of the psalter.<sup>8</sup> The representation of the Trinity found in the head of Christ in the *Ecclesia* diagram, through small but effective iconographic details, provides an image of divine unity which is part of the symbolic embodiment of the Church. This wholeness, or fruition, describes the eternal Church. The halo of the head in effect becomes a plan of the heavenly Jerusalem, with ranks of the blessed arrayed in tiers. Heaven as a direct union with Christ is manifested in the image of his face, and the textual commentary also gives a sense of the permanence and completeness of the Beatific Vision.<sup>9</sup> The layout explained in the text can be seen clearly in the other version of the *Ecclesia* diagram in Cotton Roll XIV. 12 (figure 53).

The outward, direct gaze of the face of Christ in the *Ecclesia* diagram invites comparison with the representations of the Holy Face associated with the Veronica icon, the trace of Christ’s face imprinted upon a cloth.<sup>10</sup> The image of the Holy Face or ‘Veronica’ offers its gaze directly to the beholder, creating a communication between the viewer and the face of Christ. In England, one of the most well-known examples of

---

<sup>7</sup> R. E. Learner, ‘Joachim of Fiore’s Breakthrough to Chiliasm’, *Cristianesimo nella storia*, 6 (1985), pp. 489–512.

<sup>8</sup> Gemeinhardt, ‘Joachim the Theologian’, pp. 50–86.

<sup>9</sup> Burton Russell, *A History of Heaven*, pp. 95–97, 119.

<sup>10</sup> For the history of the Veronica, see the collection: H. L. Kessler and G. Wolf, eds., *The Holy Face and the Paradox of Representation: Papers from a Colloquium Held at the Bibliotheca Hertziana, Rome and the Villa Spelman, Florence, 1996* (Bologna, 1998).



the 'Veronica' is from the *Chronica Majora* of Matthew Paris. In the Arundel Psalter, Matthew Paris glosses the 'Veronica' drawing by stating that the face of the Saviour is painted to stimulate the mind further towards devotion.<sup>11</sup> The cult of the Veronica is associated with Pope Innocent III, but there are references to such an object from the late twelfth century and the papacy of Innocent's predecessor Celestine III (r. 1191–1198).<sup>12</sup> However, it was Innocent who instigated a procession in 1208 that moved the Veronica veil from St. Peter's basilica to the Hospital of the Holy Spirit.<sup>13</sup> The procession carried the veil through the streets of Rome on the feast day of the Wedding at Cana, the second Sunday after Epiphany. Along with this ritual ostentation of the veil, Innocent III also disseminated an indulgence associated with the Veronica, and a special prayer. This prayer emphasised that the image was to be used for private devotion, a communication with Christ that stimulated thoughts on the individual encounter with Christ at Judgement Day. In the thirteenth century, the cult of the Veronica developed swiftly, and it is plausible that this image of the face of Christ, and its associated eschatological references, influenced the conception of the *Ecclesia* diagram in the late twelfth century and had potential implications for the continued interest which lead to it being copied in the thirteenth century.<sup>14</sup>

The prayer commonly circulated with the 'Veronica' and originating from the papal court of Innocent describes how images of Christ's face cannot normally represent the divine gaze, but presents the Veronica, as an imprint of Christ (and not made by

---

<sup>11</sup> Translated from the text in London, BL, Arundel MS 157, fol. 1v, by Klein, 'From the Heavenly to the Trivial', pp. 247–278, at pp. 272–3. The text reads: 'Et ut animus devotius excitetur, facies Salvatoris, per industriam artificis expresse figuratur.'

<sup>12</sup> B. M. Bolton, 'Advertise the Message: Images in Rome at the Turn of the Twelfth Century', in *The Church and the Arts*, ed. D. Wood (Oxford, 1995), pp. 117–30.

<sup>13</sup> C. Egger, 'Papst Innocenz III. und die Veronica. Geschichte, Theologie, Liturgie und Seelsorge', in *The Holy Face*, pp. 181–203. It is also important to note here that at this time Innocent III also commissioned the addition of an ornate silver encasement, framing the face, for the Lateran icon of the enthroned Saviour displayed on the altar of the Sancta Sanctorum. This icon was one of the most important holy images of medieval Rome, and Innocent's addition should be considered in 'direct dialogue' with the development of the Veronica cult. On this, see K. Noreen, 'Revealing the Sacred: The Icon of Christ in the Sancta Sanctorum, Rome', *Word & Image*, 22/3 (2006), pp. 228–37.

<sup>14</sup> G. Wolf, 'From Mandylion to Veronica: Picturing the Disembodied Face and Disseminating the True Image of Christ in the Latin West', in *The Holy Face*, pp. 153–79.

man), as an unmediated divine vision.<sup>15</sup> The 'Veronica' images offer a glimpse of the eschatological vision, the 'visio Dei', in its representation of the direct gaze of Christ.<sup>16</sup> The prayer attributed to Innocent III that circulates with the Veronica image emphasises that the image is a *speculum*, a mirror or glass. This metaphor for the limitations of human knowledge of the divine is drawn from Paul's first letter to the Corinthians (1 13:12–13): 'We see now through a glass darkly; but then face to face. Now I know in part; but then I shall know even as I am known.'<sup>17</sup> It is only possible for the faithful to attain the *visio Dei*, the unmediated gaze 'face to face' at the moment of the Last Judgement: this is the moment that is depicted in the head of the *Ecclesia*.

In his discussion of the development of the 'Veronica' tradition, Gerhard Wolf has observed the resonance of the artefact of the cloth being preserved within the basilica of Saint Peter in Rome, and therefore bound to the body of Christ's vicar, the pope. It is highly significant, therefore, that papal self-identification with Christ began in the late twelfth century, and further that Pope Innocent III was the first to name himself exclusively as the vicar of Christ rather than the vicar of St. Peter.<sup>18</sup> The conceptual importance of the direct relationship with Christ embodied in the office and figure of the pope is embodied in the positioning of the pope in the *Ecclesia* figure (Figure VII). Further, the pope was both bridegroom and friend of the bridegroom of the Roman Church, and this important ecclesiological theme was recalled by the Veronica procession.<sup>19</sup> Wolf suggests that the important role of the holy woman in the legend of the Veronica was profoundly interwoven with the concept of the *Ecclesia Romana* and the sacramental image which was the veil kept at Saint Peter's. The Veronica was thus perceived by the thirteenth century as the 'universal symbol of the *Ecclesia romana, id est universalis*'.<sup>20</sup> Veronica images of the face of Christ therefore contain an ecclesiological reference, as well as an invitation for the viewer to contemplate the eschatological encounter with the divine. Wolf's convincing account

---

<sup>15</sup> M. Andaloro, 'L'acheropita in ombra del Laterano', in *Il Volto di Cristo*, ed. G. Wolf and G. Morello (Milan, 2000), pp. 43–45.

<sup>16</sup> See Klein, 'From the Heavenly to the Trivial', at pp. 273–4.

<sup>17</sup> For a full discussion and bibliography see Kessler, 'Speculum', pp. 1–41.

<sup>18</sup> A. Paravicini Bagliani, *Le chiavi e la tiara: immagini e simboli del papato medievale* (Rome, 1998), 68; id., *The Pope's Body*, pp. 58–9.

<sup>19</sup> Wolf, 'From Mandylyon to Veronica', pp. 153–79.

<sup>20</sup> Wolf, 'From Mandylyon to Veronica', at p. 177.

of the ecclesiological resonance of the Veronica as a symbol of the *Ecclesia romana* gives us further context which informs how we should understand the *Ecclesia* manuscript (Rotoli figurati 4). The face of Christ in this manuscript diagram bears strong visual similarities to the images of the Veronica circulated in the thirteenth century. The simplicity of Christ's face surrounded by a nimbus, with parted and wavy hair, and a direct frontal gaze, recalls the early English Veronica images associated with the thirteenth-century drawings of Matthew Paris in the Arundel and Westminster Psalters (see figures 53 and 54). Matthew had not seen the Roman Veronica, but basing his images on the text of the circulating prayer, his pictures nonetheless convey comprehension of the meaning of Christ's gaze.<sup>21</sup> The swiftness with which the cult image of the Veronica spread through western Europe means that the creators and copyists of the *Ecclesia* image, in an important ecclesiastical centre like Vercelli, would have been conscious of the connotations of papal authority in such representations of the face of Christ.

### *Angelic hierarchies*

As elsewhere in the *Ecclesia* diagram, what the text describes is not always realised by the artist. This suggests that a yet unidentified source text provided more expansive content than was present in the diagram, or that the interpretation of the diagram required prior knowledge of this text.<sup>22</sup> This is particularly evident in the depiction of the angelic hierarchies arrayed in Christ's nimbus. It is possible to see that the angels in the secondary circle are differentiated from each other. If we look closely, the angelic figure in the uppermost section of the hierarchy, to the left of the crown, has three sets of wings (figure 52). This figure is therefore a seraph, observed in Isaiah 6:1–3. There are small differentiations between the other eight angels depicted but not enough to specifically label the others as part of the nine orders within the hierarchy. The lack of consistency in the artist's choices elsewhere regarding numbering (even when these

---

<sup>21</sup> F. Lewis, 'The Veronica: Image, Legend and Viewer', in *England in the Thirteenth Century: Proceedings of the 1984 Harlaxton Symposium*, ed. W. M. Ormrod, Harlaxton Medieval Studies, 1 (Grantham, 1985), 100–106. London, BL, Royal MS 2. A. XXII, fol. 221v (13th century, second quarter). The second image is taken from London, BL, Arundel MS 157, fol. 2r., St. Albans, c. 1240, for which see See Lewis, *The Art of Matthew Paris*.

<sup>22</sup> This theme is returned to in chapter five below.

numbers are specifically mentioned in the text) indicates that the artist did not draw precise distinctions between his angels. However, in the other known version of the *Ecclesia*, BL Cotton Roll XIV. 12, we can see much fuller evocation of nine triadic hierarchies, as here they are labelled: angels, archangels, virtues, powers, principalities, dominions, thrones, cherubim and seraphim (figure 47). Writing on angelic hierarchies in the twelfth century was concentrated around commentaries on the Neoplatonic doctrine put forward in the *De caelesti hierarchia* of the Pseudo Dionysius, and it is the Pseudo-Dionysian conception of angels which appears to be referred to in the ‘iii gerarchie angelorum’ of the *Ecclesia* diagram. There are nine orders of angels divided into three hierarchies, whose intermediary role in the cosmos is to transmit knowledge of the divine to humankind.<sup>23</sup> However, in their placement around the face of Christ, a striking comparison can be found in *The Mystic Ark* of Hugh of Saint Victor. In this text, which in its simplest structure contains a figure of Christ whose body is the Church, the nine orders angels are arrayed to either side of the head, ‘turned to contemplate the face of the majesty’.<sup>24</sup> Similarities can be seen in Conrad Rudolph’s reconstruction of the diagram, which bears a strong visual resemblance to this element in BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12, and to Rotoli figurati 4. Rudolph’s analysis of the text of *The Mystic Ark* emphasises that the angels in Hugh’s *Ark* are present as ‘citizens of heaven’, in a vision which ‘ties the beginning of time with its end’.<sup>25</sup> In the *Ecclesia* diagram, we see a comparable image of the citizens of heaven. The celestial hierarchies in the head of the *Ecclesia* diagram are balanced against the ecclesiastical hierarchies in the earthly Church as depicted in the rest of the body. These hierarchies are linked by the divine power embodied in their common structure.<sup>26</sup> Although the copyist of the *Ecclesia* diagram has not fully illustrated the heavenly orders, this concept of universal hierarchy is crucial to the unified nature of the diagram.

---

<sup>23</sup> Chenu, *Nature, Man and Society*, pp. 80–2.

<sup>24</sup> Hugh of Saint Victor, *De archa Noe*, ed. P. Sicard, CCSL, 176 (Turnhout, 2001), II, pp. 161–2; Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, pp. 498–9.

<sup>25</sup> Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, 214–20, at p. 219, and fig. 13.

<sup>26</sup> B. Tierney, *Religion, Law, and the Growth of Constitutional Thought, 1150–1650* (Cambridge, 1982), pp. 42–3.

## *The crown*

One gold crown on his head is imperial, another regal, another pontifical. [He is] the true King and Emperor whose kingdom and empire is eternal. [Christ] who is for us the pope, the bishop and shepherd of our souls.

As has been said above, Christ is the head of the church. His hair and crown are the saints who are with him.<sup>27</sup>

The triple crown worn by Christ, as the text advises, represents imperial, regal, and pontifical authority: it is the *diadema regni*, or crown of kingship. Within the structure of the crown itself there is further text. The bottom part of the crown is a brow band, illustrated as if decorated with precious stones, and bordered with strings of pearls. Of the three decorative elements, the one at the centre of the brow has a lobed fleur-de-lis form. On either side of this there are two triangular sections of the second part of the crown. The legible words on the left and right include three scriptural references to coronation, all of which are taken from Apocalypse. The added emphasis indicates the legible text on the crown of the figure of Ecclesia:

And I saw: and behold a white cloud and upon the cloud one sitting like to the Son of man, *having a crown of gold on his head* and in his hand a sharp sickle.<sup>28</sup>

For you have prepared for him with blessings of sweetness: *you have set on his head a crown of precious stones.*<sup>29</sup>

And his eyes were as a flame of fire, and *on his head were many diadems*, and he had a name written, which no man knows but himself.<sup>30</sup>

And a great sign appeared in heaven: A woman clothed with the sun, and the moon was under her feet, and *upon her head a crown of twelve stars.*<sup>31</sup>

These images of coronation corroborate the identification within the text for the head of Christ as that of Apocalypse. This configuration of Christ emphasises that he is the

---

<sup>27</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 6-9; ll. 72-3; l. 87.

<sup>28</sup> 'Et vidi: et ecce nubem candidam, et super nubem sedentem similem Filio hominis, habentem in capite suo *coronam auream*, et in manu sua falcem acutam.' Apoc. 14:14.

<sup>29</sup> 'Quoniam praevenisti eum in benedictionibus dulcedinis; *posuisti in capite eius coronam de lapide pretioso.*' Psalm 20:4.

<sup>30</sup> 'Oculi autem eius sicut flamma ignis, et *in capite eius diademata multa*, habens nomen scriptum, quod nemo novit nisi ipse.' Apoc. 19:12.

<sup>31</sup> 'Et signum magnum apparuit in caelo: mulier amicta sole, et luna sub pedibus eius, et *in capite eius corona stellarum duodecim.*' Apoc. 12:1.

‘true king and emperor’, a designation which will be considered in the context of twelfth-century statements of papal authority in chapter five below. The reference to the *mulier amicta sole*, the woman clothed with the sun of Apoc. 12:1, also refers to the identification of this woman with the Church. Evidently, the understanding of *Ecclesia* in the diagram is layered. The Church is simultaneously the congregation of the faithful, the *ecclesia universalis*, in two simultaneous states: *ecclesia militans* and *ecclesia triumphans*. Paul’s letters to the Corinthians give this fundamental metaphor of the Church as a body, with Christ as its head, and the limbs and other members as the Christian community. The ways in which *Ecclesia* was conceptualised were guided by scripture and canonical texts, but this ideological conception of the Church, as well as its institutional structure, evolved and responded to social, economic and geo-political pressures. The development of the two churches, *militans* and *triumphans*, is a twelfth-century phenomenon: the eternal heavenly Church united in one body with the earthly temporal Church. These important ecclesiological issues will be returned to in chapter five below.

## Rome

The temporal Church is embodied in the understanding of *Ecclesia* as Rome, the great royal and sacerdotal city, which is reflected not only in the presence of the pope and the Roman college within the figure but in the balance between priesthood and kingship depicted on each side of the central chronological tree diagram. These attributes are made explicit in a passage of text toward the lower left of the figure, which reads:

Here Rome [began] to rise, the future mistress of the world, in which [the royal Christ] foresaw the coming into being of the priesthood, thence the prophets were sent.<sup>32</sup>

The concept of Rome as ‘mistress of the world’ because it was the seat of St. Peter, the head of sacerdotal power in the Christian world, arose with Pope Leo I (r. 440–461).<sup>33</sup> This passage is found on the manuscript approximately level with the depictions of

---

<sup>32</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 61–2; Appendix 3, ll. 63–6.

<sup>33</sup> See discussion and references in Ullmann, *The Growth of Papal Government*, pp. 76–7.

Samuel the priest anointing Saul as king (on the left), and Moses appointing Aaron as a priest (figure VI, VII; rubric 48–9). These two scenes represent the foundation of the distinction between and the laws of priesthood and kingship, and of the hierarchical differentiation between the two. The location of this passage of text adjacent to these biblical scenes also explains the description of Rome as ‘future mistress’: the copyist is referring to the historical point on the timeline. This authoritative image of Rome as the earthly seat of the Church, the seat of St. Peter, is explained in terms of jurisdiction. Just above this passage of text, we read that:

God put the Roman Empire in charge of all people, in which he gathered all peoples into a single jurisdiction. Then He foresaw a new law in the future for a new people, because the Roman Laws were being used in wicked contracts, possessions, [and legal] actions.<sup>34</sup>

This text introduces the importance of canon law to this understanding of the Church, as well as emphasising that the jurisdiction embodied by the authority of the papacy and the Roman Church is universal. Furthermore, late twelfth-century ecclesiology evoked the priest-kings Saul, Moses, Melchisedec and Aaron as predecessors for the fusion of secular and sacred power in the figure of the pope. Melchisedec, for example, is invoked by Innocent III in his examination of the superiority of papal power which possesses both the priestly mitre and the temporal tiara.<sup>35</sup> We will explore the illustrations relating to the foundation of law in the lower half of the *Ecclesia* below. The symbolic configuration of this jurisdictional authority is contained within the imagery of the head and shoulders.

### *The dove, scales, and key*

---

<sup>34</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 55–7; Appendix 3, ll. 25–30.

<sup>35</sup> ‘In signum spiritualium contulit mihi mitram, in signum temporalium dedit mihi coronam; mitram pro sacerdotio, coronam pro regno, illius me constituens vicarium, qui habet in vestimento et in femore suo scriptum: Rex regum et Dominus dominantium: sacerdos in aeternum, secundum ordinem Melchisedech’, from *Sermones de diversis*, 3: *In consecratione pontificis*, PL 217, col. 665. Translated in R. B. Herzman and W. A. Stephany, ‘Dante and the Frescoes at Santi Quattro Coronati’, *Speculum*, 87 (2012), pp. 95–146, at p. 109.

Out of the mouth of Christ emerges a dove, holding the key of understanding and the power of discernment, which is delivered over specifically to the bishops, who should, guided by the holy spirit and not by their own, exercise with discretion the power of judgement according to divine knowledge, and declare the truth in doubtful matters, by the revelation of the holy spirit. That same dove brings in the scales of equity, which are the mother of justice, which we depict as a sword, with which the Roman Pope presides.<sup>36</sup>

This passage is crucial to understanding how the *Ecclesia* diagram configures the jurisdictional power of the Church. The placement of the dove proceeding from the mouth of Christ is the symbol of the Holy Spirit, connecting Christ with God the Father through a set of Trinitarian imagery common in the twelfth century. One early twelfth-century miniature from the Missal of Cambrai depicts the dove's wings touching the mouth of Christ and the mouth of God (figure 55). The dove proceeds from Christ's mouth wielding a key with two attributes, 'understanding' and 'power of discernment' (*clavem sciencie* and *discretionis potestas*). The text here is borne out by the configuration of the *Ecclesia* diagram, which makes an emphatic statement of the power of the pope on earth as Christ's vicar. The key labelled as 'the power of discernment' should also therefore be associated with the 'key of power' in Christ's address to Peter in Matthew 16. The diagram represents two keys, proceeding from the mouth of Christ and forming the hilt of the sword that bifurcates the figure. The keys end between St Peter and the pope, who each reach out to touch them. The key of knowledge and the key of discretion are visual representations of how the power to exercise jurisdiction, and the power to convey the truth of the Holy Spirit, were conferred on the pope through St. Peter. The *clavis scientiae* is drawn from Luke 11:52, and was associated with the *clavis potestatis* of Christ's promise to Peter in Matthew 16:19. This conflation of 'wisdom' and 'power' was transmitted to the twelfth century through Bede and incorporated into Gratian's *Decretum* and Peter Lombard's *Sententiae*.<sup>37</sup> The effect of this passage is to express the responsibility of the pope, and in turn the bishops, to exercise their power discretely, according to the Holy Spirit.

---

<sup>36</sup> Appendix 1, Text, ll. 21-5; Appendix 4 Translation, ll. 28-34.

<sup>37</sup> Tierney, *Origins of Papal Infallibility, 1150-1350*, pp. 40-2.



The scales of equity (*trutinam equitatis*) are described as the ‘mother of justice’ (*mater iusticie*). This offers a summary of the profound responsibility of the papacy to dispense justice with equity and discretion, according to the wisdom and understanding derived from the Holy Spirit. Gratian’s *Decretum* had described this high ideal in the mid-twelfth century: the papacy as the framer of laws had the right to dispense from them, but as it is the ‘mother of justice’, it must do this with reason and equity.<sup>38</sup> Justice in the diagram is depicted as a sword with which the Roman pope exercises the authority and judgement of his jurisdiction. The presence of the sword seems to recall the allegory of St. Paul (Ephesians 6:17), where the word of God becomes the ‘sword of the spirit’. In combination, the symbolism of the keys and the sword evokes both the pastoral function of preaching truth and the exercise of ecclesiastical jurisdiction.

Two more paragraphs of text further explain the symbolism of the sword and its location in the figure of *Ecclesia*, the first following on from the passage above, the second several sentences below:

This sword is covered by a sheath which is the body of the Church. Further below it is unsheathed. [This is] because of the authority and rigour which was exercised in the old days; and because of the mercy of the Church, which shows compassion and pity in the place of judgement.<sup>39</sup>

The sword of justice and all jurisdiction belongs to Christ and his Church, to take away sins and punish the head of the wicked and the condemned [Satan]. Thus, it extends from the mouth of Christ into the mouth of the devil.<sup>40</sup>

These two passages offer multiple interpretations of the sword held by the Church, the authority by which the ‘Roman pope presides’. This connects the *Ecclesia* to theories of papal supremacy and temporal power which were bound up with political events which shaped western Christendom in the twelfth and thirteenth centuries. The two swords of Luke 22:38, and the instruction from Jesus that one of the swords should be sheathed

---

<sup>38</sup> C. Duggan, ‘Equity and Compassion in Papal Marriage Decretals to England’, in *Love and Marriage in the Twelfth Century*, ed. W. van Hoecke and A. Welkenhuysen (Leuven, 1981), pp. 59–87, at p. 60.

<sup>39</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 25–7.

<sup>40</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 38–40.

(Matt. 26:52), were developed into an allegory of spiritual and temporal power. J. A. Watt has described one of the best known of these interpretations, incorporated into the *Glossa ordinaria* in the twelfth century. One sword represented the Old Testament, and one the New: both were weapons with which to combat the devil.<sup>41</sup> In the first passage, the contrast between ‘rigour’ and ‘mercy’, between the ‘old days’, and ‘compassion and pity’, is depicted in two figures at the top of the sword, just beneath the hilt: a naked infant and a youthful archer. These two figures are superimposed on the breasts of the Church ‘by whose teaching and example we are nourished and suckled’, and therefore represent the sheathed and unsheathed authority of the scriptures.<sup>42</sup> The understanding gained of both Testaments by the nourishment of *Ecclesia* forms the weapon with which evil is combatted. The depiction of ‘Satan’, the monstrous head ‘of the wicked and condemned’, trampled underfoot by the Church and pierced by the sword, will be addressed below.

What these configurations of the sword do not include, however, is temporal power. Secular leaders are present, in the figures on either side of the tree which is superimposed upon the central sword. Here we come to another important discrepancy between text and image. These figures, and the genealogical tree that they illustrate, are not described in the text on the left of the manuscript. However, the presence of different hands and the arrangement of the drawing indicate that this central tree was planned as part of the diagram. The implications of this discrepancy are discussed in chapter five below.

### The shoulders and arms: hierarchy and authority

In the shoulders and upper arms is depicted the college of the Roman church, which surrounds and protects the other corporations in the body, [which are] enclosed by the arms. On the highest seat is Peter, from the other presides [Pope] Urban, or whoever else [presides] from this [seat] since Peter.<sup>43</sup>

---

<sup>41</sup> J. A. Watt, ‘Spiritual and Temporal Powers’, in *The Cambridge History of Medieval Political Thought c.350–c.1450*, ed. J. H. Burns (Cambridge, 1988), pp. 367–423, at pp. 369–71.

<sup>42</sup> ‘Mater nostra, cuius in doctrina et exemplo pas<c>imur et lactamur.’ Appendix 1, ll. 18–9.

<sup>43</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 29–31.

The shoulders and arms of the *Ecclesia* diagram show the pope and Saints Peter, Paul and Stephen, who represent the three major orders of the clergy: bishop, priest and deacon (figure VI; Appendix 2, no. 9–14).<sup>44</sup> The remaining hierarchy of the Roman Church is represented within the torso of the figure. The pope, together with his cardinal priests, cardinal bishops, and cardinal deacons, and alongside the saints, ‘surrounds and protects the other corporations within the body’. Further, the text explains that those in the shoulders are ‘those predestined in the beginning’, while the figure’s ‘hands and arms are the Roman Church’.<sup>45</sup> Those orders of the clergy represented within the upper body are thereby neatly distinguished in their superior spiritual status by the overarching gesture of *Ecclesia*, and, as the text states, ‘by possessing continence and chastity’ (*continentia* and *castitas*; figure VII).<sup>46</sup> These virtues are shown within hands as allegorical busts, with crown and sceptre, within roundels on the hands. This separation elevates the college of the Roman Church above the hierarchies embraced within the torso.

His chest is the bishops, the heart the judges, the stomach and the ribs are the monks and the hospital orders.<sup>47</sup>

The torso of the figure contains further hierarchies, in this case those who have taken sacred orders (*sacri ordines*), arrayed in four registers on either side of the central chronological tree. As these are symbolically enclosed by the protection of the upper orders in the shoulders and arms, they will be considered here. The upper register (the chest) is the same on each side, containing illustrations of a bishop, archbishop, and patriarch. In front of each bishop are three tonsured heads, probably representing a bishop’s responsibility for the clergy within his diocese (figure VIII). The artist has taken care to create distinctions between the episcopal figures on each side, through differentiation in costume and decoration. A deliberate indication of difference in these representations of bishops could be intended to express diversity within Christian churches: all are nonetheless united in the body of *Ecclesia*. Furthermore, the mirrored

---

<sup>44</sup> The reference to a Pope Urban and the implications for the dating of the *Ecclesia* diagram is discussed in chapter one above and chapter five below.

<sup>45</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 65–6; Appendix 3, l. 75.

<sup>46</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 32–3 ; Appendix 2, nos. 21 and 22.

<sup>47</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 34–6. This description correlates with the location of these figures on the diagram, see figure VII, Appendix 2, no. 16–18, 23–25.

depiction of this upper hierarchy may refer to the Patriarchate of Rome and the Latin Patriarchate of Jerusalem — particularly given the inclusion within the torso of various categories of religious knights belonging to hospital orders (*xenodochium*). The three registers below (the heart, stomach, and ribs) are labelled *ordo iudiciarius*, *diversis monasteriorum*, *varietas senodochiorum*, *capella*, *varietas heremitarum*. We will return to the label *ordo iudiciarius* below.

In the row labelled *varietas senodochiorum*, we see four different representatives of military religious orders: each wears a chainmail hood with a forehead band, and a cloak with an emblem on the left side (figure VII, no. 25).<sup>48</sup> The first has a red equilateral cross, the second a sword with a red pommel, the third a double-barred cross, and the fourth a *tau* or ‘T’-shaped cross. In theory, this should allow us to recognise which order is represented. At least, the artist chose to distinguish between four different orders. The red equilateral cross on the left probably indicates the Poor Knights of the Temple of Solomon, now more commonly known as the Knights Templar, founded c.1120.<sup>49</sup> The red pommel of the sword on the second figure might represent the Spanish hospital order of St. James (Santiago), or the order of St. James of the Sword.<sup>50</sup> Alexander III confirmed the knights of St. James as a religious order subject to the Holy See in 1175.<sup>51</sup> The double-traversed cross of the third knight probably suggests another major hospital order, the Order of Knights of St. John of the Hospital of Jerusalem, or the Order of Hospitallers, active from c.1070.<sup>52</sup> The ‘T’-shaped cross on the figure on the right is associated with the Italian order of St. James of Altopascio.<sup>53</sup> This was a hospital order

---

<sup>48</sup> Appendix 2, no. 25.

<sup>49</sup> A. J. Forey, ‘The Emergence of the Military Order in the Twelfth Century’, *JEH*, 36/2 (1985), pp. 175–95; M. Barber, *The New Knighthood: A History of the Order of the Temple* (Cambridge, 1994), pp. 1–38, 179–81.

<sup>50</sup> S. Z. Conedera, *Ecclesiastical Knights: The Military Orders in Castile, 1150–1330* (New York, 2015), p. 73.

<sup>51</sup> Conedera, *Ecclesiastical Knights*, pp. 42–5.

<sup>52</sup> J. Riley-Smith, *The Knights Hospitaller in the Levant, c.1070–1309* (Basingstoke, 2012); A. M. J. Lombardo Delarue, ‘The Use of the Double-Traversed Cross in the English Priory of the Order of Saint John of Jerusalem’, in *The Military Orders 6.2: Culture and Conflict in Western and Northern Europe*, ed. J. Schenk and M. Carr (London, 2017), II, pp. 121–31.

<sup>53</sup> A. Cenci, ed., *L’Ospitalità in Altopascio. Storia e Funzioni Di Un Grande Centro Ospitaliero* (Lucca, 1997); S. Andreucci, ‘San Giacomo di Altipascio (Lucca)’, in *Dizionario degli Istituti di Perfezione* (Rome, 1988), VIII, cols. 462–5.

founded as early c.952 at Altopascio in Tuscany, near Lucca, situated on the via Francigena. This order protected pilgrims and travellers and maintained roads, and again a bull of Alexander III in 1169 indicates that the community was living under religious discipline by this point.<sup>54</sup>

We established in chapter two that Vercelli was located at the juncture of several major routes connecting the Italian peninsula to other cities across the Alps and was therefore the locus for intense movement of people, travellers, merchants, and pilgrims, as well as goods and knowledge. This was reflected in the presence of fourteen hospitals designated for the care of travellers. It is therefore unsurprising to find here the conspicuously early presence of the Orders of the Temple and the Hospital in the twelfth century, amid other known connections to the Latin East.<sup>55</sup> An important Templar house was established in Vercelli as early as 1145, with a church dedicated to S. Giacomo d'Albareto.<sup>56</sup> In 1156 the church of S. Leonardo in Vercelli already had a role in the care of travellers and pilgrims associated with a house belonging to the Order of St. John, and the Hospitaller presence in Vercelli is well-documented.<sup>57</sup>

The inclusion of these military religious orders within the ecclesiastical hierarchy indicates that at the time when the *Ecclesia* diagram was made, these knights were perceived to belong within the sacred orders of the Roman church. Sam Conedera has highlighted that writers and commentators in the eleventh and twelfth centuries found the military religious orders difficult to categorise.<sup>58</sup> Their place within the corporation of the Church was disputed, particularly regarding their right to bear arms. However, as James Brundage has observed, Johannes Teutonicus gave Hospitaller knights (those that administered to pilgrims and the poor in *xenodochia*) a status on a par

---

<sup>54</sup> J. Brodman, *Charity and Religion in Medieval Europe* (Washington, D.C., 2009), pp. 119–21.

<sup>55</sup> See discussion in chapter two above, particularly in relation to the Bicchieri family and the Order of the Temple. See also Bellomo, *The Templar Order in North-West Italy (1142–c.1330)*, pp. 13–21, at p. 13.

<sup>56</sup> See *Le carte dell'archivio capitolare di Vercelli*, vol. 1, p. 153, no. 126, p. 158, no. 128. Bellomo, *The Templar Order in North-West Italy (1142–c.1330)*, pp. 237–40.

<sup>57</sup> See L. Avonto, 'Presenza gerosolimitana a Vercelli nel secolo XIII', in *Vercelli nel secolo XIII* (Vercelli, 1982), pp. 113–38; Orsenigo, *Vercelli sacra*, 142; *Le carte dell'archivio capitolare di Vercelli*, vol. 2, p. 8, doc. 312; G. Colombo, 'I necrologi eusebiani', ed. R. Pastè, *Bollettino storico-bibliografico subalpino*, 25 (1923), no. 306.

<sup>58</sup> Conedera, *Ecclesiastical Knights*, at p. 13.

with lay brothers: neither clerics nor laymen.<sup>59</sup> The latter's thirteenth-century commentary on Gratian's *Decretum* was designated the ordinary gloss, and the new juridical status that he created and assigned to the military orders would have been swiftly circulated. We can infer from these indications, with due caution, that the *Ecclesia* diagram's inclusion of the military religious hospital orders within the 'major' orders of the Church body suggests a twelfth-century dating well before this later juridical assignation. The knights here are included within the upper echelons of the church hierarchy. In the late twelfth century, Pope Alexander III (r. 1159–81) had accepted that the right of defence could apply to the members of the order despite their categorisation as religious.<sup>60</sup> The formulation here indicates that this vision of papal authority definitively included the military religious orders as part of the sacred orders of the church, bound by the same laws of continence and chastity as bishops and other religious.<sup>61</sup>

The third register on the left depicts four figures representing different cloistered monastic orders (*diversis monasteriorum*, figure VII, no. 18). The lack of detail means it is impossible to distinguish orders. However, the cowled figure on the left might be wearing a Cistercian mantle, another wears sepia tinted robes and has a pointed hood, another has a similar robe and hood but left uncoloured, the fourth is bareheaded but tonsured, and carries an object that it is difficult to identify but may be a book. It is significant that all carry symbolic pastoral staffs, or crosiers, symbolising the authority and pastoral role of bishops and abbots, such as are probably depicted here.<sup>62</sup>

On the right, below the hospital orders, there is a row of hermits (*varietas heremitarum*, figure VII, no. 26). Here the artist has had more success in differentiating

---

<sup>59</sup> J. A. Brundage, 'Crusades, Clerics and Violence: Reflections on a Canonical Theme', in *The Experience of Crusading 1: Western Approaches*, ed. M. G. Bull and N. J. Housley (Cambridge, 2003), pp. 147–56, at pp. 155–6.

<sup>60</sup> L. G. Duggan, *Armsbearing and the Clergy in the History and Canon Law of Western Christianity* (Woodbridge, 2013), at pp. 226–7.

<sup>61</sup> For a discussion of the importance of military orders in defending the rights of the Church, and the recognition by Honorius II of the Knights of the temple in 1128 as a natural corollary to the first crusade, see Morris, *The Papal Monarchy*, pp. 143–53; I. S. Robinson, *The Papacy 1073–1198: Continuity and Innovation* (Cambridge, 1990), pp. 238–43; P. Partner, *The Lands of St. Peter: The Papal State in the Middle Ages and the Early Renaissance* (London, 1972), pp. 61–5.

<sup>62</sup> 'Crosier', *The Grove Encyclopedia of Medieval Art and Architecture* (Oxford, 2012), pp. 219–20.

the different figures. One is entirely bundled up in swathes of fabric with only the face emerging. The second has wild hair and a long beard and seems to be wearing rough sheepskin. On the right the last hermit, although beardless, has strange ridges and peaks of textured hair, and unusual clothing. Across central and northern Italy in the twelfth century, there were many different communities or individuals who had dedicated themselves to a life of spiritual perfection, practising various forms of asceticism and contemplation and sometimes following existing rules.<sup>63</sup> Later, a wide and diverse range of hermits were united under the 'Great Union' (*Magna unio*) approved in 1256 by Pope Alexander IV, into a loosely unified order called the *fratres eremitarum sancti Augustini*. This new order had a uniform of black habit and leather belt; this uniform habit is not depicted in the *Ecclesia*.

Within this depiction of the upper orders of the Church, we also have the striking inclusion of the *ordo iudiciarius* at the 'heart' of the figure in the second register of the torso. The term *ordo iudiciarius* refers to the ecclesiastical juridical process over which bishops presided. This is represented by several miniatures which depict aspects of legal procedure in ecclesiastical courts, identified by the role of bishops in orchestrating the cases (figure VII, no. 17, 24). The first scene shows a court case with four witnesses on the left (*testes*) and a defendant (*reus*) with arms outstretched towards the bishop-judge. Another figure, presumably the accuser, looks toward the defendant while gesturing toward the judge. Although the rough quality of the drawing and the red highlights obscure the image, the judge appears to be carrying a rectangular object, perhaps a book. Another book-like object appears just before the hands of the defendant, possibly showing the taking of an oath on a Gospel text. In the scene on the right side of this second register, an anxious looking figure is pushed towards a door, its two large hinges suggesting a prison. A crowd of witnesses looks on as the defendant is convicted (*reus convincitur*). The next scene shows the moment of judgement: a bishop, carrying a crosier, gestures with his left hand towards a bareheaded man who has his hand placed protectively over his heart as he is found guilty by the judge (*iuditio*

---

<sup>63</sup> F. Andrews, *The Other Friars: The Carmelite, Augustinian, Sack and Pied Friars in the Middle Ages* (Woodbridge, 2006), pp. 71–2.

*convincitur*, figure VII, no. 24).<sup>64</sup> The final scene at the bottom of this hierarchy of *sacri ordines* depicts a chapel (*capella*), with a priest celebrating mass before an altar (figure VII, no. 19, 20). Again, the artist suggests speech and action through gesture and gaze; the priest has his arms raised and his gaze skyward. Two tonsured figures accompany him, one wearing a chequered robe holds a book. The isolated head in front of the altar perhaps represent a layperson attending the mass.<sup>65</sup> The objects on the altar appear to be a chalice and an altar cloth; we may compare for example a historiated initial in the early fourteenth-century manuscript of James le Palmer's *Omne bonum* (figure 56).<sup>66</sup>

Each of the scenes in the second row of this upper hierarchy shows a legal process with bishops as judges. Through attention to physical gesture and the representation of witnesses, the artist has depicted an ecclesiastical judicial process that includes the oral presentation of a case, a concern for the legal rights of the person within the clerical orders, and likely the use of texts, either for oath-taking or as a reference to a systematised codification of canon law. These legal scenes represent aspects of ecclesiastical jurisdiction. Furthermore, the text of the *Ecclesia* describes how those in sacred orders must be judged by their own authority, therefore subject to canon law and papal decretals, and not secular law, as the text makes clear:

It is not permitted to pronounce the law to them, or to judge against their offences by their own authority. For this reason, the order of the judges is placed in the middle, so that by method of the canons to each their justice may be served, whether a reward or a penalty, according to what is urged by the Decretals.<sup>67</sup>

To find such practical depictions of the papal legal process enshrined within the upper hierarchies of a vision of the universal Church is remarkable and, to my understanding, unique. The status given to this representation is strongly indicative of a context in which the papacy and its supporters were deliberately producing statements of the

---

<sup>64</sup> B. Schwarz, 'The Roman Curia (until about 1300)', in *The History of Courts and Procedure in Medieval Canon Law*, ed. W. Hartmann and K. Pennington, *History of Medieval Canon Law* (Washington, D.C., 2016), pp. 160–228, at pp. 201–2.

<sup>65</sup> The text label of *sacri ordines* (holy orders) seems to apply to the four levels of hierarchy in this section of the diagram, rather than this specific scene.

<sup>66</sup> London, BL, Royal MS 6 E VI, fol. 246v.

<sup>67</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 67–8; Appendix 3, ll. 56–9.



Church's universal power and the breadth of its legal jurisdiction: the image functions as visual advocacy of this legal activity and a reflection of the expansive nature of papal authority during this period.

The presence of legal professionals in the papal curia from the mid-twelfth century is well-attested. As James Brundage has observed, the nature of the curia (and consequently the character of the wider Church) was altered by the rise to prominence of legally trained clerics.<sup>68</sup> The specific details of the legal processes represented in our diagram help us trace the legal ideas out of which the diagram emerged. In turn, this helps us date the diagram, and understand its place within western European thought of the period. Put broadly, the twelfth and early thirteenth centuries in western Europe saw the papacy move away from endorsement of the ordeal procedure when deciding ecclesiastical cases, to a process that used written and oral evidence; it is this later kind of judicial system which is represented in the *Ecclesia* diagram.<sup>69</sup>

### The torso: mother and bride

We have seen above that the figure of *Ecclesia* is identified with the bride of Christ, and that the figure has breasts which represent the mercy of divine law as played out in the New Testament, as contrasted with the rigour of Old Testament justice. The absence of the Virgin from the *Ecclesia*, in its universal visual conception of the heavenly and earthly church, is unusual. However, Marian readings of the Song of Songs which emerged in the twelfth century offer us another perspective, and an understanding that the typology of the Virgin and the Church might be present simultaneously.<sup>70</sup>

---

<sup>68</sup> J. A. Brundage, *The Medieval Origins of the Legal Profession: Canonists, Civilians, and Courts* (London, 2008), at p. 132; C. M. Radding, *The Origins of Medieval Jurisprudence: Pavia and Bologna, 850-1150* (London, 1988); C. Wickham, 'Lawyers' Time: History and Memory in Tenth- and Eleventh-Century Italy', in *Land and Power: Studies in Italian and European Social History, 400-1200* (London, 1994), pp. 275-94.

<sup>69</sup> The Fourth Lateran Council of 1215 explicitly abandoned the ordeal as a legal method. K. Pennington, *The Prince and the Law, 1200-1600: Sovereignty and Rights in the Western Legal Tradition* (Oxford, 1993), at p. 135.

<sup>70</sup> R. Fulton, 'Mimetic Devotion, Marian Exegesis and the Historical Sense of the Song of Songs', *Viator*, 27 (1996), pp. 85-118, pp. 115-18.

Our Mother by whose teaching and example we are nourished and suckled. Eyes, nose, cheeks and hair of the bridegroom Christ and the Church the bride are described in the Song of Songs and elsewhere.<sup>71</sup> The feminine aspects of the Vercelli 'Ecclesia' diagram reflect this renewed twelfth-century interest in the ecclesiological importance of the Song of Songs, the reading of the Bride as the Church, and the parallel association with the Virgin. The bodies of Christ and the Church are conflated: the image depicts the 'eyes, nose, hair and cheeks of the Bridegroom Christ and the Bride Ecclesia' together, as one. The reference to 'Mater Nostra' here surely refers to the Church, by whom Christians are 'nourished and suckled'. The earthly Church nourishes and cares for the Christian faithful through the transmission of spiritual knowledge (*in doctrina et exemplo*). The body of the diagram has breasts of charity, labelled 'ubera misericordiae', and a naked infant with arms outstretched upon them (figure VIII; no. 27). In the commentaries of Bernard of Clairvaux, composed in the 1130s, the Bride of Christ is both the Church and the Virgin, and the concept of Mary as both mother and bride of Christ was common in Song of Songs commentaries through the twelfth century. The reference to 'mercy' in the annotation of the breasts is linked to the lactation imagery around Mary, 'mother of mercy', another metaphor associated with Bernard and the Cistercian concern for affective piety that encouraged personal, affective devotion through the human aspects of Christ and the Virgin.<sup>72</sup>

## The thighs: incorporation and expulsion

### *Clerical ordination and degradation.*

The minor orders of the clergy are placed in the thighs, separated from the sacred orders. The sacrament of baptism (*baptismus*), is framed in a doorway roughly above the left knee: this is how an individual becomes a member of the Church, encounters the possibility of salvation, and enters under ecclesiastical jurisdiction (figure VIII; no. 30–33). The artist emphasises the ritual elements of the sacrament even though some elements of the drawing are unfinished (three of the figures are missing their limbs and

---

<sup>71</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 18–19; Appendix 3, ll. 21–3.

<sup>72</sup> C. Walker Bynum, *Jesus as mother: studies in the spirituality of the High Middle Ages* (London, 1982), p. 152.

one exists only as a disembodied head). One adult is seated in a large, carved stone baptismal font, another places their hands on the ritual recipient's brow and chest, readying them for immersion. We see some of the ritual gestures of baptism as another priest raises a benediction over the font. Crucially, this image of the fundamental rite of passage for any Christian is placed in a doorway, emphasising this moment of transition from one state to another, from a state of 'death' to renewal: the entrance into the body of the Church.<sup>73</sup> Nearby, two figures stand opposite one another, on either side of the font: on the right, the doorkeeper (*hostiarius*) holds a key aloft. There are four further observers or participants, one of whom lifts a palm-like branch over the font. Palm fronds (as in the liturgical symbolism of Palm Sunday) signified victory and triumph over death in the Roman tradition, an appropriate accompaniment to an individual's entry into the Church, which offered the only possible opportunity to triumph over death by means of salvation.<sup>74</sup> The branch may also refer to the rite of anointment with (olive) oil, prior to immersion. In the text, the thighs are designated as those who are reborn through baptism, and those who are to be promoted into the clerical orders.<sup>75</sup>

Here the diagram perhaps balances the parallel between baptism and clerical ordination, fusing two rites into one in a visual decision that focuses on clerical participation within the corporation of the Church.<sup>76</sup> The other minor clerical grades of *lector*, *exorcista* and *acolutus* are represented on the figure's left thigh. The reader grasps a book, the exorcist declares *exi spiritus immunde* over a possessed man who has a winged devil (*inerguminus*) emerging from his mouth, and the acolyte holds a candlestick and water pitcher, or *urceolum*.<sup>77</sup> The diagram shows the full range of clerical grades: doorkeeper, reader, exorcist, acolyte, and in the arms and shoulders the major orders of

---

<sup>73</sup> P. Cramer, *Baptism and Change in the Early Middle Ages, c. 200–c.1150* (Cambridge, 1993), pp. 173–178.

<sup>74</sup> For example, ninth-century popes sent palm branches to Frankish kings as a symbol of both 'ethical and military triumph', see: M. McCormick, *Eternal Victory: Triumphal Rulership in Late Antiquity, Byzantium, and the Early Medieval West* (Cambridge, 1990), pp. 370–3.

<sup>75</sup> Appendix 1, l. 67.

<sup>76</sup> As is discussed below, this is likely indicative of the intended (clerical) audience for the diagram.

<sup>77</sup> R. E. Reynolds, 'Ordinatio and the Priesthood in the Early Middle Ages and Its Visual Depiction', in *A Companion to Priesthood and Holy Orders in the Middle Ages*, ed. G. Peters and C. Colt Anderson (Leiden, 2016), pp. 43–69, at p. 51.

subdeacon, deacon, priest, and bishop. The orders of bishops (bishop, archbishop, and patriarch) are listed as part of the *ordo iudiciarius* in the torso of the figure above.

On the right of the diagram, the images and process of clerical degradation are depicted under the broad rubric of *am[m]onitio clericorum* (admonition of the clerics) (figure VIII; no. 34–6). This depiction is opposite to the doorway representing baptism and ordination and belonging to the Church. The rubrics accompanying the figures here are *degradatio rei* (degradation of the guilty), and *traditur curie* (delivered to the secular court), and *traditur Sathane* (delivered over to Satan). For the first rubric, a cleric divests another of his office, in the second we see a seated cleric being apprehended by two figures, one in front of the other, both wearing conical hats and clothing patterned with dots. In BL Cotton Roll XIV. 12, there is an almost identical pair of figures that is placed in a different section of the diagram (figure 57).<sup>78</sup> In the mid-thirteenth-century London manuscript, the pair appear similarly apprehending a defendant (*reus*), but in the section of the diagram immediately *below* the sequence of clerical degradation on the right-hand side. In this corresponding space in the Vercelli diagram, we instead see an *executor* in the process of apprehending another *reus* and dragging them to a prison, depicted in the background. In the Vercelli *Ecclesia*, the pair of figures are part of the sequence of degradation, representing the *traditio curiae*. Although much of the section of Cotton Roll XIV. 12 depicting this sequence is lost, the part that is still visible (above a scene of *excommunicatio* recognisable from the Vercelli diagram) shows a single figure in chainmail grasping the leg of a seated figure. The similarity between the representations of these two figures in mail, and their dissimilar locations in the two diagrams, are indicative of the wider circulation of the diagram, and manifest the difficulties these complicated structural hierarchies presented to copyists. In Cotton Roll XIV. 12, which is drawn in a clearer and more competent style, the conical hats and patterned tunics of the Vercelli pair are rendered as chainmail coifs and conical helmets. The two figures are identified as soldiers of a military order (labelled *ordo militaris*), and

---

<sup>78</sup> In London, BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12, these two figures are drawn apprehending a defendant (*reus*), in the section of the diagram immediately below the sequence of clerical degradation on the right-hand side. This replaces the scene in the Vercelli diagram which shows an *executor* in the process of apprehending another *reus* and dragging them to a prison, depicted in the background.

this is what we should most likely assume them to be in the Vercelli image: a representation of the degraded cleric's transfer to secular jurisdiction for punishment. Excommunication, the ultimate sanction the Church could use to punish a disobedient or criminal cleric by removing them from the body of the Church, is depicted by a devil with wings, horns, talons and tail, grasping a cleric by each claw and pulling them across the boundary of the Church.

## *Marriage*

To the right of the depiction of curatorship, and within the section of the figure discussed above, there are two further scenes (see figure VIII; no. 52). The first pair, a man and woman, join hands with a cloth bag or binding hanging from their arms. Labelled *contrahentes*, the pair are entering into an agreement. This is related to the couple to the right, who are drawn in such a way that only one head is properly visible, and are labelled *coniugium* (marriage). Marriage subjected women to the authority of their husbands, and this is mirrored by the same head/body metaphor which governs the meaning of the diagram. As in Ephesians 5:23–24 (and 23–33), 'the husband is the head of the wife, as Christ is the head of the Church', and 'as the Church is subject to Christ, so also let the wives be to their husbands in all things'.

The terms *contrahentes* and *coniugium* indicate two aspects of marriage which were prominent issues in twelfth-century canon law. They reflect a customary view of marriage that was processual, beginning with an initial agreement which constituted an exchange of consent.<sup>79</sup> The first image, clarified through the rubric, represents the contract of consent to the marriage, given orally, and specifically in the present tense. The second image depicts the indissoluble state of union in marriage, between two individuals who had previously given their mutual consent. The fundamental legal understanding of marriage was as a single legal personhood represented by the husband, an interpretation rooted in Genesis 2: 24: 'Wherefore a man shall leave father and mother, and shall cleave to his wife: and they shall be two in one flesh'. The second half of the twelfth century saw attempts to consolidate the definition of marriage, and what

---

<sup>79</sup> See P. L. Reynolds, 'Marrying and Its Documentation in Pre-Modern Europe: Consent, Celebration and Property', in *To Have and to Hold: Marrying and Its Documentation in Western Christendom, 400–1600*, ed. P. L. Reynolds and J. Witte (Cambridge, 2007), pp. 1–42.

constituted a legitimate marriage, and to bring this under the protection of ecclesiastical jurisdiction. At the Fourth Lateran Council, it was made clear that the principle behind the declaration that marriage was a sacrament was that the agreement had to be voluntary. Again, the *Decretum* is an important mid-twelfth-century source to consider here. The two stages of marriage as understood by Gratian are this oral exchange of intent, and subsequent completion through sexual consummation. Physical union transformed the marriage into an indissoluble sacrament.<sup>80</sup> As James Brundage has observed, Gratian's *Decretum* contained a theory of marriage which attempted to reconcile different schools of thought. Peter Lombard's *Sententiae* provided an influential understanding of consensual marriage, holding that consent given in the present tense was enough to constitute the marital bond.<sup>81</sup> This understanding of marriage constituted in the act of consent given in the present tense (*contrahentes*) was universally accepted in canon law, with the support and influence of the Bolognese canonist Huguccio (d. 1210).<sup>82</sup>

In the second half of the twelfth century, canonists conceived of the sacramentality of marriage as comparable to the union between Christ and the Church. These scenes and their situation within the body of the *Ecclesia* make clear the sacramental parallel between the state of marital union and the spiritual union of Christ and the Church. Christian marriage incorporates a multivalent symbolism of an individual's union with the divine.<sup>83</sup> This, of course, is the broader symbolic implication of the diagram as a whole: the Christian faithful, joined together as the corporation of the Church, which is in turn one with the body of Christ in the form of his bride *Ecclesia*.

In the triangular space either side of the sword in the lower part of the body, there are two further sets of three 'scenes'. These sit below the representations of ordination and degradation on the thighs of the figure and are separated from the

---

<sup>80</sup> J. A. Brundage, *Law, Sex and Christian Society in Medieval Europe* (London, 1987), pp. 235–42, at pp. 235–6.

<sup>81</sup> Brundage, *Law, Sex, and Christian Society*, pp. 264–5; Peter Lombard, *Sententiae in IV libris distinctae*, S, 3rd ed., 2 vols (Grottaferrata, 1971), vol 2, Book IV, 4. 27–28, at pp. 422–4.

<sup>82</sup> Brundage, *Law, Sex, and Christian Society*, pp. 254–55, and pp. 268–9.

<sup>83</sup> D. L. D'Avray, *Medieval Marriage: Symbolism and Society* (Oxford, 2005), pp. 170–1.

hierarchies of ecclesiastical orders above. Here, the images pertain to ecclesiastical jurisdiction and court procedure as it applied to civil cases that could be overseen by a secular judge: court representation, marriage agreements, wills and testimonies, violent wrongdoing, and the apprehension and incarceration of criminals. As the rubric clarifies, these are civil cases in the secular forum.<sup>84</sup> The first scene on the left depicts the court structure: we see a secular judge (*iudex secularis*), an *actor* (or plaintiff), and an *apparitor* (or bailiff, an assistant to the judge, who served the summons to court).<sup>85</sup> Here, in contrast to the ecclesiastical courts represented above, secular cases are overseen by a secular judge (*iudex secularis*), crowned and enthroned. The scene on the left shows the Roman procedure of using a representative (a *curator*) for a party not held to be capable or responsible before the law. In the image, the rubric reads *maior, minus, furiosus*, indicating the elderly, the very young, and the mad. This scene builds upon the sense of incorporation and belonging to the body of the Church, and this includes having the right to legal personhood and representation as a layman in the secular courts.<sup>86</sup>

### *Banishment*

Three further scenes are visible when we consider the parallel triangular frame on the right of the genealogical tree. In the upper part, a fleeing figure is apprehended by another in front of a building: the rubric explains the action as the ‘the executor dragging the defendant to prison’ (*reum trahit executor in carcerem*).

Below this, a man or *testator* lies presumably on his deathbed declaring a will, his left hand holding a document labelled the *testamentum*, his right — oddly — holding the hair of a figure depicted as a head and shoulders in front of the bed. To the right, another faceless figure (some of the drawings here are unfinished) vigorously wields a large wooden club. This figure is labelled *maleficia*, the violent gesture perhaps indicating the intention of ‘wrongdoing’ which the term entails. It is unclear why the testator is holding the hair of the figure beside the bed; indeed, it seems that the scene is unfinished as the *testator* and the figure with the club have no faces. In this detail

---

<sup>84</sup> ‘Forumulare cause civiles’.

<sup>85</sup> J. A. Brundage, *Medieval Canon Law* (London, 1995), at p. 132.

<sup>86</sup> A. Berger, *Encyclopedic Dictionary of Roman Law*, Transactions of the American Philosophical Society, 43, repr. (Philadelphia, 1981), pp. 420–1.

however, Cotton Roll XIV. 12 provides a clarifying point of comparison (figure 58). In the corresponding section of the image, the scene is much more crowded. The figure on the bed, the *testator* here gestures towards a large document labelled *testamentum*, declaring his will to three witnesses at the foot of the bed. The *testator* points towards these figures. As in the Vercelli *Ecclesia*, there is another figure drawn in front of the bed. However, in the Cotton Roll, this figure is labelled *(a)manuensio legis*, the notary who should be understood to be accurately recording and solemnising the will. On the right of the scene in the Cotton Roll, and not divided from the testamentary scene as in the Vercelli *Ecclesia*, a man in a green robe (labelled *maleficium*), whose weapon of ‘wrongdoing’ is now a club with a spiked star on the end, holds a kneeling woman by the hair. It is possible therefore that what we see in the Vercelli version, where the *testator* holds the kneeling figure by the hair, is a copying error, where the artist has conflated the two kneeling figures in the foreground to confusing effect. These kinds of errors, and displaced scenes within this complex diagram, once again strongly suggest that there were multiple copies of the *Ecclesia* diagram in circulation in the thirteenth century, with errors being disseminated across different exemplars. Nonetheless, both scenes reveal elements of medieval testamentary practice: the presence of witnesses in the Cotton Roll, the physical object of the will, and the individual actively declaring the will on their death bed.<sup>87</sup>

*Traditio curiae* is the juridical concept of punishment for spiritual crimes committed by a cleric that would be dealt with by the removal of the powers conferred by ordination, which could sometimes also result in excommunication. This has a convoluted history, particularly in the late twelfth and early thirteenth century when clerical immunity was central to the dispute between Thomas Becket and Henry II. However, the sense of this aspect of clerical immunity conveyed by the diagram is that this was a scale of clerical degradation, implying that the degraded cleric, once deposed

---

<sup>87</sup> For an overview of testamentary practice in medieval Europe see: S. K. Wray and R. Cossar, ‘Wills as Primary Sources’, in *Understanding Medieval Primary Sources: Using Historical Sources to Discover Medieval Europe*, ed. J. Rosenthal (London, 2012), pp. 59–71.



from office, was transferred to the secular arm of the law for material punishment.<sup>88</sup> The disproportionate focus on ecclesiastical members of the Church, with limited reference to lay people, is one among many aspects of the diagram which strongly suggest that the intended audience for the *Ecclesia* diagram was clerical.

## The lower limbs: grounding the Church

The thighs: those reborn [through baptism] and those ones who are to be promoted [into the clerical orders]. The private parts: the laity. The knees: those who were Romans. The shins: other law-abiding peoples.<sup>89</sup>

The limbs of the figure are glossed over, with the text going no further beyond the reference to knees and shins. What we see in the diagram are foundational governing concepts of medieval law. Here it makes sense to describe these parallel concepts in turn, reading across the diagram from left to right (figure VIII; rubrics 54–65). At the top, we have Athens (*Athene*) and Sparta (*Lacedemon*), Athens representing written law (*iure scripto*), Sparta unwritten law (*non scripto*). Below this a rural landscape with trees and buildings, labelled as rural property (*predia rusticana*), and opposite a contrasting built up environment, urban property (*predia urbana*). Below this we see a headless man working the land — the rubric has been erased and rewritten unclearly: perhaps *servus* (slave) — and this is contrasted with six heads representing the law of nations, the law of all people (*ius gentium*). The headless figure represents the lack of legal ‘personhood’ (or head) of a slave or servant, as derived from Roman law. The more detailed rubric of the Cotton Roll has the phrase in full: *servus nullum caput habet*. In the left ankle, Abel offers a lamb toward the hand of God (*Abel offert*); on the right we see Cain, drawn with a gold background at the base of a tower. Here the rubric reads: *Civitas Caym. Ius*

---

<sup>88</sup> C. Duggan, ‘The Becket Dispute and the Criminous Clerks’, *Historical Research*, 35/91 (1962), pp. 1–28, at pp. 6–15. It is important to note that while Duggan’s analysis of the canons in Gratian’s *Decretum* relevant to clerical immunity and the *traditio curiae* acknowledged that the meaning of the term seems to broadly refer to deposition and delivery to the secular jurisdiction for punishment, Gratian does not explicitly equate these concepts, and this is not necessarily the only valid interpretation.

<sup>89</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 67–8; Appendix 3, ll. 77–9.

*consuetudinis*. This refers to customary law, the law that arose when Cain built a city, and people began to live together in urban communities. Abel represents divine law, as we read elsewhere on the diagram (*Abel: iure divino*). The laity is mentioned explicitly only twice in the text of the diagram. The first example designates a physical place within the body to the members of the Church. The laity are defined as ‘the shameful parts’, the *pudenda*. This is not represented in the body of the diagram, although laypeople are present as illustrative figures within the legal scenes. A short paragraph includes the second mention of the laity.<sup>90</sup>

Angelic and human nature are like two feet, by means of which the Church tramples upon the ancient enemy, whose body is the collection of the condemned, and the description of which is found in the *Moralia in Iob* and other volumes.<sup>91</sup>

Angelic and human nature, referred to in the text above and in illustrated medallions on the figure’s feet, are the foundations of the Church (figure VI). This is a familiar twelfth-century Dionysian concept of a fundamental two-fold distinction in the natural universe. Written law, rural property, and natural law are underscored with the rubric of divine law (*Ius divinum*): laws handed down from God. Unwritten law, urban property, *ius gentium* and customary law form the broad constituent parts of ‘human law’ (*ius humanum*). These divisions, between human and divine law, summarise foundational divisions in law adopted by the church and rooted in Augustine. The feet, as the text reads, depict angelic and human nature: the right foot has a roundel with Adam and Eve covering their nakedness with their hands (*humana natura*); the left, a winged angel (*angelica natura*). Running across the figure’s feet is an extract from Psalm 90: *Super aspidem et basiliscum ambulabis et conculcabis leonem*. This is a reference to Christ trampling his enemies underfoot; the other *ancient enemy* referred to in the text alongside and quoted above is drawn below the figure, impaled by the sword and genealogy of Christ.

## The sword and Satan: struggle and salvation

---

<sup>90</sup> Appendix 1, l. 76: ‘Rubeus secularem laicorum vitam.’

<sup>91</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 68–70; Appendix 3, ll. 79–82.

The ‘enemy’ under the figure’s feet is a monstrous human head, bearded and wearing a crown, whose distorted mouth is pierced by the sharp sword wielded by the Church (figure VI). In a clumsy overdrawing in red ink, someone has not only outlined the teeth of the enemy but drawn an inverted triangle, with five thick vertical tears inside it, which has been labelled ‘the perforated jaw’ (*maxilla perforata*). The body has tightly packed scales (Job 41: 6–8). Underneath the red ink, it is possible to see that the base of the genealogical tree ends inside the mouth. In sepia ink, the crown has two lines of inscription reading:

The collection of the condemned. The king of the children of pride. His name is death, all-devouring.<sup>92</sup>

These three phrases are used to describe Satan, or Lucifer, or monstrous biblical agents of his works, Leviathan or Behemoth (figure 59). The Ecclesia diagram is framed by two lateral columns containing eight roundels for the vices and virtues. Distinct from the diagram and written in a hand that is less neat and assured than those used for the bodies of text, most of the labelled virtues are accompanied by a short piece of text linking them to a beatitude or petition of the lord’s prayer, linking the manuscript to Rotoli figurati 2. The vices instead have a list of sub-vices, emotional qualities that can be incurred by the respective sin. Caritas is the central virtue for Christianity, and is paired horizontally with Superbia. The pairs continue as follows: *spes* – *vana gloria*, *fides* – *invidia*, *sapientia* – *ira*, *prudentia* – *tristitia*, *fortitudo* – *avaritia*, *justitia* – *gula*, and *temperantia* – *luxuria*.

This depiction is therefore more complex than it first appears and not only forms part of the theme of the triumph of Christ and the Church over evil, but extends the subject of moral warning reflected in the vice and virtue roundels, and through an authoritative source in the *Moralia* offers a counterpoint to the collective corporate body of the Church represented above. The inscription reiterates the Ecclesia manuscript’s main text, quoted at the beginning of this section: the figure is the ‘ancient enemy’

---

<sup>92</sup> Appendix 2, no. 67. The equivalent inscription on London, BL, Cotton Roll, XIV. 12 reads, ‘rex filiorum superbie’.

Satan, whose body is a ‘collection of the condemned’.<sup>93</sup> This designation is indeed found in Gregory’s *Moralia in Job*. In contrast to the followers of Christ, who are part of His mystical body within the Church, sinners belong to the body of the devil in the *collectio reproborum*.<sup>94</sup> The commentary identifies the follower with the leader, positing that ‘[t]he ancient enemy is one person with the whole collection of sinners’. It is this idea of the collective body of sin that is emphasised in the monstrous figure, in contrast to the body of Ecclesia/Christ triumphant above, and indeed Gregory’s formulation provides the underlying metaphorical structure of the diagram.<sup>95</sup> The two further phrases in the crown relate to Leviathan, or Behemoth. In Gregory’s commentary, Leviathan is read, as Emile Mâle observed, as a figure for Satan, his agents and works.<sup>96</sup> A comparison with the text that accompanies this figure in Cotton Roll XIV. 12 allows us to flesh out the construction of Leviathan in the Vercelli ‘Ecclesia’ manuscript. It reveals how the depiction of the triumphant Church/Christ impaling the ‘ancient enemy’ with a sword (which is simultaneously a genealogy of Christ), is based on a metaphor which was the subject of contemporary theological and exegetical interest. The passages from Job 40 and 41, which describe the power of the Behemoth and Leviathan, were variously interpreted as the victory of Christ over Satan.<sup>97</sup> The equivalent figure in the Cotton Roll is altogether more bestial with tortured curled hair and beard and animalistic features despite the crown (figure 59). Unlike the Vercelli manuscript, it is explicitly labelled the ‘head of the body of sin: Behemoth, Leviathan’.

Mâle also drew attention to another commentator on this passage from Job, the twelfth-century theologian Honorius Augustodunensis in his *Speculum Ecclesiae*:

Leviathan, the monster who swims in the sea of the world, is Satan. God threw the line into the sea. The cord of the line is the human descent of Christ, the

---

<sup>93</sup> J. Poesch, ‘The Beasts from Job in the *Liber Floridus* Manuscripts’, *JWCI*, 33 (1970), pp. 41–51.

<sup>94</sup> J. Burton Russell, *Lucifer: The Devil in the Middle Ages* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1984), pp. 101–3.

<sup>95</sup> *Moralia* 4. 11.18 (PL 75.647): ‘Sicut autem isdem Redemptor noster una persona est cum congregatione honorum; ipse namque caput est corporis, et nos huius capitis corpus; ita antiquus hostis una persona est cum cuncta collectione reproborum, quia ipse eis ad iniquitatem quasi caput praeeminet, illi autem dum ad persuasa deserviunt, velut subiunctum capiti corpus inhaerent.’

<sup>96</sup> E. Mâle, *The Gothic Image: Religious Art in France of the Thirteenth Century* (New York, 1958), pp. 379–80.

<sup>97</sup> Job 40: 20, 41, 4–5, 10–11, 22. Gregory the Great, ‘Moralibus in Job’, PL 133, col. 489.

bait is his divinity. Attracted by the smell of flesh Leviathan tries to seize it but the hook tears his jaws.<sup>98</sup>

This reference to this metaphorical rendering of the ‘human descent of Christ’, may explain the visual placement of the genealogical tree within the mouth of the Leviathan/Satan figure, as well as the perforated jaw. The origins of this tradition take Leviathan as an allegory for death, which means that his capture and destruction with Christ as ‘bait’ refers to the resurrection of Christ—and hence of all Christians—and is linked to an earlier image from Job 14: 7–9. As C. L. Seow has indicated, the thirteenth-century Herzogenburg *Moralia* (MS 95, fol. 257v) shows God fishing for Leviathan, with a shoot growing from a tree stump indicating the theme of resurrection.<sup>99</sup> In this image, God (labelled *divinitas*) captures Leviathan with Christ on the cross as the hook: ‘Jesus Christ pierces the jaw of Leviathan’. Furthermore, Mâle, discussing illustrations of the book of Job, cited a similar image from the *Hortus deliciarum* (c. 1180) which corroborates the metaphor from Honorius, and provides a compelling parallel to the Ecclesia diagram (figure 60). The fishing line in this image clarifies the reference to Christ’s genealogy, as the cord is marked by portrait roundels described as patriarchs and prophets (*patriarche et prophete*). The text explicitly states that the image in the *Hortus deliciarum* was taken from Honorius’s *Speculum ecclesiae*.<sup>100</sup>

Another relevant example can be found in the *Lignum vitae* of Bonaventure. Bonaventure’s narration of Christ’s encounter with Leviathan occurs in the final section of the Franciscan’s work, in the ninth ‘fruit’ of his imaginary tree (*On the mystery of his glorification, the ninth fruit: the novelty of his resurrection*). The description of Christ

---

<sup>98</sup> Honorius Augustodunensis, ‘Speculum ecclesiae’, in *PL* 172, cols. 992–94, at col. 937. For the scant and uncertain details of his biography, see V. J. Flint, *Honorius Augustodunensis of Regensburg* (London, 1995).

<sup>99</sup> C. L. Seow, *Job 1–21: Interpretation and Commentary* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2013), at pp. 211–213.

<sup>100</sup> Herrad of Landsberg, *Hortus Deliciarum*, ed. T. J. Brown and K. Levy, 2 vols (London, 1979), vol. 2, no. 101, p. 134 (see Pl. 49 in vol. 1 of the same edition for the image). The rubric reads: *Jhesus Christus perforat maxillam leviathan*. The text is transcribed in the edition which collates the known copies of the destroyed manuscript. See also J. Zellinger, ‘Der geköderte Leviathan im *Hortus deliciarum* der Herrad von Landsberg’, *Historisches Jahrbuch*, 45/2 (1925), pp. 161–77, at p. 163.

battling Leviathan, and specifically piercing his jaw, furthermore integrates another aspect of the *Ecclesia* image, the unity of the Church in the body of Christ:

Then the Leviathan was led about with a hook (Job 40:25), his jaw pierced by Christ so that he who had no right over the Head which he had attacked, also lost what he had seemed to have over the body.<sup>101</sup>

As the text of the *Ecclesia* manuscript indicates, the descriptor used for Satan is an extract from Gregory the Great's *Moralia in Job*. It underlines the sense of Satan as the body of the condemned which is referred to in the inscription on the crown. The 'king of the children of pride' is another reference from the book of Job (41:25) and the description of Leviathan as the agent of Satan. The latter part refers to death, who devours all. We gain a greater sense of the complexity of this image of Leviathan/Satan from Cotton Roll XIV. 12, which makes it much clearer that this body of Satan is in direct conflict and constant battle with the militant Church. The body of the beast stretches round and back up the side of the body of Ecclesia, culminating in the tail in which the roundel of *Superbia* sits; the body of the beast encompasses every roundel of vice within it. Each phrase of the inscription refers to different characterisations of Satan. In Gregory's commentary on the book of Job, the Leviathan is read as a figure for Satan and his works.<sup>102</sup>

## *Time*

The upper part of the tree diagram visualises contemporary history until the end of time, represented in generations of thirty years (figure VI).<sup>103</sup> At the point at which the tree reaches the border of the shoulders, we reach the end of time. Here, a rubric reads: 'Quadraginta dies penitencie.' These days of penance arose from St. Jerome's calculations and commentary on Daniel 12:11–3. Jerome understood the numbers in

---

<sup>101</sup> 'Tunc extractus est leviathan hamo, ipsius per Christum perforata maxilla, ut qui nihil iuris habebat in capite, quod invasit, etiam illud perderet, quod habere videbatur in corpore.' Bonaventure, *The Soul's Journey into God; The Tree of Life; The Life of St. Francis*, trans. E. H. Cousins (New York, 1978), 'The Tree of Life,' at p. 159.

<sup>102</sup> Job 40: 20; 41: 4–5, 10–11, 22.

<sup>103</sup> There are twenty-six generations, a span of 780 years; these numbers do not seem to have any relevant scriptural meaning. This might suggest a copying error.

Daniel to refer to the time between the beginning of the reign of Antichrist, and the Last Judgement. The difference of forty-five days between these times indicated a space of time between the defeat of Antichrist and the Last Judgement. For Jerome, these forty-five days would be a brief period of earthly peace to test the faithful.<sup>104</sup> The designation of this period as one of penance did not occur until the commentary of Haimo of Auxerre in the mid-ninth century.<sup>105</sup>

However, the rubric clearly reads forty days, not forty-five, perhaps indicating a connection with the influential tenth-century works of Abbot Adso of Montier-en-Der (d. 992). Adso's narrative *On the Birth and Time of Antichrist* is often seen as a reflection of a growing concern with eschatology in the approach to the year 1000.<sup>106</sup> In this work on the advent, rule, and defeat of Antichrist with the return of Christ, Adso refers to a space of forty days for rest or penance for those who succumbed to seduction during the reign of Antichrist, before another unknown space of time before the final Judgement.<sup>107</sup> Adso's forty-day span is repeated by the twelfth-century exegete Honorius Augustodunensis in his early *Elucidarium* of 1107.<sup>108</sup> There was therefore a precedent for this forty-day span of penitence in twelfth-century commentaries. The text on the right of the *Ecclesia* figure, however, refers to forty-five days.<sup>109</sup> I wish at this point to introduce this difference between the text on the right and the figure of *Ecclesia*, because this fracture between text and content is crucial to how the *Ecclesia* diagram is innovative, which will be discussed in chapter five.

---

<sup>104</sup> See R. E. Lerner's important article on the origins and history of this period of time with exhaustive references to the works of Jerome, and the influence of this idea on medieval thinkers including Joachim of Fiore: R. E. Lerner, 'Refreshment of the Saints: The Time after Antichrist as a Station for Earthly Progress in Medieval Thought', *Traditio*, 32 (1976), pp. 97–144, at pp. 101–4.

<sup>105</sup> From Haimo of Auxerre, 'In epistolam I ad Thessalonicenses', PL, CXVII, cols. 773D–774A. Lerner, 'Refreshment of the Saints', at p. 106, n. 30.

<sup>106</sup> Adso of Montier-en-Der, *De ortu et tempore antichristi*, ed. D. Verhelst, CCCM, 45 (Turnhout, 1976). Whalen, *Dominion of God*, pp. 13–55 and passim.; R. K. Emmerson, 'Antichrist as Anti-Saint: The Significance of Abbot Adso's *Libellus de Antichristo*', *American Benedictine Review*, 30 (1979), pp. 175–90; D. Verhelst, 'Adso of Montier-En-Der and the Fear of the Year 1000', in *The Apocalyptic Year 1000: Religious Expectation and Social Change, 950–1050*, ed. R. Landes, A. Gow, and D. C. Van Meter (Oxford, 2003), pp. 81–92.

<sup>107</sup> Adso of Montier-en-Der, *De ortu et tempore antichristi*, pp. 20–30, at p. 29 (line 186).

<sup>108</sup> Lerner, 'Refreshment of the Saints', 108.

<sup>109</sup> Appendix 1, Text, ll. 79–81.

## The Body Metaphor

Concepts of interior and exterior renewal and ecclesiastical and spiritual reform recur in several manuscripts of the *Rotoli figurati*, in the work of Joachim of Fiore and the revelatory pathways of prayer found in the *Rota dominice orationis* wheel.<sup>110</sup> We have seen the juxtaposition of the Pauline idea of constant inward spiritual renewal through knowledge and prayer, with the greater historical and salvific setting, as a repeated theme.<sup>111</sup> In the *Ecclesia* diagram, the content of the image effects a statement of both a reformed spiritual and institutional ‘Ecclesia’. It incorporates the social reality of ecclesiastical jurisdiction as well as the reformed Church after Pope Gregory VII, which G. B. Ladner called the ‘mystical and hierarchical body of Christ.’<sup>112</sup>

Theological approaches to the sacraments changed in the last quarter of the twelfth century, later ratified by definitive and transformative statements made on sacramental theology at the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215. *Rotoli figurati* 4 (*Ecclesia*) refers to many major elements of sacramental theology, including references to baptism, marriage, and penance. As we have seen, the spiritual marriage of Christ to the Church is a fundamental metaphor for the meaning of this diagram. Further, the empty medallions at the centre, and the content of the ‘Ecclesia’ diagram of BL, Cotton Roll XIV. 12, indicate that one type of this image incorporated tables of consanguinity and affinity. The inclusion of specific social elements (marriage, testaments, legal status) within a manuscript also featuring depictions of baptism, ordination, degradation and excommunication, suggests that sacramental theology is an important lens through which to explore its meaning. In a complicated path through the twelfth and the first half of the thirteenth centuries, enduring theological changes were made to how the Church construed the sacraments. One of these changes was that marriage was configured as a sacrament under the New Law. The first version of Peter Lombard’s

---

<sup>110</sup> See G. Constable, ‘Renewal and Reform in Religious Life: Concepts and Realities’, in *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, ed. R. L. Benson (Oxford, 1999), pp. 37–67.

<sup>111</sup> 2 Cor. 4:16. See chapter three above, and the discussion in particular on *Rotoli figurati* 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*) and 6 (*Mappamondo*).

<sup>112</sup> G. B. Ladner, *The Idea of Reform: Its Impact on Christian Thought and Action in the Age of the Fathers* (Cambridge, MA, 1959), 423.



*Sententiae* was completed by 1154 and underwent a series of revisions that produced a second version in 1158.<sup>113</sup> Hugh of Saint Victor's treatise, *De sacramentis Christianae fidei* (1130–37), placed the sacraments according to the period of scripture from which they were drawn; of natural law, written law, and the age of grace.<sup>114</sup> These are also grouped according to type: major sacraments (baptism, eucharist), minor sacraments, and preparatory sacraments. Marriage is not integrated within the groups of sacraments, but these works treat marriage as containing two sacraments.<sup>115</sup>

The corporeal symbolism of the *Ecclesia* diagram governs the compound metaphors contained within, but this method of mapping the members or parts of the 'body of the Church' onto the different members or orders of the living Church was a model developed in late twelfth-century ecclesiology. As Agostino Paravicini-Bagliani has observed, such symbolism supported concepts of Christianity which foregrounded the Roman Church as the embodiment of the faith.<sup>116</sup> Selecting four examples from the period—Honorius Augustodunensis, Lothar of Segni (Innocent III) (d. 1216), Giles of Rome (d. 1316), and Opicinus de Canistris (d. c. 1352)—Paravicini-Bagliani illustrates the application of the body-Church metaphor to the body of the pope, the head of the Church. Honorius Augustodunensis, a canon whose influential didactic writings were popular and widely circulated, wrote a commentary on the Song of Songs taking the 'seven members' of the Bride/Church (eyes, ears, teeth, lips, knees, neck, shoulders) from the scripture to correspond to the seven orders of the elect in the Roman Church.<sup>117</sup> Prior to becoming Innocent III, Lothar of Segni, in his *Commentary on the Mysteries of the Mass*, wrote that the figure of the pope during the liturgical rites should be shown reverence in the seven parts of the body (mouth, chest, shoulders, hands,

---

<sup>113</sup> P. W. Rosemann, *Peter Lombard* (Oxford, 2004), at p. 55. See Peter Lombard, *Sententiae*; Peter Lombard, *The Sentences*, trans. G. Silano (Toronto, 2007).

<sup>114</sup> Hugh of Saint Victor, *De sacramentis Christianae fidei*, PL 176: 183–618,

<sup>115</sup> P. L. Reynolds, *How Marriage Became One of the Sacraments: The Sacramental Theology of Marriage from Its Medieval Origins to the Council of Trent* (Cambridge, 2016).

<sup>116</sup> A. Paravicini Bagliani, *The Pope's Body* (London, 2000), pp. 70–1.

<sup>117</sup> 'Tota Ecclesia est unum corpus, cuius caput est Christus, membra eius ordines electorum.' Honorius Augustodunensis, 'Expositio in Cantica Canticorum', PL, CLXXII, col. 347D. See M. T. d'Alverny, 'Le cosmos symbolique du XIIe siècle', *Archives d'Histoire Doctrinale et Littéraire du Moyen-Âge*, 28 (1954), at p. 33.

arms, knees, feet). When pope, Innocent III continued to expand his identification of the churchly body with the papal body: if the Church (and its members) became 'sick', the pope was similarly afflicted.<sup>118</sup> The lists of bodily attributes in the Song of Songs, and the transference of these to the body-Church metaphor in ecclesiological thought, are augmented by the overarching allegory of spiritual marriage from the same exegetical tradition. Along with his identification of the body-Church with the figure of the pope, Innocent also conceived of the papal office and power as based on the understanding that the pope was the bridegroom of the Church.<sup>119</sup> Almost a century later, in 1300, Giles of Rome stated that the right to exercise power granted to the supreme pontiff was such that he could be called the Church. Opicinus de Canistris, the cleric at the papal court at Avignon whom we have discussed above, produced complex diagrams of his vision of the universal Church that draw upon the same metaphorical tropes. In these diagrams, as Paravicini-Bagliani has observed, a figure of the pope is not only visually similar to images of Christ elsewhere in Opicinus's drawings, but is identified both as 'the body of the Church militant', and the 'apostolic body of the Church'.<sup>120</sup> The expansion of the corporeal symbolism noted by Paravicini-Bagliani in these examples demonstrates how the metaphor was developed over time to support an authoritative image of the Roman Church and the powers of its pontiff as vicar of Christ on earth.

This developing model of the Church as the body of Christ was not only used as an authoritative image of embodiment, but also as a statement of incarnation. The image must therefore be considered in the light of contemporary theological debates on the nature of Christ and the Incarnation. These came to a head in the decree issued after the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215:

There is indeed one universal church of the faithful, outside of which nobody at all is saved, in which Jesus Christ is both priest and sacrifice. His body and blood are truly contained in the sacrament of the altar under the forms of bread and wine, the bread and wine having been changed in substance, by God's power, into his body and blood, so that to achieve this mystery of unity we receive

---

<sup>118</sup> See references to the writings of Innocent III in Paravicini Bagliani, *The Pope's Body*, at p. 70.

<sup>119</sup> Reynolds, *How Marriage Became One of the Sacraments*, 61.

<sup>120</sup> Paravicini Bagliani, *The Pope's Body*, pp. 70–1.

from God what he received from us.<sup>121</sup>

There is no mention of Christ's blood, of sacrifice, of bread and wine, in the diagram under discussion. However, it uses the image model that remained integral to writings on Christ's sacrifice after 1215. For example, Jacques de Vitry, in the early thirteenth century, wrote that Christian society operated as a body, with Christ as its head, and each member composed of categories of humans performing their respective offices of duty.<sup>122</sup> This later developed into ideas of divine harmony explored in Dante's vision of Paradise in the *Commedia*, but the absence of post-1215 Christological imagery suggests that the diagram arises from an earlier, mid-twelfth-century, background of thought.

The Vercelli *Ecclesia* contributes to our understanding of this ecclesiological symbolism: both corporeal imagery drawing on the tradition of Song of Songs commentary, and the extension of the body-Church metaphor onto the body of the pope as head of the Church, feature in the diagram. In the *Ecclesia* of Cotton Roll XIV.12, the inscription next to the pope and saints assembled on the shoulders states: 'the head of the Church militant' (figure 47).<sup>123</sup> Although this inscription is missing from the Vercelli diagram, the text and image supply us with the rich detail which illustrates this authoritative imagery.

### *Hugh of Saint Victor's diagram of Noah's Ark*

In chapter three we established the important role complex images played in communicating theological thought in the twelfth century. One of the most important

---

<sup>121</sup> 'Una vero est fidelium universalis ecclesia, extra quam nullus omnino salvatur, in qua idem ipse sacerdos et sacrificium Iesus Christus, cuius corpus et sanguis in sacramento altaris sub speciebus panis et vini veraciter continentur, transubstantiatis pane in corpus et vino in sanguinem potestate divina, ut ad perficiendum mysterium unitatis accipiamus ipsi de suo, quod accepit ipse de nostro.' From N. P. Tanner, ed., *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*, 2 vols (London, 1990), I, vol. I, at p. 230.

<sup>122</sup> '[...] quasi ex variis membris a se invicem propriis officiis multifarie differentibus, sub Christo capite, unum corpus ecclesie compingatur': Jacques de Vitry, *Libri duo, quorum prior orientalis sive Hierosolymitanae alter occidentalis historiae nomine inscribitur*, ed. F. Moschus [1597], repr. (Farnborough, 1971), pp. 357–8. Cited in G. Rosser, *The Art of Solidarity in the Middle Ages: Guilds in England 1250–1550* (Oxford, 2015), at p. 188.

<sup>123</sup> 'Capud ecclesie militantis', as noted by Cleaver, 'Past, Present and Future for Thirteenth-Century Wales: Two Diagrams in British Library, Cotton Roll XIV.12', at p. 24.

proponents of images as a powerful tool for understanding was Hugh of Saint Victor. The work undertaken by Marco Rainini to establish the influence the work of Hugh of Saint Victor is likely to have exerted on Joachim of Fiore's use of imagery means that it is important here to discuss some aspects of Hugh's complex imagery which are relevant to the *Ecclesia* diagram. The three works of Hugh which focus upon a comprehensive representation of the past, present and future of salvific history as a means of spiritual ascension toward the divine and eternal are his *De arca Noe morali* [*The Moral Ark*], *De arca Noe mystica* [*The Mystic Ark*], and the *De vanitate mundi*.<sup>124</sup> In these works, the construction of a complex diagram of Noah's Ark is used as an exegetical tool to communicate Hugh's systematic theology. The drawing described in *The Mystic Ark* contains three main elements: a *maiestas* image of Christ enthroned as in the vision of Isaiah; an *imago mundi*; and a schematic construction of Noah's Ark viewed from above. In appearance, the diagram would have been framed by the embrace of Christ, holding the cosmos so that his hands and feet would be visible. The layers of meaning within this image are constructed through different 'Arks': the Ark of Noah, the Ark of the Church, the Ark of Wisdom and the Ark of Mother Grace. These signify levels of historical, allegorical, anagogical and tropological meaning. *The Mystic Ark* is a lengthy and complex description of a diagram which was used as a focus point during a series of lectures by Hugh. The image does not survive. The sheer complexity of the description — and the monumentality of the image according to the measurements contained within it, which put the height at over two metres — has led many scholars to interpret it as a solely imaginary construct. Foremost in this opinion is Mary Carruthers, who has argued that Hugh's Ark was never intended to be a real drawing, but should rather be understood as a powerful mnemonic device and evaluated within the context of cognitive techniques of visual learning common in the twelfth century.<sup>125</sup> Conrad Rudolph, by contrast, has offered a detailed reconstruction based on his study of the text, which he assesses as a record of those lectures.<sup>126</sup> The scale of the image, in

---

<sup>124</sup> J. A. H. Lewis, 'History and Everlastingness in Hugh of St Victor's Figures of Noah's Ark', in *Time and Eternity: The Medieval Discourse*, ed. G. Jaritz and G. Moreno-Riaño (Turnhout, 2003), pp. 203–22.

<sup>125</sup> Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, pp. 293–302.

<sup>126</sup> Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, Ch. 1 and 2.

Rudolph's reconstruction, leads him to suggest that the image could reasonably have existed as a wall-painting within the chapter house at the abbey of Saint Victor. Patrice Sicard also argued that the *Mystic Ark* could have had a physical existence. Sicard offers an interpretation of *The Mystic Ark* as a dynamic pedagogical tool painted by the teacher as the lecture was given, on a flat surface such as a large sheet of parchment or the floor.<sup>127</sup> The act of drawing and creating diagrams was an essential part of Hugh's exegetical and pedagogical process.<sup>128</sup>

The composite elements which make up *The Mystic Ark* are shared in remarkable number by those constructing Rotoli figurati 4, the *Ecclesia* diagram, not least by its overall appearance as a framed figure of the head of Christ, whose body is the Church. In both *The Mystic Ark* and the fuller allegorical expositions of *The Moral Ark*, this Pauline theme of the relation of the head to the members is frequently repeated.<sup>129</sup> Hugh's symbol of the *maiestas*, the Lord enthroned, is an image of divine power. Between the head and the feet of Christ, in *The Mystic Ark*, stretches out the Church. This is the same structure as the *Ecclesia*: the historical time of the Church is mapped through its central genealogy, while above and below Christ's head and feet are visible (figure VI). The framing nature of Christ's head and feet, in Hugh's text, gives a sense of Christ as co-eternal with the Father, present before Creation and after time. Elsewhere in Hugh's works, in his *De sacramentis*, Hugh describes the *maiestas* as a representation of care and governance of all creation, as a whole and of individuals, incorporating a role of reward and punishment.<sup>130</sup> In this respect, the *Ecclesia* diagram, with its depiction of ecclesiastical jurisdiction, seems to evoke multiple aspects of Hugh of Saint Victor's writings. The multiple themes and images gathered together in Hugh of Saint Victor's description of Noah's Ark include a *mappa mundi*, descriptions of the vices and virtues and other categories of information concerning the Church, pathways of affective contemplation, a historical genealogy, an image of the eternal body of Christ and the six ages of the world. These are all motifs found in the Rotoli figurati.

---

<sup>127</sup> Sicard, *Diagrammes médiévaux*, pp. 46, 55.

<sup>128</sup> Smalley, *The Study of the Bible*, 96.

<sup>129</sup> Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, 262. Hugh of Saint Victor, *De archa Noe*, 1: 3, 10.

<sup>130</sup> Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, pp. 206–9.

Noah's Ark is described in detail in Genesis, and the architectural element of the metaphor was important, a common analogue for the process of study throughout the middle ages.<sup>131</sup> Perhaps the most well-known instance is found in Gregory's *Moralia in Job*, where the stages of exegesis from literal, to allegorical, to moral and finally to mystical, are compared to the construction of a citadel. Hugh of Saint Victor uses this description from Gregory, and develops it in his work on *The Mystic Ark*. Hugh's work synthesises multiple levels of interpretation: 'the historical ark built by Noah; second, the ark of the Church which Christ built; and third, the *arca sapientiae*, which 'every day wisdom builds in our hearts from continuous meditation on the law of God.'<sup>132</sup> For Carruthers, the *arca sapientiae* is memory, and this is crucial to her interpretation of the text as a cognitive device. I would like to offer another interpretation of Hugh's Ark, an interpretation in which the reality of the drawing ceases to matter very much, and we can tread a path between the contrasting positions taken by Carruthers and by Conrad Rudolph.

Carruthers' argument that the governing metaphor of the Ark is a pedagogical instrument is convincing. And yet, so is Rudolph's emphasis on the reality of the image, particularly because there are common visual similarities between his reconstruction of *The Mystic Ark* and the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4). Two passages from *The Mystic Ark* and *The Moral Ark* highlighted by both Carruthers and Rudolph serve as an indication of how Hugh's work was designed to affect an individual's imagination. The first is from the end of *The Mystic Ark*, the shorter treatise detailing the construction of the image. The second is from the closing passage of the *Moral Ark*.

We have related these things concerning the representation of our Ark so that if anyone might wish to reflect upon the beauty of the house of the Lord and its wonders, which are numberless, he might rouse his devotion for a while with this exemplar.<sup>133</sup>

---

<sup>131</sup> On architectural images in medieval pedagogy, see: Kinsella, 'Edifice and Education'. More broadly, see Cleaver, *Education in Twelfth-Century Art and Architecture*.

<sup>132</sup> Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, 53. Hugh of Saint Victor, *De archa Noe*, I, iii. 236–8 (CCCM 176, p. 17).

<sup>133</sup> Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, pp. 501–2.

Therefore, let us now propose the exemplar of our Ark itself, as we have promised. This we have painted externally in order that you may learn from without what you ought to do within so that, when you have reproduced the form of this exemplar in your heart, you may rejoice that the house of God has been built within you.<sup>134</sup>

For Carruthers, the first passage from *The Mystic Ark* demonstrates that this work is a 'picture-summary' of the extensive material in *The Moral Ark*, an aid to processes of 'memory and invention'. The attitude Hugh takes, of presenting this work as an exemplar to others ('... so that if anyone') shows that the diagram is not prescriptive, it can — indeed, should — be used by others. This refers to the pedagogy of memory, and the importance of individual receptions and associations.<sup>135</sup> The same passages as interpreted by Rudolph are invitations to readers of *The Moral Ark* to 'conduct their own discussions', based on their own individual experience and learning. Given the widespread dissemination of the text, this is what happened in many learned contexts throughout western Europe.<sup>136</sup> For Rudolph, the image of *The Mystic Ark* is supposed to be understood as part of the collaborative *collatio*, to be discussed in the cloister. The text of the Ark is specifically a *reportatio*, a record of lectures, which is designed to provide the structure of the diagram so that those outside the abbey of Saint Victor could construct the image themselves, 'component by component'.<sup>137</sup> For both, the function of the description is outwardly addressed, as a pedagogic tool which encourages others to construct their own 'mystic arks': Carruthers' in the mind's eye, Rudolph's as a mural-painting in the cloister. Both acknowledge that the considerable number of copies of the text must indicate that use of the diagram was widespread. Rudolph allows that the enormous size and complexity of the original painting at Saint Victor must have been rendered differently in copies. However, he insists that the specificity of the text means that it could only have been used as a model to make additional copies of *The Mystic Ark*, however crudely sketched on a cloister wall. *The*

---

<sup>134</sup> Hugh of Saint Victor, *De archa Noe*, 3. Translated by Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, p. 257.

<sup>135</sup> Carruthers, *The Book of Memory*, p. 296.

<sup>136</sup> Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, at pp. 257–8.

<sup>137</sup> Rudolph states his case against Mary Carruthers specifically here: Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, pp. 12–16. On the text as *reportatio* see Rudolph, 'First, I Find the Center Point', pp. i–110.

*Mystic Ark* follows the themes of another of Hugh's works, his *De sacramentis christianae fidei*, and is composed of symbolic elements, images, and diagrams which are recognisable as characteristic of Hugh's thought.<sup>138</sup>

What both interpretations acknowledge is that Hugh's description of the diagram stresses how it is not prescriptive; his text provides an exemplary model of an image, the readers' interpretation of which would vary depending on the individual and on context. This allows for a greater degree of flexibility in how this diagram might have appeared, and it seems plausible that both mental and physical constructions were possible uses of *The Mystic Ark*. John Lewis has observed 'compound symbolism' in the interwoven complexity of *The Mystic Ark*, and recognises Hugh's drawing as a single visual composition which nonetheless contains elements 'suggestive of discrete formal diagrams'.<sup>139</sup> We have observed the thematic similarities between Hugh of Saint Victor's Ark texts and the collected concerns of the Rotoli figurati. Furthermore, we have noted a specific affinity between the overarching structure of *The Mystic Ark* and the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 4). It is the contention of this study that the *Ecclesia* diagram participates within the same visual and interpretative discourse as Hugh of Saint Victor's Ark. If Hugh's *Mystic Ark* diagram functioned as a non-prescriptive model, it would be plausible that multiple separate diagrammatic forms (Lewis's 'discrete' diagrams) derived from this highly popular and widely influential text. The method represented by the model of the Ark — a metaphor already widely recognised, as we have seen — could be used to create images that compiled thematic strands of the Ark. In the *Ecclesia* diagram, the sense of unity and completion remains, in the figure of Christ and the body of the Church, in the representation of time and history, even if the infinite complexity of the detail does not.

Moreover, the flexibility of the model as a pedagogical tool which is directly hinted at by Hugh in his opening and closing passages to both the *Mystic* and *The Moral Ark*, could be the reason for the lack of visual survivals. If the image was used in learning contexts, then partial elements would be drawn as needed for specific audiences — these would not have been works of art, but rather sketches or drawings. And readers

---

<sup>138</sup> Rudolph, *The Mystic Ark*, at p. 17.

<sup>139</sup> Lewis, 'History and Everlastingness', pp. 203–22, at pp. 205–6.



would not necessarily have attempted to recreate the complete diagram, because multiple composite elements would suffice, and would be simpler to draw.

In the *Ecclesia* diagram, furthermore, we have the addition of a text by Joachim of Fiore, in a different hand from the main text. If the model for the *Ecclesia* was an authoritative image, it would be highly unusual to find an addition like this. If, instead, the drawing was already based on a non-prescriptive model, the addition of a text of interest to the canons of S. Eusebio, which seemed already pertinent to the content of the diagram, would be much more plausible. Marco Rainini has already observed that the work of Joachim of Fiore requires placing in the context of late twelfth century figurative theology, an arena dominated by Victorine theologians.<sup>140</sup>

---

<sup>140</sup> M. Rainini, 'Symbolica theologia. Simboli e diagrammi in Ugo di San Vittore', in Ugo di San Vittore. Atti del XLVII Convegno storico internazionale. Todi, 10-12 ottobre 2010 (Spoleto, 2011), pp. 285-337.

## Conclusion

The *Ecclesia* diagram is an image which resists categorisation. The image synthesises iconography and pictorial representation, while its compartmentalisation and manipulation of spatial relationships to create meaning is highly diagrammatic. Through close examination, it has been possible to draw out from the dense concatenation of different elements a coherent understanding of the diagram's thematic meaning, and a sense of how this image reflects the theological and intellectual of the late twelfth century. That only one other example of this image exists presents difficulties for analysis, and a fuller understanding of how this image functioned requires comparison to a wide range of complex medieval images.

For example, one twelfth-century medieval work which makes use of a similarly complex iconography can be found in the *Hortus deliciarum* (*Garden of Delights*). This manuscript was produced in the last quarter of the twelfth century at the Augustinian convent at Hohenburg (Mont Sainte-Odile), where its iconographic programme was designed by the abbess Herrad (d. 1195) for the use of the religious women under her care.<sup>141</sup> It presents a coherent account of salvific history from Creation to the end of time, illustrated by elaborate pictorial cycles; the cosmic scale of divine history is balanced throughout by a focus on the history of the convent at Hohenburg, and the spiritual lives of the canonesses in the community. Elizabeth Monroe's recent work on the *Hortus deliciarum* has argued that the complexity of the manuscript's design, particularly the interplay of image and text, both on the page and in the unity of the work, deliberately makes a demand of rigorous mental and physical investment from

---

<sup>141</sup> The original manuscript held at Strasbourg was destroyed in 1870, but was reproduced from the copies of the images and text produced by scholars in the nineteenth-century: R. Green, ed., *Herrad of Hohenburg. Hortus Deliciarum*, 2 vols (London, 1979). The manuscript's dating and sources are described in vol. I, pp. 14–88. For a discussion of the arguments surrounding the Abbess Herrad's role in the production of the manuscript, as artist or as compiler, see: F. J. Griffiths, *The Garden of Delights: Reform and Renaissance for Women in the Twelfth Century* (Philadelphia, 2007), pp. 123–5.

the reader which was part of its spiritual function.<sup>142</sup> The *Hortus deliciarum* is a rare example of a unified encyclopaedic manuscript designed to balance the macrocosm of salvation history with the microcosm represented by the personal spiritual act required of the reader.

Further, Nathaniel Campbell has identified a striking measure of innovation in Herrad's use of diverse textual sources to create striking images.<sup>143</sup> One image from the *Hortus deliciarum* which might offer a fruitful point of comparison for the *Ecclesia* diagram is the *Woman Clothed with the Sun*. This is the final image in the *Hortus deliciarum* depicting images from the Apocalypse of John, and is followed by extracts from the *Speculum ecclesiae* of Honorius Augustodunensis, on Apocalypse 12–13. These extracts reiterate salvation history from Adam to the Babylonian captivity typologically anticipating Christ and the Church. An introductory text explains that the discussion of Old Testament 'mysteries' in the texts will illuminate the preceding series of diagrams.<sup>144</sup> The exegesis of the text explains that the woman is the Church, and the dragon which attacks her is the devil, her adversary. As the dragon attempts to steal her child, so the devil tries to lure away the faithful who are the children of the Church. The seven heads of the dragon are the seven vices, which can be countered by the seven gifts of the Holy Spirit, interpreted as the seven precepts of the law, and the virtues. This image and the text alongside it were used by Herrad to summarise eschatology at the end of her collection: the mission of the earthly Church, moral precepts, and the individual and collective battle between the faithful and evil, are embodied in this figure, in the richness of its iconographic references, and in the use of a particular source text alongside it.<sup>145</sup>

The *Ecclesia* diagram makes a statement through a comparable synthesis of knowledge, for an audience with particular interests and concerns. The iconography of this image is demonstrably linked to the ecclesiological and eschatological concerns of

---

<sup>142</sup> E. Monroe, 'Dangerous Passages and Spiritual Redemption in the *Hortus Deliciarum*', in *Push Me, Pull You: Imaginative and Emotional Interaction in Late Medieval and Renaissance Art*, ed. S. Blick and L. D. Gelfand (Leiden, 2011), I, pp. 39–74.

<sup>143</sup> N. Campbell, 'Lest He Should Come Unforeseen: The Antichrist Cycle in the *Hortus Deliciarum*', *Gesta*, 54/1 (2015), pp. 85–118.

<sup>144</sup> A. Krüger and G. Runge, 'Lifting the Veil: Two Typological Diagrams in the *Hortus Deliciarum*', *JWCI*, 60 (1997), pp. 1–22, at pp. 21–2.

<sup>145</sup> Campbell, 'Lest He Should Come Unforeseen', pp. 108–9.

the late twelfth century, which remained relevant throughout the thirteenth century when this manuscript was copied. A brief comparison to the *Hortus deliciarum* demonstrates the importance of placing the thematic concerns of the *Ecclesia* diagram in context, and exploring them not only in light of broader visual culture, but within the debates surrounding the reform ideologies of the late twelfth and thirteenth century.

## 5 Ecclesiology and eschatology at the end of the twelfth century

By unpacking the dense imagery of Rotoli figurati 4, we have seen how the *Ecclesia* diagram makes innovative use of corporeal symbolism, embodying the Church — as *ecclesia militans* and *ecclesia triumphans*— as a jurisdictional and spiritual whole. We have examined how the hierarchies and categorisations of the unified Church illustrated in the diagram convey an authoritative picture of right ecclesiological order. We have also noted the way in which this diagram synthesises macroscopic spiritual ideas with social and political concerns can be compared to other complex diagrammatic works from the second half of the twelfth century. In particular, the *Ecclesia* diagram coalesces the mystical body of Christ and the heavenly Church with the social realities of twelfth-century developments in law and sacramental theology. The congregation of the Christian faithful is depicted as a corporate and jurisdictional whole —bound together by shared laws handed down from heaven, and by a shared participation in the linear progression of providential history —all under the authoritative structure of papal primacy.

The origins of this diagram are most likely in the late twelfth century, and the plausible circumstances of its use in learned centres in Vercelli should inform our understanding of its meaning and function, and the broader significance of its ecclesiological statement. Vercelli maintained important and strong strategic relationships with the papacy in this period. Furthermore, the cathedral of S. Eusebio had an associated advanced school, with a chair in theology which attracted important learned figures from across Europe. In chapter three we observed how in the second half of the twelfth century there was a broader flourishing in visual culture of the diagrammatic mode, which particularly aided in the transmission of complex and innovative ideas present in contemporary theology. In this chapter, we will use this knowledge of the context of the late twelfth century Vercelli, and our understanding of broader changes in visual culture, to gain a better understanding of the complex presentation of ecclesiology and eschatology in the *Ecclesia* diagram.

[He is] the true King and Emperor whose kingdom and empire is eternal.  
[Christ] who is for us the pope, the bishop and shepherd of our souls. Thus, the king and priest brings the regalia of the priesthood to his betrothed, whose vicar is Peter and his orthodox successors, and those are priests and also kings, whose vicars are worldly kings, who are subject and devoted to Him.<sup>1</sup>

The categorisations and divisions of the Church illustrated in the *Ecclesia* diagram give a presentation of right ecclesiological order framed within the metaphor of the Church as a body whose head is Christ, which originates with Saint Paul.<sup>2</sup> At its head is Christ, ‘the true king and emperor, whose kingdom and empire is forever.’<sup>3</sup> This earthly structure is governed by the pope, in his position as vicar of Christ, following the tradition of Saint Peter. Contemporary canon law is encoded within it, as are the hierarchies of the different sacred orders of the clergy, and the Church’s ultimate claim to jurisdiction over the secular courts.

We have seen how the diagram uses several allegorical images of the Church: the Church is the body with Christ at its head, it is the *navicula Petri*, the bride of Christ, and the mother of the faithful. The Church and the priesthood are endowed by Christ’s authority through St Peter, and are therefore not human institutions, but divine ones. As Peter was established as the first pope, the first governor of the Church, all subsequent orthodox (*catholicos*) successors of Peter are supported by this divine sacramental link. The chain of divine ordination stretches back through all priests to Peter. Therefore, all popes succeed Peter in his role as Christ’s vicar on earth. This divine authority means that all priests are ‘also kings’, and all worldly kings are in turn subject to the higher spiritual power (*unde et ei subditi sunt et devoti*). The image subjects emperors and worldly rulers to the superior authority, not only of the pope, but of all priests. The diagram states that Christ is the ‘true king and emperor’, and he is also, for Christians, the *pontifex pastor* who is ‘bishop and shepherd of our souls’. As the priest and king, Christ conferred the office of priesthood on his bride the Church, through St. Peter, and all of his orthodox successors, who act as Christ’s vicar on earth. The text states that those who hold the office of pope are ‘priests and also kings’, because of the divinely conferred status of the Petrine see. The vicars, in turn, of priests are worldly

---

<sup>1</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 7-10; Appendix 3, ll. 8-11.

<sup>2</sup> 1 Cor. 12: 12-27; 2 Cor. 6:16. Appendix, ll. 1-3.

<sup>3</sup> ‘Verus Rex imperator, cuius regnum et imperium est in eternum.’ Appendix 1, ll. 6-7.

kings (*reges mundani*), who are subject to Christ and to spiritual authority. The power of worldly kings is derived from their role as vicars to the pope. The status of the papal office as both kingly and priestly is signified by a detail in the figure of the pope (figure 61). This figure, who is positioned in front of a palace, wears a pallium, and touches the keys emerging from the mouth of Christ in a gesture mirroring those of St. Peter; he wears a mitre with side points, but carries a tiara. This tiara signifies imperial power; it is not worn, because the pontifical power conferred by the mitre is superior.<sup>4</sup> The pope, as vicar of Christ, holds both and thereby holds the fullness of power.<sup>5</sup> The conception of the papal office in the diagram is exalted, as we can see from the pope's position, on a level with St. Peter. This elevated understanding of the pope as vicar of Christ, and the head of the regal or kingly priesthood (*regale sacerdotium*), emerges from the twelfth-century reforming ecclesiology of figures such as Bernard of Clairvaux and Hugh of Saint Victor, reaching full expression at the turn of the century under Innocent III.<sup>6</sup>

### *Ecclesia Militans, Ecclesia Triumphans*

Christ wears a crown divided into three parts, which the text explains as signifying imperial, regal, and pontifical power.<sup>7</sup> The outer circle of the halo is occupied by bearded figures identified as the twenty-four elders of the Apocalypse, while the inner circle is occupied by angels. A smaller figure perches within this frame, the adjacent lettering indicating that it is meant to represent the Ancient of Days, the *antiquus dierum*, or God the Father. This, and the angelic and bearded figures in the halo, are iconographic features which it would be common to see in images of Judgement Day and in Apocalypse illustration. These powerful motifs sit uneasily next to the liveliness of drawings of badly-behaved clerics being admonished, or of consummation within a marriage, images which illustrate the social and political aspects of ecclesiastical jurisdiction within the Christian congregation. How can such images be included

---

<sup>4</sup> Innocent III argued that the power signified by the mitre took priority over the power signified by the tiara, demonstrating the superiority of the papal office. See Innocent III (Lothar de Segni), *Sermo in festo d. Silvestris pontificis maximi*, PL 217, col. 481.

<sup>5</sup> Paravicini Bagliani, *Le chiavi e la tiara*, p. 68.

<sup>6</sup> Hugh of Saint Victor wrote 'Papa vicem et locum Christi tenet', in his *De officiis ecclesiasticis*, 1, 43, PL 177, 402. Cited by Robinson, 'Church and Papacy', pp. 252–305, at p. 269.

<sup>7</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 5–6.

alongside a vision of Christ in majesty, witnessed by the twenty-four elders? The inclusion of these apocalyptic motifs introduces a macrocosmic view as a counterpoint to ecclesiastical jurisdiction on earth, and complicates how we should read this image.

The text compounds these complications, as there is a difference between what is described and what is depicted. Although the artist of the *Ecclesia* diagram does not complete the hierarchies of angels or the number of the Elders correctly, in this instance Cotton Roll XIV. 12 supplies a more accurate vision of these motifs, which are nonetheless described in the Vercelli manuscript's text.

Around the outside of Christ's head are the twenty-four seats of the Elders. There are also twelve Apostles judging the twelve tribes of Israel. In the middle circle [there are] three hierarchies of angels. Within the third circle the souls of the saints are gathered. The Elders will judge, the angels will attend [them]. The souls are crowned in the judgement. Seeing God face to face as he is and Jesus Christ, whom he sent, whom the angels desire to see, which is eternal life. This gathering of the saints is said to be the heavenly Jerusalem since in the heavens the vision of peace is brought fully to fruition.<sup>8</sup>

The apocalyptic nature of the Vercelli *Ecclesia* diagram is clarified by this text. Further scriptural references indicate that the seated figure is the Apocalyptic vision of Christ (Apoc. 1: 12–20): 'one like to the son of man' (Apoc. 1:13), with 'hair white like wool' (Apoc. 1:14). The text states that Christ is at the head of the Church, while the faithful make up the body, together forming the Church as the congregation of the faithful. Simultaneously, however, another meaning of this image is made clear. The Church is a unity made up of two parts, both of which are represented here.<sup>9</sup> These are described respectively as the Church 'triumphans in vita celestis', and 'militans in via', two ecclesiological categories of the Church: the Church Militant as the members currently engaged in spiritual warfare on earth and the *ecclesia triumphans* as the ahistorical, heavenly Church rejoicing in the beatific vision. The image of a single church body — the City of God— simultaneously existing among those in heaven and those on pilgrimage on earth, is Augustine's.<sup>10</sup> But these two states of the Church were relatively

---

<sup>8</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 10–16; Appendix 3, ll. 12–9.

<sup>9</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 3–4; Appendix 3, ll. 3–5.

<sup>10</sup> Augustine, *De civitate Dei [Libri XI–XXII]*, ed. B. Dombart and A. Kalb, CCSL, 47–48, repr.



novel terms at the time this diagram was likely conceived of. Christine Thouzellier traces the history of these terms, and locates the first use of ‘ecclesia militans’ and ‘ecclesia triumphans’ in Peter Comestor’s *Historia scholastica*, completed in 1168 and rooted in the milieu of the university of Paris in the second half the twelfth century.<sup>11</sup> The vision of Christ at the Apocalypse is part of the attainment of those who will reach the heavenly Jerusalem of the Church Triumphant, and will there see God face to face. What we have here in the *Ecclesia* diagram, therefore, is a united vision of the Church in these two states, two parts (‘due sunt partes’), one historical and one ahistorical, existing eternally.

### *Ecclesiological Readings of Apocalypse*

We need not be surprised by the deployment of apocalyptic material in a statement of ecclesiology. There was a longstanding exegetical reading of Apocalypse, which de-emphasised its eschatological purpose and represented the text as a symbolic analogy for the existing Church. Such a reading ultimately derives from the writings and interpretative methods of Tyconius, the late fourth-century African Donatist theologian and exegete, who was a strong influence on Augustine, although the latter was loath to admit his debt to a Donatist opponent.<sup>12</sup> Tyconius’s only surviving work is a short treatise, the *Liber regularum* (c. 382), on the seven compositional rules of scripture.<sup>13</sup> However, his lost *Expositio Apocalypseos* directly and widely influenced early medieval exegesis of the Apocalypse, and some of its content and much of its argument was transmitted through later writers who drew from it.<sup>14</sup> Jerome’s contemporary commentary (c. 360) transformed the earliest literal and millenarian Apocalypse interpretation of Victorinus of Pettau (c. 300), born of the early Christian belief in the imminence of the events described, into an interpretative allegorical framework which

---

(Turnhout, 1955), bk. XX, pt. 9, at p. 716.

<sup>11</sup> C. Thouzellier, ‘Ecclesia militans’, in *Etudes d’histoire du droit canonique dédiées à Gabriel Le Bras*, 2 vols (Paris, 1965), II, pp. 1407–1423, at pp. 1415–16.

<sup>12</sup> K. B. Steinhauser, *The Apocalypse Commentary of Tyconius: A History of Its Reception and Influence* (Frankfurt, 1987).

<sup>13</sup> Tyconius, *Tyconius: The Book of Rules*, trans. W. S. Babcock (Atlanta, 1989).

<sup>14</sup> P. Fredriksen, ‘Tyconius and Augustine on the Apocalypse’, in *The Apocalypse in the Middle Ages*, ed. R. K. Emmerson and B. McGinn (London, 1992), pp. 20–37.

moved away from apocalyptic expectation as the unfolding revelations of the vision of St. John did not occur.

However, it was with Tyconius that the exegetical tradition of reading the Apocalypse as the key to understanding and defining the structure of the earthly Church began. His innovative exegetical approach, as Paula Fredrikson has observed, liberated the imagery of the Apocalypse from literal interpretation. Moving away from the millenarian idea of an imminent apocalypse that had previously characterised late fourth-century North-African Latin Christian culture, Tyconius instead read the Apocalyptic vision as a symbolic description of the current Church as it manifested itself simultaneously on earth and in heaven.<sup>15</sup> Tyconius' non-prophetic and ecclesiological approach to the interpretation of the Apocalypse was received and interpreted by his near contemporaries, particularly through Augustine, who drew on his ideas to define the City of God, divided between its citizens travelling through the world (*in via*) and those already triumphant (*triumphans*) in heaven. As Augustine wrote:

Therefore, the church even now is the kingdom of Christ and the kingdom of heaven. Thus even now the saints of Christ reign with Him, though not in the same way as they will reign hereafter.<sup>16</sup>

Tyconius' method of giving ecclesiological meaning to Apocalypse was soon reflected in the visual culture of late antiquity. Some of the most important examples of this can be found in the apse mosaics of Roman basilicas from the sixth to the ninth centuries, recently the subject of analysis by Erik Thunø. Thunø argued that the arrangement of Christ and the saints in Roman apse mosaics made them 'recognisable' to the congregation, and was balanced by the representation of apocalyptic motifs in the triumphal arch: usually a combination of the four living creatures, the twenty-four Elders, hierarchies of angels, the adoration of the Lamb, and often a procession of lambs

---

<sup>15</sup> Fredrikson, 'Tyconius and Augustine on the Apocalypse', pp. 24–6). Fredriksen, 'Tyconius and Augustine', at pp. 24–6.

<sup>16</sup> Augustine, *The City of God against the Pagans*, trans. R. W. Dyson, Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought (London, 1998), at pp. 997–9. Latin text: *Ergo et nunc ecclesia regnum Christi est regnumque caelorum. Regnant itaque cum illo etiam nunc sancti eius, aliter quidem, quam tunc regnabunt*. Cited from Book 20, Ch. 9: Augustine, *De civitate Dei*.

from Bethlehem and Jerusalem.<sup>17</sup> In the ninth-century triumphal arch of Santa Prassede (figure 62), the twenty-four Elders are depicted presenting their crowns to Christ. The motif is taken from chapters four and five of the Apocalypse and represents twelve prophets from the Old Testament and the New. These motifs, as elsewhere, are found on the triumphal arch because it functions as the entrance to the apse, the holy of holies, where the soul may encounter Christ. Christians can *glimpse* the face of God at the mass through Christ's sacrifice; the true Beatific Vision will only occur at the Last Judgement. Their frequent depiction in apse mosaics represents the *Ecclesia triumphans*, which emphasises the unity and integration of both testaments. The Apocalyptic visual vocabulary of these apse mosaics is in fact ecclesiological, designed to represent a unified image of both states of the Church and thus momentarily uniting the congregation on earth with the saints in heaven. This is an explicitly Tyconian interpretation.

### *The Papacy and Visual Representations of Authority*

From the fourth century onwards, the most common central feature of Roman apse mosaics was Christ accompanied by Saints Peter and Paul, distinguished as ecclesiological symbols of Rome, as may be seen in the early sixth-century example from Santi Cosma e Damiano (figure 63). Peter and Paul, as the apostles respectively to the Jews and to the Gentiles (Galatians 2: 8–9), represented the concept of *concordia apostolorum*, the idea that the Church had resolved into harmony the Old Testament division.<sup>18</sup> In Rotoli figurati 4, the *Ecclesia* diagram, Peter stands to the left of the key, opposite the figure of the pope. Paul stands almost behind Peter. This unusual

---

<sup>17</sup> The motif known as the procession of lambs is believed to have originated in Rome, alongside the late fourth century apse mosaic of the *traditio legis*, in S. Pietro. It is also found alongside the *traditio legis* in SS. Cosma e Damiano, S. Prassede and S. Cecilia. See R. Wißkirchen and S. Hedi, 'Der Prototyp des Lämmerfrieses in Alt-St. Peter. Ikonographie und Ikonologie', in *Tesserae: Festschrift für Josef Engemann*, ed. E. Dassmann and K. Thraede (Münster, 1991), pp. 138–160.

<sup>18</sup> C. Piétri, 'Concordia apostolorum et renovatio urbis. Culte des martyrs et propagande pontificale.', *Mélanges d'Archéologie et d'Histoire de l'Ecole française de Rome*, 73 (1961), pp. 275–322; H. L. Kessler, 'The Meeting of Peter and Paul in Rome: An Emblematic Narrative of Spiritual Brotherhood', *Dumbarton Oaks Papers*, 41 (1987), pp. 265–75. The latter is reprinted as 'The Meeting of Peter and Paul in Rome: An Emblematic Narrative of Spiritual Brotherhood', in *Old St. Peter's and Church Decoration in Medieval Italy*, by H. L. Kessler (Spoleto, 2002), pp. 265–75.

iconographic arrangement foregrounds an important symbolic gesture. Peter is framed by a chequered gold background, mirroring the frame around the pope as his vicar opposite him. Both pope and apostle reach forward to touch the key that emerges from the mouth of Christ: there are in fact two keys, one directly behind the other. Peter touches the one in front, and the pope distinctly touches the one behind. Here the image again differs from the text: these are the keys of Matthew, 16:19, given to Peter by Christ, who declares: 'I will give to thee the keys of the kingdom of heaven. And whatever thou shalt bind upon earth, it shall be bound also in heaven: and whatsoever thou shalt loose upon earth, it shall be loosed also in heaven.'<sup>19</sup> The double keys, and the specific double gesture, give a particular prominence to Peter, while retaining the figure of Christ at the centre of ecclesiological unity and the universal jurisdiction of the Church, just as in the earlier Roman apse mosaics at Santi Cosma e Damiano, Santa Prassede (first half of the ninth century), and Santa Cecilia, and in the apsidal arch at San Marco (both ninth century) (see figures 63–65).

Popes could also insert themselves into apse mosaics to make a statement that gave the papal office a degree of intercessory powers below that of the saints and martyrs. Ann Marie Yasin has argued that five of the eucharistic prayers of the Roman Church established by Gregory the Great (590–604), and very similar to those still in use today, were prayers of intercession: 'petitions made on behalf of the worshipping congregation' that included readings from the *acta* of martyrs and saints.<sup>20</sup> The parallel integration of the saints into the liturgy added to the significance of the saints represented in the material fabric of cult space itself, in the most visible space of the apse mosaic above the altar. They stood as intercessors, as mediators between the faithful congregation and Christ. Where papal interventions present the donor pope within the space of the apse mosaic, his role is further stressed as an intercessor and mediator for the congregation of the Christian faithful. The pope's position in the apse creates 'another spatial and temporal overlap between the reality shown there and the congregation in the church below'.<sup>21</sup> For example, the depiction of Pope Paschal I in the ninth-century

---

<sup>19</sup> Matt. 16:19.

<sup>20</sup> A. M. Yasin, *Saints and Church Spaces in the Late Antique Mediterranean: Architecture, Cult, and Community* (Cambridge, 2009), at p. 255.

<sup>21</sup> Thunø, *The Apse Mosaic*, pp. 152–6.

apse mosaic of Santa Maria in Domnica places him deliberately in a liminal space, kneeling so that his feet emerge from the frame as he touches the right foot of the Virgin (figure 66). This emphasises his closeness to the congregation of the *Ecclesia Romana*, but also places the donor pope within the hierarchy of mediation: he is what Thunø calls the ‘gateway to the realm of the apse’, the mediator to the saints and to the Virgin who can in turn intercede with Christ.<sup>22</sup> A similar idea of the pope as mediator appears to be depicted in the positioning of the figure of the pope in the *Ecclesia* diagram. The office’s intercessory role is emphasised by the architectural background by which he is framed, and the mirrored gestures shared between the pope and Saint Peter. Tyconius’ ecclesiological reading of the Apocalypse informed and structured modes of public visual representation in late antique and early medieval Rome, and that popes strategised their place within them.

Beyond visual culture, Tyconius’ ecclesiological reading continued to be transmitted through the writings of Bede in eighth-century Northumbria, the approximately contemporary Ambrose Autpert at San Vincenzo al Volturno, and Haimo of Auxerre in ninth-century Francia, among others. Tyconius’ ideas were also disseminated via Bede and Haimo in the compilation of the *Glossa ordinaria*, from c. 1120, and in the mid-twelfth century by Richard of Saint Victor in his reworking of the *Glossa*, which continued to avoid millenarianism and instead adhered to the Tyconian-Augustinian tradition. As Yves Chrste observed, an apparently diminished interest in visual treatments of the Apocalypse in monumental art from the 1170s coincided with a corresponding flourishing in ecclesiological interpretations of the book of Apocalypse in diverse cultural contexts.<sup>23</sup> The twelfth century saw a new phase of papal intervention in Roman apse mosaics, which the pontiffs started to commission again for the first time since the ninth century. S. Clemente boasted a radically innovative apse mosaic commissioned by Pope Paschal II (1099–1118) and completed by 1119, which drew on late antique traditions in order to communicate the reform ideology of the contemporary papacy and its allies in Montecassino (figure 67). The apse itself is

---

<sup>22</sup> Thunø, *The Apse Mosaic*, p. 154.

<sup>23</sup> Y. Chrste, ‘The Apocalypse in The Monumental Art of the Eleventh through Thirteenth Centuries’, in *The Apocalypse in the Middle Ages*, ed. R. K. Emmerson and B. McGinn (London, 1992), pp. 234–58, at p. 237.

dominated by a grid of coiled acanthus vines, with the gaps within and around the vegetal roundels populated by stylised birds, plants, animals and people. These are an evocation of Late Antique iconographies from the early Roman Church. Stefano Riccioni has convincingly argued that the arrangement of these ornamental motifs is a deliberate visual rhetorical device. The apse mosaic is, Riccioni writes, ‘...a diagram’, using techniques derived not only from monumental sources but from manuscripts to guide the viewer to the comprehension of the mosaic with its accompanying inscriptions: ‘a book writ large’.<sup>24</sup>

Innocent II, in the 1130s, commissioned the decoration in Santa Maria in Trastevere (completed 1140–48, see figure 68). The early medieval traditional array of the saints here is supplemented by the central depiction of Christ and Mary crowned together on a jewelled throne, while the figures flanking them are prelates including, on the far left, Pope Innocent II. The wall above the conch, above Christ, depicts a cross with alpha and omega, and the seven candlesticks from the vision of the Son of Man (Apoc. 1: 12–20). Apart from St. Peter, the other prelates are depicted in contemporary clerical costume. This is a depiction of Christ and the Virgin enthroned as the bridegroom and his bride, the *sponsus* and *Ecclesia sponsa* of the Song of Songs. The coronation of the Virgin was a radically innovative iconographic theme in the twelfth century. While this new motif probably reflected a growing popularity in veneration of the Virgin, there is further political significance. In Ursula Nilgen’s important analysis, this mosaic is a statement illustrating the Church returned to Christ, and returned to wholeness, after the Anacletan schism.<sup>25</sup> This imagery, and the new method of using detailed inscriptions to explain the mosaic’s symbolism, articulated the prevailing authority and unity of a Roman Church in the wake of conflict.

---

<sup>24</sup> S. Riccioni, ‘Rewriting Antiquity, Renewing Rome. The Identity of the Eternal City through Visual Art, Monumental Inscriptions and the *Mirabilia*’, *Medieval Encounters*, 17/4–5 (2011), pp. 439–63, at pp. 449–50; id., ‘Segni epigrafici e sistemi illustrativi *alla greca* nel mosaico di San Clemente a Roma’, in *Medioevo mediterraneo: l’Occidente, Bisanzio e l’Islam. Atti del convegno internazionale di Studi, Parma, 21–25 settembre 2004*, ed. A. C. Quintavalle (Milan, 2007), pp. 371–80.

<sup>25</sup> U. Nilgen, ‘*Maria Regina*: Ein politischer Kultbildtypus?’, *Römisches Jahrbuch für Kunstgeschichte*, 19 (1981), pp. 1–33, at p. 30; M. Lawrence, ‘*Maria Regina*’, *Art Bulletin*, 7/4 (1925), pp. 150–161.

The crowned Virgin alongside Christ in the apse mosaic of Santa Maria in Trastevere is an important indicator of a new development in ecclesiological themes in Roman art during this period, connecting to the innovative iconography of the coronation of the Virgin. As we have seen in chapter four, exegesis of the Song of Songs had long interpreted the Bride as Ecclesia, but during the twelfth century, mariological readings of the Song began to flourish. The confluence of mariological and ecclesiological readings allowed the Bride of the Songs to represent Mary. Building on Nilgen's arguments, more recent studies have demonstrated that the iconography of the apse mosaic was influenced by contemporary exegesis, and that the congregation in S. Maria in Trastevere would have understood the enthroned woman as representing both the Church and Mary.<sup>26</sup> The visual vocabulary of the Vercelli *Ecclesia* is evidently part of this flourishing tradition, deploying apocalyptic imagery and contemporary exegetic readings in a depiction of an ecclesiastical structure which is already divine and straddles both heaven and earth. What could be a more powerful way of legitimising ecclesiastical authority, and the hierarchies which depended upon it, than making use of iconographic motifs which had structured so many public and authoritative representations of the existing church, with one foot on earth, one foot in heaven? The twelfth century, however, also saw the flourishing of new modes of reading Apocalypse and new modes of relating to eschatology.

### *The Femininity of the Ecclesia Diagram*

Given the presence of the Coronation of the Virgin as a new iconographic theme in Roman monumental architecture in the twelfth century, and this visual theme's evident importance as a reflection of the political claims of the reform papacy, it is perhaps puzzling that there are no representations of the Virgin in the *Ecclesia* diagram. Yet her presence is conjured by metaphor and allegory. Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) uses a diagrammatic form which connects to late twelfth-century political ideology, in

---

<sup>26</sup> M. Stroll, *Symbols as Power: The Papacy Following the Investiture Contest* (Leiden, 1991), pp. 162–79; Riccioni, 'Rewriting Antiquity, Renewing Rome', pp. 439–463; M. Andaloro and S. Romano, 'L'immagine nell'abside', in *Arte e iconografia a Roma dal tardoantico alla fine del medioevo*, ed. M. Andaloro and S. Romano (Milan, 2002), 89–93.

particular to papal claims of primacy in relation to the investiture of temporal power, which as we have seen is also reflected in contemporary monumental works of art particularly centred in Rome.<sup>27</sup> There are also several compelling feminine attributes given to the figure as a depiction of Ecclesia, who is identified as the Bride of Christ as described in the Song of Songs. Further, the Roman Church is the mother of all Christians, in an image conceived by Pope Gelasius I and taken up again by the reform papacy in the eleventh century.<sup>28</sup>

Our Mother by whose teaching and example we are nourished and suckled.  
Eyes, nose, cheeks and hair of the bridegroom Christ and the Church the bride  
are described in the Song of Songs and elsewhere.<sup>29</sup>

The Church of the *Ecclesia* diagram is ‘our mother’, in an ecclesiological reading of the Song of Songs which was prevalent in the twelfth century and particularly associated with the writings of Bernard of Clairvaux (d. 1153). Attributes such as ‘nurturing’, ‘suckling’, ‘mercy’, and ‘compassion’ compound the maternal imagery associated with the allegorical figure of Ecclesia.<sup>30</sup> However, she is also the ‘the bride’ of the Song of Songs. Bernard did not write a specific Marian commentary, but his sermons contributed to the popularity of this understanding, as Ann Astell has observed.<sup>31</sup> The Marian commentaries on the Song of Songs emerged in the early twelfth century, written by male religious, and were well circulated. These readings of the Song of Songs understood the text as an account of the life of the Virgin and her relationship with her son Jesus, who was the bridegroom. Prior to the twelfth century, the bride of the Song was understood either allegorically as the Church, or tropologically as the soul’s relationship with Christ.<sup>32</sup> Two of the early twelfth-century authors of these innovative commentaries were Rupert of Deutz, Honorius Augustodunensis, and at the end of the century, Alexander Neckam’s (d. 1217) commentary was circulated as the

---

<sup>27</sup> Lawrence, ‘*Maria Regina*’, pp. 150–161.

<sup>28</sup> Gelasius I, *Epistola*, 14. 9, cited by Robinson, ‘Church and Papacy’, at p. 259.

<sup>29</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 18–9.

<sup>30</sup> Appendix 1, l. 27: ‘... et misericordiam Ecclesie que loco iudicii condolet et miseretur.’

<sup>31</sup> A. W. Astell, *The Song of Songs in the Middle Ages* (Ithaca, 1990), p. 44.

<sup>32</sup> Fulton, ‘Mimetic Devotion, Marian Exegesis and the Historical Sense of the Song of Songs’, pp. 85–116, at p. 90.



authoritative Marian reading.<sup>33</sup> Honorius produced the first systematic mariological reading of the Song in his *Sigillum Beatae Mariae*, in the first half of the twelfth century.<sup>34</sup> In this exposition, he writes of the Song of Songs:

The glorious Virgin Mary manifests the type of the Church, which is shown to be both virgin and mother ... Therefore all things which are written about the Church may be sufficiently appropriately read even about her [Mary].<sup>35</sup>

This passage conveys Honorius' sense of a typological equivalence in the interpretation of the bride and her bridegroom in the Song; the bride is the Church and Mary. E. Ann Matter has noted the 'allegorical fluidity' of Honorius' mode of understanding the Song in the *Sigillum*, a text which drew upon a long-established Marian liturgical tradition at a time when devotion to the Virgin was growing.<sup>36</sup> Further, during this century, verses from the Song of Songs were incorporated in the monastic office of the Feast of the Assumption. Returning to the image of the Virgin in the apse mosaic in S. Maria in Trastevere (figure 68), we can see how its makers may have deliberately engaged with this multi-layered and recognisable allegorical interpretation: this was the Mary of the Assumption, the bride of Christ, and therefore the Church too.<sup>37</sup>

Further, the union and love told of by the Song of Songs was also important to twelfth-century understanding of marriage within Christian society. The Song typologically described the marriage of Christ and *Ecclesia*, and was used by commentators such as Hugh of Saint Victor in his *De sacramentis* to elucidate the sacramental meaning of conjugal union.<sup>38</sup> As Ann Astell notes, the swift developments

---

<sup>33</sup> Fulton, 'Mimetic Devotion, Marian Exegesis and the Historical Sense of the Song of Songs', pp. 85–116, at 85–6.

<sup>34</sup> V. I. J. Flint, 'The Commentaries of Honorius Augustodunensis on the Song of Songs', *Revue Bénédictine*, 84/1–2 (1974), pp. 196–211, at pp. 197–200.

<sup>35</sup> 'Gloriosa virgo Maria typum Ecclesia gerit, quae virgo et mater exstitit... Ideo cuncta quae de Ecclesia scribuntur, de ipsa etiam satis congrue leguntur.' Honorius Augustodunensis, *Sigillum beatae Mariae*, PL 172, cols. 495–518, at 499D–500A. Translated as *The Seal of Blessed Mary*, at p. 53.

<sup>36</sup> E. Ann Matter, *The Voice of My Beloved: The Song of Songs in Western Medieval Christianity, Middle Ages* (Philadelphia, 1990), pp. 151–76, at pp. 156–8.

<sup>37</sup> Nilgen, 'Maria regina', pp. 1–33.

<sup>38</sup> See J. Chydenius, *Medieval Institutions and the Old Testament* (Helsinki, 1965).

in expositions of the Song of Songs throughout the twelfth century in turn had an important role in the development of the theology of marriage as a sacrament.<sup>39</sup> We have seen in chapter four how the *Ecclesia* diagram depicts various kinds of sacramental union, through its images of baptism, marriage, ordination, and vows of chastity and continence. I would go further to argue that the diagram, in the framework of allegorical fluidity characteristic of twelfth-century theology, is a representation of sacramental union expressed through the ‘great sign’ of conjugal love. Union is expressed through baptism and the soul’s belonging to the church, to the vows of the cleric, to the contract of marriage, to the bride and the bridegroom who are both represented in the ‘eyes, nose, cheeks and hair’ of the figure’s face. This sense of union is present at every interpretative level of the *Ecclesia*, from microcosm to macrocosm.

### *Joachim of Fiore and the Ecclesia diagram*

However, we have also seen in chapter four how some elements of the *Ecclesia* disrupt this image. We have seen how the presence of themes found in the work of Joachim of Fiore and present on Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore) seem to be imposed upon the coherent image presented by the figure. In the text on the right of the *Ecclesia*, we find reference to the ‘virtuous cosmic woman’, in R. K. Emmerson’s memorable phrase, of Apocalypse 12. 1: ‘Clothed with the sun, and the moon was under her feet, and upon her head was a crown of twelve stars’. We have established in chapter one that the text on the right side of the diagram was added in a different hand, and at a slightly later stage than the text to the left. Nonetheless, this mention of the *mulier amicta sole* connects with the partially legible inscription on the figure’s crown, of which we can read *stellarum duodecim*.<sup>40</sup> This woman is the eschatological figure of Ecclesia. The text on the right of the *Ecclesia* diagram thus relates to this reference in the crown.

*Behold, a woman, clothed with the sun and the moon beneath her feet, etc. She remains in solitude for 1260 days. This is the church, which must stand in the desert of this life for 1260 years, that is from Christ until the death of Antichrist. After those years have elapsed, there will remain, according to Daniel, 45 days. After that the day of judgement will approach. Of those 1260 days, that is years,*

---

<sup>39</sup> Astell, *The Song of Songs in the Middle Ages*, pp. 30–1.

<sup>40</sup> R. K. Emmerson, ‘The Apocalypse in Medieval Culture’, in *The Apocalypse in the Middle Ages*, ed. B. McGinn (London, 1992), at p. 322. Appendix 2, no. 8

1187 have elapsed. Whence it is inferred that the times of the Antichrist and the day of judgement are imminent, so that what is said may be fulfilled: you will see the son of man coming in clouds, with great power and majesty. The period of time, however, which will be from the time of Antichrist until the day of judgement, God alone knows, because nobody knows about this day.<sup>41</sup>

In the *Ecclesia* diagram, we see an image which in form makes use of the Tyconian reading of the Apocalypse, as an allegory for divine authority in heaven mediated by the authority of the papal office and the Roman Church on earth. Further, we have seen how it probably reflects several different strands of innovative twelfth-century theology which relies on a certain allegorical fluidity. The text on the right side of the document adds another layer of complexity to our interpretation. These passages bring a historical, and therefore millenarian, aspect to the Apocalypse and impose this upon the *Ecclesia* diagram. The awareness conveyed by this text that the time of the Antichrist was imminent should affect our understanding of how this manuscript was constructed. We have seen how the *Ecclesia* diagram shares content with Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore) (figures XIII–XIV). All the Joachimist content of the *Ecclesia* was incorporated by Hand C in these passages, indicating an awareness of Joachim's works that seems to reach beyond the works present in Rotoli figurati 7. In the *Genealogia*, Joachim observes that according to his own calculations, the date when he wrote the text (1176) meant that there were just over two generations remaining before the time of the Antichrist would end (42 generations after Christ) around the year 1260.<sup>42</sup> Similarly, the author of the passage above is aware that soon, after the death of Antichrist, and after a space of time, the day of Judgement will come.

The focus on apocalyptic imminence in the thirteenth-century interpretations of Joachim's work perhaps reflects concurrent developments in popular religious culture, which was attentive to a perceived degradation of mankind and critical of the perceived corruption of the institution of the earthly Church. The apocalyptic thought of the Calabrian abbot would have a long, influential legacy. As we have seen, Joachim's thought is present in Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore).<sup>43</sup> In 1935,

---

<sup>41</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 78–88.

<sup>42</sup> Joachim of Fiore, 'Genealogia', in *Die Genealogia*, ed. G.–L. Potestà, at p. 92, ll. 33–36.

<sup>43</sup> See chapter one sections 4–7 for a discussion of Joachim's authentic writings.

Wilhelm Kamlah argued that Joachim of Fiore completely revolutionised Apocalyptic interpretation, disrupting the dominant Tyconian hermeneutic of Apocalyptic and historical understanding to read the Apocalypse instead as a description of the history of mankind and a vision of its end.<sup>44</sup> According to Joachim, the final age of history would usher in the age of the Antichrist and would begin forty-two generations after the birth of Christ, which was calculated to fall around the year 1260. It is the explicit chronological potential of the third status of this historical division that was unique to Joachim, and which stoked apocalyptic expectation. However, it is important to observe here that Joachim did not consider himself a prophet; he had ‘neither prophecy nor conjecture nor revelation’. Instead, he was an exegete to whom God had granted an intellectual gift of spiritual intelligence, a gift which allowed him to understand the truth hidden in scripture.<sup>45</sup>

There seem to be conflicting references to Joachim of Fiore in the *Ecclesia* diagram that cause tension with its other apocalyptic and ecclesiological motifs. In chapter one, I established that there are shared hands at work on both Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). In chapter two we explored the kinds of intellectual communities active in Vercelli in the late twelfth and through the thirteenth century, and presented evidence that these communities had sustained interest in advanced theological thought. It is plausible therefore that the incorporation of Joachimist content into the *Ecclesia* diagram might have been a result of the author having immediate access to the texts now included in Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). A decision was made to borrow text regarding the opening of the seven seals, the persecutions of the Church, and parts of the tree diagrams, from the *Genealogia* and attempts were made to map Joachim’s readings onto the genealogical tree in the centre of the diagram. On the diagram, it is possible to see that the passages of the text on the

---

<sup>44</sup> See Kamlah, *Apokalypse und Geschichtstheologie*.

<sup>45</sup> Joachim purportedly told this to Adam of Persigny, a fellow Cistercian, around 1198. The meeting in Rome was recounted in the *Chronicon Anglicanum* of Ralph of Coggeshall (d. 1305): Ralph of Coggeshall, *Chronicon anglicanum of Radulph de Coggeshall*, ed. J. Stevenson, Rolls Series, 66 (London, 1875), at p. 68. The translation is taken from McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality*, at pp. 99–100. See also C. Egger, ‘A Pope without Successor: Ralph of Coggeshall, Ralph Niger, Robert of Auxerre, and the Early Reception of Joachim of Fiore’s Ideas in England’, in *Joachim of Fiore and the Influence of Inspiration*, ed. J. E. Wannenmacher (Farnham, 2013), pp. 145–81.

right list the seals broadly mapped to events in the Old Testament on the left, and their openings in the New Testament above. The passages of text have been spaced so they are placed adjacent to the correct part of the central genealogical tree (figure VI).

However, the upper part of the text on the right side of the diagram is predominantly concerned with the opening of the sixth and seventh seals. This is because they pertain to the present; Joachim wrote that the age of the sixth seal was about to begin, and would only last a brief period before the seventh and final ‘sabbath’ age would begin. The opening of the fifth seal incorporated the persecution of the Church by the Holy Roman Empire: Joachim was writing and amending the text in the context of the resurgence of conflict between the Hohenstaufen and the popes in the last quarter of the twelfth century. The popes who are listed on the Vercelli version of the *Genealogia* tree diagrams, close to the label indicating the coming of *Christus iudex*, are Alexander III, Lucius III, and Urban III. There is therefore an urgency to these writings that is directly pertinent to the simultaneously living and Apocalyptic vision of the Church which the *Ecclesia* diagram depicts. We can see this urgency elsewhere in the Vercelli version of the *Genealogia*. It includes a list of popes for every generation until the expected end of Joachim’s second age: the final pope listed for the generation of 1170 is Alexander III. A blank space is left next to the subsequent generations of 1200, 1230, and finally 1260.

The text of the *Ecclesia* manuscript, however, in its anxious examination of the details of the opening of the fifth, sixth, and seventh seals, actually gives an internal date of 1187.<sup>46</sup> The text on the left of the figure in the diagram makes a direct reference to a pope Urban, which can therefore be understood to refer to Urban III, in the final year of his pontificate. I have described other views on this dating in detail in the first chapter, but here it suffices to say that the content of this manuscript originates in a time of political conflict and crisis between the popes and the Holy Roman Emperor Frederick Barbarossa. Urban III came into direct conflict with the Emperor during his

---

<sup>46</sup> ‘Of those 1260 days, that is years, 1187 have elapsed. Whence it is inferred that the times of the Antichrist and the day of judgement are imminent, so that what is said may be fulfilled: you will see the son of man coming in clouds, with great power and majesty.’ Appendix 1, ll. 81–4; Appendix 3, ll. 96–9.

short pontificate: indeed, commentators have underlined how weak the papacy was in the last quarter of the twelfth century.<sup>47</sup> Furthermore, it is probable that dramatic geopolitical events shaped Joachim's writing in the year 1187. The second and third crusades occurred during his lifetime, and Joachim's pilgrimage to the Holy Land in his thirties was influential on his decision to join the religious life before he returned to Sicily in the 1150s. Joachim's *Vita* reports that it was in the Holy Land, on Mount Tabor, that he experienced the first of his divine revelations. This first revelation was that of the 'twofold law', which formed the basis for his foundational historical-theology of *concordiae* between the persecutions of the Church and those of the people of Israel.<sup>48</sup> The events of crusading history in the 1180s and 90s surely had an impact upon his conception of an imminent divine intervention. In 1187, the sultan of Egypt, Saladin, took Jerusalem from Christian control. The defeat of the Christian military forces in the holy city, the 'Fall of Jerusalem', resulted in Pope Gregory VIII (r. October–December 1187, whose predecessor was Urban III) issuing an encyclical letter to all of Christendom calling for crusade.<sup>49</sup>

In addition to the city communes, bishops and their entourages in northern Italy (the milieu in which the *Ecclesia* manuscript was produced) were intensely engaged partisans in these conflicts. The Vercelli church supported the pope, and indeed could even have been charged with producing content which asserted papal power. Urban III, who we have seen likely features in Rotoli figurati 4, was briefly bishop of Vercelli in

---

<sup>47</sup> Morris, *The Papal Monarchy*, at pp. 200–1.

<sup>48</sup> Details from the life of Joachim are taken from H. Grundmann's edition of the *Vita. b. Joachimi abbatis [Vita]*, published at pp. 528–539 of: H. Grundmann, 'Zur Biographie Joachims von Fiore und Rainers von Ponza', *DA*, 16 (1960), pp. 437–546. Reprinted as: 'Zur Biographie Joachims von Fiore und Rainers von Ponza', in *Ausgewählte Aufsätze*, Schriften der Monumenta Germaniae Historica, 25, 3 vols (Stuttgart, 1976), 1, pp. 255–360. The *Vita* is generally agreed to be a work of a *socius* who joined Joachim at Corazzo (when Joachim was abbot), and then accompanied him to S. Giovanni in Fiore. It is therefore likely to contain some firsthand knowledge and to have been written shortly after Joachim's death. For a more recent scholarly account of the life of Joachim, see Potestà, *Il tempo dell'Apocalisse*. A. Gatto offers an up-to-date chapter on Joachim's life and works in the important new collected volume edited by M. Riedl: A. Gatto, 'The Life and Works of Joachim: An Overview', in *A Companion to Joachim of Fiore*, ed. M. Riedl (Leiden, 2017), pp. 20–40.

<sup>49</sup> B. Bombi, 'Papal Legates and Their Preaching of the Crusades in England between the Twelfth and the Thirteenth Centuries', in *Legati, Delegati e l'impresa d'Oltremare (Secoli XII–XIII)*, ed. M. P. Alberzoni and P. Montaubin (Turnhout, 2014), pp. 211–61.

1183 to 1184, before he took over the archbishop's seat of Milan and then became pope. His successor was Alberto Avogadro, who would be bishop of Vercelli from 1185 until 1205. We can be certain that if the the *Ecclesia* diagram *was* conceived of in Vercelli, then it was produced under Alberto's episcopate or shortly after. Bulls issued by Urban III indicate that the pope continued to maintain a protective interest in the Vercelli diocese, doubtless because of its strategic importance in his conflict with Frederick Barbarossa. Urban III therefore represents important links between his papacy and the Vercelli see, which would have been a crucial influence for the ideological basis of the *Ecclesia* manuscript in the cathedral chapter.

Under Alberto's episcopate a chair in theology was instituted at the already extant cathedral school, the organisation of which was entrusted to a great lawyer and theologian of S. Eusebio: Canon Cotta.<sup>50</sup> He also bequeathed his library to the canons of S. Eusebio, including a copy of Peter Lombard's *Sententiae* written only a generation before, and still held at the Biblioteca Capitolare.<sup>51</sup> Studies by Paolo Rosso among others have argued that Cotta studied in Paris, and was in contact with Peter Lombard and those in the circle of Thomas Becket, such as Herbert Bosham and Gerard de la Pucelle, who are cited in Cotta's will.<sup>52</sup> Certainly, Bishop Alberto and Canon Cotta were part of a cultural milieu linked to the papal court through Alberto and to the intellectual advances of the university of Paris through Cotta.

Bernard McGinn has called the papal reforms that occurred from 1073 and the pontificate of Gregory VII, to the death of Innocent III in 1216, 'geopolitical' in their scope. The transformation of the papacy in this period was certainly profound, from a relatively localised institution into an international political power, capable of launching crusading parties across the seas and establishing itself, in principle and to a significant extent in practice, as the centre of ecclesiastical government and jurisdiction for the whole of Western Christendom.<sup>53</sup> Joachim of Fiore was encouraged in his early work by Urban III, whom he visited in Verona in 1186. What is crucial for the *Ecclesia*

---

<sup>50</sup> 'Doctor doctissimus' and 'ad sepulcrum quondam domini Cottae de Tronzano canonici cardinalis ecclesiae Vercellensis sacrae theologiae professoris'. See chapter two, above, and Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, at p. 100.

<sup>51</sup> C. Frova, 'Teologia a Vercelli alla fine del secolo XII: i libri del canonico Cotta', pp. 311–33.

<sup>52</sup> Rosso, *Studio e poteri*, pp. 99–101.

<sup>53</sup> McGinn, 'Joachim of Fiore and the Twelfth-Century Papacy', pp. 15–34.

diagram's use of apocalyptic visual vocabulary is the attempt to map Joachim's thought in a novel way onto an image that draws from monumental art in the Tyconian tradition. Joachim's hermeneutic of history, as we have seen from the text of his *Genealogia*, and the focus on the opening of the fifth, sixth, and seventh seals in the *Ecclesia* diagram, uses the relation of popes and emperors to interpret how contemporary events connected with the events to come before Judgement Day. He thereby placed the papacy at the centre of historical events; this was an innovative theology, which may have had great attractive power to the popes themselves. Joachim of Fiore recognized, as Bernard McGinn has observed, that the role of the pope in the last days needed clarifying. His theological hermeneutic placed the papacy at the heart of the events of the end times. We have seen how Joachim made statements during his lifetime which demonstrate his rejection of the status of prophet. Rather, his gift of spiritual intelligence gave him the means to understand what was already present in scripture. Even in his use of the year-day principle and his brilliant numerical concordances, Joachim shied away from predicting the specific dates of Apocalyptic time. However, it is clear that he was writing with the conviction that less than a century remained before the events of the end times would come. His method of exegesis allowed a greater understanding of how the divine plan would be played out in the lead up to this period. The abbot's perceived knowledge of the vital role of the Petrine See in these times came, as we have seen, in a period when the papacy was finding new ways to assert its supreme spiritual authority.

## *Conclusion*

Like the monumental statements of intercessory authority found in apse mosaics and monumental artworks of twelfth-century Rome, the *Ecclesia* diagram has its origins in a period when the papacy was struggling to define a new ideology of its power. This diagram makes an explicit claim for the pope as the custodian both of the teaching of St Paul and the power and authority conferred on St Peter. In the combined ecclesiological and eschatological strands of the *Ecclesia* diagram we witness a moment of profound anxiety in the papacy which is conversely reflected in its triumphalist tone. The diagram was made at a time when the Apocalyptic readings of Tyconius, transmitted into the late twelfth century, and seen in medieval visual culture in the twelfth-century



interventions to Roman apse mosaics, were confronted with an alternative, Apocalyptic-historical vision as propounded by Joachim. This diagram draws on motifs which we can also see used in monumental art, to create a vision of the Church which is both earthly and eternal, and which at the same time attempts to map onto this a new interpretation of history through the thought of Joachim of Fiore. The maker of this image reached into both the past and the present to find an iconographical language of sufficient authority to support the great claims made at a time of conflict by the pope and by his allies, including the bishop of Vercelli. They did so in response to a period of intense political crisis and conflict with competing jurisdictions.

This therefore is the immediate context which informs the powerful statement of papal authority as a way of organising the civic and religious body of the Church on earth which is made by the *Ecclesia* diagram. That the authors of this statement chose to draw upon a reading of the Apocalypse which played down its eschatological imminence — the tradition originating with Tyconius — demonstrates the strong purchase and the great power of that tradition as a way of understanding the structure of temporal and spiritual order and authority. A diagram like this supplies a link between the ideology of power and the world in which that power was exercised. It takes the Apocalyptic visual motifs of monumental art in churches in which popes enacted their daily routines and ecclesiastical rites and rituals, and disseminated these images across the peninsula within a different context which repeats and transforms them, adumbrated by and integrated with authoritative texts. The ecclesiological interpretation of Apocalypse, traditionally associated with monumental art, which makes use of a reinvented late antique tradition, emerged at a moment of tension as it was reinterpreted and placed in combination with novel interpretations of history. We have seen from comparison with Cotton Roll XIV. 12 that the Vercelli *Ecclesia* has been uniquely augmented by the addition of its Joachimist commentary and central tree figure. This material adds a temporal and millenarian dimension which less evident in the ecclesiological diagram as it was originally conceived, a dimension which resonates against the existing diagrammatic form. The *Ecclesia* diagram therefore stands as a vital witness to how new and existing traditions of understanding time and ecclesiology were drawn on, in an attempt to define authority during the political struggles between pope and emperor at the turn of the twelfth and thirteenth centuries.

In this chapter we have presented evidence which suggests that the *Ecclesia* diagram and Rotoli figurati 7 not only have iconographic details and thematic concerns which reflect late twelfth century interests, but that these interests are also strongly evident in the context of late twelfth-century Vercelli. In the following chapter, we will return to the city of Vercelli, but in the third quarter of the thirteenth century, the period in which all of the Rotoli figurati were copied. The late twelfth-century ecclesiological and eschatological motifs reflected in Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore) had developed, but were still evidently of value to the intellectual communities associated with the cathedral of S. Eusebio. In the case of Joachim of Fiore, understandings of his interpretation of history and Apocalypse had become intertwined with events which drove profound social and religious change throughout the Italian peninsula and beyond. The reception of these kinds of motifs therefore changed, and in the case of the Rotoli figurati, an early fourteenth century note is direct evidence of this. The next chapter begins with this note, and proceeds to examine how events driven by Joachite interpretations of history and Apocalyptic time had an immediate and perhaps frightening relevance to the copyists of the Rotoli figurati, and the inhabitants of Vercelli.

## 6 Joachim of Fiore and Dolcino of Novara: the changing reception of the Rotoli figurati, c. 1187 to 1307

Noli vexari finem hic querere mundi.  
Fantasia ista vana est atque falsa.  
Namque si vera foret iam dudum mundus abesset.

Quia anno Domini MCCLXo completa debent esse omnia que dicuntur de Antichristo et de consumatione seculi secundum Iohacistas, ut patet in descriptione, cum tamen modo currat annus domini MCCCVII. q.<sup>1</sup>

Do not trouble yourself with lamenting the end of the world here. This fantasy is vain and also false. For if this were true, then already, some little time ago, the world would be gone. Because in the year of the Lord 1260 should have been completed all things which are said about the Antichrist and about the finishing of the world according to the Joachists, as is laid clear in this diagram, when however just now it is the year of our Lord 1307. q.

This extraordinary polemical note is found on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), the manuscript containing three authentic works by Joachim of Fiore (figure XIV).<sup>2</sup> The writer has used the term *Iohacistas* (Joachists), to describe a group who were evidently vocal about the imminent end of the world and the coming of Antichrist.<sup>3</sup> It

---

<sup>1</sup> ACVC, Rotoli figurati, 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), dorse.

<sup>2</sup> See chapter one, section 7.

<sup>3</sup> The terms *Ioachistas*, *Iohacistas* or *Ioachita* or *Iohacite* were used variously in the thirteenth century as an identifier of those who displayed a positive interest in Joachim or his thought, and later, as we see here, became a negative term. It is important to remember that a diverse range of work was attributed to the abbot in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. M. Reeves suggested that Salimbene de Adam of Parma had invented the term, with his phrases *maximum Ioachista*, and *maximi Iohacite*. See M. Reeves, 'The Originality and Influence of Joachim of Fiore', *Traditio*, 36 (1980), pp. 269–316, at p. 299; Salimbene de Adam, *Cronica*, ed. G. Scalia, CCCM, 125–125A, 2 vols (Turnhout, 1998). Scholars concerned with differentiating 'Joachite' or 'Joachimist' according to particular understandings of the abbot's authentic works use different and specific definitions, but there is no concrete agreement about which term should be used. Reeves used Salimbene's term 'Joachite' to mean those who were committed disciples to Joachim's Trinitarian doctrine of history; 'Joachimist' as a broader adjective encompassing different degrees of his influence on ideas or writings, in: Reeves, 'Originality and Influence', at p. 297). B. McGinn uses these terms differently: 'Joachite' for texts or ideas influenced by a body

also associates these ‘Joachists’ directly with the works of Joachim found on the manuscript.<sup>4</sup> However, this group were fantasists engaging in ‘false’ apocalyptic speculation: the world should have ended in the year 1260 if the Apocalypse had indeed proceeded as the *descriptio* — evidently a reference to the *Figura arboris* of the *Genealogia* — lays out. Instead, the world still turned in the year 1307. The message is an emphatic warning to any potential reader, and is placed in such a way as to be visible when the document is rolled. We can therefore wonder, to what audience(s) was this note directed? To a novice or an educated cleric, who might be misled by its contents, or perhaps to a potentially critical figure, who might see this document as evidence of heterodox thought within the community of S. Eusebio? The latter can be no more than speculation, but this note was directed to a reader with potential interest in the manuscript, in the year 1307, most plausibly at the cathedral of S. Eusebio in Vercelli. And yet, this proscription was not sufficient incentive for the manuscript to be destroyed: its contents were apparently valued beyond this potential link to Joachite

---

of ideas claiming Joachim as their source, and ‘Joachimist’ for those works which are true reflections of Joachim’s authentic thought and writings. See B. McGinn, ‘The Abbot and the Doctors: Scholastic Reactions to the Radical Eschatology of Joachim of Fiore’, *Church History*, 40 (1971), pp. 30–47. I will follow R. E. Lerner and use the term ‘Joachite’ to refer to those who engaged with the ‘thought family’ of ideas, thoughts, and writings associated with or attributed to Joachim of Fiore. Some of the characteristics of this thought family were a belief in a trinitarian pattern of three governing the unfolding salvation history, and the imminent arrival of a final age of the Holy Spirit. See R. E. Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham: Medieval Millenarians and the Jews* (Philadelphia, 2001), at p. 120. This use of the term also incorporates the meaning I understand by the attribution of the term in the note on Rotoli figurati 7, a belief in the imminent beginning of the end times, and the role of the figure of Antichrist within that period. However, I also acknowledge that some recent scholarship has argued for a more nuanced reading of Joachim’s dominance in thirteenth- and fourteenth-century apocalyptic and prophetic texts, and calls for a less general use of the term Joachite as it overlooks other biblical scholars of Joachim’s time and after. B. Fitzgerald has recently argued for a reexamination of the prophetic work of those centuries, and instead to view Joachim’s influence in the broader intellectual context of the period. Fitzgerald has instead examined prophetic speculation as a development in hermeneutic methodology, beginning in the Paris schools in the late twelfth century; B. D. Fitzgerald, *Inspiration and Authority in the Middle Ages: Prophets and Their Critics from Scholasticism to Humanism* (Oxford, 2017), at pp. 1–16. I will use the term ‘Joachite’, for the purposes of addressing Rotoli figurati 4 and 7, with the understanding that this necessarily oversimplifies the intellectual climate of interest in similar themes.

<sup>4</sup> Given that Rotoli figurati 7 contains a contemporary rubric indicating authorship (*Epistola Joachim*), it is plausible that the note writer understood this manuscript as a collection of the authentic works of Joachim of Fiore.

apocalyptic speculation in the early fourteenth century. What was happening in the local context of Vercelli at this time to concern the annotator enough to leave this note in the first place? This short text supplies us with a polemical perspective with which to examine the changing reception of the *Rotoli figurati* over time. With its heightened language and employment of rhetorical devices to demonstrate falsity and error, this note is evidently an example of clerical anti-heretical writing established by the mid-thirteenth century.<sup>5</sup> The note extends our relevant timeframe for examining the group from the late twelfth into the first decade of the fourteenth century, and tells us that we must examine the year 1307 in particular for relevant contextual information. We can infer that the Joachite content of *Rotoli figurati* 7 (and therefore the Joachite content of *Rotoli figurati* 4 (*Ecclesia*), too) was perceived as a potential source for speculation about the end of the world for a heterodox group referred to as the *Joachists*. This group purportedly believed that the end of the world was imminent, and the arrival of Antichrist was an essential part of this belief. However, the world did not end in 1260 according to their expectations, which the sceptical annotator understood to be laid out in the manuscript *Rotoli figurati* 7. The fact that this note was left also suggests that 1307 was a year in which these issues —Joachism and prophetic apocalyptic speculation— were a cause of anxiety, particularly in clerical centres in northern Italy, despite the year of the end having passed. An evident reason for this particular anxiety is that at this very time Joachim and his works were perceived as potentially heretical, and widely associated with heterodox movements and activity.

We have previously seen how the late twelfth century provides a plausible context for the images and ideas contained in *Rotoli figurati* 4 (*Ecclesia*) and 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore). We have also seen that these manuscripts were probably copied in the third quarter of the thirteenth century, and have examined the textured historical context of Vercelli in this period in chapter two. Vercelli in the thirteenth century was a wealthy urban centre, with links to the papacy, a strategic city influenced by both papal and imperial political interests. It was long a site of transalpine cultural exchange and intellectual activity. The advanced cathedral school at S. Eusebio possessed a chair in

---

<sup>5</sup> See L. J. Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Century: The Textual Representations* (York, 2011), pp. 1–11.

theology with connections to Paris in the late twelfth century, and from the 1220s the Victorine canons had an educated community at the abbey of S. Andrea. From 1228, the city had negotiated a contract to accommodate a university *studium*, active in the city until after 1260. Reportedly from the 1220s, and certainly from the 1230s, Vercelli was also a home to the Franciscan and Dominican orders, with established convent schools, and educated individuals from both orders active in the city. The interaction between these different communities and their various intellectual approaches presents a vibrant and complex cultural milieu.<sup>6</sup> We have discussed in the previous chapter the radical new ways of understanding and approaching the book of the Apocalypse and consequent upheavals in eschatology and apocalypticism that arose in the second half of the twelfth century. The thought of Joachim of Fiore was undoubtedly central to these changes and developments, and his important legacy and influence into the thirteenth century (and beyond) has been widely acknowledged. In the realms of eschatology, apocalypticism, and prophecy, his name and his authentic and spurious works were invoked so often—if only to dismiss his work as heretical or incorrect—that he is a near-constant figure not only in the intellectual developments of the mendicant orders and university theology, but also in political discourse. As Marjorie Reeves and Morton Bloomfield first traced, his influence is visible across western Europe well beyond the middle ages.<sup>7</sup>

Although Joachim was certainly endorsed within the Church until his death in 1202, his orthodoxy first came under doubt at the Fourth Lateran Council in 1215, which specifically condemned his work on the Trinity. Authentic unproscribed works and other Joachite writings created by his order of Fiore were disseminated in response to this conciliar condemnation, and his popularity rose again in the 1220s, particularly among the mendicant orders, for which he had particular importance. From the 1250s, speculative prophecy and apocalypticism influenced by Joachim's thought and historical

---

<sup>6</sup> See chapter two above. See also Jaeger, *The Envy of Angels*; J. W. Baldwin, *Masters, Princes, and Merchants: The Social Views of Peter the Chanter and His Circle*, 2 vols (Princeton, NJ, 1970).

<sup>7</sup> Reeves, *Influence*; ead. 'Originality and Influence', pp. 269–316; M. Reeves and W. Gould, *Joachim of Fiore and the Myth of the Eternal Evangel in the Nineteenth Century* (Oxford, 1987); M. W. Bloomfield and M. Reeves, 'The Penetration of Joachism into Northern Europe', *Speculum*, 29/4 (1954), pp. 772–93.

theology, and by spurious works circulating under his name, were not only controversially present in elite intellectual and scholarly communities, but were central to changes in popular religious movements.<sup>8</sup> Broadly, the term ‘Joachists’ seems to indicate those who were (or who were thought to be) openly enthusiastic of Joachim and his writing, and who might also have appropriated some or all of his historical theology, including spurious texts associated with the abbot. The term also became linked to the division that formed in the Franciscan order during the thirteenth century, in relation to those in the order who wished to remain observant of the ideals of absolute poverty practised by Francis of Assisi, the Franciscan Spirituals. In the last quarter of the thirteenth and the first decades of the fourteenth century, the division between the spirituals and the so-called conventuals within the Franciscan order became increasingly fraught. These tensions were exacerbated by the connections —real or perceived— which the Franciscan spirituals maintained with popular religious movements and with other more radical groups.<sup>9</sup> Some elements of Joachite theology were undoubtedly adopted by some in the Franciscan order in the first fifty years of its spread and success. As Joachite apocalyptic expectation infused, in diverse ways, many popular religious movements, the link between Joachim’s works and heterodox religious behaviour became clearer. Scholars of Joachism now predominantly reject attempts to trace close links between Joachim of Fiore’s genuine works and their interpretation by later heterodox groups.<sup>10</sup> However, in the note on the dorse of our manuscript, we read a direct indication that clerics active in the first decade of the fourteenth century perceived a direct connection between authentic works of Joachim and the heterodox fantasies of *Iohacistas*.<sup>11</sup>

To illuminate as far as possible the changing reception of the Joachite manuscripts in Vercelli through the thirteenth and early fourteenth century (Rotoli

---

<sup>8</sup> F. Andrews, ‘The Influence of Joachim in the 13th Century’, in *A Companion to Joachim of Fiore*, ed. M. Riedl (Leiden, 2017), pp. 190–266.

<sup>9</sup> D. Burr examines Salimbene’s use of the term alongside ‘Spiritual’ in: *The Spiritual Franciscans*, at pp. 284–6.

<sup>10</sup> See E. R. Daniel, ‘Apocalyptic Conversion: The Joachite Alternative to the Crusades’, *Traditio*, 25 (1969), pp. 127–54; id. ‘Origins of Franciscan Joachitism’, pp. 671–6.

<sup>11</sup> In this case ‘Joachist’ is not being used as a generic term, in the same way that *patarene* might have been used in the early middle ages, or *beguin* in the late thirteenth century. See Russell, *Dissent and Order in the Middle Ages*, at pp. 72–3.

figurati 4, and Rotoli figurati 7), this chapter will use the themes selected by the note as a framework. This will necessarily take a highly selective view of a century of religious and cultural change across western Europe and the Italian peninsula. We must consider aspects of the reception and influence of Joachim of Fiore, and the later role of his works and thought in heterodox controversies. As these subjects are too broad for the scope of the chapter, they will be addressed as they are directly relevant to the source manuscripts, with the aim of further enriching our understanding of how these manuscripts were copied and understood so close to the apocalyptic year of 1260. The chapter will begin with a brief look at Joachim's authority in the years after his death, considering the widespread belief in the year 1260 as the date of the Apocalypse, and with the role of the Antichrist (and in parallel the figure of an angelic pope) in Joachite thought. The abbot became inextricably linked with these themes wherever they arose in prophetic and apocalyptic speculation, partially accounting for the use of the epithet 'Joachist' being used negatively and applied to a diverse array of speculative thought. Joachim's influence on changes in religious practice is perhaps reflected most strongly in the way the mendicant orders and the Franciscans co-opted his thought. Apostolic poverty, and movements deriving from that premise, are crucial to the association of Joachim's thought with radical and sometimes dissenting religious groups. We will therefore discuss influential figures within these groups, Gerardo of Borgo San Donnino in Paris, Gerardo Segarelli in Parma, and finally Dolcino of Novara, whose execution for heresy occurred in Vercelli in the year 1307.

Furthermore, the chapter will aim to foreground how aspects of Joachite historical theology were used to frame contemporary events in apocalyptic terms, so that his writings and figures became highly politicised in broader papal and imperial discourse. Interpretations of Joachim's writings could be used to legitimise total re-imaginings of the structure of Church and society, or to justify the importance of particular religious orders, or declare that a pope or an emperor was the envisaged Antichrist of the Apocalypse. Joachim's name, by 1307, had therefore become intrinsically associated with violent heretical groups, and examining his texts came with the risk of dangerous heterodoxy. How did this changing reception develop over the intervening century? The question is covered by the depth and range of scholarship on medieval heresy over the thirteenth century, and in particular by scholarly attention to



the rise of popular religious groups offering alternatives to the structural hierarchy of the Church and active in the south of France and the Italian peninsula, such as the Cathars. For the purposes of this study, it is necessary to select certain crucial events in the history of Joachim's heterodoxy, as it were, as they allow us to discern a changing reception of visual theology over the period which is directly pertinent to the inherent diagrammatic quality of the Rotoli figurati. Arguably, the visual nature of Joachim's symbolic thought itself provided a cause for concern for the institutional Church, in as much as that visual symbolism inspired the apocalyptic interpretations of his thought by popular religious groups. An examination of the radical and subversive shapes that these themes took over the century will lead us back to the note on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7, and its likely relationship to the violent events which took place in Vercelli in 1307.

### *Joachim's Orthodoxy*

During his lifetime, Joachim was perceived as an orthodox monk who had received a divine gift for scriptural exegesis and spiritual visions. By the 1260s, however, Joachim's works were associated with prophecies and heretical apocalypticism which threatened to destabilise the effective jurisdiction of the institutional Church. This double historical identity can be examined through the evidence of the changing reception of Joachim's thought in the Rotoli figurati. Joachim did not see himself as a prophet, and we have evidence of this from an answer he gave to Adam of Persigny, who questioned the source of his predictions. Joachim replied that he had no gift of prophecy, 'but that God who once gave the spirit of prophecy to the prophets has given me the spirit of understanding to grasp with great clarity in His Spirit all the mysteries of sacred scripture, just as the prophets who once produced it in God's Spirit understood these mysteries.'<sup>12</sup> He had been gifted, he said, with a new exegetical understanding, founded on a hermeneutic theory balanced between biblical typology and analogy, and he called typology *concordia* or concordance.<sup>13</sup> This is not to say that Joachim did not see himself

---

<sup>12</sup> B. McGinn, *Apocalyptic Spirituality*, p.100, cited from Ralph of Coggeshall, *English Chronicle*, Rolls Series, 66, p. 68.

<sup>13</sup> Twelfth-century exegesis took four Augustinian categories of sense meaning at its basis: literal, allegorical/doctrinal, moral/tropological, anagogical/spiritual. See chapter 3.

in a time of impending crisis: as his letters make clear, Joachim saw his as a desperate time in the history of salvation. He received the encouragement of three popes, and papal recognition and encouragement for his works. There is convincing evidence that Joachim endeavoured to submit his works for papal examination and authorisation, and should thus be an orthodox figure operating with endorsement from the Church. As described in the previous chapter, Pope Urban III renewed Joachim's papal dispensation to write. Earlier, in 1184 at Veroli, Joachim had demonstrated to Pope Lucius III that God had given him the form of the *concordia*, which would underpin his historical theology, and he had further demonstrated his spiritual understanding by commenting on a supposed prophetic text discovered in the possession of Cardinal Matthew of Anders, using his hermeneutic theory and the double system of persecutions in the Old and New Testaments (*De prophetia ignota*).<sup>14</sup> Later, in 1188, Pope Clement III wrote to Joachim from Rome, encouraging him to complete the *Expositio in Apocalypsim*, and the *Liber de concordia*, and submit them for inspection to the papal court. A copy of the letter from Clement III is included in two manuscripts of Joachim's *Liber de concordia*, no doubt as a demonstration of its papal endorsement and authoritative orthodoxy.<sup>15</sup> In 1196, Pope Celestine III (r. 1191–98) issued a bull that approved the constitutions of the Order of Fiore (the Florentians) and the foundation of the abbey church of San Giovanni in Fiore.<sup>16</sup> The life of his works and his reputation after the abbot's death were therefore sustained and propagated by the papally approved order which he founded (the constitutions of which have not survived). It is likely, given Joachim's former membership of the Cistercian order, that the Florentians took these constitutions as a basis, presumably making them stricter. The order expanded rapidly after 1196 and was given papal support in the first half of the thirteenth century.<sup>17</sup>

---

<sup>14</sup> The text is edited by M. Kaup in: Joachim of Fiore, 'De prophetia ignota', in *Scripta breviora*, ed. M. Kaup (Rome, 2014), pp. 29–90. See also Gatto, 'The Life and Works of Joachim', pp. 20–40.

<sup>15</sup> The letter is edited in E. R. Daniel's partial edition of the *Liber de concordia*. Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de Concordia*, at p. 3.

<sup>16</sup> The fundamental study of Joachim's life is Grundmann, 'Biographie', pp. 437–546. This has to some extent been superseded by G.-L. Potestà's biography of Joachim: *Il tempo dell'Apocalisse*.

<sup>17</sup> See V. De Fraja, 'Joachim the Abbot: Monastic Reform and the Foundation of the Florentian Order', in *A Companion to Joachim of Fiore*, ed. M. Riedl (Leiden, 2017), pp. 109–143.

Joachim's interviews and relationships with kings and emperors indicate that he was held in high esteem by both papal and secular authorities. This is crucial to understanding the political context of Joachim's thought during his lifetime, and partially accounts for the overall longevity of his orthodox influence during the period covered by this chapter. An exceptional source for Joachim's interactions with secular leaders is Roger Howden, who records the abbot's meeting with Richard I of England.<sup>18</sup> In the winter of 1190/1, Joachim met Richard at Messina in Sicily on the latter's return from his negotiations with Saladin. Howden's account of this meeting is important, because it reveals that Joachim's gift of prophecy was at that time respected as a means of analysing the Apocalypse, and of understanding history through a spiritually gifted form of exegesis.<sup>19</sup> Joachim offered his exegesis of St John's vision of the seven-headed Dragon. Five of the heads were understood as historical persecutors of the Church: Herod, Nero, Constantius, Mohammed, and Meselmut.<sup>20</sup> The sixth was the current persecutor, Saladin, who three years prior had taken Jerusalem from Christian military forces. Of the seventh and final head, Joachim expounded that this head was Antichrist, and that he had already been born in the city of Rome and that he would obtain the papal see. Reportedly, Richard I responded that Clement III was the pseudo-pope of Joachim's prophecy. Each named head stood as a representative symbol of an entire epoch of the Church. Alexander Patschovsky has convincingly argued that the symbolic function of each figure explains the variation and interchangeability of the names in the

---

<sup>18</sup> This main source for this meeting is the *Chronica* (1201/1202) of Roger Howden, who accompanied Richard in the Holy Land during the Third Crusade and wrote that the King had heard of Joachim's fame and gift at prophecy and wished to meet him. M. Reeves argued convincingly for this account's authenticity, in: *Influence*, at pp. 6–10. Reeves cites the account from Roger of Howden, *Chronica Magistri Rogeri de Houedene*, ed. W. Stubbs, Rolls Series, 51, 4 vols (London), vol. 3, pp. 75–9.

<sup>19</sup> See Grundmann, 'Biographie', pp. 499–501; Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de Concordia*, pp. xiii–xx.

<sup>20</sup> *Meselmutus* refers to the title given to the ruler of Morocco during the twelfth-century Berber *Almohad* dynasty, which conquered north Africa and much of the Iberian peninsula in 1195. See A. Patschovsky, 'The Holy Emperor Henry the First' as One of the Dragon's Heads of Apocalypse: On the Image of the Roman Empire under German Rule in the Tradition of Joachim of Fiore', *Viator*, 29 (1998), pp. 291–322, at p. 302, n. 39. See also id. 'Semantics of Mohammed and Islam in Joachim of Fiore', in *Conflict and Religious Conversation in Latin Christendom: Studies in Honour of Ora Limor*, ed. I. J. Yuval and R. Ben-Shalom (Turnhout, 2014), at pp. 117–8.

tradition.<sup>21</sup> The king purportedly challenged the abbot's understanding with the traditional story of the rise of Antichrist from Babylon. In the *Concordia*, and the *Genealogia*, Joachim presents Rome as the *noua Babilon*. This is juxtaposed with the Church as the *noua Ierusalem*. Rome as the 'new Babylon' refers to the city as a symbolic secular kingdom, representative of the Roman *Imperium*.<sup>22</sup> In his claim that this Antichrist of the imminent final *status* of the Holy Spirit would reach papal office, we learn that Joachim expected a pseudo-pope. Marjorie Reeves also identified this image in his authentic work, the *Expositio in Apocalypsim*. Joachim describes 'some great prelate', who will control 'the beast that ascends from the earth... Who opposes and exalts over everything that is called God'.<sup>23</sup>

### *The Condemnation of Joachim's Trinitarian Theology at the Fourth Lateran Council (1215)*

After Joachim's death, the disagreement, of which the abbot had written in his lifetime, with certain aspects of the work of the Paris master Peter Lombard (d. 1160), was perceived to be of sufficient seriousness to be a matter for examination at the Fourth Lateran Council of 1215. The intellectual examination of the dispute at the Council resulted in an official condemnation of Joachim's response to the Lombard as heterodox:

We therefore condemn and reject the little book or treatise which the abbot Joachim published against master Peter Lombard on the unity or essence of the Trinity, in which he calls him a heretic and a madman because he wrote in his *Sentences*: 'There is a supreme reality which is Father, Son and Holy Spirit, and it does not beget, neither is it begotten, nor does it proceed.' From which he asserts that Peter Lombard makes God not so much a Trinity as a quaternity,

---

<sup>21</sup> Patschovsky, 'The Holy Emperor', pp. 291–322, at pp. 306–7.

<sup>22</sup> Reeves, *Influence*, at pp. 7–9. This juxtaposition is given full visual expression in the diagram of Babylon/Rome in the *Liber figurarum*, and: A. Patschovsky, 'Il diagramma di Gioacchino da Fiore dei due alberi Gerusalemme-Babilonia ed Ecclesia-Roma', *Florentia*, 16/17 (2002), pp. 7–21.

<sup>23</sup> Reeves, *Influence*, at p. 9. Joachim of Fiore, *Expositio in Apocalypsim*, repr. Venice [1527], ed. F. Bindoni (Frankfurt, 1964). Reeves highlights the following passage from fol. 168r, commenting on Apocalypse 13:11: *Sic verisimile videtur quod, sicut Bestia illa quae ascendit de mari habitura est quendam magnum regem de secta sua, qui sit similis Neronis, et quasi imperator totius orbis. Ita Bestia quae ascendet de terra habitura sit quendam magnu[m] prelatum, qui sit similis Symonis Magi, et quasi universalis pontifex in tot[e] orbe terrarium, et ipse sit ille Antichristus de quo dicit Paulus, 'Quod extollitur et adversatur supra omne quod dicitur Deus' (2 Thess. 2:8).*

that is to say three persons and a common essence, a sort of fourth [...].<sup>24</sup>

Joachim's condemnation has been explained in the intellectual context of the increasingly educated cardinalate of Innocent III, which strengthened connections between Rome and the university milieu of Paris. Educated theologians in the upper echelons of papal government were able to formally discredit, as Fiona Robb points out, any development in doctrinal theology that might challenge their own view.<sup>25</sup> Peter Lombard had examined the distinctions between nature and person in the Trinity, constructing an argument against any understanding that the Trinitarian persons could be constructed as numerical parts of a whole. One aspect of this part of Lombard's theology offered a modification to Augustine on the divine essence of the Trinity, warning against the consequential understanding of this divine essence as existing on a different 'level of being from Them [the Trinitarian persons], and one more fundamental or abstract'. Rather, Lombard's arguments construct a picture of the divine essence as inextricably possessed and shared identically in the Trinity.<sup>26</sup> It was felt by his critics that Joachim radically misinterpreted Peter Lombard on the above point, instead believing that the Parisian scholar's theology led to the heretical creation of a *quaternity* from the divine essence, in addition to the persons of the Trinity. Another aspect of the dispute is that Joachim had strong antischolastic attitudes, which led him to be hostile to Peter Lombard's methodology, as it introduced theoretical aspects into theology which did not have a direct source in patristic literature, or in scripture.<sup>27</sup> He vociferously

---

<sup>24</sup> The conciliar examination of the dispute is edited in the first two canons of the Council. The text of the Council is edited in Alberigo, Joannou and Leonardi, *Conciliorum Oecumenicorum Decreta*, pp. 231–2. It is translated in H. Rothwell, *English Historical Documents, 1189–1327* (London, 1996), III, pp. 661–3. The translation here is cited from Tanner, *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*, I, at pp. 213–3. See also F. Robb, 'The Fourth Lateran Council's Definition of Trinitarian Orthodoxy', *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 48/1 (1997), pp. 22–43.

<sup>25</sup> Nearly half of the thirty cardinals created under Innocent III used the title *magister* or had completed extensive study at the emerging universities. Robb, 'Trinitarian Orthodoxy', at p. 24. Innocent III was not the instigator of the prosecution. As Robb argues, Innocent had made use of Joachim's diagram of the *Tetragrammaton* in the theological works produced prior to his becoming pope, see: F. Robb, 'Did Innocent III Personally Condemn Joachim of Fiore?', *Florentia*, 7 (1993), pp. 77–94.

<sup>26</sup> M. L. Colish, *Peter Lombard*, 2 vols (Leiden, 1994), vol. 1, pp. 245–7.

<sup>27</sup> See McGinn, 'The Abbot and the Doctors', pp. 30–47.

attacked the notion of quaternity in a relatively late work on the Trinity, the *Psalterium decem chordarum* (c. 1183–4), a section of which is likely to be the lost treatise (*libellus sive tractatus de unitate seu essentia trinitatis*) described in the documents of the Lateran condemnation.<sup>28</sup> Here, he targets a passage from Lombard's *Sentences*, describing it as insane, a term repeated in the conciliar account. Robb highlights that Joachim's interpretation of Lombard's argument relies on his 'visual imagination' — he reconstructs Lombard's description of the divine essence (a 'certain supreme reality', *quaedam summa res*), as a substance that has a separate existence and a numerical value.<sup>29</sup> Joachim's rebuttal to Lombard draws its own numerical comparison:

For one ten piece pertains to the Father, one to the Son, and one to the Holy Spirit, all three ten pieces together to the Trinity [...] the value of the ten piece is meant to designate the perfection of the Person, and not to signify quantity. Similarly, a thirty piece is used to designate trinity, not to signify quantity [...] Therefore, three ten pieces designate three Persons, of whom each one is perfect God. A thirty piece, which is the collection of the *denarii*, designates the Trinity of one substance, because perfect God is the Trinity and perfect God is each individual person.<sup>30</sup>

The introduction of Joachim's numerical analysis of ten-pieces and thirty-pieces is found in the text of the *Genealogia* on Rotoli figurati 7, and in the text on the right side of Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*).<sup>31</sup> The accusation of heretical thinking implicit in Joachim's

---

<sup>28</sup> McGinn, *The Calabrian Abbot*, at pp. 165–8. Joachim's written expression of his condemnation has also been constructed from the council analysis of the dispute, and from early thirteenth-century pseudonymous tracts defending Joachim from his detractors. See F. Robb, 'A Late Thirteenth-Century Attack on the Fourth Lateran Council: The *Liber Contra Lombardum* and Contemporary Debates on the Trinity', *Recherches de Théologie Ancienne et Médiévale*, 62 (1995), pp. 110–44.

<sup>29</sup> The passage of text is repeated and translated from the early Venetian printed edition of the *Psalterium decem chordarum* (Venice, 1517), fol. 277ra–b, in: Robb, 'Trinitarian Orthodoxy', at p. 27, n. 3.

<sup>30</sup> Cited after Robb, 'Trinitarian Orthodoxy', at p. 27. 'Sed denarius unus pertinet ad Patrem, denarius unus ad Filium, denarius unus ad Spiritum Sanctum, tri[ce]narius simul ad trinitatem [...] Denarius itaque numerus positus est pro designanda perfectione persone, non pro significanda quantitate [...] Tres ergo denarii tres persones designant, quarum quelibet perfectus est deus. Unus tricenarius qui est collectio denariorum, unius substantie trinitatem, quia perfectus deus trinitas, perfectus deus singula personarum.' The *Psalterium decem chordarum* is more recently edited as: Joachim of Fiore, *Joachim abbas Florentis. Psalterium decem cordarum*, ed. K.–V. Selge, *Fonti per la storia dell'Italia medievale. Antiquitates*, 34 (Rome, 2009).

<sup>31</sup> Appendix 1, l. 92.

fervent disagreement with Peter Lombard arises from his numerical comparison, which suggests a Trinitarian doctrine dependent on unity of collection. Examination of the case at the Fourth Lateran Council led to the accusation against Joachim that his own understanding of Trinitarian doctrine was ‘one of collectivity and resemblance’, not a correct ‘unity of essence’. The abbot understood the Trinity as like any collectivity; the three persons in their multiplicity were also ‘one’ in the same way as Christ’s faithful:

Christ’s faithful are not one in the sense of a single reality which is common to all. They are only one in this sense, that they form one church through the unity of the catholic faith, and finally one kingdom through the form of a union of indivisible charity.<sup>32</sup>

An underlying problem with the implications of analogical thinking also seems to be present. Joachim’s use of objects and images, of ‘picturing’ and his rejection of Peter Lombard’s conceptual abstraction, has often been selected as an aspect of the dichotomy between monastic and scholastic theology.<sup>33</sup> However, Joachim’s visual conceptions of the Trinity in his theology of history imaginatively mapped them onto human time. As Clare Monagle has recently suggested, for Joachim the Trinity was a historical force that generated the shape of human history.<sup>34</sup> His use of concordance was explained in the *figurae* of the *Liber Figurarum* by diagrams which created patterns from biblical history, united and governed by the order and structure provided by God. As Marco Rainini has convincingly demonstrated, these diagrams record separate strands of development in his symbolic thinking.<sup>35</sup> Various images that are contained within the

---

<sup>32</sup> ‘Non enim ut ait, fideles Christi sunt unum, id est una quedam res que communis sit omnibus, hic modo sunt unum, id est una ecclesia propter catholicae fidei unitatem et tandem unum regnum propter unionem indissolubilis caritatis.’ Cited from Tanner, *Decrees of the Ecumenical Councils*, I, at p. 231.

<sup>33</sup> See J. Leclercq, ‘The Renewal of Theology’, in *Renaissance and Renewal in the Twelfth Century*, ed. R. L. Benson, G. Constable, and C. D. Lanham (Oxford, 1999), at pp. 68–87.

<sup>34</sup> C. Monagle, *Orthodoxy and Controversy in Twelfth-Century Religious Discourse: Peter Lombard’s Sentences and the Development of Theology* (Turnhout, 2012).

<sup>35</sup> See Rainini, *Disegni dei tempi* (2006). The testament to Joachim’s visual imagination known from three extant manuscripts as the *Liber Figurarum* are drawn together as a diachronic collection that is generally agreed to have been established by the members of the order of Florentians at S. Giovanni in Fiore after the abbot’s death in 1202. These are: Dresden, Sächsischen Landesebibliothek, MS A 121 (late 13<sup>th</sup> century); Oxford, Corpus Christi College, MS 255A; Reggio Emilia, Biblioteca del Seminario Vescovile, MS R1. Fragments also exist at the Vatican Library, the Bibliothèque Nationale in Paris, and in Milan. The first study of this image collection was that of Marjorie Reeves and Beatrice Hirsch-Reich, *The Figurae of Joachim of Fiore* (London, 1972).

*Liber figurarum* also exist independently, and in different versions, or in association with others of Joachim's works. Figures are integral, as we have seen, to the *Genealogia*, and are often found alongside the *Liber de concordia*, the *Psalterium decem chordarum*, and his *Expositio in Apocalypsim*. In his use of symbols, Joachim is like other monastic theologians such as Bernard of Clairvaux, Gerhoch of Reichersberg, and Hildegard of Bingen. A requisite advanced level of spiritual intelligence was essential for a correct understanding of these advanced forms of visual analogy. The diagrams collected together in the *Liber figurarum* do not correspond exactly to the early versions of the *figure arboris* on Rotoli figurati 7, or relate directly to Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*). What is of crucial interest for the study of the Rotoli figurati is how particular arrangements and themes found in the *Liber figurarum* manuscripts might bear thematic witness to the schema underlying the *Ecclesia*. In this we see the historical genealogy of Joachim's early work governed by the unified structure of the Church body, whose head is Christ. The Council's condemnation of Joachim's thinking was predicated on a disapproval of his metaphorical use of material, worldly objects (such as coins) in theological discussion of the invisible machinations of divinity. However, Joachim himself made repeated and emphatic statements that his analogies are to be interpreted according to spiritual understanding only, a fact that does not seem to have been regarded by the Council. The declaration that Joachim's visual construction of Trinitarian unity should be condemned as heretical discouraged theologians in general from making visual comparisons between the divine and the material world, and instead encouraged recourse to abstract analogy, as typified by Peter Lombard's approach to questions of doctrine.<sup>36</sup> Joachim's 'visual thinking' was therefore a point of difficulty for the orthodox interpretation of his work during the thirteenth century.

However, the specificity of the 1215 condemnation is perhaps the reason that it did not appear to affect Joachim's reputation in the first quarter of the thirteenth century. Indeed his work continued to be engaged with, and it has been argued that the earliest and most widely circulated spurious work produced after Joachim's death, the

---

<sup>36</sup> Discussed in full, with reference to the text of Joachim's *Psalterium decem chordorum*, by Robb, 'Trinitarian Orthodoxy', at pp. 36–43.



*Super Hieremiam*, was disseminated by the Florentian order partly in response to the condemnation.<sup>37</sup> The conciliar declaration that condemned aspects of Joachim's Trinitarian theology as part of a statement on in the decretals disseminated by Pope Gregory IX in 1234.<sup>38</sup> Although we know that the issue was very specific, and did not condemn Joachim as a figure or his work as a corpus, it nonetheless affected its broader perception. One story reported by Archbishop Luke of Cosenza (d. 1224), Joachim's former *socius* and amanuensis, describes how a scribe in Luke's service was afraid to copy Joachim's *Expositio in Apocalypsim*. This scribe refused to continue with his work, until he experienced a vision of an old man, who assured him that although one book of the abbot had been condemned, this did not forbid the copying of another.<sup>39</sup> As Marjorie Reeves memorably put it his reputation,

[w]as based on a standard set of stories, some containing truth, some apocryphal. He was known as the prophet of Antichrist, the interpreter of the seven-headed dragon, the oracle on the fate of Jerusalem, the recipient of a miraculous gift of spiritual understanding, the prophet of the two great mendicant orders, and the proclaimer of 1260 as the year of crisis.<sup>40</sup>

Some of these stories are directly recorded in the content of the Rotoli figurati, as we have seen. Yet as is shown in the historical record, and the note recording the changing reception of Rotoli figurati 7, Joachim's ideas were later condemned in a more wide-ranging proscription. This second condemnation at the provincial Council of Arles (1263), after the prophetic year 1260, was far more damaging than the first.<sup>41</sup>

---

<sup>37</sup> Reeves, *Influence*, at p. 76; R. B. Moynihan, 'The Development of the Pseudo-Joachim Commentary *Super Hieremiam*: New Manuscript Evidence', *Mélanges de l'Ecole Française de Rome. Moyen Âge, Temps Modernes*, 98/1 (1986), pp. 109–41.

<sup>38</sup> Gregory IX, 'Decretales 1.1.1f', in *Corpus iuris canonici*, ed. E. Friedberg, 2 vols (repr. Graz, 1959). See S. Grosse, 'Thomas Aquinas, Bonaventure, and the Critiques of Joachimist Topics from the Fourth Lateran Council to Dante', in *A Companion to Joachim of Fiore*, ed. M. Riedl (Leiden, 2017), pp. 144–89, at pp. 149–50.

<sup>39</sup> Lerner, *The Feast of Saint Abraham*, at pp. 39–40; S. E. Wessley, *Joachim of Fiore and Monastic Reform* (New York, 1990), at p. 90. The two versions of the legend are edited from sixteenth century collections compiled by members of the Florentian order, in: A. M. Adorasio, *La Legenda del Santo di Fiore: B. Ioachimi abbatis miracula* (Rome, 1989), at pp. 137–8, and 167–70.

<sup>40</sup> Reeves, 'Originality and Influence', at p. 298.

<sup>41</sup> M. Reeves, *Joachim of Fiore and the Prophetic Future: A Medieval Study in Historical Thinking* (Stroud, 1999), at p. 27.

## *1260 as the Year of Crisis and the coming of the Antichrist*

Behold, a woman, clothed with the sun and the moon beneath her feet, etc. She remains in solitude for 1260 days. This is the church, which must stand in the desert of this life for 1260 years, that is from Christ until the death of Antichrist. After those years have elapsed, there will remain, according to Daniel, 45 days. After that the day of judgement will approach. Of those 1260 days, that is years, 1187 have elapsed. Whence it is inferred that the times of the Antichrist and the day of judgement are imminent, so that what is said may be fulfilled: you will see the son of man coming in clouds, with great power and majesty. The period of time, however, which will be from the time of Antichrist until the day of judgement, God alone knows, because nobody knows about this day. In that time, the Jews and all nations will be converted to the faith, and penance, and the seventh seal will be opened, at the beginning of which the tribulations will cease, since the mysteries will be completed as it is written in the Apocalypse. In the voice of the seventh angel, who when he shall begin to sound the trumpet, the mystery of God will be completed, just as the Old Testament is completed, and the greatest peace was in the time of the birth of Christ. Then John came, now Elias will come.<sup>42</sup>

The passage above, taken from Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*), states that the Day of Judgement was at hand. It uses the day-year method to account for 1,260 days of Apocalypse 12.6 representing the 1,260 years of the earthly Church before the tribulations of Antichrist. Joachim also reached this conclusion based on his calculation in the *Liber concordia* that the third and final *status* would begin in the forty-second generation after Christ, which fell in the year 1260. In this year, a ‘universalis ... pontifex nove Ierusalem’ would arise, who would reform the earthly Christian congregation.<sup>43</sup> Salimbene repeated the belief that the beginning of Joachim’s third *status* was to begin in the year 1260.<sup>44</sup> Joachite apocalyptic expectation thus centred on this year, and was drawn into the rhetoric surrounding the conflict between the papacy and Emperor Frederick II — from both sides. Pope and emperor were each accused of being the feared Antichrist.<sup>45</sup> Joachim’s ideas became incorporated with other figures of

---

<sup>42</sup> Appendix 1, ll. 78–90; Appendix 3, ll. 92–106.

<sup>43</sup> See Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de Concordia*, chap. 45, at pp. 402–3.

<sup>44</sup> ‘Quem statum inchoatum dicunt in illa verberatione que facta est MCCLX’. Salimbene de Adam, *Cronica*, at p. 677.

<sup>45</sup> McGinn, ‘The Abbot and the Doctors’, at pp. 45–7.

medieval eschatology, including the Holy Pope, the Last World Emperor, Antichrist, and Gog and Magog as participants in the final drama of the end times.<sup>46</sup>

The previous chapter examined how Joachim's conception of a central role for the pope in the leadership of the Church during the end times was crucial to the reception and transmission of his works in orthodox environments.<sup>47</sup> The imminent cataclysm of the end times as pictured in the apocalypticism of the thirteenth century featured the figure of the Antichrist, the great opponent of Christian salvation, who would ally with the devil and aim to destroy the Church and the Christian congregation.<sup>48</sup> We have discussed the transformative effect of Joachim's understanding of Antichrist in chapter five. After these battles, there would be a time of great spiritual peace and conversion, before the final cataclysm. As we have seen, Joachim envisioned that in the forty-second generation a new leader would arise: 'a new leader from Babylon, a universal pontifex of the New Jerusalem to whom would be given full liberty to renew the Christian religion and to preach the word of God'.<sup>49</sup> Joachim was thus one of the key proponents of the central role of the papacy in apocalyptic thought and piety. B. McGinn has offered an important consideration on this theme, arguing that the papal apocalyptic role had a dual identity, which should be understood as an antithesis between 'the hope for a coming papal messiah and dread of a pope who would be man's final enemy'. This apocalyptic role —while courted by the papacy in the choice to endorse a figure like Joachim— never became an official part of what McGinn describes as 'papal propaganda'. Rather, the wish for a coming 'Holy Pope' cast doubt on the conduct of the papal office, and fostered a desire for a complete and

---

<sup>46</sup> See Daniel, 'Apocalyptic Conversion', pp. 127–54; Patschovsky, 'The Holy Emperor', pp. 291–322.

<sup>47</sup> My argument develops from that of McGinn, who takes a broader view, explaining the change through the post-Gregorian increased visibility of the papacy, and the failure of the papacy to effect reform after the Fourth Lateran Council of 1215. B. McGinn, 'Angel Pope and Papal Antichrist', *Church History*, 47/2 (1978), pp. 155–73, at p. 157.

<sup>48</sup> Another key figure of the end times, prominent in the thirteenth century and later, and relevant to the perceived orthodoxy of Rotoli figurati 7, is the myth of the Last World Emperor. This figure has a separate history, originating in the early middle ages, and framed as an imperial force who would have a crucial role in restraining the Antichrist, before submitting his authority to God. See M. Reeves, 'Joachimist Influence on the Idea of a Last World Emperor', *Traditio*, 17 (1961), pp. 323–70.

<sup>49</sup> *Liber de Concordia*, Book 4, chap. 45, pp. 402–3.

divinely inspired reform of the Holy See.<sup>50</sup> Joachim's exegesis took the final stage of history to be a time of spiritual understanding, which would be characterised by an increasingly monasticised or contemplative society and an overarching spiritualisation concordant with the age of the Spirit. This would also include the spiritualisation of the papal office itself. Joachim's visions of a transformed society were not calls for reform; rather, they reflected his understanding that this change was part of a divinely ordained plan for human history. In the decades following his death, as the proponents of papal primacy encountered increasingly forceful opposition, the abbot's influential description of this third and final stage came to be understood in some quarters as a radical critique of the increasingly worldly and political machinations of papal government. However, as Bernard McGinn has convincingly argued, Joachim in his lifetime supported a pacifist papacy which would aim to accommodate and negotiate with secular and imperial authority, to focus more fully on internal reform and regeneration.<sup>51</sup> For Joachim, the role of the papacy was explicitly *not* to develop the *ecclesia militans* to ready itself to resist the current and imminent persecutions of Antichrist. Instead, the role of the Church in the coming third *status* and the imminent crises of the Apocalypse was to be a 'suffering servant', a spiritual, holy institution which would preach and inspire. Furthermore, there would be a special pope, whose leading role would be to guide the remaining Christian congregation through the transition to this final age, and through the trials of Antichrist. This universal *pontifex* would arise in the forty-second generation after Christ (most frequently calculated as the year 1260), from Babylon, and would 'renew the Christian religion and ... preach the word of God'.<sup>52</sup>

In the posthumous interpretation of Joachim's works, the idea of a reforming holy pope was widely circulated as a figure of the end times, and by the end of the thirteenth century had become the 'Angelic Pope', the *pastor angelicus*. The idea of a holy pope acquired critical force during the thirteenth century, used in debates surrounding the nature and leadership of the papacy and particularly in the issue of poverty. The papacy as an increasingly effective, wealthy bureaucratic and legal machine for political governance was at odds with the Joachimist conception of the

---

<sup>50</sup> McGinn, 'Angel Pope', at pp. 155–6.

<sup>51</sup> McGinn, 'Angel Pope', pp. 155–173, at p. 158.

<sup>52</sup> Liber de Concordia, Book 4, Ch. 45, at pp. 402–3.

holiness of the office, generating increased ambivalence in the broader perception of the papacy as a religious institution. The popular perception of poverty as a central element of religious perfection, disseminated swiftly in the first half the century by the mendicant orders, meant that the operations of the papacy began increasingly to seem like the opponents of spiritual reform.<sup>53</sup>

### *Franciscan Joachimites in Vercelli and beyond*

In a letter dated to the 1240s, the English Franciscan scholar Adam Marsh wrote to the bishop of Lincoln, Robert Grosseteste (d. 1253) regarding some treatises of Abbot Joachim which he had been brought by ‘a brother friar coming from beyond the Alps’, probably from northern Italy.<sup>54</sup> Marsh had been active in Vercelli for at least five years in the 1230s, studying with the Augustinian canons at S. Andrea under their abbot, the Pseudo-Dionysian translator and commentator Thomas Gallus.<sup>55</sup> He travelled more widely in Italy, and was active in the early government of the Franciscan order, before and after this period.<sup>56</sup> McEvoy has suggested that it was perhaps Hugh de Digne (d. 1285) who had sent Marsh, in England, these works of Joachim.<sup>57</sup> Marsh described Joachim in this letter as ‘a holy man’, ‘who is thought not without cause to have been divinely inspired to understand the mysteries of prophecy’. The English Franciscans saw Joachim as a spiritual exegete, a commentator and interpreter of the Apocalypse and of the current and impending crises of the Christian congregation.<sup>58</sup> Roger Bacon, who acted as an advisor alongside Adam to Bishop Grosseteste, wrote of Joachim’s works

---

<sup>53</sup> McGinn, ‘Angel Pope’, at p. 160.

<sup>54</sup> The letter is edited and translated in: Adam Marsh, *The Letters of Adam Marsh*, trans. C. H. Lawrence, 2 vols (Oxford, 2006), vol. I, no. 43, at pp. 118–121.

<sup>55</sup> See chapter two, above.

<sup>56</sup> Vercelli, ACVC, Cod. LXXII contains a letter by Robert Grosseteste dated to the mid-thirteenth century, found as the initial front flyleaf of a fifteenth century manuscript. The letter is categorised as two separate letters in: S. Harrison Thomson, *The Writings of Robert Grosseteste, Bishop of Lincoln, 1235–1253* (Cambridge, 1940), pp. 99, 104, nos. 46, 54. Thomson gives it two titles, *De forma prima omnium* (*De unica forma omnium*), and *De Intelligentiis*, but it is one letter from Grosseteste to his student Adam Rufus. The Vercelli manuscript is the earliest known testimony of the letter, according to the lists compiled by Thomson.

<sup>57</sup> J. McEvoy, *Robert Grosseteste* (Oxford, 2000), at pp. 156–7.

<sup>58</sup> Bloomfield and Reeves, ‘Penetration of Joachimism’, pp. 772–793.

that they offered understanding and ‘greater certainty regarding the time of Antichrist’.<sup>59</sup> This group of English mendicant scholars engaged with Joachim’s understanding of history and his analysis of the Apocalypse, together with his account of the Antichrist.<sup>60</sup> Marsh, Grosseteste, and Bacon did not engage with Joachim’s Trinitarian theology, nor with his complex three-fold view of history.<sup>61</sup> Rather, they seem to have engaged with strands of exegesis found predominantly in his earlier works, such as the *Genealogia* and the *De septem sigillis*: works that may well have been circulating in Vercelli during the time when Adam Marsh was active in the city. It is certainly within the realms of possibility that Marsh may first have encountered Joachim’s historical exegesis in Vercelli, through earlier versions of the Joachite texts we have in the Rotoli figurati.

In the mid-thirteenth century therefore, Joachim of Fiore and his works endured through his reputation as a prophet of the Apocalypse, and as a theologian. The reception and knowledge of his work among highly educated clerics and religious was widespread, as we have seen.<sup>62</sup> Joachim’s Trinitarian concords divided history into three overlapping *status*. The Christian faithful in the final status, expected to begin around the year 1260, would be led by a spiritual and monastic pope, and *viri spirituales* would lead the faithful through this tumultuous period. These new orders of spiritual men were claimed (from both within the orders and without) to be embodied in the Franciscan and Dominican orders. Joachim’s fullest visualisation of how society would be arranged in the third status is found in the diagram of the *Liber figurarum* (figure 69).<sup>63</sup> Gerardo di Borgo San Donnino, a Franciscan friar, published in Paris in 1254 a short text called the *Liber introductoris in euangelium eternum*. This probably consisted of

---

<sup>59</sup> Roger Bacon, *Opus majus*, ed. J. Bridges (London, 1900), I, pp. 268–9.

<sup>60</sup> Z. Matus, ‘Reconsidering Roger Bacon’s Apocalypticism in Light of His Alchemical and Scientific Thought’, *Harvard Theological Review*, 105/2 (2012), pp. 189–222.

<sup>61</sup> Bloomfield and Reeves, ‘Penetration of Joachism’, at p. 786.

<sup>62</sup> See chapter five, above.

<sup>63</sup> Reeves and Hirsch-Reich, *Figurae*, at pp. 232–248. Marco Rainini’s historiographical survey of the *Liber figurarum* suggests that the first indirect reference to a distinct book of Joachimite figures occurs in the testimony of the commission instigated by Pope Alexander IV in 1255, to examine the controversy of the ‘Eternal Gospel’. Rainini, ‘Il *Liber figurarum* come problema storiografico’, pp. 213–44.

an introduction written by Gerard, accompanied by either full or partial versions of Joachim's *Liber de concordia*, *Psalterium decem chordarum*, and his *Expositio in Apocalypsim*.<sup>64</sup>

Gerardo's introduction and commentaries to these works offered a radical reinterpretation of what would happen in Joachim's third and final status of human history. While Joachim had intimated that the institutions of the Church would survive the tribulations of Antichrist and be transformed within the paradisiacal framework of the new age, Gerardo argued that ecclesiastical institutions and clerical authority would be overthrown, and replaced by the *virī spirituales*. Joachim's argument that a new spiritual understanding of both Old and New Testaments would characterise this third, more intellectual age, was pushed by Gerardo to the extreme, with an entirely *new* testament existent in the form of the *corpus* of Joachim's works and transmitted by the new orders of this *status*.<sup>65</sup> This third testament was the 'Eternal Gospel' or 'Eternal Evangel': Gerardo's introduction of this idea was the point upon which Joachim's reputation would turn in the thirteenth century.<sup>66</sup> In Paris, secular intellectual leaders within the communities at Paris responded forcefully to the circulation of these works, notably in the tract by William of Saint-Amour (d. 1272), which declared that the mendicant orders were allied with Antichrist and bent upon the destruction of the Church.<sup>67</sup> The disturbance was such that in 1255, the leaders of the mendicant orders, respectively the minister general John of Parma and the master general Humbert de Romanis, issued a joint encyclical which firmly dissociated the orders from Gerardo's

---

<sup>64</sup> B. Töpfer offered an early analysis that the Dresden manuscript which also contains the *Liber figurarum* has three texts with marginal glosses that correspond to those of Gerardo di Borgo San Donnino as quoted in the Commission of Anagni. The collection of texts, the *Liber de concordia*, *Psalterium decem chordarum*, and the *Apocalypsis noua* in this manuscript, are argued to represent the 'Eternal Gospel' (*Euangelium eterernum*), without his short introductory tract. See B. Töpfer, 'Eine Handschrift des Evangelium aeternum des Gerardino von Borgo San Donnino', *Zeitschrift für Geschichtswissenschaft*, 8 (1960), pp. 156–63.

<sup>65</sup> See Reeves, *Influence*, pp. 59–70; Whalen, *Dominion of God*, pp. 177–86; D. Burr, *Olivi's Peaceable Kingdom: A Reading of the Apocalypse Commentary* (Philadelphia, 1993), pp. 1–20.

<sup>66</sup> Moynihan, 'The Development of the Pseudo-Joachim Commentary *Super Hieremiam*', 109–442. See also R. E. Lerner, 'Antichrists and Antichrist in Joachim of Fiore', *Speculum*, 60/3 (1985), pp. 553–70.

<sup>67</sup> A. G. Traver, 'The *Liber de Antichristo* and the Failure of Joachite Expectations', *Florentia*, 15 (2001), pp. 87–98.

interpretation of Joachim's works. However, the encyclical maintained that Joachim's conception of the new spiritual men was connected with the mendicant orders, and gave them spiritual authority and a crucial role to play in the salvation of the Christian faithful during the end times.<sup>68</sup> The impact of Gerardo's text upon the reputation of the mendicant orders is reflected in Pope Alexander IV's investigative commission of 1255, using authoritative texts sent from San Giovanni in Fiore to examine the accusations. This papal commission gives us a description of how Joachim's teachings and his later interpretations were received in the mid-thirteenth century, again not entirely condemning the abbot, but pointing out errors in his thinking.

### *Joachite Inspiration and Popular Religious Movements*

There was a spreading religious and millenarian fervour across the Italian peninsula by the year 1260. In Parma in that year, a Franciscan friar named Gerardo Segarelli began to live a life of voluntary poverty, penance, and preaching, attracting many followers. Salimbene de Adam recounts the early years of Gerardo's preaching and conversion, detailing that many of his followers came from wealthy families and that by 1284 the movement had spread, with adherents in Ferrara, Ravenna, and the March of Ancona preaching on Gerardo's behalf, and people travelling through Modena and Reggio to receive his blessing.<sup>69</sup> Segarelli's followers called themselves *minimi*, and were also known as *apostolici* for their adherence to a life of apostolic poverty.<sup>70</sup> Salimbene's *Chronicle* reports disapprovingly that preaching by the apostles on behalf of Segarelli was very popular with laypeople, with large crowds gathering to hear the *minimi*.<sup>71</sup> Their popularity is reflected in Salimbene's complaint that laypeople donated more frequently to the Apostolic friars than to the Franciscans and Dominicans.<sup>72</sup> The focus of the Order

---

<sup>68</sup> B. McGinn, *Visions of the End: Apocalyptic Traditions in the Middle Ages* (New York, 1998), pp. 164–5.

<sup>69</sup> Salimbene de Adam, *Cronica*, at p. 819.

<sup>70</sup> B. R. Carniello, 'Gerardo Segarelli as the Anti-Francis: Mendicant Rivalry and Heresy in Medieval Italy, 1260–1300', *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 57/2 (2006), pp. 226–51, at p. 227.

<sup>71</sup> Salimbene de Adam, *Cronica*, at p. 386.

<sup>72</sup> 'Et plus et libentius dabant eis Parmenses, concives mei, viri et mulieres, quam fratribus Minoribus et Predicatoribus darent.' Salimbene de Adam, *Cronica*, at p. 373.



of the Apostles under Segarelli was a life of voluntary evangelical poverty, penance, and holiness, and this had a broad appeal across the peninsula at a time when many similar movements attracted laypeople in increasingly populous towns and cities.<sup>73</sup> However, Grado Merlo has argued that it was not only laypeople who were attracted to this apostolic movement, and moreover that their activity was in fact often accepted by ecclesiastical officials.<sup>74</sup> Further, as Augustine Thompson has demonstrated, the number of independent penitential religious movements in Italy in the thirteenth century reflects a widespread cultural flourishing of lay religious life and communal spirituality.<sup>75</sup> Joachim himself began his religious life as an itinerant, unordained preacher, wandering barefoot and preaching to villagers in Calabria in the 1170s. It was only after a year of this activity that he became afraid that preaching without permission and ordination was a sin and applied to Bishop Robert of Catanzaro to receive minor orders.<sup>76</sup> By the year 1300, the movement had been condemned: Segarelli was condemned for heresy by a Dominican inquisitor and burned at the stake on 18 July, in Parma.<sup>77</sup>

### *Dolcino of Novara and Radical Apocalypticism*

Shortly after Segarelli's death, in Bologna in the year 1300, another figure enters the history of this movement. Dolcino of Novara claimed himself as Segarelli's successor and advocated his sanctity.<sup>78</sup> This figure presented himself as the inheritor of Gerardo's sanctity, and under his leadership, the *minimi* became variously known as the Order of the Apostles (*Ordo apostolorum*), Apostolics (*apostolici*), or pejoratively the Pseudo-

---

<sup>73</sup> L. K. Little, *Religious Poverty and the Profit Economy in Medieval Europe* (Ithaca, N.Y., 1983).

<sup>74</sup> G. G. Merlo, *Eretici ed eresie medievali* (Bologna, 1989), pp. 104–10.

<sup>75</sup> A. Thompson, *Cities of God: The Religion of the Italian Communes, 1125–1325* (University Park, PA, 2005).

<sup>76</sup> Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de Concordia*, at pp. xiii–xiv.

<sup>77</sup> Carniello, 'Gerardo Segarelli as the Anti-Francis', at p. 226.

<sup>78</sup> R. Orioli, *Venit perfidus heresiarcha: il movimento apostolico-dolciniano dal 1260 al 1307* (Rome, 1988), pp. 119–26. Brian R. Carniello has convincingly taken issue with the wide scholarly acceptance of the supposed connection and shared beliefs between Dolcino and Gerardo Segarelli. Carniello calls for a more nuanced understanding, with Gerardo considered independently and as part of a less radical movement of mendicant piety. See: 'Gerardo Segarelli as the Anti-Francis', pp. 226–51.

Apostles.<sup>79</sup> We know more about Dolcino, and he is distinguished from Gerardo by his purported dissemination of written letters to his followers that set out their systems of belief. However, his beliefs are known through sustained extant sources which are highly critical. The first is the account of his final defeat which is consistently attributed to the inquisitor Bernard Gui and included within the fifth part of his *Practica inquisitionis heretice pravitatis* (c. 1323–4), as *De secta illorum qui se dicunt esse de ordine apostolorum* [*De secta*].<sup>80</sup> However, the text was most likely written in 1316 or earlier by an inquisitor active in northern Italy; the author of the account states that they are writing on 1 May 1316.<sup>81</sup> They also state that this is ten years after the events that Dolcino prophesied should have occurred, and yet none of them have happened. This comment could have been added for emphasis, with the account compiled much earlier. The second, the *Historia fratris Dulcini heresiarche* [*Historia*] is an anonymous account which describes the same events, but it contains a level of local detail that suggests a provenance from the region of Vercelli, and a desire to positively reflect the actions of that diocese in its military action against Dolcino and his followers.<sup>82</sup> In the *De secta*, there is an account of Dolcino's apocalyptic beliefs which is purportedly drawn from letters he wrote in the early 1300s. The work reports that these letters were copied out selectively, which suggests that they might be a relatively accurate representation of

---

<sup>79</sup> I refer to the movement under Dolcino's leadership as the Order of the Apostles.

<sup>80</sup> The *De secta* is published in A. Segarizzi, ed., *Historia fratris Dulcini heresiarche di anonimo sincrono e De secta illorum qui se dicunt esse de ordine Apostolorum di Bernardo Gui*, *Rerum italicarum scriptores*, IX/5, 2 vols (Città di Castello, 1907), pp. 15–36. This account is also edited in: Bernard Gui, *Practica inquisitionis heretice pravitatis*, ed. C. Douais (Paris, 1896), at pp. 327–355. There is also a partial French translation in Bernard Gui, *Manuel de l'inquisiteur*, repr. 2006 (Paris, 1926). An Italian translation is found in R. Orioli, ed., *Fra Dolcino: nascita, vita e morte di un'eresia medievale* (Milan, 2004), pp. 113–39. It is broadly accepted that Gui was not the author, and it occurs at the end of the collection in the *Practica*. See G.-L. Potestà, 'Federico III d'Aragona re di Sicilia nelle attese apocalittiche di Dolcino', in *Studia humanitatis. Saggi in onore di Roberto Osculati*, ed. A. Rotondo (Rome, 2011), pp. 227–38.

<sup>81</sup> *De secta*, p. 23.

<sup>82</sup> The second account is edited as the *Historia fratris Dulcini heresiarche di Anonimono Sincrono* [*Historia*] in the same volume edited by A. Segarizzi, at pp. 1–14. An Italian translation is available in Orioli, *Fra Dolcino*, at pp. 91–105. See also P. Castillo, 'Historia fratris Dulcini heresiarche. Un análisis estructural', *Prohistoria*, 22 (2014), pp. 159–173. An English translation is provided in S. K. Cohn, ed., *Popular Protest in Late Medieval Europe: Italy, France, and Flanders* (Manchester, 2004), at pp. 55–8. A further short account on the Order of the Apostles by the Siennese chronicler Agnolo di Turo (d. after 1350) is also reproduced in Cohn's volume.

Dolcino's beliefs, but also that tropes of anti-heretical writing traditions are being employed.<sup>83</sup> The *De secta* repeatedly refers to Dolcino's misguided interpretation and exegesis of the Old and New Testaments,<sup>84</sup> and to his use of scripture to make false prophecies.<sup>85</sup> These particularly tropes seem to refer to the work of Joachim of Fiore. And furthermore, it is these methods of Joachim's historical theology –in the trees of concordance between the Old and New Testaments, in the *Genealogia*, the *Figura arboris*, and the Trees of Ascending Generations which we find on Rotoli figurati 7. What we read in Dolcino's beliefs as interpreted through the *De secta* therefore plausibly suggests a connection to Joachite theology, and arguably, a specific knowledge of Joachim's works. Spiritual intelligence, Joachim's conception of contemplative, divinely-inspired understanding, gave authority to his exegetical conjecture and prophesy.<sup>86</sup> In his examination of the *De secta* and its relationship to the note on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7, Marco Rainini has observed that this same phrase 'spiritual intelligence', is used to demonstrate the madness of Dolcino's own prophetic knowledge.<sup>87</sup>

Dolcino was from the region of Novara, bordering Vercelli to the north-east, and belonged to a prominent family of that region (the *Presbyteri*) who were powerful within the governmental hierarchies of the diocese. The anonymous *Historia* records that Dolcino was the son of 'Iulius Presbyter', from the village of Tarecontano in the Valle d'Ossola, in the diocese of Novara.<sup>88</sup> The only other source for Dolcino's life

---

<sup>83</sup> Sackville, *Heresy and Heretics in the Thirteenth Century*, pp. 154–6. See also the analysis of D. Burr, 'Olivi, Fra Dolcino, and the Beast', *Franciscan Studies*, 72/1 (2014), pp. 411–32.

<sup>84</sup> For example: 'Et ad confirmandum predicta adducit multa de scriptis Veteris et Novi Testamenti interpretando et exponendo de corde suo intellectu perverso.', *De secta*, p. 21.

<sup>85</sup> 'Et ad confirmandum predicta adducit prophetias et scripturas Veteris ac Novi Testamenti pluries exponendo eas secundum suum pravum intellectum.' *De secta*, p. 22.

<sup>86</sup> See Reeves, *Influence*, pp. 16–7. Joachim took spiritual intelligence (*spiritualis intelligentia*) as an integral part of the third *status* of the Holy Spirit. See for example the summaries in the *Liber de concordia*, Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de Concordia*, at p. 17. E. A. Constant provides a useful analysis of Joachim's construction of a new form of prophetic knowledge outside traditional Augustinian categories, in: E. A. Constant, 'Concepts of Prophecy in the Middle Ages: Inspired Exegesis, Visions from God, and the Interaction of Theories and Practice' (unpublished Ph.D., Michigan State University, 2016), at pp. 45–6, and 46 ff.

<sup>87</sup> For example, 'se habere revelationem a deo et spiritum intelligencie prophetarum', *De secta*, p. 19. Rainini, 'I rotoli dei diagrammi di Vercelli', pp. 250–52.

<sup>88</sup> Orioli demonstrates that Bernard Gui's account of Dolcino's heritage manipulates the account

comes from a brief account in Benvenuto da Imola's commentary on Dante's *Commedia*, written several decades later, in 1376. Benvenuto notes that Dolcino was educated in Vercelli by 'Syon da Vercelli'. Names and dates correlate with the magister Syon (Syon da Vercelli), who was active as a teacher in Vercelli until his death in 1290.<sup>89</sup> Dolcino's actions and beliefs were based on a form of Joachite thought and apocalyptic expectation, and it appears that he was active in and around Vercelli during his early life. If he did study under Syon da Vercelli in the 1270s, it is conceivable that he may have encountered the material contained within the Rotoli figurati. I propose that his later execution in Vercelli in 1307, was directly connected to the note being left on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7 that year.

After the execution of Gerardo Segarelli in 1300, the remainder of the group's followers were subject to trial by the inquisitions lead by the Order of Preachers. It was in the seven years after Segarelli's death that Dolcino wrote the letters, commonly now referred to as manifestos, in the years 1300, 1303, and 1306. These are transmitted through the text associated with Bernard Gui (the *De secta*), and his record of the inquisition.<sup>90</sup> The letters set out Dolcino's conviction that the apocalypse was imminent, that the now-corrupt Church would be destroyed, and that only a select few of the faithful would be saved: Dolcino took on the role of leader of a congregation that had been divinely selected for salvation.<sup>91</sup>

To a following mostly composed of laymen and women, Dolcino wrote that his congregation had a role to play in preaching salvation to humankind, and had an interpretation of salvific history, which divided time beyond Joachim's three into four *status*.<sup>92</sup> The first was of the patriarchs and men of the Old Testament, in a state of matrimony, the second beginning with Christ and the apostles, ending with St Silvester and Constantine. During the third status the popes presided over the conversion of the Gentiles, but St Benedict, and then St Francis and St Dominic, instigated a new, more

---

from the anonymous *Historia* to delegitimise Dolcino, ignoring the local relevance of the *Presbyter* surname and introducing the idea that he was the illegitimate son of a priest. Orioli, *Venit perfidus heresiarcha*, pp. 95–104.

<sup>89</sup> See chapter two.

<sup>90</sup> Segarizzi, *Historia fratris Dulcini heresiarche*, pp. 21–5.

<sup>91</sup> '[...] a Deo specialiter esse missum et electum.' *De secta*, p. 20.

<sup>92</sup> *De secta*, pp. 20–1.

spiritual way of life. However, a true and radical apostolic life of poverty was intended by God for the fourth and final age, the beginning of which was represented by Segarelli, and this would last until Judgement Day. Dolcino's characterisation of the Church in the late thirteenth century was of decline, awaiting the imminent and violent deaths of the corrupted system of prelates, clergy, and religious who dishonoured it, at the hands of the Last Emperor. The Church of the Order of the Apostles would be one of pure reformed poverty. This order utterly rejected the authority of the institutional Roman Church, and incorporated the idea of the *pastor angelicus*, the Holy Pope, who would be sent by God.<sup>93</sup>

Co-opting another apocalyptic motif, Dolcino of Novara conceived of a living Last World Emperor, identified with Frederick III of Sicily (r. 1295–1337). This emperor would fight for the Apostles and the cause of the Holy, and would be responsible for purging the Church of evil and executing Pope Boniface (r. 1294–1303).<sup>94</sup> Frederick would also remove the corrupt orders of the Church, specifically the clergy, who would be 'killed and banished by a divine sword wielded by this emperor, slaughtered and destroyed throughout all the land'.<sup>95</sup> Dolcino's version of the Last World Emperor offered vindication to the suffering of the Apostles, and also created an apocalyptic vision in which the final emperor's character was messianic, and would create a final rule which would endure until the time of Antichrist.<sup>96</sup> He also identified four popes as actors in his apocalyptic vision for the years 1303 to 1305: Celestine V as the first holy pope, followed by the wicked figure of Boniface VIII.<sup>97</sup> His unnamed

---

<sup>93</sup> McGinn, 'Angel Pope', pp. 155–173.

<sup>94</sup> 'Fredericus debet relevari [...] Bonifacium papam pugnando habere et facere occidi cum aliis occidendis.' *De secta*, p. 21.

<sup>95</sup> '[...] omnes, inquam, supradicti divino gladio exterminabuntur ab imperatore relevato ... et occidentur et consumentur per universam terram.' *De Secta*, p. 21.

<sup>96</sup> 'Fredericus imperator relevatus regnabit et imperabit per universam mundum magis quam fecerit aliquis imperator, et durabit usque ad tempus Anti-Christi.' *De secta*, p. 22.

<sup>97</sup> '[...] in istis diebus nostris ... sub anno domini MCCCIII quatuor pape sunt scripti, duo boni scilicet primus et novissimus, et duo mali scilicet secundus et tercius. Primum papam exponit et dicit esse Celestinum qui cessit papatum. [...] Secundum vero papam exponit et dicit esse Bonifacium octavum qui successit Celestino. [...] Tertium vero papam dicit esse successorem Bonifacii quem non nominat nomine proprio. [...] Quartum vero papam non nominat nomine proprio quem asserit esse sanctum [...] in ecclesia erit unus papa sanctus qui tunc regnabit.' *De Secta*, pp. 22–3.

successor would be another evil figure before the final role of the Holy Pope in the Last Days.<sup>98</sup> This last pope would be divinely elected, and would solve the final corruption at the heart of the Church by eradicating the machinations of the cardinalate, who would have been destroyed by the Last World Emperor. The final Holy Pope would complete the renewal of the Church, and rule in tandem with the Last World Emperor until the last battle with Antichrist.

### *The Order of the Apostles and Vercelli in the year 1307*

During the first years of the fourteenth century, Dolcino was active as an itinerant preacher, and moved north toward the city of Trento, in the alpine northeast on the Adige river.<sup>99</sup> Three important figures emerged here: Alberto of Cimego, Margherita of Trento, and Longino Cattaneo of Bergamo. Margherita's participation has captured the attention of commentators, as she was a young religious woman, of an aristocratic family, who left a convent to preach alongside these men.<sup>100</sup> In 1304, three members of the Order of Apostles were executed for heresy, and it is at this point that members of the group including Dolcino travelled to the diocese of Vercelli. The towns and villages mentioned are clustered around the southern end of the Valsesia region (the Sesia river valley), north of Vercelli: Gattinara, and further north, Serravalle, and west through the foothills of the Alps to Biella. Later, the group moved north into more rural and remote locations in the Biellese Alps. Several villages mentioned are located along the valleys of the Strona di Mosso and Sessera rivers, northeast of Biella.<sup>101</sup> These regions had a distinct identity and were frequently engaged in disputes over autonomy with local lords and with diocesan authority in the bishop of Vercelli. The apparent readiness of these more remote regions to resist the rulings of urban and episcopal authorities suggests that they formed a relatively safe area in which the Apostles could operate. The

---

<sup>98</sup> '[...] et tunc, destructis maliciosis predictis, ipsi regnabunt et fructificabunt usque ad finem mundi.' *De Secta*, p. 23.

<sup>99</sup> Orioli, *Venit perfidus heresiarcha*, pp. 103–14.

<sup>100</sup> C. Mornese, 'Le donne nella rivoluzione apostolica', in *Fra Dolcino e gli apostolici tra eresia, rivolta e roghi*, ed. C. Mornese and G. Buratti (Novara, 2000), pp. 190–202.

<sup>101</sup> The anonymous *Historia* lists locations in Monte Trivero, Mosso, Còggiola, Fléccia, Crevacuore, Mortigliengo, Curino, and Monte Rubello. *Historia*, pp. 9–10.

villages of the Valsesia, and the towns of Biella, Trivero, Gattinara and Serravalle had all been engaged in a long history of conflict and resistance involving the regional landowners, the counts of Biandrate. The Biandrate lords relied upon the rural economy of the *contado* to support their influence and power outside the cathedral cities and communal authorities of Vercelli and Novara. The complex arrangement of land ownership and fealty meant that the Biandrate managed and held immediate jurisdiction over the Valsesia, but ultimate obligation was due to Vercelli.<sup>102</sup> In the anonymous *Historia*, we read that the inhabitants of the small town of Serravalle aided the Apostles in evading inquisitors.<sup>103</sup> The *podestà* of Vercelli arrested and condemned the rector of the church at Serravalle for aiding and supporting the Apostles, but local landowners continued to encourage the Apostles and support them, giving them space to build shelters and preach. The *Historia* further reports that many people travelled from afar to the region to hear Dolcino.<sup>104</sup> The remoteness of the region and its history of dissent correlate with the complex operation of diocesan authority within these river valleys, fortified towns and remote mountain villages, functioning patchily alongside the secular lordship of the Biandrate.<sup>105</sup>

The way in which the pope and the diocese of Vercelli dealt with the Order of the Apostles relied on military action conducted in defence of the Church. Episcopal military forces under the command of Raniero Avogadro, bishop of Vercelli (1303–1310), captured Dolcino after a year-long, brutal conflict during which the group maintained an armed resistance, probably with the support of the inhabitants of the villages in the region. Avogadro aimed to eradicate the Apostles: their renown, and popularity among laypeople and tertiary religious, was a threat to ecclesiastical authority across the region. The florid descriptions in the anonymous account are particularly detailed regarding the purported theft or desecration of church furnishings by members

---

<sup>102</sup> Guglielmotti, *Comunità e territorio*, pp. 183–91.

<sup>103</sup> ‘Et cum ipse frater Dulcinus cum quamplurimis sequacibus esset in loco Serravallis et intellexisset quod inquistitores pravtatis heretice eum persequabantur, auxiliantibus sibi quibusdam de dicto loco Serravallis, qui sibi assistebant aufugit inde cum sua pestifera comitiva.’ *Historia*, p. 4.

<sup>104</sup> ‘Ad quem Dulcinum homines et mulieres de diversis mundi partibus veniebant audituri suas falsas predicationes et erronea documenta.’ *Historia*, p. 4.

<sup>105</sup> J. B. Pierce, *Poverty, Heresy, and the Apocalypse: The Order of Apostles and Social Change in Medieval Italy, 1260–1307* (London, 2012), pp. 128–32.

of the Apostles (sacred images, paintings, altar tables, chalices, ornaments, and books) which for small churches would be significant and irreplaceable treasures. One notable accusation is the alleged destruction of the *campanile* and bells of the church of Trivero. The symbolic resonance of this silencing of the institutional church, and the threat to the very structure of community life it might have represented to the reader, cannot be misinterpreted. In its detailed local knowledge, and its reference to the loss of property to confraternities and priests, the text is rhetorically designed to rouse the defensive anger of local clerics and to participate within a broadly recognisable vocabulary for the description of heretical behaviour. All accounts indicate that in the summer of 1305, the community of the Apostles left the river valleys and found a new refuge high up in the mountains, where they were effectively placed under siege by the military forces under Bishop Raniero Avogadro. In March 1306 they moved to another peak, Monte Rubello, near Trivero.

At this point, the bishop of Vercelli received papal aid for another military offensive, which took the form of a crusade —military action conducted in defence of the Church. Pope Clement V (r.1305–1314) issued a plenary indulgence to ‘all of Christ’s faithful who personally go to fight and exterminate’ the heretics.<sup>106</sup> The pope’s response additionally required assistance and cooperation from Louis of Savoy, inquisitors active throughout Lombardy, and the archbishop of Milan, and undoubtedly amplified and transformed the broader perception of the conflict to a crusade narrative: a battle for the defence of the true church of God.

The culmination of that military campaign nonetheless seems to have taken place in a sparsely populated and forbidding landscape further north in the Valsesia. The last refuge of the group is widely accepted to have been Monte Rubello di Trivello, a peak northeast of the city of Biella.

On Holy Thursday, 10 March 1306, the aforesaid brother Dolcino the heretic, along with his perfidious followers numbering 1,300 or so went up to Mount Rubello, which is above the mountains of Trivero, and in the following year on Holy Thursday, 23 March, he was captured and imprisoned with his followers,

---

<sup>106</sup> N. J. Housley, ‘Politics and Heresy in Italy: Anti-Heretical Crusades, Orders and Confraternities, 1200–1500’, *The Journal of Ecclesiastical History*, 33/2 (1982), pp. 193–208, at p. 195.



those pestilential dogs.<sup>107</sup>

The bishop resumed a siege, cutting off supplies to the mountain. The atrocities recorded in the anonymous account occurred during this period: the Apostles and their supporters among local communities were said to have murdered, tortured and mutilated innocent people. Faithful Christians were reportedly put to death on gallows, and infants were left to die without baptism; acts of monstrosity which are characteristic topoi of anti-heretical texts.<sup>108</sup> The depiction of the group as bestial, inhuman, and demonic was supportive to the effective military campaign orchestrated by the diocese of Vercelli. By 23 March 1307, the episcopal forces were able to overcome the remaining living Apostles at Stavello. The perceived leaders of the group were captured, and the remaining members were killed; the *Historia* reports that the battle was so grimly final that the local river was renamed *Carnaschus* (Carnage) as it became red with blood from the bodies of the dead. Dolcino, Margherita, and Longino were imprisoned at Biella for two further months while waiting for Clement V's declaration on their punishment. The three were transferred to the secular justice system for judgement, and their executions occurred on 1 June 1307, in Vercelli. Margherita was burned at the stake. Longino and Dolcino were first tortured, processed through the public squares of the city of Vercelli and mutilated, before being burned. The note on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7 strongly suggests that clerics in the city of Vercelli made a direct connection between the traumatic events and the anxieties they inevitably generated, and the works of Joachim of Fiore which they had in their possession. The pursuit of Dolcino across the region over the preceding years, and the direct involvement of the pope to address the threat he presented, surely created an atmosphere of intense anxiety. The bishop of Vercelli was praised by Clement V as an inheritor of the greatness of his predecessor and patron saint Eusebius of Vercelli, who defeated the Arian heresy. It was also reported

---

<sup>107</sup> *Historia*, p. 13. This translation is taken from: Cohn, *Popular Protest in Late Medieval Europe*, pp. 55–6. The details of this account are drawn from the *Historia* and from J. B. Pierce's account of the narrative in: Pierce, *Poverty, Heresy, and the Apocalypse*, pp. 128–32.

<sup>108</sup> A. Patschovsky, 'Heresy and Society: On the Political Function of Heresy in the Medieval World', in *Texts and the Repression of Medieval Heresy*, ed. C. Bruschi, P. Biller (York, 2003), pp. 23–41.

that all aristocratic families who participated in the ecclesiastical armies received financial compensation from the Church.<sup>109</sup>

The heightened language used for both accounts drawn from in this chapter, the *Historia* and the *De secta*, make use of different kinds of anti-heretical attributes. The *Historia* focuses on the monstrosity and bestial acts of the Order of the Apostles, while the *De secta* offers a polemic against the error and madness of Dolcino and his followers. Strikingly, the *De secta* abhors Dolcino's writings for their 'falsitas errorque et insania', and for the fact that at the time when the author of the account was writing (1316), the apocalyptic terrors Dolcino predicted should have come to pass ten years ago.<sup>110</sup> These phrases and constructions strongly echo the language of the note, when it vehemently asserts that those who hope to find answers about the end of the world in the contents of Rotoli figurati 7 are mistaken: 'fantasia ista vana est atque falsa'. Furthermore, the note also includes evidence of the error in the prediction of the catastrophic year of 1260, in its internal dating. The evidence for Dolcino's early presence in Vercelli studying with Syon da Vercelli, the dramatic and violent end to the activities of the Order of the Apostles, and the association of Dolcino with Joachite thought; these factors seem to coalesce in the language of the note left on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7.<sup>111</sup> Furthermore, these textual similarities and connections require further study in the context of textual criticism and anti-heretical writing. These connections might suggest a coherent rhetorical papal or clerical programme, part of a strategy to address a particular kind of heterodoxy which was perhaps known to the (local?) author of the *De secta*, and the annotator who was plausibly a cleric at the cathedral of S. Eusebio.

---

<sup>109</sup> The bull of Clement V (addressed to the Archbishop of Milan), and letter to Bishop Raniero, are edited in: Orioli, *Fra Dolcino: nascita, vita e morte*, pp. 107–9.

<sup>110</sup> '... et hec excerpta descripsi, ut pateat presentibus et futuris eorum falsitas errorque et insania, sicut experientia iam lapsi temporis luce clarius declaravit, quia hoc anno quo hec scripsi, scilicet in kalendis maii anno Domini MCCCXVI, iam decem anni elapsi sunt quod illa tempora de quibus dixerat transierunt, et que futura in ipsis predicerat minime evenerunt'. *De secta*, p. 23.

<sup>111</sup> Marco Rainini has independently observed the same shared language on the note of Rotoli figurati 7 and the text of the *De secta*, and has come to similar conclusions regarding the connections between Vercelli, Joachim of Fiore, and Dolcino of Novara. His findings are now published in 'I rotoli dei diagrammi di Vercelli', pp. 233–263.

## Conclusion

Vercelli in the late twelfth century possessed an active and advanced learned community with an early and highly esteemed centre for theological teaching. Those teaching in the cathedral centre in this period were eminent and powerful ecclesiastical figures with strong links to the papacy and a plausible interest in innovative theological and ecclesiological thought. We have seen Vercelli in that period had become a prestigious site of learning, attracting individuals from across Europe to the various active intellectual communities, particularly centred upon the cathedral school of S. Eusebio. In the late twelfth century, Bishop Alberto commanded respect and authority well beyond the diocese of Vercelli, and he was commissioned in representative roles by a succession of popes.<sup>112</sup> Alberto's political acumen was such that he was recorded in the necrology of Vercelli as a skilled mediator in negotiations between the pope and the emperor. During the first half of his episcopate, he navigated adeptly between the pope and emperor, obtaining papal privileges and imperial favours which benefited his diocese. The confidence placed in Alberto by Pope Innocent III seems to have been based on his understanding of the bishop's reputation, and his scholarly expertise in determining cases of forgery in canon law.<sup>113</sup> The important roles Alberto was granted by a succession of popes elevated the strategic value of the city to the papacy. It is also probable that the relationships and environments he fostered increased the city's value as a place of perceived cultural importance to the papacy: Vercelli was an important intellectual centre, under a bishop whose intellectual and political brilliance was valued by the papacy.

We have seen how *Rotoli figurati* 4 and 7 contain visual and textual works which communicate thematic concerns we might associate with this period in the late twelfth century, in particular the works and thought of Joachim of Fiore. Through examining these two manuscripts, we have seen how they witness a highly politicised

---

<sup>112</sup> As discussed in chapter two, Alberto was given roles that expressed confidence in his authority and expertise as an ecclesiastical judge by Pope Lucius III, Urban III, Celestine III, and Innocent III.

<sup>113</sup> See chapter two for a more detailed discussion. Frances Andrews offers a good and concise overview of Alberto's political skill as background to his role in defining a new rule for the Humiliati order: Andrews, *The Early Humiliati*, pp. 83–9.

thread of medieval theology which would have been relevant, in different ways, to audiences in the late twelfth and thirteenth century. It is plausible that the image of the *Ecclesia* derives from a late twelfth century exemplar. This kind of intellectual activity could plausibly have been cultivated under the direction of Alberto. Despite the internecine conflict which affected many important northern Italian cities in the thirteenth century, as the city communes grew in power and authority, the cathedral of S. Eusebio sustained its intellectual communities and retained its prestigious relationship with the Petrine see. It is my contention that the copying of the Rotoli figurati in the thirteenth century reflects a sustained intellectual interest in their content, particularly relevant as the year 1260 approached. This chapter, however, has focused on the reception of the work of Joachim, which was so important to the papacy in the late twelfth century, but which underwent a radical transformation in influence and interpretation in the thirteenth century. The note on the dorse of Rotoli figurati 7, left in 1307, is a further reflection not only of this sustained intellectual interest in the works of Joachim of Fiore, but of the dramatic relevance the heretical associations of Joachite thought possessed in the early fourteenth century. Joachim's work has more often been associated with the Franciscan order, and with the offshoots and groups that asserted Franciscan spiritual ideals. What we find in Rotoli figurati 4 and 7 is powerful evidence that Joachim's work was still of interest to the Roman Church through authoritative intellectual centres in close relationship with the papacy in the thirteenth century, as found in the survival of these works at the cathedral of S. Eusebio.

## Conclusion

This study has presented for the first time these seven long-neglected and extraordinary thirteenth-century manuscripts held at the chapter library of the cathedral of S. Eusebio in Vercelli. The Rotoli figurati are a striking example of the multifaceted and complex ways images were used to transmit, gather, generate, and organise different forms of knowledge in the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries. In considering each manuscript, both separately and within the broader context of medieval visual culture, I have presented a clear case for their significance. Further, my study has placed these manuscripts in the broader context of the surge in the use of highly complex diagrammatic images, used to express contemporary innovations in theological thought, new forms of knowledge, and modes of religious practice and preaching. In doing so, areas of tension emerge; we have seen how the *Ecclesia* diagram demonstrates attempts to synthesise competing forms of knowledge, exposing fault lines in conceptions of time and history at the end of the twelfth century. In this sense, these documents offer a rich source for further investigation as to the use and function of the diagrammatic mode in the generation of new forms of knowledge. This study thereby contributes to the school of thought which recognises the centrality of images to the transmission of knowledge in the middle ages, particularly in matters concerning the Church.

In addition, the very strong probability that these manuscripts were made in or for the cathedral chapter of S. Eusebio and have never left it, a claim supported by paleographical evidence, analysis of the manuscripts' content, and the broader context of thirteenth-century culture in Vercelli, has enabled a thoroughly historicised account of the creation and use of these images in a particular place, over the period c.1180–1307. I have sought to understand these documents within the most plausible context for their use in Vercelli, and in doing so described a city with a dynamic intellectual culture, led by powerful bishops with strong links to the papal court. In the first half of the thirteenth century, Vercelli's fortune and prestige as an intellectual centre only grew, with the community of canons from the Parisian school of Saint Victor established at S. Andrea from 1219, which became home to the renowned theologian Thomas Gallus. Furthermore, the establishment of the *studium* in 1228 drew many young scholars to the

community; Jordan of Saxony spent time in Vercelli recruiting these well-trained men to the Order of Preachers. There is continued evidence for the development of the city as an intellectual centre, centred on the *studium* as well as the cathedral school, in the mid-thirteenth century. From the 1260s, we observed the presence of further noted scholars in the city. In this period, the grammarian Syon da Vercelli is one example of the high level of teaching activity in the city's schools.

The thesis contributes to broader investigation of the significance of complex images in the expression of medieval knowledge. It goes further to demonstrate that the use of images for the generation of knowledge may also reveal tensions, anxieties, and fault lines, particularly in attempts to use images to synthesise concepts of authority. In the *Rotoli figurati*, I have contended that we can observe the *process* of constructing forms of authoritative knowledge. In this historicised account, we can see how these attempts were a direct response to contemporary issues concerning the renegotiation of authority in the Church and in the world. Furthermore, I have established that broader negative perceptions of Joachimite thought in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries did not mean that his historical theology was altogether discounted by the papacy. Rather than solely being associated either with Franciscan intellectual centres or with heterodox critics of the ecclesiastical hierarchy, some of the *Rotoli figurati* demonstrate that ecclesiastical institutions with strong links to the papacy sustained an interest in Joachim's thought. His interpretation of the vital role of the papacy in the last era of the Church on earth was to maintain its hold. The two manuscripts containing works or themes associated with Joachim were probably copied prior to the year 1260, indicating that apocalyptic speculation derived from Joachim's conception of history was actively engaged with in ecclesiastical centres.

Furthermore, I have shown that the violent upheaval surrounding the papal campaign to eradicate the heterodox religious group of the Order of the Apostles in the first years of the fourteenth century was immediately associated with the works of Joachim of Fiore by the canons in charge of the manuscript collections at S. Eusebio at that time. This extends our understanding of the relevance and currency of Joachim's thought beyond what was previously considered plausible for northern Italy in the late thirteenth century.

I have observed that the use of complex images was important to the Church, in centres —of which Vercelli is unlikely to have been the unique example— which were collecting and producing materials under the direction of bishops with powerful relationships with the papacy. The value and currency of the Rotoli figurati led them to be copied in the third quarter of the thirteenth century, in the case of Rotoli figurati 4 and 7, most likely prior to 1260. In Rotoli figurati 1 we find the only known example of the proofs of Euclid's *Elements* circulating as a visual exemplar without any accompanying text, demonstrating how these images may have been used in pedagogy at the cathedral school of S. Eusebio. In Rotoli figurati 2 (*Rota dominice orationis*), and 3 (*Genealogia christi*), we see examples of a kind of diagram which emerged in the schools of Paris in the late twelfth century, representing new methods of ordering and systematising knowledge. In the *Rota dominice orationis*, this system of ordering spiritual knowledge also reflects new methods of personal spiritual reflection, which would be ratified in the strategies for socio-religious change laid out under the papacy of Innocent III, and in the Fourth Lateran Council (1215). The *Atti degli apostoli* roll records and represents monumental forms of knowledge, incorporating text which historicises the images. In it we see an act of translation, a transfer of artistic form from the monumental scale of wall-paintings in the now lost Romanesque cathedral of S. Eusebio to a style of illustration of the Acts of the Apostles which is now known solely through manuscript illustration. Although damage sustained to Rotoli figurati 6 (*Mappamondo*), and the inaccessibility of recent multispectral images taken of this manuscript, has meant that critical engagement with the map's text was impossible, this study has demonstrated that the *mappamondo* is connected to other manuscripts within the Rotoli figurati. The map is an intricate statement of universal knowledge placed within the cosmological framework of the divine. In this sense, it is closely affiliated with the framing devices — the balance between microcosm and macrocosm—which are also observed in the *Rota dominice orationis*. Furthermore, this balance of scale, and the use of historical and cosmological framing devices, are also found in the *Ecclesia* diagram (Rotoli figurati 5). This manuscript, and Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), have been granted the most space in this thesis. The *Ecclesia* diagram is extremely rare, known only in the Vercelli instance and through the Cotton Roll. I have argued that its structure places this diagram within the same visual discourse as the

complex figurative theology of Hugh of Saint Victor, with Joachimist augmentations reflecting the concerns and interests of the late twelfth-century papacy. Multiple hands active in this manuscript reflect the addition of these materials, and one hand has added a previously unknown text of Joachimist thought, which may yet prove to be a work of the Calabrian abbot. In its composite nature, the *Ecclesia* diagram is governed by a multivalent figure representing Christ, the earthly and heavenly Church, trampling on its enemies and triumphant in its battle with the eternal enemy of Christendom. It is, moreover, an image of social order, under the primary and supreme universal governance of the Petrine See. It therefore offers an attempt to balance and integrate multiple presentations of time and history, the apocalyptic role of the papacy simultaneously integrated with an image of right order in the world, with the Church as primary authority. This diagram offers an ideological statement of papal power and legal authority which, so far as we know, had not otherwise been seen in visual form, and which had no single textual source. This figure, as a flawed and layered image, has clearly been augmented and reworked. As it was copied in the second half of the thirteenth century, it reflects a papal interest in this composite statement of ecclesiastical jurisdictional supremacy which was still current in this later period. Its relation to Rotoli figurati 7 (Giacchino da Fiore), is very close. I have contended, building on recent work by Marco Rainini and others, that the Gioacchino da Fiore manuscript offers an example of how Joachim intended his early figural works to circulate. Its copying in Vercelli, and continued conservation despite the papal campaigns to eradicate those heterodox groups who propounded interpretations of his views which were deemed heretical, demonstrate Joachim's enduring currency and perceived value in the context of debates surrounding the role and power of the Church.

What we should take from this evidence is an image of papal interest not only in Joachim's work, but in complex *visual* works transmitting contemporary knowledge of time, history, and social order as a means to reveal God's plan. These composite visual encyclopaedias were conceived in the late twelfth century, but they were still perceived to have important theological value throughout the thirteenth century, and into the early fourteenth. If we look forward to recent studies of complex images from the mid-fourteenth century, we can see possible evidence that this papal interest in the value of complex theological images was sustained over time. Sarah Griffin, in her thesis on time



in the drawings of Opicinus de Canistris, has observed that the often pathologised work of this Pavian cleric in fact reflects the intellectual concerns of the Avignon papacy. An inventory of the papal library at Avignon dating to 1369 in fact records the work of Hugh of Saint Victor, and of Joachim of Fiore. Griffin has drawn the line, long overlooked, between these twelfth-century diagrammatic innovations and the complex schemata produced by Opicinus at the papal court and almost certainly under papal direction. Then, as in the twelfth century, these images reflect an interest close to the authoritative centre of the Church in finding new ways to represent and collate knowledge of the world, which was also knowledge of God. Each of the *Rotoli figurati* transmit knowledge in different ways, often in the diagrammatic mode, born from the visual encyclopaedic trend widely recognised to have emerged in the twelfth century, and developed and built upon in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. Research on the fourteenth-century Avignon papacy has argued that the Roman Church maintained a concern for a visual method of meaningfully ordering information which has often been overlooked.

Emerging in the twelfth century, this kind of image making was a means of transmitting authoritative knowledge throughout the period and beyond. Further, this study has shown how complex diagrams were not only a means of communicating knowledge, they were also generative. Their composition and their meaning require patient and prolonged study, and consideration from every perspective. Several of the *Rotoli figurati* required mediators in the form of teachers or lecturers, at least to those viewers who were unfamiliar with how to look at such images, in order to fully comprehend their meaning. The endeavour of learning how to see and understand the *Rotoli figurati* is part of the richness of their meaning. The *Rotoli figurati* may be an extraordinary survival, but the number of chapter libraries in northern Italy with only partially catalogued libraries is vast; I hope that more may be found, and a broader understanding of how these complex images enriched the transmission and creation of knowledge in the middle ages will develop with further scholarly interest. This thesis has predominantly focused on manuscript drawings, with reference to sources from monumental works such as wall-paintings and mosaics. However, the study of the diagrammatic mode more widely calls for connections to be drawn across an expanded field of medieval visual culture. Symbolic systems which rely on arrangement and order

to generate spiritual meaning are systems which this study would classify as diagrammatic, and these are found in many other forms of visual communication in the middle ages, such as stained glass and reliquaries. Lucy Donkin has demonstrated how the symbolic decoration of an early twelfth-century pavement in the cathedral of S. Maria in Novara resonated with monumental imagery throughout the church, and was used as framework for liturgical and baptismal rites, a schema which reflected broader religious and social concerns pertinent to the historical context of Novara.<sup>1</sup> Stefano Riccioni has argued that the symbolic imagery of medieval apse mosaics, in their ordered arrangement and amendment with inscription — the interaction between image and text — should be understood as monumental diagrams.<sup>2</sup> Donkin's analysis of the Novara pavement gives it an important symbolic resonance in the broader pictorial programme of the entire church, completed by the orderly movement of people within that framework in the performance of ecclesiastical rites. Similarly, the recent work by Marius Hauknes on the monumental thirteenth-century fresco cycle in the great hall of Cardinal Conti at SS. Quattro Coronati in Rome has begun to elucidate how this visual programme operates as a diagram, with smaller groups and themes interacting through their spatial arrangement and through the perspective of the viewer in order to underpin the thematic aims of the whole.<sup>3</sup> On a smaller scale, studies of the icon of the Saviour in the Sancta Sanctorum in the Lateran by Kirstin Noreen and Nino Zchomelidse have examined the additions made to this icon in the late twelfth and thirteenth centuries.<sup>4</sup> The silver encasement added to the icon during the pontificate of Innocent III covers Christ's body, revealing only the head and the feet. Building on Gerhard Wolf's observation of how this covering reflects Innocent's own interest in propagating the cult of the Veronica, Zchomelidse shows how the geometric

---

<sup>1</sup> L. Donkin, 'Suo Loco: The *Traditio Evangeliorum* and the Four Evangelist Symbols in the Presbytery Pavement of Novara Cathedral', *Speculum*, 88/1 (2013), pp. 92–143.

<sup>2</sup> S. Riccioni, *Il mosaico absidale di S. Clemente a Roma: Exemplum della chiesa riformata* (Spoleto, 2006), pp. 39–40.

<sup>3</sup> Hauknes, 'Painting Knowledge', pp. 19–47.

<sup>4</sup> Noreen, 'Revealing the Sacred', pp. 228–37; N. Zchomelidse, 'The Aura of the Numinous and Its Reproduction: Medieval Paintings of the Savior in Rome and Latium', *Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome*, 55 (2010), pp. 221–63; 'Liminal Phenomena: Framing Medieval Cult Images with Relics and Words', *Viator*, 47/3 (2016), pp. 243–96.

arrangement of scenes, motifs, and roundels on the cover functions to evoke an eschatological dimension.<sup>5</sup> Noreen's analysis also explores the meaning generated by the scenes on the icon's encasement, showing how placement and gesture in the registers of this external decoration mediate between the viewer and the holy image, but also makes a statement about its nature, its placement in the Lateran palace, and the icon's relation to other images of Christ in Rome. These examples demonstrate how diverse works which make use of such ordering principles participate within the diagrammatic mode of image making, and framing our understanding of medieval visual communication in these terms justifies further exploration in future studies.

In this thesis I have offered a presentation and historicised account of the provenance and function of the Rotoli figurati. I have also used these remarkable documents as a lens through which to examine broader issues relating to medieval visual culture and the role of drawings and the diagrammatic mode in the generation of knowledge. Through these processes, I hope to have demonstrated that the Rotoli figurati are a valuable resource. Their exceptional survival should refocus our attention on the significant role of complex and diagrammatic images in medieval thought.

---

<sup>5</sup> Wolf, 'From Mandyllion to Veronica', pp. 153–79.

## Note on transcription and translation

In manuscript transcriptions, I have expanded abbreviations or contractions and indicated this through italics, otherwise preserving the orthography. Punctuation has been standardised and capitalisation added, for ease of reading. Uncertain readings, from damage or illegibility, are indicated by [...], with multiple word losses indicated by [\* \* \*]. Angle brackets indicate a supplied letter <x>. Suggested readings are included in the text with the original manuscript reading included in a footnote reference. Paragraph marks are indicated by ||. Tironian signs have been silently expanded to *et*. Quotations from the Bible are referenced in footnotes. Within translations, I have set quotations from scripture in italics, along with any other quotations, with references footnoted. In my translations, I have aimed for clarity in modern English. I have added modern punctuation. Unless otherwise stated, all bible references are cited from the Vulgate, English translations are cited from the Douay-Rheims as revised by Challoner.

## Appendix 1: ACVC, Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*): Text

The text that follows is a working edition of the main passages of text of the *Ecclesia* manuscript, beginning with the left side of the figure, reading down and then across to the right side. This does not include the rubrication, or the smaller passages of text at the edges of the document, which accompany the roundels for each vice and virtue. Through including this basic working edition, I aim to make the text of this manuscript accessible.\*

Imago hec representat Ecclesiam que figuraliter homini comparatur, cuius caput est Christus.<sup>1</sup> Ceteri fideles membra dicuntur,<sup>2</sup> que totaliter Ecclesia Christus integer appellatur, videlicet caput cum membris, cuius due sunt partes: triumphans in vita celestis, scilicet, Ierusalem cum angelis, et militans in via.<sup>3</sup> Caput quidem Christum significat, qui in  
5 Apocalipsi legitur: simili filio homini, cuius capilli sunt candidi tamquam lana.<sup>4</sup> Corona aurea in caput eius una imperialis, alia regalis, alia pontificalis. Verus Rex imperator, cuius regnum et imperium est in eternum. Idem est pro nobis assistentes pontifex pastor, et episcopus animarum nostrarum. Ipse ergo rex et sacerdos sponse sue contulit regale sacerdotium<sup>5</sup>, cuius vicarium Petrum et eius successores catholicos, et sacerdotes sunt et  
10 reges, cuius vicarii sunt reges mundani, unde et ei subditi sunt et devoti.<sup>6</sup> Circa Christi caput exterius sunt xxiiior sedilia seniorum; xii scilicet apostoli iudicantes xii tribus Israelis. In medio circulo iii gerarchie angelorum. Infra tertium circulum sanctorum anime concluduntur. Seniores iudicabunt. Angeli assistent. Anime iuditio coronantur. Videntes deum facie ad faciem<sup>7</sup> sicuti est, et quem misit Iesum Christum,<sup>8</sup> in quem desiderant angeli  
15 conspiciere,<sup>9</sup> quod est vita eterna. Ista sanctorum colectio celestis Ierusalem dicitur, quia in celis visione pacis perfruitur.

---

\* I am grateful to Gustav Zamore, Mirella Ferrari, Marco Rainini, Gervase Rosser, Martin Kauffmann, Winfried Rudolf, and James Norrie for their knowledge and assistance in rendering an accurate edition of the Latin text. Any errors which remain are my own.

<sup>1</sup> 1 Cor 11:3

<sup>2</sup> MS d\*\*\*ur

<sup>3</sup> Augustine, *De civitate Dei [Libri XI-XXII]*, ed. by B. Dombart and A. Kalb, CCSL, 47–48, repr. (Turnhout, 1955), bk. XX, pt. 9, at p. 716.

<sup>4</sup> Apoc 1:13–14

<sup>5</sup> 1 Peter 2:9

<sup>6</sup> MS d\*\*\*ti

<sup>7</sup> MS *facie ad facie ad faciem*. This is an example of dittography.

<sup>8</sup> John 17:3

<sup>9</sup> 1 Peter 1:12

Mater nostra, cuius in doctrina et exemplo pas<c>imur et lactamur. Oculi, nasus, gene, capilli sponsi *Christi* et sponse *Ecclesie*, ex Canticis Canticorum et alibi describuntur.

20

De ore *Christi* columba egreditur habens clavem sciencie discretionis potestas,<sup>10</sup> specialiter episcopis tradita, qui secundum spiritum sanctum non suum debent discrete secundum scientiam dei<sup>11</sup> potestatem iudicii exercere, et revelante spiritu sancto veritatem in dubiis declarare. Eadem columba trutina<m><sup>12</sup> equitatis inducit, que est mater iusticie quam per  
25 gladium descignamus.<sup>13</sup> Cui presidet papa romanus. Gladius iste in corpore *Ecclesie* vagina tegitur, inferius evaginatur: propter auctoritatem et rigorem qui antiquitus exercebatur, et misericordiam *Ecclesie* que loco iudicii condolet et miseretur.

<I>n humeris et brachiis depingitur collegium Romane *Ecclesie*, quod circumdat et  
30 protegit alia collegia ipso corpore brachiis concluduntur. In superiori sede est Petrus. Ab alia presidens Urbanus, vel quislibet alius, eandem et ab eodem quoniam Petrus. Post Petrum tanquam minister et asistens ponitur Paulus. Inferior Petro ab eodem latere ponuntur vi episcopi cardinales, et vigintiocto presbyteri. A sinistris est Stephanus, cuius merito diacones<sup>14</sup> plurimum honorantur, et sunt x et viii. Sub diaconibus est ordo  
35 subdiaconorum, et aliorum inferiorum continentiam et castitatem habencium que in manibus depinguntur.

<G>ladius iusticie et tocius iurisdictionis ad *Christum* pertinet et *Ecclesiam*, cuius est: peccata tollere, caput malorum et reproborum punire. Ideo protenditur ab ore *Christi* in os  
40 diaboli. Ad quam<sup>15</sup> iusticiam exercendam vocavit rationalem naturam, quam primi homines tenuerunt cum preceptis iuris naturalis. Abel: iure divino. Caym: lege consuetudinis. Gentes: iure gentium. Moyses: iure divine constitutionis. Athene: iure scripto. Lacedemon: non scripto. A quibus Romani habuerunt ius civile.

45 Novissime sucessit ius canonicum, sancto spiritu promulgatum, ad regendum populum *Christianum* qui primo vocatur ad baptismum, postmodum remanet in officio coniugali, vel promovetur ordine clericali, tum in sacris ordinibus, et ideo contrahere non possunt tam in inferioribus qui illicite contrahu<n>t. Quibus non licet sibi ius dicere, et a<u>ctoritate propria suas iniurias vindicare. Ideo positus est ordo iudiciarius in medio, ut ratione  
50 canonum ius suum cuique servetur in premium, vel in penam, de quibus agitur in decretis.

---

<sup>10</sup> MS potestatis

<sup>11</sup> MS die

<sup>12</sup> MS trutina

<sup>13</sup> MS descignamus

<sup>14</sup> MS diaconis; diacones erased.

<sup>15</sup> MS quem

|| Lapsi a viciis et erroribus suis *per penitenciam* in *ecclesia* reparantur.

55 Romanum imperium omnibus Deus prefecit in quo<sup>16</sup> omnes populos ad unam iurisdictionem collegit. Ubi ius novum in populo novo futurum previdit, quorum romanorum<sup>17</sup> iura in contractibus maleficiis possessionibus actionibus vertebantur. De quibus tractatur in legibus. In hoc enim distinguitur materia legum, que circa istas personas versatur, a materia decretorum que est promotio et amotio clericorum.

60

Hic cepit orriri Roma, futura mundi domina, in qua *Christus* Regale sacerdotium<sup>18</sup> fore previdit, ex tunc prophetie missi sunt.<sup>19</sup>

||Sicut supra dictum est, *Christus* est caput *Ecclesie*. Capilli et corona eius sancti qui sunt  
65 cum eo. Corpus eius sunt ceteri fideles. A principio predestinati humeri eius, manus et brachia; ecclesia romana pectus est; eius episcopi, cor; iudices venter; et coste: claustrales<sup>20</sup> et sinodochici. Femora: renati et promovendi. Pudenda: laici. Genua: fuerunt Romani. Tibie: ceteri populi iusticie insistentes. Quasi pedes duo sunt angelica et humana natura, per quas conculcat ecclesia hostem antiquum, cuius corpus est collectio reproborum. Cuius  
70 descriptio, ex Moralibus Iob, et alii<s> voluminibus invenitur.

||Mundus in pedibus *Ecclesie* subponitur,<sup>21</sup> et per opera sex dierum distinguitur.

||Tres sunt colores huius imaginis generales. Aureus in capite. Candidus in ministris  
75 *Ecclesie*. Rubeus in inferiori ordine. Aureus divinitatem supernam. Candidus ecclesiasticarum personarum mundiciam. Rubeus secularem laicorum vitam.

<E>cce mulier amicta sole, et luna sub pedibus eius, et cetera.<sup>22</sup> Mansit in solitudine: mille ducentis xexaginta diebus.<sup>23</sup> Id est ecclesia, que in deserto huius vite stare debet,  
80 mille ducentis sexaginta annis, a Christo videlicet usque ad mortem Antichristi. Quibus expletis, secundum Daniele restabunt xlv dies.<sup>24</sup> Post modum instabit dies iudicii. Ex quibus mille cc lx diebus, id est annis, elapsi sunt mille c et lxxxvii. Unde colligitur

---

<sup>16</sup> MS qua

<sup>17</sup> MS Ro.

<sup>18</sup> 1 Peter 2:9.

<sup>19</sup> Augustine, *De civitate Dei*, bk. 18, pp. 27–36.

<sup>20</sup> MS claustrales

<sup>21</sup> Ephesians 1:22–3.

<sup>22</sup> Apoc. 12:1.

<sup>23</sup> Apoc. 12:6.

<sup>24</sup> Daniel 12:11–12.

*Antichristi tempora imminere et diem iudicii, ut impleatur quod dicitur: Videbitis filium hominis venientem in nubibus cum potestate magna et maiestate.*<sup>25</sup> *Spacium autem illius*  
85 *temporis quod erit ab Antichristo ad diem iudicii soli Deo patet. Quia de die*<sup>26</sup> *illa nemo*  
*scit.*<sup>27</sup> *In illo tempore, convertentur Iudei et omnes nationes ad fidem, et penitenciam, et*  
*aperietur sigillum vii. In cuius incoatione cessabunt tribulationes. Quia cumsummata*  
*erunt misteria sicut scriptum est in Apocalipsi: In voce vii angeli, qui cum ceperit tuba*  
*canere, cumsummabitur misterium Dei,*<sup>28</sup> *sicut consummatum est Vetus Testamentum, et*  
90 *summa pax fuit in tempore nativitatis Christi. Tunc venit Iohannes, nunc veniet Helias.*<sup>29</sup>

*¶ <A>n̄i Ecclesie, id est, mcclx, expanduntur per xliior terdenarios, a Christo usque in*  
*finem. Sicut quadragintadue generationes sunt a Iacob usque ad Christum.*<sup>30</sup> *Ante tempora*  
*Antichristi aperietur sigillum sextum, continens duas tribulationes novissimas et aperientur*  
95 *prophetie Aggei et Zacharie, et hystoria libri Hesdre, Iudiht, Hester, Ezechielis, Danielis,*  
*Ieremie, et ultima pars libri Regum. Tunc credunt egressurum Got de finibus suis, et*  
*percu<ci>etur nova Babilon, quam interpretantur romanum inperium, et nova Ierusalem*  
*reedificabitur; id est Ecclesie dignitas restituetur.*

100 *¶ <A>pertum fuit sigillum v in persecutione Saracenorum, que multas ecclesias subvertit in*  
*Grecia. Tunc inplete sunt prophetie Osee [et] Isaye.*

*¶ <A>pertum est sigillum iiii cum multe Christianorum ecclesie Aggarenis grassantibus*  
*sunt delete.*

105 *¶ <A>pertum est sigillum iii cum Arriani, Gotti, Wandali, Longobardi, Perse ecclesias*  
*destruere ceperunt.*

*<A>pertum est sigillum secundum, in persecutione gentilium Romanorum, videlicet*  
110 *Neronis, Deccii in martiribus.*

*¶ <A>pertum fuit sigillum primum, sub principibus et pontificibus Iudeorum qui primi*  
*sunt ecclesiam persecuti.*

---

<sup>25</sup> Luke 21:12.

<sup>26</sup> MS *diae*

<sup>27</sup> Matt. 24:36.

<sup>28</sup> Apoc. 10:7.

<sup>29</sup> Matt. 17:1-13.

<sup>30</sup> Apoc. 12:2-3.



115 A *Christo* incepit multiplicari ecclesia in duodecim ramos *quarum* x sub quarto et quinto<sup>31</sup> sigillo sunt delete. Duobus ramis superstitibus, *id est* Ecclesia Romana quam fundaverunt Petrus et Paulus.

Navis Petri comparatur arce Noe, extra *quam* nemo salvatur.<sup>32</sup> Silvester comparatur  
120 Melchisedec quia *uterque* rex et sacerdos. Zacharias cum successisset Silvestro in *utroque*, ea divisit, cum Karolum in partem vocavit; quod significatum est in in unctione et Saulis regis, et Aaron sacerdotis.

llvii sigillum fuit sub Iacob et Ioseph,<sup>33</sup> in quorum temporibus qui enim lex et prophete  
125 sub Iohanne Batista.

vi sigillum fuit in persecutione Medorum, et Macedonum.

llv fuit in persecutione Assiriorum, cum x tribus translate sunt, tribus Iude, Beniamin, quasi una remanserunt usque ad *Christum*.

lliiii fuit sub bello Assiriorum

130 lliii fuit sub bello Syrorum.

llii in bello Caneneorum

llPrimum sigillum, sub bello Egiptiorum. Hec tribulationes successerunt in Veteri Testamento, eodem ordine succedunt.

llVetus Testamentum arbori comparatur. Cuius <s>tipes ab Adam usque ad Iacob  
135 protenditur, inde usque ad Oziam conscendet in ramos xii tribuum, a quo<sup>34</sup> incipit deficere in Christum. Arbor vero Novi Testamenti incipit ab Ozia que ramos ecclesiarum facit a *Christo*, usque ad Carolum; ibi glorificata cepit deficere. Glorificata est enim ecclesia sub Karolo, sicut Sinagoga sub Salomone.<sup>35</sup>

140 Tribulationes quas passa est Sinagoga, concordant cum illis quas habet Ecclesia. Prelati sinagoge comparantur prelati Ecclesie. Ierusalem est Ecclesia. Babilon et cetera barbara regna regibus comprimentibus ecclesiam secundum sua tempora comparantur. In multis enim conveniunt ea que acciderunt patribus Veteri<s> Testamenti, cum his que accidunt nobis.

---

<sup>31</sup> MS *quinte*

<sup>32</sup> MS *solvatur*

<sup>33</sup> MS *Ioseph*

<sup>34</sup> MS a q

<sup>35</sup> Joachim of Fiore, *Liber de concordia*, Book IV, Ch. 5, p. 334.

## Appendix 2: ACVC Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*): Legends and Rubrics

The legend numbering refers to the labelling in Figures VII and VIII; as much as possible, I have read left to right across the diagram.

Virtues: *Caritas, Spes, Fides, Sapientia, Prudentia, Fortitudo, Iusticia, Temperantia.*

Vices: [*Superbia*], *Vana gloria, Invidia, Ira, Tristitia, Avaricia, Gula, Luxuria.*

|                                                                                                                            |                                                                               |                                                               |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1. Vidi dominum<br>sed[entum] super<br>solium exc[elsum]<br>ea q[uae] sub ipso<br>erant replebant<br>templum. <sup>1</sup> | 16. <i>Episcopus</i><br><i>Archiepiscopus</i><br><i>Patriarcha</i>            | 31. Lector                                                    |
| 2. Diadema regni <sup>2</sup>                                                                                              | 17. Ordo iudiciarius<br>Testes reus                                           | 32. Exorcista.<br>Exi spiritus<br>immunde.<br>Inerguminus     |
| 3. Antiquis dierum <sup>3</sup>                                                                                            | 18. [Diversis]<br>monasteriorum                                               | 33. Acolitus                                                  |
| 4. Pater noster qui es<br>in celis <sup>4</sup>                                                                            | 19. Capella                                                                   | 34. Degradatio rei<br>Am[m]onitio<br>clericorum               |
| 5. Corona aurea[m] in<br>capite eius <sup>5</sup> lapide<br>precioso. <sup>6</sup>                                         | 20. Sacri ordines                                                             | 35. Traditur cure                                             |
| 6. Posuisti domine in<br>capite eius <sup>7</sup> [***].                                                                   | 21. Continentia                                                               | 36. Traditur Sathane                                          |
| 7. In capite eius<br>diademata multas <sup>8</sup>                                                                         | 22. Castitas                                                                  | 37. <i>Iesus Christus</i>                                     |
| 8. [In capite eius]<br>stellarum<br>duodecim. <sup>9</sup>                                                                 | 23. Patriarcha<br><i>Archiepiscopus</i><br><i>Episcopus</i>                   | 38. Tiberius cesar                                            |
| 9. Sedes Romana                                                                                                            | 24. Ordo iudiciarius<br>Reus <i>convincitur</i><br>Iuditio <i>convincitur</i> | 39. Navicula Petri                                            |
| 10. Presbyteri cardinales                                                                                                  | 25. Varietas<br>senodochiorum                                                 | 40. Imperium Romanum<br><i>hec incipit.</i>                   |
| 11. Sex episcopi<br>cardinales.                                                                                            | 26. Varietas<br>heremitarum                                                   | 41. Machabei<br>Regnum Grecorum.<br>Regnum Persarum.          |
| 12. Paulus, Petrus                                                                                                         | 27. Ubera misericordie<br>Rigor                                               | 42. Eldres Hester                                             |
| 13. <i>Sanctus</i> Stephanus                                                                                               | 28. Karolus accipit<br>gladium Azaria.                                        | 43. Regnum Babilonum                                          |
| 14. Diaconi cardinales                                                                                                     | 29. Constantinus dat<br>omniam Silvestro<br>pape.<br>[Figure x]               | 44. Regnum Assiorum<br>finis veteris<br>testamenti.           |
| 15. Quadraginta dies<br>penitencie                                                                                         | 30. Baptismus<br>Hostiarius                                                   | 45. Ysayas predicat<br>evangelium initium<br>novi testamenti. |
|                                                                                                                            |                                                                               | 46. Regnum Sirorum.                                           |
|                                                                                                                            |                                                                               | 47. Regnum Iuda                                               |
|                                                                                                                            |                                                                               | 48. Samuel inungit<br>Saulem in regem.                        |

<sup>1</sup> Isaiah 6:1.

<sup>2</sup> Isaiah 62:3.

<sup>3</sup> Daniel 7:9.

<sup>4</sup> Matt. 6:9.

<sup>5</sup> Apoc. 14:14.

<sup>6</sup> Ps. 20:4.

<sup>7</sup> Ps. 20:4.

<sup>8</sup> Apoc. 19:12.

<sup>9</sup> Apoc. 12:1.

- |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                               |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| <p>49. Moyses ungit Aaron<br/>in sacerdotem.</p> <p>50. Archa Noe. Iudex<br/>secularis</p> <p>Actor<br/>Ap[p]aritor</p> <p>51. Forum seculare<br/>cause civiles<br/>Autor curator<br/>Maior minora<br/>furiosus<br/>Contraquentes<br/>Coniugium</p> <p>52. Reum trahit<br/>executor in<br/>carcerem.</p> <p>53. Forum seculare<br/>cause civiles<br/>Testator<br/>Testamentum<br/>Maleficia</p> <p>54. Athene</p> <p>55. Predia rusticana</p> <p>56. Servus</p> <p>57. Abel offert</p> <p>58. Ius divinum</p> <p>59. Angelica natura<br/>Super aspidem et<br/>basilliscum<br/>ambulabis et<br/>conculcabis<br/>leonem.<sup>10</sup></p> <p>60. Lacedemon</p> <p>61. Predia urbana.</p> <p>62. Ius gentium</p> <p>63. Civitas Caym; Ius<br/>consuetudinis</p> <p>64. Ius humanum</p> <p>65. Humana natura<br/>Conculcabis leonem<br/>et draconem.<sup>11</sup></p> <p>66. Maxilla perforata.</p> | <p>67. Coperde<br/>reproborem.<sup>12</sup> Rex<br/>filius superbie.<br/>Nomen illi mors;<sup>13</sup><br/>omnia devorans</p> |
|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

<sup>10</sup> Ps. 90:13.

<sup>11</sup> Ps. 90:13.

<sup>12</sup> MS reproborem

<sup>13</sup> Apoc. 6:8.

### Appendix 3: ACVC, Rotoli figurati 4 (*Ecclesia*): Translation

[Left]

This image represents the Church which is compared figuratively to a man whose head is Christ. The other faithful are said to be the limbs, the Church which altogether is called Christ complete, that is the head with its limbs, of which there are two parts: one triumphing in the heavenly life, that is in Jerusalem with the angels, the other serving  
5 on the journey. Indeed, the head represents Christ who in Revelation is one reads about as follows: *one like to the son of man whose hair is white as wool*. One gold crown on his head is imperial, the other regal, the other pontifical. [He is] the true King and Emperor whose kingdom and empire is eternal. [Christ] who is for us the pope, the bishop and shepherd of our souls. Thus, the king and priest brings the regalia of the priesthood to  
10 his betrothed, whose vicar is Peter and his orthodox successors, and those are priests and also kings, whose vicars are worldly kings, who are subject and devoted to Him.

Around the outside of Christ's head are the twenty-four seats of the Elders. There are also twelve Apostles judging the twelve tribes of Israel. In the middle circle [there are]  
15 three hierarchies of angels. Within the third circle the souls of the saints are gathered. The Elders will judge, the angels will attend [them]. The souls are crowned in the judgement. Seeing God face to face as he is and Jesus Christ, whom he sent, whom the angels desire to see, which is eternal life. This gathering of the saints is said to be the heavenly Jerusalem since in the heavens the vision of peace is brought fully to fruition.

20

Our Mother by whose teaching and example we are nourished and suckled. Eyes, nose, cheeks and hair of the bridegroom Christ and the Church the bride are described in the Song of Songs and elsewhere.

25 Out of the mouth of Christ emerges a dove, holding the key of understanding and the power of discernment, which is delivered over specifically to the bishops, who should, guided by the holy spirit and not by their own, exercise with discretion the power of judgement according to divine knowledge, and declare the truth undoubtingly, by the revelation of the holy spirit. That same dove brings in the scales of equity, which are the  
30 mother of justice, which we depict as a sword, with which the Roman Pope presides. This sword is covered by a sheath which is the body of the Church. Further below it is unsheathed because of the authority and rigour which was exercised in the old days; and the mercy of the Church, which shows compassion and pity in the place of judgement.

35 In the shoulders and upper arms is depicted the college of the Roman church, which surrounds and protects the other corporations in the body, [which are] enclosed by the arms. On the highest seat is Peter, from the other presides [Pope] Urban, or whoever else [presides] from this seat since Peter. After Peter, Paul is placed as a minister and in attendance. Below Peter from that side are placed six cardinal bishops and twenty-eight  
40 priests. To the left is Stephen, on whose merit deacons are greatly honoured; and there are eighteen. Under the deacons is the order of subdeacons, and that of other lesser clerics, possessing continence and chastity, which are depicted in the hands.

The sword of justice and all jurisdiction belongs to Christ and his Church, to take away  
45 sins and punish the head of the wicked and the condemned [Satan]. Thus it extends from the mouth of Christ into the mouth of the devil; in order to exercise this justice it called upon rational nature, which the first men held with the precepts of natural law. Abel: with divine right. Cain: with customary law. The gentiles: with the law of the gentiles. Moses: with the divine right of the constitution. Athens: with written law.  
50 Sparta: with unwritten law. From these the Romans had civil law.

Most recently canon law has followed, promulgated by the Holy Spirit in order to rule the Christian people, who are first called to baptism and afterwards [either] remain in the marital office, or are promoted to the clerical order, whether in sacred orders — who  
55 are therefore unable to enter a contract [i.e. marriage] — or in lower orders, who contract [marriage] licetly. It is not permitted to pronounce the law to them, or to judge against their offences by their own authority. For this reason, the order of the judges is placed in the middle, so that by method of the canons to each their justice may be served, whether a reward or a penalty, according to what is urged by the Decretals.  
60

Those fallen by their sins or errors are renewed in the Church through penance.

God put the Roman Empire in charge of all people, in which he gathered all peoples into a single jurisdiction. Then He foresaw a new law in the future for a new people,  
65 because the Roman Laws were being used in wicked contracts, possessions, [and legal] actions. Concerning what is treated in the laws, this is distinguished by the matter of the laws, which concerns those persons, and the matter of decrees, which is the promotion and degradation of the clergy.

70 Here Rome began to rise, the future mistress of the world, in which [the royal Christ] foresaw the coming into being of the priesthood, from then the prophets had been sent.

As has been said above, Christ is the head of the church. His hair and crown are the saints who are with him. His body is the rest of the faithful. Those predestined in the  
75 beginning are his shoulders. [His] hands and arms are the Roman church. His chest is

the bishops, the heart the judges, the stomach and the ribs are the monks and the hospital orders. The thighs: those reborn [through baptism] and those ones who are to be promoted [into the clerical orders]. The private parts: the laity. The knees: those who were Romans. The shins: other law-abiding peoples. Angelic and human nature are like  
80 two feet, by means of which the Church tramples upon the ancient enemy, whose body is the collection of the condemned, and the description of which is found in the *Moralia in Iob* and other volumes

The world is placed under the feet of the Church, and through the work of six days is  
85 divided.

There are three general colours in this image: gold in the head, white for the ministers of the Church, red for the lower order; gold for the higher divinity, white for the purity of people of the Church, red for the secular life of the laity.

90

[Right]

Behold, a woman, clothed with the sun and the moon beneath her feet, etc. She remains in solitude for 1260 days. This is the church, which must stand in the desert of this life for 1260 years, that is from Christ until the death of Antichrist. After those years have  
95 elapsed, there will remain, according to Daniel, 45 days. After that the day of judgement will approach. Of those 1260 days, that is years, 1187 have elapsed. Whence it is inferred that the times of the Antichrist and the day of judgement are imminent, so that what is said may be fulfilled: you will see the son of man coming in clouds, with great power and majesty. The period of time, however, which will be from the time of  
100 Antichrist until the day of judgement, God alone knows, because nobody knows about this day. In that time, the Jews and all nations will be converted to the faith, and penance, and the seventh seal will be opened, at the beginning of which the tribulations will cease, since the mysteries will be completed as it is written in the Apocalypse. In the voice of the seventh angel, who when he shall begin to sound the trumpet, the mystery  
105 of God will be completed, just as the Old Testament is completed, and the greatest peace was in the time of the birth of Christ. Then John came, now Elias will come.

The years of the church, that is, one thousand two hundred and sixty, are expounded through forty-two, thirty-year spans, from Christ up until the end, just as there are 42  
110 generations from Jacob to Christ. Before the time of antichrist, the sixth seal will be opened, which will contain two very novel tribulations, and there will be revealed the prophecies of Aggeus and Zacharias, and the history of the books of Ezra, Judith, Esther, Ezechiel, Daniel, Jeremiah, and the last part of the Book of Kings. Then they believe that Gog will come out of his territory, and the New Babylon, which is  
115 understood as the Roman Empire, will be struck, and the new Jerusalem shall be rebuilt, that is the dignity of the Church shall be restored.

- The fifth seal was opened during the persecution of the Saracens, who tried to destroy many churches in Greece. Then the prophecies of Osiah, and Isaiah were fulfilled.
- 120 The fourth seal was opened when many churches of Christians were destroyed by the advancing Agareni.
- The third seal was opened when the Arians, Goths, Vandals, the Lombards, and the
- 125 Persians began to destroy the churches.
- The second seal was opened during the persecution of the martyrs by the Roman gentiles, namely Nero and Deccius.
- 130 The first seal was opened under the leaders and priests of the Jews, who persecuted the first Church.
- From Christ the church began to multiply into twelve branches. From those, under the fourth and fifth seal, ten have been destroyed. Two of the branches prevail; this is the
- 135 Roman Church which Peter and Paul have founded.
- The ship of Peter is compared to the ark of Noah, because outside of it, nobody will be saved. Silvester is compared to Melchisedec, because both are kings and priests. Zacharias although he succeeded Silvester in both, separated it [i.e. priesthood and
- 140 kingship], when he summoned Karolus to the part [i.e. of kingship]. What is depicted is the anointment of the king Saul and the priest Aaron.
- The seventh seal was under Jacob and Joseph, in whose times [were] when law and the prophets [were] under John the Baptist.
- 145 The sixth seal was during the persecutions of the Medes and the Macedonians.
- The fifth [seal] was during the persecution at the hands of the Assyrians, when the ten tribes were translated [i.e. to Babylon], while the tribes of Benjamin and Judea, almost like one, remained until Christ.
- The fourth was during the war of the Assyrians.
- 150 The third was during the war of the Syrians.
- The second was during the war of the Canaanites.
- The first seal was during the war of the Egyptians. These tribulations followed [each other] in the Old Testament, they follow in the same order.
- 155 The Old Testament is compared to a tree, the lineages extend from Adam to Jacob. From that place up to Oziah ascend the 12 branches of the tribes, from which it begins [to end] in Christ. Indeed, the tree of the New Testament begins from Oziah, who

made the branches of the churches from Christ, until Charlemagne; there, [glorified] it began to [come to an end]. For the church was glorified under Charles, just as the  
160 synagogue was under Solomon.

The tribulations which the synagogue suffered accord with those which the church has suffered. The [aforementioned] synagogues are compared to the [aforementioned] churches. Jerusalem is the Church. Babylon and other barbarian kingdoms, with  
165 tyrannous kings compared to the church according to its times. For in many things, what happened to the fathers of the Old Testament concords with things which have happened to us.



## Appendix 4: ACVC, Rotoli figurati 4 and 7: Textual comparison

| Seals                | Rotoli figurati 4 ( <i>Ecclesia</i> )                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | Rotoli figurati 7 (Gioacchino da Fiore), <i>Figura arboris</i>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
|----------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Opening Seventh Seal | Spacium autem illius temporis quod erit ab Antichristo ad diem iudicii soli Deo patet. Quia de die illa nemo scit. In illo tempore, convertentur Iudei et omnes nationes ad fidem, et penitenciam, et aperietur sigillum vii. In cuius incoatione cessabunt tribulationes. Quia cumsummata erunt misteria sicut scriptum est in Apocalipsi: <i>In voce vii angeli, qui cum ceperit tuba canere, cumsummabitur misterium Dei sicut consummatum est Vetus Testamentum, et summa pax fuit in tempore nativitatis Christi. Tunc venit Iohannes, nunc veniet Helias.</i> | Inchoata VII sigilli apertione cessabunt tribulationes, quia cumsummata erunt misteria, sicut scriptum est. <i>In voce septimi angeli</i> [Apoc. 10:7] Spacium uerso illius temporis soli Deo committitur. Circa ista tempora tenet opinio egressurum Gog de finibus suis.                                              |
| Opening Sixth Seal   | Ante tempora Antichristi aperietur sigillum sextum, continens duas tribulationes novissimas et aperientur prophetie Aggei et Zacharie, et hystoria libri Hesdre, Iudiht, Hester, Ezechielis, Danielis, Ieremie, et ultima pars libri Regum. <i>Tunc credunt egressurum Got de finibus suis, et percu&lt;ci&gt;etur nova Babilon, quam interpretantur romanum inperium, et nova Ierusalem reedificabitur, id est Ecclesie dignitas restituetur.</i>                                                                                                                  | Iste due generationes novissime pervenient ad septimi signaculi apertione. Hic percucietur nova Babylon novaque Iersuaalem edificabitur in angustia temporum. Hic aperietur prophetia Aggei et Zacharie prophetarum et historia libri Ez<d>re et Iudith et Hester et Ezechielis et Danielis et ultima pars libri regum. |
| Opening Fifth Seal   | Apertum fuit sigillum v in persecutione Saracenorum, que multas ecclesias subvertit in Grecia. Tunc inplete sunt prophetie Osee et Isaye.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Apertio sigilli quinti continet bella novorum Caldeorum et nove babilonis contra spirituaalem Ierusalem.                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| Opening fourth seal  | Apertum est sigillum iiii cum multe Christianorum ecclesie Aggarenis grassantibus sunt delete.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | Apertio sigilli quarti continet Agarenorum bella. Multe enim Christianorum ecclesie grassantibus sunt delete.<br>Hic ceperunt consumari secundum intelligentiam typicam ea que Osee                                                                                                                                     |

|                     |                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|---------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                     |                                                                                                                                 | et Ysayas prophetarum primi de imminente sibi tempore prophetaverunt.<br>Apertio sigilli quarti. Hic cepit oriri persecutio Saracenorum, que post non multos annos quasi mare intumuit et multas Grecorum ecclesias conquassando subvertit.                                                     |
| Opening third seal  | <i>Apertum est sigillum iii cum Arriani, Gotti, Wandali, Longobardi, Perse ecclesias destruere ceperunt.</i>                    | Apertio sigilli [III] Arrianorum tempora representat in quibus a Gothis, et Wandalis, Longobarbis, et Persis sustinuit persecutiones ecclesia.                                                                                                                                                  |
| Opening Second seal | <i>Apertum est sigillum secundum, in persecutione gentilium Romanorum, videlicet Neronis, Deccii in martiribus.</i>             | Apertio sigilli secundi tempore gentilium completa est in martyribus.                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| Opening First Seal  | <i>Apertum fuit sigillum primum, sub principibus et pontificibus Iudeorum qui primi sunt ecclesiam persecuti.</i>               | Apertio sigilli primi a passione Domini sumpsit originem, peracta vero est sub principibus et pontificibus Iudeorum. Ipsi enim primi persequi ceperunt ecclesiam.                                                                                                                               |
|                     |                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| Seventh Seal        | vii sigillum fuit sub Iacob et Ioseph, in quorum temporibus qui enim lex et prophete sub Iohanne Batista.                       | Sigillum septimum continet sabbatum, ide est, requiem a servitute legis. Lex enim et prophete usque ad Iohannem Batistam.                                                                                                                                                                       |
| Sixth Seal          | vi sigillum fuit in persecutione Medorum, et Macedonum.                                                                         | Sigillum VI continet bella Medorum, pari modo et Macedonum.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Fifth Seal          | v fuit in persecutione Assiriorum, cum x tribus translate sunt, tribus Iude, Benjamin, quasi una remanserunt usque ad Christum. | Sigillum quintum continet bell Chaldeorum.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| Fourth Seal         | iiii fuit sub bello Assiriorum                                                                                                  | Sigillum quartum continet. Hic cepit oriri persecutio Assiriorum, a quibuss infra pauco annos regnum Israel, hoc est [decem] <absortum est translatis X tribubus [in] Assyrios, et pro quibus reges Assiriorum gentes alias in eorum possessionibus locaverunt, que postea Samarite dicte sunt. |
| Third Seal          | iii fuit sub bello Syrorum.                                                                                                     | Sigillum tertium continet bella Syrorum                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |

|             |                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|-------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Second Seal | ii in bello Cananeorum                                                                                                              | Sigillum secundum continet bella Chananeorum.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| First Seal  | Primum sigillum, sub bello Egiptiorum. Hec tribulationes successerunt in Veteri Testamento, eodem ordine succedunt.                 | Sigillum primum continet bella Egiptiorum.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|             | Hic cepit oriri Roma, futura mundi domina, in qua Christus Regale sacerdotium fore previdit, exinde propheta missi sunt. (ll. 61–2) | Hic cepit oriri Roma, que futura erat domina mundi in qua regale sacerdotium previdit esse futurum, et ideo, ut testatur Augustinus in libro de civitate Dei, ex tunc propheta missi sunt, qui ea, que sub Romano imperio erant consumanda, prescriberent et ultimum Christi adventum in plenitudine temporum predicarent. |