

**Ecclesiastical Politics and the Role
of Women in African-American
Christianity, 1860–1900**

George Scratcherd

Christ Church

University of Oxford

Thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

June 2016

Abstract

Ecclesiastical Politics and the Role of Women in African-American Christianity, 1860–1900

George Scratcherd, Christ Church, University of Oxford

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

June 2016

This thesis seeks to offer new perspectives on the role of women in African-American Christian denominations in the United States in the period between the Civil War and the turn of the twentieth century. It situates the changes in the roles available to black women in their churches in the context of ecclesiastical politics. By offering explanations of the growth of black denominations in the South after the Civil War and the political alignments in the leadership of the churches, it seeks to offer more powerful explanations of differences in the treatment of women in distinct denominations. It explores the distinct worship practices of African-American Christianity and reflects on their relationship to denominational structure and character, and gender issues. Education was central to the participation of women in African-American Christianity in the late nineteenth century, so the thesis discusses the growth of black colleges under the auspices of the black churches. Finally it also explores the complex relationship between domestic ideology, the politics of respectability, and female participation in the black churches.

Extended Abstract

Ecclesiastical Politics and the Role of Women in African-American Christianity, 1860–1900

George Scratcherd, Christ Church, University of Oxford

Submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

June 2016

This thesis seeks to offer new perspectives on the role of women in African-American Christian denominations in the United States in the period between the Civil War and the turn of the twentieth century. It situates the changes in the roles available to black women in their churches in the context of ecclesiastical politics. By offering explanations of the growth of black denominations in the South after the Civil War and the political alignments in the leadership of the churches, it seeks to offer more powerful explanations of differences in the treatment of women in distinct denominations. It explores the distinct worship practices of African-American Christianity and reflects on their relationship to denominational structure and character, and gender issues. Education was central to the participation of women in African-American Christianity in the late nineteenth century, so the thesis discusses the growth of black colleges under the auspices of the black churches. Finally it also explores the complex relationship between domestic ideology, the politics of respectability, and female participation in the black churches.

While there has been a great deal of literature documenting the expansion of women's roles in African-American Christianity too much of it is descriptive

rather than explanatory. Studies of the religious history of African-American Christian women in the nineteenth century tend to have focussed primarily on key flashpoints in the institutional history of women's church roles. For example, Jualynne Dodson's work on women in the African Methodist Episcopal Church in the nineteenth century focusses on the highest profile women preachers in the church such as Jarena Lee and Amanda Berry Smith; and on debates over expansion of the formal roles open to women, such as the creation of boards of stewardesses, lay preaching licenses for women, and the debates over the ordination of women. Historians have tended to focus on describing such pivotal points in the history of women in nineteenth-century Christianity and the debates surrounding them. Little attention has been paid to explaining the underlying causes of such moments and explaining why these debates transpired the way they did. Historians' recounting of debates over the role of women in church newspapers and journals and at church conferences and conventions predominantly treat the terms of these debates at face value. Church leaders most frequently expressed their support or opposition to granting greater roles and influence to women in scriptural terms. For example, church leaders frequently cited St Paul's directive that 'the women should keep silence in the churches' and differed in their interpretation as to whether it applied to modern churches. Second only to direct reference to Scripture were arguments predicated on a vision of domesticity in which women's place was the home and women had no place in the public life of the church. Too often historians have merely described, understood, and explained the oppositions or support of church leaders to female authority and leadership in these superficial terms. Church leaders' attitudes have been

described as though they merely depended on how they interpreted Scripture and how conservative a view of domestic life they held. This ultimately oversimplifies the explanation of the differing degrees of progress towards greater female leadership in different denominations and at different times. It reduces it to a question of how theologically conservative, sexist and misogynistic church leaders were with little explanation of why particular groups of church leaders should hold such views and little reference to any wider context of church politics, denominations' resources and requirements, and subtleties of denominational discipline and character. Too frequently women's role in the expansion of female church power has been seen as one of universal support, with women campaigning for greater roles out of a proto-feminist motivation to enhance female power in church and society. Neither of these are accurate, as many women opposed the ordination of women especially, and women often sought greater power in their churches not for its own sake but because of their attachment to varied causes and their affiliations on varied issues in church life, such as a connection to the holiness movement, for example. In turn male church leaders have been occasionally been portrayed as universally hostile to the expansion of female roles. Even when diversity in the opinion of male church leaders has been recognised, its causes have been simplified to questions of scriptural interpretation, and differing degrees of sexism. This thesis aims to add a great deal more context and texture to the explanations of the motivations behind both the male and female participants by recognising that they operated in a wider context of numerous diverse issues in church life and church politics, which drove their opinions and actions with regard to women and gender issues in their churches.

The scholarly literature frequently portrays the story of African-American women in the nineteenth century as a slow but steady inexorable progress towards expanded roles with greater authority and agency for women, culminating in the ordination debates of the 1880s and 1890. This is problematic on several levels, not least because of the numerous reverses of expansions to women's roles, most notably the revocation of Henry McNeil Turner's ordination of Sarah Ann Hughes in 1887. Understanding gender in nineteenth-century African-American Christianity in this fashion results in histories which focus most on the later nineteenth century when women had won some concessions, and had some positions made available to them in their churches. This focus increases as these histories progress chronologically through the nineteenth century as more roles became available to women. The corollary of this is that most historians, when seeking to understand the history of African-American women's participation in nineteenth-century Christianity, have paid little attention to earlier periods in the nineteenth century when women's rights within their churches were constrained. The implication is seemingly that the lack of a right to participate and the consequent predominant absence of women from leadership within African-American Christianity makes these periods irrelevant for the analysis of female participation. However this thesis argues that it is essential to study these periods of absence; to interrogate the silence of church leaders over gender questions. In order to understand why later in the nineteenth century women were able to secure some leadership positions in their churches it is necessary to understand why this was not considered or countenanced earlier. Studying the absence of women from church leadership also has significance when denominations are considered

comparatively. While women were still severely restricted in the authority they exercised in some denominations, other pioneering churches, like the Spencer churches, for example, offered women significantly more authority and responsibility. Therefore the hesitancy of larger African-American denominations to do so cannot be easily dismissed as an expected product of the attitudes of the time. The differences between these churches must be studied and understood in order to find an explanation. Furthermore, even when the possibility of expanding the role of women was raised and dismissed, the terms of discussion were very different between different denominations. While the possibility of licensing women to preach was frequently raised in African-American Methodist churches in the early and mid-nineteenth century, it was not on the agenda of African-American Baptist churches.

These problems and omissions in the existing literature on African-American Christian women in the nineteenth century have significantly limited its explanatory power. The secondary literature offers little to explain why certain advances were made when they were. For example it offers no explanation of why the AME Church created boards of stewardesses in 1868, rather than earlier or later, or why the AME Zion Church began ordaining women in the 1890s. Furthermore it offers little explanation of significant differences between denominations in their treatment of women. In some cases these differences were significant despite other distinctions between denominations being relatively small. For example, the AME Church and the AME Zion Church were in most respects very similar denominations. Their disciplines differed very little in the late nineteenth century. Yet the AME Church banned the ordination of women in 1888 and did not reverse the decision

until 1948. Yet the AME Zion Church began ordaining women beginning with Julia A. J. Foote in 1894. There was a difference of over fifty years between the dates at which these two very similar churches began ordaining women. This requires explanation, and cannot be easily dismissed by pointing to other major differences between the churches — the cause of this major chronological disparity must have been more subtle. Yet historians' accounts of the debates over the ordination of women in these churches do not offer any explanatory framework by which to understand this difference. In part the lack of explanatory power of the secondary literature to explain such issues is due to the oversimplification of the motives of the participants in these debates, but also due to a lack of detailed understanding of the institutional structures and characters of the African-American church denominations. The primary aim of this thesis is to correct this omission of explanations for the timing and the differences between denominations in the expansions of women's church roles in the late nineteenth century.

This thesis attempts to offer explanations of female participation in the churches through a strong institutional understanding of the separate church denominations. Methodologically this is achieved by a detailed reading of the institutional literary productions of these churches: the church newspapers and journals and well as their conference, convention and association records and minutes, both at a national and sub-national level. The thesis also relies on the records of auxiliary organisations and sub-groups within these churches, especially women's auxiliaries and missionary societies. This close institutional understanding allows a detailed assessment of the particular challenges these churches faced and the resources they could command, in

terms of personnel, finance, education (particularly ministerial education) and various other logistical requirements, such as church buildings and missionaries. It also allows a greater understanding of church character conceived in a more abstract sense, especially the degree to which these churches believed in and practiced centralisation and stratification of authority and power, both officially through church discipline and unofficially through disposition.

The first two chapters of the thesis seek to situate the nineteenth century debates over the role of women in their broader denominational contexts. The first chapter seeks to establish these debates as part of denominations with distinct characteristics, traits and structures. It seeks to show how the institutional characteristics and requirements were complex and protean, especially as they were shaped by the movement of African-American churches into the post-emancipation South and by mergers and divisions between and within denominations. The second chapter then seeks to situate the motives of the principal actors, both male and female who shaped the changing role of women in the churches. It shows that these motives were part of a complex nexus of wider issues in church politics, and that opinions on gender issues often fitted into broader liberal or conservative, sectional or generation groupings and factions within denominations. The third and fourth chapters elaborate the resources upon which women drew in staking their claim to participate in church leadership and the challenges they faced in expanding these resources. The third chapter demonstrates that distinct styles of worship and church practice were conducive to the participation and agency of women within their churches, but that these liberal, egalitarian worship styles were generally contentious within church politics. The fourth chapter discusses

the educational resources and institutions which grew and developed with numerous foundations in the postbellum period. These created generations of women amply qualified for leadership positions in their churches. The fifth chapter situates the way in which women participated in their churches as subject to complex ideologies related to daily life, the family and racial uplift. It discusses the impact of domestic ideology on women's church roles, recognising that it often sought to limit the public role of women, but also argues that women co-opted and subverted that ideology and transformed it into a source of social power. It also discusses the concept of the 'politics of respectability', and argues that it represented a further development of women's subversion of the domestic ideology of their churches. This chapter shows that respectability was a fundamentally more inward-looking philosophy than has previously been recognised, as much concerned with improving African-American communities from within as aggressively challenging Jim Crow.

The greater significance of this thesis is that it offers insight into the role of women in African-American Christianity in the nineteenth century, but also sheds light on the longer term legacy of female participation in African-American Christianity into the twentieth century. It has been estimated that for most of the twentieth century at least two thirds of the congregations of African-American Christian churches were women. During the twentieth century women were the bulwark and mainstay of African-American Christianity, and they continued to expand their power and presence within their churches. In 1948 the decision by the AME General Conference to allow the ordination of women sparked a wave of liberalisation in the treatment of

women in African-American Christianity in the 1940s and 1950s. Furthermore the debates over the expansion of female roles and especially ordination in the nineteenth century have significant contemporary resonance. In the past two decades all the major African-American Methodist churches have elected women to episcopacy for the first time. In 2000 Vashti McKenzie became the first woman elected bishop in a major African-American denomination when she was consecrated the 117th bishop of the AME Church. The AME Zion Church followed suit in 2008 when it elected Bishop Mildred Hines, as did the CME Church, electing Bishop Teresa Snorton in 2010. During the twentieth century female African-American Christian women such as Nannie Helen Burroughs, Anna Julia Cooper and Pauli Murray played extremely important roles within their churches and in African-American history as a whole, so it is essential to understand the nineteenth-century origins of female leadership in African-American Christianity.

Acknowledgments

I am deeply indebted to many people who provided help, advice, and support throughout the lengthy process of writing this thesis.

I would like to thank my supervisor, Richard Carwardine. Over the years his advice and suggestions have improved my thesis in countless ways. His patience and kindness have been invaluable.

I am also grateful to my various examiners. The examiners of the final thesis, Stephen Tuck and David Bebbington recommended corrections which significantly improved the quality of the completed work. Similarly, suggestions offered by Peter Thompson at confirmation of status and by Gareth Davies at transfer of status were essential in guiding my work at those points.

At various times my writing was also kindly read by other members of the Rothermere American Institute and by visiting Harmsworth Professors, including Jay Sexton, Nigel Bowles, Peter Onuf, Robin Kelley, Ian Tyrrell, and many of my fellow doctoral students. Their comments and insights were very much appreciated.

I am grateful for the assistance provided to me by the staff members of the various libraries and archives where I conducted my research. Foremost among these are the library staff of the Vere Harmsworth Library, the History Faculty Library, and the Bodleian Library system in Oxford. Additionally I would like to thank the librarians and archivists in the British Library; the Library of Congress; the Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture in New York; the Presbyterian Historical Society in Philadelphia; the Moorland-Spangarn Research Center at Howard University; the Virginia Baptist Historical Society;

the American Baptist Historical Society's archives at Mercer University; the Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archives; the Robert W. Woodruff Library at the Atlanta University Center; the archives of Spelman College; the archives of Wilberforce University; the United Methodist Archives & History Center at Drew University; Emory University Library; and Yale University Library.

During my research trips I was graciously welcomed by the pastors and congregations of several African-American churches. In particular, I would like to acknowledge the welcome afforded to me by the Rev. Mark Kelly Tyler of Mother Bethel AME Church in Philadelphia.

Finally, and most importantly, I would like to thank my family. Without my mother and father none of this would have been possible. Their love and support kept me going when completion seemed very distant. I am also very grateful for their continued financial support while I completed my doctorate. Thank-you also to my love, Swii Yii Lim, who kept supporting me right to the end. I love you all.

George Scratcherd

May 2017

Contents

1	Introduction	7
1.1	Summary of African-American denominations	9
1.2	Summary of women's roles in nineteenth-century African-American churches	22
1.3	Methodology and scope	48
1.4	Primary sources	64
1.5	Secondary literature review	68
1.6	Organisation of chapters	82
2	Black denominationalism and gender	86
2.1	Growth of the AME Church	89
2.2	Growth of the AME Zion Church	96
2.3	Origins of the CME Church	103
2.4	Competition among Methodists and others	111
2.5	Logistical challenges of southern expansion	119
2.6	Black Baptist convention building	133
2.7	Minor denominations and schisms	163
2.8	Denominationalism and church growth	170

3	Situating gender in postbellum black church politics	171
3.1	Sectionalism and hierarchy	181
3.2	Sectionalism and generational change in the AME Zion Church leadership	187
3.3	Interracial cooperation and black Baptists	194
3.4	Clerical education	204
3.5	Secular politics	215
3.6	Ecclesiastical politics and gender	218
4	Church practice and the style of worship	219
4.1	Holiness movement	224
4.2	Preaching style and the nature of ministry	248
4.3	Slave survivals and southern peculiarity	261
4.4	The role of ministers' wives	267
4.5	Music and hymnody	274
4.6	Grass-roots African-American Christianity	279
5	Education for women and the African-American churches	280
5.1	Early history of higher education for African-American women	283
5.2	Pedagogical Philosophies: The Hampton-Tuskegee Model . . .	288
5.3	Pedagogical philosophies: Booker T. Washington and Daniel Alexander Payne	298
5.4	Philanthropy and funding	312
5.5	Wilberforce University and women's higher education in the African Methodist tradition	318
5.6	Baptist institutions and single sex colleges	327

5.7	Denominations, co-education, and the legacy of black women's education	343
6	Domesticity and Respectability in African-American Church Literature	358
6.1	The African-American literature of domesticity	359
6.2	The purposes of domesticity	370
6.3	The politics of respectability	383
6.4	Black religion, female radicalism	390
7	Conclusion	391
8	Appendices	398
8.1	Appendix A: Courses of Study at Atlanta Baptist Female Seminary, 1881	398
8.2	Appendix B: African-American enrolment in industrial education in 1899–90	400
8.3	Appendix C: <i>The Negro Artisan</i> — Classification of Industrial Schools	407
9	Bibliography	409
9.1	Manuscript and archival sources	409
9.2	Printed primary sources	410
9.3	Microform collections	417
9.4	Online collections	417
9.5	Church newspapers and journals	418
9.6	Printed secondary works	418

9.7	Unpublished theses	453
9.8	Websites	457
9.9	Films	463

List of abbreviations

ABFMS	American Baptist Free Mission Society
ABHMS	American Baptist Home Mission Society
ABMC	American Baptist Missionary Convention
AMA	American Missionary Association
AME	African Methodist Episcopal
AME Zion	African Methodist Episcopal Zion
ANBC	American National Baptist Convention
AUMP	African Union Methodist Protestant
ATLA	American Theological Library Association
BME	British Methodist Episcopal
CAMBC	Consolidated American Missionary Baptist Convention
CME	Colored Methodist Episcopal
COGIC	Church of God in Christ
CORE	Congress of Racial Equality
FAS	Free African Society
MEC	Methodist Episcopal Church
MECS	Methodist Episcopal Church, South
NAACP	National Association for the Advancement of Colored People
NACW	National Association of Colored Women
NBC	National Baptist Convention
NTIU	National Theological Institute and University
NwSBC	Northwestern and Southern Baptist Convention
PCUS	Presbyterian Church in the United States
PCUSA	Presbyterian Church in the USA

RZUA	Reformed Zion Union Apostolic
SBC	Southern Baptist Convention
UAME	Union American Methodist Episcopal
WC-NBC	Women's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Con- vention
WCTU	Women's Christian Temperance Union

1 Introduction

Enter most African American congregations and you are likely to see male pastors standing before predominantly female audiences. This pattern has been characteristic of the Black Church since the late nineteenth century.¹

The period between the start of emancipation during the Civil War and the end of the nineteenth century was a crucial period, not just for shaping African-American women's religious roles, but for American religion generally. Religious reconstruction should be seen as outlasting the symbolic end of political reconstruction in 1877. Denominations, both those predominantly black and biracial, dramatically reshaped themselves in the wake of emancipation. Northern denominations moved south to minister to the freed people, while southern denominations faced new competition for adherents with differing degrees of success. This reshaping continued as the apparatus of Jim Crow began to develop, and churches became increasingly central to black resistance. The role of women in church life was central to the ways in which churches dealt with these changes both at the denominational level and locally, especially in the South where these changes were most dramatic.

Throughout the history of African-American Christianity, its congregations have been dominated by women. Independent African-American churches and

¹D.C. Wiggins, *Righteous Content: Black Women's Perspectives of Church and Faith* (New York, 2005), p. 1

denominations have had majority female congregations since they first began to be founded in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. This was exacerbated by the increased independence African-American churches were afforded after the Civil War and emancipation, and by the rapid expansion of their membership and geographical reach in the postbellum South. Of 3,527,660 communicants reported by African-American churches in the 1906 census of religious bodies, 2,203,537, or 62.5 percent, were female.² The pre-eminent importance of women to African-American Christianity continues to the present day.

It is essential to understand the historical development of women's roles in African-American churches and their participation in religious life. This study therefore aims to develop upon the existing historical studies of the nature and growth of African-American women's leadership in their churches in a vital period in the development of African-American Christianity in the postbellum United States. The existing historiography has insufficiently appreciated the interconnection between questions of gender and women's roles in church life and questions of denominationalism, ecclesiastical structure, and church politics. The chronology of the expansion of the leadership roles open to women, and significant denominational differences therein, are not well explained in the existing literature. These changes in women's roles occurred in a time of rapid denominational expansion and political flux for African-American Christianity, so the 'woman question' was intimately

²J.E. Dodson, *Engendering Church: Women, Power, and the AME Church* (Lanham, MD, 2002), p. 102

Department of Commerce and Labour, Bureau of the Census, *U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906* (Washington, DC, 1910), p. 140

connected with church politics and mediated by distinctions in denominational structure. The opinions of black church leaders, male and female, pertaining to the roles available to women were influenced by their alignment on a range of political issues within their denominations, such as questions of lay rights, educational issues, and the appropriate pace of church growth. In fact, these issues interacted mutually with issues of gender, and questions regarding the role of women were not at the margins of church governance, but at the heart of a nexus of ecclesiastical politics. In African Methodism, for example, church leaders' positions on the ordination of women frequently aligned closely with their positions on other issues, such that loosely defined factions, comparatively liberal and conservative, within these denominations can be discerned. An appreciation of denominational distinctiveness and church politics therefore offers a more powerful explanatory framework for the nature and chronology of women's leadership in African-American Christianity in the Reconstruction period and the Gilded Age. In turn, viewing black church politics through the lens of the 'woman question' offers an important and as yet underappreciated context.

1.1 Summary of African-American denominations

It is first necessary to introduce the African-American churches, particularly their origins, denominational composition, and character. The growth and development of the main African-American denominations in the postbellum era is discussed extensively later in this thesis, especially in chapter 2, so here they will be introduced principally as they existed up to and including

the Civil War.

Throughout the nineteenth century, the majority of African-American Christians who subscribed to organised and independent African-American churches were Methodists or Baptists. The origins of black Methodism began with the autonomy of individual black congregations. The greater centralised, connectional, and denominational control in Methodism compared to Baptist churches meant that black Methodists enjoyed less autonomy within predominantly white Methodism. Black congregations soon separated from white Methodist connections and established the first black Methodist denominations. There is some contention regarding priority in the establishment of the first black Methodist connection. The Union Church of Africans was the first such denomination officially organised in September 1813 by Peter Spencer and William Anderson. In the 1850s it would split to become the two churches now commonly known as the Spencer Churches, which are considered comparatively minor denominations, distinct from the three major black Methodist churches. The members of the Union Church of Africans had first created a separate congregation when they led the black congregants out of the Asbury Methodist Episcopal Church in Wilmington, Delaware, and founded the Ezion Methodist Episcopal Church in 1805. However, some historians like Harry V. Richardson and J. Curtis Foster have argued that this was predated by the African Methodist Episcopal Church. Although they accept that the Union Church of Africans was officially organised as a separate denomination in 1813, prior to the official incorporation of the AME Church in 1816, they argue that the series of developments which led to the foundation of the AME Church began long before Spencer had acted in

Delaware and that the earlier de facto independence of the Allenite movement represents the origin of African Methodism.³

Richard Allen, along with Absalom Jones, led a prayer group of African Americans who had been part of St George's Methodist Church in Philadelphia. In 1787, they had been forcibly removed to a segregated part of the church during prayer. In protest they withdrew from St George's and established the Free African Society on 12 April 1787. The FAS 'was not a church, but a benevolent and reform society like many others being formed at the time', but it was nonetheless a 'quasi-religious reform organization'. Allen soon became concerned with the direction in which the FAS was going, in part due to 'his objection to what he perceived to be an incipient influence of Quakerism.'⁴ The FAS began to hold religious services and gradually became a non-denominational church, dedicating its church building on 17 July 1794. When the African Church voted to affiliate with the Episcopal Church, Jones and Allen both instead favoured affiliation with the Methodists. Jones accepted the decision of the majority; Allen did not. St Thomas' African

³D.J. Russell, Jr., *History of the African Union Methodist Protestant Church* (Philadelphia, 1920), pp. 1–11

L.V. Baldwin, *The Mark of a Man: Peter Spencer and the African Union Methodist Tradition: The Man, the Movement, the Message, and the Legacy* (Lanham, MD, 1987), pp. 11–18

L.V. Baldwin, "Invisible" Strands in African Methodism: A History of the African Union Methodist Protestant and Union American Methodist Episcopal Churches, 1805–1980 (Metuchen, NJ, 1983), pp. 1–4

L.V. Baldwin, 'Spencer, Peter', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01729.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

H.V. Richardson, *Dark Salvation: The Story of Methodism as It Developed Among Blacks in America* (Garden City, NY, 1976), pp. 76–84

⁴A.C. Lammers, 'The Rev. Absalom Jones and the Episcopal Church: Christian Theology and Black Consciousness in a New Alliance', *Historical Magazine of the Episcopal Church*, 51 (1982), p. 168

H.T. Lewis, *Yet With a Steady Beat: The African American Struggle for Recognition in the Episcopal Church* (Valley Forge, PA, 1996), pp. 27–8

Episcopal Church of Philadelphia became the first black Episcopal Church on 12 August 1794 and it was formally received into the diocese of Pennsylvania only two months later. Jones became its pastor and the first black Episcopalian priest. Allen, after leaving the FAS, had established the Bethel Church, a black Methodist church which was dedicated by Bishop Francis Asbury on 29 June 1794. Allen was ordained deacon in 1799, and although the Bethel Church remained officially attached to the white Methodist structure, it operated with de facto independence. It was not until 1816 that the Bethel Church decisively split from the Methodist Episcopal Church and the AME Church was established. Mother Bethel AME Church in Philadelphia is now the oldest church property in the United States to be continuously owned by African Americans.⁵

Throughout the nineteenth century (until the unification of black Baptists at its close) the AME Church was the largest independent black Christian denomination in the United States. In 1903 W.E.B. Du Bois wrote that

⁵R. Allen, *The Life, Experience, and Gospel Labours of the Rt. Rev. Richard Allen* (Philadelphia, 1833), pp. 13–21

G.F. Bragg, 'Allen-Payne', Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, Sc MG 244 (George Freeman Bragg manuscripts), fo. 1

C.H. Wesley, *Richard Allen: Apostle of Freedom* (Washington, DC, 1935)

C.V.R. George, *Segregated Sabbaths: Richard Allen and the Emergence of Independent Black Churches, 1760–1840* (New York, 1973)

R.S. Newman, *Freedom's Prophet: Bishop Richard Allen, the AME Church, and the Black Founding Fathers* (New York, 2008), pp. 63–70, 158–82

H.H. Mitchell, *Black Church Beginnings: The Long—Hidden Realities of the First Years* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2004), pp. 66–8, 102–12

H.D. Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church (The Black Church in Action)* (Nashville, TN, 1980), pp. 12–25

F.V. Mills, 'Allen, Richard', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articleS/08/08-00031.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

D.S. Armentrout, 'Jones, Absalom', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00769.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

the AME Church was ‘the greatest Negro organization in the world’.⁶ It expanded rapidly in its early years from its base in Philadelphia, and within two years of its founding its membership had increased from 1,000 to 7,000, and by 1822 it comprised forty-three churches across Pennsylvania; Maryland; Washington,DC; New Jersey; and New York. It continued to grow and its westward expansion under the leadership of Bishops William Paul Quinn and Morris Brown is still lauded by the church to this day. Quinn was commissioned as the church’s first general missionary to the west in 1840.⁷ One of the most important institutions of the church was its principal educational institution, Wilberforce University in Xenia, Ohio, founded by the Methodist Episcopal Church in 1856 and purchased outright by the AME Church in 1863.⁸ Its weekly newspaper, *The Christian Recorder*, was first published in 1852, and its quarterly journal, *The AME Church Review*, in 1884.⁹ Richard

⁶W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Souls of Black Folk: Essays and Sketches* (Chicago, 1903), p. 197

⁷Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 193–4

C.E. Lincoln and L.H. Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience* (Durham, NC, 1990), p. 53

W.B. Gravely, ‘Brown, Morris’, *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00192.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁸Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 277–87

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, p. 53

J.R. Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne: Christian Educator* (Philadelphia, 1935), pp. 85–108

N.T. Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne: The Venerable Preceptor of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Lanham, MD, 2012), pp. 69–102

M.K. Tyler, ‘Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne of the African Methodist Episcopal Church: The Life of a 19th Century Educational Leader, 1811–1865’ (University of Dayton, Ph.D. thesis, 2006), pp. 129–160

On the foundation and development of Wilberforce University, see section 5.5

⁹J.P. Danky (ed.), *African-American Newspapers and Periodicals: A National Bibliography* (Cambridge, MA, 1998), p. 151

Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 273

G.A. Williams, *The Christian Recorder, Newspaper of the African Methodist Episcopal Church: History of a Forum for Ideas, 1854–1902* (Jefferson, NC, 1996)

J.H. Bailey, *Race Patriotism: Protest and Print Culture in the A.M.E. Church* (Knoxville, TN, 2012), pp. 14–17

Allen died in 1831, and in 1852 Daniel Alexander Payne was consecrated as the church's sixth bishop. Payne would go on to become the most important bishop and leader in the church after the Civil War, and served as senior bishop from 1873 until his death in 1893. Payne was responsible for coining the AME Church's long-standing motto, 'God our Father, Christ our Redeemer, Man our Brother.' Collectively Allen and Payne along with William Paul Quinn and Henry McNeal Turner are sometimes referred to as 'the four horsemen', such was their importance as the leading bishops in the nineteenth-century history of the church.¹⁰

The AME Church is sometimes referred to denominationally as the Bethel Church, to distinguish it from the second-largest black Methodist denomination, the AME Zion Church. Like the AME Church, the AME Zion Church was founded in the late eighteenth century as a result of the separation of the black membership from a predominantly white Methodist congregation. John Street Methodist Episcopal Church in New York had a large black membership, yet black members were not permitted to be ordained as ministers or attend the church's conferences. In 1796, led by Peter Williams, many of the black congregants of John Street Church began conducting separate

¹⁰D.A. Payne, *Recollections of Seventy Years* (Nashville, TN, 1888), pp. 109–19

Bragg, 'Allen-Payne', Schomburg, Sc MG 244, fo. 1

Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 85

Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, pp. 58–64

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 50–6

Mills, 'Allen, Richard', *American National Biography Online*,

[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00031.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

E.Z. Vicary, 'Payne, Daniel Alexander', *American National Biography Online*,

[<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00574.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

The phrase 'four horsemen' of the AME Church was coined by The late Bishop Vinton R. Anderson in *A Syllabus for Celebrating the 200th Birthday of the A.M.E. Church* (Nashville, TN, 1986)

services, initially held in a cabinetmaker's shop. By September 1800, a new church building was completed which was incorporated in 1801 as the 'African Methodist Episcopal Church of the City of New York', though it was usually referred to as the Zion Church. The Zion Church continued to operate under the auspices of the Methodist Episcopal Church. In 1816 it joined with Asbury African Methodist Episcopal Church to constitute a nascent preaching circuit. In 1820 the church finally separated from the Methodist Episcopal Church and formed its own denomination. After disputes with the MEC over control of church property, the Zion and Asbury Churches convened what would become the organising conference of the new denomination on 11 August 1820, and the church's first *Discipline* was published that October. Although full separation from the MEC would not be completed until 1824, this conference is usually considered as the founding of the AME Zion Church as an independent denomination. The first annual conference was held in New York on 21 June 1821 and included representatives from four other churches from Pennsylvania, Connecticut, and New York. In 1822, James Varick, the pastor of the Zion Church, was consecrated as the denomination's first bishop, or superintendent, on 30 July 1822.¹¹ After Varick's death in July 1827, he was succeeded by Christopher Rush at the General Conference the following

¹¹J.W. Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church; or, The Centennial of African Methodism* (New York, 1895), pp. 56–64, 130–53
 J.J. Moore, *History of the A. M. E. Zion Church in America. Founded in 1796, In the City of New York* (York, PA, 1884), pp. 15–26
 W.J. Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church: Reality of the Black Church* (Charlotte, NC, 1974), pp. 43–50, 58, 71–83
 Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 56–8
 S.D. Martin. 'Varick, James', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01583.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

May. Rush led the church until his death in July 1873.¹² Throughout the antebellum period, the AME Zion Church maintained its distinction and independence from the Allenite AME Church, though it did not formally incorporate the word ‘Zion’ into the name of the connection until 1848.¹³ The church remained small during the antebellum period, as it was eclipsed by the AME Church throughout most of the northern states beyond its base of membership in New York. By 1860, the church numbered only 4,600 members and 105 preachers, though after the Civil War it expanded rapidly and gained a particularly strong base of membership in North Carolina.¹⁴ The church’s primary educational institution was Livingstone College in Salisbury, North Carolina, founded as Zion Wesley Institute in 1879.¹⁵ Its weekly newspaper, *The Star of Zion* was first published in 1876, and its quarterly journal, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* in 1890.¹⁶

The third, and smallest, of the three main black Methodist churches was not founded until after the Civil War. The CME Church was known as the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church until 1954 when it changed its name to the Christian Methodist Episcopal Church.¹⁷ The CME Church was created with the cooperation of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South,

¹²Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 84–95, 566

¹³Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 130–53

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, p. 58

¹⁴Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, p. 58

On the postbellum expansion of the AME Zion Church, see section 2.2

¹⁵Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 306–9

On the foundation and development of Livingstone College, see section 5.5

¹⁶Danky (ed.), *African-American Newspapers and Periodicals*, p. 540

Bailey, *Race Patriotism*, p. 14

¹⁷O.H. Lakey, *The History of the CME Church* (Memphis, TN, 1985), pp. 538–42

R.R. Sommerville, Jr., *An Ex-Colored Church: Social Activism in the CME Church, 1870–1970* (Macon, GA, 2004) pp. 81, 85–7

as a separate denomination for its black members. In part this cooperation from the MECS was an attempt to stem the exodus of its black members to the AME and AME Zion Churches in the wake of the Civil War and instead to direct them to a new black Methodist connection with close ties to the MECS. An organising conference called on 15 December 1870 created the new church and William H. Miles and Richard H. Vanderhorst were consecrated as its first bishops.¹⁸ Given its origins it is unsurprising that the CME Church has throughout its history remained an almost exclusively southern church. After its foundation it grew rapidly, though not as quickly as did the AME and AME Zion Churches which were also expanding into the South after the Civil War. By 1890 the CME Church's membership was over 100,000, mostly in Alabama, Georgia, Mississippi, and Tennessee.¹⁹ The church's newspaper, *The Christian Index*, was adopted as its official organ at the church's organising conference.²⁰ Sometimes nicknamed the 'old slavery church' due to its connections with the MECS, the CME Church has been the most conservative of the three black Methodist churches, especially with regards to women's rights and lay rights within the church.²¹

¹⁸C.H. Phillips, *The History of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church in America* (Jackson, TN, 1925), p. 26

O.H. Lakey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism": A Study of the Background and the Beginnings of the Christian Methodist Episcopal Church* (Dallas, TX, 1972), pp. 78–88

Lakey, *The History of the CME Church*, pp. 165–88

Sommerville, *An Ex-Colored Church*, pp. 37–40

Richardson, *Dark Salvation*, pp. 226–31

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 61–2

¹⁹E.L. Wheeler, *Uplifting the Race: The Black Minister in the New South, 1865–1902* (Lanham, MD, 1982), p. 49

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, p. 63

On the foundation and postbellum expansion of the AME Church, see section 2.3

²⁰Lakey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, pp. 102–3

Danky (ed.), *African-American Newspapers and Periodicals*, p. 150

²¹W.E. Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree: The African-American Church*

All three major black Methodist churches shared similar organisational structures and polities inherited from the MEC and the MECS. Methodist Episcopal polity was a complex hierarchy of several strata of church governance. The central governing body and supreme legislative authority within the churches were their respective general conferences. General conferences met every four years and comprised delegations from all the annual conferences. Among the many responsibilities of the general conference was the election of bishops. Below the General Conference were the annual conferences. The term 'annual conference' referred not only to the annual meeting itself, but also the geographically delimited area over which each discrete annual conference governed. Usually annual conferences corresponded to individual states, though sometimes they comprised only a portion of a state, or portions of multiple states. Bishops were assigned annual conferences over which they administered. The yearly meeting of the annual conference included ministers and lay delegates from all the churches within its auspices. Among the responsibilities of the annual conferences were the appointment of pastors to local charges, the administration of itinerant preachers, and election of delegates to the general conference. Each annual conference was composed of several districts, each administered by a presiding elder, below which were the quarterly conferences. Quarterly conferences comprised the meeting every three months of ministers and officers of the local congregation to review the work of auxiliary societies, to elect delegates to the annual conference, to appoint church officers and to administer the church discipline. All three black Methodist churches were also governed by connectional boards or councils

in the South, 1865–1900 (Baton Rouge, LA, 1993), p. 123

of bishops, boards of trustees, and judicial boards as well as numerous other auxiliary boards administered by the General Conference.²²

The ministry in African Methodism was also complex and comprised several categories. The highest office in all three connections was that of bishop. In the AME and CME Churches, bishops were always consecrated for life, whereas in the AME Zion Church, prior to 1880 they were only elected quadrennially. After 1880, the AME Zion Church also consecrated bishops for life. Additionally, prior to the 1868 General Conference, bishops in the AME Zion Church were officially known as superintendents in accordance with the terminology employed by Wesley instructing Thomas Coke and Francis Asbury in the establishment of Methodism in North America. This reflected the deep suspicion with which the idea of a strong episcopacy was held in the AME Zion Church during the nineteenth century and the church's concomitant appreciation of lay rights. Indeed, differences over the understanding of the nature of the episcopacy were the stumbling block in several discussions of union between the Bethel and Zion connections.²³

There were two standard levels of ordained ministry, deacons and elders,

²² *The Doctrines and Discipline of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1817), pp. 55–61

R.H. Cain, 'The Powers of the General Conference', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 1 (October 1884), pp. 86–8

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 106–111

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 55–70

²³ Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 147–8

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 105–9

W.B. Gravely, 'African Methodisms and the Rise of Black Denominationalism', in R.R. Richey and K.E. Rowe (eds.), *Rethinking Methodist History: A Bicentennial Historical Consultation* (Nashville, TN, 1985), pp. 111–24

R.W. Trueblood, 'Union Negotiations Between Black Methodists in America', *Methodist History* Vol. 8, No. 4 (July 1970), pp. 18–29

D.C. Dickerson, 'Black Ecumenism: Efforts to Establish a United Methodist Episcopal Church, 1918–1932', *Church History* Vol. 52, No. 4 (December 1983), pp. 479–91

of which deacons were the junior. Ordained ministers most often served as pastors, which meant that they were the central ecclesiastical authority in an individual church congregation and were ultimately responsible for it. Exhorters were the most junior category of preachers, licensed by the quarterly conference, and usually assigned as religious public speakers within the individual congregation. Licensed or local preachers were above exhorters and licensed to preach as local clergymen. Itinerant preachers were licensed by the annual conference and, as their name implies, were travelling preachers within the limits of the annual conference. These three categories of preachers were usually unordained.²⁴

The first black Baptist congregations included the African Baptist or Bluestone Church on William Byrd's plantation in Mecklenburg, Virginia, founded in 1758; the Silver Bluff Church in Silver Bluff, South Carolina, probably founded between 1773 and 1775; and the First African Church of Savannah, founded 20 January 1788.²⁵ Black Baptist churches soon emerged throughout the South in the early years of the nineteenth century, including in Kentucky, Tennessee, Alabama, Mississippi, and Louisiana. In the North, black Baptist churches were present in Massachusetts by 1805, New York by

²⁴ *The Doctrines and Discipline of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 148–85
 Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 103–6
 Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 71–3
 W.R. Cannon, 'The Meaning of the Ministry in Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 8, No. 1 (October 1969), pp. 3–19

²⁵ J.M. Simms, *The First Colored Baptist Church in North America* (Philadelphia, 1888), pp. 19–20
 M. Sobel, *Trabelin 'On: The Slave Journey to an Afro-Baptist Faith* (Westport, CT, 1979), p. 296
 Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 23–24
 J.M. Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship: The Black Baptist Quest for Social Power* (Macon, GA, 2004), pp. 9–14
 Mitchell, *Black Church Beginnings*, pp. 53–60

1808, Pennsylvania by 1809, and New Jersey by 1812. By 1813 there were estimated to have been around 40,000 African-American Baptists, and by 1860 there were at least 130 African-American Baptist churches in the South and 75 in the North.²⁶

Baptist polity is congregational. Each congregation is autonomous and subject to no binding superstructures of authority. Baptist denominations are much more loosely connected than Methodists. Individual congregations voluntarily subscribe to local associations, and to state, sub-national, and national conventions. However, these exist not to govern individual congregations, but simply to serve functions that were beyond the reach of an individual congregation. Often conventions were explicitly for purposes of supporting missionary or educational efforts. The aggregation of black Baptist social influence and power was through voluntary association and convention building, which served to connect black Baptists on scales much larger than the individual church. Black Baptists organised several quasi-national conventions both before and after the Civil War, and during the decade after the war most states established independent state conventions of black Baptists. However, it was not until 1895 that a truly national black Baptist convention was organised with the founding of the National Baptist Convention.²⁷

²⁶Mitchell, *Black Church Beginnings*, p. 92

A.H. Pinn and A.B. Pinn, *Fortress Introduction to Black Church History* (Minneapolis, 2002), p. 70

²⁷B. Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice: African-American Women and Religion* (New York, 2010), pp. 104–6

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. ix–xv, 181–5

On the organisation and development of black Baptist conventions, see section 2.6

1.2 Summary of women's roles in nineteenth-century

African-American churches

This study aims to provide a more nuanced context in which to understand changes in African-American women's religious experience and thus to offer deeper explanations of the historical processes which effected them. It is therefore necessary to introduce the principal developments in the roles, offices, positions, and organisations which were open to women and through which they could participate in their churches. The growth and curtailment of opportunities for women were fiercely contested in the conferences, conventions, and synods of African-American denominations throughout the late nineteenth century, and in church periodicals and newspapers. These contests escalated as a consequence of several attempts to sanction the ordination of women, to open lay positions of authority to women, to create new lay positions, and to create new women's organisations. The chronology and narrative of the principal flashpoints, debates, and decisions have been amply elucidated in the existing secondary literature. However, it will help briefly to reiterate this chronology before pursuing its deeper contextualisation and explanation throughout this study.

In the AME Church there existed a long-standing tradition of female ambition, vocation, participation, and preaching as old as the Church itself. Many women had informally preached without licences throughout the antebellum period. They served as both exhorters (who led local prayer meetings) and evangelists (who proselytised outside their own community). The most renowned antebellum AME female preacher was Jarena Lee. In 1809, prior

to the organisation of the AME Church, Richard Allen (founder of the AME Church and then a deacon in the Methodist Episcopal Church) permitted Lee to preach without a licence. She was not granted a formal licence after the organisation of the Church in 1816, but Allen verbally authorised her to act as an exhorter and she continued to preach in Philadelphia, New York, and New Jersey.²⁸ Other women were also active preachers in the antebellum Church. Joseph Thompson's *Bethel Gleanings* describes one Philadelphia preacher, Sophie Murray, as 'the first evangelist of Bethel', and another, Elizabeth Cole, as 'holding many glorious prayer meetings'.²⁹ Doritha Hill led female prayer meetings in Baltimore and Mary Prout 'was a leader of a female prayer meeting' in Maryland in the early years of the Church. Wealthy Dorsey acted in a similar capacity in Philadelphia.³⁰ Harriet Felson Taylor was described as the 'First Female Exhorter and Local Preacher' of Washington's Union Bethel Church and Rachel Evans of New Jersey was 'a preacheress of no ordinary ability. She could rouse a congregation at any time.'³¹ Priscilla Baltimore of

²⁸J. Lee, *The Life and Religious Experience of Jarena Lee, A Coloured Lady* (Philadelphia, 1836)

Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 77–8, 90–1

J.E. Dodson, 'Nineteenth-century A.M.E. Preaching Women', in H.F. Thomas and R.S. Keller (eds.), *Women in New Worlds: Historical Perspectives on the Wesleyan Tradition* (Nashville, TN, 1981), p. 278

W.L. Andrews (ed.), *Sisters of the Spirit: Three Black Women's Autobiographies of the Nineteenth Century* (Bloomington, IN, 1986), pp. 4–7

Newman, *Freedom's Prophet*, pp. 230–4

Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 23–30

²⁹J. Thompson, *Bethel Gleanings* (Philadelphia, 1881), pp. 34–7

Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 75–6

Dodson, 'Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women', pp. 278–9

³⁰B.T. Tanner, *An Outline of Our History and Government for African Methodist Churchmen, Ministerial and Lay, in Catechetical Form* (Philadelphia, 1884), p. 35

Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 13, 43, 75

³¹A.W. Wayman, *Cyclopaedia of African Methodism* (Baltimore, 1882), p. 57

Dodson, 'Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women', p. 279

Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 52, 56

St Louis ‘was not only the assigned itinerant minister but single-handedly laid foundations for African Methodism in this area of the Mississippi River Valley.’³²

The possibilities for women in the AME Church in the postbellum period were shaped by several key decisions of the Church’s General Conference. The first in 1868 created the position of stewardesses, lay assistants in each church ostensibly equivalent to male stewards and the first position open to women in the Church’s hierarchy. The second in 1884 sanctioned the licensing of women as lay preachers — a practice which had existed informally on a small scale since the Church’s very beginnings. However, ordination remained closed to women, a decision reaffirmed by the General Conference of 1888.³³ Debates took place at national and regional AME conferences and in the pages of the Church’s journals and newspapers as to the appropriate limits of women in the Church. Voices supporting the ordination of women were few, but did exist. Many more sought to curtail women. Yet some came to realise the value of women as stewardesses and supported their further advancement in the Church hierarchy. Henry McNeal Turner, a black political leader and later an AME bishop, reported in 1873 that ‘I have found the stewardesses worth more than all the male officers put together’.³⁴ Women themselves were the principal architects of the advances sanctioned by the General Conference through their persistent pressure to be licensed to preach and through their

³²Dodson, *Engendering Church*, p. 31

³³Dodson, ‘Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women’, pp. 281–7

Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 90–5

Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 89–90

³⁴H.M. Turner, ‘How the Stewardesses System Operates in the A.M.E. Church’, *The Christian Recorder* (15 May 1873), p. 1

effectiveness as unofficial preachers and stewardesses.

Even during the antebellum period women had sought to expand their rights within the church, especially the right to preach. In 1844 Nathan Ward and forty signatories unsuccessfully petitioned the General Conference of the AME Church 'to admit females to receive a license to preach in the connexion.'³⁵ Four years later the Daughters of Zion submitted a similar petition 'to grant their license in all respects as men are licensed, and so to graduate up to the highest office in the church'. They were at one point granted permission to preach, but ultimately, after spirited debate, did not receive licences from the conference.³⁶ In 1850 the Philadelphia Conference discussed 'Whether it should be tolerated for women to form a Connection, and appoint their preachers to stations in the several districts?' after a group of women had done so.³⁷ According to Daniel Alexander Payne these women 'held together for a brief period, and then fell to pieces like a rope of sand.'³⁸ At the next General Conference in 1852 the question of licensing women to preach was raised again by Bishop William Paul Quinn and the Rev. Thomas Lawrence, but was defeated by a large majority.³⁹ The issue was not raised at the General Conference again until 1864, when Henry Davis thrice raised the question only for it to be postponed and ignored.⁴⁰ It was not until 1868 that the women finally achieved a position in the Church's hierarchy with

³⁵C.S. Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1922), p. 415

³⁶D.A. Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Nashville, TN, 1891), p. 301

³⁷*Ibid.*, p. 237

³⁸*Ibid.*, p. 237

³⁹J.A. Handy, *Scraps of African Methodist Episcopal History* (Philadelphia, 1902), pp. 189–90

⁴⁰Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 477, 487

the creation of boards of stewardesses.⁴¹

The tradition of unlicensed female preaching continued after the Civil War. The most prominent preachers were Amanda Berry Smith and Harriet A. Baker. Smith evangelised extensively at camp meetings in the north-eastern states, especially in New York, New Jersey, and Pennsylvania between 1871 and 1878.⁴² J.M. Thorburn noted in his introduction to her autobiography, ‘I have never known anyone who could draw and hold so large an audience as Mrs. Smith.’⁴³ Baker similarly won great renown through evangelising at camp meetings and revivals between 1874 and 1889. She had won the sanction of the AME Church as a preacher after leading a revival at the white Evangelical Church of Brownstown, Pennsylvania, where she converted seventy-two people.⁴⁴ She went on to become a pastor when the Philadelphia Conference appointed her ‘to take charge of the St Paul’s Church on Tenth Street, in the city of Lebanon, Pa’ in 1889.⁴⁵ Other women also continued the preaching tradition prior to the 1884 General Conference. Margaret Wilson preached in New Jersey from 1870, as did Emily Calkins Stevens from 1882, and Lena Doolin-Mason of Hannibal, Missouri ‘preached in nearly every state in the Union’.⁴⁶

The continuing preaching activities of women challenged the masculine

⁴¹Ibid., p. 81

⁴²Dodson, ‘Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women’, pp. 283–4
J.H. Acornley (ed), *The Colored Lady Evangelist: Being the Life, Labors and Experiences, of Mrs. Harriet Baker* (Brooklyn, 1892), pp. 31–3

⁴³A.B. Smith, *An Autobiography: The Story of the Lord’s Dealings with Mrs. Amanda Smith the Colored Evangelist* (Chicago, 1893), p. vi

⁴⁴Acornley (ed), *The Colored Lady Evangelist*, p. 41

⁴⁵Ibid., p. 46

⁴⁶J. Morgan, *Morgan’s History of The New Jersey Conference of The A.M.E. Church from 1872 to 1887* (Camden, NJ, 1887), pp. 17, 45
Dodson, ‘Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women’, pp. 284–5

hierarchy of the church. Unlicensed female preaching, alongside the growth of the church in the South, provoked debates regarding women's place in the church and its sanctioned hierarchy, and regarding the nature of godly womanhood. In the first instance, female preaching and persistent petitioning for a place in the Church hierarchy prompted the creation of the boards of stewardesses. A board of stewardesses for a church consisted of three to nine women 'who assist the stewards, class-leaders, and pastor in managing the spiritual, and sometimes the temporal affairs of the church. . . They are especially charged with looking after the females of the church'.⁴⁷ Stewardesses were lay assistants, ostensibly similar to the existing position of steward. Prior to their creation in 1864, many had doubted the prudence of allowing women any official position in the Church. In 1852, an editorial in *The Christian Recorder* asked

Must the Church, that needs the most manly strength, the most gigantic minds to execute her labors, confide them to those whom nature has fitted for the easier toils of life? Shall the labors of a Paul, a Silas, a Peter, a Luther, a Calvin, a Wesley, be trusted to the weaker sex?⁴⁸

The Rev. Elisha Weaver, later the editor of *The Christian Recorder*, echoed these sentiments in a speech in 1858. He criticized women 'pressing into the empire which belongs exclusively to man' in defiance of 'the gentle and attractive grace of their sex.' He argued that man's superior faculties 'entitle him to absolute rule.'⁴⁹ The introduction of stewardesses provoked resistance

⁴⁷H.M. Turner, *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity, or the Machinery of Methodism. Practically Illustrated through a Series of Questions and Answers* (Philadelphia, 1885), pp. 165–6

⁴⁸Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 301

⁴⁹E. Weaver, 'Woman — Her True Sphere', *Repository of Religion and Literature and of Science and Art* Vol. 1, No. 2 (1858), pp. 58–61

in some churches, especially from stewards and other existing male officers.

Henry McNeal Turner reported that one steward

objected to the whole thing and desired to let such a law as that remain a dead letter on the statute book. But I told him, that if he could not stand the stewardesses, he must go out of the board and let me put in such officer as could. . . The next day some of my leaders and local preachers, having heard of what had transpired. . . were disposed to be troublesome. I gave them to understand that. . . if they could not work in harness, because I had made a few stewardesses, they had better vacate their positions at once.⁵⁰

Similarly *The Christian Recorder* reported in October 1873 that

In some of our Churches in this vicinity, the Stewardesses, appointed in regular order, have been, and are, subjected to much unchristian treatment at the hands of those, of whom better things were expected — we mean some of the officers whose tenure of office is in no way superior to that of the Stewardesses.⁵¹

Clearly the introduction of stewardesses was provocative and controversial. Male lay officers were threatened by the potential influence stewardesses could wield, and their status was undermined by the apparent inclusion of women alongside the stewards in the Church hierarchy.

However, in reality the influence of the stewardesses was severely curtailed and they were certainly not the equals of the stewards. The hesitancy with which women were introduced into the offices of the Church was reflected in the limitations placed on them. The boards of stewardesses were introduced at the minimum possible cost to the influence of existing lay officers. Their creation may have been designed to curtail and contain the pressure for the

⁵⁰Turner, 'How the Stewardesses System Operates', p. 1

⁵¹'Our Swivel', *The Christian Recorder* (23 October 1873), p. 4

licensing of female preaching within the structure of the Church.⁵² In the absence of the requisite minimum of three suitable women, men could serve as stand-in stewardesses. Furthermore all appointments of stewardesses had to be ‘confirmed by the Board of Stewards only in a regular stewards’ meeting’. They were neither members of the official board of the church nor did they attend the quarterly conference. They had ‘no legislative or judicial discretion, but are merely assistants.’⁵³

Despite these limitations, the stewardesses proved their worth and won many plaudits. Henry McNeal Turner wrote that among those who had resisted the introduction of stewardesses ‘I heard some of the same individuals say, that it was the best thing the General Conferences did’, while he himself ‘found the stewardesses worth more than all the male officers put together’.⁵⁴ In 1888, the Rev. Theodore Gould of the Philadelphia Conference wrote to *The Christian Recorder* with ‘An Important Query — Why should not the stewardesses be members. . . of the Quarterly Conferences?’ They had proved their worth, ‘and no class of officers in the Church should be appreciated more highly than the stewardess. . . [T]he female members are as capable and as willing to work for the cause of Christ and humanity as are the male’. Gould identified the reason as prejudice, ‘Simply because they are women’. For him the question was one of justice: ‘The time has now come when the sisters of our great Church must be protected in their rights.’⁵⁵ Women’s service as stewardess earned them recognition as valuable contributors to the Church

⁵²Dodson, ‘Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women’, pp. 282–3

⁵³Turner, *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity*, pp. 166–7

⁵⁴Turner, ‘How the Stewardesses System Operates’, p. 1

⁵⁵T. Gould, ‘An Important Query — Why should not the stewardesses be members and also of the Quarterly Conferences?’, *The Christian Recorder* (5 April 1888), p. 2

and swayed the debate over women's roles.

The debate over the licensing of women as preachers in 1884 was also divisive. George C. Sampson presented a resolution to the General Conference in May 1884 acknowledging the existing unofficial licensing of female preachers, and suggesting that they be brought within the official structures of the church, subject to the same rules and requirements as local preachers.⁵⁶ This resolution was adopted and for the first time it officially sanctioned the licensing of women. Simultaneously it sought to regulate all existing and future licensees, bringing them within the jurisdiction of the quarterly conferences. However, as with the introduction of stewardesses sixteen years earlier, the new role opened to women was viewed with suspicion. Another resolution at the same Conference introduced by W.D. Cook sought to limit the new role for women, much as the role of stewardess had been constrained:

Whereas, we have in our Church some female ministers who have been holding pastoral charges much to the detriment of the Church; therefore be it Resolved, That they are hereby prohibited from assignment to a special charge, and simply labor as evangelists.⁵⁷

Some women had already been appointed pastors, most notably Sarah Ann Hughes at Fayetteville Station and then at Charlotte Mission in North Carolina, and Margaret Wilson at Haleyville Mission in New Jersey.⁵⁸ This resolution sought to put an end to the practice. Dr James H.A. Johnson

⁵⁶ *Journal of the 18th Session and 17th Quadrennial Session of The General Conference of The African Methodist Episcopal Church in The World* (Philadelphia, 1884), p. 253

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 256

⁵⁸ S.W. Angell, 'The Controversy over Women's Ministry in the African Methodist Episcopal Church During the 1880s: The Case of Sarah Ann Hughes', in J. Weisenfeld and R. Newman (eds.), *This Far by Faith: Readings in African-American Women's Religious Biography* (New York, 1996), pp. 96–99

spoke in favour, arguing that were it not to pass, 'it would sap the foundation of the Church and corrupt its very purity'.⁵⁹ He argued that women had no right to preach from the pulpit and that the appropriate sphere for women had been circumscribed by God. Finally he invoked St Paul's directive to 'Let your women keep silence in the churches'.⁶⁰ The Rev. Dr Thomas H. Jackson concurred that scripture proscribed women's public work in the church. Another supporter of the resolution, the Rev. G.W. Bryant, said, 'I vote in favor of their staying home and taking care of the babies.'⁶¹ The resolution was adopted by a vote of sixty-five to eleven. Interestingly, the report of the Conference notes that 'There were quite a number of female preachers in attendance while this question was being discussed', including Sarah Ann Hughes and Margaret Wilson.⁶² It does not report their reactions to these arguments. However, one of those in attendance, Lucy Cooper, wrote to *The Christian Recorder* and in a lengthy letter rebutted the Rev. Dr Jackson with 'biblical proof that women have high and holy callings as well as men', citing Acts 2: 'I will pour out my spirit upon all flesh; and your sons and your daughters shall prophesy'. She also emphasized that 'in the African Methodist Episcopal Church women are its principal support'.⁶³ Henry McNeal Turner, often a visible advocate of women in the church, also supported the licensing of female preachers. He wrote that 'Women ought to be utilized in any way suitable to their condition and circumstances'. He

⁵⁹The General Conference — Report of the two last days', *The Christian Recorder* (5 June 1884), p. 2

⁶⁰1 Cor. xiv.34

⁶¹The General Conference — Report of the two last days', p. 2

⁶²Ibid.

⁶³L. Cooper, 'Woman's Sphere in the Church', *The Christian Recorder* (19 June 1884), p. 1 Acts ii.17

also disagreed with the view that scripture precluded women from preaching. However, he did not agree with Lucy Cooper that women were entitled by scripture to assume higher ministerial offices.⁶⁴

Nevertheless in 1885, Turner sparked new debates over whether the licensing of women to preach should be followed by the ordination of women as deacons. On 29 November 1885 he ordained Sarah Ann Hughes as a deacon.⁶⁵ The question of the ordination of women was discussed in several articles in *The Christian Recorder* and *The AME Church Review* between then and the 1888 General Conference.⁶⁶ The debate paralleled similar debates in other denominations. The Methodist Episcopal Church, South created the office of deaconess, not ordained, and similar in function to the stewardesses of the AME Church.⁶⁷ In 1880, Anna Howard Shaw was ordained as the first female Methodist minister in the United States.⁶⁸ In 1889, Ella Niswonger was ordained in the United Brethren Church.⁶⁹ In the same year, the Cumberland Presbyterian Church ordained Louisa Woosley, and in 1891 she published *Shall*

⁶⁴Turner, *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity*, pp. 99–101, 169

⁶⁵A.S. Felts, 'Women in the Church', *The Christian Recorder* (18 February 1886), p. 1
Angell, 'The Controversy over Women's Ministry', pp. 102–3
On Alice S. Felts, see Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 64–6

⁶⁶David W. Wills has demonstrated that fourteen percent of the articles that appeared in *The AME Church Review* between 1884 and 1893 were authored by women, and so it is a valuable source for female perspectives on the ordination debate.

D.W. Wills, 'Aspects of Social Thought in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1884–1910' (Harvard University, Ph.D. thesis, 1975), p. 162

J.H. Bailey, *Around the Family Altar: Domesticity in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1865–1900* (Gainesville, FL, 2005), p. 87

⁶⁷R.S. Keller and R.R. Ruether (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Women and Religion in North America* (Bloomington, IN, 2006), p. 326

⁶⁸A.D. Gordon, 'Shaw, Anna Howard', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00615.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁶⁹Ella Niswonger, 1865–1944', [<http://www.gcaph.org/history/biographies/ella-niswonger>] (Accessed April 2016)

Woman Preach?, a treatise on the question of the ordination of women.⁷⁰ The question was addressed in *The Christian Recorder* in February 1886 by Mrs Alice S. Felts who wrote in strong support of Bishop Turner. She argued that ‘two-thirds of the present church membership are women’ and that principles of religious equality mandated that offices of the Church be filled by women on an equal footing with men.⁷¹ Similar disputes were to be found in *The AME Church Review*. Most of its articles were hostile to Turner.⁷² However, Bishop John M. Brown supported the ordination of women and called for women to be ordained as deaconesses and as presbyters.⁷³ Ultimately the matter was decided at the General Conference of 1888, which firmly established a ban on female ordination.⁷⁴ Nevertheless women continued to preach under the licences permitted at the 1884 General Convention. Lena Doolin-Mason’s continued preaching activity supposedly led to the conversion of 1,617 people in Minneapolis. Harriet A. Baker became the pastor of St Paul’s Church in Lebanon, Pennsylvania. Mary C. Palmer, Melinda M. Cotton, Emma V. Johnson and Mary L. Harris, all continued to preach under the auspices of the Philadelphia Conference as did Margaret Wilson in the New Jersey Conference.⁷⁵

⁷⁰*The Cumberland Presbyterian*, (22 July 1952), p. 4; *The Cumberland Presbyterian*, (26 August 1952), p. 15 [<http://www.cumberland.org/hfcpc/minister/woosleyL.htm>] (Accessed April 2016)

M.L. Hudson, ‘“Shall Woman Preach?” Louisa Woosley and the Cumberland Presbyterian Church’, *American Presbyterians* Vol. 68, No. 4 (Winter 1990), pp. 221–230
L. Woosley, *Shall Women Preach? or the Question Answered* (Caneyville, KY, 1891)

Keller and Ruether (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Women and Religion in North America*, p. 348

⁷¹Felts, ‘Women in the Church’, p. 1

⁷²Dodson, ‘Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women’, p. 286, n. 31

⁷³J.M. Brown, ‘The ordination of women: What is the authority for it?’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 2 (April 1886), pp. 359–361

⁷⁴Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 159

⁷⁵Dodson, ‘Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women’, p. 287

The debates over the licensing of women to preach and the ordination of women as deaconesses were far more fierce and divisive than those over the creation of boards of stewardesses. They focussed more on scripture and the offices held by women in the early church. In part this was due to the influence female preachers, deaconesses, and ministers would wield over the church as a whole. Despite some initial concerns, stewardesses actually wielded little influence over individual churches, never mind quarterly conferences, or the denomination. Once the boards became established, concern over stewardesses disappeared. They filled traditional female roles as carers and domestics within the church hierarchy. They did not disturb the social order of the church. Female preachers, by contrast, assaulted the traditionally-conceived male monopoly on preaching, questioned the masculinity of the pulpit, and wielded significant influence throughout the church.

In the AME Zion Church, just as in the AME Church, there existed a long tradition of unlicensed female preaching, extending back into the antebellum period. Among the most notable of these early preachers affiliated with the AME Zion Church were Sojourner Truth and Zilpha Elaw, whose 1846 memoir of her religious experience, ministry, and preaching was one of the earliest such testimonies by a black female preacher along with that of Jarena Lee.⁷⁶ As in the AME Church, during the antebellum period the primary means by which AME Zion women contributed to their Church was through benevolent societies and fundraising societies. Most often these, as in the

Angell, 'The Controversy over Women's Ministry', pp. 95–6

⁷⁶Dodson, 'Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women', p. 279–80

Andrews (ed.), *Sisters of the Spirit*, pp. 7–9, 49–160

Z. Elaw, *Memoirs of the Life, Religious Experience, Ministerial Travels and Labours of Mrs. Zilpha Elaw, An American Female of Colour* (London, 1846)

AME Church, were known as Daughters of Conference groups. The earliest women's organisation in the AME Zion connection was The Female Benevolent Society, commonly known as 'The Mother Society', which was known to have been founded before 1820 in the Church's earliest years, as its fund-raising helped with the completion of the mother church of the Zion connection in New York in 1820. It was soon joined by another 'Female Branch of Zion'.⁷⁷ The first Daughters of Conference group to be so named was organised in 1821, the year of the first conference of the Church, and led by Mary Roberts of Mother Zion Church, who served as its president until her death over forty years later.⁷⁸ It is also noteworthy that a sub-organisation existed within the Daughters of Conference from the outset, known as 'The Mite Society' whose membership was composed of the elderly and the young, and whose purpose was to inculcate in the church's youth a denominational loyalty, a sense of duty and community, and the habit of fund-raising and donation to the Church.⁷⁹ Throughout the antebellum period, Daughters of Conference and equivalent societies (with names like 'United Sons and Daughters of Zion's Benevolent Society', 'King's Daughters', 'Willing Workers', 'Christian Endeavor', and 'The Daughters of Bishop') emerged in most cities where the Zion connection was present and in most Zion churches and congregations.⁸⁰

The fundraising efforts of Daughters of Conference organisations in both the

⁷⁷W. Thompson, 'An Address Delivered Before the Female Branch Society of Zion', *The Colored American* (20 May 1837)

⁷⁸A. Evans, 'Origin and Work of the Daughters of Conference and Kindred Societies', *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 7, No. 4 (January 1898), pp. 66–7
Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 538

⁷⁹Thompson, 'An Address Delivered Before the Female Branch Society of Zion'

⁸⁰E.H. Badham, 'Woman's Place in the Church', p. 23

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 133–7

AME and AME Zion Churches allowed the churches to expand and support their ministry. As one article from the later nineteenth century reflected,

The origin and work of the Daughters of Conference... is full of self-sacrifice and devotion to the cause of Missions... The preacher must go and preach; Zion churches must be erected and we will give the money — and for this grand and glorious purpose the United Daughters of Conference were organized at that early, needy time in Mother Zion Church. ... [They were] the angels of the conference, who by their presence and munificent gifts have done much to lighten the burden of the ministry.⁸¹

After the Civil War the AME Zion Church began to debate the expansion of the positions and roles in congregations which were open to women. This process began in earnest at the General Conference of 1876 in Louisville, Kentucky. At this conference the Church voted to ‘strike out the word “male” in the Discipline’. It is unclear whether this resolution was immediately implemented, as in 1880 a group of Boston women again successfully petitioned ‘to strike out the words “man” and “men” in the Discipline’, in order to give ‘women the same rights in the church as men.’⁸² Bishop John B. Small, one of the most progressive advocates of women’s rights and lay rights within the church, argued for a broad interpretation of this amendment: ‘The word male having been stricken from our discipline, females are eligible to fill any position of which they are capable.’ At the time this liberal interpretation was unrealistic, though the more specific applications he highlighted were

⁸¹Evans, ‘Origin and Work of the Daughters of Conference and Kindred Societies’, pp. 66–7

⁸²*Daily Journal of the Sixteenth Quadrennial Session of the General Conference of the A.M.E. Zion Church, of America, Held at Montgomery, Alabama, May, A.D., 1880* (New York, 1880), p. 71

Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 159

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 111

M.S. Jones, *All Bound Up Together: The Woman Question in African American Public Culture, 1830–1900* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1997), p. 156

applied: ‘Not merely are female members entitled to vote, when persons are brought to trial before the society of which they are members, but they are eligible to be appointed as members of a committee for trial of such cases.’⁸³ In practice, this amendment to the Discipline granted the women the right to vote at church conferences and to sit in judgment of those brought before church trials. It would be easy to overstate the significance of this, however, as few women were elected as delegates to state-level annual conferences or the General Conference in the nineteenth century. In practice the voting rights granted to women were mainly exercised at the local quarterly conferences. It was not until the 1892 General Conference that a woman, Fannie Van Brunt of Mother Zion Church, New York, was elected as a delegate to the General Conference, though seven lay women delegates were elected to the subsequent General Conference in 1896.⁸⁴ It was reported by John Dancy, editor of the *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* that the seven women in attendance had ‘represented their Conferences with a dignity, courage and ability that won them respect and honor from everyone. Their presence created no friction, no controversy and provoked no minority report against their being seated.’⁸⁵

⁸³J.B. Small, *Code on the Discipline of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church* (York, PA, 1898)

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 187

⁸⁴‘Our Women’, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 3, No. 2 (January 1892), p. 242

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 111

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 186

The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review gives her name as ‘Van Brunt’, Walls renders it as ‘Van Bronk’, Jones renders it as ‘Van Brounk’.

⁸⁵‘Editorial — The General Conference’, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 6, No. 3–4 (July– October 1896), p. 33

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 186

The 1876 General Conference also followed the example of the AME Church eight years earlier by creating boards of stewardesses. The AME Zion Church boards of stewardesses differed from those of the AME Church in that they were created and appointed by the quarterly conferences rather than the individual congregation. However, like in the AME Church they were subordinate auxiliaries to the stewards, rather than their equals. As in the AME Church, boards of stewardesses provided women with a means to work within their congregation and to prove their value in the hope of pressing their claims for further expansion of women's roles. However, they were also a means to contain women's ambitions in the church within a subordinate station.⁸⁶

The greatest controversy over the role of women in the AME Zion Church rose in the 1890s, however, when the first two women in the connection were ordained. Bishop James Walker Hood ordained Julia A.J. Foote, a San Francisco-based conference missionary, as a deacon at the New York Annual Conference on 20 May 1894 at Poughkeepsie. The ordination passed without much fanfare. Mary J. Small was the wife of Bishop John B. Small, and had been licensed as an unordained preacher in 1892. She was also ordained as a deacon by Bishop Alexander Walters at the Philadelphia and Baltimore Conference on 19 May 1895 at York, Pennsylvania. Both women were later promoted and ordained as elders. Small was ordained as an elder by Bishop Charles Pettey in 1898 and Foote by Bishop Alexander Walters in 1900.⁸⁷ Just

⁸⁶Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 111

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 158

⁸⁷'Editorial — A Female Elder', *The Star of Zion* (2 June 1898), p. 2

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 111–2

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 190

like the ordination of Sarah Ann Hughes in the AME Church, the ordination of women in the AME Zion Church provoked great debate and controversy, which was conducted in the church's pulpits, its newspaper, *The Star of Zion*, and its journal, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review*.⁸⁸

The furore reached its peak after Small's ordination as elder when Presiding Elder W.H. Snowden effectively excommunicated her from the local church. The Church's board of bishops immediately came to Small's defence, led by Bishop Hood, and overturned Snowden's action.⁸⁹ A few church leaders enthusiastically supported the ordination of women. The Rev. J. Harvey Anderson argued in favour of "she" being entitled to the same immunities as the "he," from start to finish.⁹⁰ A more common position among those who supported Small's ordination was that the ordination was permitted under

S.D. Martin, *For God and Race: The Religious and Political Leadership of AMEZ Bishop James Walker Hood* (Columbia, SC, 1999), pp. 163–75

⁸⁸Examples of articles debating the ordination in *The Star of Zion* during the summer of 1898 include:

B.J. Bolding, 'Woman Ordination. Scripture Does Not Forbid It', *The Star of Zion* (7 July 1898), p. 3

R.A. Morrisey 'Chambers Answered. Scripture Authority for the Ordination of Women', *The Star of Zion* (14 July 1898), p. 7

F.M. Jacobs 'Topics of the Times', *The Star of Zion* (21 July 1898), p. 1

'A Female Elder', *The Star of Zion* (21 July 1898), p. 8

J.E. Price, 'Mrs. Small's Case', *The Star of Zion* (28 July 1898), p. 1

'Editorial — Women Bishops Next', *The Star of Zion* (28 July 1898), p. 4

W.H. Snowden, 'Rev. Mrs. Small's Case', *The Star of Zion* (28 July 1898), p. 6

'Episcopal Dots', *The Star of Zion* (4 August 1898), p. 2

J.B. Small, 'Women Ordination', *The Star of Zion* (11 August 1898), p. 1

'Mrs. Elder J. B. Small', *The Star of Zion* (11 August 1898), p. 1

R.S. Rives, 'Not In Favor of Women Elders', *The Star of Zion* (18 August 1898), p. 5

E.S.W. Simmons, 'Female Elders', *The Star of Zion* (25 August 1898), p. 3

⁸⁹J.W. Hood, 'In an Awkward Fix', *The Star of Zion* (14 July 1898), p. 1

Martin, *For God and Race*, p. 168

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 190

⁹⁰J.H. Anderson, 'Searchlight Scenes — Ordination Of Women And The General Conference', *The Star of Zion* (29 September 1898), p. 1

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 190

church law once references to gender had been struck from the Discipline in 1876. This position was usually accompanied by the caveat that the ordination of women must be selective and that only the most able and qualified women were suitable. This was the position taken by the Rev. R.A. Morrissey in *The Star of Zion* who pointed out that the ordination of women should not be ‘wholesale and indiscriminate’, but that those with ‘special qualification and fitness... should be admitted to the ministry.’⁹¹ Similarly, B.F. Grant, a layman who had attended the Baltimore and Philadelphia Conference at which Small was ordained, argued that ‘of course she won her position by merit — no favor in it.’⁹² Still others argued that no further women should be ordained but did not seek to rescind the ordinations of Foote and Small.⁹³

Many strongly opposed the ordinations, however. Much of the rhetoric of the strongest opponents of female ordination in the AME Zion Church emphasised the masculinity of the pulpit, its incompatibility with femininity and true womanhood, and argued that one or the other would be destroyed by allowing female ordination. The Rev. S.A. Chambers argued that ‘woman is not man’s equal, and that the claim is simply ridiculous.’ He raised the prospect of a slippery slope, warning that ‘the next thing it will be women pastors, presiding elders and Bishops’.⁹⁴ An editorial in *The Star of Zion*

⁹¹R.A. Morrissey, ‘Female Preachers — Objections Answered — Scripture Proofs’, *The Star of Zion* (22 September 1898), p. 2

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 192

⁹²Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 192

⁹³Martin, *For God and Race*, p. 166

⁹⁴S.A. Chambers, ‘Redhot Cannon Ball: No Authority in Scripture for the Ordination of Women’, *The Star of Zion* (16 June 1898), p. 1

S.A. Chambers, ‘Cannon Balls: Reply to Rev. J.H. Gilmer, Jr.’, *The Star of Zion* (21 July 1898), p. 3

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, pp. 192–3

deemed women 'Physically Unfit' and 'not physically able to pastor a church. She is too timid and fearful'. Women, it was argued would not be able to visit the sick in the middle of the night or travel long distances in poor weather on rural preaching circuits. C.H.J. Taylor feared for Small's femininity, and wrote that 'There is plenty of work for good women like Mrs. Small to do in this world, without unsexing them by making them elders.'⁹⁵

Bishop Hood's biographer, Sandy Dwayne Martin, has argued that 'women took little direct part in the debate', and that 'many women were also firm adherents of the traditionalist camp, some of whom perhaps held the conviction that women should not participate in such openly controversial and even acrimonious displays'.⁹⁶ Nevertheless, it is clear that many women spoke out in support of Small, Foote and the ordination of women. Sarah Dudley Pettey, author of *The Star of Zion's* woman's column praised her Church in June 1898 for its progressive attitude to women's rights and emphasised Small's 'most excellent record as an evangelist.'⁹⁷ Evalina Badham, in an article entitled 'Woman's Place in the Church' in *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* asked, 'Could I place her in one prescribed circle and say stay thou here? No, I could not.'⁹⁸ In *The Star of Zion* in December 1898 Carissa Betties encouraged Small: 'You are right; go, and as you go preach.' She rebuked male opponents of the ordinations, and urged them to 'Let her

⁹⁵'Physically Unfit', *The Star of Zion* (18 August 1898), p. 4

'Don't Need Women Elders', *The Star of Zion* (11 August 1898), p. 4

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, pp. 192-3

⁹⁶Martin, *For God and Race*, p. 167

⁹⁷S.D. Pettey, 'Some Prominent Elders in Zion', *The Star of Zion* (23 June 1898), p. 5

Martin, *For God and Race*, p. 171

⁹⁸E.H. Badham, 'Woman's Place in the Church', *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 7, No. 1 (April 1897), pp. 21-4

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 191

alone; she is doing what you won't do.'⁹⁹

As in the equivalent debates in the AME Church, the discussion of female ordination in the Zion connection was couched in biblical terms. Just as in the Bethel Church, opponents employed a literal reading of selected scriptural passages, such as St Paul's instruction to 'Let your women keep silence in the churches: for it is not permitted unto them to speak'.¹⁰⁰ In turn, supporters of female ordination appealed to the spirit of the gospels as representing the equality of all humanity before God, and referred to passages like Galatians 3:28: 'There is neither Jew nor Greek, there is neither bond nor free, there is neither male nor female: for ye are all one in Christ Jesus.'¹⁰¹ They also cited examples of female calling and leadership and referred to Acts 2: 'I will pour out my spirit upon all flesh; and your sons and your daughters shall prophesy'.¹⁰² The controversy had abated by the end of 1898, when Bishop Hood wrote to *The Star of Zion* that 'the discussion on the ordination of women has closed'.¹⁰³ Hood was mistaken, however, as at the 1900 General Conference the Rev. A.J. Rogers introduced a resolution seeking to rescind the ordinations. When the matter of the ordination of women was voted on five days later on 21 May 1900, the resolution was defeated, and the ordination of women upheld. This was principally due to the unified support of the board of bishops, although four of them made statements qualifying their support

⁹⁹C. Betties, 'Let Rev. Mrs. Small Alone', *The Star of Zion* (22 December 1898), p. 6
Martin, *For God and Race*, p. 171

¹⁰⁰1 Cor. xiv.34

¹⁰¹Galatians iii.28

Joel ii.28

¹⁰²Acts ii.17

¹⁰³J.W. Hood, 'Female Elders', *The Star of Zion* (27 October 1898), p. 5
Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 168–9

as conditional on the ability and qualifications of any women ordained in the future. The decision brought about a difference in policy between the Bethel and Zion connections which would persist for fifty years.¹⁰⁴

The third major black Methodist denomination was the most conservative of the three regarding the role of women. The CME Church was founded in 1870, but there was no mention of women in the records of the church's General Conferences until 1878, when 'Miss Alice Courtney, Evangelist was introduced and addressed the conference.'¹⁰⁵ The CME Church lagged behind the AME and AME Zion Churches. During the 1880s and 1890s, while those Churches considered full ordination for women, the CME Church debated the creation and remit of boards of stewardesses. A proposal for establishment of stewardesses was first brought to the General Conference of 1882 by G.W. Usher of Georgia, but reportedly 'produced laughter' from the delegates.¹⁰⁶ A proposal for women to serve 'as stewardess auxiliaries' at the next General Conference presented by E.J. Blaylock and J.R. Reeves in 1886 was also rejected. It was not until the 1890 General Conference that boards of stewardesses were created by the CME Church when a resolution by G.C. Rawlston and R.L. Shepherd 'to create stewardesses and have them confirmed by the quarterly conference' was approved.¹⁰⁷ As in the other African Methodist Churches stewardesses were subordinates, assistants to

¹⁰⁴Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 172–3

¹⁰⁵Lahey, *The History of the CME Church*, p. 270

O.H. Lahey and B.B. Stephens, *God In My Mama's House: The Women's Movement in the CME Church* (Memphis, TN, 1994), p. 95

¹⁰⁶Phillips, *The History of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 126

Lahey, *The History of the CME Church*, p. 272

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 158

Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 102

¹⁰⁷Lahey, *The History of the CME Church*, p. 272

the stewards, rather than their equals. As in the AME Church they were not initially permitted voting rights in the quarterly conferences, despite holding office in local congregations. This restriction was not amended until 1902, when stewardesses were first granted membership and voting rights at quarterly conferences.¹⁰⁸

Petitions for the licensing of women as preachers soon followed the creation of the office of stewardess in the CME Church. There is evidence of numerous female CME preachers in the late nineteenth century. One, referred to in *The Christian Index* only as Mrs. Mason, preached a sermon before the Missouri and Kansas Annual Conference on 24 September 1893 and was described as ‘the most wonderful woman preacher of the age.’¹⁰⁹ Charles H. Phillips, later a bishop in the Church, in 1896 praised the sermons of the ‘Rev. Miss Claretta Avery, a young girl preacher about ten years old’, in Atlanta, Georgia.¹¹⁰ The first resolutions seeking official licensing of female preaching were introduced before the 1894 General Conference by G.I. Jackson, A.L. Jackson, J.W. Roberts, and R.H. Meadley, but all were defeated.¹¹¹ There was significant opposition to female preaching in the CME Church. In one article in *The Christian Index*, T. Archuie Burkhalter urged women to ‘stay in the pews’, while F.D. Fennell characterised female preaching and leadership as ‘the greatest things we have to fear.’ Charles H. Phillips took a more moderate tone and lamented that ‘We wish we could endorse women as preachers. Somehow, we believe that preaching is a calling particular to men. We are

¹⁰⁸ Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 103–4

Lakey and Stephens, *God In My Mama’s House*, pp. 85–9

¹⁰⁹ Lakey and Stephens, *God In My Mama’s House*, p. 95

¹¹⁰ Ibid., p. 96

¹¹¹ Ibid., p. 97

willing at any time to hear the weaker sex; but we should not like to be called upon to license them to preach.’¹¹² Female preaching was defended in the pages of *The Christian Index* by Ida E. Roberts, who claimed that Fennel ‘seems to be afraid of women domination in the Church as some Southerners are of “Negro Rule.”’ Roberts was known to have been a preacher since 1890, and she promised, ‘Our work will tell for itself; it will bear inspection as well as criticism.’¹¹³ In spite of opposition women continued to preach, and in 1897 in contravention of church law, Mary Mims became the first licensed preacher in the CME Church. The licensing of female preachers was not approved by the General Conference until 1918, the decision having been precipitated by the ordination (in contravention of church law) of Ida E. Roberts and Georgia A. Mills at the 1915 North Carolina Annual Conference. One further unsanctioned ordination of a woman occurred with that of the Rev. D.B. Whitehead in Philadelphia in 1943, but it was not until 1948 that women were granted ordination in the CME Church as deacons and elders, and not until 1966 as full clergy.¹¹⁴

In addition to the expansion of the roles available to individual women, all three Methodist Churches saw the foundation of women’s missionary societies in the late nineteenth century. In the AME Church the Women’s Parent Mite Missionary Society was founded in 1874. The Ladies’ Home and Foreign Missionary Society of the AME Zion Church was founded in 1880 and the Women’s Missionary Society of the CME Church in 1890.¹¹⁵

¹¹²Ibid., p. 96

¹¹³Ibid., p. 97

¹¹⁴Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 103

¹¹⁵Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 159

Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 168–86

These societies operated similarly to the earlier Daughters of Conference organisations insofar as their primary purpose was fundraising. However, the focus of fundraising had shifted throughout the century and was by then focussed on foreign missions. These new missionary societies were also much more engaged with the politics, both internal and external, of their denominations than had been their predecessors. In the CME Church the effort to create a connectional missionary society began in with a proposal at the 1882 General Conference by Caroline W. Poe of the Women's Missionary Society of the East Texas Conference. However, the proposal was deferred until the next General Conference in 1886, which resolved to 'recommend the organization of a General Woman's Missionary Society throughout our denomination; and that each Annual Conference be empowered to organize a Women's Missionary Society'. However this society still remained constrained and firmly within the control of the Church's male leadership because its first constitution, adopted in 1890 specified that the society's principal officer, its Corresponding Secretary, had to be male.¹¹⁶

The nature of Baptist polity precluded the creation of roles for individual women within individual congregations, in contrast to the practice of Methodist denominations. The sovereignty of the individual congregation, and the absence of a binding episcopal superstructure, meant that while in theory female preaching and ordination could be sanctioned by any congregation, in practice investing any power in women even at the level of the

Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 59, 94–110

Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 198–202

¹¹⁶ Lakey, *The History of the CME Church*, pp. 271–2, 304–5

S.J. McAfee, *History of the Woman's Missionary Society in the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church* (Phenix City, AL, 1945), pp. 270–301

individual congregation brought female authority too close to the pinnacle of Baptist authority for male church leaders to accept. The development of female leadership within black Baptist polity was therefore contingent on the creation of the superstructure of associations and conventions, above the individual congregation, to which local churches voluntarily subscribed. During the nineteenth century, black Baptist women were excluded from preaching, ministry, and administration within their churches. Their roles were limited to teaching in Sunday schools and participation in missionary societies and women's auxiliaries. There were some itinerant female evangelists in several states, however, since as itinerants they were not subject to the whims and insecurities of the male pastor of an individual congregation. However, without an ecclesiastical superstructure to appeal to, these same whims and insecurities prevented any authority for women within individual congregations.¹¹⁷ Congregational sovereignty in theory implied that all members of the congregation should be permitted to vote on matters in individual churches, especially the selection of deacons and pastors. However, in practice women were usually excluded from speaking and voting at church meetings prior to the 1880s. Ebenezer Baptist Church of Richmond, Virginia, granted women suffrage in church meetings soon after its new pastor, Peter Randolph, was installed shortly after the Civil War. Also in Richmond, the First African Baptist Church granted its women the right to vote on the election of its pastor in response to a petition by more than two hundred of its female members in 1880.¹¹⁸ However, these churches were among the very few

¹¹⁷Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 105–12

¹¹⁸*Ibid.*, pp. 106–7

that granted such rights to women. Women's participation in black Baptist policy, therefore, was most significantly effected through their involvement in women's and missionary auxiliaries. Most state black Baptist conventions organised women's auxiliaries, but it was not until September 1900 that a national black Baptist women's society was created, the Women's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention.

1.3 Methodology and scope

The primary research methodologies employed are those of social history, institutional history, and specifically church history. This has entailed a close critical reading of a broad and diverse range of primary source material, but particularly primary source material generated by the institutions and apparatus of churches, denominations and their leaders. This primary source material has consisted, in part, of records of church conferences, synods, and conventions; of church newspapers and journals; of church disciplines, catechisms, accounts, and budgets; of collections of hymns and sermons; of publications of church leaders and educators, including treatises on education and domesticity, biographies, autobiographies, and church histories; and finally of manuscript collections of papers of church leaders and educators. These sources have been studied critically in order to ascertain a close understanding of church politics, of the positions of opinions of church leaders on central questions in church governance, and how these alignments in church politics pertained to questions of the religious life of women. In particular they have been studied in order to tease out deeper explanatory contexts for support and

opposition to the promotion of women in official church hierarchies beyond the superficial reasons evident in the explicit debates at church conferences. This primary methodology of institutional church history has been supplemented with insights and understandings from other historical approaches, and other disciplines. The most significant among these are from demographic and family history, gender and women's history, feminist theory, including subsets of these related specifically to African-American women, such as womanist theory and historiography, and intersectionality.¹¹⁹ Additionally this thesis depends heavily on theology, particularly ecclesiology.

A close examination of denominational distinctiveness and connectedness is essential to understand differences in the way women were treated by distinct denominations. Therefore this thesis necessarily takes a synoptic view of African-American Christianity, but also treats the denominations which comprised it as discrete institutional structures, rather than referring to a monolithic 'black church'. Of course, it is necessary to recognise that denominational boundaries were permeable and that there was a great deal of interaction between churches. Debates over the role of women in different denominations influenced each other. However, in recognising this it is also important to note that the boundaries with white denominations were also permeable. Ideas and debates in white churches, including those over the role of women also influenced African-American denominations. Ecclesiastical

¹¹⁹On womanism, see C.T. Gilkes, *"If It Wasn't For The Women...": Black Women's Experience and Womanist Culture in Church and Community* (Maryknoll, NY, 2001), pp. 10, 30–1

On intersectionality, see K. Crenshaw, 'Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics', *University of Chicago Legal Forum* (1989), pp. 139–67

structures and elements of black church polity were derived directly from their white counterparts. Yet African-American Christianity is rightly seen as distinct from the Christianity of predominantly white denominations, and has been portrayed as such in the historiography. Indeed, as Martin Luther King, Jr. observed, ‘the church is still the most segregated major institution in America. At 11:00 on Sunday morning we stand at the most segregated hour in this nation.’¹²⁰ Just as it is correct to emphasise the distinctiveness of African-American Christianity, while not ignoring its interaction with white Christianity, so emphasising denominational distinctiveness within African-American Christianity does not preclude the interconnectedness of those denominations.

Despite the interconnectedness of black denominations, and the fluidity of ideas, membership, and allegiance between them, organised, independent African-American Christianity (which is the focus of this thesis) was practised within the organisational remit of institutional churches, be they single congregations or large hierarchical connections. Whether formal or informal, official or unofficial, the participation of women in their churches was regulated by church institutions. This was especially true with regard to the holding of lay or clerical offices. The boundaries of denominations therefore marked sharp discontinuities in the possibilities afforded to the religious experience of African-American women. The principal aim of this thesis is to provide a stronger explanatory framework for changes, progressions, and continuities

¹²⁰‘Questions & Answers — Dr. Martin Luther King’s 1963 WMU Speech Found — Archives — WMU Libraries’
[\[http://www.wmich.edu/library/archives/mlk/q-a.html\]](http://www.wmich.edu/library/archives/mlk/q-a.html) Archived at
[\[http://web.archive.org/web/20070822230652/http://www.wmich.edu/library/archives/mlk/q-a.html\]](http://web.archive.org/web/20070822230652/http://www.wmich.edu/library/archives/mlk/q-a.html) (Accessed April 2016)

in the religious life of African-American women as mediated through their churches, and the apparent discontinuities therein across denominational boundaries. Consequently the focus of this thesis must be institutional, and so the primary sources relied upon are in the first instance, institutional records and literary output of African-American churches and denominations.

This thesis attempts to take a broad denominational definition of African-American Christianity. Of course it encompasses the major African-American denominations in the Methodist and Baptist traditions: the AME, AME Zion, and CME Churches, and the National Baptist Convention and its predecessors. Naturally African Methodist and black Baptist denominations must be central to such a study. Booker T. Washington is reputed to have said that ‘If a black man is anything but a Baptist or a Methodist, someone has been tampering with his religion.’¹²¹ Although Methodists and Baptists will be at the heart of this thesis, it will also examine the role of African Americans in other denominations including Episcopalianism, Presbyterianism, Congregationalism, Roman Catholicism and the early stages of the emergence of Pentecostalism (especially the formation of the Church of God in Christ). Such a broad denominational study will better capture the distinctiveness of individual denominational cultures as they pertain to female participation and will illustrate the breadth and also the unities within the African-American experience. In Catholic, Presbyterian, and Episcopalian denominations black congregations were subordinate to the laws of the denominations as a whole. Furthermore black women had to struggle not only for gender but also for racial equality. Perhaps the most prominent nineteenth-century black Episcopalian

¹²¹Attributed to Booker T. Washington. Quoted in Lewis, *Yet With a Steady Beat*, p. 1

woman, Anna Julia Cooper, observed in 1886 that black clergy were leaving the Episcopal Church and becoming Methodist and Baptist pastors.¹²² The same discrimination which prompted this also created the subordination of black women, who not only shared in the ban on female ordination, but also were placed below white Episcopalian women's organizations which were already subordinate, in turn, on grounds of gender. Naturally, black Catholic women were not ordained, but the Catholic Church did offer roles to women as nuns. Three black religious communities existed in America in the nineteenth century. The Oblate Sisters of Providence were founded in Baltimore in 1829 and their first superior was Elizabeth Langhe; the Sisters of the Holy Family were founded in New Orleans in 1842 and led by Henriette Delille; and the Sisters of the Third Order of St Francis were founded in Savannah, Georgia around 1890 by Mother Mathilda Beasley.¹²³ In addition to examining African Americans' religious experience beyond Methodism and Baptist polity, this study will also attempt to address the religious experience of African Americans within the predominantly white Methodist Episcopal Church (albeit usually in black congregations within that denomination), and in various smaller and often neglected black denominations, including the so-called Spencer Churches, and the Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Church.¹²⁴

¹²²A.J. Cooper, *A Voice From the South* (Xenia, OH, 1892), p. 35
 Lewis, *Yet With A Steady Beat*, p. 5

¹²³Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 68
 C. Davis, *The History of Black Catholics in the United States* (New York, 1990), pp. 98–115

¹²⁴G.S. Shockley (ed.), *Heritage & Hope: The African American Presence in United Methodism* (Nashville, TN, 1991)
 Baldwin, *The Mark of a Man*
 Baldwin, "Invisible" Strands in African Methodism

The chronological scope of this study is bounded by the Civil War and emancipation and by the end of the nineteenth century. The selection of the Civil War and emancipation as the chronological beginning for this study requires only brief explanation. The closing of the Civil War and emancipation represented the greatest and most dramatic alteration in the nature of African-American Christianity in the nineteenth century. During the last half of the war and especially the five years after the war ended African Americans left the biracial churches of the South and joined black denominations in vast numbers. This occurred most rapidly among black Methodists. Between 1860 and 1870 the estimated black membership of the MECS fell from 207,000 before the war, to 78,000 at its close. The AME Church won more of these than any other Methodist denomination. In 1864 the membership of the Church was estimated at 50,000; by 1866 at 73,000; by 1876 at 206,331; and by 1880 it had dwarfed its prewar levels — *The Christian Recorder* reported that the total membership including probationers was 387,360.¹²⁵ By 1870, the white Methodist Church in Georgia had only

L.V. Baldwin, 'The A.U.M.P. and U.A.M.E. Churches: An Unexplored Area of Black Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 19, No. 3 (April 1981), pp. 175–8

L.V. Baldwin, 'Festivity and Celebration in a Black Methodist Tradition, 1813–1981', *Methodist History* Vol. 20, No. 4 (July 1982), pp. 183–91

L.V. Baldwin, 'Black Women and African Union Methodism, 1813–1983', *Methodist History* Vol. 21, No. 4 (July 1983), pp. 225–37

History of the Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Churches of America (Lawrenceville, VA, 1998)

¹²⁵Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 496

U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906, p. 447

R.R. Wright, *Centennial Encyclopaedia of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1916), p. 5

C.O.H. Thomas, 'Statistics of the A.M.E. Church', *The Christian Recorder* (19 August 1880), p. 4

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, p. 54

Probationers were provisional members of the church for six months before gaining full membership.

1,504 black members, compared to 27,371 before the war. The white Georgia Baptist Convention's black membership shrank from 27,734 in 1860 to 5,745 in 1870, while the membership of black Baptist congregations grew from a few hundred to 38,878 over the same period.¹²⁶ Similarly, by 1874 only 1,614 African Americans remained affiliated with white Baptist congregations in South Carolina, and by 1867 there were more than 21,000 members of black Baptist churches in the same state.¹²⁷ For the first time in their history the independent black denominations were able to expand into the South, and quickly established conventions and associations in the former Confederate states. New church edifices were built and congregations founded. The scale and character of the African-American denominations were transformed by emancipation and consequently so were ecclesiastical politics, and the nature of the debates over the role of women.

The selection of the close of the nineteenth century as the chronological end of the study requires more explanation. By the end of the century several of the key processes in the development of women's leadership in African-American Christianity were complete. The debates over the ordination of women in the AME Church had been concluded by the ban on the ordination of women enacted at the 1888 General Conference. One final expansion of the formal roles available to women in the AME Church was enacted by the General Conference of 1900 with the creation of unordained deaconesses. However, no further expansion of the official roles available to women in the AME Church would take place until the 1948 General Conference reversed

¹²⁶D.W. Stowell, *Rebuilding Zion: The Religious Reconstruction of the South, 1863-1877* (Oxford, 1998), p. 80

¹²⁷Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 108

the decision of 1888 and sanctioned the ordination of women.¹²⁸ Similarly the debates over the ordination of women in the AME Zion Church were concluded by the end of the century after the ordinations of Julia A.J. Foote and Mary J. Small in 1894 and 1895 respectively. Although women's auxiliary organisations and societies within African Methodism continued to grow and prosper into the twentieth century, by 1900 the expansion of formal church offices for individual women had come to a close. By the end of the century the long process of consolidation, unification, and convention building among black Baptists had produced a truly national convention with the foundation of the National Baptist Convention in 1895. This in turn had led to the creation of the first truly national organisation of black Baptist women, the Women's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, in September 1900.¹²⁹

While the closing of the nineteenth century did mark the completion of various processes of change within African-American Christianity, it was not a period of stability for the black churches. Rather the nature of African-American Christianity remained in flux. Although the foundation of the NBC had brought black Baptists the social power inherent in national unification, their national unification was unstable, and in the following years schisms split the convention. In 1897 questions over the control of the Foreign Mission board led to the separation of the Lott Carey Foreign Mission Convention from the NBC. In 1915 the NBC split still further over the question of

¹²⁸Dodson, 'Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women', pp. 288–9

Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 90–1

¹²⁹Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 127–8

E.B. Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent: The Women's Movement in the Black Baptist Church, 1880–1920* (Cambridge, MA, 1993), pp. 8, 150–60

whether the convention's publishing board should remain independent or be incorporated with the convention itself. This division led to the establishment of the Unincorporated Convention, later known as the National Baptist Convention of America, to separate from the NBC under the leadership of the Rev. Richard Henry Boyd.¹³⁰ The emergence of Pentecostalism also signified the dramatic changes taking place in African-American Christianity in the early twentieth century. In 1897, the Church of God in Christ was founded by former Baptists led by Charles Price Jones and Charles Harrison Mason. Initially it was simply a Holiness church. It drew on the Methodist tradition of entire sanctification and the Holiness movement within Methodism. Indeed, the adoption of the doctrine of entire sanctification had provoked the separation of many of the church's earliest members from the Mississippi Baptist Convention. In 1906, one of the first Pentecostal revivals took place in Los Angeles, California — the Asuza Street Revival — led by African-American itinerant preacher William J. Seymour. Having participated in the revival, Mason reorganised the Church of God in Christ as a Pentecostal denomination in 1907. To this day, COGIC remains not only the largest African-American Pentecostal denomination, but the largest Pentecostal denomination in the USA.¹³¹

Many studies of African-American Christianity have periodised its history

¹³⁰Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 195–7

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 33–5
Z.G. Glass, 'Boyd, Richard Henry', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00164.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

¹³¹A.D. Butler, *Women in the Church of God in Christ: Making a Sanctified World*
(Chapel Hill, NC, 2007), p. 29

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, pp. 76–82
M.T. Girolimon, 'Seymour, William Joseph', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/OS/OS-02029.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

in different ways from this thesis. Important works on African-American churchwomen such as *Righteous Discontent* and *Gender and Jim Crow* have focussed on periods straddling the turn of the century. For example, by encompassing the period from 1880 to 1920, *Righteous Discontent* sought to analyse and explain the changes in African-American Baptist polity around the turn of the century, rather than viewing them as a boundary for historical periodisation.¹³² The limitation of this approach is that by beginning in 1880, Higginbotham could not fully encompass the legacy of the Reconstruction era on the later development of the women's movement in the black Baptist church. Such a periodisation for this thesis would exclude the analysis of the immediate impact of emancipation and rapid church growth in the South during Reconstruction. It would not include developments pertaining to African-American churchwomen including the early history of Wilberforce University and the establishment of boards of stewardesses in the AME Church, both of which had a profound influence on later ordination debates and the organisation of women's movements, societies, and auxiliaries in the 1880s and 1890s. To attempt to extend this thesis further into the early twentieth century would be cumbersome and an attempt to analyse too many distinct phases of historical change and development in African-American Christianity. Therefore it seems appropriate to view the emergence of Pentecostalism as marking a new, discrete, and separate phase of African-American Christianity from the focus of this thesis. This study examines the consolidation of Baptist conventions and the attempts to develop a national convention rather

¹³²Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*

G.E. Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow: Women and the Politics of White Supremacy in North Carolina, 1896–1920* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1996)

than the early history of the new National Baptist Convention. Therefore the completion of this process of consolidation marks an appropriate end point. This allows the thesis to focus on historical processes which were mostly complete by 1900 as distinct from later continuing developments. Other histories, notably William E. Montgomery's *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, have focussed on the same chronology as this thesis. This periodisation of African-American religious history approximately accords with the periodisation of the Reconstruction era and Gilded Age in American historiography more broadly.¹³³

Geographically this thesis is limited to the United States and the small presence of the AME Church and the British Methodist Episcopal Church in Canada.¹³⁴ The expansion of formerly exclusively northern denominations into the post-emancipation South is central to this thesis. This thesis only briefly addresses the history of African-American Christianity beyond the United States. In this period there was significant missionary activity led by African-American churches in Africa, Asia, and the Caribbean. The AME Church also expanded into South Africa, Haiti, and Liberia during this period, with that expansion particularly driven by the efforts of Bishop Henry McNeal Turner.¹³⁵ There is a strong and growing literature on African-American missionary efforts in the late nineteenth century in which the vital

¹³³Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*

¹³⁴On the British Methodist Episcopal Church see R.W. Winks, *The Blacks in Canada: A History* (Montreal & Kingston, 1997), pp. 355–9

¹³⁵S.W. Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner and African-American Religion in the South* (Knoxville, TN, 1992), pp. 215–37

A.E. Johnson, *The Forgotten Prophet: Bishop Henry McNeal Turner and the African American Prophetic Tradition* (Lanham, MD, 2012), pp. 71–92

Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 193–4

contributions of female missionaries have been well recognised. The history of the AME Church in South Africa has been ably elucidated by James T. Campbell and he gives due attention to the role of women in the AME Church in South Africa. However the literature on the development of the AME Church outside the United States and South Africa beyond missionary efforts and in the establishment of annual conferences is sparse. The role of women in African-American Christianity beyond the United States remains a fruitful area for future research.¹³⁶

Methodologically, this thesis must contend with the specific challenges of religious and spiritual history. In the first instance these challenges are individual and personal. The spiritual faith and beliefs of historical subject must always necessarily be approached remotely. The historical evidence

¹³⁶On African-American missionaries see:

S.M. Jacobs (ed.), *Black Americans and the Missionary Movement in Africa* (Westport, CT, 1982)

S.D. Martin, *Black Baptists and African Missions, 1880–1915: The Origins of A Movement* (Macon, GA, 1989)

D.W. Wills and R. Newman (eds.), *Black Apostles at Home and Abroad: Afro-Americans and the Christian Mission from the Revolution to Reconstruction* (Boston, 1982)

Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 188–255

B.S. Hughes, ‘Middle Passages: The redemption of African America through the African mission field, 1862–1905’ (Yale University, Ph.D. thesis, 2009)

D.F. Roth ‘“Grace Not Race.” Southern Negro Church Leaders, Black Identity, and Missions to West Africa, 1865–1919’ (The University of Texas at Austin, Ph.D. thesis, 1975)

M. Labode, ‘“A Native Knows A Native”: African American Missionaries’ Writings about Angola, 1919–1940’, *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 4, No. 1 (Fall 2000)

D.C. Dickerson, ‘Henry M. Turner and Black Latinos: The Mission to Cuba and Mexico’, in *Religion, Race, and Region: Research Notes on A.M.E. Church History* (Nashville, TN, 1995), pp. 121–30

On the AME Church in South Africa see:

J.T. Campbell, *Songs of Zion: The African Methodist Episcopal Church in the United States and South Africa* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1998)

J.R. Coan, ‘The Expansion of Missions of the African Methodist Episcopal Church in South Africa, 1896–1908’ (Hartford Seminary, Ph.D. thesis, 1961)

through which the historian engages with religious subjects — their declarations and actions — must reflect the underlying religious beliefs of these agents. However, it is up to the historian to interpret these external and historically visible signals in order to assess the underlying faith and belief system. Overt religious justification of an action may not reflect fully the underlying motivations. In a sense religious history must recognise that, to some extent, all religious historical actors are driven by an interaction of spiritual and temporal motivation. This thesis, for example, at times argues that the overt scriptural justifications offered by some clergy for the actions of church conferences and conventions ought not to be taken at face value, as mere indications of the fervour of those churchmen in their belief in certain biblical passages. The patterns of ecclesiastical politics which surround those decisions, and the factional alignments of clergy within denominations on contentious issues of church politics strongly suggest that imputing motivations to pure, abstract theology would be overly simplistic. Instead the interaction of belief with temporal concerns offers more powerful historical explanations. Such assessments are inherently problematic, however. They remain, fundamentally, circumstantial assertions. The internal religious beliefs of our subjects, and their interactions with broader temporal worldviews, are ultimately, in absolute terms, obscured from history.

Beyond problematising questions of individual belief and motivation, this thesis must be situated within a pattern of religious history in recent decades which has sought to decentre religious history from the study of male, elite, Anglo-Saxon, mainline Protestants, and has sought instead to prioritise the religious history of previously marginalised and neglected groups, especially

women, racial and ethnic minorities, and minor denominations. This of course reflects a wider historiographical trend since the 1960s, the influence of the 'new social history.' These historiographical trends have also been accompanied by an increasing scepticism towards grand narratives and metanarratives of American religious history, and a preference for writing histories 'from the bottom up'; from the perspective of ordinary people, rather than elites. In the realm of religious history this has often manifested as a move away from the history of overarching denominations; and a preference for the construction of religious historical narratives as aggregations of microhistories, often at the level of individual congregations, where the role of the neglected ordinary church member is more visible. In a sense, this thesis must necessarily engage with a view of religious history which privileges women and racial minorities, focussed as it is on gender issues in African-American Christianity in the nineteenth century. However, the story of African Americans, while once historiographically marginal in American religious history generally, has a tradition of its own grand narratives and denominational histories stretching back to Carter G. Woodson and W.E.B. Du Bois, if not to Daniel Alexander Payne's appointment as the first official historian of the AME Church in 1848.¹³⁷

A historical methodology predicated on the aggregation of congregational-level histories is practically problematic for African-American religious history, since no African-American denomination has centralised archives of its own,

¹³⁷T.A. Tweed, 'Introduction: Narrating U.S. Religious History', in *Retelling U.S. Religious History* (Berkeley, 1997), pp. 1–6

H.S. Stout, D.G. Hart (eds.), *New Directions in American Religious History* (New York, 1997), pp. 3–5

and the source bases for black church history are widely scattered across a range of archives of other denominations and archives dedicated to African-American history. A study like this thesis which seeks to analyse the influence of women within national denominational structures and hierarchies must necessarily look beyond the scale of the individual congregation to the records of state and national-level conventions, conferences, bishops, and elders. However, too exclusive a focus on institutional church history at the denominational level would produce an equally incomplete historical picture. Much of the religious experience and ecclesiastical influence of all African Americans, and especially women, was far removed from national, denominational-scale institutions. It was situated in the quotidian practice of individual churches and congregations. This thesis must therefore employ a methodology which attempts to capture religious history across a range of institutional scales. It attempts to do so by examining a range of aspects of church life — preaching and ministry, educational institutions, and domestic literature. Further to this, chapter 4 specifically focusses on aspects of church life and worship at the scale of the individual congregation. While it does not explicitly employ a methodology of aggregating case-studies of congregations, it still focusses on elements of worship such as preaching style, liturgy, slave survivals in worship, and hymnody, which were dictated more from the congregation than from the denomination.

The religious history of women also poses particular methodological challenges. As Ann Braude has argued, women cannot be conceived as marginal actors in religious history:

Women's significance in groups considered marginal must not be allowed

to obscure their centrality in maintaining what scholars traditionally have called the 'mainstream.' Women's history *is* American religious history.¹³⁸

Any history which situates women as central to religious life must then consider the power relationship between women who constitute a majority of most churches and denominations, including African-American ones, and predominantly male church hierarchies. To quote Braude again,

If women are to be the main characters, then, power must be the subplot, whatever the main events. The theme of many stories of American religion is a strong association of lay piety with femininity and of clerical roles with masculinity. As Mary Maples Dunn puts it, 'passive females, ruled over by ministers... personify Christian virtue.'... The conceit of male dominance has been essential to the logic of American religion.¹³⁹

Any study of the religious history of women must avoid this conceit, but must also assess the power relationship between churches numerically dominated by women in which male clergy wielded significant official ecclesiastical authority. The recognition and representation of female agency in religious history must be balanced with a recognition that in many cases male church leaders had powers which could attempt to counteract that agency. Therefore in order to write women's religious history which fully captures the causal mechanisms behind changes in the religious lives and experience of women, both the voices of churchwomen themselves and male church leaders' opinions in regard to women in their churches must be recognised, without denigrating the agency of either.¹⁴⁰

¹³⁸A. Braude, 'Women's History *is* American Religious History', in T.A. Tweed (ed.), *Retelling U.S. Religious History*, p. 91

¹³⁹*Ibid.*, pp. 90–1

¹⁴⁰*Ibid.*, pp. 87–100

1.4 Primary sources

This study draws on a wide range of primary source material. Studying the history of African-American churches is significantly more challenging than for equivalent white denominations, because none of the African-American denominations, connections, or conventions have their own dedicated, centralised archives. A select few individual historic churches hold archives, but for the most part the largest collections of archival material relating to black denominations are held in the archives of corresponding white denominations, and in archives specialising in African-American history generally.¹⁴¹

Numerous archives were visited in order to provide the primary source material for this thesis. These included the manuscript and microfilm collections of the Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture in New York; the Presbyterian Historical Society in Philadelphia; the archives of Mother Bethel AME Church in Philadelphia; the manuscript and microform collections of the Library of Congress; the manuscript collections of the Moorland-Spingarn Research Center at Howard University; the Virginia Baptist Historical Society; the American Baptist Historical Society's archives at Mercer University; the Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archives; the manuscript and microfilm collections of the Robert W. Woodruff Library at the Atlanta Uni-

C.A. Brekus, 'Introduction: Searching for Women in Narratives of American Religious History', in *The Religious History of American Women: Reimagining the Past* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2007) pp.1–13

¹⁴¹A.J. Raboteau, D.W. Wills, R.K. Burkett, W.B. Gravely and J.M. Washington, 'Retelling Carter Woodson's Story: Archival Sources for Afro-American Church History', *The Journal of American History* Vol. 77, No. 1 (June 1990), pp. 183–199
W.B. Gravely, 'The Afro-American Methodist Tradition: A Review of Sources in Reprint', *Methodist History* Vol. 9, No. 3 (April 1971), pp. 21–33

versity Center; the archives of Spelman College; the archives of Wilberforce University; the United Methodist Archives & History Center at Drew University; the manuscript and microfilm collections of Emory University; and the microfilm collections of Yale University. These were supplemented by primary sources which have been digitised online, including the African-American newspapers collection from Accessible Archives and the 'Documenting the American South' collections of the University of North Carolina.¹⁴²

Due to the institutional focus of the thesis, the most important base of primary sources is church records and newspapers. Methodist denominations produced records and journals of their quarterly, annual, and general conferences. Many of these for the AME Church and the AME Zion Church have been microfilmed by the American Theological Library Association (acrshortatla) as part of their collection of *African American Religious Serials, 1850-1950*.¹⁴³ General and annual conference records from this collection were consulted at both Yale University and the Library of Congress. Numerous other microfilmed records and serials from this collection were also examined including various church newspapers and the records of several African-American organisations, both religious and secular. Additionally a larger collection of AME Church General and annual conference records which have not been microfilmed were consulted at the archives of Wilberforce University, as part of the Benjamin W. Arnett collection. Beyond the African branch of Methodism, this thesis also makes use of records of the

¹⁴²See Bibliography

'Accessible Archives' [<http://www.accessible-archives.com>] (Accessed April 2016)

'Documenting the American South' [<http://docsouth.unc.edu>] (Accessed April 2016)

¹⁴³'African American Religious Serials, 1850-1950' [<http://goo.gl/TbrQtn>] (Accessed April 2016)

predominantly white Methodist denominations, including records of black congregations and conferences within the Methodist Episcopal Church. The Annual Conference records of both the Methodist Episcopal Church and the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, were consulted at the United Methodist Archives & History Center, and records of black congregations and the black Delaware Conference of the MEC were consulted at the Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture. A further valuable set of resources pertaining to African Methodism was the newspapers and journals of the three principal African Methodist denominations. *The Christian Recorder*, the newspaper of the AME Church has been extensively studied, and is available online through Accessible Archives. This was supplemented by the church's journal, aimed at its clergy, *The AME Church Review*, which was consulted on microfilm at the Library of Congress and Yale University, as were the newspaper and journal of the AME Zion Church, *The Star of Zion* and *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review*, respectively. The newspaper of the CME Church, *The Christian Index* was consulted on microfilm, sourced from the Tennessee State Library and Archives.¹⁴⁴

In researching African-American Baptist polity, the most valuable primary sources were the large microfilm collection of *African-American Baptist Annual Reports, 1865-1990s*, published by Scholarly Resources, which contains records from the black Baptist associations of most states during the late nineteenth century, as well as records of the National Baptist Convention and several quasi-national conventions which preceded it.¹⁴⁵ This collection was consulted

¹⁴⁴Danky (ed.), *African-American Newspapers and Periodicals*, pp. 150–1, 540

¹⁴⁵'African-American Baptist Annual Reports, 1865–1990s'

[<http://microformguides.gale.com/Data/Download/8395000C.pdf>] (Accessed

at the American Baptist Historical Society, the Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archives, and Yale University. Additionally, the magazine of the National Baptist Convention was studied on microfilm at the Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archives and Yale University. Due to the congregational structure of Baptist polity and the lack of a truly national black Baptist convention prior to 1895 the connections between black Baptist churches and white Baptist conventions remained strong throughout the late nineteenth century and as a result white Baptist newspapers and magazines have also provided insight into black Baptists. In particular, issues of *The American Baptist*, the newspaper of the American Baptist Free Mission Society, and *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* contained articles pertaining to African-American Baptists, and were consulted at the American Baptist Historical Society, and online via HathiTrust.

Another black Baptist newspaper called *The American Baptist* was also published during the nineteenth century. It was the official organ of the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky, and was edited by William J. Simmons, president of the State University at Louisville, and one of the most prominent advocates of women's education and leadership among nineteenth-century African-American Baptists. *The American Baptist*, and its sister publication, *Our Women and Children*, also edited by Simmons, would have proved valuable sources for this thesis. However, African-American Baptist historian James Melvin Washington reported that he was unable to locate copies of *The American Baptist* when researching *Frustrated Fellowship*.¹⁴⁶ It

April 2016)

¹⁴⁶Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 139–40, n. 9

seems probable that no issues of *The American Baptist* or *Our Women and Children* from the nineteenth century have survived, at least in any major archive. Only a few issues for 1903 and 1904, which have been digitised by the Library of Congress were able to be located.¹⁴⁷

In addition to these collections, several collections of personal papers and manuscripts were consulted. These included the papers of several key bishops and leading clergy in various African-American churches, as well as the papers of leading African-American clubwomen and educators. At the Moorland-Spingarn Research Center, the papers of George Freeman Bragg, Anna Julia Cooper, Daniel Alexander Payne, Mary Church Terrell, and Henry McNeal Turner; at the Library of Congress, the papers of Benjamin Tucker Tanner and James Walker Hood (part of the Carter G. Woodson collection) and Nannie Helen Burroughs; and at the Schomburg Center, the papers of Theophilus Gould Steward, Henry C. Bunton, and George Freeman Bragg were all consulted.

1.5 Secondary literature review

My research speaks to many literatures: the historiographies of Reconstruction; the rise of Jim Crow; the nineteenth-century women's movement; female preaching and ordination; demographic and family history; the history of African-American education and colleges; and the historiography of African-

¹⁴⁷Danky (ed.), *African-American Newspapers and Periodicals*, p. 39
'American Baptist — Chronicling America — Library of Congress',
[<http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn93062854/issues/>] (Accessed April 2016)

Personal correspondence with Simmons University, Louisville, KY, and Evelyn Brooks Higginbotham shed no further light on whether any other issues of these newspapers survive.

American religion broadly speaking. These literatures interact in complex ways. It is scarcely possible to survey these historiographies comprehensively here, but a brief description and critique of some of the most important works will provide historiographical context for this thesis.

Of course, the body of historiography most germane to this thesis is that which directly addresses the religious lives of African-American women, particularly in the nineteenth century. Arguably the definitive work in this field is Bettie Collier-Thomas's recently published *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, which stands as a monumental and comprehensive history of African-American women and religion. While it is strongest in its coverage of the twentieth century, its contribution to the history of African-American women's religion in the nineteenth century is substantial. Of comparable importance are *Righteous Discontent* and *Gender and Jim Crow* by Evelyn Brooks Higginbotham and Glenda Elizabeth Gilmore respectively. Of these two *Righteous Discontent* has the more explicit religious focus, regarding exclusively black Baptist polity, and particularly the women's movement therein. Though Higginbotham examines its precursors, her study's principal subjects are the members of the National Baptist Convention and particularly its auxiliary Women's Convention. *Gender and Jim Crow* is specifically a study of North Carolina, and as such insofar as it addresses African-American women's religion it is almost exclusively within the remit of the AME Zion Church, the largest African-American denominational presence within that state. Gilmore's selection of Sarah Dudley Pettey, the wife of an AME Zion Church bishop, as her central subject illustrates the centrality of that church to her study. Among its many insights, *Righteous Discontent* provided an

invaluable analysis of the deployment of what Higginbotham terms ‘the politics of respectability’ by African-American Baptist clubwomen as a tool of resistance against discrimination and deprivation. This thesis addresses this contribution specifically in chapter 6. *Gender and Jim Crow*, too, provides an essential contribution to the historiography of women’s organisation and activism in this period, particularly by highlighting the significance of inter-racial engagement and cooperation in the Women’s Christian Temperance Union. While both are seminal works, *Righteous Discontent* and *Gender and Jim Crow* share deficiencies. Both seek to address the relationship between African-American women and the emergence of Jim Crow, and consequently do not acknowledge the long processes stretching back to the Civil War. The changes in black Christianity during Reconstruction shaped the social power of the black churches through consolidation and convention building and the processes of denominational growth, which in turn created political pressures within the churches, ultimately resulting in the increased influence of women. Understanding these processes is essential to explain the origin of the social power and capital wielded by African-American clubwomen in the early twentieth century. *Righteous Discontent*’s focus on the WC-NBC and that it begins its history in 1880 means that it offers little information on the Baptist Churches in the immediate wake of emancipation, while *Gender and Jim Crow* studies an even later period, beginning in 1896. Both books, insofar as they consider the activism of their subjects to be conditioned by their religion, are also limited in their appreciation of the ways in which this religious experience was conditioned by institutional structures of the churches. They focus almost exclusively on single denominations and thus

fail to take a synoptic view of African-American Christianity in which the importance of denominationalism can be highlighted.¹⁴⁸

Numerous other studies of history of African-American women's religion in the nineteenth century have also informed this thesis. Several works have republished and examined sermons and autobiographical accounts of nineteenth-century African-American churchwomen. William L. Andrews's *Sisters of the Spirit* is principally a compilation of the religious autobiographies of Jarena Lee, Zilpha Elaw, and Julia A.J. Foote, although Andrews's introduction does provide a valuable discussion of traditions in African-American spiritual autobiography. Bettye Collier-Thomas's *Daughters of Thunder* is also built around a compilation of primary sources, specifically sermons, but also features a useful survey of African-American female preaching and introductory discussions of each of the fourteen preaching women featured. The majority of the sermons and preachers featured are from the twentieth century and so lie beyond the remit of this thesis, however. Daphne C. Wiggins's *Righteous Content*, while a thoughtful study, is not particularly historical. *This Far By Faith* is a valuable collection of essays pertaining to the traditions of African-American women's religious biography, and another valuable essay collection pertaining specifically to Methodist women is *Women in New Worlds*. The most valuable essay in that collection for this thesis is Jualynne Dodson's and her sociological study of women in the AME Church, *Engendering Church*, remains the leading work focussed explicitly on women in the AME Church. Cheryl Townsend Gilkes's *If It Wasn't For the Women*,

¹⁴⁸Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*
Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*

and Anthea D. Butler's *Women in the Church of God in Christ* are the most valuable studies of women in the Pentecostal and Sanctified traditions.¹⁴⁹

It is important that these works should be contextualised in the history of African-American women and women's movements more broadly. Important works in this respect include Paula Giddings's *Where and When I Enter*, Darlene Clark Hine's *A Shining Thread of Hope*, Deborah Gray White's *Too Heavy a Load*, Ruth Bogin and James Loewenberg's *Black Women in Nineteenth Century American Life*, and Martha S. Jones's *All Bound Up Together*. Of these Jones places the most emphasis on religion, particularly the introduction of women's suffrage in the AME Zion Church in 1876. Additionally, the history of black women's preaching and ordination can be situated with a broader literature on women in religion, particularly the work of Catherine A. Brekus.¹⁵⁰

Valuable general works on the history of nineteenth-century African-

¹⁴⁹ Andrews (ed.), *Sisters of the Spirit*

B. Collier-Thomas, *Daughters of Thunder: Black Women Preachers and Their Sermons, 1850–1979* (San Francisco, 1998)

Wiggins, *Righteous Content*

Weisenfeld and Newman (eds.), *This Far by Faith*

Thomas and Keller (eds.), *Women in New Worlds*

Dodson, *Engendering Church*

Gilkes, *If It Wasn't For the Women*

Butler, *Women in the Church of God in Christ*

¹⁵⁰ P. Giddings, *Where and When I Enter: The Impact of Black Women on Race and Sex in America* (New York, 1984)

D.C. Hine, *A Shining Thread of Hope: The History of Black Women in America* (New York, 1998)

D.G. White, *Too Heavy a Load: Black Women in Defense of Themselves, 1894–1994* (New York, 1999)

B.J. Loewenberg and R. Bogin (eds.), *Black Women in Nineteenth-Century American Life: Their Words, Their Thoughts, Their Feelings* (University Park, PA, 1976)

Jones, *All Bound Up Together*

C.A. Brekus, *Strangers & Pilgrims: Female Preaching in America, 1740–1845* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1998)

Brekus, *The Religious History of American Women*

American churches include William E. Montgomery's *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, C. Eric Lincoln and Lawrence H. Mamiya's *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, Andrew Billingsley's *Mighty Like a River*, and Henry H. Mitchell's *Black Church Beginnings*. Lincoln and Mamiya's book is one of the most comprehensive general histories of African-American churches, though it is somewhat limited insofar as it treats 'the black church' somewhat monolithically and specifically excludes African Americans in predominantly white denominations and minor black denominations. Jon Michael Spencer's work on music and hymnody in African-American Christianity provides a perspective on its history found very little elsewhere. *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree* comprehensively analyses the black churches during the same chronological period as this thesis and offers detailed description and analysis of their growth during religious reconstruction. The development of African-American Christianity in the South during religious reconstruction has also been examined by Katharine L. Dvorak in *An African American Exodus*, by Reginald Francis Hildebrand in *The Times Were Strange and Stirring*, and in relevant portions of Leon F. Litwack's *Been in the Storm So Long* and Daniel W. Stowell's *Rebuilding Zion*, though none of these works make any concerted attempt to relate the general growth and development of black churches at this time to the significant changes in the roles women played in those processes.¹⁵¹

¹⁵¹Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*
 Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*
 A. Billingsley, *Mighty Like a River: The Black Church and Social Reform* (New York, 1999)
 Mitchell, *Black Church Beginnings*
 J.M. Spencer, *Protest & Praise: Sacred Music of Black Religion* (Minneapolis, MN, 1990)

African-American Methodists have received substantially more concerted study in the secondary literature than have African-American Baptists. The AME Church has the strongest body of secondary literature of any single black denomination. This is in part due to the work of its official historiographers. Howard D. Gregg's *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* is the principal comprehensive history of the church published in the latter half of the twentieth century, though it has been supplemented by the work of a later official historian in Dennis C. Dickerson's *Religion, Race, and Region*. James T. Campbell's *Songs of Zion* and Clarence E. Walker's *A Rock in a Weary Land* provide general histories of the AME Church during the chronological period of this thesis. *Social Protest Thought in the African Methodist Episcopal Church* is an indispensable collection of primary documents, organised thematically. Carter Brown Jr. and Larry Eugene River's study of the origins of the AME Church in Florida, *Laborers in the Vineyard of the Lord*, and their companion work for the AME Zion Church, *For a Great and Grand Purpose*, are among few such histories of these churches related to specific states.¹⁵²

J.M. Spencer, *Black Hymnody: A Hymnological History of the African-American Church* (Knoxville, TN, 1992)

K.L. Dvorak, *An African-American Exodus: The Segregation of the Southern Churches* (Brooklyn, NY, 1991)

R.F. Hildebrand, *The Times Were Strange and Stirring: Methodist Preachers and the Crisis of Emancipation* (Durham, NC, 1995)

L.P. Litwack, *Been in the Storm So Long: The Aftermath of Slavery* (New York, 1979)

Stowell, *Rebuilding Zion*

¹⁵²D.C. Dickerson, *The Historiographers of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Nashville, TN, 1993)

Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*

Dickerson, *Religion, Race, and Region*

Campbell, *Songs of Zion*

C.E. Walker, *A Rock in a Weary Land: The African Methodist Episcopal Church during the Civil War and Reconstruction* (Baton Rouge, 1982)

S.W. Angell and A.B. Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1862-1939* (Knoxville, TN, 2000)

The AME Zion Church has received far less attention, although Sandy Dwayne Martin's biography of Bishop James Walker Hood, *For God and Race* contains detailed discussion of the controversies surrounding ordination of women in the AME Zion Church in the 1890s in which Hood played a central role. As for the AME Church, a comprehensive history of the AME Zion Church exists, written by Bishop William J. Walls. The CME Church has also received the attention of few historians, but its official historian Bishop Othal Hawthorne Lakey has produced invaluable works; his *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, his *History of the CME Church*, and his study of the women's movement in the church, *God in My Mama's House*. Raymond R. Sommerville, Jr.'s *An Ex-Colored Church*, Eula Wallace Harris and Maxi Craig Harris's *Christian Methodist Episcopal Church Through the Years*, and Sara J. McAfee's *History of the Woman's Missionary Society in the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church* are among only other notable book-length studies of the CME Church in the secondary literature. Lewis V. Baldwin's *"Invisible" Strands in African Methodism* and *The Mark of a Man* remain the principal works on the Spencer Churches. Grant S. Shockley's *Heritage & Hope* is one of very few studies of African Americans within the traditions of predominantly white Methodist denominations, though it only briefly addresses the nineteenth century.¹⁵³

L.E. Rivers and C. Brown, Jr., *Laborers in the Vineyard of the Lord: The Beginnings of the AME Church in Florida, 1865–1895* (Gainesville, FL, 2001)

C. Brown, Jr. and L.E. Rivers, *For a Great and Grand Purpose: The Beginnings of the AMEZ Church in Florida, 1864–1905* (Gainesville, FL, 2004)

¹⁵³Martin, *For God and Race*

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*

Lakey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*

Lakey, *The History of the AME Church*

Lakey and Stephens, *God In My Mama's House*

E.W. Harris and M.C. Harris, *Christian Methodist Episcopal Church Through the Years* (Jackson, TN, 1965)

For Baptists, Evelyn Brook's Higginbotham's work, especially *Righteous Discontent*, has been extremely influential, and with good reason. The principal work on black Baptist convention building and organisation is James Melvin Washington's *Frustrated Fellowship* which is a highly detailed and comprehensive study of black Baptist church politics in the postbellum period, though it offers little insight into the role played by women. His untimely death prevented his completion of his subsequent work, *Fractured Freedom*, which would have continued his history of the National Baptist Convention into the twentieth century. However, Leroy Fitts's *A History of Black Baptists*, Paul Harvey's *Redeeming the South*, and Mechal Sobel's *Trabelin' On* do explore black Baptists during religious reconstruction, but they offer little specific discussion of women.¹⁵⁴

The literature on black Presbyterians and Episcopalians is limited. Andrew E. Murray's *Presbyterians and the Negro — A History* and Jesse B. Barber's *Climbing Jacob's Ladder* are rather outdated, and Gayraud S. Wilmore's *Black and Presbyterian: The Heritage and the Hope* is not entirely historically focussed. None offer much specific discussion of black Presbyterian women. Harold T. Lewis's *Yet With a Steady Beat* and Gardiner H. Shattuck's *Episcopalians and Race* are excellent histories of black Episcopalians, but also

McAfee, *History of the Woman's Missionary Society*

Baldwin, "Invisible" Strands in African Methodism

Baldwin, *The Mark of a Man*

Shockley (ed.), *Heritage & Hope*

¹⁵⁴Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*

Q.H. Dixie, 'Preface to the New Paperback Edition', in Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. xix

L. Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists* (Nashville, 1985)

P. Harvey, *Redeeming the South: Religious Cultures and Racial Identities among Southern Baptists, 1865–1925* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1997)

Sobel, *Trabelin' On*

offer little discussion of women. However, a great deal has been written about the prominent Episcopalian woman Anna Julia Cooper, and many of her writings have been published. There are four particularly important works on black Catholics: *Taking Down Our Harps*, Stephen J. Ochs's *Desegregating the Altar*, Cyprian Davis's *The History of Black Catholics in the United States* and the more recently published *Uncommon Faithfulness*. Davis's *History* features a chapter on black women's religious orders which has yielded interesting avenues for research.¹⁵⁵

The greatest attention paid to ecclesiastical politics in the black churches is to be found in various biographies of bishops and church leaders. Biographies of Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne, Bishop Henry McNeal Turner, Bishop Benjamin Tucker Tanner, Bishop James Walker Hood, and Theophilus Gould Steward all offer insight into the debates over women in the AME and AME Zion Churches during the period. They provide the most detailed analysis of the interactions of church leaders, and of the ecclesiastical politics of the AME and AME Zion Churches in all of the secondary literature. They also relate this acute analysis of ecclesiastical governance and politics to gender

¹⁵⁵ A.E. Murray, *Presbyterians and the Negro — A History* (Philadelphia, 1966)
 J.B. Barber, *Climbing Jacob's Ladder: The Story of the Work of the Presbyterian Church U.S.A. Among the Negroes* (New York, 1952)
 G.S. Wilmore, *Black and Presbyterian: The Heritage and the Hope* (Philadelphia, 1983)
 Lewis, *Yet With A Steady Beat*
 G.H. Shattuck, Jr., *Episcopalians and Race: Civil War to Civil Rights* (Lexington, KY, 2000)
 D.L. Hayes and C. Davis (eds.), *Taking Down Our Harps: Black Catholics in the United States* (Maryknoll, NY, 1998)
 S.J. Ochs, *Desegregating the Altar: The Josephites and the Struggle for Black Priests, 1871–1960* (Baton Rouge, 1990)
 Davis, *The History of Black Catholics in the United States*
 M.S. Copeland, L. Mosely, and A.J. Raboteau (eds.), *Uncommon Faithfulness: The Black Catholic Experience* (Maryknoll, NY, 2009)

issues and debates surrounding the ordination of women. In that respect these studies are the closest in the secondary literature to the analysis offered in this thesis. However, they remain somewhat limited by their respective focuses on the perspectives of their individual subjects as bishops and church leaders, and thus are inhibited from taking broad synoptic and comparative views of church politics across and between denominations.¹⁵⁶

One final body of literature merits review. Chapter 6 of this thesis draws extensively on the historiography of the black family and on literatures relating to domesticity and respectability. This study references numerous such works for a theoretical and historiographical framework of domesticity and respectability in order to apply them to the case of the African-American churches, including Kathryn Kish Sklar's *Catherine Beecher: A Study in American Domesticity*, Barbara Leslie Epstein's *The Politics of Domesticity*, and Karen J. Blair's *The Clubwoman as Feminist*. Julius H. Bailey's *Around the Family Altar* specifically addresses the domestic literature produced by the late nineteenth-century AME Church, though it has been criticised for being overly focussed on the opinions of domesticity espoused by male bishops and church leaders to the neglect of the perspective of women.¹⁵⁷ Jualynne Dodson,

¹⁵⁶Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne: Christian Educator*
 Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*
 Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*
 Johnson, *The Forgotten Prophet*
 W. Seraile, *Fire in His Heart: Bishop Benjamin Tucker Tanner and the A.M.E. Church* (Knoxville, 1998)
 Martin, *For God and Race*
 W. Seraile, *Voice of Dissent: Theophilus Gould Steward (1843–1924) and Black America* (Brooklyn, 1991)
 A.G. Miller, *Elevating the Race: Theophilus G. Steward, Black Theology, and the Making of an African American Civil Society, 1865–1924* (Knoxville, 2003)

¹⁵⁷K. Kish Sklar, *Catherine Beecher: A Study in American Domesticity* (New York, 1976)
 B.L. Epstein, *The Politics of Domesticity: Women, Evangelism, and Temperance in*

for example, asked why rather than emphasising ‘Images of Black Victoria’ he did not ‘read through his textual data to a reality of an alternative vision of womanhood contained in the ideal type of “race woman.”’¹⁵⁸ However, Bailey’s work clearly illustrates that whether or not it was embraced by AME women, male leaders in the AME Church did build a denominational ideology of female domesticity, especially an older generation represented by Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne and *The Christian Recorder* editors the Rev. Elisha Weaver and Bishop Benjamin Tucker Tanner, despite more progressive attitudes among younger leaders like Bishop Henry McNeal Turner and the Rev. Theophilus Gould Steward.

The historiography of the black family has been controversial and well documented. It would be redundant here to elaborate on these historiographical debates at great length. The publication of Assistant Secretary of Labor Daniel P. Moynihan’s *The Negro Family: The Case For National Action* in March 1965, commonly known as the Moynihan Report, provoked intense controversy and backlash for characterising the black family as broken, a ‘tangle of pathology’, and responsible for the ‘deterioration of the fabric of Negro society.’¹⁵⁹ In response to it, James Farmer of CORE wrote that ‘We are sick unto death of being analyzed, mesmerized, bought, sold, and

Nineteenth-Century America (Middletown, CT, 1981)

K.J. Blair, *The Clubwoman as Feminist: True Womanhood Redefined, 1868–1914* (New York, 1980)

Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*

¹⁵⁸J.E. Dodson, ‘Review of Julius H. Bailey, *Around the Family Altar: Domesticity in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1865–1900*’, *The Catholic Historical Review* Vol. 93, No. 2 (April 2007), p. 453

¹⁵⁹D.P. Moynihan, ‘The Negro Family in America: The Case for National Action’ (March 1965) [<http://www.blackpast.org/primary/moynihan-report-1965>] (Accessed April 2016)

slobbered over, while the same evils that are the ingredients of our oppression go unattended.¹⁶⁰ The Moynihan Report sparked a wave of revisionist historiography of the black family which sought to refute the conclusions of Moynihan and his predecessors, which Herbert Gutman deemed ‘reactive’ and which, he argued, ‘studied either what was done for slaves, or what was done to them, because it was assumed as given that most slaves could do little more than react to diverse external stimuli.’¹⁶¹ Works such as John Blassingame’s *The Slave Community*, Eugene Genovese’s *Roll, Jordan, Roll*, and Herbert Gutman’s *The Black Family in Slavery and Freedom* presented the black family as stable, monogamous, and nuclear, not scarred and ravaged by the legacy of slavery.¹⁶² As James T. Patterson has argued, they attempted to show that ‘African Americans, no matter how oppressed, were not psychologically damaged. On the contrary, advocates of this point of view proclaimed black Americans had always shown admirable creativity and courage in resisting their white oppressors.’¹⁶³ Historians such as Brenda Stevenson and Patterson have noted that in the 1980s and 1990s a further wave of counter-revision permeated the study of the black family critiquing the revisionism of the 1960s and 1970s embodied by Gutman.¹⁶⁴ Works such

¹⁶⁰J.T. Patterson, *Freedom Is Not Enough: The Moynihan Report and America’s Struggle Over Black Family Life from LBJ to Obama* (New York, 2010), p. xv

¹⁶¹H.G. Gutman, ‘Slave Family and Its Legacies’, *Historical Reflections* Vol. 6, No. 1 (Summer 1979), p. 191

¹⁶²J.W. Blassingame, *The Slave Community: Plantation Life in the Antebellum South* (New York, 1972)

E.D. Genovese, *Roll, Jordan, Roll: The World the Slaves Made* (New York, 1974)

H.G. Gutman, *The Black Family in Slavery and Freedom, 1750–1925* (New York, 1976)

¹⁶³Patterson, *Freedom Is Not Enough*, p. 131

¹⁶⁴B.E. Stevenson, ‘Black Family Structure in Colonial and Antebellum Virginia: Amending the Revisionist Perspective’, in M.B. Tucker and C. Mitchell-Kernan (eds.), *The Decline in Marriage Among African Americans: Causes, Consequences, and Policy Implications* (New York, 1995), p. 34

as Ken Auletta's *The Underclass*, William Julius Wilson's sociological study, *The Truly Disadvantaged*, and Stevenson's own studies of slaves in colonial and antebellum Virginia seem to reinforce Moynihan's conclusions that the black family was not necessarily nuclear and stable, albeit with more nuance.¹⁶⁵

Much of these debates and historiographical revisions have ultimately been somewhat present-minded and politicised. The shifting sands of this historiography pose a challenge for the historian assessing the domestic ideology of the nineteenth-century black church, as ultimately domestic ideals must be predicated on demographic realities. However, as chapter 6 of this thesis argues, while the positive, objective nature of the late nineteenth-century black family must have affected the way in which domestic ideology was consumed and practised it need not necessarily colour the historical understanding of the normative goals of that ideology. Whatever the black family objectively was need not necessarily have been reflected in what church leaders ultimately intended it to become, and understanding the aspirational character of the black church's domestic ideology is important in its own right.

Patterson, *Freedom Is Not Enough*, p. 131

¹⁶⁵K. Auletta, *The Underclass* (New York, 1982)

W.J. Wilson, *The Truly Disadvantaged: The Inner City, the Underclass, and Public Policy* (Chicago, 1987)

Patterson, *Freedom Is Not Enough*, p. 146–52

1.6 Organisation of chapters

This study is structured in seven chapters, though since this introduction is numbered as chapter one, the five principal chapters are numbered from two to six. Chapter two concerns denominationalism within African-American Christianity and its influence on questions of female participation in church life. It traces and analyses the expansion of the African-American churches into the newly emancipated South, comprising rapid growth in their membership, reorganisation of their denominational structures, and a southward shift in their geographical focus. It attempts to correct the historiographical oversight whereby gender issues in African-American Christianity have not been treated as a product of the distinct histories of the several denominations. Different patterns of denominational growth, both geographically and chronologically; competition between churches; different theologies, doctrines, and disciplines all provided drastically different contexts for churches to consider the role of women. Consequently there were marked differences between denominations in the roles open to women and the ways in which those roles evolved.

Chapter three argues that opinions on gender within the black churches were not monolithic, but rather reflected a diversity of political opinions based on the situation of 'the woman question' alongside a range of other issues in ecclesiastical politics. There are clear and identifiable patterns in the support and opposition for expanding the role of women in church politics throughout the late nineteenth century. These patterns of church leaders' opinions on gender issues were closely correlated with their opinions on many other issues in church politics during the period. There were

factions within all denominations on the major issues and controversies of denominational politics. The alignment of church leaders on key issues in church politics was determined by their understanding of the meaning of church community. Church leaders fell into broadly defined mentalities about what their churches should look like. The role they envisioned for women was an integral part of their vision of their churches, influenced by their understandings of theology, and the degree of hierarchical stratification they envisioned for church leadership. Gender issues were an integral part of complete structured understandings of church politics, rather than a separate and isolated.

Chapter four looks beyond the controversies over female preaching and ordination to examine the religious experience of ordinary African-American women in quotidian church practice, the style of worship, lay participation, and informal contributions to church life. Throughout its history African-American Christianity has been characterised by the diversity and distinctiveness in the manner and style of its church worship. Unique preaching styles, music, congregant participation, and even attire all have long and complex roots. The Reconstruction era and Gilded Age contributed significantly to the evolution of church services in African-American denominations and congregations as free independent churches internalised the distinctive practices of slave Christianity. This chapter argues that these developments in worship practices were primarily driven from the bottom up, led by congregants and often resisted by the upper echelons of church leadership and hierarchy. As such, they were often led by women and prioritised female engagement in worship. In order to analyse the quotidian experience of African-American women's

Christianity, this chapter analyses the importance of the holiness movement, pastoring and preaching style, slave survivals in worship, the role of ministers' wives, and music and hymnody.

Chapter five examines the relationship between the advancement of women in leadership roles in church hierarchies and organisations and developments in the education of African-American women, the vast majority of which were led by churches. The foundation and growth of numerous women's colleges provided an educated elite of women, a 'female talented tenth', as Evelyn Brooks Higginbotham put it, many of whom went on to occupy key leadership positions in women's auxiliaries and missionary organisations in the major black denominations. In turn women's auxiliaries and organisations within African-American denominations successfully pushed for and funded the foundation and expansion of female educational institutions. Chapter five will also seek to show that the establishment and growth of female educational institutions directly contributed to greater religiosity and piety among African-American women. The chapter will also examine the politics of educational funding and organising within African-American denominations.

Chapter six analyses the diverse literature of domesticity produced by the African-American churches in the late nineteenth century. Throughout the nineteenth century the African-American churches developed a large and complex domestic literature. In church newspapers and journals (particularly their family columns) and in standalone works like Daniel Alexander Payne's *Treatise on Domestic Education*, church leaders expounded their particular views on how African-American Christians should structure their domestic and family life; how they should raise and educate their children; and how

they could create pious Christian households.¹⁶⁶ This chapter also addresses the concept of the ‘politics of respectability’ as practised by African-American women, led by women’s organisations such as the Women’s Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. In particular, this chapter draws on and responds to the work of Evelyn Brooks Higginbotham, especially in her book *Righteous Discontent*.¹⁶⁷

¹⁶⁶D.A. Payne, *A Treatise on Domestic Education* (Cincinnati, 1889)

¹⁶⁷Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*

2 Black denominationalism and gender

Throughout the history of African-American Christianity the attitudes of churches and church leaders to the major issues, questions, and politics of the day have been highly sensitive to denominational differences. This is equally true of the national political issues that affected their African-American congregants and the internal issues of governance within the church denominations themselves. During the Reconstruction era, when the major African-American denominations underwent significant reorganization, these protean nuances of denominational character, structure, and politics were even more marked and important. However, the existing historical literature has paid insufficient attention to issues of denominationalism in the politics of African-American churches in the later nineteenth century. Several particular deficiencies stand out. While the principal denominational differences between the major groupings of African-American Christianity, Baptists and Methodists, are relatively clear and well acknowledged in the literature, the distinctions within African-American Methodism, in particular, are often less clearly expressed. Studies which explore denominational church politics in detail are frequently studies of a single denomination which offer little in the way of broader comparison between denominations. In turn, more general studies of issues in African-American religious history, not focused on

an individual denomination, often fail to acknowledge specific differences in denominational character. When these distinctions are made they are often superficial. For example, numerous studies acknowledge the fact that while the AME Zion Church began ordaining women in 1895, the AME Church banned the ordination of women in 1888, and did not reverse the ban until 1948. However, they do not offer a detailed comparative analysis of why this was the case in terms of differences in denominational character and politics. Indeed, comparative denominational analysis has been sorely lacking from the historiography of women in African-American Christianity in the later nineteenth century.

A further deficiency of the existing literature is the scant attention paid to smaller African-American denominations and to African-American congregations within predominantly white denominations. Very few scholars have attempted to correct this, the most notable being Lewis V. Baldwin.¹⁶⁸ Even these efforts, however, have mostly failed to situate these smaller churches comparatively alongside their larger cousins in terms of church politics.

This oversight whereby gender issues in African-American Christianity have not been treated as products of the distinct histories of the several denominations requires correction. The character and treatment of debates regarding the role of women in the several African-American denominations and churches, and when those debates occurred, were contingent on denominational character, chronologically specific within denominational context,

¹⁶⁸Baldwin, *The Mark of a Man*

Baldwin, "Invisible" Strands in African Methodism

Baldwin, 'The A.U.M.P. and U.A.M.E. Churches', pp. 175–8

Baldwin, 'Festivity and Celebration in a Black Methodist Tradition', pp. 183–91

Baldwin, 'Black Women and African Union Methodism', pp. 225–37

and profoundly influenced by interactions between different denominations and even by schisms within churches and discussions of unions between denominations.¹⁶⁹ The nature of church hierarchy and structure, whether episcopal, connectional, or congregational, defined the entire scope of the roles which were even considered as possible for women. The rapid expansion of African-American denominations into the South after the Civil War and the withdrawal of many southern black churches from the authority of white denominations affected not only the politics of those churches whose denominational affiliations were changed as a result, but the internal organisation of all denominations. The postbellum reality of African-American Christianity in the South presented an organisational and logistical challenge, in terms of money, buildings, qualified preachers, pastors, and church leaders.¹⁷⁰ This in turn entirely reordered the political priorities of these churches, externally in terms of their situation within national politics, and internally in terms of the debates regarding the principal issues of church organization: the pace and direction of church growth; the raising and divestment of church funds; the churches' educational priorities; missions; questions of emigration; and issues regarding the role of women. The role of women was fundamentally connected to the many other issues within the politics of the several churches. Therefore, the shifts in these politics provoked by emancipation had a significant effect on the debates regarding women, both directly, through the increased necessity

¹⁶⁹Gravely, 'African Methodisms and the Rise of Black Denominationalism', pp. 111–24
 Trueblood, 'Union Negotiations Between Black Methodists in America', pp. 18–29
 Dickerson, 'Black Ecumenism', pp. 479–91
 R.E. Richey, 'The Social Sources of Denominationalism: Methodism', *Methodist History*
 Vol. 15, No. 3 (April 1977), pp. 167–85

¹⁷⁰Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 92–6

of women's organizational, fundraising, and leadership work, and indirectly through the newly created political alignments throughout denominational politics.

2.1 Growth of the AME Church

Even before the close of the Civil War the major African-American denominations began their rapid expansion into the south. Missionaries from the two major independent black Methodist denominations followed in the Union armies south as early as 1863.¹⁷¹ Alongside them were missionaries from major white denominations; the American Missionary Association, predominantly organised by the Congregational Churches; the Freedmen's Aid Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church; the Board of Missions for Freedmen of the Presbyterian Church in the United States; and the American Baptist Home Mission Society.¹⁷² The denominations which benefited most

¹⁷¹J.D. Lynch, 'The Beaufort, S.C. Correspondence', *The Christian Recorder* (25 July 1863), p. 1

Walker, *A Rock in a Weary Land*, p. 50

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 38–96

¹⁷²*First Annual Report of the Freedmen's Aid Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church*, Robert W. Woodruff Library, Atlanta University Center, Freedmen's Aid Society Records, 1866–1932, Microfilm Roll 113

The First Annual Report of the General Assembly's Committee on Freedmen of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America (Pittsburgh, 1866), Presbyterian Historical Society, RF 376, Box 1, Folder 6

The Second Annual Report of the General Assembly's Committee on Freedmen of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America (Pittsburgh, 1867), Presbyterian Historical Society, RF 376, Box 1, Folder 7

'A Sketch of the Origin and Work of the Presbyterian Board of Missions for Freedmen' (Pittsburgh, 1888), Presbyterian Historical Society, RG 3376, Box 1, Folder 4

J.M. Richardson, 'The Failure of the American Missionary Association to Expand Congregationalism Among Southern Blacks', *Southern Studies* Vol. 18 (Spring 1979), pp. 51–73

J.M. Richardson, *Christian Reconstruction: The American Missionary Association and Southern Blacks, 1861–1890* (Athens, GA, 1986)

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 74–83, 100–109

from the opening of the South to these missionaries were the two major African Methodist denominations. The AME Church, in particular, grew extremely rapidly in terms of membership. African Americans abandoned the white Methodist churches, especially those of the Southern Methodist Episcopal Church, in great numbers and throughout most of the South the majority of these joined the AME Church. The black membership of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, had stood at 207,766 to the Civil War, but had fallen to 78,742 at its close.¹⁷³ This exodus only accelerated after the war. In Georgia, for example, whose black Methodists overwhelmingly joined the AME Church, the membership of the MECS fell from 27,371 in 1861 to only 1,504 in 1870.¹⁷⁴ Almost all of this collapse occurred between 1864 and 1870. This decline was mirrored by the rapid growth in AME Church membership. Nationally, AME membership was estimated at 50,000 in 1864 and at 73,000 in 1866. By 1876 church records indicate a membership of 206,331 and in 1880 *The Christian Recorder* reported a total membership of 387,360 including probationers.¹⁷⁵ Georgia and South Carolina in particular would become particular strongholds for the AME Church in the South. The Georgia Annual Conference was created on 30 May 1867 (the state's churches had previously been administered by the South Carolina Conference), and by 1872 there were estimated to be nearly 40,000 members in the state.¹⁷⁶

¹⁷³ *Minutes of the Annual Conferences of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, 1860–1866* (Nashville, TN, 1860–1865), United Methodist Archives and History Center, Drew University

Lahey, *History of the CME Church*, pp. 105, 108

¹⁷⁴ Stowell, *Rebuilding Zion*, p. 80

¹⁷⁵ Thomas, 'Statistics of the AME. Church'

Probationers were provisional members of the church for six months before gaining full membership.

¹⁷⁶ *Minutes of the Georgia Conference of the AME Church*, Wilberforce University Archives

Writing to *The Christian Recorder* in November 1866, Bishop Henry McNeal Turner wrote:

This has been a year of revivals in Georgia, some of our churches has had [sic] as high as 450 probationers on the list, and as for conversions, they will only be known in eternity. Persons, who were thought to be immovable, have been brought into the church and powerfully converted, not under me, but under God.¹⁷⁷

By 1890 the Georgia Conference of the AME Church had been subdivided into three smaller conferences, but those three conferences alone had more members than the sixteen annual conferences in the North combined.¹⁷⁸

Membership also grew rapidly in South Carolina. The 1864 General Conference of the AME Church had resolved that ‘so soon as it may be expedient. . . a Conference including North and South Carolina, Georgia and East Florida’ should be established.¹⁷⁹ Daniel Alexander Payne presided over the first session of this annual conference in May 1865, at which time, according to Bishop Wesley J. Gaines, there were ‘40,000 colored Methodists scattered throughout that State.’¹⁸⁰ In April 1867, at the meeting of the South Carolina Annual Conference, immediately prior to the separation of the Georgia, Florida, and Alabama Annual Conferences, the Conference Minutes reported 49,995 members and probationers.¹⁸¹

Journal of the Quadrennial Session of the General Conference of African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1864, 1873. Wilberforce University Archives, Benjamin W. Arnett Collection

¹⁷⁷H.M. Turner, ‘Letter from Henry M. Turner’, *The Christian Recorder*, (24 November 1866), p. 1

¹⁷⁸W.J. Gaines, *African Methodism in the South; or, Twenty-Five Years of Freedom* (Atlanta, GA, 1890), pp. 236–7

¹⁷⁹Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 472

¹⁸⁰Gaines, *African Methodism in the South*, p. 7

¹⁸¹Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 524

¹⁸²Gaines, *African Methodism in the South*, pp. 6–7, 240–1

Table 2: Organisation of southern AME Church Annual Conferences¹⁸²

Conference	Organised
South Carolina	15 May 1865
Louisiana	1 November 1865
North Carolina	1867
Virginia	10 May 1867
Georgia	30 May 1867
Florida	8 June 1867
Alabama	25 July 1868
Kentucky	8 September 1868
Tennessee	10 September 1868
Mississippi	1 October, 1868
Texas	22 October 1868
Arkansas	19 November 1868

Table 2 shows that the AME Church quickly established a structure of conferences to organize its new congregations throughout the South and that all the southern states had a separate annual conference by 1868 (the Missouri Annual Conference had been organized before the war in 1855). In fact the growth of the AME Church in the South during the Reconstruction era was such that by 1890 the southern annual conferences had a combined membership of 228,541, compared with 46,553 in the North.¹⁸³ By 1906 its total membership stood at 494,777, until the close of the nineteenth century it had remained the largest single black denomination, and in 1903, W.E.B. Du Bois described it as ‘the greatest Negro organization in the world’.¹⁸⁴

This growth had been spurred by a concerted missionary effort by the Church. The Church sent 77 missionaries to the South between 1863 and

B.T. Tanner, *An Apology for African Methodism* (Baltimore, MD, 1867), pp. 334–424

Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 110–20

¹⁸³ Gaines, *African Methodism in the South*, p. 236

¹⁸⁴ *U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906*, p. 137

Du Bois, *The Souls of Black Folk*, p. 197

1870.¹⁸⁵ Among this number were many of the most prominent leaders of the Church including several bishops and future bishops. One such was Henry McNeal Turner who, as the first black chaplain in the United States Colored Troops, served in Virginia. After the war he spent much of the next three years travelling throughout Georgia organizing numerous churches, licensing pastors, and converting the freed people of the state.¹⁸⁶ Like Turner, who would go on to be elected to the Georgia House of Representatives, James Lynch was a young, politically-engaged minister, whom Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne described as ‘the bold lion, the far-seeing statesman; Lynch was born to be the skillful organizer’.¹⁸⁷ He would later serve as Secretary of State of Mississippi from 1869 to 1872, but prior to that he had spearheaded the AME Church’s missionary efforts in the South. He and James Hall had been the Church’s first missionaries to South Carolina and Georgia in May 1863.¹⁸⁸ Lynch was accompanied by his sister, who, on hearing her brother’s farewell sermon in New York ‘was so profoundly moved that in the evening of the same day she called upon Bishop Payne to know if she could be sent also as a missionary teacher to the freedmen’, a request which Payne had granted.¹⁸⁹ This would

¹⁸⁵ Walker, *A Rock in a Weary Land*, p. 50

¹⁸⁶ Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 72–3

S.W. Angell, ‘Turner, Henry McNeal’, *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01557.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

¹⁸⁷ Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 467

¹⁸⁸ Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 467–9

Gaines, *African Methodism in the South*, pp. 4–5

W.B. Gravely, ‘James Lynch and the Black Christian Mission During Reconstruction’, in Wills and Newman (eds.), *Black Apostles at Home and Abroad*, pp. 166–70

W.B. Gravely, ‘A Black Methodist on Reconstruction in Mississippi: Three Letters by James Lynch in 1868–1869’, *Methodist History* Vol. 11, No. 4 (July 1973), pp. 3–18

W.B. Gravely, ‘The Decision of A.M.E. Leader, James Lynch, to Join the Methodist Episcopal Church: New Evidence at Old St. George’s Church, Philadelphia’, *Methodist History* Vol. 15, No. 4 (July 1977), pp. 263–69

¹⁸⁹ Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 468

presage the significant role African-American women would play on behalf of their churches in the South in organising congregations and educating the freed people.

The most important organisational presence in the Church's missions in the South, however, was that of its bishops. They were responsible for the organisation of the new annual conferences which were established. The 1864 General Conference had seen the election of Alexander W. Wayman and Jabez P. Campbell to the episcopacy, and they were both instrumental in the southward expansion of the Church. Bishop Campbell organised the Louisiana Conference at New Orleans on 1 November 1865. Like the South Carolina Conference, the Louisiana Conference initially extended beyond the boundaries of that state and additionally encompassed Mississippi, Arkansas, Alabama, Texas, and Western Florida. In Louisiana, Campbell was joined by the Rev. John Turner, who served as the first secretary of the conference and John M. Brown, later a bishop of the church. According to some reports Brown paid his way in New Orleans working as a barber, and continued his ministry in New Orleans despite imprisonment due to his status as a free African American from the North.¹⁹⁰ One year after the establishment of the Louisiana Conference, at its second meeting it reported 8,186 members and 113 preachers.¹⁹¹ Bishop Wayman was responsible for the organisation of many of the southern annual conferences. In 1867 he organized the annual conferences for Virginia, Georgia, and Florida. In Florida, one congregant

¹⁹⁰W.W. Brown, *The Rising Son: Or, The Antecedents and Advancement of the Colored Race* (Boston, 1874), p. 449

Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 110

¹⁹¹Tanner, *Apology for African Methodism*, pp. 387–398

wrote upon hearing Wayman preach that ‘The appearance of the Bishop in our midst filled the hearts of the people with gratitude to God for having spared them to see a Bishop of their own race.’¹⁹² While Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne was also instrumental in the organisation of the Church in the South, Bishops Campbell and Wayman, newly elected, represented a new generation of leadership in the AME Church. Prior to the Civil War, the AME Church had ordained only six bishops. Between 1864 and the 1896 General Conference, eighteen were elected and ordained.¹⁹³ The growth of the church and its expansion into the South necessitated many more bishops, and indeed expansion at all levels of the church hierarchy — more presiding elders, more pastors, more deacons, and more stewards. The need for more annual conferences and more episcopal districts had cleared the way for a new, younger generation of church leaders, whose interests were aligned with the South, away from the church’s epicentre in Philadelphia. Their churches had been built by the laity and by the efforts of churchwomen, as teachers and stewardesses. They advocated a liberal church politics which sought to divest funds and influence away from the centre and towards the South, and towards lay interest. Concomitant with this new church politics was the tendency to a liberal position on the question of women’s roles within the church.

¹⁹²Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 112

¹⁹³‘The Bishops of the A.M.E. Church’ [<http://www.amec3000.org/allamebishops.htm>] Archived at [<http://web.archive.org/web/20120313142547/http://www.amec3000.org/allamebishops.htm>] (Accessed April 2016)

2.2 Growth of the AME Zion Church

Second to the AME Church, the AME Zion Church won the most members among the freed people who joined Methodist churches. Both followed a church discipline largely based on that of the Methodist Episcopal Church. The AME Church emerged in Philadelphia and the AME Zion Church in New York in the early nineteenth century. Both had separated from the MEC. However, in spite of the many similarities between the two churches, there were nuanced differences in their characters. The Zion Church considered itself the ‘Freedom Church’, implicitly comparing its relative liberality on issues of human rights and church discipline to the position of the slightly more conservative AME Church. Bishop William J. Walls wrote that ‘the A.M.E. Zion Church is proud of the fact that it is established on both ecclesiastical and freedom principles’.¹⁹⁴ It took great pride in the fact that Frederick Douglass, Harriet Tubman, and Sojourner Truth had all been associated with the church.¹⁹⁵ The minutes of the church’s 1880 General Conference would claim that

The distinguishing characteristic of our church is freedom. . . Her very pronounced position on the subject of slavery kept her out of the South until the power of that system was broken; but she was among the first to send missionaries to our long oppressed people when the way was open, as she had been among the foremost advocates of emancipation in the dark days of slavery, and also foremost in sheltering and feeding the panting fugitive on his weary way to a land of freedom.¹⁹⁶

¹⁹⁴Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 97

¹⁹⁵Brown, Jr. and Rivers, *For a Great and Grand Purpose*, p. xii

¹⁹⁶*Minutes of the Sixteenth Quadrennial Session of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church* (1880), p. 54

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 185

In a less abstract sense, the AME Zion Church differed from the Bethel Church in its distrust of hierarchy, the greater influence of its laity, and the greater independence of individual congregations. These traits were a product of the antebellum history of the Church. While upon the foundation of the AME Church, Richard Allen was immediately elected as its first bishop, the Zion Church lacked such a singular figure when its founding churches withdrew from the New York Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church in 1820 and 1821 and formed the AME Zion Church. In fact the tensions which had provoked the secession of the Zion Churches from the Methodist Episcopal Church had centred on their frustrations with the ecclesiastical law and episcopal authority of the MEC, which sought to maintain control over the ordination and appointment of ministers within the black churches. The means by which the black Methodist churches in New York sought to redress this was by electing their own elders. On 13 September 1820 they elected James Varick and Abraham Thompson as elders. Once the AME Zion Church was established, Varick was then selected as the church's superintendent. The title of 'superintendent' was that which John Wesley had bestowed on Dr Thomas Coke and Francis Asbury when he appointed them 'to be joint superintendents over our brethren in North America'.¹⁹⁷ Not only did the term 'superintendent' imply a hesitancy about episcopal authority, the Church also saw it as a return to Wesleyan tradition. The office was further limited as it was held for a four-year term, subject to re-election. As historian Sandy Dwayne Martin has explained,

During the earliest days of Zion, the superintendent or chief officer was

¹⁹⁷Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 105

an elder who had been set aside for a designated period of time to oversee the connection, with the clear understanding that at the next quadrennium he might be removed from office. Indeed, these pioneer Zionites apparently made a special effort to dissociate themselves from the more Episcopal Methodism represented by the Methodist Episcopal Church, out of which they formed, and the African Methodist Episcopal Church, Zion's rival.¹⁹⁸

In practice, the terms 'superintendent' and 'bishop' became used increasingly interchangeably in the AME Zion Church. The official title remained 'superintendent' until 1868 when union discussions with the AME Church finally provoked an official change. Although the leadership of the AME Zion Church did develop into a stronger episcopacy throughout the nineteenth century, the historical origins of AME Zion leadership did still limit episcopal power.¹⁹⁹

As well as a strong laity and a limited episcopacy, another result of the way the Zion Church split from the Methodist Episcopal Church was a greater degree of congregational authority while still maintaining a connectional structure. As church historian Bishop William J. Walls wrote,

The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church is a Methodist connection, a denomination with churches bound together with each other as congregations of the A.M.E. Zion Church, with a central form of polity governing each congregation while each congregation maintains a separate and distinct identity.²⁰⁰

While not immediately apparent, these subtle differences between the characters of the AME Church and AME Zion Churches had great significance for the nature of the politics of these churches after the Civil War. Both churches

¹⁹⁸Martin, *For God and Race*, p. 178

Brown and Rivers, *For a Great and Grand Purpose*, pp. 3–4

¹⁹⁹Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 105–6

²⁰⁰Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 102

Brown and Rivers, *For a Great and Grand Purpose*, p. 3

had differences of opinion on many issues among their leaders during the postbellum era. However, where significant differences emerged between the ways these otherwise similar churches treated major issues, at least a partial explanation can be offered by reference to the historical egalitarianism and liberalism of the AME Zion Church. For example, it can help to explain the significant difference in the outcome of the two churches' debates over the ordination of women in the 1880s and 1890s. It illuminates why the Zion Church expanded into the South as it did, and the liberal characteristics of the church became the reality of church practice for those southern Methodist churches which joined Zion rather than Bethel.

The expansion of the AME Zion Church into the post-emancipation South was almost as rapid as that of the AME Church. In 1860 the AME Zion Church had approximately 4,600 members. By 1870 that number had grown over twenty-five-fold to approximately 125,000, and the majority of that growth was in the South.²⁰¹ The Zion Church secured a particular stronghold in North Carolina, where James Walker Hood established the annual conference on 17 December 1864 with 12 ministers and 400 members. Although 9 of those 12 ministers soon left their posts, by the time of the second annual conference in 1865 they already had 6,488 members, 832 probationers, 17 local preachers, and 31 exhorters.²⁰² The Zion Church gained members throughout the South. However, in many of the states it was heavily outcompeted by

²⁰¹Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 85

D.H. Bradley, *A History of the AME Zion Church, 1796–1872* (Nashville, 1956)

Stowell, *Rebuilding Zion*, p. 94

²⁰²Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 289–297
Minutes of the North Carolina Annual Conference of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church in America, 1865 (Hartford, CT, 1866) ATLA Microfilm, p. 8

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 188

the AME Church and even the predominantly white Methodist Episcopal Church. In Georgia, for example, between 1864 and 1870 the AME Church won almost 40,000 new members, the MECS around 15,000, while the AME Zion Church gained only around 3,000 new members.²⁰³

The central organizing figure of the Zion Church's missions in the South was Bishop Joseph Jackson Clinton. Clinton became a bishop in 1856, and in 1862 took charge of the Southern and Philadelphia Annual Conferences, which initially held responsibility for the entire South as Union armies opened it to black missionaries. Clinton was described as 'Genial in his manner, easy, graceful and commanding in his bearing, generous and jovial, kind, respectful to all' and according to James Walker Hood, 'As an executive officer he had no superior'.²⁰⁴ However, Clinton initially despaired that 'he had not a single minister or dollar to take a delegation as missionaries to the South'.²⁰⁵ He was able to organise the missions only after \$300 was raised from the churches of Washington by Melvina Fletcher, governess in the household of Postmaster-General Montgomery Blair. Much like James Lynch's sister, Fletcher presaged the importance of women in the southern missionary field, in this case through fundraising.²⁰⁶

Clinton initially sent five missionaries to the South in 1863: James Walker Hood, Wilbur G. Strong, John Williams, David Hill, and William F. Butler. Williams seemingly never made it south, fearing for his safety, while Hill died

²⁰³Stowell, *Rebuilding Zion*, p. 96

²⁰⁴*Minutes of the Seventeenth Quadrennial Session of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church* (New York, 1884), p. 89

Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 172

²⁰⁵Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 186

²⁰⁶*Ibid.*

soon after arriving in North Carolina. The remaining three missionaries were successful, Strong in the Gulf coast states, Butler in Kentucky, and most significantly, Hood in North Carolina.²⁰⁷ Hood successfully outcompeted missionaries from the MEC and the AME Church. Immediately upon his arrival in North Carolina he began organizing congregations and receiving them into the Zion connection. Andrew Chapel at New Bern would go on to be known as St Peter's Church, 'The Mother Church of Zion Methodism in the South', but when Hood arrived in New Bern he found missionaries from the MEC and the Congregationalists competing for the allegiance of the divided four hundred-strong congregation. They were soon joined by two missionaries from the AME Church. However, after Hood's Easter sermon the congregation voted to join the Zion Church. Hood then brought the congregation at Beaufort to the Zion connection.²⁰⁸ He went on to win over St Stephen's Church of Wilmington from the AME Church and continued to receive new congregations throughout the state. Bishop Clinton organized the North Carolina Annual Conference on 17 December 1864, and the first Annual Conference in the South was soon followed by others (see Table 3).

By 1890, the AME Zion Church had 111,949 members in North Carolina, compared to 16,156 AME members.²¹⁰ It is easy to explain the success of the AME Zion Church in North Carolina and the success of the AME Church in Georgia and South Carolina in terms of personnel. The most effective

²⁰⁷Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 186–7

²⁰⁸Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 85–6
 Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 51–8

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 186–9

²⁰⁹Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 188–202

²¹⁰Angell, *Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 65–6

Table 3: Organisation of southern AME Zion Church Annual Conferences²⁰⁹

Conference	Organised
North Carolina	17 December 1864
Louisiana	13 March 1865
Kentucky	6 June 1866
South Carolina	24 March 1867
Alabama	3 April 1867
Georgia	15 June 1867
Tennessee	6 October 1868
Florida	22 April 1869
West Tennessee	October 1869
Mississippi	October 1869
Arkansas	January 1870

missionaries of each of those churches were present in those respective states in the immediate wake of emancipation: Turner and Lynch in Georgia and South Carolina, and Hood in North Carolina. Nor is it surprising that the AME Church should have focused its missionary efforts on South Carolina, being the native state of both Henry McNeal Turner and senior Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne. Furthermore, the AME Church had been present in South Carolina until 1822 when the reaction to the Denmark Vesey conspiracy forced them out of the state.²¹¹ For the AME Zion Church, as for the AME Church, its expansion into the South dramatically reconfigured the centre of gravity of the denomination. Within a space of a few short years, the northern membership of the church had been dwarfed by its southern membership. Of course, as with the AME Church, this created a new church politics in the postbellum period in which southern interests, distant from the Church's administrative centre, held great influence. The fact that AME Zion influence in the South was more geographically focused (on North Carolina) than that

²¹¹Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 44–5

of the AME Church did not hinder the importance of southern voices in the AME Zion Church but rather focused their influence, as, for example, Glenda Elizabeth Gilmore has demonstrated in the case of Bishop Charles C. Pettey and Sarah Dudley Pettey.²¹²

2.3 Origins of the CME Church

In addition to the two major independent black Methodist denominations which had existed prior to the Civil War, the emergence of the CME Church in 1870 created yet another denominational branch of African-American Methodism. As in other denominations, the discussions of the ‘woman question’ and the roles which were available to women in the CME Church was contingent on denominational church politics, which in turn depended on the fundamental character of the church, the ideological inclinations of its leadership, and how these were affected by the church’s growth and development in the later nineteenth century. The CME Church was the most conservative of the three major black Methodist Churches, and was the slowest to expand the roles available to women. For example, while the AME Church created boards of stewardesses in their churches from 1868 onwards, when the same position was proposed to the CME Church’s General Conference, the proposal ‘produced laughter’, and it was not until 1890 that boards of stewardesses were introduced.²¹³ Understanding the comparative

²¹²G.E. Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow: Women and the Politics of White Supremacy in North Carolina, 1896–1920* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1996)

²¹³Phillips, *The History of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 126
Lakey, *The History of the CME Church*, p. 272
Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, p. 158
Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 102

conservatism of the CME Church requires an understanding of its origins and postbellum development.²¹⁴

Between 1860 and 1866 the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, had lost 62.1% of its African-American membership. Initially the MECS had been very slow to respond to the withdrawal of its black members. As Hunter Dickinson Farish argued,

To begin with, the South was slow to perceive the full implications of emancipation as regards the religious life of the Negro. It was unprepared to revise radically its conception of the proper place of blacks in the connection. Though the Negro was cordially urged to remain in the Church, it was expected that he would continue in an inferior and subordinate relation.²¹⁵

It is unsurprising that the African-American membership of the MECS left in such great numbers. Within the MECS African Americans could neither be ordained as pastors or preachers nor made presiding elders. The dislocation of war broke existing ties between church members and their congregations. During wartime the MECS was unable to make any significant effort to retain the allegiance of its African-American members. The General Conference of 1862 did not meet and annual conferences met irregularly.²¹⁶ While rival churches sent missionaries among the freed people, the MECS was in disarray. By the time of the 1866 General Conference, the need for action was pressing. The address of the bishops to the conference highlighted this need:

²¹⁴W.B. Gravely, 'The Social, Political and Religious Significance of the Formation of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church', *Methodist History* Vol. 18, No. 1 (October 1979), pp. 3–25

²¹⁵H.D. Farish, *The Circuit Rider Dismounts: A Social History of Southern Methodism, 1865–1900* (Richmond, VA, 1938), p. 170
Lakey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, p. 59

²¹⁶H.N. McTyeire, *A History of Methodism* (Nashville, 1884), p. 664
Lakey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, pp. 60–1

The interest of the colored population should engage your serious attention... Many of them will probably unite with the African M.E. Church, some of them with the Northern Methodist Church, while others, notwithstanding extraneous influences and unkind misrepresentation of the Church, will remain with us... For those who remain with us the Church should provide generously every thing important to their religious culture.²¹⁷

The conference set up a Standing Committee on the Religious Interests of Colored People. Its report called for wholesale reform. It recommended the granting of preaching licences to African Americans and the right of ordination of African Americans as deacons and elders. It suggested the organization of separate African-American congregations to be organized into separate districts and quarterly conferences under African-American leadership, all within the MECS connection. The report even authorised the bishops to organize separate annual conferences for black churches: 'When two or more annual conferences shall be formed... Let our Bishops advise and assist them in organizing a separate [sic] General Conference jurisdiction for themselves'. The General Conference adopted the report.²¹⁸

The efforts to organize the African-American churches and conferences varied widely. Some annual conferences were organised promptly. In 1866 the Tennessee, North Alabama, and North Mississippi Annual Conference for black congregations was organised, and later in January 1869 a separate Mississippi Colored Conference grew out of it. In other states, annual conferences

²¹⁷ *Journal of the General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, Held in New Orleans, 1866*, pp. 18–19

Lakey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, pp. 65, 124

Lakey, *The History of the CME Church*, p. 133

²¹⁸ *Journal of the General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, Held in New Orleans, 1866*, pp. 58–9

Lakey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, p. 66

Lakey, *The History of the CME Church*, pp. 135–6

for African Americans had not been organised at all by the 1870 General Conference and new annual conferences had to be newly created after the CME Church was founded, as in the case of Louisiana, whose black congregations were not transferred from the MECS to the CME Church until 1872. Likewise, there were no annual conferences organized for North Carolina or Florida by 1870. It is unsurprising that states where the MECS was least effective, such as Virginia and North and South Carolina, were where the AME and AME Zion Churches were most successful. There seem to have been differing approaches adopted by different CME bishops. While Bishop O.S. Doggett had quickly organized an annual conference for Tennessee, Bishop George Foster Pierce focused on organizing individual congregations, and did not organize the Georgia Colored Conference until 23 January 1869. The Tennessee and Kentucky Conferences appointed Superintendents of Colored Work. Thomas Taylor, the Superintendent for the Tennessee Conference, frequently reported on his work in *The Christian Advocate*. In all, the mixed success of the Southern Methodists' attempts to organize and retain their black members had produced five colored annual conferences with over 40,000 members by the 1870 General Conference.²¹⁹

Nevertheless, it seems that these efforts proved insufficient, as the withdrawal of black members only accelerated after 1866. It was clear that those African Americans who still remained with the MECS fully expected that doing so would result in the creation of a new and autonomous African-American Methodist organization under the auspices of the MECS. This was the expectation of the AME Church, as according to Isaac Lane, 'As

²¹⁹Lahey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, pp. 76–78

early as 1866 the African Methodist Episcopal Church, through their bishops, urged our uniting with them, claiming that there was no room in this country for another independent organization.'²²⁰ Lane and Lucius H. Holsey, both future bishops of the CME Church, expected the same. Lane wrote, 'After emancipation. . . at once a movement was inaugurated to give the Negroes a separate and independent organization. . . we made it known that we preferred a separate organization of our own'.²²¹ Likewise, Holsey sought a separate organisation: 'In 1855-66 I started up a colored church, as we were then called, in Sparta, Georgia. There I built the first church *looking to the organization off our separate and distinct ecclesiasticism*'.²²² Again, by the time of the MECS General Conference in 1870, the need for decisive action was paramount. The AME Church's *The Christian Recorder* in 1869 noted that 'the M.E. Church South. — This church is making desperate efforts to regain her standing among the colored people of the South' and that 'She spares no means to get back the preachers and the people, whom at the dawn of liberty, she drove off with contempt.'²²³ The General Conference met in May 1870 in Memphis. The laity did not participate in the General Conference, and since the ordination of African Americans in the MECS was first sanctioned by the 1866 General Convention, it met for the first time with black delegates present. The bishops' address once again referred to the black members of the church:

²²⁰I. Lane, *Autobiography of Bishop Isaac Lane, LL.D* (Nashville, 1916), p. 84

²²¹*Ibid.*, pp. 19–21, 84

²²²Lahey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, p. 69

Emphasis in original.

²²³'The M.E. Church South', *The Christian Recorder* (13 March 1869), p. 2

'Our Church in Kentucky', *The Christian Recorder* (8 May 1869), p. 2

Conformably to the wish of the last General Conference, we have organized and presided over five Annual Conferences, composed exclusively of colored members; have formed forty-five Districts, with circuits and stations. . . our colored brethren are performing the duties of Presiding Elders and pastors. . . It is our purpose. . . to call a General Conference to be holden next winter, for the purpose of organizing them into an entirely separate Church.²²⁴

The black delegates in attendance concurred and the delegates representing the Colored Conferences for Memphis and Kentucky offered a resolution stating that ‘We believe that the time has come now when a General Conference can be organised for our race. . . we ask that you form at once and authorize the organization of a Colored General Conference.’²²⁵ A resolution from the Colored Georgia Conference, introduced by Richard H. Vanderhorst, who would become one of the founding bishops of the CME Church, expressed ‘our high appreciation of the interest you have manifested in our race; and also our entire approval of the plan adopted by the General Conference of 1866.’²²⁶ Therefore the General Conference appointed a delegation led by senior Bishop Robert Paine and Bishop Holland N. McTyeire which would attend the first General Conference of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church, organised for 16 December 1870 in Jackson, Tennessee. The conference met with Bishop Paine presiding over forty-six delegates from the eight existing Colored Annual Conferences: Memphis, Mississippi, Alabama, Georgia, Kentucky, Arkansas, and South Carolina. It adopted the discipline of the MECS almost wholesale, with only very minor alterations (for example, registers of members were

²²⁴ *Journal of the General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South, 1870*, p. 168

²²⁵ *Daily Christian Advocate* (27 May 1870)
Lakey, *The Rise of “Colored Methodism”*, p. 80

²²⁶ *Daily Christian Advocate* (16 May 1870)
Lakey, *The Rise of “Colored Methodism”*, p. 80

not required to note the race of the members), and it adopted the church structure of the MECS identically. Richard H. Vanderhorst and William H. Miles were elected as the first bishops of the new church and the conference closed with their consecration.²²⁷

In the subsequent years the CME Church grew and formed new annual conferences beyond the eight founding conferences. However, unlike the AME and AME Zion Churches, which had begun in the North, the CME Church remained exclusively southern. Throughout its history it never elected a bishop born north of the Mason-Dixon line.²²⁸ Initially the AME Church expressed ambivalence towards the new Church, its bishops writing in a letter to the CME Church General Conference, 'We confess that we would have been more than pleased if, in the providence of God, you could have seen your way clear to have united with us instead of increasing the number of independent organizations of Methodists by one.'²²⁹ The CME Church would go on to be viewed by the other major black Methodist Churches as the 'rebel church' and the 'old slavery church', as they viewed the close relationship of the CME Church with its parent with suspicion.²³⁰ Indeed, throughout its history the CME Church has been comparatively more conservative than its rival black Methodist denominations. The case of women's rights within the Church is illustrative. The CME Church introduced stewardesses twenty-six years after the AME Church did so; it first granted preaching licences to women in 1918, thirty-four years after the AME Church did so, and the General Conference

²²⁷Lahey, *The Rise of "Colored Methodism"*, pp. 81–8

²²⁸Lahey, *The History of the CME Church*, pp. 670–2

²²⁹Phillips, *The History of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church in America*, p. 65

²³⁰Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 123

sanctioned the ordination of women only in 1966, sixteen years after the AME Church did so, and seventy-two years after the first women were ordained in the AME Zion Church.²³¹

The causes of this comparative conservatism lie in the Church's roots, a child of the more conservative of the two major white Methodist denominations, adopting its discipline and continuing to operate closely alongside it, even after their separation. Additionally the fact that CME Church was born and remained an exclusively southern church meant that it never achieved the same cosmopolitanism that was prompted by the geographical breadth of the other black Methodist Churches. It did not have its resources strained to quite the same extent as the AME and AME Zion Churches by the missionary challenge of winning, organising, and administering the newly emancipated South. As a result it did not have to draw on the resources of its laity, and especially its women: intellectual resources; fundraising and organisational ability; and personnel. The bulk of its church membership was not geographically remote from its historical heart and organisational centre as was the case for the AME and AME Zion Churches after their great influx of southern members. They therefore did not experience the same liberalising and anti-hierarchical pressures for laity rights and women's rights in their church polity. For all that the AME Church and Zion Church's polities differed, in regard to women especially, that of the CME Church showed even less resemblance.

²³¹Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 102–3

2.4 Competition among Methodists and others

Just as important as the growth of the major black Methodist Churches in the postbellum South was the way in which they competed for adherents, not only with each other, but with the white Methodist Churches and indeed other denominations, especially the Presbyterians and Congregationalists. Rapid church growth in the South resulted in large memberships, geographically distant from the organisational centres of the churches. It strained the pastoral, financial, and organisational resources of the churches. It therefore provided a strong impetus to enhanced lay and women's rights; expansiveness in aspirations for church growth; a broader, more populist base in church-led education; and an overall liberalisation in church politics. This was only further enhanced by the ferocity of competition between denominations in the post-emancipation South.

Many southern congregations were absorbed by northern churches en masse. Numbers had been left in disarray, often abandoned by their pastors. Freed from the constraints of slavery, many congregations opted to transfer their allegiance from their previous denomination (often the MECS) to a new northern church. Often large semi-independent urban congregations would elect to join a new church, providing strong bases for their new denominations. The AME Church won such congregations in Charleston, Nashville, Savannah, and Augusta, for example. In some cases, such congregations had even been under black pastors within the MECS, such as the 800-member church led by Richard Parker in Norfolk, Virginia, which joined the AME Church

in 1863.²³² Many African-American Christians in the South were in a less ordered state. Some groups of black worshippers were the remnants of former biracial congregations, now without pastors. Others were not part of any congregation at all. At Helenaville, South Carolina, James Lynch described ‘a village containing about eight hundred colored inhabitants. . . Methodists, Presbyterians, Baptists, and Episcopalians. . . all worshipping together, or what is nearer the truth quarreling together.’²³³ The independent black Methodist Churches and the major white denominations sought to win the adherence of organised, large congregations and to assemble new congregations from disordered worshippers alike.²³⁴

The AME and AME Zion Churches had a significant advantage in the racial bonds they shared with the freed people. The independent black Churches represented religious autonomy and racial uplift. Their missionaries saw it as their duty to ‘extend a hand of mercy to bone of our bone and flesh of our flesh’, as Henry McNeal Turner put it.²³⁵ Some of their missionaries, such as William and Wesley Gaines and William Bentley of the AME Church, had been born slaves.²³⁶ Both these churches competed with each other, often for the same congregation, as in the case of the two major black Methodist Churches of Wilmington, North Carolina, St Luke’s and St Stephen’s. Initially both congregations had opted to join the AME Church. However, after disputes between the missionary representatives of the AME and AME Zion Churches,

²³²A.W. Wayman, ‘A Visit to Norfolk Virginia’, *The Christian Recorder* (24 October 1863), p. 1

²³³J.D. Lynch, ‘The Beaufort, S.C. Correspondence’, *The Christian Recorder* (25 July 1863), p. 1

²³⁴Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 86–7

²³⁵H.M. Turner, ‘A Call to Action’, *The Christian Recorder* (4 October 1862), p. 1

²³⁶Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 71

James Walker Hood of the Zion Church persuaded the leaders of St Luke's Church to withdraw from the Bethel Church and join the Zion, but failed to persuade the leaders of St Stephen's to do likewise.²³⁷ Nevertheless, these two major black Methodist Churches ultimately forged mostly discrete spheres of influence within the South.

The white Churches in turn had significant advantages over the black Methodist denominations, drawing on substantial financial resources, very large membership bases and well-established missionary societies. The chief rival of the AME and AME Zion Churches for the adherence of southern black Christians, especially those former MECS members who already embraced Methodism, was the northern Methodist Episcopal Church. By 1868 the MEC had organised nine Annual Conferences in the South and had around 90,000 southern black members.²³⁸ From the outset the northern Methodists were presented with one significant advantage over their rivals, especially the black Methodist Churches. In November 1863 the War Department had empowered the Methodist Episcopal Church to occupy abandoned church buildings and those which had been led by pastors loyal to the Confederacy. Where many black congregations were without church buildings after emancipation, the MEC was able to make provision. Much of the MEC's success with African Americans in the South was achieved by enlisting the leadership of existing black pastors and preachers. The General Conference of 1864 had encouraged 'making freedmen the pastors of freedmen'. As one missionary wrote, 'No one is so well adapted to pastoral labor among . . . the freedmen . . . as

²³⁷Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 188

Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 59–60 '

²³⁸Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 72

those preachers who have arisen among them.'²³⁹ MECS Bishop Holland N. McTyeire acknowledged that for his church's northern rival, black pastors were 'the most efficient agents for extending their new organization in the Southern field'.²⁴⁰ Initially the MEC had organised biracial congregations. One Methodist pastor wrote that 'There will be no galleries in heaven', referring to the segregated seating arrangements of many biracial churches.²⁴¹ However, this ambition soon abated, particularly in the northern border states. The case of missionary Timothy Lewis in Charleston was typical. Having initially organised a biracial congregation, within four months he had been forced to reorganise it into separate black and white congregations.²⁴² Lewis also came under criticism from Richard H. Cain, AME missionary and future bishop, for attempting to prevent congregations from joining the AME Church, especially by manipulating the MEC's advantage with regard to church property.²⁴³

Fortunately for AME missionaries like Cain, other white churches were less successful in their missionary efforts among the freed people. Much as the Methodists had divided in the antebellum period, the Presbyterian Church had divided into 'New School' and 'Old School' factions in 1837. These divisions were loosely sectional, with New School Presbyterianism being more influential

²³⁹ *The Christian Advocate* (31 March 1864)

R.E. Morrow, *Northern Methodism and Reconstruction* (East Lansing, MI, 1956), p. 146

Dvorak, *An African-American Exodus*, p. 97

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 72–3

²⁴⁰ McTyeire, *A History of Methodism*, p. 670

Dvorak, *An African-American Exodus*, p. 97

²⁴¹ Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 72

²⁴² *Missionary Advocate* 21 (June 1865), p. 22

Morrow, *Northern Methodism and Reconstruction*, pp. 126–131, 181–190, 244–245

Dvorak, *An African-American Exodus*, p. 98

²⁴³ *The Christian Recorder* (29 July 1865)

in the North, and Old School in the South.²⁴⁴ Although the predominantly New School Presbyterian Church in the USA (PCUSA) did establish some presbyteries in the South, it failed to win many congregants among the freed people.²⁴⁵ Indeed, the existing African-American membership in southern presbyteries rapidly shrank, having been comparatively very small to begin with. In Georgia, there had been 643 black Presbyterians in 1860 and 517 in Tennessee. By 1866, there were so few remaining that the Presbyterian Church in the United States (PCUS), the Old School branch of the Presbyterian Church, stopped reporting figures for black membership.²⁴⁶ There are several reasons for the failure of Presbyterianism among the freed people. Unlike northern Methodist Churches, the PCUSA made little accommodation of African Americans in its church structure. While the Church ostensibly believed that the freed people were ‘redeemed with us by the infinitely meritorious death and sacrifice of Christ’, according to its General Assembly, this equality did not exist in practice.²⁴⁷ Congregations remained segregated; there were effectively no black ministers and few exhorters; there was no provision for educating black clergy until 1876; and the General Assembly urged African Americans ‘to occupy their old position’ within the Church.²⁴⁸ The Presbyterians were also unable to call on the financial resources for their

²⁴⁴C.C. Goen, *Broken Churches, Broken Nation: Denominational Schisms and the Coming of the Civil War*, pp. 68–75

²⁴⁵J.B. Barber, *Climbing Jacob’s Ladder: The Story of the Work of the Presbyterian Church U.S.A. Among the Negroes* (New York, 1952), p. 39
Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 73–8

²⁴⁶Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 72

²⁴⁷*Minutes of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, 1860* (Philadelphia, 1860), p. 370

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 74

²⁴⁸A.E. Murray, *Presbyterians and the Negro — A History* (Philadelphia, 1966), pp. 146–7
Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 75

missionary efforts that northern Methodists could command. In 1867, only 526 out of 2,508 congregations contributed to the missionary effort among the freed people, and the Church's Board of Missions for Freedmen complained that their effort had 'not been sustained in a manner at all commensurate with its importance.'²⁴⁹ It has also been argued that the sober, intellectual tone of Presbyterian worship — especially among Old School Presbyterians, not prone to emotional displays of spiritual conversion and religious fervour — was not amenable to the religious tendencies and preferences of most freed people.²⁵⁰ What little success Presbyterians achieved was mostly with higher status African Americans, such as Jonathan C. Gibbs, one of their few black missionaries, who achieved some success in Charleston as pastor of Zion Presbyterian Church. Nevertheless, the postbellum Presbyterian missionary effort among emancipated African Americans was almost a total failure.²⁵¹

The Congregationalists, if anything, fared worse than the Presbyterians. The denomination had strong ties to the American Missionary Association, officially a nonsectarian organisation whose primary purpose was education rather than evangelism. Nevertheless, the AMA's educational efforts were often highly religious in character. Many of the AMA's missionaries had

²⁴⁹ *Minutes of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, 1866* (Philadelphia, 1866), p. 76
Minutes of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, 1867 (Philadelphia, 1867), p. 446
Minutes of the General Assembly of the Presbyterian Church in the United States of America, 1871 (Philadelphia, 1871), p. 510

²⁵⁰ Wilmore, *Black and Presbyterian*, p. 54

²⁵¹ R.H. Cain, 'Charleston Correspondence', *The Christian Recorder* (5 August 1865), p. 1
 E.J. Adams, 'Letter from Charleston', *The Christian Recorder* (5 August 1865), p. 1
 T. Holt, *Black Over White: Negro Political Leadership in South Carolina During Reconstruction* (Urbana, IL, 1977), p. 89
 Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 77–8

ministerial experience. Missionaries' teaching was often moralistic in character. Some sought for the AMA to take a more actively religious and evangelistic direction in its work. Other missionaries preached and converted freed people in their spare time, and undoubtedly their work on behalf of the AMA put them in a unique position of access to emancipated African Americans from which to do so. Several Congregational churches in major cities were situated in close proximity to AMA schools, in New Orleans, Montgomery, Atlanta, and Savannah, for example. By 1878 there were 84 Congregational churches in the South, and by 1885 there were 118 with 7,512 members of whom some 6,000 were black. Numerous factors hampered the growth of the Congregationalists among the freed people even in spite of the AMA's presence and influence. To an even greater extent than for the Presbyterians, cultural differences, especially in the style of worship, hindered the appeal of Congregationalism. AMA missionaries frequently derided the emotionalism and physicality of the worship of many freed people. One, William G. Kephart, complained of 'an excessive effervescence of emotional feelings with very little intelligent understanding of even the first elementary principles of the gospel.' He felt that to remedy the deficiencies he perceived in African Americans' worship would 'require much patience, labor, and prayer, to remove this mass of *rubbish* from their minds'.²⁵² Cultural differences also prevented the AMA from appointing significant numbers of black missionaries, as African Americans were seen as unable to meet the required standards of education and morality. In Georgia, for example, only five percent of the AMA's

²⁵²Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 80
Emphasis in original

teachers were African Americans. In turn many African Americans, especially preachers, responded with hostility to Congregationalist condescension. AMA missionary Henry Kelsey wrote that 'There is much suspicion on the part of the colored preachers and churches concerning us', while Enoch K. Miller complained that in Arkansas, black preachers did 'all in their power to monopolize the attention of freedmen.'²⁵³ What efforts the Congregationalists made to win black churches and include black preachers were made through attempts to co-opt existing preachers and congregations. For example, AMA missionary Joseph W. Healey in New Orleans attempted to recruit the pastor of St James AME Church, John Turner, but ultimately failed and Turner remained with the AME Church.²⁵⁴

Ultimately, the competition that Methodists and Baptists faced from other denominations proved ineffectual. Nevertheless competition between the missionaries of the many churches present in the post-emancipation South had significant effects on the internal politics of those various denominations. Certainly the most effective white church to rival the existing independent black churches was the Methodist Episcopal Church. However, the presence of missionaries from other churches should not be ignored. Nor should be the fact that African-American churches in the South existed within these denominations. Although there were far fewer black Presbyterian, Congregationalist, Episcopalian, and Catholic churches in the postbellum

²⁵³Ibid., p. 81

²⁵⁴J.M. Richardson, 'The Failure of the American Missionary Association to Expand Congregationalism Among Southern Blacks', *Southern Studies* Vol. 18 (Spring 1979), pp. 51-73
 Richardson, *Christian Reconstruction*, pp. 141-59
 Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 78-82

South than Methodist or Baptist, their members' religious life was shaped by the distinct characteristics, structures, and polities of those churches. It is essential that those distinct religious experiences not be subsumed into a monolithic historiographical black church experience, especially with regard to some of the most divergent aspects of those polities, such as women's rights and roles in church life.

2.5 Logistical challenges of southern expansion

The intense nature of denominational competition in the post-emancipation South was only exacerbated by the logistical challenges and resource demands of missionary work and church expansion. In particular, there was a shortage of church buildings; a need for funds to pay for missionary work; and a need for qualified missionaries preachers and pastors, especially black ones. These demands pressed particularly hard on the independent black denominations, the AME and AME Zion Churches. They lacked the financial resources of their white counterparts, and their missionary societies were not as large, well-organised or as firmly established. The difficulties, issues, and disputes around the question of church property and buildings were in large part a product of the way in which the existing church arrangements had disintegrated in wartime. Many black congregations had existed as part of biracial congregations in which they were segregated into separate sections of the church, most commonly the balconies and galleries. The war and emancipation left many black congregations abandoned by their white pastors. Often these congregations were able to remain in their church buildings while their

white pastors and congregants fled in the face of advancing Union armies. In Helenaville and Beaufort, South Carolina, for example, black members from numerous denominations took up residence in abandoned Episcopal churches. In March 1865, the editor of the AME Church's *The Christian Recorder*, took pride when he preached to a newly organised AME congregation in the pulpit of a formerly white church, while his congregation sat not in the gallery, but throughout the whole church, noting 'the pleasure and satisfaction exhibited by the congregation.'²⁵⁵

However, the occupation of church buildings by African-American congregations was often soon challenged by whites. On 30 November 1863, the War Department granted the Methodist Episcopal Church the right to take control of churches which had previously been pastored by ministers loyal to the Confederacy. As a result, many former MECS churches occupied by black churches were appropriated by the missionaries of the MEC. For example, James Lynch complained of the actions of MEC missionary T.W. Lewis regarding a church occupied by a black congregation in Charleston. Lynch reported that Lewis was 'making a strong effort to hold the property by military order, which the Secretary of War gave to Bishop James about eighteen months since.' Lynch feared that 'two thousand Methodist members are... to be forced from their churches because they do not choose to follow Mr. Lewis.'²⁵⁶ The members then went on to worship with the Zion Colored Presbyterian Church, but soon, according to Richard H. Cain, 'The Methodists

²⁵⁵'Editorial Correspondence', *The Christian Recorder* (22 April 1865), p. 2

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 88–96

²⁵⁶J.D. Lynch, 'Organization of the African Methodist Church in Charleston', *The Christian Recorder* (6 May 1865), p. 2

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 89

were turned out without a day's warning'.²⁵⁷ When church properties were not militarily confiscated, their occupation by African Americans was frequently challenged by the existing claims of white southerners to the property, often by white churches. Even when church buildings had always previously been used by black members, it was usually difficult for them to claim ownership successfully. For example, in Jackson, Mississippi, while a white church did not claim ownership of a black congregation's church building, it did claim the land on which the building stood. According to one black missionary, 'our people have nothing to disprove that claim. It is so near to the white church, not more than twenty-five yards, that the latter contend that it must and shall be removed.'²⁵⁸

Such difficulties were also exemplified by the case of Hiram Rhodes Revels, an AME missionary and later the first African American to serve in the United States Senate. The congregation of which Revels took leadership in Vicksburg, Mississippi, had worshipped in a white-owned church. However, within months of his arrival in Vicksburg, Revels found that 'The thing which we so anxiously anticipated we are now realizing. We are thrown out of our place of worship.' Initially they were 'not able to find a vacant church, hall, or even a room, of sufficient size in which to meet for the time being.' Eventually they took up temporary residence in a barracks, although it was 'too small, and in every respect unfit for... purpose.' Eventually Union military forces in Vicksburg provided them lumber in order to construct a church, but they then had trouble securing land. Revels wrote,

²⁵⁷R.H. Cain, 'Charleston Correspondence', *The Christian Recorder* (5 August 1865), p. 1
Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 92

²⁵⁸Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vme and Fig Tree*, p. 90

We would now be engaged in erecting the house, but for the fact that we have reason to believe that the (white) Trustees of the Southern M.E. Church, who alone can give a deed for our ground, will refuse to give one that would place the people and property under the control of the bishop and Conference of the A.M.E. Church.

Revels and his congregation had been offered the basement of the white Methodist church, but they declined: 'our people, from a painful recollection of their past and a happy realization of their present ecclesiastical relations, determined to decline the offer.'²⁵⁹

Many black congregations had such difficulties in securing a place to worship. Even those whose buildings were not subject to legal dispute or military confiscation might lose them to the destruction of the war, as was the case of one black congregation in Columbia, South Carolina, whose church building was destroyed during Sherman's March to the Sea. John Horton, a member of that church pleaded, 'We are all very anxious to have a church, and we would like our brethren at the North to help us if they possibly can.'²⁶⁰ The African Methodist Churches lacked buildings throughout the South. As AME missionary Thomas Crayton wrote in 1867, 'Our greatest want at present are houses of worship. Oh that the Lord would send us help to fill that want!'²⁶¹ Many congregations had to make do with makeshift buildings acting as churches. Ezra Presbyterian Church in Savannah met in an old gristmill, while an African Methodist Episcopal Church in Adel, Georgia, met in a railway boxcar. In Austin, Texas, the black Baptists met in a

²⁵⁹H.R. Revels, 'Letter from Vicksburg', *The Christian Recorder* (7 October 1865), p. 1
Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 90–1

²⁶⁰J. Horton, 'Letter from Columbia', *The Christian Recorder* (30 September 1865), p. 3
Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 92–3

²⁶¹T. Crayton, 'Letter from Georgia', *The Christian Recorder* (14 September 1867), p. 2
Stowell, *Rebuilding Zion*, p. 91

barbershop, while the Methodists met in an opera house. Some congregations even worshipped in brush arbors.²⁶²

The problem of church buildings was only exacerbated by the creation of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church in 1870. The issue of church property had first arisen at the 1866 General Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. Having resolved to create independent Conferences for its black members, the Church received a delegation from the African Methodist Episcopal Church, composed of John Turner, Charles Burch, and M.M. Clark. They presented a letter which requested ‘the transfer to colored trustees, of the *deeds* of those congregations which have already united with the A.M.E. Church — but have not yet obtained titled deeds for their property.’²⁶³ The Colored Methodist Episcopal Church’s Committee on the Religious Interests of Colored People responded to the request in its report to the General Conference:

Having provided for the full development of a church organization for the colored people, up to a General Conference in connection with the M.E. Church, South, your committee recommend the adoption of the following resolutions:

Resolved, 2. That this Conference reciprocates the kind regards of the Bishops and delegates of the African M.E. Church, but does not grant their request in regard to the transfer of Church property, held for the use of colored congregations.²⁶⁴

The Conference ultimately adopted a resolution which permitted the use of church buildings by black congregations which had entirely withdrawn from the Church. However, it did not authorise the transfer of deeds. The MECS

²⁶²Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 94

²⁶³Lahey, *The Rise of “Colored Methodism”*, pp. 74–5

Emphasis in original

²⁶⁴*Ibid.*, p. 75

sought to retain property for its proposed African-American Conference, which would become the CME Church. By the General Conference of 1870 the establishment of the CME Church was an imminent reality, and as such the accommodation of congregations which had withdrawn and joined the AME and AME Zion Churches ceased. The Conference adopted a resolution which transferred all such property to the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church:

Resolved, . . . That all trustees now holding church property for the use of our colored membership, be instructed to make titles to said property to the properly constituted trustees of the Colored M.E. Church, South, according to the Discipline of said Church when organized.²⁶⁵

The conference expressed the view that it had neither the legal nor the moral authority to transfer property to those who had withdrawn from the denomination. As a result, in 1870 the AME and AME Zion Churches experienced another wave of their congregations being removed from their church buildings, as those buildings were transferred to the CME Church.

Ultimately, the black denominations had to invest in building new churches. James Lynch described one Methodist Church in Augusta, Georgia:

The church property is worth eight thousand dollars. The church is a good, substantial building, very tastefully furnished inside and admirably planned, having three aisles, a capacious altar, and a pulpit, it is located in a very attractive part of the city, and on a large lot neatly fenced.²⁶⁶

The AME Church spent considerable sums on church building in the postbellum years. A church built by Richard H. Cain in Charleston cost \$10,000.²⁶⁷

²⁶⁵Ibid., p. 79

²⁶⁶J.D. Lynch, 'Another Church Received Into the Connexion', *The Christian Recorder* (8 July 1865), p. 1

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 94–5

²⁶⁷R.H. Cain, 'Charleston Correspondence', *The Christian Recorder* (14 October 1865), p. 1

In 1876, the AME Church's South Carolina Conference spent \$12,118.87 on church extension. In 1878, a total of \$4,804.14 was spent on church extension and a further \$5,884.05 on church buildings in the AME Georgia Conference.²⁶⁸ In 1880, the AME Church spent \$396,894.48 for building and repairing purposes.²⁶⁹ While Churches received some financial support for church-building from the Freedmen's Bureau, it was far from sufficient. The need for church buildings placed a heavy financial burden on the independent black Churches and they had to raise considerable sums. Nevertheless, they built many churches. The AME Church's South Carolina Conference had only 58 churches in 1867, but by 1875 it had 268, despite several new conferences having separated from it.²⁷⁰ The AME Church as a whole had as few as 286 churches in 1866, but had 2,051 by 1880, and the overwhelming majority of that growth was in the South.²⁷¹

In addition to the paucity of church buildings there was a shortage of qualified preachers in the South. James Lynch began the process of licensing slave preachers shortly after arriving in South Carolina: 'I licensed two local preachers, and two exhorters who had been previously verbally licensed'.²⁷² However, there were very few literate preachers among the freedmen, and too few northern missionaries to pastor the congregations. Henry McNeal Turner

²⁶⁸'Pamphlets Received', *The Christian Recorder* (29 April 1875), p. 4

'A Sermon Preached in Port au-Prince, Hayti', *The Christian Recorder* (24 January 1878), p. 1

'Our Ministry', *The Christian Recorder* (2 May 1878), p. 2

²⁶⁹Thomas, 'Statistics of the AME. Church'

²⁷⁰Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 524

'Pamphlets Received', *The Christian Recorder* (29 April 1875)

²⁷¹Thomas, 'Statistics of the A.M.E. Church'

Wright, *Centennial Encyclopaedia*, p. 5

²⁷²Lynch, 'The Beaufort, SC. Correspondence'

in Georgia resorted to severely relaxing the requirements for licensing. In 1866 and 1867 he neither required literacy nor acquaintance with the Bible. He licensed preachers on street corners and approached potential ministers and preachers asking, 'Can you preach?' and 'Can you sing and pray?' As a result, Stephen Ward Angell has shown that only 18 out of 101 ministers in Georgia appointed between 1867 and 1869 had any prior experience.²⁷³ Black Baptists, too, lacked qualified preachers, and the minutes of most of their state conventions repeatedly lamented the presence of unqualified preachers, and men fraudulently claiming to be pastors and ministers among their churches. The problem of poorly qualified ministers in the southern black churches persisted for decades after the Civil War. Indeed, in 1890, Booker T. Washington asserted that 'three-fourths of the Baptist ministers and two-thirds of the Methodists are unfit, either mentally or morally, or both, to preach the Gospel to anyone or to attempt to lead any one.'²⁷⁴ Likewise the Montgomery Baptist minister, the Rev. A.N. McEwen, editor of Alabama's *Baptist Leader*, claimed,

The greatest object of over two—thirds of the Baptist ministers of Alabama is to collect their salaries. They care no more for the moral and intellectual training of the people than they care for the snap of their finger.²⁷⁵

The demands placed on Churches by the lack of ministers and church buildings required them to depend greatly on their lay members. Lay members,

²⁷³Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 72–3 and n. 56

²⁷⁴B.T. Washington, 'The Colored Ministry. Its Defects and Needs', *The Christian Union* (14 August 1890)

L.R. Harlan (ed.), *The Booker T. Washington Papers, Vol. 3: 1889–95* (Urbana, IL, 1974), pp. 71–5

²⁷⁵B.T. Washington, 'The Colored Ministry. Its Defects and Needs'

and especially women, were instrumental in raising the funds which facilitated church building and were central to the organisation, management, and leadership of churches. Throughout the history of both the AME and AME Zion Churches women's benevolent societies had played an important part in church fundraising. The Female Benevolent Society and the Female Branch of Zion society facilitated the construction of AME Zion churches in New York in 1820 and 1840. The Zion Church's Daughters of Conference society was first established in 1821, and soon helped fund missionaries for New York, New England, New Jersey, and Pennsylvania. Numerous female benevolent societies were established throughout the AME Zion Church in the antebellum period, such as The Young Daughters of Conference led by Mary Roberts and Ellen Stevens; The Daughters of Conference of New England, led by Eliza Ann Gardner of Boston, Mary E. Anderson of Worcester, and Adella Hicks Turner of Providence; and the United Sons and Daughters of Zion's Benevolent Society of Troy, New York, founded in 1835. Likewise, in the AME Church such groups had existed since the early years of the Church, and quickly emerged throughout the churches and conferences of the South.²⁷⁶

After emancipation, Daughters of Conference organisations helped raise vital money to send missionaries south and to build churches. Their funds were distributed among the pastors and churches at annual conferences, and time was always set aside in the proceedings and minutes for the receipt of their contributions.²⁷⁷ In 1867, a correspondent of *The Christian Recorder* wrote of his church's Daughters of Conference that 'These sisters have for many

²⁷⁶Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 133–7

²⁷⁷Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 85–6

years done the itinerancy great service by their annual donations, and their zeal in aiding the cause of Christ'.²⁷⁸ Often individual societies raised only small amounts, but the societies were numerous and their overall contribution was significant. Special collections were held at services and they organised bake sales and fairs to raise money.²⁷⁹ The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Daughters of Conference of New England were responsible for raising most of the funds that sent missionaries John Williams, James Walker Hood, W.F. Butler, and Wilbur G. Strong to the South.²⁸⁰ In 1866, in Natchez, Mississippi, the African Methodist Episcopal Church's Benevolent Daughters of Zion held festivals and provided \$1,228 towards purchasing their church from the MEC, a sizable contribution to the initial price of \$8,000.²⁸¹ Similarly, in 1878, the Daughters of Conference of Selma, Alabama, donated a considerable sum toward the purchase of land for the building of the Metropolitan AME Church in Washington, DC.²⁸² Smaller contributions were also very valuable to the development of the Church in the South. In 1872, in Abbeville, South Carolina, the AME Daughters of Conference contributed \$54.25 to the construction of a parsonage. The money supplied to and distributed by annual conferences helped support the much needed ministers and pastors in southern churches. Their contributions were often directed to needy churches: 'Many a weak Church selected by Conference to sustain it during its session, received such

²⁷⁸'Daughters of Conference', *The Christian Recorder* (1 June 1867), p. 2

²⁷⁹For example, J.H. Pierce, 'Notice', *The Christian Recorder* (27 October 1866) Dodson, *Engendering Church*, p. 66

Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 99

²⁸⁰Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 137

²⁸¹'A Letter from Natchez', *The Christian Recorder* (10 February 1866), p. 1

'Good news from Natchez, Miss.', *The Christian Recorder* (2 June 1866)p. 2

²⁸²'Congratulatory', *The Christian Recorder* (29 August 1878), p. 1

indirect help from these women, as enabled it to bear a burden that otherwise would have been insupportable'.²⁸³ Daughters of Conference were able to gain significant influence in the Church through their fundraising. They were allotted time at conferences to present their contributions and often received lectures and sermons from bishops in return.²⁸⁴ Their monies were a bargaining chip which they wielded especially to influence the selection of ministers for their church. The consent of women's organisations was informally necessary for ministerial appointments, and bishops regularly consulted their representatives when selecting ministers.²⁸⁵

Women were also crucial to the funding of church expansion through collections from congregations. Since the antebellum period, the AME Church had operated the 'Two Cents Plan' in which each church member paid two cents per year into the general fund in addition to regular collections to fund the overarching denomination, bishops, presiding elders, and missions, and for educational purposes. In 1872, the General Conference adopted the 'Dollar Money System' in which pastors were required 'to collect the sum of one dollar from or for each member in his church or churches...or at least one third of it'. A finance department and a financial director were also introduced to manage the Dollar Money.²⁸⁶ This greatly enhanced the ability of the AME Church to finance its new southern conferences and

²⁸³'Our Daughters of Conference', *The Christian Recorder* (17 April 1873), p. 4

²⁸⁴For example, 'Daughters of Conference', *The Christian Recorder* (24 May 1862), p. 2

'The New York Annual Conference', *The Christian Recorder* (20 June 1878), p. 1

²⁸⁵Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 85–6

²⁸⁶'To the Ministers, Members and Friends of the African Methodist Episcopal Church in America', *The Christian Recorder* (15 June 1872), p. 3

Richardson, *Dark Salvation*, p. 200

Dodson, *Engendering Church*, p. 67

churches. In 1866, the general treasury had received \$47,483.76 from its members, \$29,601.59 of which had come from its 22,388 southern members.²⁸⁷ Between 1872 and 1876, the Church treasury received \$95,554.11; between 1876 and the 1880 General Conference it received \$99,925.68; and between 1880 and 1888 it received \$368,895.86.²⁸⁸ These increases were in large part due to the Dollar Money. The southern contribution to the Dollar Money was significant. In 1875, the Florida Conference raised \$1,593 in Dollar Money and the South Carolina Conference raised \$2,849.60.²⁸⁹ In 1876 the South Carolina Conference raised \$3,427.19; in 1877 the Georgia Conference raised \$1,922.21; and in 1880 the North Georgia Conference raised \$2,168.30.²⁹⁰ Women were a majority of the Church's membership, especially in the South, and they paid much of the Dollar Money. Jualynne Dodson has examined lists of Dollar Money contributors, and based on a count of those with female first names believes they represent the majority of Dollar Money contributors between 1888 and 1892.²⁹¹ *The Christian Recorder* frequently published a 'Dollar Money Record' featuring a 'Roll of Usefulness and Honor', listing those who paid Dollar Money. Examination of names on these lists suggests that Dodson's finding holds true for earlier years.²⁹² Both through payment of Dollar Money and the fundraising of Daughters of Conference societies and female communicants, women made themselves indispensable to their

²⁸⁷Dodson, *Engendering Church*, p. 102

²⁸⁸Ibid., p. 68

²⁸⁹'Pamphlets Received'

²⁹⁰'A Sermon Preached in Port au-Prince, Hayti'

'Our Ministry'

Gaines, *African Methodism in the South*, p. 95

²⁹¹Dodson, *Engendering Church*, p. 68

²⁹²Based on an examination of 'Dollar Money Record' articles in *The Christian Recorder*, 1874-1876

churches in the South. As William E. Montgomery argued,

It would not be an exaggeration to say that the securing of property, the construction of buildings, and the expansion and maintenance of these buildings were the direct result of the vital role that women played.²⁹³

Southern women were also extremely valuable as participants in the churches they helped fund. Acting as stewardesses in great numbers they were provided vital assistance to fledgling congregations and provided valuable services for the many women members in particular. The AME Church had introduced boards of stewardesses at the General Conference of 1868, having previously rejected petitions calling for boards of stewardesses at several General Conferences. It was no coincidence that the Church had reversed its position and introduced the position of stewardess at the moment when the Church's growth was most rapid. The role of stewardess allowed the church to harness the organisational abilities of its women throughout its numerous new churches in the South, which was essential for the development and maintenance of those new congregations with their thousands of new members. The AME Zion Church followed suit in 1876, introducing stewardesses and also voting to 'strike out the word "male" in the Discipline', thus allowing women to vote for church trustees and participate in quarterly and annual conferences.²⁹⁴ One minister in Union Springs, Alabama, saw stewardesses as

²⁹³Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, p. 95

²⁹⁴*Daily Journal of the Sixteenth Quadrennial Session of the General Conference of the A.M.E. Zion Church, of America, Held at Montgomery, Alabama, May, A.D., 1880* (New York, 1880), p. 71

Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 159

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 111

M.S. Jones, *All Bound Up Together: The Woman Question in African American Public Culture, 1830–1900* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1997), p. 156

essential: 'The Stewardesses have done a good work for the church since I have been here; I do not think we could have got along without their help.'²⁹⁵ The pastor of one Texas church even dismissed the male officers of his church and replaced them with stewardesses: 'For six months he was unable to get the officers of the church together, after which he removed them and appointed a board of stewardesses which is the only counsel that he has.'²⁹⁶

Women also helped the AME Church's missionary efforts in the South as itinerant preachers, though in limited numbers. Charlotte S. Riley was a noted preacher in the South Carolina Conference from 1873.²⁹⁷ Amanda Berry Smith also travelled south to preach. After attending the 1872 AME General Conference, she stayed in Tennessee and attended a camp meeting in Knoxville.²⁹⁸ However, such cases were few. Most preaching women were based in the North and their itinerant activities were normally restricted to their own annual conference. Nevertheless, the logistical challenges of the expansion of black churches into the South presented significant opportunities for the laity and especially women. It made the church more dependent on their labour, fundraising, and organisational abilities, which in turn created an impetus for their denominations to enhance laity and women's rights within their churches.

²⁹⁵'Our Church News', *The Christian Recorder* (25 July 1878), p. 4

²⁹⁶'Our Church News', *The Christian Recorder* (24 May 1877), p. 4

²⁹⁷Dodson, 'Nineteenth-Century A.M.E. Preaching Women', p. 288

²⁹⁸Smith, *Autobiography*, pp. 205–15

2.6 Black Baptist convention building

Table 4: National, quasi-national, and regional black Baptist conventions to 1900²⁹⁹

Conference	Organised
Consolidated American Missionary Baptist Convention	1866
Baptist General Association of Western States and Territories	1873
New England Baptist Convention	1874
Baptist Foreign Mission Convention	1880
American National Baptist Convention	1886
National Baptist Convention, U.S.A., Inc.	1895
Lott Carey Foreign Mission Convention	1897

The development of black Baptist churches in the postbellum South was fundamentally different in character from the growth of other denominations in the region. Since Baptist churches are organised under a congregational church model, the growth in black Baptist churches represented the proliferation of autonomous African-American congregations. Although the Congregationalists also operated with a congregational structure, the paternalism of that denomination meant that there were very few autonomous black Congregationalist churches. The growth of the independent black Methodist Churches in the postbellum South was the result of coordinated and directed expansion by organisationally centralised and hierarchical denominations. Although southern black Methodists did seek out those churches, the organisation and structuring of the African Methodist Episcopal and African Methodist Episcopal Zion Churches in the South were fundamentally a top-down process.

²⁹⁹Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 200

While the American Baptist Home Mission Society sent many missionaries to the South and organised many black congregations, this was not the structured creation of an American Baptist Home Mission Society hierarchy, even when those congregations did affiliate with the ABHMS. The withdrawal of black Baptist congregations from existing white-dominated associations; the organisation of black associations and state-level conventions; the organisation of quasi-national black Baptist conventions; and ultimately the creation of the National Baptist Convention were all driven by the black Baptist churches themselves, autonomously and at a congregational level. The black Baptist convention movement was fundamentally a bottom-up process.

While the development of new church structures in the South was fundamentally different for Baptists, the withdrawal from existing associations was similar to that of African-American Christians of all denominations in the South. For all denominations it was driven by the desire for individuals and congregations to break free of the subordination and racism which had characterised their worship prior to emancipation. As Katharine L. Dvorak has argued, ‘in the chaos of ambivalent white pressures, denominational competition, and social confusion of the period, black initiative was decisive in the emergence of a pattern of racial separation in southern churches.’³⁰⁰ Black Baptists withdrew from biracial congregations and black congregations left white-led associations in great numbers and organised their own congregations and associations. In Georgia, for example, some associations lost all their black members very rapidly. The Sunbury Association on the Georgia coast had 7,542 members of whom 6,857 were black in 1865. In July 1865

³⁰⁰Dvorak, *An African-American Exodus*, p. 2

twenty black churches withdrew and formed a new black association, the Zion Association, with six churches from Florida and South Carolina. This left the Sunbury Association with so few members that it had to join with the Piedmont and Union Associations. Even so, the New Sunbury Association was left with only 115 black members, and by 1875 it had none. Other associations lost their black members more slowly, like the Georgia Association of Baptists which still had 2,046 black members in 1875. However, many of the black members who did leave went on to form the black Ebenezer Association in 1867. Other new black organizations drew their membership from existing white-led associations: the Walker Association of east central Georgia, organised in 1868, absorbed most of the black members of the Hephzibah Association, and the Southwestern Georgia Association was organised in 1870 by former black members of the Bethel Association. By 1871, there were sufficient black Baptist associations in Georgia to form a state-level convention, the Missionary Baptist Convention of Georgia, founded at the Central Baptist Church in Augusta. The eighty-six delegates present elected the Rev. Frank Quarles of Atlanta as president. This growth only continued, and by 1877 there were 26 black Baptist Associations in Georgia.³⁰¹

This pattern of organising associations and state conventions was replicated throughout the South. The first black Baptist state convention in the South was the General Baptist State Convention of North Carolina, organized in 1866. Alabama organized a state convention the same year, followed by

³⁰¹Stowell, *Rebuilding Zion*, pp. 82–3

N.H. Pius, *An Outline of Baptist History* (Nashville, 1911), p. 64

Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, p. 67

Virginia in 1867, Arkansas in 1868, and Kentucky in 1869.³⁰² By 1876, every southern state but Florida had a black Baptist missionary state convention.³⁰³ In addition to these state conventions, two large regional conventions had been organized during the Civil War years. The Northwestern Baptist Convention and the Southern Baptist Convention were organized in 1864. Two years later, both conventions met in a special session in Richmond, Virginia. The session combined the conventions to form the Consolidated American Missionary Baptist Convention (CAMBC), the first quasi-national black Baptist convention, which met annually.³⁰⁴

Table 5: Meetings of the CABMC³⁰⁵

Location	Year
Nashville, Tennessee	1867
Savannah, Georgia	1868
Paducah, Kentucky	1869
Wilmington, North Carolina	1870
Brooklyn, New York	1871

William Troy, the pastor of the Second Baptist Church of Richmond, Virginia, was elected president while the other senior officers were all northerners from Brooklyn. The CAMBC was intended to be a national convention in order to discourage sectionalism among black Baptists, like that which had divided the white Baptists. The convention sought to organise four regional

³⁰²Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, pp. 66–7

³⁰³Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 113

³⁰⁴Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, p. 68

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 79–81

³⁰⁵L.G. Jordan, *Negro Baptist History, U.S.A.* (Nashville, 1930), pp. 266, 271, 276, 279
Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, p. 68

auxiliary conventions and within its overarching framework incorporate state conventions and local associations. William Troy's motion to organize these regional auxiliary conventions passed in 1867, but was not acted upon until 1872, when the report of the CAMBC's Executive Board recommended the creation of four district auxiliary conventions in the South. The matter was referred to a special committee chaired by J.H. Magee which recommended the creation of six auxiliary districts: the four southern conventions recommended by the Executive Board plus a Western District embracing all territory north of the Ohio and west of the Great Lakes, and an Eastern District embracing New England and the mid-Atlantic states. However, the CAMBC failed to organise a comprehensive system of auxiliary district conferences and only alienated many of their regional members. As a result, regional conventions began to be organised independently from the CAMBC. In the west, the General Association of the Western States and Territories was organised, in Mexico, Missouri, on 15 January 1873, led by William H. Howard of Lexington. The New England Baptist Missionary Convention was organised in August 1874, led by Theodore Doughty Miller of Philadelphia. However, the most significant breakaway convention arose in the South, where at the annual meeting of the Sunday School Convention of Tennessee a new body called the Missionary Baptist State Convention of Tennessee, North Alabama, North Mississippi, East Arkansas, and Kentucky was organized in late 1873. This in turn led to the establishment of a more permanent southern convention, the Southwestern and Southern Missionary Baptist Convention, which first met on 20 May 1875 in Montgomery, Alabama. The independence and sectionalism of the west and New England began significantly to undermine the CAMBC.

The CAMBC was further undermined once it began to meet triennially, which led to a strengthening of local and state conventions which met annually in its place. The CAMBC became increasingly irrelevant.³⁰⁶

While it was being torn apart by sectionalism, the CAMBC was also undergoing significant financial difficulties. Rufus Perry, the most influential leader of the CAMBC, highlighted the problem in presenting the report of the Executive Board at the 1872 Convention, saying that the board

began to perceive a threatening indifference on the part of many of our ministers, and to apprehend the approach of the death of the Convention, which must inevitably follow, when contributions from our churches and other supporters of the Convention are, by any means, cut off.³⁰⁷

Financial contributions to the convention had become meagre. Perry reported that gross receipts for the year ending 30 September 1872 had been \$4,039.03, and that ‘all the money received at the mission-rooms, but \$153.52, was collected or given by friends in the North. The money sent in by churches in the South was only \$53.52.’³⁰⁸ That \$53.52 came entirely from Virginia, North Carolina, and South Carolina, and according to Perry none was contributed by Alabama, Tennessee, Kentucky, or Missouri. Perry’s prediction of the

³⁰⁶ *Report of the Third Annual Meeting of the Consolidated American Baptist Missionary Convention, held with The Washington St. Baptist Church, at Paducah, Kentucky, From Thursday, Sept. 16th, to Wednesday, September 22d, 1869* (New York, 1869), ATLA African American Religious Serials, 1850–1950

Report of the Thirty-Second Annual Meeting of the Consolidated American Baptist Missionary Convention, held with First Baptist Church at St Louis, Missouri, from Thursday, October 17th, to Tuesday, October 22d, 1872 (Brooklyn, 1872), ATLA African American Religious Serials, 1850–1950

Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, pp. 68–71

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 124–31

³⁰⁷ Report of the Thirty-Second Annual Meeting of the Consolidated American Baptist Missionary Convention, p. 8

³⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 10–11

death of the convention ultimately proved true. The convention held on through its 1878 meeting in Lexington, Kentucky, with significantly depleted membership and funds, but it was ultimately dissolved at its 1879 meeting in Cincinnati.³⁰⁹

The collapse of the CAMBC left a significant vacuum in the organization of black Baptists. This vacuum was particularly felt in the missionary field. The CAMBC had been the principal supporter of black Baptist missionaries in Africa. The need for a replacement convention to support African missions was immediately apparent. The Rev. William W. Colley, a missionary in Africa, returned to the United States in 1880 to attempt to organise such a convention. The Baptists of Virginia employed him as he sought support among black Baptist leaders, and he urged them to attend a meeting he held in Montgomery, Alabama, from 24 to 26 November 1880. one hundred and fifty Baptist leaders attended Colley's meeting at the First Baptist Church in Montgomery and organised the Baptist Foreign Mission Convention, electing the Rev. W.H. Alpine as the president and Colley as Corresponding Secretary. Eleven vice-presidents were also elected along with a Foreign Mission Board. Initially, the growth of the convention was slow, but ultimately Colley was able to secure the membership of many major black Baptist organisations. However, the New England Baptist Missionary Convention and the Baptist African Mission Convention declined to join.³¹⁰

In addition to the Baptist Foreign Mission Convention, two other quasi-national black Baptist conventions were soon established. The first developed

³⁰⁹Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 122–4

³¹⁰Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, pp. 73–6

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 136–8

in response to the Baptist Foreign Mission Convention, as many black Baptist leaders resented its willingness to cooperate with white Baptist organisations in its mission efforts. This sentiment was epitomised by the Rev. William J. Simmons, who, on 9 April 1886, called on other black Baptist leaders to attend a session to organise an alternative convention.

William J. Simmons was an influential leader among the Baptists of Kentucky. Ida B. Wells described him as ‘a big man, figuratively and physically.’³¹¹ Simmons, born in 1849 and a South Carolina native, had attended Howard University, graduating in 1873. In 1879 he had taken up the pastorate of the First Baptist Church of Lexington, Kentucky. He quickly became an influential figure in the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky, and was soon called on by the association to take up the presidency of its newly established college, the Kentucky Normal and Theological Institute, renamed the State University in 1884. He took over as president at the beginning of its second year of operation and was extremely successful, boosting enrolment, securing the college’s finances, and establishing high academic standards.³¹² Of his tenure as president, one Kentucky newspaper wrote,

Few men of Professor Simmons’ ability and standing would have been willing to risk their future in an enterprise like the Normal and Theological Institution; an enterprise without capital and but a few friends. But it can be truly said of Professor Simmons, that he has proven himself master of the situation. The school had been talked of for nearly twenty years but no one ever dreamed of its being a possibility. When he was elected president, every cloud vanished, and the sun-shine of success could be seen on every side. Some of his students already rank among the foremost preachers, teachers and orators of the State.³¹³

³¹¹Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 140

³¹²On Simmons as president of the State University see section 5.6

³¹³H.M. Turner, ‘Introduction’, in W.J. Simmons, *Men of Mark: Eminent, Progressive and Rising* (Cleveland, OH, 1887), p. 46

Henry McNeal Turner commented that ‘As an educator, he has likely no superiors.’³¹⁴ I. Garland Penn, the noted editor of *The Lynchburg Laborer*, and author of *The Afro-American Press and its Editors*, wrote of Simmons that he

is recognized by the nation as an educator, both with respect to the school-room and the newspaper... Dr. Simmons’ capacity for thought is an unusual one. His literary efforts are such, we feel that the world of journalism is becoming so great a power through him, that men yet unborn will regard him as of superior mind.³¹⁵

Penn also quoted another writer who described Simmons as ‘the chief Baptist scholar on this continent, [and] one of the race’s big coming men.’³¹⁶

As well as his presidency of the State University, Simmons’s other great vocation among the Kentucky Baptists was as a newspaper editor and writer. He earned great renown for his 1887 book, *Men of Mark: Eminent, Progressive and Rising*, a compilation of profiles of leading African Americans of the time. He was elected as editor of *The American Baptist* on 29 September 1882. Established in 1879, it declared itself to be ‘The Oldest Religious and family journal in the South among the colored people’, and was the official organ of the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky, as well as of most of the state’s district and Sunday School conventions.³¹⁷ In 1886, Simmons founded a second newspaper, *Our Women and Children*, which was decried

³¹⁴Ibid.

³¹⁵I.G. Penn, *The Afro-American Press and its Editors* (Springfield, MA, 1891), pp. 120–2

³¹⁶Ibid., p. 122

³¹⁷*Minutes of the Eighteenth Annual Session of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, held with the State Baptist Church, Bowling Green, Ky., August 11 to 15, 1886, and of the Nineteenth Annual Session held with the First Baptist Church, Georgetown, Ky., August 17 to 21, 1887* (Louisville, KY, 1888), p. 63 (back cover)
Turner, ‘Introduction’, in Simmons, *Men of Mark*, pp. 46–7
Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 120–2

in an advertisement in the minutes of the Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky as follows:

This Journal has for its aim the advancement of women and children, and should be in every household. As an educator it has no superior. It is useful to the wife, mother, children and sister, while the male sex can be guided and helped. We shall defend *women from wrongs and demand for her Justice*. The ablest writers male and female have been secured, and this publication shall be an encyclopedia of the times. For children we shall always have a loving heart and tender word, and shall further advocate more care for them on the part of parents, guardians and teachers. We shall encourage them to get an education, learn trades, practice economy and save money... Several departments shall be sustained wherein the best news of the kind can always be obtained, viz: 'Religion,' 'Education,' 'Temperance,' 'Science,' 'Poetry,' 'Puzzles,' 'Opinions of the Press,' 'The Kitchen,' 'Children's Post-office,' 'Women and Women's work,' 'Social Notes,' 'Stories and Biographies of Eminent Men and Women.'³¹⁸

Many of the most prominent black Baptist women of Kentucky wrote for these two newspapers, including several who were officers of the state's Baptist Women's Educational Convention and teachers at the State University. These included Mary V. Cook, Ione E. Wood, Lavinia B. Sneed, and Lucy Wilmot Smith.³¹⁹ It is scarcely surprising that Simmons should have published newspapers which so prominently featured female authors and women's issues. Simmons was one of the most progressive black church leaders of the age regarding female participation in churches, in education, and in African-American society in general. Simmons was a key participant in the organisation of the Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky

³¹⁸ *Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883-87. Held with the Churches mentioned in the proceedings* (Louisville, KY, 1887), p. 48 (back cover)

³¹⁹ Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 376-81, 410-9

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 78, 254, n. 109

On these women and their contributions to the newspapers, see section 5.7.

in 1883, the first example of such an organised state-wide women's auxiliary Baptist convention. Simmons was also actively engaged in secular race politics. He was a member of the Committee of Colored Citizens of Kentucky, and organised several State Conventions of Colored Citizens.³²⁰ As Chairman of the Committee of Colored Citizens he delivered a memorable address in 1885 concerning the grievances of African Americans in the state on the subjects of, 'Civil Rights,' 'The Public Schools,' 'Normal Schools,' 'Juries,' 'Railroads,' 'Mobs,' 'City Charters,' 'Militia,' and 'The Justice of Our Cause.'³²¹

The black Baptists of Kentucky were among the most organised, active, and progressive in the nation. Simmons was not alone in his active engagement in denominational and secular politics, and in his support for female participation in politics and society. Perhaps the most noted leader among the Kentucky black Baptists during Simmons's time was William H. Steward, particularly after the General Association's longstanding moderator, George W. Dupee stepped down in 1882 after eleven years in office.³²² Steward served as recording secretary of the General Association for more than forty years, taking up the post in 1877, and was still listed as secretary in the minutes for 1918.³²³ He was also the chairman of the board of trustees for the State

³²⁰Turner, 'Introduction', in Simmons, *Men of Mark*, pp. 48–55

³²¹*Call For a Convention of Colored Citizens of Kentucky* (1885), pp. 15–26

³²²*Minutes of the Thirty-fourth Annual Session of the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky, held with Washington Street Baptist Church, Paducah, Ky. Wednesday, Thursday, Friday, Saturday and Sunday, August 13, 14, 15, 16, and 17, 1902* (Louisville, KY, 1902), pp. 16–7

Dupee did return for a second period as moderator from 1894 to 1895, though his influence among the Kentucky Baptists waned in the interim.

³²³*Minutes of the Tenth Annual Session of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky. Held with the United Baptist Church, Richmond, Kentucky, August 14, 15, 16, 17 and 18, 1878* (Louisville, KY, 1878), p. 2
Minutes. Fiftieth Annual Session of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, held with the Fourth Street Baptist Church, Owensboro, Ky. Wednesday,

University, and served as an associate editor and business manager for *The American Baptist*. He later succeeded Simmons as editor of *The American Baptist* after Simmon's death in 1890.³²⁴ He was also a leading freemason, serving as Worshipful Master of the Grand Lodge of Kentucky among other masonic offices. He was described as 'a most liberal man, contributing freely to every cause that is presented to him...[and] In all his undertakings, he is zealous, earnest and faithful.'³²⁵

Another prominent Kentucky Baptist contemporary of Simmons was the Rev. Daniel Abraham Gaddie, whom Simmons described as 'the strong man of Kentucky... A man of splendid physique, a very Ajax in bravery, a Hercules in strength.'³²⁶ Born in 1836, he was one of the more senior of the Kentucky black Baptist leaders, and Simmons commented that 'All the old brethren, Rev. DeBaptiste, Rufus L. Perry and a host of others, are well acquainted with him and hold him in high esteem.'³²⁷ He was a vice-president of the CAMBC before its collapse, and was assistant moderator for the General Association in Kentucky from 1880. He was elected to succeed Dupee as moderator in 1886.³²⁸ He was a member of the board of trustees of the State University, and was awarded the degree of Doctor of Divinity in 1887. He

Thursday, Friday, Saturday and Sunday, August 14, 15, 16, 17 & 18, 1918 (Louisville, KY, 1918), p. 8

Simmons, *Men of Mark*, p. 605

³²⁴ *Journal of the American National Baptist Convention. Three Sessions. Indianapolis, Ind., 1889. Louisville, Ky., 1890. Dallas, Texas, 1891.* (Louisville, KY, 1892), p. 48

³²⁵ Simmons, *Men of Mark*, pp. 603–7

³²⁶ Simmons, *Men of Mark*, p. 647

³²⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 648

³²⁸ *Twelfth Annual Session. Minutes of General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky, held with Fourth Street Baptist Church, Owensboro, Ky, August 11th, 12th, 13th, 14th and 15th, 1880* (Louisville, KY, 1880), p. 2
Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, p. 2

was also a noted temperance campaigner.³²⁹

A third noteworthy Kentucky Baptist leader was Charles H. Parrish, who, like Simmons and Steward was part of a younger generation of Kentucky Baptist leaders, who succeeded that of Dupee and Gaddie. In fact he was ten years younger than Simmons, having been born in 1859.³³⁰ He was a professor of Greek as well as secretary and treasurer of the State University.³³¹ He also served on the executive board of the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky.³³² He was noted for his ardent support of women's causes, and in 1898 he married his fellow State University teacher, Mary V. Cook, the young leading light of the Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky.

On 25 August 1886 at the First Baptist Church of St Louis, Missouri, representatives from black Baptist associations from twenty-six states plus the District of Colombia met and organized the American National Baptist Convention, and elected Simmons president. The ANBC represented black Baptists from throughout the nation, but the South was particularly well represented. It was in large part driven by the energy and organisation of Simmons and the Kentuckians. In addition to Simmons, Gaddie served as Treasurer and Parrish as Financial Secretary. After Simmons's death in October 1890, Steward also took office, as recording secretary.³³³ The ANBC,

³²⁹ Simmons, *Men of Mark*, pp. 647–50

³³⁰ Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 249, n. 49

³³¹ *Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887*, p. 41

³³² *Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second Annual Session, First Baptist church, Henderson, Ky., August 12 to 17, 1890. Twenty-third Annual Session, Main Street Baptist Church, Lexington, Ky., August 11 to 16, 1891. Twenty-fourth Annual Session, United Baptist Church, Richmond, Ky., August 16 to 21, 1892* (Louisville, KY, 1893), pp. 2–4

³³³ *Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889–91*, pp. 2, 41, 52

also adopted Simmons's *The American Baptist* as its official newspaper.³³⁴

The ANBC was intended to have a broader remit than the Baptist Foreign Mission Convention. Its constitution described its object as being

To consider the moral, intellectual, and religious growth of the denomination, and to deliberate upon those great questions which characterize the Baptist churches. And further, to devise and consider the best methods possible for bringing us more closely together, both as churches and as a race.³³⁵

The ANBC was, in a sense, intended to be a true national convention, an overarching denominational organisation for black Baptists in the United States. However, it operated alongside the Baptist Foreign Mission Convention and neither truly united all black Baptists.³³⁶

The third quasi-national convention was the National Baptist Educational Convention, organized in 1892 in Savannah, Georgia. Led by the Rev. W. Bishop Johnson, the pastor of the Second Baptist Church of Washington, DC, it sought to provide a national unifying convention for organizing educational efforts among black Baptists in the United States, and to federate all schools owned, organised, and controlled by black Baptists.³³⁷

All three of the new quasi-national conventions offered women new forums of expression and in which to engage in religious leadership. Women were

³³⁴ *Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887*, p. 63 (back cover)

Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889–91, p. 48

³³⁵ *Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889–91*, p. 3

³³⁶ D.C. Woolley et al. (eds.), *Baptist Advance: The Achievements of the Baptists of North America for a Century and a Half* (Nashville, 1964), p. 202

³³⁷ *National Baptist Education Convention, held in the First African Baptist Church, Savannah, Georgia, September 20–21, 1892*, pp. 1–10

Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, pp. 76–8

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 139–42

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 64

delegates at the meetings of all three conventions. Mary V. Cook and Elizabeth A. Garland were members of the executive board of the National Baptist Educational Convention.³³⁸ However, the ANBC reflected the progressive attitudes towards women common among the black Baptist leaders of Kentucky, and particularly Simmons, who was at the core of its organisation and leadership. As a result, the ANBC was the most open of the three quasi-national conventions to female participation and leadership. Several women sat on the committees and boards of the ANBC. From among the leaders of the Kentucky Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky, Mary V. Cook, a professor at the Louisville State University, was on its executive committee; Amanda V. Nelson, the president of the women's convention, was a statistical secretary; and Lucy Wilmot Smith, Simmons's private secretary and a teacher at the State University, was the ANBC's official historian. Alabama, another state with a particularly active women's convention, was also represented, as Alice A. Bowie served as educational secretary. Seven women's missionary and educational state conventions were represented by the ANBC by 1891.³³⁹ Women also often made speeches and presentations at the meetings of the ANBC. At the 1890 meeting in Louisville, Miss Nellie Lee Frye delivered the address of welcome, and a series of speeches by women included a paper on 'The Intellectual Growth of Baptist Women' by Miss Jennie Watson of Ohio; one on 'The Ideal Mother' by Virginia; one on 'Woman's Work' by Miss Susie Stone of Alabama; one by Elizabeth A. Garland, which was described as soul-stirring, though its title was not recorded; and a report on 'Women's

³³⁸ *National Baptist Education Convention, 1892*, p. 3

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 64

³³⁹ *Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889-91*, p. 64

Work' by Mary V. Cook.³⁴⁰ The next year, at the 1891 meeting, the speeches and papers presented by women included one on 'The Bible as believed by Baptists' by Miss Hattie G. Eskridge; one on 'Woman's Influence in Medicine' by Mary V. Cook; one on 'Our Girls at Home' by Mrs. O.B. Clanton of Ohio; one on 'Woman's influence in Literature', read by Miss Susie A Stone of Alabama in the absence of its author, Mrs. A.E. Johnson of Maryland; as well as a letter of greeting from the faculty and students of the Louisville State University, read by Lavinia B. Sneed; and the report of the Committee on Young People's Work, read by Mary V. Cook.³⁴¹

There were efforts to establish women's auxiliaries for these precursor, quasi-national conventions. A proposal to establish a women's auxiliary to the ANBC was rejected in 1890. This did not reflect an opposition to female organisation and representation, but rather a view, particularly influenced by that of Simmons himself, that women's roles should be integrated into the main body of black Baptist organisation, rather than separate. Women should be sufficiently represented among the main association that separate representation should be unnecessary. Indeed, when Simmons had helped organise the Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky, it was only created as a separate body 'When it was found that the sisters could not meet with the general body as was first decided'.³⁴² Such was Simmons's

³⁴⁰ *Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889-91*, pp. 3, 26, 34-5
Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, Seventh Session, held in the First African Baptist Church, Savannah, Georgia, September 15-18, 1892, and Eighth Annual Session, held in the Vernon Avenue Baptist Church, Washington, D.C., September 16-19, 1893 (Louisville, KY, 1894), pp. 2, 6-11

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 64-5

³⁴¹ *Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889-91*, pp. 51-2, 54-5

³⁴² M.V. Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in E.M. Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit: A Collection of Sermons and Papers on Baptist Doctrine and Missionary and*

influence in the ANBC that even after his death, this attitude persisted in the ANBC, and it never organised a women's auxiliary.³⁴³ Unlike the ANBC, however, the Baptist Foreign Mission Convention approved a proposal for a women's auxiliary in 1890, and began preparations, but then withdrew support for its organisation two years later.³⁴⁴

The goal of unifying the various regional and quasi-national conventions into a truly unified national convention was an obvious one for many black Baptist leaders. In the early 1890s an effort to unify the New England Baptist Missionary Convention, the African Foreign Missionary Convention, and the Foreign Mission Convention of America had failed. Nevertheless, the desire to form a tripartite union of the major conventions remained. The Rev. S.E. Griggs, the Rev. L.M. Luke, and the Rev. A.W. Pegues therefore organised a meeting of representatives of the Baptist Foreign Mission Convention, the American National Baptist Convention, and the National Baptist Educational Convention in Montgomery, Alabama, in 1894. The meeting set in motion the process of uniting the three conventions. It appointed committees which were to report on the potential structure and organisation of the union at the second meeting. Therefore, a year later in the meeting at Friendship Baptist Church in Atlanta on 28 September 1895, the three conventions united to form the National Baptist Convention of the United States of America, the first truly national and unified convention of black Baptists in the United States. The Rev. E.C. Morris of Helena, Arkansas, was elected president and William

Educational Work (Philadelphia, 1890), p. 279

³⁴³V.E. Broughton, *Twenty Year's Experience of a Missionary* (Chicago, 1907), pp. 100–1 Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 154

³⁴⁴L.G. Jordan, *Negro Baptist History U.S.A.* (Nashville, 1930), p. 261

H. Steward was elected secretary. The NBC quickly became the largest black denominational organisation in the country. In 1890, the US Census Bureau had reported 1,348,989 black Baptists, but by 1906 the National Baptist Convention was reported to have 2,261,601. Very rapidly almost all black Baptists in the United States had become members of congregations affiliated with the NBC.³⁴⁵

The black Baptist convention movement and the growth of black Baptist churches had significant ramifications for the roles that were available to women participating in their churches, associations and conventions. Baptist polity necessitated a fundamentally different relationship between women and their churches than in other denominations. The principal reason for this was the congregational church structure of Baptist polity. Connectional denominations had a more structured and stratified church hierarchy which extended beyond the individual congregation. For black Methodists, the pastor led the individual congregation, but his authority was superseded by a structure of presiding elders, bishops, quarterly conferences, annual conferences, and the general conference. This elongated hierarchy created more spaces where women could be permitted roles, authority, and leadership without challenging the masculinity of the ultimate authorities in the church. Women could be made stewardesses and deaconesses, and while this would give them some small authority in their congregation, this was very distant from the higher authorities of the denominational structure. This was not the case for Baptist congregational polity. Although Baptist churches were

³⁴⁵Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, pp. 78–84
Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 147–85

members of local associations and state, regional, and national conventions, de jure these relationships were strictly voluntary. Associations and conventions had no binding authority over individual congregations. This congregational autonomy was frequently expressed in the reports and constitutions of Baptist associations and conventions. As one typical example, from the Colored Shiloh Baptist Association of Virginia expressed it, '[Baptist polity] sanctions no such body as a national or provincial church, nor of any authoritative concentration of church power, but maintains church independence...all ecclesiastical church power is in the church as a body'.³⁴⁶

Prior to the creation of the NBC most associations and conventions only served functions which could not be organised effectively by individual congregations such as missionary and educational efforts. The creation of significant roles for women within Baptist congregations was inherently a threat to the masculinity of church leadership as it created a source of female power in close proximity to the ultimate authorities of the church — the leaders of the individual congregation and the pastor. There was less space to slot in roles for women within the compressed hierarchy of individual congregations. Consequently, in Baptist polity there could never be any serious consideration of the ordination of women like there was in the black Methodist denominations. Roles for women had to be created as part of the more remote superstructure of voluntary associations and conventions, where their participation could be quarantined to fields like missions and education, segregated from any authority over individual congregations. Therefore, the

³⁴⁶ *Journal of Proceedings of the Colored Shiloh Baptist Association of Virginia, Held in the First Baptist Church of Lynchburg at its Third Annual Session, On the 5th, 6th, 7th, 8th and 9th of Aug., 1868*, pp. 10–12 (Virginia Baptist Historical Society)

primary developments for women within black Baptist churches in the later nineteenth century were the creation of women's auxiliaries of state, regional, and national conventions.

The development of state Baptist conventions brought with it the establishment of auxiliary women's conventions. Numerous states already had well established women's auxiliaries by the 1890s, including the Women's Missionary Baptist Convention of Georgia, the Kentucky Baptist Women's Educational Convention, the Mississippi Women's General Baptist Missionary Society, the Women's Baptist Educational and Missionary Convention of South Carolina, and the Women's General Baptist Convention of Texas.³⁴⁷

The first state women's convention was that of Kentucky. The convention was organised with the support of William J. Simmons, who had been influenced by visiting meetings of white women's Baptist auxiliaries. Many women's organisations already existed in individual black Baptist churches in Kentucky. As early as 1880, the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky had recommended that each church appoint a fundraising committee of five women.³⁴⁸ Simmons recognised the potential of bringing them together to form a state-wide body. He proposed the organisation of a women's state auxiliary at the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky, and then presided over its initial meeting on 18 September 1883. After helping establish the women's auxiliary, Simmons then stepped

³⁴⁷Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 58–9

'African-American Baptist Annual Reports, 1865–1990s'

[<http://microformguides.gale.com/Data/Download/8395000C.pdf>] (Accessed April 2016)

³⁴⁸*Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky, 1880*, p. 19

aside and let it be run autonomously by the women themselves.³⁴⁹ The first president of the women's convention was Amanda V. Nelson, who guided it through its first decade. She was supported by many leading women of Kentucky, including Mary V. Cook, Lavinia B. Sneed, and Lucy Wilmot Smith, all teachers at the State University in Louisville.³⁵⁰ The women's convention initially represented sixteen local black Baptist women's societies throughout Kentucky, but very quickly it came to represent societies in nearly every black Baptist congregation in the state.³⁵¹

The constitutionally declared objects of the women's convention were threefold:

First — To encourage the attendance at the youth of our State at the State University, that they may secure a Christian education.

Second — To contribute to the funds for the payment of the debt on the property of the State University.

Third — To develop in its members a greater missionary spirit.³⁵²

³⁴⁹ *General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth Annual Session. Held at Maysville, Ky., August 15 to 19, 1883 and Sixteenth Annual Session, Held at Franklin, Ky., August 13 to 17, 1884* (Louisville, Ky, 1884), p. 35

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, pp. 280–1

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 60

³⁵⁰ *Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883–87*, pp. 2–5

Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of the Sixth Session, held with the Green Street Church, Danville, Ky. September 14th to 17th, 1888

(Louisville, KY, 1889), p. 2

Minutes of the Seventh Session. The Baptist Women's Educational Convention, held with Fifth-Street Baptist Church, Louisville, Ky., October 10th to 14th, 1889 (Louisville, KY, 1890), p. 3

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 281
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 60–3

On the careers of these women, see section 5.7

³⁵¹ Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 280

³⁵² *Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883–87*, p. 2

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 280

The convention organised numerous educational fundraising initiatives, including the organisation of ‘children’s bands’, which promoted education among the children of the state while raising money.³⁵³ The women of the Kentucky convention directed their efforts towards the State University at Louisville, a college owned by the black Baptists of the state. They raised considerable funds for the school — \$12,000 between 1883 and 1900 — and encouraged the black Baptist youth of the state to attend. One particular success was that their efforts resulted in the creation of a women’s dormitory, greatly facilitating the access of women to educational opportunities at the college.³⁵⁴ The women’s convention supported the distribution of black Baptist literature, as many of its leading members wrote for *The American Baptist* and *Our Women and Children*, and the convention adopted *The American Baptist* as its official newspaper.³⁵⁵ The convention also supported missionaries, and always supported at least one home missionary to operate in Kentucky.³⁵⁶

The women’s society in Alabama was initially organised by the Rev. Edward M. Brawley. Brawley was a native of Charleston South Carolina, born on 18 March 1851. As a young man he had studied at Howard University for three months in 1870 before transferring to the preparatory department of Bucknell University in Lewisburg, Pennsylvania, in 1871. He then moved

³⁵³ *Baptist Women’s Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883–87*, pp. 4, 22, 30, 37, 39

Cook, ‘The Work for Baptist Women’, in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 280
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 60–61

³⁵⁴ Cook, ‘The Work for Baptist Women’, p. 281

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 61

On the fundraising of the women’s convention for the State university see section 2.6

³⁵⁵ *Baptist Women’s Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883–87*, p. 30

³⁵⁶ Cook, ‘The Work for Baptist Women’, in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 280

on to its collegiate course that fall. He graduated on 30 June 1875, and was immediately ordained and commissioned as a missionary for South Carolina by the American Baptist Publication Society. He organised Sunday school conventions throughout the state and then organised those into a statewide convention in May 1877, for which he served as corresponding secretary and financial agent. He received his A.M. degree from Bucknell University and later an honorary Doctor of Divinity degree from the State University of Louisville, Kentucky, in May 1885. He was appointed president of the Alabama Baptist Normal and Theological School in October 1883, and then instituted a collegiate department and doubled the school's enrolment. In January 1887 he began the publication of the *Baptist Tribune*, which was soon adopted as the official organ of the black Baptists of Alabama. He later succeeded William J. Simmons as the president of the ANBC in 1891 after Simmon's death in October 1890.³⁵⁷

Another influential Alabama Baptist minister who supported the state women's convention was Charles L. Purce. Like Brawley, he was a South Carolina native, born in 1856. He attended the Benedict Institute from 1878 to 1879 then transferred to Richmond Seminary, graduating in 1883. He then pastored a congregation of 1,100 until in 1886 he moved to Alabama to take up a post as professor of Greek and Latin at Selma University. He later succeeded Brawley as president of the university.³⁵⁸ In 1894, he left Selma to become president of the State University at Louisville.³⁵⁹

³⁵⁷Simmons, *Men of Mark*, pp. 908–13

Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889–91, p. 41

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 61–2

³⁵⁸Simmons, *Men of Mark*, pp. 454–6

³⁵⁹Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 249, n. 52

Brawley was inspired by Simmons and the women of Kentucky and helped found a separate Alabama women's Baptist convention on 27 January 1886 at Tabernacle Baptist Church in Selma. The Baptist Women's State Convention of Alabama encouraged the establishment of local women's societies throughout the state, and by 1890 it represented 10,000 women in sixty societies throughout the state. Like the Kentucky women, the Alabama women's convention directed their efforts towards the support of their university, in their case, Selma University. They followed the Kentuckians' lead in organising children's bands and by 1891 they had raised \$4,000 for the school. The first president of the women's convention was Mrs. Annie A. Brooks, who was assisted by Mrs. Rebecca Pitts. The two were described as 'a power for good.'³⁶⁰ Many of the leading women of the convention were themselves graduates of Selma University. Two of the first four presidents elected before 1904 were teachers, including Eliza Pollard, who was one of the earliest graduates of Selma University. Other leading women of the convention were the wives of leading Alabama Baptist ministers, including the wives of Charles Dinkins, Edward M. Brawley, and Charles Purce. Mrs Susie A. Stone was another influential member. The financial secretary from 1889, she also went on to be influential in the ANBC, regularly speaking at its meetings.³⁶¹

³⁶⁰ Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 282

³⁶¹ *Minutes of the Fourth Annual Session of the Baptist Women's State Convention, Held with the First Baptist Church of Greenville* (Montgomery, AL, 1889), pp. 5, 15
Minutes of the Sixth Annual Session of the Baptist State Women's Convention, held with the Second Baptist Church of Eufaula, Alabama, June 25-June 28, 1891 (Montgomery, AL, 1891), pp. 14, 22-3
Minutes of the Seventh Annual Session of the Baptist Women's State Convention, held with the New Morning Star Baptist Church of Demopolis, Alabama, June 23-26, 1892 (Montgomery, AL, 1892), p. 13
Minutes of the Baptist Women's State Convention, Ninth Annual Session, held at the Sixteenth Street Baptist Church, Birmingham, Alabama, June 21-24, 1894

Women's conventions were soon established in other states. The Women's Baptist Missionary Association of Arkansas was founded at the First Baptist Church of Little Rock on 18 May 1888. Their statement of purpose declared that

Believing that in the great work of religiously training the world, and giving the gospel to the many who are yet in darkness, the women are equally responsible, in proportion to their ability, as the other sex, and feeling that we can better accomplish these duties by being organized, we therefore banded ourselves together in association.³⁶²

The president of the Arkansas women's convention was Mrs. R.B. White and the corresponding secretary was Mrs. Carrie Woods.³⁶³

The Women's Baptist Mission Society of Texas was organised in 1886, though it initially did not meet separately from the general state black Baptist convention. It supported missionaries in the field and organised local missionary societies in Texas. By 1891 it represented sixty-three societies, which had held 816 meetings and raised \$3,546.70. Its leading members were J.L. Peck, F. Dysart, and Maggie Thomas, and it was particularly supported by the prominent Texas minister, the Rev. A.R. Griggs.³⁶⁴

A women's convention in South Carolina was also organised on 15 May 1889. Its committee comprised Mrs. F. Davis as president, Miss A.E. Dillard

(Montgomery, AL, 1895), p. 10

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.) *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, pp. 281–3

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 61–3

Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889–91, pp. 34, 54

³⁶²Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.) *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 283

³⁶³*Ibid.*

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 62

³⁶⁴Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.) *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 283–4

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 62

as recording secretary, and Miss Maria Jones as corresponding secretary. Its object was 'To cultivate a spirit of Christian benevolence in its members. . . and to aid the cause of missions, home and foreign.'³⁶⁵

The Women's Convention of Georgia was organised on 23 May 1889 by the Rev. W.J. White of Augusta, and its initial committee comprised Mrs. Josephine Muns of Augusta as president; Mrs. Nellie L. Cook of Augusta as corresponding secretary; and Mrs. Mary A. Rutherford of Rome, Georgia, as treasurer. Other black women's state conventions were also organised in Virginia, Louisiana, Mississippi, Tennessee, and West Virginia. However, by far the most effective and influential women's auxiliary was the national one.³⁶⁶

Immediately upon the foundation of the National Baptist Convention in 1895, black Baptist women attempted to organise a women's auxiliary. At Friendship Baptist Church in Atlanta, the Woman's National Baptist Convention was organised with Alice A. Bowie of Alabama as president, Virginia Broughton as recording secretary, and Mrs. C.J. Robinson of Arkansas as corresponding secretary. However, this convention did not meet with the approval of the leadership of the National Baptist Convention and was disbanded at the NBC's second meeting in St Louis in 1896.³⁶⁷

³⁶⁵ *Minutes of the First Annual Session of the Women's Baptist Educational and Missionary Convention of S.C. held with Calvary Baptist Church, Columbia, S.C., May 15th and 16th, 1889* (Columbia, SC, 1889), pp. 1–2

³⁶⁶ Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.) *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 284–5
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 62

³⁶⁷ 'Woman's National Baptist Convention', *National Baptist Magazine* Vol. 2 (October, 1895), p. 235
Broughton, *Twenty Years' Experience of a Missionary*, pp. 100–1
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 155

It was not until 1900 that the women of the NBC gathered enough support to successfully establish a separate national women's convention on a more permanent basis. The renewed efforts to establish a women's convention were driven in large part by the persistence of Nannie Helen Burroughs. Burroughs was a prolific organiser and speechmaker. She was a graduate of the M Street Colored High School in Washington, DC, she went on to become a dynamic leader in the national women's convention, and later served as president of the National Training School for Women and Girls, Incorporated, in Lincoln Heights, Washington, DC, from its foundation on 19 October 1909 until her death on 20 May 1961.³⁶⁸ From 1900 until 1909, Burroughs worked for the Foreign Mission Board of the NBC, as secretary to Lewis G. Jordan, its corresponding secretary. Jordan had been elected as corresponding secretary of the Foreign Mission Board in 1896, having previously been the pastor of the Union Baptist Church in Philadelphia. In 1900 the Foreign Mission Board, and Jordan and Burroughs with it, had relocated to Louisville, Kentucky.³⁶⁹

As in the case of the ANBC, the progressive attitude of Kentucky Baptists towards women's organising may have played an important part in the successful foundation of the national women's convention in 1900. After successful lobbying by Burroughs and others, the proposal for the women's convention was put before the meeting of the NBC at the Fifth Street

³⁶⁸S. Harley, 'Nannie Helen Burroughs: "The Black Goddess of Liberty"', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 81, No. 1/4 (Winter–Autumn 1996), pp. 62–71

V.W. Wolcott, '"Bible, Bath, and Broom": Nannie Helen Burroughs's National Training School and African-American Racial Uplift' *Journal of Women's History* Vol. 9, No. 1 (Spring 1997), pp. 88–110

A.T. McCluskey, '"We specialize in the wholly impossible": African American Women School Founders and Their Mission' *Signs* Vol. 22, No. 2 (Winter 1997), pp. 403–426

³⁶⁹Jordan, *Negro Baptist History*, p. 238–9

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 155–9

Baptist Church in Richmond, Virginia, in September 1900. The motion was successfully proposed by Jordan, and seconded by the noted Kentucky Baptist leader Charles H. Parrish, who, along with his wife Mary V. Cook, was also a professor at the State University in Louisville. The motion was approved and the Women's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, came into being.³⁷⁰

Sarah Willie Layten of Philadelphia was elected as the president of the new convention; Sylvia C.J. Bryant of Atlanta as vice-president; Nannie Helen Burroughs as corresponding secretary; Virginia Broughton of Nashville, Tennessee, as recording secretary; and Susie C. Foster of Montgomery, Alabama, as treasurer.³⁷¹ Sarah Willie Layten and Nannie Helen Burroughs were the dynamic driving forces of the convention's leadership in its early years. Layten, a native of Memphis, Tennessee, was a graduate of LeMoyne College. In the early 1890s she had been influential in the foundation of a number of black women's clubs in California. She had moved back to Philadelphia in 1894 and was highly active in the women's club movement, including as a member of the National Association of Colored Women.³⁷² Burroughs continued her work for the Foreign Mission convention alongside her work for the WC-NBC until she moved back to Washington, DC, to take charge of the National Training School in 1909. She was prolific in her organising work for the WC-NBC, delivering 215 speeches, organising 12 women's societies, and authoring 9,235

³⁷⁰ *Journal of the Twentieth Annual Session of the National Baptist Convention, held in the Fifth Street Baptist Church, Richmond, Va., September 12th–17th, 1900* (Nashville, TN, 1900), p. 195

³⁷¹ *Ibid.*

³⁷² J.C. Smith, (ed.), *Notable Black American Women, Book II* (Detroit, 1996), pp. 403–6
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 158

letters during the convention's first year alone.³⁷³

At its founding, the WC-NBC represented women's societies from 26 states and territories.³⁷⁴ By 1903 it was reported to represent nearly a million black Baptist women, and nearly one and a half million by 1907.³⁷⁵ The WC-NBC's constitution declared its objects to be the dissemination of knowledge, the facilitation and coordination of the work of existing local and state women's Baptist societies, and the raising of funds for missionary and educational purposes. It served these roles and more. It facilitated communication and coordination between women's societies in all parts of the country. According to Burroughs, thanks to the WC-NBC, 'women from the North, South, East and West know each other by name, and are in sympathy with the work that is being carried out in the respective sections.'³⁷⁶ The convention's early connections to the Foreign Mission Board persisted, and as a result they prioritised fundraising for mission work. One early contribution was the funding of a mission by Emma Delaney to Blantyre in British Central

³⁷³Ibid.

Journal of the Second Annual Session of the Woman's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, held in the Mound Street Baptist Church, Cincinnati, Ohio, September 11–16, 1901 (Nashville, TN, 1901), p. 21

³⁷⁴*Journal of the Twentieth Annual Session of the National Baptist Convention, 1900*, p. 196

³⁷⁵*Journal of the Fourth Annual Assembly of the Woman's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, held in the Shiloh Baptist Church, Philadelphia, PA., September 16–21, 1903*, (Nashville, TN, 1904), p. 299

Journal of the Eighth Annual Assembly of the Woman's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, held in the Vermont Avenue Baptist Church, Washington, D.C., September 18–23, 1907 (Nashville, TN, 1908), pp. 187, 204

Journal of the Eighth Annual Assembly of the Woman's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, held in the First Baptist Church, Lexington, Ky., September 16–21, 1908 (Nashville, TN, 1909), pp. 246–7

³⁷⁶*Journal of the Eighth Annual Assembly of the Woman's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, 1907*, p. 187
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 162

Africa.³⁷⁷ Perhaps the convention's most significant contribution, however, was that it staked a claim for the autonomous representation of women within national black Baptist organisations. As Nannie Helen Burroughs wrote upon the organisation of the convention,

For a number of years there has been a righteous discontent, a burning zeal to go forward in his name among the Baptist women of our churches and it will be the dynamic force in the religious campaign at the opening of the 20th century. It will be the spark that shall light the altar fire in heathen lands.³⁷⁸

The foundation of the WC-NBC was the manifestation of that zeal and that spark.

The WC-NBC became one of the most powerful institutions for social reform, education, women's autonomy, and racial uplift in the nation. However, the social power and influence of the Women's Convention was predicated on the social power of black Baptists consolidated in the NBC. That social power had been generated by the growth, organisation, and consolidation of black Baptist conventions which had concentrated the influence of individual congregations into state, and later national bodies. The social power of black Baptist women in the early twentieth century was therefore, in large part, predicated on particular patterns of denominational growth among black Baptists during the preceding half century.

³⁷⁷ *Journal of the Twenty-fourth Annual Session of the National Baptist Convention held with the Ebenezer Third Baptist Church, Austin, Texas, September 14th–19th, 1904* (Nashville, TN, 1904), pp. 358–61

Broughton, *Twenty Years' Experience of a Missionary*, p. 102

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 156–7

³⁷⁸ *Journal of the Twentieth Annual Session of the National Baptist Convention, 1900*, p. 196

2.7 Minor denominations and schisms

The overwhelming majority of African-American Christians in the nineteenth century were either Methodists or Baptists, especially in the South. By 1906 over ninety percent of all southern Christians were either Baptists or Methodists.³⁷⁹ Between the time of the foundation of the National Baptist Convention and the emergence of Pentecostalism in the early twentieth century, almost all African-American Christians were either members of the NBC or one of the major three black Methodist Churches. As a result, very little scholarly attention has been paid to minor African-American churches outside the mainstream of African-American Christianity. These Churches often presented radically different possibilities for women from those in the mainstream African-American denominations with which they had reciprocal relationships of influence. Furthermore, studying these Churches offers insights into the nature of hierarchy and authority within African-American Christianity, which in turn influenced the prospects of lay rights and women's rights within the churches.

Perhaps the most fascinating of the minor African-American churches are the Spencer Churches. The Spencer Churches were small African Methodist Churches whose congregations were principally in Delaware and New Jersey. Their histories have been termed '“Invisible” Strands in African Methodism' by historian Lewis V. Baldwin. The two current Spencer Churches emerged as a result of a schism in the Union Church of Africans in the 1850s. The origins of the Union Church of Africans were in the black members of Asbury Methodist

³⁷⁹ *U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906*, p. 137

Episcopal Church in Wilmington, Delaware, who left the congregation in 1805 due to racist practices in the church. They founded Ezion Methodist Episcopal Church and later separated from the Methodist Episcopal Church in 1813, forming a new denomination.³⁸⁰

The Union Church of Africans and its successors are of particular interest for several reasons. One is their particular openness to women. Comparatively early in the nineteenth century, church mothers like Mother Ferreby Draper and Mother Lydia Hall were noted to be particularly influential within the church. Upon her death in 1868, Mother Draper was referred to as ‘one of the early saints of the Union Church of Africans.’ The Spencer Churches were also noteworthy for their acceptance of women preachers. The Union Church of Africans’ 1852 Discipline stated that ‘Concerning women preachers, the Quaker Friends have always spoken for us, that being their way, they shall always preach for us when they have a mind, and none but them.’³⁸¹ This particular treatment of women reflected a suspicion of clerical authority and protectiveness of lay rights in the Spencer Churches, similar to the AME Zion Church.³⁸²

This concern for lay rights was illustrated in the schism that occurred in the Union Church of Africans between 1851 and 1856, shortly after the deaths of its founders, Peter Spencer and William Anderson. Clearly Spencer and Anderson were essential to preserving the cohesion of the church. The schism was the result of a dispute over the right of church members to select their preachers. In 1851 the church’s elder minister, Ellis Saunders, asserted

³⁸⁰Baldwin, *“Invisible” Strands in African Methodism*, pp. 37–51

³⁸¹Baldwin, ‘Black Women and African Union Methodism’, pp. 227–8

³⁸²Baldwin, *“Invisible” Strands in African Methodism*, pp. 62–3

that he had the right to preach at the denomination's mother church in Wilmington whenever he pleased. Indeed, according to the Church Discipline he did, and he also commanded the support of the majority of the church's trustees. However, this was opposed by the church membership, who voted to expel Saunders and the trustees who supported him in order to defend their right to select their preachers. The dispute became a court case which was argued several times in the Delaware court system between 1851 and 1855. Meanwhile, in 1852, a group of the trustees who had supported Saunders, led by Daniel B. Anderson and John Benton, separated from the Union Church of Africans. They worshipped at Benton's home until 11 December 1855 when they bought the meeting house which would eventually become the mother church of the Union American Methodist Episcopal Church. Also in late 1855, despite a court decision seemingly favouring Saunders, he and the remaining trustees were still excluded. They therefore led thirty congregations out of the Union Church of Africans leaving only the mother church in Wilmington. In 1856, they joined with Anderson and Benton's initial congregation of former trustees. They took the name African Union Church, until at a special conference in January 1865 they adopted the name Union American Methodist Episcopal Church.

A few (at least six) of the thirty congregations did rejoin with the mother church, however, and, confusingly, this branch of the Union Church of Africans then also took the name 'African Union Church'. This branch merged with the First Colored Methodist Protestant Church in 1866 and formed the African Union Methodist Protestant Church. There was a natural affinity between the branch of the Union Church of Africans originating from the congregants

(rather than from the trustees) of the mother church and the First Colored Methodist Protestant Church. The First Colored Methodist Protestant Church had originated in the early 1840s in Maryland and Pennsylvania. Its congregations had separated from the AME Church due to their concern about its episcopal structure and their desire for a more representative and democratic form of church governance. Their new church had no episcopacy, lay representation in all church conferences, and the representation of local preachers at church conferences. Likewise the Union Church congregation which had opposed Saunders did so in order to defend the representation and rights of lay congregants and to support a vision of a more level, less hierarchical church structure. Given how dramatically weakened they had been by the split of the early 1850s, they had much to gain from union. While most black Methodist church unions were impeded by concerns of autonomy and denominational identity, the egalitarian and democratic nature of the First Colored Methodist Protestant Church's structure allayed such fears. However, it is important to recognise that it was not only the similar egalitarianism of the churches which permitted union, but also the weakening of the Union Church by its schism.³⁸³

Such disputes were common in the first decades of independent African Methodism. As Lewis V. Baldwin argues,

All of the early African Methodist Churches demonstrated a common tendency to contention, rivalry, and schism. Personality conflicts and irreconcilable differences within the A.M.E. Church resulted in a split in 1840, producing a rival body known as the First Colored Methodist Protestant Church. Even before the A.M.E. Zion Church was formally

³⁸³Ibid., pp. 81–95

organized in 1821, dissension entered the ranks of the Zionites, resulting in the organization of at least three rival churches.³⁸⁴

Not all schisms in African Methodism were so hostile, however. While slavery split white churches, the danger of slavery split the AME Church. The AME Church first established a presence in Canada in 1834 and founded its first Canadian annual conference in 1840. When the Fugitive Slave Law was passed in 1850, former slaves who were AME leaders in Canada and the Caribbean feared returning to the United States to attend church conferences. An Ontario pastor, Benjamin Stewart, proposed that Canadian and Caribbean conferences split from the AME Church and administer themselves separately. His proposal was adopted at an AME Church conference in 1856, and the British Methodist Episcopal Church was established. However, after the Civil War, this original motive for separation was removed. Yet the BME Church did not immediately reunite with the AME Church. However, as time passed it began to struggle financially, especially with regard to its missionary activities. Its ability to continue independently was strained. Therefore its leader, Bishop Richard Disney, negotiated a reunion with the AME Church which was ratified in 1881. It is striking that the only two successful unions of black Methodists, that which created the AUMP Church, and the reunion of the AME and BME Churches, occurred when the smaller church was under great pressure and struggling to continue independently. Where churches were capable of surviving independently their union discussions failed, such was the importance of denominational cultures and identities. Furthermore, even the reunion of the BME Church with the AME Church was only partially

³⁸⁴Ibid., p. 81

successful. The reunion had been endorsed by eighty-six percent of the church membership, and Bishop Disney became an AME bishop. However, the majority of BME Church members in Ontario opposed reunion. They re-established the BME Church in Ontario in 1886, declared that Disney had defected, and elected Walter Hawkins as general superintendent. This re-establishment demonstrates that even in its short life, the BME Church established a strong denominational identity not easily dissolved. It also illustrates once again the importance of churches' own feeling of autonomy. The Canadian churches could not continue within the AME Church if they felt they would be doing so because their opposition had been overwhelmed by Caribbean church members.³⁸⁵

One other minor denomination provides insight into denominational structure and schisms. The Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Churches of America was a denomination of comparable size to either of the Spencer Churches by the time of the 1906 Census of Religious Bodies, with 3,059 members.³⁸⁶ Yet the RZUA Churches have received almost no scholarly attention. The origins of the Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Churches are of interest in regard to the study of black denominationalism, however. The RZUA denomination was essentially a Methodist connection that emerged in southeastern Virginia around the counties of Mecklenburg, Brunswick, and Lunenburg in the wake

³⁸⁵B.T. Tanner, 'Richard Randolph Disney', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 2, No. 1 (July 1885), pp. 1–8

A.R. Green, 'British Methodist Episcopal Church', *The Christian Recorder* (15 August 1863), p. 1

D.C. Dickerson, 'Canaan in Canada: The Founding of the British Methodist Episcopal Church', in *Religion, Race, and Region*, pp. 49–68

Winks, *The Blacks in Canada*, pp. 355–9

³⁸⁶*U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906*, p. 137

of the Civil War. It was the product of a coincidence of its members' and its founder's dissatisfaction with the denominational character of the larger African Methodist denominations. James R. Howell was an AME Church member who aspired to the ministry. His ambitions were frustrated due to his lack of education, and he commented that he felt he was 'crucified by the rulers and Pharisees of this day.'³⁸⁷ In 1864, he travelled from Philadelphia to southeastern Virginia, where he began preaching to former slaves, who 'were no longer permitted to gather for worship in the white churches, had no educated ministry, and were not in sympathy with the ecclesiasticism of the colored Methodist denominations.'³⁸⁸ Five years later, the Zion Union Apostolic Church was founded, which in turn would be the parent of the RZUA denomination. The confluence of suspicion of the formalism and 'ecclesiasticism' that originated the RZUA Churches reflected the fact that emancipation mandated a less formal and clerical denominational character, as much for the large denominations as for the disaffected few that formed the RZUA Churches.³⁸⁹

³⁸⁷ *History of the Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Churches of America* (Lawrenceville, VA, 1998), p.3

³⁸⁸ *U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906*, p. 483

³⁸⁹ *U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906*, p. 483
History of the Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Churches of America (Lawrenceville, VA, 1998), pp. 1–7

2.8 Denominationalism and church growth

The rapid growth of the African-American Churches in the post-emancipation South provoked internal tensions which hinged on aspects of denominational character, and particularly nuances of denominational difference between churches. Differences in class and customs between the freed people who constituted the vast majority of the new membership of the independent African-American churches and the existing membership and leaders of those churches, raised questions about lay rights and representation, and consequently women's church rights. This in turn provoked fundamental changes in denominational identity during the Reconstruction era and beyond. Simultaneously, the logistical challenges of winning the denominational allegiance of southern freed people, ministering to them, and building the new ecclesiastical structure of the postbellum South demanded all the resources the African-American churches could muster. This made women an invaluable resource as fundraisers and organisers, which in turn pressed the claim for women's church leadership. From the middle of the nineteenth century through the Reconstruction era, schisms and other developments in small, often overlooked African-American churches also centred on denominational character and lay rights. These are of historical interest in their own right, but also reveal patterns which shed light on the larger denominations.

3 Situating gender in postbellum black church politics

In 1888, the General Conference of the African Methodist Episcopal Church, held in Indianapolis, instituted a ban on the ordination of women in response to the ordination of Sarah Ann Hughes as deacon by Bishop Henry McNeal Turner in November 1885. The ordination had already been overturned by the Baltimore Conference in 1887. However, the resolution adopted by the General Conference was worded implicitly to rebuke Turner. It read:

Whereas, Bishop H.M. Turner has seen fit to ordain a woman to the order of a deacon; and Whereas said act is contrary to the usage of our Church, and without a precedent in any other body of Christians in the known world, and as it cannot be proved by the Scriptures that a woman has ever been ordained to the order of the ministry; Therefore be it enacted, That the bishops of the African Methodist Episcopal Church be and are hereby forbidden to ordain a woman to the order of deacon or elder in our Church.³⁹⁰

Not only did it challenge Turner's action in the ordination, but also his argument in his 1885 book *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity* that there was a scriptural justification for female preaching.³⁹¹ It is unsurprising that those who opposed the ordination of women should frame the resolution as an attack on Turner. Although he had sought to build bridges within

³⁹⁰Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 159

³⁹¹Turner, *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity*, p. 99

the church since his election in 1880, he remained a highly divisive figure. His election at the 1880 General Conference in St Louis was immensely controversial. Turner's ally John T. Jenifer described his opponents as a 'small, turbulent element, rampant, boisterous [which] had not the manners of an English mob.'³⁹² Prior to the episcopal elections, an opponent of Turner, C.C. Felts, had attempted to read a list of charges against him, while the senior bishop, Daniel Alexander Payne, had alluded to the doubts about Turner's moral character. Commenting on the scriptural readings he argued that

If a man desires the office of a Bishop, he desireth a good work. A Bishop then must be blameless (No one should vote for a man who is not blameless. Anathema be the man who casts his vote for any other man), the husband of one wife (not having a concubine following him behind as he goes through the country), vigilant, sober, of good behaviour, given to hospitality, apt to teach.³⁹³

Turner had notoriously been associated with a prostitute in 1869, so it seems that Payne's comments were a thinly veiled attempt from the senior bishop to derail his election.³⁹⁴ There were also other questions surrounding Turner's character. His use of snuff was frowned upon by most AME Church leaders. Indeed, the 1872 General Conference recommended that 'no brother be admitted to full membership in any of our Conferences nor ordained to deacon's and elder's orders until the use of tobacco is discontinued.'³⁹⁵ Turner

³⁹² *The Christian Recorder* (1 July 1880)

Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, p. 153

³⁹³ Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, p. 152

Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 128

³⁹⁴ Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 92–99, 152

³⁹⁵ *The Fifteenth Quadrennial Session of the General Conference of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, (Nashville, 1872), ATLA African American Religious Serials, 1850–1950, p. 44

was also associated with intemperance because during his tenure as publisher of the *Savannah Colored Tribune*, the newspaper had advertised alcoholic beverages.³⁹⁶

However, the attacks on Turner's character, while genuinely prompted by strict moral requirements of the church leadership, were also prompted by church politics. Turner was the youthful leading light of a faction in the church which was politically engaged; advocated decentralisation in the denomination's structure; supported lay rights; and argued for a greater representation of southern interests in the church's leadership and policies (hence John T. Jenifer's claim that his opponents had 'stronger sectional feelings than connectional love.')³⁹⁷ The attacks on Turner at the time of his election represented the resistance of the church's old guard to the growing influence of a new generation of progressive, young, southern bishops and church leaders. In this light it is apparent that the rebuke of Turner in the resolution banning female ordination was, in fact, part of the wider political divisions within the denomination.

Yet there has been little appreciation of the connection between the debate over female ordination and the political alignments which ran throughout the leadership of the AME Church, defining the debate on most important issues in church politics. Indeed, the existing historical literature has too often treated gender issues in African-American Christianity in a vacuum, divorced from the wider political realities, issues, and alignments within the denominational politics. As a result, analyses of gender issues in late nineteenth-century

³⁹⁶D.A. Payne, 'Moral Education is a Humbug', *The Christian Recorder* (2 June 1887), p. 1
Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, p. 147

³⁹⁷Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, p. 153

African-American Christianity have often lacked explanatory power. Far too frequently, the secondary literature has portrayed the debates about the role of women and their increasing influence in African-American Christian churches in the late nineteenth century as a proto-feminist campaign by women to increase their voice and influence, arrayed against a monolithic, intractable male church hierarchy determined to resist the expansion of female influence and leadership.³⁹⁸ Certainly there were determined efforts by women to open new leadership opportunities for themselves in the churches and to expand their influence. However, these were rarely exclusively, or even primarily, intended to blaze trails for women for the sake of purely principled beliefs in the rights of women to assume religious leadership. Rather, they seem often to have been the by-products of strong female engagement in issues and causes at the centre of church politics, which in turn necessitated and facilitated the growth of female influence in church institutions. For example, the autobiography of Amanda Berry Smith, perhaps the most famous black female preacher of the 1870s and 1880s, reveals that she did not primarily view herself as a beacon or pioneer for women preachers. Instead, it seems that her greatest motivation throughout her preaching career was the depth of her belief in scriptural holiness. Like many black women who sought greater influence in their churches and denominations, Smith's preaching activity was driven by her engagement in a controversial issue in church politics — in her case one of theology. Women's engagement in issues of gender equality within churches was part of their overall belief structure regarding the organisation

³⁹⁸Dodson, *Engendering Church*; Gilkes, *If It Wasn't for the Women*; Jones, *All Bound Up Together* all demonstrate a tendency to ignore broader denominational politics

of their denominations and the practice of worship.³⁹⁹

Equally the representation of male church authorities as universally resistant to the expansion of female power and influence in church life (especially the ordination of women) is highly misleading. Certainly many prominent leaders, even in the more liberal black Methodist denominations, were strongly and intractably opposed to any liberalisation of church law regarding women. That much is apparent from the debate over the ordination of women at the 1888 General Conference of the AME Church at which leading delegates argued against the ordination of women. For example, a prominent delegate, James H.A. Johnson, argued that allowing women to be ordained would ‘sap the foundation of the Church and corrupt its very purity’, while another, the Rev. G.W. Bryant is recorded to have said, ‘I vote in favour of their staying home and taking care of the babies.’⁴⁰⁰ Indeed, there was strong opposition from the very top of the AME Church. Daniel Alexander Payne, the longstanding senior bishop of the church, opposed almost every attempt to liberalise church law regarding women’s roles during his lifetime, including the creation of boards of stewardesses, the licensing of women as lay preachers, and the ordination of women. He was joined in this opposition by successive editors of the church’s newspaper, *The Christian Recorder*, Elisha Weaver (editor from 1861 to 1864 and 1867 to 1868) and Bishop Benjamin Tucker Tanner (editor from 1868 to 1884, elected bishop in 1888).⁴⁰¹ Similarly, there were many fierce opponents of female ordination in the AME Zion Church,

³⁹⁹Smith, *Autobiography*, pp. 75–108

⁴⁰⁰‘The General Conference — Report of the two last days’, *The Christian Recorder* (5 June 1884), p. 2

⁴⁰¹Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, pp. 35–62

including Bishop John W. Smith (elected bishop in 1904), the editor of *The Star of Zion* during the AME Zion Church's ordination controversy in the late 1890s; Bishops Thomas H. Lomax and C.R. Harris; and the Rev. S.A. Chambers of Rock Hill, South Carolina, who wrote in *The Star of Zion*, that 'I doubt a woman's call to the ministry as I do my ability to fly.'⁴⁰²

Although there was a large and influential section of each African-American denomination who opposed the increase of female influence (especially ordination), there were also many who supported it. Alongside Bishop Turner, prominent AME Church leaders who sought to advance women included Richard H. Cain, Bishop T.M.D. Ward, the Rev. Theophilus Gould Steward, and the leading missionary then Rev. James Lynch. In the AME Zion Church there were even more prominent leaders who supported the ordinations of Julia A.J. Foote and Mary J. Small in 1894 and 1895 respectively. Foote was ordained deacon by Bishop James Walker Hood (the senior bishop) in May 1894 and ordained elder in 1900 by Bishop Alexander Walters. Small was ordained deacon by Bishop Walters in May 1895 and ordained elder by Bishop Charles Calvin Pettey. In the controversy which ensued, Bishops Hood, Walters, and Pettey also received the strong support of the recently consecrated Bishop John Bryan Small, the husband of Mary J. Small. Furthermore, the ordination debates in the AME and AME Zion Churches were the most controversial and difficult instances of the expansion of female power in those denominations during the late nineteenth century. On the numerous other instances in which women expanded the leadership roles available to

⁴⁰²S.A. Chambers, 'Redhot Cannon Ball: No Authority in Scripture for the Ordination of Women', *The Star of Zion* (16 June 1898), p. 1
Martin, *For God and Race*, p. 163

them in their churches, there was considerably more support, or at least acceptance of its necessity. Male church authorities were sufficiently open to growing female influence to sanction the creation of lay stewardesses and deaconesses in the AME Church in 1868 and 1900 respectively and to grant suffrage to women in AME Zion Church conferences in 1876.⁴⁰³

There are clear and identifiable patterns in the support and opposition for expanding the role of women in church politics throughout the late nineteenth century. Repeatedly, Payne and Tanner would oppose expansion while Turner and Hood would support it. These patterns of church leaders' opinions on gender issues are closely correlated with their views on many other issues in church politics during the period. Of course, there were factions within all denominations on the major issues and controversies of ecclesiastical politics. These groupings held true across a broad range of issues to such an extent that loosely defined parties and groupings can be identified, which were broadly conservative or progressive, hierarchical or egalitarian. These factions were never uniform, always tentative. Not every church leader can easily be classified as conservative or progressive, and there were anomalies wherein certain elders and bishops favoured policies which do not seem to fit the pattern. However, there is still sufficient cohesion to argue that the divisions between Turner and Payne, for example, represented wider divisions within the church. What has not been generally acknowledged is that debates about female leadership fell into this pattern: those who supported the expansion of female roles in the churches were frequently those who took progressive, egalitarian positions on other issues of church politics. This was

⁴⁰³ Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 66

no coincidence. The alignments of church leaders on key issues in church politics was determined by their understanding of the meaning of church community, their denominational polity, their ideals of church structure, and style of church practice. Church leaders fell into broadly defined mentalities about what their churches should look like. The role they envisioned for women was an integral part of their vision of their churches, influenced by their understandings of theology, and the degree of hierarchical stratification they envisioned for church leadership. Gender issues were an integral part of complete structured understandings of church politics, rather than separate and isolated.

Of course, many historians have recognised the fact there were divergent opinions among church leaderships regarding gender issues. Indeed, the debates surrounding particular flashpoints in the expansion of women's church roles in the late nineteenth century have been well documented and described, including the creation of boards of stewardesses; the licensing of lay female preachers; the creation of lay deaconesses and the ordination of women in the AME Church; and granting women suffrage in church conferences and the ordination debate in the AME Zion Church. However, very few studies have either recognised or attempted to explain the patterns in support and opposition to the advancement of women in these debates. There has been little recognition that church leaders' positions on what would have been termed 'the woman question' were mirrored in their affiliations and alignments within church politics, and by their overall political philosophies. Insofar as historians have recognised that the debates about women divided the male leadership of African-American churches, they have tended to treat these

divisions in isolation from the rest of church politics. Gender issues have been seen as discrete and accounts have focussed on the theological and scriptural arguments in favour of or in opposition to female leadership. This is unsurprising, as this is the language in which these debates were couched in the church conventions and conferences at the time. Opponents of female leadership and the ordination of women primarily based their arguments on scriptural references, especially to St Paul's directive to 'Let your women keep silence in the churches'⁴⁰⁴ Its supporters, too, almost always framed their arguments in scriptural terms, arguing that such passages from St Paul only applied to the early Greek churches when women were veiled, and citing passages like Acts 2.17: 'I will pour out my spirit upon all flesh and your sons and your daughters shall prophesy.'⁴⁰⁵ The underlying assumptions about denominational structure, about style of worship, and about the demands and requirements of the pastorate — all the connections to the range of issues in church politics which divided their denominations' leaderships, and which informed their positions on gender issues — were generally left unspoken. However, they would have been all too apparent to those involved at the time. In the historical account, the negotiations and contestations over women's roles in the churches have been divorced from their context in church politics. Attempting to understand why particular church leaders supported or opposed female ordination or the creation of boards of stewardesses simply because they favoured certain scriptural interpretations based on certain passages omits a great deal of the context. The same is true of explanations which

⁴⁰⁴1 Cor. xiv.34

⁴⁰⁵Acts ii.17

Turner, *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity*, p. 99

implicitly rely on differing degrees of misogyny in church leaders' views on the place of women. Accounts of the expanding role of women in late nineteenth-century Christianity which rely on such explanations can be at best descriptive rather than explanatory. They cannot account for the timing of key decisions which expanded and curtailed women's church leadership. Church leaders did not arbitrarily begin to favour biblical passages which sanctioned female preaching in the 1880s and 1890s. Rather the changes in attitudes to female leadership in these years can be explained by understanding the context of church politics. Similarly it is necessary to view gender issues as part of an interrelated network of issues in church politics to understand variations between denominations in their policies regarding women. The AME Church established a firm ban on the ordination of women in 1888 which was not revoked until 1948. However, the AME Zion Church, which in most ways was a very similar denomination to the AME Church ordained its first women in 1894. When a resolution its 1900 General Conference attempted to revoke the ordinations and establish a similar ban, it was defeated. The AME Zion Church continued to ordain women throughout the early twentieth century.⁴⁰⁶ As a result there was a gap of over fifty years between the first successful ordinations of women in the AME and AME Zion Churches. This requires explanation, but none has yet been achieved in the existing literature because the debates about female leadership have not been understood in their proper context of church politics.

⁴⁰⁶Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 100

3.1 Sectionalism and hierarchy

The enormous and rapid growth of the African-American Churches in the postbellum period fundamentally reshaped church politics. The success of black missionaries to the south in winning converts, the exodus of African Americans from predominantly white churches, and the wholesale transfer of African-American congregations from predominantly white denominations dramatically increased the membership of the independent African-American Churches and shifted their geographical focuses southwards. This precipitous growth and geographical shift strained the resources and structures of denominations which until the Civil War had been northern and comparatively small. Naturally, this altered the preoccupations of the leaders of churches which were completely restructuring themselves to meet these new requirements. The single black denomination most affected by its expansion into the South was the AME Church. Despite the opportunities presented to the AME Church by its southward growth, it was remarkably slow and unresponsive in meeting the challenges of organising its growing southern constituency. The church organised southern annual conferences relatively quickly after the end of the Civil War. However, in most other respects there was little concerted organisational effort or investment directed to the south from the church's central authorities. The General Conference was not held in the deep South until 1876 when it was held in Atlanta.⁴⁰⁷ The church invested very little in building churches and educational institutions in the south. Most of what was spent was directed to the upper South, notably including

⁴⁰⁷Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 114

the construction of the new Metropolitan AME Church in Washington, DC. As one delegate complained at the 1874 South Carolina Annual Conference, ‘Dollar Money goes to build up Northern interests as all the book concern and everything else belonging to the general interest are in the North.’⁴⁰⁸ Indeed, most northern bishops emphasised the need to support the church’s northern institutions, especially Wilberforce University which was closely associated with Daniel Alexander Payne, who served as its president from 1863 to 1876.⁴⁰⁹ However, by far the most contentious issue was the lack of southern bishops. Until 1880, very few AME bishops were southerners (Payne had grown up in Charleston, South Carolina, but had lived in the North since attending Gettysburg Seminary in 1835).⁴¹⁰ No bishops lived in southern states and episcopal visits to their southern charges were infrequent. Writing in *The Christian Recorder* in 1877, a Texas minister complained that ‘Your Bishops are like the wild geese that come from Canada. They come during the rich harvest and gather and return home again.’ In his reply Benjamin Tucker Tanner attempted to defend the bishops but ultimately conceded that ‘one half the Bishops, at least, should live South; not simply visit it and lay themselves to the charge of coming down like the “Canadian geese” but have their residences there.’⁴¹¹ Initially southerners just sought for more bishops to live in the South, but through the 1870s it became increasingly

⁴⁰⁸ *Minutes of the South Carolina Annual Conference, 1874*, p. 48

⁴⁰⁹ Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, pp. 98–108

Tyler, ‘Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne’, pp. 142–54

Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, pp. 74–98

Letter from Daniel Alexander Payne to the Rev. T.M.D. Ward, 7 June 1870, Moorland-Spingarn Research Center, Box 80-1 (Daniel Alexander Payne Collection), fo. 3

⁴¹⁰ Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, pp. 9–24

⁴¹¹ ‘Bishops in the South’, *The Christian Recorder* (5 July 1877), p. 2

apparent that this would be insufficient. As Henry McNeal Turner wrote in 1872, the church should 'require each Bishop to live in his Episcopal district, or one or more to take up residence in the heart of the South... If this can not be done, then give us two new Bishops who live in the South, though their work may be in the North.'⁴¹² By the 1876 General Conference in Atlanta, the latter solution seemed to be the more favoured. However, the conference did not succeed in creating new bishops. The existing bishops exerted pressure against a resolution to expand the board of bishops, and it was defeated by seventy-five votes to sixty-five. This represented the last stand of the northern old guard of bishops against the influence of southern leadership and the policy directions they envisioned for the church, including broader geographical distribution of the church's financial and educational resources, and greater lay rights. However, the 1876 conference did make some concessions to southern representation at the top of the Church. Turner was made manager of the Church's publishing department and Richard H. Cain was elected Corresponding Secretary of the Parent, Home, and Foreign Missionary Society.

By the 1880 General Conference, it was clear that the church had no choice but to expand the board of bishops and assign the newly elected bishops specifically southern episcopal districts. Three new bishops were to be elected and the favourites were the leading lights of the church in the South, especially Turner and Cain. The election was structured as a series of sequential ballots in which a candidate needed to secure a majority to

⁴¹² 'Reply of Rev. H. M. Turner to Rev. J. C. Embry', *The Christian Recorder* (9 March 1872), p. 1

be elected. Such was the numeric influence of the South in the church by 1880 that Turner was easily elected on the first ballot, winning 66 percent of the vote. After another three ballots, William F. Dickerson and Richard H. Cain were elected to the remaining two episcopal posts. Cain, like Turner, was a southerner whose independent, progressive views drew the ire of the existing bishops. Dickerson was an intelligent, moderate northerner whom Payne supported for the episcopacy, presumably as a counterweight to Turner and Cain.⁴¹³ This did not mark the end of sectional tension in the church though. The 1884 General Conference was similarly fraught, not least because of the attempt by Bishop Brown and the Philadelphia Conference to snub those who had opposed Turner in 1880. Neither C.C. Felts nor Theophilus Gould Steward was selected as a delegate to the General Conference, although Steward eventually did attend. Throughout the 1880s, tensions between Turner and Payne (and the perspectives on church policy they represented) continued to simmer.

Matters came to a head once again at the 1888 General Conference. Between 1884 and 1887, three bishops — William F. Dickerson, Richard H. Cain, and James Shorter — had died. Turner was left as the only southern bishop and the only surviving bishop who had been elected in 1880. So once again the 1888 General Conference was dominated by new episcopal elections and the issue of southern representation on the board of bishops. Four bishops were to be elected. Two of the posts were ultimately taken

⁴¹³*Daily Christian Recorder* Vol. 1 (3 May 1880), United Methodist Archives & History Center, Drew University
D.C. Dickerson, 'William Fisher Dickerson: Northern Preacher / Southern Prelate' in *Religion, Race and, Region*, pp. 69–96

by southerners and two by northerners. The first elected, a southerner, was Wesley J. Gaines. However, Gaines was no ally of Turner. His candidacy had been supported by Theophilus Gould Steward, who in turn had strongly opposed Turner in 1880.⁴¹⁴ Gaines was joined by another southerner, Abram Grant; the northerner Benjamin Arnett, who had served for several years as the church's treasurer; and another northerner, Benjamin Tucker Tanner, the longstanding editor of *The Christian Recorder* and staunch ally of Payne in his disputes with Turner. The results of the 1888 episcopal elections did re-establish the increased southern presence in the board of bishops, but they also represented a retreat from the enthusiasm for southern values in church politics which had been evident in 1880. It was this conservative resurgence in 1888 that ultimately doomed the prospects for female ordination in the AME Church and led to the establishment of a ban on female ordination which stood for sixty years. The emergence of a powerful southern liberal influence in church policy in 1880 allowed female ordination to be seriously considered by the church and supported by several bishops through Turner's ordination of Sarah Ann Hughes. However, it also doomed its prospects. The liberal southern challenge was too abrupt and ultimately overreached on the issue of female ordination and therefore provoked a backlash.⁴¹⁵

The sectional tensions in the AME Church from the 1870s to the 1890s were in no small part based on differing ideals regarding the structure of authority and the nature of hierarchy within the Church. The contours of these

⁴¹⁴Angell, *Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 191–7

⁴¹⁵Angell, *Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 191–7

W. Seraile, *Fire in His Heart: Bishop Benjamin Tucker Tanner and the A.M.E. Church* (Knoxville, 1998), pp. 110–113

ideals in church politics directly shaped the prospects for the expansion of the offices available to women. Even the more progressive of the Church's leaders recognised that it would not be feasible to grant positions to women which were perceived as direct threats to existing male authority. The experience of southern church leaders was a reliance on lay support and granting lay authority to women. They were therefore more predisposed to the greater stratification of the church hierarchy, particularly in the lay and lower ordained offices. They also often had missionary backgrounds. Turner, Lynch, and Cain had been among the first African-American missionaries to follow the Union armies south. They therefore generally held expansionist visions of the church, favouring investment of personnel and resources in missionary effort to expand the Church both within and beyond the United States. Turner, for example was the driving force behind the establishment of the AME Church in South Africa.⁴¹⁶ This contrasted with the views of leaders like Payne and Tanner, whose policies demonstrate that they favoured the consolidation of the church where it was already established rather than its rapid expansion. Naturally, rapid church growth entailed the broadening, spreading, and diluting of the concentrated authority at the centre of the church. This much was evident from the pressure to expand the board of bishops and the enormous growth in the numbers of lay officers in the church. The corollary of a belief in broader, more stratified church authority, particularly in the lower offices, was that offices could be granted to women without threatening the existing male hierarchy. Lay offices could be created for women with specific caveats. For example, when boards of stewardesses were created it was made quite

⁴¹⁶Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, pp. 134–8

explicit that they were subordinate to the male boards of stewards. The appointment of stewardesses was subject to the approval of each church's board of stewards and stewardesses were not permitted to attend quarterly conferences.⁴¹⁷ Nevertheless, the egalitarian attitude towards the structure of church authority which predominated in the South, and came into the ascendancy in 1880, was significantly more favourable to female advancement than the alternative.

3.2 Sectionalism and generational change in the AME Zion

Church leadership

To explain the very different context in which female ordination was initiated and ultimately accepted in the AME Zion Church, it is necessary to understand that the Zion Church had a very different experience of expansion into the South in the immediate postbellum period from the AME Church. The growth of the Zion Church in the South was far more concentrated than that of the Bethel Church. North Carolina quickly became the heart of the southern Zion Church. By the 1890s, over one quarter of the Church's communicants were in North Carolina. As a result of the concentration of its southern growth, the AME Zion Church was far better able to integrate its southern growth with its existing northern structures, organisations, and membership. The sectional disparity in terms of resources, investment, and authority which characterised the AME Church's politics in the late nineteenth century was far less pronounced in the AME Zion Church. For example, the majority of the AME Church's higher education funding went to Wilberforce University in

⁴¹⁷Turner, *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity*, pp. 166–7

Xenia, Ohio. By contrast the leading higher educational institution organised by the Zion Church was Livingstone College in Salisbury, North Carolina.

Nevertheless, the postbellum southward shift of the AME Zion Church was not without consequences for its denominational politics. Though less pronounced than in the AME Church, tensions of southern representation in church leadership and policy were also evident in the Zion Church. These were most clearly manifested during the 1870s, especially at the 1876 General Conference and in its aftermath. In the early 1870s, a series of conflicts among Zion elders in eastern North Carolina, while not explicitly sectional in character, reveal a great deal about the nature of hierarchy in the Zion Church. More significantly, however, they led to the election of James Walker Hood to the episcopacy at the 1872 General Conference, an election which heralded the growing influence of the South, especially North Carolina, and of a younger generation of progressive leaders within the Zion connection. The increasingly sectionally divided character of Zion's episcopacy was then reinforced four years later at the 1876 General Conference with the election of Bishop Thomas Lomax with strong southern support, to the consternation of many northern Zionites.⁴¹⁸

An initial source of tension within the Zion Church's leadership in North Carolina was the conflict between Bishop John D. Brooks and the Rev. Ellis Lavendar. The details of the dispute are vague, but it seems that Lavendar became dissatisfied with the stern disciplinarian style of Bishop Brooks. According to AME Zion Church historian, Bishop William J. Walls,

⁴¹⁸Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 578–80
Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 83–95

Brooks was ‘extremely rigid and he stressed the highest point of discipline and execution of laws. He believed more in justice than he did in toleration or patient training’, a report corroborated by James Walker Hood, who commented that ‘As a pastor he was too rigid and dogmatic for great success in building up the church.’⁴¹⁹ Evidently this had alienated Lavendar who, in 1870, left the Zion Church to join the CME Church. As a result of this incident, Brooks was retired as an active bishop, not reelected at the 1872 General Conference (since it was not until 1880 that that the church began electing bishops for life). The second incident which disturbed the Zion Church in eastern North Carolina prior to the 1872 General Conference was a dispute between James Walker Hood and the ambitious young presiding elder of the Lumberton District, the Rev. G.W. Price. Evidently Price, who was a close advisor of Bishop John Jamison Moore, overexerted his authority on two counts. First, he successfully exerted pressure to have Hood moved from his pastorate at Fayetteville to Charlotte, seemingly against Hood’s wishes. Second, he tried a fellow minister in a church conference. When this action was revoked by Bishop Moore, Price charged Moore with maladministration on the floor of the North Carolina Annual Conference. Hood defended Moore, Price’s charges were dismissed, and, in short order, Price left the Zion Church and joined the Methodist Episcopal Church.⁴²⁰

There were several important consequences of these disputes. Firstly, the nature of these conflicts reveals that although the power of the episcopacy in the Zion Church was strengthening after the Civil War, the Church retained a

⁴¹⁹Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 182

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, p. 572

⁴²⁰Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 84–8

sufficiently egalitarian character that the decisions and judgments of bishops were not above challenges from elders such as Lavendar and Price. Secondly, the retirement of Bishop Brooks had left an episcopal vacancy. The church required stronger episcopal oversight over its turbulent and fast growing membership in North Carolina. This presented an opportunity for a greater voice for the South in church leadership. Hood was the obvious choice, and enjoyed the support of the majority of the North Carolina Annual Conference. He had been the most effective Zion missionary in the state in the wake of emancipation; he had successfully ministered to congregations in Wilmington, Fayetteville, and Charlotte; he had founded and organised many congregations and ordained numerous ministers throughout the state; and he had been prominent in the state's politics, particularly in the North Carolina Freedmen's State Convention of 1865. He was endorsed for the bishopric by Bishop Joseph Jackson Clinton, who had initially sent him to North Carolina as a missionary in 1863. His defence of Bishop Moore had also earned him cachet, not only with Moore himself, but throughout the church. Hood was also seen as a bulwark against the threat posed to the church in North Carolina by Lavendar and Price, who, having defected to the CME Church and the MEC, respectively, sought to take their congregations and others with them. Hood later wrote that

Rev. G.W. Price, Presiding Elder of the Lumberton (N.C.) District, attempted to take his whole district and the church at Wilmington, N.C. He took several churches and about one thousand members. We got the church at Lumberton back, but it took us seven years to do it, and the Methodist Episcopal Church had the advantage of possession and the use of our property all those years, while our people were

without a place of worship.⁴²¹

Despite having been born in Pennsylvania, given his influence in North Carolina, Hood's candidacy represented the growing influence of the South in the Zion Church. The 1872 General Conference convened in Hood's church, Clinton Chapel in Charlotte, on 19 June. It is likely that the support behind Hood's candidacy prompted the hosting of the conference in Hood's pastorate. Hood was elected on 1 July and consecrated as the church's seventeenth bishop two days later.⁴²²

Hood's election signified that the southward shift in the church's membership was beginning to be mirrored by increased southern influence in its leadership. Though it was prompted by internal divisions within the Church in eastern North Carolina, it did not represent a major division between northerners and southerners within the Church's leadership. The election of Thomas Lomax four years later illustrated the emergence of such divisions. Lomax was a native of Cumberland County, North Carolina. He was ordained by Hood in 1864, and rose rapidly in the Church, being ordained deacon by Bishop Clinton on 25 November 1867 and ordained elder by Bishop Moore on 1 December 1868. Lomax was undoubtedly representative of the southern influence within the Church. The 1876 Conference was the second general conference held in the South. It convened at the Fifteenth Street Church in Louisville, Kentucky, on 1 June. Lomax was elected principally due to the near unanimous support of the delegates from the Third Episcopal District, which comprised Virginia and North and South Carolina. This election pro-

⁴²¹Hood, *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 99–100

⁴²²Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 84–88

voked the ire of the northern establishment within the Church, and Lomax was assigned to a mission district with a meagre salary. Hood viewed this a deliberate tactic to marginalise Lomax, and so sought to support Lomax by giving him charge of the prosperous Clinton Chapel in Charlotte.⁴²³

Table 6: Senior bishops of the AME Zion Church⁴²⁴

Bishop	Seniority	Ordained elder	Consecrated bishop	Death
Christopher Rush	2 nd bishop	23 July 1822	18 May 1828	16 July 1873
William Haywood Bishop	5 th bishop	18 May 1828	4 July 1852	June 1873
George Alfred Spywood	6 th bishop	23 May 1844	9 July 1853	15 January 1875
John Tappan	7 th bishop	15 May 1835	9 July 1853	1870
James Simmons	8 th bishop	22 May 1833	30 June 1856	February 1874

The election of Lomax had further significance. Lomax was elected to take the place of Bishop Christopher Rush who had died on 16 July 1873. Rush had been the Church's second bishop, ordained by the church's founder, James Varick, in 1822, and had been senior superintendent (or bishop) since Varick's death in 1827.⁴²⁵ Many of the other senior bishops of the church had also died prior to the 1876 General Conference (see Table 6). By the time of the 1876 General Conference, only two bishops remained who had been consecrated prior to the Civil War, one of whom, Bishop Joseph Jackson Clinton, had been an ardent supporter of missions to the freed people and of southern interests within the church.⁴²⁶ There was, therefore, a significant change in

⁴²³Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 92–5

⁴²⁴Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 670–2

⁴²⁵Ibid.

⁴²⁶Ibid.

the character of the Zion episcopacy. The death of Bishop Rush meant that the Zion Church had no equivalent figure to Daniel Alexander Payne (who was born in 1811 and had been senior bishop of the AME Church since 1873). As a result, when a new generation of younger, progressive leaders from the South came to the fore of the Church's leadership, led by James Walker Hood, there was no abrupt reaction from the established conservative leadership within the Church as there had been in the AME Church. There was also no analogy to the conservative resurgence of 1888 in the AME Church which stymied hopes for female ordination. Furthermore, while there were sectional tensions within the Zion connection, they were far less pronounced than in the Bethel Church, partly due to the concentration of the Zion Church's growth in the South in southern Virginia and North Carolina. This also meant that there was less immediate pressure to expand the lay positions available to women since the church's manpower and financial resources were not as stretched by the organisation of its southern membership. This explains why the debates over the ordination of women did not begin until a decade later than those in the AME Church with the ordination of Mary J. Small in 1894. However, the corollary of that delay was that the progressive generation, which came into the ascendancy in the 1870s, was at the height of its power and influence by the time of those debates in the 1890s. Upon the death of Bishop John Jamison Moore on 9 December 1893, James Walker Hood became the church's senior bishop.⁴²⁷ Whereas in the AME Church the efforts of Henry McNeal Turner to ordain Sarah Ann Hughes were obstructed by the conservative senior bishop Daniel Alexander Payne and his allies, in the Zion Church it was

⁴²⁷Ibid.

the senior bishop himself who first ordained a female deacon. Additionally, while the antebellum limitations on the office of superintendent may have been reduced in the postbellum period, prior to 1880 bishops were elected for terms of four years, rather than for life, and unlike the AME Church, the Zion Church did not require candidates for the bishopric to have first acquired the rank of elder.⁴²⁸ Much of the church's hostility to hierarchy remained in its character. The comparative youth and progressiveness of the Church's board of bishops by the 1890s, combined with this egalitarian ethos may explain why the Zion Church ultimately defeated a resolution banning the ordination of women at its 1900 General Conference, where the AME Church had passed such a resolution in 1888.

3.3 Interracial cooperation and black Baptists

Sectionalism had more severe consequences for black Baptists than for Methodists. It undermined efforts at the creation of national Baptist conventions and was one of the primary factors in the collapse of the CAMBC. Sectional divisions were inherent in Baptist polity, since Baptist congregations naturally organised into local associations and regional conventions more easily than into national conventions. Local and regional considerations were therefore prioritised in the most important and socially powerful organisations in Baptist polity. Among Methodists, annual conferences were subordinated to the national denomination, whereas among Baptists efforts to create national conventions had to reconcile the divergent interests of the regional conventions from which they were to be constituted.

⁴²⁸Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 105–11

The organisational requirements of missionary activity among newly emancipated African Americans in the South prompted African-American Baptists to debate the possibility of union with the principal white Baptist conventions. Ultimately the two principal black Baptist conventions would unite with each other to form the CAMBC. However, their attempts at cooperation with northern white Baptists are revealing regarding nineteenth-century black Baptist understandings of region, interracial cooperation, and church structure. There were two principal black conventions and three predominantly white conventions that led Baptist missions to the freed people. The existing Baptist convention present in the antebellum South was the Southern Baptist Convention. Unsurprisingly, the racial attitudes of the SBC precluded significant interracial cooperation in its mission work. Indeed, its 1866 Convention resolved ‘That while we are not opposed to any rightminded man aiding in this important work, it is our decided conviction that this work must be done mainly by ourselves.’⁴²⁹ As a result the SBC was very ineffective in its missions among the freed people, and it was not considered for any meaningful cooperation by the black Baptist conventions.

Among the northern Baptist organisations, two merit particular consideration for their missionary work among the freed people, and for the possibilities of cooperation and union that they explored with the black conventions. The American Baptist Home Mission Society was founded in 1832 and was the largest and wealthiest of the major Baptist conventions.

⁴²⁹ *Proceedings of the Southern Baptist Convention, held at Russelville, Kentucky, May 22d, 23d, 24th, 25th and 26th, 1866* (Richmond, 1866) Baylor University Libraries Digital Collections: Southern Baptist Convention Annuals, p. 86
Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 63

Many in the ABHMS, including its corresponding secretary, Jay S. Backus, were reluctant to advocate any form of racial equality, partly out of concern for a possible reunification with the Southern Baptists. Although they did employ black missionaries, they were reluctant to offer African Americans leadership roles. It was not until May 1867 that the ABHMS elected William T. Dixon as the first African-American member of its board, by which time the CAMBC had already been founded. Dixon was joined by Leonard A. Grimes in 1869. However, even the election of Dixon was something of a snub to the CAMBC, since the favoured candidate of the CAMBC to join the ABHMS board was its corresponding secretary, Rufus Lewis Perry. Perry was considerably more radical than the moderate Dixon, who consequently was more palatable to the ABHMS board.⁴³⁰

The American Baptist Free Mission Society was founded in Boston in May 1843 as a more abolitionist alternative to the ABHMS. In particular it opposed the ABHMS's toleration of slaveholders as missionaries. The Free Mission Society was significantly smaller and less well financed than the ABHMS. In contrast to the ABHMS its members supported numerous African-American missionaries and elected several African Americans to its board from early in its history. Charles Satchell and Wallace Shelton were African-American members of its board by 1844, and other black ministers elected to its board in the 1840s included Jeremiah Asher, William P. Newman, Duke William Anderson, William Troy, Sampson White, William Spellman,

⁴³⁰ *The American Baptist* (4 June 1867)
The American Baptist (4 June 1869)
 Simmons, *Men of Mark*, pp. 495–99, 425–29
 Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 54–56, 84–87

Henry L. Simpson, and Samuel H. Davis.⁴³¹

The two black conventions responded to the different racial attitudes of the white conventions. The elder of the two black conventions was the American Baptist Missionary Convention. It was organised at Abyssinian Baptist Church in New York City in August 1840. Indeed, many of the convention's leaders were based in New York (with some based in New England), while its greatest sphere of influence in the post-emancipation South was in Virginia. Many of its leaders were Virginians, including Leonard Grimes, Sampson White, William E. Walker, Samuel W. Madden, and William T. Dixon, and Virginians had organised many of its most important congregations in the North, including Abyssinian Baptist Church itself.⁴³²

The other black convention was the Northwestern and Southern Baptist Convention. Founded in St Louis, Missouri, in June 1864, it developed out of the Western Colored Baptist Convention, which had operated in the northern Mississippi valley between 1853 and 1859. As its name implied, its constituency was to the west of that of the ABMC. Its purpose was to organise missions for 'freed brethren in the valley of the lower Mississippi [and]

⁴³¹ *The American Baptist* (16 June 1870)

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 43, 55–8, 87

⁴³² *Annual Report of the American Baptist Missionary Convention, 1842*, Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archive

Report of the Twelfth Anniversary of the American Baptist Missionary Convention, held in the meeting-house of the First Independent Baptist Church, Boston, Mass., On Friday before the third Lord's Day, August, 1852 (Boston, 1852), Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archive

Report of the Thirteenth Anniversary of the American Baptist Missionary Convention, held in the meeting-house of the Second Baptist Church, New Bedford, Mass., On Friday before the third Lord's Day, August 19th, 1853 (Philadelphia, 1853), Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archive

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 38–43

in the states of Tennessee, Arkansas, and Missouri.⁴³³ Its founding member congregations were twenty-six churches from Illinois, Indiana, Ohio, Missouri, Tennessee, Louisiana, Mississippi, and Arkansas. Its president was William P. Newman, pastor of Union Baptist Church in Cincinnati. The NwSBC had close ties to the ABFMS and shared its strong position on racial issues, its constitution affirming that it was constituted of members 'of anti-slavery principles, who recognize the equality of man, and the brotherhood of the race.'⁴³⁴

These ties were in evidence as black Baptists considered unification with white Baptists. The abolitionist history and anticaste character of the ABFMS made it the principal candidate for a rapprochement with the black Baptist conventions. The earnest effort to effect this unification was led by William P. Newman. He proposed the following resolution at the meeting of the NwSBC in June 1865:

Whereas, the principles of the American Baptist Free Mission Society are the same as those of the Convention, therefore,
Resolved that the corresponding secretary be instructed to correspond with the aforesaid society for the purpose of finding out whether we cannot be more closely connected in our missionary work.⁴³⁵

The two conventions exchanged delegations at their next meetings, and the unification of the conventions looked likely. In October 1865, Newman wrote in *The American Baptist* that

We want a union of the bond and free, black and white. . . that shall revolutionize the religious and political sentiments of this country. . . a great

⁴³³Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 44

⁴³⁴Ibid., pp. 44–5

⁴³⁵*The American Baptist* (12 September 1865)

equal-rights and gospel organization with the name of the American Baptist Anti-Caste Missionary Convention.⁴³⁶

The ABMC also considered closer cooperation with the white conventions. At its meeting in August 1865, Nelson G. Merry offered a resolution similar to Newman's:

Whereas, The American Baptist Free Mission Society has done much work for our race during the last twenty-five years, therefore Resolved, that we invite the Free Mission Society...to fraternize with us, in our missionary work.⁴³⁷

This resolution was quickly modified to extend this invitation to the ABHMS, too. Counterintuitively, this seems not to have been born of a desire to unify with both white conventions, but rather with neither — an attempt to scupper the union with the ABFMS in favour of a union of only the two black conventions. James Melvin Washington has argued that this may have been due to the strength of freemasonry among the leaders of the ABMC and the anti-Masonic views and policies prevalent among the white leaders of the ABFMS.⁴³⁸ Evidently, in spite of the strong abolitionist and anticaste character of the NwSBC, it was more enthusiastically in favour of an interracial Baptist union than was the ABMC. This distinction soon became moot, however, as the death of Newman from cholera on 3 August 1866 effectively ended any prospect of an interracial union. Even Newman's enthusiasm for union with white Baptists had begun to wane prior to his death, as the rise of the Ku Klux Klan and the creation of black codes tested

⁴³⁶ *The American Baptist* (2 October 1865)

⁴³⁷ *The American Baptist* (19 September 1865)

⁴³⁸ Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 74–5

his faith in interracialism. Shortly after Newman's death, the reciprocal delegates of the ABMC and the NwSBC met in Richmond, Virginia, and successfully resolved on a union of the two black conventions, forming the CAMBC.⁴³⁹

While the divisions over interracial Baptist unions between the two black conventions did represent a division between two relatively discrete geographical constituencies, there is little to suggest that the cause of those differences was motivated by sectionalism. However, geographically-driven, sectional divisions did become more apparent after the creation of the CAMBC and ultimately provoked its collapse. Just as among Methodists, the reorganising of Baptist Christianity in the South within the structure of a convention led by a northern minority provoked the emergence of a faction within the leadership who represented southern interests in response to northern elitism. The CAMBC's northern missionaries were frequently critical of the emotionalism of southern worship and of the qualifications of former slave preachers. One missionary, Charles Satchell, wrote to *The American Baptist* of the 'vices and irregularities inseparably attendant upon the state of slavery', of 'bad men under the garb of preachers', and that 'Old habit and customs will doubtless linger long in some places, but scriptural education and an enlightened ministry, with the blessing of God, will in time overcome all these evils'.⁴⁴⁰ These critiques were met with hostility by southerners, as evidenced by William Troy's report of a visit to Savannah, Georgia, where he was given the 'cold shoulder' by local ministers including William J. Campbell, the pastor of the

⁴³⁹Ibid., pp. 75–81

⁴⁴⁰*The American Baptist* (26 June 1868)

city's First African Baptist Church. His host informed him that this was because he was a 'Yankee nigger'.⁴⁴¹ Southern ministers reacted not just against the elitism of northern missionaries and carpetbagger ministers. They also resented that the leadership of the convention remained almost entirely composed of ministers based in the North. Although some of them had been born in the South, the composition of the executive board remained narrow and closed and many felt that Rufus Perry, the corresponding secretary, wielded undue power from his pastorate in Brooklyn.⁴⁴²

The consequences of southern disaffection with the CAMBC's northern leadership became apparent in 1872 when the executive board proposed a quasi-presbyterial restructuring of its system of the convention's governance. The initial proposal was for four districts to be organised in the South, but this plan was soon modified by the Committee on Fields and Missions to add two further districts for the rest of the country. Each district was to have its own executive board, but these were to be subordinate to the national executive board. They were to forward all their reports to the national executive board, and the national board also selected the district secretaries, although their salaries were to be raised by the districts themselves. The national executive board retained its power, focussed in New York and the northeast. Their attempt at restructuring the convention offered little real autonomy to the new districts, especially in the South where Rufus Perry and the leaders of the CAMBC continued to appoint their northeastern allies

⁴⁴¹ *History of the First African Baptist Church from its Organization, January 20th, 1788, to July 1st, 1888* (Savannah, GA, 1888), pp. 58–9

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 110

⁴⁴² Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 108–12

to prominent missionary positions. Western Baptists were the first to take action in response to the restructuring, and so founded the Baptist General Association of Western States and Territories in Mexico, Missouri, on 15 January 1873. They were soon joined by a breakaway southern convention, the Missionary Baptist State Convention of Tennessee, North Alabama, North Mississippi, East Arkansas, and Kentucky in October 1873. It was led by Nelson G. Merry, pastor of Nashville's First Colored Baptist Church, and George Washington Dupee, pastor of Washington Street Church in Paducah, Kentucky. They were two of the most influential black Baptist ministers in the South, and among the loudest voices in opposition to northeastern domination of the CAMBC. The creation of rival regional conventions entirely undermined the CAMBC, and although it limped on until 1879, it was then dissolved by its members at its meeting in Cincinnati.⁴⁴³

The wider significance of the issue of regional power in black Baptist polity was its influence on the progress towards a truly national black Baptist convention in the late nineteenth century. The discrete interests of the two principal regional conventions had to be reconciled in order to form the CAMBC, but it was also the interaction of these interests which prevented unification with the ABFMS. That, in turn, started black Baptists down a path of independent black convention building which, while beset with reverses and setbacks, ultimately resulted in the creation of the National Baptist Convention in 1895. For all the anticaste and abolitionist credentials of the ABFMS, the social power of black Baptists from the Civil War to

⁴⁴³Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 124–31
Fitts, *A History of Black Baptists*, pp. 70–1

the present has depended on the existence of autonomous black Baptist conventions which African Americans controlled for themselves, and in which leadership was not shared with whites, however benevolent. However, while regional influence set black Baptists down the path towards an independent black convention, it also greatly hindered and slowed the process. The congregational autonomy inherent in Baptist congregational polity meant that regional hegemony within national conventions would not be tolerated for long, and as a result the CAMBC collapsed.

The principal venue for female participation in the structure of Baptist polity was in women's auxiliary organisations to Baptist associations and conventions. As a result, the significance of sectionalism for black Baptist women's organising was in its effect on convention building. An effective, socially powerful black Baptist women's organisation required that black conventions organise independent of white conventions and required the influence of a truly national convention. Baptist women could wield comparatively little official influence within individual congregations in a congregational church structure. The ecclesiastical sovereignty of the congregation precluded significant female influence over such a small sovereign body. The principal source of female leadership and influence was therefore in auxiliary organisations. While state-level auxiliary organisations were important, the most effective women's auxiliary by far was the national one, the Women's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, which under leaders like Nannie Helen Burroughs, Virginia Broughton, and Sarah Willie Layten organised a widespread program of social reforms and activism and raised significant funds for the NBC. That no national women's auxiliary existed until that time

was in no small part due to the difficulties in reconciling sectional interests in black Baptist polity.⁴⁴⁴

3.4 Clerical education

Attitudes toward gender issues in African-American church politics were part of an interrelated nexus of issues in church politics. Churches' involvement in education was undoubtedly a critical area of church politics, closely related to attitudes to the advancement of women. Not only was a church leader's attitudes to issues in education a predictor of his alignment in church politics. It also directly contributed to the way he thought about the prospect of women taking up church offices. The distribution of educational institutions and resources was directly related to how centralised the denomination should be, which, as has been argued, determined the feasibility of granting women church offices. Additionally, churches had great influence over what was taught and what was emphasised in teaching in their educational institutions. What was valued in education offers insight into what was valued in church officers and pastors. This is particularly true of clerical education. In turn, what church leaders sought in officers and pastors determined their attitude to women taking up those positions.

In the case of the AME Church these issues are again best illustrated by reference to the disputes between Henry McNeal Turner and Daniel Alexander Payne. Payne built his ministerial career on his promotion of education. While still a young minister, Payne attended the Philadelphia Annual Conference in 1842. There he successfully proposed a resolution which urged that

⁴⁴⁴Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 58–63

the elders and deacons of the Connection make use of all the means in our power from henceforth to cultivate our minds and increase our store of knowledge. That we recommend to all our elders and deacons, licensed preachers and exhorters, the diligent and indefatigable study of the following branches of useful knowledge: English Grammar, Geography, Arithmetic, Rollin's Ancient History, Modern History, Ecclesiastical History, Natural and Revealed Theology.⁴⁴⁵

Later in life, Payne recalled that the state of education among the clergy of the AME Church at the time had been woeful. Many pastors were barely literate and many were extremely hostile to the introduction of minimum standards of education for the ministry. Payne attributed this to avarice on the part of undeserving pastors who were unqualified for their posts. While it is likely that Payne exaggerated both the poor state of education in the ministry and the hostility he encountered, there was certainly a great deal of opposition to the minimum standards Payne advocated. Payne persisted, however. In 1843, he became pastor of Israel AME Church in Washington, DC, one of the two churches which later merged to become the Metropolitan AME Church. Shortly thereafter he began publishing a series of five 'Epistles on the Education of the Ministry' in *The Quarterly Magazine of the AME Church*. Urging legislation on ministerial education at the forthcoming 1844 General Conference he wrote,

The rising generation must increase in knowledge and, the ministry who is to succeed must be wiser than we are, or they will never be able to give the needful instruction to those enlightened minds, who will constitute their hearers. Therefore, what shall we do to aid our young men, that they may become competent for the ministry, is the first question which ought to be proposed at that meeting, and the first one answered.⁴⁴⁶

⁴⁴⁵Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 141

⁴⁴⁶B.T. Tanner, *An Outline of our History and Government for African Methodist Churchmen, Ministerial and Lay, in Catechetical Form* (1884), p. 171

These epistles were almost universally condemned. Much of this reaction stemmed from a fear that Payne's critique presented the denomination in a bad light and would provoke discord within the church. Payne was condemned as a 'reckless slanderer of the general character of the connection' who was 'branding the ministry with infamy.'⁴⁴⁷ The Rev. George Horgarth, the editor of *The Quarterly Magazine*, acknowledged that

Great fear is entertained by some that if the measures proposed by him are adopted by the General Conference, discord and dissolution will necessarily take place in the church between the ignorant and the intelligent portion of it. They admit themselves friendly to education, to an intelligent ministry and an intelligent congregation; yet they appear to be backward about coming forward with their objections and views on the subject.⁴⁴⁸

At the 1844 General Conference, the issue came to a head as Payne introduced similar resolutions on clerical education to those he had introduced in Philadelphia two years earlier. He called for the church 'to institute a course of studies for the education of the Ministry.'⁴⁴⁹ Payne's resolution was initially defeated, but was subsequently reintroduced after a speech in its favour by the Rev. Abram D. Lewis, and passed at the second attempt. The church instituted a two-year course of education for exhorters and a four-year course for preachers.⁴⁵⁰

Payne was elected bishop in 1852 and continued to focus on education. In 1856, Payne had collaborated with the Methodist Episcopal Church in the

⁴⁴⁷Coan, Daniel Alexander Payne, p. 65

⁴⁴⁸Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 163

⁴⁴⁹Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 168
Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 67

⁴⁵⁰G.F. Bragg, 'Daniel A. Payne', Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, Sc MG 244 (George Freeman Bragg manuscripts), fo. 1
Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', pp. 75–128

foundation of Wilberforce University in Xenia, Ohio. When the Civil War threatened to close the college, Payne used his influence as a bishop to ensure that the AME Church bought Wilberforce outright in 1863. Payne became president of the university, the first African-American university president in the nation's history, and served until 1876. Throughout the rest of his life, Payne spend a great deal of time and effort supporting Wilberforce. On several occasions, Payne secured congressional support for Wilberforce, including funds for rebuilding after it was destroyed by arsonists in 1865, and another donation of \$25,000 in 1870.⁴⁵¹ He repeatedly urged that the denomination focus its educational spending on Wilberforce rather than diverting funds to the establishment of new colleges and educational institutions throughout the south. Payne emphasised academic rigour and argued that the church should found fewer colleges and ensure the highest possible standards. In 1884, he wrote,

Do not fritter away the thousand dollars on would-be colleges. Concentrate that sum; yes, concentrate ten times ten thousand upon one. By doing so you will make it strong. It will then effect more for the race and the Church than the same amount scattered between ten different institutions. . . When united, our pennies, our dimes, our quarters, our dollars, our tens, hundreds and thousands of dollars must be concentrated upon a single college.⁴⁵²

⁴⁵¹Letter from Daniel Alexander Payne to the Rev. T.M.D. Ward, 7 June 1870, Moorland-Spingarn Research Center, Box 80-1 (Daniel Alexander Payne Collection), fo. 3

On the foundation of Wilberforce, and fundraising for it see section 5.5

⁴⁵²D.A. Payne, 'Thoughts About the Past, the Present, and the Future of the African M.E. Church', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 1, No. 1 (July 1884), pp. 5-6; Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', p. 160

⁴⁵³Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 82-3

Gregg evidently takes the date of the North Georgia Conference's resolution as the date he gives for Morris Brown College

Table 7: Foundation of early AME Colleges⁴⁵³

College	Founded
Wilberforce University	1856 (founded) 1863 (purchased by the AME Church)
Edward Waters College	1866, Jacksonville, FL
Allen University	1870, Columbia, SC
Paul Quinn College	1872, Waco, TX
Western University	1880, Quindaro, KS
Morris Brown College	1881, Atlanta, GA
Kittrell College	1886, Kittrell, NC
Shorter College	1886, North Little Rock, AR
Daniel Payne College	1889, Birmingham, AL
Payne Theological Seminary	1894, Wilberforce, OH
Turner Theological Seminary	1894, Atlanta, GA

In this he was opposed by most southern bishops. They emphasised broad investment in education to train as many young African Americans as possible and to ensure that educational institutions were spread throughout the South. By the 1880s, the church was beginning to found other colleges in addition to Wilberforce, to Payne's chagrin (see Table 7). However, Turner felt this process was proceeding too slowly in the South: 'We ought, and must, establish a college somewhere in the heart of the South; or else our church there will begin to wane. Other denominations, poorer than we, are doing it, why not we?'⁴⁵⁴ Turner was involved in the foundation of several southern colleges. He supported the resolution at the 1881 North Georgia Annual Conference that proposed the establishment of an institution of higher education in Atlanta. In 1885, this college was opened as Morris Brown College despite the concerns of Bishop Payne who feared it would draw funds away from Wilberforce. Turner was also instrumental in the foundation of Turner

⁴⁵⁴H.M. Turner, 'Forty Things the General Conference Ought To Do', *The Christian Recorder* (25 March 1880), p. 1

College near Memphis in 1882, which was absorbed into Campbell College in 1887. Another college bearing Turner's name was founded in Shelbyville, Tennessee, also in 1887.⁴⁵⁵ Other southern bishops also organised colleges. William F. Dickerson founded colleges in Georgia and South Carolina, and Richard H. Cain helped found Paul Quinn College in 1872, bought the land in Waco to which it moved in 1877, and served as its president from 1876 to 1880. Southern bishops did not seek to neglect Wilberforce, but simply did not favour it to the detriment of all other colleges. Indeed, Turner was a great admirer of Wilberforce. He endorsed Payne's purchase of Wilberforce and wrote that it 'is surrounded with a high-toned class of our people, giving to the students the best associations that can be desired', and that it 'stands as a monument to Negro genius and industry, and demonstrates his moral and intellectual equality with the progressive nations of the earth.'⁴⁵⁶

Payne differed from the southern bishops not only regarding the geographical spread and number of higher education institutions. He also differed in his view of the purpose of education and the training of ministers. Payne always emphasised academic rigour, a classical syllabus, and theological precision, particularly in ministerial education. Turner had different priorities. That much is evident from his opinion on the requirements for the ministry: 'We want men well known to the Church; if not great preachers and scholars, men noted for coolness, discretion, judgment, kindness, affability, executive power, and activity.'⁴⁵⁷ He praised Wilberforce not for scholarly rigour, but because

⁴⁵⁵ Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 160–1

⁴⁵⁶ H.M. Turner, 'Wilberforce University', *The Christian Recorder* (5 September 1863), p. 1
H.M. Turner, 'Visit to Wilberforce University', *The Christian Recorder* (24 July 1873), p. 1

⁴⁵⁷ Turner, 'Forty Things the General Conference Ought To Do'

it

does one great thing for her students: she makes them have a good opinion of themselves; she imparts the most manly and womanly instincts to every boy and girl on the place. Their very walk, toss of the head, and gesture utter self-respect and self-admiration, which underlies all greatness, all success and all future honor.⁴⁵⁸

It is noteworthy that what Turner valued in education could equally be manly or womanly. Turner did not view the purpose of education as classical learning, which many institutions reserved for male students, but racial pride and self-respect, equally applicable to men and women. Similarly, for church officers and the pastorate, he emphasised practical competence above abstract theological training. This may explain why, unlike Payne, Turner encouraged the education of women, the establishment of institutions of industrial education as well as traditional universities, and the appointment of women to church offices, including the pastorate.

Similar divisions regarding the style and purpose of clerical education also affected black Baptists. The principal institution for the education of African-American Baptist ministers in the South after the Civil War was the National Theological Institute. It was founded in Washington, DC, in December 1864 by the Rev. Edward Turney, and was chartered by the US Congress on 10 May 1866. By March 1867, what had begun as an educational society had expanded to include a university in Washington, DC, and was renamed The National Theological Institute and University. Between 1867 and 1870, two factions struggled for control of the NTIU, and the schools

⁴⁵⁸H.M. Turner, 'Observations — Wilberforce University an its Environments', *The Christian Recorder* (23 July 1885), p. 2

and the university it controlled. The bipartite structure of the institute on the one hand, and the university on the other, exacerbated the issue. One faction in the dispute was led by Boston minister Justin D. Fulton, and dominated by New Englanders, mostly from Massachusetts. The ‘Fultonites’ controlled the institute’s executive committee of whose members fourteen lived in Massachusetts. They were opposed by Turney, the NTIU’s founder, and most of the corporate board, who were the trustees of the university, and who mostly lived in Washington, DC. Of the officers of the NTIU, only five were black, drawn from among the leaders of the CAMBC. Leonard A. Grimes and Duke William Anderson were members of the executive board, Rufus Lewis Perry was a vice-president, and Theodore Doughty Miller and William Thomas Miller sat on the board of managers. The five African Americans were all aligned with Turney.⁴⁵⁹

Much of the controversy was provoked by attempts by the Fultonites to take control of the Institute. In 1867, they attempted to move the headquarters of the Institute to Boston. This was partly in response to Turney’s request to Congress to modify the Institute’s charter so that it could found its university (which it did), and receive funds for that purpose from the Freedmen’s Bureau. When Turney secured \$9,000 from the Freedmen’s Bureau, it was seized by the Fultonite treasurer, Zalmon Richards, and the executive board. Both the efforts to remove the Institute to Boston and to block funding from the Freedmen’s Bureau were prevented by Turney, partly thanks to his ally Edgar Harkness Gray, who was chaplain of the US Congress. The Fultonites were

⁴⁵⁹Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 87–95

C.H. Corey, *A History of the Richmond Theological Institute with Reminiscences of Thirty Years’ Work among the Colored people of the South* (Richmond, 1895), pp. 53–4

mostly prominent members of the ABHMS, and their attempts to control the NTIU were partly designed to secure the ABHMS greater control over the ministerial education of Baptist freedmen preachers in the South. The executive board did not control the university, but it did control all the other NTIU institutions throughout the South, including schools at Richmond, Virginia; St Helena, South Carolina; and Augusta, Georgia. After Turney had successfully established his university in Washington, DC, the ABHMS petitioned Congress to revoke its charter in favour of its own newly established university, Wayland Theological Seminary in Richmond, Virginia. It is clear that the ABHMS and its allies on the NTIU's executive board sought to monopolise the administration of clerical education for freed people. They ultimately succeeded in defeating Turney. He was dismissed from the NTIU in late 1868 after he, according to the executive board, claimed that he had 'under his care and depending on him alone for support, twenty-six schools and 1,700 scholars', and that he had 'solicited pecuniary aid' for that purpose. Although dismissed, Turney continued his work with the support of the CAMBC and the ABFMS, but upon his death in 1872 his university ceased to operate.⁴⁶⁰

The conflict between the Turneyites and Fultonites was more than merely a matter of control and influence. It also reflected disagreements over the content, style, and curriculum of the Institute and university. These disagreements closely mirrored those among Methodists over clerical education. Like Daniel Alexander Payne, the Fultonites favoured a rigorous, literary curriculum built around classical theological study. Many of the Massachusetts

⁴⁶⁰Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, pp. 87–95

ministers who made up the board were graduates of prestigious northern seminaries like Newton Theological School, Madison University, and Rochester Theological Seminary. They sought to replicate the pattern of education at such seminaries for freed people's schools. Turney and his allies recognised that such curricula would not be the most productive for many freedmen ministers, many of whom were only partially literate. Instead Turney sought a broader-based educational system, and also sought to expand the remit of the NTIU beyond merely educating ministers. He argued that 'The Object of the Association was to give such men a proper general instruction in Christian doctrines, preaching and the general management of churches.' In 1867, he sought an amendment to the charter to allow the university to offer normal school education for teachers, and other undergraduate education.⁴⁶¹

Many of the African Americans involved in the controversy were sorely disappointed by Turney's dismissal, as they interpreted the type of education advocated by the executive board and the ABHMS as an attempt to pacify and subordinate the black Baptists of the South. This view was expressed by the Rev. Duke William Anderson in *The American Baptist*:

Their scheme appears to be to blend the rebel element [white southern Baptists] with their instructors, and thereby teach the colored men in such a way as will prevent them from becoming competent and capable.⁴⁶²

In response to the ascendancy of the Fultonites after Turney's dismissal, the CAMBC began to establish independent black-led educational organisations to fund and influence the direction of African-American education in the South.

⁴⁶¹Ibid.

⁴⁶²*The American Baptist* (15 October 1867)

Along with the ABFMS, the CAMBC helped support a small 'Free Mission school' run by Duke William Anderson. Anderson also became the first black trustee of Howard College. However, the most significant step towards autonomous black support for, and influence in, southern education was the organisation in 1869 of the Consolidated American Educational Association, led by Rufus Lewis Perry and William Thomas Dixon. It operated in a close relationship with the CAMBC and was a precursor of the National Baptist Education Convention, which was one of the conventions which merged to form the National Baptist Convention.⁴⁶³

Although the Fultonites emerged victorious in the disputes over the NTIU, their approach to education was thoroughly discredited among African-American Baptists, and the rapidity of their success prompted the growth of independent black educational organising. The impetus to black-led educational work with accessible curricula, and in which southerners were actively engaged, presaged the educational activism of the black Baptist women's organisations in the early twentieth century, epitomised by Nannie Helen Burroughs's National Training School for Women and Girls. More generally, however, the African-American reaction against elitist education, led by northern whites, reflected a trend in the late nineteenth century of greater black autonomy in religious organising, and a greater integration of northern and southern interests.

⁴⁶³ *Report of the Thirty-Second Annual Meeting of the Consolidated American Baptist Missionary Convention, held with First Baptist Church at St. Louis, Missouri, From Thursday, October 17th, to Tuesday, October 22d, 1872* (Brooklyn, 1872), Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archive

3.5 Secular politics

Henry McNeal Turner's emphasis on competence and racial pride in education reflected his engagement in secular politics. Another key element of the division between Turner and Payne was their opinion of secular politics. The degree to which church leaders believed that they should engage in secular politics was more than a partisan issue which often merely coincided with their opinion of female advancement in the church. Political engagement directly influenced church leaders' views on gender. Turner was always among the most politically engaged of the leaders of the AME Church. After the Civil War he was active in the organisation of the Republican Party in Georgia and attended the state constitutional convention. He served as postmaster in Macon and was elected to the Georgia state legislature in 1868, although African-American representatives were prevented from taking their seats until 1870. Turner's time in the Georgia legislature was brief as he failed to win re-election in 1870 after a re-count supervised by the Democrats overturned his initial victory.⁴⁶⁴ He was not the only leading southern minister to hold political office. Hiram Rhodes Revels was the first African-American US Senator; Richard H. Cain served two terms as Representative for South Carolina in the 1870s; and James Lynch was the first African-American Secretary of State of Mississippi. Payne initially supported the political involvement of AME Church ministers. In 1868, he praised Turner after his expulsion from the Georgia legislature, saying that 'The heroic leader of the

⁴⁶⁴Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, p. 82
S.W. Angell, 'Turner, Henry McNeal', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01557.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

movements against the Democrats is Rev. H.M. Turner, one of its Presiding Elders. A braver patriot does not tread the soil of the Republic.⁴⁶⁵ However, he soon came to doubt the wisdom of ministers participating in secular politics. He argued that it was a distraction from their ministerial duties, although it is likely he had also become disillusioned with the prospects of African Americans in secular politics, as the tactics of southern Democrats nullified African-American political influence, and Redemption began to win back state governments for the Democrats. His fears about the deleterious effects of political activity on ministerial duties were likely exacerbated by James Lynch's defection from the AME Church to the Methodist Episcopal Church due to his belief that political integration should be mirrored by religious integration and that due to

the changed status of my race, and the revolution of public sentiment, toward us — the grand march of the grander idea of human brotherhood. . . . the Mission of the A.M.E. Church as a seperate [sic] organization is drawing to a close.⁴⁶⁶

C.S. Smith, another AME minister who joined the Methodist Episcopal Church, wrote that

Instead of discovering anything like 'snubbing' or 'contempt,' I beheld an interchange of Christian greeting, which at once dispelled my fears,

⁴⁶⁵'Meeting of the Western College Society', *The Christian Recorder* (12 December 1868), p. 1

Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, p. 82

⁴⁶⁶Gravely, 'The Decision of A.M.E. Leader, James Lynch, to Join the Methodist Episcopal Church', pp. 263–69

Gravely, 'James Lynch and the Black Christian Mission During Reconstruction', pp. 166–70

Gravely, 'A Black Methodist on Reconstruction in Mississippi', pp. 3–18

Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, p. 97

sent a thrill of joy to my soul, and caused me to feel that I was in the midst of an assembly of saints.⁴⁶⁷

Payne was a man of absolute denominational loyalty, so the tendency of some politically active southern ministers to leave the AME Church soured him on secular politics. This was especially true in the case of Lynch, whom Payne had mentored personally.

How did the political engagement of southern AME Church leaders relate to their support for female advancement in the church? It demonstrates that opposition to women holding office in the church was not predicated on a political fear of the emasculation of African-American male church leaders. The claim that the AME Zion Church was more willing to ordain women because it was less political than the AME Church does not stand up to scrutiny of the political engagement of factions within the AME Church. Rather than fearing that ordaining women would harm the image of black masculinity at a time when it was under attack from Jim Crow, politically engaged AME ministers like Henry McNeal Turner favoured competent church officials regardless of their gender. Seemingly, effective community organisation and religious leadership was more important than preserving the masculinity of the pulpit for the sake of political appearances.

⁴⁶⁷Hildebrand, *The Times Were Strange and Stirring*, p. 95

3.6 Ecclesiastical politics and gender

The advancement of women and questions of female ordination in African-American Christianity were integrally connected to a range of other issues in church politics. Sectional divisions; different ideals of church organisation and hierarchy; different visions of Christian education; and the connections between church politics and secular politics must be fully understood in order to explain the alignment of church leaders on gender issues. It is insufficient simply to report that a given church leader opposed or supported female ordination. The historian must understand why that church leader did so, and this requires an appreciation of how the church was understood as a whole. If gender issues are treated in hermetic isolation, it is impossible to understand the chronological progress of debates about women's church roles and the denominational variations therein.

4 Church practice and the style of worship

The most celebrated developments in the history of women in African-American Christianity in the late nineteenth century were sometimes remote from the majority of African-American Christian women. The majority of most African-American congregations were women and most experienced their religion in the practice, worship, and organisation of their own local congregation. The expansions of formal roles for women in their denominations, while undoubtedly important, often had little bearing on the lived experience of Christianity of most black women. Women expanded their influence in the church through founding, organising, and participating in women's benevolent and auxiliary organisations, through unordained preaching and exhorting, and in the case of the AME Zion Church by securing ordination as deacons. Yet the debates over the ordination of women in the General Conferences of the African Methodist Churches were far removed from ordinary churchwomen, and there were very few ordained black women, female pastors, or even female preachers in the nineteenth century. In order to understand fully the changing nature of black women's Christianity in the late nineteenth century it is necessary to attempt to understand the nature of quotidian church practice, church life, and the style and character of worship. William T. Noll, writing about the Methodist Protestant Church, makes an argument which is equally

true of African-American churches:

While historical attention usually centers on the church at the general level, the movement for laywomen's rights was, above all, a local story — a record of women in countless local congregations who... did work that had to be done, and gradually received acceptance and recognition of their efforts, often grudgingly, from the men who ran the churches. Before churchwomen could serve at a national level, it was necessary to earn support for their wider role from their own congregations and pastors. Every local church of every denomination has such a story to tell. Often these homey struggles were more bitter, protracted — and triumphant — than those that made national headlines.⁴⁶⁸

Women's experience of church was in the preaching, the music, the call and response in their services, in their participation in organisation as stewardesses and lay organisers, and in their personal experience of religious feeling expressed by testifying. Therefore, the nature of the ministry, both lay and ordained, shaped black women's Christian experience. The expectations, demands, and duties of the lay roles and ministries in which women participated, as stewardesses and deaconesses, as exhorters and preachers, and in women's auxiliary ministries affected the ways in which women participated in their churches. The type of ministry that was desired and that predominated in the black Churches also affected the prospects for expansion of women's roles and ministries within the Churches, including featuring in the debates over the ordination of women. The nature of the ministry also affected the way in which male ministers interacted with lay churchwomen in their congregations.

The style of preaching, as a particular subset of ministerial duties, had similar ramifications for churchwomen. Women as congregants were the audi-

⁴⁶⁸W.T. Noll, 'Laity Rights and Leadership: Winning Them for Women in the Methodist Protestant Church, 1860–1900', in Thomas and Keller (eds), *Women in New Worlds*, p. 219

ence for preaching in black churches and so the degree of formalism, erudition and scholarliness, emotionalism, musicality, and accessibility all contributed to women's experience of this central aspect of worship. Furthermore the necessary skills and traits sought from and expected for successful preaching and the deficiencies church leaders identified in the existing standard of preaching offer insight into whether preaching was envisioned as an aspect of ministry of which women were capable. In turn, we can gain further insight into the causes of the rate at which women accessed the opportunity to preach in different African-American denominations at different times during the late nineteenth century. Additionally, by assessing the historical record of black women's preaching it is possible to assess how the active black female preachers measured up to the expressed priorities and desirable styles in preaching and what features black preaching women themselves sought to emphasise in their sermons.

Church music; hymnody; slave survivals, such as circle shouts; call and response; individual testimony; and other ritual and worship practices all contributed to the style of worship as experienced by African Americans, and especially African-American women, as these practices and rituals in African-American Christianity offered particular opportunities for individual lay and female participation and expression in worship. More generally, these elements of worship offer insight into the direction of the broader character of African-American denominations regarding lay and women's rights; regarding tradition, formalism, emotionalism, and charismatic expression in worship; and regarding sectional influences within the Churches.

These aspects of church practice can be categorised and analysed through

various ecclesiological labels: the holiness movement had a pronounced influence on African-American worship in the late nineteenth century, and the related influences of revivalism, the missionary impulse, and Christian perfectionism and moral reform were also significant. Analyses of the increase in auxiliary ministry in nineteenth-century Protestantism have viewed the social reformist impulse and service vocation in ministry as being in opposition to prior revivalist emphases on conversion. Similarly some historiography has identified a public/private split in Protestant evangelicalism, the former concerned with personal morality and the latter with social issues. Studies of black hymnody have also offered broad categorisations of hymns as evangelistic or social, concerned with personal sanctification or social reformation.⁴⁶⁹ While such categorisations may be applied to individual hymnic texts, they fit less easily on the church polities which underlay their creation. These categorisations did not interact and oppose each other as neatly in African-American Protestantism as in historiographical analyses of white American Protestantism. However, the interaction of revivalism, evangelism, personal moral reform, and emergent social reform which presaged Social Gospel activism, while not easily categorised into neat binaries, is useful for understanding the milieu of worship in which black women's church participation was situated in the late nineteenth century. Through all these lenses we can also further understand the broad character and inclination of African-American Christian Churches regarding lay rights and participation (of great significance for women as the majority of the laity) and the personal experience of faith as expressed in actual church practice and worship. The

⁴⁶⁹Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, p. 33

politics of everyday church life, however, does not necessarily map neatly on the more explicit ecclesiastical politics of denominational leadership as discussed in the previous chapter.

To attempt to understand the Christianity of African-American women in the late nineteenth century from within their congregations and from the perspective of their regular worship is to approach women's church participation from the bottom up, as history from below. Insofar as preaching, church music, and the pastoral work of the ministry were the everyday mundane reality of church life, viewing black churches in this light suggests comparisons to the concept of *infrapolitics* as employed in Robin D.G. Kelley's analyses of political resistance by African Americans against racial, political, and economic oppression. Drawing upon the work of anthropologist James C. Scott, Kelley has explored 'a dissident political culture that manifests itself in daily conversations, folklore, jokes, songs, and other cultural practices.' Scott describes *infrapolitics* as 'the circumspect struggle waged daily by subordinate groups... beyond the visible end of the spectrum.' The ecclesiastical *infrapolitics* of black church life, if it can so be called, is to be found in the daily life of individual church congregations and their worship. With regard to women's participation in black church life, this was not as explicitly a politics of resistance as that portrayed by Kelley or Scott. In their engagement in their churches women did not seek primarily to undermine and subvert the existing church powers, but rather to earn their rights as equal church members. Yet the varied and changing patterns of church practice were distinctly political, as all aspects of church life were coded with attitudes to church community, hierarchy and status in church organisation, sectional considerations, and

theology, all of which in turn had direct effects on the lived religion of black churchwomen and the prospects for enhanced female church participation and leadership.⁴⁷⁰

4.1 Holiness movement

Perhaps the most significant trend in opening worship to greater female participation and in encouraging women to express themselves in their worship was the influence of the holiness movement in nineteenth-century evangelical Protestantism. The roots of the holiness movement were Methodist and can be traced in large part to John Wesley and his pamphlet *A Plain Account of Christian Perfection*. Central to holiness was the experience of a second work of grace, or entire sanctification. Followers of holiness believed that the sanctification of a believer constituted a second act of God's grace, distinct from the first act of grace, being salvation and justification by faith. This belief was common throughout Methodism, derived from Wesley. However, holiness belief was distinct in its view of sanctification as an immediate, instantaneous, and complete experience of divine grace, and thus as 'entire sanctification'. This stood in contrast to the views of those who saw sanctification as a gradual process which might never necessarily be completed during earthly life. According to holiness doctrine, entire sanctification through grace was an act of Christian perfection, in which Christians were so perfected in love for God that they were freed from wilful immorality and sin. Holiness adherents who believed they had experienced entire sanctification therefore strove for

⁴⁷⁰R.D.G.Kelley, *Race Rebels: Culture, Politics, and the Black Working Class* (New York, 1994), pp. 8–9

individual moral reform, and practised strict standards of personal morality. They dressed modestly and plainly, and observed strict temperance regarding alcohol, tobacco, and coffee. As James Walker Hood expressed it in one sermon,

We can also be holy here, and must, 'for without holiness, no man shall see the Lord.' None but the pure in heart have the promise that they shall see him, and, therefore, to have a well-grounded hope of this unspeakable privilege, we must purify ourselves, as he is pure. Our affections must be pure, our thoughts pure, our words and actions pure.⁴⁷¹

Holiness was also closely associated with strong revivalist, evangelistic, and missionary impulses, as the experience of entire sanctification fostered a desire to effect similar conversion and sanctification in others. Indeed, it might be argued that the origins of the American holiness movement were in the antebellum revivals of the Second Great Awakening, and particularly in the influence of Charles Grandison Finney. Later nineteenth-century holiness institutionally crystallised this quest for revivals and conversions in organisations like the National Campmeeting Association for the Promotion of Holiness, founded in 1867 to arrange camp meeting revivals. It was the unbridled, enthusiastic evangelism and revivalism of the holiness movement that seemingly drew much of the ire of mainstream church leaders (particularly Methodists). It was seen as a threat to church discipline and organisation. Holiness itinerancy and evangelism would often exceed and transgress upon assigned circuits and districts, in breach of ecclesiastical regulations.⁴⁷²

⁴⁷¹J.W. Hood, 'The Perfect Felicity of the Ressurrected Saints a Result of Conformity to the Divine Likeness', in *The Negro in the Christian Pulpit; or the two characters and two destinies as delineated in twenty-one practical sermons* (Raleigh, NC, 1884), p. 199

⁴⁷²C.E. Jones, 'The Holiness Complaint with Late-Victorian Methodism' in Richey and Rowe (eds.), *Rethinking Methodist History* (Nashville, TN, 1985), pp. 59–64

Holiness experienced far less hostility within African-American Christianity than in wider American Protestant culture. Holiness was very influential within the AME Zion Church. Nearly all Zion leaders subscribed to the doctrine of entire sanctification, including highly influential bishops like James Walker Hood and Alexander Walters. The influence of holiness is clear throughout Hood's 1884 book *The Negro in The Christian Pulpit* which collected several of his sermons, and a few from a few other Zion bishops too. Hood's sermons demonstrate his devotion to the doctrines of entire sanctification:

[Upon sanctification] Our aspirations, habits of life, manner of conversation, objects of pursuit, sources of pleasure, hopes and fears are all different. . . and the more complete our sanctification, the more marked will this difference appear. We are thus admonished, 'Be not conformed to this world, but be ye transformed.' Let your transformation be complete.⁴⁷³

His sermons also elucidated the transformative power of Christian perfection:

Jesus prayed — 'Sanctify them through thy truth.' Then there is the declaration, that God wills our sanctification. . . much more shall the blood of Christ cleanse us from all sin. The stream of sanctifying influence is destined to sanctify, and make holy all who are subjected to its power, and to bring them into that state of perfection, in which they shall feel the fulness of divine love, and be wholly freed from sin.⁴⁷⁴

Hood and other AME Zion leaders also adhered to the standards of moral rectitude common to the holiness movement. According to Hood, 'Christian perfection is a characteristic of the saint on earth.'⁴⁷⁵ Nor was this moral

⁴⁷³Hood, 'Divine Sonship and the Sequence of Wondrous Love', in *The Negro in The Christian Pulpit*, p. 51

⁴⁷⁴Hood, 'The Streams which Gladden God's City', in *The Negro in The Christian Pulpit*, pp. 187–8

⁴⁷⁵Hood, 'The Perfect Felicity of the Ressurrected Saints', p. 195

perfectionism merely theological or rhetorical, nor only the matter of sermons or private practice. It had very public ramifications in the church, most visibly in the case of Bishop William H. Hillery, one of only two AME Zion bishops ever to be removed from the episcopacy. After much judicial wrangling within the denomination, Bishop Hillery was removed from office on charges of persistent drunkenness and indebtedness, thanks in no small part to the efforts of Bishop Hood. At Hood's urging he was replaced by Bishop Alexander Walters, a loyal holiness and temperance advocate and close ally of Hood's.⁴⁷⁶

Holiness, it seems, did not experience the near universal acceptance in the AME Church that it did in the AME Zion Church. While most AME leaders embraced the doctrine of entire sanctification, there were some prominent leaders and bishops who did not. One particularly noteworthy expression of holiness influence in the AME Church came in 1877, when George C. Whitfield became pastor of Mother Bethel Church in Philadelphia, the mother church of the denomination, organised and built by Richard Allen in 1794. It was the most important and visible pastoral-level appointment in the church. Whitfield had been closely associated with the National Holiness Association, and was particularly influenced by the preaching of William McDonald, to which he ascribed his sanctification. Upon his appointment at Mother Bethel, he immediately began preaching holiness sermons. An account of one of his sermons from March 1878 appeared in *The Christian Recorder*, which demonstrates his dedication to holiness:

He gave a description of God's Holiness. . . He then directed his argument to an elucidation of the doctrines of justification and sanctification,

⁴⁷⁶Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 97–104

holding that roots of bitterness were not eradicated until the latter grace was obtained. He declared that he felt annoyed by the charge that he was all the time talking of holiness, he said it was not Whitfield but God who demands it.⁴⁷⁷

In June 1877, he hosted a holiness revival meeting at the church, at which New York holiness leader John Inskip of the Methodist Episcopal Church preached the keynote sermon. The most famous black female preacher of the age, Amanda Berry Smith, was also present and testified that she had been ‘converted clearly, and radically, and positively, and unmistakably, and tremendously’.⁴⁷⁸

Shortly after Whitfield’s June 1877 revival meeting, the Rev. H.H. Lewis reported for *The Christian Recorder* on a ‘Higher Life Meeting’ in Philadelphia, which was to be ‘be an experience meeting by those who enjoyed the blessing of sanctification, and also those that did not.’ His account provides a fascinating insight into the influence of holiness in the AME Church, as it quotes several of the most influential bishops and leaders in the denomination providing their view of sanctification. Several, including Bishop Jabez P. Campbell, Dr. Benjamin Tucker Tanner (later a bishop), the Rev. Theodore Gould, the Rev. R. Barney, the Rev. J.S. Thompson, the Rev. W.H. Davis, and the Rev. W.H. Stiles all attested to their belief in and experience of sanctification. Campbell ‘believed in Sanctification, perfect love, and holiness’, while Tanner said that ‘he had a knowledge of his conversion over 22 years ago, and his knowledge of the fact that God had come again and lifted him up into the higher life, was equally sure.’ Others were more equivocal. The Rev. L. Patterson said that

⁴⁷⁷‘Local Column’, *The Christian Recorder* (7 March 1878), p. 3

⁴⁷⁸A.M. Israel, *Amanda Berry Smith: From Washerwoman to Evangelist* (Lanham, MD, 1998), p. 62

‘he had enjoyed the blessing three times and lost it’. The Rev. C.C. Felts had not experienced sanctification, but ‘he proposed to seek until he found it’. Nor had the Rev. Levi J. Coppin (later a bishop) experienced sanctification and he expressed ambivalence as to its meaning:

He knew he was converted, that there was a marked change, and he knew he was called to the ministry, as for any further graces he did not know, but his hope and prayer was that the good Lord might give it to him, what ever was meant in those terms.

However, despite the uncertainty of some in attendance regarding sanctification, the tenor of the meeting was seemingly strongly in favour of holiness doctrine. In closing, the Rev. Lewis, the article’s author, effusively testified on the subject:

Sanctification is a reality, the blessing of it is instantaneous, and the state is progressive as well. To sanctify is to cleanse to purify, to set apart to a holy use, to separate from cherished evils, or secret bosom sins. In this, we breathe a purer Christian atmosphere, and have greater victory over ourselves and common or special evils.

Seemingly only Henry McNeal Turner expressed an opinion explicitly opposed to entire sanctification when he ‘read a passage of Scripture and give his interpretation as he understood sanctification, thinking it a gradual work.’⁴⁷⁹

Indeed, AME Church literature was full of holiness language throughout the late nineteenth century. Although the overwhelming majority of correspondents affirmed entire sanctification, numerous permutations of opinion proliferated. While Jabez P. Campbell expressed his belief in and experience of entire sanctification in 1877, his earlier writings indicate that he viewed it in

⁴⁷⁹H.H. Lewis, ‘Higher Life Meeting’, *The Christian Recorder* (9 August 1877)

a complex and unconventional manner. In 1864 he wrote that ‘sanctification is both gradual and instantaneous, according to the faith of different persons.’⁴⁸⁰ Turner was not alone in his belief in gradual sanctification. Henry Davis wrote to *The Christian Recorder* that ‘sanctification is a work which is gradual. . . it is a progressive work, and not perfected at once’.⁴⁸¹ Such opinions were rare, however.

Even those African-American church leaders in the AME Church and beyond who did not embrace entire sanctification were still usually supportive of many aspects of holiness practice. Turner himself firmly believed in the transformative power of the Holy Spirit. Stephen Ward Angell terms this Turner’s ‘doctrine of the Holy Spirit’, which manifested with direct supernatural influence, as Turner described in 1876:

All the Prophets spoke under the influence of the Holy Ghost, and did not know, fully, what they were saying, God took possession of all their energies and moved them to speak and to write such things as He desired to communicate to the children of men.⁴⁸²

While this view of the Holy Spirit was distinct from holiness doctrine, there are clear resonances. Even clearer is the resemblance to the beliefs of Pentecostalism, which emerged in the early twentieth century, heavily influenced by the holiness movement. In practical terms, black church leaders all embraced the strict morality of holiness. Despite insinuations to the contrary at the 1880 General Conference, Turner himself was an ardent prohibitionist, who

⁴⁸⁰J.P. Campbell, ‘On Gradual and Immediate Sanctification’, *The Christian Recorder* (26 March 1864), p. 1

⁴⁸¹H. Davis, ‘Sanctification’, *The Christian Recorder* (16 February 1861), p. 2

⁴⁸²P.T. Smith ‘Local Religious Items — Bethel A.M.E. Church’, *The Christian Recorder* (21 September 1876), p. 4
Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 268–9

often lectured against the use of tobacco and alcohol.⁴⁸³ Indeed, just like the AME Zion Church, the AME Church was comprehensively and rigorously pro-temperance, believing that ‘Drunkenness is a sin which degrades human nature, banishes reason, insults God, and it exposes the drunkard to the greatest evils.’⁴⁸⁴ Temperance was a frequent subject of sermons and church literature. The church also strove for reform of sexual morality. For example, a sermon by the Rev. William H. Morris in 1886 entitled ‘A Plea for Purity’ took as its text 1 Thessalonians, 4:3: ‘For this is the will of God, even your sanctification, that ye should abstain from fornication’, and lamented the prevalence of marital infidelity.⁴⁸⁵

Holiness and the doctrine of entire sanctification were widely accepted by late nineteenth-century African-American Baptists, too. In the 1890 volume of sermons and papers by leading ministers, *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, the sermon on sanctification was contributed by the Rev. Charles H. Parrish, the professor of Greek at the State University of Louisville, Kentucky. He took as his text John xvii:17, Christ’s prayer for his disciples, ‘Sanctify them through your truth.’ In the sermon, Parrish made clear that he believed ‘Sanctification is a continuous process, which goes on throughout the life of the believer.’ Nevertheless he did indicate that entire sanctification was possible, as he argued, ‘Our sanctification shall not always be incomplete. We shall not be satisfied until we awake in his likeness. But such likeness involves perfect sanctification, which shall be the believer’s portion.’ The sermon captures the sense of sanctification as a continual struggle for purity, which underlay

⁴⁸³ Angell, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner*, pp. 185–90

⁴⁸⁴ P.E. Crews, ‘Drunkenness’, *The Christian Recorder* (26 July 1877), p. 1

⁴⁸⁵ W.H. Morris, ‘A Plea for Purity’, *The Christian Recorder* (11 March 1886), p. 2

the holiness preoccupation with personal morality:

Sanctification is not confined to mere outward actions. It is of the whole nature. The spiritual, intellectual, and physical natures are alike the sphere of it. There must be holy, spiritual emotions and affections permeating the heart, influencing the mind, and, reaching the body, controlling all its appetites and powers. All filthiness of the flesh must be put aside. War must be waged, and every Canaanite exterminated. Every sin must be dragged from its lurking place and destroyed. Let us cleanse ourselves from all filthiness of the flesh and spirit, perfecting holiness in the fear of God... It is like the ascent of a mountain. One is always going forward, though not always upward... Self-purification is declared to be the work of every one that hath the hope of the likeness of Christ.⁴⁸⁶

Parrish's sermon demonstrates the constant self-scrutiny that holiness devotees demanded of themselves.

The affinity with holiness practice also extended to the revivalist and evangelistic character of the church. Holiness placed great emphasis on revivalism and evangelism, since if one could contribute towards one's own sanctification, then one could also influence others to do so for themselves. As AME Bishop Jabez P. Campbell put it, 'It makes it to be the duty of believers to pray, and pray continually, for sanctification for themselves and others, when they know that they have been regenerated.'⁴⁸⁷ The belief in human agency in the process of sanctification was influential in African-American Holiness. Jabez P. Campbell argued that it was necessary to pray for sanctification, while James Walker Hood wrote that 'If we seek holiness of the heart, we shall obtain it' and that

This state of resignation which comes from a complete yielding of everything, body and soul to the will of God, brings with it a peace

⁴⁸⁶C.H. Parrish, 'Sanctification', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, pp. 91–103

⁴⁸⁷Campbell, 'On Gradual and Immediate Sanctification'

which we generally call sanctification; and you must get there before you go.⁴⁸⁸

Although Turner did not believe in entire sanctification, he, more than any other leader in his church, embraced an evangelistic, expansionist vision for the future of his church and African-American Christianity in general. He led the efforts to expand the AME Church overseas, particularly in Africa; was heavily involved in the postbellum expansion of the church into the South; represented southern interests within the church; and generally favoured expansion over consolidation in many aspects of church organisation. It is clear, too, that the AME Church was explicitly revivalist, with reports of revival meetings and camp meetings throughout the late nineteenth century.⁴⁸⁹ One revival meeting at Mother Bethel in Philadelphia produced ‘about seventy conversions’, while the Indiana Conference held what was described as ‘an old fashioned Methodist camp-meeting’ at Terre Haute, Indiana, for a number of consecutive years.⁴⁹⁰ Revivals were a common occurrence among black Baptists, too. The General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky reported revivals among the Baptists of the state in 1885 and 1886, for example. They reported that ‘Our churches generally have been engaged in protracted meetings, which were attended with great success.’ and that ‘The revivals and the large additions to the churches has been the theme of great rejoicing with the members of the churches.’⁴⁹¹ While this moral reformism,

⁴⁸⁸Hood, *The Negro in The Christian Pulpit*, pp. 188, 232

⁴⁸⁹Dvorak, *An African-American Exodus*, pp. 5–15

⁴⁹⁰‘The Revival services at Bethel Church’, *The Christian Recorder* (11 March 1886), p. 2
‘Camp Meeting’, *The Christian Recorder* (9 August 1877), p. 2

⁴⁹¹*Minutes of the Seventeenth Annual Session of the General Association Colored Baptists in Kentucky. Held with the Green Street Baptist Church, Danville, Ky. August 12 to 16, 1885* (Louisville, KY, 1886), p. 18

evangelism, and revivalism cannot solely be ascribed to holiness influence, it clearly had a profound impact. Furthermore, where these existed in their own right they cannot but have created an easier environment for holiness to thrive.

There were some minor concerns expressed by black church leaders about holiness influence, mostly regarding church unity. Misgivings were raised over the influence white-controlled holiness organisations wielded over African Americans, as in the case of Amanda Berry Smith, perhaps the most famous female black preacher of the age. In 1875, *The Christian Recorder* asked,

Where is Amanda Smith? She belongs to us, and we ought to set her to work. Tell me nothing about the work she is doing among our white brethren. They don't need her. They are rich in spiritual gifts and spiritual work. We are poor, languishing and dying. We tell Amanda Smith to come home.⁴⁹²

James Walker Hood also expressed concern over the schismatic character of charismatic holiness:

You have often seen young converts start out so full of zeal and good works, as to throw old Christians in the shade; and the same may be said of churches. They are formed under the influence of a great revival, or a godly zeal, which takes possession of a portion of the members of an old organization, and causes them to break away from their cold and formal associates, and form a new organization for the promotion of holiness.⁴⁹³

Given that the holiness movement spawned several breakaway holiness churches, like the Church of the Nazarene, which separated from mainstream white

Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, p. 37

⁴⁹²'The Mite Society', *The Christian Recorder* (4 March 1875), p. 4

⁴⁹³Hood, 'Loss of First Love', in *The Negro in The Christian Pulpit*, pp. 253–4

Methodism, this was no idle concern for those, like Hood, with strong denominational loyalties. Nevertheless holiness was mostly well-received and influential in African-American churches.

Throughout its nineteenth-century history, the holiness movement offered a powerful vehicle for female empowerment in Christianity. Among white Methodists, the most influential female holiness preachers of the nineteenth century were Phoebe Palmer and Frances Willard. Palmer has been called ‘the major force behind the mid-19th century Holiness revival.’⁴⁹⁴ A talented organiser, writer, preacher, evangelist, and missionary, Palmer spread holiness through her preaching in the United States, Canada, and Britain; as editor of the periodical *Guide to Holiness* from 1864 until her death, and as author of works such as *The Way of Holiness* and *The Promise of the Father*. Frances Willard was also an influential writer on holiness, and her 1888 book *Woman in the Pulpit* made the case for female preaching. The arguments of white holiness women like Palmer and Willard had a profound influence on black holiness women.⁴⁹⁵ The influence of Willard’s temperance activism was apparent when in 1898, the women’s column of *The Christian Recorder* urged women organising new temperance societies for their churches to ‘Have your meeting Sabbath afternoon, if possible, and have a good program... You might have some one read up... on the life of Frances Willard’.⁴⁹⁶ Likewise

⁴⁹⁴L.S. Dayton and D.W. Dayton, ‘“Your Daughters Shall Prophecy”: Feminism in the Holiness Movement’, *Methodist History* Vol. 14, No. 2 (January 1976), p. 72

⁴⁹⁵Dayton and Dayton, ‘“Your Daughters Shall Prophecy”’, pp. 72–8

T. Hovet, ‘Phoebe Palmer’s “Altar Phraseology” and the Spiritual Dimension of Woman’s Sphere’, *The Journal of Religion* Vol. 63, No. 3 (July 1983), p. 267

P. Palmer, *The Promise of the Father* (Boston, 1859), p. 6

F.E. Willard, *Woman in the Pulpit* (Boston, 1888), p. 34

⁴⁹⁶‘Women’s Column’, *The Christian Recorder* (3 November 1898), p. 6

her influence for black women preachers was clear when the same column observed,

Frances Willard has an admirable article. . . in behalf of ordaining women as preachers. There is not one man in a hundred who can preach as well as Miss Willard. Perhaps that is just the trouble. The weaker brethren in the ministry are a little afraid of women's competition.⁴⁹⁷

However, black women employed holiness independently of white Christianity to forge preaching opportunities and distinctive worship practices for themselves.

The impact of holiness on African-American women's Christianity is most obvious in the case of the prominent black women preachers of the age. The autobiographical accounts of Amanda Berry Smith and Julia A.J. Foote and John H. Acornley's contemporary biography of Harriet A. Baker all emphasise the importance of holiness for these women, as do their sermons. Amanda Berry Smith was probably the most celebrated black women preacher of the late nineteenth century. She experienced sanctification when she attended a sermon preached by holiness leader John Inskip at Green Street Methodist Episcopal Church in New York in September 1868.⁴⁹⁸ Inskip was a powerful speaker, described as 'a veritable whirlwind', and his sermon that day on the text of Ephesians 4:24 was focussed on holiness doctrine. He spoke of sanctification, that 'It is instantaneous. . . To illustrate, how long is a dark room dark when you take a lighted lamp into it?' His preaching inspired Smith who repressed the urge to exclaim about her experience, saying to herself, 'if you make a noise they will put you out.' However at the culmination of the

⁴⁹⁷'Our Woman's Column', *The Christian Recorder* (15 December 1887), p. 4

⁴⁹⁸Israel, *Amanda Berry Smith*, pp. 41–3

sermon Smith shouted ‘Glory to Jesus!’ and was relieved when Inskip replied ‘Amen, Glory to God.’ Upon leaving the church, Smith then described her own instantaneous sanctification:

Just as I put my foot on the top step I seemed to feel a hand, the touch of which I cannot describe. It seemed to press me gently on the top of my head, and I felt something part and roll down and cover me like a great cloak! I felt it distinctly; it was done in a moment, and O what a mighty peace and power took possession of me!⁴⁹⁹

This account suggests several important features of the experience of sanctification by African-American women. It illustrates the importance of spontaneous individual testimony as part of the process of experiencing sanctification. Smith presents her internal struggle during Inskip’s sermon and her eventual outburst in a white congregation almost as a microcosm of her quest for and eventual experience of sanctification. Like many women, Smith presented her experience as a direct supernatural connection to the Divine. She described a disembodied voice urging her to go to Green Street Church that Sunday while she had been cleaning. Similarly, in her autobiography she describes an occasion when her preaching career seems to have been prophesied in a vision in 1855, when she would have been around eighteen years old:

I seemed to go into a kind of trance or vision, and I saw on the foot of my bed a most beautiful angel. It stood on one foot, with wings spread, looking me in the face and motioning me with the hand. . . Then, it seemed, I went to a great Camp Meeting and there seemed to be thousands of people, and I was to preach and the platform I had to stand on was up high above the people. . . I was on this platform with a large Bible opened and I was preaching from these words: — ‘And I if I [sic] be lifted up will draw all men unto me.’ O, how I preached,

⁴⁹⁹Smith, *Autobiography*, p. 79

and the people were slain right and left... I thought God had spared me for a purpose, so I meant to be converted.⁵⁰⁰

While her autobiography frequently describes supernatural Divine inspiration, Smith also participated in the practical manifestations of holiness life. She embraced the holiness practice of dressing modestly. In fact she modelled her attire on that of Quakers:

when I sought the blessing of cleansing I had no difficulty on the dress question. I always admired the Friends' dress, so this was at once my choice, and at that time many of the Christian sisters among all the colored churches in Philadelphia, New York, and Baltimore, dressed like the Friends, and were generally called Band Sisters, and, as a rule, were noted for their deep piety and Christian character. I loved them for this, as well as admired their very plain dress, for the height of my ambition was to be a consistent, downright, outright Christian.⁵⁰¹

She was also a keen temperance advocate, and joined the Women's Christian Temperance Union in 1875. She was particularly prominent in its Brooklyn chapter, sharing the stage with its president Mary Coffin Johnson at its first anniversary celebration. Smith's own preaching was explicitly revivalist and inspired by holiness. She preached because she 'wanted everybody to get saved right away'. Her earliest preaching opportunity came at Salem, New Jersey, in October 1870 in the AME Church of Frisby J. Cooper. She preached on the text 'Have ye received the Holy Ghost since ye believed?' (Acts 9:2), presumably a holiness sermon, and as a result 'The Lord convicted sinners and backsliders and believers for holiness... A revival broke out, and spread for twenty miles around.'⁵⁰² The itinerant and revivalist character of Smith's

⁵⁰⁰Ibid., pp. 42–3

⁵⁰¹Ibid., pp. 493–4

⁵⁰²Ibid., p. 158

Israel, *Amanda Berry Smith*, pp. 53–4, 59

preaching persisted throughout her career and took her to numerous camp meetings and as far afield as England, Africa, and India.⁵⁰³

Smith's autobiography presents her Holiness faith as one requiring steadfastness in the face of racism and opposition to holiness doctrine. Her account frequently refers to hostility to her holiness. Even upon her first visit to the National Holiness Camp Meeting in 1872 she commented that 'Prejudice against the doctrine was strong.' Frequently she was urged to hold her tongue on the topic.⁵⁰⁴ On one occasion, her friend, Mother Jones, said to her 'Sister Smith, if I were you I would not say anything about sanctification. You see people do not like it, and they persecute you'.⁵⁰⁵ In some cases it is not clear whether this criticism was from white or black people, although it is clear in many cases that Smith experienced opposition to holiness within black church contexts. Certainly the Rev. Nelson Turpin, who was pastor at Smith's Sullivan Street AME Church for a time, 'openly opposed and denounced the doctrine and experience of the blessing of full salvation'. Furthermore, it seems that Turpin's hostility was particularly directed towards holiness women in his congregation, about whom he would say 'They put on a plain bonnet and shawl and wear a long face, but they are sanctified Devils.'⁵⁰⁶ Similarly, Smith referred to a black church uptown, Union Church, in which 'There was not a member in it that believed in the doctrine of holiness; and from that church there had been great criticism in regard to my professing

⁵⁰³Smith, *Autobiography*, p. x

Israel, *Amanda Berry Smith*, pp. 69–91

M. De Jong, 'Smith, Amanda Berry', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anborg.org/articles/08/08-01400.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁵⁰⁴Smith, *Autobiography*, p. 209

⁵⁰⁵*Ibid.*, p. 110

⁵⁰⁶*Ibid.* pp. 109–10

such a blessing.⁵⁰⁷ This presents a more complex image of holiness in African-American Christianity than seems to be presented in official church literature, where there is little overt hostility to holiness.

Smith also frequently expressed her experience of racism in her holiness practice. She told of one occasion when she was forcibly removed to the smoking car by a train conductor while travelling to preach, and she expressed her fear of travelling to a holiness camp meeting in Knoxville because ‘the Kuklux are down there, and they might kill you.’⁵⁰⁸ She was on occasion asked to leave white church services she tried to attend. Yet in spite of the racism she was subjected to, Smith continued to associate with white holiness organisations.

In the face of doctrinal hostility and racism, Smith presented her holiness preaching as a personal quest. It seems clear that her holiness frequently took precedence over any denominational loyalty to the AME Church. However, it is clear that she did not operate in a vacuum and was influenced by the prevalent holiness of the age. Certainly Smith was inspired by some of the most famous holiness women. Phoebe Palmer had a profound impact on Smith, and doubtless influenced her devotion to holiness and her call to preach. Smith’s autobiography refers to a friend of hers, Sister Scott, who told her ‘that years before in Canada, she had got the blessing through Mrs. Dr. Palmer.’⁵⁰⁹ Smith herself regularly attended Palmer’s Tuesday Holiness meetings in New York.⁵¹⁰ She also received congratulations from Frances Willard on the

⁵⁰⁷Ibid., p. 111

⁵⁰⁸Ibid., p. 207

⁵⁰⁹Ibid., p. 81

⁵¹⁰Israel, *Amanda Berry Smith*, p. 49

publication of her autobiography, and she certainly heard Willard speak at a temperance camp meeting in August 1875.⁵¹¹ Smith was not only influenced by white holiness women, but white holiness in general. It is striking that frequently she preferred to associate with white holiness advocates than with her fellow African Methodists. On the day she experienced sanctification, she had consciously bypassed her own Sullivan Street AME Church in order to attend Inskip's Green Street Church. After having attended one of her first camp meetings at Oakington, Maryland, in July 1870, Smith preferred to go on to the Methodist Episcopal Church's camp meeting in Sing Sing, New York, rather than staying in Oakington for the AME Church's first national camp meeting which followed soon after in August.⁵¹² Smith became famous preaching at predominantly white camp meetings, especially those at Ocean Grove, New Jersey, from 1874 onwards. Smith was not unique as an African American attending predominantly white holiness camp meetings. It seems that such meetings actively encouraged African-American participation and often featured services and meetings specifically for African Americans in attendance, and camp meeting organisers expressed an appreciation of African-American religious music. Nevertheless, Smith seems unique in the degree of prominence and fame she was afforded by her preaching at holiness camp-meetings, and the degree to which winning this fame among whites distanced her from her own black denomination.

Julia Foote shared Smith's commitment to holiness. In 1895, she became the first woman ordained deacon in the AME Zion Church, soon followed

⁵¹¹Smith, *Autobiography*, p. 485

⁵¹²Israel, *Amanda Berry Smith*, pp. 51–2

by Mary Small. Foote soon followed Small as the second female elder in the church in 1899. Her autobiography provides ample evidence of her holiness faith. Like Smith, she recounts the moment of entire sanctification as a direct supernatural physical manifestation:

The glory of God seemed almost to prostrate me to the floor. There was, indeed, a weight of glory resting upon me. I sang with all my heart... Glory to the Father! glory to the Son! and glory to the Holy Ghost! who hath plucked me like a brand from the burning. . . perfect love took possession, I lost all fear. I went straight to my mother and told her I was sanctified.⁵¹³

It is perhaps unsurprising that instantaneous, entire sanctification should be presented as an instantaneous moment of connection with the Divine. However, also like Amanda Berry Smith, Julia Foote also recounted her call to preach as inspired by direct and angelic supernatural visitation:

what seemed to be an angel, made his appearance. In his hand was a scroll, on which were these words: 'Thee have I chosen to preach my Gospel without delay.' . . [He] sent the angel again with this message: 'You have I chosen to go in my name and warn the people of their sins.'⁵¹⁴

Foote's autobiography also makes clear the importance of individual testimony as a means of spreading Holiness and as a means of women's self expression on religious matters. Foote recalls that after first giving testimony of her sanctification 'a good many came to me, asking questions about sanctifica-

⁵¹³J.A.J. Foote, *A Brand Plucked from the Fire: An Autobiographical Sketch by Mrs. Julia A.J. Foote* (Cleveland, OH, 1879), pp. 43–4

Andrews, *Sisters of the Spirit*, pp. 186–7

⁵¹⁴Foote, *A Brand Plucked from the Fire*, pp. 66–8
Andrews, *Sisters of the Spirit*, pp. 200–202

tion...the church became much aroused; some plunged into the ocean of perfect love, and came forth testifying'.⁵¹⁵

Belief in entire sanctification was a vital spur for many women preachers, including Foote. Her surviving sermons illustrate that her desire to preach was driven by holiness and it constituted her principal subject matter. Her 'Threshing Sermon' of 1851, included in her autobiography, alludes to holiness. Preaching on Micah 4:13, Foote employed the metaphor of 'the Gospel flail, by which means the devil is threshed out of sinners.' She explicitly tied this to holiness, since its 'strokes are applied in the power and demonstration of the Holy Spirit'.⁵¹⁶ The latter of Foote's two surviving sermons, titled 'Christian Perfection', was published in *The Star of Zion* in 1894. This more mature sermon presents a more explicit, yet also nuanced, holiness emphasis. Foote argues in favour of the doctrine of Christian perfection, particularly emphasising the Pauline perfectionism of her text, Colossians 1:28. In order to legitimise Christian perfection she critiques what she perceived as its abuses. She argued against quasi-antinomian versions of perfectionism which suggested that perfection meant to be beyond the possibility of sin, and against versions of perfectionism which necessitated a withdrawal from the world. She explicitly singled out the Oneida Perfectionists and their practice of complex marriages and Roman Catholics and their practice of monasticism. Implicitly she was also criticising other black women's interpretations of

⁵¹⁵J.A.J. Foote, *A Brand Plucked from the Fire: An Autobiographical Sketch by Mrs. Julia A.J. Foote* (Cleveland, OH, 1879), pp. 53–5

Andrews, *Sisters of the Spirit*, pp. 192–3

⁵¹⁶Foote, *A Brand Plucked from the Fire*, pp. 105–6

Andrews, *Sisters of the Spirit*, p. 223

Collier-Thomas, *Daughters of Thunder*, pp.60–1, 64–5

perfectionism, specifically Rebecca Cox Jackson, who advocated celibacy, and Sojourner Truth's associations with Robert Matthews and the Kingdom of Matthias movement. Through these surviving sermons (and a hymn by Foote entitled 'How to Obtain Sanctification', included in her autobiography), it is clear that holiness advocacy drove Foote's preaching and her public expression of her faith.⁵¹⁷

Although few black women preachers of the late nineteenth century left significant biographical or sermonic material, a third, Harriet Baker, further illustrates the importance of holiness to black women's preaching. Although never ordained, Baker served as an evangelist and preacher in the AME Church from 1874, and in 1889 she was appointed to pastor St Paul's AME Church in Lebanon, Pennsylvania. Much of what is known of Baker is thanks to the contemporary biographical account written by John H. Acornley, which included two of Baker's sermons. Baker was less explicit than Smith or Foote in elucidating her holiness influences. Yet her career and her preaching has much in common with theirs. Bettye Collier-Thomas has argued that Acornley demonstrated Baker's adherence to holiness doctrine when he wrote that she 'firmly believes that she was directed by the Holy Spirit to enter upon her mission IN THIS MANNER AND IN THIS PLACE and wonderfully did the Lord show her the way.'⁵¹⁸ Like Smith and Foote, Baker's descriptions of both her conversion and call to preach were presented as direct, instantaneous,

⁵¹⁷Foote, *A Brand Plucked from the Fire*, pp. 122–4

Andrews, *Sisters of the Spirit*, p. 233–4

Collier-Thomas, *Daughters of Thunder* pp. 57–68

⁵¹⁸J.H. Acornley (ed), *The Colored Lady Evangelist: Being the Life, Labors and Experiences, of Mrs. Harriet Baker* (Brooklyn, 1892), p. 42 (emphasis in original)
Collier-Thomas, *Daughters of Thunder*, p. 72

physical, and supernatural manifestations of Divine inspiration. Just as in Smith and Foote's accounts, in her conversion the power of God physically overpowered her: 'The power of God struck me down. . . [He] taught me by his spirit to read his holy Word, and not only to read it, but to understand it also.' Angelic visitations inspired Foote's call to preach, and foretold Smith's evangelistic mission. So too Baker's call to preach was inspired by a physical manifestation of the Divine:

Mrs. Baker saw, or believed she saw, in this dispensation of Divine providence, the hand of God pointing the way. She fell to the ground as one dead, and when she regained consciousness she heard a voice which seemed to say, 'Go now or you shall die.'⁵¹⁹

Baker interpreted this as her 'Divine commission' to preach. Her sermons do not explicitly speak of holiness or perfection in the fashion of Smith or Foote. However, her sermon titled 'Behold the Man', on the text of John 19:5, makes an argument for the validity of her call to preach. By extension this functioned as an argument for female preaching and for the validity of individual Divinely-inspired preaching vocations. She begins with an allusion to St Paul's call to preach, implicitly comparing it to her own, then went on to emphasise the validity of heavenly authority for preaching over temporal authority, by reminding her audience that in Christ's case, 'when the priests and the scribes demanded his authority for what he did, he put them to shame'. While Baker's holiness was not as overt as that of other prominent female preachers, Bettye Collier-Thomas has identified the influence of holiness doctrine in Baker's advocacy of the importance of the individual preaching

⁵¹⁹Acornley (ed), *The Colored Lady Evangelist*, pp. 36

vocation and the purity of the message over worldly authority.⁵²⁰

Indeed, the common aspects of the influence of holiness doctrine on the famous black female preachers of the late nineteenth century— Smith, Foote, and Baker — all facilitated an individual responsibility for one’s own religion. The supernatural accounts of conversion and calls to preach in the stories of these famous preachers were certainly in part connected to holiness influence. The doctrine of entire sanctification necessitated an instantaneous moment in which the second gift was received. It is understandable, therefore, that this should be presented as a tangible, physical manifestation of the Divine when described in biographies. However, in part these accounts may have been merely a product of the tropes of nineteenth-century (especially women’s) religious autobiography.⁵²¹ Certainly similar accounts were present in earlier autobiographies which predated the holiness movement, like that of the early AME preaching woman Jarena Lee, who experienced conversion ‘as if I were in an ocean of light and bliss’ and who was called to preach by a voice which ‘seemed to say — “Preach the Gospel; I will put words in your mouth”’. Similarly Zilpha Elaw’s autobiography of 1846 describes her conversion as prompted by falling into a trance and her call to preach as prompted by an angelic visitation.⁵²² To whatever degree supernatural accounts of conversion, sanctification, and calling were motivated by holiness doctrine, it is clear that they represented a genuine and profound conviction on the part of these black

⁵²⁰Acornley (ed), *The Colored Lady Evangelist*, pp. 31–3

Collier-Thomas, *Daughters of Thunder*, pp. 69–90

⁵²¹Dodson, *Engendering Church*, pp. 72–3

⁵²²J. Lee, *Religious Experience and Journal of Mrs. Jarena Lee* (Philadelphia, 1849), p. 10
Z. Elaw, *Memoirs of the Life, Religious Experience, Ministerial Travels and Labours of Mrs. Zilpha Elaw, An American Female of Colour* (London, 1846)
Andrews, *Sisters of the Spirit*, pp. 49–160

women that preaching was their spiritual calling. The belief in such calling was of profound importance for black women for whom preaching required a transgression of social practices and temporal religious authorities which agitated against female religious self-expression and which often legislated against women in the pulpit. That black preaching women called upon supernatural manifestations to justify their calling reflects the deep emotional and spiritual convictions which were often prompted by holiness.

Preaching women offer particular insights into the importance of holiness in the religious experience of black women. Their examples do not directly illustrate the importance of holiness in the daily experience of most churchwomen. However, certain insights from the importance of holiness for preaching women can be extrapolated to a wider constituency. The characteristic of holiness doctrine that it personalised the responsibility for one's religious life was not only important for black women who sought to preach. The doctrines of entire sanctification and Christian perfection, in whatever precise permutation they were conceived, made it incumbent on the individual to seek sanctification through prayer and faith, and to live a morally upright life to uphold the standards of Christian perfection. This individual responsibility decentred responsibility and direction from church authorities and hierarchies, thus democratising religious life. For women this shifted some control over religious life from the androcratic church to the female individual. In this light, one central element of holiness practice for black women in their churches was individual testimony. The ability to testify to one's experience of sanctification — to stand and speak in church contexts which frequently silenced women — was a unique contribution of holiness

that allowed women to express and vocalise their religious experience. The importance of individual testimony for women in the Pentecostal and Sanctified tradition has been well understood. It has been highlighted by scholars of women in these traditions including Anthea D. Butler and Cheryl Townsend Gilkes, who argues that ‘For women, testimony can be a form of protest against some of the constraints of being female and a means of lament over the brokenness in their relationships with men.’⁵²³ Although the connections between the later Pentecostal tradition and the earlier holiness movement are readily apparent, few scholars have noted the significant degree to which holiness doctrine afforded ordinary black churchwomen the theological means to testify, or that such testimony afforded these black women a means to interject their religious voice and experience into a masculine liturgy. The powerful influence of holiness in African-American Christianity afforded black women greater control over their religious lives and the voice in which to express it.

4.2 Preaching style and the nature of ministry

Women’s everyday experience of their religion was mediated through the ministry. Many aspects of church life were presided over by the ordained ministry and particularly the pastor of the individual congregation. The nature of the minister determined the character of the church service, liturgy, and preaching black churchwomen experienced on a Sunday as members of a congregation as audience. Pastoral duties beyond the Sunday service, as community organiser, leader, carer, and educator, were all vitally important

⁵²³Gilkes, *If It Wasn ’t For The Women*, p. 137

to women as recipients of pastoral attention and as pastoral charges. However, African-American women were not only passively affected by the character of the ministry. When conceived more broadly than merely the ordained ministry, women themselves were active participants in the ministry. Lay ministries of many kinds offered women the ability to participate in the life, management, organisation, and leadership of their churches and communities. The nature and extent of those lay ministries were determined by the churches' understandings of the nature of ministry, what was desired of ministry, and what its duties were and ought to have been. More rarefied ministries, such as itinerant preaching and even ordained positions, were also subject to the active participation of women. There were certainly black women preachers, a few of whom pastored congregations, and three black women were ordained in the nineteenth century (though one of those ordinations was later revoked). Yet the nature of preaching and pastoring, how they were conceived and understood, and how their requirements were defined, circumscribed the aspirations of women who sought to preach, and discourses on ministry shaped the degree to which women were seen as capable of fulfilling its duties.

The nature of ministry was not stable, but subject to contestation. This partly constituted overt debate. Certainly in African-American Christianity there were debates over the ordination of women, and over the qualifications of the existing male ministry, such as the debate prompted by Booker T. Washington's critique of the level of education of the African-American clergy in the South in 1890.⁵²⁴ However, more pervasive were subtle, gradual

⁵²⁴Washington, 'The Colored Ministry. Its Defects and Needs', *The Christian Union* (14 August 1890)
Harlan (ed.), *The Booker T. Washington Papers, Vol. 3: 1889–95*, pp. 71–5

changes in the practice of ministry, provoked by the dramatic alterations in the structure of churches and denominations, and in society more generally in the late nineteenth century. Scholars including William McGuire King have argued that the late nineteenth century represented a period of reevaluation of ministry in American evangelical Protestantism. King, principally in reference to white Methodism, has argued that this period witnessed a ‘dissatisfaction with older, revivalistic modes of ministerial work’, which were replaced with ‘a new model of ministry, a more inclusive and participatory model.’ According to King’s argument, revivalistic and itinerant ministry was increasingly replaced by a more settled ministry, with increased focus on social and cultural life, rather than merely conversions. Ministry became a ‘service vocation’, and as a result was less the preserve of ordained clergy, but instead was increasingly democratised. The result was an increase in the prevalence and influence of auxiliary ministries, and particularly auxiliary ministry boards. These took an active social role in their church communities and thus, although they were partly a development of earlier benevolent societies, their function was distinct — no longer principally the raising and distribution of funds, but instead active ministry within their local congregations.⁵²⁵

King’s arguments regarding the changes in ministry in white churches must be adapted when we consider black churches. Like their white counterparts, African-American churches did adopt a more pastoral, service-orientated model of ministry in the late nineteenth century, and they developed a more complex system of auxiliary ministries. However, African-American Christian-

⁵²⁵W.M. King, ‘The Role of Auxiliary Ministries in Late Nineteenth-Century Methodism’, in R.R. Richey and K.E. Rowe (eds.), *Rethinking Methodist History: A Bicentennial Historical Consultation* (Nashville, TN, 1985), pp. 167–72

ity also remained comfortable with revivalism and itinerancy. In part, this may have been because the charismatic style inherent in revival harmonised more readily with African-American forms of worship and seemed less of a departure from traditional religion than it did for white Protestants. Revivals bore resemblance to African-American church 'love feast' traditions and to celebrations like the 'Big August Quarterly' of the Spencer Churches. Another explanatory factor may be that revivals in African-American Christianity posed less of a threat to denominational structure and organisation. In white Protestantism the revivalist impulse tended to operate outside the traditional bounds of denominations, often manifesting in trans-denominational camp meetings or in itinerancy which transgressed the boundaries of denominationally-defined districts and circuits. This was especially true when revivalism was mediated through the lens of holiness, since through the creation of independent revivalist organisations, such as the National Camp Meeting for the Promotion of Holiness, the separatist tendency of revivalism was enhanced. In reports of revivals in African-American Christianity it seems that they usually originated within the structure of existing congregations. Certainly some camp meetings were organised at the level of annual conferences and state conventions. The AME Church even organised some national camp meetings. Yet these remained denominationally confined. Some African Americans participated in white-led revivals and camp meetings. This was never on a sufficient scale to provoke anxiety on the part of African-American church leaders regarding revivalism or denominational loyalty.

Throughout the late nineteenth century, African-American Churches expressed grave concerns regarding the deficiencies of their ministries. In

1890, Booker T. Washington asserted that in the South ‘three-fourths of the Baptist ministers and two-thirds of the Methodists are unfit, either mentally or morally, or both, to preach the Gospel to anyone or to attempt to lead any one.’⁵²⁶ Francis Grimké, the noted black Presbyterian minister, writing in *The AME Church Review* expressed similar concerns. He levelled three critiques: that the ministry was insufficiently intelligent, that it was immoral and corrupt, and that it lacked piety. He wrote that ‘there is yet a vast amount of ignorance in many of our pulpits’, and that ‘a large number of unworthy men have found their way into the ministry — unworthy (1) in the sense of being bad in character, immoral; and (2) in the sense of entering it from improper motives.’ He lamented that ‘Men think of [ministry] now only as an *avocation* or means of making an *easy* and *respectable* living.’⁵²⁷ Similar concerns were expressed by Baptists. In 1869, the Virginia Baptist State Convention complained of ‘unprincipled, unscrupulous men, who give no evidence of a fitness or being called of God to the gospel ministry, [who] seek to enter the ministry [by] deception, fraud and trickery’, and again in 1873 of ‘false men, who represent themselves as Baptist Ministers of the Gospel’.⁵²⁸ Rufus Perry,

⁵²⁶Washington, ‘The Colored Ministry. Its Defects and Needs’, *The Christian Union* (14 August 1890)

Harlan (ed.), *The Booker T. Washington Papers, Vol. 3: 1889–95*, pp. 71–5

⁵²⁷Francis J. Grimké, ‘The Defects of our Ministry, and the Remedy’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 3, No. 2 (October 1886), pp. 154–5 (emphasis in original)

H.W. Bowden, ‘Grimké, Francis James’, *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00589.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁵²⁸*Minutes of the Second Annual Session of the Virginia Baptist State Convention, held in Petersburg, Virginia on May 12th, 13th, 14th, 15th and 16th, A.D., 1869 with the Gilfield Baptist Church*, p. 21 (Virginia Baptist Historical Society)
Minutes of the Sixth Annual Session of the Virginia Baptist State Convention held in Alexandria, Va. On May 14th, 15th, 16th and 17th, 1873, together with Constitution and Rules of Order; also, Minutes of the VA. Baptist S.S. Union, p. 11 (Virginia Baptist Historical Society)

the influential leader in the CAMBC, similarly wrote in 1868 of ‘bad men under the garb of preachers, who go around imposing on the ignorance of the people, baptizing them for a fee of five dollars, or performing some other spiritual service by which they can rob them.’⁵²⁹ The General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky similarly expressed regular concerns about unqualified or fraudulent ministers, warning that ‘our churches should be more particular about ordaining illiterate men, and sending them out as pastors, to teach the people, when they are incompetent to teach.’⁵³⁰

These deficiencies in the ministry provided the opportunity for women to contribute valuably instead, particularly through lay preaching and auxiliary ministries. In 1890, the American National Baptist Convention resolved to ‘condemn these exaggerated statements of Prof. Washington...in misrepresenting the attainments and advancement of our ministry’. It is striking that immediately after this resolution in the minutes, it is recorded that female delegates presented a series of speeches with titles including ‘The Intellectual Growth of Baptist Women’, ‘The Need of Women as Missionaries in the Churches’, ‘The Ideal Mother’, and ‘Women’s Work’. The texts of the speeches were not recorded, but the juxtaposition with the condemnation of Booker T. Washington’s critique of black ministers is fascinating, and possibly the speeches may have suggested ‘Women’s Work’ as a valuable supplement

⁵²⁹ *The American Baptist* (26 June 1868)

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 109

⁵³⁰ *Minutes of the Seventh Anniversary of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, held in the York Street Baptist Church, Louisville, Ky. August 11, 12, 13 and 14, 1875* (Shelbyville, KY, 1875), p. 14

Minutes of the Second General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, Held with the Washington Street Baptist Church, Paducah, Ky., August 9th, 10th, 11th, 12th, 13th, 1870 (Louisville, KY, 1870), p. 11

to male ministry.⁵³¹ However, the possibility of female auxiliary ministry supplementing male ministry was conditioned by the ideals and expectations of ministry within their churches and how these were seen as applicable to women.

In light of the recognised problems with many deficient clergy, it is hardly surprising that church journals, primarily directed at clergymen, were replete with articles discussing the requirements of and desirable qualities for pastors and ministers. Several themes can be discerned. The desire for a highly-educated and well-disciplined ministry was repeatedly emphasised. In one article, the Rev. H.T. Johnson wrote that ‘The minister should be a man of broad culture and extensive learning.’⁵³² In a similar vein, Prof. J.M. Maxwell, Principal of Louisville High School, wrote that ‘the minister should have power with men, and that thus power should and must be the outgrowth of knowledge, and under the control of sanctified intelligence.’⁵³³

Many pointed out that education was not the ultimate virtue in ministry, however. Grimké argued that the remedy for the problems he had highlighted was threefold: ‘First, the educational standard of ministerial qualification must be raised... Second, there should be a more conscientious and rigid exercise of discipline on the part of ecclesiastical courts and presiding officers... Third, greater emphasis should be laid upon Christian character.’ Of these three, Grimké prioritised the third: ‘We are concerned more about the heads than the hearts of the men who are to occupy our pulpits. Mere smartness is

⁵³¹ *Journal of the American National Baptist Convention, 1889–91*, pp. 33–4

⁵³² HT. Johnson, ‘An Efficient Ministry’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 1, No. 2 (October 1884), p. 117

⁵³³ J.M. Maxwell, ‘The Greatest Needs of the Minister — What?’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 2, No. 4 (April 1886), p. 443

too often allowed to atone for lack of spirituality, and even more for serious defects of character.’⁵³⁴ Grimké was not alone in arguing for character and piety above education. Prof. H.S. Bennett of Fisk University wrote that ‘It is not the business of the ordinary preacher to trouble himself in regard to Higher Criticism... It is more important that the preacher should be able to reach men than that he should be versed in Higher Criticism.’⁵³⁵ The Rev. W.H. Yeocum outlined six ‘Spiritual Graces’, as the most important ministerial virtues: righteousness, holiness, faith, tenderness, patience and meekness.⁵³⁶

Others emphasised the importance of pastoral and community work over scholarliness and learned preaching. The Rev. William H. Thomas advised that ‘as a pastor... [the minister] is to feed and govern the church. He is to advise, rebuke, comfort and support as occasion requires’.⁵³⁷ In *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review*, the Rev. M.W. Story of Oxford, Pennsylvania, also emphasised pastoral work in an article on the subject in 1891, discussing the pastoral duties of visiting the sick and elderly, training the young, and conducting prayer meetings.⁵³⁸ Similarly, the Rev. Robert E. Wilson of Johnstown, Pennsylvania, wrote that ‘pastoral visits have a most important bearing on our influence and work as ministers.’⁵³⁹ This

⁵³⁴Grimké, ‘The Defects of our Ministry’, pp. 156–7

⁵³⁵H.S. Bennett, ‘The Ministry Demanded by the Age, with Especial Reference to Colored People’, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 3, No. 3 (April 1893) pp. 366–7

⁵³⁶W.H. Yeocum, ‘Spiritual Graces of the Christian Minister’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 2, No. 1 (July 1885), pp. 75–7

⁵³⁷William H. Thomas, ‘The Ministry We Need’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 1, No. 1 (July 1884), p. 64

⁵³⁸M.W. Story, ‘Pastoral Work’, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 1, No. 4 (July 1891) pp. 249–57

⁵³⁹R.E. Wilson, ‘The Work of the Ministry’, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 1, No. 4 (July 1891), p. 271

pastoral emphasis suggests that King's interpretation of later nineteenth-century ministry becoming more orientated towards service may also be applicable to African-American churches. If so, it may provide a partial explanation for the development of women's roles as auxiliaries and preachers during this period.

Some expectations of ministry were seen as incompatible with women, however. In particular, masculine physical strength and hardiness were lauded in African-American Christianity, particularly as it applied to missionary work. In the AME Church, for example, early itinerants like William Paul Quinn who expanded the denomination west of the Alleghenies in the 1820s embodied this masculine ideal.⁵⁴⁰ Quinn's exploits were widely praised in the later nineteenth century, including by Bishops Benjamin Tucker Tanner and Benjamin W. Arnett, and by Henry Highland Garnett.⁵⁴¹ The church's missionary efforts to the South created a new generation of heroic masculine itinerants, like James Lynch and Henry McNeal Turner who provided contemporary relevance and reinforcement of this masculine ideology. Itinerant and missionary preaching was portrayed as all the more masculine due to its hardships. One AME historian, H.T. Kealing, praised itinerants who left 'the cushioned pew and sure salary for the doubtful allurements of hardships, deprivation and misrepresentation'.⁵⁴² Bishop Tanner praised preachers 'of strong muscles, a strength not to be resisted'.⁵⁴³ This hardship was equally true of the Reconstruction era southern missionary field. Fatigue, disease,

⁵⁴⁰Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, pp. 40–41

⁵⁴¹*Ibid.*, p. 40

⁵⁴²*Ibid.*, p. 40

⁵⁴³*Ibid.*, p. 41

and extreme heat plagued the missionaries. With the railroads destroyed by war, they often had to travel long distances on foot. They operated under the continual threat of white violence and initially could not travel beyond the security afforded by the Federal armies.⁵⁴⁴ Though many women, including Amanda Berry Smith, worked as successfully as missionaries and itinerants, the conception of strength and hardiness as a requisite ministerial virtue was frequently cited as an argument against female ministry and preaching. The Rev. James H.A. Johnson, who argued against female ordination at the 1888 AME Church General Conference, made the case against female preaching on those grounds:

[A]s to her physical development, there is quite a conspicuous difference. She is not made for that hard work and rough usage that is to be experienced by man. She evidently is the 'weaker vessel,' and is not made to contend with hurricanes, to climb mountain slopes, to fight wolves and bears, to go through the hardships attending the performance of duty in the Gospel ministry.⁵⁴⁵

In the same vein, an editorial in *The Star of Zion* argued that a woman was

not physically able to pastor a church. She is too timid and fearful to get up at one or two o'clock in the night, unless some man is with her, and go across the city to see the sick or pray with some one ready to die... It would be too hot and dusty in the summer and too cold and slushy in the winter for her to walk ten, fifteen and twenty miles on a circuit in the country to try to preach the gospel.⁵⁴⁶

⁵⁴⁴Montgomery, *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree*, pp. 65–66

H.R. Revels, 'Letter from Vicksburg', *The Christian Recorder* (7 October 1865), p. 1

'Our Work in the South', *The Christian Recorder* (16 December 1886), p. 2

⁵⁴⁵James H.A. Johnson, 'Female Preachers', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 1, No. 2 (October 1884), p. 102

⁵⁴⁶'Don't Need Women Elders', *The Star of Zion* (11 August 1898), p. 4
Jones, *All Bound Up Together*, pp. 192–3

These arguments were even extrapolated beyond missionary and itinerant ministry to mandate physical strength even for rooted, static pastorates.⁵⁴⁷

Closely related to the view of physical strength as necessary for ministry were the ideals associated with preaching style. Perhaps the greatest historical description of the African-American preaching style was in James Weldon Johnson's preface to his *God's Trombones*:

The old-time Negro preacher of parts was above all an orator, and in good measure an actor. He knew the secret of oratory, that at bottom it is a progression of rhythmic words more than it is anything else. Indeed, I have witnessed congregations moved to ecstasy by the rhythmic intoning of sheer incoherencies. He was a master of all the modes of eloquence. He often possessed a voice that was a marvelous instrument, a voice he could modulate from a sepulchral whisper to a crashing thunder clap. His discourse was generally kept at a high pitch of fervency, but occasionally he dropped into colloquialisms and, less often, into humor. He preached a personal and anthropomorphic God, a sure-enough heaven and a red-hot hell. His imagination was bold and unfettered. He had the power to sweep his hearers before him; and so himself was often swept away. At such times his language was not prose but poetry.⁵⁴⁸

Much of the distinctiveness of black preaching has become well understood as manifested in the twentieth century. It is important to attempt to understand in what form these features existed, developed, and changed in the postbellum nineteenth century and what their implications were for the predominantly female lay congregations. Several discourses on preaching style featured in church journals in the late nineteenth century. The Rev. F.J. Cooper of Newport, Rhode Island, urged that the minister 'should know how to preach, sing and pray', that 'The manner [of preaching] should be with all

⁵⁴⁷Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, pp.40-1

⁵⁴⁸J.W. Johnson, *God's Trombones: Seven Negro Sermons in Verse* (New York, 1927), p. 5

kindness, tenderness, yet pointed and *positive*', and should avoid '*cold, ice-bound ritualistic formalism*'. Rather preaching should adopt a 'a simple, yet profound conversational manner, avoiding as far as possible superfluous loftiness'.⁵⁴⁹ In an article on 'Voice Culture', the Rev. D.H. McKee of Pittsburg warned that 'Some ministers fail entirely and others fail in part, because they have defective voices. Some voices are strong and of good quality, but are poor in articulation.' In contrast to such ministers, 'The preacher who can present the Gospel in choice language, musical tones, and in a graceful manner... will ever have the advantage... Those words which are spirit and life should be conveyed to the people by a voice as rich as the preacher is able to acquire.'⁵⁵⁰ The Kentucky Baptist leader William H. Butler similarly encouraged simplicity and clarity in preaching: 'preach earnestly, zealously, faithfully, practically... Preach plainly, yet intelligently.'⁵⁵¹ Similar advice was offered by George W. Williams while discussing the preaching of Duke William Anderson: 'If there is one quality more than another that the minister needs, it downright earnestness — perfect sympathy with those to whom he preaches.'⁵⁵² While some commentators focused on the sonorous quality of the preaching, others clearly prioritised a genuine connection and engagement with the congregation.

Theophilus Gould Steward was particularly noted for his preaching abilities,

⁵⁴⁹F.J.Cooper, 'The Best Method of Preaching for The Times', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 1, No. 4 (April 1885), pp. 383–5 (emphasis in original)

⁵⁵⁰D.H.McKee, 'Voice Culture', *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 1, No. 4 (July 1891), pp. 265–6

⁵⁵¹*Minutes of the Fifth Anniversary of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, held with the High Street Baptist Church at Paris, Ky., August 13–16, 1873* (Louisville, KY, 1873), pp. 31–3

⁵⁵²G.W. Williams, *History of the Negro Race in America from 1619 to 1880: Negroes as Slaves, as Soldiers, and as Citizens*, Vol. 2. (New York, 1885), p. 488

and indeed was praised by the noted educator and writer Josephine Turpin Washington:

For a race which, as is conceded, has special aptitude for vocalization, we are strangely lacking in a good pulpit delivery. It is a rare thing to find a preacher (and the fault obtains in other speakers) who does not either rant and rend the air, or chant his discourse with singing intonation. It will be a great thing if you can awaken in the men who listen to you a desire to follow your example of acquiring a good voice and an attractive pulpit manner.⁵⁵³

Conscious reflection on the style of preaching, it seemed, discouraged an absent-minded lapse into formalism, but rather encouraged accessibility, conversationalism, musicality, and engaging rhetorical style. In this regard, it seems that preaching in African-American Christianity was reflecting greater ministerial engagement with congregations, and a more conscious engagement with the laity, and hence with the majority of African-American churchwomen.⁵⁵⁴

The desire for a powerful style in preaching was also used as an argument against female preachers and speakers, however. One such instance occurred when at the Zion Church's Centennial Jubilee, Keziah P. McKoy Hood, wife of Bishop James Walker Hood, served as presiding officer. According to *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review*, 'It was feared that she would be timid and subject to "stage fright" as most women are when first called upon to preside. But taking her cue from Miss Eliza Gardner she seized the gavel

⁵⁵³Letter from Josephine T. Washington to T.G.Steward, 8 July 1923, Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, Sc Micro R-5910 (Theophilus Gould Steward Papers), box 1, fo. 1

⁵⁵⁴J.M. Spencer, *Protest & Praise: Sacred Music of Black Religion* (Minneapolis, MN, 1990), pp. 225–43
Gilkes, *If It Wasn't for the Women*, pp. 129–35

and appeared as much at home as Bishop Hood himself.’⁵⁵⁵ In reality many surviving reports of female preaching are full of praise. The development of preaching and the move away from elitist formal styles towards greater accessibility can only have helped integrate female preaching into the broader landscape of African-American sermonising.

4.3 Slave survivals and southern peculiarity

Expectations in preaching did not only have gendered implications, but sectional ones too. As northern black missionaries moved south during and after the Civil War, they were often perturbed by the heightened emotionalism of southern preaching. Henry McNeal Turner wrote of the enthusiasm of one southern preacher whose emphasis on ‘Hell fire, brimstone, damnation, black smoke, hot lead, &c.’ represented ‘a much cruder conception of God and the plan of salvation’.⁵⁵⁶ Similarly, an article in *The AME Church Review* described an emotional sermon:

Logic has thrown open its buckler of cold steel, and Feeling is exposed to assault... [the preacher] closes the Bible, his tones become fuller, charged with the intensity of deep emotion... The elevated voice drops the rising and falling of ordinary forensic discourse, and glides down by intervals of the scale. He plays on the border-land of speech and song.⁵⁵⁷

The distinctive emotionalism and ‘cruder’ character of southern preaching represented a source of tension within churches which found their de facto

⁵⁵⁵‘Our Women’, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 7, No. 1 (April 1897), pp. 58–9

⁵⁵⁶H.M. Turner, ‘Army Correspondence’, *The Christian Recorder* (1 July 1865), p. 2

⁵⁵⁷H.T. Kealing, ‘The Colored Ministers of the South — Their Preaching and Peculiarities’, *The AME Church Review* Vol 1., No. 2 (October 1884), p. 142

centres in the postbellum South but their historical, *de jure* centres in the North; which found the bulk of their lay memberships intellectually and physically distanced from their bishops and elite clergy. Yet preaching style was only the tip of the iceberg in that regard.

Some distinctive features of slave Christianity have now been lost. Many others persist, having been merged with conventional Methodist and Baptist worship in the earliest black churches, and reinforced during the antebellum period and in the immediate wake of emancipation. During the postbellum nineteenth century these slave survivals provoked tension between southern congregations and mostly northern church leaders, and consequently, to some extent, between laity and clergy. Since to a great extent female power in late nineteenth-century African-American Christianity was vested in the laity, understanding religious slave survivals helps to explain female experience.

One distinctive slave survival was the 'ring shout' or 'circle shout'. Several accounts of ring shouts survive from the mid and late nineteenth century. A description of one on St Helena Island, South Carolina, by Laura M. Downes, a missionary teacher, described it as 'a savage, heathenish dance'. Another, also on St Helena Island was described by William Francis Allen in 1867; a third in 1866 in Yorktown, Virginia, by Margaret Newbold Thorpe, a missionary teacher; and a fourth at the close of the Civil War by Methodist minister, the Rev. John Paris.⁵⁵⁸ The most illustrative account of a ring shout, which set it in relation to organised black Christianity, was one witnessed and described by Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne in Baltimore in 1868:

After the sermon they formed a ring, and, with coats off, sang, clapped

⁵⁵⁸Spencer, *Protest & Praise*, pp. 143–5

their hands, and stamped their feet in a most ridiculous and heathenish way... I then went and taking their leader by the arm, requested him to desist and to sit down and sing in a rational manner. I also told him that it was a heathenish way to worship, disgraceful to themselves, to the race, and to the Christian name... After the sermon in the afternoon, when I had another opportunity to speak privately to the leader of the band, he replied, 'Sinners won't get converted unless there is a ring.' Said I: 'You might sing till you fell down dead and you would fail to convert a single sinner, because nothing but the Spirit of God and the word of God can convert sinners.' He replied: 'The Spirit of God works upon people in different ways. At camp meetings there must be a ring here, a ring there, a ring over yonder, or sinners will not get converted.' This was his idea, as it was also that of many others... I have been strongly censured because of my effort to change the mode of worship, or modify the extravagances indulged in by the people.⁵⁵⁹

The survival of ring shouts provoked tension between traditional practices among freed people and the more formal expectations of worship among clerical elites. The resistance Payne experienced was a manifestation of both sectional tension within African-American Christianity and an expression of lay resistance to clerical authority.⁵⁶⁰

Other practices which may be less directly associated with slave Christianity were 'call and response', and the closely associated practice of informal congregant participation in preaching through vocalised interventions and assents, which would have been alien to white Christianity. Bishop Othal Hawthorne Lakey, historian of the CME Church, employs the term 'shouting' to connote the practice. It was described by Du Bois in *The Souls of Black*

⁵⁵⁹Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 126–7

Payne, *Recollections*, pp. 255–6

A.J. Raboteau, *Slave Religion: The "Invisible Institution" in the Antebellum South* (New York, 2004 updated edition), pp. 68–80

Mitchell, *Black Church Beginnings*, pp. 8–10

Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, pp. 13–14

⁵⁶⁰Raboteau, *Slave Religion*, pp. 66–75

Folk:

The black and massive form of the preacher swayed and quivered as the words crowded to his lips and flew at us in singular eloquence. The people moaned and fluttered, and then the gaunt-cheeked brown woman beside me suddenly leaped straight into the air and shrieked like a lost soul, while round about came wail and groan and outcry, and a scene of human passion such as I had never conceived before.⁵⁶¹

This practice persists in some African-American churches, but in the late nineteenth century it provoked tension between clergy and laity. In 1901, the Rev. Walter H. Brooks was defeated in an election for the pastorate of the First African Baptist Church of Richmond, mostly due to the votes of the female members of the church. One such women, Margaret Hewlett reported that she voted against Brooks because ‘he wouldn’t let the sisters give vent to their feelings. He would stop in his sermons and wait for order.’⁵⁶² Such rejections of prestigious, but overly formal pastors by lay members were not unprecedented. Indeed, Daniel Alexander Payne was rejected by the congregation of Ebenezer AME Church in Baltimore in 1850. One of the stewards explained to Payne that ‘They believe you are a Christian gentleman, but they say you have too fine a carpet on your floor. You are too proud. If a member asked you to take tea with him, you would not. Also you refuse to let them sing their spiritual songs.’⁵⁶³

One of the unorthodox church practices which most directly involved women was the role of the ‘church mother’. One of the most senior women in the congregation, she was usually the widow of a pastor, a bishop, or a

⁵⁶¹Du Bois, *The Souls of Black Folk*, p. 190

⁵⁶²Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, pp. 108–9

⁵⁶³Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. iv
Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, pp. 83–4

deacon. The church mother was seen as a spiritual and moral leader alongside the pastor in what Cheryl Townsend Gilkes has called ‘the dual-sex politics of black churches.’ Hers was often the only seat in the church formally reserved. She often played a role in stage-managing worship, and often had an unofficial veto power in decisions in her church. Church mothers were extremely influential, including in the selection of pastors. They were the central voice of lay authority alongside the clerical authority of the pastor. Church mothers existed in all major denominational families of black Christianity. They were most prevalent in the sanctified traditions (Pentecostal, Holiness, Apostolic), but were also found in Methodist, Baptist, and Congregational churches.⁵⁶⁴ Among the church mothers recorded in the early history of the AME Church were Mother Shepherd and Mother Duncan of Mother Bethel Church in Philadelphia.⁵⁶⁵ Several influential church mothers have been noted in the nineteenth-century history of the Spencer Churches, including Mother Ferreby Draper and Mother Lydia Hall.⁵⁶⁶ Mother Lizzie Robinson was the first ‘General Mother’ in the Church of God in Christ and among her most influential successors was Mother Anne L. Bailey, the wife of Bishop John Seth Bailey, who also served as International Supervisor of Women of

⁵⁶⁴A.D. Butler, ‘Church Mothers and Migration in the Church of God in Christ’, in B.B. Schweiger and D.G. Matthews (eds.), *Religion in the American South: Protestants and Others in History and Culture* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2004), pp. 195–218

Gilkes, *If It Wasn’t for the Women*, pp. 61–75, 103–4

Butler, *Women in the Church of God in Christ*, pp. 43–54

Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 77

Lincoln and Mamiya, *The Black Church in the African American Experience*, p. 275

Lahey and Stephens, *God In My Mama’s House*, pp. 19–25

⁵⁶⁵Dodson, *Engendering Church*, p. 13

⁵⁶⁶Baldwin, ‘Black Women and African Union Methodism’, pp. 227–8

Baldwin, *“Invisible” Strands in African Methodism*, pp. 62–3

the Churches of God in Christ.⁵⁶⁷ The records of the First Congregational Church in Atlanta also show the importance of church mothers among black Congregationalists, as they note that ““Key Mothers” were selected from the more populous sections [of Georgia] to come to the city.”⁵⁶⁸ The presence of church mothers was not always welcomed, however, as Rufus Perry of the CAMBC, complained:

In addition to the vices and irregularities inseparably attendant upon the state of slavery, there have been the ‘church mothers,’ ‘gospel mothers,’ and ‘old sheppards,’ officials quite outside of the New Testament arrangement, but who nevertheless claim to be under the special influence of the Spirit, and exercise an authority, greater, in many cases, than that of ministers.⁵⁶⁹

Even at this early stage, shortly after the Civil War, the presence of church mothers was a distinguishing sectional difference even within the comparatively diverse polity of black Baptists, and one which provoked class and sectional tensions.

⁵⁶⁷‘Obituary, Written by Mother Bailey and submitted by the family’, Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, Sc MG 325 (DuPree African-American Pentecostal and Holiness Collection, 1876–1989), box 5, fo. 8

‘Mother Anne C. Bailey’, Schomburg Center, Sc MG 325, box 5, fo. 8

‘We salute the grand women of the Church of God in Christ’, Schomburg Center, Sc MG 325, box 5, fo. 8

‘Itinerary of Women’s Conventions in New Jersey’, Schomburg Center, Sc MG 325, box 5, fo. 8

‘Main Objective of the N.J. Women’s Convention’, Schomburg Center, Sc MG 325, box 5, fo. 8

‘Excerpt from Mother Anne L. Bailey’s letter to her beloved missionaries’, Schomburg Center, Sc MG 325, box 5, fo. 8

‘Historical sketch of the Women’s Convention of the Churches of God in Christ’, Schomburg Center, Sc MG 325, box 5, fo. 8

Butler, *Women in the Church of God in Christ*, pp. 43–54

⁵⁶⁸‘The First Congregational Church of Atlanta’, Robert W. Woodruff Library, Atlanta University Center, First Congregational Church of Atlanta, United Church of Christ Collection, 1867–1999, box 1, fo. 2

⁵⁶⁹*The American Baptist* (26 June 1868)

Washington, *Frustrated Fellowship*, p. 109

Slave survivals in late nineteenth-century African-American Christianity were not innocuous historical novelties, but sources of class, sectional, and gendered tensions which ultimately empowered the laity; poorer church members, particularly in the South; and women. They were straws of resistance and expression in a time in which there was an increasing pressure from the older northern denominations to formalise worship.

4.4 The role of ministers' wives

Perhaps the only figure in African-American congregations whose influence was comparable to that of the church mother was the minister or pastor's wife. An account of the wife of the nineteenth-century Baptist minister Duke William Anderson's wife in George W. Williams's *History of the Negro Race in America* provides some insight into the desirable traits sought and expected in nineteenth-century ministers' wives:

His wife was in every sense a pastor's wife. She bore for him the largest sympathy in his work; and cheered him with her prayers and presence in every good cause. She was intelligent and pious, loved by the church, honored by society. She found pleasure in visiting the sick, helping the poor, comforting the sorrowful, and in instructing the erring in ways of peace.

It is almost impossible to compute the value of a pastor's wife who appreciates the work of saving souls. If she is a good woman her influence is unbounded. Every person loves her, every person looks up to her. There are so many little things that she can do, if not beyond the province of the pastor, often out of the range of his influence. Mrs. Anderson was all that could be hoped for as a pastor's wife. She was of medium size, in complexion light, rather reserved in her manners, affable in address, very sensitive in her physical and mental constitution. Much of Anderson's service in Detroit must go to the account of his sainted wife. And it may not be irrelevant to remark that every minister of Christ's influence and success is perceptibly modified by his wife —

much depends upon her!⁵⁷⁰

William's description captures much of the role of the pastor's wife. Within her church she often had numerous organisational and leadership roles. She was usually responsible for the maintenance of the church property, for stage managing worship, and for chairing church committees in the pastor's absence. She served on boards of stewardesses or deaconesses or else supervised them, directed them, and coordinated with them. Bishops' wives also often undertook some of the secretarial tasks associated with episcopal administration and helped organise their husbands' circuits of their episcopal districts. As Glenda Gilmore wrote of Sarah Dudley Pettey, the wife of Bishop Charles Calvin Pettey of the AME Zion Church, who undertook such episcopal management tasks, she 'had to employ the organization of a field marshal.'⁵⁷¹ Within her own congregation she shared in the temporal authority of her husband. Yet as Williams suggests, often her remit was more subtle and transcended that of the pastor. Her responsibilities encompassed realms of congregational life which the pastor could not influence. Pastors' wives had particular responsibilities for the welfare of women and children in the congregation, which they discharged by directly acting as spiritual and moral counsellors, by acting as virtuous exemplars to those segments of the congregation, and by acting as a special guardian of their temporal needs as communicants. They also often shared in the pastors' work in caring for the sick in the community, the caring role having particular resonance with nineteenth-century conceptions of female virtues. The subtle influence of the pastor's wife on her husband and

⁵⁷⁰G.W. Williams, *History of the Negro Race*, Vol. 2., p. 496

⁵⁷¹Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, p. 17

those around her was captured by Sarah Dudley Pettey's women's column for *The Star of Zion* in an obituary of her friend Katie Walters, the wife of Bishop Alexander Walters. Of her she wrote that

She was an ideal preacher's wife, never murmuring or complaining, but always cheerfully accepting her portion as a true helpmate. . . She was a great and a good woman, wielding a power of unbounded influence wherever she trod. . . The impressions of Mrs. Walters upon her young husband had much to do with shaping his life and character and preparing him for future usefulness.⁵⁷²

Pastors' wives' influence often extended beyond the individual church and congregation, however. The leaders of local, regional, state, and national women's denominational organisations, associations, and conventions were often the wives of leading ministers and bishops. This was the case in the Baptist women's conventions of Kentucky and Alabama, founded in the 1880s. All of the first four presidents of the Baptist Women's State Convention of Alabama were wives of important ministers in the state. The third president, Amanda Tyler, was married to the Rev. Manfield Tyler, the chairman of the board of trustees of Selma University, and Eliza Pollard, the fourth president, was married to the Rev. Robert T. Pollard, who was the university's fourth president. Other senior members of the Alabama women's convention who were married to leading ministers included Mrs. A.A. Bowie, and the wives of Charles Dinkins, Edward M. Brawley, and Charles Purce.⁵⁷³ Similarly, leading women of the Kentucky women's convention, Lavinia B. Sneed and Mary V. Cook — both teachers at the Louisville State University — married

⁵⁷²S.D. Pettey, 'Woman's Column', *The Star of Zion* (24 December 1896), p. 2

⁵⁷³A.W. Pegues, *Our Baptist Ministers and Schools* (Springfield, MA, 1892), p. 398–404
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 62–3

fellow professors at the university and leading Baptist ministers, Charles Sneed and Charles H. Parrish, respectively.⁵⁷⁴

Many ministers' wives were also prolific writers. Frequently when black churches established newspapers and journals, whether at the national or state level, women were required as columnists and as departmental or section editors, especially for women's, children's, and family columns. In such cases, the editors most frequently turned to the wives of prominent ministers or bishops. Sarah Dudley Pettey wrote a bimonthly 'woman's column' for *The Star of Zion* from August 1896, and was also the treasurer of the Women's Home and Foreign Missionary Society of the AME Zion Church.⁵⁷⁵ A women's column for *The Christian Recorder* was written by Fannie Jackson Coppin (under the pen name Catherine Casey), the wife of Levi Jenkins Coppin. He was a minister who pastored Mother Bethel AME Church in Philadelphia, the mother church of the denomination, between 1879 and 1881 and again between 1896 and 1900.⁵⁷⁶ He was later elected a bishop of the church in 1900.⁵⁷⁷ Many of the leading black Baptist women of Kentucky, including

⁵⁷⁴Ibid.

On the careers of these women, see section 5.7

⁵⁷⁵D.W. Parker, 'Mrs. Bishop C.C. Pettey', *The Star of Zion* (23 July 1896), p. 1
M.A. Majors, *Noted Negro Women: Their Triumphs and Activities* (Chicago, 1893), pp. 57–64

Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion*, pp. 580–1

Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, pp. 16–7

⁵⁷⁶'A Brief History of Mother Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church'
[<http://www.motherbethel.org/content.php?cid=18>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁵⁷⁷'Woman's Department, Contributed by Catherine Casey', *The Christian Recorder* (18 July 1878), p. 3

'Woman's Department, Contributed by Catherine Casey', *The Christian Recorder* (25 July 1878), p. 3

Mother Bethel AME Church Archives, fo. 2008.587 'Bishops' Wives — Coppin, Fannie J.'

F. Jackson-Coppin, *Reminiscences on School Life, and Hints on Teaching* (Philadelphia, 1913), pp. 9–38

Mary V. Cook and Lavinia B. Sneed, who were ministers' wives, also wrote for *The American Baptist* and *Our Women and Children*, the newspapers of the Kentucky black Baptist convention, edited by William J. Simmons.⁵⁷⁸

Ministers' wives were also often teachers and professors. Fanny Jackson-Coppin was the second black woman to receive an A.B. degree, graduating from Oberlin in 1865, as well as the first ever student-teacher in its preparatory department. In September 1865 she became a teacher at the pioneering Institute for Colored Youth in Philadelphia. In 1869, she was promoted and made principal of the institute, the first black woman to serve in such a capacity at an institution of higher education. She continued as principal until failing health forced her retirement in 1902. She even continued at the institute after she married in 1881, remaining in Philadelphia while her husband was assigned a pastorate in Baltimore.⁵⁷⁹ Sarah Dudley Pettey was also a noted teacher. A graduate of the State Normal School of North Carolina, and Scotia Seminary, she was an assistant grade school principal for six years followed by two years as an assistant professor in the County Teachers' Normal Institute.⁵⁸⁰ Mary V. Cook and Lucia B. Sneed of Kentucky were both professors at the Louisville State University and were married to ministers who were fellow professors there.

Williams, *History of the Negro Race*, pp. 448–9

Majors, *Noted Negro Women*, pp. 170–5

L.M. Perkins, 'Heed Life's Demands: The Educational Philosophy of Fanny Jackson Coppin', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3 (Summer 1982), pp. 184–5

L.M. Perkins, 'Coppin, Fanny Jackson', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00202.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁵⁷⁸Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 367–74, 413–5

⁵⁷⁹Perkins, 'Heed Life's Demands', pp. 186–7

⁵⁸⁰Parker, 'Mrs. Bishop C.C. Pettey', p. 1

Majors, *Noted Negro Women*, pp. 57–64

Ministerial marriages also served a political function. The ideal minister's wife was supposed to serve as an exemplar and a moral model to her husbands' pastoral charges. So too their marriage was supposed to be an exemplar, a virtuous model of industrious, devoted, faithful, pious Christian family life. This ideal was not only to be projected to the church congregation, but also outwards towards society at large and particularly towards white society. The virtues of ministers' wives, of the ideal help-meet — piety, humility, industry, charity, humility — were all idealised in order that black ministerial marriages might prove to be beacons which would challenge and undermine white racist characterisations of black marriages as immoral, and of black family life as degenerate.⁵⁸¹

It is important to recognise, however, that while marriage to a minister was often empowering for women within their communities and church congregations, marriage was also often constraining for women's ambitions. Many school districts prohibited married women from teaching. This was the case in Washington, DC, and in the case of Mary Church Terrell, it forced her to retire from her teaching position at the M Street Colored High School in 1891 when she married Robert Terrell.⁵⁸² The autonomy and independence afforded to a prominent minister's wife may have allowed Fannie Jackson Coppin to continue in Philadelphia running the Institute for Colored Youth while her husband pastored elsewhere. However, it seems that while many

⁵⁸¹Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, pp. 17–8

⁵⁸²B.W. Jones, 'Mary Church Terrell and the National Association of Colored Women, 1896 to 1901', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 67, No. 1 (Spring 1982), pp. 20–33
D.B. Fradin and J.B. Fradin, *Fight On! Mary Church Terrell's Battle for Integration* (New York, 2003), pp. 53–6
C. Neverdon-Morton, 'Terrell, Mary Eliza Church', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00686.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

prominent ministers' wives were also teachers, there may have been no causal relationship between the two, since women like Fannie Jackson Coppin, Sarah Dudley Pettey, Mary V. Cook, and Lavinia B. Sneed all had highly successful teaching careers before their marriages to ministers. There is also ample evidence of influential and successful female religious and educational leaders who were not the wives of ministers or bishops, or who were not married at all. Nannie Helen Burroughs, the longstanding corresponding secretary of the WC-NBC and principal of the National Training School for Women and Girls in Washington, DC, never married. Although Anna Julia Cooper did marry a clergyman, her husband, George Cooper, died only two years after they wed, and she outlived him by 81 years without remarrying. Yet this did not hinder her, and in fact several scholars have argued that had her husband lived, it would have hindered her teaching career, in a similar manner to the career of Mary Church Terrell.⁵⁸³ Ministers' wives filled important roles in their churches, and many women gained a great deal of cachet and influence due to their marriages to leading ministers and bishops. However, it is also clear that for many dynamic, intelligent African-American women in the late nineteenth century, marriage to a minister was not a prerequisite for success.

⁵⁸³M.S. Giles, 'Special Focus: Dr. Anna Julia Cooper, 1858–1964: Teacher, Scholar, and Timeless Womanist' *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 75, No. 4 (Fall 2006), p. 624

4.5 Music and hymnody

One of the most distinctive features of African-American worship is, and was in the nineteenth century, its music. As Bishop Othal Hawthorne Lakey and Betty Beene Stephens have argued, ‘There is no question that the singing so inimical to African-American life would scarcely be what it was, and indeed is, were it not for the melodious soprano, alto, and contralto of black women who gave tune to melody, soul to lyric, wing to song, and heart to harmony.’⁵⁸⁴ For the vast majority of women in African-American congregations, confined to their pews (at least during services), music and hymns were a vital means of distinctive religious expression. That church music was a means of lay expression and power is evident in Bishop R.R. Wright’s account of the origins of choral singing in the AME Church. Wright explained that the earliest choirs were formed spontaneously within congregations when the best singers would sit together forming an informal choral section.⁵⁸⁵ Later these were formalised and set apart by the pastors. The spontaneity and autonomy with which choirs formed demonstrates the potency of church music for the expression of the religious sentiments of the laity. Yet, as with many such expressions, the formation of choirs initially provoked hostility and resistance, as Bishop Payne reported, in his description of one of the earliest AME choirs, organised at Mother Bethel, in 1841:

It gave great offense to the older members, especially those who had professed personal sanctification... Similar excitements and irritations,

⁵⁸⁴Lakey and Stephens, *God In My Mama’s House*, p. 74

⁵⁸⁵R.R. Wright, *The Encyclopaedia of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1947), p. 352
Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, pp. 8–9

resulting in withdrawals and small splits, followed the introduction of choral singing in the majority of our Churches — not in the cities only, but in the large towns and villages also. Rev. Elisha Weaver, stationed in Chicago, was impeached in 1857 by his Board for introducing vocal and instrumental music into his Church, and at the Annual Conference of that year an animated discussion followed, relative to a resolution declaring instrumental music detrimental to the spiritual interests of the Church. But now it is the aim of every Church in the Connection to have a good choir.⁵⁸⁶

In part the hostility may have been related to a general hostility to change, in part due to resistance to an autonomous laity, and in part due to a suspicion of overt expressiveness and enthusiasm in worship lest it tarnish the image of the church in the eyes of respectable white Methodist patrons. Similar tensions were provoked by the introduction of instrumental music in the AME Church in 1848.⁵⁸⁷

A particularly valuable body of sources for the historian of black church music is the various hymn books published and used by African-American churches. Both the principal historians of the AME Zion and CME Churches have emphasised that the hymnodic traditions of their denominations represent unique fusions of slave music and spirituals with the Wesleyan tradition of Methodist hymns.⁵⁸⁸ However, in reality almost all hymn books used by African-American denominations in the nineteenth century were very close adaptations of the hymn books of the equivalent white denominations with little added or amended that referred to a distinctly African-American musical tradition.

⁵⁸⁶Payne, *Recollections*, pp. 233–5

Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, p. 9

⁵⁸⁷Payne, *Recollections*, pp. 235–6

⁵⁸⁸Walls, *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church*, pp. 116–17

Lahey and Stephens, *God In My Mama's House*, pp. 71–2

All of the earliest hymn books of the AME Zion Church were modelled on the hymn books of the Methodist Episcopal Church. Its inaugural hymn book in 1839, its successor of 1858, and the reprint of the 1858 volume in 1869 were all essentially abridgements of the MEC hymnal. The 1872 hymn book, too, was merely an adaptation of the equivalent white Methodist volume. It was not until 1892 that the AME Zion Church published a hymn book containing material that significantly diverged from that found in the MEC hymn books. It was still mainly based on the MEC hymn book of 1849 but added sixty-six new hymns, of which thirty-seven were popular gospel hymns and twenty-nine were original hymns by AME Zion ministers.⁵⁸⁹

After its founding in 1870, the CME Church used the hymn book of the Methodist Episcopal Church, South. It produced only one hymn book of its own during the nineteenth century, in 1891, which was a very close adaptation of the 1889 MECS hymn book. Without a truly national convention prior to 1895, most black Baptist congregations used the hymnals produced by white Baptist organisations. From 1897, the National Baptist Publishing Board began publishing song books on behalf of the National Baptist Convention. R.H. Boyd, the president of the Publishing Board, and later the leader of the Unincorporated Convention, reported in 1904 that 'We are now making fourteen song books of our own. These are all printed and bound by us. A number of them are edited by the best Negro Baptist composers of music'.⁵⁹⁰

⁵⁸⁹ Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, pp. 25–30

⁵⁹⁰ *Journal of the Twenty-fourth Annual Session of the National Baptist Convention, held with the Ebenezer Third Baptist Church, Austin, Texas. September 14th–19th, 1904* (Nashville, TN, 1904), pp. 109–10
 Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, p. 79
 Z.G. Glass, 'Boyd, Richard Henry', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00164.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

The first full hymnal for the National Baptist Convention was *The National Baptist Hymnal*, published in 1903, but it was largely based on the hymn book of the white American Baptist Publication Society, *The Baptist Hymnal* of 1883. It is likely that the 1883 hymnal was the one used by most black Baptists up to 1903, anyway. *The National Baptist Hymn Book* of 1905 was a revision of the 1903 volume, featuring 622 of the 704 hymns from 1903 with a supplement of ten new additions. However, it was still mostly based on the white Baptist hymnal. Indeed, throughout the nineteenth century and the first decade of the twentieth, few of the official hymnals in use in African-American churches contained much distinctive African-American content.⁵⁹¹

The exception, and the church which had at least a partially distinct hymnodic tradition in the nineteenth century was the AME Church. The earliest hymn book produced for the AME Church was Richard Allen's *A Collection of Spiritual Songs and Hymns, Selected from Various Authors*. It featured fifty-four hymns, and as its title implied, many of these were drawn from the African-American spiritual tradition. Eileen Southern, who pioneered the historical study of Allen's hymn book, noted that it was remarkable in that in addition to many hymns drawn from the standard Methodist corpus of the time, it included several hymns drawn from oral tradition, as well as one by Allen himself. It also pioneered the 'wandering chorus', free-standing choruses that could be attached to several other separate hymns.⁵⁹² A second AME hymn book was published in 1818 which drew

⁵⁹¹Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, pp. 74–83

⁵⁹²E. Southern (ed.), *Readings in Black American Music* (New York, 1971), pp. 52–61

E. Southern, 'Hymnals of the Black church', *Journal of the Interdenominational Theological Center* Vol. 14, No. 1–2 (Fall–Spring 1986–1987), pp. 127–140

K.L. Waters, Sr., 'Liturgy, Spirituality, and Polemic in the Hymnody of Richard Allen',

heavily on the 1807 *Methodist Pocket Hymn-Book*. Of the 314 hymns in the 1818 volume, 244 were drawn from the white *Methodist Pocket Hymn-Book*, and eighteen were preserved from Allen's 1801 volume. The 1818 hymn book was further revised in 1837. However, the seminal hymnal of the AME Church in the nineteenth century was the 1876 *Hymn Book of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, compiled by Henry McNeal Turner. Turner's hymn book was largely Wesleyan, almost half of its hymns having been written by members of the Wesley family. For the first time since 1801, pieces written by African Methodists were also included — nine hymns written by AME Church bishops (or future bishops). Turner also included a section titled 'Anniversary of Freedom' with two antislavery hymns, 'Freedom's Morn', and 'Freedom's Jubilee'. He also featured fifty-nine hymns which in the preface he called 'the old Zion songs.' Of all the hymns included in African-American hymnals in the nineteenth century these bore the strongest connection to slave spirituals and traditional African-American music. Many featured call and response elements, and twelve were drawn from Ira Sankey's collection of revival gospel songs published in 1875. Turner defended their inclusion, writing 'these time honored and precious old songs... have been as it were resurrected and regiven to the church. Besides I am not ashamed to say that I love these good old soul-inspiring songs a thousand fold more than I do these latter day operatio[sic] songs'.⁵⁹³ Turner's inclusion of these songs was typical of the democratic, even radical character of his church leadership, and

The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History Vol. 2, No. 2 (Spring 1999)

⁵⁹³H.M. Turner 'Compiler's Remarks' in *The Hymn Book of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (1876)

his comments in their defence may have been a veiled rebuke of the formalism in his denomination, as represented especially by Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne.⁵⁹⁴

4.6 Grass-roots African-American Christianity

It is a historiographical truism that the history of the quotidian, history from the bottom-up, is more challenging to reconstruct. The commonplace is less frequently, or more subtly, recorded, and therefore less accessible to the historian. It is easy for the historian of African-American Christianity to observe that the wellspring of female leadership, authority, and power in the churches is the ordinary women in the pews each Sunday. Certainly it is true that without the everyday practice of the churches the more remarkable developments in women's church leadership such as female preaching and ordination would have been impossible. However, it is insufficient to state simply that the unremarkable practice of worship was the foundation of more remarkable developments. Everyday worship must be explored by the historian in order to provide more powerful explanations of developments like the increase in female preaching in postbellum black Christianity. In the everyday practice of holiness; in shifts in the style and character of ministry; in slave survivals in worship; and in church music tensions can be found, at the nexus of which are questions of lay rights and women's rights in church contexts. These elements of church practice and worship can thus be shown to be, at least in part, the roots of female social power in African-American Christianity.

⁵⁹⁴Spencer, *Black Hymnody*, pp. 9-14

5 Education for women and the African-American churches

In the October 1884 issue of *The AME Church Review*, published approximately a year before Henry McNeal Turner ordained Sarah Ann Hughes, the Rev. James H.A. Johnson authored an article on the subject of female preachers, expanding on the debates from the General Conference of May that year. In it he argued of women that

Some of her sex, it is true, are susceptible to a very high degree of education. But it cannot be perceived by the light of mental philosophy that the Supreme One has endowed her with those stern, intellectual, masculine qualities which are indispensable to those who are to 'go into all the world and preach the gospel to every creature.' There is a difference in the intellectual constitution of woman and of man.⁵⁹⁵

Johnson's argument reflected a common attitude among the leadership of African-American churches: While subordinate to scriptural considerations, women's faculties, especially their intellectual capabilities and educational attainment, were an inhibiting factor for their prospects of attaining leadership roles in their churches. For many church leaders, like Johnson, much of this was due to perceived inherent and immutable characteristics of women. However, even Johnson, who was a fierce opponent of female preaching and ordination, was willing to concede that some women could attain 'a very

⁵⁹⁵J.H.A. Johnson, 'Female Preachers', *The AME Church Review*, Vol. 1 (October 1884), p. 102

high degree of education', to some extent compensating for the perceived inherent shortcomings of their sex. While for Johnson this was insufficient, for others highly educated women were, by merit of that education, capable of leadership and wielding responsibility within their churches and beyond. Writing in defence of Turner's ordination of Hughes in *The AME Church Review* in April 1886, Bishop John M. Brown praised the impact of education on leading women: 'It may be said to the credit of Oberlin College, Ohio, that her doors have been opened from the beginning of her existence to women. . . Some of the leading thinkers among women were educated there, such as Lucy Stone Blackwell, and, I believe, the Rev. Olympia Brown.'⁵⁹⁶ Olympia Brown was the first woman ordained in the Universalist Church, and indeed the first woman ordained with the full approval of her denomination.⁵⁹⁷ Although Bishop Brown specifically cited a white female minister, in the same paragraph he elucidated the history of female preaching by African-American women in the AME Church:

It may be said to the credit of the African M. E. Church that women have been admitted to her pulpits from the foundation of that denomination. As early as 1835, and before Mrs. J. Lee was an acceptable preacher among us, Mrs. Martha Low was also a woman of great use. . . Mrs. Emily Rodney Williams and others are at work for God and His church, acceptably.⁵⁹⁸

⁵⁹⁶J.P. Campbell and J.M. Brown, 'The Ordination of Women; What the Authority for it' [sic], *The AME Church Review*, Vol. 2 (April 1886), p. 354

Bishop Brown was incorrect. Olympia Brown was educated at Mount Holyoke Female Seminary, Massachusetts, and Antioch College, Ohio. Nevertheless, the value he placed on women's education is clear.

⁵⁹⁷S.A. Kujawa, 'Brown, Olympia', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00097.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
C. Lasser, 'Stone, Lucy', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00663.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁵⁹⁸Campbell and Brown, 'The Ordination of Women; What the Authority for it', p. 354-5

Bishop Brown thus clearly connected his support for female preaching and ministry to the virtues of female education and the potential for women to benefit from it, even to the extent that they should preach. Many of those church leaders who disagreed with Brown and opposed female preaching and ministry saw the value of educating women to enhance their ability to offer a benign, pious, and learned influence on their families and communities. Even the conservative Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne valued the education of women at Wilberforce College. While he saw no place for women in the pulpit, he believed in the centrality of mothers in domestic education. Payne believed it the duty of the mother to teach her children in several advanced fields of study: '[The] natural aptness... of the mother may make her more successful in [teaching] botany, music, and some other of the fine arts... the mother may eclipse him [the father] in one or more of the intellectual forms of knowledge such as mental and moral philosophy.'⁵⁹⁹ Payne believed that 'there is a sense in which the mother is the special teacher and educator of her own child' and prayed, 'Let the time come when every father and every mother shall be ministering priests around the family altar.'⁶⁰⁰ In order to fulfil these obligations, Payne made every effort to provide for the education of women within the AME Church and particularly at his beloved Wilberforce College.

⁵⁹⁹Payne, *A Treatise on Domestic Education*, pp. 135–6

⁶⁰⁰Payne, *A Treatise on Domestic Education*, pp. 135–6

'Prayer by Bishop Payne', *The Sixteenth Session and the Fifteenth Quadrennial Session of the General Conference of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Atlanta, GA, 1876), p. 213

Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 121

Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 383, n. 34

5.1 Early history of higher education for African-American women

The educational opportunities afforded to African-American women in the postbellum period were decisive in shaping the leadership roles they could play in their churches and, through their churches, in their wider communities. The churches were at the heart of the expansion of educational opportunities for African Americans and especially women in the nineteenth century. However, the earliest institutions open to African Americans were not associated with African-American denominations. Oberlin College in Ohio first enrolled African Americans and women in 1835, two years after its founding. Only five higher education institutions specifically for black people were established before the Civil War: the Institute for Colored Youth (later Cheyney University) in Philadelphia, in 1837; Avery College in Allegheny, Pennsylvania, in 1849; the Ashmun Institute (later Livingstone College) in Chester County, Pennsylvania, in 1854; Wilberforce University in Xenia, Ohio, in 1855; Miner Teacher's College in Washington DC, in 1851.⁶⁰¹ Of all these

⁶⁰¹H.N. Drewry and H. Doermann, *Stand and Prosper: Private Black Colleges and Their Students* (Princeton, NJ, 2001), p. 33

Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 259

D.A. Gerber, *Black Ohio and the Color Line, 1860–1915* (Urbana, IL, 1976)

F.E. Brooks and G.L. Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities: An Encyclopedia* (Santa Barbara, CA, 2011), p. 1

The Institute for Colored Youth was founded as the African Institute.

Miner Teacher's College was also known as Miner School for Girls and Miner Normal School and was later associated with Howard University. It became known as Miner Teacher's College in 1860. Another historically black college, Harris-Stowe State University, dates its establishment in 1857, as Harris Teachers College, a normal school for white students. The normal school for African Americans, Stowe Teachers College, was not founded until 1890, and the two schools were not merged until after the 1954 *Brown v. Board of Education* decision. See 'The HSSU Campus Community: Campus History' [http://www.hssu.edu/sp/_content.cfm?wID=50&pID=478] (Accessed April 2016)

institutions, only the Ashmun Institute was established specifically for the education of male students. Miner Teacher's College was specifically for the education of women. The Institute for Colored Youth added a girls' school when it reopened in 1852 after a six-year hiatus, 'the pupils being selected from those of a standing above that of the ordinary schools.' Both Wilberforce and Avery had specific Ladies' Departments and courses.⁶⁰² Among these institutions there was certainly religious involvement.⁶⁰³ However, in spite of the religious influence on these early black colleges, Wilberforce University was unique due to its connection to the AME Church. Wilberforce was the first private, historically black university in the United States, and, from 1863,

⁶⁰²United States Department of Education, *Special Report of the Commissioner of Education on the Condition and Improvement of Public Schools in the District of Columbia, Submitted to the Senate June, 1868, and to the House, with Additions, June 13, 1870* (Government Printing Office, Washington, DC, 1871), pp. 380–1

⁶⁰³*Special Report of the Commissioner of Education*, 1871, pp. 379–80
 C.G. Woodson, *The Education of the Negro Prior to 1861: A History of the Education of the Colored People of the United States from the Beginning of Slavery to the Civil War* (New York, 1915), pp. 266–70
 J.F. Pacheco, 'Myrtilla Miner', in P.S. Foner and J.F. Pacheco, *Three Who Dared: Prudence Crandall, Margaret Douglass, Myrtilla Miner — Champions of Antebellum Black Education* (Westport, CT, 1984)
 J. Null, 'Myrtilla Miner's "School for Colored Girls": A Mirror on Antebellum Washington', *Records of the Columbia Historical Society, Washington, D.C.*, Vol. 52 (1989), pp. 254–268
 'Myrtilla Miner — National Abolition Hall of Fame and Museum', [<http://www.nationalabolitionhalloffameandmuseum.org/mminer.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
 Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, pp. 2–4
 'Ashmun Institute Chartered in 1854' [<http://www.accessible-archives.com/2011/04/ashmun-institute-chartered-in-1854/>] (Accessed April 2016)
Special Report of the Commissioner of Education, 1871, pp. 380–3
 Woodson, *The Education of the Negro Prior to 1861*, pp. 270–2
 Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 251
 'Avery College Historical Marker' [<http://explorepahistory.com/hmarker.php?markerId=1-A-37E>] (Accessed April 2016)
 Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, pp. 3–7

the first to be fully owned, controlled, and staffed by African Americans. It appointed the first African-American university president in the United States, Daniel Alexander Payne, in 1863. Under Payne's leadership it was pioneering in striving for the highest academic standards, teaching a classical academic curriculum. Wilberforce was a unique leader among early historically black colleges, and this was in large part due to its religious affiliation to the AME Church.⁶⁰⁴

In total, twenty-eight African Americans had received degrees before the outbreak of the Civil War, though none of these were awarded by black institutions.⁶⁰⁵ Lucy Stanton Day Sessions is believed to have been the first African-American woman college graduate, having completed the two-year Ladies' Literary Course at Oberlin College in 1850. This course differed from the bachelor's programme only in that there was no requirement for higher mathematics, Greek, or Latin, though it did not award an A.B. During her time at Oberlin, Sessions had been elected President of the Ladies' Literary Society during her senior year, and was selected to present an address titled 'A Plea for the Oppressed' during the commencement ceremonies in

⁶⁰⁴Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 106–9
 Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 428–30
 Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, pp. 8–9
 'About WU — History', Wilberforce University
[\[http://www.wilberforce.edu/welcome/history.html\]](http://www.wilberforce.edu/welcome/history.html) (Accessed April 2016)

⁶⁰⁵Woodson, *The Education of the Negro Prior to 1861*, pp. 115–7
 Drewry and Doermann, *Stand and Prosper*, pp. 32–3
 Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, p. xxi
 T.C. DeLaney, 'Chavis, John', *American National Biography Online*,
[\[http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00165.html\]](http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00165.html) (Accessed April 2016)
 'A History of Amherst College'
[\[https://www.amherst.edu/aboutamherst/facts/history\]](https://www.amherst.edu/aboutamherst/facts/history) (Accessed April 2016)
 'Jones, Edward — Amherst College Class of 1826' [\[http://www3.amherst.edu/~rjyanco94/genealogy/acbiorecord/1826.html#jones-e\]](http://www3.amherst.edu/~rjyanco94/genealogy/acbiorecord/1826.html#jones-e)
 (Accessed April 2016)

1850.⁶⁰⁶ Mary Jane Patterson was the first African-American woman to be awarded a bachelor's degree, in English, also from Oberlin College, in 1862.⁶⁰⁷ The second was Fanny Jackson-Coppin, who, partially funded by Daniel Alexander Payne, enrolled at Oberlin's ladies' department in 1860. She transferred to the full collegiate programme the next year, and graduated and received her A.B. in 1865. During her time at Oberlin she had been selected as class poet and made the first African-American student-teacher at the college's preparatory department. After graduating she became principal of the Institute for Colored Youth in 1869, the first African-American woman principal of a higher education institution.⁶⁰⁸ Another notable early female African-American college graduate was Sarah Jane Woodson Early. Along with her sister, Hannah, she enrolled at Oberlin, and she graduated in 1856. She was appointed 'Preceptress of English and Latin and Lady Principal and Matron' at Wilberforce University in 1866, making her the first African-

⁶⁰⁶'Lucy Stanton Day Sessions (1831–1910)', in Smith (ed.), *Notable Black American Women, Book II*, pp. 588–9

'Sessions, Lucy Stanton Day (1831–1910)'

[<http://www.blackpast.org/aah/sessions-lucy-stanton-day-1831-1910>]

(Accessed April 2016)

'Claiming Their Citizenship: African American Women from 1624–2009', National Women's History Museum

[<http://www.nwhm.org/online-exhibits/africanamerican/25.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁶⁰⁷Smith (ed.), *Notable Black American Women, Book II*, p. 588

D. Clark Hine and E. Barkley Brown (eds.), *Black Women in America: An Historical Encyclopedia* (Oxford, 1993), p. 381

⁶⁰⁸Mother Bethel AME Church Archives, fo. 2008.587 'Bishops' Wives — Coppin, Fannie J.'

F. Jackson-Coppin, *Reminiscences on School Life, and Hints on Teaching* (Philadelphia, 1913), pp. 9–38

L.M. Perkins, 'Heed Life's Demands: The Educational Philosophy of Fanny Jackson Coppin', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3 (Summer 1982), pp. 181–190

Smith (ed.), *Notable Black American Women, Book II*, p. 248

L.M. Perkins, 'Coppin, Fanny Jackson', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00202.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

American woman to be a member of a college faculty.⁶⁰⁹

These early pioneering institutions and individuals in African-American education prior to the Civil War were only a small vanguard. The scale of education for African Americans, including women, expanded rapidly after emancipation. Missionary societies, secular philanthropists, and government agencies all founded schools and colleges with the purpose of educating the freed people. The African-American churches had a profound influence on the expansion of these educational efforts. Missionary-sponsored teaching employed various models of education, but it was primarily the black churches which provided a genuine voice for African Americans in shaping pedagogical philosophies, models, and structures for the education of their own race: by example in their own schools and colleges, by collaboration with missionaries and institutions outside their direct control, and through treatises, discourses, and discussions on the education of African Americans. The means by which educational institutions were opened up to women, the foundation of new institutions and courses for women, the syllabuses and courses of study they undertook, and the pedagogical philosophies which shaped their educational experiences all had profound effects on the pioneering African-American women who first sought higher education at the schools and colleges of their denominations, and on the generations that followed them.

⁶⁰⁹P.S. Foner and R.J. Branham (eds.), *Lift Every Voice: African American Oratory, 1787–1900* (Tuscaloosa, AL, 1998), pp. 384–8
M.N. Thompson and A.L. Jones, ‘Sarah Jane Woodson Early (1825–1907)’, in Smith (ed.), *Notable Black American Women, Book II*, pp. 198–200
D. Smith and D.A. Payne, *Biography of Rev. David Smith, of the A. M. E. Church* (Xenia, OH, 1881), p. 118

5.2 Pedagogical Philosophies: The Hampton-Tuskegee Model

The subjects, curricula, and courses of study offered to African Americans and the methods by which they were taught in the postbellum period determined their academic experience and their educational outcomes. The two poles of pedagogical theory pertaining to the education of African Americans between the Civil War and the twentieth century were the Hampton model of normal and industrial education, and the classical academic curriculum as advocated by Daniel Alexander Payne (and later W.E.B. Du Bois).⁶¹⁰ The Hampton model of industrial education refers to the educational philosophy pioneered at the Hampton Agricultural and Industrial School, later known as the Hampton Normal and Agricultural Institute, and continued and adapted at the Tuskegee Normal School for Colored Teachers under the leadership of Booker T. Washington.

In order to understand the development of industrial education for African Americans as a pedagogical model it is first necessary to understand the career of Samuel Chapman Armstrong, the white founder and first principal of the Hampton Institute. At the close of the Civil War, Armstrong served as a Freedmen's Bureau agent for schools around Hampton, Virginia. The Freedmen's Bureau was dissolved in 1872, but by that time Armstrong had already embarked on the foundation of the Hampton Institute, by which means he sought to continue provision of education and training for the African Americans of the Virginia tidewater. With support of \$9,000 from the American Missionary Association and \$10,000 from John King, a Pittsburgh

⁶¹⁰In the context of the educational theory of the time, the term 'normal' school refers to the teaching of pedagogical norms, and as such principally refers to teacher training.

philanthropist, Armstrong purchased a 159-acre property known as Little Scotland on the Hampton River. The Hampton Institute opened on 1 April 1868 with fifteen pupils, with a teacher and a matron provided by the AMA. The institute grew rapidly in student numbers. It already had thirty pupils by 26 April. By act of the General Assembly of Virginia on 4 June 1870, the school was incorporated as ‘Hampton Normal and Agricultural Institute, for the instruction of youth in various common schools, academic and industrial branches, the best methods of teaching same and best mode of practical industry in its application to agriculture and the mechanic arts.’ It also soon became self-sustaining, and even profitable based on the output of its industrial training. Armstrong served as principal of the Hampton Institute until his death on 11 May 1893 at which point he was succeeded by the school’s chaplain, Dr. Hollis B. Frissell. There he pioneered a model of industrial and normal education for African Americans, which, while not an unprecedented educational schema, was at Hampton established on an unprecedented scale, set within the context of postbellum race relations and a political philosophy which sought to stabilise race relations in the South in a pragmatic fashion which allowed the peaceful and stable co-existence of the freed people and white southerners.⁶¹¹

At Hampton, students engaged in manual labour in the morning and studied in the afternoon and evening. In all, starting before dawn, students engaged in a twelve-hour routine of work, study, and military drill.

⁶¹¹Talbot, *Samuel Chapman Armstrong*, pp. 154–169, 176
 Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, pp. 47–8
 ‘Dr. Hollis Burke Frissell — Digital Library of Hampton University’
 [<http://contentdm.auctr.edu/cdm/singleitem/collection/hamu/id/62/rec/6>]
 (Accessed April 2016)

Women were trained in domestic labour including cooking, cleaning, sewing and needlework, dressmaking, and general housekeeping skills, while men's work was mostly agricultural, but also included carpentry, blacksmithing, brickmaking and bricklaying, and other artisanal skills. This curriculum expanded further after the completion of the Armstrong-Slater Trade School building in 1896, which offered instruction in farming, carpentry, harness making, printing, tailoring, clocksmithing, blacksmithing, painting, and wheelwrighting; and the Domestic Science Building alongside it in 1898, which similarly enhanced the manual training for female students. Wages from their industrial work was applied to their boarding fees.⁶¹² Academic study was orientated towards teacher training. Its subject matter therefore comprised that which would facilitate graduates to go on to teach industrial skills to other African Americans, and excluded classical languages and higher and abstract sciences. According to the report of J.C. Kinney, a white guest who observed Hampton's seventh commencement in 1875 and reported his observations to the *Hartford Courant*,

The design of the school is to fit its graduates to do helpful work among the ignorant and degraded colored masses of the south. For such an object Latin, Greek and the higher mathematics are useless, and they are wisely omitted from the course. A practical English education is given, sufficient to make good teachers, and with it there seems to have been imparted some comprehension of the needs of the race and a genuine missionary spirit.⁶¹³

⁶¹²Talbot, *Samuel Chapman Armstrong*, pp. 168, 186

F.G. Peabody, *Education For Life: The Story of Hampton Institute: Told in Connection with the Fiftieth Anniversary of the Foundation of the School* (Garden City, NY, 1918), p. 247

'Hampton University: History' [<http://www.hamptonu.edu/about/history.cfm>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁶¹³Quoted in L.R. Harlan, *Booker T. Washington: The Making of a Black Leader*,

The subjects taught in the academic division of the school comprised reading, writing, arithmetic, spelling, and grammar, as well as some geography and basic history. Hampton did not award bachelor's degrees and did not follow a classic collegiate four-year unified curriculum. However, nor did it offer formal trade certificates until 1895. Its industrial syllabus was partly a product of Armstrong's pragmatism. Most of Hampton's students arrived with a rudimentary elementary school education at best, especially in the early years.⁶¹⁴

The nature of Armstrong's educational philosophy can be traced to his fundamental belief in white supremacy and superiority. The combination of this belief and his desire for a stable and prosperous South led him to reject radical and violent solutions to the racial problems of the new South, such as re-enslavement, mass deportation, or genocide. Instead, he sought to embed within his educational philosophy a gradualist accommodationist racial politics which would unite and pacify the powerful and the powerless, racial hatred and claims for equality. It would play off these conflicting and volatile forces while maintaining white power and supremacy and encouraging the economic rejuvenation of the South.⁶¹⁵

In this light, industrial education at Hampton can be seen to have served multiple purposes within Armstrong's political pedagogy. Armstrong was perturbed by the potential for large-scale African-American migration away

1856–1901 (New York, 1972), p. 49

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, pp. 48

⁶¹⁴Anderson, *The Education of Blacks in the South*, p. 34

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, pp. 48

⁶¹⁵Talbot, *Samuel Chapman Armstrong*, pp. 135–6

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, pp. 47

from the South. He believed that the best prospects for African Americans were located in the South, and that its prosperity depended on retaining and training its black population, and that in turn a prosperous South would mean a prosperous North. In the Hampton Institute's newspaper, *The Southern Workman*, Armstrong wrote:

Some of the Negroes are leaving the South, not because they are oppressed or outraged, but because they are anxious to better their condition. He is told that he can do better in the North, or East, or West than at home; and, being of a trusting, confiding nature, easily led and influenced, he believes the representations that are made to him. But, except in some rare instances, there is no oppression of the black man in the South today. He is paid fair wages, and has all the work he cares to do. His work however is altogether in the field. He is not a success — at least the recent generation is not a success — in the factory.⁶¹⁶

One of the purposes of industrial education, then, was to constrain the African-American workforce within the South and fit it for usefulness to a capitalistic and agrarian system to benefit the white hegemony. Francis Greenwood Peabody, a trustee and an early historian of the Hampton Institute, reiterated Armstrong's attitude:

it is obvious that the vast majority of the Negro race, as of other races, must continue to be hand-workers, in the fields or in household or mechanic arts, and that their training must be adapted to the rural and industrial conditions in which they are to earn their living. The education, therefore, of those of their own race who are to teach and guide them, should not only cover the elements of culture, but also promote manual industry and mechanical skill. The training of the mind should be applied to the training of the hand.⁶¹⁷

⁶¹⁶ *The Southern Workman* (February 1881), pp. 16–17

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 55

⁶¹⁷ Peabody, *Education For Life*, pp. xiv–xv

A primary political goal of industrial and agricultural education for freed people therefore was to provide a bridge which would ease the transition from the southern slave economy into a new postbellum economy.

A second political goal of industrial education was to forge a social buffer to supplement that economic continuity; to defuse racial tensions by obviating African-American radicalism and demands for equality or retribution, which could prove equally incendiary to both blacks and whites and devastatingly destabilising for Armstrong's promised South. In part this was to be achieved by insulating African Americans from the destabilising influence of higher classical and academic education and making them content with their situation as labourers. This was couched in obfuscatory language that imbued industrial training with moral virtue; which prompted African-American students to embrace the 'dignity of labor'; and which spoke of 'the moral effect of technical skill, the conception of labor as a moral force'.⁶¹⁸ As Peabody noted,

industrial efficiency has moral consequences. This high doctrine of the spiritual significance of physical work has been taught with reiterated emphasis in many Reports of the school. 'The moral advantages of industrial training over all other methods justify the expense' (1872). 'Experience has strengthened my conviction of labor as a moral force' (1888). 'Character is the best outcome of the labor system' (1891). 'Honestly giving value for value, labor becomes a stepping stone, a ladder, to education, to all higher things, to success, manhood, and character' (1892). In other words, industrial education not only increases wage-earning capacity, but promotes fidelity, accuracy, honesty, persistency, and intelligence.⁶¹⁹

The subtext of this emphasis on morality and character in industrial education was that physical work defused African-American resentment and replaced it

⁶¹⁸S.C. Armstrong, *Education For Life* (Hampton, VA, 1913), p. 8

⁶¹⁹Peabody, *Education For Life*, pp. xv-xvi

with docility and gradualist and accommodationist attitudes. Its antithesis, advanced learning in subjects like Latin, Greek, and higher mathematics, fostered notions of equality, even superiority, in African Americans which in turn provoked resentment of their actual subordination. This promotion of docility and gradualism was supplemented by an actual encouragement of such attitudes. Armstrong, for example, for a long time argued against African-American voting, and wrote that ‘the ballot is nearly useless in their hands’.⁶²⁰ Deferential attitudes among Hampton students were frequently noted by visitors. J.C. Kinney’s report on the 1875 commencement noted that ‘the valedictory... showed a comprehension of the ignorance and superstition of the black race.’⁶²¹ Similarly, the philanthropist and reformer Charles Brace also observed the same commencement and wrote:

Many of the students alluded to their former condition of slavery, but without any tone of reproach or desire for vengeance... Not an expression of hostility or ill-feeling appeared in any address. Each speaker seemed to feel that the fortunes of his race depended on the self-control, virtue, and intelligence of each individual, and that their future was in their own hands. They all, apparently, deprecated any intruding of themselves socially, or of pressing their social rights beyond what was proper and convenient.⁶²²

Commentators also made reference to the modest appearance of Hampton students. Brace also noted that ‘The girls looked like respectable working-girls, and the boys much as young country teachers would anywhere.’⁶²³ Similarly

⁶²⁰ *The Southern Workman* (December 1877), p.90

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 54

⁶²¹ Quoted in Harlan, *Booker T. Washington: The Making of a Black Leader*, pp. 50–1

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 50

⁶²² Quoted in Harlan, *Booker T. Washington: The Making of a Black Leader*, p. 58

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 51

⁶²³ Quoted in Harlan, *Booker T. Washington: The Making of a Black Leader*, p. 55

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 50

J.C. Kinney commented that ‘The exercises were notable for the good taste of all who participated. The girls were dressed plainly and neatly with no attempt at display, and they, in common with the young men, conducted themselves with unassuming dignity.’⁶²⁴ Thus Hampton aimed to forge a deferential buffer of African Americans whose attitudes would soften racial tensions, preserving stability and prosperity. Brace’s commentary also alluded to another aspect of the Hampton philosophy. While the virtues of industrial education accrued in the first place to the individual, they were ultimately designed for the benefit of the whole race.

It may be erroneous to privilege the industrial and agricultural aspect of the Hampton curriculum over its function as a normal school. The impulse to do so is understandable, since its emphasis on industrial education marks its most stark contrast with the educational patterns which preceded it, and which operated in other institutions which taught more classical academic syllabuses, including Wilberforce University. This would be to misunderstand the ambition of Armstrong and the Hampton project, which sought not merely the improvement of its current students, but of the African-American race, of the postbellum American South, and ultimately of the nation as a whole. In this light the industrial training at Hampton should be viewed properly as an adjunct to the teacher training. Indeed, the historian of education James D. Anderson has argued for this interpretation of the Hampton model:

The Hampton-Tuskegee curriculum was not centered on trade or agricultural training; it was centered on the training of teachers. A condition from admission to Hampton was the ‘intention to remain through the whole course and become a teacher.’ This goal was achieved because

⁶²⁴Quoted in Harlan, *Booker T. Washington: The Making of a Black Leader*, pp. 50–1

approximately 84 percent of 723 graduates from Hampton's twenty classes became teachers. Moreover, Hampton did not offer any trade certificates until 1895, twenty-seven years after the school's founding.⁶²⁵

Hampton was therefore to act as a seed which would spread the virtues of its teaching throughout the African-American race. As Peabody put it, the goal was 'to train selected Negro youths who shall go out and teach and lead their people...to teach respect for labor'.⁶²⁶ In this light a third purpose to Armstrong's industrial education can be discerned. It sought to inculcate its graduate teachers with the moral virtues derived from labour and the technical skills and knowledge to act as role models for those they went on to teach. As Armstrong has argued, the teachers taught at Hampton were to be conduits through which Hampton's values would spread throughout their race:

The primary aim was to work the teachers long and hard so that they would embody, accept, and preach an ethic of hard toil or the 'dignity of labor.' Then, and only then, believed Armstrong, could his normal school graduates develop the appropriate values and character to teach the children of the South's distinctive black laboring class.⁶²⁷

Through this self-perpetuating structure, the goal of Armstrong and Hampton was implicitly to subdue any radical political sentiment among the African-American population of South, and employ them in virtuous, predominantly agricultural work, thereby providing a social and economic continuity with

⁶²⁵Anderson, *The Education of Blacks in the South*, p. 34

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 49

⁶²⁶Talbot, *Samuel Chapman Armstrong*, p. 157

Peabody, *Education For Life*, p. 99

⁶²⁷Anderson, *The Education of Blacks in the South*, p. 34

Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 49

the antebellum socio-economic order, obviating any necessity for destabilising radical or violent upheaval.

In its goal to perpetuate its educational philosophy beyond its walls, the Hampton Institute was markedly successful. Its influence was indirectly responsible for over five thousand so-called Rosenwald Schools built for African Americans throughout the South in the early twentieth century, funded by philanthropist Julius Rosenwald. Its model of industrial education was even exported to institutions which predated it. For example, the Penn School on St. Helena Island, near Beaufort, South Carolina, was founded by white abolitionist Laura M. Towne as one of the earliest schools for freed people. It was one of very few independent schools for freed people to last beyond the Reconstruction era without the support of a missionary organisation or religious denomination. During Towne's lifetime it adhered to a classical academic curriculum. However, so influential was that Hampton model by the time of Towne's death in 1901 that, under its new principal, Rossa Belle Cooley, it adopted an agricultural, industrial, and domestic curriculum and was renamed as the Penn Normal, Industrial, and Agricultural School.⁶²⁸ However, without doubt the Hampton Institutes's greatest impact and legacy was effected through its influence on Booker T. Washington and the Tuskegee Normal and Industrial Institute.

⁶²⁸R.E. Butchart, 'Penn Normal, Industrial, and Agricultural School', in Jones-Wilson et al. (eds.), *Encyclopedia of African-American Education*, pp. 353–4
E. Jacoway, *Yankee Missionaries in the South: The Penn School Experiment* (Baton Rouge, LA, 1980)

5.3 Pedagogical philosophies: Booker T. Washington and Daniel Alexander Payne

Such was Washington's influence and so great has been historical interest in him, that extensive historical study has probed his life and work. It would be redundant, therefore, to reiterate the minutiae of Washington's biography here, save to trace briefly the contours of Hampton and Armstrong's influence on him, how this was manifested in his leadership at the Tuskegee Normal and Industrial Institute, and how, in turn this was instrumental in defining the contours of the debates over curricula which were central to the experience of education in the colleges led by the African-American churches, especially as pertaining to the education of African-American women.

Washington arrived at the Hampton Institute in the fall of 1872 at the age of sixteen. He quickly came to admire Armstrong and the Hampton philosophy. He would later describe Armstrong as 'that which made the greatest and most lasting impression on me. . . the noblest, rarest human being that it has ever been my privilege to meet.'⁶²⁹ Washington took to life at Hampton quickly. He eagerly adopted the routine of personal cleanliness, clean shirts and socks, a daily bath and a toothbrush, sleeping between sheets; all were novelties to him, but he embraced them and came to associate them with self-respect. He also demonstrated great proficiency in the academic curriculum. He was particularly proficient in rhetoric, elocution and composition, presaging his talent as a public speaker.

After graduating from Hampton in 1875, Washington took up a teaching

⁶²⁹B.T. Washington, *Up From Slavery: An Autobiography* (Garden City, NY, 1901), p. 54
Watkins, *The White Architects of Black Education*, p. 44

position in Malden, West Virginia, and studied at Wayland Seminary in Washington DC for several months. In 1879, Armstrong invited Washington to return to Hampton to run the night school. In 1881, Armstrong recommended Washington for a post as principal of a new normal school for African Americans to be established at Tuskegee, Alabama. On taking up the post, Washington discovered that the school did not yet exist in any form; no buildings, no land, no faculty. This did not deter him, and he set about building a new school, the Tuskegee Normal School for Colored Teachers, founded on 4 July 1881. He began teaching in an old church building, and soon purchased 100 acres and began erecting school buildings. Tuskegee grew rapidly, in no small part due to Washington's consummate skill as an orator and fundraiser. Teaching at Tuskegee was based on the Hampton model but with an exclusively black faculty. Washington attracted some of the most prestigious black scholars to Tuskegee, including the botanist George Washington Carver. Such was the success of Tuskegee that Washington soon came to be seen as the leading national spokesman on the subject of African-American education, and Tuskegee became a paragon and model, embraced by educational philanthropists throughout the United States.⁶³⁰

In terms of fund-raising capacity and the esteem in which it was held by white Americans for black education, the only significant rival to Tuskegee at this time was Howard University. Howard, in Washington DC, was chartered in 1867, having been established with the support of the Congregational Church in Washington DC and the Freedmen's Bureau. It was named for its

⁶³⁰Washington, *Up From Slavery: An Autobiography* (Garden City, NY, 1901)
R.J.. Norrell, *Up from History: The Life of Booker T. Washington* (Cambridge, MA, 2009), pp. 41–60

founder, General Oliver Otis Howard, the Commissioner of the Freedmen's Bureau. Such was its prestige that it received more than half a million dollars per year from its white governors and an annual congressional appropriation. Howard stood in contrast to Tuskegee in that it modelled its curriculum explicitly on white universities and offered a full slate of four-year liberal arts courses and classical curricula. However, in the nineteenth century Howard had an almost exclusively white faculty. Therefore it is not to Howard that we must look for the African-American rebuttal to the advocates of industrial education, but to the black churches and their colleges, especially Wilberforce, and most of all to Daniel Alexander Payne.

Though Payne supported Washington when he provoked controversy by criticising the educational standards among African-American clergy in 1890, their educational philosophies were very different. Payne was described by leading black Episcopalian clergyman George Freeman Bragg as 'a veritable "Man of the Hour", with a massive brain, a well-trained intellect, a brave and loyal heart, and a will of iron,' and as 'a walking seminary of learning. . . the great Apostle of Negro education', who was responsible for 'Originating and Pushing forward a Nation-wide Propaganda of Education.'⁶³¹ From a young age Payne set himself the highest standards of academic achievement and became a well-trained scholar in many fields, including classical languages, theology, philosophy, and history. He was elected as the first official historiographer of the AME Church in 1868 and as President of Wilberforce University from 1863 to 1876. He made Wilberforce a university in his own

⁶³¹G.F. Bragg, 'Allen-Payne', Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, Sc MG 244 (George Freeman Bragg manuscripts), fo. 1

image. Wilberforce taught a full classical curriculum including ancient and modern languages, mathematics, science, rhetoric and composition, elocution, theology, and philosophy. Payne took great pride that Wilberforce taught a curriculum comparable to the major white colleges. His highest priority was the spiritual and moral education of the students and to instil piety, yet he saw that as intrinsically connected to higher study:

Our aim is to make Christian scholars, not mere bookworms, but workers, educated workers with God for man — to effect which we employ not the Classics and Mathematics only, but Science and Philosophy also, the former for their discriminating, polishing and cultivating influences, the latter for the quickness and exactness which they impart to the cognitive faculty, and the seed thoughts which they never fail to sow in the mind. And yet we hold that the Classics and Mathematics, as Science and Philosophy, can and must be consecrated to human well-being by the teachings, the sentiments, and the spirit of Jesus.⁶³²

This relationship between higher study and piety was spelled out in his Quadrennial Address at the 1856 General Conference of the AME Church:

we all ought to cultivate our minds by the study of every science — physical mental and moral — so that we may be better qualified to study the Bible. The sciences to which allusion is made introduce us to the God of nature [the Bible] cannot be thoroughly understood by the preacher, nor rendered intelligible to the bearer, without some knowledge of anatomy, physiology, metaphysics, and ethics.⁶³³

On that occasion Payne had been addressing his fellow clergy. Indeed Payne's 'great educational propaganda among the colored people of this country', had begun with a campaign against clerical ignorance and illiteracy in the AME

⁶³²Smith and Payne, *Biography of Rev. David Smith*, p. 121

Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 100

⁶³³Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 38

Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 95

Church, and even near the end of his life he was Booker T. Washington's strongest supporter in his critique of the levels of clerical education.⁶³⁴ Payne was above all a denominational partisan and fierce advocate of the AME Church. His first object in education, particularly at Wilberforce, was the training of the next generation of AME clergy. Insofar as his purpose in education was vocational, it was of a very different kind from the vocational training at Tuskegee. Tuskegee's vocational training was, in a sense, democratic. It was designed to provide vocational training to as wide a range and a great a number of African Americans as possible. Payne's first purpose was to educate an elite, and particularly an elite, highly-educated clergy. Therefore it is not surprising that Payne advocated a classical curriculum as this was the most relevant form of education for achieving Wilberforce's primary goal.

It would be a mistake to see Payne's pedagogy as an absolute antithesis of that of Armstrong or Washington. Although the Hampton-Tuskegee model of industrial education and Payne's emphasis on classical academic curricula are often seen as mutually exclusive and contradictory, this is mainly due to their different political implications regarding accommodationism and racial uplift rather than an absolute discontinuity in their content. In some respects they overlapped. They shared a focus on self-discipline, orderliness, good time-management, personal hygiene, tidiness, cleanliness, hard work, and respect for authority. Wilberforce closely monitored the adherence of its students to a strict moral code of conduct. Physical culture was a required

⁶³⁴G.F. Bragg, 'Daniel A. Payne', Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, Sc MG 244 (George Freeman Bragg manuscripts), fo. 1
 B.T. Washington, 'The Colored Ministry. Its Defects and Needs'
 Martin, *For God and Race*, pp. 152–6
 Angell, *emph*Bishop Henry McNeal Turner, pp. 196–7

course for both men and women and Payne emphasised the virtue of manual labour. Indeed, in his sermons Payne's advice sounds strikingly similar to the language of Armstrong and Washington: 'Be diligent laborers. Shun no work that will bring you an honest penny. Fools only think labor is dishonorable.'⁶³⁵ Early in his career Payne had been rejected as a prospective pastor by the Ebenezer Church of Baltimore, because he was seen as aloof. '[Y]ou have too fine a carpet on your floor. You are too proud', he was told by the church's stewards.⁶³⁶ Yet when it came to education, for all Payne valued advanced classical study, he was not in an ivory tower and did not condescend to any course of study requiring genuine discipline and application.

Payne differed markedly from the Hampton-Tuskegee model in his vision of how education would promote racial uplift. He shared its avowed belief in the transformative power of education. Like Washington and Annstrong he was averse to abrupt confrontation with the white hegemony or radical claims of black equality. Indeed Payne was mostly apolitical, at least in any explicit fashion. He was critical of AME clergy who engaged too closely in secular politics, particularly those who sought and held political office. He believed too strongly in his duties as a spiritual leader to condone such temporal distractions. However, Payne was also hostile to the deference and accommodation with racism implied by the Hampton-Tuskegee model. Instead, Payne's racial politics subtly imbued his educational philosophy. He always believed that African Americans were entitled to full equality with whites, but believed as a matter of practicality that this could only be

⁶³⁵Payne, Sermon, 1862, quoted in Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 120

⁶³⁶Payne, *History of the AME Church*, p. iv

Coan, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 84

achieved by making the reality of African Americans' equal moral standing and intellectual achievement undeniably clear. This might be termed Payne's 'moral assimilationism'. That is to say that Payne believed that by living up to and even by demonstrably exceeding white standards of moral virtue and intellectual achievement, African Americans would show themselves to be undeniably worthy of equality in white eyes, and thus equality would gradually be attained. Therefore Payne sought to educate a vanguard black intellectual elite. For that purpose no other model of education would be fit except for one that precisely followed the highest standards of education available to white Americans.

Such was Payne's towering influence in his denomination that most AME clergy supported his vision for classical education at Wilberforce. Most recognised, as Payne had, that the resources and funds available to the church were severely limited and that clerical education had to be the church's first educational priority. Some, including Henry McNeal Turner, advocated a broader base to the church's educational efforts, including more institutions, especially more colleges in the South. Although not all agreed with Payne that Wilberforce should be the prime, near exclusive, focus of the church's educational efforts, most at least accepted that Wilberforce had to be the *primus inter pares* of the church's colleges and schools. However, Payne's preference for classical curricula was not unchallenged within the AME Church. For example, in an article in *The AME Church Review* in July 1888, Will M. Jackson of Lexington, Kentucky, argued for the importance of industrial education. He argued that industrial education was best fitted to the vocational needs of African Americans as a whole, since there were far

more viable employment opportunities for African Americans in mechanical, industrial and domestic trades than in higher professions:

We cannot make ministers, lawyers, doctors and teachers of all our children. Some of them are not fitted by nature for either of these professions, and even if they were fitted for them, each would soon be overcrowded, as is the case with teaching now. In our present condition we stand more in need of skilled mechanics, carpenters, wagon-makers, bricklayers, blacksmiths, machinists, etc., among our boys, and milliners, dress-makers, etc., among our girls.⁶³⁷

In essence, Jackson was arguing for the form of education which could provide the best prospects for the greatest number. In turn he argued this would bring prosperity and financial security to the race. Financial prosperity was the foundation upon which African Americans could claim their rights and this was built on the employment prospects facilitated by industrial education:

It is not its distinguished statesmen, its eminent jurists, its skilful physicians, or its learned educators that bring great material prosperity to any people, but its tradesmen and artisans — men in the middle walks of life, who give employment to them masses.⁶³⁸

Sixteen later, again in *The AME Church Review*, R.L. Stokes made a similar argument that industrial training did the most good for the majority:

in a broad sense, the business of Tuskegee is not so much with the talented tenth, as with the plain, commonplace nine-tenths. She is one step nearer the masses than is, for instance, Atlanta University. . . Tuskegee, less prententious than Atlanta, or Fiske, [sic] begins at the very bottom; her raw material in students is often the crudest; but as educational

⁶³⁷W.M. Jackson, 'Industrial Education the Need of Our Youth', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 5, No. 1 (July 1888), p. 44
Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1862-1939*, p. 86

⁶³⁸Jackson, 'Industrial Education the Need of Our Youth', p. 45
Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought*, p. 87

progression is logarithmic, her transformation of one of these rude boys into the typical Tuskegee Senior is more miraculous than the conversion of a Harvard Freshman into a Doctor of Philosophy.⁶³⁹

However Stokes went still further, expressing an attitude that learning for its own sake was worthless, an attitude which Daniel Alexander Payne, who had died in 1893, would have abhorred. Indeed Stokes termed it ‘that archaic ideal of scholarship... that knowledge should be pursued as offering in itself a most sufficient end and pleasure and distinction of possession.’⁶⁴⁰ Stokes’s argument was presented as a defence of Booker T. Washington and Tuskegee. He pointed out that Washington expressed no hostility to college education and that Tuskegee in fact had a highly successful academic department. He felt that Washington’s critics had created a straw man that Washington sought to promote industrial education to the exclusion of classical academic disciplines. In fact he argued that Washington believed both had their place and both were necessary to serve the educational, vocational, and financial needs of the entire African-American race. He quoted Washington that:

it was never meant that all Negro youths should receive industrial training, any more than it was meant that all white youths should pass through the Massachusetts Institute of Technology, or Amherst Agricultural College, to the exclusion of such training as is given at Harvard, Yale or Dartmouth.⁶⁴¹

Views such as those of Stokes and Jackson had gained currency in the AME Church after Payne’s death and with the remarkable success of Tuskegee.

⁶³⁹R.L. Stokes, ‘Some Negro Criticisms of Dr. Booker T. Washington’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 20 (January 1904), pp. 271–8

Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought*, p. 95

⁶⁴⁰Stokes, ‘Some Negro Criticisms of Dr. Booker T. Washington’, pp. 271–8

Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought*, p. 94

⁶⁴¹Stokes, ‘Some Negro Criticisms of Dr. Booker T. Washington’, pp. 271–8

Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought*, p. 93

However, there remained those firmly opposed to industrial education. Writing in *The AME Church Review* nine months after Stokes's article, Charles C. Cook argued against it on three grounds. First, he argued that industrial education would devalue true education. Students would pursue study only for what profit they could gain; 'he will contrive means to buy this knowledge cheap and sell it dear.'⁶⁴² The motivation to acquire education that was hard-earned evaporated, and so education itself became diluted. Cook lamented this because he believed that classical education, and the training in how to think that it entailed, was flexible enough to meet the needs of all African Americans. He referred to the 'industrial school, with a lower standard, or no standard at all', and he argued that 'the establishment of parallel English, normal, scientific, industrial and agricultural schools or even in a less degree, departments in the same school, means an exchange of a harder for an easier course.'⁶⁴³ His second criticism of industrial education was that without the outlet of suitable trades, redundant training would prove volatile. He argued that 'our manual training without resulting employment has... the character of an explosive.' Cook offered little explanation of what he meant by this, but it seems probable that he believed that industrial training would build unjustified expectations for employment and improvement in students which, when frustrated, would provoke resentment and foster class and racial tensions. Cook's third critique of industrial education was that it was funded principally by charity. He wrote that 'charity means pity, not unmixed with

⁶⁴²C.C. Cook, 'Industrial or Higher Education: Which? (First Paper)', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 21 (October 1904), pp. 145–56

Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought*, p. 89

⁶⁴³Cook, 'Industrial or Higher Education', pp. 145–56

Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought*, p. 89

contempt. There are evil effects of charity at its best; but charity not at its best, mere money, is a blight.⁶⁴⁴ Cook's critique of industrial education was fundamentally pessimistic. He feared the damage it would do, and although he lauded classical education, he only referred to preserving it, offering little vision of its future prospects. This was unlike Payne's 'moral assimilationism', which bore within it some optimism that with sufficient education and moral uplift, African Americans could earn their rightful place.

Another perspective on the interaction of classical and industrial education was that of William J. Simmons, the president of the State University at Louisville, Kentucky, and one of the most influential black Baptist educators of the age. Like Payne, he expressed concern, not about industrial education per se, but about its potential to dilute and debase higher classical education. He argued that classical curricula should be kept separate from industrial education:

If the industrial craze be not watched, our literary institutions will be turned into workshops and our scholars into servants and journeymen. Keep the literary and industrial apart... We need scholars. All men are not workers in the trades, and never will be... In plainer words, let the student be free from industrial trade work when he has made certain grades in his classes. We want good workmen and good scholars, not deluded smatterers in either department.⁶⁴⁵

Simmons believed that students on higher academic courses should not be encumbered by industrial classes and requirements. Yet like Payne he believed that schools ought to teach the dignity of labor. They must learn the gospel of manual labor; not simply as a means of bread and butter, but an honorable

⁶⁴⁴Cook, 'Industrial or Higher Education', pp. 145–56

Angell and Pinn (eds.), *Social Protest Thought*, p. 89

⁶⁴⁵Turner, 'Introduction', in Simmons, *Men of Mark*, p. 51

calling and duty.’ He also felt that industrial courses themselves were too broad and ill-defined, insufficiently rigorous, and lacking sufficient specialisation. Rather than ‘Gingerbread work, fiddling with tools, frittering away time’, he felt that students should be ‘made master of a trade’, which, he argued, required study of the science underlying even industrial vocations:

the farmer should be educated in science, elementary engineering, mechanics and agriculture; the miner, mineralogy, geology, chemistry, and his own work; the merchant in geography, history, foreign language, political economy and laws; the machinist must master all the known powers of material nature — heat and cold, weight and impulse; matter in all conditions — liquid, solid and gaseous, standing or running, condensed or rare, adamantine or plastic — all must be seen through and comprehended by the master of modern mechanics. Architects, engineers, teachers and all classes of workers require a technical education.⁶⁴⁶

Though Simmons encouraged many young women at the State University to undertake the collegiate course, and many more were enrolled in the academically rigorous normal course, he also encouraged female domestic education:

I mean to take the female along too. They must be taught domestic economy, household ethics, home architecture, cookery, telegraphy, photography, printing, editorial work, dressmaking, tailoring, knitting, fancy work, nursing, dairying, horticulture, apiaculture, sericulture, poultry raising, stenography, type-writing, practical designs, painting, repousse work, etc., etc.⁶⁴⁷

His stated goal in female domestic education was to improve household management and domestic thrift. He made a point of the potential benefits to African-American society of wives who saved their husbands’ earnings

⁶⁴⁶Ibid., p. 52

⁶⁴⁷Ibid., p. 52

carefully. Simmons's concern was not with the virtues of industrial and vocational training but with its poor standards and its intermingling with classical study, to the detriment of both. He also shared Payne's view of the importance of focussing, concentrating, and consolidating scarce education resources, rather than divesting them too broadly. Just as Payne sought to concentrate the educational work of the AME Church solely at Wilberforce, so Simmons did not value mere numbers over higher standards, either in classical or industrial schools. He argued that 'It would be wiser to spend ten thousand dollars on a single school per year, and make a first class industrial department, than two thousand dollars on each of five schools.' Simmons, like Payne, carefully maintained the highest academic standards at the university he led. He was one of the most distinguished voices in African-American education, and certainly one of the most prominent among black church-led institutions. Payne and Simmons therefore represented the overarching caution expressed by independent black church universities to 'the industrial craze' of late nineteenth-century African-American education.⁶⁴⁸

The vision of education which privileged classical curricula over industrial and domestic training, as represented by Payne and Simmons, found its greatest continuation not within the remit of the African-American churches, but in W.E.B. Du Bois. It was Du Bois who, in the summer of 1906, made a scathing attack on the Hampton-Tuskegee model in a speech at the Hampton Institute. He characterised it as 'the soothing syrup attitude toward the race problem', and Hampton itself as 'an institution where the President of the United States can with applause tell young men not to hitch their wagons to

⁶⁴⁸Ibid., pp. 51–3

a star, but to a mule'.⁶⁴⁹ In its place, he argued, 'we must give to our youth a training designed above all to make them men of power, of thought, of trained and cultivated taste; men who know whither civilization is tending and what it means.'⁶⁵⁰ Though the term was originally coined by Henry Morehouse, the long-serving executive secretary of the American Baptist Home Mission Society, Du Bois advocated the education and leadership of the 'Talented Tenth', an elite vanguard whose talents and virtues would transcend racist assumptions and stake a claim to equality. They would 'guide the Mass away from the contamination and death of the Worst' and, Du Bois argued, 'The Talented Tenth rises and pulls all that are worth saving up to their vantage ground.'⁶⁵¹ Although he did not express its virtue in religious terms, Du Bois created and advocated an educational philosophy in which the highest academic standards were seen as virtuous and the uplift of the race was led by an intellectual elite. In a sense Du Bois's educational philosophy was the heir of Daniel Alexander Payne's.

It is within this context of the controversy over curricula, which contrasted industrial and agricultural education with classical academic subjects, that the educational experience of African-American women between the Civil War and the twentieth century must be understood. The great enthusiasm for the Hampton-Tuskegee model of industrial education was set against the inclination that for African Americans to stand on equal footing with

⁶⁴⁹W.E.B. Du Bois, 'The Hampton Idea', in W.E.B. Du Bois, H. Aptheker (ed.), *The Education of Black People: Ten Critiques, 1906-1960* (Amherst, MA, 1973), pp. 9, 12

⁶⁵⁰Ibid., p. 14

⁶⁵¹W.E.B. Du Bois, 'The Talented Tenth', in *The Negro Problem: A Series of Articles by Representative American Negroes of Today* (New York, 1903), pp. 33, 45
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 20, 25

whites, they must be educated to an equally high, and therefore classically academic standard. This tension defined the structure of education for women, particularly at church-led institutions, especially at Wilberforce University and Spelman Seminary, the leading centres for women's education within the African Methodist and black Baptist denominational polities respectively.

5.4 Philanthropy and funding

In spite of all the debate over industrial and classical education, James D. Anderson and Glenda Gilmore have rightly pointed out that the selection of college curricula was not purely a matter of theoretical pedagogy. Though during the Reconstruction era, funding for the education of African Americans was available through Reconstruction agencies, missionary societies like the American Missionary Association, and the federal government through the Freedmen's Bureau, by the late 1880s and 1890s this funding was dwindling. Of the major educational foundations dedicated to the funding of African-American education, only two were founded in the nineteenth century, the Peabody Education Fund (1867), and the John F. Slater Fund (1882). Rockefeller's General Education Board (1902), the Anna T. Jeanes Foundation (1907), the Phelps-Stokes Fund (1911), and the Julius Rosenwald Fund (1917) were all twentieth-century foundations.⁶⁵² By the late nineteenth century African-American institutions were increasingly dependent on philanthropy, and white philanthropists were increasingly persuaded by the merits of the

⁶⁵²U.W. Leavell, 'Trends of Philanthropy in Negro Education: A Survey', *The Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 2, No. 1 (January 1933), pp. 38–52

R.B. Westin, 'The State and Segregated Schools: Negro Public Education in North Carolina, 1863–1923' (PhD, Duke University, 1966), pp. 11–15

Hampton-Tuskegee model. Spurred by racist white characterisations of black barbarism, philanthropic funding increasingly gravitated away from institutions of higher learning towards those providing industrial and domestic education. Atticus G. Haygood, the general agent of the Alter Fund, made this preference clear in his 1890 report:

As to industrial training, so far as schools for Negroes are concerned, the discussion is now at an end. Men now consider only the question of method. Eight years ago industrial training was well under way at Hampton Institute; it was feebly attempted at three or four schools; not considered as possible at most of them; in not a few utterly condemned. Industrial departments are now recognized necessities everywhere.⁶⁵³

After J.L.M. Curry became general agent of the Peabody Fund in 1881, the two main education funds adopted a policy of concentrating their funding on industrial education. The Slater Fund dedicated over half of their total donations of \$60,000 to Hampton and Tuskegee, and both increased the pressure on other institutions to conform to their model.⁶⁵⁴ Racist discourse especially focussed on the supposed disarray of the black home and family and so the development of domestic courses became a particular condition of education funding. The character of black education fell firmly within the control of the white philanthropists upon whom it depended and classical education was therefore increasingly marginalised.⁶⁵⁵

⁶⁵³Quoted in W.E.B. Du Bois, *The Negro Artisan: A Social Study* (Atlanta, 1902), p. 41
G.H. Shattuck, 'Haygood, Atticus Greene', *American National Biography Online*
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00649.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁶⁵⁴Du Bois, *The Negro Artisan*, p. 42

W. Urban, 'Curry, Jabez Lamar Monroe', *American National Biography Online*
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00215.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

⁶⁵⁵Anderson, *The Education of Blacks in the South*, pp. 102–37

Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow* pp. 34, 138–42, 282 n. 115

A. Meier, *Negro Thought in America, 1880–1915* (Ann Arbor, MI, 1963), pp. 208–9, 221–2

This tendency was further exacerbated by the passage of the Morrill Act of 1890. It was an expansion of the 1862 Morrill Act which had granted federal lands in states, based upon the numbers of their Congressional delegations, for the establishment of agricultural colleges and universities. The 1890 Act aimed to increase the number of these land-grant colleges in the South, particularly for African-Americans. It stipulated that the colleges founded with the land grant had either to admit African Americans or else also establish a parallel institution for African Americans. The act resulted in the establishment of at least seventeen new agricultural and mechanical colleges for African Americans in the South. It served to reinforce the trend towards agricultural and industrial education for African Americans, and also the tendency towards racial segregation in higher education in the South, since many states opted to establish separate African-American colleges.⁶⁵⁶

Educational institutions responded to these developments by adapting their curricula and introducing more industrial and domestic courses. This did not necessarily entail wholesale restructuring of the pedagogic character of the institution. Many colleges for African Americans offered numerous courses of study and were divided into several departments. Most offered a classical course of study alongside a normal school programme and vocational and industrial courses. These were often preceded by a preparatory course. Indeed, even Hampton was divided into an academic department, a normal

⁶⁵⁶‘7 U.S. Code § 323 - Racial discrimination by colleges restricted’
[\[https://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/7/323\]](https://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/7/323) (Accessed April 2016)
 ‘Morrill Act: Primary Documents of American History (Virtual Services and Programs, Digital Reference Section, Library of Congress)’
[\[https://www.loc.gov/rr/program/bib/ourdocs/Morrill.html\]](https://www.loc.gov/rr/program/bib/ourdocs/Morrill.html) (Accessed April 2016)
 Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, pp. 75–6

department with modern school, an agricultural department, a department of productive industries and domestic work, and a trades school.⁶⁵⁷ Many colleges appended an industrial department to their existing curricula; others chose to emphasise their industrial departments in their fundraising efforts. Punctuating the academic day with mandatory domestic and industrial classes was common practice. Shaw University of Raleigh, North Carolina, was an institution of classical and higher learning, but it introduced a requirement for manual training in every year of study except the final year. As its course catalogue explained, ‘We do not teach trades, and make no pretensions to doing it, for we have no desire to inaugurate a trade school, but we do pretend to carry on industrial work along educational lines, and this work will be extended more and more as fast as financial means are obtained.’⁶⁵⁸ At Howard University, students in the preparatory and normal schools studied trades at ‘specified hours’.⁶⁵⁹ At Clark University in Atlanta, pupils at the common school took three years of industrial training. Tougaloo University in Jackson, Mississippi, combined industrial work with its grammar school, preparatory, and teacher training courses. Claflin University of Orangeburg, South Carolina, assigned four forty-five minute periods of manual training per week for students in its preparatory and normal courses. As Haygood noted, ‘Every school in connection with the Slater Fund recognizes the utility and necessity of industrial training; so does every important school for the Negro race whether aided by the fund or not.’⁶⁶⁰ Undoubtedly the increased focus on

⁶⁵⁷Du Bois, *emph*The Negro Artisan, p. 42

⁶⁵⁸*Ibid.*

⁶⁵⁹*Ibid.*, p. 47

⁶⁶⁰Quoted in *Ibid.*

For details on the manual and industrial education in the curricula of black colleges, see

industrial education, even within diverse curricula, must have compromised the standards of classical and higher education. Separate industrial departments consumed much of the funding they attracted and mandatory industrial classes in academic courses consumed class time. However, as James D. Anderson has illustrated, industrial training itself was merely highlighted for white audiences, and was not an academic ideal in itself. Industrial classes were foregrounded to attract funding, while academic classes were preserved behind that veneer. Biddle University of Charlotte, North Carolina, for example, proudly declared that each student spent one or two hours a day in the industrial department, four days a week. However, it also retained Hebrew as a required course of study in its ministerial training.⁶⁶¹

The dependence of black colleges on white philanthropy also compromised them in that it increased the pressure to end their co-education of males and females. Particularly in the South, and especially among private schools, co-education in higher education institutions for whites was proportionally far less common than in those for African Americans. Fears were expressed about the consequences of the proximity of men and women in such institutions, particularly with regard to the consequences for sexual morality. Such concerns resonated with the agents of educational foundations in the light of pervasive racist characterisations of African Americans as promiscuous. Separate education of women would also facilitate a greater focus on domestic education, cordoned-off from true academic study. However, the education of women

Du Bois, *The Negro Artisan*, pp. 42–58

⁶⁶¹J.D. Anderson, *The Education of Blacks in the South, 1860–1935* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1988), pp. 79–110

Du Bois, *The Negro Artisan*, p. 48

Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, pp. 138–9, 282, n. 115

was so important to the goal of improving the condition of black homes and families that it would not be sacrificed. It was also recognised that the vast majority of black women, unlike many white women, would have to work, usually either as domestics or as teachers, depending on their levels of education. Separate women's colleges were the ideal, but in reality this was rarely possible. Many black colleges set up during Reconstruction, including most denominational establishments, were co-educational and had to be continued to be supported as such. Continued co-education afforded black women the opportunity to attain education with a classical syllabus in a way that was impossible for most southern white women who were often limited to the study of art, music, and literature.⁶⁶²

The pedagogic philosophy of black education was not merely a matter of the preferences of black educators, but was dictated by the realities of funding. White education foundations and the models of Hampton, Tuskegee, and Booker T. Washington all compromised the possibilities of black educators. However, these possibilities were also dictated by the degree to which institutions were dependent on white support, which with regard to church-built institutions like Wilberforce and Spelman depended on the independence and structure of their parent denominations.

⁶⁶²Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, pp. 35–42

5.5 Wilberforce University and women's higher education in the African Methodist tradition

Wilberforce University had initially been founded in 1856 by the Cincinnati, Ohio, Conference of the Methodist Episcopal Church. The foundation had first been proposed at the 1854 conference, at which, by coincidence, Daniel Alexander Payne had been in attendance. The conference made clear its belief in the importance of securing the cooperation of the AME Church in the venture, and enlisted the willing Payne to secure it. Payne campaigned vigorously to secure support in his church, and brought the proposal before the 1856 General Conference. However, to Payne's dismay, the proposal was rejected due to a widespread suspicion of the Cincinnati Annual Conference's close association with the American Colonization Society.⁶⁶³ By the time of the AME General Conference, resolutions to establish the college had already passed the Cincinnati Conference, and on 30 April 1856 legal papers were submitted to the state of Ohio establishing Wilberforce University.⁶⁶⁴ Despite the AME Church's rejection of Wilberforce, Payne and two other AME members, the Rev. Lewis Woodson and Alfred Anderson, were elected to the board of trustees. Payne soon went on to serve on the scholarship committee and on a committee to select a new member of the faculty.⁶⁶⁵

During its early years, Wilberforce served as an institution where many

⁶⁶³Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', pp. 129–142

Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, pp. 74–7

Tyler has shown that, contrary to much of the historical literature, including Payne's own account, the Cincinnati Conference was closely tied to the ACS, and that the fears of many AME members were justified.

⁶⁶⁴Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 77

⁶⁶⁵Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', pp. 142–3

Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 79

southern slaveholders sent their illegitimate mixed-race children. As a result, much of the university's support came to an end when the Civil War drove its 'Chief patrons into the rebel army.'⁶⁶⁶ By June 1862 matters had come to a head. At a meeting of the board, the university's president, Richard S. Rust, resigned and the operation of the university was suspended for six months. Soon after the meeting, Rust approached Payne with the proposal that the AME Church purchase Wilberforce outright. Undaunted by his previous defeat, Payne agreed to the purchase and set about raising the required funds and seeking support within his church for his unilateral decision. Rather than present another resolution before the General Conference, he sought the support of the seven annual conferences individually. Each was to contribute towards the cost and in return had equal representation on the board of trustees. Payne need not have worried, though. Support for the purchase was almost unanimous in the AME Church, the previous objections against the white Methodists now being moot.⁶⁶⁷ On 11 June 1863, the purchase was completed and Payne was elected as the first African-American university president in the history of the United States. Wilberforce became the first

⁶⁶⁶D.A. Payne, 'The History of the Origin and Development of Wilberforce University', in Smith and Payne, *Biography of Rev. David Smith of the A.M.E. Church* (Xenia, OH, 1881), p. 111

B.W. Arnett, and S.T. Mitchell, *The Wilberforce Alumna: A Comprehensive Review of the Origin, Development, and Present Status of Wilberforce University* (Xenia, OH, 1885), pp. 17–18

H. Talbert, *The Sons of Allen: Together with a Sketch of the Rise and Progress of Wilberforce University, Wilberforce, Ohio* (Xenia, OH, 1906), pp. 267–8

Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', pp. 143–4

Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 260

Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 78

⁶⁶⁷D.A. Payne, 'Bishop Payne's appeal in behalf of the Wilberforce University', *The Christian Recorder* (4 April 1863), p. 1

university to be owned and operated by African Americans.⁶⁶⁸

Wilberforce was situated at Tawawa Springs, approximately three miles east of Xenia, Ohio. Xenia's black population was proportionally the largest in the state, and it grew rapidly after emancipation, more than doubling by 1870. More than ninety percent of this black population was concentrated in a small area at the east of the city. As well as the large AME Church there were two black Baptist churches in Xenia. The concentration of the black population in the east of the city concentrated black political power, and as a result African Americans maintained a presence on the city council and board of education. As a result of the large black community in Xenia, Wilberforce enjoyed strong local support and a degree of independence and security afforded to few black colleges.⁶⁶⁹

Indeed, one of the most distinctive features of Wilberforce was its academic independence. Alongside Payne, its faculty comprised many leading black intellectuals. Prof. John G. Mitchell, who was named on the deed along with Payne, was dean of the seminary and principal. Future AME bishop James A. Shorter served as treasurer, and Sarah Jane Woodson Early soon became the head of women's education. Among those who joined them in subsequent years were William S. Scarborough, later one of Payne's successors as president and lecturer in classical languages; Richard R. Wright, sociologist and later AME bishop; Theophilus Gould Steward, AME minister, missionary, and theologian;

⁶⁶⁸Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 423–38

Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, p. 81

Gregg, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 82–3, 106–10, 277–88

⁶⁶⁹Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, pp. 260–1

Talbert, *The Sons of Allen*, pp. 265–7

and W.E.B. Du Bois.⁶⁷⁰ Under black leadership, Wilberforce was able to shape African-American education for African Americans, and, under Payne's tenure, twenty-nine full graduates were produced. These included thirteen women, two of whom graduated from the classical department, six from the normal department, and two from the scientific department, including Hallie Quinn Brown, later president of the National Association of Colored Women, and a professor at Wilberforce herself.⁶⁷¹

Wilberforce was less subject to the whims of white philanthropy than most black colleges. Certainly Wilberforce depended on donations, but it was already well established by the time Reconstruction era educational funding evaporated, and always retained the support of the AME Church. Nevertheless, Payne had to work hard to fund Wilberforce, particularly in the early years. To fund the initial purchase of \$10,000, he proposed that each annual conference contribute \$2,000 over two years and appointed leaders within each conference responsible for the fundraising. Along with James A. Shorter and John G. Mitchell, Payne published repeated appeals for funds in

⁶⁷⁰Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 262

Meier, *Negro Thought in Americapp.* 210–14, 264

Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', p. 154

Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 349

⁶⁷¹Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 430–1

'A Sketch of the Life of Miss Hallie Quinn Brown', pp. 257–61

A.S. McFarlin, 'Hallie Quinn Brown: Black woman elocutionist', *Southern Speech Communication Journal* Vol. 46, No. 1 (1980), pp. 72–82

H.Q. Brown (ed.), *Homespun Heroines and Other Women of Distinction* (Xenia, OH, 1926)

D.C. Hine and E.B. Brown (eds.), *Black Women in America: An Historical Encyclopedia*, Vol. 1 (Oxford, 1993), p. 176

C. Strom, 'Brown, Hallie Quinn', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00121.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

'Brown, Hallie Quinn (1850–1949)'

[<http://www.blackpast.org/aah/brown-hallie-quinn-1850-1949>] (Accessed April 2016)

The Christian Recorder.⁶⁷² Ultimately the purchase was funded. However, Wilberforce soon experienced another crisis of funding on 14 April 1865, when much of the campus was damaged by arson.⁶⁷³ Of the \$30,000 in damage, only \$8,000 was covered by insurance.⁶⁷⁴ Payne undertook a fundraising tour of Europe to help provide for the rebuilding.⁶⁷⁵ By the time of his retirement from the presidency in 1876, Payne had raised in excess of \$92,000 for Wilberforce.⁶⁷⁶ Donations were secured in bequests from Chief Justice Salmon P. Chase and Charles Avery, founder of Avery College, of \$10,000 each. The abolitionist Gerrit Smith gave \$500. The Freedmen's Bureau provided \$28,000: an initial grant of \$3,000 at the discretion of its commissioner, Gen. Oliver O. Howard, followed by another \$25,000 granted by a joint resolution of Congress in the wake of a direct appeal by Payne.⁶⁷⁷ In 1867 and 1868, the Society for the Promotion of Collegiate and Theological Education at the West donated \$1,800, and the American Unitarian Association \$500 per annum between 1868 and 1875.⁶⁷⁸ The university continued to raise funds under Payne's successors as president. Under Benjamin F. Lee, president from 1876

⁶⁷²Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', pp. 152, 154

⁶⁷³Talbert, *The Sons of Allen*, pp. 272–3

Payne, *Recollections of Seventy Years*, pp. 153–4

Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', p. 155

⁶⁷⁴J. Cousins, 'An appeal on behalf of Wilberforce University', *The Christian Recorder* (2 September 1865)

⁶⁷⁵Strobert, *Daniel Alexander Payne*, pp. 87–98

Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', p. 156

⁶⁷⁶Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 192

Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', p. 157

⁶⁷⁷Letter from Daniel Alexander Payne to the Rev. T.M.D. Ward, 7 June 1870, Moorland-Spingarn Research Center, Box 80-1 (Daniel Alexander Payne Collection), fo. 3

⁶⁷⁸Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', pp. 157–8

Payne, *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 434–5

Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, p. 349

Talbert, *The Sons of Allen*, pp. 272–3

until 1884, over \$79,000 was raised, and in 1898 the state legislature of Ohio voted Wilberforce an endowment of over \$6,600.⁶⁷⁹ Ultimately Wilberforce was able to sustain itself as the AME Church's leading institution of higher learning, though Payne jealously guarded its revenues as other AME colleges were established. As a result it was able to maintain a relatively rigorous academic curriculum.

Payne was disparaging about the educational standards of Wilberforce under the MEC: 'The studies were elementary English studies; therefore the institution was improperly called a university.'⁶⁸⁰ After the AME Church took over, Payne set about reorganising Wilberforce and its curriculum to much higher standards. In addition to the existing preparatory department, the classical department was opened in 1866, the scientific department in 1867, and the normal department in 1872.⁶⁸¹ By the end of the century, four degrees were awarded: bachelor of arts, bachelor of divinity, bachelor of science, and bachelor of law. The classical curriculum featured ancient and modern languages, mathematics, science, rhetoric, and composition. Hebrew and theology were also requirements for ministerial candidates.⁶⁸²

Payne believed firmly in the importance of domestic education, and sought to ensure women would be educated in both classic subjects and domestic skills. Wilberforce was co-educational from the outset.⁶⁸³ Given its financial challenges, the AME Church could not afford a separate institution for the education of women. The daily routine at Wilberforce also reflected

⁶⁷⁹Smith, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church*, pp. 349–50

⁶⁸⁰Payne, *Recollections of Seventy Years*, p. 151

⁶⁸¹Tyler, 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne', p. 158

⁶⁸²Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 264

⁶⁸³Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 383 n. 34

Payne's disciplined personality. The morning began at 5:30, followed by mandatory attendance at chapel. Classes ran throughout the day, punctuated by military-style drill, supervised by the head of the school's military science department. Punctuality, hygiene, and moral restraint were emphasised. The use of alcohol or tobacco, gambling and profanity were all considered serious offences. Interactions between male and female students were strictly chaperoned, and there were even separate hallways for men and women. Payne aimed not only for academic excellence at Wilberforce, but also moral excellence.⁶⁸⁴

Wilberforce, though guided by Payne's preference for classical curricula, was not immune to the influence of industrial education. In 1888, the Republican-controlled Ohio state legislature voted funding for the establishment of a commercial, normal, and industrial department. The C.N.I. department provided a range of industrial courses including carpentry, sewing, printing, shoe-making, agriculture, blacksmithing, brickmaking, and masonry.⁶⁸⁵ The establishment of the C.N.I. department was accompanied by numerous scholarships, one to be awarded annually by each state legislator. As a result, the department brought Wilberforce a significant new source of funding, which helped support its range of classical courses alongside. The establishment of industrial education at Wilberforce did not significantly compromise its classical curricula.⁶⁸⁶

⁶⁸⁴Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, pp. 266–7

⁶⁸⁵Du Bois, *The Negro Artisan*, p. 47

Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 265

⁶⁸⁶D.A. Gerber, 'Segregation, Separatism, and Sectarianism: Ohio Blacks and Wilberforce University's Effort to Obtain Federal Funds, 1891', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 45, No. 1 (Winter 1976), pp. 1–20
Campbell, *Songs of Zion*, p. 265

Morris Brown College in Atlanta, another AME college, was established in 1885 and enrolled 107 students in its first year. It was specifically focussed on teacher training. Like Wilberforce, it established an industrial department alongside its classical, collegiate, preparatory, music, theology, and law departments.⁶⁸⁷ Similarly, Paul Quinn College of Waco, Texas, had an industrial department and it attempted to integrate elements of industrial training throughout its syllabuses.⁶⁸⁸

The principal college of the AME Zion Church was Livingstone College. Zion Wesley Institute had been founded in Concord, North Carolina, in 1879, but it soon foundered as it depended almost exclusively on donations from AME Zion congregations in the North Carolina Conference. It was reopened in nearby Salisbury on 9 October 1882 as a result of the efforts of Bishop James Walker Hood and the Rev. Joseph Charles Price. They had set out to reopen the college while attending the World Ecumenical Methodist Conference in London the previous year. Price became Livingstone's first president and declared his purpose as 'the education of the head, the heart, the hand of the Negro youth of America.'⁶⁸⁹ Like Wilberforce, Livingstone taught mostly classical curricula, and included theological, classical, normal and preparatory departments.⁶⁹⁰

⁶⁸⁷A.S. Cochran, 'The Development of Teacher Education at Morris Brown College', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol.16, No. 2 (Spring 1947), pp. 246–251
 'Morris Brown College', *The Christian Recorder* (30 August 1894)
 Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, pp. 94–5

⁶⁸⁸Du Bois, *The Negro Artisan*, p. 52

⁶⁸⁹W.L. Yates, *He Spoke, Now They Speak: A Collection of Speeches and Writings of and on the Life and Works of J.C. Price* (Salisbury, NC, 1952), p. 14
 B.A. Johnson, 'History of Livingstone College', *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 5, No. 1 (April 1895), p. 13

Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, p. 40

⁶⁹⁰Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, pp. 36–42, 140–1

Livingstone's first enrolled student was a woman, among five students enrolled on the first day. Within a matter of weeks, Lizzie Williams of Newbern, North Carolina, became the first student enrolled from beyond Salisbury. Soon dormitory space became scarce. A dormitory initially for male students was given over to females by the end of the second year, by which time 120 students were enrolled. A purpose-built women's dormitory was erected in the summer of 1883, and another, Hopkins Hall, was built in 1886. Women were also on Livingstone's faculty from the outset. Victoria Richardson was one of the first faculty members, and Mrs. M.E. Harris served as matron. Richardson would later become principal of the preparatory department, assisted by Mary A. Lynch and Annie C. Tucker.⁶⁹¹

Strict moral standards were observed regarding the interaction of male and female students, as at Wilberforce. Rather than dancing together, students would march in single-sex formations to music for amusement. Yet co-education at Livingstone was controversial, and some parents of students urged the Zion Church to open a separate single-sex institution for women. Ultimately maintaining Livingstone alone was too costly for this suggestion to have been viable. Nevertheless, the Rev. E.D.W. Jones staunchly defended co-education arguing that 'Livingstone College is doing for women what no other institution is doing, bringing her up to be the equal of her eternal antagonist, man, in debate, in public spirit, in morals and thought'.⁶⁹²

Livingstone had initially received some contributions from the Slater Fund,

⁶⁹¹E.D.W. Jones, 'The Commencement', *The Star of Zion* (9 June 1898), p. 1
Johnson, 'History of Livingstone College', pp. 8–15

Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, pp. 36–42, 140–1

⁶⁹²Jones, 'The Commencement', p. 1

and had consequently also taught industrial courses, though these became neglected after that funding was withdrawn in 1893.⁶⁹³ By 1902, it was clear that Livingstone once again needed to appeal to white philanthropic funds. Bishop Hood wrote to the Rockefeller fund, explaining that ‘The moral and intellectual training [at Livingstone] is not excelled by any, [but] we have not been able to do what we have desired on industrial lines, because we have not had the means.’⁶⁹⁴ The next year, Livingstone merged with East Tennessee Industrial School and introduced industrial courses. They highlighted female domestic education, in particular, in their presentation to white audiences, but as with Wilberforce, they used the resultant funding to continue to support classical education, too.⁶⁹⁵

5.6 Baptist institutions and single sex colleges

Spelman Seminary, later renamed Spelman College in 1927, opened for teaching on 11 April 1881 in the basement of Friendship Baptist Church in Atlanta, Georgia. Initially known as the Atlanta Baptist Female Seminary, it had been founded by two northern white Baptist women, Sophia B. Packard and Harriet E. Giles, after Packard had been shocked by the condition of black women in the South while serving as a missionary the previous year. Their avowed purpose in the school was to ‘train the intellect, to store the mind with useful knowledge, to induce habits of industry and a desire for general information, to inspire a love for the true and the beautiful, and to

⁶⁹³ Johnson, ‘History of Livingstone College’, p. 13

⁶⁹⁴ Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, p. 140

⁶⁹⁵ Ibid.

prepare the pupils for the practical duties of life.’⁶⁹⁶ Spelman was the first collegiate level institution specifically for black women.

Initially the school was poorly provisioned. It operated out of a cramped one-room church basement, not large enough to meet the demand. The school lacked blackboards and textbooks. Henry Morehouse, field agent of the ABHMS, commented that it was ‘dark, damp, so full of smoke at times that a visitor declared it was difficult to tell, across the room, who were white and who were black.’⁶⁹⁷ It was described in *The Home Mission Monthly* as ‘an unhealthy place and ill adapted to the uses of a school.’⁶⁹⁸ The education provided was initially basic as a result, little more than a Sunday or primary school, covering basic literacy and numeracy. In 1883, the situation was partly remedied, when the school moved out of the church basement to a larger property, a former Union barracks, on a tract of land adjacent to the all-male Atlanta Baptist Seminary.⁶⁹⁹ The school’s financial difficulties were significantly ameliorated when, in 1884, John D. Rockefeller donated over \$7,000 in order to pay off the mortgage on the new school property. In return, the school was renamed Spelman Seminary in honour of Rockefeller’s wife’s family. The Slater Fund also contributed to Spelman, paying the teachers in the Industrial Department and providing it with a printing press in the

⁶⁹⁶Y.L. Watson-Moore, ‘Training the head, the hand, and the heart: The evolution of the academic curriculum of Spelman College (1881–1953)’ (Georgia State University, Ph.D. thesis, 2000), p. 10

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 32

⁶⁹⁷Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 32

⁶⁹⁸‘Woman’s American Baptist Home Mission Society’, *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol 5, No. 1 (January 1883), p. 44

⁶⁹⁹Watson-Moore, ‘Training the head, the hand, and the heart’, pp. 54, 57–9
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 32

1884–85 academic year.⁷⁰⁰

The first class at the school had comprised eleven students, but the numbers enrolled grew rapidly. By the close of the school's first year 175 had enrolled, and by 1883 this had grown to almost 300. By the end of that year the number was 412, and by 1885 it was 645, of whom 250 were boarders.⁷⁰¹ It was not until 1887 that Spelman graduated its first students with high school diplomas, and not until 1901 with bachelor's degrees.⁷⁰² Packard and Giles jointly headed Spelman until 1888, when Packard was appointed president. Packard served as president until her death in 1891, when she was succeeded by Giles, who held the position until 1909. Initially there were only four teachers in the 'basement school'. Once the school moved to its new premises, more teachers were employed. There were nine by the end of 1883. Although

⁷⁰⁰'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (January 1883), p. 44

'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 115

'Educational Department — Schools for the Colored People', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 183

Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', pp. 61–2

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 32

⁷⁰¹'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (January 1883), pp. 19–20

'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (January 1883), p. 43

'Women's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 20

'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 43

'Educational Department — Schools for the Colored People', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 183

'Spelman Seminary, Atlanta, Ga. - Review of the Year', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 231

Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', pp. 10, 58

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 31–2

⁷⁰²'Spelman History in Brief' [<http://www.spelman.edu/about-us/history-in-brief>] (Accessed April 2016)

Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', p. 73

one of the primary purposes of the school was the training of black women as teachers, few African Americans were employed on the mostly white faculty. The first was Dr. Sophia Jones, who organised Spelman's school of nursing in 1886.⁷⁰³

As its curriculum developed, Spelman taught a diverse range of subjects. Much of its focus was on domestic and industrial training, but it also taught more formal academic subjects. It aimed to prepare its students to be useful in society as agents of racial progress. Packard and Giles recognised that many of Spelman's graduates would pursue careers as teachers, and some would serve as missionaries. They aimed to create a vanguard of black women teachers who could carry the educational impulse beyond Spelman's walls. However, their greatest emphasis was on Christianity, conversion, and piety. Indeed, Spelman's motto was 'Our Whole School for Christ'. In their 1883 report to the Women's American Baptist Home Mission Society, Packard and Giles wrote, 'It is essential that these colored people shall be Christianized as well as educated.' In addition to their teaching, they led four prayer meetings and four Bible readings, and taught two Bible classes each week in addition to distributing dozens of Bibles. Prayer meetings were not listed on the syllabus, but rather as mandatory in the school's regulations. Pious, moral character, courtesy, deportment, personal presentation, and self-control were all required of students and strictly enforced. Almost every report of Spelman in *The Home Mission Monthly* made a point of reporting how many of the

⁷⁰³'Women's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 20
F.M. Read, *The Story of Spelman* (Atlanta, GA, 1961), p. 86
Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', pp. 2, 55
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 34

students had experienced conversion. Religiosity was imbued throughout the institutional character of Spelman.⁷⁰⁴

Domestic, industrial, and preparatory education were emphasised more than higher learning, especially in Spelman's early years. As Beverly Guy-Sheftall has noted, 'Spelman's founders never agonized over the need to offer their black female students the classical education which male students were being offered elsewhere.'⁷⁰⁵ The industrial department was initiated in 1883 and taught numerous domestic skills including cooking, dress-making, sewing, housekeeping, and laundry. Among the facilities provided were sewing machines and a large laundry, installed in 1885. Though teacher training was also an important focus for Spelman, its reports to various Baptist missionary societies indicate that the industrial department's domestic training was a particular source of pride.⁷⁰⁶

As time went on, Spelman's range of courses became more diverse and sophisticated. Teacher training had begun in a rudimentary fashion with the establishment of a 'model school' by one of the teachers, Caroline Glover. It was in 1891 that the curriculum was drastically revised under the advice of

⁷⁰⁴'Women's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 20

'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 43

'Spelman Seminary, Atlanta, Ga. — Review of the Year', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 231

Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', pp. 10, 55–6, 64–6

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 34–5

⁷⁰⁵B. Guy-Sheftall, *Spelman: A Centennial Celebration, 1881–1981* (1981), p. 27

Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', p.17

⁷⁰⁶'Spelman Seminary, Atlanta, Ga. — Review of the Year', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), pp. 231–2

Du Bois, *The Negro Artisan*, pp. 45–6

Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', pp. 3, 17–18, 54–8

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 33–4

the ABHMS superintendent of education, Malcolm MacVicar. Prior to that Spelman had offered an elementary course, a scientific course, a missionary training course, a nursing course, and two normal courses. On MacVicar's recommendation collegiate and academic departments were added, the former of which offered a classical four year bachelor's degree. Shortly after being appointed president of Spelman that same year, Giles also set about improving the standards of teacher training at Spelman, introducing modern teacher training methods and the teaching of educational theory. In spite of all these improvements, it is clear, however, that in the nineteenth century the academic standards of Spelman fell far below those of the leading African Methodist-led colleges.⁷⁰⁷

Unlike the African Methodist colleges open to women, Spelman was a single-sex institution. When it was first proposed for Spelman to move out of the 'basement school', the ABHMS proposed a merger with the male Atlanta Baptist Seminary to form a co-educational college. This proposal was rejected by Packard and Giles with support from their missionary society in New England. They wrote in their annual report of their 'convictions of the wisdom of continuing... as a *separate girls school*.'⁷⁰⁸ In refusing the merger they forfeited ABHMS funding for the purchase of their new site. Therefore they depended instead on the donation from Rockefeller as well as over \$7,500 raised by their missionary society in New England to fund the purchase.⁷⁰⁹

⁷⁰⁷Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', pp. 11–12, 54–6, 63–9 Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 33–7

The full syllabus of the normal and academic departments for 1881 is reproduced in Read, *The Story of Spelman*, p. 379, and in Appendix A of this thesis.

⁷⁰⁸Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', p. 58 (emphasis in original)

⁷⁰⁹Educational Department — Schools for the Colored People', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 6, No. 1 (January 1884), p. 183

Another noteworthy single-sex Baptist school for black women was the Mather school. It was one of the earliest postbellum schools in the South for black women, founded in 1867 in Beaufort, South Carolina, by the Boston missionary Rachel Crane Mather. In 1882, the WABHMS took responsibility for the school's financial support. The Mather school was not as well funded or as large and prestigious as Spelman became. It comprised preparatory, normal, and industrial departments, but unlike Spelman it did not establish a full collegiate course during the nineteenth century. Like Spelman though, it prioritised elementary and high school education, and particularly focussed on domestic and teacher training. Unlike the African Methodist colleges it did not attempt to provide courses in higher and classical subjects.⁷¹⁰

Black Baptists did not only support single-sex colleges, however. Several colleges were supported by black Baptist state conventions. As for the African Methodist colleges, those principally supported by black Baptists could ill afford separate single-sex colleges, so their institutions were co-educational. Often these colleges received much of their financial support from black Baptist women's auxiliary conventions. They were therefore established in states whose women's conventions were strongest and earliest established, most notably the State University at Louisville in Kentucky, and Selma

Watson-Moore, 'Training the head, the hand, and the heart', pp. 57–8

⁷¹⁰ *Good News: The Story of the Mather School* (Original film from the collections of the American Baptist Historical Society, 1949)

'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (January 1883), p. 43

'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (January 1883), p. 67

'Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society', *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (January 1883), pp. 92–3

University in Alabama.⁷¹¹

Table 8: Enrolment in the State University at Louisville, Kentucky⁷¹²

Academic year	Enrolled		Graduated	
	Total	Ministerial	Normal school	Collegiate
1879–80	25			
1880–81	111			
1882–83	192	22		
1883–84	205	20	11	3
1884–85	205		9	
1886–87	175	18	7	4
1889–90	212	22	11	3
1890–91	250	23	12	3
1891–92	290			

The State University at Louisville, Kentucky, was founded in 1879 as the Kentucky Normal and Theological Institute, sponsored and controlled by the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky.⁷¹³ It was renamed as the State University in 1884 after the approval of a new charter by the

⁷¹¹Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, pp. 280–2

⁷¹²*Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, held with the Virginia Street Baptist Church, Hopkinsville, Ky., August 17, 18, 19, 20, and 21, 1881* (Louisville, KY, 1882), p. 19
General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884, pp. 10, 32, 36
Minutes of the Seventeenth Annual Session of the General Association Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1885, p. 18
Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, p. 41
Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second, Twenty-third, and Twenty-fourth Annual Sessions, 1890, 1891, & 1892, pp. 21, 38

⁷¹³*General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 10
'State University of Louisville', *Home Mission Echo* (March 1989), p. 6
Lawrence H. Williams, *Black Higher Education in Kentucky, 1879–1930* (Lewistown, NY, 1987), p. 20
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 59

state legislature, and would later be renamed Simmons University in 1918.⁷¹⁴ Enrolment was initially slow, and the school struggled financially. Its fortunes improved rapidly when William J. Simmons was appointed the president of the school for its second year, beginning on 18 September 1880. At the time, the school reportedly 'had but thirteen pupils, two teachers and an empty treasury.'⁷¹⁵ Table 8 shows the numbers enrolled as reported in the minutes of General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, and, of those, how many were ministerial students, and the numbers of normal school and collegiate course graduates, when reported. In 1884, one of the graduates from the academic department, and at least three from the normal department were women, as were at least four of the normal school graduates in 1890. In 1887 all four of the collegiate graduates, and two from the normal course were women.

The university had significant costs. The property in Louisville was purchased for \$18,000, in addition to which, by 1891, the university had debts for repairs and maintenance totalling \$4,000.⁷¹⁶ Even what property it had was cramped. It was noted that 'It was crowded with students to its utmost capacity', which forced the university 'to crowd the students into uncomfortable quarters.' The General Association repeatedly stressed the

⁷¹⁴*General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 37

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 59

The name did not imply that it was a public university — it remained controlled by the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky. The approval of its charter had passed the legislature two years earlier, but had not been fully enacted due to an oversight.

⁷¹⁵Turner, 'Introduction', in Simmons, *Men of Mark*, p. 45

⁷¹⁶*Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, p. 16

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 281

need to 'provide more room to accommodate the students.'⁷¹⁷

Therefore, as well as boosting enrolment, Simmons led a wide range of funding campaigns. He personally made numerous fundraising tours both in Kentucky and nationally. As one of his 'plans to raise money to carry on the Institute, Prof. Simmons suggested the organization of a troupe of Juvenile Jubilee Singers', with which he made several fundraising tours.⁷¹⁸ He also frequently travelled the country soliciting funds from philanthropists and white Baptist organisations, notably securing \$500 from John D. Rockefeller in 1884. Other prominent members of the Kentucky Association also toured to secure funds, including the Rev. A. Barry, who secured a donation of \$500 from Kentucky's white Baptist association.⁷¹⁹ Indeed, predominantly white Baptist organisations made numerous contributions to the school, including the ABHMS, which raised an annual appropriation. Sums from the ABHMS reported in the minutes of the Colored Baptists of Kentucky include \$1,500 in 1881, \$2,715 in 1884, and \$2,000 in 1887. In 1888, the ABHMS contributed \$7,800 to complete the payment of the university's mortgage.⁷²⁰

⁷¹⁷ *Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, pp. 16, 20
General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884, p. 36
Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second, Twenty-third, and Twenty-fourth Annual Sessions, 1890, 1891, & 1892, p. 38

⁷¹⁸ *Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, p. 20

⁷¹⁹ *Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, p. 20
General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884, p. 37

⁷²⁰ *Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, p. 20
General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884, p. 38
Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association

These donations were initially secured by Simmons and their continuation was doubtless in part due to his close relationship with the ABHMS, having been made its District Secretary for the South in 1887.⁷²¹

The Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky was also instrumental in the funding of the university. Its constitution specified that the convention's purposes were 'To encourage the attendance at the youth of our State at the State University, that they may secure a Christian education...[and] To contribute to the funds for the payment of the debt on the property of the State University.'⁷²² At their initial meeting in 1883 they raised \$711.15 for the university.⁷²³ By 1891, the convention had raised \$5,889.46, including \$1,201.66 in 1890, and by 1900 it had raised over \$12,000.⁷²⁴ They succeeded in their constitutional aim of funding a women's dormitory, and contributed to the elimination of the university's mortgage and other debts. In addition to direct fundraising, they led the efforts to encourage enrolment; they organised 'children's bands' to encourage attendance, educate children, raise the profile of the university, and raise

of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, p. 42

Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of the Sixth Session, 1888, p. 19

Minutes of the Seventh Session. The Baptist Women's Educational Convention, 1889, p. 12

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 281

⁷²¹*Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887*, pp. 42–3

Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883–87, p. 40

⁷²²*Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883–87*, p. 2

⁷²³*General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 36

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 280

⁷²⁴Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 281
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 61

money; and they organised boxes of provisions — food, crockery, clothing, bedsheets, stationery — to be sent to the university.⁷²⁵

The State University was remarkable for its high academic standards. It had initiated its collegiate department in 1882, and it also had preparatory, normal school, and model school departments. Its collegiate department followed a classical curriculum based on that of Howard University where Simmons himself had studied. In 1884, the General Association encouraged the introduction of an industrial department, noting that it ‘will furnish practice to the idea that the body as well as the mind should be educated... This will also place us in a position to obtain aid from the “Slater Fund”’. By the time of the 1887 meeting of the General Association, the industrial department was in operation, teaching subjects including sewing, printing, cooking, and telegraphy.⁷²⁶ The university had an almost exclusively black faculty, led by Simmons, who was praised for his virtues as an educator by Henry McNeal Turner:⁷²⁷

⁷²⁵ *Baptist Women’s Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of 1st, 2d, 3d, 4th, 5th sessions, 1883–87*, pp. 22, 30

Baptist Women’s Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of the Sixth Session, 1888, pp. 15, 19

Cook, ‘The Work for Baptist Women’, in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, pp. 280–1

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 60–61

⁷²⁶ *General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 37

Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, pp. 41–2

Turner, ‘Introduction’, in Simmons, *Men of Mark*, p. 43

S.D. Martin. ‘Simmons, William James’, *American National Biography Online* [<http://www.anb.org/articles/14/14-00561.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 59–60, 248 n. 36

⁷²⁷ *Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, p. 16

Twenty-first Annual Report of the Woman’s American Baptist Home Mission Society with the Report of the Annual Meeting Held in the Free St. Baptist Church, Portland,

As an educator, he has likely no superiors. Discarding specialism in education, he claims that ideal manhood and womanhood cannot be narrowed down to any one sphere of action, but that the whole being — every faculty with which we are endowed — must receive proper development. No boy or girl comes under his influence without feeling a desire to become useful and great. He infuses inspiration into the least ambitious. He has a knack of ‘drawing out’ all there is within.⁷²⁸

Just as Simmons encouraged the black Baptist women of Kentucky to organise a state convention, so he also strongly encouraged the education of women at the State University. The faculty too was comprised in large part of women. Upon his appointment he was initially assisted by Mrs. C.V. Parris as Matron, who resigned and was replaced by Mrs. M.F. Otey of Washington at the end of fall term, 1881. They were soon joined by Georgia Gaddie at the head of the primary department and Miss S. Gertrude Walters in charge of music.⁷²⁹ By 1884, seven of the nine faculty members named in the General Association minutes were women, and by 1887 it was seven of thirteen, on both occasions including the heads of the normal department and model school.⁷³⁰ Many of the female teachers were the wives of leading Baptist ministers, or of other professors at the university, though they were accomplished in their own right, and most were also prominent in the Baptist Women’s Educational Convention.⁷³¹

Maine, May 3–4, 1899, (Boston, 1899) pp. 93–4

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 61, 248 n. 42

⁷²⁸Turner, ‘Introduction’, in Simmons, *Men of Mark*, p. 46

⁷²⁹*Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, pp. 19–20

⁷³⁰*General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 37
Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, pp. 41–2

⁷³¹Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 367–74, 376–81, 410–19
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 62–3
See also section 5.7

As well as emphasising high academic standards, the State University also sought to instil moral virtue and piety in its students, and upheld strict standards of discipline. The General Association frequently praised the ‘very good discipline, [and] high state of moral excellence among the students’. The minutes noted ‘that the students are above the average in morals. . . [and] the Faculty are strict in administering the discipline’.⁷³² They also often made reference to the powerful religious influence of the university’s milieu on its students and enumerated the conversions there, as at the start of the 1890–91 school year, when ‘deep religious feeling was spontaneously manifested among the students, and in less than two weeks forty happy souls professed a hope in Christ.’ Likewise twelve conversions were reported for 1880–81, fifty-four for 1882–83, and a revival at the university in early spring of 1890 ‘resulted in fourteen students professing a hope in Christ.’⁷³³

The black Baptists of Alabama had been quick to follow their counterparts in Kentucky in organising a women’s convention, and so they were also quick to follow their lead in establishing a university. The Alabama Colored Baptist State Convention had been formed in 1868, and soon after the foundation of a theological school was suggested. The project was led by William McAlpine, who proposed it at the 1873 convention and was selected to be its primary fundraiser the following year. By 1877 he and Charles Octavius Boothe had

⁷³² *General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, pp. 10, 36

⁷³³ *Thirteenth Annual Session. Minutes of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1881*, p. 20
General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884, p. 36
Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second, Twenty-third, and Twenty-fourth Annual Sessions, 1890, 1891, & 1892, pp. 21, 38

selected Selma as the site, and the school opened as the Alabama Normal and Theological School in January 1878. Initially it occupied Saint Phillip Street Baptist Church, but within a year it moved to a 36 acre site, formerly the 'Old Fair Grounds', purchased for \$3,000, with its buildings renovated for a further \$700. Although it did employ black teachers, unlike the Wilberforce University or the State University at Louisville, it was not initially led by a black president, but rather by Harrison Woodsmall, a white missionary from Indiana. The school was incorporated in 1881. Its fortunes were vastly improved by the appointment of Edward M. Brawley as president in October 1883. He reorganised the college, establishing a collegiate department and doubling the number of students.⁷³⁴ It changed its name to Selma University in 1885, then to Alabama Baptist Colored University in 1895, then finally back to Selma University in 1905. Its primary teaching was elementary, high school, normal school, and ministerial training programmes.⁷³⁵ Having started with 4 students in 1878, it had expanded to 382 by 1900, 57 of whom were ministerial students. By 1894, it had awarded 94 diplomas, and by 1900, it had graduated 142 students from the normal school and a further 15 from the collegiate course. Selma University was not noted for offering industrial education during the nineteenth century (it would begin to offer industrial courses in 1921). However, nor did Selma University achieve high standards of classical education. As its enrolment numbers suggest, its collegiate course was a comparatively minor part of its teaching. Those it taught to a higher

⁷³⁴Simmons, *Men of Mark*, p. 911

⁷³⁵*Minutes of the Women's Baptist State Convention, Ninth Annual Session, 1894*, p. 10
 F.E. Brooks and G.L. Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities: An Encyclopedia* (Santa Barbara, CA, 2011), pp. 81–2

level were mostly destined to be teachers. Selma University received significant levels of support from the Alabama Baptist Women's State Convention. Each year, the minutes of its annual session reiterated the need for

women to raise up this institution for the training of preachers and teachers, thus helping to lift our people from ignorance, superstition and sin, and making them useful men and women. . . [and] that the Women's Baptist State Convention would more earnestly attempt to make our school at Selma all that it should be. That we put our united efforts in arranging better buildings on our school grounds, and that we use every effort to secure students for our school, thus showing our loyalty to our denomination.⁷³⁶

As a result, the Women's Convention pledged to raise funds towards the '\$25,000 [needed] for building, \$5,000 for library, press, school apparatus, etc. And our teacher [sic] should have better salaries.'⁷³⁷ They funded the construction of a 'hall for young women on the university grounds', costing more than \$4,000.⁷³⁸ While Kentucky demonstrated most clearly demonstrated the importance of women's conventions to the establishment of independent black Baptist colleges, the women of Alabama showed that the Kentuckians were not alone in these efforts.⁷³⁹

⁷³⁶ *Minutes of the Eighth Annual Session of the Baptist Woman's State Convention, held with the Gilfield Baptist Church, Wetumpka, Ala.* (1893), p. 6

⁷³⁷ *Minutes of the Sixth Annual Session of the Baptist Women's State Convention, 1891*, p. 22

⁷³⁸ Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, p. 282

⁷³⁹ *Minutes of the Sixth Annual Session of the Baptist Woman's State Convention, 1891*, pp. 14, 22

Minutes of the Seventh Annual Session of the Baptist Women's State Convention, 1892, p. 13

Minutes of the Eighth Annual Session of the Baptist Woman's State Convention, p. 6

Minutes of the Women's Baptist State Convention, Ninth Annual Session, 1894, p. 10

Cook, 'The Work for Baptist Women', in Brawley (ed.), *The Negro Baptist Pulpit*, pp. 281-3

Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, pp. 81-2

5.7 Denominations, co-education, and the legacy of black women's education

At three of the most influential colleges for black women in the late nineteenth century, Wilberforce, Spelman, and the State University at Louisville, the experience and outcomes of the educational process were characterised by the balance of classical academic study against industrial and domestic training. At none of these schools was either excluded entirely, and the perception that pedagogical choices for African-American educators in the late nineteenth century were binary is misleading. Decisions about the style of curricula were defined to a significant degree by the necessities of funding. As a result, black women's educational experiences at these church-led colleges were shaped by two primary factors. The first of these was whether the religious institution supporting the college was a white missionary organisation, as in the case of Spelman, or an independent African-American denomination, as in the cases of Wilberforce, Livingstone, and the State University at Louisville. This in turn influenced the nature of the leadership, administration, and faculty of the college. Where Wilberforce was headed by Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne and an unparalleled black faculty, Spelman was led by Packard and Giles, and staffed almost exclusively by white teachers. However, benevolent white missionary educators may have been, they brought assumptions to their educational work based on racist prejudices about the capacities of black women and their future potential, as well as pedagogical models based on experience in white education. Black-led institutions were inherently more capable of tailoring the education they provided to the needs of their black

students.

The second, related factor, in shaping educational philosophies was whether the institution was co-educational. In part, whether a school was co-educational was a product of the nature of the supporting denomination. The pressures of financing their co-educational colleges was such that for independent black denominations to establish separate single-sex colleges would have been financially impossible. If women were to receive higher education under the auspices of those churches it had to be in co-educational colleges. By contrast, white educators and missionaries understood their educational work on the basis of their knowledge of white colleges and institutions. In the South, education for white women was usually separate from that for men. White Baptist missionaries were therefore inclined to establish their schools and colleges on such a basis. They also had the means to do so, being well supported by their missionary societies, and being more easily able to secure finance from philanthropic funds than black-led institutions.

Historians have disagreed about the comparative effects of co-education and single-sex education on women. Beverly Guy-Sheftall has argued that separate education of black women allowed provision for the distinctive educational needs of black women, which in co-educational institutions were subordinate to the educational priorities of male students. She also argued that women's colleges have traditionally been more willing to place women in positions of authority.⁷⁴⁰ Certainly, in providing separate colleges for women, Baptist missionaries ensured that the education they offered black women was

⁷⁴⁰'Black Women and Higher Education: Spelman and Bennett Colleges Revisited', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3 (Summer 1982), pp. 279–80

better funded than that at Wilberforce or Livingstone. However, it was also less academically rigorous and imbued with assumptions about the necessity of domestic education for African Americans. Furthermore while Wilberforce employed African American women on its faculty as early as 1866, it was not until 1955 that Dr. Willa Player became the first black woman president of a black women's college, Bennett College.⁷⁴¹ As Glenda Gilmore has argued, rather than enhancing women's education, single-sex education for African-American women distanced them from classical education which was the most effective training for leadership.⁷⁴² Certainly both Spelman and Wilberforce produced leaders who drove forward the black women's movement in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, but it is to Wilberforce, not Spelman, that we must look for the pioneering history of black women's education.

How can the relative impacts of these two factors on the outcomes of church-led education for African-American women be weighed? One approach would be to examine statistics for enrolment, numbers of graduates, and of teachers in order to attempt to situate the African-American church-led schools and universities in a broader numerical context. An invaluable source for such statistics is the surveys conducted by the Atlanta Conference of Atlanta University in 1902, edited by W.E.B. Du Bois. More than thirty black colleges and universities had been founded by 1877, and around one hundred by 1900.⁷⁴³ Almost all of these offered some industrial courses and enrolled

⁷⁴¹Ibid., pp. 281–2

⁷⁴²Gilmore, *Gender and Jim Crow*, pp. 37–43

⁷⁴³Du Bois (ed.), *The Negro Artisan*, pp. 34–7, 66–8

Brooks and Starks, *Historically Black Colleges and Universities*, pp. vii–ix, xvii–xx, 18, 75

some proportion of their students on them. The Atlanta Conference surveyed ninety-eight schools and compiled, among other information, details of their total numbers of enrolled students, the total number of those enrolled in industrial training, and breakdowns of which specific industrial subjects were studied. A selection of these data is reproduced in Appendix B, including figures for sewing and cooking courses, being those for which data were gathered and which were specifically aimed at women. In the absence of more gender-specific enrolment data in the study, this serves as an approximation for the female proportion of the enrolment. At the schools which reported both total enrolment and numbers for industrial courses, more than 56% of the students studied industrial, manual, or domestic courses. Of those approximately 53% took sewing courses. Almost 27,000 students were enrolled at the surveyed institutions, 15,000 studied industrial courses, and almost 8,000 took sewing classes.⁷⁴⁴

Industrial education constituted a very significant proportion of education for African Americans by the end of the nineteenth century. Domestic courses for women were also a large part of industrial and manual training for African Americans at this time. It is not clear, however, to what extent women's domestic courses were comparable with other industrial courses. As the Atlanta University study noted, 'These gross numbers, however, are of little value on account of the varying value and thoroughness of the courses given. The easiest course is that of sewing for girls, and this one item swells the

⁷⁴⁴Since sewing student numbers may have overlapped with cooking students in the survey, aggregating the figures was not possible, so the figure for sewing alone was used in this calculation.

returns unduly for it is often given in a desultory way.⁷⁴⁵ So while the figures for which courses were taken can offer some insight into the significant extent to which women students were subject to the trend towards industrial education, this must remain somewhat impressionistic.

To situate the church-led schools highlighted in this chapter in this broader spectrum, it is necessary to disaggregate these data. The Atlanta study offered a tentative potential categorisation of industrial schools based on the extent of their industrial offering and the significance thereof in their curricula. This classification is reproduced in Appendix C. Clearly in this classification, the leading church-led schools rank as offering and requiring comparatively little industrial and domestic education. However, it also shows that a significant number of the schools surveyed made industrial and domestic training their primary focus (those classified in the study as trade schools and manual training schools). Many more had industrial courses as ‘more or less compulsory’, including Wilberforce. It is worth noting, however, that by 1900 Wilberforce was moving away from a strict emphasis on classical curricula as Daniel Alexander Payne’s influence began to wane after his death. Earlier in Wilberforce’s history the prominence of industrial education in its course offering might have been less marked. Other church-led schools, like Spelman, and the AME Church’s Paul Quinn College were categorised as having relatively little industrial influence in their curricula. Similarly, though not included in the list of categorised colleges, Livingstone College had only 9 students enrolled in industrial courses out of a student body of 266, which suggests that industrial courses remained a

⁷⁴⁵Du Bois (ed.), *The Negro Artisan*, pp. 38–8

small part of Livingstone's mission by this time, too. All of this shows that church-led schools, especially those highlighted in this chapter, did serve as a counterweight to the trend of increasing marginalisation of classical academic study, replaced by industrial and manual training. However, the enrolment numbers for these schools remained relatively small compared to the overall number of industrial students. The number of church-led schools was also eclipsed by the number of schools founded as a result of the 1890 Morrill Act, or funded primarily by the Slater Fund. By 1886–87, forty received funding from the Slater Fund, which in turn prompted increases in their industrial departments.

Table 9: African-American Teachers and Professor in Colleges⁷⁴⁶

	1890	1900	1910
Male	7,236	7,743	7,225
Female	7,864	13,524	22,547
Total	15,100	21,267	29,772

It is also worth considering how the church-led schools were represented in their rates of graduations, and particularly the number of female graduates they produced. Very few African-American women received B.A. degrees during the nineteenth century. Writing in 1891, Anna Julia Cooper reported that

I wrote a few days ago to the Colleges which admit women and asked

⁷⁴⁶US Department of Commerce, Bureau of the Census, *Negro Population in the United States 1790–1915* (1918), pp. 508, 526

B. Collier-Thomas, 'Guest Editorial: The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Overview', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3, The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview (Summer 1982), pp. 173–180

how many Colored women had completed the B.A. course in each during its entire history.[sic] These are the figures returned: Fisk leads the way with twelve; Oberlin next with five; Ann Arbor, Wellesley and Wilberforce three each, Livingstone two, Atlanta one, Howard, as yet, none.

I then asked the principal of the Washington High School how many out of the large number of female graduates from his school had chosen to go forward and take a collegiate course. He replied that but one had ever done so, and she is now in Cornell.⁷⁴⁷

Although women graduates from full four-year collegiate courses were few, these numbers can be put in better context by appreciating that comparatively few African Americans received BA degrees during the nineteenth century. Between 1875 and 1880 the total number was less than 200.⁷⁴⁸ The black churches' colleges contributed importantly to the education of those African-American women who pursued full collegiate degrees, a contribution equalled only by Fisk, and a few predominantly white colleges, notably Oberlin. However, the scale of African-American women's education at this high level was admittedly very limited. Far more significant was the large number of African-American women who received certificates from normal school courses and went on to become teachers. Table 9 shows that by the end of the nineteenth century the number of black female teachers and professors in colleges had eclipsed the number of male ones, and the trend only accelerated. Colleges like Wilberforce and the State University at Louisville awarded significantly more normal course certificates than BA degrees, yet the number of black female teachers at the end of the nineteenth century suggests that the contribution of teachers from among the graduates of those colleges must have

⁷⁴⁷A.J. Cooper, 'Higher Education of Women', *The Southland* (April 1891), pp. 199–200, Moorland-Spingarn Research Center, Box 25-5 (Anna Julia Cooper Papers), fo. 63

⁷⁴⁸Fradin and Fradin, *Fight On!*, p. 29

been comparatively negligible. However, many leading African-American women leaders and organisers in the late nineteenth century were graduates of, or teachers at, these colleges, and gained a great deal from the experience. In a sense, colleges like Wilberforce, Livingstone, and the State University at Louisville were the fountainhead of a generation of leaders of the African-American women's movement in the late nineteenth and early twentieth. Their influence cannot be captured in a purely quantitative assessment. In order to assess fully the legacy of the church-led schools for African-American women, case studies of these influential women are required.

Many of the female graduates during William J. Simmons's tenure as president of the State University at Louisville went on to notable careers of educational and organisational leadership. Mary V. Cook enrolled on the normal course at the State University on 28 November 1881. She excelled as a student and was soon enlisted as a student-teacher. She graduated from the normal course on 17 May 1883 as valedictorian of her class and was elected to a permanent teaching position as principal of the normal department and professor of Latin and mathematics, a position she held until she resigned along with William J. Simmons in 1890, shortly before his death. She also served as librarian for the model school department. She simultaneously continued her studies, moving on to the collegiate course, from which she graduated, receiving her A.B. degree in May 1887.⁷⁴⁹ She was an important

⁷⁴⁹ *General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 37
Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, p. 41
Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second, Twenty-third, and Twenty-fourth Annual Sessions, 1890, 1891, & 1892, p. 22
Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 62

figure in the Kentucky Baptist Women's Educational Convention, serving as second vice-president and a member of the board of managers in 1884; assistant secretary in 1885; secretary of the board in 1886; and corresponding secretary from 1887.⁷⁵⁰ She was a noted public speaker. She delivered a speech on the history of the Baptist Women's Educational Convention at its jubilee meeting on 18 January 1889, which was well received by *The American Baptist*, which commented that

The history of the Convention by Prof. Mary V. Cook, their corresponding secretary, was a concise and comprehensive paper. She left the well-beaten tracks of most of the lady speakers, and dealt entirely with facts, and without sentiment traced the Convention from its incipency until the present time. It was an interesting paper, brimful of information, and was well received. Miss Cook is never more in earnest than when saying a word for the women's work.⁷⁵¹

She also spoke before the American National Baptist Convention on 27 August 1887 on the subject of 'Women's work in the denomination'; before the Kentucky State Teachers' Association in 1887 on 'Woman, a potent factor in Public Reform'; and before the American Baptist Home Mission Society on 25 September 1888 on 'Female Education'. She wrote a regular column for the Kentucky black Baptist newspaper, *The American Baptist*, edited by William J. Simmons, and also served as editor of the educational department of Simmons's other newspaper, *Our Women and Children*.⁷⁵²

⁷⁵⁰ *Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second, Twenty-third, and Twenty-fourth Annual Sessions, 1890, 1891, & 1892*, pp. 2–4
Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of the Sixth Session, 1888, p. 2
Minutes of the Seventh Session. The Baptist Women's Educational Convention, 1889, p. 2

⁷⁵¹ Quoted in Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, p. 372

⁷⁵² *Ibid.*, pp. 367–74

Majors, *Noted Negro Women*, pp. 195–6

Another notable graduate of the Louisville State University was Lucy Wilmot Smith. She graduated from the normal course in 1887, and was subsequently made principal of the model school department for the following year.⁷⁵³ She was, for many years, private secretary to William J. Simmons, and in 1884 he recruited her to write the children's column for *The American Baptist*. She also frequently wrote for *Our Women and Children*, as well as for *The Baptist Journal* of St Louis. Like Cook, she read many papers before national organisations; joined the faculty of the State University; and was active in the Baptist Women's Educational Convention, serving on the assistant board of managers from 1886; and as secretary for children's bands from 1887.⁷⁵⁴ Simmons wrote of Smith that 'She frequently writes for the press and wields a trenchant pen. Is ambitious to excel, and will yet make her mark.'⁷⁵⁵

Ione E. Wood was the precocious niece of William J. Simmons. She graduated from the normal school of the State University in 1884, and received her A.B. before the age of twenty, graduating in 1888.⁷⁵⁶ While still a student, she was made an assistant teacher, then permanently appointed as a teacher of Greek and Natural Philosophy. She later went on to teach in

⁷⁵³ *Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887*, p. 41

Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 62

⁷⁵⁴ *Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second, Twenty-third, and Twenty-fourth Annual Sessions, 1890, 1891, & 1892*, pp. 2–4
Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of the Sixth Session, 1888, p. 2

Minutes of the Seventh Session. The Baptist Women's Educational Convention, 1889, p. 2

⁷⁵⁵ Quoted in Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 376–81

⁷⁵⁶ *General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 36
Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 410–2

the model school, too.⁷⁵⁷ She served on the assistant board of managers for the Baptist Women's Educational Convention in 1888, and the full board of managers from 1889.⁷⁵⁸ She contributed to several newspapers and magazines, including *Our Women and Children*.⁷⁵⁹

Lavinia B. Sneed (née Elliott) graduated with her A.B. from the State University along with Mary V. Cook in 1887. Like her contemporaries she taught while still a student, and continued after graduating as a teacher of sciences and English branches in the normal department.⁷⁶⁰ Another female A.B. graduate of 1887, Lula C. Osborne, was professor of Latin and French while still a student by 1884, and continued in that role after completing her degree.⁷⁶¹ Mary E. Britton graduated from the normal course in 1890, and became a teacher in Lexington public schools. She was a prolific columnist and wrote for numerous newspapers including *The Lexington Herald Our Women and Children*; and *The Ivy*, a Baptist newspaper for children, published in Baltimore.⁷⁶² The influence of female graduates from the State University

⁷⁵⁷ *General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 37
Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, p. 41

⁷⁵⁸ *Baptist Women's Educational Convention of Kentucky. Minutes of the Sixth Session, 1888*, p. 2
Minutes of the Seventh Session. The Baptist Women's Educational Convention, 1889, p. 2

⁷⁵⁹ Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 410–3
 Majors, *Noted Negro Women*, p. 237

⁷⁶⁰ *Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887*, p. 41
 Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 413–5
 Majors, *Noted Negro Women*, p. 236

⁷⁶¹ *General Association of Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Minutes of Fifteenth and Sixteenth Annual Sessions, 1883 & 1884*, p. 37
Minutes of the Eighteenth and Nineteenth Annual Sessions of the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1886 & 1887, p. 41

⁷⁶² *Minutes of the General Association Colored Baptists of Kentucky. Twenty-second,*

also extended to other states. Pauline Dinkins, a State University graduate, went on to teach at Selma University and serve on the board of managers of the Baptist women's state convention of Alabama.⁷⁶³

Black Methodist colleges, particularly Wilberforce, also produced very influential female graduates and teachers. Hallie Quinn Brown attended Wilberforce in the early 1870s, receiving her B.S. in 1873. She was one of the most renowned female speakers of the age, travelling widely in Europe and was twice presented before Queen Victoria. She was praised as 'having few equals as an elocutionist', and 'ranks as one of the finest in the country.'⁷⁶⁴ After completing her degree, she became a touring lecturer, and also taught in schools in Mississippi and South Carolina. She served as principal of the Ladies' Department of the AME Church's Allen University in Columbia, South Carolina, from 1885 to 1887, and then taught in the Dayton, Ohio, public schools from 1887 to 1891, and at the Tuskegee Institute from 1892 to 1893. She was then appointed professor of elocution at Wilberforce, though she continued her regular public speaking tours, and so did not teach at Wilberforce full time until 1906. When she was reappointed as professor of elocution at Wilberforce in 1906 by William Scarborough, she was given a further brief as a travelling fundraising agent for Wilberforce. In that capacity she secured a donation of \$16,000 from E.J. Emery in London, which allowed for the construction of a female dormitory. She later taught English at Wilberforce from 1915 to 1919. She was also very active in the black

Twenty-third, and Twenty-fourth Annual Sessions, 1890, 1891, & 1892, p. 21

Penn, *The Afro-American Press*, pp. 415–9

⁷⁶³Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, pp. 63, 249, n. 52

⁷⁶⁴'A Sketch of the Life of Miss Hallie Quinn Brown', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 6, No. 3 (January 1890), pp. 259–60

women's club movement. She founded the Colored Women's League, one of the precursors of the National Association of Colored Women; served as president of the Ohio State Federation of Colored Women's Clubs between 1905 and 1912; and as president of the NACW from 1920 to 1924. She was also an author, of *Homespun Heroines and Other Women of Distinction*, a compilation of profiles of notable black women; and three other books on elocution.⁷⁶⁵

Many other leaders of the women's club movement in the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century were also associated with Wilberforce as either students or teachers. Anna Julia Cooper, an Oberlin graduate, taught languages, literature, and mathematics at Wilberforce in the mid-1880s. She also taught at Oberlin and went on to teach at the Washington Colored High School, later named M Street Colored High School in Washington, DC. She succeeded Robert Terrell as principal of the school in 1901, but she was dismissed in 1906 under controversial circumstances, as her pedagogy was seen as in conflict with the philosophy of Booker T. Washington. She later went on to become the fourth African-American woman to earn a doctoral degree, receiving her PhD from the University of Paris-Sorbonne in 1924.

⁷⁶⁵'A Sketch of the Life of Miss Hallie Quinn Brown', pp. 257–61

A.S. McFarlin, 'Hallie Quinn Brown: Black woman elocutionist', *Southern Speech Communication Journal* Vol. 46, No. 1 (1980), pp. 72–82

H.Q. Brown (ed.), *Homespun Heroines and Other Women of Distinction* (Xenia, OH, 1926)

D.C. Hine and E.B. Brown (eds.), *Black Women in America: An Historical Encyclopedia*, Vol. 1 (Oxford, 1993), p. 176

C. Strom, 'Brown, Hallie Quinn', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00121.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

'Brown, Hallie Quinn (1850–1949)' [<http://www.blackpast.org/aah/brown-hallie-quinn-1850-1949>] (Accessed April 2016)

As well as other organisations, she was particularly active in the NAACP. Her most famous work was *A Voice from the South*, in which she argued for the importance of black women in racial uplift, and lamented the lack of interracial cooperation among women.⁷⁶⁶

Another Oberlin graduate who taught at both Wilberforce and the M Street Colored High School was Mary Church Terrell. She was the daughter of Robert Reed Church, a Memphis, Tennessee, businessman and the first African-American millionaire in the South. She earned her BA from Oberlin in 1884, and then taught at Wilberforce before accepting a teaching position M Street Colored High School in 1887. She was forced to resign this position in 1891 when she married Robert Terrell, as the Washington, DC, school board did not allow married women to continue teaching. She later went on to great renown in the African-American women's club movement, and in national African-American organisations in general. She was a founder of the Colored Women's League of Washington, DC, in 1892. She then shepherded

⁷⁶⁶Cooper, 'Higher Education of Women', pp. 186–202

Z.E. Dyson, 'Mrs. Anna J. Cooper', *The Parent-Teacher Journal* (May–June 1930), pp. 12–3, Moorland-Spingarn Research Center, Box 23-1 (Anna Julia Cooper Papers), fo. 1

A.J. Cooper *A Voice From the South* (Xenia, OH, 1892)

M.S. Giles, 'Special Focus: Dr. Anna Julia Cooper, 1858–1964: Teacher, Scholar, and Timeless Womanist' *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 75, No. 4 (Fall 2006), pp. 621–634

S. Harley, 'Beyond the Classroom: The Organizational Lives of Black Female Educators in the District of Columbia, 1890–1930' *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3 (Summer 1982), pp. 254–265

V.G. Thomas and J.A. Jackson, 'The Education of African American Girls and Women: Past to Present', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 76, No. 3 (Summer 2007), pp. 362–3

G. Bates, 'These Hallowed Halls: African American Women College and University Presidents', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 76, No. 3 (Summer 2007), p. 374

F.R. Keller, 'Cooper, Anna Julia Haywood', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00197.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

its merger with the National Federation of Afro-American Women to form the National Association of Colored Women. She was the NACW's first president from 1896 to 1901. She was also a founding member of the NAACP, and a prolific author, writing columns for newspapers and journals including the *Journal of Negro History*, the *North American Review*, and *The Crisis*.⁷⁶⁷

When viewed purely numerically, it may appear that the contribution of the black churches' schools, colleges, and universities to the education of women was comparatively small. Furthermore, much of that contribution may have been subsumed into the dominant pedagogical ideology of the late nineteenth century, that of industrial and domestic education. The industrial pedagogy may have facilitated a rapid increase in the number of schools for African Americans, and the number of African Americans in education, broadening and, in a sense, democratising black education. However, it was also a constraining ideology for some African-American female students, suggesting lives and careers as domestics and curtailing any further ambitions to meaningful community leadership. Industrial and domestic education crowded out higher and classical learning in many schools, and the black church institutions were among the few that resisted this trend. Though they represented a small bastion, as has been shown, from it came a generation of female educators, clubwomen, activists, and organisers, whose influence belies the numerically small scale of black church-led education for women.

⁷⁶⁷M.C. Terrell, *A Colored Women in a White World* (Washington, DC, 1940)
B.W. Jones, 'Mary Church Terrell and the National Association of Colored Women, 1896 to 1901', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 67, No. 1 (Spring 1982), pp. 20–33
Fradin and Fradin, *Fight On!*, pp. 29–59
C. Neverdon-Morton, 'Terrell, Mary Eliza Church', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00686.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

6 Domesticity and Respectability in African-American Church Literature

In 1885, Daniel Alexander Payne, the Senior Bishop of the African Methodist Episcopal Church, published his *Treatise on Domestic Education* in which he offered advice on household management, family life, and above all childrearing. It was warmly received by the leadership of the church. Bishop Henry McNeal Turner wrote of it that

It is simple, comprehensive and practical, yet learned, classical and philosophical. . . Every young man and wife in the land should make the study of it. . . a prerequisite to their future happiness and the happiness of their children.⁷⁶⁸

When reviewed by the Church's journal, *The AME Church Review*, it was urged that "Domestic Education" is a book that should be read by every household in the land, especially by each of the households of our seven millions.⁷⁶⁹ Payne's treatise was the culmination of a domestic ideology fashioned in the pages of African-American church newspapers and journals dating back to the Civil War and beyond. This tradition of African-American domestic literature in turn drew on and adapted the longstanding white 'cult of domesticity' which permeated Victorian culture. This domestic ideology was

⁷⁶⁸H.M. Turner, 'Bishop Payne's Book', *The Christian Recorder* (10 September 1885), p. 1

⁷⁶⁹'Our Book Table', *The AME Church Review* Vol. 2 (1885), p. 203

a device for entrenching patriarchy in African-American society as much as in white society. However, when deployed by African Americans and especially when deployed by the institutions of the African-American churches, its purposes were far more diverse than this. Domesticity, it will be shown, was central to a particular strategy of racial uplift espoused by many African-American church leaders, and to a corollary vision of how African-American society should be reconstructed and restructured as it recovered from slavery. Furthermore, it tells us a great deal about the dynamics of class within African-American society. However, domesticity was never uniformly deployed in African-American Christianity and nor was it ever fully under the control of the predominantly male church leadership. It was protean and dynamic and was therefore subject to adaptation and subversion. The political deployment of respectability by numerous African-American women's groups and clubs in the late nineteenth century and early twentieth century can be seen to have adopted elements of the older language of domesticity. In doing so they refashioned it and subverted the elements of it which sought to silence the public voice of women and constrain them into a purely private, separate sphere. Thus they were able to create a far more dynamic mode of resistance to racism and the institutions of Jim Crow.

6.1 The African-American literature of domesticity

The most prominent site for the shaping of the language of domesticity in the black churches was in their newspapers and journals. This was in no small part due to the conscious effort of many of their editors. The AME Church's

newspaper, *The Christian Recorder*, was re-established after the Civil War having ceased publication in 1864. Two editors in particular stamped their influence on *The Christian Recorder* by prominently featuring the family and domestic issues in the newspaper. Elisha Weaver had edited *The Christian Recorder* between 1861 and 1864 and resumed the editorship in 1867. He enthusiastically endorsed his successor Benjamin Tucker Tanner when he took over in June 1868, writing that he was ‘amply qualified for said position, and who knows how to sympathize with the many disadvantages our people have to contend with.’⁷⁷⁰

Throughout his editorship, Weaver encouraged readers of *The Christian Recorder* to view it as a ‘family newspaper’ which should be used to help teach children to read, and argued that ‘a good family paper for children is equal to five months’ schooling’.⁷⁷¹ Weaver introduced a new column, the ‘Family Circle’. In it Weaver particularly offered advice on the education of children and on parenting. He advocated a harmonious home life in which mother and father fulfilled distinct and complementary roles. He stressed that the mother should be the principal source of spiritual education for children in the home, but that the structure and the harmony of the home was predicated on the submission and obedience of the wife to the husband. He also argued that children should be educated principally by gentle reasoning and by the example of good role models, who spoke to them in with ‘soft, gentle, soothing modulations of the human voice’.⁷⁷² In this way, Weaver was moving beyond

⁷⁷⁰E. Weaver, ‘An Editor’s Farewell’, *The Christian Recorder* (20 June 1868), p. 2

⁷⁷¹E. Weaver, ‘A Family Paper’, *The Christian Recorder* (12 October 1861), p. 4

⁷⁷²E. Weaver, ‘How to Speak to Children’, *The Christian Recorder* (12 October 1861), p. 4
E. Weaver, ‘How to Treat Children’, *The Christian Recorder* (25 November 1865), p. 4

the emphasis on discipline, order, and punishment which proliferated in the literature on child-raising during the antebellum period.

Benjamin Tucker Tanner's editorship had much in common with that of Weaver, especially as it pertained to domesticity. Like Weaver, he placed child-raising at the heart of the 'Family Circle' column. He also established the first African-American church newspaper specifically directed at children, *The Child's Recorder*. The newspaper was published during two separate periods — between 1870 and 1873 and between 1880 and 1884 — with Tanner as its editor. Although it was relatively popular, it foundered on both occasions due to the difficulty in collecting subscription payments. Although only one issue of *The Child's Recorder* now survives, between it, advertisements for *The Child's Recorder* in *The Christian Recorder* and the 'Family Circle' column, it is clear that Tanner sought to use these publications to instil piety in children at a young age and win them over to the church.⁷⁷³ Like Weaver, he believed that children should receive religious instruction from an early age, rather than awaiting a conversion experience. Tanner also used *The Child's Recorder* and other church literature to teach children about racial pride, and to stress racial unity. For example he carefully elucidated the implicit racism of religious imagery found in white periodicals. He thus aimed to raise a generation equipped to drive forward both the AME Church and the cause of racial uplift.

Again, much like Weaver, Tanner saw the mother as the most significant influence on the moral upbringing of children. He wrote that mothers should 'tremble, and pray under a sense of their responsibility. How much depends on

⁷⁷³Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, pp. 9–10

them!’⁷⁷⁴ Their influence and example should pervade the home and should be ever present in the lives of their children. Nevertheless, he viewed the roles of the mother and father in the home hierarchically, and placed the father at the head of ‘household piety’. In practice, this meant that the father was to lead the formal domestic religious services and household prayers (which Tanner strongly encouraged), while the informal education of children and the intangible influence of her piety was the realm of the mother. The father was also to be an example of manhood and masculinity for his sons. Of course these roles were predicated on the model of a stable two-parent family, which was consciously drawn from the models presented in the literature of white domesticity. Tanner, like Weaver, idealised such happy harmonious homes. So did other church leaders like James A. Handy, who wrote that

The sweet influences of a cheerful home are rarely effaced. The gentle grace and pleasant smiles of a mother, live in her daughters long after her form has mingled with the dust. The kind and cheerful words of a father, shine out in the acts of sons, who come to wear his mantle, and to fill his place.⁷⁷⁵

Tanner realised that, in practice, many African-American families in the wake of slavery could not reflect this aspiration. However, he believed that the influence of religion and domesticity could bring it about, and therefore offered marital advice in the ‘Family Circle’ column which he believed would contribute to it. He urged that young men should seek out modest and pious wives, skilled in sewing and cooking, and that wives should encourage temperance in their husbands. He was also strongly opposed to divorce, and

⁷⁷⁴Benjamin Tucker Tanner, ‘Home Influences’, *The Christian Recorder* (30 January 1869), p. 4

⁷⁷⁵J.A. Handy, ‘A Cheerful Home’, *The Christian Recorder* (6 February 1873), p. 5

in his teaching he strictly adhered to the AME Church's teaching on the subject which allowed divorce only in the case of adultery.⁷⁷⁶

Weaver and Tanner saw no paradox in arguing that mothers should be the primary influence on the religious education while they as men monopolised the writing of the literature for that education. The principal medium through which women's voices were represented in *The Christian Recorder* was poetry. Articles written by women occasionally appeared in *The Christian Recorder*, and *The AME Church Review*, the church's journal. In fact David Wills has shown that 14 percent of the articles published in *The AME Church Review* between 1884 and 1893 were authored by women.⁷⁷⁷ Nevertheless there seems to have been very little hostility toward the church's domestic literature from women. In fact, many of the articles by women which address questions of domesticity seem to echo quite closely the views espoused by Weaver and Tanner. It seems that many women lighted on their emphasis of the importance of motherhood, while overlooking its subordination to fatherhood, its emphasis on submissiveness and its predication on a doctrine of separate spheres. For example, in an article titled 'The Influence of Home', Ada Newton Harris argued that 'The training of the child largely depends upon the mother. What a trust God has given her!' She also emphasised the benign example of motherly piety as the best way to raise Christian children:

⁷⁷⁶Benjamin Tucker Tanner, 'Marriage and Domestic Happiness', *The Christian Recorder* (26 December 1868), p. 4

Benjamin Tucker Tanner, 'Womanly Modesty', *The Christian Recorder* (22 October 1870), p. 4

Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, pp. 25–6, 45–6

⁷⁷⁷Wills, David W., 'Aspects of Social Thought in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1884–1910' (Harvard University, Ph.D. thesis, 1975), p. 162

Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, p. 87

‘the child must have a proper respect for Christianity... But this cannot be taught by teaching him to repeat the Lord’s Prayer... but rather by letting him see that his mother is a gentle and pious woman’. Harris followed the pattern in the church’s domestic literature of encouraging gentleness and harmony rather than strict discipline for children, writing that ‘A child should be ruled by love and not by fear; harsh words should never be spoken to him.’ Yet she also emphasised the importance of teaching children the importance of hard work and thrift and tellingly wrote that ‘Work is ennobling; work makes the man a man.’⁷⁷⁸

The AME Church was far from unique among African-American churches in its development of a domestic literature after the Civil War. In *The Star of Zion* and *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review*, the AME Zion Church and its leaders stressed the importance of godly homes and offered advice to parents, just as did the leaders of the AME Church. Writing in the *Quarterly Review* in 1894, Bishop Charles C. Pettey idealised the home: ‘That which is nearest and dearest to us — is at home... Every man ought to try and get a home; let it be ever so humble, there’s no place like home.’⁷⁷⁹ Yet, also like the leaders of the AME Church, the Zion Church’s leaders generally based their domestic prescriptions around the model of a stable two-parent

⁷⁷⁸A.N. Harris, ‘The Influence of Home’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 3 (1886), pp. 304–307

Ada Newton Harris was the daughter of an AME minister in the New Jersey Annual Conference. She had married her husband, an Episcopal minister, in May 1885, who had then died the following January, shortly before the publication of this article. She went on to become a noted educator and lecturer.

See J.C. Smith (ed), *Notable Black American Women, Book II* (Detroit, 1996), pp. 147–8

⁷⁷⁹C.C. Pettey, ‘The Christian’s Home’, *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 4, No. 3 (1894), p. 302

home, which was neither applicable nor possible for many African-American households. In another article from the *Quarterly Review* in 1894 it was argued that 'It is a thousand times better to have an honest father and a true hearted mother than to inherit riches or social position.'⁷⁸⁰ The imperative for domestic improvement was set out by Prof. George E. Stevens when he wrote in 1893,

If the instruction given to our children in the schools, has not borne the best results generally, the cause must be traced to the counteracting influences that spring from the discomfort, superstition, ignorance, vice, squalor, poverty and profligacy, that hamper daily the growth of the best elements in human character at its most important and crucial stage.⁷⁸¹

Interestingly, the leaders of the Zion Church seem to have been more candid than those of the AME Church in admitting the social problems among African Americans which their domestic ideology sought to correct.

As in the AME Church, much of the domestic advice in the literature of the Zion Church was in its newspaper, *The Star of Zion*. However, while the 'Family Circle' column of *The Christian Recorder* was written by men, the most significant column in *The Star of Zion* which dealt with issues pertaining to women was Sarah Dudley Pettey's 'Woman's Column', which featured twice each month, beginning in August 1896. Pettey's column was a marked departure from much of the black church literature on domesticity to that date. Pettey lived a remarkably public life. In addition to her column she was prominent in several women's clubs and societies in North Carolina,

⁷⁸⁰'Our Homes', *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 4, No. 1 (1894), p. 487

⁷⁸¹G.E. Stevens, 'The Afro-American's Home the True Test of his Growth and Power', *The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review* Vol. 3, No. 4 (1893), p. 452

and travelled widely, acting as secretary to her husband, Bishop Charles C. Pettey. She and Charles were devoted to one another and Charles treated her as a social and intellectual equal. She would therefore not brook the assertions of earlier domestic literature that a woman should submit herself to her husband and constrain her life to the home. In her first column she wrote that

we shall not be narrowed down to the limited confines of womanhood simply, though we shall strive to make woman's interest our paramount aim by clipping and culling news notes, fashion notes, and household receipts, gathering choice tid-bits of information for the children of Eve.

Indeed she would not be so narrowly constrained, since

we feel not only interested in our own sex, but in humanity at large. Therefore matters pertaining to Church and State, vital questions and living issues, shall receive the approval or condemnation of this column.⁷⁸²

She wrote about women's issues as central to the racial challenges faced by African Americans and strongly encouraged women to engage in politics and public life. In 1896, she wrote that 'The new woman has enlisted as a thorough-going political campaigner... They bring important issues before the wives, sisters, and mothers, then urge them to influence their husbands, brothers and sons.'⁷⁸³ It seems therefore that Pettey did view the roles of husbands and wives as somewhat distinct and complementary, yet she certainly rejected the implications of so much domestic literature that this should imply the subordination or submissiveness of wives and mothers. She

⁷⁸²S.D. Pettey, 'Woman's Column', *The Star of Zion* (6 August 1896), p. 2

⁷⁸³S.D. Pettey, 'Woman's Column', *The Star of Zion* (15 October 1896), p. 2

also clearly opposed the view that women's sphere was exclusively private or that women should not exert a powerful voice and significant influence in public affairs.

Since Baptist churches, unlike Methodists, were congregational in their structure they were necessarily far less centralised and homogeneous. This was all the more so in the case of the African-American Baptist churches prior to the formation of the National Baptist Convention, the first truly national black Baptist convention, in 1895. There was therefore necessarily more variation in the writing about domestic issues in the black Baptist tradition. It is consequently also more challenging for the historian to grasp the nature of domestic ideology as deployed by black Baptists. It is nonetheless possible to gain some insight from the records of certain black Baptist conventions and associations. One notable example is the minutes of the Woman's Mission Society of the Georgia Missionary Baptist Convention of 1891. Quite atypically these minutes contain the full text of various addresses delivered by the women of the society, rather than just their titles. Of particular note are the essay by sister L.H. Johnson of Albany, Georgia, on the subject 'Love at Home'; and the essay by Mrs. Amelia W. Sullivan of Augusta, Georgia, on the subject 'True Womanhood'. Johnson's essay argues that love in the home was the root of Christian unity in society more broadly, and the Georgia Missionary Baptist Convention specifically: 'Love at home makes a wide place in the hearts of the great Christian family... therefore keep love at home: it makes love in this Convention'. Sullivan's essay argued that true womanhood is often misunderstood. She argued that

The great error of womankind is, that they too often take the shadow

for the substance, the glitter for the gold, the trappings of the world for the priceless value of true woman worth. . . It is not wealth, or beauty, or connection, or station of life, or power of mind, or literary attainments, or vanity, and richness of outward accomplishments.

Instead she believed that ‘All true women should have an aim in life. In some way try and make the world better by you having lived in it.’ In so arguing, Sullivan was challenging the association of true womanhood in a great deal of white domestic literature with the trappings of domesticity and the ability not to need to work, and thus to restrain oneself to the private sphere. She was thus attempting to reclaim true womanhood for African-American women who often could not live up to standards of womanhood based on ‘wealth’ or ‘richness of outward accomplishments’; she wanted to universalise true womanhood and to associate it with piety and Christian virtue.⁷⁸⁴

Due to the decentralised nature of black Baptist polity, white Baptist missionaries also exerted a great deal of influence on domestic education among African-American Baptists. This was also due to the wealth, reach, and influence of the white Baptist missionary associations and conventions, especially the American Baptist Home Mission Society. Perhaps the most prolific female Baptist missionary among African Americans in the postbellum period was Joanna P. Moore. From 1884 she organised ‘Fireside Schools’ whose object was

to secure the daily prayerful study of God’s word by having this read to parents and children together; to teach parents and children, husbands and wives, their respective duties one to another; to supply homes with good reading matter; and also to inculcate temperance,

⁷⁸⁴ *Minutes of the Twenty-First Annual Session of the Missionary Baptist Convention of Georgia, 1891* (Augusta, GA, 1891), pp. 54–57

industry, neighborly helpfulness, and greater attention to the work of the church.⁷⁸⁵

Moore also led the Second Mothers' Conference of the State of Arkansas, a convention of predominantly African-American mothers held in 1894. Among the subjects discussed at the conference were 'What can we do for careless mothers and neglected children', 'How to teach temperance at home', and 'Ten evils that can result from fashionable dress'. Among the addresses and essays were an address entitled 'Why We Should Help Mother' by Belle C. McBane of Raleigh, North Carolina; one entitled 'Importance of Right Training for Children' by Sister D.B. Pettiford of Birmingham, Alabama; and an essay entitled 'Home Happiness' by Sister M.M. Osborn of Vicksburg, Mississippi. McBane wrote that

mother has a greater responsibility to bear than any other person. . . If good, [the children] will follow mother's example; if bad, they will do the same. . . we believe that the mother can undo in one day the teacher's work of many days.

So, like many Methodist women, McBane emphasised the importance of motherhood above all to the development of children. Osborn's essay echoed much of the domestic literature of other African-American churches in placing a premium on the happiness, harmony, and stability of the home. She believed that 'The happiness of the home depends on true hearted religion. If we have that everything good will follow.' Sister Pettiford urged that the mothers of the conference should 'Let our first object be to teach our children a knowledge of the true God. . . Then will their most precious and sacred memories be of

⁷⁸⁵B.G. Brawley, *Women of Achievement: Written for the Fireside Schools Under the Auspices of the Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society* (Chicago, 1919), p. 6

mother and that home'.⁷⁸⁶ She thus reiterated the frequent idea of African-American domestic literature that religion should be at the heart of domestic education. Therefore, by emphasising the power of mothers and loving and Christian homes to form strong communities and raise virtuous children, the Second Mothers' Conference and the Fireside Schools were practical efforts to encourage modes of domesticity which would lead to the improvement of African-American society and to racial uplift.

6.2 The purposes of domesticity

The ideology of domesticity which permeated the literature of the African-American churches in the decades following the Civil War served various purposes, both conscious and unconscious, for those who shaped it. Domesticity was a means of effecting a particular strategy of racial uplift in which African Americans acculturated themselves to white standards of patriarchy. It was therefore also a means of reshaping African-American society after slavery according to a certain set of values and ideals.

African-American domestic literature, just like white domestic literature, was principally a patriarchal means of preserving the masculine monopoly on public life. As has already been indicated, when women adopted the domestic language of their churches, they were particularly prone to emphasise the importance that literature placed on motherhood. They were far less likely to embrace the corollary aspects of that literature that wives should be submissive and that the role of mothers should be subordinate to that of the father in the ordering of home life. They were also prone to view the

⁷⁸⁶ *Minutes of the Second Mothers' Conference, 1894* (1894), pp. 2, 15, 20–21

domestic roles of wives and mother as entirely compatible with an active role in public life, and particularly in social improvement, benevolent and charitable activity, and racial uplift. However, it is clear that in much of the male-written domestic literature, the importance of motherhood had encoded within it the implication that because motherhood was so important, for women to engage in public life was to neglect their duties as mothers. They would thus irreparably harm both society and the future of their race. For example, in October 1886, the Rev. Augustus W. Watson warned women against ‘neglecting family religion to perform public duties’.⁷⁸⁷ This notion of separate spheres can be particularly observed in the debates regarding the ordination of women. At the General Conference of the AME Church in 1884, which discussed a resolution proposing that women should be licensed to preach in the connection, the Rev. G.W. Bryant contributed by saying, ‘I vote in favor of their staying home and taking care of the babies.’⁷⁸⁸

However, there was more to the domestic literature than merely the defensiveness of male clergymen. In a sense, domesticity was staking a claim for the equal humanity of African Americans and particularly for their gendered humanity as prescribed by the patriarchal standards of the age. It made claims for the womanhood and manhood of African Americans; for the femininity of black women and the masculinity of black men. In the case of women, white society had made domesticity one of the central tenets of what Barbara Welter has termed ‘the cult of true womanhood’. Welter has

⁷⁸⁷A.W. Watson, ‘Give Us Christian Homes’, *The AME Church Review* Vol. 3, No. 2 (October 1886), p. 196

⁷⁸⁸‘The General Conference — Report of the two last days’, *The Christian Recorder* (5 June 1884), p. 2
Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, p. 87

argued that there were four cardinal virtues associated with true womanhood, namely piety, purity, submissiveness, and domesticity.⁷⁸⁹ As has been shown, all these virtues were closely associated with African-American domestic literature, too. However, true womanhood was often racially constructed as exclusively the province of white women.⁷⁹⁰ So African Americans had to aspire strenuously to these virtues and advocate them in order to stake a claim of true womanhood. They cited scripture to advocate female submissiveness, specifically Ephesians: 'Wives, submit yourselves to your own husbands, as unto the Lord.'⁷⁹¹ The advice offered by columns like the 'Family Circle' about marriage and maintaining stable homes was doubtless partly a means of reinforcing and demonstrating black female purity, and particularly sexual purity, which was all the more important given the slanders against black women as promiscuous that were prevalent in late nineteenth-century America. Above all, black church leaders sought to live up to the white standards of domesticity. Since the 'cult of true womanhood' was itself a construction of white society this meant that these leaders strove to emulate white models of domesticity even when those models did not fit easily with the nature of African-American society. That is why, despite the obvious problems, Benjamin Tucker Tanner continued to present a picture of domestic life based around a stable, two-parent family in *The Christian Recorder* and *The Child's Recorder*. He did so even though he knew that in the wake of slavery, which had divided and disrupted so many African-American families, this idealised

⁷⁸⁹B. Welter, 'The Cult of True Womanhood: 1820–1860', *American Quarterly* Vol. 18, No. 2 (Summer, 1966), pp. 151–2

⁷⁹⁰Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, p. 23

⁷⁹¹Ephesians v. 22

conception of family structure often did not apply. Similarly, the white model of domesticity was clearly based on wives and mothers who did not work and who devoted their lives exclusively to the home. As Welter argued, 'The true woman's place was unquestionably her own fireside — as daughter, sister, but most of all as wife and mother. Therefore domesticity was among the virtues most prized by the women's magazines.'⁷⁹² Again, African-American domestic literature sought to emulate this. However, a great many families could not afford to have a wife or mother who did not work. White domesticity was also focussed on the material trappings of domesticity. By the postbellum period, white domestic manuals increasingly presumed the ownership of new cooking utensils and domestic appliances and featured instructions on their use. Intricate decorations and expensive furnishings were increasingly the mark of a well-kept and respectable home. Many African-American families could not replicate these material resources and this type of consumption. Black church leaders recognised this and therefore they stressed hard work and thrift to replicate this and as a substitute for the materialism of white domesticity. Aspiring to white paradigms of domesticity was complicated and difficult for African Americans given the poverty of many of them, a problem which was compounded by the depression which followed the panic of 1873. It led to the collapse of the Freedmen's Savings and Trust Company, or Freedmen's Bank, and the loss of the savings of over 60,000 depositors. This not only exacerbated the material impoverishment of many African-American freed people, but also critically undermined their faith in thrift and saving. It also led to a rise in sharecropping which made it necessary for all family

⁷⁹²Welter, 'The Cult of True Womanhood: 1820–1860', p. 162

members to work.⁷⁹³

Shirley J. Carson has argued that African-American women, however, shaped a different ideal of womanhood from that of white society. They did not simply accept elements of the white ideal of womanhood which were not applicable to African-American society. Rather they combined them with more traditional elements of African-American women's experience, which drew on the roles of women under slavery, and even on traditional African practices, which had been preserved. If at times male black church leaders tried to impose ill-fitting white models of womanhood on African-American women, or northern models on southern women, or comparatively affluent aspirations on impoverished women, then by contrast the archetypes of the 'Black Victoria' and the 'race woman' were truly African-American, and universally applicable ideals. Deborah Gray White has written that under slavery women

were not submissive, subordinate or prudes. . . they also had a great deal in common with their African foremothers, who, in many West African societies, held positions not inferior but complementary of those of men. . . mutual respect characterized relationships between the sexes.⁷⁹⁴

These relationships carried through into the ideal type of the Black Victoria. Black Victoria was domestic, a wife, and mother, but she did not adhere to the white requirements of submissiveness, and nor was she restricted to the private sphere. According to Carson,

⁷⁹³Du Bois, *The Souls of Black Folk*, p. 33

E. Foner, *Reconstruction: America's Unfinished Revolution, 1863-1877* (New York, 2002), pp. 531-2

Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, p. 24

⁷⁹⁴D.G. White, *Ar'n't I a Woman: Female Slaves in the Plantation South* (New York, 1985), p. 22

First and foremost she was intelligent and well-educated. She displayed a strong community and racial consciousness, often revealed in her work — whether paid or unpaid — within the black community. Self-confident and out-spoken she was esteemed by her community which frequently applauded her as a ‘race woman’ and role model for young people. In these areas the black community’s expectations of the ideal woman differed from those of larger society.⁷⁹⁵

This adaptation of the white ideals of womanhood to an African-American mould marked a new departure by African-American women in the late nineteenth century. It echoes Sarah Dudley Pettey’s description of ‘the new woman’ and it paved the way for the political deployment of respectability by African-American women’s organisations in the first decades of the twentieth century.

African-American domesticity was not merely making claims for the humanity and womanhood of African-American women, however. It also sought to demonstrate the true manhood of African-American men. The legacy of slavery pressed the need for the assertion of black manhood and masculinity. As the minutes of the National Negro Convention of 1855 put it, ‘As a people we have been denied the ownership of our bodies, our wives, home, children and the products of our labor.’⁷⁹⁶ In order to reclaim their manhood, black men needed to assert their autonomous ability to head stable households, and to provide for and protect their families. In the minds of the clergymen who shaped black Christian domesticity, this autonomy would be all the more apparent, and black masculinity better demonstrated, if black men were able to provide for their wives sufficiently that they did not need to

⁷⁹⁵S.J. Carson, ‘Black Ideals of Womanhood in the Late Victorian Era’, *Journal of Negro History* Vol. 77, No. 2 (Spring, 1992), p. 62

⁷⁹⁶H. Bell (ed), *Proceedings of the National Negro Conventions, 1830–1864* (New York, 1969), p. 33

work. They longed for the vision of the family as posited by Catherine Beecher and Harriet Beecher Stowe in 1869: 'The father undergoes toil and self-denial to provide a home, and then the mother becomes a self-sacrificing labourer to train its inmates.'⁷⁹⁷ So the desire of these leaders to shape a domestic ideology which would limit women to the home was also a means of asserting black manhood. Benjamin Tucker Tanner believed that black manhood and autonomy were best demonstrated by achieving material success, and he argued that adolescents and young men between twelve and seventeen years old should begin training for a life in business.⁷⁹⁸ However, just as with black womanhood, it was problematic to assess black manhood by the standards of white society. If black men were to be assessed by their employment, then it could not be on the same scale as white men. As AME Church minister and army chaplain Theophilus Gould Steward argued, 'Ordinarily the kind of work a people... naturally take to, indicates their capacity... all colored people of this country understand that what a black man does, is no indication of what he is.' Even many well educated African Americans had to work as farmers and labourers due to the discrimination they experienced in the labour market. Therefore, Steward argued, 'We cannot judge colored men by their occupation; and the fact that they are not ashamed of such occupation but are contented in them argues nothing.'⁷⁹⁹ So African-American men needed a different measure for their masculine virtue. That measure naturally

⁷⁹⁷C. Beecher and H. Beecher Stowe, *The American Woman's Home, or Principles of Domestic Science; being a Guide to the Formation and Maintenance of Economical, Healthful, Beautiful and Christian Homes* (New York, 1971), pp. 18–19

⁷⁹⁸Benjamin Tucker Tanner, 'Train the Boys for Business', *The Christian Recorder* (5 June 1884), p. 2

⁷⁹⁹T.G. Steward, 'Colored Society — III', *The Christian Recorder* (23 November 1876), p. 1

defaulted to home life. Masculine domestic virtues included piety, temperance, and industry. The Rev. T.H. Jackson urged young men to remember that ‘there is a higher, a better, a nobler life than the merely sensual.’⁸⁰⁰ It was recognised that fathers should play an important part in the spiritual and moral education of his children. Yet there was a balance to be struck between recognising the importance of fatherhood to masculinity, and feminising that role by too closely associating black fathers with domesticity. Therefore fathers were encouraged to be the formal heads of family piety and to lead family prayers, while leaving the direct spiritual education of children to their mothers. Family prayer was considered pivotal. An 1870 circular letter by the General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky highlighted its importance on three counts. First, the common interest of a family made it appropriate to pray to God for favour together. Second, it was a scripturally mandated duty. Third, it had a beneficial influence on family members, promoting spiritual welfare and piety. Of particular importance was the example of the father leading prayers: ‘the father appearing daily before his family in the capacity of a priest of God. . . answers a most important purpose in the early training of children.’⁸⁰¹

Domestic ideology served not only to assert the humanity, womanhood, and manhood of African Americans in society at large and to white society in particular. It was not only outward-looking, but also served a constructive, inward-looking empirical function. It aimed to help reconstruct black society after emancipation, shattered by slavery and civil war, dislocated and faced

⁸⁰⁰T.H. Jackson, ‘To the Young Men’, *The Christian Recorder* (22 March 1877), p. 1

⁸⁰¹*Minutes of the Second General Association of Colored Baptists in Kentucky, 1870*, pp.20–2

with the possibility of structuring black communities very differently from those of slave society. Perhaps the most significant way in which the apparatus of black domestic literature sought to reconstruct black society was by literally putting black families back together. From the end of the Civil War, Elisha Weaver encouraged the use of the 'Information Wanted' columns in *The Christian Recorder* to find family members separated under the slave system. An agent of the Freedmen's Bureau commented that 'In their eyes the work of emancipation was incomplete until the families which had been dispersed by slavery were reunited.'⁸⁰² Domestic ideology also sought to reorder the relationships within reconstructed families. It has been illustrated that harmonious, happy families were seen as the best environment for child-raising. More specifically, most church leaders strongly discouraged parents from corporally punishing their children. There were some exceptions to this. D.W. Adams wrote in *The Christian Recorder* in 1877 that 'It appears that parents now actually think too much of their free children to hit them a little slap. . . . When we were all in slavery our children were not half the trouble to us as they are now.'⁸⁰³ However, it is precisely this image, that of the corporal punishment of slaves, that made the vast majority of church leaders shy away from the continued corporal punishment of children. In many respects the emphasis on two-parent families as the principal site of child-raising and spiritual education represented a reformulation of the structure of African-American communities in emancipation. Many of the functions which the church literature ascribed to the family and the household had been previously

⁸⁰²Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, p. 18

⁸⁰³D.W. Adams, 'Training Children', *The Christian Recorder* (10 May 1877), p. 2

fulfilled by the whole community under slavery. The domestic ideology was attempting to prepare African Americans for their emancipated lives by creating a more atomistic social structure based around the household more than the community; shrinking and tightening the units of social organisation. In some respects, therefore, domesticity can be seen as the supplanting of elements of African-American slave culture with structures drawn from free northern black society. Since domesticity and its aspirations for racial uplift were inherently bound up with issues of class, one can therefore view much of the domestic literature pertaining to family structure as the attempt of a comparatively privileged class of northern African Americans to impose their values on to the freed people, albeit with benign intentions.

Domesticity did not seek to reshape African-American society only as it emerged from slavery but also for future generations. So much about African-American Christian domesticity was concerned with raising Christian children. In part this was a result of the desire of churchmen to secure the future of their own denominations. Benjamin Tucker Tanner, fearing that the AME Church was 'going to pieces', created *The Child's Recorder* specifically to 'create connectional patriotism'.⁸⁰⁴ *The Child's Recorder* sought to make children proud of their denomination. Its masthead prominently featured an image of Richard Allen, the founder of the AME Church; Mother Bethel Church in Philadelphia, its first church; and the image of the anvil, since the first Mother Bethel Church edifice was a repurposed blacksmith's shop and the anvil was its altar. The domestic advice about the religious education of children sought

⁸⁰⁴Benjamin Tucker Tanner, 'The Children's Recorder', *The Christian Recorder* (28 August 1869), p. 2

to secure the next generation of adherents for the churches. However it went further than this. It also sought to produce the next generation of church leaders. As the Rev. Augustus W. Watson argued,

All great men and women owe their greatness to their early home training... Take the homes of Bishops Allen, Quinn, Morris Brown, Wm. Fisher Dickerson, the Wesley family and others as homes from which great men have come.⁸⁰⁵

Domestic education, therefore, was not only essential to African-American society broadly, but also to the churches specifically.

The Christian education of children from an early age was actually a relative innovation. In the early nineteenth century children were generally considered to be inherently sinful until they experienced Christian conversion, and until that point they could not be full members of the Christian community. A major influence on the change away from this point of view was the writings of Horace Bushnell. In his *Discourses on Christian Nurture*, published in 1847, he suggested that ‘the child is to grow up a Christian and never know himself as being otherwise’, and that ‘The aim, effort, and expectation should be, not as commonly assumed, that the child is to grow up in sin to be converted after he comes to a mature age’.⁸⁰⁶ Julius H. Bailey has argued that Bushnell’s writings had a profound influence on several AME Church leaders including Elisha Weaver, who often reprinted extracts from Bushnell’s writings in *The Christian Recorder*. The issues raised by Bushnell paralleled a later debate within the AME Church in the 1880s over the propriety of infant baptism, and whether baptised children immediately became full members of the church,

⁸⁰⁵Watson, ‘Give Us Christian Homes’, p. 197

⁸⁰⁶H. Bushnell, *Christian Nurture* (Hartford, 1861), p. 10

or whether there should be an intervening probationary period. The question was effectively settled in 1890 with the publication of *The Relation of Baptized Children to the Church* by Levi Coppin (who later became an AME Church bishop in 1900). Coppin authoritatively argued that baptism granted children full membership in the church and that they should therefore receive religious instruction from a young age, echoing the arguments of Bushnell forty-three years earlier. Bailey has argued that Weaver saw Bushnell's view of the Christian education of children as a means of applying his domestic ideology to southern African Americans as well as northerners and thus overcoming the difficulties posed by the varied familial circumstances of the freed people. By emphasising the Christian nurture of children rather than its material aspects, Bushnell could cast domesticity in a more universally applicable light, especially for the impoverished freed people of the South. Furthermore Bushnell's emphasis on the 'organic connection' between parents and children allowed a very flexible approach to the structuring of familial relations and the education of children. However, as Bailey admits,

While Weaver made a valiant attempt to press the experiences of African American families into the shape of the white Victorian ideal, the experiences of African Americans were too varied to fit neatly into place. Although Bushnell's theological stance on Christian nurture provided a paradigm from which to rethink the relationship between parents and children, Weaver ultimately endorsed the two-parent home, the use of domestic worship manuals, and regular family prayer times as the normative Christian experience.⁸⁰⁷

The way in which the church newspapers sought to educate children was not constant, even after it became the general practice to educate them in

⁸⁰⁷Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, p. 20

Christianity from a young age. There was a noticeable change in the language used by Tanner when promoting the relaunch of *The Child's Recorder* in 1880. He moved away from publishing extracts from white domestic literature and instead focussed his writing for children on racial awareness and encouraging parents to teach children the skills required for racial uplift. At the same time the AME Church was rapidly expanding its programmes directed at children, especially the number of Sunday Schools. Also, in the 1880s, the writing about women in *The Christian Recorder* embraced the public role of African-American women in racial uplift to a much greater extent. The literature of the AME Church began to idealise the archetype of the Black Victoria and the articulate, outspoken, self-confident 'race woman'. It may be that this was partly due to the influence of Henry McNeal Turner, who collaborated with Tanner on the relaunching of *The Child's Recorder*, and was generally more progressive on most issues than Tanner. Bailey has termed these shifts in the AME Church's domestic literature 'the radicalization of domesticity'.⁸⁰⁸ While these changes did mark a noticeable change from earlier domestic language, to term it as radical is an overstatement. However, it does suggest a movement towards the translation of domestic language into the language of respectability as deployed by the African-American women's club movement in the early twentieth century.

It was in this context that Bishop Payne published his *Treatise on Domestic Education*. In a sense, Payne's treatise can be seen as a reaction to the 'radicalization of domesticity'. Writing at the end of his career, Payne sought to reassert the importance of domesticity which he felt was being lost. Payne,

⁸⁰⁸Bailey, *Around the Family Altar*, p. 63

like Weaver and Tanner before him, emphasised the importance of motherhood. He believed that mothers should pray openly for their children, while fathers prayed privately. He also believed that the domestic education of girls should be separate from the domestic education of boys. Girls, he argued, should be instructed by their mothers in personal hygiene, housework, modesty, thrift, and piety and that these should be prioritised over more abstract forms of higher learning. Payne's opinions on the domestic roles of women therefore reflected very traditional notions that women were extremely important as wives and mothers, but that their appropriate sphere was the home. Payne thus represented a dying breed, set to be replaced by the powerful women's movement which was developing in the churches (and especially the Baptist churches) in the late nineteenth century, and by powerful, self-confident, outspoken and educated female leaders like Nannie Helen Burroughs, Virginia Broughton, Sarah Willie Layten, Anna Julia Cooper and Ida B. Wells.

6.3 The politics of respectability

In September 1900 at the Fifth Street Baptist Church in Richmond, Virginia, during the annual meeting of the National Baptist Convention, a Woman's Convention was organised and met for the first time. It was not unique. Many new African-American women's organisations were being organised around that time. The National Association of Colored Women had been founded four years earlier and the two organisations shared many of their leading members. While it was the first national black Baptist women's organisation, many state level conventions had had women's auxiliaries for

years. Yet the Women's Convention, Auxiliary to the National Baptist Convention, was to become one of the most influential organisations through which African-American women resisted racism and prejudice and participated in racial uplift throughout the first half of the twentieth century. Among its leaders were women who reshaped the language of domesticity into a powerful tool for women to campaign publicly for racial equality. Its corresponding secretary, Nannie Helen Burroughs, is often spoken of in the same breath as Du Bois for her contribution to African-American racial consciousness.

Women like Burroughs were a product of the significant expansion of education for African-American women which followed emancipation and the Civil War. Institutions like the Benedict Institute at Columbia, South Carolina; the Atlanta Female Seminary, later renamed Spelman Seminary; and the Mather School at Beaufort, South Carolina, were founded under the auspices of the American Baptist Home Mission Society, as were similar institutions by the home mission societies of other denominations, like the Freedmen's Aid Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, and the American Missionary Association of the Congregational Churches. Such schools and colleges educated generations of young African-American women and provided the seedbed from which leaders like Nannie Helen Burroughs could emerge. Their curricula primarily featured traditional domestic and womanly subjects. For example, describing her curriculum, Mrs. M.E. Becker of the Benedict Institute wrote: 'Friday eve. Our talk is on deportment... We discuss society rules, position, street etiquette, table manners, etc. etc.... We all know that morals are judged by manners and womanly deportment often protects

womanly honor.’⁸⁰⁹ Yet alongside the traditional curriculum for young women there was always a strong emphasis on religious and literary education. The two went hand in hand. As Sophia B. Packard, principal of Spelman Seminary, wrote, ‘Already there is a deep religious interest, and twenty have found Christ, while many more have asked our prayers. . . We intend forming into a class the pupils who are preparing to go to Africa as missionaries.’⁸¹⁰ Evidently these schools and colleges, while principally aiming to provide an education for young women in domestic matters, were also producing a generation of religious, socially conscious, educated women who would form the basis of the women’s club movement in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. This expansion of education for women was the corollary of a similar expansion in the education of African-American men. Very quickly after emancipation numerous colleges were founded throughout the South by the home mission societies of various church denominations. A significant majority of these colleges and schools were focussed on industrial training and education. It seems that the domestic training of women, and with it their religious and literary education, was a by-product of the significant expansion of the industrial training of African-American men. Some African-American leaders like Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne and later W.E.B. Du Bois expressed unease about the predominance of industrial education rather than higher learning in the education of African Americans. On the subject of Booker T. Washington’s emphasis on industrial training, Du Bois wrote

He advocates common-school and industrial training, and depreciates institutions of higher learning; but neither the Negro common-schools,

⁸⁰⁹ *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 5, No. 1 (January 1883), p. 41

⁸¹⁰ *The Baptist Home Mission Monthly* Vol. 7, No. 1 (January 1885), p. 21

nor Tuskegee itself, could remain open a day were it not for teachers trained in Negro colleges, or trained by their graduates.⁸¹¹

Similarly, Daniel Alexander Payne frequently complained that the resources of the AME Church were being squandered by establishing new colleges like Morris Brown College, in Atlanta. He would rather have seen the limited educational funds of the church channelled into his own Wilberforce University and focussed on the education of an elite clergy to a very high level. It seems these complaints demonstrate two differing models of African-American education. That advocated by Payne and Du Bois envisioned racial uplift being led by a highly educated elite vanguard of African Americans; a top-down vision of African-American leadership: Du Bois's 'talented tenth'. By contrast those, like Washington, who advocated industrial training sought to educate large numbers of African Americans, throughout the South in particular, for useful and productive employment. It seems that only under this latter model of education was there the means by which significant numbers of educational institutions for women would be established, since the domestic education of women seemingly went hand in hand with the industrial education of men.

The generation of women who graduated from these women's schools and colleges and who led the newly emerging national African-American women's clubs and organisations from the mid-1890s reshaped the language of domesticity which had been prevalent in their churches since the Civil War. They inherited that language and adapted it into a language of respectability which they deployed politically as a tool for racial uplift and resistance

⁸¹¹Du Bois, *The Souls of Black Folk*, p. 42

against racial prejudice. Undoubtedly the ‘politics of respectability’ as coined by Evelyn Brooks Higginbotham is the central conceptual framework for understanding the social and political activism of the women’s club movement of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. It is at the heart of the historiography. Yet there has been no concerted attempt to understand its relationship to the domestic language which preceded it.

In her 1993 book, *Righteous Discontent*, Higginbotham employed the concept of the ‘politics of respectability’ to characterise ‘black Baptist women’s opposition to the social structures and symbolic representations of white supremacy’.⁸¹² Black Baptist women set for themselves high standards of ‘manners and morals’, of decorum, deportment, dress, and appearance. By doing so they ‘contested the plethora of negative stereotypes by introducing alternate images of black women...[they] implicitly contradicted the lazy, immoral, and inept images portrayed in racist literature.’⁸¹³ In no sense did this represent an accommodation with white racism. In fact it actively subverted it, as Higginbotham argues:

Polite behaviour on Jim Crow streetcars and trains did not constitute supine deference to white power. Nor did politeness constitute unconscious acts of political concession... On the contrary, the politics of respectability constituted a deliberate, highly self-conscious concession to hegemonic values. While deferring to segregation in practice, adherents of respectability never deferred to it in principle. The Baptist women’s emphasis on manners and morals served to reinforce their sense of moral superiority over whites.⁸¹⁴

The strategy of respectability drew on the strategy for racial uplift in the

⁸¹²Higginbotham, *Righteous Discontent*, p. 186

⁸¹³*Ibid.*, p. 191

⁸¹⁴*Ibid.*, pp. 192–3

domestic ideology which preceded it. By employing respectability, African-American women sought 'to refute the logic behind their social subordination'.⁸¹⁵ Respectability was a means of asserting the equal personhood of African-American women, just as domesticity had sought to stake their claim to true womanhood. Respectability inherited and adapted the strategies and language of domesticity. In practical terms, its methods — of deportment, dress, presentation, and manners — had been taught to African-American women by the domestic literature of their churches for decades. Yet respectability was much more powerful as a source of racial uplift and pride than was domesticity, because it preserved and did not seek to curtail the public voice of women. The acculturation and implicit claims of equality with white society which the outward signs of respectability bestowed on women were not squandered by limiting women to the home, but instead were deployed to challenge publicly the prejudice of white society: 'the Baptist women emphasized manners and morals while simultaneously asserting traditional forms of protest, such as petitions, boycotts, and verbal appeals to justice.'⁸¹⁶ The effectiveness of such appeals and protests far outweighed the transgression of Victorian notions of the place of women which they represented. Respectability, therefore, was an externalisation of the logic behind domesticity. It took the inward looking aspirations of domesticity to meet white standards, and turned them outwards to face white society, made them public; to show white society that its standards had been met and present white racists with the hypocrisy of their prejudice. Respectability was always

⁸¹⁵Ibid., p. 193

⁸¹⁶Ibid., p. 187

aware of white society; 'the behaviour of blacks was perceived as ever visible to the white gaze. The black Baptist women imagined constant surveillance by whites'.⁸¹⁷ Yet unlike domesticity it was also always challenging white society and was never content to await white approval passively.

Respectability was however, exclusive and exclusionary, just as was domesticity. Like domesticity, it was bound up with class. This is hardly surprising since its nature was an assimilation of the standards and morals of the dominant, privileged class. Adherents of respectability were ever vigilant against backsliding and slackness in the practice of respectable behaviour. They were aware that black society could and would be judged by the most negative image it portrayed of itself. They therefore 'demanded that every individual in the black community assume responsibility for behavioral self-regulation and self-improvement', and black society 'continuously defined and re-defined itself through the exclusion of what it marked out as "low" '.⁸¹⁸ In practice, this meant that rather than reflecting class distinctions within black society, the practice of respectability in fact came to define class and hierarchy among African Americans. Therefore respectability also came to symbolise a model of resistance to racism which was led from the top of African-American society, by a vanguard, an elite. The proponents of respectability therefore, perhaps unwittingly, limited the appeal of their political challenges to racism, and ensured that they could never be universal popular movements that truly encompassed African-American society.

⁸¹⁷Ibid., p. 196

⁸¹⁸Ibid., p. 187

6.4 Black religion, female radicalism

There is a longstanding debate in the historiography of African-American religion about whether Christianity has prevented African Americans from adopting socially radical positions: whether it has pacified and stymied black resistance to their own oppression. Much of this debate has focussed on slave religion. Scholars including Sterling Stuckey and Eugene Genovese have argued that Christianity has hindered African-American efforts to advance themselves by advocating radical social change, while Gayraud Wilmore in *Black Religion and Black Radicalism* argued that African-American religious leadership has often been the wellspring of resistance to oppression.⁸¹⁹ However, this debate has not really addressed whether African-American Christianity provoked or hindered progressivism or indeed radicalism on questions of gender. On the one hand it was the churches which gave rise to the language and practice of respectability which placed women front and centre in the cause of racial uplift. Yet for most of the nineteenth century, the churches paid lip service to white domestic values according to which a true woman's place was exclusively in the home. The churches offered complex and contradictory opportunities and challenges for women who sought to engage in the task of challenging racism. However, ultimately by the early decades of the twentieth century they could produce only modes of female resistance to racism which depended on the standards and values of an educated black elite, and which continued to challenge white society on its own terms.

⁸¹⁹G.S. Wilmore, *Black Religion and Black Radicalism: An Interpretation of the Religious History of African Americans* (Maryknoll, NY, 1998, revised 3rd edition), pp 109–15, 253–61

7 Conclusion

The developments in women's leadership in late nineteenth-century African-American Christianity were not triggered by bishops and ministers at church conferences exchanging scriptural quotations, attempting to justify their support or opposition to female preaching or ordination. This was merely the overt expression of systems of ecclesiology and theology through which they understood the nature of their churches, and the appropriate role of women in them. The systems of belief which conditioned church leaders' support or opposition to female leadership were determined by a complex web of church politics in which 'the woman question' interacted mutually with questions of lay rights, church growth and finance, church-led education, domestic ideology, antiracism, emigration, and external secular politics. Yet the deeper roots of 'the woman question' in African-American Christianity have been overlooked by many historians.

In the late nineteenth century African-American women gained new opportunities and means to participate in their churches and actively direct their religious experience. New church offices, increased opportunity to preach, the growth and elaboration of church-led educational institutions, the emergence and proliferation of women's auxiliaries and benevolent societies, and, in the AME Zion Church, ordination all enhanced female agency. Women have

always been the power behind the throne in black churches. They constitute the majority of the membership. It was in the late nineteenth century that women overcame the barriers that had kept them passive in the pews. As a result, in the twentieth century African-American women were able to participate in directing the experience of worship within the churches, and were able to leverage the social power of black Christianity, particularly as a means of resistance to Jim Crow and racism.

The explanatory power of any argument regarding historical causation can be assessed partly by how well it explains the timing of events. Why did the AME Zion Church ultimately sanction the ordination of women almost fifty years before the AME Church? Why did the AME Church finally create boards of stewardesses in 1868 rather than earlier or later? Why did the CME Church not introduce stewardesses until twenty years after the AME Church had? In the case of the effort to explain the growth of female power and influence in late nineteenth-century African-American Christianity, this thesis has offered and discussed several causal processes which enhanced female power in the churches. The rapid expansion of African-American churches in the post-emancipation South destabilised the existing denominational structures of the independent black churches. Freed people, less used to the formality of northern African-American worship, challenged northern dominance, and gradually they came to be represented in the leadership of their denominations. Disagreements over the style of worship and particularly slave survivals in ritual and music reflected class differences within denominations which drove forward the cause of lay rights in order to create more egalitarian and democratic church structures. Simultaneously

the logistical challenge of church expansion combined with the intensity of denominational competition in the postbellum South demanded the churches enhance lay and women's rights in order to make use of their fundraising and organisational abilities. These processes shaped the factions that developed in church leadership over a range of issues in church politics, such as the appropriate degree of ministers' involvement in secular politics. The factions which emerged in the leadership of the black churches reflected greater or lesser degrees of conservatism, which were well reflected in the attitudes of the respective bishops and church leaders towards women's roles.

Church-led educational opportunities for women which grew and developed in the later nineteenth century gave women the opportunity to exercise more influence both in their churches and in society more broadly. This was particularly true of the colleges administered by African-American denominations, such as Wilberforce and Livingstone, since they more actively resisted the pressures to replace classical syllabuses with industrial and domestic training. The influence of the Hampton-Tuskegee model was particularly pernicious for African-American women, who, in white eyes, were in great need of domestic education, and on whom classical studies would be wasted. Male black church leaders produced their own domestic ideology in the late nineteenth century. However, this was coopted by African-American churchwomen who employed domestic ideology and the related concept of respectability and subverted their constraining implications. Rather than being restricted to the home by domesticity and rather than assimilating to white models of respectability, African-American women used both ideologies as constructive mechanisms for inward-looking social improvement in black communities and

as outward-looking weapons to undermine racist stereotyping.

Of course, these explanations and processes all interacted and contributed to the development of female influence. How is the interaction of these causal processes to be weighed and in what conceptual framework can it be understood? It is insufficient to think simply of the onward march of progress driven exclusively by female agency. Black churchwomen actively campaigned for greater influence in their churches. Much of the expansion of women's roles in the nineteenth century was won by women's consistent advocacy and pressure and by their ability to demonstrate their indispensability to their churches. However, insofar as black women practised their religion in the context of denominational churches, they were subject to the authority of male leadership. The decisions made about the ordination of women in the AME and AME Zion Churches were made by the male delegates of the General Conferences. Certainly female preaching brought the issue before the conferences, but it is nonetheless essential to understand, in depth, why the male church authorities divided as they did on such questions. Admittedly autonomous female organising was more potent in Baptist churches which lacked the overarching episcopal structure to appeal to. For black Baptist women the most effective means of wielding influence was through auxiliary societies, which required significantly less cooperation and consent from male authorities.

Simple understandings of denominational structure and character can explain the broad strokes. The congregational nature of Baptist polity of course meant that women would have to express their desire to influence and lead their churches in a very different way from Methodist women. The

inherent conservatism of the CME Church, as a child denomination of the MECS, is largely sufficient to explain its comparative hesitancy over roles for women. More nuanced discontinuities in denominational treatment of women require more subtle conceptualisations of the causal processes, however. One possible framework for understanding the interaction of the processes which enhanced women's positions in their churches is generational change.

By the end of the nineteenth century, black churches were increasingly populated by a generation which had grown up after emancipation. The South had been fully integrated into the churches, and southern influence had matured. The lay influence which had characterized southern black Christianity bore fruit as lay and women's rights began to be realised. Increasing numbers of black churchwomen had been educated and sought to utilise that education as teachers, preachers, organisers, and activists. Most importantly, an older conservative generation of bishops and church leaders was being replaced by a younger more liberal one. Differences in the pace and timing of these generational transitions can explain inter-denominational differences with regard to questions of women's roles. In large part, the rejection of the ordination of women in the AME Church came about because the question arose while Daniel Alexander Payne was still alive. His broadly conservative influence over the AME Church outweighed the radicalism of Henry McNeal Turner. By contrast when the question of female ordination came before the AME Zion Church, the longstanding senior bishop, Christopher Rush, had died and the new senior bishop, James Walker Hood was in fact the one who had first ordained a woman in the connection.

The greater significance of this thesis is not only that it offers insight

into the role of women in African-American Christianity in the nineteenth century, but also sheds light on the longer-term legacy of female participation in African-American Christianity into the twentieth century. It has been estimated that for most of the twentieth century at least two thirds of the congregations of African-American Christian churches were women. During the twentieth century women were the bulwark and mainstay of African-American Christianity, and they continued to expand their power and presence within their churches. By 1940 there were already at least one hundred female pastors of missions and churches in the AME Zion connection.⁸²⁰ In 1948, the decision by the AME General Conference to allow the ordination of women marked a wave of liberalisation in the treatment of women in African-American Christianity in the 1940s and 1950s. Furthermore the debates over the expansion of female roles and especially ordination in the nineteenth century have significant contemporary resonance. In the past two decades all the major African-American Methodist churches have elected women to episcopacy for the first time. In 2000, Vashti McKenzie became the first woman elected bishop in a major African-American denomination when she was consecrated the 117th bishop of the AME Church. The AME Zion Church followed suit in 2008 when it elected Bishop Mildred Hines, as did the CME Church, electing Bishop Teresa Snorton in 2010. During the twentieth century, female African-American Christian women such as Nannie Helen Burroughs, Anna Julia Cooper, and Pauli Murray played extremely important roles within their churches and in African-American life as a whole, so it is essential to understand the nineteenth-century origins of female leadership in

⁸²⁰Collier-Thomas, *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice*, p. 100

African-American Christianity.

8 Appendices

8.1 Appendix A: Courses of Study at Atlanta Baptist Female Seminary, 1881

Reproduced from Read, *The Story of Spelman*, p. 379

NORMAL DEPARTMENT

FIRST YEAR

FIRST TERM

Reading and Spelling
Primary Arithmetic
Geography
Writing

SECOND TERM

Reading and Spelling
Intellectual Arithmetic
Geography
Writing

SECOND YEAR

FIRST TERM

Reading and Definition
Written Arithmetic
Geography
Writing

SECOND TERM

Reading and Definition
Practical Arithmetic
Geography
Writing

THIRD YEAR

FIRST TERM

Practical Arithmetic
English Grammar
History of the United States
Composition and Recitations

SECOND TERM

Practical Arithmetic
English Grammar
History of the United States
Composition and Recitations

ACADEMIC DEPARTMENT

FIRST YEAR

FIRST TERM	SECOND TERM
Higher English Grammar	Higher English Grammar
Algebra	Algebra
Physiology and Hygeine	Physical Geography
Essays	Essays

SECOND YEAR

FIRST TERM	SECOND TERM
Latin or English Analysis	Latin or Political Economy
Rhetoric	Universal History
Geometry	Geometry and Trigonometry
Essays	Essays

THIRD YEAR

FIRST TERM	SECOND TERM
Latin or English literature	Latin or Chemistry
Natural Philosophy	English History
Constitution of United States	Botany
Essays	Essays

FOURTH YEAR

FIRST TERM	SECOND TERM
Astronomy	Moral Philosophy
Mental Philosophy	Evidences of Christianity
Zoology	Geology
Essays	Essays

8.2 Appendix B: African-American enrolment in industrial education in 1899–90

Reproduced from Du Bois (ed.), *The Negro Artisan*, pp. 34–7, 66–8

* Statistics for 1898–1899

† Statistics for 1897–1898

School	Location	Total enrolment	Industrial courses	Sewing	Cooking
Alabama					
Kowaliga Academic and Industrial School	Kowaliga	205	205	125	10
Emerson Normal Institute	Mobile	201	100	60	
State Normal Institute	Montgomery	928	466	289	29
Agricultural and Mechanical College	Normal	499	499	76	34
Talladega College	Talladega	618	195	115	26
Stillman Institute	Tuscaloosa	45	35		
Tuskegee Normal and Industrial School*	Tuskegee	1,180	1,180	90	61
Arkansas					
Shorter University	Argenta	86	16		9
Arkadelphia Academy*	Arkadelphia	92	20	20	20
Arkansas Baptist College	Little Rock	213	56	50	2
Philander Smith College	Little Rock	388	95	82	82
Branch Normal College	Pine Bluff	214	109	45	
Southland College	Southland	127	120	60	20

School	Location	Total enrolment	Industrial courses	Sewing	Cooking
Delaware					
State College for Colored Students	Dover		46	20	4
District of Columbia					
Howard University	Washington	768	223	75	
Normal School (colored)	Washington		38	38	
Florida					
Cookman Institute	Jacksonville		23	7	7
Edward Waters College	Jacksonville		22	22	
Fessenden Academy	Martin	206	130	80	27
Emerson Memorial Home and School	Ocala	76	76	76	19
Orange Park Normal and Manual Training School	Orange Park	79	79	43	43
Florida State Normal and Industrial School	Tallahassee	209	100	48	48
Georgia					
Jeruel Academy	Athens	221	80	80	
Knox Institute	Atlanta	270	114	94	
Atlanta University	Atlanta	263	233	167	51
Morris Brown College	Atlanta	499	83	44	44
Spelman Seminary	Atlanta	599	450	402	50
Storrs School	Atlanta		93	93	

School	Location	Total enrolment	Industrial courses	Sewing	Cooking
Haines Normal and Industrial Institute	Augusta	460	208	200	15
Georgia State Industrial College*	College	231	140	40	
Fort Valley High and Industrial School	Fort Valley	350	75	50	36
Dorchester Academy	McIntosh	408	209	124	21
Ballard Normal School	Macon		272	262	10
Central City College	Macon		91	15	10
Beach Institute	Savannah	320	41	35	1
Clark University	South Atlanta	476	310	175	48
Allen Normal and Industrial School	Thomasville	210	78	78	6
Kentucky					
State Normal School for Colored Persons	Frankfort	170	170	70	70
Chandler Normal School	Lexington	220	111	111	
Louisiana					
Gilbert Academy and Industrial College	Baldwin	248	141		
Leland University	New Orleans	115	16	16	
Straight University	New Orleans	539	229	157	
Maryland					
St Francis Academy	Baltimore	59	27	13	8
Industrial Home for Colored Girls*	Melvale	105	105	105	40
Princess Anne Academy	Princess Anne	82	60	29	29

School	Location	Total enrolment	Industrial courses	Sewing	Cooking
Mississippi					
Mount Hermon Female Seminary	Clinton	60	60	60	60
Southern Christian Institute	Edwards	87	43	15	10
Mississippi State Normal School	Holly Springs	257	80	80	
Rust University	Holly Springs	230	124	56	10
Jackson College	Jackson	102	60	60	
Tougaloo University	Tougaloo	436	221	98	70
Alcorn Agricultural and Mechanical College	Westside	339	339		
Missouri					
Lincoln Institute	Jefferson City	278	125	49	
George R. Smith College	Sedalia	200	52	40	
New Jersey					
Manual Training and Industrial School	Bordentown	109	109	41	32
North Carolina					
Washburn Seminary	Beaufort	158	118	70	
Biddle University	Charlotte	236	107	20	
Scotia Seminary	Concord	290	290	290	290
Franklinton Christian College*	Franklinton	158	10	10	
Agricultural and Mechanical College for the Colored Race	Greensboro	174	174	64	64

School	Location	Total enrolment	Industrial courses	Sewing	Cooking
High Point Normal and Industrial School	High Point	276	66	60	15
Lincoln Academy	Kings Mountain	235	155	110	85
Barrette Collegiate and Industrial School	Pee Dee	111	75	20	20
Plymouth State Normal School	Plymouth	87	37	37	
St Augustine's School	Raleigh	323	100	50	50
Shaw University	Raleigh	511	190	120	
Livingstone College	Salisbury	266	9		
Gregory Normal School†	Wilmington	228	100	1,100	
Rankin-Richards Institute	Windsor		16	16	
The Slater Industrial and State Normal School	Winston		118	38	37
Pennsylvania					
Institute for Colored Youth	Philadelphia	318	272		87
South Carolina					
Schofield Normal and Industrial School	Aiken	303	231	173	72
Browning Home School†	Camden	180	136	100	36
Avery Normal Institute	Charleston	345	75	75	
Brainerd Institute	Chester	205	205	117	40
Allen University	Columbia	343	84	84	20

School	Location	Total enrolment	Industrial courses	Sewing	Cooking
Benedict College	Columbia	488	213	109	20
Pennsylvania Normal and Industrial School	Frogmore	265	179	91	
Brewer Normal School†	Greenwood	245	147	147	
Claffin University	Orangeburg	708	487	195	46
Tennessee					
Warner Institute	Jonesboro	101	78	52	84
Knoxville College	Knoxville	304	68	36	10
LeMoyne Normal Institute	Memphis	718	462	378	30
Morristown Normal College	Morristown	277	93	93	68
Central Tennessee College	Nashville	540	70	9	
Roger Williams University	Nashville	268	100	98	
Texas					
Bishop College	Marshall	337	327	106	14
Wiley University	Marshall	411	200	160	60
Paul Quinn College	Waco	276	149	92	
Virginia					
Ingleside Seminary*	Burkeville	109	109	109	109
Gloucester Agricultural and Industrial College*	Cappahosic	97	97	20	27
Hampton Normal and Agricultural Institute	Hampton	939	949	412	

School	Location	Total enrolment	Industrial courses	Sewing	Cooking
St Paul Normal and Industrial School*	Lawrenceville	318	230	72	22
Manassas Industrial School*	Manassas	65	65	38	
Norfolk Mission College	Norfolk	690	406	280	92
Virginia Normal and Collegiate Institute	Petersburg	343	183	183	20
Virginia Union University	Richmond	157	12		
West Virginia					
Storer College	Harper's Ferry	142	105	40	40

8.3 Appendix C: *The Negro Artisan* — Classification of Industrial Schools

Reproduced from Du Bois (ed.), *The Negro Artisan*, pp. 31, 58

Categories

1. Janitor work and chores performed by students
2. Repair work and equipment by student labor
3. Teaching of ordinary housework to girls
4. Teaching of house-service for the training of servants
5. The school of work; co-operative industry for gain, but use of student labor
6. Teaching of trades
7. The industrial settlement
8. The social settlement
9. Manual training
10. Technological education

Categorisation of schools

1, 2 — Janitor and Repair Work with incidental industrial training

Calhoun

Benedict

Paul Quinn

3, 4 — House work

Spelman

Scotia

5A — Industries given as courses of study more or less compulsory

Howard

Clark

Florida State

Wilberforce

Scofield

Walden

Biddle

Rust

5B — Co-operative Industry for gain and trade instruction — the School of Work

Tuskegee

Alcorn

Tougaloo

A. & M. College, Normal, AL

6 — Trade Schools

A. & M. College, Greensboro, NC

Lincoln Institute, MO

9 — Manual Training Schools

Shaw

Virginia Union

Talladega

Tillotson

Knox

LeMoyne

Orange Park

Ballard

Prairie View

Southern

Atlanta University

6, 9 — Manual Training and Trade Schools

Hampton

Claffin

9 Bibliography

9.1 Manuscript and archival sources

American Baptist Historical Society, Mercer University, Atlanta, GA

Emory University Manuscript, Archives and Rare Book Library (MARBL),
Atlanta, GA

Carter G. Woodson collection, 1876–1999 (Manuscript Collection No.
1040)

Reverdy C. Ransom collection, 1936–1975 (Manuscript Collection No.
1043)

Library of Congress Manuscript Division

Nannie Helen Burroughs Papers, 1900–1963 (MSSS7026)

Carter G. Woodson Papers, 1736–1974 (MSS46342)

Library of Congress Microfilm Reading Room

Moorland-Spingarn Research Center, Howard University, Washington, DC

George Freeman Bragg papers

Daniel Alexander Payne papers

Henry McNeal Turner papers

Mary Church Terrell papers

Anna Julia Cooper papers

Mother Bethel AME Church Archives, Philadelphia, PA

Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia, PA

Robert W. Woodruff Library, Atlanta University Center, Atlanta, GA

Freedmen's Aid Society Records, 1866–1932 (microfilm edition published by Scholarly Resources, Inc.)

First Congregational Church of Atlanta, United Church of Christ Collection, 1867–1999

Schomburg Center for Research in Black Culture, New York Public Library

George Freeman Bragg Manuscripts (Sc MG 244)

Theophilus Gould Steward Papers (Sc Micro R-5910)

Henry C. Bunton Papers (Sc MG 291)

DuPree African-American Pentecostal and Holiness collection, 1876–1989 (Sc MG 325)

Robin W. Winks Blacks in Canada collection, 1956–1972 (Sc Micro R-5857)

Southern Baptist Historical Library and Archives, Nashville, TN

United Methodist Archives & History Center, Drew University, Madison, NJ

Virginia Baptist Historical Society, Richmond, VA

Wilberforce University Archives, Xenia, OH

Benjamin W. Amett collection

Yale University, New Haven, CT

9.2 Printed primary sources

Acornley, John H. (ed), *The Colored Lady Evangelist: Being the Life, Labors and Experiences, of Mrs. Harriet Baker* (Brooklyn, 1892)

Adams, Revels A., *Cyclopedia of African Methodism in Mississippi* (Natchez, MS, 1902)

Allen, Richard, *The Life, Experience, and Gospel Labours of the Rt. Rev. Richard Allen. To Which is Annexed the Rise and Progress of the African Methodist Episcopal Church in the United States of America. Containing a Narrative of the Yellow Fever in the Year of Our Lord 1793: With an Address to the People of Colour in the United States* (Philadelphia, 1833)

Armstrong, Samuel Chapman, *Education For Life* (Hampton, VA, 1913)

- Arnett, Benjamin W., *The Budget for 1881: Containing the Annual Reports of the General Officers of the African M.E. Church of the United States of America* (Xenia, OH, 1881)
- Bragg, George F., *History of the Afro-American Group of the Episcopal Church* (Baltimore, 1922)
- Brawley, Benjamin Griffith, *Women of Achievement: Written for the Fireside Schools Under the Auspices of the Woman's American Baptist Home Mission Society* (Chicago, 1919)
- Brawley, Edward M., *The Negro Baptist Pulpit: A Collection of Sermons and Papers on Baptist Doctrine and Missionary and Educational Work* (Philadelphia, 1890)
- Broughton, Virginia W., *Twenty Years' Experience of a Missionary* (Chicago, 1907)
- Brown, Hallie Quinn (ed.), *Homespun Heroines and Other Women of Distinction* (Xenia, OH, 1926)
- Brown, William Wells, *The Rising Son: Or, The Antecedents and Advancement of the Colored Race* (Boston, 1874)
- Bushnell, Horace, *Christian Nurture* (Hartford, 1861)
- Butt, Israel L., *History of African Methodism in Virginia; or Four Decades in the Old Dominion* (Hampton, VA, 1908)
- Cadbury, M. H., *The Life of Amanda Smith: The African Sybil, The Christian Saint* (Birmingham, AL 1916)
- Cooper, Anna Julia, *A Voice From the South* (Xenia, OH, 1892)
- Coppin, Fanny Jackson, *Reminiscences of School Life, and Hints on Teaching* (Philadelphia, 1913)
- Corey, Charles H., *A History of the Richmond Theological Institute with Reminiscences of Thirty Years' Work among the Colored People of the South* (Richmond, 1895)
- Daily Journal of the Sixteenth Quadrennial Session of the General Conference of the A.M.E. Zion Church, of America, Held at Montgomery, Alabama, May, A.D., 1880* (New York, 1880)

- Department of Commerce and Labour, Bureau of the Census, *U.S. Census: Special Reports: Religious Bodies: 1906* (Washington, DC, 1910)
- The Doctrines and Discipline of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1817)
- Duncan, Sara J., *Progressive Missions in the South and Addresses; With Illustrations and Sketches of Missionary Workers and Ministers and Bishops' Wives* (Atlanta, GA, 1906)
- Du Bois, W.E.B., *The Negro Artisan: A Social Study* (Atlanta, 1902)
- , *The Souls of Black Folk: Essays and Sketches* (Chicago, 1903)
- Du Bois, W. E. B., Aptheker, Herbert (ed.), *The Education of Black People: Ten Critiques, 1906–1960* (Amherst, MA, 1973)
- Elaw, Zilpha, *Memoirs of the Life, Religious Experience, Ministerial Travels and Labours of Mrs. Zilpha Elaw, An American Female of Colour; Together with Some Account of the Great Religious Revivals in America [Written by Herself]* (London, 1846)
- Foote, Julia A.J., *A Brand Plucked from the Fire: An Autobiographical Sketch* (Cleveland, OH, 1879)
- Forten, Charlotte L., Billington, Ray Allen (ed.), *The Journal of Charlotte L. Forten: A Free Negro in the Slave Era* (New York, 1953)
- Grimké, Francis J., Woodson, Carter G. (ed.), *The Works of Francis J. Grimké*, 4 Vols. (Washington, DC, 1942)
- Gaines, Wesley J., *African Methodism in the South; or, Twenty-Five Years of Freedom* (Atlanta, GA, 1890)
- Handy, James A., *Scraps of African Methodist Episcopal History* (Philadelphia, 1902)
- Harlan, Louis R. (ed.), *The Booker T. Washington Papers* 14 Vols. (Urbana, IL, 1972)
- Hartzell, Joseph C., *Methodism and the Negro in the United States* (Lancaster, PA and Washington, DC, 1923)
- History of the First African Baptist Church from its Organization, January 20th, 1788, to July 1st, 1888* (Savannah, GA, 1888)

- Holsey, Lucius Henry, *Autobiography, Sermons, Addresses, and Essays of Bishop L.H. Holsey, D.D.* (Atlanta, GA, 1898)
- Hood, James Walker, *The Negro in the Christian Pulpit; or the two characters and two destinies as delineated in twenty-one practical sermons* (Raleigh, NC, 1884)
- , *One Hundred Years of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church; or, The Centennial of African Methodism* (New York, 1895)
- Johnson, Andre E. (ed.), *An African American Pastor Before and During the American Civil War: The Literary Archive of Henry McNeal Turner* Volume 1 (Lewiston, NY, 2010)
- (ed.), *An African American Pastor Before and During the American Civil War: The Literary Archive of Henry McNeal Turner* Volume 2 (Lewiston, NY, 2012)
- Johnson, James Weldon, *God's Trombones: Seven Negro Sermons in Verse* (New York, 1927)
- Jordan, Lewis G., *Negro Baptist History, U.S.A., 1750–1930* (Nashville, TN, 1930)
- Journal of the 18th Session and 17th Quadrennial Session of The General Conference of The African Methodist Episcopal Church in The World* (Philadelphia, 1884)
- Kealing, Hightower T., *History of African Methodism in Texas* (Waco, 1885)
- Lane, Isaac, *Autobiography of Bishop Isaac Lane, LL.D., with a Short History of the C.M E. Church in America and of Methodism* (Nashville, 1916)
- Lee, Jarena, *The Life and Religious Experience of Jarena Lee, A Coloured Lady, giving an account of her call to preach the gospel. Revised and corrected from the original manuscript, written by herself* (Philadelphia, 1836)
- Lockwood, Lewis C., *Two Black Teachers During the Civil War: Mary S. Peake, the Colored Teacher at Fortress Monroe; Life on the Sea Islands: Charlotte Forten* (New York, 1969, originally published 1863)
- Majors, Monroe Alphus, *Noted Negro Women: their Triumphs and Activities* (Chicago, 1893)

- McTyeire, Holland N., *A History of Methodism* (Nashville, 1884)
- Moore, John Jamison, *History of the A.M.E. Zion Church in America. Founded in 1796, In the City of New York* (York, PA, 1884)
- Morgan, Joseph, *Morgan's History of The New Jersey Conference of The A.M.E. Church from 1872 to 1887* (Camden, NJ, 1887)
- The Negro Problem: A Series of Articles by Representative American Negroes of Today* (New York, 1903)
- Palmer, Phoebe, *The Promise of the Father* (Boston, 1859)
- Payne, Daniel Alexander, *The Semi-Centenary and the Retrospection of the African Methodist Episcopal Church in the USA* (Baltimore, 1866)
- , *A Treatise on Domestic Education* (Cincinnati, 1889)
- , *Recollections of Seventy Years* (Nashville, TN, 1888)
- , *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Nashville, TN, 1891)
- Peabody, Francis Greenwood, *Education For Life: The Story of Hampton Institute: Told in Connection with the Fiftieth Anniversary of the Foundation of the School* (Garden City, NY, 1918)
- Pegues, A.W., *Our Baptist Ministers and Schools* (Springfield, MA, 1892)
- Penn, I. Garland, *The Afro-American Press, and Its editors* (Springfield, MA, 1891)
- Phillips, Charles Henry, *The History of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church in America: Comprising Its Organization, Subsequent Development and Present Status* (Jackson, TN, 1925)
- Ponton, Mungo M., *The Life and Times of Henry McNeal Turner* (Atlanta, GA, 1917)
- Ransom, Reverdy C., *School Days at Wilberforce* (Springfield, OH, [1886?])
- , *The Industrial and Social Conditions of the Negro: A Thanksgiving Sermon* (Chicago, 1896)
- , *The Spirit of Freedom and Justice: Orations and Speeches* (Nashville, TN, 1926)

- , *The Negro: The Hope or Despair of Christianity* (Boston, MA, 1935)
- , *The Pilgrimage of Harriet Ransom's Son* (Nashville, TN, 1949)
- Redkey, Edwin S. (ed), *Respect Black: The Writings and Speeches of Henry McNeal Turner* (New York, 1971)
- Riley, Walter H., *Forty Years in the Lap of Methodism: History of Lexington Conference of Methodist Episcopal Church* (Louisville, KY, 1915)
- Rush, Christopher, *A Short Account of the Rise and Progress of the African M.E. Church in America* (New York, 1866)
- Scruggs, Lawson A., *Women of Distinction* (Raleigh, NC, 1893)
- Simmons, William J., *Men of Mark: Eminent, Progressive and Rising* (Cleveland, OH, 1887)
- Sims, James M., *The First Colored Baptist Church in North America. Constituted at Savannah, Georgia, January 20, A.D. 1788. With Biographical Sketches of the Pastors* (Philadelphia, 1888)
- Small, John B., *Code on the Discipline of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church* (York, PA, 1898)
- Smith, Amanda Berry, *An Autobiography: The Story of the Lord's Dealings with Mrs. Amanda Smith, the Colored Evangelist: Containing an Account of Her Life Work of Faith, and Her Travels in America, England, Ireland, Scotland, India, and Africa as an Independent Missionary* (Chicago, 1893)
- Smith, Charles Spencer, *A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church: Being a Volume Supplemental to A History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church, by Daniel Alexander Payne, D.D., LL.D., Late one of Its Bishops: Chronicling the Principal Events in the Advance of the African Methodist Episcopal Church from 1856 to 1922* (Philadelphia, 1922)
- Smith, David and Payne, Daniel Alexander, *Biography of Rev. David Smith, of the A.M.E. Church Being a Complete History, Embracing over Sixty Years' Labor in the Advancement of the Redeemer's Kingdom on Earth. Including 'The History of the Origin and Development of Wilberforce University'* (Xenia, OH, 1881)

- Stewart, Theophilus Gould, *Pioneer Echoes. Six Special Sermons: Five of Which Were Preached in South Carolina and Georgia from 1866 to 1871* (Baltimore, 1889)
- , *Fifty Years in the Gospel Ministry from 1864 to 1914. Twenty-seven Years in the Pastorate; Sixteen Years' Active Service as Chaplain in the U.S. Army; Seven Years Professor in Wilberforce University; Two Trips to Europe; A Trip in Mexico* (Philadelphia, 1921)
- Talbert, Horace, *The Sons of Allen: Together with a Sketch of the Rise and Progress of Wilberforce University, Wilberforce, Ohio* (Xenia, OH, 1906)
- Talbot, Edith Armstrong, *Samuel Chapman Armstrong: A Biographical Study* (New York, 1904)
- Tanner, Benjamin Tucker, *An Apology for African Methodism* (Baltimore, 1867)
- , *An Outline of Our History and Government for African Methodist Churchmen, Ministerial and Lay, in Catechetical Form* (Philadelphia, 1884)
- Taylor, Marshall W., *Life, Travels, Labors and Helpers of Mrs. Amanda Smith, The Famous Missionary Negro Missionary Evangelist* (Cincinnati, OH, 1887)
- Terrell, Mary Church, *A Colored Women in a White World* (Washington, DC, 1940)
- Thompson, Joseph, *Bethel Gleanings* (Philadelphia, 1881)
- Turner, Henry McNeal, *The Genius and Theory of Methodist Polity, or the Machinery of Methodism. Practically Illustrated through a Series of Questions and Answers* (Philadelphia, 1885)
- Washington, Booker T., *Up From Slavery: An Autobiography* (Garden City, NY, 1901)
- Wayman, Alexander W., *My Recollections of African M.E. Ministers, or Forty Years' Experience in the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Philadelphia, 1881)
- , *Cyclopædia of African Methodism* (Baltimore, 1882)
- Willard, Frances E., *Women in the Pulpit* (Boston, 1888)

Williams, George W., *History of the Negro Race in America from 1619 to 1880: Negroes as Slaves, as Soldiers, and as Citizens*, 2 Vols. (New York, 1885)

Woosley, Louisa, *Shall Women Preach? or the Question Answered* (Caneyville, KY, 1891)

Wright, Richard R, *Centennial Encyclopaedia of the African Methodist Episcopal Church Containing Principally the Biographies of the Men and Women, Both Ministers and Laymen, Whose Labors during a Hundred Years, Helped Make the A.M.E. Church What It Is; Also Short Historical Sketches of Annual Conferences, Educational Institutions, General Departments, Missionary Societies of the A.M.E. Church, and General Information about African Methodism and the Christian Church in General; Being a Literary Contribution to the Celebration of the One Hundredth Anniversary of the Formation of the African Methodist Episcopal Church Denomination by Richard Allen and others, at Philadelphia, Penna., in 1816* (Philadelphia, 1916)

9.3 Microform collections

African American Religious Serials, 1850–1950 [<http://goo.gl/TbrQtn>] (Accessed April 2016)

ATLA African-American Baptist Annual Reports, 1865–1990s [<http://microformguidesgale.com/Data/Download/8395000C.pdf>] (Accessed April 2016)

9.4 Online collections

Accessible Archives — African American Newspapers Collection [<http://www.accessible-archives.com/collections/african-american-newspapers/>] (Accessed April 2016)

American Baptist — Chronicling America — Library of Congress [<http://chroniclingamerica.loc.gov/lccn/sn93062854/issues/>] (Accessed April 2016)

Baylor University Libraries Digital Collections: Southern Baptist Convention Annuals

[<http://digitalcollections.baylor.edu/cdm/landingpage/collection/ml-sbcann>] (Accessed April 2016)

University of North Carolina — Documenting the American South
[<http://docsouth.unc.edu>] (Accessed April 2016)

9.5 Church newspapers and journals

The American Baptist

The AME Church Review

The AME Zion Church Quarterly Review

The Baptist Home Mission Monthly

The Christian Index

The Christian Recorder

National Baptist Magazine

Repository of Religion and Literature and of Science and Art

The Star of Zion

9.6 Printed secondary works

Agresti, Barbara Finlay, 'The First Decades of Freedom: Black Families in a Southern County, 1870 and 1885', *Journal of Marriage and Family* Vol. 40, No. 4, Black Families (November 1978), pp. 697–706

Allen, Walter R, 'Black Family Research in the United States: A Review, Assessment and Extension', *Journal of Comparative Family Studies* Vol. 9, No. 2 (Summer 1978), pp. 167–89

Anderson, Eric, *Race and Politics in North Carolina, 1872–1901: The Black Second* (Baton Rouge, LA, 1981)

Anderson, Eric and Moss, Alfred A., Jr. (eds), *The Facts of Reconstruction: Essays in Honor of John Hope Franklin* (Baton Rouge, LA, 1991)

Anderson, James D., *The Education of Blacks in the South, 1860–1935* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1988)

- Anderson, Vinton R. (ed.), *A Syllabus for Celebrating the 200th Birthday of the A.M.E. Church* (Nashville, TN, 1986)
- Andrews, William L. (ed.), *Sisters of the Spirit: Three Black Women's Autobiographies of the Nineteenth Century* (Bloomington, IN, 1986)
- Angell, Stephen Ward, *Bishop Henry McNeal Turner and African-American Religion in the South* (Knoxville, TN, 1992)
- Angell, Stephen Ward, and Pinn, Anthony B. (eds.), *Social Protest Thought in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1862–1939* (Knoxville, TN, 2000)
- Auletta, Ken, *The Underclass* (New York, 1982)
- Bailey, Julius H., *Around the Family Altar: Domesticity in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1865–1900* (Gainesville, FL, 2005)
- , *Race Patriotism: Protest and Print Culture in the A.M.E. Church* (Knoxville, TN, 2012)
- Baldwin, Lewis V., 'The A.U.M.P. and U.A.M.E. Churches: An Unexplored Area of Black Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 19, No. 3 (April 1981), pp. 175–8
- , 'Festivity and Celebration in a Black Methodist Tradition, 1813–1981', *Methodist History* Vol. 20, No. 4 (July 1982), pp. 183–91
- , 'Black Women and African Union Methodism, 1813–1983', *Methodist History* Vol. 21, No. 4 (July 1983), pp. 225–37
- , *"Invisible" Strands in African Methodism: A History of the African Union Methodist Protestant and Union American Methodist Episcopal Churches, 1805–1980* (Metuchen, NJ, 1983)
- , *The Mark of a Man: Peter Spencer and the African Union Methodist Tradition: The Man, the Movement, the Message, and the Legacy* (Lanham, MD, 1987)
- Barber, Jesse B., *Climbing Jacob's Ladder: The Story of the Work of the Presbyterian Church U.S.A. Among the Negroes* (New York, 1952)
- Barnes, Sandra L., 'A Sociological Examination of W.E.B. Du Bois' The Souls of Black Folk', *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 6, No. 2 (Spring 2003)

- Bartlett, David C. and McClellan, Larry A., 'The Final Ministry of Amanda Berry Smith: An Orphanage in Harvey, Illinois, 1895–1918', *Illinois Heritage*, Vol. 1, No. 2 (Winter 1998), pp. 20–26
- Bassett, Paul M., 'A Study in the Theology of the Early Holiness Movement', *Methodist History* Vol. 13, No. 3 (April 1975), pp. 61–84
- Bates, Gerri, 'These Hallowed Halls: African American Women College and University Presidents', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 76, No. 3, Celebrating the Legacy of "The Journal": 75 Years of Facilitating Excellence in Black Education (Summer 2007), pp. 373–390
- Batten, J. Minton, 'Henry M. Turner, Negro Bishop Extraordinary', *Church History* Vol. 7, No. 3 (September 1938), pp. 231–46
- Battle, Michael, *The Black Church in America: African American Christian Spirituality* (Malden, MA, 2006)
- Bauchum, Rosalind G., *African American Organizations, 1794–1999: A Selected Bibliography Sourcebook* (Lanham, MD, 2001)
- Bay, Mia, *The White Image in the Black Mind: African-American Ideas about White People, 1830–1925* (New York, 2000)
- Bebbington, David, *Baptists Through the Centuries: A History of a Global People* (Waco, TX, 2010)
- Bennett, James B., *Religion and the Rise of Jim Crow in New Orleans* (Princeton, NJ, 2005)
- Berlin, Ira, Fields, Barbara J., Miller, Stephen F., Reidy, Joseph P., Rowland, Leslie S. (eds), *Free At Last: A Documentary History of Slavery, Freedom, and the Civil War* (Edison, NJ, 1997)
- Berry, Mary Frances, 'Twentieth-century Black Women in Education', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3 (Summer 1982), pp. 288–300
- Bieze, Michael Scott, and Gasman, Marybeth (eds.), *Booker T. Washington Rediscovered* (Baltimore, 2012)
- Billingsley, Andrew, *Mighty Like a River: The Black Church and Social Reform* (New York, 1999)
- Blair, Karen J., *The Clubwoman as Feminist: True Womanhood Redefined, 1868–1914* (New York, 1980)

- Blassingame, John W., *The Slave Community: Plantation Life in the Antebellum South* (New York, 1972)
- , *Black New Orleans, 1860–1888* (Chicago, 1973)
- Blum, Edward J. and Poole, W. Scott (eds.), *Vale of Tears: New Essays on Religion and Reconstruction* (Macon, GA, 2005)
- Bonner, Florence B., and Thomas, Veronica G., ‘Introduction and Overview: New and Continuing Challenges and Opportunities for Black Women in the Academy’, *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 70, No. 3, Black Women in the Academy: Challenges and Opportunities (Summer 2001), pp. 121–123
- Bower, Anne L. (ed.), *African American Foodways: Explorations of History and Culture* (Urbana and Chicago, IL, 1997)
- Bradley, David Henry, *A History of the A.M.E. Zion Church, 1796–1872* (Nashville, TN, 1956)
- , ‘Francis Asbury and the Development of African Churches in America’, *Methodist History* Vol. 10, No. 1 (October 1971), pp. 3–29
- Brazzell, Johnetta Cross, ‘Brick without Straw: Missionary-Sponsored Black Higher Education in the Post-Emancipation Era’, *The Journal of Higher Education* Vol. 63, No. 1 (January–February 1992), pp. 26–49
- Breeze, Lawrence E., ‘The Inskips: Union in Holiness’, *Methodist History* Vol. 13, No. 4 (July 1975), pp. 25–45
- Brekus, Catherine A., *Strangers & Pilgrims: Female Preaching in America, 1740–1845* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1998)
- (ed.), *The Religious History of American Women: Reimagining the Past* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2007)
- Brooks, F. Erik and Starks, Glenn L., *Historically Black Colleges and Universities: An Encyclopedia* (Santa Barbara, CA, 2011)
- Brown, Canter, Jr. and Rivers, Larry E., *For a Great and Grand Purpose: The Beginnings of the AMEZ Church in Florida, 1864–1905* (Gainesville, FL, 2004)
- Brown, David W., *Freedom Drawn From Within: A History of the Delaware Annual Conference of the United Methodist Church* (Valley Forge, PA, 2010)

- Brown, Earl Kent, 'Women in Church History: Stereotypes, Archtypes and Operational Modalities', *Methodist History* Vol. 18, No. 2 (January 1980), pp. 109–132
- Brown, Elsa Barkley, 'Womanist Consciousness: Maggie Lena Walker and the Independent Order of Saint Luke', *Signs* Vol. 14, No. 3 (Spring 1989), pp. 610–633
- Brown, Hugh Victor, *A History of the Education of Negroes in North Carolina* (Raleigh, NC, 1961)
- Brown, Kenneth O., '“The World-Wide Evangelist” — The Life and Work of Martha Inskip', *Methodist History* Vol. 21, No. 4 (July 1983), pp. 179–191
- Brown-Kubisch, Linda, *The Queen's Bush Settlement: Black Pioneers, 1839–1865* (Toronto, 2004)
- Bullock, Henry Allen, *A History of Negro Education in the South from 1619 to the Present* (Cambridge, MA, 1967)
- Bunkle, Phillida, 'Sentimental Womanhood and Domestic Education, 1830–1870', *History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 14, No. 1, Reinterpreting Women's Education (Spring 1974), pp. 13–30
- Burkett, Randall K., 'The Reverend Harry Crosswell and Black Episcopalians in New Haven, 1820–1860', *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 7, No. 1 (Fall 2003)
- Burton, Michael C., *Deep Roots: The African Black Contribution to Christianity* (New York, 2008)
- Burton, Orville Veronon and McMath, Robert O., Jr. (eds.), *Toward a New South? Studies in Post-Civil War Southern Communities* (Westport, CT, 1982)
- Butchart, Ronald E., *Northern Schools, Southern Blacks, and Reconstruction: Freedmen's Education, 1862–1875* (Westport, CT, 1980)
- , *Schooling the Freed People: Teaching, Learning, and the Struggle for Black Freedom, 1861–1876* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2010)
- , 'Black hope, white power: Emancipation, reconstruction and the legacy of unequal schooling in the US South, 1861–1880', *Paedagogica Historica: International Journal of the History of Education* Vol. 46, Nos. 1–2 (2010), pp. 33–50

- Butler, Anthea D., *Women in the Church of God in Christ: Making a Sanctified World* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2007)
- Camp, Stephanie M.H., *Closer to Freedom: Enslaved Women and Everyday Resistance in the Plantation South* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2004)
- Campbell, James T., *Songs of Zion: The African Methodist Episcopal Church in the United States and South Africa* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1998)
- Cannon, William R., 'The Meaning of the Ministry in Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 8, No. 1 (October 1969), pp. 3–19
- Carlson, Shirley J., 'Black Ideals of Womanhood in the Late Victorian Era', *Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 77, No. 2 (Spring 1992), pp. 61–73
- Carnes, Mark C. and Griffen, Clyde (eds.) *Meanings for Manhood: Constructions of Masculinity in Victorian America* (Chicago, 1990)
- Cheek, H. Lee, Jr., 'Original Diversity: Bishops Allen, Asbury, and Black Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 35, No. 3 (April 1997), pp. 188–191
- Chesson, Michael B., *Richmond After the War, 1865–1890* (Richmond, 1981)
- Chilcote, Paul W., 'Sanctification as Lived by Early Methodist Women', *Methodist History* Vol. 34, No. 2 (January 1996), pp. 90–103
- Clarke, Martin V., 'John Wesley's "Directions for Singing": Methodist Hymnody as an Expression of Methodist Beliefs in Thought and Practice', *Methodist History* Vol. 47, No. 4 (July 2009), pp. 196–209
- Clary, George E., Jr., 'Southern Methodism's "Unique Adventure" in Race Relations: Paine College, 1882–1903', *Methodist History* Vol. 9, No. 2 (January 1971), pp. 22–33
- Coan, Josephus R., *Daniel Alexander Payne: Christian Educator* (Philadelphia, 1935)
- Cochran, Anne Scarlett, 'The Development of Teacher Education at Morris Brown College', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 16, No. 2 (Spring 1947), pp. 246–251
- Collier-Thomas, Bettie, 'Guest Editorial: The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3, The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview (Summer 1982), pp. 173–180

- , *Daughters of Thunder: Black Women Preachers and Their Sermons, 1850–1979* (San Francisco, 1998)
- , *Jesus, Jobs, and Justice: African-American Women and Religion* (New York, 2010)
- Collins, Patricia Hill, ‘The Social Construction of Black Feminist Thought’, *Signs* Vol. 14, No. 4, Common Grounds and Crossroads: Race, Ethnicity, and Class in Women’s Lives (Summer 1989), pp. 745–773
- Cone, James H., *Black Theology and Black Power* (New York, 1969)
- , *A Black Theology of Liberation* (Philadelphia, 1970)
- , *God of the Oppressed* (London, 1977)
- , *For My People: Black Theology and the Black Church* (Maryknoll, NY, 1984)
- Conway, Jill K., ‘Perspectives on the History of Women’s Education in the United States’, *History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 14, No. 1, Reinterpreting Women’s Education (Spring 1974), pp. 1–12
- Copeland, M. Shawn, Mosely, LaReine-Marie, and Raboteau, Albert J. (eds.), *Uncommon Faithfulness: The Black Catholic Experience* (Maryknoll, NY, 2009)
- Corbin, J. Wesley, ‘Christian Perfection and the Evangelical Association through 1875’, *Methodist History* Vol. 7, No. 2 (January 1969), pp. 28–44
- Cott, Nancy F. And Pleck, Elizabeth (eds.), *A Heritage of Her Own: Toward a New Social History of American Women* (New York, 1979)
- Coulter, E. Merton, ‘Henry M. Turner: Georgia Negro Preacher-Politician During the Reconstruction Era’, *The Georgia Historical Quarterly* Vol. 48, No. 4 (December 1964), pp. 371–410
- Crenshaw, Kimberlé W., ‘Demarginalizing the Intersection of Race and Sex: A Black Feminist Critique of Antidiscrimination Doctrine, Feminist Theory and Antiracist Politics’, *University of Chicago Legal Forum* (1989), pp. 139–67
- Cummings, Melbourne S., ‘The Rhetoric of Bishop Henry McNeal Turner’, *Journal of Black Studies* Vol. 12, No. 4 (June 1982), pp. 457–467

- Cunningen, Donald, Dennis, Rutledge M., Glascoe, Myrtle Gonza (eds.), *The Racial Politics of Booker T. Washington* (Oxford, 2006)
- Currie, Robert, *Methodism Divided: A Study in the Sociology of Ecumenicalism* (London, 1968)
- Dagbovie, Pero Gaglo, 'Exploring a Century of Historical Scholarship on Booker T. Washington', *The Journal of African American History* Vol. 92, No. 2 (Spring 2007), pp. 239–264
- Daniel, W. Harrison, 'The Methodist Episcopal Church and the Negro in the Early National Period', *Methodist History* Vol. 11, No. 2 (January 1973), pp. 40–53
- Danky, James P. (ed.), *African-American Newspapers and Periodicals: A National Bibliography* (Cambridge, MA, 1998)
- Davis, Cyprian, *The History of Black Catholics in the United States* (New York, 1990)
- Davis, Marianna W. (ed.), *Contributions of Black Women to America: Civil rights, politics and government, education, medicine, sciences*, Vol. 2 (Columbia, SC, 1982)
- Dayton, Lucille Sider and Dayton, Donald W., '“Your Daughters Shall Prophecy”: Feminism in the Holiness Movement', *Methodist History* Vol. 14, No. 2 (January 1976), pp. 67–92
- Del Pino, Julius E., 'Blacks in the United Methodist Church from Its Beginning to 1968', *Methodist History* Vol. 19, No. 1 (October 1980), pp. 3–20
- Dickerson, Dennis C., 'Black Ecumenism: Efforts to Establish a United Methodist Episcopal Church, 1918–1932', *Church History* Vol. 52, No. 4 (December 1983), pp. 479–91
- , 'William Fisher Dickerson: Northern Preacher/ Southern Prelate', *Methodist History* Vol. 23, No. 3 (December 1983), pp. 135–152
- , *The Historiographers of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Nashville, TN, 1993)
- , *Religion, Race, and Region: Research Notes on A.M.E. Church History* (Nashville, TN, 1995)

- , *A Liberated Past: Explorations in A.M.E. Church History* (Nashville, TN, 2003)
- , *African Methodism and its Wesleyan Heritage: Reflections on A.M.E. Church History* (Nashville, TN, 2009)
- Dodson, Jualynne E., 'Power and Surrogate Leadership: Black Women and Organized Religion', *Sage* Vol. 5, No. 2 (Fall 1988), pp. 37–41
- , *Engendering Church: Women, Power, and the AME Church* (Lanham, MD, 2002)
- , 'Review of Julius H. Bailey, *Around the Family Altar: Domesticity in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1865–1900*', *The Catholic Historical Review*, Vol. 93, No. 2 (April 2007), pp. 452–3
- Dougherty, Mary Agnes, 'The Methodist Deaconess: A Case of Religious Feminism', *Methodist History* Vol. 21, No. 2 (January 1983), pp. 90–98
- Drago, Edmund L., *Black Politicians and Reconstruction in Georgia: A Splendid Failure* (Athens, GA, 1982)
- Drewry, Henry N., and Doermann, Humphrey, *Stand and Prosper: Private Black Colleges and Their Students* (Princeton, NJ, 2001)
- Du Bois, W.E.B., *Black Reconstruction: An Essay Toward a History of the Part Which Black Folk Played in the Attempt to Reconstruct Democracy in America, 1860–1880* (New York, 1935)
- Dunlap, E. Dale, 'Tuesday Meetings, Camp Meetings, and Cabinet Meetings: A Perspective on the Holiness Movement in the Methodist Church in the United States in the Nineteenth Century', *Methodist History* Vol. 13, No. 3 (April 1975), pp. 85–106
- Durbin, Linda M., 'The Nature of Ordination in Wesley's View of the Ministry', *Methodist History* Vol. 9, No. 3 (April 1971), pp. 3–20
- Dvorak, Katharine L., *An African-American Exodus: The Segregation of the Southern Churches* (Brooklyn, NY, 1991)
- Earle, Jonathan, *The Routledge Atlas of African American History* (New York, 2000)
- Elkins, Stanley M., *Slavery: A Problem in American Institutional and Intellectual Life* (Chicago, 1968)

- Elliott, Daryl M., 'Entire Sanctification and the Church of the United Brethren in Christ to 1860', *Methodist History* Vol. 25, No. 4 (July 1987), pp. 203–221
- Engerman, Stanley L., 'Black Fertility and Family Structure in the US, 1880–1940', *Journal of Family History* Vol. 2 (1977), pp. 117–38
- Engram, Eleanor, *Science, Myth, Reality: The Black Family in One Half-Century of Research* (Westport, CT, 1982)
- Epstein, Barbara Leslie, *The Politics of Domesticity: Women, Evangelism, and Temperance in Nineteenth-Century America* (Middletown, CT, 1981)
- Evan, Curtis J., *The Burden of Black Religion* (New York, 2008)
- Evans, G.R., *The Church and the Churches: Toward an Ecumenical Ecclesiology* (Cambridge, 1994)
- Evans, Stephanie Y., *Black Women in the Ivory Tower, 1850–1954: An Intellectual History* (Gainesville, FL, 2008)
- Fairclough, Adam, *Teaching Equality: Black Schools in the Age of Jim Crow* (Athens, GA, 2001)
- , *A Class of Their Own: Black Teachers in the Segregated South* (Cambridge, MA, 2009)
- Farish, Hunter Dickinson, *The Circuit Rider Dismounts: A Social History of Southern Methodism, 1865–1900* (Richmond, VA, 1938)
- Faulkner, Carol, *Women's Radical Reconstruction: The Freedmen's Aid Movement* (Philadelphia, 2006)
- Fitts, Leroy, *A History of Black Baptists* (Nashville, 1985)
- Foner, Eric, *Reconstruction: America's Unfinished Revolution, 1863–1877* (New York, 1988)
- Foner, Philip S. and Pacheco, Josephine F., *Three Who Dared: Prudence Crandall, Margaret Douglass, Myrtilla Miner — Champions of Antebellum Black Education* (Westport, CT, 1984)
- Foner, Philip S. and Branham, Robert J. (eds.), *Lift Every Voice: African American Oratory, 1787–1900* (Tuscaloosa, AL, 1998)

- Foster, Frances Smith, 'A Narrative of the Interesting Origins and (Somewhat) Surprising Developments of African-American Print Culture', *American Literary History* Vol. 17, No. 4 (Winter 2005), pp. 714–740
- Foster, Frances Smith and Haywood, Chanta M., 'Christian Recordings: Afro-Protestantism, Its Press and the Production of African-American Literature' *Religion and Literature*, Vol. 27, No. 1 (1995), pp. 15–33
- Fradin, Dennis Brindell and Fradin, Judith Bloom, *Fight On: Mary Church Terrell's Battle for Integration* (New York, 2003)
- Franklin, D. Bruce, 'The White Methodist Image of the American Negro Emigrant to Liberia, West Africa, 1833–1848', *Methodist History* Vol. 15, No. 3 (April 1977), pp. 147–166
- Franklin, John Hope, *Reconstruction After the Civil War* (Chicago, 1961)
- Franklin, Vincent P., 'Recent Books on African American Educational History', *The Journal of African American History* Vol. 87, New Perspectives on African American Educational History (Autumn 2002), pp. 446–449
- Franklin, Vincent P., and Anderson, James D. (eds.), *New Perspectives on Black Educational History* (Boston, 1978)
- Fredrickson, George M., *The Black Image in the White Mind: The Debate on Afro-American Character and Destiny, 1817–1914* (New York, 1971)
- Friedman, Jean E., *The Enclosed Garden: Women and Community in the Evangelical South, 1830–1900* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1985)
- Friend, Craig Thompson, *Southern Masculinity: Perspectives on Manhood in the South Since Reconstruction* (Athens, GA, 2009)
- Fuller, T.O., *History of the Negro Baptists of Tennessee* (Memphis, TN, 1936)
- Fulop, Timothy E., Raboteau, Albert J. (eds.), *African-American Religion: Interpretive Essays in History and Culture* (New York, 1997)
- Furstenberg, Frank F., Jr., Hershberg, Theodore, Modell, John, 'The Origins of the Female-Headed Black Family: The Impact of the Urban Experience', *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History* Vol. 6, No. 2, The History of the Family, III (Autumn 1975), pp. 211–233

- Galea, Kate P. Crawford, ‘“Anchored Behind the Veil”: Mystical Vision as a Possible Source of Authority in the Ministry of Phoebe Palmer’, *Methodist History* Vol. 31, No. 4 (July 1993), pp. 236–247
- Gardner, Eric, *Black Print Unbound: The Christian Recorder, African American Literature, and Periodical Culture* (Oxford, 2015)
- Gedge, Karin E., *Without Benefit of Clergy: Women and the Pastoral Relationship in Nineteenth-Century American Culture* (Oxford, 2003)
- Genovese, Eugene D., *Roll, Jordan, Roll: The World the Slaves Made* (New York, 1974)
- George, Carol V.R., *Segregated Sabbaths: Richard Allen and the Emergence of Independent Black Churches, 1760–1840* (New York, 1973)
- Gerber, David A., *Black Ohio and the Color Line, 1860–1915* (Urbana, IL, 1976)
- , ‘Segregation, Separatism, and Sectarianism: Ohio Blacks and Wilberforce University’s Effort to Obtain Federal Funds, 1891’, *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 45, No. 1 (Winter 1976), pp. 1–20
- , ‘Segregation, Separatism, and Sectarianism: Ohio Blacks and Wilberforce University’s Effort to Obtain Federal Funds, 1891’, *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 45, No. 1 (Winter 1976), pp. 1–20
- Gerteis, Louis S., *From Contraband to Freedman: Federal Policy Toward Southern Blacks, 1861–1865* (Westport, CT, 1973)
- Giddings, Paula, *Where and When I Enter: The Impact of Black Women on Race and Sex in America* (New York, 1984)
- Gienapp, William E., *The Civil War and Reconstruction: A Documentary Collection* (New York, 2001)
- Gifford, Carolyn De Swarte, ‘Sisterhoods of Service and Reform: Organized Methodist Women in the Late Nineteenth Century: An Essay on the State of the Research’, *Methodist History* Vol. 24, No. 1 (October 1985), pp. 15–30
- Giggie, John Michael, *After Redemption: Jim Crow and the Transformation of African American Religion in the Delta, 1875–1915* (New York, 2008)

- Giles, Mark S. 'Special Focus: Dr. Anna Julia Cooper, 1858–1964: Teacher, Scholar, and Timeless Womanist' *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 75, No. 4 (Fall 2006), pp. 621–634
- Gilkes, Cheryl Townsend, "'Together and in Harness': Women's Traditions in the Sanctified Church', *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* Vol. 10, No. 4 (Summer 1985), pp. 678–699
- , 'The Roles of Church and Community Mothers: Ambivalent American Sexism or Fragmented American Familyhood?', *Journal of Feminist Studies in Religion* Vol. 2, No. 1 (Spring 1986), pp. 41–59
- , "'If It Wasn't For The Women...': Black Women's Experience and Womanist Culture in Church and Community' (Maryknoll, NY, 2001)
- Gilmore, Glenda Elizabeth, *Gender and Jim Crow: Women and the Politics of White Supremacy in North Carolina, 1896–1920* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1996)
- Goen, C.C., *Broken Churches, Broken Nation: Denominationalism and the Coming of the Civil War* (Macon, GA, 1985)
- Goldin, Claudia, 'Female Labor Force Participation: The Origin of Black and White Differences, 1870 and 1880', *The Journal of Economic History* Vol. 37, No. 1, The Tasks of Economic History (March 1977), pp. 87–108
- Gomez-Jefferson, Annette L., *In Darkness With God: The Life of Joseph Gomez, a Bishop in the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Kent, OH, 1998)
- , *The Sage of Tawawa: Reverdy Cassius Ransom, 1861–1959* (Kent, OH, 2002)
- Gordon, Linda, 'U.S. Women's History', in Eric Foner (ed.), *The New American History* (Philadelphia, 1992), pp. 257–84
- Grammer, Elizabeth Elkin, *Some Wild Visions: Autobiographies by Female Itinerant Evangelists in Nineteenth-Century America* (Oxford, 2003)
- Gravely, William B., 'Hiram Revels Protests Racial Separation in the Methodist Episcopal Church (1876)', *Methodist History* Vol. 8, No. 3 (April 1970), pp. 13–20
- , 'The Afro-American Methodist Tradition: A Review of Sources in Reprint', *Methodist History* Vol. 9, No. 3 (April 1971), pp. 21–33

- , 'A Black Methodist on Reconstruction in Mississippi: Three Letters by James Lynch in 1868–1869', *Methodist History* Vol. 11, No. 4 (July 1973), pp. 3–18
- , 'The Decision of A.M.E. Leader, James Lynch, to Join the Methodist Episcopal Church: New Evidence at Old St. George's Church, Philadelphia', *Methodist History* Vol. 15, No. 4 (July 1977), pp. 263–69
- , 'The Social, Political and Religious Significance of the Formation of the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church', *Methodist History* Vol. 18, No. 1 (October 1979), pp. 3–25
- Green, Roger J., 'Settled Views: Catherine Booth and Female Ministry', *Methodist History* Vol. 31, No. 3 (April 1993), pp. 131–147
- Gregg, Howard D., *History of the African Methodist Episcopal Church (The Black Church in Action)* (Nashville, TN, 1980)
- Gregg, Robert, *Sparks from the Anvil of Oppression: Philadelphia's African Methodists and Southern Migrants, 1890–1940* (Philadelphia, 1993)
- Gregory, Sheila T., 'Black Faculty Women in the Academy: History, Status, and Future', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 70, No. 33, Black Women in the Academy: Challenges and Opportunities (Summer 2001), pp. 124–138
- Griggs, A.C., 'Notes: Lucy Craft Laney' *Journal of Negro History* Vol. 19, No. 1 (January 1934), pp. 97–110.
- Gutman, Herbert G., *The Black Family in Slavery and Freedom, 1750–1925* (New York, 1976)
- , 'Slave Family and Its Legacies', *Historical Reflections* Vol. 6, No. 1 (Summer 1979), pp. 183–99
- Guy-Sheftall, Beverly, *Spelman: A Centennial Celebration, 1881–1981* (Charlotte, NC, 1981)
- , 'Black Women and Higher Education: Spelman and Bennett Colleges Revisited', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3, The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview (Summer 1982), pp. 278–287
- Hanson, Joyce Ann, *Mary McLeod Bethune and Black Women's Political Activism* (Columbia, MO, 2003)

- Hareven, Tamara K., 'The History of the Family as an Interdisciplinary Field', *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History* Vol. 2, No. 2, *The History of the Family* (Autumn 1971), pp. 399–414
- Harlan, Louis R., *Booker T. Washington: The Making of a Black Leader, 1856–1901* (New York, 1972)
- Harley, Sharon, 'Beyond the Classroom: The Organizational Lives of Black Female Educators in the District of Columbia, 1890–1930' *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3 (Summer 1982), pp. 254–265
- , 'Nannie Helen Burroughs: "The Black Goddess of Liberty"', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 81, No. 1/4, Vindicating the Race: Contributions to African-American Intellectual History (Winter–Autumn 1996), pp. 62–71
- Harris, Eula Wallace and Harris, Maxie Craig, *Christian Methodist Episcopal Church Through the Years* (Jackson, TN, 1965)
- Harrison, Paul M., *Authority and Power in the Free Church Tradition: A Social Case Study of the American Baptist Convention* (Princeton, NJ, 1959)
- Hartley, Benjamin L., 'Salvation and Sociology in the Methodist Episcopal Deaconess Movement', *Methodist History* Vol. 40, No. 3 (April 2002), pp. 182–197
- Harvey, Paul, *Redeeming the South: Religious Cultures and Racial Identities among Southern Baptists, 1865–1925* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1997)
- Hatch, Nathan O., *The Democratization of American Christianity* (New Haven, CT, 1989)
- Hayes, Diana L. and Davis, Cyprian (eds.), *Taking Down Our Harps: Black Catholics in the United States* (Maryknoll, NY, 1998)
- Haywood, Chanta M., 'Constructing Childhood: The Christian Recorder and Literature for Black Children, 1854–1865', *African American Review* Vol. 36, No. 3 (Fall 2002), pp. 417–428
- Higginbotham, Evelyn Brooks, 'African-American Women's History and the Metalanguage of Race', *Signs* Vol. 17, No. 2 (Winter 1992), pp. 251–274
- , *Righteous Discontent: The Women's Movement in the Black Baptist Church, 1880–1920* (Cambridge, MA, 1993)

- Hildebrand, Reginald E, ‘“An Imperious Sense of Duty”: Documents Illustrating an Episode in the Methodist Reaction to the Nat Turner Revolt’, *Methodist History* Vol. 19, No. 3 (April 1981), pp. 155–174
- , ‘Methodist Episcopal Policy on the Ordination of Black Ministers, 1784–1864’, *Methodist History* Vol. 20, No. 3 (April 1982), pp. 124–142
- , *The Times Were Strange and Stirring: Methodist Preachers and the Crisis of Emancipation* (Durham, NC, 1995)
- Hill, Patricia R., ‘Heathen Women’s Friends: The Role of Methodist Episcopal Women in the Women’s Foreign Mission Movement, 1869–1915’, *Methodist History* Vol. 19, No. 3 (April 1981), pp. 146–154
- Hine, Darlene Clark, *A Shining Thread of Hope: The History of Black Women in America* (New York, 1998)
- Hine, Darlene Clark and Brown, Elsa Barkley (eds.), *Black Women in America: An Historical Encyclopedia* (Oxford, 1993)
- History of the Reformed Zion Union Apostolic Churches of America* (Lawrenceville, VA, 1998)
- Hodges, George W., *Touchstones of Methodism* (New York, 1947)
- Hoganson, Kristin, *Consumers’ Imperium: The Global Production of American Domesticity, 1865–1920* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2007)
- Holmes, Dwight Oliver Wendell, *Evolution of the Negro College* (New York, 1934, reprint 1970)
- Holt, Thomas, *Black Over White: Negro Political Leadership in South Carolina During Reconstruction* (Urbana, IL, 1977)
- Holter, Dan W., ‘Some Changes Related to the Ordained Ministry in the History of American Methodism’, *Methodist History* Vol. 13, No. 3 (April 1975), pp. 177–194
- Horowitz, Helen Lefkowitz, *Alma Mater: Design and Experience in the Women’s Colleges from Their Nineteenth-Century Beginnings to the 1930s* (New York, 1985)
- Hovet, Theodore, ‘Phoebe Palmer’s “Altar Phraseology” and the Spiritual Dimension of Woman’s Sphere’, *The Journal of Religion* Vol. 63, No. 3 (July 1983), pp. 264–80

- Howard, Ivan, 'Wesley Versus Phoebe Palmer: An Extended Controversy', *Wesleyan Theological Journal* Vol. 6, No. 1 (Spring, 1971), pp. 31–40
- Hudson, Mary Lin, '“Shall Woman Preach?” Louisa Woosley and the Cumberland Presbyterian Church', *American Presbyterians* Vol. 68, No. 4 (Winter 1990), pp. 221–230
- Hudson, Winthrop S., 'The American Context as an Area for Research in Black Church Studies', *Church History* Vol. 52, No. 2 (June 1983), pp. 157–171
- Hull, Gloria T., Scott, Patricia Bell, Smith, Barbara (eds.), *All the Women Are White, All the Blacks Are Men, But Some of Us Are Brave: Black Women's Studies* (Old Westbury, NY, 1982)
- Irons, Kendra Weddle, 'Phoebe Palmer: Chosen, Tried, Triumphant (An Examination of Her Calling in Light of Current Research)', *Methodist History* Vol. 37, No. 1 (October 1998), pp. 28–36
- Israel, Adrienne M., *Amanda Berry Smith: From Washerwoman to Evangelist* (Lanham, MD, 1998)
- Jacobs, Sylvia M. (ed.), *Black Americans and the Missionary Movement in Africa* (Westport, CT, 1982)
- Jacoway, Elizabeth, *Yankee Missionaries in the South: The Penn School Experiment* (Baton Rouge, LA, 1980)
- Jarrett Gray, C., Jr., *The Racial and Ethnic Presence in American Methodism: A Bibliography* (Madison, NJ, 1991)
- Jason, William C., Jr., 'The Delaware Annual Conference of the Methodist Church, 1864–1965', *Methodist History* Vol. 4, No. 4 (July 1966), pp. 26–40
- Johnson, Alonzo, Jersild, Paul T., *Ain't gonna lay my 'ligion down: African American Religion in the South* (Columbia, SC, 1996)
- Johnson, Andre E., *The Forgotten Prophet: Bishop Henry Mcneal Turner and the African American Prophetic Tradition* (Lanham, MD, 2012)
- Johnson, Dorothy Sharpe and Williams, Lula Goolsby, *Pioneering Women of the African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church* (Charlotte, NC, 1996)

- Johnson, Karen A., *Uplifting the Women and the Race: The Educational Philosophies, and Social Activism of Anna Julia Cooper and Nannie Helen Burroughs* (New York, 2000)
- Johnson, Paul E. (ed.), *African-American Christianity: Essays in History* (Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA, 1994)
- Jones, Allen W., 'The Role of Tuskegee Institute in the Education of Black Farmers', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 60, No. 2 (April 1975), pp. 252–267
- Jones, Beverly W., 'Mary Church Terrell and the National Association of Colored Women, 1896 to 1901', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 67, No. 1 (Spring 1982), pp. 20–33
- Jones, Charles Edwin, 'The Posthumous Pilgrimage of Phoebe Palmer', *Methodist History* Vol. 35, No. 4 (July 1997), pp. 203–213
- , *The Wesleyan Holiness Movement: A Comprehensive Guide* (Lanham, MD, 2005)
- Jones, Jacqueline, 'Women Who Were More than Men: Sex and Status in Freedmen's Teaching', *History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 19, No. 1, Women's Influence on Education (Spring 1979), pp. 47–59
- , *Soldiers of Light and Love: Northern Teachers and Georgia Blacks, 1865–1875* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1980)
- , *Labor of Love, Labor of Sorrow: Black Women, Work and the Family From Slavery to the Present* (New York, 1985)
- Jones, Martha S., *All Bound Up Together: The Woman Question in African American Public Culture, 1830–1900* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1997)
- Jones-Wilson, Faustine C., Asbury, Charles A., Okazawa-Rey, Margo, Anderson, D. Kamili, Jacobs, Sylvia M., and Fultz, Michael (eds.), *Encyclopedia of African-American Education* (Westport, CT, 1996)
- Joyner, Charles, *Down by the Riverside: A South Carolina Slave Community* (Urbana, IL, 1984)
- Keller, Rosemary Skinner, 'Creating a Sphere for Women in the Church: How Consequential an Accommodation?', *Methodist History* Vol. 18, No. 2 (January 1980), pp. 83–94

- , 'Women and the Nature of Ministry in the United Methodist Tradition', *Methodist History* Vol. 22, No. 2 (January 1984), pp. 99–114
- Keller, Rosemary Skinner and Ruether, Rosemary Radford (eds.), *Encyclopedia of Women and Religion in North America* (Bloomington, IN, 2006)
- Kelley, Robin D.G., *Race Rebels: Culture, Politics, and the Black Working Class* (New York, 1994)
- Killian, Charles, 'Daniel A. Payne and the A.M.E. General Conference of 1888: A Display of Contrasts', *Negro History Bulletin* Vol. 32, No. 7 (1969), pp. 11–14
- , 'Bishop Daniel A. Payne: An Apostle of Wesley', *Methodist History* Vol. 24, No. 2 (January 1986), pp. 107–119
- King, William McGuire, 'Denominational Modernization and Religious Identity: The Case of the Methodist Episcopal Church', *Methodist History* Vol. 20, No. 2 (January 1982), pp. 75–89
- King, Willis J., 'The Negro Membership of the (Former) Methodist Church in the (New) United Methodist Church', *Methodist History* Vol. 7, No. 3 (April 1969), pp. 32–43
- Knotts, Alice G., 'Race Relations in the 1920s: A Challenge to Southern Methodist Women', *Methodist History* Vol. 26, No. 4 (July 1988), pp. 199–212
- , 'Southern Methodist Women and Interracial Relations in the 1930s', *Methodist History* Vol. 27, No. 4 (July 1989), pp. 230–240
- , 'The Debates Over Race and Women's Ordination in the 1939 Methodist Merger', *Methodist History* Vol. 29, No. 1 (October 1990), pp. 37–43
- Kolchin, Peter, *First Freedom: The Responses of Alabama's Blacks to Emancipation and Reconstruction* (Westport, 1972)
- Krech, Shepard, III, 'Black Family Organization in the Nineteenth Century: An Ethnological Perspective', *The Journal of Interdisciplinary History* Vol. 12, No. 3 (Winter 1982), pp. 429–452

- Labode, Modupe, ‘“A Native Knows A Native”: African American Missionaries’ Writings about Angola, 1919–1940’, *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 4, No. 1 (Fall 2000)
- Lahey, Othel Hawthorne, *The Rise of “Colored Methodism”: A Study of the Background and the Beginnings of the Christian Methodist Episcopal Church* (Dallas, TX, 1972)
- , *The History of the CME Church* (Memphis, TN, 1985)
- Lahey, Othel Hawthorne and Stephens, Betty Beene, *God In My Mama’s House: The Women’s Movement in the CME Church* (Memphis, TN, 1994)
- Lammers, Ann C., ‘The Rev. Absalom Jones and the Episcopal Church: Christian Theology and Black Consciousness in a New Alliance’, *Historical Magazine of the Episcopal Church*, 51 (1982), pp. 159–84
- Lawson, Ellen N. and Merrill, Marlene ‘The antebellum “Talented Thousandth”: Black College Students at Oberlin before the Civil War’ *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 52, No. 2 (Spring 1983), pp. 142–155
- Leavell, Ullin W. ‘Trends of Philanthropy in Negro Education: A Survey’, *The Journal of Negro History*, Vol. 2, No. 1 (January 1933), pp. 38–512
- Leclerc, Diane, ‘Two Women Speaking “Women”: The Strategic Essentialism of Luce Irigaray and Phoebe Palmer’, *Wesleyan Theological Journal* Vol. 35, No. 1 (Spring, 2000), pp. 182–199
- Leeman, Richard W., ‘Speaking as Jeremiah: Henry McNeal Turner’s “I Claim the Rights of a Man”’, *Howard Journal of Communications* Vol. 17, No. 3 (2006), pp. 223–243
- Lerner, Gerda, ‘Early Community Work of Black Club Women’, *Journal of Negro History* 59 (1974), pp. 158–67
- Leverenz, David, *Manhood and the American Renaissance* (Ithaca, NY, 1989)
- Lewis, Harold T., *Yet With a Steady Beat: The African American Struggle for Recognition in the Episcopal Church* (Valley Forge, PA, 1996)
- Lincoln, C. Eric and Mamiya, Lawrence H., *The Black Church in the African American Experience* (Durham, NC, 1990)

- Lindley, Susan Hill, ‘“*You Have Stept Out of Your Place*”: *A History of Women and Religion in America* (Louisville, KY, 1996)
- Lippy Charles H., and Williams, Peter W. (eds.), *Encyclopedia of the American Religious Experience: Studies of Traditions and Movements: Volume 1* (New York, 1988)
- Little, Lawrence S., ‘The African Methodist Episcopal Church Media and Racial Discourse, 1880–1900,’ *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 2, No. 1 (Fall 1998)
- , *Disciples of Liberty: The African Methodist Episcopal Church in the Age of Imperialism, 1884–1916* (Knoxville, TN, 2000)
- Litwack, Leon F., *Been in the Storm So Long: The Aftermath of Slavery* (New York, 1979)
- Loewenberg, Bert James and Bogin, Ruth (eds.), *Black Women in Nineteenth-Century American Life: Their Words, Their Thoughts, Their Feelings* (University Park, PA, 1976)
- Lowery, Kevin T., ‘A Fork in the Wesleyan Road: Phoebe Palmer and the Appropriation of Christian Perfection’, *Wesleyan Theological Journal* Vol. 36, No. 2 (Fall, 2001), pp. 187–222
- Luker, Ralph E. *The Social Gospel in Black and White: American Racial Reform, 1885–1912* (Chapel Hill, NC, 1991)
- Mabokela, Reitumetse Obakeng, and Green, Anna Lucille (eds.), *Sisters of the Academy: Emergent Black Women Scholars in Higher Education* (Sterling, VA, 2001)
- Madyun, Na’im, and Witherspoon, Noelle, ‘Guest Editorial Comment: Historical and Contemporary Contextualizations on Religion and Spirituality and Black Educational Outcomes’ *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 79, No. 3, The Role of Spirituality, Religion and the African American Church on Educational Outcomes (Summer 2010), pp. 199–201
- Mariner, Kirk, ‘The Negro’s Place: Virginia Methodists Debate Unification: 1924–1925’, *Methodist History* Vol. 18, No. 3 (April 1980), pp. 155–170
- Martin, Sandy Dwayne, *Black Baptists and African Missions, 1880–1915: The Origins of A Movement* (Macon, GA, 1989)

- , 'Black Churches and the Civil War: Theological and Ecclesiastical Significance of Black Methodist Involvement, 1861–1865', *Methodist History* Vol. 32, No. 3 (April 1994), pp. 174–186
- , *For God and Race: The Religious and Political Leadership of AMEZ Bishop James Walker Hood* (Columbia, SC, 1999)
- Mays, B.E., 'The Education of Negro Ministers', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 2, No. 3, A Survey of Negro Higher Education (July 1933), pp. 342–351
- McAfee, Sara J., *History of the Woman's Missionary Society in the Colored Methodist Episcopal Church* (Phenix City, AL, 1945)
- McCluskey, Audrey Thomas "‘We specialize in the wholly impossible’: African American Women School Founders and Their Mission' *Signs* Vol. 22, No. 2 (Winter 1997), pp. 403–426
- McCluskey, Audrey Thomas, and Smith, Elaine M., (eds.), *Mary McLeod Bethune: Building a Better World: Essays and Selected Documents* (Bloomington, IN, 1999)
- McCray, Carlos R., Grant, Cosette M., and Beachum, Floyd D., 'Pedagogy of Self-development: The Role the Black Church Can Have on African American Students', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 79, No. 3, The Role of Spirituality, Religion and the African American Church on Educational Outcomes (Summer 2010), pp. 233–248
- McCullogh, Gerald O., 'The Pilgrimage of Perfection in Love', *Methodist History* Vol. 13, No. 3 (April 1975), pp. 195–200
- McFadden, Margaret, 'The Ironies of Pentecost: Phoebe Palmer, World Evangelism, and Female Networks', *Methodist History* Vol. 31, No. 2 (January 1993), pp. 63–75
- McFarlin, Annjennette S., 'Hallie Quinn Brown: Black woman elocutionist', *Southern Speech Communication Journal* Vol. 46, No. 1 (1980), pp. 72–82
- McMillen, Sally G., *To Raise Up the South: Sunday Schools in Black and White Churches, 1865–1915* (Baton Rouge, 2001)
- McPherson, James M., 'The New Puritanism: Values and Goals of Freedmen's Education in America', in Stone, Lawrence (ed), *The University in Society* (Princeton, NJ, 1974)

- Meier, August, *Negro Thought in America, 1880–1915* (Ann Arbor, MI, 1963)
- Melton, J. Gordon, ‘African American Methodism in the M.E. Tradition: The Case of Sharp Street (Baltimore)’, *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 8, No. 2 (Spring 2005)
- Melton, J. Gordon, Murphy, Larry G., Ward, Gary L., *Encyclopedia of African American Religions* (New York, 1993)
- Miller, Albert G., *Elevating the Race: Theophilus G. Steward, Black Theology, and the Making of an African American Civil Society, 1865–1924* (Knoxville, 2003)
- Mitchell, Henry H., *Black Church Beginnings: The Long-Hidden Realities of the First Years* (Grand Rapids, MI, 2004)
- Mitchell, Roland W., ‘Commentary: The African American Church, Education and Self Determination’, *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 79, No. 3, The Role of Spirituality, Religion and the African American Church on Educational Outcomes (Summer 2010), pp. 202–204
- Montgomery, William E., *Under Their Own Vine and Fig Tree: The African-American Church in the South, 1865–1900* (Baton Rouge, LA, 1993)
- Morgan, S. Philip, McDaniel, Antonio, Miller, Andrew T., and Preston, Samuel H., ‘Racial Differences in Household and Family Structure at the Turn of the Century’, *American Journal of Sociology* Vol. 98, No. 4 (January 1993), pp. 799–828
- Morris, Calvin S., *Reverdy C. Ransom: Black Advocate of the Social Gospel* (Lanham, MD, 1990)
- Morris, Robert C., *Reading, 'Riting, and Reconstruction: The Education of Freedmen in the South, 1861–1870* (Chicago, 1981)
- Morrow, Ralph E., *Northern Methodism and Reconstruction* (East Lansing, MI, 1956)
- Murphy, Larry G. (ed.), *Down by the Riverside: Readings in African American Religion* (New York, 2000)

- Murray, Andrew E., *Presbyterians and the Negro — A History* (Philadelphia, 1966)
- Murray, Peter C., 'The Racial Crisis in The Methodist Church', *Methodist History* Vol. 26, No. 1 (October 1987), pp. 3–14
- Neverdon-Morton, Cynthia, 'Self-Help Programs as Educative Activities of Black Women in the South, 1895–1925: Focus on Four Key Areas', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3, The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview (Summer 1982), pp. 207–221
- Newman, Richard S., *Freedom's Prophet: Bishop Richard Allen, the AME Church, and the Black Founding Fathers* (New York, 2008)
- Nash, Margaret A., *Women's Education in the United States, 1780–1840* (New York, 2005)
- 'New Finding Aid: A Guide to Materials on Women in The United Methodist Church Archives', *Methodist History* Vol. 34, No. 4 (July 1996), pp. 263–264
- Noble, Jeanne L., *The Negro Woman's College Education* (New York, 1956)
- , 'Negro Women Today and Their Education', *The Journal of Negro Education*, Vol. 26, No. 1 (Winter 1957), pp. 15–21
- Noll, Mark A. *God and Race in American Politics: A Short History* (Princeton, NJ, 2008)
- Noll, William T., 'Women as Clergy and Laity in the 19th Century Methodist Protestant Church', *Methodist History* Vol. 15, No. 2 (January 1977), pp. 107–121
- , 'A Welcome in the Ministry: The 1920 and 1924 General Conferences Debate Clergy Rights for Women', *Methodist History* Vol. 30, No. 2 (January 1992), pp. 91–99
- Norrell, Robert J., *Up from History: The Life of Booker T. Washington* (Cambridge, MA, 2009)
- Norton, Mary Beth and Alexander, Ruth M. (eds.), *Major Problems in American Women's History: Documents and Essays* (Lexington, MA, 1996)

- Norwood, Frederick A., 'Report on Seminar: Women in Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 10, No. 1 (October 1971), pp. 56–57
- Null, J., 'Myrtilla Miner's "School for Colored Girls": A Mirror on Antebellum Washington', *Records of the Columbia Historical Society, Washington, D.C.*, Vol. 52, (1989), pp. 254–268
- Ochs, Stephen J., *Desegregating the Altar: The Josephites and the Struggle for Black Priests, 1871–1960* (Baton Rouge, 1990)
- Patterson, James T., *Freedom Is Not Enough: The Moynihan Report and America's Struggle Over Black Family Life from LBJ to Obama* (New York, 2010)
- Patterson, L. Dale, 'Improvement in Methodist Ministerial Education at the End of the Nineteenth Century', *Methodist History* Vol. 23, No. 2 (January 1985), pp. 68–78
- Patton, June O., "'And the Truth Shall Make You Free": Richard Robert Wright, Sr., Black Intellectual and Iconoclast, 1877–1897', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 81, No. 1/4, Vindicating the Race: Contributions to African-American Intellectual History (Winter–Autumn 1996), pp. 17–30
- Perdue, Robert E., *The Negro in Savannah, 1865–1900* (New York, 1973)
- Perkins, Linda M., 'Heed Life's Demands: The Educational Philosophy of Fanny Jackson Coppin', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3, The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview (Summer 1982), pp. 181–190
- , 'The Impact of the "Cult of True Womanhood" on the Education of Black Women', *Journal of Social Issues* Vol. 39, No. 3 (Fall 1983), pp. 17–28
- , 'Lucy Diggs Slowe: Champion of the Self-Determination of African-American Women in Higher Education', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 81, No. 1/4, Vindicating the Race: Contributions to African-American Intellectual History (Winter–Autumn 1996), pp. 89–104
- , 'Introduction: New Perspectives on African American Educational History', *The Journal of African American History* Vol. 87, New Perspectives on African American Educational History (Autumn 2002), pp. 369–371

- Peters, John Leland, *Christian Perfection and American Methodism* (Salem, OH, 1995)
- Pierce, Yolanda, 'The Soul of Du Bois' Black Folk', *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 6, No. 2 (Spring 2003)
- Pinn, Anthony B., *Why Lord? Suffering and Evil in Black Theology* (New York, 1995)
- (ed.), *Making the Gospel Plain: The Writings of Bishop Reverdy C. Ransom* (Harrisburg, PA, 1999)
- (ed.), *Moral Evil and Redemptive Suffering: A History of Theodicy in African-American Religious Thought* (Gainesville, FL, 2002)
- , 'DuBois' Souls: Thoughts on "Veiled" Bodies and the Study of Black Religion', *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 6, No. 2 (Spring 2003)
- Pinn, Anne H. and Pinn, Anthony B., *Fortress Introduction to Black Church History* (Minneapolis, 2002)
- Pochmara, Anna, 'The Black Man's Burden: Dilemmas of Black Masculinity in Booker T. Washington's Up from Slavery', *The Americanist* Vol. 25, pp. 97–109
- Pope-Levison, Priscilla, 'A "Thirty Year War" and More: Exposing Complexities in the Methodist Deaconess Movement', *Methodist History* Vol. 47, No. 2 (January 2009), pp. 101–116
- , 'Methodist Interracial Cooperation in the Progressive Era: Amanda Berry Smith and Emma Ray', *Methodist History* Vol. 49, No. 2 (January 2011), pp. 68–85
- Quarles, Benjamin, 'Ministers Without Portfolio', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 39, No. 1 (January 1954), pp. 27–42
- Rabinowitz, Howard N., *Race Relations in the Urban South 1865–1890* (New York, 1978)
- Raboteau, Albert J., *Slave Religion: The "Invisible Institution" in the Antebellum South* (New York, 1978)

- , *Religion and the Slave Family in the Antebellum South* (Notre Dame, IN, 1980)
- , *A Fire in the Bones: Reflections on African-American Religious History* (Boston, 1995)
- , *Canaan Land: A Religious History of African Americans* (New York, 2001)
- Raboteau, Albert J., Wills, David W., Burkett, Randall K., Gravely, Will B., and Washington, James Melvin, 'Retelling Carter Woodson's Story: Archival Sources for Afro-American Church History', *The Journal of American History* Vol. 77, No. 1 (June 1990), pp. 183–199
- Range, Willard, *The Rise and Progress of Negro Colleges in Georgia, 1865–1949* (Athens, GA, 1951)
- Raser, Harold E., "“Christianizing Christianity”: The Holiness Movement as a Church, the Church, or No Church At All?", *Wesleyan Theological Journal* Vol. 41, No. 1, pp. 116–147
- , *Phoebe Palmer, Her Life and Thought* (Lewiston, NY, 1987)
- Read, Florence Matilda, *The Story of Spelman College* (Atlanta, GA, 1961)
- Rector, Theresa A., 'Black Nuns as Educators', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3, The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview (Summer 1982), pp. 238–253
- Redkey, Edwin S., 'Bishop Turner's African Dream', *The Journal of American History*, Vol. 54, No. 2 (September 1967), pp. 271–290
- Richardson, Harry V., *Dark Salvation: The Story of Methodism as It Developed Among Blacks in America* (Garden City, NY, 1976)
- Richardson, Joe M., *The Negro in the Reconstruction of Florida, 1865–1877* (Tallahassee, FL, 1965)
- , 'The Failure of the American Missionary Association to Expand Congregationalism Among Southern Blacks', *Southern Studies* Vol. 18 (Spring 1979), pp. 51–73
- , *Christian Reconstruction: The American Missionary Association and Southern Blacks, 1861–1890* (Athens, GA, 1986)

- Richey, Russell E., 'The Social Sources of Denominationalism: Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 15, No. 3 (April 1977), pp. 167–185
- , 'Evolving Patterns of Methodist Ministry', *Methodist History* Vol. 22, No. 1 (October 1983), pp. 20–37
- (ed.), *Reimagining Denominationalism: Interpretive Essays* (New York, 1994)
- Richey, Russell E., and Rowe, Kenneth E. (eds.), *Rethinking Methodist History: A Bicentennial Historical Consultation* (Nashville, TN, 1985)
- Richey, Russell E., Rowe, Kenneth E., Schmidt, Jean Miller (eds.), *Perspectives on American Methodism: Interpretive Essays* (Nashville, TN, 1993)
- Rivers, Larry E. and Brown, Canter, Jr., *Laborers in the Vineyard of the Lord: The Beginnings of the AME Church in Florida, 1865–1895* (Gainesville, FL, 2001)
- Robert, Dana L., 'Holiness and the Missionary Vision of the Woman's Foreign Missionary Society of the Methodist Episcopal Church, 1869–1894', *Methodist History* Vol. 39, No. 1 (October 2000), pp. 15–27
- Rose, Willie Lee, *Rehearsal for Reconstruction: The Port Royal Experiment* (Indianapolis, 1964)
- Rowe, Kenneth E., 'Power to the People: George Richard Crooks, The Methodist, and Lay Representation in the Methodist Episcopal Church', *Methodist History* Vol. 13, No. 3 (April 1975), pp. 145–176
- Ruether, Rosemary and McLaughlin, Eleanor, *Women of Spirit: Female Leadership in the Jewish and Christian Traditions* (New York, 1979)
- Ruggles, Steven, 'The Origins of African-American Family Structure', *American Sociological Review* Vol. 59 (February 1994), pp. 136–51
- Russell, Daniel J., Jr., *History of the African Union Methodist Protestant Church* (Philadelphia, 1920)
- Scherer, L.B., 'The National Baptist Magazine', *Newsletter of the Afro-American Religious History Group of the American Academy of Religion*, Vol. 6 (Spring 1982)

- Schweiger, Beth Barton, and Matthews, Donald G. (eds.), *Religion in the American South: Protestants and Others in History and Culture* (Chapel Hill, NC, 2004)
- Scott, Patricia Bell, 'Schoolin' "Respectable" Ladies of Color: Issues in the History of Black Women's Higher Education', *Journal of NAWDAC* (Winter 1979), pp. 22-28
- Seraile, William, 'Theophilus G. Steward, Intellectual Chaplain, 25th US Colored Infantry', *Nebraska History* Vol. 66 (1985), pp. 272-293
- , *Voice of Dissent: Theophilus Gould Steward (1843-1924) and Black America* (Brooklyn, 1991)
- , *Fire in His Heart: Bishop Benjamin Tucker Tanner and the A.M.E. Church* (Knoxville, 1998)
- Sernett, Milton C., *Black Religion and American Evangelicalism: White Protestants, Plantation Missions, and the Flowering of Negro Christianity, 1787-1865* (Metuchen, NJ, 1975)
- , *Afro-American Religious History: A Documentary Witness* (Durham, NC, 1985)
- , *Bound for the Promised Land: African American Religion and the Great Migration* (Durham, NC, 1997)
- Shattuck, Gardiner H., Jr., *Episcopalians and Race: Civil War to Civil Rights* (Lexington, KY, 2000)
- Shaw, Stephanie J., 'Black Club Women and the Creation of the National Association of Colored Women', *Journal of Women's History* Vol. 3, No. 2 (Summer 1991) pp. 10-25
- Sherer, Robert G., *Subordination or Liberation? The Development and Conflicting Theories of Black Education in Nineteenth Century Alabama* (Tuscaloosa, AL, 1977)
- Shockley, Grant S. (ed.), *Heritage & Hope: The African American Presence in United Methodism* (Nashville, TN, 1991)
- Short, Roy H., 'Methodist Bishops, Their Ordination as Deacons and Elders', *Methodist History* Vol. 7, No. 1 (October 1968), pp. 11-23

- Singleton, George A., *The Romance of African Methodism: A Study of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (New York, 1952)
- Sklar, Kathryn Kish, *Catherine Beecher: A Study in American Domesticity* (New York, 1976)
- Slowe, Lucy D., 'Higher Education of Negro Women', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 2, No. 3, A Survey of Negro Higher Education (July 1933), pp. 352–358
- Smith, Jessie Carney, (ed.), *Notable Black American Women, Book II* (Detroit, 1996)
- Smith, Sandra N. and West, Earle H., 'Charlotte Hawkins Brown', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 51, No. 3, The Impact of Black Women in Education: An Historical Overview (Summer 1982), pp. 191–206
- Smith, Timothy L., *Revivalism and Social Reform: American Protestantism on the Eve of the Civil War* (New York, 1957)
- , 'Righteousness and Hope: Christian Holiness and the Millennial Vision in America, 1800–1900', *American Quarterly* Vol. 31, No. 1 (Spring 1979), pp. 21–45
- Sobel, Mechal, *Trabelin' On: The Slave Journey to an Afro-Baptist Faith* (Westport, CT, 1979)
- Sommerville, Raymond R., Jr., *An Ex-Colored Church: Social Activism in the CME Church, 1870–1970* (Macon, GA, 2004)
- Southern, Eileen (ed.), *Readings in Black American Music* (New York, 1971)
- , 'Hymnals of the Black Church', *Journal of the Interdenominational Theological Center* Vol. 14, No. 1–2 (Fall–Spring 1986–1987), pp. 127–140
- Spain, Rufus B., *At Ease in Zion: A Social History of Southern Baptists: 1865–1900* (Nashville, TN, 1967)
- Spencer, Jon Michael, *Protest & Praise: Sacred Music of Black Religion* (Minneapolis, MN, 1990)
- , *Black Hymnody: A Hymnological History of the African-American Church* (Knoxville, TN, 1992)

- Spencer, Ralph W., 'Anna Howard Shaw', *Methodist History* Vol. 13, No. 2 (January 1975), pp. 33–51
- Spivey, Donald, *Schooling for the New Slavery: Black Industrial Education, 1868–1915* (Westport, CT, 1978)
- Stange, Douglas C., 'Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne's Protestation of American Slavery', *The Journal of Negro History* Vol. 52, No. 1 (January 1967), pp. 59–64
- Staples, Robert, 'Social Structure and Black Family Life: An Analysis of Current Trends', *Journal of Black Studies* Vol. 17, No. 3 (March 1987), pp. 267–286
- Sterling, Dorothy (ed.), *We Are Your Sisters: Black Women in the Nineteenth Century* (New York, 1984)
- Stith, Forrest C., 'The Paradox of African American Methodist History', *Methodist History* Vol. 48, No. 2 (January 2010), pp. 76–80
- Stout, Harry S. and Hart, D. G. (eds.), *New Directions in American Religious History* (New York, 1997)
- Stowell, Daniel W., *Rebuilding Zion: The Religious Reconstruction of the South, 1863–1877* (Oxford, 1998)
- Straker, Ian B., 'Black and White and Gray All Over: Freeborn Garrettson and African Methodism', *Methodist History* Vol. 37, No. 1 (October 1998), pp. 18–27
- Stringer, Patricia A., and Thompson, Irene, *Stepping Off the Pedestal: Academic Women in the South* (New York, 1982)
- Strobert, Nelson T., *Daniel Alexander Payne: The Venerable Preceptor of the African Methodist Episcopal Church* (Lanham, MD, 2012)
- Stuckey, Sterling, *Slave Culture: Nationalist Theory and the Foundations of Black America* (New York, 1987)
- Swerdlow, Amy and Lessinger, Hanna (eds.), *Class, Race and Sex: The Dynamics of Control* (Boston, 1983)
- Swint, Henry Lee, *The Northern Teacher in the South, 1862–1870* (New York, 1907, reprint 1941)

- Synan, Vinson, *The Holiness-Pentecostal Tradition: Charismatic Movements in the Twentieth Century* (Grand Rapids, MI, 1997)
- Taylor, Alrutheus Ambush, *The Negro in the Reconstruction of Virginia* (Washington, DC, 1926)
- Taylor, Kay Ann, 'Mary S. Peake and Charlotte L. Forten: Black Teachers During the Civil War and Reconstruction', *The Journal of Negro Education*, Vol. 74, No. 2 (Spring 2005), pp. 124–137
- Taylor, Traki L., "'Womanhood Glorified': Nannie Helen Burroughs and the National Training School for Women and Girls, Inc., 1909–1961', *The Journal of African American History* Vol. 87, New Perspectives on African American Educational History (Autumn 2002), pp. 390–402
- Thomas, Hilah F. and Keller, Rosemary Skinner (eds.), *Women in New Worlds: Historical Perspectives on the Wesleyan Tradition* (Nashville, TN, 1981)
- Thomas, James S., 'Methodism's Splendid Mission: The Black Colleges', *Methodist History* Vol. 22, No. 3 (April 1984), pp. 139–157
- Thomas, Veronica G. and Jackson, Janine A., 'The Education of African American Girls and Women: Past to Present', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 76, No. 3, Celebrating the Legacy of "The Journal": 75 Years of Facilitating Excellence in Black Education (Summer 2007), pp. 357–372
- Thompson, Charles H., 'Introduction: The Problem of Negro Higher Education', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 2, No. 3, A Survey of Negro Higher Education (July 1933), pp. 257–271
- Tindall, George Brown, *South Carolina Negroes, 1877–1900* (Columbia, SC, 1952)
- Toldson, Ivory A., and Anderson, Kenneth Alonzo, 'Editor's Comment: The Role of Religion in Promoting Academic Success for Black Students', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 79, No. 3, The Role of Spirituality, Religion and the African American Church on Educational Outcomes (Summer 2010), pp. 205–213
- Tolnay, Stewart E., 'The Decline of Black Marital Fertility in the Rural South: 1910–1940', *American Sociological Review* Vol. 52, No. 2 (April 1987), pp. 211–217

- Trott, Norman L., 'Traveling Preacher: Heritage and Hope', *Methodist History* Vol. 4, No. 4 (July 1966), pp. 41–43
- Troxell, Barbara B., 'Ordination of Women in the United Methodist Tradition', *Methodist History* Vol. 37, No. 2 (January 1999), pp. 119–130
- Trueblood, Roy W., 'Union Negotiations Between Black Methodists in America', *Methodist History* Vol. 8, No. 4 (July 1970), pp. 18–29
- Truesdale, Al, 'Reification of the Experience of Entire Sanctification in the American Holiness Movement', *Wesleyan Theological Journal* Vol. 31, No. 2, pp. 95–119
- Tuck, Stephen, *We Ain't What We Ought To Be: The Black Freedom Struggle from Emancipation to Obama* (Cambridge, MA, 2010)
- Tucker, David M., 'Review of Bishop Henry McNeal Turner and African-American Religion in the South by Stephen Ward Angell', *The American Historical Review* Vol. 98, No. 3 (June 1993), pp. 953–954
- Tucker, M. Belinda and Mitchell-Kernan, Claudia (eds.), *The Decline in Marriage Among African Americans: Causes, Consequences, and Policy Implications* (New York, 1995)
- Tweed, Thomas A. (ed.), *Retelling U.S. Religious History* (Berkeley, 1997)
- Vann Woodward, C., *Origins of the New South, 1877–1913* (Baton Rouge, LA, 1951)
- Walker, Clarence E., *A Rock in a Weary Land: The African Methodist Episcopal Church during the Civil War and Reconstruction* (Baton Rouge, LA, 1982)
- Walls, William J., *Joseph Charles Price, Educator and Race Leader* (Boston, 1943)
- , *The African Methodist Episcopal Zion Church: Reality of the Black Church* (Charlotte, NC, 1974)
- Warner, Lacey C., *Saving Women: Retrieving Evangelistic Theology and Practice* (Waco, TX, 2007)
- Washington, James Melvin, 'The Origins of Black Evangelicalism and the Ethical Function of Evangelical Cosmology', *Union Seminary Quarterly Review* Vol. 32, No. 2 (Winter 1977), pp. 104–116

- , *Frustrated Fellowship: The Black Baptist Quest for Social Power* (Macon, GA, 2004)
- Waters, Kenneth L., Sr., 'Liturgy, Spirituality, and Polemic in the Hymnody of Richard Allen', *The North Star: A Journal of African American Religious History* Vol. 2, No. 2 (Spring 1999)
- Watkins, William H., *The White Architects of Black Education: Ideology and Power in America, 1865–1954* (New York, 2001)
- Weaver, John B., 'Charles F. Deems: The Ministry as Profession in Nineteenth-Century America', *Methodist History* Vol. 21, No. 3 (April 1983), pp. 156–168
- Wein, Roberta, 'Women's Colleges and Domesticity, 1875–1918', *History of Education Quarterly* Vol. 14, No. 1, Reinterpreting Women's Education (Spring 1974), pp. 31–47
- Weisenfeld, Judith and Newman, Richard (eds.), *This Far By Faith: Readings in African-American Women's Religious Biography* (New York, 1996)
- Welter, Barbara, 'The Cult of True Womanhood: 1820–1860', *American Quarterly* Vol. 18, No. 2 (Summer 1966), pp. 151–74
- Wesley, Charles H., *Richard Allen: Apostle of Freedom* (Washington, DC, 1935)
- Westerfield Tucker, Karen B., *American Methodist Worship* (Oxford, 2001)
- Wharton, Vernon L., *The Negro in Mississippi 1865–1890* (New York, 1965)
- Wheeler, Edward L., *Uplifting the Race: The Black Minister in the New South, 1865–1902* (Lanham, MD, 1982)
- White, Charles Edward, 'What the Holy Spirit Can and Cannot Do: The Ambiguities of Phoebe Palmer's Theology of Experience', *Wesleyan Theological Journal* Vol. 20, No. 1, pp. 108–121
- , 'The Beauty of Holiness: The Career and Influence of Phoebe Palmer', *Methodist History* Vol. 25, No. 2 (January 1987), pp. 67–75
- White, Deborah Gray, *Ar'n't I a Woman: Female Slaves in the Plantation South* (New York, 1985)

- , *Too Heavy a Load: Black Women in Defense of Themselves, 1894–1994* (New York, 1999)
- Wiggins, Daphne C., *Righteous Content: Black Women's Perspectives of Church and Faith* (New York, 2005)
- Williams, Burton J., 'Religion and Reconstruction: A Cleric's Conception', *Methodist History* Vol. 9, No. 3 (April 1971), pp. 45–52
- Williams, Gilbert Anthony, *The Christian Recorder, Newspaper of the African Methodist Episcopal Church: History of a Forum for Ideas, 1854–1902* (Jefferson, NC, 1996)
- Williams, Heather Andrea, '“Clothing Themselves in Intelligence”: The Freedpeople, Schooling, and Northern Teachers, 1861–1871', *The Journal of African American History* Vol. 87 (Autumn, 2002), New Perspectives on African American Educational History (Autumn 2002), pp. 372–389
- Wills, David W. and Newman, Richard (eds.), *Black Apostles at Home and Abroad: Afro-Americans and the Christian Mission from the Revolution to Reconstruction* (Boston, 1982)
- Wilmore, Gayraud S., *Black and Presbyterian: The Heritage and the Hope* (Philadelphia, 1983)
- (ed.), *African American Religious Studies: An Interdisciplinary Anthology* (Durham, NC, 1989)
- , *Black Religion and Black Radicalism: An Interpretation of the Religious History of African Americans* (Maryknoll, NY, 1998, revised 3rd edition)
- Wilson, William J., *The Truly Disadvantaged: The Inner City, the Underclass, and Public Policy* (Chicago, 1987)
- Wimberly, Anne Streaty, 'Called to Witness, Called to Serve: African American Methodist Women in Liberian Missions, 1834–1934', *Methodist History* Vol. 34, No. 2 (January 1996), pp. 67–77
- Wimbush, Vincent L., *African Americans and the Bible: Sacred Texts and Social Structures* (New York, 2000)
- Winks, Robin W., *The Blacks in Canada: A History* (Montreal & Kingston, 1997)

- Witherspoon, Noelle, and Arnold, Bruce Makoto, 'Pastoral Care: Notions of Caring and the Black Female Principal', *The Journal of Negro Education* Vol. 79, No. 3, The Role of Spirituality, Religion and the African American Church on Educational Outcomes (Summer 2010), pp. 220–232
- Wolcott, Victoria W. "“Bible, Bath, and Broom”: Nannie Helen Burroughs’s National Training School and African-American Racial Uplift’ *Journal of Women’s History* Vol. 9, No. 1 (Spring 1997), pp. 88–110
- Woodbridge, John D., *The Evangelicals: What They Believe, Who They Are, Where They Are Changing* (Nashville, TN, 1975)
- Woodson, Carter G., *The Education of the Negro Prior to 1861: A History of the Education of the Colored People of the United States from the Beginning of Slavery to the Civil War* (New York, 1915)
- , *The History of the Negro Church* (Washington, DC, 1921)
- , *The Mis-Education of the Negro* (Washington, DC, 1933)
- Yates, Walter L., *He Spoke, Now They Speak: A Collection of Speeches and Writings of and on the Life and Works of J.C. Price* (Salisbury, NC, 1952)

9.7 Unpublished theses

- Alexander, Torin Dru, 'What Meaneth This? A Postmodern “Theory” of African American Religious Experience' (Rice University, Ph.D. thesis, 2010)
- Angell, Stephen Ward, 'Henry McNeal Turner and Black Religion in the South, 1865–1900' (Vanderbilt University, Ph.D. thesis, 1988)
- Bailey, Julius H., 'Around the Domestic Altar: Domesticity in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1865–1900' (The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Ph.D. thesis, 2003)
- Baldwin, Lewis V., "“Invisible Strands” in African Methodism: A History of the African Union Methodist Protestant and the Union American Methodist Protestant Churches, 1805–1980' (Northwestern University, Ph.D. thesis, 1980)

- Brazzell, Johnetta Cross, 'Education as a Tool of Socialization: Agnes Scott Institute and Spelman Seminary, 1881-1910' (University of Michigan, Ph.D. thesis, 1991)
- Brooks, Evelyn, 'The Women's Movement in the Black Baptist Church, 1880-1920' (The University of Rochester, Ph.D. thesis, 1984)
- Burke, Dawne Raines, 'Storer College: A Hope for Redemption in the Shadow of Slavery, 1865-1955' (Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Ph.D. thesis, 2004)
- Cabral, Linda Britton, 'Letters from Four Antebellum Black Women Educators to the American Missionary Association, 1863-1870' (University of Massachusetts Boston, Ed.D. Thesis, 2006)
- Cardwell, Sarah, "'I, too, am America'" The Founding of Bennett College for Women and the Implications of a Progressive Education for Black Women' (Sarah Lawrence College, M.A. thesis, 2008)
- Case, Sarah Harper, 'Renegotiating Race and Respectability in the Classroom: Women and Education in the New South' (University of California, Santa Barbara, Ph.D. thesis, 2002)
- Childs, David J., 'The Black Church and African American Education: The African Methodist Episcopal Church Educating for Liberation, 1816-1893' (Miami University, Ph.D. thesis, 2009)
- Coan, Josephus R., 'The Expansion of Missions of the African Methodist Episcopal Church in South Africa, 1896-1908' (Hartford Seminary, Ph.D. thesis, 1961)
- Collier-Thomas, Bettye, 'The Baltimore Black Community, 1865-1910' (The George Washington University, Ph.D. thesis, 1974)
- Collins, Alicia Carol, 'Socialization at Two Black Women's Colleges: Bennett College and Spelman College' (University of Pittsburgh, Ed.D. thesis, 2001)
- Corley, Florence Fleming, 'Higher Education for Southern Women: Four Church-related Women's Colleges in Georgia, Agnes Scott, Shorter, Spelman, and Wesleyan, 1900-1920' (Georgia State University, Ph.D. thesis, 1985)
- Dickerson, Dennis Clark, 'Black Steelworkers in Western Pennsylvania, 1915-1950' (Washington University, Ph.D. thesis, 1978)

- Dodson, Jualynne Elizabeth, 'Women's Collective Power in the AME Church' (University of California, Berkeley, Ph.D. thesis, 1984)
- Dunlap, Tameka L., 'Washington's Sweetheart: Nannie Helen Burroughs' (Howard University, Ph.D. thesis, 2008)
- Gilkes, Cheryl Louise Townsend, 'Living and Working in a World of Trouble: The emergent career of the black woman community worker' (Northeastern University, Ph.D. thesis, 1979)
- Gilmore, Glenda Elizabeth, 'Gender and Jim Crow: Women and the politics of white supremacy in North Carolina, 1896–1920' (The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Ph.D. thesis, 1992)
- Graham, Frances Denise, 'The Founding of an All Black Female Seminary: Spelman, 1881–1927' (University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, Ph.D. thesis, 1996)
- Harvey, Paul William, 'Southern Baptists and Southern Culture, 1865–1920' (University of California, Berkeley, Ph.D. thesis, 1992)
- Hildebrand, Reginald Francis, 'Methodism and the Meaning of Freedom: Missions to Southern Blacks During the Era of Emancipation and Reconstruction' (Princeton University, Ph.D. thesis, 1991)
- Home, Melissa M., '"Built for Mind and Spirit": The Socialization of Race through Higher Education at Fisk University and Spelman College, 1881–1930' (Carleton University, M.A. thesis, 2008)
- Hughes, Brandi Suzanne, 'Middle Passages: The redemption of African America through the African mission field, 1862–1905' (Yale University, Ph.D. thesis, 2009)
- Johnson, Andre Eric, 'The Prophetic Oratory of Henry McNeal Turner' (The University of Memphis, Ph.D. thesis, 2008)
- Johnson, Karen Ann, '"Uplifting Women and the Race": A Black Feminist Theoretical Critique of the Lives, Works and the Educational Philosophies of Anna Julia Cooper and Nannie Helen Burroughs' (University of California, Los Angeles, Ed.D. thesis, 1997)
- Jones, Martha S., 'The "Woman Question" in African-American Public Culture, 1830–1900' (Columbia University, Ph.D. thesis, 2001)

- McGinnis, Frederick Alphonso, 'A History of Wilberforce University' (University of Cincinnati, Ph.D. thesis, 1940)
- Mendiola, Kelly Willis, 'The Hand of a Woman: Four Holiness-Pentecostal Evangelists and American Culture, 1840–1930' (The University of Texas at Austin, Ph.D. thesis, 2002)
- Merritt de Boer, Clara 'The Role of Afro-Americans in the Origin and Work of the American Missionary Association: 1839–1877' (Rutgers University, Ph.D. Thesis, 1973)
- Minifie, Paul Andre, 'Roots of Black Rhetoric: African Methodist Episcopal Zion's Pioneering Preacher-Politicians' (The University of Texas at Austin, Ph.D. thesis, 2007)
- Morrison, Brian Courtney, 'Selected African American Educational Efforts in Baltimore, Maryland during the nineteenth century' (Morgan State University, Ph.D. thesis, 2008)
- Noble, Jeanne L., 'The Negro Woman Looks at Her College Education' (Columbia University, Ph.D. thesis, 1955)
- Pinn, Anthony Bernard, 'I Wonder as I Wander: An examination of the problem of evil in African-American religious thought' (Harvard University, Ph.D. thesis, 1994)
- Raser, Harold Eugene, 'The Way of Holiness: Phoebe Palmer and Perfectionistic Revivalism in Nineteenth-Century American Religion' (The Pennsylvania State University, Ph.D. thesis, 1987)
- Reddick, Bonnie Lynn, 'Lifting as We Climb: African American Women's Education Experiences in the Ivory Tower' (The Claremont Graduate University, Ph.D. thesis, 2011)
- Roth, Donald Franklin, "'Grace Not Race.'" Southern Negro Church Leaders, Black Identity, and Missions to West Africa, 1865–1919' (The University of Texas at Austin, Ph.D. thesis, 1975)
- Sehat, David, 'The American Moral Establishment: Religion and Liberalism in the Nineteenth Century' (The University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, Ph.D. thesis, 2007)
- Seraile, William, 'New York's Black Regiments During the Civil War' (City University of New York, Ph.D. thesis, 1977)

- Stephens, Randall James, “‘The Fire Spreads’: The origins of the southern holiness and pentecostal movements’ (University of Florida, Ph.D. thesis, 2003)
- Sutton, Virginia Ann, ‘The Early History of Bennett College, Greensboro, North Carolina’ (Wake Forest University M.A. thesis, 1969)
- Thornbery, Jerry John, ‘The Development of Black Atlanta, 1865–1885’ (University of Maryland, Ph.D. thesis, 1977)
- Tyler, Mark Kelly, ‘Bishop Daniel Alexander Payne of the African Methodist Episcopal Church: The Life of a 19th Century Educational Leader, 1811–1865’ (University of Dayton, Ph.D. thesis, 2006)
- Watson-Moore, Yolanda L., ‘Training the head, the hand, and the heart: The evolution of the academic curriculum of Spelman College (1881–1953)’ (Georgia State University, Ph.D. thesis, 2000)
- West, Michael Rudolph, ‘The Education of Booker T. Washington: The Negro Problem, Democracy, and the Idea of Race Relations’ (Columbia University, Ph.D. thesis, 2000)
- Westin, Richard Barry, ‘The State and Segregated Schools: Negro Public Education in North Carolina, 1863–1923’ (Duke University, Ph.D. thesis, 1966)
- Wills, David W., ‘Aspects of Social Thought in the African Methodist Episcopal Church, 1884–1910’ (Harvard university, Ph.D. thesis, 1975)

9.8 Websites

- ‘About WU — History’, Wilberforce University
[<http://www.wilberforce.edu/welcome/history.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Angell, Stephen Ward, ‘Turner, Henry McNeal’, *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01557.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Armentrout, Donald S., ‘Jones, Absalom’, *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00769.html>]
(Accessed April 2016)

Baldwin, Lewis V., 'Spencer, Peter', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01729.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

'The Bishops of the A.M.E. Church'
[<http://www.amec3000.org/allamebishops.htm>] Archived at
[<http://web.archive.org/web/20120313142547/http://www.amec3000.org/allamebishops.htm>] (Accessed April 2016)

Bowden, Henry Warner, 'Grimké, Francis James', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00589.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

'A Brief History of Mother Bethel African Methodist Episcopal Church'
[<http://www.motherbethel.org/content.php?cid=18>] (Accessed April 2016)

'Brown, Hallie Quinn (1850–1949)'
[<http://www.blackpast.org/aah/brown-hallie-quinn-1850-1949>]
(Accessed April 2016)

'Claiming Their Citizenship: African American Women from 1624–2009',
National Women's History Museum [<http://www.nwhm.org/online-exhibits/africanamerican/25.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

De Jong, Mary, 'Smith, Amanda Berry', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01400.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

'Dr. Hollis Burke Frissell — Digital Library of Hampton University'
[<http://contentdm.auctr.edu/cdm/singleitem/collection/hamu/id/62/rec/6>] (Accessed April 2016)

'Ella Niswonger, 1865–1944',
[<http://www.gcuh.org/history/biographies/ella-niswonger>]
(Accessed April 2016)

Girolimon, Michael Thomas, 'Seymour, William Joseph', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-02029.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

- Glass, Zipporah G., 'Boyd, Richard Henry', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00164.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Gordon, Ann D., 'Shaw, Anna Howard', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00615.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Gravely, Will B., 'Brown, Morris', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00192.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- 'Hampton University: History' [<http://www.hamptonu.edu/about/history.cfm>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Heffron, J.M., 'Armstrong, Samuel Chapman', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00034.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Hine, Darlene Clark, 'Bethune, Mary Jane McLeod', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/06/06-00042.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- 'A History of Amherst College' [<https://www.amherst.edu/aboutamherst/facts/history>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Holt, Thomas C., 'Du Bois, W.E.B.', *American National Biography Online* [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00191.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- 'Jones, Edward — Amherst College Class of 1826' [<http://www3.amherst.edu/~rjyanco94/genealogy/acbiorecord/1826.html#jones-e>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Keller, Frances Richardson, 'Cooper, Anna Julia Haywood', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00197.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Kujawa, Sheryl A., 'Brown, Olympia', *American National Biography Online*, [<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00097.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

- Lach, Edward L., Jr., 'Brown, Charlotte Eugenia Hawkins', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00117.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Lasser, Carol, 'Stone, Lucy', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00663.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Mamie E. Locke, 'Harper, Frances Ellen Watkins' *American National Biography Online*
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00304.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Martin, Sandy Dwayne, 'Brawley, Edward McKnight', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00170.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- , 'DeBaptiste, Richard', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00360.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- , 'Simmons, William James', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/14/14-00561.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- , 'Varick, James', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-01583.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- , 'Walls, William Jacob', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-02241.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- McCaskill, Barbara, 'Lee, Jarena', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/16/16-03109.html>] (Accessed April 2016)
- Mills, Frederick V., 'Allen, Richard', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00031.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

- Moses, Wilson J., 'Crummell, Alexander', *American National Biography Online*,
 [/mnt/george/nfs/georgeserver/library/scans/grimke/out/]
 (Accessed April 2016)
- Moynihan, Daniel P., 'The Negro Family in America: The Case for National Action' (March 1965)
 [http://www.blackpast.org/primary/moynihan-report-1965]
 (Accessed April 2016)
- Mugleston, William F., 'Washington, Booker T.', *American National Biography Online*,
 [http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00737.html] (Accessed April 2016)
- Neverdon-Morton, Cynthia, 'Terrell, Mary Eliza Church', *American National Biography Online*,
 [http://www.anb.org/articles/15/15-00686.html] (Accessed April 2016)
- 'An Ohio Leader, Benjamin W. Arnett',
 [http://aaregistry.org/historic_events/view/ohio-leader-benjamin-w-arnett] (Accessed April 2016)
- Patton, June O., 'Laney, Lucy Craft', *American National Biography Online*,
 [http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00425.html] (Accessed April 2016)
- Perkins, Linda M., 'Coppin, Fanny Jackson', *American National Biography Online*, [http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00202.html]
 (Accessed April 2016)
- 'Slowe, Lucy Diggs', *American National Biography Online*,
 [http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00690.html] (Accessed April 2016)
- 'Questions & Answers — Dr. Martin Luther King's 1963 WMU Speech Found — Archives — WMU Libraries'
 [http://www.wmich.edu/library/archives/mlk/q-a.html] Archived at [http://web.archive.org/web/20070822230652/http://www.wmich.edu/library/archives/mlk/q-a.html] (Accessed April 2016)

- ‘Sessions, Lucy Stanton Day (1831–1910)’
[\[http://www.blackpast.org/aah/sessions-lucy-stanton-day-1831-1910\]](http://www.blackpast.org/aah/sessions-lucy-stanton-day-1831-1910) (Accessed April 2016)
- Shattuck, Gardiner H., ‘Haygood, Atticus Greene’, *American National Biography Online*,
[\[http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00649.html\]](http://www.anb.org/articles/08/08-00649.html) (Accessed April 2016)
- ‘Spelman History in Brief’
[\[http://www.spelman.edu/about-us/history-in-brief\]](http://www.spelman.edu/about-us/history-in-brief) (Accessed April 2016)
- Strom, Claire, ‘Brown, Hallie Quinn’, *American National Biography Online*,
[\[http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00121.html\]](http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00121.html) (Accessed April 2016)
- Synnott, Marcia G., ‘Burroughs, Nannie Helen’, *American National Biography Online*,
[\[http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00132.html\]](http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00132.html) (Accessed April 2016)
- Theodore C. DeLaney, ‘Chavis, John’, *American National Biography Online*,
[\[http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00165.html\]](http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00165.html) (Accessed April 2016)
- ‘Tribute of Respect — Mrs. Woosley, Kentucky’, *The Cumberland Presbyterian*, (26 August 1952), p. 15
[\[http://www.cumberland.org/hfcpc/minister/woosleyL.htm\]](http://www.cumberland.org/hfcpc/minister/woosleyL.htm)
 (Accessed April 2016)
- Urban, Wayne ‘Curry, Jabez Lamar Monroe’, *American National Biography Online*, [\[http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00215.html\]](http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00215.html)
 (Accessed April 2016)
- Vicary, Elizabeth Zoe, ‘Payne, Daniel Alexander’, *American National Biography Online*,
[\[http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00574.html\]](http://www.anb.org/articles/09/09-00574.html) (Accessed April 2016)
- Warrick, Susan E. (ed.), ‘Women in the Wesleyan and United Methodist Traditions: A Bibliography’ [\[http://s3.amazonaws.com/gcah.org/UMC\History/Bibliographies/Bibliography.pdf\]](http://s3.amazonaws.com/gcah.org/UMC\History/Bibliographies/Bibliography.pdf) (Accessed April 2016)

Williams, Kenneth H., 'Revels, Hiram Rhoades', *American National Biography Online*,
[<http://www.anb.org/articles/04/04-00839.html>] (Accessed April 2016)

'Woman Minister Dies', *The Cumberland Presbyterian*, (22 July 1952), p. 4
[<http://www.cumberland.org/hfcpc/minister/woosleyL.htm>]
(Accessed April 2016)

9.9 Films

Good News: The Story of the Mather School (Original film from the collections of the American Baptist Historical Society, 1949)